

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

----- X

November 13, 2024  
Start: 10:52 a.m.  
Recess: 11:01 a.m.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Rita C. Joseph, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Eric Dinowitz  
Jennifer Gutiérrez  
Shahana Hanif  
Kamillah M. Hanks  
Shekar Krishnan  
Linda Lee  
Farrah N. Louis  
Mercedes Narcisse  
Pierina Ana Sanchez  
Althea V. Stevens

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Julie Won  
Chi A. Ossé  
Diana Ayala

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a microphone  
3 check for the Committee on Education located in the  
4 Committee Room on the 13th of November 2024 recorded  
5 by Pat Kurzyna.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning. Welcome  
7 to the New York City Council vote hearing on the  
8 Committee on Education.

9 At this time, please silence all  
10 electronics.

11 At this time also, do not approach the  
12 dais.

13 Chair, you may begin.

14 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: [GAVEL] Good morning  
15 and welcome everyone to today's Committee on  
16 Education vote on Resolution 13 sponsored by myself,  
17 a resolution designating the second Friday in March  
18 annually as Social and Emotional Learning Day in the  
19 City of New York and recognizing the importance of  
20 ensuring that pre-kindergarten through 12th grade  
21 public school students acquire the social-emotional  
22 competency needed to succeed in life, and Resolution  
23 95 sponsored by Council Member Hanif, a resolution  
24 calling upon the New York City Department of  
25 Education to consult with faith-based organizations

2 to develop and provide all grade level with a  
3 curriculum that focuses on religious diversity to  
4 provide professional development focus on religious  
5 diversity for teachers, staff, and administrators, to  
6 ensure accurate classification of hate crimes and  
7 annual school report and immediate notification and  
8 full disclosure to parents of hate crime statistics  
9 and to ensure that schools take action to condemn  
10 bullying and harassment based on religious clothing,  
11 food requirements, and the need for prayer space and  
12 time year-round.

13 I'm proud to have sponsored Resolution 13  
14 along with 26 of my Colleagues. The Committee  
15 previously heard testimony on the Resolution at a  
16 hearing on school-based health centers and school-  
17 based mental health clinics on April 17, 2024. New  
18 York City State Education Department defined social-  
19 emotional learning as the process through which  
20 children, youth, and adults acquire and effectively  
21 apply the knowledge, attitude, and skills necessary  
22 to understand and manage emotions, set and achieve  
23 positive goals, feel and show empathy for others,  
24 establish and maintain positive relationships, and  
25 make responsible decisions. Studies show that

2 students receiving SEL instruction have higher  
3 academic achievements, better motivation, fewer  
4 disruptive behaviors, and less emotional stress, and  
5 such instruction results in greater equity among  
6 students. Designating SEL Day in New York City Public  
7 Schools recognizes the importance of ensuring that  
8 pre-K through 12th grade public school students  
9 acquire the social-emotional competency needed to  
10 succeed in life.

11 I'm also proud to have signed on as a co-  
12 sponsor of Resolution 95, which was heard at a  
13 hearing on legislation on June 18, 2023. Bias-based  
14 bullying is defined as physical, verbal, social, or  
15 cyber-based threats directed towards a minority  
16 population based upon race, ethnicity, religious  
17 beliefs, gender, or sexual orientation, and include a  
18 systematic abuse of power that is characterized  
19 intentionally, frequency, and imbalance of power.  
20 Rate of such bullying has risen nationwide, and  
21 2019's New York State Comptroller Report found  
22 significant under-reporting of these incidents in New  
23 York City Public Schools. Additionally, research  
24 linked bias-based bullying to poor academic  
25 performance and negative mental and social outcomes,

2 including depression, anxiety. Advocates argue that  
3 incorporating lessons on religious bias and  
4 inaccuracies in schools can reduce religious-based  
5 bullying, but teachers often lack the necessary  
6 resources to do so.

7 I encourage all of my Colleagues to vote  
8 yes on both of these important pieces of legislation  
9 which aim to enhance social-emotional well-being of  
10 all New York City Public Schools.

11 I will now turn to Council Member Hanif  
12 to make a statement.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you to  
14 Speaker Adams for including Resolution 95 on today's  
15 agenda. I also want to thank the 35 sponsors of this  
16 resolution, including co-prime sponsor Council Member  
17 Schulman and Education Chair Joseph for their  
18 support. This Resolution calls on the Department of  
19 Education to consult with faith-based organizations  
20 to develop and provide all grade levels with a  
21 curriculum that focuses on religious diversity. In my  
22 new capacity as Co-Chair of the Council's Task Force  
23 to Combat Hate, I've heard from students of different  
24 backgrounds about the lack of understanding that many  
25 students have about the religious experiences of

2 their peers. This creates an environment where  
3 students are more vulnerable to bullying or bias-  
4 based incidents, which can range from subtle  
5 microaggressions to violent hate crimes. It has been  
6 eye-opening to learn about the ways in which students  
7 have been made to feel either ostracized or unsafe  
8 due to the religion that they practice. Over the last  
9 year, there have been 367 incidents of religious-  
10 based bullying, harassment, intimidation, and  
11 discrimination in our schools. With the troubling  
12 rise of antisemitic, Islamophobic, and other hate  
13 crimes, it is more crucial than ever to cultivate  
14 inclusivity and prevent hate through education. Our  
15 schools must be nurturing places where young New  
16 Yorkers are able to express their full selves without  
17 fear. In order to meet this imperative, we must bring  
18 a universal religious diversity curriculum to our  
19 classrooms. By teaching students about the mosaic of  
20 religions that makes New York City such a culturally  
21 rich and vibrant place, we can foster mutual  
22 understanding, respect, and exchange amongst our next  
23 generation. I'm grateful for the interfaith coalition  
24 of supporters of this Resolution, including leaders  
25 from the Muslim, Jewish, Christian, and Sikh

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

7

2 communities. The diversity of this coalition and the  
3 effort they've consistently dedicated to this fight  
4 over the last few years underscores how critical this  
5 resolution is. I encourage all my Colleagues to vote  
6 in favor of Reso. 95 and for the Department of  
7 Education to develop and implement this curriculum  
8 immediately. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Thank you. I would  
10 like to thank my Staff and Committee Staff.

11 I'll now turn to the Clerk to call the  
12 roll.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Good  
14 morning. William Martin, Committee Clerk. Roll call  
15 vote, Committee on Education, Resolutions 13 and 95.  
16 Items are coupled. Chair Joseph.

17 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: Aye on all.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Sanchez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Louis.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all.

22 Congratulations to the bill sponsors.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Gennaro.  
24 Dinowitz. Gutiérrez.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Aye.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

8

2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
3 you, Council Member Gutierrez. Dinowitz.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Aye on all.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
6 you, sir. Hanif. Hanks.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Krishnan.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Aye.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Lee.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Aye on all.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Narcisse.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Aye on all.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Schulman.  
15 Stevens.

16 With the vote of 10 in the affirmative,  
17 zero in the negative, and no abstentions, both items  
18 have been adopted by the Committee, and the roll will  
19 be held open at request of the Chair.

20 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Whoever voted and is on  
21 Finance, can you head over to the Chambers for the  
22 Finance vote? Thank you.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN:  
24 Continuation roll call, Committee on Education.  
25 Council Member Stevens.



1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

9

2 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Aye on all.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
4 you. The vote is now 11 in the affirmative, zero the  
5 negative, and no abstentions.

6 CHAIRPERSON JOSEPH: [GAVEL]

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 15, 2024