

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING OF THE
NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL

----- X

December 9, 2021
Start: 2:19 p.m.
Recess: 6:00 p.m.

HELD AT: Hybrid Hearing -
Council Chambers City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne Adams
Alicka Ampry-Samuel
Diana Ayala
Inez D. Barron
Joseph Borelli
Justin. L Brannan
Selvena Brooks-Powers
Tiffany Cabán
Fernando Cabrera
David Carr
Robert Cornegy, Jr.
Darma Diaz
Ruben Diaz
Eric Dinowitz
Daniel Dromm
Mathieu Eugene
Oswald Feliz

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

James F. Gennaro
Vanessa L. Gibson
Mark Gjonaj
Barry S. Grodenchik
Robert F. Holden
Ben Kallos
Peter Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Farah Louis
Alan N. Maisel
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Francisco Moya
Bill Perkins
Keith Powers
Antonio Reynoso
Kevin Riley
Carlina Rivera
Ydanis Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Mark S. Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
Peter Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Inna Vernikov
Kalman Yeger
Laurie Cumbo

Reverend Paul Daniels
Cathedral of Saint John the Divine

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good afternoon,
3 everyone. Welcome to today's New York City Council
4 Stated Meeting. At this time would all panelists
5 please turn on your videos? To minimize disruption,
6 please place electronic devices to vibrate or silent.
7 Thank you. We are ready to begin.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Ladies and gentleman, at
9 this time, please place all electronic devices, all
10 electronic devices, to vibrate. Thank you for your
11 cooperation. Madam Majority Leader?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Good afternoon and
13 welcome to the Stated Meeting of December 9th, 2021.
14 I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo, and I'd like to
15 thank you for joining us. If you'd like to follow
16 along, the agenda for today's meeting is posted on
17 our website.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Please join us for the
19 Pledge Allegiance.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: I pledge allegiance to
22 the flag of the United States of America and to the
23 Republic for which it stands, one nation under God,
24 indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Roll call.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?
COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?
COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?
COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?
COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present. Blessed
and present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brannan?
COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers? Cabán?
COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera? Carr? Chin?
COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?
COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Presente.
COUNCIL CLERK: Darma Diaz?
COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Ruben Diaz?
COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Presente.
COUNCIL CLERK: Dinowitz?
COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Present
COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Present.
3 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?
4 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.
5 COUNCIL CLERK: Feliz?
6 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Presente.
7 COUNCIL CLERK: Gennaro?
8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.
9 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?
10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.
11 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj? Grodenchik?
12 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.
13 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?
14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.
15 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?
16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
17 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo? Koslowitz?
18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Koslowitz?
20 Lander?
21 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.
22 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?
23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.
24 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?
25 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Powers?

COUNCIL CLERK: Louis?
COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel? Menchaca?
COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.
COUNCIL CLERK: Miller? Moya? Perkins?
COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso? Riley?
COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?
COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?
COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?
COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.
COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?
COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich? Vallone?
COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.
COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Vernikov? Yeger?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli? Cumbo?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Here.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much.

10 We will now have today's invocation which will be
11 delivered by the Reverend Paul Daniels, Spiritual
12 Leader at the Cathedral of Saint John the Divine
13 located at 1047 Amsterdam Avenue and Manhattan. We
14 welcome you.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All stand. Please
16 Rise.

17 REVEREND PAUL DANIELS: Let us pray. Oh
18 God of Life in whom we live, move and have our being.
19 We stand before your singular truth and justice as
20 mere mortals. Often indeed we seek after the right,
21 the good, the light, and often indeed we fail. And
22 so we stand before your singular truth and justice
23 with ready hearts and minds that know the right, the
24 good, and the light, come through the power of your
25 free grace and love alone. Give to all gathered here

1 today the wisdom of humility, the spirit of justice,
2 and a hunger for your singular truth and justice.

3
4 May the eyes of our leaders in this city be turned to
5 the suffering of its people, their hearts attuned to
6 empathy, and their minds fixed on the transformation
7 of pestilence into power, poverty into plenty, and
8 justice into peace. In your one holy and gracious
9 name we pray, amen.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much
11 Reverend Paul Daniels. We so appreciate your
12 presence here today. If you would hold for one
13 moment, because I would now like to ask Council
14 Member Mark Levine to spread the invocation onto the
15 record and to let us know a little bit more about how
16 he knows you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam
18 Majority Leader, and most of all, thank you Reverend
19 Paul Daniels for your presence here today, for your
20 inspirational words. I have the honor to represent
21 your home base, the Cathedral of Saint John the
22 Divine in New York City in the heart of Morningside
23 Heights, and I want to share with everyone that you
24 are currently an assistant clergy member there at the
25 Cathedral. You grew up in Raleigh, North Carolina.

1 Reverend Daniels was a parishioner of Saint Ambrose
2 Episcopal Church and was ordained in the Episcopal
3 Church of the Good Shepherd in Raleigh, North
4 Carolina on December 12th, 2020. The Reverend
5 Daniels holds a Bachelor of Arts in Philosophy from
6 Morehouse College. He then became a fellow at the
7 Global Partnerships of the Episcopal Church for two
8 years in Grahamstown, South Africa. This was
9 followed by the Reverend Daniels pursuing a Masters
10 of Divinity from Yale University. Reverend Daniels
11 has been influenced by the writings of Howard
12 Thurman, a renowned scholar who was involved in the
13 Civil Rights movement and served as a mentor to the
14 Reverend Doctor Martin Luther King. Reverend Daniels
15 is currently pursuing a PHD in Systematic Theology at
16 Fordham University and his research interest live at
17 the intersections of Black Theology, Christian
18 Mysticism, and Black Critical Philosophy. For fun he
19 loves to read, take long walks, and he enjoys
20 cooking. Thank you again Reverend Daniels for your
21 service to our community and for your presence here
22 today. Thank you. Back to you, Matt. Do I need to
23 say the official wording? Yes, I do. I would like
24

1
2 to make a motion for unanimous consent to spread the
3 invocation in full upon the record.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much
5 Council Member Levine and to Reverend Daniels.
6 Aren't you glad you stood around to hear your
7 accolades? And I also want to note that you also
8 have a Spellman [sic] sister here in Council Member
9 Adrienne Adams. We thank you so much for being here,
10 and we thank you for sharing your energy and your
11 talent and your prayer with us today. Thank you so
12 much. Thank you so much Council Member Levine. We
13 will now have the adoption of minutes by Council
14 Member Mark Treyger.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I make a motion
16 that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of November
17 10th, 2021 be adopted as printed.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Messages and papers
19 from the Mayor.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Communication from
22 City, County, and Borough Offices?

23 COUNCIL CLERK: M349 Certification of
24 Election of Tiffany Cabán, new Council Member 22nd
25 District.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,
3 printed, and filed, and I want to congratulate
4 Council Member Tiffany Cabán for joining us today at
5 the first Stated Meeting of the City Council.
6 Congratulations, Council Member Cabán. Welcome.
7 Very happy to have you here.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: M350 Certification of
9 election of Inna Vernikov, new Council Member 48th
10 District.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,
12 printed, and filed, and we want to welcome Council
13 Member Inna Vernikov to her first Stated Meeting of
14 the New York City Council. Congratulations, Council
15 Member.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: M-- excuse me. M351,
17 certification of election of David M. Carr, new
18 Council Member 50th District.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered,
20 printed, and filed, and I'm really, really happy to
21 congratulate someone I've known a long time, Council
22 Member David Carr, his election to the New York City
23 Council. Welcome, Council Member Carr, to your first
24 Stated Meeting of the New York City Council.

COUNCIL CLERK: M352 Certification of November 2nd, 2021, General Election for City Council Members.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered, printed, and filed.

COUNCIL CLERK: M353 New York City's debt incurring power.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered, printed, and filed.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Petitions and communications.

COUNCIL CLERK: M354 and 355 Resignation of Steven Matteo as Minority Leader, and appointment of Joseph C. Borelli as new Minority Leader.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered, printed, and filed. And congratulations to my friend, Minority Leader Joe Borelli.

COUNCIL CLERK: M356 Resignation of Steven Matteo as Council Member 50th District.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Received, ordered, printed, and filed. We're going to miss Steve. He's a great guy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Land Use Call-ups.

COUNCIL CLERK: M357.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I'm going to ask that
3 the clerk take a roll call vote on today's Land Use
4 Call-ups. Remember, members who are both here online
5 and in-person, we are just at this moment voting on
6 Land Use Call-ups. So, clerk, if you could take the
7 role.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye on all.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Adams
11 votes aye on all. Ampry-Samuel?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ampry-
14 Samuel votes aye. Ayala?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ayala
17 votes aye. Barron?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brannan?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Present

23 [sic].

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabán?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Aye.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 15

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Cabán
3 votes aye. Cabrera? Carr?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Aye.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Carr votes
6 aye. Chin?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Chin votes
9 aye. Cornegy?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Darma Diaz?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Darma Diaz
14 votes aye. Ruben Diaz?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Si.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Dinowitz?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Council Member
18 Dinowitz vote aye. Dromm?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Dromm vote
21 aye. Eugene?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Feliz?

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Aye on all.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: I vote aye.

UNIDENTIFIED: [speaking Spanish]

COUNCIL CLERK: Gracias. Gennaro?

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gibson?

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gjonaj?

COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Gjonaj
votes aye. Grodenchik?

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Grodenchik
votes yes. Holden?

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Holden
votes aye. Kallos?

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Kallos
vote aye. Koo?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Koslowitz
votes aye. Lander?

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Lander
3 votes aye. Levin?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Levin
6 votes aye. Levine?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Levine
9 votes aye. Louis?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Louis
12 votes aye. Maisel?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Maisel
15 votes yes. Menchaca?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Menchaca
18 votes aye. Miller? Council Member Miller? Moya?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Perkins?
21 Powers?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Reynoso?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Riley?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 18

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: I vote aye.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Rivera

6 votes aye. Rodriguez?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Rodriguez

9 votes aye. Rose?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Rose votes

12 aye. Rosenthal?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: COUNCIL MEMBER Rosenthal

15 votes aye. Salamanca?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Treyger?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Ulrich?

20 Vallone?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Van Bramer?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Van Bramer

25 votes aye on all. Vernikov?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 19

2 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: I vote aye.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Vernikov votes aye on
4 all. Thank you. Yeger?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Yeger
7 votes aye. Council Member Brooks-Powers on Land Use
8 Call-ups?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers votes aye.
11 Thank you. Borelli?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Borelli
14 votes aye. Cumbo?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Aye.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Today's Land Use
19 Call-ups have a vote of 47 in the affirmative and
20 zero negative.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Council Member Gjonaj?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We will now have
23 communication from Speaker Corey Johnson.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon. Happy
25 Thursday. Welcome to today's Stated Meeting. We

1
2 have a very busy agenda ahead of us today, but before
3 we delve into the agenda, I'd like to remind all
4 members that masks are required to be worn throughout
5 the Stated Meeting, even while speaking. Today, we
6 are voting on 29 bills and a resolution to help us
7 tackle some of the issue we face as a city, including
8 a bill to allow non-citizen New Yorkers to vote in
9 municipal elections. While across our nation voting
10 participation is being challenged, here in New York
11 City we are expanding it. Our city will become the
12 largest municipality in the nation that will allow
13 non-citizens to vote in local elections. This
14 afternoon we're voting on several bills regarding
15 traffic safety measures, another one allowing the
16 Civilian Complaint Review Board to initiate its own
17 complaints against members of the NYPD where alleged
18 misconduct has occurred. Before we go any further,
19 we just did it, but it's important to do it again. I
20 want to extend a special welcome to our newest
21 Council Members, Council Member Tiffany Cabán,
22 Council Member Inna Vernikov, and Council Member
23 David Carr. They were sworn in last week, and today
24 they are taking part in their first Stated Meeting.
25 Council Member Cabán represents District 22 in

1
2 Queens. Council Member Vernikov represents District
3 48 in Brooklyn, and Council Member Carr represents
4 District 50 in Staten Island. Congratulations again
5 to all three of you. We are really grateful that you
6 are here today. Welcome. As we head into the winter
7 months, I want to ask everyone to remain vigilant as
8 we continue to battle COVID-19, especially in light
9 of the new variant. Omicron has arrived in New York
10 City. As with any of the previous variants, it
11 brings concern and worry. We must recommit ourselves
12 to ensuring we do all we can to fight this pandemic.
13 As of December 8th we have lost 34,925 New Yorkers to
14 COVID-19. It is critical that we keep wearing masks
15 in public spaces, stay home if you feel sick, and to
16 get vaccinated if you haven't already, and if you are
17 vaccinated, please get your booster shot. As I do at
18 every Stated Meeting, I'd like to a moment to
19 acknowledge some of the losses we have endured as a
20 city, Alvin Suriel Assistant Chief of FDNY EMS died
21 on Tuesday, December 7th. He became the 264th member
22 of the FDNY to succumb to an illness related to the
23 9/11 terrorist attack. He was a 32-year veteran of
24 the New York City Emergency Medical Service
25 Department, and he was only 52 years old. On

1 December 3rd we lost probationary fire fighter
2 Vincent Malvo [sp?]. He was at the FDNY training
3 academy when he suffered a medical emergency.
4 Probationary fire fighters Malvo was rushed to Harlem
5 Hospital where he sadly died. He was only 31 years
6 old. On November 26th we lost Stephen Sondheim, a
7 Broadway legend who transformed the American stage
8 musical. Born in Manhattan, Sondheim wrote the
9 lyrics for Westside Story and Gypsy. During the 70s
10 and 80s he created musicals such as Sweeney Todd,
11 Company, which I saw the other day-- it was fabulous--
12 - Follies, and Into the Woods. Sondheim wrote the
13 music and the lyrics for more than a dozen Broadway
14 shows. He was 91 years old. We also lost a member of
15 our Council family. We mourn the death of Retired
16 Sergeant at Arms Gerry Steffarie [sp?]. Gerry was an
17 exemplary worker and retired from the Council in
18 2012. He is survived by his two daughters Julianne
19 and Diana and his five grandchildren. If we could
20 all rise and have a moment of silence for everyone
21 that we have lost.

22 [moment of silence]

23
24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. Okay, now
25 jumping into our docket for the day. The Council

1 will be voting on the following Finance items,
2 Introduction 1520A, sponsored by Council Member and
3 Finance Chair Danny Dromm, will require the
4 Department of Finance to report on the operations of
5 the Parking Violations Bureau. Introduction number
6 2458, sponsored by Council Member Dromm, would
7 authorize the Lowe East Side bid and the Hudson Yards
8 bid to increase their annual assessments. We have a
9 transparency resolution and five affordable housing
10 property tax exemptions, Hong Ning Senior Housing in
11 Council Member Margaret Chin's district, Johanna One
12 in Council Member Bill Perkins' district, 250 West
13 HDFC in Council Member Perkins' district, 1018 East
14 163rd Street in Council Member Rafael Salamanca's
15 district, and Seaview Estates in Council Member
16 Debbie Rose's district. The Council will be voting
17 on the following Land Use items: Citywide hotels text
18 amendment as modified would establish a special
19 permit for new hotels and for enlargements where
20 hotels are permitted as-of-right. The Council will
21 modify the vesting provisions for vacant sites in the
22 Theater District. Also included are the site
23 selections of a 572-seat primary school in Council
24 Member Paul Vallone's district, a 576-seat primary
25

1 school in Council Member David Carr's district, an
2 801-seat high school in Council Member Daneek
3 Miller's district, a new supportive space for the
4 Hungerford School in Council Member Debbie Rose's
5 district. Also in Council Member Rose's district,
6 Stapleton Beacon Article 11 disposition which will
7 facilitate the construction of 359 affordable units.
8 Starrett-Lehigh High in terminal warehouse building
9 rezoning in my district as modified will expand the
10 special West Chelsea district and will facilitate the
11 adaptive reuse of these existing buildings. Our
12 modification will be to reduce the floor area allowed
13 for large retail use. 506th Third Avenue as modified
14 will facilitate a five-story commercial development
15 and commercial enlargement at a nearby property in
16 Council Member Brad Landers' district, and the
17 Council will modify the MIH options. Bed-Stuy East
18 and Weeksville Mosaic UDAP and Article 11 tax
19 exemption to facilitate the development of 46
20 affordable cooperative home ownership units in
21 Council Member Robert Cornegy and Alicka Ampry-
22 Samuels districts. One White Avenue industrial
23 business incentive area will facilitate the
24 development of a new eight-story commercial and
25

1 industrial building in Council Member Steve Levin's
2 district. 40-20 83rd Street rezoning will facilitate
3 a new nine-story residential building with 163 units,
4 up to 49 permanently affordable in Council Member
5 Danny Dromm's district. Beach [sic] 79th Self-
6 Storage in Council Member Selvena Brooks-Powers'
7 district. 31st Street and Haight [sp?] Avenue
8 rezoning will facilitate three new mixed-use
9 buildings with approximately 287 dwelling units, 69
10 of which will be affordable in Council Member Tiffany
11 Cabán's district. And finally, we'll be voting on
12 the withdrawal of the New York City Law Department
13 office lease from our calendar. Moving on to our
14 legislative agenda. I'll be brief since we have a
15 lot to get through today. Introduction Number 2141A
16 sponsored by Council Member Carlina Rivera will
17 remove references to clinically outdated and
18 stigmatizing terms once used to refer to disabilities
19 in our laws, and instead use intellectual disability
20 or intellectual and developmental disability. I want
21 to thank Sarah Lisk [sp?] from the staff. Also out
22 of the Committee on Mental Health, Disabilities and
23 Addiction, we're voting on Introduction 2442A
24 sponsored by Council Member Diana Ayala who is also
25

1
2 the Chair of the Committee. This bill will require
3 the Mayor to establish an Office of Community Mental
4 Health within the Executive Office of the Mayor, and
5 again, I want to thank Sarah Lisk. From the
6 Committee on Health, Introduction number 1625
7 sponsored by-- 1625B sponsored by Council Member
8 Carlina Rivera, will require the Department of Health
9 and Mental Hygiene to make different forms of
10 nonsurgical contraception available at city health
11 sites. I want to thank Harboni Ahujah [sp?]. Our
12 next bill in Introduction Number 1621A sponsored by
13 Council Member Danny Dromm, and out of the Committee
14 on Governmental Operations, this bill will establish
15 a committee to examine the City's position on nuclear
16 disarmament, and this is related to recognizing the
17 City as a nuclear weapons-free zone. I want to thank
18 CJ Murray. Related to that bill we have Resolution
19 976A also sponsored by Council Member Dromm out of
20 the Committee on Civil Service and Labor calling on
21 the Comptroller to instruct our pension funds to
22 divest from companies involved in the production and
23 maintenance of nuclear weapons. I want to thank
24 Elizabeth Arzt from the Committee on Governmental
25 Operations. We also have Introduction Number 2459A

1 sponsored by Council Member Oswald Feliz. This bill
2 will make the Mayor's Office of Information Privacy a
3 charter-mandated office. I want to thank CJ Murray.
4 Today we have two bills from the Kimeon [sic]
5 veterans, Introduction Number 2354A sponsored by
6 Council Member Eric Dinowitz, the Chair of the
7 Committee, will expand the Veterans Advisory Board
8 from 11 members to 13 members. The second bill from
9 the Committee on Veterans is Introduction Number 479A
10 sponsored by Council Member Danny Dromm. This bill
11 will extend all city benefits and services to
12 veterans who have bad discharge papers due to their
13 sexual orientation or gender identity or expression.
14 From the staff I want to thank Bianca Vitale for
15 those two bills. Moving on. Out of the Committee on
16 Contracts, Introduction Number 1624A sponsored by
17 Council Member Ben Kallos will expand the data
18 included in the City's Minority and Women's Business
19 Enterprise quarterly report in order to provide
20 additional information on enterprise vendors. From
21 the staff I want to thank Alex Paulenoff and Leah
22 Skrzypiec. We also have Introduction Number 2130A
23 sponsored by Council Member Helen Rosenthal out of
24 the Committee on Consumer Affairs. This bill will
25

1 help connect New Yorker's information on student loan
2 forgiveness, and from the staff I want to thank
3 Stephanie Jones, Leah Skrzypiec and Noah Meixler.

4
5 Next up we have two bills from the Committee on Women
6 and Gender Equity. First, Introduction Number 1085B,
7 sponsored by Council Member Mark Treyger, will
8 establish a two-year long pilot program to provide
9 legal representation and domestic violence survivors
10 in divorce proceedings. And second, Introduction
11 2372B, sponsored by Council Member Carlina Rivera,
12 will extend the statute of limitations for a civil
13 action alleging a gender-motivated act of violence
14 from seven years to nine years. And from the staff I
15 want to thank Smita Deshmukh for those two bills.

16 Out of the Committee on Civil Service and Labor and
17 sponsored by its Chair, Council Member Daneek Miller,
18 we have Introduction Number 2454. This bill will
19 meliorate the free rider effect by removing certain
20 benefits that public sector unions are required to
21 provide to non-members. From the staff I want to
22 thank Bianca Vitale. We have one bill from our
23 Committee on Housing and Buildings, Introduction
24 Number 2309A, sponsored by Council Member Ben Kallos,
25 will require applicants seeking to rent out rooms in

1 a Class A dwelling unit for fewer than 30 consecutive
2 days as short term rentals to register with the
3 Mayor's Office of Special Enforcement and obtain a
4 registration number before being permitted to rent
5 out rooms. Booking services will be required to
6 verify the short term rental registration number for
7 any accommodation before listing it on their service.
8

9 And from the staff I want to thank Louis Cholden-
10 Brown. Moving on and out of the Committee on General
11 Welfare, we also have two other bills. First up,
12 Introduction Number 147B, sponsored by Council Member
13 Steve Levin who is the Chair of the Committee, and it
14 will provide transparency around which clients are
15 selected or ejected for supportive housing. The
16 second bill, Introduction 2176A, also sponsored by
17 Chair Levin. This bill will require the Department
18 of Social Services to create a written notice for
19 supportive housing residents of their rights pursuant
20 to various state and local laws. From the staff I
21 want to thank Aminta Kilawan. We got it done, Steve.

22 Next, we have three bills from the Committee on
23 Environmental Protection. First, Introduction Number
24 2425A sponsored by Rafael Salamanca, and it will
25 require the Department of Environmental Protection to

1 assign Borough Commissioners. From the staff I want
2 to thank Samara Swanston and Kris Sartori. Next,
3 Introduction 2460A, sponsored by Council Member James
4 Gennaro, will authorize the New York City Mayors
5 Office of Environmental Protection-- of Environmental
6 Remediation, excuse me, the authority to issue civil
7 penalties against parties who violate program
8 requirements. From the staff, again, Samara Swanston
9 and Kris Sartori. Introduction Number 51A, sponsored
10 by Council Member Bill Perkins, will require a study
11 on the installation of geothermal energy systems on
12 government-owned sites. Again, Samara and Kris. And
13 next, we're voting on Introduction Number 2366A from
14 the Committee on Parks and Recreation, sponsored by
15 the Chair of that committee, Council Member Peter
16 Koo. It will require the Department of Parks and
17 Recreation to conduct risk and health inspections of
18 street trees, and I want to thank Kris Sartori and
19 Patrick Mulvihill. Moving on, from the Committee on
20 Fire and Emergency Management, we have Introduction
21 Number 1949A sponsored by Majority Leader Laurie
22 Cumbo. This bill will require New York City
23 Emergency Management to ensure the periodic review of
24 all citywide emergency plans coordinated by the
25

1 Department, and I want to thank Joshua Kingsley and
2 William Hungatch [sp?]. Next up we're voting on four
3 bills out of the Committee on Transportation,
4 Introduction Number 2417A sponsored by Council Member
5 Bob Holden, and it'll prohibit the sale or
6 distribution of products designed to conceal or
7 obscure license plates. I want to thank Jessica
8 Steinberg Alpin [sp?]. This afternoon we're voting
9 on Introduction Number 2201A sponsored by Council
10 Member Carlina Rivera. This bill will permit owners
11 and operators of motorcycles to digitally provide
12 photographic evidence that parking was paid for at
13 the time of an alleged parking violation. Again, I
14 want to thank Jessica. Introduction Number 9A,
15 sponsored by Council Member Inez Barron, will require
16 the Department of Transportation to install traffic
17 control devices at intersections near schools.
18 Again, I want to thank Jessica. And to improve
19 traffic safety, the last bill we're voting on is
20 Introduction Number 1724A, sponsored by Council
21 Member Ben Kallos. This bill will authorize the
22 creation of a program for installing and operating
23 cameras on school bus arms, school bus stop arms,
24 that are capable of photographing drivers who
25

1 illegally pass a school bus, and I want to thank
2 Elliott Lynn. From the Committee on Public Safety,
3 we have two bills. First, Introduction Number 2297A,
4 sponsored by Council Member Francisco Moya. This
5 bill prohibits the NYPD from hiring cops that have
6 been fired for misconduct. The second bill is
7 Introduction Number 2440A sponsored by Council Member
8 Adrienne Adams, who is the Chair of our Committee on
9 Public Safety. Currently, the Civilian Complaint
10 Review Board is largely limited to conducting
11 investigations of police misconduct in response to
12 complaints filed by members of the public. This bill
13 will give the CCRB the power to initiate its own
14 complaints against members of the NYPD that allege
15 misconduct involving excessive use of force, bias-
16 based policing and racial profiling, discourtesy or
17 offensive language. And from the staff, for these
18 two bills, I want to thank Joshua Kingsley. The
19 right to vote is fundamental to a modern functioning
20 democracy. Today, we are making history here in
21 these chambers by expanding the right to vote to more
22 than 800,000 immigrant New Yorkers who have not yet
23 attained US citizenship. New York has been built by
24 immigrants, and we are what we are today because of
25

1
2 them. I am proud to voting on legislation that will
3 give the right to vote to green card holders and
4 people who are authorized to work in the United
5 States of America. Immigrants pay taxes. They use
6 city services. Their kids go to our public schools.
7 They are part of our community, and they deserve a
8 say in local government. Out of the Committee on
9 Governmental Operations, Introduction Number 1867,
10 sponsored by my friend Council Member Ydanis
11 Rodriguez who has worked so hard on this for so long.
12 We'll get this bill across the finish line and will
13 create a new system of non-citizen voting in New York
14 City. a non-citizen New Yorker will be eligible to
15 vote under this bill if they are either a lawful
16 permanent resident or authorized to work in the
17 United States, have been a resident of New York City
18 for at least 30 consecutive days, and meet all the
19 qualifications for registering to vote under the New
20 York State Election Law, other than US citizenship.
21 Any person who satisfied these criteria will be able
22 to register as a municipal voter with the New York
23 City Board of Elections. Once registered, they'll be
24 able to vote in any primary, general, or special
25 election for Mayor, Comptroller, Public Advocate,

1
2 Borough President, or City Council Member. They will
3 also be able to vote on any local ballot initiatives.
4 And from the staff I want to thank Jackie Bazillis
5 [sp?] and CJ Murray [sp?]. That is our very long
6 agenda today, Madam Majority Leader. I want to thank
7 you for presiding as always, and I turn it back to
8 you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Speaker
10 Johnson. We will now move into discussion of General
11 Orders. I'd like to first recognize Council Member
12 Gennaro.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you, Madam
14 Leader. I'll be brief in lieu of the long agenda.
15 Speaking on my bill, Intro 2460A. On Earth Day in
16 2009 the City Council passed Local Law 27 known as
17 the New York City Brownfield and Community
18 Revitalization Act, which I sponsored, that created
19 the only municipal Brownsfield Cleaning Program in
20 the United States. We created that program because
21 80 percent of New York City Brownfield sites do not
22 qualify for the New York State Brownfields program,
23 and since the program started in 2010, 750 projects
24 have been cleaned. More than 1,600 units of
25 affordable housing have been built, and businesses of

1 all kinds have been opened. Most of the projects
2 have been done in communities that have suffered the
3 most environmental injustice. Whenever some
4 developers have, you know, taken liberty with the
5 program. The city needs an enforcement mechanism in
6 the form of civil penalties to make sure all
7 participants in the program [inaudible] fully, and
8 thereby maintain the integrity of the City
9 Brownsfield Clean-up Program. This bill gets that
10 done. I'd like to thank in a special way Speaker
11 Johnson, Jason Goldman, Jeff Baker, Samara Swanston,
12 Kris Sartori, my Legislative Director [inaudible] and
13 Mark McIntyre [sp?] from the Administration who is
14 the Director of the Office of Environmental
15 Remediation who worked on this with me back in 2009.
16 He's still there. He heads that program. I want to
17 thank him for this partnership, and thank you Madam
18 Leader.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. We'll
21 now have Council Member Ben Kallos.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I've been a
23 tenant most of my life and I'm tired of having to
24 compete with tourists for housing in our city.
25 Housing should be for New Yorkers. Hotels should be

1 tourists, for tourists. It's as simple as that.
2
3 There were 37,000 units on AirBnB and 20,000 of them
4 are currently listed as entire homes, which is not
5 allowed in buildings with three or more units under
6 state law. There are many bad actors out there, like
7 one who rented apartments across 35 different
8 buildings to tens of thousands of guests for over
9 55,441 nights. That's more than a century of housing
10 kept off the market. It is possible that many hosts
11 don't even know that what they're doing is illegal.
12 Today we are voting to pass a law to require every
13 host to register their units and every platform to
14 register with the City. Through the registration
15 process, hosts will learn whether it is legal to rent
16 their units. Units that are rent-regulated, city
17 subsidized, affordable housing, or a NYCHA public
18 housing won't be allowed. Market-rate rentals would
19 be able to register and list their units. Property
20 owners would get notice when this happens.
21 Cooperatives, condominiums, and building owners will
22 be able to opt out of any having any units listed.
23 Single family homeowners would be free to register
24 and list a spare room. By passing this legislation
25 we actively respond to New York City's affordable

1 housing crisis a little better by hopefully bringing
2 as many as 20,000 apartments back onto the market,
3 many of which might even be affordable. This morning
4 we had 45,780 people wake up at our shelters, 14,773
5 of them were children, 11,168 adults as part of 8,500
6 families. We could end family homeless with just
7 half the units that are coming back. With only
8 16,714 single adults in the shelter system we could
9 house every homeless New Yorker in these soon to be
10 vacant Airbnb units. I'd like to conclude by
11 thanking Mike McKee [sp?] and Tenants Pact, the
12 Coalition Against Illegal Hotels and it's working
13 group, in particular Tom Caylor [sp?] and Mary Cox
14 [sp?]. Many colleagues who have been provided
15 insight into this legislation including to but not
16 limited to Senator Liz Kruger and Council Member
17 Carlina Rivera. My counsel Wilfredo Lopez and Louis
18 Cholden-Brown, we couldn't have done it without you.
19 Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Council
22 Member Kallos. We'll now have Council Member Koo.
23 Council Member Koo?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yes, I'm here.
25 Thank you, Majority Leader. Today I ask my

1
2 colleagues to join me in supporting Intro 2366A, a
3 bill that takes a huge step towards protecting our
4 city's most important natural resources, our trees.
5 Too often do our constituents call 311 to report
6 damaged, unhealthy, and dangerous trees only to watch
7 them fall during the next severe storm due to the
8 city's inaction. Intro. 2366A will address this by
9 requiring the Parks Department to more regularly
10 conduct risk and health inspections of our street
11 trees so issues can be found earlier on. It will
12 also provide more transparency as to how our city's
13 trees are inspected. More importantly, this bill
14 will finally give us answers as to what happens to
15 our 311 complaints. Parks will be required to report
16 on the number of trees referred for inspection each
17 year. How many are actually inspected and report on
18 the results of those inspections? All of this
19 information will also be maintained on the map posted
20 on their website. Ultimately, this bill is about
21 increasing governmental transparency, keeping our
22 residents safe, and protecting our urban canopy so
23 that it can be around for generations to come. I
24 hope you will join me in voting yes on this bill.
25 Thank you, Kris, Patrick, Chima [sp?], and Monica,

1
2 Bret [inaudible], Jeff Baker, Jason, and Speaker
3 Johnson, along with my own staff [inaudible]. Thank
4 you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much
6 Council Member Koo. We'll now have Council Member
7 Brooks-Powers.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
9 and good afternoon. I'd like to convey my support for
10 Intro. 1625. I'm proud of the Council's efforts to
11 broaden and protect New Yorker's access to safe and
12 effective long-term contraception. I would like to
13 also speak on a bill that I have had the privilege of
14 introducing with Councilwoman Carlina Rivera, Intro
15 2372 which will create a two-year look-back window
16 for the Gender-motivated Violence Act so that cases
17 where the statute of limitations has expired can be
18 reopened. Victims of gender-based violence face
19 enormous pressure to stay silent in the wake of their
20 abuse. Without support from others they can feel
21 alone and the pandemic has only exacerbated that
22 isolation. Our legal system must recognize this
23 reality. All survivors deserve to have their voices
24 heard on their terms, but far too often they're
25 stonewalled by an expired statute of limitations.

1
2 With this new two-year look-back window, countless
3 others will finally be able to come forward. Justice
4 delayed is justice denied. I am so glad to say that
5 when this Council passes Intro. 2372 today, justice
6 will be delivered. Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much
8 Council Member Brooks-Powers. We'll now have Council
9 Member Mark Gjonaj.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you,
11 Majority Leader. At this time, I request that we
12 consider Intro. 1867A as a separate question from the
13 remainder of the General Orders Calendar.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: It's automatic.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So moved.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you
17 Majority Leader. Before I begin to make a motion, I
18 just want to first thank Corey Johnson, our Speaker,
19 the Council Staff, the Majority Leader and all that
20 have been very helpful in this process. With that
21 being said, I wish it wasn't me that was doing this,
22 because too often when we think of immigration and
23 immigrant issues, we don't think it's a white issue.
24 It's an [inaudible] issue. Immigration impacts all
25 races, all colors, all faiths, but today I stand

1 before you to make a motion that hopefully will give
2 the cover of so many of my colleagues that have
3 concerns about the current bill in its current form.
4 I hope they find the strength to be honest with
5 themselves and do right by their conscious as we
6 discuss this. This is no way is a motion to defeat
7 the bill that's being proposed. This is so that we
8 can make the bill better. And when we think of the
9 responsibilities of elected officials that we are,
10 this is the responsible course that we're supposed to
11 be taking. Irresponsible would be rubber stamping.
12 Irresponsible would be voting on a bill that you're
13 not completely informed about. Irresponsible would be
14 allowing this bill in its current form to have
15 unintended consequences. On an annual basis we issue
16 1.1 million green cards. So when we talk about the
17 bill and those that will have the right and the
18 privilege to vote, it's not about the 800,000 to a
19 million that currently call New York City home. This
20 also in the future will include a potential 1.1
21 million new green card holders. Mr. Speaker, Madam
22 Majority Leader, I share with you as a son of
23 immigrants. My parents immigrated here in 1968, June
24 12th. Twenty-two years later they became American
25

1
2 citizens. In speaking to my mom yesterday and today
3 about this bill, she shared with me the pride that
4 she had, how she went and bought a new dress, how my
5 father who is no longer with me went and bought a new
6 suit, took family members as they went through the
7 process, and it was one of the proudest days in their
8 lives.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: If I may, my
11 grandmother--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing]
13 Please conclude.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: became a citizen
15 at the age of 80, after living here for 40 years.
16 And my mother was the interpreter, and when she was
17 asked questions to allow her this privilege, the
18 person doing the interview asked, "Do you love this
19 country enough to fight for it?" And she said yes.
20 "Do you love it enough to go to war for it?" And my
21 grandmother said, "I am 80 years old, I don't have
22 the strength to go to war, but I can make food for
23 the military that would go to war." And she said it
24 proudly. She is no longer with me.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
3 Member.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: At this time, I
5 make a motion to recommit Intro. 1867A to the
6 Committee on Government Operations, not to kill the
7 bill, but hopefully for reconsideration that will
8 emphasize at a minimum on the 30 days residence
9 requirement, to make that hopefully something more
10 acceptable, such as a resident for one year and one
11 day before they're--

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Council
13 Member Gjonaj, just to--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: offered this
15 privilege.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
17 Member Gjonaj.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I just want to talk
19 about process for a moment, and Madam Majority Leader
20 [inaudible].

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We're going to have
22 a moment of pause.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Council Member Gjonaj's
24 made a motion to recommit. The amendment process is
25 separate from the motion to recommit. So at first,

1 we will debate this motion to recommit. It'll be a
2 debate on the floor on his motion. Once that is over
3 with and everyone who wants to speak can speak, then
4 we'll have a roll call vote on that motion to
5 recommit. I am voting no on the motion to recommit,
6 but that is the process where we're at. Is that
7 correct?
8

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Correct.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: So, is there-- Madam
11 Majority Leader, is there anyone else who wants to
12 debate Council Member Gjonaj's motion to recommit?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member
14 Yeger?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very
16 much, Madam. I serve on the Government Operations
17 Committee as I have for the last four years, and we
18 heard this bill a number of months ago, and it was
19 voted out of Committee this week. As members of this
20 Council know, there was also a letter sent by a
21 substantial number of the members of this Council, I
22 think the number exceeds 20, raising several
23 questions about the bill, not merely questions like I
24 raised that it's unconstitutional under state law.
25 It's very clear, and we'll discuss that later. But

1 questions about how the bill would operate. For
2 example, does the Board of Elections have enough
3 money to do this? Is the Board of Elections prepared
4 to do this? Questions about how the registration
5 system would work with respect to the 30 days,
6 whether 30 days is too short. Should it be longer?
7 Should it be 60 days? Should it be year? And that
8 letter having been sent this week, here we are today
9 and it's still on the floor, and the issue before us
10 is really just sending it back to the committee. Let
11 the committee have the bill back so that the
12 information can be brought into the committee so that
13 the bill, if necessary, can have a few words changed
14 to make it either better or perhaps even to beat the
15 likely court challenge which is going to come from
16 this. We all know that's happening. So, this is a
17 very simple bill not-- this is a very simple motion
18 not to kill the bill, not to beat the bill, not to
19 vote it down, but to send it back into the other room
20 where the Governmental Operations Committee can
21 consider this later this week or next week and have
22 that conversation. Thank you very much, Madam
23 President.
24
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
3 Member Yeger. Council Member-- Speaker Corey
4 Johnson.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
6 Majority Leader. I just want to be clear so folks
7 understand. If this bill is amended in any way, it
8 would need to be re-aged and there is not enough re-
9 aging days between now and the next Stated Meeting of
10 the City Council, and that Stated Meeting is not
11 moving for a variety of reasons, which means that the
12 bill could not come up again before this council
13 finishes, which means that the bill would die this
14 year. It would then be kicked to the next council.
15 The bill would need to be reintroduced, reheard,
16 sponsors would need to sign onto it again, and it
17 would go through a full legislative process. So, if
18 this bill is amended today in any way, the bill is
19 technically dead for this legislative session and the
20 next City Council would have to take it up. I wanted
21 to clarify that so people understand that.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you for your
23 clarity. Council Member Lander? Followed by
24 Menchaca.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam
3 majority Leader. I've been a member of tis City
4 Council for three terms now, 12 years. In every one
5 of those terms I've been proud to be a sponsor of
6 this bill, to extend voting rights to our non-citizen
7 neighbors. For much of that time, across all three
8 terms, the bill had a super majority of sponsors. I
9 looked back. It had a super majority in my first
10 term in the Council, and it has a super majority
11 today. There is strong support in this body and in
12 this city to recognize that our neighbors who pay
13 taxes, who work hard, who take care of us through
14 caregiving jobs deserve the right to vote in our
15 municipal elections. But whether you think that or
16 don't think that, and respectfully, whether you
17 believe a court will find that this bill is within
18 our authority or not within our authority, we have
19 the opportunity at long last, after more than a
20 decade, to express this body's support for the well-
21 supported legally and morally and economically idea
22 that our non-citizen neighbors should vote in our
23 municipal elections. And I don't want to have it
24 said that after three terms of super majority
25 support, we failed even to vote to consider it.

1
2 Let's be clear what the Speaker said. Sending this
3 back to committee where it would be amended or
4 amending the bill on the floor is killing the bill
5 this session, and hoping that that next Council, the
6 fourth in which it would be introduced, would do
7 better than we do. We have an opportunity to make
8 history today. Let's do it. Please vote no on this
9 motion to send the bill back to the committee.
10 Please vote no if amendments are introduced. Please
11 vote yes when this bill comes to the floor for a
12 vote. Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member
14 Menchaca followed by Council Member Gjonaj, and then
15 Council Member Chin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Hello. Hi,
17 everyone. Carlos Menchaca. I have also served here,
18 not for 12, but for eight years as the Chair of the
19 Immigration Committee with some incredible members
20 within the committee that have done so much work in
21 BMT [sic] and beyond the committee work that we've
22 done to engage immigrant communities. What we are
23 talking here, and why I'm saying no to this
24 amendment, is that we're ready to move forward. It
25 has taken this long to have discussions about what it

1 looks like, and this was often delayed in
2 conversation because Trump was in power. The idea of
3 pushing something like this during the reign of
4 terror of Trump is no longer with us. now we can
5 work together to ensure that we can build a process
6 to enfranchise people who are in our neighborhoods,
7 who have been part of community building, and during
8 COVID you saw essential workers, immigrants, fight
9 and work on our behalf to make sure that our economy
10 and city kept moving. The least we can do is give
11 them the opportunity to vote. I ask you, and I'm
12 standing with the Speaker and Lander and so many of
13 you right now, to vote no on this amendment and any
14 amendment because it will effectively kill this bill
15 now. This is our time. This is our city. This is
16 our vote. Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member
19 Chin followed by Council Member Gjonaj then Council
20 Member Borelli.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I've also been on
22 the City Council. This is my 12th year, and I
23 started advocating for the right for immigrants who
24 are non-citizen to vote even before I joined the City
25 Council. This has been a long journey. Council

1
2 Member Gjonaj, why did your parents have to wait so
3 long to become a citizen? I don't think it's not
4 because they don't want to. There are a lot of
5 people, a lot of immigrants from around the world,
6 and I march and I rally with immigrants from Africa,
7 from Russia, from Asia. They want representation.
8 My mother couldn't vote for me because she wasn't a
9 citizen. She had a green card. She paid tax. There
10 were a lot of members in the community, especially
11 senior citizens, that's been going to classes trying
12 to learn the language. It's not that easy. And the
13 price for the application has been-- keep going up.
14 Imagine if you need to take the test in Russian or in
15 Spanish, or in Chinese, or in Korean, it's not easy
16 to learn a language, and especially for immigrants
17 who have to work every day just to support their
18 family. They want to be citizens. They want to be
19 able to vote for the President, but at least we have
20 the opportunity to allow them to vote for the elected
21 official that's representing them in the city. A lot
22 of them are very active. They volunteer on campaign.
23 They come to community meeting, but Election Day they
24 cannot vote for Mayor, they cannot vote for the City
25 Council. But this bill will give them that

1
2 opportunity to get involved, but have that right to
3 vote for their representative, and hopefully that
4 will encourage the regular citizen who usually don't
5 vote to get out and vote, and that's what democracy
6 is all about. And this bill is taxation with
7 representation. Thank you.

8 [applause]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member
10 Borelli?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Was Gjonaj ahead
12 of me, or--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] Yes,
14 he was.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Can I have my
16 five minutes?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I'll allow Council
18 Member Gjonaj and then thank you so much Council
19 Member Borelli.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you
21 Majority Leader, and thank you colleague,
22 Councilwoman Chin for that passionate speech.
23 Democracy gives us choices. My parents waited. They
24 chose to wait. What this bill is going to allow a
25 year from now is someone with a work visa to come in

1 and 30 days later be able to vote. That person is a
2 transient, not a permanent resident, not a
3 contributor to society and the fabric of New York
4 City. That person is coming in for the duration of
5 that job or that project and going back to their home
6 country or another place of origin. This bill is
7 allowing-- and I must say this, because one of the
8 issues that came up was fear of. Wasn't too long ago
9 that we were all focused on television as we were
10 hearing about Russian influence in an election, and
11 we were mortified that that could happen. This bill
12 in its current form doesn't protect New York City or
13 make it fairer. It makes it vulnerable to outside
14 influence, whether that be Russia, China, or any
15 other nationality that does not share the same
16 principles in freedom and values that we do as
17 Americans. So be careful, as my grandmother would
18 say, what you ask for, because you just may get it.
19 This bill makes the crown jewel of this country, New
20 York City, vulnerable. Not today because of the one
21 million New Yorkers that would benefit from this
22 right, but based on the 1.1 million green cards that
23 will be issued each and every year moving forward,
24 and it doesn't take much to use your imagination to
25

1 figure out how dangerous this bill is for the future
2 of New York City, for the future of New York.

3
4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. Thank
5 you, Council Member Gjonaj. We now have Council
6 Member Borelli.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you. I'd
8 like to speak briefly about the legality of this
9 considering one of my colleagues and friends did
10 mention that this would be challenged in court, and
11 that essentially the court would be determining if
12 what we do today is actually legally or just. I
13 think that's reason enough to support this motion to
14 send it back to the committee. Non-citizen voting
15 has a long history in New York State. By 1804, state
16 election law specifically requires citizenship to
17 vote. In 1827 state election law defines citizenship
18 unambiguously as citizenship in the United States.
19 Article II of our State Constitution reads, "Every
20 citizen shall be entitled to vote at every election
21 for all officers elected by the people and upon all q
22 questions submitted to the vote of the people
23 provided that such citizen is 18 years of age or
24 over, and it shall have been a resident of this city
25 and of the county, city, or village for 30 days."

1 Now, that particular section of the State
2 Constitution was passed in 1938 and was approved by a
3 vote, a referendum of the people. not only was it
4 approved by the people in the referendum in 1938, but
5 it was voted five times since then, in 1943, 1945,
6 1961, '66 and as recently as 1995. The people of the
7 state actually voted to do that. A hundred year
8 definition of citizenship, affirmed by people as
9 uniquely qualified to vote in city elections, not
10 once, not twice, but six times. I'll note that some
11 of my friends and colleagues who support this measure
12 oppose the State Constitutional Convention that could
13 have happened four years ago, the actual appropriate
14 time by which this measure could be brought to light.
15 Furthermore, Article III of the State Constitution
16 defines those counted for redistricting persons as
17 inhabitants, not citizens. Meaning, the State
18 Constitution takes the time to differentiate between
19 times we count people as inhabitants versus times we
20 count people as citizens. We count people as
21 citizens to vote. In 1993 and 1997 and 2003,
22 legislation was introduced in the State Assembly for
23 the constitutional change to allow non-citizen
24 voting. Parallel bills were introduced to limit it
25

1 to municipal elections. I ask you, why would the
2 State Assembly go through the process of having a
3 state constitutional change if you didn't have to
4 have a state constitutional change. It's not easy,
5 but the truth is you have to. All those bills were
6 defeated but the mere suggestion that that was what
7 was required lends to the point that this is not
8 legal what we are doing. At some point, some will ask
9 us, what about our School Board elections as we did
10 between 1968 and 2003. The state constitution address
11 that. It defines local governments as a county, city,
12 town or village, period. So it limited itself from
13 School Board elections. Thank you [inaudible] I
14 really appreciate that. I know you're in much danger
15 from my spittle [sic]. All those points in the
16 school board law specifically addressed the issue of
17 what elections were covered by the State
18 Constitution. No matter how much my friend Carlos
19 doesn't want to hear it, the State Constitution is
20 clear. Moreover, Article 52 Section A of the State
21 Education Law specifically allowed each parent who
22 was a citizen of that state, meaning they
23 specifically specified a citizen of the state could
24 vote in election law. Now, again, that gives credit
25

1 to the notion that state law is what determines that.
2 But that's not all, the State Election Law further is
3 clear on this issue. Section 5-102 states, "No
4 person shall register for and vote at any election
5 unless he is a citizen of the United States." That's
6 clear, right? That's an actual statute from the
7 state. Furthermore, Section 23 of the Municipal Home
8 Rule Law states that a referendum is required, not
9 optional, for any Local Law that changes the
10 nominating, electing, or removing an elected officer,
11 and that's what we're doing. So at the very least, my
12 point is, if you want to do this, there's no problem
13 with that as long as you do it the right way. This is
14 not just an opinion of mine, Joe Borelli, the
15 Minority Leader, the Republican leader. In 2013 an
16 Administrative Attorney testified to this body that
17 non-citizen voting is inconsistent with the State
18 Constitution would require a citywide referendum. On
19 9/17 of this year Mayor de Blasio himself, a bonafide
20 [sic] progressive known to you all, said, "Our Law
21 Department is very clear. It's not legal for this to
22 be decided at the city level. I really believe this
23 has to be decided at the state level." I'm almost
24 finished, excuse me. Two weeks ago, on New York One,
25

1
2 the same Democratic Mayor said the same thing. And
3 finally on September 20th of this year, our Chief
4 Democracy Officer, the person who we presume, his
5 only job is to make sure every legal voter in this
6 city has the opportunity to vote, said that the law
7 could violate the State Constitution. So I urge you
8 all to vote yes on this motion. Send this back to
9 committee. Let's talk about these legal issues. If
10 that happens to not by the case, then I urge you all
11 to vote no on the bill. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Council
13 Member Borelli. We'll now have Council Member Van
14 Bramer followed by Levin and Carr.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.
16 So, listening to Council Member Gjonaj, I just want
17 to say I very much appreciate it, the story of your
18 grandmother and your parents and your immigrant story
19 which reminds me that we are all immigrants in this
20 room and in this city, and either an immigrant or the
21 son or granddaughter of an immigrant, and while I
22 share you appreciation and of course your family's
23 story, I don't share you concern. I think this is
24 one of the best species of legislation that this
25 council is poised to pass, and this is a great day

1
2 for democracy in the City of New York. I am not
3 afraid of too many people having the ability to vote.
4 I am afraid that too many feel powerless in the very
5 city that they live and work and raise their family
6 in. This is the best of who we are, this piece of
7 legislation is everything that we are about. New
8 York City is that beacon of hope for the entire
9 country. We lead. This is how we do it, and I could
10 not in any good conscience not be for this because I
11 know my own history. I know that my grandmother
12 Winnfred [sp?] Cody O'Connor [sp?] came from Ireland,
13 one of 14 children. I know that they were not
14 welcomed when they came to this country, and it is
15 important for all of us to remember that we are all
16 immigrants. This is a city built by and for
17 immigrants, and this is such a good day for
18 democracy, a great day for this New York City
19 Council, one that I'm incredibly proud to serve in
20 for the last 12 years and to have been a prime co-
21 sponsor. So I'll be voting no on this call for an
22 amendment and any other amendments in honor of my
23 grandmother, but in honor of everyone's family who
24 absolutely deserves the franchise in this city.
25 Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
3 Member Van Bramer. We'll now have Council Member
4 Levin followed by Council Member Carr.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
6 much, Madam Majority Leader. My colleagues, I want
7 to just speak to you as a proud sponsor of this bill
8 and I've been a sponsor for these three terms. Just
9 on a process issue, I just want to make sure that
10 we're absolutely clear, this bill deserves an up or
11 down vote today, and there's a super majority of
12 sponsors on this bill. If it's an up or down vote,
13 the bill will pass. If we vote in favor of my
14 colleague, Council Member Gjonaj's amendment, this
15 bill will be dead for this term as the Speaker said.
16 This bill will be dead. There's no way that we-- if
17 we were to vote for this amendment that we could pass
18 this bill in this term. We would essentially be
19 precluding ourselves from being able to have that up
20 or down vote. So, in the interest of transparency in
21 government, we have had hearings on this bill. We
22 have had a robust public discussion on this bill.
23 There's not a member in this room who doesn't know
24 what this bill does, okay? We have to vote no on
25 this amendment because this amendment is a subterfuge

1 on the legislative process here, because what it
2 essentially does is it kills the bill, because it
3 would have to re-age, and we do not have the time in
4 this session to re-age a bill. The last aging
5 deadline was the other day. So, I just want to make
6 that absolutely, abundantly clear. Voting yes on
7 this amendment is essentially an end-around around
8 our legislative process, and that's unacceptable to
9 me as a member of this body. This bill deserves an
10 up or down vote. Vote no on this amendment. Thank
11 you, respectfully to my colleague, Council Member
12 Gjonaj.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
15 Member Levin. Council Member Carr?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you, Madam
17 Majority Leader. I appreciate it. I want to thank
18 all of you for welcoming me here today on my first
19 Stated, in particular Speaker Johnson, Minority
20 Leader Borelli. I've stood in the back of this
21 chambers many years as a Chief of Staff, and I'm just
22 honored to be counted among you. But I want to speak
23 briefly on the bill and amendment being proposed,
24 excuse me, the motion to recommit that's been
25 proposed. To me, the right to vote is inherent to

1 citizenship. They cannot be separated from one
2 another. In order to be able to vote in this
3 country, in this state, in this city you have to be a
4 citizen of this country and of the state residing
5 here in New York City. I won't go into the
6 legalities. Minority Leader Borelli did it far more
7 thoroughly than I ever could. I believe in the
8 spirit of the immigrants who have come to this city
9 in past generations. I'm the son of an immigrant.
10 My father came here in 1971. He's still a green card
11 holder himself. Like Council Member Chin and her
12 family, he was not able to vote for me this year.
13 I'm the great grandchild of Italian immigrants to
14 this city from the turn of the last century. I
15 absolutely celebrate the contributions that they have
16 made generationally to this city and to this country.
17 I value you them deeply. But to me, in order to be
18 able to cast a vote for who is going to govern us,
19 you have to have been able to make a commitment to
20 this country and sworn an oath of allegiance to this
21 country. To me, that is absolutely essential if
22 we're going to expand the franchise. And I just
23 would like to point out as Council Member Gjonaj
24 alluded in his comments, this bill would not just
25

1 enfranchise green card holders. It would enfranchise
2 those who are authorized to work in this country.
3 That includes those who are here on non-immigrant
4 visas. That includes those who are recipients of
5 deferred action from US Immigration and customs
6 enforcement. So to me, if we're going to have a
7 serious conversation about what the franchise should
8 be in this city, we should send it back to committee.
9 Let this committee do its work. Let a future Council
10 do its work, if that's indeed what is needed. And so
11 I urge my colleges to vote yes on the motion and no
12 under the underlying bill if it comes to it. Thank
13 you.

14
15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. We now
16 have Council Member Vernikov, Barron, Cornegy, then
17 Dromm. Welcome.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Thank you,
19 Madam Majority Leader. My name is Inna Vernikov. I
20 represent the 48th Council District in Southern
21 Brooklyn. It is an absolute honor for me to be here
22 with all of you today, being able to take a vote.
23 [inaudible] elected Republican I understand that we
24 will, as well as the newly incoming Council Members,
25 disagree on many issues. However, I think that civil

1
2 discourse is really the cornerstone of our democracy,
3 and I look forward to working with all of you and
4 incoming Council Members, especially on issues that
5 we can agree on. That being said, I cannot support
6 this bill, the Intro to 1867A. The right to vote is
7 a sacred right and belongs squarely to United States
8 citizens. And I'm not just saying this as a
9 republican talking point. I myself am an immigrant
10 who came to this country at 12 years old. Both of my
11 parents did not speak English. I did not speak
12 English. My parents had to work two jobs to make
13 ends meet, and I had to work very hard to obtain
14 United States citizenship just so that we can vote.
15 We had to learn English, learn history, pay taxes,
16 and prove that we have a good moral character. And
17 on top of that, I'm also an Immigration Attorney, and
18 I have many clients that I represent who come to this
19 country both legally and illegally, and I believe
20 that this is a slap in the face to those immigrants
21 who worked so hard to obtain United States
22 citizenship so that they can have a say in our
23 election process. This is also a slap in the face to
24 the integrity of our election process. If this bill
25 passes, there's no way to oversee that the non-

1
2 citizens voting actually pay their taxes and have
3 good moral character. However, the application for
4 citizenship, the petition for nationalization, which
5 I am very familiar with, it's a great system that is
6 already in place to make sure that those voting are
7 entitled to that privilege. With that, I'll vote aye
8 on the motion. Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

10 Council Member Barron followed by Council Member
11 Cornegy and Dromm. Council Member Barron, you may
12 unmute yourself.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Can
14 you hear me?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. Thank you
17 so much. I'm going to be very brief. In terms of the
18 motion on the floor, I'm voting no on the motion. I
19 think that the bill that we will vote on after we
20 discharge this motion, that bill is an important
21 bill. It's been around, as someone had said, for
22 close to 12 years. I believe it was first introduced
23 by Council Member Perkins, and I know that
24 subsequently my husband, then Assembly Member Charles
25 Barron, carried the bill and others came behind after

1 that, inheriting the bill and carrying it forward.
2 This is an age that we're living in when so many of
3 the other elements in our country are looking to
4 restrict and limit voting rights, voting
5 opportunities. I think that we've got to make sure
6 that as people are here-- yes, some people are
7 concerned that it's only a month, but as they're here
8 that they be educated as to what's going on and
9 encouraged to join those of us who do vote, which I
10 believe only comes to about 20 percent. I'm not sure
11 the exact number. And we need to also encourage
12 those who are already registered to vote to come out
13 and vote. And the last point I want to make on this
14 point is that the bill as it stands, I believe, won't
15 affect any elections until perhaps June of 2023. So
16 we certainly have-- not we individually, but the
17 Council coming in behind us will certainly have an
18 opportunity to look at how they might want to refine
19 the bill or make modifications or amendments to that
20 bill. Much pri-- much time to have to consider that
21 before the bill would take effect. Thank you very
22 much.
23
24
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much.

3 We now have Council Member Cornegy followed by
4 Council Member Dromm.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Madam Majority
6 Leader, I actually defer my time. Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay, we'll now
8 have Council Member Dromm.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Madam
10 Majority Leader. I really appreciate the opportunity.
11 I also want to acknowledge Council Member Perkins and
12 Council Member Barron who carried this legislation
13 before I did. I carried it for the first two terms
14 that I was in the New York City Council for eight
15 years, and because when became Finance Chair I asked
16 Ydanis Rodriguez to take it, and I'm so glad that
17 he's going to take it over the finish line today. I
18 want to urge my colleagues to vote against this
19 motion. It is going to table it, as has been said
20 before. This is an attempt to stifle voters and to
21 disenfranchise voters. We have seen these attempts
22 all over the country happening before. If you are a
23 true believer in democracy, you will vote in favor of
24 this. we should be enfranchising voters and making
25 sure that everyone who pays taxes, which is the

1 founding principle of this country, no taxation
2 without representation, and we should be firm in our
3 support of that basic and fundamental American right.
4 It is way past time to pass this legislation. We
5 have had enough discussion. We've had enough attempts
6 to push it aside, and now is the time to pass this
7 legislation. Thank you, and I look forward to making
8 sure that this motion is defeated and that we take
9 the vote on the overall bill, the legislation that is
10 before us. Thank you.

11
12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member
13 Holden? Followed by Vallone.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: This motion is
15 really to send it back to committee. And it-- so
16 what's the big deal if it gets to the other council,
17 the next council? Is it to put a feather in your cap
18 to send this right and vote on this today? By the
19 way, at the democratic conference that we had, we had
20 a number of questions and nobody could answers these
21 questions. Like how many actual voters will be
22 voting in these elections? Can the Board of Election
23 handle this? Can they even handle this without
24 screwing it up and without giving the wrong forms?
25 And that will happen, folks. That will happen. And

1
2 again, if you want to become a citizen, you become a
3 citizen by doing months of study, obviously. You
4 study the Bill of Rights. You answer 100 questions
5 to become a citizen. You're an educated voter by
6 then, hopefully. You're saying with this bill that
7 we don't really want an educated voter. Somebody
8 here 30 days, folks, 30 days can vote in our
9 election, decide who our Mayor, City Council, and
10 other elected officials could be. Again, I'm not
11 really that educated. You're not asking them to go
12 to class. You're not asking them to study New York
13 City history or the electorate. You're not asking
14 anything. You're saying you should-- taxation without
15 representation. Well, guess what, folks? We
16 represent them. Does anybody turn away somebody
17 who's not a citizen? Does anybody do that here? We
18 all represent them, so stop with that. Let's do the
19 right thing here, and let's take some time. Get the
20 answers, folks. That's all we're asking. So I
21 support the motion. Thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
23 Member Holden. We'll now have Council Member Vallone,
24 followed by Council Member Reynoso.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Good afternoon
3 everyone. Thank you, Madam Majority Leader. You
4 know, I think there's a single point that some of us
5 who may be for the bill or oppose the bill that just
6 can't get past. We all have our immigration stories
7 and very proud of them and we should be. That's how
8 we got here. But the bill has a fatal flaw, and when
9 we brought the questions up about that one flaw,
10 we've yet to get that answer, and it's not the answer
11 of bringing up our immigration stories with the right
12 of those who toiled here so long that the ability to
13 have a say in local government. No one is saying,
14 however, that that person should have a right after
15 just 30 days. And if that point needs to be
16 reargued, resubmitted, re-figured out by committee or
17 the next Council, then so it be. Thirty days is not
18 enough for someone to decide who's going to represent
19 the greatest city in the world, irrespective of what
20 country you come from, irrespective of what you
21 believe on this particular bill. You can be for it
22 or against it, but nobody is for 30 days, and that's
23 part of this bill, and that is where I struggle with
24 this bill. It's not a matter of being pro or against
25 immigration or pro-voting or against your ability to

1
2 have that vote. It's saying is that enough? Is that
3 what we want to vote on today? To give someone who
4 is just visiting or someone who's a transient worker
5 or someone who is just here for 30 days to say, "Yep,
6 that should be the Mayor. That should be the Borough
7 President. That should be the Council Member." How
8 do you even engage those people? We don't even know
9 how to properly interact in the way to submit an
10 informed vote. So that's my concern. We mentioned
11 it at the delegation conference and we've mentioned
12 it before. And you're not going to get those who re
13 for or against the bill on its merits together today
14 on that. But that particular point, and that's the
15 one that has concerned me from the beginning, the 30-
16 day requirement, and for that we have to seriously
17 consider this motion and push it off to the next
18 calendar. Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Council
20 Member Vallone. Council Member Reynoso.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you, Madam
22 Majority Leader. It just never fails. When white
23 power or white men's power is being attacked, what
24 they would consider being attacked, they stand up and
25 they fight. They fight to preserve their power and

1
2 their influence. And what we're saying today is that
3 [inaudible]. There are people in this city that
4 participate in every aspect of this great country in
5 all positive ways, raising children, sending children
6 to public schools, riding on our roads, driving on
7 our roads, and it's about time that they have a say
8 as to what their representation looks like, and we
9 have to stop and think about this sea of mostly white
10 men that have stood up against this bill at this
11 moment in an effort to preserve their power and
12 influence, and that is exactly what will happen every
13 time you challenge power. The faces always look the
14 same, and it just never fails, and I was hoping that
15 today we could have seen something different. This
16 bill will pass today. It will. Maybe make another
17 effort another time when you reassume power, I guess,
18 to try to undo what I think is the principle
19 foundation of democracy which is the right to vote,
20 specifically if you're paying taxes. So, I encourage
21 all my colleagues to vote no on this request put
22 forth by Council Member Gjonaj and to vote no on any
23 amendments, and vote yes on the bill. Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
25 Member Reynoso. Commission Cornegy?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you, Madam
3 Majority Leader. I would like to-- as a sponsor of
4 the bill, the original sponsor of the bill, I would
5 like to offer a different perspective. You know, I
6 appreciate and respect everyone's immigrant story.
7 However, my ancestors did not come here as
8 immigrants. We came here as slaves and fought
9 vehemently to be able to be a part of the fabric of
10 America and literally die for the right to vote,
11 blood, sweat, and tears, and are still engaged and
12 embroiled in eroding voter rights acts for
13 communities of color across the country. So it's
14 hard. Again, I am a sponsor, but I'm reminded of the
15 tremendous amount of work that continues for black
16 communities across any eroding impact of our votes in
17 the very districts that we serve in. so, I certainly
18 would like to see this, you know, pulled through and
19 made sure that there are no opportunities for us as
20 people who came here as slaves, and like I said,
21 literally died. We don't lose our place in the ranks
22 through voting. So I mean, listen, I'm an original
23 sponsor, and like Antonio said, it'll probably be
24 passed, but I would be remiss if I didn't remind
25 people that there's one more perspective that we

1 haven't talked about, and that is a different kind of
2 immigrant experience and a different kind of voter
3 rights that we still are suffering throughout the
4 country. We all have applauded the work of voter
5 rights advocates in the south, black women's vote,
6 and all those kinds of things, and that's not being
7 heard or represented sometimes, and it's not being
8 heard or represented in this bill. it may very well
9 pass, but like I said, I would be remiss if I didn't
10 offer that perspective of representing a people whose
11 vote has monumentally been taken for granted and now
12 has eroded to the place where even the Voter Rights
13 Act that were put in place to protect our vote and
14 our voices are being eroded.

15
16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
19 Member Cornegy. I-- at this point I'm going to offer
20 my remarks. This is a very personal issue to me and
21 it's been very emotional. Council Member Ydanis
22 Rodriguez is my brother and we have been in a
23 foxhole, as many of you know, for the last year very
24 closely working together. There's so many
25 progressive ideas right now that are on the table in

1 terms of voting rights acts and things that we're
2 going to do to empower communities of color. We've
3 seen that most recently with Rank Choice Voting. In
4 the last Rank Choice Voting Mayoral election, we had
5 an African-American Man, Eric Adams, won the primary
6 night with 30.7 percent of the vote, Maya Wiley with
7 21.4 percent of the vote, and Garcia with 19 percent
8 of the vote. But we saw through a Rank Choice Voting
9 process, Eric Adams wound up winning by 50.4 percent
10 and Garcia by 49.6 percent. So what we're seeing in
11 that is we had an extraordinary experience of Eric
12 Adams and Maya Wiley coming in first and second in a
13 mayoral race in New York City. this was historic,
14 but through a process, had it have been successful,
15 the third place white woman candidate could have beat
16 both the African-American men and the African-
17 American woman through a process called Rank Choice
18 Voting that was supposed to empower black
19 communities, and if it had been successful, it would
20 have done just that. It would have taken out the two
21 winning African-American candidates. We are in a
22 process right now. We just completed a census.
23 Redistricting is happening. Our communities and the
24 composition of our communities are changing, and for
25

1 me, with this particular legislation, I'm concerned
2 as Council Member Cornegy talked about, where do
3 African-American voters fit in. And we're not just
4 talking about some sort of ethnic group. we are
5 talking about the people for the last century who
6 have protested, who have been on the front lines, who
7 have died, who have been lynched, who have given
8 their lives and shed blood, sweat, and tears as we
9 saw on the Edmund Pettis Bridge on Bloody Sunday. We
10 are the people that are fighting for the right for
11 all people. I want everybody in this room to
12 recognize that if not for the sacrifice of African-
13 American people the vast majority of people in this
14 room would not have the right to vote. You would not
15 be able to have the right to vote. You would not be
16 able to hold the seats that many of you hold here if
17 it had not been for African-Americans. So it's
18 critical when we're passing all of these progressive
19 measures of legislation that we recognize the
20 African-American contribution to making it possible.
21 This is essentially in many ways-- this is going to--
22 this particular legislation is going to shift the
23 power dynamics in New York City in a major way, and
24 we do not have the numbers or the information to know
25

1
2 how that is going to impact African-American
3 communities who have been the most vulnerable in
4 their existence in New York City. Gentrification has
5 taken root in our communities. Our businesses have
6 been taken over. Our homes have been taken over.
7 Our schools have been co-located. The only thing
8 that many African-American communities have left are
9 their black representatives and representation. This
10 bill, in many of our communities, in areas such as
11 upper Harlem and otherwise are going to be
12 dramatically changed. Because we are all black and
13 brown, because we're all black and brown and other
14 races doesn't mean that we all share the same values
15 and principles that we're all going to vote and do
16 things in the same way. This measure will also
17 change some districts, Republican to Democratic,
18 Democratic to Republican. This is going to change
19 our communities in a major way. And I'll just
20 conclude by saying, the 30 days-- do you know how
21 long African-Americans had to fight to no longer be
22 considered three-fifths of a man? We had to fight so
23 hard just to be considered a whole person in this
24 area, and we would then say in many ways that someone
25 could be here for 30 days. There are different

1
2 classifications of a green card. Not all green cards
3 take five to seven years. Some of them you get
4 temporarily immediately, and we are not discussing
5 those temporary green cards at all. So, I think it's
6 important that we continue to have this discussion,
7 and again, as the Majority Leader, I just want to
8 close with saying in this body we should never shy
9 away from wanting to ask questions. We should never
10 shy away from wanting more information. We should
11 never shy away from wanting to be able to make a bill
12 better. We can't continue with the expediency or the
13 fear that we're going to be cancelled if we even are
14 known to have asked for more information or for more
15 questions, or to want to make something better. That
16 culture needs to end in order for us to produce
17 better bills, to be more comprehensive, and to make
18 sure that everybody is included in the bills that we
19 are pushing forward. I've never heard in this one
20 discussion about how the African-American voter is
21 going to be impacted by this bill. This is going to
22 be a great win for the ethnic groups that are going
23 to be the highest number in the City of New York.
24 And so, Ydanis, this is your legacy. This is yours,
25 and this is going to be a huge win numerically for

1
2 the Dominican Republic community, and I applaud you
3 for that. We're all here to support our ethnic
4 groups, and we're all here to make sure that we all
5 win, but I need to know in supporting this, which I
6 need more time, how are African-Americans going to be
7 impacted, because that's the community I come from.
8 I'm clear how the Dominican Republic community will
9 benefit, but not the African-American community, and
10 it's only fair that I know that information. Thank
11 you. Council Member Grodenchik?

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: The mic's not on.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you,
14 Majority Leader Cumbo, Mr. Speaker, my colleagues. I
15 want to congratulate Ydanis Rodriguez for this
16 legislation. I don't necessarily agree with it, but
17 I've known Ydanis for six years since I entered the
18 Council. I know he's passionate. I know that Danny
19 Dromm, my dear friend of many years, is passionate
20 about this. I got up to speak because race was
21 injected into this debate today, and I have to tell
22 you I resent that. I truly resent that. I represent
23 one of the most diverse districts in the City of New
24 York. I am a product of New York City. I was born in
25 the Bronx. I raised in New York City public housing

1 in Queens, and I have been blessed to be a public
2 school graduate here, and a graduate of State
3 University of New York. And I want to tell you about
4 my experience. My grandfather came here about this
5 time in 1903. He was fleeing oppression, and he was
6 not seen as a white guy in czarist Russia. He was
7 seen as a Jew, and my grandmother came and they were
8 married in Margaret Chin's district in 1907, and my
9 grandparents, the other grandparents came from the
10 Polish part of the Austrian-Hungary Empire in 1912.
11 And I'm grateful that they did, because the truth of
12 the matter is that the rest of family was murdered by
13 the Nazis [inaudible] their name be obliterated. And
14 I stand here today in my last few weeks of my public
15 service career to say that this bill should be
16 debated on the merits. I have worked, I have
17 represented a majority, almost majority Asian-
18 American district. I work with Latinos and blacks and
19 people from all across the world who came to this
20 city because they wanted one thing. They wanted
21 freedom. Just a few more seconds, madam Majority
22 Leader.
23

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: You can conclude.
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you. So
3 to me, I don't think that you should vote unless
4 you're a citizen, and that's what I've held for a
5 long time, and I respect everybody's opinion here.
6 But I just want people to know my story, that I would
7 not be alive if we were in the other country, because
8 in the other country Jews were viewed as subhuman.
9 Thank you, Ms. Majority Leader.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much.
11 I thank you for sharing your story. Council Member
12 Gennaro followed by Council Member Treyger.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you.
14 Thank you, Madam Majority Leader. I wish to be
15 associated with your good remarks on this bill. I
16 guess I have two things to mention, and this is
17 something that I mentioned to the sponsor of the
18 bill. You know, to me, there's a fundamental
19 unfairness that is introduced when you tell a
20 resident of New York City, a permanent resident, that
21 they now will be bestowed with the privilege of
22 voting for local-- for local government officials,
23 but they don't have the ability to run for those
24 offices. So, we're telling them that you're good
25 enough to vote, but not good enough to hold office.

1
2 They're good enough to vote for mayor, but not be
3 mayor, and to me that's, you know, kind of like a
4 cast system there. And so I think this is one of the
5 fundamental-- I mean, here we're trying to argue
6 about what's-- what kind of-- you know, debate about
7 what's fair, but you know, to me it's-- that a
8 fundamental unfairness which is built in, if we told
9 somebody that you can vote. You know, you can do
10 that, but you can't, you know,-- you can't run for
11 office. And [inaudible] would say this could be an
12 attempt for people to say, look, we're looking for
13 permanent residents to vote for us, but you don't get
14 chance to like run against us, and that's a problem
15 for me. And also, fundamentally, you know, I and
16 everyone in this body took an oath, an oath, to
17 uphold the Constitution of the State of New York, and
18 this, no matter how you feel about it-- certainly on
19 its face violates the Constitution of the State of
20 New York and voting for this would be a violation of
21 my oath of office to uphold the Constitution of the
22 State of New York. Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much.
24 We'll now here from Council Member Treyger.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
3 Majority Leader. We've heard quite a bit. I speak as
4 a proud son of immigrants, grandson of immigrants,
5 and I want to offer a unique perspective that I have
6 not heard so far today. When the vote came before
7 the Council in the last term about the city ID cards,
8 myself and I believe also Council Member Maisel
9 abstained, and the reason for that was because I
10 specific questions about who had access to the
11 information of the residents that would apply for the
12 cards, and that was before the election of trump, and
13 I was told, "Council Member, your questions and your
14 concerns are being overblown." And later, with the
15 election of President Trump, that became a major
16 issue in New York, because they went after that
17 information. And so I heard someone say earlier that
18 Trump era is over. I beg to disagree. He no longer
19 is president, but there are people in power who
20 absolutely continue that Trump legacy and those Trump
21 policies, and there are serious questions about the
22 Board of Elections' capacity. Who will be
23 responsible to verify paperwork? If residents ask,
24 "Is my information safe?" Who will be privy to it?
25 The same Board of Elections that still has people who

1
2 have been dead for years on their roles will be privy
3 and be responsible to process very sensitive,
4 important, and critical information. And can any of
5 us say with a straight face that their information
6 will not be compromised?

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: And I also want
9 to say for the record-- I also want to say for the
10 record that as the first Russian-speaking official in
11 New York City history, according to what I've been
12 told, when I ask the city to pass a law to require
13 interpreters for not just Russian-speaking residents,
14 but other languages, I was told that we didn't have
15 the authority. I was told that we did not have the
16 authority to get interpreters at poll sites to assist
17 voters. So I wanted to offer those perspectives on
18 the record, Majority Leader. Thank you for the time.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you so much,
20 Council Member Treyger. Council Member Cabán?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Yeah. Thank you.
22 Thank you. I was not expecting to speak on my first
23 day in chambers with y'all, but I feel really, really
24 strongly about this. When I took office, the first
25 piece of legislation was this one. I stood on the

1
2 steps with all of the advocates and directly-impacted
3 folks earlier this morning and said in full sincerity
4 that there is not one piece of legislation before
5 this body at this moment that does more to expand
6 democracy and to lift up the folks of the people that
7 make this city what it is. Expanding the right to
8 vote for some folks does not in any way diminish or
9 tarnish the right to vote for other folks. Yes, I
10 understand that amongst our communities we have
11 different experiences, different struggles, but what
12 anchors all vulnerable communities, whether you are
13 black, brown, the disability community, whether you
14 are queer, the intersection of any marginalized
15 identity that these systems were not made for, what
16 anchors us in those struggles are so common and the
17 same, and it is really divisive to say that our power
18 as one specific community would be watered down by
19 extending the right to allow other voices into our
20 halls of power. This is about making sure that every
21 single person in our city that contributes to our way
22 of life and living has a voice and a vote, and the
23 only way to do that-- the only way to do that is to
24 allow folks the power to step into the voting booth
25 and exercise that right. You can't just say that we

1 as elected officials, we're just going to look out
2 for you. We're just-- don't worry, we got you. You
3 don't need to vote for us to be able to do that.
4 It's nonsense, and we know it. Generation after
5 generation we have seen our people be left behind
6 because they have not had that power. So I'm
7 grateful for Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez and
8 stand firmly with him and the rest of the coalition
9 to say that we need to pass this and we need to pass
10 this now. We should not be waiting another decades,
11 another minute to get this done. Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Council Member
14 Ydanis Rodriguez?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible]
16 the hearing of Government Operations, I couldn't
17 control my emotion because I came here to wash dishes
18 at Old Henry Restaurant at West 46th Avenue. And
19 then now it's a Capital Bank when I pass by. And
20 then my second job was working [inaudible]
21 Corporation, a cafeteria inside Two Broadway. So
22 when that happened [inaudible] having meet with the
23 DOT Commissioner, and it's those days that my
24 daughter go to her school, I walk by and see them in
25 the front, and I share with them that reality. So

1
2 this is different from all the bill about regulating
3 how people vote, right? This is not about amending
4 anything that we have different interpretation. This
5 is about how the City of New York have the
6 responsibility to go back to our New York State
7 Constitution of 197-- 1777 that allow people no
8 citizen to vote, and that point of time were longer
9 as Public Advocate Jumaane Williams stated today.
10 People voting without being citizen, then people not
11 being allowed to vote because they're not citizen.
12 How did it happen? When did it happen? What fear
13 does it bring? Go to Texas. See what's going on
14 there. Why are they passing legislation? To secure,
15 to be sure that they will establish that no citizen
16 will not, able to vote. Because the federal law of
17 our country established that in order to vote in
18 federal election, President by President, Members of
19 the House of Representatives, senator, it is a must
20 to be citizen. Now when my collage, goof friend
21 Borelli, that even though we don't agree with this
22 he's my good friend and we do a lot of work together
23 and we have a lot respect to each other, disagree
24 that the New York State Constitution never use the
25 word "only." When they talk about citizen have the

1 right to vote. They don't use the word only. You
2 don't find it. And that's [inaudible]. That's the
3 piece [inaudible] real unusual of the Washington Post
4 story today. Hear from the academic what are the
5 same, that we have the right to do it. So it's
6 interesting that besides two or three colleagues,
7 right, that took the floor to address the 30 days,
8 right? The rest [inaudible] to my Trump supporters.
9 They don't agree with 30 days. They've been speaking
10 about why we should not pass this bill. So they will
11 not be voting for this bill. This the Democratic
12 agenda. This is about us showing Texas, San Antonio,
13 Colorado, other states how we do business. What is
14 democracy all about it? That's what we're doing. My
15 good friend, Majority Speaker, you have a great
16 conversation with Berta Louis [sp?] from the Black
17 Institute, and she show them number to you. And she
18 showed to you that close to 400,000 new voters are
19 black. They come from Nigeria. They came from Mali.
20 They come from Ghana, they are [sp?], Haitian.
21 They're Jamaican, close to 400,000. And for those
22 that want to bring fear on the 30-day, let me give
23 you a number. From-- the close to a million new
24 voters. Right now 800,000 number is the number that
25

1 we're using. Five hundred thousands are individuals
2 that have green cards. So for those that want to
3 bring fear about the undocumented, my brother,
4 [inaudible] undocumented within [sic] New York City
5 working at the deli, working in supermarket. They
6 did the same job that I did from '83 to 2000 when I
7 had a green card and I worked at Old Henry Restaurant
8 in the cafeteria, driving a taxi, being at City
9 College organizing the student [inaudible], graduated
10 from City College and being a teacher from '93 to
11 2000 at [inaudible] school. I did it with green
12 card. I don't want to challenge anyone who believe
13 that the US citizen [inaudible] higher level, because
14 I compare myself. When did we come to this
15 conclusion? When? [inaudible] look like in movies
16 and think about a place in this world where human
17 beings are living together, and a group is telling
18 the others you are here for years working hard,
19 paying taxes, and you don't have a right [inaudible].
20 For God sake--

21
22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Ydanis--

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Let's get it
24 done. Let's vote no on this amendment. Si se puede.

25 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We will now take a roll call vote? Yes, Speaker Corey Johnson?

SPEAKER JOHNSON: There has been a robust and lively debate on the floor of the New York City Council. It doesn't happen often here, but I'm glad we're having this debate, and all I want to say is today needs to be a historic day for our city, for our country. This is the right thing to do. Let's not get distracted. Let's get this done. I implore all of my colleagues and friends to vote no on this motion to recommit, to vote no on any amendment, and to get to the bill, and let's prove it. Thank you very much. I ask for a roll call vote on Council Member Gjonaj's motion to recommit.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Speaker Johnson.

COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: [inaudible]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Excuse me? Oh, yes, ma'am.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Madam Majority Leader. Respectfully, welcoming our newest members, Council Members Cabán and our Council Member Inna, and Council Member Carr.

1 Welcome to the New York City Council. We are
2 experiencing an amazing day today, and for that I
3 congratulate all of my colleagues for this spirited
4 debate. Mr. Speaker, I only rise to express my
5 opinion. Twelve years is too long for any piece of
6 legislation to languish, particularly a piece of
7 legislation that affects thousands upon thousands of
8 people who pay taxes in the City of New York that
9 contribute to our wellbeing as citizens of the City
10 of New York, and for one who will be returning in
11 January as a member of this amazing body, what I say
12 to my colleagues is that 12 years is 12 years too
13 long for this legislation. We must make this happen
14 today, and for those of us returning in January, it
15 will be incumbent upon us to amend this legislation
16 if we deem so necessary. I vote aye. I vote no on
17 the amendment, but I will vote aye on the bill.

18
19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Hold on. It's not the
20 amendment. You vote no on the motion to recommit.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Yes.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: You vote no on the
23 motion to recommit?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Yes, Mr. Speaker,
25 I do vote no on the motion to recommit--

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: respectfully to my amazing colleague, Council Member Gjonaj.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Council Member Adams.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Ampry-Samuel?

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Everyone at this time needs to vote at the microphone.

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote no.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I vote no on this motion to recommit. We cannot disenfranchise and deny people who are entitled to vote the opportunity to vote in local elections. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brannan? Council Member Brannan? Brooks-Powers?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We'll come back.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cabán?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera? Carr?

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: I vote yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Chin?

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cornegy?

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Darma Diaz?

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ruben Diaz?

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Permission to explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Madam Majority. I have this black guy with kinky hair and a broken English from [inaudible] Puerto Rico is a US citizen, but when I go to Puerto Rico being a US citizen, I cannot vote for President of the United States because the Constitution, because the law requires so. When I got elected as a Council Member I swear to you with my hand in the bible to protect and defend the Constitution of the United States. Today, I cannot vote against the Constitution even though it sounds good, possibly a good quality and a humanitarian thing, but this black guy with kinky

1 hair, broken English from [inaudible] Puerto Rico is
2 voting yes in this [inaudible].

3
4 COUNCIL CLERK: Dinowitz?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I first just
6 want to thank every single person who spoke on this
7 for speaking from the heart, and I want to say I
8 deeply respect everyone's view and respect everyone
9 for sharing their thoughts. I vote no on the motion
10 to recommit.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote no on the
13 motion, because I support my immigrant constituents.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote no.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Feliz?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: I vote no.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gennaro?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Aye.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote no.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gjonaj?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Grodenchik?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote aye.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: No.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote no to the
8 amendment.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: How did he vote?
11 Council Member Koo, how did you vote, yes or no?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote no to the
13 amendment.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you Council Member
15 Koo. Koslowitz?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: No.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: No.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Lander?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: You couldn't
21 hear me? That wasn't loud enough? I vote no.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brannan?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: No.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: No on the motion
3 to recommit.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine? Louis?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I vote no. And
6 I'm hoping when the incoming class comes in that we
7 can do this the right way, implementing it the right
8 way.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: In the name of
13 restoring rights, voting rights, to our New Yorkers,
14 I vote no on the motion.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Nay [sic]

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Moya?

18 Perkins? Powers?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: No.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: No.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Riley?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: No.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote no.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I vote no, and
4 for clarification, Council Member Diaz was signing on
5 this bill when he was running for Congress, but I
6 vote no on this.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
9 explain my vote?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. I want
13 to say that this is one of the few times-- I've been
14 here 12 years-- that I've seen such spirited debate.
15 I came to the floor with a notion to vote a certain
16 way, and so I appreciate the debate and all the
17 thoughtful comments that were made by my colleagues.
18 I am going to vote no for this motion, but it is with
19 reservation, because I do feel that 30 days is not a
20 sufficient amount of time to be invested in this
21 country and this city. And so I'm voting against the
22 amendment after much-- hearing much of the debate,
23 but I do hope that when this pass, and I know it will
24 pass, that we will look at making sure that people
25 who vote-- and I'm not talking about the people who

2 are here now who have green cards, but people who
3 come here really have a vested interested, and that
4 this not be used to-- for other purposes. So I'm
5 voting no.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
7 Member Rose.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Rosenthal?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I vote no.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote no.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I vote no on the
14 motion.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote yes on the
17 motion to recommit.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Yes on the
20 motion.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: On behalf of
23 the people of Woodside [sic] and Sunnyside, Long
24 Island City, and Astoria, and in memory of my
25 grandmother, I am proud to vote no.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Vernikov?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: I vote yes on
4 the motion.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Yeger?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,
7 May I be excused to explain my vote?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
9 granted.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very
11 much. I appreciate it. You know, we don't get to
12 debate often enough in the Council, I believe. My
13 colleagues who are here for 12 years probably agree
14 with me. I'm only here four years and I've had more
15 debate when I was on a Community Board than I've had
16 here. So I appreciate the chance to do this. I'll
17 say a number of things. First of all, you know, this
18 was a motion to send it back to a committee. It's
19 not a motion about whether or not you want immigrants
20 to vote or not vote or any of that, but it became
21 important during the course of this debate that
22 everybody has to discuss their personal story. So,
23 my story, because I've said this before on this
24 floor. My father came here on a boat with his
25 parents and his older brothers. He-- my four

1
2 grandparents, none of whom were born here, in various
3 trips escaped the atrocities of Nazi Germany from
4 various places, from Poland, from Lithuania, from
5 Russia. One of my grandfathers made his way from
6 Russia over the water into Japan where he was able to
7 live for a few years-- for a few days, until he was
8 able to move to China to Shanghai where he stayed for
9 several years before being welcomed into the United
10 States. They didn't have the right to vote. This is
11 not about their right to vote. None of them have seen
12 me be elected. They never missed an election, by the
13 way, after they became citizens, but none of them saw
14 me elected, they weren't alive. My grandmother was.
15 She was actually my constituent until she passed away
16 a year ago. So one of my grandparents did see it.
17 It's an American Dream, the right to vote. This
18 debate now was not about the right to vote. It was
19 about a motion to send it back to a committee. So
20 what happens here at the Council? We know the rule,
21 because we've seen it for the last four years. I've
22 seen it for a long time in politics. Whoever doesn't
23 agree with you must be a racist. Must be. Has to
24 be. You don't agree with me, you love white power.
25 You have to be. You don't agree with me, you're a

1 Trumpist. You don't agree with me, it's because you
2 hate Latinos. Twenty years ago when I was working
3 for the historic campaign of a candidate for Mayor of
4 New York who was of Puerto Rican descent, the
5 gentleman who just referenced another member of this
6 body's support for this bill was supporting the
7 Jewish candidate 20 years ago. When I was supporting
8 Fernando Ferrer and the gentleman was supporting Mark
9 Green. Don't come here and tell us that we're racist
10 because we don't agree with you. When have I ever
11 said that to you? When has anybody who's on the
12 other side of you ever said that to you or anybody
13 else? It happens all the time. Mr. Speaker, you know
14 you've seen it for the last four years. It happens
15 all the time. Don't agree with me, you're a racist.
16 You're a Trumpist. You're this, you're that. How
17 about I just have a policy difference? How about I
18 read the Constitution? I went to law school just
19 like the lawyers in this Council and I read the
20 Constitution and it means something to me. No, it
21 has to be we're racists, has to be. You're leaving
22 the Council in 20 days. It's a chance to stand up
23 and say, you know, maybe not everybody who disagrees
24 with me is racist. I know not everybody who
25

1
2 disagrees with me is racist, and I'll say that. So
3 with that, I vote aye on the motion to send it back
4 to the Committee, which I'm proud to serve, and the
5 Council which may hear it next year or may not, but
6 I'm thankful to my neighbors for sending me back here
7 to do their work. Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
9 Member Yeger. And I just want to make a reminder
10 that I was supposed to make earlier that in our
11 comments, we should refrain from referencing one
12 another in our statements. So let's continue to-- I
13 mistakenly did it as well, but we should not mention
14 either of us by name, because we can't continue a
15 continuous debate. Council Member Borelli, you were
16 going to speak? Oh, you were just stretching. I'm
17 sorry? Oh, okay, yes.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Brooks-Powers?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Permission
20 to explain my vote?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: So, just
24 wanted to put on record that I'm looking forward to
25 the next Council to be able to work to perfect this

1
2 bill, one that I definitely support as a co-sponsor,
3 as a first-generation American, but I do find to have
4 some concerns which I have been working alongside the
5 prime sponsor with the hopes of perfecting this piece
6 of legislation, and it is my hope that in the next
7 council we are able to take it a step further. So,
8 while I support the concept of this bill, the bill as
9 it is written currently, I have concerns about, but
10 for the purpose of this motion, I will vote no on
11 sending it back to committee. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
13 Member.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. One last
15 time, Cabrera? Levine? Microphone, Council Member,
16 please.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote no on the
18 motion.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Moya?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote no on the
21 motion.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Perkins?
23 Borelli?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on the
25 motion.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: In the spirit of
4 wanting to know more information, in the spirit of
5 wanting to be able to ask more questions, in the
6 spirit of just simply saying, I do not have enough
7 information to know how this particular bill will
8 affect our city, and I want to be clear, the decision
9 that we are making today is going to have national
10 repercussions. What we are doing today is going to
11 set a precedent throughout the nation. Are we moving
12 in the right direction? Yes. Have we implemented as
13 thoroughly as we should have? The answer is no, and
14 I reserve the right to say we need to be at the
15 drawing board to make better-informed decisions. I,
16 as I said before, want to know specifically how it is
17 going to impact African-American communities ? This
18 is a significant community in this city and this
19 nation. All across the United States of America
20 during the Presidential election, battleground states
21 were talked about during the entire election and what
22 meant was how are African-American going to come out
23 to save this country from what was going to become
24 another demise of the next four years. We need to--
25 following this particular vote, black and brown

1
2 communities need to come together to understand how
3 we are going to work collectively together, because
4 throughout these elections we have seen that on so
5 many elections, the African-American community has
6 been the community to save the day, and it ws
7 mentioned by other colleagues about our Republican
8 colleagues. African-American as a whole, as a block,
9 have remained true to the ideals of the Democratic
10 Party. We have to make sure that we work together
11 collaboratively, that we make sure that black and
12 brown communities understand that we have had many of
13 the same experiences in this country and that we have
14 to work collaboratively and together. We saw in the
15 presidential election that many other ethnic groups
16 voted Republican jeopardizing the entire future of
17 this country by voting Republican. No offense to my
18 Republican brothers and sisters here. I just want to
19 be clear here, that my concern is how this is going
20 to impact African-American communities. We can't
21 leave that up to circumstance. It's not a
22 coincidence. We can't just let whatever happens
23 happen. This is a very vulnerable group in the City
24 of New York that has sacrificed too much for every
25 single person in this room. So I vote yes, because I

1 reserve my right to ask more questions, to make this
2 a more effective bill. No one has the answer as to
3 how this is going to impact African-American
4 communities. Nobody has the numbers how it's going
5 to impact the City of New York. No one knows, but
6 the bill sounds good, so we're voting it through.
7

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote no. Proudly
10 vote no.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: By a vote of 14 in
12 the affirmative, 35 in the negative, and 0
13 abstention, the motion is defeated.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you, Madam
15 Majority Leader. The Council will now consider the
16 separate vote on Introduction 1867A. At this time I
17 ask the Clerk for a roll call vote on Introduction
18 1867A, as it was amended by the Committee on
19 Governmental Operations, the bill we were going to
20 vote on today, before we had this debate. I am
21 requesting a roll call vote since it was decoupled, a
22 roll call vote on that bill.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye. I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Ayala?

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel? My
apologies.

COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brannan?

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brooks-
Powers? Cabán? Cabrera? Carr?

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Nay.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Chin?

SPEAKER JOHNSON: That was a no, correct?

COUNCIL CLERK: Yes. Yes, Mr. Speaker.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I proudly vote aye.
Finally.

COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to
explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: As I stated at
the beginning of this debate, I was an original

1 sponsor on this bill. I asked for-- I voted yes on
2 the motion to recommit because I think that there's
3 much more work that could be done on the bill. I will
4 be voting yes with a reasonable expectation that as
5 we move forward and we discuss issues around voter
6 disenfranchisement in the black community, as we
7 support or don't support Stacey Abrams as she fights
8 for voter rights for black people, as we continue to
9 fight for the full restoration of the Voter Rights
10 Acts that were put in place for black communities,
11 that I can get the same support going forward. Now I
12 won't be a member of this body, but that fight for
13 myself and my family will never stop because I think
14 it's essential and it's part in partial about true
15 democracy in the city. so my vote yes, with the
16 reasonable expectation that everybody on this body,
17 all my progressive colleagues will stand in
18 solidarity with me as I fight for full restoration of
19 the Voter Rights Acts, as I fight for an end to voter
20 disenfranchisement across the country as it relates
21 to black people. Thank you. I vote aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Darma Diaz?

24

25

1 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I vote aye, but I'd
2 like to explain my vote or just make a comment, if
3 that's okay, Majority Leader?
4

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes, ma'am.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: I just-- I want to
7 begin just by thanking you all for this healthy
8 conversation. As a community advocate who's worked
9 with many residents that would have liked to have
10 been able to vote, it's a historic day. As for
11 African-Americans, I've made it my business to take
12 time to go down south to take that walk, to try to
13 have a better understanding. As a Puerto Rican, as a
14 woman, I get it. To the nonprofits that are out
15 there that by my accord, abuse of [sic] residents,
16 today's a new day. It was hard for me to walk the
17 walk and canvas and hear my people that advocated
18 with me for over 20 years, [inaudible] across the
19 street from City Hall advocating for new schools to
20 tell me that they were not a deciding factor. I
21 [inaudible] supported at the hierarchies [sic] and
22 their organizations made that decision for them. I
23 hope they understand [speaking Spanish] Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Gracias.
25

COUNCIL CLERK: Ruben Diaz? Council Member Ruben Diaz, Senior?

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [inaudible] I was out of my office. What are we voting for now?

SPEAKER JOHNSON: We're voting on the bill itself. So, whether your support the bill or not.

COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Okay, alright. Alright, I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Dinowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I vote yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye, because as in the words of Langston Hughes, this will bring America closer to being America again. Thank you.

COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Feliz?

COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: I vote aye, and briefly, I just feel compelled to say that we've seen and heard different perspectives from people of all backgrounds. I just felt compelled to say that we shouldn't throw the word "racism" anytime that we

2 have a disagreement with others, regardless of how
3 difficult the issue is. Thank you.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gennaro?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: I vote no. I
6 wish to be associated with the comments of Council
7 Member Feliz. I vote no.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Gennaro,
9 can you clarify that? How do you vote?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Oh, I'm saying
11 that I'm voting no on the bill--

12 COUNCIL CLERK: [interposing] Thank you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: but I want to be
14 associated with the comments of Council Member Feliz.
15 I agree with his comments, but I'm voting no on the
16 bill.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Got it. Thank you.

18 Gibson? Council Member Gibson?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Colleagues, on
20 behalf of my district and many residents and families
21 who will benefit from this, both from the West
22 African and [inaudible] I vote yes.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gjonaj?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Pass.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 111

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I vote no on
3 1867, aye on the rest, and I welcome my new
4 colleagues. I'm not going to be here much longer--

5 COUNCIL CLERK: [interposing] Council
6 Member Grodenchik--

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] We're just
8 voting on the single bill. The bill was decoupled.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: OH, I'm
10 sorry, Mr. Speaker. I vote no on 1867.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Holden?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote no.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Yes.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council
16 Member Koo? Council Member Koo? Koslowitz?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: No.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
20 permission to explain my vote?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam
24 Majority Leader. I do deeply appreciate debate on the
25 floor of this body. I think it is good for us to have

1 really strong debate and disagree respectfully here.
2 I will say I think it is profoundly disingenuous,
3 however, to make it seem as though if immigrants just
4 work hard, they could become citizens in this country
5 when Republicans in Congress are denying 11 million
6 Americans a path to citizenship and have been doing
7 so for decades. If we lived in a country where
8 citizenship was offered to all who want it, then it
9 might make sense to say on the floor of this body
10 that that should be an expectation of voting, but in
11 the country we are living and where immigrants are
12 denied basic human dignity and yet expected to
13 perform jobs that are essential to us through this
14 pandemic. I find it a really disingenuous argument.
15 We are voting to expand municipal voting rights to
16 our immigrant neighbors in big part because they have
17 been denied a path to citizenship by Congress, and
18 that is why I'm so proud of what we're doing today.
19 I think is not only profoundly morally right, I think
20 it's economically smart for New York City to be a
21 place where immigrants can come and participate fully
22 in our economy and in our democracy. It heralds a
23 strong and bright future for this city which has
24 always been an immigrant city which brings people in
25

2 and enfranchises them. That is how our whole city
3 thrives, not only our immigrant neighbors, but every
4 single one of us. So, with bright hope for the
5 future of inclusive multiracial democracy in New York
6 City, I vote aye.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council
8 Member Levin?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye,
10 proudly.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye,
13 proudly.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Louis?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I vote aye.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Maisel?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: No.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Hang on Council Member.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: No.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Menchaca?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
22 explain my vote?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
24 granted.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
3 Majority Leader, and thank you to this incredible
4 Council. We are two States away from ending this
5 session, and I feel-- have a lot of feelings right
6 now, but I just want to say thank you for listening,
7 for speaking your truth. I hope that you feel heard,
8 and I know that we don't always agree, but I want to
9 get to the core of so many pieces that I heard that I
10 felt were connected to things like fear. That is
11 what will prevent us from moving forward as one city,
12 our city, our vote. What I kept being reminded of are
13 the immigrant communities that came out without being
14 asked during Sandy to rebuild. The day laborers
15 across the entire city came out and rebuilt our city.
16 They weren't asked to do that. Even when their homes
17 were broken they came out. It's time and time again
18 I've seen immigrants come out and say no to
19 atrocities that they have been experiencing like the
20 [speaking Spanish]. They have come out and said we
21 need changes in the law. Most of them could not
22 vote. These are the people that will continue to
23 make our city better and they will be reflected in
24 our institutions of government as representatives
25 because of that vote, which will be a better city.

1 That's why I'm saying yes, but I also want to say
2 thank you to you all the incredible coalition that
3 held strong over the years. New York Immigration
4 Coalition, thank you for your leadership on this and
5 the Black Institute, CPC, [inaudible], out of my
6 district, so many of you that have been doing the
7 work on the ground to do things like participatory
8 budgeting, so that we can experiment about what
9 happens when we bring people out of the shadows and
10 into government to make decisions in our
11 neighborhood. At one point, more people voted in PB
12 than the people who voted in the Democratic Primary
13 to elect me as the City Council. That's the energy
14 that's waiting. And I want to associate my remarks
15 with Brad Lander who spoke about people who are
16 waiting right now but because of the reform that is
17 not happening at the federal level, they wait, and
18 they languish in the shadows, and today, we're going
19 to bring the light and we're going to bring the love,
20 and I want to say thank you. I vote aye.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, Council
23 Member. Council Member Miller? Council Member
24 Miller only on Introduction 1867A.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: We'll come back. Moya?

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Permission to
3 explain my vote?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Tank you Madam
7 Majority Leader. TO me, this is a very personal vote
8 that I take today. I'm the proud son of an
9 Ecuadorian immigrants. I have the distinction of
10 being the first Ecuadorian-American to ever be
11 elected to public office, not just in the state of
12 New York but in this country, and that would not have
13 been possible without the hard work and effort of my
14 parents. Voting is very important tradition in our
15 household. We always go vote as a family, and
16 there's always been one family member that's never
17 had the opportunity to vote for their son, and that's
18 my mom who's right here. And this is going to be for
19 the women who has given the opportunity to be in
20 elected office, and this one is for my Ma and for
21 about 900,000 immigrants that have truly made a
22 difference in the lives of so many here in New York.
23 I proudly vote aye. This is for my beautiful mother
24 who will get to vote for her son again. Thank you so
25 much.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Council
3 Member Moya. Hi Mom.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Perkins?
5 Powers?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye.
7 Congratulations everyone who will now be able to
8 participate in very important decisions about the
9 City's future. I vote aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Reynoso?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Pass.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Got it. Riley?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?
15 Rodriguez?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to
17 explain my vote?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: We would not
20 be here without Speaker Johnson and his team. Thank
21 you to him and to the great Chief of Staff, Jason,
22 Jim [sic], Kelly, Jeff. I want to also thank my
23 colleagues at the Council who are sponsoring today's
24 legislation, specifically Council Member Danny Dromm,
25 Council Member Margaret Chin. We are the three lead

1
2 prime of this bill because we've been there since
3 2009. I was so lucky to join the Council without
4 waiting for January to be serving. I took office
5 immediately, and this was one of the first bills that
6 I signed when you were the lead prime. So for me
7 this is a train that had never stopped. This is a
8 train that started with Council Member Barron,
9 Council Member Perkins. They were two great African-
10 American leaders who led this fight and we follow
11 them. So thank you. I also wanted to thank
12 everyone, especially all the colleagues here,
13 especially Council Member Fernando Cabrera, the Chair
14 of the Government Operation Committee because of his
15 leadership and his committee, all the member of that
16 committee. Yesterday, we pass it, and then we are
17 here. Last thing I would like to thank the New York
18 Immigration Coalition, United Neighborhood Houses,
19 our city of Coalition [sic], DACA recipients, my
20 office staff, all of them, and Lisa, Evelyn [sic],
21 Thomas, Von Troy [sp?], those of you who worked so
22 hard to be sure that we were able to take this bill
23 to where we are today. All of you worked tirelessly
24 to get us to this point. It is not secret that today
25 inside these Chambers the New York City Council is

1 making history. Many other cities across the nation
2 as well as abroad are watching this meeting today. In
3 one of the most diverse cities in the world, we need
4 to ensure that there is adequate representation for
5 all New Yorkers. That starts by expanding the scope
6 of who is allowed to vote in our local elections.
7 Intro 1867 will allow lawful permanent residents in
8 New York City to vote in municipal elections. That
9 includes immigrants who have green cards, work
10 authorization, DACA recipients, TPS. Our City Our
11 Vote Campaign has been about giving a voice to the
12 voiceless. I know what it is to feel like you live in
13 the shadows working as a dishwasher, taxi driver. I
14 know that- I know what it's like to live with a green
15 card and having people always look down on because of
16 my accent. Even they still believe that I have green
17 card and they're so proud to have green card. My
18 story is a story of every immigrant New Yorkers.
19 Immigrants in New York own over half of the local
20 businesses and contribute over 190 billion dollars to
21 the citywide GDP. During the highs of the pandemic
22 it was our immigrant New Yorkers who kept New York
23 City running. They did not have the luxury of
24 working from home or escaping to the Hampton or to
25

1 the Hudson Valley. Over half of our frontline
2 essential workers are immigrants and approximately
3 one in five are non-citizen New Yorkers. They have
4 all earned the right to participate in our elections.
5 It is estimated that nearly one million immigrant New
6 Yorkers will be eligible to vote. That includes
7 nearly 100,000 Muslim immigrants who will be
8 enfranchised by this bill. Additionally, according
9 to the Black Institute, 50 percent of non-citizens
10 are from Jamaica, Uganda [sic], Haiti, Trinidad and
11 Tobago alone. Furthermore, others are Nigeria,
12 Ghana, Mali, Congo and other countries in Africa, or
13 they're from Europe or they're from Asia, or they're
14 from Latin America. We are on track to write a new
15 chapter in our city history, one that will finally
16 include a voice of all immigrants of all New Yorkers
17 who hold green cards or work authorization, DACAs or
18 TPS. I also think it is important that we look at
19 municipal voting as a midpoint not as a deterrent,
20 giving New Yorkers with green card or working permit
21 the right to vote for the local representative will
22 encourage them to continue their path to citizenship
23 so that they can later vote in federal election. In a
24 time when many states are passing over suppression
25

1
2 law like we haven't seen since the Jim Crow era, New
3 York City-- and thank you Speaker Johnson. Because
4 of your leadership, New York City must be seen as a
5 shining example for all the progressive cities to
6 follow. My hope is that 50 years down the line when
7 our children look back and we will not be here, at
8 this moment they will see a diverse coalition of
9 fighters who came together to change New York City
10 history by giving immigrant New Yorkers the power of
11 the ballot. With that, proudly I vote aye.

12 [speaking Spanish]

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, Council
14 Member. Council Member Rose?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. I vote
16 aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rosenthal?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I vote aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Salamanca?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Treyger?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I'm going to
25 abstain for part of the reasons I mentioned earlier.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, Council Member. Ulrich?

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you. I vote no on Introduction 1621A, 1867--

SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Just voting on the single bill right now.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I apologize. Thank you. I was on a candy run and I didn't hear that announcement. So I do have Reese's Pieces if anybody's interested. If you have low blood sugar, let me know. If you're diabetic, stay away. Alright. So this is just on the-- I vote no. Okay, alright. Thank you. Sorry.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: No.

COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: One of my proudest aye votes. I am very proud to vote yes.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Vernikov?

COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: I vote no.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council Member Yeger?

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Kalman, the mic's not on.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,
3 may I be excused to explain my vote.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yes, sir. Go ahead.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you. Thank
6 you, Mr. Speaker. You know, after I spoke earlier,
7 one of my colleagues mentioned to me, you know, why
8 do you have your back to the cameras when you're
9 talking, and it dawned on me as I listened to the
10 remainder and I've reflected on the last four years
11 about how frequently we speak for the cameras here.
12 Not me, I don't. I speak-- I turn around. I've made
13 it my point since we got back into these chambers
14 always to face my colleagues. I'm not talking to the
15 press. I'm not talking the viewer at home. I'm not
16 talking to the clerks. I'm sorry that I always turn
17 my back on you. I'm not talking to the President of
18 the Council. I'm talking to my colleagues here.
19 That's what we've been doing. We're a legislature.
20 We debate. And you know, as I watched a lot of the
21 performance, I haven't performed. My point when I
22 make a point is to speak to my colleagues, try to
23 convince you I'm right. Sometimes you agree with me.
24 Most of the time you don't. That's okay. And my
25 opposition to this bill is based on a simple reading

1 of the Constitution. There's a basic tenant and
2 statutory interpretation. My Latin is not as good as
3 it used to be. I'm probably going to butcher it, but
4 it essentially [speaking Latin]. When a statute, the
5 Constitution, an ordinance, a rule, a measure says
6 something in a category of things and doesn't say the
7 other things in that category, it necessarily
8 excludes those things. The Minority Leader did far
9 more research than I did, and it's very clear that
10 the Constitution of the State of New York reserves
11 the right to vote to citizens. I didn't write the
12 Constitution. Never served on a Constitutional
13 Convention. We all, members of our party, voted
14 against-- or supported opposition to the
15 Constitutional Convention. We could have gotten up
16 there and changed it if we did, if we wanted to.
17 That's what the Constitution says. As I said at the
18 Committee a few days, if we want to change and bring
19 more people to enfranchisement with the right to
20 vote, then there's a way to do it. Albany can do it.
21 Very simple, we do not have the legal authority to do
22 this. We don't. Want it-- I wanted legal authority
23 to do a lot of things that I don't have the legal
24 authority to do, that's life. That's the oath we
25

1 took, the oath to support the Constitution of the
2 United States and the Constitution of the State of
3 New York. I'm voting no on this bill, thank you very
4 much, and I do that with respect, with respect to the
5 colleagues with whom I've served for the last four
6 years, with respect to Mr. Speaker, with respect to
7 the President of the Council, and even with the
8 respect to the sponsor of this bill. No matter what
9 he says, I will still have respect for him. But the
10 discourse here today I think is something that we all
11 ought to recognize is not how a body should be. It's
12 not what this body should be, and it's unfortunately
13 something we've seen far too often. Thank you very
14 much, Madam President.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brooks-
18 Powers?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Permission
20 to explain my vote?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: So first,
24 I want to take a moment to congratulate my colleague,
25 Council Member Rodriguez, and the coalition of

1
2 advocates behind this bill who worked very hard to
3 empower our immigrant communities and give them a
4 stronger voice in local government. As a first
5 generation American, I recognize this bill is a major
6 step for justice in representation for these vibrant
7 communities. And when I say as a first generation
8 American, I don't mean something far removed, I mean
9 both my parents born in another country, siblings
10 current green card holders. So this is an issue that
11 is very near and dear to me. However, I have been
12 working to have a concern raised by the constituents
13 who have sent me here to the Council to represent
14 them addressed for almost over a month, and that
15 issue, unfortunately, was unable to be addressed in
16 time for today's vote. And as a result of this
17 concern which is the 30-day provision that is in the
18 bill, I will have to unfortunately abstain my vote on
19 this bill, that I felt very deeply about, and quite I
20 feel robbed in this moment as well. But I am looking
21 forward to taking up the mantle that my colleague is
22 leaving behind to perfect and improve this bill in
23 the next council where we can address the many
24 concerns that were raised. It's unfortunate, but
25 this is a-- this is where we can be able to improve

1 the Council in terms of our process and our ability
2 to talk with one another about issues and really
3 sharpen one another around these different nuances
4 with legislation. And so that is truly a Council I'm
5 looking forward to serving in in the next Council.
6 Thank you so much.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cabán?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Very proudly vote
11 aye, and thrilled that this is my first vote. Thank
12 you.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cabrera?

14 Gjonaj?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to
16 explain my vote?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
18 granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you,
20 Majority Leader. To my brother Ydanis, your hard
21 work has proven that success comes with hard work.
22 I'm grateful that you know this was not personal in
23 any way. And for the colleagues that do know me,
24 thank you for the message that you are not a racist.
25 This was an honest conversation and a debate. And

1
2 I'm grateful to have been able to be a part of it
3 without fear of being labeled or for fear of being
4 cancelled out, because that's not what government is
5 and that's not the roles that we have and
6 responsibilities that we have to our constituents and
7 the positions and the office that we hold. I'm
8 hopeful that this bill will become a better bill with
9 the new Council, that you'll have the time to discuss
10 and make a piece of legislation that will assure and
11 protect New York City. This bill in its current form
12 for 30 days of anyone visiting this country being
13 able to vote is a threat to our sovereignty. And
14 with that, I regret that I have to vote no on this
15 bill. I would have loved to have voted yes moving
16 forward. I'd sharpen this to be the best bill that
17 it could be, because that's what New Yorkers deserve.
18 That's what immigrants deserve, and that's what this
19 City warrants from us. I vote no. Thank you.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Koo?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote yes.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Miller?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote yes.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Reynoso?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to
3 explain my vote?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I just want to
7 congratulate Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez and
8 Danny Dromm that the great work that they did on
9 pushing this bill, and for our Speaker Corey Johnson.
10 It's not an easy thing to do, and many of times in
11 our Council and four years in his speakership, we've
12 taken on tough votes. He never did it because it was
13 easy. He always thought-- he always did it because
14 it ws right. So, I just want to thank you, Corey,
15 for putting this together. And to all of the
16 immigrants that have come to this country to
17 contribute, you finally are going to get an
18 opportunity to choose who represents you, and I
19 couldn't be prouder today to vote. Aye on this bill.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Borelli?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you. I
22 vote no.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: This is perhaps
25 the hardest vote that I've taken since I've been in

1 the Council, and I just want to-- I just want to
2 address, because we're not addressing members by
3 name, it was mentioned here that many of the
4 communities that will benefit are many of our African
5 immigrants from the Congo, from Mali, from Nigeria,
6 but according to the research that I saw at the Black
7 Institute, the African community is negligible in
8 terms of the level-- this is not going to amplify
9 their voices in a meaningful way in the City of New
10 York. According to the Black Institute data that was
11 also given to me, the top three ethnic groups that
12 will benefit from this is the Dominican Republic,
13 China, as well as Mexico. Those are the three groups
14 that are going to benefit the most from this in a
15 very substantial way. The other groups that my
16 colleague mentioned are not even in the top 10, and
17 my concern again, is how the African-American
18 community will fair in a situation where our numbers
19 are not amplified in any meaningful way. So I
20 continue to be concerned about that. At Dem
21 Conference I also mentioned, just honestly speaking,
22 you know, this is a conversation that the black and
23 Latino community has to have. It has not happened,
24 because it's not politically correct, but it's a
25

1 conversation that needs to happen. I continue to
2 remain concerned. As I read in Dem Conference about
3 during the presidential election how many of our
4 Latino brothers and sisters voted Republican for
5 President Trump. That concerns me of activating this
6 particular bill because of that reason. I understand
7 that's not politically correct. I understand that
8 people are going to have challenges with it. I need
9 my Latino brothers and sisters to know that they are
10 African brothers and sisters. You are African and we
11 need to move forward collectively as African people
12 and to stop the divisions. We are not black and
13 brown. We are multiple shades of black. And I'm
14 just going to conclude with that, and I'm going to
15 say on this bill I vote no. I encourage the next
16 Council to vote on a bill that's better, that is more
17 constructive, that brings all the different multiple
18 perspectives into play, that answers key questions on
19 how it's going to impact the City of New York, and
20 how it empowers all communities moving forward.
21 Thank you so much. I turn it over back to Speaker
22 Johnson.
23

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?
25

1
2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I proudly vote aye on
3 this bill. Congratulations to Council Member
4 Rodriquez and to all the advocates. Today is a
5 historic day for New York City and for the United
6 States of America. Congratulations, Ydanis.

7 [applause]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: By a vote of 33 in
9 the affirmative, 14 in the negative, and 2
10 abstentions. Intro 1867A is hereby adopted.
11 Congratulations, Council Member Rodriguez.

12 [applause]

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We still have a whole
14 lot of voting to do, so let's try to get through it.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Only--

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Yeah, we
17 have a quorum.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We are now back
19 into the discussion of General Orders. Moving onto--

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Are people
21 signed up for it?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Yes, it is.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Oh, people should maybe
24 think about waving their time and speaking during
25 their allotted voting window.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Okay. I will call
3 on each member and-- these are on the bills that we
4 are about to vote on.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: And they could also
6 take time to speak when they vote instead of speaking
7 now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And Speaker Corey
9 Johnson has recommended that you speak when your bill
10 is put forward for a vote when it is your turn to
11 vote. So, I will-- out of fairness, I will call on a
12 member. You can decide to speak or say I will
13 reserve my time for my vote. We will begin with
14 Council Member Treyger followed by Holden, Menchaca,
15 Feliz, and Barron.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Council Member Treyger?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Majority Leader,
18 I will pass.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
20 Member Treyger. Council Member Holden?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [inaudible]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Good idea.

23 Council Member Menchaca?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [inaudible]

1 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Wow, alright.
2 Council Member Feliz?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: I'll deliver my
4 remarks on voting. Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. And
6 Council Member Barron?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You almost made
8 it through, but I promise it won't be two minutes.

9 [applause]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I just want to
11 speak to my colleagues very briefly about Intro Nine.
12 All of you know that my background is education.
13 It's interesting to share a brief story since we're
14 telling stories and sharing memories. When I was
15 appointed as a principal at PS81, my mother and I
16 went to the school to bless the school, and her
17 blessing was that I would have it easy, but my prayer
18 was that Lord, don't let anything significant or
19 major happen to any of my children while I'm here.
20 Their safety was of utmost concern to me, and it's in
21 that vein that I'm introducing Intro Nine, yes, one,
22 two, three, four, five, six, seven, eight, nine,
23 which says that by September 30th, the Department of
24 Transportation will identify each intersection
25

1 immediately adjacent to a school that does not have a
2 traffic control device such as a stop sign or traffic
3 control, and that by no later than September 30th,
4 2024, the DOT would have installed a traffic control
5 device at each such intersection. And I just want to
6 thank-- it was originally introduced as an Intro-- I
7 mean, as a Reso, but we fought and the legal team
8 helped to design it so that it could be a Local Law.
9 and I just want to thank Corey Johnson, Jason
10 Goldman, Ydanis Rodriguez, Director Jeff Baker,
11 Tereza Nassa [sp?], Brad Lee [sp?], Elliott Lynn,
12 Jessica Albin [sp?], Rick Arbello [sp?], Kevin
13 Koslowtiz, and my staff, Chief of Staff Amawali Clay
14 [sp?], and my Legislative Director and CUNY Liaison
15 Indigo Washington, and I just want to say that Ms.
16 Washington will be leaving. Tomorrow is her last
17 day, and I'll have more comments on that at a later
18 portion of the meeting. Thank you.

19
20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you,
21 Council Member Barron. We will now move into the
22 discussion of General Orders.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We just did.
24
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Excuse me, I'm
3 sorry. We'll now move into report of special
4 committees.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Before we get there, I
7 want to just-- before I forget, I want to wish our
8 colleague, Council Member-- I feel bad she's had to
9 endure this on her birthday, Council Member Adrienne
10 Adams, happy birthday. Very happy birthday to you.

11 [applause]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: What a way to
13 spend your birthday.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: She wants to hear about
15 the reports of standing committees.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
17 on Civil Service and Labor, Preconsidered Intro 2454
18 collective bargaining.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
20 Orders.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
22 on Consumer Affairs and Business Licensing, Intro
23 2130A, student loan forgiveness.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
25 General Orders.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
3 on Contracts, Intro 1624A minority and women-owned
4 business enterprises.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
6 General Orders.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
8 on Environmental Protection, Intro 51A, geothermal
9 exchange systems.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
11 General Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2425A Borough-- DEP
13 Borough Commissioners.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
15 General Orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2460A Environmental
17 remediation.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
19 General Orders.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
21 on Finance, Intro 1520A Parking Violations Bureau.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
23 General Orders.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Into 2458 Business
25 Improvement District.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
3 Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Reso 1839,
5 transparency resolution.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
7 Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 939 and
9 Reso 1841 through Preconsidered LU 943 and Reso 1845
10 tax exemption.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
12 Orders.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
14 on Fire and Emergency Management, Intro 1949A,
15 emergency plans.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
17 General Orders.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
19 on General Welfare, Intro 147A and 2176A supportive
20 housing.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
22 General Orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
24 on Governmental Operations, Intro 1621A Nuclear
25 Disarmament Advisory Committee.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2459A, Office of
5 Information Privacy.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
7 General Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
9 on Health, Intro 1625B non-surgical contraception.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
11 General Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
13 on Housing and Buildings, Intro 2309A, short term
14 rentals.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
16 General Orders.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
18 on Land Use, Intro 2443A, joint living working
19 quarters for artists.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved and laid over.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 899 through 904, 175
22 Park Avenue, and LU 906 and 907, 250 Water Street.

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
24 modifications and referred to the City Planning
25

2 Commission pursuant to Section 197D of the New York
3 City Charter.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: LUs 914 and 915, special
5 Brooklyn Navy Yard District, and LUs 918 and 919,
6 SoHo, NoHo Neighborhood Plan.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
8 modification and referred to City Planning Commission
9 pursuant to Section 197D of the New York City
10 Charter.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 922 Bed-Stuy East and
12 Weeksville [sic] Mosaic.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
14 Orders.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 923, health and fitness
16 citywide text amendment.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
18 Orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 924, fresh two zoning
20 text amendment, LUs 925 and 926, 10316 Vanwick [sp?]
21 Expressway rezoning, and LUs 929 and 930 River Ring
22 [sp?].

23 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
24 modifications and referred to the City Planning

2 Commission pursuant to Section 197D of the New York
3 City Charter.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 931 and Reso 1848,
5 Stapleton Beacon article.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
7 Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 932 through 936 River
9 Ring.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
11 modifications and referred to the City Planning
12 Commission pursuant to section 197D of the New York
13 City Charter.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 937 and Reso 1849B, 79
15 Self Storage rezoning.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
17 Orders.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 938, 16005 Arch
19 Avenue.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
21 modifications and referred to the City Planning
22 Commission pursuant to Section 197D of the New York
23 City Charter.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 944 and
25 Reso 1850, New York City Law Department office space.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled to be filed
3 pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 945 and
5 Reso 1851 through Preconsidered LU 948 and Reso 1854,
6 school facilities.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
8 Orders.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 949 and
10 Reso 1855, Coney Island Amusement Park.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved and laid over.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LUs 950 and
13 951, 79 Quay [sp?] Street.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with
15 modifications and referred to the City Planning
16 Commission pursuant to Section 197D of the New York
17 City Charter.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 952 and
19 Reso 1856 and Preconsidered LU 953 and Reso 1857,
20 31st Street and Haight [sp?] Avenue rezoning.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
22 Orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 954 and
24 Reso 1858 and Preconsidered LU 955 and Reso 1859,
25 4520 83rd Street.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
3 Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered LU 956 and
5 Reso 1860 and LU 957 and Reso 1861, One White [sic]
6 Avenue.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
8 Orders.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
10 on Mental Health, Disabilities and Addiction, Intro
11 2141A removing outdated clinic language.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
13 General Orders.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2442A Office of
15 Community Mental Health.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
17 General Orders.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee on
19 Parks and Recreation, Intro 2366A, tree inspections.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
21 General Orders.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
23 on Public Safety, Intro 2297A, Police Department
24 qualifications.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
3 General Orders.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2440A Civilian
5 Complaint Review Board.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
7 General Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
9 on Rules, Privileges, and Elections M346 and Reso
10 1862, approving the appointment of Leah Goodrich,
11 Planning Commission.

12 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
13 Orders.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: M347 Reso 1863 approving
15 the appointment of Joseph Twig [sp?], Planning
16 Commission.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
18 Orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
20 on Transportation, Intro 9A, traffic control devices
21 near schools.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
23 General Orders.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro. 1724A, passing
25 stopped school buses.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
3 General Orders with a message of necessity.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2201A use of
5 photographic evidence by motorcyclists.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
7 General Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2417A, prohibiting
9 the obscuring of licenses plates.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
11 General Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
13 on Veterans, Intro 479A and 2354B, City veteran
14 benefits and Veterans Advisory Board.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
16 General Orders.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee
18 on Women and Gender Equity, Intro 1085B Civil Legal
19 Services for domestic violence survivors.

20 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
21 General Orders.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Intro 2372B, Gender
23 Motivated Violence Act.

24 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on
25 General Orders.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 146

2 COUNCIL CLERK: General Orders Calendar
3 LU 911 and Reso 1864, citywide hotels text amendment.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
5 Orders.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: General Orders Calendar
7 LU 916 and Reso 1865 and LU 917 and Reso 1866, 506
8 Third Avenue.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
10 Orders.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: General Orders Calendar
12 LU 920 and Reso 1867 and LU 921 and Reso 1868,
13 Starrett-LeHigh terminal warehouse rezoning.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
15 Orders.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing
17 various persons Commissioner of Deeds.

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General
19 Orders. And at this time, I am asking for the Clerk
20 to take a roll call vote on all of the items coupled
21 on today's General Order Calendar. Let's get this
22 done.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Gibson?
24
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Mr. Speaker,
3 thank you Madam Majority Leader. I proudly eye on
4 all of today's agenda items. Thank you so much.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thanks Vanessa.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Adams?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: [inaudible]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
9 granted. Because it's your birthday.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: [inaudible] Thank
11 you, Madam Majority Leader. Today, one of the many
12 important bills we're voting on is Introduction 2440,
13 my bill to empower the Civilian Complaint Review
14 Board to initiate its own complaints and
15 investigations for allegations of police officer
16 misconduct. Currently, the CCRB only has the
17 authority to conduct an investigation in response to
18 complaints filed by a member of the public. This
19 longstanding policy, however, unfairly places the
20 burden on the victims of officer wrong-doing and can
21 lead to long delays for these investigations.
22 Members of the public often do not file complaints to
23 the CCRB for a variety of reasons, including fear of
24 retaliation or just not knowing where to begin.
25 Introduction 2440 will change this by allowing the

1 agency to be proactive and not have to wait before
2 they take action. As the nation's largest civilian
3 oversight agency, the CCRB has the important
4 responsibility of looking into and issuing findings
5 for bad behavior, including excessive use of force,
6 abuse of authority, bias-based policing, and racial
7 profiling. Enhancing their authority will lead to
8 greater accountability when it comes to public
9 safety. As a council we have passed many great
10 reforms on policing this past year, and this is the
11 latest reform that will make a difference for all New
12 Yorkers. I urge all of my colleagues to support this
13 long over-due, but common sense, legislation. Thank
14 you, Speaker Johnson, for your leadership and Chief
15 Of Staff Jason Goldman. Special thanks to Committee
16 Counsel Josh Kingsley and Matthew Thompson [sp?] for
17 your work, and lastly, my Chief of Staff and my
18 Legislative Director Jamal Wilkerson [sp?] and
19 Benjamin Fang [sp?]. Thank you very much, Madam
20 Majority Leader.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye on all.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Ampry-Samuel?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel votes aye on all. Thank you. Ayala?

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ayala votes aye on all. Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to explain my vote?

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission granted.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. As I started saying, my Legislative Director and CUNY Liaison, Indigo Washington will be leaving. Tomorrow is her last day. She did start with my husband, Charles Barron, in 2009 and has been instrumental in supporting our legislation, our committee hearings, Women's Caucus, and the BLAC and CUNY agenda. And most people will know that she's been quite instrumental in organizing and pushing for the union effort for staffing. She will be working with the incoming Senator Cordell Clear [sp?] in Harlem where she resides, and I just wanted to wish her the best as she goes through her new path. She's been very helpful all of this time, and we're going to miss her.

[applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Regarding my vote. I vote aye on all with the exception of 918, 919, which I'm voting no, and I abstain on 906, 907, 908, 909, 929, 930. And I vote no on 2440, which was just referenced. The reason I vote no on that is because it in fact violates our policy of first in time. This portion of the bill is a part of the Community Power Act which says, "police oversight with elected review," and this portion of that elected review board calls for exactly this. I stated previously my objection to the violation of policy this body regarding first in time, and if in fact, my bill as a part of the ECR bill was reported first, it should have had a standing, it should have had a vote, and that did not happen, and I object vehemently to that. I think that extracting pieces of the ECR bill is designed to eviscerate the bill, water the bills down, and take away the meat and the substance of the bill, and for that reason I'm voting no, and I encourage my colleagues who understand what process is and how important it is--

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: [interposing] Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: to vote no on
2440. Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you, Council
Member Barron.

COUNCIL CLERK: Brannan?

COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Brooks-
Powers?

COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I vote aye
on all.

COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cabán?

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: [inaudible]

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
granted. Please come forward.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you,
Majority Leader. I'm honored to be here at my first
Stated Meeting.

COUNCIL CLERK: One moment.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Better? Great.
Thank you, Majority Leader. Honored to be here at my
first Stated Meeting and grateful for all of the help
the Speaker, Jason, and staff have provided to make
this transition as seamless as possible. Thrilled to
not only have had an opportunity to vote for the

1 landmark Our City Our Vote bill, but the other great
2 bills on the agenda today. Congratulations to my new
3 colleagues on their work to make our streets safer,
4 expand access to contraception, and create a
5 Supportive Housing Tenant's Bill of Rights. We're
6 also voting today on a Land Use project in my
7 district. My predecessor worked on the project for
8 years, a project that will bring affordable housing
9 and significant community space to a transit-rich
10 part of the district. And while I came in in the
11 ninth inning of this project, in these final few days
12 we were able to get a commitment from the applicant
13 to fund a quarter of a million dollars of
14 improvements to the playground across the street.
15 Going forward, I'm excited to work on Land Use
16 projects that further the vision of housing as a
17 human right, and universal public good, not a vehicle
18 for the profits of developers and landlords. That's
19 how we affirm the dignity and wellbeing of working
20 class New Yorkers and cultivate the strong community
21 bonds that are the cornerstone of true public safety.
22 So I vote aye on all with the exception of Intro
23 1724A, in which I vote no. Thanks.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Cabrera?
3 Carr?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: I'm going to be
5 voting no on Introduction 1621A, 2309A, 2440A, and
6 M346 with accompanying Resolution 1862, and then aye
7 on the rest.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Chin?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye on all.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Chin votes
11 aye on all. Cornegy?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Darma Diaz?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye on all.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Ruben Diaz,
16 Senior? Dinowitz?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Permission to
18 explain my vote?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
20 granted.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I just want to
22 take a quick moment. One of the bills we're voting
23 on today is a charter revision on which I'm prime
24 sponsor. I want take a moment to thank Bianca Vitale
25 and Elizabeth Arzt, as well as Jenna Klous [sp?] and

2 Mike Corbit [sp?] for their work on this legislation
3 which will expand the Veterans Advisory Board to
4 include family members of veterans and to, you know,
5 clarify that we support all veterans here in New York
6 City regardless of their discharge status. And with
7 that, I vote aye on-- I vote aye on all.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Dromm?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Would like to
10 thank all of the advocates who are across the street
11 right now watching the live stream of this who really
12 came out in support of nuclear disarmament. I thank
13 you for all that you've done. And with that, I'd
14 like to say that I vote yes on all. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Eugene?
16 Riley?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Aye on all.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Feliz?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Permission to
20 explain my vote?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you. Today
24 I have the honor and the privilege of introducing my
25 first bill ever, Intro 2459A which establishes the

1 Office of Information Privacy, an office that will
2 implement and oversee privacy protection policies in
3 the City of New York. The great people of our city
4 provide sensitive information to our government
5 agencies every single day and in so many different
6 ways. They do it when applying to our public
7 schools, when they are obtaining healthcare services,
8 and also even when they are seeking legal services.
9 They provide their most private information. And
10 also, many of the agencies even share information to
11 be able to quickly and effectively provide services.
12 By creating the Office of Information Privacy, we
13 will help make sure that sensitive information
14 provided to our agencies is truly kept private.
15 It'll also help ensure that people can continue to
16 see government services with trust, trust that their
17 private information will be kept private. For those
18 reasons, I proudly vote yes on my bill Intro 2459A,
19 and I encourage everybody else to vote yes as well.
20 And I also vote yes on the rest of the bills. Thank
21 you.

22
23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you and
24 congratulations.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gennaro?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Gjonaj?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye on all.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Grodenchik?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Not bad for
8 an old guy. Aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, sir. Holden?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Permission to
11 explain?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
13 granted.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So I vote aye on
15 all with the exception of Intro 2440, Intro 1763,
16 Intro 2265, and Reso 976. No also on LU 918 and LU
17 919. I'd just like to make a few comments on my
18 Intro 2417, which is really prohibiting the
19 obstructing of the license plates, now a common
20 practice for career criminals who routinely use
21 products that distort or hide license plates from
22 cameras and law enforcement agencies. Many of these
23 products can be purchased from well-known online
24 realtors-- retailers, I'm sorry. The bill will
25 prohibit the sale or distribution of any materials or

1 substance with purposes to conceal or obscure the
2 license plate numbers and so forth. We're seeing a
3 lot of that. The way this happened, I was driving in
4 my neighborhood and right in front of us was a car, a
5 SUV, that went into the other lane speeding, and was
6 attempting to go through the traffic light, and he
7 had a curtain that came down like James Bond over the
8 license plate. And by the way, they get that on
9 Amazon. I've already spoken to Amazon. They are
10 going to discontinue the sale before this becomes
11 law, but I just want to urge all my colleagues to
12 vote Intro 2417 which would make this illegal to
13 sell, these contraptions, in the City of New York. I
14 want to thank, by the way, Speaker Corey Johnson and
15 many of the cosponsors on this bill. We had 29, I
16 believe, 29 cosponsors of all, you know, both sides
17 of the aisle. I also want to thank Jason Goldman,
18 obviously, the Chief of Staff, Legislative Director
19 Jeff Baker, Transportation Committee Chair Rodriguez,
20 my Chief of Staff Daniel Carzina [sp?], and my
21 Legislative Director Craig Carawana [sp?]. Thank you
22 so much.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Kallos
3 votes aye on all. Council Member Koo?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye on all.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Koslowitz?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Lander?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
9 permission to explain my vote?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
11 granted. Where'd you go?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you. I want
13 to congratulate and welcome Council Member Vernikov,
14 Carr, and Cabán. Our city will be better [inaudible]
15 service. Congratulations to the [inaudible] debate
16 and disagreement is good in a democratic body. I'm
17 going to vote no on Intro 1724A. While motorists
18 should never pass a school bus, mercifully, this
19 behavior has not been linked to serious injuries or
20 fatalities in New York City, and I'm concerned about
21 the potential of this bill to open up the possibility
22 of the privatization of enforcement, and the
23 expansion of fees and fines for revenue purposes. In
24 Suffolk County where this bill was implemented, 45
25 percent of the fee revenue collected went to the

2 vendor. I care a lot about and believe we should
3 engage in automated enforcement, but I think we have
4 to be really judicious in how we do it. I'm also
5 very enthusiastic about the nuclear disarmament
6 bills. Congratulations Danny Dromm. I pledge as New
7 York City Comptroller to work with this community and
8 explore the divestment of the New York City pension
9 funds from the sale and development of nuclear
10 weapons. I vote aye on the rest.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: My apologies, Council
12 Member Lander, could you repeat that. My apologies.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: No on 1724, aye
14 on the rest.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, sir.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
19 explain, Madam Majority Leader?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
21 granted.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
23 much. Today, the Council's voting on two bills that
24 I'm proud to sponsor, Intro 147A which requires the
25 Department of Social Services to produce an annual

1 report of supportive housing placements, Proposed
2 Intro 2176A which requires that a bill of rights be
3 distributed to supportive housing tenants. Our city
4 is facing a homelessness crisis and supportive
5 housing is considered the most successful existing
6 model for ending chronic homelessness among
7 vulnerable populations. It is a lynchpin in the
8 fight for successful housing. Residents have a place
9 to call home and an environment that provides direct
10 case management and access to mental health
11 providers. This integrated service model enables
12 people to connect to the programs that are right for
13 them and access care that they deserve. Simply put,
14 supportive housing is housing for those most in need.
15 Because it is so important, it is our responsibility
16 to make sure that we are upholding the highest
17 standards for residents who are vulnerable and
18 maintaining adequate accountability. Some advocates
19 have argued that the easiest to serve clients are
20 accepted in supportive housing, and we need to be
21 targeting our approach to house those most in need of
22 care. Intro 147A will require DSS to produce an
23 annual report on the number of individuals eligible
24 for, referred to, accepted, and rejected for
25

1
2 supportive housing placement and the reason the
3 client has been rejected for placement. This data
4 will help us to figure out together if there are any
5 hiccups in the system or communities who are being
6 underserved and opportunities for improvement. In
7 addition, 2176A would require DSS to provide a notice
8 to supportive housing residents of their rights
9 pursuant to various state and local laws. This bill
10 would help improve transparency and ensure supportive
11 housing tenants know their rights. I'm a strong
12 supporter of supportive housing. It's a proven
13 valuable resource in addressing street homelessness.
14 These bills will help ensure that supportive housing
15 programs are successful and reach the target
16 populations so that those most in need are supported
17 are well served. I just want to thank Speaker Corey
18 Johnson, Chief of Staff Jason Goldman, my staff,
19 committee staff, and all the advocates that worked on
20 this legislation. Thank you very much. I vote aye
21 on all.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: I vote aye on
25 all.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Louis?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: I vote aye on all.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Maisel?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes on all,
6 accept no on 1621.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Menchaca?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
9 explain my vote?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I want to bring
13 in some remarks that I was going to make during
14 general discussions. One, I think not only I'm so
15 happy that we passed the bill. there's going to be
16 future discussions, and I won't be here as a Council
17 Member to be part of those future discussions, but as
18 I listened to today's debate about the amendment
19 time-- or another amendment that may come to the
20 floor around 30 days, I just want to say this: I
21 think-- it feels wrong to segregate a population that
22 are New Yorkers and giving them a different timeline
23 to get access to the same right. Separate but not
24 equal is real, and we've discussed that as a country.
25 And so I hope that echoes in this chamber after I

1
2 leave. I also want to say thank you to Speaker
3 Johnson and Jason. They did a lot to lift for the
4 bill that we just passed, Our City Our Vote, and I
5 didn't say thank you to them, and I just want to say
6 thank you. Next, I don't want to-- I want to speak
7 on a budget item. Key to the City has been something
8 that has been so strong in commitment from this
9 Council, but it was defunded during our budget
10 crisis. There was a lot of opposition in the BNT
11 about this, and I'm so happy that today we're going
12 to be restoring Key to the City to the New York
13 Immigration Coalition at 700,000 dollars, and we
14 heard your concerns. We have reshaped the program
15 and it fits so well and how we are thinking about Our
16 City Our Vote, because this is going to support new
17 immigrants, newly arrived immigrants, refugees, and
18 indigenous speaking communities to overcome the
19 language and cultural barriers so that they get
20 access to education, public health benefits, and
21 seeking mental health services. Legal services will
22 also be part of how they connect to the City of New
23 York. When we're talking about the new immigrants
24 we've just enfranchised, those who are legally
25 permanent residents, this is a part of what the

1 Council has done and is committed to. And I want to
2 say thank you to Moya and Salamanca who had a lot of
3 concerns, and I'm so thankful that they are
4 supportive of this. I am voting no on Land Use item
5 918 and 919. This is the SoHo/NoHo rezoning plan
6 that the mayor has pushed. Thank you.
7

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller? Moya?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Powers?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Reynoso?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on
15 all.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rivera?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to
18 explain my vote?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
20 granted.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you for the
22 opportunity to speak with you today to make history
23 and take care of our neighbors. I'll proudly be
24 voting aye on all of the bills, and especially proud
25 to bring municipal voting to New York City. In

1 everything I do I prioritize building a future for
2 New York City that is safe, equitable, and inclusive.
3 I have several pieces of legislation before the body
4 today that help achieve that goal, and to be
5 introducing three new bills that will create big
6 positive change for New Yorkers. The first bill
7 known as the LARC Bill, that we'll be-- that we have
8 voted on today. It requires city health clinics to
9 provide long-acting reversible contraception, or
10 LARC, to all New Yorkers regardless of ability to
11 pay, making New York City the leader in access to
12 reproductive healthcare that we know we are. In
13 acknowledgment of our nation's history of forced
14 sterilization, specifically in the Puerto Rican
15 community. This bill also mandates DOHMH provide
16 culturally sensitive education on LARC options
17 because true access includes informed decision
18 making. Introduction 2372B, my bill with the
19 phenomenal Council Member Selvena Brooks-Powers,
20 offers a path to healing for survivors who have been
21 failed by the very institutions tasked to protect
22 them by creating a two-year look-back window for
23 survivors of gender-motivated violence to file civil
24 actions against their assailants under the Gender-

1 motivated Violence Protection Act of 2000, even if
2 the statute of limitations in the case has already
3 expired. As New Yorkers, we pride ourselves on being
4 ahead of the curb, but when it comes to codified
5 language on disability, we are woefully behind. My
6 other bill, Introduction 2141 removes clinically
7 outdated derogatory terms from our city's health
8 laws, replacing them with language that ensures the
9 city can provide inclusive, person-first services to
10 all New Yorkers. And finally, my last bill, 2201
11 brings a long overdue solution for bureaucratic
12 challenges facing motorcyclists. I'm so happy and
13 pleased that we're voting on these four bills today.
14 Thank you to everyone who voted aye. I encourage the
15 rest of y'all to do the same, and to sign onto the
16 three bills I am also proudly introducing, including
17 Hotels to Housing, a game-changing bill to increase
18 our affordable housing stock. Thank you so much. I
19 proudly vote aye.

20
21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Council
23 Member Miller?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Good evening. I
25 will be voting aye on all with the exceptions of 1724

1
2 for which I will be voting no, and 2440 which I will
3 be abstaining.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rodriguez?
7 Rose?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I vote aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Rosenthal?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: With
11 congratulations to my colleagues, aye on all.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Salamanca?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Treyger?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
16 explain my vote?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission
18 granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Colleagues, I
20 speak this evening, now, on my bill Intro 1085B, a
21 Local Law in relation to Civil Legal Services for
22 domestic violence survivors who are a party to a
23 divorce proceeding. The bill was introduced in
24 August of 2018. The world has changed a lot since
25 then, but unfortunately, with the pandemic we know

1 domestic violence has only gotten worse. In May of
2 2018 the New York Times wrote an article called
3 "Their Husbands Abuse Them, Shouldn't Divorce Be
4 Easy." This article gave a harrowing insight into
5 the struggles so many women face when they seek a
6 divorce. Because of this historic bill, victims and
7 survivors of domestic violence can focus on their
8 safety without having to worry about the cost of a
9 divorce. The bill will offer free legal services for
10 domestic violence survivors who are party to a
11 divorce proceeding. Your safety shouldn't be
12 determined by your income. No one should have to
13 stay in an abusive marriage, simply because they
14 can't afford a divorce lawyer, and as we know,
15 domestic violence impacts all of our communities
16 across the city. This is an important bill, and I
17 ask my colleagues to vote aye. I want to thank Chair
18 Darma Diaz, Brenda McKinney, Chloe Rivera, Smita
19 Deshmukh, Anna [inaudible] my Chief of Staff, Vanessa
20 Ogle [sp?], Maria Henderson, and with that, I vote
21 aye with the exception of 2440, where I vote no.
22 Thank you, Majority Leader.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Madam Majority
3 Leader, I'd like to vote aye on all with the
4 exception of Introduction 1621A, 1867A, 2309A, 2440A,
5 and M346 with accompanying Resolution 1862, and aye
6 on the rest as I mentioned. Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I vote no on
10 2440 and aye on all the rest, and everyone safely
11 [sic] home. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Van Bramer?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye on all.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Vernikov?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Madam Majority
16 Leader, no on Introduction 1621, 2309, 2440, and M346
17 with accompanying Reso 1862, and aye on the rest.
18 Thank you.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,
22 may I be excused to explain my vote?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very
25 much. First off, I neglected to say publicly what I

1 said privately, just welcome to my new colleagues,
2 our new colleagues, Council Member Cabán, Carr,
3 Vernikov with whom I share a larger border. I look
4 forward to working with you all. You know, I look
5 around the room and it's-- is that clock right? It's
6 5:50, and you know, there was a member of this body
7 once that suggested that Council Members ought to get
8 paid overtime-- I don't agree with that, by the way,
9 I disagree with that.
10

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I disagree with
13 that. Council Members should not get paid overtime.
14 To be clear, that's my position. That Council Member
15 is not in the room now because they're busy outside
16 doing interviews, because that's the way they feel
17 that their job is. Our job is in here or in our
18 community, not shilling for the press and making our
19 points for the camera and the picture. Not you, Joe,
20 relax. I vote aye on all with the exception of
21 Introduction 2458. Very briefly, I typically vote
22 against the increase of bid assessments because those
23 are taxes. Those are taxes that have to be assessed
24 on people who do business in those neighborhood
25 because the City refuses to provide the basic

1 services that are necessary. It shouldn't be that
2 way. People pay taxes, they ought to get the
3 services. So I'm voting no on 2458. I'm voting no
4 on 2440, no LU 911 with accompanying Resolution 1864.
5 Voting no on Introduction 2309 for the reasons I said
6 at committee on that, I believe. I am voting no
7 Introduction 2460. I am voting no on LU 918 and 919,
8 LU 924, and I'm abstaining on Introduction 1621 for
9 the reasons I stated at Committee. And I have one
10 more no vote, excuse me. Usually better at this. I
11 vote no on Introduction M346 and accompanying
12 Resolution 1862. Thank you very much Madam
13 President.

14
15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Always problems,
18 huh? Always problems. I vote aye on all except
19 1621A, 2309, 2440A, and M346 with accompanying
20 Resolution 1862. Good night everyone.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Last call, Cabrera?
22 Ruben Diaz, Senior? Perkins? Rodriguez? Eugene?
23 Council Member Eugene?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, sir. Cumbo?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all.

5 Folks that are on Zoom, we still need you. We have a
6 Resolution. So please don't leave.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: All items of
8 today's-- order, excuse me. Can we have quiet in the
9 Chamber? All items on today's General Order Calendar
10 are adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 0
11 negative and 0 abstentions, with the exception of
12 Intro 2440-A which was adopted by a vote of 37 in the
13 affirmative, 9 negative, and 1 abstention. Intro
14 1621A which was adopted by a vote of 41 in the
15 affirmative, 5 negative, and 1 abstention, and Intro
16 1724A which was adopted by a vote of 44 in the
17 affirmative, 3 negative, 0 abstentions. And intro
18 2309 which was adopted by a vote of 42 in the
19 affirmative, 5 negative and 0 abstentions. And M346
20 and Resolution 1862 which was adopted by a vote of 42
21 in the affirmative, 5 negative, and 0 abstentions.
22 And Intro 2458 which was adopted by a vote of 46 in
23 the affirmative, 1 negative, and 0 abstentions. And
24 LU 911 and Resolution 1864 which was adopted by a

1
2 vote of 46 in the affirmative, 1 negative, and 0
3 abstentions. Introduction and reading of bills.

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills are referred
5 to committees as indicated on today's agenda.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. We'll
7 now move into discussion of Resolutions. Are there
8 any Council Members that have signed up to speak on
9 today's Resolutions? There are no members that wish
10 to speak on today's resolution. If we could please
11 have quiet in the Chamber? We are now going to move
12 into a voice vote on today's Resolution. If you wish
13 to vote against or abstain from today's Resolution,
14 please notify the Legislative Documents Unit by email
15 right now. I'll now read today's Resolution into the
16 record. Resolution 976A calls on the New York City
17 Comptroller to instruct the pension funds of public
18 employees in the New York City to divest from an
19 avoid any financial exposure to companies involved in
20 the production and maintenance of nuclear weapons.
21 Reaffirms New York City as a nuclear weapons-free
22 zone. Joins the ICAN [sic] City's appeal and calls
23 on the United States to support and join the treaty
24 on the prohibition of nuclear weapons. Will all
25 those in favor please say aye?

ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: All opposed say nay. Hard to tell sometimes. Any abstentions? The ayes have it. We will now move into General Discussion. Are there any members that wish to speak on General Discussion? I'm informing Speaker Johnson that we have 12 members ready to speak on General--

[laughter]

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader, I move to replace the Chair for the rest of the meeting.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: We have Council Member Kallos.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: No we don't.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Seeing as we have no members signed up to speak on General Discussion, I will now call on Speaker Corey Johnson to close today's Stated Meeting.

SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader, you didn't use all the time on your clock in remarks earlier, so if you want to-- the Stated Meeting of December 9th, 2021 is hereby adjourned. One Stated Meeting left. Thank you all very much.

[gavel]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[TRANSCRIBER'S NOTE] VOTE CLARIFICATION:

Introduction 2460 is adopted by the Council with 46
in the affirmative, 1 negative, and zero abstentions.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 13, 2022