

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND
ADDICTIONS

September 4, 2019
Start: 10:10 a.m.
Recess: 1:18 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 16th Fl.

B E F O R E: ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
Chairperson

DIANA AYALA
Co-Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

FERNANDO CABRERA
LAURIE A. CUMBO
RUBEN DIAZ SR.
VANESSA L. GIBSON
MARK GJONAJ
ROBERT F. HOLDEN
CARLOS MENCHACA
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS
RAFAEL SALAMANCA JR.
RITCHIE TORRES
MARK TREYGER
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 2

2 A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

3 Joey Koch
4 Senior Vice President for Operations Support

5 Brian Honan
6 Director of the Office of Intergovernmental
7 Relations in the New York City Housing Authority,
8 NYCHA

9 Monica Martinez
10 Legislative Coordinator of New York City Housing
11 Authority, NYCHA

12 Olive Osterwind
13 Executive Project Manager at New York City
14 Housing Authority, NYCHA

15 Ukah Busgith
16 Deputy Director for the Department of
17 Administration and Citywide Programs, Family
18 Partnerships

19 Suhali Mendez
20 Advocate in the Disability Justice Program at
21 New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

22 Aixa Torres
23 President of Alfred E. Smith Houses Resident
24 association

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 3

2 [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Good morning
4 everyone and thank you all for coming to today's
5 joint hearing on the Committee of Public Housing and
6 the Committee on Mental Health, Disabilities and
7 Addiction. I am Council Member Alicka Ampry-Samuel
8 and I am Chair of the Public Housing Committee and I
9 am joined by Chair Diana Ayala as well. Last year as
10 part of the federal government investigation into
11 NYCHA the Department of Justice alleged that failing
12 elevators left disabled residents trapped in their
13 homes. The media accounts this summer have
14 underscored these concerns. Recent local news reports
15 describe multiple cases where residents with limited
16 mobility were stuck in their buildings. These stories
17 have brought renewed attention to a long-standing
18 problem. NYCHA has struggled to fulfill its legal
19 obligations to make public housing accessible for
20 residents with disabilities. Accessibility can take
21 many forms; elevators are of course a critical tool
22 in ensuring residents ability to physically access
23 programs and services but NYCHA's responsibility go
24 beyond that. NYCHA is required by law to provide
25 reasonable accommodations so that disabled residents

2 have an equal opportunity to use and enjoy NYCHA
3 housing. Resident's needs may be as varied as the
4 residents themselves and as a result NYCHA may be
5 required to provide different accommodations. This
6 morning I had the opportunity to take a look at New
7 York One's report on a family living in the Bronx,
8 Miss Nancy... Nancy Montanez and her daughter Cristy,
9 the story broke my heart. Cristy hasn't left her
10 house since May 30th, we have to do better on behalf
11 of so many New Yorkers that truly depend on us and
12 after watching that news story last... well this
13 morning and taking a look at Errol Louis's interview
14 with the new Chair. I took a look at the
15 developments, just half of the developments within
16 the 41st council district and just doing a quick
17 glance of the capital repair needs and the elevator
18 repair needs, the total cost for just my district
19 alone to fix the elevators came up to 141 million
20 dollars. So, that is the concept and the, the context
21 for why we're having this hearing today and so I, I,
22 I do want to thank the media because we said over the
23 past two years that it's going to take everyone to
24 get together in order to do right on behalf of the
25 residents and so the council is doing their part but

2 I just wanted to take the time and just thank the
3 media for that story that, that we all saw between
4 last night and this morning so I just wanted to say
5 that. Again, in order to best serve the hundreds of
6 thousands of New Yorkers who live in public housing
7 NYCHA has a duty to identify both challenges and
8 solutions to meeting the functional needs of
9 residents and NYCHA housing applicants with
10 disabilities. The committees to date are eager to
11 support NYCHA in fulfilling this responsibility. In
12 recognition of NYCHA's laudable new efforts to think
13 strategically about long term solutions we look
14 forward to hearing from NYCHA about the state of
15 accessibility today and also their projections for
16 the future. So, with that I turn it over to my Co-
17 Chair, Council Member Diana Ayala.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Good morning,
19 thank you Chair Samuels. Good morning everyone, I'm
20 Council Member Diana Ayala, Chair of the Committee on
21 Mental Health, Disabilities and Addictions. I'd like
22 to thank my colleague, Council Member Alicka Ampry-
23 Samuel, Chair of the Committee on Public Housing for
24 co-chairing this hearing with me today. Today we are
25 here to identify the challenges and explore the

2 solutions in meeting the needs of NYCHA residents and
3 NYCHA housing applicants with disabilities who face
4 issues of accessibility. Almost one million New York
5 City residents or one point... 11.2 percent of the
6 city's population have disclosed that they are living
7 with a disability and these New Yorkers are more
8 likely to be experiencing poverty, economic distress
9 and unemployment than individuals without
10 disabilities. In fact, the poverty rate for people
11 living with disabilities in the city is 36.5 percent,
12 almost double the poverty rate for people living
13 without disabilities in New York City. Individuals
14 with disabilities are 9.3 percent more likely than
15 people without disabilities to spend more than 50
16 percent of their income on rent but despite these
17 staggering numbers accessible housing in New York
18 City is limited, expensive and very difficult to
19 find. This hearing will allow the committees and the
20 public to learn more about how NYCHA is working to
21 improve its physical structural deficiencies so that
22 disabled residents can live safely and with dignity.
23 I want to thank NYCHA and the advocates here today
24 for the commitment that they have made to making
25 accessibility in public housing a priority. I look

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 7

2 forward to hearing more about all of the work they
3 are doing and the role that the City Council can play
4 in supporting these efforts. I also want to thank
5 committee staff Counsel Sara Liss; Policy Analyst
6 Cristy Dwyer; Finance Analyst Lauren Hunt and my
7 Legislative Director and Deputy Chief of Staff Bianca
8 Almedina for making this hearing possible, thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you
10 Chair Ayala. So, we will get started now. If you are
11 here to testify please let the Sergeant at Arms know
12 and complete the testimony slip because right now we...
13 because right now we only have one person testifying
14 so I just want to make sure if you're here to testify
15 and you did not fill out the slip please do so now.
16 And we have just been joined by Council Member Ruben
17 Diaz Senior. Okay. So now we'll hear testimony from
18 NYCHA so we're calling Joey Koch, Brian Honan and
19 Monica Martinez. And I just want to make sure that
20 there are no residents that were wanting to testify,
21 alright, okay. Counsel will swear you in.

22 CC: Please raise your right hand. Do you
23 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing
24 but the truth in your testimony before these

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 8

2 committees and to respond honestly to Council Member
3 questions?

4 [panel affirms]

5 JOEY KOCH: Chairs Alicka Ampry-Samuel
6 and Diana Ayala, members of the Committee on Public
7 Housing and Mental Health, Disabilities and Addiction
8 and other distinguished members of the City Council
9 good morning. I am Joey Koch, Senior Vice President
10 of Support Services. I am pleased to be joined by
11 Brian Honan, Director of Intergovernmental Relations
12 and other members of NYCHA's team. Thank you for this
13 opportunity to discuss our efforts to assist
14 residents with accessibility needs including our work
15 to improve elevator service. I've devoted most of my
16 career to public service and I came to NYCHA last
17 September to help turn this vital organization
18 around. In my role I oversee elevator, emergency,
19 heating, technical services as well as maintenance,
20 repair and skilled trade staff. At NYCHA our mission
21 is to provide safe, affordable housing and access to
22 social and community services that strengthen
23 communities. We support residents with accessibility
24 needs by providing reasonable accommodations,
25 physical improvement to buildings and connections to

2 services. Through NYCHA's reasonable accommodation
3 policy residents with disabilities can request an
4 accommodation that supports their needs. This could
5 include transfer to an accessible apartment, an
6 apartment with an extra bedroom to accommodate large
7 medical equipment, an apartment on a lower floor or
8 an apartment near relatives or a medical facility or
9 an apartment modification to make it more physically
10 accessible and usable such as installation of a
11 rolling shower, grab bars, ramps, flashing doorbells
12 or smoke and carbon monoxide detectors and lower
13 cabinets, light sockets, faucets and other fixtures.
14 We will also grant temporary permission for
15 caregivers to join a household based on their
16 circumstances. Residents can request a reasonable
17 accommodation at their development's management
18 office or through NYCHA's self-service website. We
19 are focused on improving our buildings to enhance
20 resident's quality of life. For instance, we updated
21 the architectural design guidelines for the
22 rehabilitation of our buildings taking into account
23 accessible and age friendly designs. We incorporate
24 these standards to the maximum extent feasible to
25 better support the safety, health and comfort of

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 10

2 residents including those with disabilities. Guided
3 by the new architectural standards in the past two
4 years we have invested over eight million dollars in
5 accessibility and age friendly improvements including
6 new ramps at 40 developments and we allocated 2.75
7 million dollars for accessibility modifications over
8 the next four years. Our updated architectural
9 standards apply not only to rehabilitation projects
10 but also to the development and preservation work
11 that we are doing. The new 100 percent affordable
12 housing we're building for seniors incorporates
13 accessible apartment design as well as hand rails
14 through the corridors, grab bars and emergency pull
15 cords in bathrooms and the building improvements
16 we're accomplishing through our PACT section 8
17 conversion initiative will incorporate accessible and
18 age friendly designs to the maximum extent feasible.
19 NYCHA's family partnerships department connects
20 residents to critical programs and services to
21 promote stability and enable them to remain
22 independent, well and aging in place. This is
23 accomplished by engaging vulnerable populations
24 including people with disabilities and connecting
25 them to critical health and social services from

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 11

2 community-based organizations and other city agencies
3 to meet their needs. In addition, at our 40 senior
4 only developments and 11 NORCs which means naturally
5 occurring retirement communities, seniors and their
6 caregivers are supported with on site and nearby
7 assistance. Every year residents self-identify as
8 having a disability during the annual review process
9 and this information is reported in NYCHA's resident
10 database. In the event of an emergency such as a
11 natural disaster, this data helps NYCHA staff quickly
12 identify those who need assistance to evacuate which
13 would be coordinated through the New York City Office
14 of Emergency Management and the FDNY. This
15 information also ensures that residents with
16 disabilities are provided with information and
17 resources to help them shelter and place safely. We
18 know how vital... how vital reliable elevator service
19 is for residents including for people with mobility
20 and other disabilities. Service disruptions can
21 affect resident's lives. Elevator service... elevator
22 service at NYCHA needs improvement. To improve
23 service, we have been implementing various changes
24 and enhancements collaborating with the federally
25 appointed monitor and developing elevator action

2 plans in accordance with our recent agreement with
3 HUD. Before I take you through some of these efforts
4 this morning, I'd like to provide some information
5 and context about the elevators at NYCHA. Our more
6 than 1,300 elevators make about 3.2 million trips
7 every day. Even with 400 dedicated and hardworking
8 elevator mechanics, mechanic helpers, supervisors,
9 dispatchers, managers and critical... and clerical
10 staff maintaining these elevators with an annual
11 budget of 74 million dollars the needs of NYCHA's
12 elevators are significant. The chronic lack of
13 federal government investment in NYCHA's aging
14 buildings represent challenges to our elevators. For
15 example, a roof leak can cause mechanical and
16 electrical problems for elevators that may also need
17 to be taken out of service. Fortunately, Mayor De
18 Blasio's 1.3-billion-dollar investment to replace
19 over 900 roofs at the authority will help address the
20 former issue. We measure elevator performance
21 primarily with two metrics; the number of elevator
22 outages at the time... and the time it takes to restore
23 service after an outage. An outage is defined as a
24 single elevator that is out of order and unavailable
25 for resident use this may be due to equipment

2 failure, power outages, water intrusions,
3 preventative maintenance, corrective maintenance, or
4 vandalism. A no service condition occurs when all of
5 the building's elevators are experiencing outages at
6 the same time. For single elevator buildings, all
7 outages are considered no service conditions. From
8 January through August of this year, we have.. there
9 have been approximately 28,400 outages portfolio,
10 portfolio wide, about 500 fewer than the same period
11 last year. These outages were not necessarily no
12 service conditions meaning that residents would still
13 be able to use other elevators in the building. It
14 took just under 10 hours on average to restore
15 elevator outages this year, down from over 12 hours
16 during the same period of time in 2018. This August,
17 there were about 1,200 fewer outages than the prior
18 month and the restoration time was over five hours
19 quicker, the fastest restoration time of the year.
20 When outages are reported either by a resident or
21 development staff our elevator repair teams respond
22 vigorously around the clock. From 2016 to 2018, the
23 median response time for outages in single elevator
24 buildings was 3.5 hours, portfolio wide the response
25 to no service conditions was 4.5 hours. Outages at

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 14

2 senior only buildings as well as those that occur
3 when residents with mobility and other self-reported
4 disabilities live are treated as high priority. We
5 use stair climber equipment to transport residents to
6 and from their apartments during no service
7 conditions. In addition, we will offer voluntary
8 temporary relocation to residents with mobility
9 disabilities in cases of long term no service
10 conditions. As expected, half of our elevator work
11 orders are created during nights and weekends when
12 residents are more likely to be at home. After hours
13 our emergency services department monitors and
14 responds to issues in coordination with our elevator
15 response team. A total of 38 roving elevator response
16 teams work staggered shifts outside regular business
17 hours. In March we added four after hour teams which
18 has been an effective strategy to reduce outages and
19 response times. Within two hours of becoming aware of
20 an unplanned outage or a no service condition NYCHA
21 staff will post notices on each landing's elevator
22 door. Robo calls are also made to all effected
23 residents for no service conditions. Residents
24 receive robo calls when service has been restored as
25 well. For long term outages we will also put notices

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 15

2 under resident's doors, conduct hallway meetings with
3 residents and meet with the resident association. Our
4 goal is to reform monthly printed.. preventative
5 maintenance on every elevator which requires it to be
6 taken out of service for two to four hours as well as
7 annual inspections and tests required by the city's
8 Department of Buildings. For planned outages like
9 these we post notifications to residents 48 hours
10 prior. For planned no service conditions residents
11 also receive robo calls to notify them in advance.
12 Residents again receive robo calls when service has
13 been restored. NYCHA senior staff receive email
14 notifications every three hours on all no service
15 conditions, outages, and outstanding elevator work
16 orders that have been opened for more than two hours.
17 In January NYCHA signed an agreement with HUD that
18 outlines a schedule of milestones and requirements
19 related to elevator service among other high priority
20 areas. We are working with the monitor appointed by
21 the federal government to develop action plans to
22 meet these goals which will improve service for
23 residents. We are meeting bi-weekly with the monitor
24 and his team to develop a comprehensive elevator
25 action plan which is due this fall. As part of the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 16

2 HUD agreement Mayor De Blasio who has provided
3 unprecedented resources to NYCHA is investing 2.2
4 billion in capital funding in the authority on top of
5 the approximately 4.3 billion in capital and
6 operating funds he has already committed, investments
7 that will impact elevator service directly or
8 indirectly. We expect to replace 275 elevators
9 through our capital plan over the next five years. An
10 additional 248 elevators are scheduled for
11 replacement beyond that period, 161 elevators by the
12 year 2028 using city funds committed under the
13 agreement and 87 elevators by 2026 using state and
14 federal funding. To date we have rehabilitated over
15 50 elevators through our PACT initiative which raises
16 capital for much needed repairs and expect to
17 rehabilitate another five to six hundred elevators
18 over the next five years through PACT. Even before
19 NYCHA entered into the agreement with HUD we have
20 been working hard to deliver better elevator services
21 for residents and we have seen some progress. Here
22 are some examples of those efforts. We are in
23 discussions with the New York City Office of Labor
24 Relations and our union partners about implementing
25 an expanded 24/7 coverage for elevator repair staff.

2 This would improve outage response times since
3 current weekend staffing is limited and we are not
4 able to address many outages until Monday. To date we
5 have installed air conditioner units in about 340
6 elevator rooms to reduce outages caused by
7 overheating conditions in the summer months. In 2016
8 we instituted operational safety checks that are
9 conducted before returning an elevator to service.
10 While this adds about an hour to two hours to service
11 restoration it's a critical part of ensuring safety.
12 We are enhancing the analytical and reporting
13 capabilities of Maximo, our asset management
14 database. This includes tracking planned outages and
15 no service conditions allowing elevator mechanics to
16 more accurately record the cause of the outages so we
17 can perform analytics enabling elevator mechanics to
18 confirm and close work orders from their handheld
19 devices and improving outage notification to
20 residents. Plans are underway to repair and replace
21 more than 2,100 hoist motors and generators across
22 the portfolio and NYCHA is currently rolling out an
23 alternative work schedule for janitorial staff at all
24 of our developments providing greater coverage
25 earlier in the day and later in the evening seven

2 days a week. This means more frequent cleaning of
3 elevators door tracks by caretakers at the start of
4 each shift which would help to reduce the frequency
5 of outages. While we are making improvements to
6 elevator service more needs to be done to provide
7 residents the service they deserve. With new
8 leadership, our collaboration with the monitor and
9 the action plans we're developing in accordance with
10 the HUD agreement we have a roadmap for progress.
11 Although we do not have the funding necessary to
12 replace every aging elevator at NYCHA, we are making
13 the most of the money we do have and we are working
14 creatively to address the needs through programs like
15 PACT and we will continue to do all we can to support
16 residents with accessibility needs from apartment
17 modifications and building improvements to
18 connections to vital services. Thank you for your
19 partnership as we continue moving forward and we are
20 happy to answer any questions you may have.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you, we
22 have been joined by Council Member Cabrera, Council
23 Member Holden and Council Member Van Bramer. So, just
24 getting started, how many elevators are out today?

25 JOEY KOCH: At this very moment?

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 19

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Like at this
3 very moment, how many elevators are... [cross-talk]

4 JOEY KOCH: I do not know off the top of
5 my head, but I can certainly get you that... [cross-
6 talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I wouldn't
8 expect you to know... [cross-talk]

9 JOEY KOCH: ...number... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...that number,
11 okay, off the top of your head but somebody can...
12 [cross-talk]

13 JOEY KOCH: But we can get that number
14 absolutely.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And I also
16 want to know out of those elevator outages currently
17 today, how many of them have... how long have they been
18 out and then also how many of those buildings only
19 have one elevator?

20 JOEY KOCH: Uh-huh.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And then also,
22 how many individuals have a disability or confined to
23 a wheelchair who live in those buildings.

24 JOEY KOCH: Okay, we will certainly get
25 you as much of that information as we can.

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 20

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Somebody
3 working on it right now, right... [cross-talk]

4 JOEY KOCH: Yes... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...we should
6 have it in... [cross-talk]

7 JOEY KOCH: ...they are... they are working...
8 [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...a couple of
10 minutes, right?

11 JOEY KOCH: They are working... [cross-
12 talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay... [cross-
14 talk]

15 JOEY KOCH: ...on it right now.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. The
17 Department of Housing and Urban Development's HUD,
18 section 504 regulations define an accessible dwelling
19 unit as a unit that is located on an accessible route
20 and can be approached, entered and used by
21 individuals with physical disabilities. How many 504
22 apartments are in the NYCHA system as a whole?

23 [off mic dialogue]

24 BRIAN HONAN: 4,483.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: 504 according
3 to the technical... [cross-talk]

4 BRIAN HONAN: 504, correct... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...regulation,
6 okay, okay. What is the process for residents to
7 obtain reasonable accommodations related to
8 disability?

9 BRIAN HONAN: So, a resident can go to
10 the management office to request a form for a
11 reasonable accommodation or they can go to our
12 website and get the information there, there they
13 would have to provide medical documentation and the
14 reason for their accommodation. Accommodations are,
15 are, are supplied for a whole host of reasons from
16 needing an accessible apartment to rightsizing to
17 having a hearing in, in person rather than going to
18 the hearing office but we do use these broadly and we
19 do use these... and we, we do... you know we do accept
20 them with very... you know with a minimum amount of
21 documentation.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: In the event
23 of a medical necessity what are the processes
24 involved for a NYCHA resident requesting a transfer
25 from an able-bodied apartment to an accessible one?

2 BRIAN HONAN: So, a NYCHA resident and..
3 but one has to state that they want a transfer, the
4 reason for their transfer, say my apartment.. my, my
5 situation has changed, I need now an accessible
6 apartment that would have to be stated.. [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Is it two
8 different forms?

9 BRIAN HONAN: Sorry, no, no, it's, it's
10 just a.. it's just a form so.. and, and what is
11 actually needed. We will then ask other, other
12 questions do you want that transfer to be in that
13 development, you know many times people want to be
14 close with their friends, their family, their
15 services so they want to be as close to where they
16 currently are as possible or do you want to broaden
17 your universe and you would accept an apartment, you
18 know in the borough or even throughout the portfolio
19 that would, you know open up the possibilities
20 greater. We will then look for the closest 504
21 apartment but if that is not possible we can make a..
22 an apartment a 504 meaning we can take a current
23 shower and make it roll in accessible, we can lower
24 countertops, we can have grab bars, things that
25 somebody would need for an apartment in this case.

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, out of the
3 4,483 504 apartments is there a different number of
4 apartments that may not be designated as 504 based
5 on, you... going in and converting an apartment?

6 BRIAN HONAN: Yes, that number has
7 increased significantly from apartments that were
8 originally built 504 to apartments that were created
9 over the last few years.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, how many
11 apartments... [cross-talk]

12 BRIAN HONAN: In, in the last year...
13 [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...are... [cross-
15 talk]

16 BRIAN HONAN: ...we have... we have converted
17 500 apartments to 504.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Is that part
19 of the 4,483 or separate from the... [cross-talk]

20 BRIAN HONAN: That is correct, that, that
21 is part of the, the original number that I gave, the
22 over 4,000 number that I gave.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so there
24 are no apartments that NYCHA went in and converted
25

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 24

2 that are not necessarily like technically a 504
3 apartment, but you made it accessible for someone?

4 BRIAN HONAN: We did have... we, we did
5 actually have less than one percent of our apartments
6 were originally 504 and you have to remember too when
7 most of our NYCHA apartments were built they were not
8 built in mind for... you know years ago I don't think,
9 you know that... I don't think they thought like we
10 were all going to get older or our situations were
11 going to get changed but they were not built for, you
12 know people with disabilities, they certainly were
13 not built for older people so, you know as years have
14 gone on we've had to make changes, you know with the...
15 with the changing status of our population.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Is there an
17 opportunity... and so follow me with this one, I'm
18 thinking back to when there was a campaign to work
19 with seniors who were in larger apartments and to get
20 them to downsize... [cross-talk]

21 BRIAN HONAN: Right... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...and so there
23 were like surveys conducted and seniors had the
24 opportunity to, to volunteer to downsize, is there
25 any opportunity at all or program or process for

2 someone to maybe who's in an... in the wheelchair and
3 they live on the 14th floor in the building and they
4 want to go to a lower floor and the possibility of
5 the families swapping at all?

6 BRIAN HONAN: So, swapping is not
7 something that... currently that we would be able to do
8 because of the TDAP agreement with legal aid.. [cross-
9 talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Explain that
11 to me.

12 BRIAN HONAN: So, so we have... in order to
13 get a transfer, in order to get an apartment within
14 NYCHA you go into what is known as the tenant
15 selection process, we look at many different factors,
16 you know length of time on the waiting list, priority
17 status, size of family, you know all of that gets
18 factored into, into your selection, often times I
19 think... you know I hear from residents who say I know
20 there's an apartment available on the second floor,
21 it would meet my needs why can't I just go into that
22 apartment. The fact is we have over 200,000 people on
23 our waiting lists so the demand is great and
24 following this process while frustrating for some is
25 the most fair way possible in order to give

2 apartments to, you know a, a city that really has a
3 great need. As far as a, a campaign we don't have one
4 currently but that's something that we would
5 certainly be interested in working with the council
6 and advocates on. We did have a campaign last year on
7 rightsizing where we offered residents... senior
8 residents and other residents the opportunity to move
9 and we even offered them a monetary bonus to do that.
10 I will say that it wasn't very successful because the
11 move was borough wide and most people really want to
12 stay within their development because... for various
13 reasons as I stated earlier, that's where their
14 friends are, that's where the services are, that's
15 where their church is, that's where their doctors
16 are. So, even a move from say the Lower East side of
17 Manhattan to uptown could be, you know life changing
18 for some folks and so it wasn't as attractive as, as
19 we thought but getting people to apartments that
20 suits their needs is certainly something that's, you
21 know really important to us and we certainly... you
22 know we would like to work with folks who are
23 interested in that so.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so
25 speaking of wait lists, NYCHA's personnel have

2 reported that there's a high demand for 504
3 apartments what is the exact number of... and how long
4 is the wait list?

5 BRIAN HONAN: So, so there are over 8,000
6 applicants waiting for an apartment of which 99 are
7 waiting for a, a 504 unit, only 29 applicants
8 requested a lower floor of which 13 want low and
9 accessible units and from August of last year through
10 July 30th of this year the average wait time for a
11 modified lower floor apartment was 400 and, and 46
12 days so... well over a year.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And that,
14 that's for a modified... well a transfer to a modified...
15 and the wait list... [cross-talk]

16 BRIAN HONAN: Correct... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...for someone
18 else.

19 BRIAN HONAN: Yeah, so this is just a
20 transfer, the... these, these are just for transfers
21 not for people coming off the applicant list, but we
22 can get the number for the people coming from the
23 applicant list.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, that
25 would be helpful.

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 28

2 BRIAN HONAN: We... you know we don't offer
3 a priority for applicants; we do have a priority for
4 people who are looking to transfer so...

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Okay,
6 just for clarification how many buildings and how
7 many apartments at NYCHA are wheelchair user
8 accessible?

9 BRIAN HONAN: So, we have a... no, so do...
10 oh, so unit... for units we have 4,443, the number that
11 I mentioned earlier are wheelchair accessible and we
12 have over 2,000 that are partially accessible meaning
13 they have a ramp in, in front of the building which
14 is way higher than we were years ago and last year
15 we, we added over 500 ramps.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. What
17 assistance does NYCHA provide to individuals with
18 mental health issues or intellectual and or
19 developmental disabilities to access those
20 accommodations?

21 BRIAN HONAN: So, NYCHA has, has a family
22 services department that is made up of 70 staff
23 members if there is a resident who has, you know
24 special needs they can contact their management
25 office and a referral can be made for that person to

2 family services and they would intervene depending on
3 the evaluation that is done they could connect them
4 either to city or non profit services that could help
5 them. I will tell you... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Family, family
7 service is not the management office.

8 BRIAN HONAN: Family services... well
9 correct, so originally, they go to the management
10 office who, who will make a reference to family
11 services, family services then will do an assessment
12 and connect them to the services that they need.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And how long
14 is that time frame, so if someone goes to the
15 management office or contacts the management office
16 and then the manager calls the family partner... the
17 family services and then what's the turn around?

18 BRIAN HONAN: It should be immediately
19 but it... they... somebody should come in and they should
20 be immediately notifying someone in family services
21 but I don't believe that is something that we... you
22 know we, we have a metric on but it is something that
23 should be done, you know right away.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And... okay,
25 continue with the, the programs and services and

2 just, you know give us a sense of what that
3 department...

4 BRIAN HONAN: Sure, so... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...does?

6 BRIAN HONAN: So, for, for residents who
7 are facing tenancy actions I can tell you that there
8 is... we have an agreement with legal aid, it's called
9 the Blatch agreement that requires us to refer
10 somebody who has a mental disability or a cognitive
11 issue to family services, there they will do an
12 assessment and they will... from there they will either
13 get them the legal or guardian ad litem that they
14 need in order to move forward in their... you know in
15 their cases. Family services will also help people,
16 you know do things like their annual recertifications
17 or get them to organizations that they... that they
18 need. Family services has more and more become a
19 connection to other organizations that do provide
20 these services that are offered to all New Yorkers
21 whether that be a government agency or a nonprofit.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so
23 because there's no like metric in the sense and it's
24 pretty much self-reporting and you have to contact
25 the management office if you need like help and

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 31
2 support and sometimes however our most vulnerable may
3 not know who to reach out to or may not know that
4 they can go to the management office, is there any
5 way that you are like collecting this information and
6 being able to take the... take a look at what's coming
7 in and what's being reported to see if there's
8 something more you can do to be more like proactive
9 in the services that you provide?

10 BRIAN HONAN: I'm going to ask my
11 colleague, Ukah, Ukah to come up and... to speak on
12 this, she, she runs this department and she would
13 certainly know this better than, than I do.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. We're
15 going to swear you in Miss Ukah Busgith.

16 CC: Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
17 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
18 testimony before these committees and to respond
19 honestly to Council Member questions?

20 UKAH BUSGITH: Yes.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, Miss
22 Busgith the, the, the former question would be, does
23 NYCHA have an approach in place to screen for and
24 asses the functional needs of residents, NYCHA
25 residents, who have disabilities or you know who are

2 applying housing like what do you do to asses it and
3 kind of look at the information that you have coming
4 in?

5 UKAH BUSGITH: So, so we don't have a
6 process to connect to every single resident, the
7 majority of our referrals are, are done by property
8 managers or our resident association would call us
9 and say I have a resident that's living next door to
10 me, I, I suspect a hoarding condition so we get most
11 of our referrals, 90... 98 percent come from property
12 management, residents can also self-referral... self-
13 refer or their neighbors could refer... send a
14 referment... a referral to the property... I mean family
15 partnerships or the association can call us directly,
16 our office... we can go to family days to promote our
17 programs, we have connections to all the senior
18 centers so across the city, there are over 100 senior
19 centers, all those senior centers or the majority of
20 them offer some kind of case management so if a
21 resident are attending those centers there's a way to
22 connect the services, again property management could
23 make referrals to us when property, property
24 management do the sections they may see a condition
25 that they refer residents to us if there are rental

2 arrears but the senior at risk they may send those
3 referrals to us, if they're frailty so there are many
4 ways that... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, what
6 happens when, when you do receive those referrals?

7 UKAH BUSGITH: Yes... [cross-talk]

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: What do you do
9 with that information after?

10 UKAH BUSGITH: So, the referrals are sent
11 to us we can... each borough has an administrator, the
12 administrator assign the case depending on the
13 severity of it to a, a paralegal or a social worker
14 so if it's a hoarding condition it... they will refer
15 it to a social worker who will go to the household
16 and conduct a home visit, assess the situation, if
17 APS, adult protective services are required we, you
18 know make... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: You know to,
20 to put this into context, sorry to cut you off
21 because we're not talking about... [cross-talk]

22 UKAH BUSGITH: Yes, reporting... [cross-
23 talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...hoarding. Is
25 there... let's talk about Miss Montanez family, Miss

2 Nancy Montanez and her daughter Cristy, they were
3 referred to you, right and so what are you doing to,
4 to, to help this mother and her daughter from a
5 family service... from, from your unit?

6 UKAH BUSGITH: Okay, I'm not familiar
7 with that particular case right now...

8 BRIAN HONAN: So, actually in that case
9 that was a... that was a case where property management
10 has been involved so as soon as... what it... the issue
11 in Throggs Neck really is more of an infrastructure
12 issue and a capital issue than an, an elevator issue
13 per se and we can explain, you know more... [cross-
14 talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, I'm... we,
16 we, we have a... [cross-talk]

17 BRIAN HONAN: Right and... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...ton of
19 questions based... [cross-talk]

20 BRIAN HONAN: ...sure... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...on that but
22 I'm... [cross-talk]

23 BRIAN HONAN: I know... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...trying to get
25 to... [cross-talk]

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 35

2 BRIAN HONAN: ...and I... [cross-talk]

3 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...I think of
4 the individual.

5 BRIAN HONAN: Under, under, understood.
6 So, immediately when the issue was identified we
7 contacted all residents with disabilities and we
8 offered them a transfer, three accepted the remaining
9 families did not for personal reasons that only they
10 can speak to, we continue to reach out to them once a
11 week and ask them, you know has your situation
12 changed and if it has, you know we would give them a
13 transfer, if it hasn't we will... you know they will...
14 they, they remain where they are. For those families
15 we offer stair climbers, if you have a wheelchair
16 during the morning hours and the evening hours and...
17 you know in order to get them but you know no matter...
18 no matter how many services we offer them, you know
19 it is not... it is not something that is an ideal
20 situation to say the least... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: But why
22 wouldn't family services be involved with that family
23 who need services?

24

25

2 UKAH BUSGITH: So, are, are they
3 requesting access to services or they just can't
4 leave the building? I'm sorry.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Because of
6 their situation they can't leave the building.

7 UKAH BUSGITH: They can't leave the
8 building.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, why
10 wouldn't... so, this has been going on since May 30th,
11 right?

12 BRIAN HONAN: Right.

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And this is a,
14 a mother... a, a senior... [cross-talk]

15 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...who uses a
17 walker and her daughter who is confined to a
18 wheelchair. Who is involved with that family? So, to
19 me it sounds like social services would be involved
20 and not just the... I don't see the manager going to
21 this family house every single day, checking on them,
22 I would think that that would be flagged to social
23 services and flagged to family services and so I'm
24 confused honestly... [cross-talk]

25 UKAH BUSGITH: So... [cross-talk]

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...as why you
3 don't even know about the family like serious... like
4 I'm dead serious right now, I wasn't expecting that.

5 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh. Uh-huh.

6 JOEY KOCH: So, in the... in the case of
7 the families at Throggs Neck in particular property
8 management has actually been going door to door
9 checking on residents and asking them if they need
10 assistance and family services has been involved with
11 many families at, at Throggs Neck, Ukah specifically
12 has been, she may not have been involved in this
13 particular instance but family partnerships certainly
14 was involved and certain residents that needed to be
15 relocated Ukah's team came and spoke with them and
16 helped with, with certain transfers that were done in
17 some of... with the three families that did... that did
18 move...

19 UKAH BUSGITH: I, I should give an
20 example. I'm sorry, I was away so I'm not familiar
21 with that particular case but in many cases... [cross-
22 talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Since May 30th
24 Ukah.

25 UKAH BUSGITH: Oh, sorry...

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 38

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We keep saying
3 that, okay.

4 UKAH BUSGITH: Well sorry. So, in, in
5 Throggs Neck for example there was a resident who did
6 not want to transfer so we... I called her myself and
7 talked her into eventually getting a transfer, it was
8 difficult, she was frustrated, she was wheelchair
9 bound, she was heavy, we had to get a special chair
10 climber to take her down so we are involved in those
11 cases but again these services are... residents have to
12 accept it, we can go to the door 500 times and if
13 they say I don't want to move we can't convince them
14 to move.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Has someone...
16 has someone relocated?

17 UKAH BUSGITH: Yes.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And, and how...
19 what's the follow up like with that family and how
20 far did they go for the... [cross-talk]

21 UKAH BUSGITH: They, they went into an
22 elevator building from Throggs Neck... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: The same
24 development and includes... [cross-talk]

25

2 UKAH BUSGITH: ...with an elevator... [cross-
3 talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...an elevator
5 building... [cross-talk]

6 UKAH BUSGITH: Two... a building with two
7 elevators, correct.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay and
9 what's the follow... how often do you stay in contact
10 with...

11 UKAH BUSGITH: The Bronx office stays in
12 contact but I'm not... you know she calls me personally
13 whenever she has an issue because she has my phone
14 number but I, I don't know, I don't monitor every
15 single case often.

16 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, now the
17 question is how many people work in, in the family
18 services unit?

19 UKAH BUSGITH: So, there are 52 staff and
20 as I mentioned 70... but we have seven social workers
21 maybe... two... one was on leave just returned but there
22 are 52 staff, 19 are those were assigned... 18 of those
23 are assigned to senior centers out of the 52.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And will...
25 [cross-talk]

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 40

2 UKAH BUSGITH: And we do have some fairly
3 temp, temp workers that... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, just
5 explain the structure of your department.

6 UKAH BUSGITH: Sure, so I'm the Director,
7 there's a deputy, we do have a reentry program under
8 family partnerships and then there are four borough
9 administrators, the administrators each have... there's
10 one for Queens and Staten Island, one for the Bronx,
11 one for Manhattan and one for Brooklyn, those social...
12 those boroughs may have one or two social workers on
13 staff and a supervisor or two that monitors all the
14 cases so if a... there's a referral that's submitted to
15 the, the Bronx for instance the administrator will
16 assign it depending on the severity of it to a social
17 worker or a paraprofessional, they will then call the
18 resident, make an appointment, conduct a home visit,
19 assess the needs of the resident and then refer them
20 to one of our partners that were vetted.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, I'm
22 going to end my questions there, I have follow up
23 questions but now we'll hear from Chair Ayala.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Good afternoon.
25 Brian could you... could you repeat again what the

2 number of... what, what the timeline is for transfers
3 to 504 apartments?

4 BRIAN HONAN: So, the average wait time,
5 of August of last year to July of this year for a
6 resident to transfer below or modified floor for
7 people with disabilities are 460 days.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Do you know how
9 many people applied for a transfer?

10 BRIAN HONAN: There were four, 419
11 residents who are waiting for an apartment on a, a
12 lower floor and 268 residents who are waiting for...
13 you know for... and 268 residents were... received them.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: And how many were
15 called?

16 BRIAN HONAN: So, I can give you a full
17 breakdown here. From August 18th to seven... July of 19
18 actually those... the numbers that I originally gave
19 were just for lower floors, the total number of
20 residents looking for a reasonable accommodation were
21 1,400... over 1,400, of those 176 or care with a
22 specific provider and travel time was over 60
23 minutes, 102 needed a home health care attendant so
24 they needed more room in their apartment for that
25 person, 292 needed an extra bedroom, 58 were people

2 with a disability in a non-elevator building, 498
3 were disabled wanting to go to a first or second
4 floor, that was the number that I mentioned before,
5 168 needed an accessible apartment, 116 were disabled
6 and requested a reasonable accommodation for other
7 needs.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay, because my...
9 I'm, I'm trying to... the average time doesn't really...
10 it, it, it's not... it's not resonating with me because
11 we... and I know that specific... and I can speak
12 specifically for my district where we don't... unless
13 NYCHA is creating more or retrofitting more units to
14 meet the 504 requirements then it's almost impossible
15 to meet that timeline when we don't have enough 504
16 apartments to accommodate the need... [cross-talk]

17 BRIAN HONAN: Well... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...so when you say,
19 you know it, it's approximately a year then it's a
20 little bit, you know it throws me off a little
21 because it's not... it's not what I'm seeing, you know
22 in the district. I've had residents that have been
23 waiting for years for a 504 apartment.

24 BRIAN HONAN: So, we are creating more
25 apartments that... you know for people with, with

2 disabilities, they're not new apartments they are
3 apartments being retrofitted but people... the reasons
4 people with a disability may request another
5 apartment may not be because they want the apartment
6 retrofitted, it may be because they live in a walk up
7 building and they want a building with an elevator,
8 it may be because they want to be on a lower floor,
9 they're on the tenth floor of their building, they
10 are not confident in the elevator, they, they have a
11 lot of anxiety whether if there was an issue they
12 want to make sure they're on the first or second
13 floor so they can get out of that building, you know
14 easier. They... you know as I stated they also may need
15 a health care attendant so they need more room in
16 their apartment or they may now need a hospital bed
17 and that requires a bedroom where as before they did..
18 you know they didn't need that so there are a number
19 of reasons why people, you know request to transfer
20 and it's not only to make... you know for an apartment
21 that's accessible.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Now where a 504
23 apartment does exist so where there's a possibility
24 of retrofitting an apartment to meet the 504
25 requirement is there special consideration given to

2 where that unit should be located? For instance we
3 have a constituent that's on the 17th floor, the son
4 has a disability, he has... you know cerebral palsy,
5 often times the elevators are out, the kid has to
6 still get to therapy, he has to still get to school,
7 has medical appointments, it takes several people to
8 bring this child, you know down 17 flights and then
9 back up again, not sure why, you know an apart... a 504
10 apartment would be situated on the 17th floor which
11 would make, you know it even harder to be able to
12 exit in the event of an emergency... [cross-talk]

13 BRIAN HONAN: Right... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...so I, I wonder if
15 there's been any conversation as of late to
16 rethinking where we're placing the 504 apartments so
17 that at least if you're in a fourth floor and you are
18 a wheelchair user, you know the elevator doesn't work
19 you're still, you know technically now home bound but
20 there... it's, it's easier to get you out of the
21 building in the event of an emergency than having to
22 travel from the 17th floor.

23 BRIAN HONAN: That's right, so in 2014
24 NYCHA created a, a priority for residents with
25 mobility impairments for first or second floor

2 apartments. Last year we worked with the state
3 legislature, sent them to Hamilton and Assembly
4 Member Titus to codify that into state law so now if
5 you are a NYCHA resident with a mobility impairment
6 you have to get a priority for a second.. first or
7 second apartment. So, I can tell you that over 800
8 people in the last year since that has become law
9 have applied and received the priority for that and
10 been approved for the priority of that and a little
11 less than 200 actually received the, the apartments
12 so we are thinking that, it does make sense for
13 people to be on the lower floors and so this way they
14 can access and... you know and exit the building
15 easier.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah. Of those 504
17 apartments... and Miss Koch's testimony she said that
18 apartment, you know modifications are, are made to
19 make the apartments more physically accessible, does
20 that also include bathrooms because my experience has
21 been that, I don't know if this is the older model of
22 504 haven't... and I'd be happy to come for a tour to
23 see a new one... [cross-talk]

24 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...is that while the
3 doors are wider, the bathrooms are so small there's
4 no way that you can exit... you can enter it and if
5 you're, you know in a wheelchair and so it would
6 require somebody picking you up physically and you
7 know situating you in the bathtub in order for you to
8 bathe.

9 BRIAN HONAN: So, some of... some of these
10 goes... so, thank you... thank you very much so, some of
11 these go to the original design of the apartment and
12 sometimes when you look at the way the apartment was
13 originally designed it is not possible to retrofit
14 but the biggest thing that, you know residents want
15 is exactly what you mentioned, they want to make
16 sure... they, they want to have a roll in shower so
17 this way they don't have to depend on somebody in
18 order... you know for basic functions like bathing,
19 they want to make sure that that door is wide enough
20 that they can get in and out of that without
21 depending on somebody else. Independent living I
22 think is, you know from my experience is the most
23 important thing to residents in these situations and
24 so number one we have to look at the way the
25 apartment was originally designed and, and when we

2 can make modifications we can, if we can't make
3 modifications to that apartment we will look for an
4 apartment... if it's possible an apartment within that
5 development that, that becomes hard because, you know
6 usually most of the apartments are designed the same
7 way in a particular development or the development
8 close by because again we want to make sure that
9 people are close to their services.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Understood. So, in
11 the testimony you, you also said that in the past two
12 years NYCHA has invested eight million in
13 accessibility and age friendly improvements including
14 grants at 40 developments, how do you prioritize the
15 buildings that get the grants?

16 BRIAN HONAN: That's a... so, often times
17 it's, you know need, we look at... and, and funding.
18 So, for instance... you know the, the biggest project
19 that we did recently was at Walt Houses, you know a
20 development that I know you're very familiar with on
21 the Lower East side where the Council helped, the
22 Council came up with funding for that project and if
23 you look at the, the ramps there they are really
24 serving the resident's needs... you know resident's
25 needs there but we look at where the funding is

2 available and where the need is the greatest, you
3 know and if we can put those... match those together
4 that's where we can get, you know the most for our...
5 you know... you know for, for the funding that we have.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay, this is a...
7 okay, in addition... okay, so the 40 senior only
8 developments and 11 NORCs, seniors and their
9 caregivers are supported with on site and nearby
10 assistance, could you explain a little of what you're
11 referring to with this because I'm assuming and I
12 don't want to assume that you're talking about the
13 fact that most of the senior buildings are situated
14 in buildings that have, I think the same senior
15 center but that I know of there is no memorandum of
16 agreement that requires that that senior center
17 provide services that are specific to the residents
18 of a particular building nor are they contracted or
19 encouraged to really do outreach at these
20 developments to encourage more participation by the
21 residents and some of my buildings, my senior
22 buildings we had social workers on site, that was a
23 very helpful resource, I understand NYCHA is wanting
24 to pull away from the social services aspect of the
25 work and really focus on being a landlord however

2 when we construct senior housing where we have a
3 vulnerable population, a building full of a
4 vulnerable population that requires a unique set of
5 services it was really heartbreaking to see NYCHA
6 really pull away from that before really ensuring
7 that there was some connectivity between what was
8 happening at the senior center and what was happening
9 at the building because my experience is that most of
10 the seniors in the building have some level of
11 resentment for the senior center because they feel
12 like, you know they're a guest in their own home and
13 they're coming to visit and they don't feel as
14 welcomed because the senior center is not NYCHA,
15 they're renting and they are there to provide a
16 service for the entire community and they are often
17 times, you know understaffed and over worked and they
18 don't have the time to really, you know pay that
19 attention to the NYCHA residents and so when, when
20 you say that, you know you are... that, that those
21 services exist how do you say that with such
22 certainty and ensure us that those services are
23 actually being rendered when, you know on the ground
24 we're not... that's not the experience that we're
25 having?

2 BRIAN HONAN: So, thank you for, for the
3 question and this... the transition and it's been about
4 a... you know probably a ten year transition now from
5 the time when NYCHA ran... owns all of our senior
6 centers and our community centers to... you know to
7 nonprofits and you know who certainly provide, you
8 know... you know very good services but yes, you are
9 right, you know most of them they are limited to that
10 center so if you're not going to the center you're...
11 you know it's not proactive, they're not... you know
12 they're not going... they're not making apartment
13 visits or, or, or things like that. In developments
14 where we did have social workers that was a very
15 helpful tool because residents got support from
16 things like just even something simple as, you know
17 helping to make sure that they're bills were paid,
18 you know on time to helping with annual recert, you
19 know and stuff like that so this is the area where we
20 are matching what is available, you know through our
21 relationships with our partners and the funding that
22 is available, there's certainly some way we can do...
23 we can do better.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I, I think... I mean
25 I think that you have to... you have to... you... that you...

2 that you are obligated to because you have seniors
3 that are living in a... in a building and you know
4 maybe Miss Smith hasn't been out of her apartment in
5 a week, who notices, right... [cross-talk]

6 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: If her next door
8 neighbor is not paying attention who notices? And so
9 that was the, the, the... you know the, the beauty of
10 having these social workers on site that they knew
11 who these seniors were, they knew who the most
12 vulnerable were and so there was an action plan, I
13 used... directed a senior center and before I left that
14 senior center I made sure that I left a breakdown, I
15 knew who was who and who needed more support and what
16 that support looked like and I wanted to make sure
17 that when I left... when I left that the next person
18 understood, you know you need to really pay closer
19 attention to this person, this person and this person
20 for this reason and for that reason and that doesn't
21 happen when you have a senior center located... and
22 it's always a benefit to have a senior center, I'm
23 not... you know knocking the idea of having one but I...
24 what I am objecting to is the fact that there hasn't
25 been any real attempt for NYCHA and... to have a, a

2 meaningful conversation with the Department for the
3 Aging so that those services are really getting to
4 the neediest individuals at those buildings and so
5 when you come here and you testify that these
6 services exist it's a little misleading because it
7 almost gives a... it gives the impression to the
8 Council that this is taken care of when in fact there
9 are a lot of loops and there's a lot of opportunity...
10 missed opportunities to really service the most
11 vulnerable population and so I don't say it as a
12 critique but hopefully, you know as an opportunity,
13 you know to bring a little bit more awareness to this
14 and open, you know some sort of conversation between
15 the two agencies to, to better collaboration because
16 we don't really... you know these, these, these seniors
17 are really vulnerable but I want to ask... [cross-talk]

18 BRIAN HONAN: And can... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

20 BRIAN HONAN: I'm sorry and Council
21 Member knowing that this is a priority for residents,
22 for the Council and for NYCHA with new leadership
23 both at DFTA and, and, and at NYCHA we will make sure
24 that this, this is something that the two agencies

2 has discussed and see how we can do better in this
3 area.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Yeah, so in terms
5 of... I, I want to just go... I'll have one more question
6 and then I'll, I'll let my colleagues ask because I
7 know that they, they're anxious to ask their own set
8 of questions but the, the report that Courtney put
9 out yesterday in New York One highlighted,
10 highlighted also a development in my district,
11 Mitchell which I get complaints about just about
12 maybe two or three times a week that the elevators
13 are out and it's not necessarily a senior building
14 but it's a naturally occurring kind of retirement
15 situation where most of the tenants aged in place and
16 I know that, you know you've referenced several times
17 the, the... what is that mechanism that... the machine
18 that... [cross-talk]

19 JOEY KOCH: The stair climber?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: The stair climber
21 and its never been made available and yet we've had I
22 believe it's over 800 outages at that development,
23 how... what, what... you know so what accommodations are...
24 is NYCHA making to ensure that knowing that this
25 building obviously from... you know from what I

2 understand is not slated to get new elevators until
3 2023 which is a ways away and we, we know, right
4 based on the recent data that the elevators are
5 continuing to break down at Mitchell, what is NYCHA
6 prepared to do to provide reasonable accommodations
7 so that my seniors and, and, and the residents at
8 Mitchell are not subjected to waiting for five hours
9 in the lobby before getting home?

10 BRIAN HONAN: So... and before Miss Koch
11 talks to that I just want to state that in 2017 we
12 identified Mitchell as an... a development that has
13 serious elevator problems and we submitted to the
14 state a plan to replace all of the elevators at, at
15 Mitchell and it was a total of 12 elevators and
16 1,100... 11 million dollar investment and we are still,
17 you know waiting... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Waiting... [cross-
19 talk]

20 BRIAN HONAN: ...for approval, you know
21 for... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...for... [cross-talk]

23 BRIAN HONAN: ...that but this is... this is
24 something that we've known is the problem for a long
25 time, we, we do, you know our best to do patchwork

2 here but the truth is until we get new elevators here
3 Mitchell is going to continue to be a challenge but
4 that doesn't mean that we can't do better.

5 JOEY KOCH: So, we have an elevator team
6 dedicated only to Mitchell five days a week, Monday
7 through Friday eight to 4:30 so that if something
8 does happen during the day they are there immediately
9 to fix it, we also have additional teams on... that we
10 have working after hours to help as well. Currently
11 NYCHA staff in addition to that is at Mitchell doing
12 a soup to nuts review of the elevators, we instituted
13 a new program in June called the Nest Program which
14 is NYCHA elevator special teams and they are
15 dedicated to going to specific developments and doing
16 a soup to nuts review of every elevator in the
17 developments and they are currently at Mitchell, in
18 June they were in Chelsea, last month they were in
19 Gowanus and we saw a reduction in 50 percent of the
20 elevator outages in those two developments so we
21 expect that this will make a difference in Mitchell.
22 It should be noted that an elevator outage does not
23 necessarily mean that there is no service to the
24 building, that is what we call a no service
25 condition, Mitchell has had both outages and no

2 service conditions, it is definitely one of our
3 developments that we are most concerned about in
4 terms of the number of outages and the difficulties
5 that the residents have with those elevators that is
6 why we have the dedicated staff there now.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I think the same
8 was... I think Wagner and Patterson were also on that
9 list and... so, you know I, I really look forward to a
10 more comprehensive plan but I'm really concerned
11 about, you know the conditions at Mitchell and any,
12 you know a plan to, you know to try to make a... you
13 know a reasonable accommodation is, is, is
14 appreciated, you know how... so when the elevator goes
15 out you have a two hour time frame from the time that
16 you're notified that the elevator is out to notify
17 the residents and to post notifications in the
18 building, how do you notify residents who are
19 visually and hearing impaired?

20 BRIAN HONAN: So, the visually impaired
21 we do robo calls as well, for hearing impaired I
22 think, you know we can... we certainly... we, we need to
23 do better and find a different way but it is... it... you
24 know it's flyers and robo calls is, is our main
25 mechanism for reaching out and we also post on our...

2 on our website as well. I will have you know that in
3 an effort to be more transparent NYCHA worked with
4 the state legislature this year on a bill that will
5 take affect on December 1st that will require us to
6 put in one location all elevator, gas, electric and
7 water, heating and hot water outages on our website,
8 it will also require us to put a status and, and the
9 work that's being completed, that will be on our
10 website on December 1st, six months after that you
11 can also get a history so you can look say at
12 Mitchell Houses and you can say the elevators are
13 always out and then when someone says well I think
14 you're exaggerating, you'll say nope, look, you know
15 right from here I can tell you on this date we had a
16 problem, on this date we had a problem, on this date
17 we had a problem too so it is.. it is an important
18 transparency tool, at the end of the day people want
19 better services but I, I just want to tell you more
20 how we do, you know communication.

21 JOEY KOCH: And, and, and two additions
22 to that to enhance notification to residents with the
23 robo calls we are instituting an interactive response
24 so that if there's an elevator outage and the person
25 picks up they can then say press one if you need

2 assistance and then the property manager or CCC,
3 emergency services will be notified that there may be
4 something to... someone that needs assistance so in the
5 case of Mitchell if there's a resident who needs help
6 and we need to make sure that there's a stair climber
7 readily available just that person can say press one,
8 yes, I need assistance so we can make sure that we
9 know who needs that assistance and that will be
10 hopefully up and running by the end of the year.
11 Additionally, with notifications we are trying... we
12 are instituting what are called push notifications on
13 hand held devices by the end of the year as well so
14 that a resident can much like you make from the MTA
15 or any other service provider you'll get a
16 notification on your phone that says you should be
17 advised that the elevator is out of service, you
18 should be advised that heat is out of service, it is
19 a new feature that we are currently working on and
20 hopefully that will also be completed by the end of
21 the year.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay, I mean
23 that's, that's perfect. I think the robo calls are
24 great when they happen, I just wanted to bring to
25 your attention that they don't always happen and you

2 know the... actually this question came about because I
3 had a resident at Mitchell North Houses just a few
4 weeks ago who had a water outage in her building and
5 she is, you know for the most part homebound so she
6 doesn't leave her apartment very often and she had no
7 idea why there was an outage because there was no
8 robo call made and because of her disability she, you
9 know often times does not... is not able to leave her
10 apartment and did not see the posted notifications in
11 the building and so it's important that all... you know
12 residents are notified and when we do our annual
13 recertification is when we come in as new residents
14 there's a very extensive application that needs to be
15 completed that asks about our history, what
16 accommodations need to be made so that information
17 needs to be stored somewhere where somebody is
18 actually paying attention to it, you know I'll give
19 you an example. My, my building is going to be doing
20 elevator renovations next week, my, my landlord has
21 been harassing the rest of us for the last six months
22 like what... you know what, what reasonable
23 accommodations need to be made in your apartment, my
24 father has a disability, you know she's been trying
25 to accommodate us but it's been six months in the

2 coming, it didn't happen overnight and so I just need
3 NYCHA to be a little bit more aware, this, you know
4 is an important issue for the Council, it's an
5 important issue for, you know the members and so I...
6 you know I, I will end it there because I, I know
7 that my colleagues are interested in asking some
8 questions as well.

9 BRIAN HONAN: And Council Member to your
10 point I would agree, I, I think that most residents
11 are incredibly resilient and can deal with whatever
12 they know but knowing is so important to them but if
13 you don't know you assume the worst and so if it's an
14 outage for an hour or two hours you think maybe it's
15 for a day, maybe it's for two days but when it... you
16 know had we notified them and said this is an outage
17 that's going to last a few hours people could deal
18 with that and make accommodations so we always need
19 to do a better job on, on communication, I appreciate
20 that.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Alright, I... just
22 on, on that note also because again at Patterson we
23 had a water outage at one point and I wonder if, if
24 an individual is home alone and doesn't have any
25 family and doesn't have anyone to call and there's no

2 water and they're not getting a robo call and they
3 can't leave their apartment and don't know what's
4 going on somebody needs to know that that individual,
5 you know may... somebody needs to knock on doors like...
6 [cross-talk]

7 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: ...hey do you need
9 anything, do you need water, you know... you know it's
10 been eight hours since you had water, do you... you
11 know do you need something, somebody needs to do
12 that and I think... you know like this is so, so, so
13 big that it makes it difficult to do that and that's
14 a service that you really need to centralize a little
15 bit better so there should be like a point person at
16 each development that, that or maybe Alicka and I
17 will just lay back...

18 BRIAN HONAN: Okay.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And yes, we
20 will. Yes, we will. Its, it's interesting because I
21 wrote that down as my follow up, is there any kind of
22 coordination between family services and resident
23 engagement because everything that you sit here and
24 talk about at every single hearing it boils down to,
25 you know how does it have a direct impact on the

2 residents and, and have they been notified so we've
3 been... every hearing we talk about robo calls, every
4 hearing we're talking about, you know like how to do
5 outreach effectively to the residents and so for me
6 it just sounds like it would be a no brainer that you
7 would have some level of coordination between social
8 workers who went to school to figure out how to, you
9 know like really relate to the residents and then
10 resident engagement that's supposed to engage with
11 the residents so...

12 BRIAN HONAN: And I think it depends on
13 the, the length of the outage, if it's a prolonged
14 outage or not and so if it's a prolonged outage we
15 have, you know taken resident engagement and family
16 partnerships away from what they're doing and, and
17 station them at a development, you know Council
18 Member Gibson's district last year I remember we had
19 a huge issue in Morrisania air rights where the
20 elevators were down and resident engagement
21 practically moved into the development, you know
22 there so it is, you know case by case depending on
23 the length of the outage but you are right, they are
24 better equipped to communicate with residents to do
25 it in a way that's, you know empathetic.. you know

2 empathetic and also too that's their primary function
3 whereas the folks on the ground do want to make sure
4 that they're dealing with the outage and making sure
5 the outage... you know the outage is as short as
6 possible. One of the first things though that
7 property management does though is get the list of
8 people who self, self-identified as having, you know
9 either life sustaining equipment or mobility issues
10 that we contact those people first, you know
11 depending on the type of outage but, you know getting
12 the right people to communicate is, you know always
13 helpful.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
15 thank you Council Woman Ayala. We have been joined by
16 Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo, Council Member Gjonaj,
17 Council Member Gibson, Council Member Torres, Council
18 Member Treyger and Council Member Richards. Have you
19 received the information about how many elevators are
20 out today, it's been about one hour and 25 minutes?

21 BRIAN HONAN: I mean we will have it
22 before the meeting...

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, with that
24 being said the... when you go online, and it says

2 outages what does that number report because
3 currently it says there are eight elevator outages.

4 JOEY KOCH: So, that would be a no
5 service condition so that means that there are eight
6 buildings that currently do not have elevator service
7 at all.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: At all. So,
9 there's only... technically there's only eight
10 buildings that do not have any service meaning like
11 if there's two elevators both elevators are down...
12 [cross-talk]

13 JOEY KOCH: That was... that's exactly what
14 that would mean.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, right now
16 the entire New York Housing Authority there are only
17 eight buildings?

18 JOEY KOCH: That is very possible, yes.
19 That does not mean that there are no outages, I don't
20 want to be mis... I don't want to mislead you in any
21 way, there could be buildings that might have
22 multiple elevators and one of those elevators may be
23 down... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: But right now,
25 there are only... [cross-talk]

2 JOEY KOCH: ...but right now and that
3 sounds very possible.

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay and six
5 of those are in Throggs Neck right now.

6 JOEY KOCH: Six of those are in Throggs
7 Neck?

8 BRIAN HONAN: Three.

9 JOEY KOCH: There are three that I'm
10 definitely aware of in Throggs Neck.

11 BRIAN HONAN: There is six addresses,
12 right, there's... [cross-talk]

13 JOEY KOCH: There might be six.

14 BRIAN HONAN: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, just
16 according to... [cross-talk]

17 BRIAN HONAN: Yes... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...the website
19 just now, it changed over the past hour and a half.
20 Okay, so next we'll hear from Council Member Cabrera.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
22 much to the Chairs for holding this hearing, welcome.
23 Let, let me start at the microlevel, you spoke about
24 that we have made an eight million dollar investment
25 in accessibility and age friendly improvement and

2 then we allocated another 2.75 million dollars for
3 the next four years but what's the funding gap to
4 really meet all of our needs?

5 BRIAN HONAN: I'm going to ask my
6 colleague Oliver to.. you know from capital projects
7 to help answer that question.

8 [off mic dialogue]

9 BRIAN HONAN: So, Council, Council Member
10 could I.. could I ask you to be just a little bit more
11 specific, are we talking about just elevators in
12 general?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Well just
14 related to accessibility, age friendly improvement,
15 and just what you mentioned here and accessibility
16 modification.

17 BRIAN HONAN: So, we can.. we can tell
18 you, you know what it would take to.. in order to get,
19 you know ramps in every building, we can tell you
20 what it would take to bring our elevators up to a
21 state of good repair, those are numbers that we can
22 get you, if you want to boil down, you know even more
23 that's something that we'd be happy to meet with you
24 on but those are the two things that we certainly can
25 tell you right at this moment.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, what, what
3 are those numbers?

4 CC: I'll need to swear you in first.

5 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Sure.

6 CC: Do you affirm to tell the truth, the
7 whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
8 testimony before these Committees and to respond
9 honestly to Council Member questions?

10 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Yes. So, to get you an
11 actual number I would have to go back and, and
12 research that, I don't want to give you false
13 information. What I can tell you is that we... we've,
14 we've reached about a two and a half percent goal of
15 fully accessible apartments and we're working towards
16 I believe five percent so we're about halfway there.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, you would
18 need... so help me understand based on what we have
19 allocated here, you know just give me a ballpark,
20 right, you know we're not holding you to... [cross-
21 talk]

22 OLIVER OSTERWIND: I'm going to have to
23 get back to you on that number.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay. So, what
25 I'm trying to get at is... you... the fact is we're

2 going... we're going be fixing these apartments at the
3 same time you're going to have some apartments that
4 are going to need further repair and so it's going to
5 augment the problem... [cross-talk]

6 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...are, are we at
8 a place where we're gaining ground, we're just
9 keeping up or we're trying to catch up? I'm just
10 trying to get a picture here because I'm a little
11 surprised that we don't have these numbers here
12 because how do... how do... when do we know this is going
13 to come to an end?

14 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Sure... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...if we don't
16 have those numbers, I mean I just a little surprised.

17 [off mic dialogue]

18 BRIAN HONAN: So, I can tell you on... well
19 two... the two areas that, you know we've, we've been
20 focusi9ng on so far, you know elevators we have a 1.5
21 billion dollar need in order to make sure that all of
22 our elevators are in the state of good repair...

23 [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: That's very
25 helpful... [cross-talk]

2 BRIAN HONAN: ...that is, you know just at
3 a, a bear minimum but Miss Koch meets with the
4 monitor every two weeks and sometimes now more often
5 they are going to come up with an agreed upon action
6 plan that will be presented to the public as well
7 once it's signed off on and from there too the, the
8 number may, you know may even be more as well because
9 the plan that they come up with, you know may have
10 even more enhancements, you know as, as well.

11 JOEY KOCH: So, if I could just add, add
12 to that elevator problems are not necessarily just
13 elevator problems... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Uh-huh... [cross-
15 talk]

16 JOEY KOCH: ...infrastructure issues
17 greatly affect the elevator so if a roof is leaking
18 it leaks which is the case of Throggs Neck and I'm
19 sure we'll have questions on that, that effects the
20 elevators. If there's a voltage reduction by Con
21 Edison that effects the elevator so in the action
22 plan, we are identifying not only the elevator needs
23 but some of the ancillary problems that cause
24 elevator problems.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: What I'm trying
3 to get at is this, this is the frustrating part for
4 me that are we battling a losing battle because
5 you're not getting the funding that you need just a
6 lot of patch up that takes place or let's say we, we
7 fix one and then we end up having other problems or
8 we're... it gets actually worse in some situations as
9 you know because we didn't have the funding, I... if I
10 heard the numbers right we, we need what, 40 billion
11 dollars in all of NYCHA and if we keep moving at the
12 speed that we're moving this, this number might get
13 even bigger... will get bigger and so are we lose... are
14 we fighting a losing battle because you're not
15 getting the necessary funding especially from the
16 federal government that you need?

17 JOEY KOCH: So, I think and I've been at
18 NYCHA for almost a year, my one year anniversary is
19 coming up and I think certainly when I started what
20 I've been trying to do is be more strategic, figure
21 out what the problems actually are. Elevators is a
22 perfect example that in the past they did not... when
23 they went to fix the elevator they weren't
24 necessarily on their handheld and in the work order
25 marking what it was that was causing the elevator

2 problem, we have changed that as of June we can now..

3 [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: That's good..

5 [cross-talk]

6 JOEY KOCH: ..do that so we're able to
7 pinpoint not only what the problem is but where we
8 can spend our scarce resources so we need to be more
9 strategic just like when we're looking at elevator
10 replacement it's not just the elevator that might
11 need to be replaced, it might be the roof, it might
12 be any number of things so I think we are very
13 resource challenged, I don't think anybody would say
14 that we're not... we have that problem but we are
15 looking to be more strategic about how we spend the,
16 the limited funding that we have.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: But you could be
18 as strategic as you could ever be, you could be a ten
19 and if you don't have the resources you're not going
20 to get it done, it's impossible you can ask any
21 landlord in the city that if you don't have the
22 resources its not going to happen, I know that's a
23 depressing thought but it should be a motivating
24 thought and a catalyst to say we need more funding
25 because the reality is at the speed that we're going

2 the way I see it we're not going to see it in our
3 lifetime, the residents are not going to see it in
4 their lifetime and, and we... at least in the city we
5 have made an effort that's not guaranteeing the
6 future, the future administration, the future council
7 and the federal government, you know it's... we're,
8 we're just not getting the help they put a monitor
9 but give me some money, give me some funding to get
10 the job done and that's the frustrating part for me
11 because I just don't see how you're going to get it
12 done honestly as, as, as strategic and I'm glad that
13 you are and we got to do the most we can with the
14 money... let me ask you another question here with the
15 Mitchell Houses. How much are we spending on that
16 dedicated team every year to be there full time?

17 JOEY KOCH: I don't know off the top of,
18 of my head but it's a... it's a dedicated team that's
19 there every day.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: You would say
21 about half a million dollars?

22 JOEY KOCH: Possibly... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Easy, a million
24 dollars?

2 JOEY KOCH: ...I, I, I would have to get
3 back to you on that, I don't want to guess.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Yeah, you know...
5 you know the crazy thing for me is that it's going to
6 take ten million dollars, it's going to take five
7 years, we're going to spend five million dollars to
8 have a dedicated team that we could have used that
9 funding to get it done, that's the kind of thing... you
10 see what I'm saying, that one... not solving one
11 problem leads to another problem. Thank you so much
12 for hearing my level of frustration and hopefully we
13 can make more noise at the federal level, thank you
14 so much lady chairs...

15 BRIAN HONAN: Thank you very much...

16 JOEY KOCH: Thank you and just to get...
17 give you some numbers from... at... as of 9:45 this
18 morning there were eight no service conditions that
19 you referenced, there were 15 elevator outages and
20 there were 18 work orders that exceeded two hours and
21 that was as of 9:45.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And eight of,
23 of... so, six of the eight were in Throggs Neck, right?

24 JOEY KOCH: I can tell you... no, only
25 three are in Throggs Neck.

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 74

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, with
3 that Council Member Gjonaj.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you Chair.
5 Maybe you should clarify that again because our
6 records are showing that six buildings in Throggs
7 Neck are showing that they're down.

8 JOEY KOCH: So, this, this was as of 9:45
9 so something may have changed since then, it looks
10 like there are currently... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: But you should
12 be... [cross-talk]

13 JOEY KOCH: ...ten single elevator outages
14 as of the information that my colleague just sent...
15 gave to me but I will check out what's going on with
16 Throggs Neck right now.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: But you should be
18 seeing what we see, if you go on the website you
19 should be seeing... unless you have something else that
20 we don't.

21 JOEY KOCH: Yeah, I, I'm looking at what
22 I referred to in my testimony, the reports that I get
23 every three hours that's what I was just referring
24 to.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And if we... if we
3 look it up now at this very moment, real time it
4 shows Throggs Neck 2751 Sampson Avenue, 2755 Sampson
5 Avenue, 2761 Sampson Avenue, 2932 Avenue V... I'm
6 sorry, 2770 Dewey Avenue which is Throggs Neck, 2815
7 Dewey Avenue which is Throggs Neck, 2815 Schley
8 Avenue which is Throggs Neck, that's six so either I
9 have better information than you do or...

10 JOEY KOCH: Right, I, I know... right,
11 you're... so three of them are... three of those are the
12 long term outages that we're... that we're experiencing
13 the other ones were not in my report that doesn't
14 mean that that's not accurate, I get one every three
15 hours, this might be stale, I'm not suggesting that
16 that might not... that isn't accurate, I get a report
17 every three hours, this is the one that was from
18 however long ago it was, ten o'clock a little bit
19 before ten o'clock so you... that may be accurate, I'm
20 not suggesting it's not, this is the report that I
21 get every three hours, that might be a little bit
22 older than what you're looking at right now.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: It's just
24 astonishing that we're at a hearing where we're
25 supposed to be prepared to do our best to answer

2 questions and if I have better information than you
3 do we have a real problem and that information is
4 readily available and if there's a conflict I would
5 imagine that you help clarify why there's a
6 discrepancy between what's on the web now and what
7 you have.

8 JOEY KOCH: I, I'm not suggesting that
9 it's not a conflict, I think that... the website is up
10 to date, I just went to look into my email to see
11 what the report said prior to me starting my
12 testimony, I haven't gone on the website, I do not
13 know what's there, I'm not suggesting that there's a
14 conflict, the website is, is probably accurate I just
15 wanted to give you information that I was asked for
16 or what I had when I had it.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Is there a
18 protocol for us to track those that are disabled
19 throughout NYCHA?

20 BRIAN HONAN: We can give you the
21 numbers, we can give you the personal information of
22 people who are, you know self-identified as being
23 disabled, yes, we can give you the number.

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 77

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: What do we do
3 when there's long term outages, what is the protocol
4 that you follow?

5 JOEY KOCH: So, during a long term outage
6 we meet with the residents, we will temporarily
7 relocate residents who request it, we have institute
8 stair climbers at scheduled times throughout the day,
9 in the morning and in the evenings, that's on
10 weekends as well and we hold hallway meetings, we
11 hold meetings with the TA and we slip information
12 under the door.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: When was the last
14 meeting that was held at Throggs Neck housing?

15 JOEY KOCH: I believe they had one last
16 week.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And the one prior
18 to that?

19 JOEY KOCH: I believe they had one... they
20 have been having them every, every week, they've been
21 meeting with the residents.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Who would that
23 be?

24

25

2 JOEY KOCH: So, property management holds
3 meeting with the residents of the buildings effected
4 every week.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Would NYCHA
6 family services play a role in this?

7 JOEY KOCH: I do not know that, they,
8 they may but they may not.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Would support
10 services play a role or follow up or engage with the
11 feedback that is being provided to the resident
12 manager?

13 BRIAN HONAN: I think it depends on what
14 the topic of the meeting is and if they are needed,
15 if it is just an update on the conditions at the
16 development and then they would not be needed and the
17 TA president too is, you know Miss Johnson at that
18 development has been very involved as well and has
19 participated in many of these meetings as well.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Right but what
21 are we doing to follow up on the issues? So, when I
22 hear from family services that the name Miss Montanez
23 is not familiar to her, I have to ask myself well is
24 Miss Milagros Franco a familiar name, who can answer
25 this question here and now?

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 79

2 BRIAN HONAN: So... again so, one, one
3 second...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Yeah... I think it
5 was Miss Busgith that testified that that... you're
6 from family services, correct, can we bring her up to
7 the table and maybe she can help shed some light on...

8 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh, right. So, so
9 Council Member I, I... we would be happy to meet with
10 you on all of the individual residents, you know at
11 Throggs Neck and their conditions especially if they
12 want to come forward but for individual residents and
13 their personal information I don't think, you know
14 this is the forum to do that. The... Miss, Miss
15 Martinez... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Mr. Honan...
17 [cross-talk]

18 BRIAN HONAN: ...identify... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...this is the
20 forum because all of these three names have been
21 covered by news 12, New York One, PX 11, have been
22 covered by local print media, have been on every T.V.
23 screen, there's an elevator that's been down for
24 three months...

25 BRIAN HONAN: Right...

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...and they're
3 called NYCHA prisoners and if that hasn't hit your
4 radar, I don't know what else needs to be done.

5 BRIAN HONAN: Certainly, it has hit our
6 radar and Council Member I, I called you on the day,
7 you know when this happened.. [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: You did.. [cross-
9 talk]

10 BRIAN HONAN: ...you know and I informed
11 you of, of the situation and told you it would be a
12 long term outage and how we are... we are working on...
13 you know with this, this is something that we do take
14 very serious I just don't know and I... and forgive me,
15 you know you tell me that, you know these things were
16 covered I just don't know this individual so I don't
17 want to.. [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Mr. Honan, I don't
19 think... [cross-talk]

20 BRIAN HONAN: ...discuss her... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...it would be you
22 that should be familiar with these names, I would
23 imagine it would have to be support services or
24 family services...

2 BRIAN HONAN: Right but I just don't want
3 to discuss her personal information in a very public
4 forum... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: We can google it...
6 [cross-talk]

7 BRIAN HONAN: ...you know without her
8 permission.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: You can google
10 it.

11 BRIAN HONAN: Right.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Her name and her
13 testimony is out there where this woman has a 42 year
14 old blind daughter with cerebral palsy and is blind..

15 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And has called
17 this a prison.

18 BRIAN HONAN: That is correct, yeah that,
19 that was the story that was... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: But that is not
21 familiar to anyone on the panel.

22 JOEY KOCH: So, the name is familiar to
23 us... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Oh... [cross-talk]

2 JOEY KOCH: ...we are... we are aware of what
3 her... what her situation is. The... what has happened at
4 Throggs Neck is, is a truly horrible, terrible
5 situation, the... let's, let me back up and explain how
6 we got here... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Uh-huh... [cross-
8 talk]

9 JOEY KOCH: ...just so that we're... everyone
10 is on the same page. An elevator inspector was doing
11 a routine inspection on the elevator in May, he was
12 riding on top of the elevator and noticed that there
13 seemed to be structural damage to the elevator and we
14 immediately took the elevator out of service for the
15 safety of the residents, we then immediately had our
16 engineering department come up to Throggs Neck look
17 at that building but also look at all buildings in
18 Throggs Neck to see if there was any that were
19 similarly situated, in fact there were, there were
20 two other buildings that had the same problem. Again,
21 we had to take the elevators out of service for the
22 safety of the residents. When that happened we
23 immediately reached out to residents, offered them
24 relocation if they needed it, three of which did opt
25 to relocate and we had family partnerships was there

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 83

2 helping us throughout that process, we have the stair
3 climbers scheduled and the property managers and
4 other members of the staff at Throggs Neck have been
5 going door to door meeting with residents and trying
6 to assess if they can help with any of their needs.

7 It is a... it is a terrible situation, there is no
8 question about it, we are working as diligently as we
9 can to get the elevators back working and so
10 everybody could be safe and, and have the elevators
11 work again.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: You know it's
13 very difficult not to come across angry because when
14 you say it's a terrible situation from our
15 perspective where we have the luxuries of using
16 elevators to get to and from work and we have options
17 and we have a hearing specifically on elevators I
18 would imagine that someone would be looking at every
19 issue, preparing this panel to answer the questions
20 of the Council Members and it's obvious that that's
21 not happening because family services has not
22 contacted these residents, has not identified their
23 needs especially those that are handicapped otherwise
24 there would never have been a need for them to be
25 interviewed by any media, you would have made

2 accommodations, you would have been on top of them,
3 you would have been in constant communication with
4 them, you would have relocated them.

5 BRIAN HONAN: So Council Member... so
6 actually the families were reached out to and were
7 offered a different apartment and for whatever reason
8 only three accepted their apartments within Throggs
9 Neck so our first choice was to make sure that
10 families, you know were as close to as possible at
11 home and luckily we were able to make sure that the
12 three families who accepted apartments accepted them
13 in Throggs Neck. Not every... I mean people have to
14 make decisions that are best for them, not every
15 family, you know decided that they wanted a, a
16 transfer for whatever reason and we're not, you know
17 here to, you know judge that reason but every family
18 was reached out to, we are making accommodations for
19 those families with stair climbers so they, they can
20 get out in the morning and the... in the evening hours
21 as well with the stair climbers but as, you know Koch
22 said this is a safety issue where there is no cutting
23 corners, we have an elevator here that is
24 structurally not sound in order to run and we are,
25 you know... you know getting it into condition where it

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 85

2 needs to be as fast as possible, we are working with
3 the residents but... first, I don't know a word in the
4 English language that can even overstate how
5 frustrating it must be to the residents who live
6 there whether you are... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: That's my point.

8 BRIAN HONAN: Yeah...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: That's my exact
10 point that we talk about this as a terrible situation
11 and we're trying our hardest to get this right and
12 restore services.

13 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: But they're
15 living with it.

16 BRIAN HONAN: That is correct...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Every day and the
18 question is... I come from property management, when I
19 had an issue, I was on that phone... [cross-talk]

20 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...following up but
22 when a name that was on a major network is not
23 familiar to you and you're not prepared that that's
24 going to come up and you know you have an overzealous
25 Council Member that is pretty vocal I say shame on

2 you because there are three... and please Mr. Honan
3 the... you're not expected to know everything, I don't
4 expect you to know everything but we have certain
5 safety nets in place, ferry services is one of them,
6 is that correct? They exist to ensure... [cross-talk]

7 BRIAN HONAN: Correct but Council Member
8 I think you should say shame on me because Ukah was
9 on vacation and I did call her up here and I
10 shouldn't have done that so, shame on me for doing
11 that, you know anyone that knows you good knows that
12 she is the one of the most caring individuals I've
13 ever met, she has over 400,000 people, you know who
14 her very small department does look, look after, the
15 fact that yes, after coming back from vacation over a
16 few hours maybe this name didn't, you know ring a
17 bell at that moment, it does not mean that she has
18 not, you know spent her time working with these
19 families. She and her team do incredible work and I
20 just, you know... so shame on me for, for asking her to
21 come up... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Can anyone give
23 me an update on the Milagros Franco, an amputee, both
24 legs are amputated?

2 BRIAN HONAN: Once again Council Member
3 we'd be happy to talk... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Can anyone give
5 me an update on Lisa Jenkins?

6 BRIAN HONAN: On individual situations
7 we'd be happy to set up a meeting with you and talk
8 about each one of these, I just don't think that in a
9 public forum like this to give out people's private
10 information is... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: I just googled
12 them... [cross-talk]

13 BRIAN HONAN: Okay, yeah, yeah... [cross-
14 talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: It's not that day
16 to hide contact with them and it's in privacy...

17 BRIAN HONAN: Right...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: They've gone on
19 major networks because they couldn't get the
20 services, they were interviewed, they took the time
21 to be interviewed and answer the questions and
22 explain their frustrations and the living conditions
23 that they're going through on a daily basis... [cross-
24 talk]

2 BRIAN HONAN: I understand that... [cross-
3 talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...so this is not a
5 secret.

6 BRIAN HONAN: I understand that Council
7 Member but that's a decision they made at that time,
8 I don't know if their circumstances have changed, I
9 don't know... I, I really would like to talk... [cross-
10 talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: So, let me get
12 to... [cross-talk]

13 BRIAN HONAN: ...to you about this, not on
14 this... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...I'm... well let me
16 just get this straight that we offer options to
17 relocate and if they opt not to for whatever reason...
18 [cross-talk]

19 BRIAN HONAN: Right... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...and they may
21 have their own reasons... [cross-talk]

22 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...we just forget
24 about them, is that the... is that what I'm
25 understanding?

2 BRIAN HONAN: No, that is not... family
3 services does check in with those families to make...
4 to ask them because, you know time may go by and
5 they, they may say you know what in May I decided I
6 didn't want to look... relocate but now it is really
7 getting to be very hard so I've changed my mind, I
8 would like to relocate and now can you please help me
9 with that.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Thank you Mr.
11 Honan... [cross-talk]

12 JOEY KOCH: Yes... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...that's my point
14 so if you just explained that family services stay in
15 contact with them.

16 BRIAN HONAN: That's correct.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: This is a hearing
18 specifically on elevators, correct, one of the issues
19 that we're supposed to get to... [cross-talk]

20 BRIAN HONAN: It's on accommodations but
21 elevators are a huge issue in that regard.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And the disabled
23 in NYCHA, correct?

24 BRIAN HONAN: Correct.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Wouldn't this
3 have been something that you'd be prepared for
4 whether it be Miss Ukah who's on vacation and just
5 came back and I get it but someone else is... I'm sure
6 it doesn't rely on her solely to answer these
7 questions of a Council hearing...

8 BRIAN HONAN: Once again, when... [cross-
9 talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: The follow up,
11 that's, that's... [cross-talk]

12 BRIAN HONAN: The follow up and we will...
13 we will follow up with you on these individuals...
14 [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Not with me...
16 [cross-talk]

17 BRIAN HONAN: ...cases... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: ...I want to know
19 if you followed up with them.

20 BRIAN HONAN: Right and they are
21 following up with them.

22 JOEY KOCH: So... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: They're the ones
24 that are suffering not me... [cross-talk]

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Let me... you
3 know I'm... let me say this real quick, so when I, I
4 used to be a case manager for mentally ill homeless,
5 right and I have etched in my brain, etched in my
6 memory cases that I had from 20 years ago when I
7 worked at Guarded Riverside when someone says to me
8 what was the, the, the hardest impact on your job or
9 your career where you was working in Central Park I
10 can tell you it was when I met Sammy Hinton when he
11 was on a park bench... [cross-talk]

12 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...and I was
14 able to take him to the hospital so you have cases
15 that really hit home, right and so Miss Busgith it's
16 nothing against you, I think you're an amazing
17 person, I mean you've been doing this for many years
18 but I was kind of shocked when I asked the question
19 about this woman and her daughter and you said who is
20 that because they have been without an elevator since
21 May 30th, even if I went on... when I go on vacation I,
22 I don't even know what a vacation is because my work
23 goes with me, right, as much as I want to disconnect
24 if I don't take my cell phone I'm still going to
25 remember the cases that I have... like the people that

2 I have encountered, right, human beings that are
3 going through some serious issues, right and so it
4 was... it's, it's not to beat up on you or anything but
5 I thought it was a bit appalling that I would ask the
6 director of family services, family partnerships
7 about a story or family that has... that, that, that
8 hit so many New Yorkers between last night and this
9 morning and so it... so, you know you just got off a
10 plane, you know where you were, I think the first
11 thing that somebody should have done was briefed you
12 on what happened, right and that was just the story
13 itself on the news but the fact that this family has
14 been without an elevator since May 30th that has
15 nothing to do with the media, right, that has all to
16 do with how you are working and engaging with the
17 residents in New York City housing some of the most
18 vulnerable people in society, right and so can you
19 speak to that because right... like this is feel... like,
20 like I'm kind of feeling awkward anyway asking this
21 question to you because I'm shocked..

22 UKAH BUSGITH: Right, so I may not be
23 familiar with that case but like you said there are
24 many cases that I'm totally familiar with when...

25 [cross-talk]

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS 93

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: But this... but,
3 but this is... this is... this... [cross-talk]

4 UKAH BUSGITH: ...residents... when, when the
5 elevators of Throggs Neck went out immediately there
6 was a conference call, our staff on the ground
7 knocked on every single door of disabled... residents
8 with disabilities and asked them if they want to
9 move, there are cases where people say no I don't
10 want to move so our emergency management staff
11 called, you could... you guys need to have a
12 conversation, it's... this... residents are in danger if
13 they are not moved. Again, if we... if we... I'm, I'm not
14 saying I knocked on every door, I have a team on the
15 ground, there's a person, elderly safer homes staff
16 person is a temporary person stationed at senior
17 buildings at Throggs Neck, she went to every single
18 apartment of residents with a disability, if she
19 didn't reach them the first time around she went back
20 a second time around and continuously knocked and
21 talked to them, do you want to move, its not safe for
22 you to remain, if the stair climbers are not
23 accessible to you or you're not... if, if you have an
24 appointment, you need to go to the doctor, the stair

25

2 climbers are scheduled for you to do that... [cross-
3 talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, I, I, I
5 get the... [cross-talk]

6 UKAH BUSGITH: ...so... [cross-talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...process, the
8 procedure, right...

9 UKAH BUSGITH: Right... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...when I worked
11 at Goddard Riverside, we had a board that had
12 everyone's name on it and we prioritized, you know...
13 [cross-talk]

14 UKAH BUSGITH: Right... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...some of the
16 most significant cases. When I worked at ACS, we
17 prioritized some of our most significant cases, they
18 were on the board. When I worked on the inpatient
19 psych unit some of our most significant cases, some
20 of my most hardest people to, to house I had them on
21 a list on the board so they was in my face every
22 single day, all day so if you're in the office and
23 you have your... you know what, what your priorities
24 are, you know you would know who the people are or
25 even if not by name like the situation because to me

2 I see this as priority, right? If, if families have
3 to go to the news and to the media to get help...

4 [cross-talk]

5 UKAH BUSGITH: Right... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...that means
7 that they were not able to get the help that they
8 needed directly to NYCHA, when families come to us as
9 Council Members that's because they're at their wits
10 end, right and so for me if you are prioritizing the
11 family that are in a vulnerable state then you... like
12 everyone would know what's happening and you would
13 be... like you would be, you know trying to figure out
14 what to do, how to do it and so... [cross-talk]

15 UKAH BUSGITH: Right, so if the... if this
16 particular resident chose that they want to remain...
17 there was another case where a resident was
18 wheelchair bound, she's like I am not moving but we
19 spoke to her and she eventually changed her mind
20 because she knew, I have several doctors
21 appointments, two times, three times a week I will
22 have to be taken downstairs and... she paid people in
23 the building to take her up, she realized it was a
24 hardship, this family didn't want... you know if
25 they're only... they have services, they're connected

2 to services if we can help them by relocating them
3 and that's probably the best thing to do for them
4 and... but they don't want to move we can't force them
5 and, and that's the issue with this... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so I
7 just want... I, I just want to say that when, when
8 residents... out of the entire... [cross-talk]

9 UKAH BUSGITH: So, we can go back...
10 [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...New York...
12 [cross-talk]

13 UKAH BUSGITH: ...to her again, have
14 another conversation, you know you're on the news,
15 it's a hardship for you, you feel trapped, how can we
16 help you, do you... would you like to relocate and find
17 her an apartment so her and her mother can be safe.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So, I would
19 just hope that that would be something that you do on
20 a daily basis that's routine because out of the
21 entire New York City Housing Authority we have
22 consistently had issues and concerns, right and I
23 would think that there are departments, divisions
24 within housing that actually are the people that have
25 a direct connection with the residents and that would

2 make the residents feel like, you know someone cares
3 and I would hope that the social workers and the case
4 managers that are in your division are those
5 individuals if they're the only... [cross-talk]

6 UKAH BUSGITH: Just so you know the
7 social worker at Throggs Neck was there, residents
8 come to her every single day, they.. over 200 to meet
9 with her to talk to.. accept the services. I mean
10 again, family partnership we're a small department we
11 can't touch every single apartment but if a case
12 comes to our attention we reach out however.. if we
13 have to bring six partners to the table we deal with
14 that resident and help them as fast as possible.
15 Again we're work.. and I think to, to address Council
16 Member Ayala's question about DFTA and working with
17 DFTA we are.. work closer towards an MOU because the
18 Council Members are able to lobby for capital funding
19 so that programs if they are running a senior center
20 they do more outreach surveys and so those are things
21 that are on the table that we are pushing forward
22 with. In addition to that we, we do have some grants
23 where we station paraprofessionals in those buildings
24 that we vacates as social workers so that if
25 residents need a, a letter read or bills paid,

2 entitlement or apply for SNAP we have services there
3 and in addition... and we do lobby to have partners
4 occupy our vacant offices so again there is someone
5 in the senior only buildings able to connect to the
6 resident and, and connect them to services that are
7 required. So, all those are efforts on the ways to
8 connect to residents.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: And miss Busgith
10 I, I, I don't want to lose focus and the Chairwoman
11 summed it up perfectly, not only are NYCHA residents
12 the most vulnerable but these are the most vulnerable
13 of the most vulnerable and all we're asking is that
14 there be protocol of constant communication and
15 dialogue, they need it much more than the other
16 residents, let them know when services should be
17 restored, following up, is everything okay, have you
18 been able to get in and out of your apartment in a
19 timely fashion to meet appointments or run errands,
20 is there anything else that we can do, I don't think
21 that's out of the realm of what's expected from us to
22 do when you have both legs amputated or when you have
23 a child with cerebral palsy and is blind or someone
24 that has multiple respiratory illnesses that can't
25 make it up and down those stairs and I dare imagine

2 what would have happened had this been a private
3 building, oh, the administration would have been out
4 there screaming and yelling this is appalling, we
5 would have had media coverages, we would have had
6 every elected official from city, state and federal
7 out there, we would have had protests how this is
8 unjust but yet when it becomes to the largest city
9 and the responsibilities of this government no one is
10 there to critique you and demand that you do better,
11 not strive to do better, demand it, we're supposed to
12 set the standard that the private sector is supposed
13 to follow and if that message doesn't resonate with
14 you we have real problems and the sooner we get this...
15 NYCHA out of the hands of New York City the better
16 off we are at least then we can have someone that we
17 can hold accountable because we go through these
18 hearings, it's the same routine, we expect everyone
19 to be ready and prepared to answer the questions of
20 the Council Members, some of them will be ready and
21 prepared.

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you
23 Council Member Gjonaj. Council Member Gibson.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you Chair...

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

1 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Followed by
2
3 Holden.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, thank
5 you, good afternoon. Thank you for being here and I,
6 I certainly appreciate this important hearing that
7 Chair Ampry-Samuel and Chair Ayala have put together,
8 I think I've been one of the louder voices here in
9 the Council always talking about elevators. There is
10 an expectation when residents get into an elevator
11 that they get to their location. I had a couple of
12 questions and, and certainly I share the sentiments
13 of Council Member Gjonaj and I think, you know we've
14 had a long partnership with NYCHA, many of us have
15 been here for six years or more and we just continue
16 to grow frustrated at the communication and how we
17 can continue to do better and I agree if this was any
18 other landlord and not NYCHA we would be having a
19 different conversation, there should be no difference
20 in the level of treatment and expectation of services
21 that residents of NYCHA are given whether you live in
22 NYCHA or a public building it doesn't matter whether
23 you have a disability or not and so I speak on behalf
24 of all of my residents in the Bronx and you know my
25 district from Forest to McKinley to Webster to Butler

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 to Morris to High Bridge to Claremont to Claremont

3 Parkway and Sedgwick houses, I know them by heart, I

4 speak to residents every day and it's been generally

5 frustrating so I want to ask a couple of questions

6 focused on the capital aspect of the elevators. The

7 federal dollars and the city dollars that NYCHA gets

8 dedicated to elevators only, is there a dollar figure

9 that you can provide, do we have a combination of

10 federal dollars and city dollars dedicated to

11 elevator replacement?

12 BRIAN HONAN: Once again I'm going to ask

13 Oliver from Capital to answer that question.

14 OLIVER OSTERWIND: So, the federal

15 dollars... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Uh-huh... [cross-

17 talk]

18 OLIVER OSTERWIND: ...that we received that

19 were planned for the current budget plan, just a

20 second... in our current five year plan the federal

21 dollars are 85 million...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: 85 million

23 dollars?

24 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Correct.

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right? And do we
3 have city dollars dedicated in the five-year plan as
4 well?

5 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Well city dollars are
6 allocated annually... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Right... [cross-
8 talk]

9 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Right so it's
10 difficult to forecast for five years.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay, well the
12 reason why I asked the question is because federal
13 dollars are different, they are timed different,
14 NYCHA spends and draws down on federal dollars in a
15 timely fashion because the federal government
16 requires it, city dollars are different. Every year
17 we re-appropriate city dollars year after year and
18 NYCHA does not draw down on city dollars as fast as
19 we do federal dollars so my concern is when you look
20 at the total 32 billion dollar price tag the
21 percentage that's dedicated to elevator replacement
22 is less than 20 percent, it's probably anywhere from
23 10 to 13 percent of the entire capital plan that's
24 the amount that's only dedicated to elevators. The
25 reason why I say that is because elevators are a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 priority but if you look at the total capital project
3 and the capital plan for NYCHA it is not a priority
4 and that is my concern, 85 million dollars of federal
5 dollars is a drop in the bucket when you look at the
6 level of detail and the amount of investment that we
7 need for elevator replacements. So, my concern is
8 there needs to be more dollars driven and invested in
9 for elevators and what I'd like to understand is how
10 you determine in the five year capital plan as an
11 example of Mitchell Houses being one that's targeted
12 if you're saying that Mitchell has the highest number
13 of outages today then why is Mitchell on the list for
14 2023, why can't a development like that that is in
15 such grave need be prioritized so that residents of
16 Mitchell don't have to wait? So, what I'd like to
17 understand is in the five year capital plan how do we
18 correlate the developments with the highest number of
19 outages versus the population, the number of
20 residents with disabilities and seniors all of these
21 factors should be considered when you're prioritizing
22 a five year capital plan so that's my general concern
23 and then also I want to raise and bring up the
24 physical needs assessment that was conducted a few
25 years ago outlined that according to this surveyor

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 the physical needs assessment, the majority of
3 capital dollars should be focused on interior as in
4 elevators and so again I raise that because if you
5 look at the physical needs assessment compared to the
6 overall capital plan elevators are less than 20
7 percent... [cross-talk]

8 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: ...when the PNA
10 specifically said that residents and developments
11 deserve more internal priorities. So, again and I've
12 said this to capital many times, we're not saying
13 that, you know this is a conversation where you're
14 taking away roof replacements and boiler replacements
15 but why are elevator replacements not at the top of
16 the list like roofs and boiler and everything else,
17 that's not happening in the capital and so what I'd
18 like to see is we do revisions all the times of our
19 capital and we're working right now with SCA and all
20 the others but there needs to be a revision of the
21 five year NYCHA capital plan as it relates to
22 elevator replacements, we should look at all of our
23 developments based on the number of outages and we
24 should rethink how that five year capital plan looks
25 and I'm advocating for Mitchell and I don't even

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 represent Mitchell but it's important to the Bronx to
3 make sure that the developments that are in need the
4 most are prioritized on that five year capital list.

5 JOEY KOCH: So, thank you very much for
6 your question and I'm... I don't disagree with you, we...
7 I actually am speaking with capital about trying to
8 figure out if there is a way to... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: There's a way...

10 JOEY KOCH: Yeah, well but to look to
11 see... look at the stock, look what's on the list and
12 see if there is a... to see if those are the right
13 decisions, some of those decisions may have been made
14 five years ago and circumstances could have changed
15 so if there is a way, that there is some way that we
16 can maybe look at where we are in the capital plan
17 and prioritize some developments over others that may
18 need it more than others.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: And I would argue
20 that investing in these developments early on in the
21 five year we would save money, we shouldn't be
22 spending 74 million dollars annually on elevator
23 maintenance staff just to maintain the elevators we
24 have today but dedicating staff at Mitchell and other
25 places, these are developments that need more

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 attention and so the capital plan should be
3 reflective of that. The other thing I wanted to ask,
4 and this is something that the Subcommittee on
5 Capital has really been focusing on since I became
6 Chair of the Committee, design build capabilities and
7 the capacity of the agency to use design build to
8 expedite these projects. So, many New Yorkers don't,
9 you know they don't understand, if we could go to
10 Home Depot and purchase an elevator we would do that,
11 if we can go to Home Depot and purchase a boiler we
12 would do that but these are infrastructure and
13 equipment's that have to be built out, they have to
14 be designed, they have to be built out and then you
15 have to go through the procurement and the bidding
16 process but design build expedites that into an 18
17 month time frame whereas it would be anywhere from 24
18 to 36 months so we've worked with Albany to get
19 design build capability so i8 guess my question is in
20 the capital five year for elevators do we have design
21 build authority to use today?

22 BRIAN HONAN: So, Council Member first
23 before we start let me... let me just thank you and,
24 and many members of the Committee because you are...
25 you are a... you're a Council Member that not only, you

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 know talks about an issue but also puts, you know
3 your capital dollars to... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Absolutely...

5 [cross-talk]

6 BRIAN HONAN: ...you know to set... help
7 solving the problem, you know you've invested in the
8 elevators at Morrisania air rights and we really
9 appreciate that. So, capital planning, you know
10 happens, you know many different ways so as Miss Koch
11 mentioned earlier if you're going to have elevators
12 that run correctly you have to make sure that the
13 envelope of the building is sealed and that we, we
14 are not getting border penetration in the building.
15 One of the problems that we had in Morrisania air
16 rights was there was a lot of water, you know getting
17 into the elevator shafts and that was causing
18 outages. So, in the beginning of this administration
19 when we went to the administration to ask for local
20 dollars to be invested into, to NYCHA our asks were
21 mostly on roofs and brick work because we want to
22 make sure that the buildings are sealed and then
23 after that... and you're right, most of the PNA
24 identifies interior concerns to be addressed but if
25 we don't seal up the building then we're investing

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 money and it could be at risk, you know later on. So,
3 I think we're getting closer to that day because the
4 Mayor has invested in both of these areas and we are
5 seeing improvements there and with your funding, you
6 know in particular we're being smart too in making
7 sure that we don't only do the elevators in the
8 senior building but we do the entire development so
9 we, we couple it with a larger project and you know
10 we're working together to make sure that happens as
11 well. As for design build we have one more year left
12 of design build authority from the state however
13 Senator Comrie passed a bill this year that's sitting
14 on the Governor's desk that would give us three extra
15 years of design build authority so that is something
16 that we would love to see the Governor sign and it
17 would help NYCHA not only in this area but in many
18 other areas of the capital projects and, and I'll
19 remain... and we also hired... since design build is new
20 to us, its new to most of the state we've hired a
21 consultant who has experience in this area who's
22 going to show us how to do this the most effectively
23 to make sure that we get the most bang for our
24 dollars.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 OLIVER OSTERWIND: That's what I was
3 going to add, we, we haven't had the ability to date
4 because we haven't been allowed to use this
5 technology so we've hired counsel and we've hired a
6 program manager to the capital department to help us
7 set up projects for that delivery method.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Okay. Well the
9 only thing I would say as I close is that I... again a
10 couple of things, I want there to be a revision of
11 the five year capital plan, I want NYCHA to work more
12 closely with the City Council and draw down faster on
13 city dollars that languish in our budget year after
14 year. My allocation to Morrisania air rights was two
15 fiscal years ago... [cross-talk]

16 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: ...and that money
18 has not been drawn down. I understand that NYCHA is
19 also going to have a new vendor for the elevators and
20 I can understand that, if you have a development and
21 you have old elevators it makes sense to get full
22 funding and replace all the elevators in the
23 buildings, that makes sense but what could happen is
24 NYCHA can work with the City Council, you have
25 members that give millions of dollars every single

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 year, we are happy to work with you, if there's a
3 short fall the Mayor's office and the administration
4 should fill it, if developments are on the five year
5 list for capital and we have the money in maybe year
6 one or year two why can't we up front that money so
7 that all of the money can be allocated in that year
8 two and we can start the work. The frustration is
9 that we are the ones that get the complaints on the
10 ground, there is an expectation when you go in your
11 building that you are to get to your floor safely and
12 in one of my developments air rights in particular
13 there's a senior center on the 20th floor, seniors in
14 the building fear going to the center because they
15 know they may get stuck not just the seniors and the
16 residents get stuck but guess what, the staff get
17 stuck too and so FDNY is on call for this development
18 because we know about the outages that happen every
19 day and every week and so it's frustrating to hear
20 something like at Throggs Neck, like this should not
21 be happening in housing when there are millions and
22 millions of city dollars that NYCHA has the ability
23 to spend. Yes, we can blame the federal government
24 rightfully so because they have not invested and done
25 what they should be doing but the city dollars we

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 have we need to draw down on those city dollars in a
3 quicker fashion and we also need to make sure if the
4 state and the Governor are talking about supporting
5 NYCHA they actually put their money where their
6 commitment is, we're still waiting on approval from
7 Mitchell Houses in... from 2017, we're still waiting on
8 450 million dollars to be approved by Albany, like
9 that's unacceptable, you can't talk about supporting
10 residents if you don't make sure the money is flowing
11 but you also can't talk about supporting residents if
12 you're not spending the money that you have and NYCHA
13 has city dollars, you have my money and all of my
14 colleague's money for various projects, we've been
15 asked to fund everything from the basketball court to
16 the playground to the sprinklers to the exterior LED
17 lighting, we've been asked to support everything and
18 we do our part but it's frustrating when we do our
19 part and we don't see the fruits of our labor. NYCHA
20 can do better and we say this all the time, there's
21 no reason why people say to us that NYCHA is one of
22 the biggest slum lords in New York City, well when
23 you hear these stories we tend to agree but it
24 doesn't have to be that way and so I hope when we
25 have another opportunity as we get ready for, you

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 know November and the November plan that will come
3 out and in January with the new fiscal year we really
4 should rethink the capital five year as it relates to
5 elevator replacement, I would love to see that number
6 go beyond 20 percent so that we can collectively say
7 to residents that there is a real priority on
8 elevator replacements and it's reflective of that in
9 the capital budget and here it is. That's what I
10 would love to see and also the design build and how
11 we can work on that, the drawing down on city
12 dollars. I think when you put all of this together
13 you actually can see the work being done on the
14 ground and, and you know that's what people expect,
15 that's what residents expect from us and that's what
16 we have to do to fulfill their needs so that
17 residents can live in safe and decent and quality
18 housing, we get stuck in the elevators too when we
19 go, sometimes I have to plan going to air rights, I
20 have to give myself 20 minutes to get upstairs and 20
21 minutes to get down every single time I visit and
22 that's the everyday experience that many families in
23 NYCHA deal with and so I'm hoping that after today we
24 can continue to have further conversations working
25 with our Chair to make sure that we can really make a

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 dent in the elevator conversation and prioritizing
3 elevators for residents of New York City housing.

4 BRIAN HONAN: So, Council Member as you
5 know NYCHA runs on a... the, the calendar year and so
6 it's September now and we'd be happy to set up a
7 conversation with you, with the Chair of the Public
8 Housing Committee on where we're going in our budget
9 next year and certainly, you know a two way
10 conversation will be welcome.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, don't
12 forget Mitchell and Morrisania air rights, thank you.

13 BRIAN HONAN: That's okay, I have
14 trouble... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Got to put the
16 plug in. I look forward to that and Council Member
17 Gibson I'm trying to figure out how you are able to
18 fund elevators because I looked at my, my...

19 [off mic dialogue]

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Council Member
21 Holden.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you Chair
23 and thank you for your testimony. I have some very
24 quick questions because it's getting late. You said

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 that the cause of elevator, many elevators going out
3 is a roof leaking, is that the number one cause?

4 JOEY KOCH: No, it's not. As I, I
5 mentioned earlier we have re-configured for lack of a
6 better term our Maximo work order systems so in June
7 our elevator mechanics were better able to pinpoint
8 what specifically is wrong, they're still getting
9 used to it so it's a work in progress but from...
10 through June, July, August the largest percentage of
11 outages was from mechanical issues in the machine
12 room.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So, its
14 overheating of the machines?

15 JOEY KOCH: It could be overheating which
16 is why... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: It could be or...
18 [cross-talk]

19 JOEY KOCH: ...we could... well, I, I...
20 [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: ...it is... [cross-
22 talk]

23 JOEY KOCH: ...I don't know off the...
24 [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay because I
3 would think that, you know air conditioning the
4 machine room if that overheats would be... would have
5 been a long time ago.

6 JOEY KOCH: Well you would think but...
7 [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You would think,
9 right... [cross-talk]

10 JOEY KOCH: ...but it... but it wasn't so
11 we're doing it now.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Alright, you're
13 doing it now but how many... you got I think 300 and..
14 [cross-talk]

15 JOEY KOCH: We've done over 300 since we
16 started in May, we're working pretty diligently but
17 we... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And how many
19 machine rooms are there?

20 JOEY KOCH: So, there are over 3,200
21 elevators so we... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah... [cross-
23 talk]

24 JOEY KOCH: ...are... we're working until we
25 get into every single... into every single machine

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 room, I'm... off the top of my head I believe it's by
3 next summer, I can't guarantee but I believe it's by
4 next summer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You'll have them
6 all air conditioned?

7 JOEY KOCH: I... that is the goal, it might
8 be... it might be a little bit longer but we're working
9 at a pretty nice clip at this point.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: But that's
11 another... so, overheating is the number one... it looks
12 like overheating or some problem... [cross-talk]

13 JOEY KOCH: Well I, I, I don't... I don't
14 want to... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: But it looks
16 like, it may be... [cross-talk]

17 JOEY KOCH: ...say but, but from our... what
18 we know is that overheating in the motor rooms causes
19 a lot of problems with our elevators, it's not over...
20 the overheating of the equipment but sometimes
21 equipment can melt and really creates a serious
22 problem for our mechanics.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And that would be
24 the, the problem most likely to happen in the summer?

25 JOEY KOCH: Yes.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay, so... but
3 there are other reasons. Now we... the other reasons
4 obviously could be like you said, the leaking roof or
5 just age or just vandalism even, that's possible but
6 you said you had 38 roving elevator response teams?

7 JOEY KOCH: After hours, yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: 38 after hours
9 or... I, I read four after hours.

10 JOEY KOCH: We have... we put an additional
11 four teams on, but I believe... it's 38 roving teams
12 after hours.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay because I,
14 I... the way I read it there's 38 and then there's four
15 after hours so if you can... [cross-talk]

16 JOEY KOCH: No, we have a... we have more
17 than that...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Alright, now I
19 would think that after hours would be the best time
20 to work on elevators because most people are
21 sleeping... [cross-talk]

22 JOEY KOCH: I agree with you, yes...
23 [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: ...and they don't
25 have to so shouldn't we expand that and, and so the,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS
2 the 30... you're saying there's 38 because again I
3 would ask you to look at that because I read it
4 again... [cross-talk]

5 JOEY KOCH: I will... I will look at it,
6 what... to answer your... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: If there's only
8 four response teams at night... [cross-talk]

9 JOEY KOCH: No, there are more than...
10 there are... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Alright but
12 that's what I read... [cross-talk]

13 JOEY KOCH: ...don't... after hours includes
14 weekends as well so Saturday and Sunday... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Right... [cross-
16 talk]

17 JOEY KOCH: ...to answer your question I am
18 currently in negotiation with the union to in order
19 to do 24 hour coverage and that coverage would work
20 out so that half are during normal and... the, the
21 specific percentage is I forget off the top of my
22 head but it is... it much... great... much greater
23 expansion of work hours, 24 hours a day, nights...
24 [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And is... [cross-
3 talk]

4 JOEY KOCH: ...weekends and... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay and the 400
6 personnel that you have assigned to the elevators...

7 JOEY KOCH: Uh-huh...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: ...that includes
9 clerical, and do we have... how many... [cross-talk]

10 JOEY KOCH: Yeah... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: ...mechanics?

12 JOEY KOCH: So, we have roughly 173 teams
13 that's a mechanic and a helper.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Oh, okay so just
15 one other question is the Department of Buildings
16 notified when an elevator goes out and how fast is
17 that?

18 JOEY KOCH: So, we are not required to
19 notified DOB every time an elevator goes out. So...
20 [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You're not
22 required?

23 JOEY KOCH: No.
24
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Huh, okay,
3 that's... we might have to change that. Thank you very
4 much. Thank you. Thank you Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

6 BRIAN HONAN: Council Member just to go
7 back on one of the things that you had said about
8 after hours teams and, and Miss Koch said that she
9 agreed with you, this is something that we are
10 currently working to do to have more staff on, it is
11 something that we would have to work out with the,
12 the existing union but we would love to see that
13 happen as well and we're confident that it will
14 happen.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
16 Majority Leader Cumbo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I
18 wanted to just jump right in. Under the new Chair's
19 leadership is there a direction in which he is
20 looking to change the culture and the environment
21 particularly as it pertains to this issue because I
22 think a lot of what everyone is bringing up is
23 process and also to follow with that why is the Chair
24 not present for this particular hearing?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 JOEY KOCH: So, we are making what I'd
3 like to... you know significant changes within the
4 elevator unit, we've made some management changes and
5 we are also making changes to how we look at
6 elevators in general specifically making sure that we
7 understand why the elevators were breaking. We do not
8 necessarily have an understanding as to why all the..
9 all the elevators at Mitchell, just to use Mitchell,
10 why they break down all the time because we were not
11 collecting the data accurately, we have started to do
12 that so that we can be very smart in how we spend our
13 money and how we send people and that is a process
14 that we are changing. Instead of in the past
15 vandalism was 40 percent of the causes of elevator
16 failures so that's, that's just not true, that
17 doesn't make any sense now we know that vandalism
18 only accounts for roughly 12 percent of our elevator
19 issues throughout NYCHA so we're being smarter and
20 that is the process that we are instituting where our
21 staff has to make sure we know why the elevator goes
22 out so that we can fast fix it.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, the question
24 is, why is the Chair not present, we're... why is the
25 Commissioner not present and to her credit under

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 Chair Olatoye she traditionally was present at these
3 hearings of this caliber, why has this new Chair...
4 excuse me, Commissioner as a new Commissioner opted
5 to say this hearing not so much?

6 BRIAN HONAN: I, I think that you, you
7 will see this Chair at, you know many hearings, there
8 will be no stranger to this committee and to the
9 other Committees and the... and the Council, this is...
10 this Chair's third week, Miss Koch has been involved
11 not only with NYCHA but with the federal monitor in
12 coming up and authoring along with the monitor the
13 plan moving forward on elevators and you know... you
14 know we believe that she was the one who's not only
15 with the day to day knowledge but is, you know coming
16 up with the plan that's going to move forward...

17 [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, back... so,
19 back... [cross-talk]

20 BRIAN HONAN: ...NYCHA forward... [cross-
21 talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...to the original
23 question, where is the... where is the Commissioner?

24 BRIAN HONAN: The, the Commissioner is
25 at... you know at, at NYCHA... the Chair is at NYCHA...

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I don't know... he's
3 at NYCHA?

4 BRIAN HONAN: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: So, why did he opt
6 with his third week in that he would not see this as
7 a priority hearing that he would come at the very
8 least to familiarize himself with the issues and the
9 concerns of probably one of the most serious issues
10 that is impacting NYCHA, while they all are serious
11 this would certainly be a hearing of the caliber and
12 scale that the Commissioner should be in attendance
13 at and we all know the facts that he's new, that he's
14 coming in from another state, that he's not familiar
15 with New York City public housing, that he's got a
16 salary above and beyond anything that we've seen
17 before for this particular role, I would think at
18 that level I'd make it my business to be here at this
19 meeting to demonstrate to NYCHA, to the city of New
20 York, to the NYCHA residents I'm here, I'm on it, I
21 take the issue seriously, I'm addressing it and
22 here's what we're going to do differently and I'm
23 also here to listen so that I can better familiarize
24 myself, why did that not happen?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 BRIAN HONAN: So, every issue that's
3 mentioned in the agreement and this is one of the
4 five issues that we mentioned in the agreement are of
5 utmost importance to the Chair, you know pretty,
6 pretty much every minute he's been at NYCHA, he's
7 looked at the agreement and how it's going to change
8 the organization, he has conversations with Miss Koch
9 constantly on where we're going so this is a priority
10 issue for the Chair but you know we can have further
11 discussions on, you know his attendance at hearings.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: You're presence is
13 the greatest demonstration of your care and priority
14 to something so I'll just leave it at that because
15 obviously this line of questioning is not going to
16 magically bring him here but in order to show that
17 level of seriousness to an issue your presence is
18 the... is the first marker of the fact that you're
19 going to do something about this issue. So, you're
20 very well aware of the issue in my district with Mr.
21 Tyrese Stanback [sp?]... [cross-talk]

22 BRIAN HONAN: Yep... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...the resident TA
24 leader who got stuck in an elevator, had his
25 wheelchair stolen... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...because he had to
4 leave it on the floor in order to crawl up the steps
5 to his apartment. I want to know similar to Chair
6 Gibson how do you prioritize a Council Member's
7 allocation for resources to a particular issue? So,
8 I'll give you an example, let's say... let's say I've
9 prioritized and I'm doing this to make an extreme of
10 it, I've prioritized a basketball court let's just
11 say I did that in my district but NYCHA's priorities
12 are boilers, right, overall we want to address all
13 the boiler systems in the city of New York, how do
14 you treat me saying I want my basketball court fixed
15 in comparison to an overall goal of boiler systems,
16 get the boiler systems, totally get the seriousness
17 of it but we as Council Members put in allocations
18 for lights, cameras, basketball courts, elevator
19 repairs, all of these different things, how do they
20 get... because we've got... for the vast majority we have
21 two years left... [cross-talk]

22 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...and I certainly
24 do not want to leave these last two years with my
25 residents with dilapidated elevators, having their

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 wheelchairs stolen, having all of these different
3 things happening to them, having residents crawl up
4 the stairs and now that I'm a mom I'm even more
5 conscious of it, you do everything, get everything
6 right, get the stroller right, put the bag on it,
7 get... duh, duh, duh... got the groceries and this and
8 now you're stuck, you have laundry, a baby, a
9 stroller, a carriage, you're stuck and I... and I get
10 it in a more intimate way now so how do you
11 prioritize our priorities?

12 BRIAN HONAN: I mean... well first in the
13 issue of Mr. Stanback what happened to him on that
14 night is inexcusable, I spoke to him that night, I
15 spoke to him the next day and, and I, you know... we've
16 even gone back and just asked how could something
17 like that happen and to be honest with you I, I still
18 don't have an answer because it just should never
19 have happened. Mr. Stanback is a... is a great leader
20 of NYCHA, of the Fort Greene community... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Uh-huh... [cross-
22 talk]

23 BRIAN HONAN: ...and... but even if he... even
24 if... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Its humiliating..
3 [cross-talk]

4 BRIAN HONAN: It's, it's humiliating and
5 so for that... for, for, for him I, I... you know I... you
6 know I've spent... I've spent time with him, I feel for
7 him and I don't... I don't... I'm not even going to
8 pretend to have an excuse for that, but we need to do
9 better at... with the elevators and with Lafayette
10 Gardens in general.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: How, how do you do
12 better? Here's what I know, there is a budget for
13 elevator repair... [cross-talk]

14 BRIAN HONAN: Right... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Right, how do you
16 decide which Council district will get that priority
17 because if it means I got to roll around on the
18 ground with foam coming out my mouth, spitting and
19 screaming and yelling I'm prepared to do that, how do
20 you prioritize who gets the resources, I'm willing to
21 do whatever I got to do to make sure, I respect all
22 my colleagues here... [cross-talk]

23 BRIAN HONAN: Right... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...to make sure that
25 these resources come back to my district and I know

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 Council Member Gibson can roll around with foam
3 coming out her mouth better than me but we're going
4 to duke it out to get these resources to come to our
5 district, how do you decide this?

6 BRIAN HONAN: So, it is not based on
7 Council district, it is based on conditions and
8 outages and I'll let Miss Koch talk to... more about
9 that but you certainly are, you know an advocate to
10 your district and you let me know, you know of all
11 the issues in your district... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I'm not good
13 enough... [cross-talk]

14 BRIAN HONAN: ...from, from... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...because the
16 resources aren't coming back and my residents are
17 still crawling up the stairs so I'm, I'm obviously
18 doing something wrong here.

19 BRIAN HONAN: Uh-huh.

20 JOEY KOCH: So, as I mentioned a bit
21 earlier, we... Lafayette is in the five year plan but
22 we are taking a look at how... we are... how we have been
23 allocating resources and whether or not we've
24 prioritized the correct elevators correctly. We look
25 at number of outages, the conditions of the building

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 in general and we look at the PNA, the analysis that
3 was done. I can't speak to how this was created
4 recently because I... as I mentioned I've only been
5 here for a year, what I can say is that looking at
6 elevators and why elevators go out is a multifaceted
7 problem, it could be the roof, it could be the
8 envelope it is possible and I don't know this off the
9 top of my... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: It's going to be
11 different... [cross-talk]

12 JOEY KOCH: ...head... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...in every single
14 development...

15 JOEY KOCH: It's going to be different in
16 every development, its also going to be different
17 depending on what other work needs to get done so if
18 Lafayette is due for a roof replacement lets say, it
19 does not make sense to put in a new elevator until
20 the roof is done. We have to do it properly so that
21 the new elevator does not get injured or ruined
22 because the roof wasn't replaced, we have to be
23 smarter about how we're spending our money. So, what
24 we're doing now and what we've started to do recently
25 is really look at the capital plan decide why certain

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 elevators are being done, when, is that the right way
3 of looking at it just because an elevator is old does
4 not mean that that elevator has a problem, the
5 problem could be the roof could be any number of
6 things. So, we're really looking at how the decisions
7 have been made and seeing if there's a way if need be
8 to move something around.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I hear you and
10 I'll just end on this, in our positions we often or
11 rarely ever have the luxury of looking at anything
12 for an extended period of time, you have to look at
13 it and solve it immediately so we don't have
14 necessarily the luxury to look at something over a
15 years period of time, we have to get in and make a
16 decision or to allocate resources or to get on the
17 ground and do something very quickly so each building
18 is going to be very different. Do you feel that you
19 all don't have enough... I'm trying to really
20 understand the systemic problem, do you feel that you
21 don't have enough staff because... are... is, is... a role
22 like yours, do you have someone that's looking over
23 Brooklyn, someone that's looking of Staten Island,
24 someone that's looking over Queens, do you have
25 people... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 JOEY KOCH: So, yes so... [cross-talk]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: ...in different...

4 [cross-talk]

5 JOEY KOCH: ...within the... so, within the
6 elevator department there are administrators that are
7 assigned to each borough, yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Are there not
9 enough?

10 JOEY KOCH: I could absolutely use more
11 staff I'm not going to pretend that I can't, but I
12 think we also need to realize how to utilize what we
13 have better. So, for instance, the, the negotiation
14 with the union and having staff 24 hours a day that
15 could make a huge difference because currently people
16 might have to wait from a Friday night to a Monday
17 morning because of an outage because we don't have
18 staff working on the weekend so the negotiations that
19 we're doing with the union to ensure that we have
20 adequate staff and by adequate I mean a large
21 percentage of our staff working nights and weekends
22 could really make a difference in how quickly we're
23 able to get the elevators up and running again.

24 BRIAN HONAN: And so Council... and Council
25 Member too I'd also like to add that this is not

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 guess work on our part, part, you know it needs
3 development, the elevators are ranked from five to
4 one, five being the worst, one being new elevators
5 and I can tell you so if you asked about the
6 elevators at a particular development we could tell
7 you what their ranking is and I can tell you right
8 now we have... of the elevators in our portfolio 2,227
9 of them are ranked either three, fours or fives that,
10 that is some fair to poor condition and 1,059 of them
11 are ones and twos so more of our elevators are
12 either, you know aging to a point where they need
13 replacement than elevators that are in, you know... you
14 know good condition that we need... you know we're,
15 we're confident, you know for the future.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Can... and I would
17 just close with this, I would appreciate if any way
18 that you could do an assessment in terms of my
19 district to let me know where we rank there and also
20 what are the resources that will be necessary and
21 needed in order to do the repairs necessary for my
22 district and a timetable of when that can happen
23 because, you know there are so many important things
24 in our communities which... from libraries to schools
25 to cultural institutions to housing, so many

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

1
2 different issues but, you know in this case I really
3 have to prioritize my entire capital budget on
4 elevator repair because it's just unconscionable to
5 think that someone would have to crawl up the stairs
6 and get their wheelchair stolen from them is just
7 something that... it's humiliating, its dehumanizing,
8 it's something that no individual should have to
9 experience and so this is certainly a, a critical
10 issue and I... and I would like to know what do I need
11 to do and while we may not be able to get brand new
12 elevators in every one, there may be some repairs
13 that could happen to fill the gap in that way.

14 BRIAN HONAN: We... I agree with you and,
15 and your, your, your district is unique in the fact
16 too that it has many, many high rise buildings
17 including the tallest building in NYCHA, the Atlantic
18 Terminal so it is an issue throughout from Atlantic
19 Terminal all the way to Ingersoll throughout the... and
20 Farragut and, and Lafayette, all of these buildings
21 depend on the elevator service, the folks to get up
22 and down.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you,
25 Council Member Salamanca.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you
3 Madame Chair. Good, good afternoon everyone. I'm
4 going to be brief; I have my five-year-old with me so
5 please excuse us and I want to thank him for his
6 patience. I, I, I came in the special election in, in
7 February of 2016 and so I'm kind of a fairly.. I
8 consider myself a fairly new Council Member but I've
9 been a Council Member for four summers; 2016, 2017,
10 2018, and 2019 and in these four summers the
11 elevators in the Jackson Houses have gone down and
12 they've gone down for one particular reason, the
13 transformers are not working in Jackson Houses so my
14 entire development over... close to 900 units during
15 the summer they lose electricity and therefore the
16 elevators are not working. This, this particular
17 summer there was a fire to the transformer and
18 therefore we had to bring in generators to, to, to
19 provide electricity so that these buildings could be
20 powered up and the elevators can work, you know about
21 this issue prior to me coming into office, four
22 summers have passed by, what are you doing to address
23 the issue of the transformers in Jackson Houses so
24 that you can address the issue with the elevators not
25 working?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 BRIAN HONAN: So, thanks so much Council
3 Member and, and thank you for your partnership as
4 always too and, and not only the Miss Koch and I know
5 about the issue, I mean I speak to Mr. Barber, the
6 tenant leader there a few times a week, we've been
7 out to the development to meet with the... with the
8 vendor and the tenant leadership, you know to talk
9 about how we improved conditions but right now we are
10 on generators running in, in a very large development
11 and it is... it is caused for a very challenging
12 summer. Mr. Koch... Miss Koch, excuse me oversees the
13 day to day operations of that and she can talk more
14 about what's going on now, short term and where we
15 look to be long term.

16 JOEY KOCH: So, the fire did cause damage
17 to the generator... to the room where the transformers
18 were coming in so we're in the process of designing
19 the space and cleaning up the space for new
20 transformers to be brought in, at the same time the
21 design of the permanent solution to get Jackson onto
22 the grid is underway and that is due to be finished
23 in October, it was an expedited process and then we
24 believe that by... my understanding is adorable, my
25 understanding is that at the current... the current

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

1
2 schedule for the permanent fix should be this time
3 next year, they should be on Con Ed service.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, just...
5 this is my fourth summer, and this is the, the fourth
6 time... well I... I'm constantly hearing that we're going
7 to address the issue and it will be addressed by next
8 summer and four summers have passed by, the issue has
9 not been addressed, let's see what happens next
10 summer. Finally, I, I... I'm seeing here... what role
11 does the Department of Buildings play with inspecting
12 the elevators?

13 JOEY KOCH: So, we do... our inspections
14 are done by our elevator inspectors... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay... [cross-
16 talk]

17 JOEY KOCH: ...when... and a third party when
18 a deficiency is found we send them to the Department
19 of Buildings we then correct them and send those
20 corrections as well. DOB also comes out and looks...
21 does various, random inspections on our buildings and
22 if there's an accident they are called in to look at
23 the elevator before we put it back it into... [cross-
24 talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Do they ever
3 give you... give NYCHA a violation or notice of
4 violation?

5 JOEY KOCH: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: How many
7 violations did you get this past... this past year and
8 how can the public have access to them?

9 JOEY KOCH: So, I don't... I believe all of
10 that is public information on the DOB website, I
11 believe that is public, I'm not positive, I don't
12 want to speak for DOB, but I believe that this year
13 we had roughly 11,000 violations... I'm sorry, I'm just
14 looking for the information that I have... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, is, is it
16 possible that we can... every council member can get a
17 list of violations for development in their district?

18 BRIAN HONAN: Yes, we... [cross-talk]

19 JOEY KOCH: Yeah... [cross-talk]

20 BRIAN HONAN: ...we can get that...

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: How... when can
22 we get that?

23 JOEY KOCH: We could... we'll run a report
24 for you.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, I'm
3 going to hold you to that.

4 JOEY KOCH: Okay...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, thank
6 you very much, thank you Madame Chair.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And Council
8 Member Salamanca I'm not sure how things would be if
9 it would be even... any better with them going onto the
10 grid with Con Ed, right because that's my next series
11 of questions... and you know we say that and you know
12 we, we joke about it, right because of this past
13 summer but that was my next question because me and
14 Brian talk all the time and my district the Con Ed
15 will lower the wattage on... in the district and so
16 that clearly has a direct impact on the elevators
17 going up and do and so at one point we thought it was
18 an outage because of, you know like some other reason
19 and had no idea that it was because they were
20 lowering the wattage. So, can you just speak to us a
21 little bit about the relationship you've had with Con
22 Ed and are you given the heads up when they are
23 deciding to lower the power in certain districts and
24 how that is... you know how do you notify residents and
25 what do you do and then also the next issue along

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 those same lines some buildings will have the wattage
3 lowered but those are the towers and within that same
4 development it's... it could be a lower... you know the
5 shorter building that has an elevator and you would
6 think it would make sense for them to turn down the
7 power on the building that's not a tower so, can you
8 speak to that as well?

9 JOEY KOCH: Yeah, so... [cross-talk]

10 BRIAN HONAN: Before, before, before...
11 Miss, Miss Koch talks about that I just want to just
12 give you anecdotal story, so on the hottest day of
13 the year I was at Howard Houses in your district, the
14 pool was filled with people, people were doing
15 whatever they needed to do to stay cool, we entered a
16 building that's 13 stories and the elevator was out
17 and we found out it was a Con Edison outage so we
18 entered the next building that's right next to it,
19 seven stories and we were able to walk up and you
20 know visit residents in their apartments but you
21 would think that if an outage had to happen you would
22 go to the lower floors rather than the higher floors
23 so working with Con Edison if, you know in the future
24 that if there... they have to do this, lower the
25

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 voltage, voltage to work with us to where it makes
3 sense would be something that's greatly appreciated.

4 JOEY KOCH: So... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: But can you
6 speak to that like relationship like what... [cross-
7 talk]

8 JOEY KOCH: Yeah, yeah... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...kind of
10 communication... [cross-talk]

11 JOEY KOCH: ...so, so just as an FYI five
12 percent of our outages in July, over five percent of
13 our outages in July were caused by voltage
14 reductions, I actually think the number is probably
15 higher, but our mechanics are getting used to their
16 new handheld system. We are working with Con Ed
17 specifically to address how they take down the
18 voltage in NYCHA. The example that Brian used was
19 brought up with Con Ed and the explanation that we
20 received was that they are different feeders that
21 come in through different places so NYCHA doesn't
22 have the option of saying okay, let's... which... of the
23 developments which elevators are we going to take
24 down because if we did we would take down the
25 elevator that was in the shortest building however,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 from Con Ed infrastructure perspective they may be
3 different sources of energy going to each building
4 and they are deciding which one needs to be reduced.
5 So, they are the ones who are making that decision,
6 we are working with them to figure out if there is a
7 way that they could at least give us more notice so
8 that we can inform residents that if indeed there is
9 a voltage reduction we can let people know so that
10 they can be prepared for not having elevator service
11 during that time frame and that is a... we are
12 currently working on better processes with Con Ed to
13 make sure that happens.

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, that's
15 helpful to know but also just really drilling down on
16 making it a, a mandate that you are part of part of
17 that conversation and that we are part of that
18 conversation because I'm not confident in the fact
19 that, you know they make the decision and how do we
20 know that they're making the right decision, you know
21 sometimes people just make decisions just because
22 they don't know any other way... [cross-talk]

23 BRIAN HONAN: You know the... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...and we're
25 realizing that from yesterday's hearing.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 BRIAN HONAN: I think that would be a
3 really great three way conversation if we could have
4 that too because it does... it does seem sometimes and
5 I don't know maybe it's just because I'm at NYCHA
6 that we, we tend to get the, the voltage tends to get
7 lowered in our developments quick especially when
8 it's hot.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so you
10 said a lot... so, when you talk about like how do you
11 prioritize the actual repairs, right and you
12 mentioned looking at the PNA analysis and looking at
13 the number of outages and looking at the overall like
14 capital needs or other capital needs in the building
15 once you do all of that analysis of what's happening
16 and, and, and capturing the picture, what's next? So,
17 can you take us through the steps of, of when you
18 figure out when a development should be like on the
19 list for prioritizing that particular elevator?

20 JOEY KOCH: You're talking about... [cross-
21 talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...like what's
23 the... [cross-talk]

24 JOEY KOCH: ...an elevator modernization or
25 an elevator rehabilitation?

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Yes... [cross-
3 talk]

4 JOEY KOCH: Specifically, so, I believe
5 capital should walk us through those steps.

6 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Thanks for the
7 question so we haven't done a elevator renovation in
8 a couple of years because of the PLA agreement and
9 the few elevator contractors that we have in New York
10 City were not signatures so we've now I think taken
11 care of that issue and we're ramping up again so
12 once... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: What do you
14 mean you're taking care of that issue, what does that
15 mean?

16 OLIVER OSTERWIND: I think there's been
17 an agreement between the city and, and the elevator
18 contractors and the elevator work has been exempted
19 for the PLA agreement.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay.

21 OLIVER OSTERWIND: So, when we have a
22 capital project in the pipeline it gets assigned
23 internally in, in our capital projects departments to
24 a, a project manager and an assistant project manager
25 and what comes next is to the design phase which

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 typically takes depending on the height of a building
3 six to nine months then comes the procurement phase,
4 the bidding and procurement phase where the work is
5 bid out and awarded and procured... the city funding
6 through the city procurement process, construction
7 typically for an elevator is between four and six
8 months depending on the height of the building so
9 that's roughly a timeline for an elevator
10 replacement.

11 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And at what
12 point do you inform the elected officials in that
13 particular development like who represents that
14 district as to what's happening?

15 BRIAN HONAN: So, I guess it depends on
16 if there's going to be an outage and you know and we
17 need to tell... you know we need to tell the elected
18 officials you can expect, you know since we're doing
19 elevator maintenance we, we... you know we will... you
20 know there will be a prolonged outage at that
21 building, we... you know we'll, we'll try to bring the
22 elected in early but as Oliver said, you know over
23 the last few years we haven't been doing a lot of
24 elevator work, we will be doing that more and early
25 communication is, is really important in that case

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 because you will get the calls and it, it, it's
3 better if you can say, yes, I know NYCHA told me and
4 we met with the tenants association, president and,
5 and, and the council member and they have told us
6 this is going to be a prolonged outage and you know
7 so you have the information.

8 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay and

9 because we mentioned the P... the PNA several times
10 during this hearing I'm looking now at just a list
11 from my district and when I look at Brevoort it says
12 conveying traction passenger elevator 20.8 million
13 and that's for Brevoort Houses so can you explain
14 what, what does that mean because when you look at
15 the... all the line items for elevators throughout the
16 whole PNA it says the same thing so can you explain
17 what, what that number like means, what does the 28
18 point... 20.8 million dollars actually intel?

19 OLIVER OSTERWIND: So, the... that, that is

20 a overall project budget that was arrived at with a,
21 a high level estimate internally, we have an
22 estimating group in the capital projects division and
23 that number is our goal for that development and it
24 includes a complete replacement in this case; the,
25 the car and the doors and everything and that's the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 number we work towards but ultimately the design and
3 the, the estimating process during design will, will
4 firm up that number of what that number is end... ends
5 up being.

6 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so just
7 to make it a little easier so I mentioned Brevoort
8 that's a lot of buildings and that's a high number,
9 when I look at Kingsborough Extension, Kingsborough
10 Extension is a senior building and that's just one
11 tower and it says 1.8 million so what does that mean?

12 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Again, that's a
13 complete elevator replacement, if it's... I'm not sure
14 if it's one or two... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Two... [cross-
16 talk]

17 OLIVER OSTERWIND: Right and that would
18 be a complete replacement of the car, the mechanics,
19 the machine, everything gets replaced.

20 BRIAN HONAN: And that's, that's
21 approximately the estimate that we give to replace
22 elevators... you know two elevators in a development,
23 you know so what Council Member Gibson was able to
24 allocate two million dollars for Morrisania Air
25 Rights that was based on the estimate that we gave

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 her. And remember too that those, those are 2017
3 numbers from the PNA but there... they remain pretty
4 con... you know up to date.

5 OLIVER OSTERWIND: But the number also
6 includes all the soft costs so the design services,
7 the inspection services and the consulting services
8 that are associated with a job like that.

9 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: So,
10 theoretically if I'm looking at this, this statement
11 right now and I know that it says 1.8 million for
12 Kingsborough Extension for that senior building and
13 if they're... if... the residents have been complaining
14 to me about, you know outages and I say okay, 2021
15 I'm going to allocate 1.8 million to fix the
16 elevators in Kingsborough Extension for those seniors
17 is that...

18 BRIAN HONAN: So, the... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...the
20 appropriate allocation and would it... I'm not sure if
21 it will happen, right... [cross-talk]

22 BRIAN HONAN: Right... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...Kingsborough
24 Extension... it might take three years but...

25 BRIAN HONAN: Well... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ..we're going
3 to work on that.

4 BRIAN HONAN: So, we'll, we'll count on
5 that money in the bank. So, so, so... so, what, what
6 our capital department has gotten much better at over
7 the last few years is doing really itemized cost
8 estimates and we work very closely with Oliver and
9 his department in getting those estimates so Council
10 Member if you said to me I want to replace the
11 elevators at Brevoort the PNA would be a good
12 starting point but they would also look at market
13 conditions, they would look at what bids have come
14 back recently, they would look at escalating costs in
15 construction and they, you know may give me a
16 slightly higher maybe even a slightly lower number
17 depending on the circumstances but that would be a
18 good place to start but I would rather give you the
19 latest number so this way we don't fall into a place
20 like yes, I know you fought really hard to get 1.8
21 million but, but it's really 2.1 million and now
22 we're going to have to wait till the next budget
23 cycle in order to, to fund it correctly, we wouldn't
24 want to... we would never want that.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, alright,
3 thank you. Maybe just a... some point of clarification
4 questions and things we need to get on the record as
5 we come to a close. Are elevators under warranty?

6 JOEY KOCH: So, as Oliver alluded to
7 there has not been an elevator replacement in NYCHA
8 for some time so those elevators may no longer be
9 under warranty.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And does NYCHA
11 currently track the ones that are under warranty and
12 for how long?

13 JOEY KOCH: So, elevator warranties, it,
14 it could be five years, one year, it depends on
15 parts, depends on what the warranty is for, currently
16 we are not tracking warranties in the way that we
17 should be, going forward we absolutely will be, there
18 will be in Maximo a way of uploading the warranty and
19 anytime there's any work that's done on that elevator
20 or a work order comes in for a problem with that
21 elevator there will be a warning that you need to go
22 to the warranty and that you need to make sure that
23 whatever... either call the vendor to come in and fix
24 the elevator if it's under warranty, look at the
25 problem to see if it is something not warranty

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 related and make sure we don't short the warranty
3 because that was... that's the last thing that we would
4 want to do.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay and so
6 going back to your testimony you stated that even
7 with 400 dedicated hard working elevator mechanics,
8 mechanic helpers, supervisors, dispatchers and
9 managers and clerical staff maintaining these
10 elevator... these elevators we have an annual budget of
11 about 74 million, the needs of NYCHA elevators are
12 significant, the... can you tell us the number of
13 certified elevator mechanics that you actually have
14 because when you mentioned the numbers of... [cross-
15 talk]

16 JOEY KOCH: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...of the actual
18 mechanics and just reviewing the New York One Report...
19 [cross-talk]

20 JOEY KOCH: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...where they
22 mentioned ten certified mechanics so can you just
23 kind of give us a break... [cross-talk]

24 JOEY KOCH: So, that was... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...down... [cross-
3 talk]

4 JOEY KOCH: ...ten inspectors, that, that
5 was referenced in New York One, we have about 40
6 licensed elevator mechanics.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, so just
8 a real quick breakdown again, how many employees are
9 in the department?

10 JOEY KOCH: There are close to 400
11 employees in the entire department.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: And how many
13 elevator dispatchers and how many mechanics?

14 JOEY KOCH: I don't know off the top of
15 my head how many dispatchers, we have about 170...
16 roughly 173 teams which is an elevator mechanic and a
17 helper.

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: What's the
19 difference between a house mechanic and a special
20 teams mechanic?

21 JOEY KOCH: So, special teams is... I
22 really just said a little bit earlier, they're
23 assigned to work on specific elevators, it could be
24 that's there has been a... an outage that has gone on
25 for longer than originally anticipated, they're

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 usually our more skilled staff that are assigned to
3 work on special projects, they're also the ones that
4 are being assigned to look at various developments
5 and do the soup to nuts review of everything in the
6 elevator. A regular mechanic is dispatched as needed.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay. Okay and
8 can you one more time for the record explain the
9 elevator repair work subject to the project labor
10 agreement, I know you mentioned that you were working
11 on the agreement and... but can you just kind of sum
12 that up?

13 BRIAN HONAN: Sure, so there are two
14 different unions that do elevator work and one union
15 was a signatory to the PLA and the other wasn't and
16 it made... it made doing elevator work very difficult,
17 we have now solved that problem by exempting elevator
18 work from the PLA and so we won't have that same
19 issue and, and moving forward we can now start doing,
20 you know more elevator work.

21 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, I think
22 that is all to... okay. Once... and, and this is the
23 final question, right. If you can sum up for us once
24 you receive the funding, right, from the federal
25 funding and the city funding and in a perfect world..

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 like what you're working on now because we're working
3 in the perfect world now, right, because you have
4 funding available and it's a matter of actually
5 drawing down the money, once you draw down the money
6 and once you prioritize that what's the strategic
7 plan in following through with it all if you can just
8 kind of close us out so that we can feel good that
9 this is happening?

10 BRIAN HONAN: So, one thing I, I will say
11 that I've noticed that it's different at and I'll let
12 Joey and Oliver talk about their areas but the fact
13 that their areas are talking to each other and
14 planning together is something that did not always
15 happen at... you know so the fact that capital isn't
16 working in the silo, operations isn't working in the
17 silo, they're looking at it together and, and you
18 know prioritizing based on, you know on needs is, you
19 know really, really critical and important but since
20 the money does... you know would go to Oliver based on,
21 you know some of those conversations he can talk
22 about the process from there.

23 OLIVER OSTERWIND: So, we live by our
24 five year plan and that gets updated every year and
25 it gets approved by the board at the end of each

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 fiscal year and that's how we allocate our resources,
3 we go into the projects and we, we start assigning
4 them and we, we plan for them, we, we procure the
5 design service for... services for them, we procure the
6 construction services for them and then we monitor
7 construction and we have a... in house staff and we
8 also hire consulting firms that do construction
9 management services, we hire them to supervise work
10 for us in the field to make sure that everything is
11 built the way it was supposed to... or was designed and
12 at the end we, we close out, the warranties are, are
13 issued and the equipment is handed over from our
14 perspective.

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay and when
16 a development is not part of your strategic... like you
17 five year plan like when, when you have your plan and
18 you... and you're working it and the board just
19 approved everything and then you get a development
20 with this outage that kind of turns everyone's world
21 upside down, how do you strategically plan for that
22 hiccup?

23 BRIAN HONAN: So, plans can be amended so
24 it's not like it's a five year plan and then it's set
25 in stone but plans can be amended, you know as needed

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 so, so in cases like that we can... you know, yes, we
3 can say this is what had in our five year plan but we
4 have a Throggs Neck situation or we have another
5 situation where we, we need to make different choices
6 and you know that can happen and that... you know we
7 can... we can do that through, through, through various
8 different mechanisms.

9 OLIVER OSTERWIND: And just to add so it
10 also depends... so, so we can always swap projects
11 around and it depends on what phase they're in so if
12 you already commenced design on a project or starting
13 to procure a, a, a project for construction it's... it
14 does make more sense for us to put that on a back
15 burner, we'll follow through with that but then if,
16 if an emergency comes up and a priority shift we, we
17 look at the, the, the plan and we can shift projects
18 around and switch the planning around for sure.

19 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, well
20 thank you so much and I just want to say that the
21 reason why we held this hearing was because we look
22 at New Yorkers just across the board the most
23 vulnerable are, are always the individuals that need
24 that extra level of advocacy and when we're talking
25 about accessibility it's not just NYCHA, we see it

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 in, in TA, you know we see it in our school systems,
3 everyone's talking about making all of our schools
4 more accessible and, and you I know in my district I
5 don't have one accessible subway, not one and so this
6 is an ongoing conversation but we just wanted to
7 highlight the fact that the conversation needs to be
8 happen... it should be happening and it's critical that
9 it's, it's happening now while there's so much going
10 on with NYCHA and the repairs and the federal
11 monitors report and so clearly there was a need for
12 this hearing and we look forward to working with you
13 in a more... in a true partnership and I really hope
14 that the family partnership department along with
15 resident engagement have more of a role at the table
16 in making sure that the voices of the residents are
17 heard and that they know what's happening so that
18 they can communicate that back to the residents in a
19 more healthy and appropriate way.

20 BRIAN HONAN: Thank you very much Council
21 Member and we look forward to that partnership as
22 well.

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you. The
24 next panel we will hear from will be Suhali Mendez
25 with New York Lawyers for Public Interest and Miss

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 Torres from Smith Houses and that's.. and that's all
3 we have for testimony today. Okay. Okay, you can just
4 state your name.

5 SUHALI MENDEZ: Yes, my name is Suhali
6 Mendez, I'm an advocate in the disability justice
7 program at New York Lawyers for the Public Interest.
8 I would like to speak about my organization and of
9 course our concerns with the hearing that occurred.
10 So, my organization, New York Lawyers for the Public
11 Interest is a civil rights organization that has a
12 robust disability rights practice and housing
13 advocacy for people with disabilities is an important
14 part of our work. Our organization represents tenants
15 in matters involving the need for reasonable
16 accommodations such as apartment and common area
17 retrofitting, transfers to accessible apartments and
18 protection for the use of service animals as well as
19 other housing discrimination issues. We appreciate
20 the opportunity to provide testimony regarding
21 accessible housing in New York City. In order to meet
22 the needs of New Yorkers with disabilities the New
23 York City Housing Authority or NYCHA must take
24 immediate action in the following areas; increasing
25 the area of accessible apartments within NYCHA's

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 portfolio, making reasonable accommodations and
3 modifications for existing NYCHA tenants as well as
4 vastly decreasing the amount of time that tenants
5 with disabilities must wait in order to obtain
6 accessible housing. We believe that NYCHA is not
7 meeting its responsibility to provide accessible
8 housing for New Yorkers with disabilities adequately.
9 Based on this information we've received from NYCHA
10 tenants wait lists as well for accessible apartments
11 can be years long and NYCHA refuses all too often to
12 make reasonable modifications to existing apartment's
13 entrances and common areas which could create
14 additional much needed accessible units. Over the
15 years our organization has received calls from people
16 with disabilities who live in NYCHA apartments and
17 have waited many months if not years for reasonable
18 accommodations in order to be transferred to an
19 accessible apartment. We hear frequently from NYCHA
20 tenants who report that their elevators are in woeful
21 disrepair, breaking, breaking down constantly, leave,
22 leaving them trapped in their apartments. Accessible
23 features such as elevators must be maintained and
24 working order so that they may be readily used by
25 tenants with disabilities. While the Mayor's 2017

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 updated housing plan, housing 2.0 promise to build
3 more senior housing on existing NYCHA land, it is
4 wholly insufficient to address the crisis for people
5 with disabilities who live in NYCHA or need NYCHA
6 housing. NYCHA must increase its accessible housing
7 stock in order to meet the needs of NYCHA tenants who
8 have disabilities. Adding to the accessible housing
9 stock is not enough to meet the needs of NYCHA
10 residents. New York City must hold NYCHA to the
11 standards set by New York City human rights law who
12 prohibits disability discrimination in the sale of
13 rental... or rental, excuse me, of housing and requires
14 the provision of reasonable accommodation to enable
15 people with disabilities to fully enjoy their
16 housing. We have seen in non-NYCHA housing contest
17 consistent and aggressive enforcement of anti-
18 discrimination laws that allows people with
19 disabilities to remain in their existing homes. Our
20 office has assisted countless people with
21 disabilities who live in situations merely because
22 their landlords or management... managing agents refuse
23 to provide them with legally required reasonable
24 accommodations. In many of these situations
25 aggressive enforcement has been the only solution to

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 address these problems. In conclusion, in order to
3 meet the standards of these... of the... it's tenants
4 NYCHA and New York City must both take immediate
5 action to address the needs of tenants with
6 disabilities. We implore the mayor's office and the
7 City Council to take steps to match... and... the supply
8 of accessible NYCHA housing to the needs of public
9 housing populations. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you, I
11 have a couple of questions for you but I'm going to
12 wait until... [cross-talk]

13 SUHALI MENDEZ: Yes... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...after Miss
15 Torres goes.

16 AIXA TORRES: Good afternoon, my name is
17 Aixa Torres and I am the President of Alfred E. Smith
18 Resident Association and so I come to this hearing
19 for two reasons; number one the... DHS, right, I have a
20 shelter right next to... right smack in the middle of
21 my development, you can't walk into the shelter
22 without walking on Smith property and the last
23 meeting we had we had because I called the Mayor on
24 his phone and left one of my classic messages and so
25 the meeting was held and promises were made. The

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 biggest issue though is this, that we who live in
3 public housing and one paycheck away from being
4 homeless ourselves so it's not about kicking, it's
5 about giving the services that are necessary and
6 needed. We have a lot of residents who have been
7 moving into our development who also have, have come
8 from the shelter system who also have mental health
9 issues and no one is screened, not for criminal or
10 anything they just come... if you're in the shelter
11 they just come in and nothing is done as if you were
12 coming through the right process, people need to be
13 screened and it's not about no, you can't come back
14 or you can't do this, its about screening them like
15 all of us are screened and if they need help they
16 need to get help. You just can't put people in the
17 development and just leave them there for the
18 community to deal with when we don't even know these
19 people, right. I'll give you an example, the other
20 day I was coming in this gentleman who lives in one
21 of the floors in my building looked at me in the face
22 and just started cursing like I don't... I'm not even
23 going to repeat the words, unnecessarily and I know
24 he has... the day before there was a fight downstairs
25 with that same family, the police had to come. So,

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 there are issues. Then we've had several... and it's
3 not about picking because we do have... we, we do have
4 residents that need... have, have... you know that were
5 actually evicted for doing illegal things, we're not
6 applauding that, what we're saying is if you are
7 going to put people anywhere, right, even in the
8 shelter that was our other big fight, we were trying
9 to get help for the people who have mental health,
10 you have to give them services, they're finally doing
11 it after my phone call, right, but this was for three
12 years, for three years the residents in Smith have
13 been fighting for the people in the shelter so it's
14 not like them and us, it's us, it's we, we live
15 together, right. So, I just wanted to say that and so
16 NYCHA has... had to take in people without getting the
17 resources so they need to re-think about if they're
18 doing this they need to have something to be able to
19 give those resources because they've been dismantled
20 and certain things... those issues have to be... come
21 back, you know and they have to deal with them
22 because we have to deal with them. Okay and the
23 second thing is, this whole, you know elevators that...
24 I have an excellent mechanic because I also had a
25 resident for five hours who got stuck and we raised...

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 and so after we got a mechanic who's really, I mean
3 he's really great. Like I tell him... I, I write
4 letters of recommendation, I say give him a raise but
5 he can't leave here, give him a promotion but he
6 can't leave here and they pull him out sometimes when
7 other developments have emergencies, right, but the
8 reality of it is that one of the things that has to
9 happen with all this capital stuff is they need to
10 come to the development and sit down with the
11 residents and with management and not down to... I...
12 because I'm going to tell you right now, I have
13 attorneys, right, why, because I have a contractor,
14 you want to talk about disability, they built... they
15 built a stairwell that is not handicap accessible and
16 I went are you kidding me, are you kidding me, what
17 about my residents on wheelchairs, my elderly even,
18 even little small kids, what... no, I took... so, we
19 tried to be... telling to build a, a rail like a little
20 rail so they could put the, the wheelchair, they said
21 no. So, they have built these... they have built these
22 stairwells that have no access. On September 10th I
23 welcome you to come to my development at eleven
24 o'clock, they're going to do a demonstration and that
25 has been the fight of the year for me, right. I spoke

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 to my attorney this morning, he was like.. he's like
3 enraged, right because this is all supposed to be
4 about safety and things like that and it's not safe
5 and so there, there has to be a meeting of the minds
6 but before decisions are made about what needs to be
7 fixed and what doesn't need to be fixed, what should
8 be priority in each development they need to come to
9 the residents and they need to come to management and
10 not make the decisions for us because we're the ones
11 who live there, we're the ones who have to deal with
12 it and we know, right. I'll give you a perfect
13 example, I have roll call for my heating when we have
14 no heat and no hot water, right but Xavier has done
15 an excellent job of communicating so when I did my
16 roll call he called me he says I want a meeting with
17 your grievance committee and with your board because
18 what your roll call is telling me and what my.. our
19 systems are telling me are not wrong, right, so he
20 came in, he met with us, we told him everything, they
21 went to.. and now we're going through this whole
22 project and that's what I'm saying, we're, we're the
23 best at it, stop hiring consultants because that
24 drives me crazy, it.. no, it does, I want to throw
25 them in the river because I live right next to the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE

1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 river, they're arrogant half the time, they come in
3 with their noses looking down on us, I happen to have
4 three degrees, it's not like I'm an idiot, you, you
5 know what I'm saying. I don't like the attitude, like
6 Joy Sinderbag [sp?] said in the meeting like this,
7 well, you know you have to understand that residents
8 who live in public housing don't have the
9 sophistication to understand in public, yeah. And so,
10 I'm tired of that mentality and I get we're... I get
11 some of the, the, the mentality.. you know the, the
12 attitude from because if people.. it trickles down, if
13 people on, on that level who make that kind of money
14 think about us residents in public housing that way
15 it is not acceptable and everywhere I go I mention it
16 because I am so angry about that, you know and all..
17 we can.. you could talk to us, we're not dumb, talk to
18 us, ask us questions and we'll probably be able to
19 real but if you don't talk to us and you come in
20 saying this is what you need, no, I'm tired of that,
21 you know that's.. I'm not even going to go there with
22 that... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank... [cross-
24 talk]

25 AIXA TORRES: ...don't worry.

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you so
3 much... [cross-talk]

4 AIXA TORRES: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Thank you.

6 Just a quick question, have you seen an increase in,
7 in the work that you're doing with NYCHA residents
8 over the past couple of years in trying to provide
9 them with support and representation related to the
10 accessibility issues?

11 SUHALI MENDEZ: I believe we have.

12 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: In what kind
13 of way?

14 SUHALI MENDEZ: It's more like
15 accessibility issues; elevators being in disrepair is
16 definitely one of the issues we hear commonly about,
17 things like grab bars in bathrooms, you know just
18 having the apartments retrofitted to address mobility
19 in apartments is something we commonly hear about.

20 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Have you
21 assisted at all with the recertifications or you know
22 just trying to be able to get... to assist residents
23 with recertifying their... like their lease agreements
24 and not being able to... because of the accessibility
25 issues maybe not being able to get to the management

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 office or to a place to be able to do their annual
3 recerts?

4 SUHALI MENDEZ: We, we do... but you know
5 our focus, you know in terms of our practice for... we
6 tend to focus more on reasonable accommodations so
7 that... you know that's often when folks call us when...
8 there are things, things like I've asked my... I have
9 asked management to install grab bars in my bathroom
10 for instance is the common thing we hear or the
11 elevator is not functioning, those are often the
12 complaints we get or things like... circumstances have
13 changed that they need to move to a different
14 apartment because, you know of accessibility issues
15 and things like that are often the, the concerns we
16 get from the community.

17 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, thank
18 you and my final question, Miss Torres do you work at
19 all with resident engagement or family services or
20 family partnerships on behalf of your... the residents
21 in Smith Houses?

22 AIXA TORRES: With resident engagement,
23 yes and I have the... you know and I have the... we have
24 the card which has been the best thing for several
25 reasons, it's about accountability, I can go on the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

1 computer, open up my system and I know exactly how
2 much money I have in my budget, there's no questions
3 about oh, let me get back to you like two months
4 later and I still don't know how much money now I do
5 know from the beginning...

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: I mean like as
8 far as being able to reach all the residents of Smith
9 Houses if there is an outage or if there's an
10 elevator issue or if there are residents who may
11 need, you know like more assistance and more of like
12 a touch, do you work with them at all?

13 AIXA TORRES: With resident engagement,
14 with... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Or family
16 services... [cross-talk]

17 AIXA TORRES: Okay, I don't... [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: ...either one or
19 management.

20 AIXA TORRES: I... okay, well management,
21 unfortunately... my management died last week and so
22 we're in the process of regrouping, we're... they're
23 looking at, you know I guess who they're going to
24 send because they got to be... you know they got to
25 deal with me but more importantly... not with me but

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 with the development and how we, we function,
3 management... the superintendent is now in charge,
4 we've always worked as a team. In fact, on September
5 12th we have a scheduled meeting with management and
6 the executive board and the grievance committee to
7 discuss how we're going to do the rest of the year,
8 you know because we start our new meetings and summer
9 events are over and we basically plan for the year,
10 set up a calendar, you know take all the resident's
11 complaints and they fix them as they can but at the
12 end of the day it's about having money, I mean the
13 Governor needs to release the money, we have like
14 allocated for us 15 million dollars for our... for our,
15 our piping, the pipes in Smith have to be changed
16 inside the structure because it's now... the structure
17 of some of our buildings is beginning to be effected
18 because of the water and, and the constant leakage
19 and so that needs to be released but I mean they... we,
20 we have... we are a pretty good working team, we didn't
21 always agree but there was always the respect about
22 what needed to be done and clear about prioritizing,
23 you know what are the needs, like we didn't come up
24 with the pipes have to be done first and you know I
25 want pretty kitchens, everybody is clear that we need

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE
1 ON MENTAL HEALTH, DISABILITIES AND ADDICTIONS

2 our pipes fixed so that when we spend our own money
3 fixing up our kitchens they won't... we won't have
4 misused our money because they have to break walls
5 down again and so that, that's what I talk about
6 communicating and having a real dialogue.

7 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: Okay, thank
8 you so much. Thank you and so we'll end it there...

9 AIXA TORRES: Okay...

10 CHAIRPERSON AMPRY-SAMUEL: We'll end it
11 there and... and that just goes to show that is a big..
12 is one big family and we really do work together; you
13 know just by evidence of your emotions around your
14 manager. So, thank you so much for your testimony,
15 thank you so much everyone for coming out and so this
16 concludes the Committee on Public Housing and
17 Committee on Mental Health, Disabilities and
18 Addiction hearing, September 4th oversight
19 accessibility in public housing. Thank you.

20 [gavel]

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

September 16, 2019