

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC
SITING AND MARITIME USES

----- X

August 6, 2019
Start: 1:08 p.m.
Recess: 1:44 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Rm, 16th Fl.

B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams - Committee on
Landmarks, Public Siting and
Maritime Uses
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Inez D. Barron
Peter A. Koo
I.Daneek Miller
Mark Treyger

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES 2

A P P E A R A N C E S

Kelly Murphy
School Construction Authority

Gayle Mandaro
School Construction Authority

Lacey Tauber
Housing Preservation and Development

Deborah Whitaker
Housing Preservation and Development

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES 3

1
2 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: [GAVEL] Good afternoon,
3 welcome to this meeting of the Subcommittee on
4 Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses. I am
5 Council Member Adrienne Adams; the Chair of this
6 Subcommittee and we are joined by Council Member Koo
7 as well.

8 Today, we will hold public hearings on the site
9 selection of a new 306- Seat Pre-K Center within a
10 portion of Flushing Meadows Park in Queens and the
11 designation and disposition of property for an Urban
12 Development Action Area Project to develop 41
13 affordable housing units in the East New York
14 neighborhood of Brooklyn.

15 The first item we will hear is Preconsidered
16 Application number 20185509 SCQ submitted by the New
17 York City School Construction Authority pursuant to
18 Section 1732 of the public authorities law for
19 approval of a site selection for a new approximately
20 306-Seat Pre-Kindergarten center to be located on
21 Block 2018, Part of Lot 1 in community school
22 district 21 in Queens. The site is located within a
23 portion of Flushing Meadows Corona Park adjacent to
24 the New York Hall of Science.
25

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES 4

1
2 The New York State Legislature has approved the
3 use of the land for Pre-K, but the land will remain
4 within the jurisdiction and control of the Parks
5 Department subject to a lease.

6 This Pre-Kindergarten will be located in Chair
7 Moya's district. We are now joined by SCA members
8 Kelly Murphy and Gayle Mandaro.

9 Okay, Council, please swear in the panel.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Please raise your right hands
11 and states your names. Can you make sure the
12 microphone is turned on?

13 KELLY MURPHY: Sorry about that. Kelly Murphy.

14 GAYLE MANDARO: Gayle Mandaro.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Do you affirm to tell the truth,
16 the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
17 testimony before this Subcommittee and in response to
18 all Council Member questions?

19 GAYLE MANDARO: I do.

20 KELLY MURPHY: I do.

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you, you may begin.

22 KELLY MURPHY: We will start with an overview of
23 the site, before we get into the formal request of
24 the Council. So, I can't see if I am doing this
25 right here, sorry, it's not in this correctly hold

1 on. I have paper copies; would that be easier?

2 There we go, thank you.

3
4 So, this is just an overview of the site. You
5 can see where the yellow star is, it's where the
6 proposed Pre-K center will be located within Flushing
7 Meadows Corona Park in part of the parking lot and
8 grass area along 111 Street. This is just the
9 proposed site plan where you can see in relation to
10 the Hall of Science and the reconfigured parking that
11 will be part of the project and this is just some
12 images to show. This is really just parking in a
13 non-improved kind of grass area where the proposed
14 Pre-K will be. This is just some more images of that
15 site today or actually, probably a couple of months
16 ago, there is no leaves on the trees.

17 Part of the project, it is within 42,515 square
18 feet is the area that is considered part of the
19 project, but we built on a smaller portion, about
20 35,000 square feet. It will have approximately 306-
21 Seats and contain 17 classrooms, exercise room,
22 pantry, administrative space. And what's interesting
23 about this Pre-K is that it will have a stem focus.
24 So, Department of Education is looking to partner
25

1
2 with community groups to focus on that kind of
3 education at this level.

4 This is just some renderings of the proposed
5 building. This is looking from the west view, so you
6 see the full site with the play yard up front. This
7 is the southeast view of the building. It's about
8 three stories and about 53 feet tall and this is the
9 full view of the site.

10 I will do the formal portion now. So, thank you
11 for having Gayle and I here today. The School
12 Construction Authority has undertaken the site
13 selection process for a new pre-kindergarten facility
14 on a site on Block 2108, portion of Lot 1, within
15 Flushing Meadows Corona Park in the Borough of
16 Queens. The site contains a total of approximately
17 43,516 square feet on a Lot located along 111 Street,
18 between 45th and 46th Avenues.

19 The land in which the proposed Pre-K centers to
20 be located has been approved by the New York State
21 Legislature for this pre-k center use. It's located
22 within the Corona neighborhood within Community
23 District 4 in Queens and Community Education Council
24 24.

1
2 Under the proposed project, the SCA will
3 construct a new approximately 306-Seat Pre-
4 Kindergarten facility. The notice of the following
5 of the site plan was published in the New York Post
6 on June 4, 2018 and the City Record on June 5, 2018
7 and Queen Community Board 4, CEC 24, were all
8 notified of this site plan proposal on June 6, 2018.

9 On June 12, 2018, Community Board 4 held a
10 hearing on the site plan and the City Planning
11 Commission submitted comments in support of this
12 application.

13 The SCA has considered all comments received on
14 the proposed site plan and affirms site plans
15 pursuant to Section 1731 of the Public Authorities
16 Law. In accordance with Section 1732 of the PAL, the
17 SCA submitted the proposed site plan to the Mayor and
18 City Council by letter dated August 2, 2019.

19 I look forward to your comments and questions.

20 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you very much for your
21 testimony today. This is very interesting to me.
22 The site is very interesting, it's a lovely site. We
23 all know Flushing Meadows Corona Park, lovely.
24 Especially Council Member Koo and myself, we are very
25 acquainted.

1
2 Was there ever anything on this area or was it
3 always vacant?

4 KELLY MURPHY: It's partly parking lot that
5 services the Hall of Science and during the summers
6 for the tennis tournament. And then part will just
7 be unimproved kind of grassy area closer to 111
8 Street, where the entrance of the building will be.

9 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Yeah, it's very creative.
10 So, we need to do more of that citywide. If we can
11 just get as creative as we are right here for this
12 site, I think that would be a fantastic thing to do.
13 So, I am going to have my eyes peeled for creative
14 ideas like this also in Southeast Queens if we can
15 do. Was the vote with Community Board 4, was it
16 unanimous?

17 KELLY MURPHY: Actually, there wasn't a vote
18 taken. They had a hearing and they never issued any
19 recommendation at all.

20 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Were there any concerns at
21 all by the Community Board?

22 KELLY MURPHY: They were mostly traffic related.

23 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Sure, traffic and parking and
24 all the usual.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES 9

1
2 KELLY MURPHY: Exactly, I was going to say that a
3 pretty common concern when we site schools.

4 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, and the general feeling
5 that you got from the Board seemed to be pretty
6 positive?

7 KELLY MURPHY: I think there is a great need for
8 the seats in this area. Department of Education has
9 a number of temporary units already around the
10 surrounding schools and play yards actually that are
11 servicing now that this new pre-k will allow those to
12 be removed and play yards back to those primary
13 schools. And these children to be in this brand-new
14 facility.

15 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, great. Council Member
16 Koo, did you have questions?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: No, I have no questions, but
18 this is a wonderful project. I hope you can proceed
19 as soon as possible.

20 KELLY MURPHY: Thank you.

21 GAYLE MANDARO: Thank you very much.

22 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, thank you very much.

23 KELLY MURPHY: Thank you.

24 GAYLE MANDARO: Appreciate it.
25

1
2 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Alright, we're going to call
3 our next panel, if there are no members of the public
4 that wish to testify before we go into the next
5 panel. Okay, seeing none.

6 This public hearing item is now closed. We will
7 call up Gayle Mandaro and Kelly Murphy. Oh, I am
8 sorry, we'll call you back again some day soon. The
9 next item we will hear is Preconsidered Application
10 number C 190286 HAK. The East New York North NCP-
11 UDAAP. The Application was submitted by the
12 Department of Housing Preservation and Development,
13 pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law
14 for the designation of an Urban Development Action
15 Area and the approval of an Urban Development Action
16 area project, and pursuant to Section 197-c of the
17 New York City Charter for the disposition of property
18 located at 190 Essex Street, Block 3956, Lot 59; 227
19 Vermont Street, 225 Vermont Street and 223 Vermont
20 Street, Block 3706, Lots 12, 13, and 14; and 583
21 Belmont Avenue and 581 Belmont Avenue, Block 4012,
22 Lots 32 and 34. These properties are in Council
23 Member Espinal's district in Brooklyn.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES 11

1
2 This Application will facilitate the development
3 of three fully affordable three-story residential
4 buildings providing 41 units of affordable housing.

5 We will call up Lacey Tauber and Deborah
6 Whitaker.

7 Okay, before you begin, Council will swear you
8 in.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Please raise your right hands and
10 state your names.

11 DEBORAH WHITAKER: Deborah Whitaker, sorry, my
12 name is Deborah Whitaker.

13 LACEY TAUBER: Lacey Tauber, HPD.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Do you affirm to tell the truth,
15 the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your
16 testimony before this Subcommittee in response to all
17 Council Member questions?

18 LACEY TAUBER: Yes.

19 DEBORAH WHITAKER: I do.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, you may begin, thank
22 you.

23 LACEY TAUBER: Okay, this Preconsidered item is
24 related to an Application seeing UDAAP designation
25 disposition approval for six city owned vacant lots

1
2 and project approval for a project known as East New
3 York North.

4 The project is located at 190 Essex Street, 223
5 Vermont Street, and 581, 583 Belmont Ave in Brooklyn
6 Council District 37. East New York North is slated
7 for development at our HPD's Neighborhood
8 Construction Program, NCP, which funds infill rental
9 housing projects with up to 45 residential units,
10 affordable to low, moderate, and middle-income
11 households. The development team for East New York
12 North was chosen through a competitive process in
13 April 2017 and proposes to construct three buildings
14 with a total of 41 affordable rental units plus a
15 superintendents unit.

16 The project includes a 12 percent homeless set
17 aside, which is approximately five units for families
18 referred from other social service agencies such as
19 the Department of Homeless Services, DHS.

20 Upon completion, the buildings will be three
21 stories with a total of 22 one-bedroom units and 19
22 two-bedroom units with one, two-bedroom unit for the
23 superintendent.

24 The target incomes for this project will be up to
25 70 percent of the area median income, AMI, with rents

1
2 affordable to families with incomes between 27
3 percent and 67 percent AMI. This is approximately
4 \$481 for a one-bedroom apartment and \$588 for a two-
5 bedroom apartment at the lower income tiers to
6 approximately \$1,281 for a two bedroom and \$1,545 for
7 a two-bedroom apartment at the highest income tier.

8 The buildings will be built to meet enterprise
9 green community standards. Additionally, building
10 amenities will include a laundry room, enclosed bike
11 parking and a recreational yard in all three proposed
12 buildings. In order to facilitate the development of
13 these New York North NCP project, HPD is before the
14 Landmark Subcommittee seeking approval of this land
15 use item.

16 DEBORAH WHITAKER: Thank you. Good afternoon and
17 I bring regrets from our partner Sheila Bennett from
18 East Brooklyn Congregation, she was hoping to be with
19 us this afternoon, but she is under the weather
20 today. So, she sends her regrets.

21 So, this project was certified by City Planning
22 in February and as Lacey has mentioned, we were
23 designated as the development team in 2017. The team
24 includes East Brooklyn Congregations, the Marcal
25 Group, M Lappin & Associates, and we're asking for

1
2 designation as an Urban Development Action Area and
3 disposition of city owned property.

4 So, as I mentioned, East Brooklyn Congregations
5 is one of the managing members, their primary
6 responsibility has been and will be for community
7 outreach. The Marcal Group, also a managing member,
8 will be the general contractor. And M Lappin &
9 Associates is the last managing member and will be
10 doing project management doing predevelopment in the
11 construction phase as well. The architect is DeLa
12 Cour, Ferrara and Church.

13 This map shows the three sites. As you can see,
14 they are a little bit scattered and they are all in
15 Community Board 5 in the Council Member's District.

16 So, the program anticipates 22 one bedroom and 19
17 two-bedroom rental units and the two bedroom for the
18 Super, ranging from 30 percent of area median income
19 affordable up to 70 percent of area median income
20 with a distribution pretty consistently throughout
21 that range. The lowest rent is \$481 up to \$1,549 for
22 the two-bedroom unit at the highest income range and
23 the affordability ranges from \$21,000 in change up to
24 just under \$75,000.

1
2 LACEY TAUBER: I think the PDF didn't load all
3 the way, so I guess we can turn to the print outs.

4 DEBORAH WHITAKER: Yes, our apologies. Perfect,
5 thank you so much. Okay, so, the first development
6 site is 190 Essex Street, which is just south of
7 Fulton on the west side of Essex and we anticipate 15
8 rental units and just over 13,000 of zoning floor
9 area. This is the aerial view. This is a rendering
10 of the building 9 one bedrooms, 6 two bedrooms and
11 this is our site plan. You will see the Lot is
12 irregular shaped and so, the building itself is also
13 a little bit irregular. It's barbell shaped, which
14 allows us a couple of court yards, which will bring
15 in greenery and some light and air. And then, there
16 is a recreational rear yard for the tenants use and
17 the front of the building matches the front of the
18 adjacent buildings and the front door is a little
19 pulled back to give a little bit of privacy there.

20 This is our ground floor plan. You will see the
21 utilities and storage, and such is in the front of
22 the building toward the street and then, most of the
23 residential units are toward the rear.

24 The next site is at 223-227 Vermont Street.
25 Again, 3 stories, 11 units and just over 10,000

1 zoning square feet. It's on Vermont between Liberty
2 and Glenmore.
3

4 This is the rendering; 5 one bedrooms, 6 two-
5 bedroom units. In here is our site plan, the main
6 entrance to the building is on the south side of the
7 building in an entry way off Vermont and you will see
8 also the rear yard which is a garden area for the
9 residents use. And the front of the building is
10 pulled back a little from the street to add a little
11 bit of privacy there.

12 This is our first-floor plan and you will see
13 there are two access ways to the rear yard. There is
14 a vestibule in the center of the building that goes
15 out to the garden area as well as, the entry area
16 from the street will also go back to the garden area
17 but there will be a gate at the street level.

18 The utilities also, are on the ground floor and
19 then a couple of residential units as well.

20 And this is our third site at 581 Belmont; 3
21 stories, 15 units and just over 12,000 zoning square
22 feet. It's at the corner of Belmont Avenue and
23 Schenck Avenue.

24 Here, you will see the rendering 8 one bedroom, 8
25 two-bedroom units and this is where we would plan for

1
2 the Super to be, because it's central to the other
3 properties.

4 And, here is our site plan. You will see that
5 we've pulled it back a little bit from the corner and
6 at the street and have plantings and such along the
7 street to give some buffer and then there is a garden
8 area in the backs of the buildings for residence use.

9 Here is our ground floor plan and the access to
10 the garden area will be through a vestibule on the
11 north side of the building, and the main entrance is
12 along Belmont on the southern side.

13 So, a quick couple of highlights about our
14 economic development plans. EBC and the Marcal Group
15 will work with a local workforce development partners
16 to refer candidates to the GC and subcontractors for
17 hiring. We plan to post open positions with NYCHA's
18 Resident Economic Empowerment and Sustainability
19 Department and EBC has a long history of hiring local
20 for the residential properties that it does own and
21 manage. Well, it doesn't directly manage, but the
22 buildings that it owns and EBC will conduct community
23 outreach during the rent up to meet the Community
24 Board set asides.

1
2 And lastly, like I would assume, most if not all
3 of HPD's programs, HPD will establish an MWBE goal
4 for contracting and our general contractor, the
5 Marcal Group has a history of using MWBE's for
6 expediting and security, but it will also solicit
7 MWBE bids for other trades; framing, plumbing,
8 electric, insulation, sheetrock, painting and
9 flooring, among other things.

10 And lastly, to summarize again, three 3-story
11 residential buildings with 41 rental units, plus a
12 two-bedroom Super's unit. All of the buildings will
13 have bike storage enclosed, laundry rooms and
14 recreational gardens in the rear yards and we're
15 working at this point with the enterprise community
16 to develop a community health action plan centered
17 around health food choices and health eating and
18 gardening.

19 So, our timeline here is we are anticipating with
20 the Council's approval of course, completing ULURP
21 shortly and then closing toward the end of this
22 calendar year and then construction start immediately
23 thereafter with completion late 2021 and lease up
24 late 2021, early 2022.

1
2 So, we would be happy to take any questions and
3 thank you again for your consideration.

4 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you for your testimony
5 today. Thank you very much. We've been joined by
6 Council Member Barron.

7 Just to get a flavor of how the community feels
8 about these development sites going up, how these
9 sites are going up. Can you just give us a flavor of
10 the reception by the local community boards when it
11 came to bringing these projects before them?

12 DEBORAH WHITAKER: Well, I can tell you that we
13 did receive a letter of support from the Council
14 Member. We also submitted our proposal to the
15 Community Board, and we met with the Community Board
16 early on, you know, before we started the ULURP
17 process and they were receptive. And then, we were
18 scheduled to present but the Community Board wasn't
19 able to fill the quorum. So, I am not aware of any
20 comments.

21 So, my HPD partners are saying they did not
22 receive any comments from the Community Board.

23 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, do we know if this was
24 voted out of the Community Board? How the votes
25 might have gone? No, it wasn't voted on.

1 LACEY TAUBER: It was not.

2 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Okay, okay, are there any
3 questions Council Members?
4

5 Okay, we just talked just a little bit. Okay, we
6 will just pause for a couple seconds. Thank you,
7 just bear with us.

8 Okay, thank you for your patience. Were there
9 questions Council Members? Okay, thank you very much
10 for your testimony today. We appreciate your time.

11 LACEY TAUBER: Thank you.

12 DEBORAH WHITAKER: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Consistent with the effected
14 Council Member's recommendations, we will now vote to
15 approve the Preconsidered Applications related to the
16 siting of a 360-Seat Pre-Kindergarten in Flushing
17 Meadows Corona Park, Application number 20185509 SCQ
18 and the East New York NCP-UDAAP Application number C
19 190286 HAK. We will also vote to approve L.U.'s 477
20 and 478 related to the 201-207 7th Avenue project.
21 These applications which we heard at our July 16th
22 meeting will facilitate a mixed-use development
23 containing approximately 26 affordable cooperative
24 residential units and commercial space in the
25 Speakers District in Manhattan.

SUBCOMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, PUBLIC SITING AND
MARITIME USES 21

1
2 I now call for a vote to approve L.U.'s 447 and
3 478 and Preconsidered L.U.'s related to applications
4 20185509 SCQ and C 190286 HAK. Council, please call
5 the roll.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

7 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: I vote Aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote Aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote Aye.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: By a vote of three in the
13 affirmative, zero in the negative, and zero
14 abstentions, the items are recommended for referral
15 the Land Use Community.

16 CHAIRPERSON ADAMS: Thank you and this concludes
17 today's business. I would like to thank the members
18 of the public, my colleagues, Council, and Land use
19 staff for attending today's hearing. This meeting is
20 hereby adjourned. [GAVEL]

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 1, 2018