

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES  
Of the  
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

April 18, 2016  
Start: 10:28 a.m.  
Recess: 12:10 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Daniel R. Garodnick  
James Vacca  
Margaret S. Chin  
Stephen T. Levin  
Deborah L. Rose  
James G. Van Bramer  
David G. Greenfield  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Nilda Mesa, Director  
NYC Mayor's Office of Sustainability

Keith Kerman, Chief Fleet Officer  
Department of Citywide Administrative Services, DCAS

Will Nicholas, Government Relations Manager  
Tesla Motors, Incorporated

Kevin Miller, Director  
Public Policy  
Charge Point

Kimberly Ong, Attorney  
Natural Resources Defense Council

Bethany Bowyer, Deputy Director  
Real Estate and Planning  
Downtown Brooklyn Partnership

Christina Focaccia  
Energy E-Z-GO

2 [sound check, pause]

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good morning and  
4 welcome to today's hearing of the New York City  
5 Council Transportation Committee. I am Ydanis  
6 Rodriguez, Chair of the Committee, and I am joined by  
7 my colleague Council Member Constantinides, Rose,  
8 Vacca and Lander. As we kicked off Earth Work the--  
9 in Union Square yesterday, I saw how motivated our  
10 city is to lower our collective impact on the  
11 environment. Today's hearing is directly tied to  
12 this goal focusing specifically on how to  
13 considerably reduce emission output related to  
14 vehicles. We will vote on a resolution and consider  
15 legislation aimed at finding alternatives to fossil  
16 fuel burning cars that remain so prevailing on our  
17 streets. Today, we will also vote on Resolution 1013  
18 sponsored by myself and Council Member Constantinides  
19 that would officially designate Earth Day this year,  
20 this coming Friday Care-Free Day in New York City.  
21 This initiative announced last month is designated to  
22 lower our reliance on cars in New York City,  
23 encourage carpooling, public transportation--  
24 transportation and active transportation such biking  
25 or walking at the same time that we recognize that

2 many neighborhoods, especially in Queens and  
3 Brooklyn, they have to rely on cars because they  
4 don't have other alternatives. This landmark day in  
5 New York City will be just the first of an annual  
6 celebration of the many options New Yorkers have to  
7 move about. The last organization that came on board  
8 supporting this initiative are Catholic Church with  
9 Cardinal Ballen (sp?) District 37 related in 32 BJ.  
10 Working with this strong support of the  
11 Administration we will close down several area--  
12 several areas to car traffic in the city especially  
13 Broadway from Union Square to 23rd Street area around  
14 NYU and Washington Heights, Wadsworth from 173rd to  
15 177, allowing pedestrians to foot the public space  
16 without fear of moving vehicles. We have seen  
17 tremendous success from similar initiatives in cities  
18 across the world including Paris last year managing  
19 Bubble Car, and we want to regain our status as a  
20 global leader on climate change and sustainability  
21 efforts.

22 I want to remind everyone that Earth Day  
23 is again this coming Friday, and we ask everyone to  
24 please leave their cars including myself that own a  
25 car. I'm one of those 1.4 million New Yorkers that

2 have a car, and this coming Friday I have to find a  
3 way on how to take my daughters to the two school,  
4 keep going to my business as council member, but only  
5 using public transportation. If we are able, we can  
6 commute to work using bike, train, buses and then we  
7 can help our environment and, therefore, to save our  
8 planet.

9           We will also focus today on the steps the  
10 city is taking to reduce bill coordination on a  
11 larger scale and hear Intro 1124 also sponsored by  
12 Council Member Constantinides and myself. This bill  
13 will require the Department of Transportation to  
14 create a pilot program for on-street charging  
15 stations for electric vehicles. While much of our  
16 city fleet [coughs] is already more energy efficient  
17 than the typical fuel burning vehicles that continue  
18 to roll off the assembly line especially given the  
19 low price of gas today we can continue to push the  
20 envelope and drive more demand to more efficient  
21 options. We can do the same for private vehicle's  
22 owners who are willing to spend a little more to meet  
23 a bit less. Through an on-street pilot program for  
24 electric vehicle charging stations, New Yorkers will  
25 have more access and option to recharge easing fears

2 over running out of batteries when driving. It will  
3 also add tangible structures to our streets helping  
4 New Yorkers to realize that electric vehicles are an  
5 entirely suitable option because the city is  
6 investing in more efficient infrastructure as well.  
7 Over the weekend I read about how gas stations are  
8 slowly disappearing downtown creating a fuel desert  
9 that can be particularly hard on drivers and  
10 sometimes it can put the city in danger. We lived  
11 that experience with Sandy, and when--when it took so  
12 many blocks for someone to go and get gas. But if we  
13 replace this gas station with charging docks on the  
14 street throughout the area, we can drive a shift away  
15 from fuel burning cars and more readily reduce our  
16 emission output as a whole. We are interested in  
17 hearing from the Administration their views on these  
18 pieces of legislation, as well as the strategies and  
19 method--methods they are employing to reduce our  
20 emission totals from vehicles as the 80 by 50 year  
21 plan initiative by Mayor Bill de Blasio. If there  
22 are challenges to the bill, what can we do to  
23 overcome them and further incentivize electric  
24 vehicle use in our city? What can we do to drive  
25 down care use as whole whether through the

2 installation of more protected bike lanes, investment  
3 in mass transit, or crossing transit deserts in  
4 Eastern Queens and Southeast Brooklyn. I'm eager to  
5 hear about these steps and again invite you all to  
6 take part in Car-Free Day NYC this Friday. With  
7 that, I now will call my colleague Council Member  
8 Constantinides to also speak on the legislation  
9 before us today.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank  
11 you, Chair Rodriguez and--and thank you for your  
12 strong environmental leadership when it comes to Car-  
13 Free Day on Earth Day this year as we begin Earth  
14 Week. This is a--a landmark initiative that you've  
15 begun with Car-Free NYC. I'm so excited to see all  
16 the great work that you've accomplished, and really  
17 showing New Yorkers on how we can work together to  
18 bring emissions down, and change the culture of our  
19 city. So I want to thank you, Chairman, and as--and  
20 as well for all that you do with the Transportation  
21 Committee. Everyday millions of cars take to our  
22 streets, and those cars emit dangerous gases from  
23 their tailpipes. This exhaust is one of the leading  
24 causes of carbon and greenhouse gas emissions  
25 responsible for climate change. The exhaust accounts

2 for an estimated 75% of carbon monoxide pollution,  
3 one-third of smog and 27% of greenhouse gas emissions  
4 in the United States. Any given day, hundreds of  
5 thousands of cars, trucks, buses and other vehicles  
6 crisscross the New York City streets spewing millions  
7 of metric tons of pollutants into the air in their  
8 collective wake. Car exhaust hurts us both globally  
9 and locally. New York has long suffered an epidemic  
10 of childhood asthma with 13% of children under 13  
11 diagnosed with some form of asthma. Sulfur dioxide  
12 and particulate matter, two of the more toxic  
13 pollutants emitted from car exhaust are leading  
14 causes of this dangerous condition in children. And  
15 just to speak personally, my son as he goes to the  
16 doctor, I had never seen a nebulizer before in my  
17 life, but now when he goes to the pediatrician, I see  
18 lines of nebulizers there with the kids all lined up  
19 to take their Abuterol treatment. We know asthma--  
20 childhood asthma is a serious issue, and I'm--I'm  
21 glad to be working with the Mayor's Office and the  
22 Chair to continue to combat it. While many New  
23 Yorkers do not drive to work, one step that can be  
24 [coughs]--one step that those who--who do can take is  
25 to participate in electric vehicle. New York's



2 energy grid is becoming increasingly green as we  
3 transition to more renewable energy sources. The  
4 more that electric vehicles can replace conventional  
5 cars, the more our transportation can become clean  
6 renewable energy instead of from fossil fuel.

7 Embracing green energy for power generation alone  
8 isn't enough to stem the tide of climate change and  
9 cleaner air. We must phase out every type of fossil  
10 fuel usage into the future. One of the biggest  
11 challenges faced by consumers who want to use  
12 electric cars, though, is the scarcity of places to  
13 charge them. Some wealthier citizens may have access  
14 to private garages with electric chargers, but most  
15 do not. By providing charging stations for public  
16 use we can make it possible for New Yorkers who want  
17 to make a green choice and switch to an electric car  
18 to do so. We can make--make electric cars more  
19 visible, and encourage their use. Intro 1124 is an  
20 important step in reducing these emissions here in  
21 New York City. By initiating--initiating this pilot  
22 program that would place between two and seven  
23 chargers in each borough, we can encourage the use of  
24 cleaner electric cars. The location and the  
25 appropriate fee for usage all these charges will be

2 set by POT (sic) and placed on their website. By  
3 implementing Intro 1124 and by encouraging the use of  
4 electric vehicles, we would take an important step in  
5 reducing these risks and improving the health and  
6 safety of New Yorkers protecting everyone from the  
7 global crises such as climate change and the harmful  
8 contamination of the air we breathe. Again, I want  
9 to thank Chairman Rodriguez for your commitment. I  
10 want to thank the administration for your--for the  
11 great work that you've done thus far, and on the  
12 clean city's fleets and all the greenhouse gas  
13 emissions that we've worked on so far, but we must go  
14 further, and must continue to be bold. So, I look  
15 forward to working with you. Thank you, Chairman.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank--thank you,  
17 Council Member Constantinides also not only for being  
18 the lead and giving me the opportunity for me to be a  
19 colleague on this legislation, but also for your  
20 leadership when it comes to the Committee on  
21 Transportation here, too. Now, before we begin in--  
22 in listening for the testimony from the  
23 administration represented by the Administration and  
24 the Directors of the Mayor's Office of  
25 Sustainability, I would like to thank my committee

2 staff Counsel Kelly Taylor, Policy Analyst Jonathan  
3 Masserano, Gafar Zaaloff, and my Chief of Staff  
4 Carmen de la Rosa and my Deputy Chief of Staff for  
5 Communication and Legislation Rosa Murphy. I'll now  
6 call on the [background comments]-- So then let's now  
7 ask the counsel to administer the affirmation and  
8 invite the--the--the Administration to start their  
9 testimony.

10 LEGAL COUNSEL TAYLOR: Would you please  
11 raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell the  
12 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in  
13 your testimony before the committee today, and to  
14 respond honestly to council member questions?

15 NILDA MESA: I do.

16 LEGAL COUNSEL: TAYLOR: Thank you.

17 NILDA MESA: Good morning Chairman  
18 Rodriguez, Chairman Constantinides and members of the  
19 Committee on Transportation. My name is Nilda Mesa  
20 and I'm the Director of the New York City Mayor's  
21 Office of Sustainability. Thank you for the  
22 opportunity to testify today regarding Intro 1124,  
23 which would require the establishment of a pilot  
24 program to install between two and seven on-street  
25 electric vehicle charging stations in each of the

2 five boroughs by 2018. This hearing is fitting start  
3 to Earth Week, which will see the release of the One  
4 NYC Annual Update and the first ever celebration of  
5 Car-Free NYC, and I want to salute you for your  
6 leadership on that Chairman Rodriguez. The--the  
7 adoption of electric vehicles is a major component of  
8 Mayor Bill de Blasio's commitment to green  
9 transportation, and more widely as we develop the  
10 transportation sector within our 80 by 50 Greenhouse  
11 Gas Emissions Reduction Plan. [coughs] While  
12 approximately 70% of the city's overall greenhouse  
13 gas emissions are derived from buildings, the next  
14 largest tranche is transportation, which clocks in at  
15 about 21% as of 2014. Approximately 76% of  
16 transportation greenhouse gas emissions come from  
17 light duty vehicles or cars. For us to make a dent  
18 in our transportation emissions, we will need to  
19 address lowering emissions coming from cars. In One  
20 New York, the Plan for a Strong and Just City, One  
21 NYC, which was released a year ago this week,  
22 transportation was explicitly added as a sector  
23 within the planning for reducing the city's  
24 greenhouse gas emissions 80% by 2050 or 80 by 50. In  
25 addition, One NYC include as another goal that NYC

2 would have the cleanest air quality of any large city  
3 in the US. Reducing fossil fuel based tailpipe  
4 emissions within the city is good not only for the  
5 environment, but also for our health because reducing  
6 these vehicular helps to improve air quality.  
7 Unfortunately, some of our poorest neighborhoods have  
8 some of the highest rates of asthma in the U.S.  
9 Asthma is the leading reason school children call in  
10 sick, and when children are sick wage earners may  
11 also need to miss work to care for them. So it is  
12 the neighborhoods that need their education the most,  
13 the neighborhoods where wage earners can't afford to  
14 miss work, but must to care for sick relatives that  
15 most cruelly bear the greatest impacts of gasoline  
16 fueled cars. Increasing the use of electric vehicles  
17 is an important means to reduce greenhouse gas  
18 emissions and improve air quality, which in turn  
19 promotes positive health and economic outcomes in  
20 some of our most vulnerable communities.

21 As the overwhelming majority of  
22 transportation emissions comes from private vehicles  
23 running on gasoline, we are working to shift vehicle  
24 trips to low carbon modes of transportation such as  
25 walking, biking and public transit while

2 simultaneously working to reduce emissions from the  
3 remaining vehicle travel to the greatest extent  
4 possible. Within the private sector, more than 2,400  
5 electric vehicles are currently registered in New  
6 York City. Manhattan has the most EVs registered  
7 with Queens coming in second. Within Con Ed's  
8 overall service area about 5,500 EVs are registered  
9 with the bulk in Westchester County. Cars typically  
10 are charged at home overnight or at the workplace.  
11 These vehicles utilize a growing network of EV  
12 charging locations throughout the five boroughs  
13 mostly in private parking garages. Recent years have  
14 seen steady growth in publicly available charging  
15 infrastructure. EV drivers today can plug in at  
16 roughly 300 charging locations throughout the city.  
17 Moreover, Local Law 130 of 2013 requires that 20% of  
18 new parking spaces in garages citywide be capable of  
19 supporting electric vehicle charging stations.  
20 Demand for EV charging is likely to increase in the  
21 next 24 months as a new generation of electric  
22 vehicles, which offer greater driving range at lower  
23 cost comes to market. For instance, later this year  
24 Chevrolet will begin selling the Bolt, a pure battery  
25 electric vehicle that can travel upwards of 200 miles

2 per charge and will cost under \$40,000 before  
3 incentives. In just a few weeks, Tesla has received  
4 more than 325,000 pre-orders for its Model 3, which  
5 can travel 215 miles on a single charge, and will  
6 retail for around 35,000 before incentives when  
7 delivered in late 2017. More encourage--encouraging  
8 still it was announced earlier this month that New  
9 York State will offer a \$2,000 rebate on plug-in  
10 vehicles, which together with a \$7,500 federal tax  
11 credit brings the total incentives for EVs purchased  
12 in New York State to \$9,500. As the demand side of  
13 the EV market continues to solidify, it will spur  
14 demand for additional publicly available chargers.  
15 The private sector is now actively seeking additional  
16 locations throughout the city for expanding charging  
17 infrastructure. In conversations with the private  
18 sector, we have been told of a number of challenges  
19 inhibiting greater adoption of EVs in New York City.  
20 For example, not all chargers can charge all  
21 vehicles. Some chargers take overnight to charge a  
22 car, which is ideally suited to home charging or long  
23 periods of parking, but not to multiple short trips.  
24 Other rapid chargers may be able to top off a car in  
25 30 minutes. Signage to direct drivers is not always

2 clear either, and some of the most promising growth  
3 for installation of chargers appears to be in public  
4 lots near retail centers such as the Big Box Stores  
5 in shopping malls. Our own experience to date also  
6 provides some insight, and illustrates the challenge  
7 of anticipating demand for publicly available  
8 chargers. In 2013, the city sought to support the  
9 early adopter market for EVs by providing charging  
10 stations for use by the general public. The  
11 Department of Transportation and the New York Power  
12 Authority entered into an agreement that allowed DOT  
13 to install three charging stations in each of nine  
14 municipal parking garages throughout the five  
15 boroughs for a total of 27 dedicated EV charging  
16 stations. EV drivers who used these public chargers  
17 do not pay any additional fees up beyond the general  
18 parking fee paid by all users of the facilities. Of  
19 the nine municipal locations with charging stations,  
20 the Court Square Municipal Parking facility in Long  
21 Island City gets the most use with the equivalent of  
22 two to three full EV charges each day. So far in  
23 2016, this site alone has been responsible for  
24 diverting nearly a ton of greenhouse gas emissions by  
25 using electricity instead of burning approximately



2 270 gallons of gasoline. Three other participating  
3 locations in the Lower East Side, Flushing and Staten  
4 Island, have seen moderate utilization rates while  
5 chargers in the remaining five facilities have been  
6 used much less frequently. With respect to our  
7 fleet, the city is committed to leading by example in  
8 this sector. On December 1, 2015, the Mayor  
9 announced NYC Clean Fleet, an municipal fleet  
10 sustainability plan that will give New York City the  
11 largest municipal electric vehicle fleet of any city  
12 in the country and perhaps the world. With this  
13 plan, the City intends to make New York City's  
14 transportation system the cleanest in the country.  
15 New York City operates the largest municipal fleet in  
16 the country with more than 28,000 vehicles. Its  
17 fleet size is second only to the federal government.  
18 The City currently operates over 16,000 vehicles that  
19 run on some type of alternative fuel, and its fleet  
20 has some of the nation's largest programs for hybrid  
21 vehicles, biodiesel and fleet car sharing. As part  
22 of Clean Fleet, the City pledged to achieve a 50%  
23 reduction in greenhouse gas emissions from the City's  
24 fleet by 2025, and an 80% reduction by 2035. A major  
25 component of NYC Clean Fleet is to add 2,000 electric

2 vehicles to the city's sedan fleet by 2025, giving us  
3 what will be the largest municipal EV fleet of any  
4 U.S. city. The city fleet already operates 388 full  
5 use plug-in vehicles, 65 of which have been  
6 introduced since the Mayor's Clean Fleet  
7 announcement. The city also operates an addition 610  
8 off-road plug-in units including electric carts,  
9 electric forklifts and solar power light towers and  
10 sign board. In the five months since the Mayor's  
11 announcement, the city has placed orders for 225 new  
12 electric units including 185 full use sedans and 40  
13 off-road units. We expect to receive all of these  
14 vehicles by the end of June 2016. NYC Fleet operates  
15 the largest EV charging network in New York State  
16 with 270 charges currently dedicated for city fleet  
17 use at the Department of Parks and Recreation and  
18 Department of Sanitation garages, police precincts,  
19 DOT facilities and Department of Environment  
20 Protection facilities. DCAS is currently finalizing  
21 the first long-term citywide requirement contract for  
22 fleet charging, and we expect the fleet charging  
23 network to increase to at least 350 chargers by the  
24 end of the year. The most exciting addition to this  
25 charging network is a freestanding solar carport

2 charger currently located at the municipal building,  
3 which can be used to charge two vehicles using only  
4 solar power. DCAS will be looking to expand its  
5 Solar Carport Initiative to meet the charging  
6 infrastructure demands of the Clean Fleet EV  
7 expansion. In addition, earlier this month, DCAS  
8 reached an agreement with Nissan for the donation of  
9 ten new EV chargers for use by NYC Fleet. NYC Fleet  
10 is also working to reduce emissions from FDNY  
11 ambulances. FDNY and DCAS have ordered 78--sorry--98  
12 new ambulances with alternative power units from  
13 Stealth Technology, which will greatly reduce unit  
14 idling, saving fuel and maintenance costs and also  
15 improving air quality. In December 2015, DCAS issued  
16 a Request for Information to engage the private  
17 sector in our Clean Fleet effort. The response was  
18 extensive with 77 formal responses to the RFI  
19 representing a wide variety of alternative fuel  
20 approaches. DCAS, our office and the major fleet  
21 agencies will jointly review the responses and refine  
22 our fleet strategy based on them. Finally, DCAS is  
23 doing its part to support Car-Free NYC on April 22nd.  
24 It has asked agencies to limit non-essential fleet  
25 use that day, and to find alternatives for

2 administrative functions, meetings and commuting. We  
3 will be following up with agencies on their plans and  
4 look forward to promoting alternative to car use this  
5 month as well as moving forward. On the strength of  
6 its leadership in sustainability we're proud to  
7 report that NYC Fleet was recently award the 2016  
8 Green Fleet of the Year by Fleet Owner Magazine.

9           On Intro 1124, the Mayor's Office of  
10 Sustainability and our colleagues at DCAS and DOT  
11 look forward to working with the Council to support  
12 the adoption of electric vehicles and the  
13 infrastructure required to support them in New York.  
14 We suggest, however, based on our initial research  
15 and experience to date that there may be different  
16 and better ways to support electric vehicles and the  
17 method required by this legislation as currently  
18 drafted. Intro 1124 would require DOT to install  
19 between two and seven on-street electric vehicle  
20 chargers in each borough, and to report on total  
21 program costs, charger utilization and  
22 recommendations based on program experience by March  
23 1, 2018. To date in New York City on-street charging  
24 is an untested model. In part, that reflects open  
25 unresolved questions such as whether on-street

2 parking with EV charging stations would be exclusive  
3 to EVs or also available to other vehicles, and how  
4 that might work where parking space is already at a  
5 premium. It is not clear where the electric  
6 infrastructure could accommodate this on street, and  
7 what the best type of charging stations would be. If  
8 the chargers require approval from the Public Design  
9 Commission, 180 days may not be enough time. We  
10 have only begun to tap opportunities for off-street  
11 charging. In fact, there's still ample room for  
12 improvement. We may want to review Local Law 130,  
13 implementation to improve support for chargers in  
14 private garages. With the efforts by the private  
15 sector to build out additional infrastructure it is  
16 possible that the private sector working with us  
17 could best assess patterns in gas, and that we may be  
18 able to limit the use of taxpayer funds while also  
19 utilizing the private sector's expertise and  
20 knowledge of customer needs and behavior to encourage  
21 private deployment of chargers. It could be that the  
22 greatest potential for growth is in the public lots  
23 new retail rather than on-street parking in  
24 residential neighborhoods. We need more information.  
25 Or, it might be wherever people access trains, buses

2 or ferries in the boroughs outside Manhattan. For  
3 example, the high charger utilization at DOTs Court  
4 Square facility demonstrates the promise of adding  
5 chargers at park and rides. If we could provide  
6 access to chargers adjacent to public transportation,  
7 we could in theory provide an incentive for drivers  
8 to take mass transit where they may otherwise choose  
9 to drive, and so improve traffic congestion as well.  
10 We do not have the answers yet, but we would like to  
11 continue conversations with the Council so as to not  
12 rule out other promising strategies. On behalf of  
13 the Mayor's Office, I offer my strong support for the  
14 expansion of electric vehicle use throughout the  
15 city. The Mayor's Office of Sustainability, DOT and  
16 DCAS welcome the opportunity to work with the members  
17 of the Committee on Transportation and the Council to  
18 craft a thoughtful and ambitious approach to catalyze  
19 EV uptick in our city. Thank you again for the  
20 opportunity to testify this morning.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you again  
22 for your leadership in--in the Office of  
23 Sustainability and, of course, thank you to the Mayor  
24 for his vision not only to talk about, you know, how  
25 the city can do better, but also to invest in the

2 resources that are needed in order to reduce  
3 emissions not only related to vehicles but other--the  
4 other emissions that are produced by many buildings  
5 and other source of--of emissions that we produce in  
6 the city. I have a few questions. I know that my  
7 colleagues also have, but before that, I would like  
8 to recognize Council Member Van Bramer, Miller and  
9 Levin and before we get into the question, we will  
10 pause to go back and take a vote on the Car-Free Day.  
11 [background comments] So I now call on the Clerk to  
12 call the roll for Reso 1013 and encourage a yes vote  
13 from my colleagues on Car-Free Day.

14 CLERK: Committee Clerk Matthew  
15 DeStefano, Committee on Transportation. Roll call on  
16 Resolution 1013-A. Chair Rodriguez.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Aye.

18 CLERK: Vacca.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye.

20 CLERK: Levin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye.

22 CLERK: Rose.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

24 CLERK: Van Bramer.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

2 CLERK: Constantinides.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

4 CLERK: Miller. [pause] Council Member--

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]

6 Permission to explain.

7 CLERK: Yes, sir.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you. It--  
9 it gives me great pleasure to vote aye on this, and--  
10 and to continue to work with Chair Rodriguez and the  
11 members of this community--of this committee not just  
12 to make our--our streets environmentally safe and  
13 friendly and to ease congestion, but to be able to  
14 address--use the Car-Free Day to address the issues  
15 of transportations deserts, and in the case of my  
16 district extreme transportation deserts that the  
17 community is so looking forward to the benefits of  
18 the Car-Free Day, and we want to be working  
19 diligently to make sure that we move forward to  
20 efforts, that we bring transportation opportunities  
21 to all communities throughout the city, and we're  
22 going to use this opportunity as a springboard. I  
23 applaud the Chairman for his leadership on this, and  
24 looking forward to working, and again I vote aye.



2 CLERK: By a vote of 7 in the  
3 affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions,  
4 the resolution has been adopted.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: We will leave the  
6 vote open for next 30 minutes for other colleagues  
7 who are not here, and I would like to say that we  
8 recognize also that the way of how we've been able to  
9 see so many stakeholders from the academic work,  
10 Columbia, CUNY, NYU and your school to the business  
11 community their bill in Congress, Partner for a  
12 Better New York. Everyone has come on board in the  
13 New York restoration as for green, and--and, you  
14 know, this only had the impossible Bike New York,  
15 Citi Bike. It's--when we look about what we are  
16 doing, this is about making our city the first one in  
17 the nation putting together Car-Free Day. So I'm  
18 very grateful and thanks. This wouldn't have  
19 happened with--without this great coalition and--and  
20 also without the support of the Speaker, Melissa  
21 Mark-Viverito, the Mayor de Blasio that already has  
22 sent the letter that you can see in DCAS website  
23 encouraging all the city employees to have a plan to  
24 park their car that day. Let's go to work using  
25 bikes, walking, mass transportation. I also want to

2 thank the MTA, New York City Transit who already are  
3 putting advertising through train station in the  
4 last--starting this past Friday. So, you know, this  
5 is something that is possible because we can do more,  
6 and with this we are committed to make the City the  
7 first on in the nation with the huge initiative that  
8 doesn't belong to me. We just thought of the idea,  
9 and this has been billed because from the private,  
10 academic and religion sector and governmental sector,  
11 everyone wants to save our planet not only for our  
12 generation but for the future generation. Now, let's  
13 go back and--go back to the electric vehicle charging  
14 station. I have a few questions again. One is when  
15 it comes--when you look at DCAS there's as far as we  
16 know the information that we have, you now, DCAS is  
17 the agency that oversees the 27,000 vehicles that the  
18 City use for all the agencies and to do business to  
19 keep our city running. What--what are the commitment  
20 of those private contractors that DCAS use or the  
21 agency do to lease vehicle or to rent vehicle? Has  
22 there been any conversation or any of those entities  
23 that DCAS rents vehicle from, also to encourage them  
24 to also move more into electrical vehicles?

2 NILDA MESA: That's a very good question.  
3 At this time, I think I'd like to call up Keith  
4 Kerman from DCAS who can really speak in more detail  
5 about their particular conversations. [background  
6 comments, pause]

7 KEITH KERMAN: Hi. Keith Kerman, Chief  
8 Fleet Officer, DCAS. So, yes, where DCAS leases  
9 vehicles, first off, we have the largest public  
10 contract with the Zip Car for car sharing, and in  
11 that contract we are using--and most of the vehicles  
12 we're using are hybrid vehicles for our Zip Car  
13 contracts where we need short-term additional  
14 vehicles. Those are mostly hybrids. Zip has also  
15 provided a small number so far of EV fits that are  
16 being used at the Parks Department as car share  
17 vehicles. So we do have some electric vehicles as  
18 part of our Care Share Zip Program. In this--most of  
19 the other vehicles that we lease or rent are really  
20 heavy equipment units mostly at the Department of  
21 Transportation and a small number at Police and other  
22 agencies. So for those, the main thing we're doing  
23 is we are fueling those on biodiesel. So even if  
24 it's a rented or leased heavy equipment piece or  
25 specialized piece, it's using biodiesel along with

2 the rest of the city fleet. In addition, if there's  
3 other--and there really is a small number of other  
4 rented vehicles we would be renting, you know, hybrid  
5 vehicles as we do elsewhere, but the majority of our  
6 rental car program is either the Zip Car Program,  
7 which is all hybrid or EV or the Trucking Specialized  
8 Program, which is biodiesel and that mirrors what we  
9 do with our city vehicles.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: SO what about  
11 those small vehicles use by the city employees  
12 through the other--through the agencies like DOT,  
13 DDC, DCAS or--and--and NYCHA? Like how are doing on  
14 increasing? What is--what is the plan that we have  
15 and how do we expect the city that, you know, next  
16 year we are adding this percentage of electrical  
17 vehicle, in 2018 another one, and by 2020 like how  
18 many of those-- Let's say if we have--if DCAS  
19 oversees 27,000 vehicles, you can share with us if  
20 you have information how many--what percentage or  
21 what number of the 27 are a healthy (sic) vehicle?  
22 What other percentage are like the small cars, and  
23 for the group of small cars, let's say in five year,  
24 is there any plan to turn as many of those--a small  
25 vehicle that the city use, that the city employees

2 use to do inspection, HPD whatever to move into  
3 electrical vehicles?

4 NILDA MESA: That's--this is our NYC  
5 Clean Fleet program, and so this is--we are moving  
6 towards having the largest electric vehicle fleet of  
7 any municipality in the U.S. So, and most of those  
8 will come from the light duty vehicles. It's, you  
9 know, 2,000 or so, and so the idea as part of Clean  
10 Fleet is also that we have targets for reducing  
11 greenhouse gas emissions within our--you know,  
12 because of this adoption of electric vehicles.

13 KEITH KERMAN: Did you want me--?

14 NILDA MESA: Yes, go ahead.

15 KEITH KERMAN: Okay. So, right, so the--  
16 the goal is to get to 2,000 vehicles by 2025 as the  
17 Director said. 2,000 by 2025, electric plug-in  
18 vehicles. That's the full on-road units. There are  
19 about 4,000 non-emergency light duty vehicles. It's  
20 basically, 4,000 non-emergency cars. So right now we  
21 have 380 of those are EVs, and basically the goal is  
22 200 a year, and we already have, as was mentioned in  
23 the testimony, order for 225 electric vehicles. So  
24 for year one, and the announcement was made in  
25 December. So five months later, we are basically

2 going to meet our year one goal, which is an  
3 additional 200. We should be about 500 electric  
4 vehicles on the road by the end of this year, and  
5 then basically it's--it's pretty basic. We need to  
6 do about 200 a year to get to our goal.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: How many small  
8 vehicle for the 27,000 that the City--DCAS oversees,  
9 I guess what--what number are like a small vehicle,  
10 cars?

11 KEITH KERMAN: Four--four thousand.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Four thousand?

13 KEITH KERMAN: Yep.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So the--the  
15 majority are like heavy vehicles used by--

16 KEITH KERMAN: [interposing] Well, the--  
17 the Police Department operates over 8,000 emergency  
18 response vehicles. Then everything else is really  
19 the pickup trucks, the vans, the Sanitation garbage  
20 trucks and the specialized equipment. Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Good. So what  
22 about the--that--that large number let's say that's  
23 use by the NYPD is there any plan that, you know, for  
24 that since if--if they are let's say the largest one,  
25 the agency that have the larger numbers of vehicles,

2 are--is the city in this case the Mayor's Office of  
3 Sustainability and DCAS as the agency that oversees  
4 have any plan let's say to say by--we are focusing on  
5 getting those NYPD cars to be one of those that we  
6 would like to turn them more as electrical vehicles?

7 NILDA MESA: There--right now there are  
8 some limitations in the technology for emergency  
9 vehicles. Our understanding is that the City of Los  
10 Angeles with Tesla has, you know, basically built a  
11 prototype for a police vehicle, but there isn't  
12 really anything else that exists, and I'm not sure  
13 that that's actually going into operation yet. But  
14 part of our commitment with the Clean Fleet Program  
15 is to continue to be speaking with the manufacturers,  
16 and with the agencies about what the new technology  
17 is that's coming up, and to keep pushing, you know,  
18 for that. And it--it applies as well for Department  
19 of Sanitation vehicles as well as other heavy duty  
20 vehicles. There--there are just some limitations  
21 right now. Light duty, the cars that's sort of the--  
22 the lowest hanging fruit that we know exists and the  
23 rest of them it's still under development.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. So  
25 what if--I was speaking this day to the Queens

2 Borough President Melinda Katz and we were having  
3 this conversation about the electrical car, and one  
4 thing that we were saying that, you know, she has  
5 children, I have children. For those of us, you  
6 know, that have children, if we would like to get  
7 moving to electrical car, one of the concerns that  
8 she say we should talk is about what about if we were  
9 in trouble with a battery. There's not a back-up  
10 battery that we have this car. What--how have the--  
11 you know the business sector share with the City when  
12 you have this opportunity to meet on, you know, as  
13 something that is new in the last--what? I don't  
14 know, 20 years in moving to electrical car. Like  
15 what is the challenges that the private sector  
16 recognized, and that the city has identified as yes  
17 you can run those amount--amount of miles with the--  
18 with the car being, with the battery, but what about  
19 the challenge when that battery doesn't work? What  
20 is the back up?

21 NILDA MESA: That--that is definitely one  
22 of the big factors inhibiting the adoption of  
23 electric vehicles--the--this summer, you know, one  
24 very promising development that car manufacturers  
25 like Chevy and Tesla will be coming out with vehicles



2 that have essentially double the range of possible  
3 use from their batteries. And so as that range  
4 increases from, you know, what's currently available,  
5 what's called range anxiety is anticipated to go  
6 down. But that's--that's why we're anticipating a--  
7 a, you know, an expansion within the city of electric  
8 vehicle adoption. But range anxiety is--is a very  
9 real thing and that does inhibit and that's why, you  
10 know, most cars are either charged at home or at  
11 work, and so, you know, I should say, you know,  
12 where--wherever workplace parking is. And so that's  
13 why it becomes critical to have, you know, these  
14 options available.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So we will give  
16 the opportunity to like my colleague Council Member  
17 Greenfield to vote, and then Council Member--I would  
18 like to recognize Council Member Garodnick,  
19 Greenfield and Reynoso, and after the Council Member  
20 vote, then I will give the opportunity to Council  
21 Member Lander to ask the questions since he had to go  
22 and chair a hearing. And, before calling on the  
23 council member to vote, I would like to say that we  
24 recognize that Friday is Passover. So even though on  
25 the Car-Free Day is all about volunteer, this is not

2 about creating inconvenience, but this is about  
3 creating opportunity for those who can make it, and  
4 go to be with the family and friends in the best way  
5 they can. But again, the Car-Free Day is all  
6 volunteer. Council Member Greenfield.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you  
8 very much, and Mr. Chairman, I want to congratulate  
9 you and thank you. Nobody--nobody does more in this  
10 Council to advocate alternatives and better  
11 transportation and cleaner transportation and safer  
12 transportation than you do. And so I'm really  
13 thankful for your leadership. As you mentioned, this  
14 Friday is the Eve of Passover, and so I don't want  
15 people to think that I'm going to vote for something  
16 that I can't do. So I'm going to abstain from this  
17 particular vote just so folks recognize that I  
18 support the cause, but myself and my family were  
19 actually traveling that day like many other families  
20 that for Passover. So I just want to be honest about  
21 that, but I certainly support the cause and, in fact,  
22 I myself drive an electric car that I charge right  
23 here at City Hall. Thank you.

24 CLERK: Continuation of roll call vote,  
25 Garodnick.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

3 CLERK: Greenfield.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Abstain.

5 CLERK: Reynoso.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote aye on  
7 all.

8 CLERK: The vote--the vote now stands--  
9 I'm sorry. The vote now stands at 9 in the  
10 affirmative, 0 in the negative, 1 abstention.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very  
13 much, Mr. Chair for accommodating me before I run off  
14 to Chair the Rules Committee hearing. Thanks to you  
15 and Council Member Constantinides and the other co-  
16 sponsors for this good bill and--and pushing forward  
17 this really critical issue. I just have one  
18 question, which, you know, I think I've spoken with  
19 you about before offline, but I--I wanted to ask the  
20 sponsors to think with me about it as well. Though I  
21 haven't been to Paris since they're doing it, I've  
22 been reading about their Autolib system, which is for  
23 those that don't know essentially it's like Bike  
24 Share of plug-in cars, and it seems to me a way that  
25 both to build out a charging infrastructure to get

2 more people into electric cars, and in the same way  
3 that Bike Share makes it a lot more possible for  
4 people to take bike trips than they would. To make  
5 it more possible for people to start using those  
6 cars. Some I believe would be able to give up their  
7 own cars if we had a meaningful care share system of  
8 any kind, and if it also were electric, it would also  
9 significantly reduce emissions and potential build  
10 out the charging if we did it with a franchise model  
11 where the franchiser like with City Bike got some on  
12 street parking spaces. And the deal with them was in  
13 exchange they were obligated to build out a charging  
14 infrastructure that other vehicles could potentially  
15 plug into. Perhaps it would help us achieve a lot of  
16 goals at once. So I just wonder this is something  
17 that you have looked at or thought about? Whether it  
18 might be a piece in some way of how we move forward  
19 with this--with this effort to take a look at that  
20 and see what it would look like to get there.

21 NILDA MESA: I would say we're still at  
22 early stages, and that's--that's an appealing model,  
23 and what we need to do is, you know, really dig into  
24 what all the possible opportunities are out there  
25 that's--you know, that would work within New York

2 City. I mean taking a look at sort of like usage  
3 patterns and, you know, who is it that's driving  
4 where and how we could facilitate that. But that's  
5 certainly something that is very appealing for us to  
6 be looking at.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: All right, thank  
8 you. Well, let me just urge and I'll say this to the  
9 chair and the co-sponsors that perhaps we could think  
10 about this as one of the models we would be looking  
11 at. I know it's a lot of complicated questions.  
12 Obviously, there's been a lot about the driverless  
13 cars, and they'll have a whole different  
14 infrastructure set of requirements. They won't sit  
15 on the streets in the same way with someone to plug  
16 them in, but--but it seems to me this is worth  
17 looking at may be a--a part of our effort to think  
18 about charging infrastructure, and about reducing  
19 petroleum based car trips. So thanks for this  
20 legislation. I look forward to continuing to work  
21 with you in moving forward.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member  
23 Constantinides.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you  
25 Chairman Rodriguez and Council Member Lander.

2 Absolutely I think we will certainly take into  
3 account every opportunity we can to expand electric  
4 car infrastructure and I--I definitely look forward  
5 to continuing that conversation with you. I'm with  
6 you as well, Nilda. [laughs]

7 NILDA MESA: Thanks.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: All  
9 right, I will--I have a few questions. How many--how  
10 many car--electric charging stations have we  
11 installed in New York City in municipal lots that are  
12 available to the public for utilization so far?

13 NILDA MESA: So there are about 27--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: 27.

15 NILDA MESA: --that have been installed  
16 so far. There are--there are 300 available, about  
17 300 available citywide that are--that are not like at  
18 municipal lots. Mostly those are in garages, and  
19 most of those are in Manhattan, which kind of makes  
20 sense when you think about, you know, people driving  
21 into work then they would, you know, charge up while  
22 they're here.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: And  
24 they're--but they're in garages that you have to pay  
25 for, or--or--

2 NILDA MESA: [interposing] Yeah.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: --with  
4 these arrivals--

5 NILDA MESA: [interposing] Yeah, on  
6 streets there's not--not a heck of a lot. Just--  
7 there--like I said, there are, you know, there's some  
8 real issues with--first off, there's the electric  
9 infrastructure that's available, and I'm not saying  
10 these are complete deal stoppers. These are things  
11 that--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES:  
13 [interposing] Uh-huh.

14 NILDA MESA: --you know, we need to think  
15 through, and--and work out. So, you know, what's the  
16 availability of the electric infrastructure? But  
17 also like how do you set it up in what types of  
18 neighborhoods, you know, to account for our scarce  
19 street parking already. You know, and it's just we  
20 haven't worked through that, and we look forward to  
21 working with you--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES:  
23 [interposing] Okay.

24 NILDA MESA: --on figuring out some of  
25 those issues.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: As--as to  
3 why, as--as--as far as, you know, Local Law 130 of--  
4 of 2013 do we know how many chargers have already  
5 been installed? I know it's to 20% are supposed to  
6 be in every garage that is built. Do you know how  
7 many of them built out that are accessible to the  
8 public?

9 NILDA MESA: We do not know at this  
10 point. So the requirement from 2013 was that 20% of  
11 new parking spaces in garages be made easy--I should  
12 say charger ready, which does not--which means that  
13 the conduit is there. It does not necessarily mean  
14 that there are chargers there and, you know,  
15 internally as part of our 80 by 50 transportation  
16 sector planning, that's one of the things that we've  
17 identified that we really do need to get data on.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay. I  
19 mean so I mean really we're not sure yet. [laughs]

20 NILDA MESA: No, we're not. That's why--  
21 that's why--yeah, I mean that's why I said, you know,  
22 it could be that's, you know, through Local Law 130.  
23 One of the things we need to do is assess, you know,  
24 how has this worked so far?



2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: And this-  
3 -this--so tell me because a lot of work as to how we  
4 encourage the private sector to, you know, I mean I  
5 think we're doing we're doing great work for the New  
6 York City's fleet, and it sounds like we're really on  
7 the right track. This sounds when it comes to  
8 encouraging the public to sort of make that green  
9 choice--now I've said over and over again when it's  
10 hard to be green, people are going to make  
11 traditional choices just because it's--it's society,  
12 and if--if you--if you make it easy to be  
13 traditional, yeah, they go buy a car. It--it burns  
14 petroleum. Everyone goes on their way, and that's  
15 just the way it is.

16 NILDA MESA: Right.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: But if we  
18 can equalize and make it as easy to be green as it is  
19 to be traditional, then people can make choices based  
20 on green values and not oh, this is hard. [laughs]

21 NILDA MESA: Right. I mean there--there  
22 are a lot of open questions, you know, and that's  
23 something that we're hearing as well from the private  
24 sector because they're--obviously they're very  
25 interested in, you know, selling more cars, and in

2 order to do that, we need to have more robust  
3 infrastructure. And so, you know, one of the things  
4 that we've heard from them is in that like--in other  
5 cities, for example, public parking like in lots near  
6 retail is actually something that's very promising,  
7 and they've seen a lot of growth with those models  
8 because people will come.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES:

10 [interposing] Uh-huh.

11 NILDA MESA: They'll stay for a few  
12 hours, you know, do their shopping or whatever. Get  
13 a quick charge and then they can go. And so--but we  
14 haven't really--we--we- don't know yet for New York  
15 City what's the--the right combination.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay,  
17 well I am--I mean I look at, you know, all of the  
18 suggestions as far as park and rides near public  
19 transportation. I vote yes. In near retail I vote  
20 yes, but I think we can do all three and--and still  
21 do our bill, and still do things that are still a  
22 really comprehensive network. I don't think that--

23 NILDA MESA: [interposing] Right.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: --1124

25 precludes us from--

2 NILDA MESA: [interposing] Right.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: --looking  
4 at park and rides, and looking at retail centers, and  
5 see how we can build this larger network together.  
6 Because I think we, you know, need to take that step.  
7 And, you know, if I look at the cities of Boston and  
8 Baltimore and Salt Lake City, and Indianapolis who  
9 have managed to figure out residential parking, on-  
10 street parking for electric vehicles and  
11 infrastructure. I mean, we're New York--

12 NILDA MESA: [interposing] Right.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: --you  
14 know. I--I think we got some serious chops in all  
15 these other cities.

16 NILDA MESA: [laughs] I think that--I  
17 can't agree with you more.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: And we've  
19 got you. I mean how--how we--you know, we're--we're  
20 in the right place here. We've got the right mayor.  
21 We've got the right administration. We've got the  
22 light readership and--also Mark-Viverito and Ydanis  
23 Rodriguez to get this done. So I really urge that we  
24 can, you know, be bold here, and not let the--the  
25 perfect be the enemy of the good.

2 NILDA MESA: [interposing] Right.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: We get  
4 something done as quickly as possible. Chair. Thank  
5 you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And--and I would  
7 say that, you know, I will invite you for a  
8 demonstration especially you and your leadership.  
9 It's also to look at as we are rezoning many parts of  
10 the city, also how can also the private sector, those  
11 developers that also will be partners with the city.  
12 So they does rezoning, you know, turning into great  
13 possibilities for working class and middle-class. And  
14 also building 90% of some markets, apartments. How  
15 can we also--or I can try and answer that question.  
16 You know, is that something that the Administration  
17 also has been looking at the possibility also to take  
18 advantage that we are re-zoning hundreds of acres to  
19 work with those developers also to look at those  
20 areas as potential use for electric vehicle charging  
21 stations?

22 NILDA MESA: The--the 20%, you know, for  
23 the garages for off-street parking that applies, you  
24 know, sort of citywide. So, you know, that would  
25 certainly apply to development, and this question has

2 come up and, you know, like I say, we need to--we  
3 need some more data. We need some more. We need to  
4 think through this more.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] and I  
6 have that in my--[on mic] I know that having their  
7 support the Mayor and the Speaker, their colleagues,  
8 you know, the whole borough coalition, Car-Free days  
9 are important and you'll doing. But I know that also  
10 your leadership also we can get a lot of support.  
11 All the talk--talk that I heard about, you know, is  
12 when you talk about DCAS, you know, you have the  
13 experience. You've been there for so many years.  
14 When it comes to getting, you know, that came from  
15 the Mayor to really go and--and we--you know, with  
16 other friends to other agencies to really--it started  
17 with a good reduction of vehicle because we will get  
18 those city vehicles. Those that I know are essential  
19 to be parked. That's very important and you as the  
20 director of this office not only we're looking to  
21 work around the Car-free Day on this bill, but also  
22 with other initiatives that in your leadership we  
23 have seen also important in our city. Council Member  
24 Chin, do you have a question?

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

46

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [off mic] I wanted  
3 to vote.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I will go back to  
5 the vote for the other colleagues who are here.

6 CLERK: Continuation of roll call.  
7 Council Member Chin.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye.

9 CLERK: The vote now stands at 10 in the  
10 affirmative, 0--Council Member Miller.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.

12 CLERK: The vote now stands at 11 in the  
13 affirmative, 0 in the negative, 1 abstention.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And if the two  
15 colleagues do not have--have any questions, if you do  
16 just let know, you know, then we move to the next  
17 panel. And--and the bill that we are discussing to  
18 day is the one expanding the electrical--electric  
19 vehicle charging station throughout the city.  
20 Council Member Chin.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair.

22 There are three--I have three charging stations at  
23 the municipal parking in my district on Delancey and  
24 Essex. Do you know how often are these charging  
25 stations used?

2 NILDA MESA: [off mic] Do you know this?  
3 [on mic] I don't off the top of my head, but we can  
4 get back to you with that. It's moderate.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: And then we heard.  
6 I mean, we know there are--supposedly there are four  
7 levels of charging stations available. So which  
8 level are the three charging stations in the Delancey  
9 and Essex Street municipal lot? Are they compatible  
10 to all the electric vehicles?

11 NILDA MESA: So as I'm--I'm looking at  
12 Delancey and Essex Street, it's--it's sort of the  
13 mid-range of utilization of the numbers of charging  
14 stations we have citywide. It only accommodates  
15 level 2 chargers, which are the long-time, you know,  
16 the--the chargers that take a while to charge up the  
17 cars.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: So, that's not the  
19 most up-to-date one?

20 NILDA MESA: I mean the other--I mean  
21 they have put in them as fixes (sic), you know. (sic)

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [interposing] How  
23 long does it take to charge it up?

24 NILDA MESA: It's pretty--it's like  
25 overnight, you know and it's like a full day kind of

2 thing. So there are different--there are pros and  
3 cons for both approaches, you know. So if you're  
4 charging up at the workplace or you're charging  
5 overnight, we're going to leave the car there for a  
6 while. It makes sense to have level 2 because it  
7 uses elec--less electricity and it's, you know, it  
8 can, it's like less strain on the grid, you know, at-  
9 -at a certain point. So, it's okay, but if what you  
10 need are--if what you're going to be doing are like,  
11 you know, sort of multitudes of short trips or  
12 something where you don't--you can't--you're not  
13 going to be there all that long, then level 2 is a  
14 kind of a charger that doesn't quite accommodate that  
15 other sort of use.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Now, and how are  
17 these publicized? Is it just on your website or are  
18 the people who--who rent the space at the, let's say  
19 at the parking lot that parks their cars overnight,  
20 are they--you know, do they have that information  
21 about electric charging stations are available there?

22 [background comments]

23 KEITH KERMAN: There--there are a number  
24 of services including the New York City DOT website,  
25 and the NYC.gov websites and other kind of private EV



2 promoting services that maintain the lists and  
3 distribute the lists to be the operators of where the  
4 locations are. And we are right now--it's a fairly  
5 known public, you know, it's--it's a somewhat, you  
6 know, smaller group of EV operators. So I think we  
7 get that information out to them pretty reliably.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Yeah, because I  
9 remember, oh, gosh, it must have been at least five--  
10 five years ago or more in my district at the Grand  
11 Street Co-ops we had a--a pilot project where we had  
12 a--an electric charging station right there where we  
13 had some space for, and so the residents were able to  
14 take advantage of it. Okay, thank you. Hopefully we  
15 can really get this more popularized so that more  
16 people can utilize it.

17 NILDA MESA: Yeah, there are a lot of,  
18 you know, the--the interesting thing now about  
19 looking at this issue today as oppose to say even  
20 like a year or two ago is that there have been some  
21 major advances, you know, in the technology. So with  
22 the range increasing and, you know, essentially  
23 doubling for electric vehicles, you know, and those  
24 cars will be coming out like this summer or in a few  
25 years, and that all of a sudden gives you a whole lot

2 more flexibility. It makes things, you know, a lot  
3 easier for--for consumers to use. So, I--I mean I'm  
4 anticipating we're going to have a lot of exciting  
5 possibilities in the next couple of years.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council Member  
7 Richards.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you.  
9 Thank you, chairs for your leadership on this  
10 critical issue as we try to move away from fossil  
11 fuels. Obviously electric is--is one that is a huge  
12 direction we're trying to go, and I remember I  
13 believe I have a bill, which required the city to  
14 actually expand the EV allocations across the city a  
15 little bit more. So I can't even remember if I  
16 introduce that bill yet, but certainly look forward  
17 to working with the admin on it. So I remember when  
18 we were drafting the--the original bill, one of the  
19 things that came up was UPS. UPS wanted to--their  
20 fleet to go entirely electric and--and one of the  
21 reasons they could not is because of a lack of  
22 infrastructure. So, I--so I wanted to hear where  
23 we're at in terms of expanding electrical vehicle  
24 infrastructure as obviously we're here to talk about  
25 a pilot today, but entirely across the city we know

2 that there's a need for it especially if we have  
3 companies like UPS who want to go completely  
4 electric.

5           NILDA MESA: We--today, I was really  
6 focusing more on, you know, cars and light duty  
7 vehicles. The heavier duty vehicles it's, you more  
8 of a challenge, and you're absolutely right that, you  
9 know, UPS said to us a year ago that they would like  
10 to have more infrastructure. One of the things that  
11 I think will be critical to our success is working  
12 with the utilities on the infrastructure part, and--  
13 and understanding what it is that is going to be  
14 required in order to, you know, accommodate these  
15 charging stations. Another thing that's going to be  
16 necessary is to figure out what are the use patterns,  
17 you know, for these trucks. I mean what is it, and--  
18 and that's something that I really I can't say I  
19 understand [laughs] you know today. But that--  
20 there's a lot of information that we can get from the  
21 private sector on that, and I think that's going to  
22 be really critical to our success.

23           COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And I think one  
24 of the things my bill actually did in particular was  
25 push for more infrastructure to be put on public

2 spaces. So is the city looking at expanding? So for  
3 instance we have one--I believe one charging station  
4 outside of these doors in City Hall's lot, but have  
5 we looked at our own treasure in terms of trying to  
6 figure out a way we can delve into having more usage  
7 especially on public sites--public sites the City  
8 owns?

9 NILDA MESA: We--we--sorry. So we have  
10 27 right now for--available for the public, and it's  
11 something that I think we need to be, you know,  
12 looking at more closely for our own vehicles, for  
13 city fleet vehicles. We have quite a few. So, and  
14 that's in order to meet our commitment to have 2,000  
15 electric vehicles in the next ten years or so. So  
16 our own infrastructure is going to be expanding and--

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]  
18 Right.

19 NILDA MESA: --you know, we're learning a  
20 lot just from doing that.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So it's going  
22 to be expanding. Do you have a number of where we're  
23 at now, and so what you're looking to do as we move  
24 forward?

2 KEITH KERMAN: Yeah, thank you. So right  
3 now, we have 273 electric charging stations on  
4 municipal property serving the--the city fleet  
5 including the City Hall charger location that you  
6 mentioned. By the end of the year, we'll be at 350,  
7 and one of the things we're doing now, we had never  
8 had a citywide requirement contract through DCAS for  
9 EV charging. So we're in the final stages of  
10 selecting a vendor so that we will have a long-term  
11 five-year contract for EV charging, and that will  
12 help all the agencies and the major fleet--fleet  
13 agencies expand that network. But our number for the  
14 end of this year is 350, and then, you know, with 200  
15 EVs coming every year, that number is going to grow  
16 enormously. So--so we are kind of taking every step  
17 we can to grow the--the charging capacity on public  
18 land, but especially to serve the EV fleet that  
19 we're--we're expanding so quickly.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: All right, well  
21 that's good news and I want to thank the Chairs once  
22 again for their leadership on this issue, and look  
23 forward to passing that bill. So that we can have  
24 more infrastructure especially on our city-owned  
25 lots. Thank you so much.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So with that, I'd  
3 like to thank again Nilda Mesa, the Director of the  
4 Mayor's Office of Sustainability, and Keith Kerman,  
5 we're relying on you as a--as the Fleet Manager of  
6 DCAS, and your role in supporting those will be very  
7 important. We will have a press conference on  
8 Thursday, the 21 in Times Square, 45th and Broadway  
9 giving more detail on the prep--with the preparation,  
10 but I know that the Mayor again with DOT, too,  
11 they've been very helpful. There's a big plan that  
12 they have for the closing of Broadway from Union  
13 Square to 23rd Street at the heart of crossing the  
14 street and sending the message and--and again thank  
15 you all my colleagues for being on board this  
16 initiative. With that, I'm now going to be calling  
17 the next panel. Will Nicholas from Tesla Motors,  
18 Jessie Hart--Carp from Tesla 2, and Kevin George  
19 Miller from Charge Points, and as they're coming to  
20 the table, I'm going to take--I'm going to be taking  
21 five minutes just to going and being present at the  
22 other hearing. And now I would to ask the clerk to  
23 please close the vote.

24

25

2 CLERK: The--the vote now stands--the  
3 final vote now stands 11 in the affirmative, 0 in the  
4 negative, 1 abstention.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. So  
6 we'll be back in five minutes, but our guests stay in  
7 the table. [pause, background comments, pause]

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So to continue,  
9 we will hear now the panel from the private sector,  
10 and as you know, like you represent, you know, those,  
11 the part of the city of the--the society and only  
12 here that is looking to do better in the city, but  
13 also you're coming in national or international  
14 profile. So, we know that in order to move into the  
15 electric vehicle charging stations through expanding  
16 through the--through the five borough in our city,  
17 and make our city also the center of this innovation.  
18 This is only what happened with the partnership with  
19 public and private sector working together.

20 WILL NICHOLAS: Good morning. My name is  
21 Will Nicholas and I'm the Government Relations  
22 Manager for Tesla Motors, Incorporated. I want to  
23 thank council members for allowing me the opportunity  
24 to describe Tesla's interest in Bill 1124 before the  
25 committee. Just last week one of the few gas

2 stations left in Manhattan closed. It seems an  
3 appropriate time that we now discuss how to refuel  
4 the city with the technology that will move us into  
5 the future. Tesla is an American Technology and  
6 Design Company that solely manufactures and  
7 distributes electric vehicles. Founded in 2003 by  
8 five Silicon Valley engineers seeking to end our  
9 country's dependence on oil, particularly foreign  
10 oil, this U.S. based company's core mission is to  
11 catalyze the mass market for sustainable transport.  
12 From the outset, Tesla's plan has been to capitalize  
13 on its innovative new power train technology in high  
14 end products with a goal to aggressively drive down  
15 price for iterating and improving technology in  
16 subsequent product offerings. The company first  
17 designed and built the market inspiring Tesla  
18 Roadster in 2008, a two-seat sports car capable of  
19 245 miles of range on a single charge and 0 to 60  
20 time in 3.7 seconds. Nearly 2,500 units were sold  
21 around the world with a starting price of \$109,000,  
22 and the car had an intentional limited production run  
23 in order to quickly move to the next offering, the  
24 award winning Model S. Released in 2012, less than a  
25 decade after the conclusion of the Roadster Program,



2 the Model S is capable of achieving over 270 miles of  
3 range on the updated EPA test that takes into account  
4 air conditioning usage, cold weather operation and  
5 high speed driving. With a starting price of  
6 \$71,500, Tesla has taken out nearly half of the cost  
7 of this next iteration vehicle, while providing  
8 vastly improved utility for five adults and two  
9 children, classic in storage, supercharging  
10 capability and performance with a 0 to 60 mile per  
11 hour times in as little as 2.8 seconds, improved  
12 range and dual motor all-wheel drive power train.  
13 the Model S has won numerous awards by--and named in  
14 Motor Trends Magazine 2000 car--2013 Car of the Year,  
15 and is being referred by Consumer Reports as the best  
16 car they've ever tested and scoring on 103 out of a  
17 possible 100. In the third quarter of last year,  
18 Tesla related the Tesla Model X, a crossover vehicle  
19 with seating up to seven adults, and other compelling  
20 features. And just two weeks ago, the company  
21 unveiled drivable prototypes for its mass market  
22 vehicle, Model 3, the first car based on its third  
23 generation platform with a starting price of \$35,000.  
24 Tesla now says that the affordable EV will travel 215  
25 real world miles per charge, achieve a five star

2 safety rating in each category, seat five adults  
3 comfortably, and having compatibility with the super  
4 charge network. Scheduled for start-up production in  
5 May 2017, this third generation EV planned less than  
6 a decade after the introduction of Tesla's first ever  
7 vehicle, represent the market entry of a long-range  
8 EV at a third of a price of the roadster. Once  
9 achieved, this aggressive technology innovation will  
10 represent in engineering and price reduction that no  
11 other automobile manufacturer has ever matched. To  
12 further the option of EVs and create driving  
13 confidence for customers, Tesla has launched several  
14 initiatives to make charging easy and convenient.  
15 First the Model S and Model X are compatible with any  
16 conventional outlet. The universality of the  
17 architecture allows customers to charge their  
18 vehicles in the convenience [bell] of their homes  
19 with standard 120 or 220 volt outlets. Tesla also  
20 manufactures a wall fixture that charges up to 80  
21 amps and has an 18-foot cord. These are often  
22 installed in customer's garages, but workplaces and  
23 businesses have begun to install them to accommodate  
24 employees and attract patrons. This effort to  
25 partner with parking garages, shopping centers,

2 business parks and travel destinations has increased  
3 Tesla's overall charging footprint. Tesla customers  
4 can find wall connectors on the company's public  
5 website, and receive navigation to the locations  
6 through the vehicle's 17-inch on-board screen.  
7 Currently there are over 3,815 wall connectors across  
8 the United States with 105 of them in Manhattan and  
9 Brooklyn. Tesla customers can also leverage third-  
10 party charges by adapters. J1772 adapters come  
11 standard with each vehicle and Chatham (sic) Chargers  
12 can be purchased online or at one of our service  
13 centers. In addition to these options and  
14 potentially most importantly, Tesla customers have  
15 access to the growing supercharger network that spans  
16 the globe. Superchargers are free connectors that  
17 charge Tesla EVs in minutes instead of hours.  
18 Stations are strategically placed to minimize stops  
19 during long distance travel, and are conveniently  
20 located near restaurants, shopping centers and Wifi  
21 hot spots. Tesla has--has deployed over 3,644 super  
22 chargers worldwide and over 1,841 in the United  
23 States. Of those, 52 are located in New York. This  
24 network allows free long distance travel for our  
25 customers on the most popularly traveled routes. The

2 company is working rigorously to improve and expand  
3 the network anticipating that there will be hundreds  
4 of thousands of Tesla EVs on the road in the next few  
5 years. Tesla supports issues that encourage the  
6 acceleration of sustainable transport including  
7 improving current charging infrastructure. Bill 1124  
8 will enable New York City to start the impact of  
9 public charging across each borough, and the data  
10 will allow stakeholders to thoughtfully shape the  
11 landscape for future charging projects. Markets  
12 around the world including New York City are  
13 experiencing increase in EV interest, and it's  
14 critical that stewards of this technology shift to  
15 prepare for the upcoming demand. Due to the volume  
16 of drivers in the Greater New York City Metro area,  
17 Tesla encourages stakeholders to consider installing  
18 charging solutions that meet driver expectations  
19 including convenient parking and quick charging.  
20 Both are challenging, but it is important for the  
21 large scale of option to do these at level 3 or quick  
22 charging locations are made available to the public  
23 in addition to level 2 chargers. In understanding  
24 the limited space in our dense open landscape, Tesla  
25 encourages policy that can remove barriers to

2 identify charging locations and expedite the approval  
3 processes. Optimizing the approach to build out the  
4 infrastructure will help ensure that the city can  
5 accommodate the many drivers who rely on EVs for  
6 their personal transport. Thank you for the  
7 opportunity to provide this testimony. I welcome any  
8 questions about the bill with Tesla.

9 KEVIN MILLER: Thank you, Chairman  
10 Rodriguez and the three of you to the Transportation  
11 Committee. My name is Kevin Miller and I'm the  
12 Director of Public Policy for Charge Point, Charge  
13 Point designs and sell electric vehicle charging  
14 stations and network services. Charge Point is the  
15 world's largest and most open electric vehicle or EV  
16 charging network with more than 27,000 level 2 and DC  
17 fast charging spots including more than 870 in New  
18 York State with 435 of those in those city. Every 4-  
19 1/2 seconds a driver connects to a Charge Point  
20 station, and by initiating over 15 million charging  
21 sessions, Charge Point drivers have driven over 330  
22 million gas free miles. EVs have some great  
23 properties. They're good for the environment, and  
24 they help to end our addiction to foreign oil.  
25 People who drive them love them and, of course, they

2 need a place to be charged, and we need to ensure  
3 that there is a robust charging infrastructure to  
4 enable people to use those cars. Charge Point does  
5 not own the EV charging infrastructure, but we sell  
6 our products and services to organizations that do  
7 provide those services. So typically these are  
8 apartment building owners, employers, cities,  
9 counties, and parking garage operators. Each one has  
10 its own model for providing charging services. For  
11 most, but not all employers, it's a free service to  
12 encourage clean transportation, and it's an employee  
13 benefit. Apartment building owners will often charge  
14 for the service just as they do for a coin-op  
15 laundry. Cities and counties charge cost recovery  
16 fees in order to avoid nearly giving away electricity  
17 at the taxpayer's expense. Some of these services  
18 are free, some are included in rent, some pay per  
19 use, and some are modified to elicit charging  
20 behavior and the highest utilization of the asset.  
21 We support the overall intent and purpose of Intro  
22 1124, which is to make EV charging more accessible  
23 throughout the five boroughs. New York State has  
24 made a commitment to put over 800,000 zero emission  
25 vehicles on the road by 2025, and this statewide goal

2 will require strategies for deploying charging  
3 infrastructure that work Upstate just like they will  
4 in the city. The most critical barriers to the  
5 widespread adoption of EVs in New York City are the  
6 vehicle cost. A minimal amount of publicly  
7 accessible parking areas within walking distance of  
8 workplaces, the lack of engagement with New York City  
9 employers on the benefits of workplace charging, and  
10 the absence of curbside EV charging. With regard to  
11 vehicle cost, the EV rebate included in the New York  
12 State budget, which Charge Point hopes will be  
13 allocated sufficient funding to reach as many New  
14 Yorkers as possible comes as the price for EVs  
15 continues to drop as battery technology improves.  
16 With regard to EVs and the workplace in New York  
17 City, Charge Point is partnering with CALSTART, the  
18 New York City Department of Transportation, the  
19 Northeast States for Coordinated Air Use Management,  
20 Empire State Clean Cities Coalition to roll out the  
21 Charge to Work New York City program. Charge to Work  
22 NYC will build a stronger awareness of the benefits  
23 of EVs among consumers reduce and user EV costs,  
24 directly reduce greenhouse gas emissions by up to  
25 2,300 metric tons per year. [bell] For right access

2 to a growing network of Charge Point charging  
3 stations, and produce a variety of direct community  
4 benefits including cleaner air, improved quality of  
5 life, job growth and enhanced rebate opportunities  
6 for veterans and employers who live--employees who  
7 live and work in economically disadvantaged  
8 communities. Charge Point is enthusiastic about the  
9 attention that the City Council is paying to the  
10 issue of curbside charging. We have experience in  
11 deploying curbside stations in cities like Los  
12 Angeles, San Francisco and Washington, D.C. We  
13 strongly support any effort to expand access to  
14 charging, and also recommend that any decision to  
15 shape EV charging infrastructure strategy in New York  
16 be made in the context of the smart network of home,  
17 multi-unit dwelling, workplace and public EV charging  
18 services. We applaud the focus on data gathering in  
19 Intro 1124. Charge Point has data from every one of  
20 our Smart network stations ever deployed, and we  
21 would encourage New York City to harness the full  
22 range of data available to inform its charging  
23 infrastructure priorities. Leveraging data from a  
24 network of smart chargers gives insight into charging  
25 station utilization, unique users, vehicle types and



2 much more, which can all be viewed by any range of  
3 geographic units from the zip code down to the city  
4 block or any unit of time. So, we thank you for the  
5 opportunity to testify on behalf of Intro 1124, and  
6 look forward to working with the committee, staff and  
7 other Stakeholders to devise comprehensive strategies  
8 to accelerate sustainable and scalable growth of EV  
9 charging in New York City. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I have two  
11 questions and my colleagues also have. One is how do  
12 you describe where the city is right now when we  
13 compare with other cities throughout the nation or  
14 throughout the world when it comes to moving more  
15 into electrical cars, electric cars and, therefore,  
16 of course, like taking care of the whole  
17 infrastructure because the chargers are important in  
18 order to make it?

19 KEVIN MILLER: Well, there--there are two  
20 main drivers of EV adoption. One is EV rebates, and  
21 the other it's access to charging. New York State  
22 for a while had been behind the curve, but is now  
23 getting ahead of the curve, and has taken the  
24 initiative to incentivize EVs through direct rebates,  
25 and we're working with a coalition to support the

2 full funding of that EV rebate as announced in the  
3 New York State budget and the other has to do with  
4 expansion of charging infrastructure. NYSERDA is  
5 going to be rolling out an incentive for EV charging  
6 infrastructure. So we support all efforts to  
7 continue a sustainable and scalable increase of  
8 charging station access in the city. New York has  
9 unique challenges when it comes to parking, and we--  
10 we have been partnering with the City Department of  
11 Transportation as well as other stakeholders in  
12 Office of Sustainability to address a comprehensive  
13 strategy, and we would welcome working and providing  
14 any resources that we have available to the committee  
15 to address those issues, and in New York City  
16 specific fashion.

17 WILL NICHOLAS: I think owning a car in  
18 New York City is different than most other urban  
19 metropolises across the United States, but what we've  
20 seen is we've--as a manufacturer, we've driven the  
21 cost down of electric vehicles. We foresee that the  
22 adoption rate will only increase, and so while  
23 parking remains hard for any vehicle, I thin that  
24 it's very important for this committee and for the  
25 stakeholders to be mindful of what EV adoption will

2 look like not only right now, but in the years to  
3 come. In my testimony, I had mentioned that we have  
4 \$35,000 model coming out. Other manufacturers, BMW,  
5 General Motors also have vehicles at that price point  
6 on the way. So, I think that it's very critical to  
7 considering the type of charging that will be  
8 necessary at all places that have parking whether  
9 they're public, multi-unit or private.

10 KEVIN MILLER: And if I may, one more  
11 comment, in some models that we've seen across the  
12 state, the more successful ones have been where we  
13 bring in a broad group of stakeholders from the  
14 utilities to private actors to site hosts to make  
15 sure that everyone has skin in the game. There are  
16 some assets that are best managed at the larger  
17 scale. So we've seen sustainable models that focus  
18 on utility partnership, and there are ways that we  
19 can encourage that to happen. We're working with  
20 Con-Ed and the State government is also encouraging  
21 that and we'll be focusing on that through the right  
22 (sic) proceedings that are coming forth, but bringing  
23 more actors to the table, and highlighting this at  
24 the level that you are is an important step.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Which  
3 (off mic)

4 WEILL NICHOLAS: Which city? Well, the--  
5 40% of the EV market is out of California. So, you  
6 know, I think it's safe to say that it might be Los  
7 Angeles as the top city, but New York is in the top  
8 ten of metro areas across--across the country I  
9 believe fourth or fifth for EV adoption.

10 KEVIN MILLER: Agreed. Los Angeles and  
11 other West Coast cities, San Francisco, Portland,  
12 Seattle and on the East Coast I think, you know, it's  
13 certainly not comparable in terms of size or density,  
14 but Atlanta and parts of Miami as well, are--are  
15 leading kind in the issues with charging  
16 infrastructure.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. Council  
18 Member (off mic).

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you  
20 Chair Rodriguez. So what--what can we learn from Los  
21 Angeles. What type of network have they put together  
22 that sort of makes them the cream of the crop?

23 KEVIN MILLER: Some of the important work  
24 that's been taking place in California has to do, as  
25 I mentioned, by bringing in utility partners to take

2 on the cost of infrastructure that can be  
3 prohibitive, the insulation piece not for the  
4 charging station itself, but for the connections  
5 between the grid and the charging station. So by  
6 expanding their role into that long-term asset, that  
7 has been a key to unlocking the potential of the  
8 market. There are statewide policies there, which  
9 have driven the focus towards adoption of EVs and  
10 infrastructure, and that's something that we're  
11 seeing happen in New York State now, but there are  
12 city level policies such as the ones that are on the  
13 table that can highlight the potential for growth.  
14 So there are some factors that if we bring  
15 stakeholders together at the city level, we can  
16 encourage state level policies to continue to shape a  
17 scalable model that isn't reliant on--on grant  
18 funding, but that can be scalable and sustainable.  
19 And I think only 0.5% of any of our stations across  
20 the country are tied to grant dollars. So you need  
21 to make sure that the model for continuing to drive  
22 growth in EV charging infrastructure is one that  
23 can't get the rug pulled out from under it. That can  
24 stand up on its own two feet, and that's what we've  
25 seen with our model.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I mean  
3 I'm looking at, you know, the Administration's  
4 testimony, and I think some of the things that they  
5 spoke about are all things that we should be doing in  
6 looking at opportunities to place them near retail  
7 sectors makes a lot of sense. Looking at opportunity  
8 to put them near park and rides, near public  
9 transportation. That makes sense as well, but I  
10 think that as part of a scalable model of the--the  
11 fundamentals of 1124 like having residential on-street  
12 parking should be part of that larger network. And I  
13 think that if we build the comprehensive network, we  
14 will make it easier. But people are continuing to  
15 buy cars, and if my care is a 120,000 miles, it's 13  
16 years old, I've got maybe a year left on my car, I'm  
17 going to want to purchase a new vehicle. But if you--  
18 -if you have infrastructure, as I said before, it has  
19 to be as easy to be green as it is traditional, and  
20 people just are not going to make that green choice  
21 because they are--it's either too complicated or too  
22 expensive. If we can take the complication away, I  
23 really believe that people will make their choices  
24 based on green values. I don't know if you want--

2 it's not really a question, but if you want to  
3 comment on any of that statement.

4 KEVIN MILLER: We're thinking all of the  
5 above approaches typically is why you need to  
6 consider all of the different venues for charging and  
7 making sure that the pilot that gets rolled out is  
8 just done in context with some of the other venues  
9 that you've highlighted is important. But it's not  
10 to say that one shouldn't consider one option because  
11 you're doing others right, and all the above approach  
12 is necessary in making sure that you look at retail  
13 stores. You know, you can have two hours of free  
14 charging by a site host. If they decide to offer  
15 that to bring customers there, there are a lot of  
16 economic development opportunities with these killing  
17 two birds with one stone. But that's not to say that  
18 we shouldn't consider all options on the table.

19 WILL NICHOLAS: Yeah, a second on that.  
20 I think it would be education and--and marketing to  
21 business owners and employers to provide this type of  
22 charging will only help increase the amount of  
23 charging in the pervasiveness of charging that's--  
24 that's offered throughout New York. I think that,  
25 you know, the Brooklyn Navy Yard is an example.

2 We're certainly working with them to make sure that,  
3 you know, as they begin construction we can partner  
4 to provide that type of--type of charging convenience  
5 and it will not only bring an added benefit to the  
6 patrons, but it can an improved economic situation in  
7 the Navy Yard and the tenant itself because they are  
8 then attracting the type of folks that would like to  
9 do business, but also recharge their cars while  
10 they're doing so.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Okay,  
12 thank you. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. [off mic]  
14 the conversation of, you know, as I said, private and  
15 public have to be working together to, you know,  
16 respond to something that is important for our  
17 consumers. And that's the city, you know, that we  
18 also can be in the same place or leading of the city  
19 when it comes to innovation. So thank you

20 KEVIN MILLER: Thank you.

21 WILL NICHOLAS: Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yes. So the  
23 next--I'm sorry. I'm sorry, if you don't mind in  
24 your--I want to give the opportunity to Council  
25 Member Greenfield. He also have a few questions.



2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I apologize  
3 because I'm literally between two hearings at once.  
4 It's a neat trick that we do here in the City  
5 Council. I once again want to thank the respective  
6 chairs for their commitment to passing this  
7 legislation. I'm a proud to be a co-sponsor of the  
8 legislation as well. I just wanted to say for the  
9 record that I'm--as the ads say I'm--I'm not just--  
10 I'm not just a fan of Charge Point, but a member  
11 myself. I have a card in my pocket, and I use it  
12 widely. Not so for Tesla, quite frankly, because  
13 you're too expensive on my civil servant's salary,  
14 but I'm looking forward to the new \$35,000 car.  
15 Maybe we can--we can afford that when it actually  
16 comes out. My only question--my only question is--  
17 well, I guess it's a two-part question. One is I  
18 noticed that some of the newer charges don't fit with  
19 my car, which is I guess a year old. What's with the  
20 compatibility of the cars? Are they all sort of the  
21 same across the board, or are there challenges in  
22 terms of the usage of compatibility when it comes to  
23 these electric charging stations?

24 KEVIN MILER: There are two primary  
25 technologies for charging, two families of charging

2 and I believe the Mayor's Office of Sustainability  
3 flagged that some stations can handle one or the  
4 other. Charge Point does have products that can fit  
5 all ports, and that's important part of--that you're--  
6 --that you're highlighting, counselor, is the  
7 transparency and the open accessibility so that folks  
8 who need a charge know where to go to get it. There  
9 are publicly available data sets hosted nationally  
10 that identify the types of charging stations and the  
11 types of cars they support. These are conversations  
12 that are happening I believe on the auto side. To  
13 the extent that you can make charging as barrier free  
14 to the driver as possible is critical. On Charge  
15 Point's front, you know, we're working with a range  
16 of charging stakeholders to make it possible to have  
17 a membership in any charging station network and use  
18 the--that to access any other charging station  
19 networks, the chargers. So we need to make sure that  
20 we're reducing barriers to--to charging services, and  
21 that's an important issue to highlight.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: And then my  
23 question for Tesla actually is, you know, my  
24 experience when I was looking for an electric car it  
25 was actually difficult. Quite frankly, most of the

2 dealers that I went to they weren't interested. They  
3 rebuffed me. Do you find that's sort of a similar  
4 experience that dealers for whatever reason push  
5 people away from electric and towards gas cars?

6 WILL NICHOLAS: I think that's one of the  
7 primary reasons why we're so committed to owning and  
8 operating our own stores. We see them as educational  
9 outposts as we understand that making a shift in one  
10 of the most important or--and expensive purchases  
11 that you make requires a lot of education. And so,  
12 we're committed to providing that education on a  
13 large scale, and I think that's because electric  
14 vehicles is as you know require less service, that  
15 tends to be a very significant revenue stream for  
16 dealership. And when they can't count on the--the  
17 service that an electric vehicle would have compared  
18 to an internal combustion engine, I can understand  
19 why they would make business decisions to focus on  
20 the sale of a, you know, petroleum based vehicle and  
21 not an electric car.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you. I  
23 have to go back to my other hearing, but I appreciate  
24 it. Take care.

25 WILL NICHOLAS: You, too. Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you  
3 Council Member Greenfield. On--on behalf of Chair  
4 Rodriguez I thank you both and look forward to  
5 working with the industry and having a more robust  
6 conversation on electric vehicles. Thank you.

7 KEVIN MILLER: Thank you, Council.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: The next  
9 panel will be Kimberly Ong from the Natural Resources  
10 Defense Council; Christina Foccacia(sp?). I'm sorry  
11 about that if I pronounced it wrong, and R.G. Evgo  
12 (sp?) and Bethany Bowyer from Downtown Brooklyn  
13 Partnership. If you can all come forward and the  
14 attorney will swear you in.

15 [background comments]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Oh, well,  
17 I--I just--if that works, I mean. [pause] All  
18 right, great. Fantastic. If you can begin on the  
19 left there and then work your way over, that would be  
20 great. Thank you.

21 KIMBERLY ONG: Good morning. I guess,  
22 Chairman Rodriguez--Rodriguez is busy, but good  
23 morning, Mr. Constant--Constantinides. My name is  
24 Kimberly Ong and I'm an attorney at the Natural  
25 Resources Defense Council. As you probably know,

2 NRDC is a national non-profit legal and scientific  
3 organization that has been active on a wide range of  
4 environmental issues around the globe and right here  
5 in New York City since its founding in 1970. I  
6 appreciate the opportunity to testify before you  
7 today. We submitted written comments so I'm just  
8 going to summarize them here since it looks like  
9 we're running kind of late. NRDC strongly supports  
10 Intro 1124. We are convinced that installing  
11 curbside electric vehicle charging stations would  
12 encourage the widespread adoption of electric  
13 vehicles, which in turn would reduce the greenhouse  
14 gas emissions and improve air quality in the city.  
15 NRDC encourages the adoption of electric vehicles in  
16 New York City because it's necessary to combat both  
17 climate change and air pollution. A study by NRDC  
18 and the Electric Power Research Institute found that  
19 widespread electric vehicle use nationwide could cut  
20 carbon pollution by 550 million metric tons annually  
21 in 2050 equivalent to the emissions from 100 million  
22 passenger cars. On the regional level, New York  
23 State has signed an agreement with seven other states  
24 to collectively put 3.3 million zero emission  
25 vehicles on the road by 2025. New York's share is to

2 place approximately 820,000 zero emission vehicles on  
3 the roads in the next nine years. As of early 2016,  
4 there were only about 12,000 zero emission vehicles  
5 in New York State. Therefore, a nearly 70 fold  
6 increase will be required in the next decade to meet  
7 the State's commitment. Widespread electric vehicle  
8 use would also combat ozone and particulate matter  
9 pollution since electric vehicles do not emit  
10 pollution from the tailpipes unlike gas power  
11 vehicles. Both ozone and particulate pollution can  
12 aggra--aggregate--aggravate asthma and other lung  
13 conditions, and cause premature death in people with  
14 heart and lung disease. In 2013, 2,700 premature  
15 deaths were tied to ozone and fine particulate matter  
16 related health issues, eight times higher than the  
17 number of people who died from murder. The lack of  
18 public charging stations in New York City is a major  
19 impediment to progress in electric vehicles. There  
20 are only 260 publicly available charging stations  
21 within the city limits, and the vast majority of them  
22 are located in private parking facilities in  
23 Manhattan. This shortage of available charging  
24 stations can lead to range anxiety which can serve as  
25 a barrier to electric vehicle adoption. With

2 curbside charging stations in all five boroughs,  
3 drivers across the city would be able to plug in more  
4 maximizing the use--usefulness and benefits of  
5 electric vehicles. Charging stations would also  
6 serve as a symbol educating New Yorkers about the  
7 benefits of electric vehicles and reminding us all  
8 that climate change is not only real but happening to  
9 us now, and that there are practical solutions to  
10 this global problem. If the Council were to adopt  
11 this legislation, it would be following sensibly in  
12 the footsteps of other progressive cities. For  
13 example, Washington, DC has already installed at  
14 least 20 charging stations on its city streets. The  
15 City of Amsterdam has over 1,000 public charging  
16 stations and aims to have 4,000 charging points by  
17 the year 2018. When Indianapolis completes their  
18 electric vehicle program, it will have 200 charging  
19 stations on the streets. In addition, cities like  
20 Baltimore, Boston, Burbank, Oslo, Paris, London and  
21 Berlin have all moved successfully to implement  
22 electric vehicle charging station programs. [bell]  
23 In short, NRDC believe s that Intro 1124, if enacted,  
24 would reduce reliance on dirty fossil fuels, cut  
25 climate change emissions and reduce air pollutants

2 for residents of neighborhoods across New York City.  
3 We thank you, Mr. Chairman for holding this hearing  
4 and for your leadership on this issue. NRDC  
5 certainly supports the proposed legislation. Thank  
6 you.

7           BETHANY BOWYER: [off mic] Good  
8 afternoon. [on mic] Good afternoon, now. Chairman  
9 Rodriguez and Constantinides. My name Bethany  
10 Bowyer. I'm the Deputy Director of Real Estate and  
11 Planning at the Downtown Brooklyn Partnership, and  
12 I'm here to--this afternoon just to voice our strong  
13 support for the proposed legislation to help launch  
14 electric vehicle infrastructure in New York City. As  
15 you may know, the Downtown Brooklyn Part--Partnership  
16 is a not-for-profit economic development organization  
17 overseeing three major business improvement districts  
18 that serves also the growth of Downtown Brooklyn as a  
19 thriving business retail, cultural, educational and  
20 resident neighborhood. As the largest commercial  
21 district outside of Manhattan, Downtown Brooklyn is  
22 also along with the Brooklyn Navy Yard in Dumbo part  
23 of the Brooklyn Triangle, which has become a magnet  
24 for the world's pioneering and creative entrepreneurs  
25 and has emerged as one of the largest tech clusters



2 in New York City. Since the release of the Brooklyn  
3 Tech Triangle's Strategic Plan the innovation an  
4 economy in Brooklyn is stronger than ever now  
5 supporting more than 1,350 innovation companies, 22%  
6 more than just three years ago, and that supports  
7 over 17,000 jobs. To continue the growth of the Tech  
8 Triangle, we believe the area must be supported by  
9 innovative infrastructure and electric infrastructure  
10 is a great way to do that. In addition to our  
11 innovation economy, Downtown Brooklyn is home to more  
12 than over 60,000 office workers, more than 60,000  
13 college students many of whom commute from further  
14 out within the borough, and a tremendously growing  
15 residential population. Because of all of this, we  
16 believe Downtown Brooklyn is an excellent location  
17 for the City and DOT to launch Brooklyn's Electric  
18 Vehicle Pilot Program. And because of our  
19 relationships and convening power with utilities and  
20 the real estate community, we look forward to working  
21 with the City and the private sector in furthering  
22 electric vehicles. As you likely know, electric  
23 vehicles also emit 70% less carbon per mile traveled  
24 than conventional vehicles. Their adoption can  
25 greatly reduce local air pollution especially in

2 traffic heavy neighborhood such as Downtown Brooklyn.  
3 As the city moves to hopefully adopt this pilot  
4 program, we urge that the City install at least seven  
5 charging stations per borough, consider the creation  
6 of a mobile app that will allow drivers to see when a  
7 charging station becomes available, and perhaps  
8 reserve on. And to continue preparing a more robust  
9 electric vehicle infrastructure network. As we  
10 prepare for Earth Day later this week, we commend you  
11 at the City Council for putting together this piece  
12 of legislation that will further New York City's  
13 growth as a cleaner and more innovative city, and  
14 thank you for your time.

15 [off mic] Hi, Good morning or good  
16 afternoon.

17 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [off mic] Use the  
18 mic, please. Use the mic.

19 CHRISTINA FOCACCIA: Oh, good afternoon,  
20 Chairman Rodriguez and Chairman Constantinides. I'm  
21 Christina Focaccia (sp?) with Energy E-Z-GO where I  
22 work on building partnerships that promote the  
23 adoption of electric vehicles. Energy E-Z-GO owns  
24 and operates over 545 EV fast-charging electric  
25 vehicles--vehicle charging stations in the U.S.

2 Energy E-Z-GO applauds the New York City Council for  
3 its commitment to improving our environment through  
4 promoting reduced greenhouse emissions and  
5 encouraging electric vehicle adoption. E-Z-GO  
6 supports NYC Council Bill Intro 1124, a Local Law to  
7 establish a pilot program for installation--for the  
8 installation of street parking electric vehicle  
9 charging stations. The need to assess and pilot  
10 installing street parking EZ charging stations is  
11 important in service residents and visitors committed  
12 to driving a zero emitting vehicle in New York City.  
13 There is a need so remove the barrier of EZ charging  
14 options that are limited by types of publicly  
15 accessible and available easy charging in NY--in New  
16 York City. There is a need to address and streamline  
17 permitting and processes for how E-Z charging can be  
18 co-located on our streets, whether directly on street  
19 or allowing for a process that does not hinder a  
20 suitable charging location due to its proximity or  
21 overlap onto New York City streets, sidewalks and  
22 parking right-of-ways. Piloting this is an  
23 appropriate way to assess and address these issues,  
24 and barriers associated with the growing adoption of  
25 EVs. Energy-E-Z-GO holds one of the largest and

2 fastest growing electric vehicle DC fast charging  
3 networks in--in the country with over 540 DC fast  
4 charging sites in the country in partnerships with  
5 major EV manufactures like Nissan and BMW. E-Z-GO's  
6 number one priority is taking care of its E-Z driving  
7 customers and OEM clients. With this, we bring  
8 experience on best methods of installing EZ charging  
9 that promotes EZ ownership and adoption within a  
10 given market. Our DC fast charge stations are being  
11 equipped with the capability to support both SE CCS  
12 size standard and the Chatama standard with--that  
13 with an adapter, Tesla's vehicles can also access.  
14 In addition--sorry--E-Z-GO is also experienced with  
15 installing and managing lower level E-Z Charging,  
16 level 2 charging both collate--co-located at our  
17 public retail DC Fast Charge sites, and that we're  
18 placing at multi-unit residential sites will, which  
19 will allow for the connection with J70--J1772  
20 standards. Currently, there are over 2,000  
21 registered EVs within the five boroughs and growing  
22 with closer to an additional 8,000 registered in  
23 surrounding areas. The availability of close to  
24 10,000 EVs looking to charge in NYC today requires  
25 many more chargers than currently available. To

2 allow for increased EV adoption, a significant number  
3 of EV charging stations and allowable throughput is  
4 needed. In support of the bill, E-Z-GO recommends  
5 that the New York City Council better serve EV  
6 drivers by considering EV chargers--charging  
7 throughput created by the bill versus the number of  
8 charging stations. Remitting the number of charging  
9 sites from 10 to 35 at certain charging stations  
10 levels in capacity will serve a very low number of EV  
11 drivers. However, [bell] in support of the bill as a  
12 lower number of stations is steady, DC Fast Charging  
13 is a more suitable solution that allows for EV  
14 drivers to charge at a single site in a--as fast as  
15 20 or 30 minutes versus 48 hours at lower charging  
16 station levels. E-Z-GO also recommends not limiting  
17 the number of stations to up to seven per borough or,  
18 therefore, 35 for all New York City during the pilot  
19 period and expand the number of chargers to include  
20 and allow for more chargers to be sited as needed.  
21 Finally, for on-street charging to work effectively,  
22 it is essential that on-street EV only parking spaces  
23 be properly enforced. We urge the City Council to  
24 work with both DOT and NYPD to establish clear  
25 enforcement protocols so that New Yorkers can easily

2 understand their rights and responsibilities when  
3 parking at these locations. We thank New York City  
4 Council for its support of EV adoption and leadership  
5 through the proposal of this bill.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great. I'd like  
7 to say thank you for sharing your testimony and to  
8 everyone. I think that we are in a good a place like  
9 knowing that the Administration is open to continue  
10 this conversation knowing that there's an interest  
11 from the private sector and knowing most of the  
12 important institutions such as the one that you  
13 represent also are in support of this. You know,  
14 it's always good to have a hearing knowing that  
15 there's a good level of support for it especially  
16 when it comes to the Administration being open to  
17 this. So we will continue working with my colleague,  
18 Council Member Constantindies and the rest of the  
19 team, and we will continue the conversation.

20 CHRISTINA FOCACCIA: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you and  
22 with that, this hearing is adjourned.

23 BETHANY BOWYER: Thank you.

24 CHRISTINA FOCACCIA: Thank you.

25 [gavel]

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

87

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 13, 2016