

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

December 19, 2013  
Start: 10:59 a.m.  
Recess: 11:43 a.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room  
City Hall

B E F O R E: Domenic M. Recchia  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Gale A. Brewer
- Leroy Comrie, Jr.
- Lewis A. Fidler
- Robert Jackson
- G. Oliver Koppell
- Darlene Mealy
- Diana Reyna
- Joel Rivera
- Albert Vann
- Fernando Cabrera
- Julissa Ferreras
- Karen Koslowtiz
- James G. Van Bramer
- Vincent M. Ignizio
- James S. Oddo

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Preston Niblick

Andrew Schwartz  
First Deputy Commissioner for the Department of  
Small Business

James Mettham  
Assistant Commissioner

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: [off mic]

Mic's off. Okay. Good morning and welcome to today's Finance Committee hearing. My name is Domenic M. Recchia, Jr. I'm the Chair of the Finance Committee. Before we get started I'd like to introduce all my colleague who have joined us here today. We have Council Member Julissa Ferreras, Council Member Vincent Ignizio, Council Member Rivera, Council Member Koppell, Council Member Comrie, Council Member Fidler, Council Member Cabrera, Council Member Al Vann, Council Member Brewer, Council Member Karen Koslowitz, Council Member Jimmy Oddo, and Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer. Before we start with our agenda, I just want to take a quick moment to say a few words about my tenure here at the Council. For many of us today, this will be our last official action taken as City Council Members. I am grateful the opportunity to serve as Council Member. I'm grateful to serve as the Council Member for the 47<sup>th</sup> District, and I am thankful that I had the opportunity to serve with the members of this legislative body. In my 12 years tenure at the

1  
2 City Council, first as the Chair of the  
3 Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries,  
4 International Group Relations and then Finance  
5 Chair, I was able to make a meaningful impact  
6 on the lives of New Yorkers, cultural  
7 institutions, and the culture fabric of the  
8 city as a whole. This was all done by working  
9 hand in hand with my fellow Council Members. I  
10 want to thank all of you for your dedication  
11 and commitment to public service. It has truly  
12 been a privilege to serve with you as we work  
13 to make this city better for our constituents  
14 and the generations upon generations of New  
15 Yorkers who will call this city home in the  
16 years to come. Under the leadership of Speaker  
17 Christine Quinn, the City Council is a  
18 legislative body that all New Yorkers can be  
19 proud of. Although I leave the Council with a  
20 heavy heart, the weight is lessened because I  
21 know I have established friendships that will  
22 last a lifetime. It's been great being here,  
23 but I have to say I had an outstanding staff.  
24 My staff has been wonderful for many, many  
25 years, and especially the Finance staff. I want

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

to thank my staff who has been with me. I want to thank Ashley Owens [phonetic]. I want to thank Rommy [phonetic]. I want to thank Thomas who are here, but I also want to thank all those staff members who worked for me for many, many years. But my Finance staff is the best that there could be. Under the leadership of-- [applause] They deserve a round of applause. [applause] Under the leadership of Preston Niblack Deputy Director, Jeffery Rotas [phonetic], my wonderful attorney, Tenisha Edwards [phonetic]. Tenisha, you're the best. Our wonderful economist, Ray Magesky [phonetic], Latonya Mckinny [phonetic], Nathan Toth [phonetic], Regina Ryan, Scott Crowley, and all the unit heads and analysts in the division, I want to thank you all. It's been great. I wish all of you the best of luck because of you that I was so successful in being a good Finance Chairman and one that could never forget what the staff really means. Your dedication to this city is unremarkable and people of the city should know how great all of you are. So now, we'll get down to

1  
2 business of today. We have nine items on our  
3 agenda. My Counsel, Tenisha Edwards, emailed  
4 Finance Members the briefing papers for today's  
5 agenda. So in the interest of time, I will only  
6 itemize the bills on our agenda. We are voting  
7 on a transparency reso. Remember to view all  
8 the charts carefully and disclose to any  
9 potential conflicts. We have Proposed Intro  
10 172-A sponsored by Council Member Jimmy Vacca,  
11 which would exempt all not for profit  
12 organizations from paying FDNY fees. We have  
13 Proposed Intro 1040-A sponsored by Council  
14 Member Donovan Richards, which requires the  
15 administration to create an interactive  
16 searchable online database that tracks super  
17 storm Sandy funds provided to New York City.  
18 Next, we have Proposed Intro 1204-A which  
19 extends the tax rate on hotel rooms. Next we  
20 have Proposed Intro 1171-A sponsored by Council  
21 Member Al Vann, which amends the tax lien to  
22 provide additional protections for individuals  
23 whose property is subject to the lien sale.  
24 Next, we have the preliminary budget extender,  
25 which extends the date for the Mayor to release

1  
2 the preliminary budget to February 12<sup>th</sup>. Next,  
3 we have legislation that would have extended--  
4 that would extend healthcare insurance covers  
5 to surviving spouse of a New York City Police  
6 Department employee who died in the line of  
7 duty when struck by a truck on November 30<sup>th</sup>.  
8 Next, we have a Land Use Item Council Member  
9 Carmen Arroyo's district in the Bronx, the  
10 building 1A Compass Residence which provides  
11 under 10 units of rental units to low income  
12 families will receive the full tax exemption  
13 for 40 years. And lastly, we have Intro 1186,  
14 which is a Local Law that would establish the  
15 Hudson Yards bid located in the District of  
16 Speaker Quinn who supports the establishment of  
17 this bid. I will provide details on this item.  
18 Of course, by law, the committee must answer  
19 the following four questions before the  
20 Committee vote on establish of this bid. The  
21 Department of Small Business Services who is  
22 here today will give us this information to  
23 help us decide. One, all notices of hearing  
24 for all hearings required to be held published  
25 and mailed as required. Does all the real

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

property within the districts boundary benefit the establishment of the district, except as otherwise provided by law? Is all real property benefitted by the district included within the district? And is the establishment of the district in the best interest of the public? If the committee finds the affirmative on these four questions and the number of objects required to prevent the creation of such district are not filled, then the legislation can be adopted. Those are all our items on today. Before we here from the Department of Small Business Services regarding the Hudson Yards bid, does anyone have any questions for O & B, HPD, or council staff on any of the above items? Okay. Okay. We recognize Council Member Lewis Fidler.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Before we get the Council Member Oddo who--

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Right to the very end, huh, Fidler?

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Oh, I think-

-



1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: [interposing]  
3 right to the very end, the bane of my  
4 existence. I vote no on Styrofoam.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: So there  
6 will be one. You know, in all--Mr. Chairman,  
7 you very, very appropriately thank the Finance  
8 staff and I just want them all to know that,  
9 you know, as well as they serve you, they  
10 served each and every one of us. They really  
11 did an absolutely phenomenal job from Preston  
12 to Nutrition Chairman Rhotas [phonetic] to  
13 Judge-elect Edwards and to every single one of  
14 you, I want to extend my thanks, but I think  
15 the one thing that wasn't said was what a  
16 terrific job you've done chairing this  
17 committee and I want to express to you how much  
18 we have appreciated the work you've done  
19 protecting tax payers, protecting programs,  
20 working with all of us making sure that our  
21 interests were all heard and represented here  
22 at the Finance Committee and at the Council.  
23 And so on behalf of--I hope on behalf of all my  
24 colleagues, I want to say a very hearty thank  
25 you to you, Domenic Recchia.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

[applause]

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Thank you,  
Member Fidler. Member Jimmy Oddo?

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Preston, of  
all the outgoing members, who do you think  
embodies that wonderful mixture of intelligence  
and wit and institutional memory and good looks  
best?

PRESTON NIBLACK: Council Member  
Domenic M. Recchia, Jr. seems to me to be the  
embodiment of all that one would want in a  
Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Nicely played.  
I just--

PRESTON NIBLACK: [interposing] But  
the borough of Staten Island is undoubtedly the  
best borough in all of the City of New York.

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I just ask you  
to come up there--

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: I second that.

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: And well  
played by you, sir. I want you to sit up there  
for a moment, Preston, because I want you to  
take a victory lap. You know, I first started

1  
2 coming in this building in the early 90's, and  
3 for seven glorious years I was a staffer here,  
4 and the relationships I made back then are  
5 lifelong relationships and the camaraderie  
6 among staff back then was just--it was a  
7 blessing, and I--we, as individual members are  
8 reminded every budget, every budget cycle,  
9 every one of those wonderful budget negotiating  
10 meetings that you and your staff that are out-  
11 gunned, if you will, by the OMB [phonetic] and  
12 by the folks across the hall. You guys have  
13 done so well by us, and the dedication that you  
14 and Jeff and everyone has demonstrated is so  
15 very much appreciated at the public--and I  
16 guess they want no, you know, they'd rather see  
17 paint dry, but the public should see every now  
18 and again what happens in those meetings and  
19 how professional you and your staff were in  
20 allowing us to try to be a check on the  
21 executive and try to have our fingerprints on a  
22 budget. We're often criticized that we only  
23 deal with a fraction of a fraction of the  
24 percentage of a budget and we play the  
25 periphery, but that periphery happens to be

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

senior senators and libraries and youth and run-away youth, and all the things that we as the representatives of the public, we hold dear. And I can't thank you guys enough. You have been fun. You're well informed and prepared. You did right by Speaker Quinn. You did right by this Finance Chair, and you certainly did right by me and my district and I just want to thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Thank you, Council Member Jimmy Oddo.

[applause]

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: I'd like to recognize Council Member Al Vann.

PRESTON NIBLACK: May I just make one quick response to Council Member Oddo?

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Yes.

PRESTON NIBLACK: I just wanted to say that I think that although we were always outnumbered by OMB, the Finance division was never out-gunned by them.

[applause]

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Council Member Al Vann, before you make your statement, I just

1  
2 want to recognize we've been joined by Council  
3 Member Robert Jackson. Council Member Al Vann?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Yeah, thank  
5 you, Mr. Chair. I think the protocol has pretty  
6 much been established, so it would be redundant  
7 for me to have to thank Niblack, and Rhotas,  
8 and Recchia, and Tenisha [phonetic]; it's been  
9 done, and I think we all agree with that, and I  
10 would include obviously my staffers and Dotty  
11 [phonetic] who worked on this, but I want to  
12 thank this committee because I hope you're  
13 aware that we've been involved in reforming the  
14 land sale process since probably 2011, and  
15 because of the votes that you have taken, we  
16 have really made it able for everyday people,  
17 people trying to make it to hold on to and  
18 retain the only asset they would probably ever  
19 have in life, which is their house. And you  
20 ought to be commended for that, and I'm very  
21 happy that I was informed enough and have  
22 enough support that we could advance that kind  
23 of legislation, and the piece you have today  
24 that we have voted on or will vote on is a very  
25 significant conclusion to that process, at

1  
2 least for me, and that is very often too many  
3 people when they die, they don't leave a will,  
4 and therefore, those who would have inherited  
5 that property have to go through a long costly  
6 and messy process to try and establish their  
7 position so they would be able to take  
8 advantage of the land sale, which obviously,  
9 would probably be too late, but because of the  
10 bill we will vote on today, we make it simple.  
11 We make it easy and believe me, a lot of  
12 people, a lot of poor people will be able to  
13 hold onto their property because of it, and I'm  
14 very pleased to have had the opportunities to  
15 serve with you, Tenisha, you did a tremendous  
16 job negotiating this piece out. I mean, it's  
17 unbelievable, beyond my expectation, but I  
18 wanted to thank you in particular, but I want  
19 to thank all of the Finance Committee. I want  
20 to thank my colleagues for being supportive.  
21 Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Thank you  
23 Council Member Al Vann. Council Member Leroy  
24 Comrie?  
25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Just making  
3 sure my colleague is okay. Thank you, Mr.  
4 Chair. I just want to also echo it as today is  
5 my last day as a Council Member before this  
6 body and is our last committee meeting as well.  
7 The comments of Lou Fidler and Jimmy Oddo and  
8 Al Vann, all more eloquent speakers than I, but  
9 I want to thank the Finance staff, the Counsel  
10 to the Committee, the Chairman, all of the  
11 committee members that worked on finances. Head  
12 of the Queens delegation over the past 12  
13 years. I've had a lot of opportunities to work  
14 with the Finance staff on many issues, both in  
15 my district and for the delegation and for the  
16 issues on the entire city. When we stepped into  
17 save NYCHA back in '04, when we worked on the  
18 teachers issues, helping them when we worked on  
19 libraries issues. There's not been an issue  
20 that this Finance staff has not been able to  
21 be--come up with ideas, with methodologies to  
22 save the City. And time and time again, this  
23 Finance staff has led the fight and led the  
24 effort to direct us to a better path and a  
25 better idea. The implementation of the

1  
2 immigrant opportunities initiative, the  
3 immigration--the implementation of the CASA  
4 initiative, the Workforce initiative, all of  
5 the things that we were able to do as a  
6 council, what we had to do in 2002 to try to  
7 rescue the city when the city was in a flux and  
8 trying to re-establish itself after 9/11. The  
9 Finance staff led the way, gave us sound advice  
10 and information and directions when we had to  
11 make hard choices. I'm just so humbled to have  
12 been a part of that. I'm so thankful to all of  
13 the members of the Finance staff and all of  
14 your support staff as well that worked with you  
15 to make sure that we had the information,  
16 worked with all of us to makes sure that we  
17 made the right decisions. So, all of a sudden  
18 I'm getting emotional. I'm not--I try not to  
19 show my emotion, because you know, men are not  
20 supposed to cry. You know, but--

21 [laughter]

22 [applause]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Oh, lordy.

24 [off mic] Yeah, but it's been fun. It's been  
25 fun, you know, even when we've argued. It's



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

been fun when we had to deal with issues. It's been fun because at the end of the day no matter what, where you were or what you did you were about making the City better. No matter what district, what borough, what party, you know? Jimmy Oddo and I knew each other before I came on board, but I can say that he's truly been someone that I would do anything for. So, and all of the members. I didn't--I'm going to stop right now. I was going to say more at the meeting later, but I've truly enjoyed this opportunity. Thank you, Domenic, for being a friend and not just on the council business, but on regular business and thank you all.

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Thank you, Leroy Comrie. You'll be missed. Okay, now we're going to hear from Small Business Services. They're going to give us a quick, brief statement. Small Business Services, business on the Hudson bid.

ANDREW SCHWARTZ: Good morning, Mr. Chairman and members of the Finance Committee. I'm Andrew Schwartz, First Deputy Commissioner for the Department of Small Business Services.

1  
2 I'm joined today by James Mettham, Assistant  
3 Commissioner. As required by the Business  
4 Improvement District Law, the Hudson Yards bid  
5 steering committee mailed a summary of the City  
6 Council Resolution to each owner of real  
7 property within the proposed district that the  
8 address is shown on the latest city assessment  
9 role and to other persons registered with the  
10 City to receive tax bills concerning property  
11 within the district and to tenants of each  
12 building within the district. In addition, SBS  
13 arranged for a required publication of the  
14 resolution in the City record. We're now  
15 pleased to report the results of the objections  
16 filed with the City clerk against the  
17 establishment of the Hudson Yards Business  
18 Improvement District. At the conclusion of the  
19 objection period of 5:00 p.m. on December 14<sup>th</sup>,  
20 and taking into consideration any objections  
21 post marked by that date, there was one valid  
22 objection filed with the City Clerk. Therefore,  
23 owners of 0.01 percent of assessed value of all  
24 benefitted real property situated in the  
25 district filed objections, and 0.012 percent of

1  
2 the owners of benefitted real property filed  
3 objections. So the total assessed value of  
4 property in the district is 854,988,037 dollars  
5 and the total number of properties is 1,160,  
6 which are held by 855 property owners. Our  
7 review concludes that the level of objections  
8 filed in terms of either the number of property  
9 owners or percentage of assed valuation is  
10 within the acceptable threshold needed to  
11 advance the bill for favorable consideration by  
12 the Full City Council and SBS requests the  
13 Council approve the establishment of this bid.  
14 The Department of Small Business Services  
15 supports the establishment of the bid which  
16 will be managed by the Hudson Yards/Hell's  
17 Kitchen Alliance District Management  
18 Association, and in our judgment, the bid will  
19 improve business conditions and the quality of  
20 life in Hudson Yards and Hell's Kitchen area  
21 making it a better place to live, work, and  
22 visit and laying the groundwork for further  
23 neighborhood development activities in Midtown  
24 West. We thank the Committee for its  
25 consideration of this and the 25 bids that the

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

Committee has helped establish during the administration.

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Thank you very much. We recognize Council Member Gale Brewer.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. I always have a question.

ANDREW SCHWARTZ: We know that. At least you're consistent from my last meeting.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yeah, I am very consistent. The part--I know Hell's Kitchen well, but how do you have a bid when in Hudson Yards when all I see are trucks and a lot of construction? So I don't understand who's the bid person in Hudson Yards? Is it Related and someone?

JAMES METTHAM: Good morning. My name is James Mettham. I'm assistant Commissioner at SBS. There are over 800 properties in the Hell's Kitchen/Hudson Yards area.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Hell's Kitchen, I know. Every one of them

JAMES METTHAM: And this, you are correct that this does take into a

1  
2 consideration a number of development  
3 properties that will be coming online over the  
4 next few years. Those developers, whether it's  
5 Related or others, have been part of the  
6 Steering Committee and stakeholders that have  
7 been involved in formatting and talking about  
8 the formation of this bid and have provided  
9 their support for this particular--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So how many  
11 of the stakeholders are really large? Are  
12 there some small property owners also, and has  
13 the board been put together, you know, to  
14 include--obviously you need a resident. I mean,  
15 I know the construction of what a bid war looks  
16 like because I'm on a lot of them. So, how does  
17 that work when you don't really have large  
18 buildings there yet? I just don't want the big  
19 guys to swallow up the small guys.

20 JAMES METHAM: It's a good  
21 question, and it's been talked about in the  
22 Steering Committee during formation. There  
23 will be specific classes as you alluded to in  
24 terms of residential, commercial tenants as  
25 well as property owners, and property owners,

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

they'll be a mix of both commercial property owners, both large and small, which the district management association, the non-profit will determine and work on. They've worked with the Community Board as well in terms of assuring that there will be a mixed representation of different types of commercial classes on that board.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Seeing no further questions. Does anyone have a question on anything on the agenda for today? Without seeing that--yeah, we're going to vote. Let's vote then. You'll make your statement afterwards. Okay, after the vote. Okay, Billy, please call the roll.

CLERK MARTIN: William Martin, Committee Clerk, roll call vote, Committee on Finance. Council Member Rivera?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA? I vote aye.

CLERK MARTIN: Brewer?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I vote aye, and I do want to second the words of my colleagues to say that it's the staff and it is

1  
2 phenomenal. Tenisha's the smartest and the  
3 most beautiful, amazing combination. And also  
4 Domenic Recchia, when he first headed up  
5 Cultural Affairs, I know that he's a great  
6 Finance Committee Chair, but I have to say he  
7 was a great Cultural Affairs Chair. Having  
8 brought the CASA to all of us, that's a real  
9 legacy item. And I also want to thank the  
10 colleagues, because I actually, I love going to  
11 hearings when the agencies present, and I think  
12 the way that it was organized, was phenomenal,  
13 and the best of course was working with the  
14 staff to try to figure out in budget  
15 negotiation committee how to make these numbers  
16 work for the people of the City of New York,  
17 and I don't know how staff did, but you know,  
18 particularly with Early Learn and elsewhere.  
19 They figured out a way of trying to keep senior  
20 centers and daycare centers and so on open,  
21 which is the bread and butter and the safety  
22 net that so many families have. So I am very  
23 honored I was able to co-chair the Manhattan  
24 delegation for 12 years, and sitting on budget  
25 negotiation with Finance was a real learning

1  
2 experience, and I thank everybody who helped so  
3 much, Preston Niblack and his staff, and of  
4 course the colleagues. Thank you very much and  
5 I vote aye.

6 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Thank you.

7 CLERK MARTIN: Comrie?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye on all.

9 CLERK MARTIN: Fidler?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: I just wanted  
11 to note for the final time on the record that I  
12 defeated Councilman Oddo in our Fantasy  
13 Baseball League. Trust--you know, just want to  
14 be sure that everyone knows that, and I vote  
15 aye on all.

16 CLERK MARTIN: Jackson?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: May I be  
18 excused to explain my vote?

19 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Recognized.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.  
21 First, let me just say before I vote on this  
22 particular item that I thank all of the staff  
23 that have been involved in bringing us to where  
24 we are today, our last full Finance Committee  
25 meeting of this particular term of office, and



1  
2 not only finance staff and city council, but  
3 all staff and members, offices, central office,  
4 my individual staff and bringing us together in  
5 order to move forward to bring about the type  
6 of finances that we need in order to move  
7 forward on all the issues or concerns that  
8 impact the citizens of our great city. And with  
9 that, I vote aye on all.

10 CLERK MARTIN: Koppell?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: To explain  
12 my vote briefly. First of all, Mr. Chairman, I  
13 want to thank you for your courtesy and your  
14 leadership. Always unfailingly polite and  
15 always in good humor, which we have appreciated  
16 very much, and I want to thank the staff. And I  
17 want to say that I've served on the Finance  
18 Committee and before that for many years on the  
19 Ways and Means Committee in Albany, and without  
20 taking away from anybody else because they've  
21 been very capable Finance Committee personnel  
22 that I've worked with in both places. There are  
23 two people who I will remember particularly,  
24 not to take away from anyone else, I'm not  
25 going to mention lots of names, but I do want

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

to thank here on this staff particularly Jeff Rhotas [phonetic] who was incredibly responsive to me. [applause] And members will appreciate what I'm about to say, and that is the person, and there were many good people in Albany in Ways and Means too, but the person who I remember and respect the most happens to be our new budget director Dean Fuleihan, who I worked with for many years. So, with that, thank you Mr. Chairman, and I vote aye.

CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Thank you, Oliver.

CLERK MARTIN: Vann?

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye on all.

CLERK MARTIN: Ferreras?

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS: I vote aye.

CLERK MARTIN: Cabrera?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

CLERK MARTIN: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I just want to say thank you Domenic, you've been a great Chair. I have had the fortune of having two Finance Chairs in my life, the first one being Herb Burman [phonetic] for 11 years, and

1  
2 you Domenic, and I have to say I've been a very  
3 lucky woman. I also want to say I know how it  
4 feels to be term limited, and I know that  
5 everyone who is term limited will do very, very  
6 well as I did when I left the City Council.  
7 Coming back, well, when I'm term limited I hope  
8 I see some of you coming back to the City  
9 Council or maybe you went on to bigger and  
10 better things. This will be my fifth Mayor that  
11 I have worked with. I'm looking forward to  
12 that opportunity. I just want to say to the  
13 Finance staff, you have been great, really  
14 great. Preston, Jeff, whenever I needed you you  
15 were there to speak on the phone to answer our  
16 questions. Scott Crowley, the same goes for  
17 you. We've been very, very lucky and I want to  
18 wish my colleagues the best of luck and I know  
19 we're going to see each other and be in touch,  
20 and thank you to all of you. It has been a  
21 pleasure to work with you for these last four  
22 years. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Thank you,  
24 Karen.

25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Oh, I  
3 vote aye.

4 CLERK MARTIN: Van Bramer?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I just  
6 want to say thank you to Chair Recchia, not  
7 only for his Finance chairmanship before the  
8 legacy of the cultural institutions and  
9 organizations throughout the City. Preston and  
10 Jeff, and really I just want to say thank you  
11 to all of the Council Members who have served.  
12 I look around the room and see that many of you  
13 have actually served for 12 years together and  
14 I think about all the relationships that you  
15 must have and have formed and all the things  
16 you've done 12 years together. There are nine  
17 or 10. I actually counted around the room. And  
18 that's a very special relationship that all of  
19 you share clearly. And I know they'll be more  
20 speeches later, but as one of the newer  
21 members, I just want to thank all of you for  
22 your decade plus of service to the City of New  
23 York and for the legacy that you leave all of  
24 us who will remain. So thank you. And I vote  
25 aye.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Thank you.

3 CLERK MARTIN: Ignizio?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I vote no  
5 on the hotel extender tax and aye on all  
6 others. And thank you to everybody and to this  
7 committee, to my friend Domenic who's done a  
8 great job trying to start on time, and I  
9 appreciate that. And to Tenisha and to this new  
10 guy for the Finance, Mr. Niblick. I look  
11 forward to working with him and meeting him,  
12 and my friends Jeff and Liz [phonetic]. This is  
13 a great family and part of my concern with  
14 what's going on with this Council is that we  
15 ensure it becomes a family yet again, and we'll  
16 hopefully get there with the help everybody in  
17 this room. I look forward to speaking and  
18 working with you in the new year, including  
19 those who are going on to different things.

20 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Thank you,  
21 Council Member.

22 CLERK MARTIN: Oddo?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I vote no on  
24 1204, the hotel extender. Yes, on all. And I  
25 just want to thank by name, Tenisha, for

1  
2 everything that she's done. She'd done a  
3 fabulous job. And Emra [phonetic] for teaching  
4 me as best as anyone could the class share  
5 situation and the equalization in the property  
6 tax bill. I want to say to Domenic for ten  
7 years you've been helping Staten Island. Long  
8 before you were candidate for any other office,  
9 long before you were Finance Chair, you were  
10 once called the Cultural Czar in these halls,  
11 and you helped Staten Island. So, people in  
12 the campaign season could pervert this and warp  
13 that. The truth is the truth. The record is  
14 the record and it's clear you've been a good  
15 friend to me, to the Staten Island delegation  
16 and to Staten Island for a long time. And  
17 lastly, to Lou Fidler, I would have won the  
18 championship, but we had a four-way trade and  
19 we shook on it, and then you pulled out and  
20 made a deal with someone else, and I--

21 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Seems like  
22 things never change.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: And who's  
24 wearing the crown?

25 CLERK MARTIN: Reyna?

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: A moment to  
3 explain my vote.

4 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: Certainly.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: I just wanted  
6 to thank everyone here the Finance staff, many  
7 of whom are not here any longer, many of whom  
8 continue to be here and those that perhaps will  
9 go onto wonderful, better, greater things. I  
10 just wanted to take a moment to say thank you.  
11 Thank you for always taking care of our  
12 communities. For taking care of and looking at  
13 the budget beyond numbers, and thank you for  
14 the leadership that you provided to making sure  
15 that our issues and intentions remain true to  
16 the spirit of why we're all serving in the city  
17 council. I wanted to thank our Chair for his  
18 wonderful erratic behavior to get the job done,  
19 and for him who never says--who never takes no  
20 for an answer. It is why we were able to do a  
21 lot and making sure that this Council continues  
22 to be an institution we can all be proud of,  
23 that continues to create history, and it's been  
24 an honor and a privilege to serve with each and  
25 every one of you. I love you all dearly and

1  
2 merry Christmas and a very happy and blessed  
3 new year. I vote aye on all.

4 CLERK MARTIN: Chair Recchia?

5 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: On 1204A, I  
6 vote no. Everything else I vote aye. That  
7 concludes today's hearing. I want to thank all  
8 my colleagues. It's been a great 12 years. I  
9 want to thank you all, and this concludes  
10 today's hearing, my last Finance hearing. God  
11 bless you all. Have a happy and healthy  
12 holiday season.

13 [applause]

14 CHAIRPERSON RECCHIA: We'll hold the  
15 vote open for 10 minutes.

16 CLERK MARTIN: Council Member Mealy?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye on  
18 all.

19 CLERK MARTIN: Final vote on the  
20 Committee on Finance, is all items have been  
21 adopted by a vote of 16 in the affirmative,  
22 zero in the negative and no abstentions, with  
23 the exception of Introduction 1204A, which has  
24 been adopted by a vote of 13 in the  
25



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

affirmative, three in the negative and no  
abstentions. Thank you.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is no interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 01/08/2014