



March 13, 2025
Testimony of Commissioner Lillian Bonsignore, FDNY
“Preliminary Budget Hearing for Fiscal Year 2027”

Good morning Chair Ariola and members of the Fire & Emergency Management Committee.

My name is Lillian Bonsignore and I am pleased to appear before you today to discuss the preliminary budget for the Fire Department. I am joined by First Deputy Commissioner Daniel Flynn; Chief of Department John Esposito; Chief of EMS Paul Miano; Deputy Commissioner of Management and Budget Lizette Christoff; Chief of Fire Operations Kevin Woods, Chief of Fire Prevention Thomas Currao, and Associate Commissioner of Workforce Development Nafeesah Noonan.

This is my first budget hearing as Fire Commissioner, so I would like to begin by telling you a little bit about my background. In 2022, I retired after 31 years as a member of EMS, including serving as Chief of EMS during the COVID-19 pandemic. It is an extraordinary honor for me to serve as Commissioner of this Department. I say that not just because it is the greatest Fire Department in the world – and it is – but because serving this Department as Commissioner gives me a chance to pay it back for the tremendous opportunities that I’ve experienced over more than three decades.

Joining EMS saved my life. As a teenager, I was directionless. I didn’t know what to do for a career and I wasn’t certain how I would overcome the challenges in my life. I found EMS and it

quickly became part of my identity. Public service is a calling for me. I am proud to be the Commissioner of this agency because I know that public service is a calling for thousands of members of the FDNY.

It takes a massive team effort to keep this City safe, and I thank the members of this Committee for your support, your interest, and your attention to our issues. I know that you see our members the same way that I see them: as heroes. There are heroes in every EMS station and every firehouse. There are heroes sitting behind dispatch computers and out conducting inspections and investigations. They are undertaking complicated plan reviews and analyzing finances and working to repair our facilities and keep our fleet on the road. They are on trucks and in ambulances and on boats and sitting at desks, and when the city experiences brutal heat waves or long stretches of Code Blue conditions, many FDNY personnel are outside in the conditions making sure that the job gets done.

This September, the FDNY will mark the 25-year anniversary of the darkest date in our history. September 11th was a day of immense loss for the Department. 343 FDNY members made the ultimate sacrifice while working to rescue their fellow New Yorkers. As this committee knows well, that sacrifice has continued in the decades since. We have now lost 431 individuals to 9/11 illness, and countless more struggle with diseases as a result of time spent at the site. On the 25th anniversary, we will solemnly honor the sacrifice of those members and the sacrifice of their families – as we do every day.

I responded to the World Trade Center on September 11th. I know how difficult it can be difficult to look back. Each anniversary tugs at old wounds that never quite healed. But it also serves as a reminder of the duty and the mission that we carried out 25 years ago and that we still carry out each day. We honor the memory of those we have lost by laying the foundation for those to come. In 2026, we are stronger, better prepared, and more resilient than we were 25 years ago. My focus as Fire Commissioner is continuing to drive this agency forward, strengthening our resources and improving our ability to serve the people of New York. I am committed to making sure that we have the best equipment and the best infrastructure. To training, educating, and preparing our members. To modernizing our approach to operations on the fireground, on medical responses, and in all the myriad ways that members of the FDNY interact with our fellow citizens.

One of the ways that I would like to set the agency on a successful course for the future is by addressing the enormous challenge of EMS pay. This year marks the 30th anniversary of the merger of EMS with the Fire Department. Those three decades have been marked by bravery and heroism and countless lives saved, and the City has always counted on EMS during times of great need. FDNY EMTs and paramedics shepherded the City through a global pandemic, and they face a skyrocketing call volume and a need for their skills like never before. It is time to pay them a living wage – a salary that allows them to do their incredible lifesaving work and provide for their families. As this committee knows, the authority to collectively bargain wages for City employees including EMTs and paramedics lies with the Office of Labor Relations, not the Fire Department. As Fire Commissioner, I believe in parity, and I will tirelessly advocate for their pay increases to the very best of my ability.

2025 was a busy year for the Department. We responded to more than 25,000 structural fires and more than 14,000 non-structural fires. We responded to more than 1.6 million emergency medical incidents. Of those, more than 600,000 were life-threatening emergencies. We also performed nearly 1 million patient transports to hospitals. I am happy to report that fire fatalities were down. 2022 and 2023 were years with the greatest number fire deaths in decades, with 97 and 104 deaths, respectively. In 2024, that number decreased to 77, and last year, it decreased again to 62.

One component of the drop in fire deaths is that deaths resulting from fires that were caused by lithium-ion batteries decreased from a high of 18 in 2023 to only 1 death last year. We attribute that positive development to changes in the laws regarding lithium-ion batteries – including bills passed by this committee – and to our extensive outreach and education campaigns. In 2024, the Department’s campaign to raise awareness of the dangers of lithium-ion batteries produced 83 million impressions across social media and targeted ads. In 2025, the campaign reached another 36 million impressions. The public has heard our messaging about safe use of these devices and, where possible, is storing and charging them outside.

2025 was a busy year for FDNY’s Recruitment and Retention team. Firefighter exam #4044 was established in February. It produced a diverse list of more than 20,000 candidates who passed, including 22% Black, 28% Hispanic, 40% White, and 6% Asian. 7% of the candidates who passed the exam were women. We are eager to begin processing and we anticipate the first group from this class will enter the Fire Academy in the fall.

Across the country, it is an incredibly difficult environment right now for EMS recruiting, and New York City is no exception. Our two most recent EMS recruitment campaigns produced a high number of applicants but not as many viable candidates as we would have hoped. We continue to work on enhancing our communication and programming efforts to assist applicants with the process and reduce attrition within the applicant pool, and we have adjusted our recruitment campaign schedule to begin in June this year. In this way, we hope to maintain an active talent pool that will translate to more EMTs being hired by the Department. I'm on record about how much I have loved working as a member of EMS. When you have the opportunity, please encourage your constituents to consider a career with our team.

It was also one of our busiest years ever for educational outreach to the community. FDNY members made 3,245 safety presentations to audiences totaling more than half a million New Yorkers. That included more than 1,400 events in schools to more than 218,000 students. The Mobile CPR team trained more than 116,000 people how to conduct compressions-only CPR, including more than 38,000 high school students. And in late 2025, we launched FDNY's new Control the Bleed campaign, teaching people lifesaving skills to ensure that everyday citizens can respond with confidence when faced with critical situations involving life-threatening bleeding. First responders get to the scene as quickly as possible, but through these trainings, we're equipping communities with tools to act even before help arrives.

We also continued our partnership with the American Red Cross to install smoke alarms and work with members of the community to develop plans to stay safe during a fire. In 2025, this

partnership installed more than 12,000 smoke alarms, bringing the total number of alarms installed since the beginning of this program in 2015 to more than 300,000 smoke alarms. With the generous support of the FDNY Foundation and its partners, we continue to expand our outreach, reaching New Yorkers where they live, work, and attend school, arming them with information and training to keep themselves and their neighbors safe.

Another first for the Department in the last year is that we issued our first ever criminal summons following a fatal fire in which a fire hydrant was blocked by a vehicle. The Department's Bureau of Fire Prevention continues to use this tool at fatal and multiple-alarm fires. We appreciate the councilmembers on this committee who remind their constituents – if you block a hydrant, you may delay fire operations. If the possibility of endangering your neighbors isn't reason enough to avoid this, now you may be fined up to \$5,000.

After experiencing an historic spike in brush fires in 2024, last year we installed for the first time brush fire detection cameras in select City Parks. These solar-powered cameras are positioned high above the ground like traffic cameras. They use artificial intelligence to detect smoke and flame activity, providing live video feeds to the Fire Department Operations Command Center.

In the Mayor's Preliminary FY27 budget, the Department's budget is approximately \$2.6 billion. This budget is aimed at rectifying historical shortfalls. It includes \$62 million in FY26 to fund the projected OTPS (Other Than Personnel Spending) shortfall in the current year. It also includes \$120 million in FY26, \$57 million in FY27, and additional amounts in out-years to

make up for existing personnel funding deficits. By making up these shortfalls, this budget puts the agency on stronger financial footing moving forward.

I'm thrilled to be your Fire Commissioner, and I'm excited about all the work that we're going to be doing together to help improve the lives of our members and the people of New York. With your help, we can ensure that the Fire Department is set up for success and continues providing the best possible level of service to our city. I would be happy to answer your questions at this time.



Testimony of Commissioner Christina Farrell
New York City Department of Emergency Management
Preliminary Budget Hearing
March 13, 2026

Good morning Chair Ariola and members of the City Council. I am Christina Farrell and it is my pleasure to be here today, at my first hearing as Commissioner of the New York City Emergency Management Department, to testify on the preliminary budget. I am joined today by our Chief Financial Officer Christopher Blanco.

I am very honored to be here, newly appointed as the Commissioner of the agency, and the first Commissioner appointed internally, with decades of experience as an emergency manager for the City of New York. We are standing at a moment of change as the city, state, and federal landscapes are in their own moments of transition and I am excited to be here to meet the moment. I greatly look forward to leading the agency through these transitions and to continuing my work and partnership with City Council as I do so. I have always greatly valued our friendship and collaboration – as you all know, whole community is necessary for successful management of emergencies and that will remain a core focus of mine as Commissioner.

NYC Emergency Management has a big mission. We lead the development of the City's emergency plans and the coordination of multiagency responses to emergencies, educate the public about preparedness, and advance long-term initiatives that reduce risk and increase the resiliency of New York City. Today, New York City faces more frequent and complex emergencies and disasters due to climate change, social and economic inequity, aging infrastructure, reliance on technology, cyber threats, domestic terrorism, and more.

Emergency Management is the City's go-to-leader for solving complex problems – issues that cannot be solved easily or quickly, and that cannot be solved by one entity alone, such as COVID-19 or the influx of asylum seekers. Our planners write and maintain dozens of plans for varied emergencies: chemical, biological, radiological, and nuclear hazards; coastal storms; transit strikes; power disruptions; flash floods; and winter weather, among other hazards. Our public warning specialists issue thousands of public safety messages and emergency alerts in multiple languages every year to keep New Yorkers informed. Our logisticians manage the City's resource request process to source and strategically allocate critical supplies like generators. This work saves lives, protects neighborhoods, and reduces disaster costs to New Yorkers and the city.

Over the past five years, Emergency Management's roles and responsibilities have expanded. Since January 2022, the agency has managed 68 Emergency Operations Center activations, 38 of which were simultaneous with other incidents. This trend toward the city experiencing more emergency incidents with a greater need for consequence management continues to accelerate. In the first eight weeks of 2026 alone, Emergency Management managed five large-scale emergency activations. This included a January 2026 snowstorm and a February 2026 snowstorm which was the largest snowfall in the city in the past decade; prolonged extreme cold; a weeks-long New York State Nurses Association strike; an Emergency Fuel Task Force activation; and multiple major fires – all with overlapping timelines.



Summer 2026 will bring an unprecedented convergence of global and national events to the New York City region, including eight FIFA World Cup matches, alongside major celebrations such as America250, Fleet Week, and the International Naval Review. These high-profile activities, expected to draw over 1.6 million visitors, coincide with annual events like Pride and the National Puerto Rico Day Parade and heightened seasonal risks like heat, flash flooding, and power disruptions. Emergency Management's role is coordination across multiple partners, fostering collaboration to minimize disruptions, strengthen community engagement, and maximize resources.

Emergency Management is staffed by more than 250 dedicated professionals with diverse backgrounds and areas of expertise. Nearly everyone at Emergency Management has two roles: their day-to-day role and their emergency activation role. This duality of roles is unique in City government, and the model allows the agency to respond rapidly to citywide emergencies while maintaining continuity of operations, minimizing overtime, and reducing reliance on consultants or surge staffing contracts. Since emergencies always take precedence, thousands of staff hours normally dedicated to key preparedness work like managing the City's Emergency Supply Stockpile and updating emergency plans were diverted to response activities in the last year alone.

With that, let me now provide a snapshot of our budget for next fiscal year.

Our projected total Fiscal Year 2027 City Tax Levy expense budget is \$39.6 million. We rely on our City Tax Levy expense budget to support the agency's administrative, technological and operational costs.

The projected Fiscal Year 2027 City Tax Levy Personnel Services budget is \$13.9 million, which supports the 93 personnel lines paid directly through our tax levy funds. This includes \$1.2 million in funding for 16 staff members dedicated to working on increasing communication and services to people with disabilities, access and functional needs, as well as funding for personnel overtime to support the upcoming World Cup preparation and response activities

Our projected Fiscal Year 2027 City Tax Levy Other Than Personnel Services budget \$25.7 million which covers all agency operating and administrative costs. This budget includes a significant portion of nondiscretionary funding. These funds are designated to cover our warehouse lease, utilities, and telecommunications costs including the maintenance and operations of our Emergency Operations Center and backup facilities. This money also supports our fleet and all additional equipment, supplies, and materials needed to run the agency. This also includes funding for World Cup support for public information and language access.

The agency receives grant funding to support many of our core programs. In the past year, we secured \$36.2 million in federal funding, primarily through homeland security funding. This funding is vital to our ability to run many of our initiatives, including the Ready New York public education program, Community Emergency Response Team program, Continuity of Operations Program, Geographic Information Systems, Training and Exercises, Watch Command and Response, and Citywide Incident Management System planning, and the Emergency Supply Stockpile. The impact of cuts to federal spending and the federal workforce, especially at FEMA and other federal agencies we depend upon, should not be underestimated. Federal grants make up



the majority of NYCEM's budget, with 62% of our agency's budgeted headcount supported by federal funds.

New York City has still yet to receive our Homeland Security Grant funding awards from FEMA. Despite commitments from the President on social media and reporting in the press that the City's award would fully be restored to prior year levels, the Federal government has not followed through on this commitment. The award as it currently stands totals \$133M, which represents an \$87M or a 40% cut to the program for New York State. NYCEM anticipates a reduction of upwards of \$8M though DHSES has not yet issued the final award. This would result in significant impacts to critical programs during a time when we are coordinating the World Cup, America 250, the 25th anniversary of 9/11, and at an increasing time of rising global tensions and negativity towards the United States. We will continue to work with City Hall, OMB, the City's congressional delegation, and our partner agencies to push for full funding.

I would like to close by expressing my admiration for our dedicated emergency managers. They accomplish their roles with exemplary professionalism and service to their city. I am honored to be leading this agency, and I know that the expert team at New York City Emergency Management will continue to set the model for what emergency management should be. Thank you for the opportunity to testify today. I look forward to working with the Council and I am happy to answer your questions.





Uniformed Emergency Medical Service Officers Union

Local 3621, DC37, FDNY, NYS-PEC, AFSCME, AFL-CIO

In a system where minutes matter – we have a system that is completely out of balance and teetering on the brink of collapse. *Without change, EMS simply cannot keep up.*

New Yorkers must know that it is now more deadly in our city if you or your loved one suffers a heart attack, life threatening illness, serious accidents or fall. *Health and emergency care in our city is in serious jeopardy. The survival rate from a cardiac arrest is at an all-time low. (17%)*

This crisis didn't happen overnight; it's been long time in the making, with years of neglect and bad decisions. This mayor didn't cause it, and neither did this Council. In fact, this Council has been an advocate for EMS over the years and we want to thank you for your effort and help, and we know that this Mayor is committed to equity, affordability and fairness. Pay equity is an affordability issue.

We come to you today, to again ask for your help. While these issues go far beyond collective bargaining and will take more to fix them, it does not help that our three EMS unions have been out of a labor contract for four years.

Emergency medical care for New Yorkers must be a priority. We ask you to help us do what's best for our city and prioritize this issue because it is literally a matter of life and death. We need to adequately compensate and resource our EMS First Responders, so that they can properly protect the people of our city during an emergency.

In prior years this body has proposed budget increases in excess of \$50 million to do so. We ask that this Council again ensure that the budget includes the proper funding to increase the number of EMS and decrease the turnover rate that is at an all-time high, and to ensure pay equity for our members, something this body has been fighting for along with us for many years.

Thank you.

Respectfully,

Vincent Variale

President



Founders

Vernice Miller-Travis
Peggy M. Shepard
Chuck Sutton

Board of Directors

Chair

Jeff Jones

Vice-Chair

Ken P. Mak

Secretary

Nancy Anderson, Ph.D.

Treasurer

Neetin Gulati, Esq.

Members

David Evans, Ph.D.
Abiola Fasehun, Esq.
Eric A. Goldstein, Esq.
Christy Loper
Sarangi Iyengar
Ken Mak
Crystal Romeo Upperman
Margot Brown, Ph.D.
Basil Seggos
Tamara Toles O’Laughlin
Carlos Talero
Anne Weisberg
Vernice Miller-Travis

Advisory Member

Charles Lee

Executive Director

Peggy M. Shepard



March 13th, 2026

WE ACT for Environmental Justice Recommendations to the Committee on Fire and Emergency Management on Cooling Center Operations in the FY ‘27 Budget

Dear Committee Chair Ariola, and Committee on Fire and Emergency Management,

WE ACT for Environmental Justice is a community-based organization that has been building healthy communities by ensuring that people of color and/or low-income residents participate meaningfully in the creation of sound and fair environmental health policies and practices for over 35 years.

In 2023, WE ACT convened the Extreme Heat Coalition to extend the impact of our Heat, Health, and Equity Initiative, which centered on mitigation, adaptation, and resiliency to increasing climate change-related threats of extreme heat for low-income communities and communities of color. The Coalition has members with diverse expertise, ranging from tenant rights, public health, disaster preparedness, and environmental law to climate justice. Together, we are mobilizing to ensure urban low income communities facing extreme heat vulnerability are protected through policy, adaptation planning, and resilient infrastructure interventions that advance health equity.

It is with this mission in mind that we urge this Council to prioritize expanding Cooling Center hours of operation in the most heat vulnerable neighborhoods. With the passage of Local Law 128 of 2025, the City has made notable strides toward closing gaps in coverage in the Cooling Center program. Local Law 128 calls for amending the City Charter to codify the program. Further, it requires no fewer than 7 cooling centers per 100,000 residents, where practicable. When determining where to locate cooling centers in the city, the NYCEM Commissioner must consider factors such as areas in which vulnerable populations reside as well as the heat vulnerability index. As the program currently stands, there is no dedicated funding for the program to respond to the evolving needs of community members during chronic heat exposure or extreme heat emergencies. As the [Department of Health and Mental Hygiene’s Annual Heat Mortality Report](#) states, “lack of access to home air conditioning (AC) is the most important risk factor for heat-stress death.” In the interim of lowering the cost of housing and energy so that every resident is able to achieve safe temperatures at home, Cooling Centers will continue to be a vital strategy to combat heat stress and mortality. According to the [Global Heat Health Information Network](#), 2-3 hours of cooling each day at minimum are recommended to prevent heat stress. With this in mind, Cooling Centers should maximize their availability to New Yorkers during extreme heat events. There is no guarantee the most vulnerable



residents will have viable cooling alternatives outside of the Cooling Center program, as many air-conditioned spaces are private or commercial. Access to cooling at work is not a given, since common-sense protections as outlined in the [Temperature Extreme Mitigation Program Act](#) have not been enacted by the State legislature. Given the new legislative commitment and the urgent public health case for the program, Cooling Centers require an investment to truly deliver on their promise of functioning as equitable heat emergency facilities.

The next natural step is to address access to Cooling Centers by allocating funding for them to extend their hours. Analysis by the New York City Independent Budget Office illustrates a stark contrast between Cooling Center operating hours for both evenings and weekends when compared to regular business hours during weekdays.

Figure 18: Number of Sites Open by Day of Week

Day of Week	Sites Closed by 6pm	Sites Open Late	Total Sites
Monday	351	267	618
Tuesday	350	267	617
Wednesday	352	265	617
Thursday	351	266	617
Friday	350	260	610
Saturday	31	248	279
Sunday	5	123	128
Both Saturday and Sunday	4	122	126

Source: NYCEM Cooling Center Data (Summer 2024)

New York City Independent Budget Office [Cooling Centers: How NYC Beats the Heat](#), 2025

According to data from the [Department of Environmental Conservation’s Hottest Hours maps](#), temperatures reaching their peak typically occur between 2-5pm in many neighborhoods. While several locations stay open until 6pm, the hottest hours in the day overlap with rush hour traffic. Researchers have linked high ambient temperatures to [increased risk of motor vehicle crashes](#), which can delay bus travel times to cooling centers and threaten pedestrian safety. Active transportation, waiting on train platforms, and at (especially unshaded) bus stops, also increase heat exposure. The Office of Emergency Management (NYCEM) should be resourced enough to ensure its host partners are able to remain open during and a few hours after this window. We propose NYCEM should receive a budget allocation of an additional \$1.2M in the City’s operating budget to establish a fund that covers the cost of staffing overtime hours for Libraries and Older Adult Centers, the most commonly used Cooling Center types. This figure accounts for



extending evening hours in HVI score 5 neighborhoods with locations that close by 6pm assuming a NYCEM coordinates with these locations planning for a 50th Percentile NPCC4 Heatwave projection scenario.

Funding for emergency operations is part of a critical strategy to protect New Yorkers most vulnerable to climate change while advancing the City's commitments to environmental justice, public health, and affordability. Expanding Cooling Center hours will save lives during extreme heat events and reduce the risk of overwhelming our emergency room capacity. By prioritizing these recommendations in the FY 2026–27 budget, the City Council can move beyond piecemeal responses and deliver durable, equitable solutions that safeguard frontline communities today while building a more resilient New York City for the future.

Sincerely,

Caleb Smith
New York City Policy Manager
WE ACT for Environmental Justice
caleb.smith@weact.org | 646-983-7288

**Testimony of Michelle Fleurantin, Environmental Justice Staff Attorney at New York
Lawyers for the Public Interest, to the New York City Council Committee on Fire and
Emergency Management Budget Hearing on
March 13, 2026, regarding the New York City FY27 Budget**

My name is Michelle Fleurantin and I am a Staff Attorney in the Environmental Justice Program at New York Lawyers for the Public Interest (NYLPI). Thank you Chair Ariola and members of the Council for the opportunity to testify today. I am here today to urge the committee to make sure the fire department has the funding needed to continue ensuring battery storage is safely installed and inspected across the City.

NYLPI is part of the PEAK Coalition, a campaign to replace New York City's dirty, expensive peaker plants with clean renewable energy and battery storage. Peakers are aging, inefficient fossil fuel-fired plants that run on the hottest and coldest days when energy demand spikes. They emit high levels of harmful pollution and impose tremendous human and financial costs—costs that fall hardest on the communities of color living closest to these facilities. Replacing peakers is not only an environmental necessity, but a public-health imperative and an essential step towards lowering rising household energy costs.

Battery energy storage systems (BESS) are a vital component of any plan to shut down peakers. Renewable energy is abundant, but not constant—the sun doesn't always shine, and the wind doesn't always blow. At this moment, there is no other proven, scalable alternative that would allow our city to shutter its peakers. Rejecting or delaying BESS means condemning already overburdened communities to years more of fossil-fuel pollution, respiratory illness, and preventable early deaths.

At NYLPI, we work directly with residents in environmental justice communities who *want* community-scale BESS because they understand what is at stake. Community-scale BESS will help deliver bill savings, improved health outcomes, and more reliable electrical grids. In places like the South Bronx—a community long overburdened by polluting infrastructure, high asthma rates, blackouts and brownouts, and ever-rising utility bills—residents are calling for BESS projects to shut down peakers, improve local environmental health conditions, strengthen grid reliability, and lower their energy bills.

As you know, FDNY provides comprehensive guidance, robust safety standards, and review processes that make New York City the leader in battery site safety in the country. The more BESS projects move forward, the more FDNY's workload will grow. So, for FDNY to continue its great work deploying this clean energy technology across the city, we must ensure FDNY has the resources and staffing necessary to meet this task. We thank the committee for supporting the FDNY in carrying out their goals to ensure community safety and urge the committee to ensure

robust funding and support to allow the FDNY to continue doing its exemplary work.

New York Lawyers for the Public Interest
151 West 30th Street, 11th floor
New York, NY 10001
mfleurantin@nylpi.org

For 50 years, NYLPI has fought to protect civil rights and achieve lived equality for communities in need. Led by community priorities, we pursue health, immigrant, disability, and environmental justice. NYLPI combines the power of law, organizing, and the private bar to make lasting change where it's needed most.

For more information visit: www.nylpi.org



New York Lawyers for the Public Interest, Inc.
151 West 30th Street, 11th Floor
New York, NY 10001-4017
Tel: 212-244-4664
Fax: 212-244-4570
TTY: 212-244-3692
www.nylpi.org

**Testimony of
William Juhn, Senior Staff Attorney
on behalf of
The Disability Justice Program
at New York Lawyers for the Public Interest
before the
Council of the City of New York
Committee on Fire and Emergency Management
March 13, 2026**

My name is William Juhn and I am a Senior Staff Attorney with the Disability Justice Program at New York Lawyers for the Public Interest (“NYLPI”). I thank you for the opportunity to present testimony today regarding mental health and substance use in New York City.

NYLPI is deeply concerned about the City’s dangerous and illegal practices relating to the involuntary removal of individuals perceived to have mental illness diagnoses for psychiatric evaluation. We also oppose the Behavioral Health Emergency Assistance Response Division (“B-HEARD”) pilot in its current guise as it is deeply flawed and diverts resources desperately needed for a true non-police response to mental health crisis into a program that continues the criminalization of disability. NYLPI urges the City Council to mandate significant changes to B-HEARD so that it dispatches teams of peers—individuals with lived mental health experience—and emergency medical technicians (EMTs) who are not City employees, operates 24/7, routes calls through 988, and above all, prioritizes the self-determination of people with mental disabilities.

Fully revamping our mental health and social service delivery system could not be more critical as New York City faces a \$16 billion deficit, and New Yorkers must deal with unaffordable housing, rising health care premiums, Medicaid cuts, unlivable wages, increasing gun violence, the worsening effects of climate change, and fears of global war. These stressors will lead to more mental health crises if we are not doing everything in our power to guard against that.

THE CITY MUST WHOLLY TRANSFORM ITS RESPONSE TO MENTAL HEALTH CRISES BY ELIMINATING POLICE AND REPLACING THEM WITH A PEER-LED HEALTH RESPONSE

Our current mental health crisis response system is not working, and this is what Black and Brown communities, people with disabilities, families in crisis, civil rights attorneys and other advocates have been saying for years. It is too limited, too under-resourced, and too intertwined with policing to deliver real services. And lives are being lost.

Despite the City's claims, B-HEARD is not a true non-police model. Most mental health calls are still routed through 911 and to the NYPD. During the 2025 NYC Comptroller audit period, more than 13,000 calls eligible for a health-based response did not receive one.¹ That means thousands of New Yorkers in crisis instead encountered a police response.

At the same time, response times for mental health crisis calls have more than doubled in recent years, increasing from 12 minutes to more than 26 minutes, according to the New York City Independent Budget Office earlier this year.² The median response time has also increased over this period, from just over 10 minutes to almost 16 minutes. When someone is in crisis, minutes matter.

¹ N.Y.C. Comptroller, Audit of the Behavioral Health Emergency Assistance Response Division's Effectiveness in Responding to Individuals with Mental Health Crises and Meeting Its Goals (2025),

<https://comptroller.nyc.gov/reports/audit-of-the-behavioral-health-emergency-assistance-response-divisions-effectiveness-in-responding-to-individuals-with-mental-health-crises-and-meeting-its-goals/#detailed-findings>

²N.Y.C. Indep. Budget Off., Tracking B-HEARD's Response to Mental Health Crises (Jan. 29, 2026),

<https://www.ibo.nyc.gov/content/publications/2026-january-from-dispatch-to-door-step>

The City must join other cities across the country – including Los Angeles, San Francisco, Albuquerque, Denver, New Haven, and many more – to **remove police** entirely from the equation, and **ensure that healthcare workers respond to healthcare crises**. According to [joint-research](#) by NYLPI and Human Rights Watch, there are at least 160+ emergency response programs nationwide that engage in crisis response activities without police as the initial responders or as automatic co-responders.

Closer to home, New York State is already taking action. The state legislators are working to pass a bill known as Daniel’s Law (S3670 / A4617), which would establish a statewide emergency and crisis response system where police are no longer the default first responders to health emergencies. Under Daniel’s Law, the state will only fund emergency response plans where peers and independent EMTs control the response to a health emergency, and the role of police would be strictly limited to situations involving imminent risk of serious physical harm. The bill currently has over 60 sponsors in the Assembly and the Senate.

Likewise, the City must establish a system whereby individuals who experience a mental health crisis receive appropriate services which will de-escalate the crisis and which will ensure their wellbeing and the wellbeing of all other New Yorkers. Only those who are trained in de-escalation practices should respond to a mental health crisis, and the most appropriate individuals to receive such training are health care providers and peers.³ Police officers, who are trained to uphold law and order, are not suited to deal with individuals experiencing mental health crises, and New York’s history of its police killing 24 individuals who were experiencing crises in the

³ See Bazelon Center for Mental Health Law, “When There’s a Crisis, Call a Peer: How People With Lived Experience Make Mental Health Crisis Services More Effective,” (2024), <https://www.bazelon.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/01/Bazelon-When-Theres-a-Crisis-Call-A-Peer-full-01-03-24.pdf>; Martha Williams Deane, *et al.*, “Emerging Partnerships between Mental Health and Law Enforcement,” *Psychiatric Services* (1999), http://ps.psychiatryonline.org/doi/abs/10.1176/ps.50.1.99?url_ver=Z39.88-2003&rfr_id=ori%3Arid%3Aacrossref.org&rfr_dat=cr_pub%3Dpubmed&#/doi/abs/10.1176/ps.50.1.99?url_ver=Z39.88-2003&rfr_id=ori%3Arid%3Aacrossref.org&rfr_dat=cr_pub%3Dpubmed.

last ten years alone⁴, is sad testament to that. Eliminating the police as mental health crisis responders has been shown to result in quicker recovery from crises, greater connections with long-term healthcare services and other community resources, and averting future crises.⁵

The scores of people experiencing mental health crises who have died at the hands of the police over the years is a microcosm of the police brutality around the world. Disability is disproportionately prevalent in the Black community and other communities of color,⁶ and individuals who are shot and killed by the police when experiencing mental health crises are disproportionately Black and other people of color. The City Council simply cannot stand by while the killings continue. Now is the time to remove the police as responders to mental health crises. Lives are literally at stake.

[Correct Crisis Intervention Today – NYC](#) has developed the needed antidote. Modeled on the [CAHOOTS](#) program in Oregon, which has successfully operated for over 35 years without *any* serious injuries to respondents or responders – let alone deaths -- the CCIT-NYC proposal⁷ -- upon which Daniel’s Law is based -- is positioned to make non-police responses available to those experiencing mental health crises in New York City. The proposal avoids the enormous pitfalls of the City’s B-HEARD pilot, which the City inaccurately refers to as a non-police model.

THE CITY MUST ENTIRELY REVAMP THE B-HEARD PILOT AS THE PILOT AUTHORIZES EXTENSIVE POLICE INVOLVEMENT AND IS LIKELY TO

⁴ New York Lawyers for the Public Interest, *CCIT-NYC: See Their Faces. Say Their Names.*, <https://www.nylnpi.org/resource/ccit-nyc-see-their-faces-say-their-names/> (Mar. 7, 2026).

⁵ Henry J. Steadman, *et al.*, “A Specialized Crisis Response Site as a Core Element of Police-Based Diversion Programs,” *Psychiatric Services* (2001), http://ps.psychiatryonline.org/doi/10.1176/appi.ps.52.2.219?utm_source=TrendMD&utm_medium=cpc&utm_campaign=Psychiatric_Services_TrendMD_0.

⁶ Mayor’s Office for People with Disabilities, “Accessible NYC” (2016), https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/mopd/downloads/pdf/accessiblenyc_2016.pdf.

⁷ The full text of the CCIT-NYC proposal can be found at <https://www.ccitnyc.org/ourproposal>.

CONTINUE OR EVEN INCREASE THE RATE OF VIOLENT RESPONSES BY THE NYPD

The City, via its Mayor's Office of Community Mental Health (formerly ThriveNYC), introduced a pilot program in 2021 that it contends is responsive to the need to cease the killings at the hands of the police of individuals experiencing mental health crises. Unfortunately, that is simply not the case, despite the City's glowing description of the program. Among B-HEARD's grim statistics are the following:

- As of March 2025, of 37,113 eligible calls during the New York City Comptroller's audit period, 13,042 (35%) of eligible calls did not receive a response for reasons unknown.⁸
- Moreover, **all mental health calls continue to go through 911**, which is under the NYPD's jurisdiction.
- The entire **program is run by the NYPD, the Fire Department and other City agencies**, with **NO role whatsoever for community organizations**. And there is not even any delineation of the lines of authority and communication among the various city agencies.
- **The crisis response teams are composed of EMTs who are City employees** (from the Fire Department) **who are deeply enmeshed in the current police-led response system**. Peers do not trust these EMTs. The other team members are *licensed clinical* social workers. The licensure and clinical orientation requirements are unnecessary and they also preclude a vast array of potential candidates who have excellent skills and a long history of working with people experiencing crises.
- B-HEARD has **NO requirement to hire peers**.

⁸ N.Y.C. Comptroller, Audit of the Behavioral Health Emergency Assistance Response Division's Effectiveness in Responding to Individuals with Mental Health Crises and Meeting Its Goals (2025), <https://comptroller.nyc.gov/reports/audit-of-the-behavioral-health-emergency-assistance-response-divisions-effectiveness-in-responding-to-individuals-with-mental-health-crises-and-meeting-its-goals/#detailed-findings>

- **The training of the teams does *NOT* require a trauma-informed framework, need *NOT* be experiential, and need *NOT* use skilled instructors who are peers or even care providers.**
- **The pilot operates only sixteen hours a day.**
- **There are no outcome/effectiveness metrics.**
- **There is no oversight mechanism.**

A comparison of the CCIT-NYC proposal, which is based on the CAHOOTS model with a stellar track record, and the B-HEARD program, which is not aligned with any best practices, is illustrated in the following chart:

Critical Attributes of a Mental Health Crisis Response System	CCIT-NYC's Proposal	NYC's B-HEARD Proposal
Removal of police responders	YES	NO (currently, around 79% of calls are still responded to by police, and even when all kinks are removed, 50% of calls will still be responded to by police)
Three-digit phone number such as 988, in lieu of 911.	YES	NO
Response team to consist of an independent EMT and a trained peer who has lived mental health experience and know best how to engage people in need of support	YES	NO (licensed clinical social worker and EMT employed by the New York City Bureau of Emergency Medical Services)
Crisis response program run by community-based entity/ies which will provide culturally competent care and will more likely have a history with the person in need and can intervene prior to a crisis	YES	NO (run by New York City Police Department and other City agencies)
Peer involvement in all aspects of planning/implementation/oversight	YES	NO
Oversight board consisting of 51% peers from low-income communities, especially Black, Latinx, and other communities of color	YES	NO
Creation/funding of non-coercive mental health services (“safety net”), including respite centers and 24/7 mental health care to minimize crises in the first place and to serve those for whom crisis de-escalation is insufficient	YES	NO

Response times comparable to those of other emergencies	YES	NO (Most recently reported response time of over 15 minutes -- compared with average response time of 8 to 11 minutes for non-mental health emergencies)
Response available 24/7	YES	NO (Response only available 16 hours/day)
Training of the teams to use a trauma-informed framework, be experiential, and use skilled instructors who are peers	YES	NO

Transparency and accountability are also essential in the crisis response model. NYC Former Comptroller Brad Lander’s audit identified serious gaps in the Office of Community Mental Health’s ability to track B-HEARD data, including response times, how often individuals are served, whether follow-ups occur, and other key indicators necessary to ensure New Yorkers are safe and properly cared for. Data collection and public reporting, as required by Int. [722-2026](#), will allow us to measure outcomes, find gaps, and enhance services. Without data and reporting, we cannot evaluate effectiveness.

NYLPI urges the City Council to ensure that the money previously allocated for a non-police mental health crisis response be utilized solely for a truly non-police response, and to mandate substantial modifications to the B-HEARD program by including the critical components of the CCIT-NYC proposal.

THE LIVED EXPERIENCES OF NEW YORKERS DEMONSTRATE THE URGENT NEED FOR TRANSFORMATION, TRANSPARENCY, AND ACCOUNTABILITY.

I, Christina Sparrock, speak from lived experience of mental health challenges. The stigma I face is real, and it influences how systems respond to people like me during a crisis. Much of the City's limited mental health funding goes toward limited crisis response, with very little funding allocated for prevention and early intervention. As a result, when someone calls 911 during a mental health crisis, the system defaults to police. Police officers, whose training primarily focuses on crime and the use of force, handle 911 calls related to mental health and substance use crises. When I am in a crisis, I am already afraid and do not need police to respond to make me even more afraid.

During one so-called "wellness check," police pounded unannounced on my apartment door. I believed a violent intruder was trying to enter my home to harm or kill me. In my fear, I began looking for ways to protect myself. That encounter could have ended in tragedy. I would have been another Eleanor Bumpurs, Deborah Danner, Win Rozario, Eudes Pierre. It is precisely this kind of escalation that demonstrates why police should not be the default response to mental health emergencies.

It is imperative that we remove police from mental health crisis response unless requested by the first responders who must be health care providers and peers with lived mental health experience. During a crisis, we deserve care, dignity, and de-escalation, not force.

THE CITY COUNCIL MUST ENSURE THAT NEW YORKERS HAVE ACCESS TO A WIDE RANGE OF VOLUNTARY NON-HOSPITAL, COMMUNITY-BASED MENTAL HEALTH SERVICES THAT PROMOTE RECOVERY AND WELLNESS, AS WELL AS A FULL PANOPLY OF COMMUNITY SERVICES, INCLUDING HOUSING, EMPLOYMENT, AND EDUCATION, BY ALLOCATING FUNDING FOR SUCH PROGRAMS

Since NYLPI was established 50 years ago, we have prioritized advocating on behalf of individuals with mental health conditions, and we have consistently fought to ensure that the rights

of individuals with mental health conditions are protected by every aspect of New York’s service delivery system. Core to our work is the principle of self-determination for all individuals with disabilities, along with the right to access a robust healthcare system that is available on a *voluntary, non-coercive* basis.

We have long been on record opposing mandatory outpatient and inpatient treatment for failing to offer appropriate healthcare and insufficiently safeguarding the rights of persons with mental disabilities. In line with our continued advocacy for comprehensive mental health treatment in New York, NYLPI has released our latest report: Implementation of Kendra’s Law Continues to be Severely Biased⁹. The report outlines that there is no proof that Involuntary Outpatient Commitment is more effective than voluntary treatment. We make key, urgent recommendations for New York to discontinue use of Kendra’s Law and in no event expand its scope or reach, and in the interim, take proactive measures to eliminate racial bias from Involuntary Outpatient Commitment.

Quite simply, there is no place for coercion. Forced “treatment” is not treatment at all, and it has long been rejected by health practitioners -- to say nothing of the disability community – in favor of numerous best practices strategies that offer assistance even to those who have previously resisted offers of care.¹⁰ There are multiple less invasive models of care that New York City must invest in to avoid the tragedy and enormous cost of forced treatment. At the heart of these models are trained peers, who are ideally suited to implement effective harm reduction and de-escalation techniques, especially during crises.

⁹ NYLPI, Implementation of Kendra’s Law Continues to be Severely Biased (2025), <https://www.nylpi.org/wp-content/uploads/2025/03/Implementation-of-Kendras-Law-Continues-to-be-Severely-Biased-Report-1.pdf>.

¹⁰ See, e.g., de Bruijn-Wezeman, Reina “Ending Coercion in Mental Health: The Need for a Human Rights-Based Approach,” Committee on Social Affairs, Health and Sustainable Development, Council of Europe, Parliamentary Assembly, Doc. 14895 (May 22, 2019), <https://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/Xref-XML2HTML-en.asp?fileid=27701&lang=en>.

We know how to help those with the most severe mental illness, but we fail to do so, instead providing services that are insufficient or not held to the highest accountability. We face complete system failure, yet we have done little to correct the failure and even point our fingers at those most affected by the system failure. We must stop the finger-pointing and fix the system. We must invest in innovative, voluntary health programs. And we must invest in supportive housing, rather than cart people off to a psychiatric ward or to jail.

Any proposal that facilitates the ability to force people into in-patient or out-patient “treatment” must be seen in the context of whom we’re entrusting to “remove” these individuals. As we now know all too well, the police, who are steeped in law and order, are not well-suited to deal with individuals with mental health concerns.

While there is extensive literature supporting voluntary treatment, there is no support that forced evaluation and treatment is more effective.

THE CITY MUST USE APPROPRIATE LANGUAGE IN EVERY FACET OF ITS WORK ON BEHALF OF PEOPLE WITH MENTAL DISABILITIES

New York State has moved from using the pejorative term “Emotionally Disturbed Person” to “Person Experiencing an Emotional Crisis,” pursuant to recent passage of statewide legislation.¹¹ All aspects of crisis response and mental health service delivery, including our data systems, must reflect that change. Language matters. It reflects our values and our commitment to dignity.

CONCLUSION

NYLPI respectfully requests that the City Council:

¹¹ S. 8210A, 2025–2026 Reg. Sess. (N.Y. 2025); Assemb. B. 4762B, 2025–2026 Reg. Sess. (N.Y. 2025).

- Mandate changes to the B-HEARD program to align it with the truly non-police, peer-led CCIT-NYC model and with the Daniel's Law bills.
- Ensure that New Yorkers have access to a wide range of non-hospital, community-based mental health services that promote recovery and wellness, as well as a full panoply of community services, including housing, employment, and education, by allocating funding for such programs.

Thank you for your consideration. I can be reached at (212) 244-4664 or wjuhn@nylpi.org, and I look forward to the opportunity to discuss how best to respond to the needs of individuals experiencing mental health crises in New York City.

###

About New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

For 50 years, New York Lawyers for the Public Interest (NYLPI) has been a leading civil rights advocate for New Yorkers marginalized by race, poverty, disability, and immigration status. Through our community lawyering model, we bridge the gap between traditional civil legal services and civil rights, building strength and capacity for both individual solutions and long-term impact. Our work integrates the power of individual representation, impact litigation, and comprehensive organizing and policy campaigns. Guided by the priorities of our communities, we strive to achieve equality of opportunity and self-determination for people with disabilities, create equal access to health care, ensure immigrant opportunity, strengthen local nonprofits, and secure environmental justice for low-income communities of color.

NYLPI's Disability Justice Program works to advance the civil rights of New Yorkers with disabilities. In the past five years alone, NYLPI disability advocates have represented thousands of individuals and won campaigns improving the lives of hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers. Our landmark victories include integration into the community for people with mental illness, access to medical care and government services, and increased accessibility of New York City's public hospitals. We prioritize the reform of New York City's response to individuals experiencing mental health crises, and have successfully litigated to obtain the body-worn camera footage from the NYPD officers who shot and killed individuals experiencing mental health crises. In late 2021, NYLPI and co-counsel filed a class action lawsuit which seeks to halt New York's practice of dispatching police to respond to mental health crises, and in the context of that lawsuit, seeks relief on behalf of individuals affected by the Mayor's Involuntary Removal Policy. We filed a companion lawsuit in 2024 on behalf of an individual shot within an inch of his life when experiencing a mental health crisis.



**Testimony of Alia Soomro, Deputy Director for New York City Policy
New York League of Conservation Voters
City Council Committee on Fire and Emergency Management
FY27 Preliminary Budget Hearing
March 13, 2026**

My name is Alia Soomro and I am the Deputy Director for New York City Policy at the New York League of Conservation Voters (NYLCV). NYLCV is a statewide environmental advocacy organization representing over 30,000 members in New York City. Thank you, Chair Ariola, as well as members of the Committee on Fire and Emergency Management for the opportunity to comment.

Combating climate change and improving public health means ensuring our city agencies are sufficiently staffed and funded. Below are NYLCV's top FY27 funding priorities when it comes to OEM and FDNY.

Office of Emergency Management

As the [Committee on Fire and Emergency Management's Committee Report](#) states, "Despite increasing frequency and severity of extreme weather events, including recent flooding, heat waves, and winter storms, NYCEM's budget does not reflect substantial increases in climate adaptation and resilience funding...NYCEM's Preliminary Plan shows flat funding in key areas. Additional resources are needed to expand cooling centers, enhance stormwater emergency response, and upgrade climate-vulnerable infrastructure."

Extreme heat is the [deadliest weather-related hazard](#) in the United States, and while extreme heat events are increasingly common with climate change, [New York City is especially prone](#) to these events. It has the greatest number of people exposed to the urban heat island effect in the United States due to the vast amount of asphalt, buildings, and other infrastructure that absorb and re-emit the sun's heat. Extreme heat events [particularly](#) hit seniors, low income and communities of color the hardest due to structural racism such as [residential redlining](#).

NYLCV urges the City to allocate \$1.2 million for the implementation of Local Law 128 of 2025, which codifies the NYC Cooling Centers Program. This should include funding for maintenance, staffing, increased hours of operation during extreme heat events (including weekends), and a public education campaign on extreme heat awareness and mitigation. The city should also post information about the program online and develop neighborhood-specific communication plans that promote the use of cooling centers in the top 10 most common languages in NYC.

NYC Fire Department

When it comes to FDNY's role in fighting climate change and improving public health, this agency plays a key role in ensuring battery energy storage systems (BESS) are approved, safely installed, and monitored.

Battery energy storage systems are devices that store electricity produced at one time so it can be used later. They enable energy from renewables, like solar and wind, to be stored and then released when the power is needed most. They are a vital and safe technology solution not only for the clean energy transition but to make our energy grid more resilient and efficient.

These systems can help meet grid reliability needs amid growing electricity demand (BESS provides "on-demand" power by storing energy when production is high and deliver it during peak demand), cut costs by mitigating the need for costly traditional fossil-fuel infrastructure upgrades, and dramatically increase the grid's ability to onboard new renewable energy. By storing clean energy, BESS can reduce reliance on fossil-fuel peaker plants, which are disproportionately located in EJ neighborhoods, that run only during times of high demand. These peaker plants often emit a disproportionate amount of NO_x, SO₂, and particulate matter, which contribute to respiratory illness like asthma as well as other health risks.

Battery energy storage systems are heavily regulated at the federal, state, and local level. New York City has some of the strictest BESS safety rules in the world. Every BESS site must meet rigorous standards and is reviewed for safety by both FDNY and the NYC Department of Buildings (DOB).

NYLCV underscores the importance of providing sufficient resources for FDNY staffing when it comes to meeting BESS safety regulatory requirements and ensuring permits are handled expeditiously. According to the *New York 6 GW Energy Storage Roadmap*, NYC will need approximately 2 GW of energy storage capacity within the five boroughs by 2030. Currently, there is just over 100 MW of energy storage deployed in NYC. This means ~380 MW of energy storage must be installed in the city *annually* between 2026 and 2030 to meet the 2 GW need. In addition to NYC DOB, FDNY will need significantly more staffing to process applications.

Funding city agencies such as OEM and FDNY are key to mitigating the impacts of climate change and improving public health, and we hope the City Council and Mamdani Administration prioritizes these agencies during the FY27 budget negotiations.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment.

At a November 13, 2025 NYC Council hearing, outgoing FDNY Commissioner Tucker suggested that 'patient outcomes' be considered for a performance indicator for his department. While the FDNY reports the number of New Yorkers who die in fires before they can be rescued by its firefighters, the FDNY does not report the number of patients who decline into a permanent vegetative state, or who die, while waiting for treatment and transport by its Emergency Medical Services' emergency medical technicians (EMTs) and paramedics.

Regarding this hearing on the NYC Budget as it affects the FDNY Emergency Medical Services, once again I am reminded that in 2001 **the NYC Council Members** passed Local Law 19 requiring that members of the FDNY Emergency Medical Services be **treated as a uniformed service** in labor contract negotiations. The FDNY EMS have been without a new contract since 2022, not so the other uniformed services.

Once again, I am reminded that in 2020 **the NYC Council Members** passed a Resolution that **FDNY Emergency Medical Services workers be paid comparably to police officers and firefighters.**

Once again, I remind **all 51 current NYC Council Members and the new Mayor** that neither the Law nor the Resolution has ever been followed. There have been no repercussions for elected and appointed officials who failed to implement these measures. However, the failure to implement them has had a negative impact on the public's health and wellbeing:

- It is harder to recruit and retain EMS staff because of the low wages that EMTs earn, tens of thousands less than DSNY Sanitation Workers. **1,574 FDNY EMTs were hired from FY2022 to FY2026** (to date). As of October, 2025 there were only 2,818 FDNY EMTs. As per testimony today, there are currently hundreds of vacant FDNY EMT positions.
- Fewer FDNY EMTs on staff, means fewer EMTs to advance in Emergency Medicine and become paramedics and fewer EMTs to staff ambulances. (See the January 29, 2026 and February 2, 2026 Fleet Reports that follow. Over one weekend and without an explanation to the public, the target number for FDNY ambulances to be in service daily decreased, from 488 ambulances in service daily to 332 ambulances in service daily. By that 156 decrease in ambulances, it can now appear for the first time in years, that the FDNY is inexplicably meeting and even exceeding its daily ambulance targets.)
- Fewer ambulances on the road, means it takes longer to reach New Yorkers experiencing medical emergencies. The attached image of the "Local Law 119 Compliance" page shows that in February, **3,634 New Yorkers with life-threatening medical emergencies** (Segments 1,2 and 3, including heart attack) **waited at least 20 minutes** for Advanced Life Saving (ALS) ambulances with paramedics to reach them. The longer it takes to reach a patient, **the poorer the outcome on the patient's health.**

Following are copies of part of my past mailings and e-mailings this year **to all 51 NYC Council Members** with facts concerning: the ever-rising ambulance response times, the accelerating EMS workforce attrition, the increasing NYC revenue generated by EMS work, and the continuing unjust and unequal EMS pay. These are being submitted as hearing testimony to become part of the public record because the majority of Council Members, including all members of this Council Committee, have not acknowledged receipt of this information either electronically or in writing.

Together with the Mayor, the NYC Council is a *co-equal branch* of NYC government. In light of hearing testimony since 2020 and of the Council's own briefing papers, why shouldn't the Public consider that both the Public Health threat posed by rising ambulance response times and the continuing, high FDNY Emergency Medical Services' attrition and vacancy rate are the result of nothing but words and no action coming from past and present mayoral administrations, as well as from past and present members of the City Council?

The EVERYDAY Work of the FDNY Emergency Medical Services (EMS)¹

FDNY Emergency Medical Technicians and paramedics respond to radio calls from 911 FDNY EMS dispatchers. Using the best routes considering the weather and road conditions, EMTs drive Basic Life Support ambulances and Paramedics drive Advanced Life Support ambulances to emergency sites that include among others, private homes, multi-story residential buildings with and without elevators, hi-rise commercial and government office buildings, shops, schools, houses of worship, subways, highways, local streets, parks, beaches, cruise ships, fire and crime scenes.

FDNY Emergency Medical Services staff gain access to the patient; assess the safety of the scene; determine the nature of illness or injury; assess the extent of injury or illness; use prescribed techniques and equipment to provide patient care¹ use appropriate body substance isolation procedures; assess and monitor vital signs and the appearance of patients for signs of change; make determinations regarding patient status and priority for emergency care using established criteria¹ extricate the patients; communicate with dispatchers requesting additional assistance or services as necessary; provide additional emergency care following established protocols. And they do this, while sometimes wearing bunker gear and bullet proof vests.

Certified **Emergency Medical Technicians** who staff Basic Life Support (BLS) ambulances perform CPR; control bleeding; provide non-invasive treatment of hypoperfusion; stabilize / immobilize injured bones and spines; manage environmental emergencies and emergency childbirth . . . use semi-automatic defibrillators . . . assist patients with self-administration or administer emergency medications.

Certified **Paramedics** who staff Advanced Life Support (ALS) ambulances manage patients having respiratory, cardiac, diabetic, endocrine, immune, infectious disease, neurological, pediatric, neonatal, OB, trauma (accident or crime related) or mental health incidents **that require medical intervention** within their scope of practice and skills in a pre-hospital setting.² They perform: advanced airway management (including oral and nasal intubation insertion/ rapid sequence intubation); medication administration via: intramuscular, intravenous (IV), subcutaneous, intraosseous, nasogastric, orally and nebulized routes. They administer Advanced Cardiovascular Life Support and Pediatric Advanced Life Support medications, such as **epinephrine**. They start and monitor ongoing IV medication drips; employ ventilators; administer fluids and controlled substances and document patient assessments.

FDNY Emergency Medical Services staff lift, carry and transfer patients of all sizes into ambulances; transport the patients to medical facilities while providing ongoing medical care as necessary; report the nature of injuries or illnesses to the receiving facilities; ask for medical direction from medical control physician and carry out medical control orders as appropriate; assist in moving the patients from ambulances into the medical facilities; report to the hospitals' emergency departments staff about their observations of the patient's emergency and the care EMS provided; and assist the hospitals' staff as required.

At their FDNY EMS stations, Emergency Medical Services staff dispose of medical waste; clean contaminated equipment; replace supplies; check all equipment for future readiness; ensure the cleanliness and organization of ambulance, its equipment and supplies; maintain familiarity with all specialized equipment.

¹ Some of these descriptions come from the following New York State Department of Health websites:

"Functional Position Description Emergency Medical Technician" <https://www.health.ny.gov/professionals/ems/pdf/00-10.pdf>

"Scope of Practice by Level of EMS Provider" <https://www.health.ny.gov/professionals/ems/pdf/23-07.pdf>

² Regional Emergency Medical Advisory Committee New York City, "Unified Prehospital Treatment Protocols, Effective October 1, 2024". <https://nycremsco.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/07/2024-REMAC-Unified-Prehospital-Protocols-2024-01-004.pdf>

1/29/2026

NYC Fleet Daily Service Report

NYC Fleet Daily Service Report: Agency Summary

Agency	Fleet Roster	Target daily in service	Actual IS
DCAS Managed	2,600	2,444	2,579
DEP	2,315	2,084	1,904
DOC	732	659	662
DOT	4,037	3,431	3,516
DSNY	6,251	4,876	4,866
FDNY	2,321	1,857	1,595
NYPD	9,023	8,121	8,052
Parks	2,901	2,611	2,668
Citywide	30,180	27,162	25,842

NYC Fleet Daily Service Report: Critical Fleets Summary

Agency	Critical fleet	Fleet Roster	Target daily in service	Actual IS
DCAS	Mayoral fleet	19	18	19
DCAS	OEM	141	133	141
DCAS	Sheriff	129	121	128
DEP	Customer service	113	106	101
DEP	Environmental compliance	93	87	87
DEP	Police	135	127	125
DEP	Sewer and water	1,136	1,022	892
DOC	Buses	118	106	90
DOC	Sedans	72	65	72
DOC	Vans	149	134	139
DOT	Asphalt plant	40	34	36
DOT	HIQA	174	157	158
DOT	Material hauling	288	245	214
DOT	Meters	129	110	119
DOT	Paving	509	433	429
DSNY	Collection trucks	1,514	1,241	1,123
DSNY	Dual bin collection trucks	727	596	521
DSNY	Sweepers	464	357	362
FDNY	Ambulances	651	488	307
FDNY	Ladders	193	152	113
FDNY	Pumpers	223	196	160
NYPD	Traffic	547	492	490
Parks	Forestry	174	157	132
Parks	Packers	112	101	92
Total	-	7,850	6,678	6,050

Seasonal Fleets

DSNY	Salt spreaders	411	411	362
Parks	Beach	72	65	70

NYC Fleet Daily Service Report

2/2/2026

NYC Fleet Daily Service Report: Agency Summary

Agency	Fleet Roster	Target daily in service	Actual IS
DCAS Managed	2,596	2,440	2,577
DEP	2,315	2,084	1,900
DOC	735	662	672
DOT	4,034	3,429	3,531
DSNY	6,252	4,877	4,857
FDNY	2,321	1,857	1,567
NYPD	9,032	8,129	8,076
Parks	2,902	2,612	2,681
Citywide	30,187	27,168	25,861

NYC Fleet Daily Service Report: Critical Fleets Summary

Agency	Critical fleet	Fleet Roster	Target daily in service	Actual IS
DCAS	Mayoral fleet	19	18	19
DCAS	OEM	141	133	141
DCAS	Sheriff	129	121	128
DEP	Customer service	113	106	102
DEP	Environmental compliance	93	87	89
DEP	Police	135	127	123
DEP	Sewer and water	1,137	1,023	887
DOC	Buses	118	106	92
DOC	Sedans	72	65	72
DOC	Vans	149	134	141
DOT	Asphalt plant	40	34	37
DOT	HIQA	174	157	159
DOT	Material hauling	288	245	224
DOT	Meters	129	110	120
DOT	Paving	508	432	420
DSNY	Collection trucks	1,515	1,242	1,116
DSNY	Dual bin collection trucks	727	596	517
DSNY	Sweepers	464	357	367
FDNY	Ambulances	650	332	299
FDNY	Ladders	194	143	109
FDNY	Pumpers	223	197	152
NYPD	Traffic	547	492	489
Parks	Forestry	174	157	141
Parks	Packers	112	101	94
Total	-	7,851	6,515	6,038

Seasonal Fleets

DSNY	Salt spreaders	411	411	366
Parks	Beach	72	65	69



Local Law 119 Compliance

End-to-End Response Time

End-to-End Detail

Response Time Trends

Local Law 119 Compliance

Definitions



Local Law 119 Compliance

The Local Law 119 Compliance Report provides counts and average response times for the categories of incidents outlined in Local Law 119 of 2013: The Ariel Russo Emergency 9-1-1 Response Time Reporting Act. All reports are available citywide or by borough.

NYC Analytics Data as of Mar...

Showing Month: 2026 - 2026

Month: FEB. (Latest Month)

Borough: All

Call Type: Voice

SEGMENT

Multiple select o... ^

Select all

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

Clear All ?

Agency	Description	Duration	# of Incidents
EMS	Average response time to medical emergencies by ambulance units, in total and disaggregated by segment	15:10	39,258
FDNY	Average response time to medical emergencies by fire units, in total and disaggregated by segment	12:15	12,029

Agency	Description	Percentage	# of Incidents
EMS	Percentage of response time to Advanced Life Support medical emergencies by Advanced Life support ambulances between 10 and 20 minutes, in total and disaggregated by segment	52.4%	17,474
EMS	Percentage of response time to Advanced Life Support medical emergencies by Advanced Life support ambulances between 6 and 10 minutes, in total and disaggregated by segment	23.4%	17,474
EMS	Percentage of response time to Advanced Life Support medical emergencies by Advanced Life support ambulances less than 6 minutes, in total and disaggregated by segment	3.5%	17,474
EMS	Percentage of response time to Advanced Life Support medical emergencies by Advanced Life support ambulances more than 20 minutes, in total and disaggregated by segment	20.8%	17,474

Handwritten notes: 9,156 (under 52.4%), 3,634 (under 20.8%)

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
August 4, 2025

Re: FDNY EMS' Suppressed Salaries

Dear

The failure of NYC officials to acknowledge the FDNY Emergency Medical Services (EMS) as a "uniformed service" in contract negotiations, has led to huge differences in pay between the EMS and other NYC "first responder" services. Low pay has been cited as a cause of EMS' [critical problems](#) in staff recruitment and retention. Without staff, ambulances can't run. A year's worth of fleet reports show that the number of ambulances in service on [any given day](#) is rarely above 80% of target. When ambulances can't run, ill and injured New Yorkers wait longer for help, sometimes [too long](#).

The enclosures illustrate how raises in EMS pay have lagged for years behind both those of their fellow department members, firefighters, and other municipal workers. And to understand the effect that not recognizing the FDNY Emergency Medical Services as a "uniformed service" must have on current and potential FDNY personnel, consider these facts:

- Between [2002](#) and [2024](#), the "new hire" salary for FDNY Firefighters increased **55%** from \$35,000 to \$54,122. Between [2002](#) and [2024](#), the "new hire" salary for FDNY Emergency Medical Technicians (EMTs) increased less, **36%** from \$28,900 to \$39,386.
- In 2002, the difference in base pay between newly hired FDNY EMTs and Firefighters was **21%**. By 2024, the difference in base pay between newly hired FDNY EMTs and Firefighters had **widened to 37%**.
- From 2002 to 2024, FDNY EMTs' base pay after 5½ years of service increased **53%** to \$59,534. From 2002 to 2024, Firefighters' base pay after 5½ year of service **increased more, 95%** to \$105,146.

EMTs and paramedics are not just "ambulance drivers" in the same way Firefighters are not just "firetruck drivers". The NYS Bureau of Emergency Medicine and Trauma Systems describes the scope of EMS' medical practice at: <https://www.health.ny.gov/professionals/ems/pdf/23-07.pdf> Lacking essential investment, including adequate salaries, the combined FDNY EMS and Firefighter response time to "life-threatening medical emergencies rose from 7 minutes 1 second in [1998](#) to 11 minutes and 42 seconds in [June, 2025](#). Please, what are you doing for the EMS?

Sincerely, your fellow New Yorker,

Helen Northmore

P.S. Please contact me if you find errors. I will make the corrections. Thank you.

copy to: all 51 NYC Council Members via USPS and email

3 Enc: "FDNY EMT Base Pay is Lower in 2025 than Firefighter Base Pay was in 2010"; "A Comparison of EMS Salary Increases 2010-2025 to other NYC 'Uniformed' & 'Civilian' Pattern Increases"; "EMS Earns Back 95% of its Costs for NYC".

FDNY EMT Base Pay is LOWER in 2025 than Firefighter base pay Was in 2010

► Here's the 2010 FDNY Firefighter Salary:

\$39,764 - New Hire Rate for firefighters hired on or after January 17, 2006

\$41,724 - That's an added \$1,960 for 5th Grade

\$45,445 - That's an added \$3,721 for 4th Grade

\$49,989 - That's an added \$4,544 for 3rd Grade

\$55,102 - That's an added \$5,113 for 2nd Grade

\$77,253 - That's an added \$22,151 for 1st Grade

Source: <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/firefighters-executed-contract-2010-2017.pdf>

► The 2025 FDNY EMT's Salary is Lower:

(This contract expired in 2022)

\$39,386 - New Hire Rate

\$41,616 - That's an added \$2,230 after 1 year

\$42,357 - That's an added \$741 after 2 years

\$49,047 - That's an added \$6,690 after 3 years*

\$59,534 - That's an added \$10,487 after 5 years

Source: <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/queenscb2/downloads/pdf/2024/EMT-FLYER-2022.pdf>

In the following table, please note that a person with no firefighting experience when hired, earns more than most Emergency Medical Technicians (table above) who've been trained and certified and have on the job experience providing patients with emergency medical assistance and transportation to hospital Emergency Rooms.

► These were the FDNY Firefighter Salary Steps as of 2024:

\$54,122 - Firefighter New Hire Rate

\$56,788 - That's a 4.93% increase after 1.5 years

\$61,853 - That's an additional 8.9% increase after 2.5 years


\$68,039 - That's an additional 10.00% increase after 3.5 years

\$74,998 - That's an additional 10.23% increase after 4.5 years

\$105,146 - That's an additional 40.2% increase after 5.5 years

Source: <https://www.joinfdny.com/careers/firefighter/>

The FY2010-2024 FDNY EMS Salary Increases were Lower When Compared to other New York City "UNIFORMED" Services & Did Not Keep Up with "CIVILIAN" Pattern Salary Increases

<u>"Uniformed Service"</u> <u>Contract Pattern</u> (United Firefighters Assoc.)	<u>FDNY EMTs & Paramedics</u> <u>Contracts: 2010-2022</u> <u>EMS Locals 2507 & 3621</u>	<u>"Civilian"</u> <u>Contract Pattern</u> DC 37	
<u>Fiscal Year</u>	<u>% salary increase</u>	<u>% salary increase</u>	<u>% salary increase</u>
2010	1% on 8/1/10 _____	0%* as of 6/10/2016 _____	0% ** on 3/3/2010
2011	1% _____	0% _____	1% on 9/30/2011
2012	1% _____	0% _____	1%
2013	1% _____	0% _____	1%
2014	1.5% _____	0% _____	1.5% ** + a \$1,000 bonus
2015	2.5% _____	1.5% _____	2.5%
2016	3% on 12/1/2016 _____	2.5% * + a \$1,000 ratification bonus _____	3.00%
2017	2.25% on 8/1/2017 _____	3% on 3/6/17 & 3.03% on 9/5/17	2.00% on 9/26/2017
2018	2.5% _____	2% on 6/29/2018 _____	2.25% on 9/26/2018
2019	3% on 8/1/2019 _____	2.25% on 6/29/2019 _____	3.00% on 10/26/2019
2020	3.25%	3% on 7/29/2020	0% *** bonus in lieu of
2021	3.25% _____	4% ↓ as per 2021 Contract. _____	3% 5/26/2021
	 <p>► But the 2021 EMS contract re-defined and increased the work week from 37½ hours to 40 hours equivalent to an additional 6.67% hours or 3½ more weeks of work per year starting 9/12/2021.</p>		
2022	3.50%	contract expired July 28, 2022	3% on 5/26/22
2023	3.50%	contract expired July 28, 2022	3% *** + a \$3,000 bonus
2024	4.00%	contract expired July 28, 2022	3%
2025		contract expired July 28, 2022	3.25% on 5/26/2025

► New York City's Local Law 19 of 2001 stipulated: ". . . that those individuals employed by the FDNY as EMT's, paramedics and supervisors of EMT's or paramedics be accorded the same unique bargaining rights as the uniformed forces of the City." Also SEE Appendix A and Appendix C.

► The 2021 FDNY EMS contract did not adhere to the spirit of Council Resolution 1062-2019, unanimously passed on May 28, 2020, that called "for the salaries of New York City emergency medical service personnel to be comparable to New York City's firefighters and police officers."

► About the 2021 contract, Mayor de Blasio announced, "This agreement conforms to the pattern reached with other civilian unions, and includes productivity enhancements tied to increased work hours . . ." Press Release, Office of the Mayor, "Mayor de Blasio, Commissioner Campion Announce Tentative Contract Agreement with EMS Union District Council 37, Raising Wages for Over 4,500 FDNY Employees, Official Website of the City of New York, August 6, 2021. See Appendix C, pages 19 and 20.

Sources

Williams, Diane S. "4% raises in two-year pact", Public Employees Press, November, 2008.

http://www.dc37pep.net/news/pep/11_2008/2yr_pact.html

Linn, Robert, Commissioner, "2010-2017 Memorandum of Agreement District Council 37 and the City of New York", City of New York, Office of Labor Relations, July 1, 2014.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/cbu-dc37-nyc-moa-2010-2017.pdf>

Campion, Renee, Commissioner, "Executed Contract: Firefighters August 1, 2010-July 31, 2017", NYC Office of Labor Relations, January 17, 2020.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/firefighters-executed-contract-2010-2017.pdf>

Linn, Robert, Commissioner, "EMS Memorandum of Agreement, June 10, 2016", The City of New York, Office of Labor Relations.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/ems-moa-2010-2018.pdf>

"Mayor de Blasio Announces Tentative Contract Agreement with Emergency Medical Service Workers, Bringing over 97 Percent of Workforce Under Contract", NYC Office of the Mayor, June 15, 2016. <https://www.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/536-16/mayor-de-blasio-tentative-contract-agreement-emergency-medical-service-workers->

"Mayor de Blasio and DC 37 Announce Tentative Contract Agreement, Providing A Fair Wage To 100,000 Employees", NYC Office of the Mayor, June 26, 2018. <https://www.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/327-18/mayor-de-blasio-dc-37-tentative-contract-agreement-providing-fair-wage-100-000#0>

Campion, Renee, Commissioner, "Memorandum of Agreement", August 1, 2017 to July 31, 2020, The City of New York, Office of Labor Relations. December 23, 2021.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/2017-2020-ufa-moa.pdf>

Campion, Renee, Commissioner, "EMS Memorandum of Agreement ", The City of New York, Office of Labor Relations, August 6, 2021.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/ems-moa-2021.pdf>

"Mayor de Blasio, Commissioner Campion Announce Tentative Contract Agreement with EMS Union District Council 37, Raising Wages for Over 4,500 FDNY Employees", August 6, 2021. See Appendix C. <https://www.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/552-21/mayor-de-blasio-commissioner-campion-tentative-contract-agreement-ems-union-district>

"Mayor Adams, OLR Commissioner Campion Announce Tentative Contract Agreement with Uniformed Officers Coalition", NYC Office of the Mayor, June 15, 2023. <https://www.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/420-23/mayor-adams-olr-commissioner-campion-tentative-contract-agreement-uniformed-officers#0>

DC 37 Press Release, "Mayor Adams and DC 37 announce tentative contract agreement, providing fair wage increases and other benefits to nearly 90,000 employees and securing fair deal for NYC taxpayers", February 17, 2023. https://www.dc37.net/news/newsreleases/2023/nr02_17/

**FY 2026 The FDNY EMERGENCY MEDICAL SERVICES
Earns Back 95% of its Costs for NYC
BUT NYC won't recognize the LAW giving them "Uniformed" Status**

Compare the FY 2026 EMS Budget with NYC's other Uniformed Services:

Corrections Department [\\$1.2 Billion](#); Sanitation Department [\\$1.9 Billion](#); FDNY [\\$2.6 Billion](#); NYPD [\\$6.1 Billion](#)

\$419,732,455 or just **16%** of the Fire Department's **\$2.6 billion**-dollar budget is allocated to pay for delivering ambulance and [pre-hospital emergency medical services](#) citywide. Is this a healthy budget to efficiently answer the [1.6 million medical](#) calls a year that make up the bulk of all FDNY work? Right now, the [number of ambulances](#) in service on any given day rarely rises above 80% due the inability to [recruit](#) and [retain](#) trained and [certified](#) staff because of [poverty level pay](#). [Response times](#) to life-threatening medical emergencies are longer than in [1998](#). The income from FDNY EMS supplied medical services in FY2026 will pay for the entire EMS payroll plus the cost of EMS supplies and equipment.

FY 2026 FDNY
EMERGENCY MEDICAL SERVICES BUDGET

\$373,525,375 This is allocated for EMS Personnel - for salaries, (base and overtime wages), and fringe benefits for **4,564** budgeted [positions](#), mostly for EMTs and paramedics that, due to the abysmal [pay](#), EMS has a hard time keeping filled. (With longer response times and staff shortages, why is the allocation for EMS payroll \$24M less than [FY2025](#)?)

+\$21,779,829 This is allocated for EMS Equipment and Supplies - for medical, surgical and lab equipment, cleaning supplies, books and data processing, motor vehicle fuel (ambulances, etc.), property and equipment.

+\$24,427,251 This is allocated to pay for general contractual services including maintenance and repairs, miscellaneous rentals of equipment, cleaning services, and heat, light, and power; and land, building and structure rental.

▶ **\$419,732,455** This is **the total FDNY Emergency Medical Services FY2026 budget**.

Source: Adams, Eric, Mayor, *The City of New York Executive Budget Fiscal Year 2026*, "[Expense Revenue Contract](#)", Mayor's Office of Management and Budget, Jacques Jiha, Ph.D., Director. pages 80E-84E. <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/omb/downloads/pdf/exec25/erc5-25.pdf>,

▶ **\$400,000,000** This is **the projected FY2026 revenue**, that will come into city coffers because of the life-saving work of [trained and certified](#) Emergency Medical Technicians and paramedics. Source: [The City of New York Executive Budget Fiscal Year 2026](#), Message of the Mayor. Mayor's Office of Management and Budget, Eric Adams, Mayor, Jacques Jiha, Ph.D., Director, May 1, 2025, page 157.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/omb/downloads/pdf/exec25/mm5-25.pdf>
Why despite the high call volume, is the FY 2026 revenue forecast 11% lower than previous years? Source: [Health & Hospitals Corporation Financial Statement June 30, 2024](#). p. 40.

[REDACTED]
October 6, 2025

Re: EMS Pay Suppression

Dear Council Member

The response time, attrition and pay problems in the FDNY Emergency Medical Services remain. Successive city administrations have failed to correct them. Whether or not there are private influences hindering a solution, the official inaction on these matters is "in the public eye".

Lacking a local remedy for their problems, the FDNY Emergency Medical Services unions turned to the federal government. Based on an U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission determination, and with no change in attitude from the city government, the Emergency Medical Services unions* initiated a class action lawsuit against the City of New York in December 2022. It is based on the E.E.O.C. findings, including:

"Evidence shows that in 2001, the New York City Council, the City's legislative body, passed Local Law 19, asserting that EMS First Responders are uniformed personnel, the same as Firefighters, The record further shows that on May 28, 2020, the City Council passed Resolution 1062 calling for EMS compensation to be comparable with that of Firefighters. The record show that [Defendant has] failed to comply with either . . . any difference in duties between the EMS First Responders and Firefighters fails to explain the pronounced gap in wages and benefits . . . investigation further determined that [the City] "improperly treated and compensated EMS First Responders as civilians, when they are uniformed personnel . . . efforts to conciliate Plaintiffs' charges have been unsuccessful . . . [and] further conciliation efforts would be futile or non-productive." https://www.documentcloud.org/documents/23863299-ems-class-action-complaint_dec-2022/

A trial by jury was demanded. From the enclosure to this letter, it is obvious that years ago, elected and appointed officials identified major problems for FDNY EMS, and as a consequence, for Public Safety. City officials neither negotiated a settlement to the lawsuit, nor concluded a just labor contract. When the evidence goes to a jury, how do you think the jury will decide?

Longer ambulance response times to calls for medical help can lead to serious health consequences for New Yorkers. When will city government fix the problem?

Sincerely

Helen Northmore

* Local 2507 FDNY EMTs, Paramedics and Fire Inspectors, Local 3621 FDNY EMS Officers Unions, and the FDNY EMS Superior Officers Association.

HN:bms

Enclosure: "A Compendium of Published Statements on the PAY and STAFFING Problems at the FDNY EMS 2019-2025"

In FY 2025, FDNY Emergency Medical Services' Basic Life Support (BLS) and Advanced Life Support (ALS) ambulances responded to 1,615,531 calls for emergency medical assistance. Source: FY 2025 Mayor's Management Report, p. 76: https://www.nyc.gov/assets/operations/downloads/pdf/mmr2025/2025_mmr.pdf

FDNY Ambulance Fee Schedule - Excerpted
(Medicare and Medicaid have lower reimbursement rates)

NEW YORK CITY FIRE DEPARTMENT

**Notice of Adoption of Amendments to Fire Department Rule
3 RCNY §4900-02,
“Schedule of Charges for Fire Department Ambulance
Treatment and Transport Services”**

NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN PURSUANT TO THE AUTHORITY VESTED IN THE Fire Commissioner of the City of New York pursuant to Section 487(f) and 1043(a) of the New York City Charter, and in accordance with the requirements of Section 1043 of the New York City Charter, that the New York City Fire Department has adopted the above final rule amendments.

A virtual public hearing was held on March 24, 2023. The rule and the revised schedule of charges shall take effect on May 1, 2023.

§4900-02 Schedule of Charges for Fire Department Ambulance Treatment and Transport Services

* * *

- (b) Effective [January 1, 2021] May 1, 2023, the charges for Fire Department ambulance treatment and transport services are as follows:

<u>Type of Service</u>	<u>Charge</u>
Basic Life Support Ambulance	\$ [900.00] <u>1,385.00</u>
Basic Life Support Ambulance Facilitation of Treatment in Place	\$ 630.00
Advanced Life Support Ambulance Service Level 1 (ALS1)	\$ [1,525.00] <u>1,680.00</u>
Advanced Life Support Ambulance Service Level 2 (ALS2)	\$ [1,625.00] <u>1,692.00</u>
Advanced Life Support Ambulance Facilitation of Treatment in Place	\$ 1,050.00
Additional Charges:	
– Mileage (distance traveled to hospital or medical facility with patient)	\$(15.00/mi) <u>20.00/mile</u>
– Provision of Oxygen (as applicable)	\$ 66.00

4900-02 (ambulance rates) (3/28/23 promulgation)

Source: <https://rules.cityofnewyork.us/wp-content/uploads/2023/02/4900-02-ambulance-rates-3-28-23-promulgation-final.pdf>

3rd party reimbursements received by NYC Health & Hospitals Corporation
for the work of the **FDNY Emergency Medical Services** provided on behalf of HHC
and payable to the City of New York

July 1, 2019 through June 30, 2024

\$1.6 billion dollars

Source: H&HC Financial Statements <https://comptroller.nyc.gov/statements/new-york-city-health-and-hospitals-corporation-hhc/>

Question: Are these solely reimbursements generated by FDNY EMS ambulance transports to the 11 H&HC hospitals?



EMS WORKFORCE ANALYSIS

3/1/2024

GENDER AND ETHNICITY															
EMS WORKFORCE	MALE							FEMALE							GRAND TOTAL
	W	B	H	A	N	OTHER	MALE TOTAL	W	B	H	A	N	OTHER	FEMALE TOTAL	
CHIEF OF EMS	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
ASSISTANT CHIEF	2	0	1	0	0	0	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
DEPUTY ASSISTANT CHIEF	3	0	1	0	0	0	4	3	1	0	0	0	0	4	8
DIVISION CHIEF	9	1	3	1	0	0	14	4	2	1	0	0	0	7	21
DEPUTY CHIEF	15	4	4	2	0	0	25	4	5	1	0	0	0	10	35
CAPTAIN	34	7	9	3	0	0	53	13	8	2	1	0	0	24	77
LIEUTENANT	167	44	78	32	1	5	327	35	33	28	8	0	1	105	432
PARAMEDIC	269	109	219	67	3	30	697	100	63	119	9	0	18	309	1006
EMT	1063	465	529	90	10	251	2408	171	239	212	17	4	79	722	3130
EMS TRAINEE	65	26	11	4	1	34	141	6	1	1	2	0	10	20	161
TOTAL	1627	657	855	199	15	320	3673	336	352	364	37	4	108	1201	4874
Percentage %	33.38%	13.48%	17.54%	4.08%	0.31%	6.57%	75.36%	6.89%	7.22%	7.47%	0.76%	0.08%	2.22%	24.64%	100.00%

Source: <https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2024/05/FDNY-Uniformed-Demographics-Annually.pdf>

The above **March 2024** FDNY staffing analysis lists **3,130 EMTs** and **1,006 Paramedics**. EMTs and Paramedics respond to over 1.6 million 911 calls per year in all 5 boroughs, 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, 365 days a year. A Basic Life Support (BLS) ambulance requires 2 EMTs, and an Advanced Life Support (ALS) ambulance requires 2 Paramedics. EMS dispatch data, including the severity of the medical emergencies and the response times, can be viewed at the NYC Open Data website: https://data.cityofnewyork.us/Public-Safety/EMS-Incident-Dispatch-Data/76xm-jjuj/about_data

EMS' Projected Income and Operating Budget FY2026

► According to "The City of New York Executive Budget Fiscal Year 2026 Message of the Mayor", the FDNY Emergency Medical Services will generate \$400,000,000 of income for NYC in FY 2026 (July 1, 2025-June 30, 2026). Jacques Jiha, Ph.D., Director, Mayor's Office of Management and Budget, "Message of the Mayor", Eric Adams, Mayor, May 1, 2025, page 157. <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/omb/downloads/pdf/exec25/mm5-25.pdf>

► \$400,000,000 will cover 95% of the FY2026 FDNY budget for the Emergency Medical Services. (That is different from every other NYC "uniformed" first responder service.) Jacques Jiha, Ph.D., Director Mayor's Office of Management and Budget, Eric Adams, Mayor, The City of New York Executive Budget Fiscal Year 2026, "Expense, Revenue, Contract", pages 80E-84E. <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/omb/downloads/pdf/exec25/erc5-25.pdf>

Causes & Scope of the FDNY Emergency Medical Services Staffing Crisis - -

- Successive NYC Councils Have Called for Pay Parity for the FDNY EMS
- Successive NYC Mayors Have Openly Rejected Pay Parity

The NYC Council Adopted and Then Had to Override Mayor Giuliani's Veto of Local Law 19 of 2001

"The Council finds that employees working for the fire department of the city of New York ("FDNY") as emergency medical technicians ("EMT's"), advanced emergency medical technicians ("paramedics") and the supervisors of EMT's or paramedics have certain terms and conditions of employment similar to those, of the **uniformed services** of the city of New York, including police, **fire, sanitation** and correction services . . . The Council intends by this amendment to the administrative code that **those individuals employed by the FDNY as EMT's, paramedics and supervisors of EMT's or paramedics be accorded the same unique bargaining rights as the uniformed forces of the City.**" NYC Local Law 19 of 2001.

<https://intro.nyc/local-laws/2001-19>

Next, the Giuliani and Bloomberg Administrations fought Local Law 19 in the Courts for Years but Lost

"The Mayor of New York City challenges the validity of two local laws, passed by the City Council over his veto, that give certain fire department employees the status of "uniformed" fire service members for collective bargaining purposes. Like Supreme Court and the Appellate Division, we reject the Mayor's challenge. . ." Mayor of City of N.Y. v Council of City of N.Y. 2007 June 12, 2007 Court of Appeals. As corrected through Wednesday, September 12, 2007.

<https://law.justia.com/cases/new-york/court-of-appeals/2007/2007-05132.html>

In the 18 years since that Appellate Court decision, 3 FDNY Emergency Medical Services labor contracts have been negotiated, one in 2008 with the Bloomberg administration, and two with the de Blasio administration in 2016 and 2021.

Again In 2020, the NYC Council Made Its Position Clear It Adopted Pay Parity Resolution 1062-2019-A

That "the salaries of New York City emergency medical service personnel to be comparable to New York City's firefighters and police officers". Unanimously adopted on May 28, 2020. Sponsored by Council Members: I. Daneek Miller, Laurie A. Cumbo, **Adrienne E. Adams**, Margaret S. Chin, Helen K. Rosenthal, Joseph C. Borelli, Ydanis A. Rodriguez, **Francisco P. Moya**, Ben Kallos, Peter A. Koo, **Diana I. Ayala**, **Justin Brannan**, **Robert F. Holden**, Alicka Ampry-Samuel, **Brad S. Lander**, Fernando Cabrera, Costa G. Constantinides, Carlos Menchaca, Antonio Reynoso, Farah N. Louis, Andy L. King, Donovan J. Richards, Deborah L. Rose, Robert E. Cornegy, Jr., **Keith Powers**, Carlina Rivera, **Mark Levine**, Vanessa L. Gibson, Paul A. Vallone, Alan N. Maisel, **Public Advocate Jumaane Williams**. <https://nyc.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4146331&GUID=6E165905-EC68-4D4B-9B08-BE4D480E42C2&G=2FD004F1-D85B-4588-A648-0A736C77D6E3&Options=&Search=>

But Mayor Bill de Blasio Didn't Negotiate with the EMS as a "Uniformed" Service

"Just as the FDNY's Emergency Medical Service unions prepare to negotiate a contract, **Mayor de Blasio** put a damper on their efforts to achieve pay parity with police and firefighters by suggesting that the vast gap between top salary for the other jobs and EMS pay existed because their 'work is different.' "

"Mayor de Blasio, asked during an unrelated press conference about the wide gulf in salaries between Emergency Medical Service workers and other first-responders that accounts for a high turnover rate at EMS, replied, 'We are trying to make sure people are treated fairly and paid fairly, but I do think the work is different.'" Hennelly, Bob, "De Blasio Defends Big Gap in Pay Separating EMS from Cops, Fire", *The Chief*, January 28, 2019. <https://thechiefleader.com/stories/de-blasio-defends-big-gap-in-pay-separating-ems-from-cops-fire-free-article,5401>

► EMS Union Local 2507 responded to Mayor de Blasio with a video, "The Work Is Different". It is on the union website at: <https://local2507.com/video/2507.mp4>

In a 2021 City Hall Press Release: "Mayor de Blasio, Commissioner Campion Announce Tentative Contract Agreement with EMS Union District Council 37. . . This agreement conforms to **the pattern reached with other civilian unions**. . ." Press Release, Office of the Mayor, "Mayor de Blasio, Commissioner Campion Announce Tentative Contract Agreement with EMS Union District Council 37, Raising Wages for Over 4,500 FDNY Employees, Official Website of the City of New York, August 6, 2021. Is that correct? See pp. 17,19 and 20.

"Following negotiations in the summer of 2021, the EMS union stated '**the City categorically refused to provide pay parity or anything that approximated pay parity for EMS First Responders in the FDNY.**' " Edwards, Esq., Tanisha S., Chief Financial Officer, "The New York City Council's Response to the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Budget and Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report", April 1, 2022, p. 13. <https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2022/04/Fiscal-2023-Preliminary-Budget-Response-.pdf>

Mayor Adams Took a Different Position - But Hasn't Acted

"Our EMTs, paramedics, and fire inspectors deserve our City's thanks and respect, but for years they have been shamefully denied basic pay equity. As mayor, I will not stand for discrimination against workers, especially not the women and men who have put their lives at risk to save ours day after day . . ." Mayoral Candidate Eric Adams 2020. *New York Post*, June 26, 2023; and, "Finally one of your own is going to understand." video link: <https://www.nbcnewyork.com/on-air/as-seen-on/eric-adams-voices-support-for-emt-workers-who-boycotted-ticker-tape-parade/3143223/>

"So, the goal is to look at all of these inequities and start peeling back these inequities as we finish this term . . . he said." Hennelly, Bob, "NYC Mayor: 'My goal is to 'rectify and correct' FDNY EMS pay inequity." *Work-Bites*. <https://www.work-bites.com/view-all/f5js7i8exdxwbxzd8o83e305igfq2n>

". . . but with only a few months to go. . . Adams' administration has not put EMS workers' wages on par with firefighters." Sommerfeldt, Chris, "Mayor Adams Promised Pay Equity for EMTs but New Info Reveals Strong Resistance inside City Hall", *New York Daily News*, September 7, 2025. <https://www.nydailynews.com/2025/09/07/mayor-adams-promised-pay-equity-for-emts-but-new-info-reveals-strong-resistance-inside-city-hall/?share=ywseinsowirnwu2s02v7>

► EMS Union Local 2507 has responded to Mayor Adams with a video. It can be viewed at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LSupTAV9hDA&embeds_referring_euri=https%3A%2F%2Flocal2507.com%2F&source_ve_path=OTY3MTQ

By 2019, the NYC Council Already Knew Low Pay & High Attrition Rates Were Having Negative Consequences

"The **attrition rate is higher** among Emergency Medical Technicians (EMTs) than firefighters because of a **lower average salary**, when compared to other employers in the healthcare field. EMTs also often leave FDNY for other healthcare careers, and some transition to other jobs within the Department. **This raises concerns around the Department's retention and budgetary strategy for EMS personnel.**"

" . . . **the different pay rates for uniformed [firefighters] and EMS may create staffing challenges for the Department.** . . . A first-year firefighter makes 24 percent more than an EMT . . ."

"EMS' Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget totals \$322.1 million, with a headcount of 4,301 [includes the Chiefs, Captains, and Lieutenants] . . . headcount remains unchanged when compared to the Fiscal 2019 Adopted Budget."

"The number of EMS ambulance runs and headcount has steadily increased over the years. **From 2014 to 2018, the average number of EMS ambulance runs was 1.7 million runs.** . . . The increase in the trend could be attributed to EMS having to pick up runs that were previously operated by non-FDNY entities.

"The Department generates revenue from EMS ambulance transports. . . The projected revenue for Fiscal 2020 **is \$182.2 million.**" Lee, Jin, Financial Analyst, et al., "The Council of the City of New York Report of the Finance Division on the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Plan and the Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report for the Fire Department of New York", March 7, 2019, pp. 6-15.

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2019/03/FDNY1.pdf>

Many, Many PUBLIC OFFICIALS have Gone on Record about the PROBLEMS but NOTHING HAS CHANGED

NYS Attorney General Letitia James

"Equal pay for equal work is a basic human right," said Attorney General James. "Our EMS and EMT workers dedicate their lives to supporting us, and it's past time we give them the support they deserve. I'm proud to stand with them in solidarity in their fight for fairness." "FDNY EMS Rally for Equal Pay", *Queens Gazette*, October, 2, 2019. <https://www.qgazette.com/articles/fdny-ems-rally-for-equal-pay/>

NYS Comptroller Thomas DiNapoli

"FDNY EMS personnel are compensated less than other first responders in the City and other EMS departments nationwide." Office of the New York State Comptroller Thomas DiNapoli, *Issue Brief*, February 2, 2022. <https://www.osc.state.ny.us/files/reports/osdc/pdf/fdny-issue-brief.pdf>

Stacey Pheffer Amato, New York State Assembly Chair Committee on Governmental Employees

"The long-standing practice of discriminatory pay towards EMS workers is simply unacceptable and must be rectified immediately." "FDNY EMS Rally for Equal Pay", *Queens Gazette*, October, 2, 2019. <https://www.qgazette.com/articles/fdny-ems-rally-for-equal-pay/>

NYC Council Adrienne Adams & Justin Brannan

"This tremendous wage gap sends a clear message to rank-and-file EMS . . . that they are second-class citizens in the eyes of our city. . . Police officers, firefighters and EMS workers may have different titles and responsibilities, but they are all first responders who risk their lives daily to protect our lives and "the lives of their fellow first responders. **The case for pay parity is overwhelming.** We need to deliver it and we need to deliver it now." Adrienne Adams and Justin Brannan, "Pay EMTs What They Deserve", *New York Daily News*, February 22, 2020, page 20. <https://www.nydailynews.com/2020/02/22/pay-emts-what-they-deserve-end-the-undefensible-disparities-between-these-and-other-first-responders/>

Corey Johnson, NYC Council Speaker and I. Daneek Miller, Chair of NYC Council Committee on Civil Service and Labor - May 2020

"There can be no further argument against fairly compensating these beleaguered but endlessly brave first responders. The time is now to show our gratitude for their service, commitment to excellence, and the value they add daily to our city by **giving them the equal pay and benefits** they rightly deserve." Johnson, Corey and Miller, I. Daneek, "Enough Talk, Time to Give FDNY EMS Their Due," *Gotham Gazette*, May 27, 2020. <https://www.gothamgazette.com/130-opinion/9436-enough-talk-give-fdny-emts-their-due-coronavirus-benefits>

Brooklyn Borough President Eric Adams and Council Member Justin Brannan - April 2021

"There's no other way to say it: The way New York City treats our EMS workers is shameful, if not borderline discriminatory. . . While the goal was that workers from both agencies would eventually reach pay parity, the disparity in pay has only grown, more than tripling . . . **The best way to achieve pay parity for EMS workers is to give them their own independent agency**, where they are not an afterthought, but the main show.

"**Part of responsible governance is acknowledging when something we try simply does not work . . .** We've seen enough over the last 25 years to know that the original goals behind merging FDNY and EMS did not materialize. **It's time to undo the merger, and give EMS workers the representation, funding, and professionalism they deserve.**" Adams, Eric and Brannan, Justin, "New York City Needs to Treat EMS Workers So Much Better", *am/NY*, April 21, 2021. <https://www.amny.com/oped/op-ed-new-york-city-needs-to-treat-emts-workers-so-much-better/>

NYC Council Member Francisco Moya - EMS Predominantly Women & Minorities

"It's time to end this appalling pay disparity. **EMTs shoulder the greatest burden of 911 calls. They handled 1.3 million of the 1.8 million calls, or 71% of all emergency calls, in 2018.** They accomplished that with less than half the number of EMTs than the FDNY has firefighters – 4,000 medical technicians to 11,000 firefighters. They may not look the same — FDNY is majority white and male, while EMS is predominantly made up of women and minorities — but they're alike in one critical way: They are heroes. Countless New Yorkers are alive today because of the lifesaving decisions EMTs made when they arrived on the scene. Every day we ask EMTs to save lives while barely paying them enough to live themselves," said Councilman Francisco Moya." "FDNY EMS Rally for Equal Pay", *Queens Gazette*, October, 2, 2019. <https://www.qgazette.com/articles/fdny-emts-rally-for-equal-pay/>

NYC Council Member Robert Holden

"We must do right by our EMS so they can continue to do the work that they do for nearly nine million New Yorkers and millions more who visit our city each year." "FDNY EMS Rally for Equal Pay", *Queens Gazette*, October, 2, 2019. <https://www.qgazette.com/articles/fdny-emts-rally-for-equal-pay/>

FDNY Commissioner (1996-2001) Von Essen - Gap between EMS & Firefighter Pay

"It's time to pay up. . . You have to want to do it." "*Paramedic Pay: 7 On Your Side Investigates Salaries, Benefits of NYC's First Responders*" Dan Krauth, January 29, 2021. See video interview - <https://abc7ny.com/ems-new-york-city-fdny-emts-7-on-your-side/10132108/>" 'Nobody worked harder during the pandemic . . . They gained more respect than ever. But **I don't see anybody really making an effort to close the gap between firefighters and EMTs.**' " [Former] FDNY Commissioner Von Essen. *New York Daily News*, March 16, 2021. <https://www.nydailynews.com/2021/03/16/an-unlikely-marriage-that-lived-25-years-later-fdny-and-emt-still-together-after-testy-merger/>

"Nobody did anything for those guys. These guys have been getting screwed around for years. **It's so wrong. It's disgusting,**" said Von Essen – who oversaw the transfer of the EMS service from the public hospital system, Health + Hospitals, to the FDNY." Campanile, Carl "Life-Saving NYC Medics Treated Like Zeroes with Low Pay: ex-FDNY Boss Says", *New York Post*, October 15, 2023. <https://nypost.com/2023/10/15/life-saving-nyc-medics-treated-like-zeroes-with-low-pay-ex-fdny-boss-von-essen-says/>

FDNY Commissioner (2014-2022) Daniel Nigro

"FDNY Commissioner Daniel Nigro voiced support Tuesday for boosting wages for emergency medical services staff to bring them in line with other first responders . . ." Shant Shahrigian, *New York Daily News*, March 3, 2020, as posted at: <https://www.ems1.com/labor-issues/articles/fdny-commissioner-voices-support-for-raising-emt-provider-pay-eMqjzMbfP0wmYBGD/>

FDNY Commissioner Laura Kavanaugh

". . .FDNY Commissioner Laura Kavanaugh said she agreed that the current gap in pay and benefits was outdated . . ." Lewis, Caroline, *Gothamist*, September 23, 2022. <https://gothamist.com/news/new-york-city-struggles-staff-paramedics-emt-emergency-call-response-times-grow-longer>

Chief of EMS (2019-2023) Lillian Bonsignore - Firefighter Exam and Low Pay

"Those who leave EMS do not do so without a good reason. While there are many factors that could lead a member to depart, I'd like to discuss two of the biggest. **One factor that contributes to attrition among our members is the firefighter promotional exam**, which enables age-eligible EMS members, to take a civil service test and be appointed as firefighters. This exam is uniquely available to EMS members, and the two most recent tests - Exam 2500 and Exam 7501 - **resulted in approximately 1400 members of EMS being appointed as firefighters between the beginning of 2013 and the end of 2019.**

"While we don't have specific feedback from every member who resigned, we know that **another key factor in members departing is pay.**" NYC Council Fire and Emergency Management Committee Hearing, Oversight: EMS Attrition. Hearing Testimony, January 28, 2020. <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4288305&GUID=3B51F7AA-A446-45D4-94B9-12A3EF630F68&Options=&Search=>

"Bonsignore said she . . . hopes her successor continues the push . . .[to] decrease the sizable pay gap between EMS and other first responders so EMTs and paramedics are able to support themselves and not work multiple jobs. . . **we're not just a group of ambulance drivers. We're highly trained medical professionals that can bring emergency room training to your bedside.**" Thomas Tracy "First Woman NYC EMS Chief to Retire after 3-Decade Career; 'No One Told Me We Would Have a Worldwide Pandemic', *New York Daily News*, Dec 07, 2022. <https://www.nydailynews.com/2022/12/07/first-woman-nyc-ems-chief-to-retire-after-3-decade-career-no-one-told-me-we-would-have-a-worldwide-pandemic/>

Some EMS Revenue for NYC - Health and Hospitals (HHC) Financial Statement - FY 2019

Net Amounts due to the City at June 30, the balance of third-party reimbursements received by HHC and for FDNY Emergency Medical Services provided on behalf of HHC -

2019: \$187,713,000 ✓

2018: \$192,692,000

Source: Grant Thornton, Report of Independent Certified Public Accountants, "New York City Health and Hospital Corporation (A Component Unit of the City of New York) Financial Statements, June 30, 2019 and 2018, October 16, 2019, p. 48.

<https://comptroller.nyc.gov/statements/new-york-city-health-and-hospitals-corporation-hhc/>

► **QUESTION:** What were the sources, and the amounts, of other FDNY EMS revenue in FY2019?

=====

September 2019 EMS Staffing - Pre-Pandemic The New York City Council FDNY EMS Workforce Analysis



EMS WORKFORCE ANALYSIS

MONTH ENDING:

September 30, 2019

GENDER AND ETHNICITY															
EMS WORKFORCE	MALE							FEMALE							GRAND TOTAL
	W	B	H	A	N	OTHER	MALE TOTAL	W	B	H	A	N	OTHER	FEMALE TOTAL	
CHIEF of EMS	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	1
ASSISTANT CHIEF	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
DEPUTY ASSISTANT CHIEF	2	0	2	0	0	0	4	2	0	0	0	0	0	2	6
DIVISION CHIEF	8	2	0	0	0	0	10	4	0	1	0	0	0	5	15
DEPUTY CHIEF	15	3	4	0	0	0	22	4	2	0	0	0	0	6	28
CAPTAIN	34	7	14	7	0	0	62	9	5	5	0	0	0	19	81
LIEUTENANT	200	55	83	25	0	1	364	58	40	24	6	0	0	128	492
PARAMEDIC	260	102	168	60	3	21	614	77	56	86	13	0	9	241	855
EMT	835	379	547	90	5	95	1951	198	233	257	16	1	51	756	2707
EMS TRAINEE	76	15	30	6	0	6	133	7	24	12	2	0	1	46	179
TOTAL	1430	563	849	188	8	123	3161	359	360	386	37	1	61	1204	4365
Percentage %	45.24%	17.81%	26.86%	5.95%	0.25%	3.89%	72.42%	29.82%	29.90%	32.06%	3.07%	0.08%	5.07%	27.58%	100.00%

Source: <https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2020/10/Fire-Department-of-New-York-EMS-and-Uniformed-Personnel-Demographics-Report.pdf>

The above September 30, 2019 workforce analysis listed 3,562 FDNY EMTs and non-officer Paramedics, 2,707 EMTs and 855 Paramedics. Basic Life Support ambulances are staffed with 2 EMTs and Advance Life Support ambulances are staffed with 2 paramedics. EMS covers the 5 boroughs, 365 days a year, 7 days a week, and 24 hours a day.

FDNY Emergency Medical Services EMT and Paramedics Local 2507 - Unfair Benefits

Testimony before the NYC Council - January 2020 (Before the Pandemic Declaration)

"Our members risk their lives every day just like our brothers and sisters of the fire side, many who are here today to show support. We should be paid and recognized as the first responders we are. By way of example, three days ago the Mayor issued an advisory that laid out the city's preparedness for the deadly coronavirus that has spread to 16 countries including the United States. He boasted we have the best emergency response team in the nation, guess whose members are going to be on the frontlines of this life threatening fight providing the medical support, expertise and skill to protect over eight million New Yorkers from this deadly attack, it's these EMTs and paramedics that are facing life threats each and every day. . . **Not only are they underpaid but they are only given 12 paid sick days per year unlike their colleagues on the fire side of the same department that have unlimited sick pay.**" Oren Barzilay, President Local 2507 of District Council 37 representing the uniformed EMTs, paramedics and fire inspectors. NYC Council Committee on Fire and Emergency Management, Oversight - EMS Attrition, January 28, 2020. Hearing Transcript.

<https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4288305&GUID=3B51F7AA-A446-45D4-94B9-12A3EF630F68&Options=&Search=>

FDNY Emergency Medical Services Officers' Union Local 3621 Testimony before the NYC Council - January 2020 (Before the Pandemic Declaration) - Retention and Salary

"**For the past two decades** we have been coming here explaining the trials and tribulations of New York City's EMS system, the common thread in all those meetings have been **retention and salary**. For two decades we have told you the adverse impact on the citizens of New York this causes. In the last four years alone, as of 2019, a full 68 percent of our workforce has left for other jobs. . . the practice of medicine is one that only gets better with experience, what the Mayor and city has done is create a civil service version of hunger games with EMS workers as the tribute. **The average current EMS worker has four years or less of experience, we are street doctors, and nobody here would go to a hospital if we were told them that every doctor in there has less than four years' experience.** As recent events such as the coronavirus has shown us it will be EMS on the frontline treating and containing it, we are the canaries of the medical system. . . we know our sacrifice will help protect and save those lives of the people of this great city." Anthony Almojero, Vice President Local 3621 EMS Officers' Union. NYC Council Committee on Fire and Emergency Management, Oversight - EMS Attrition, January 28, 2020. Hearing Transcript.

<https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4288305&GUID=3B51F7AA-A446-45D4-94B9-12A3EF630F68&Options=&Search=>

The New York City Council - March 2020 - Attrition Alert

"Recognizing that EMS staff are the **lowest paid first responders in NYC**, the Council in its Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Budget Response, called for an increase in EMS staff pay rates. FDNY's Emergency Medical Technicians (EMTs) and Paramedics earn less than their counterparts in many other U.S cities do.

Furthermore, **FDNY EMS salaries are significantly lower than firefighter salaries**. . . The difference in a firefighter salary and those of EMTs and paramedics grows to 68 and 31 percent respectively after five years.

"The different pay rates for uniformed (firefighters) and EMS create staffing challenges for the Department as many EMS workers apply . . . to become a firefighter. According to the Department, **the Fiscal 2019 attrition rate for EMS was 13.2 percent**, which is 8.6 percentage points higher than the Fiscal 2019 firefighter attrition rate of 4.6 percent. The attrition rate is higher among EMTs than firefighters because of a lower average salary, when compared to other employers in the healthcare field."

"EMS' Fiscal 2021 Preliminary Budget totals **\$346.3 million**, with a headcount of 4,593 positions. . . EMS has seen an increase in workload since Fiscal 2016. . . **EMS continues to spend over the budgeted amount of overtime due to increased workload, staffing challenges, . . .**"

"FDNY's annual EMS budget of approximately **\$345 million** is partially funded by revenue from ambulance transports."

"For Fiscal 2020, the FDNY is projecting \$227.8 million from all sources. Of the total **EMS actual revenue in Fiscal 2019, 44 percent came from commercial, 27 percent from Medicaid, 11 percent from Medicare, and approximately five percent from self-paying individuals.**" Kern, Jack, Financial Analyst, et al., "The Council of the City of New York Report of the Finance Division on the Fiscal 2021 Preliminary Plan and the Fiscal 2020 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report for the Fire Department of New York", March 3, 2020, pp. 6-19.
<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2020/02/057-FDNY.pdf>.

More EMS Revenue for NYC - Health and Hospitals (HHC) Financial Statement - FY 2020

Net Amounts due to the City at June 30, the balance of third-party reimbursements received by HHC and due to NYC for FDNY Emergency Medical Services provided on behalf of HHC:

2020: **\$375,742,000** ✓

2019: **\$187,713,000**

Source: Grant Thornton, Report of Independent Certified Public Accountants, "New York City Health and Hospital Corporation (A Component Unit of the City of New York) Financial Statements June 30, 2020 and 2019, October 15, 2020, p. 48.
<https://comptroller.nyc.gov/statements/new-york-city-health-and-hospitals-corporation-hhc/>

► **QUESTION:** What were the sources, and the amounts, of other FDNY EMS revenue in FY2020?

The New York City Council - March 2021 - Lack of EMS Pay Equity

"Using figures provided by the Fire Department, the average Emergency Medical Technician makes \$32,000 less than the average firefighter, and paramedics make \$14,000 less compared to firefighters. When fringe benefits, including pensions, are factored in the average EMT earns \$134,000 less and the average paramedic makes \$108,000 less." Kern, Jack, Financial Analyst, et. al., "New York City Council Report of the Finance Division on the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Plan and the Fiscal 2021 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report, Fire Department City of New York, March 19, 2021, p. 15.
<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2021/03/FDNY-.pdf>

The New York City Council - May 2021 - FDNY EMS - Lowest Paid First Responders

"FDNY's emergency medical technicians and paramedics are among the lowest paid first responders in New York City. The Council called on the administration to increase the salaries to be comparable to other first responders by performing an analysis to determine the cost of phasing in a wage increase. There are approximately 4,300 FDNY EMS members, of whom approximately 59 percent are nonwhite. **FDNY's EMTs and paramedics earn significantly less than other emergency responders in New York City** and other EMS services around the country. A starting EMT in San Francisco earns \$74,000 in the first year, compared to \$35,254 for an FDNY EMT. After five years, the base salary in New York is only \$50,604 for EMTs, \$65,226 for paramedics, in comparison to \$85,292 for firefighters. The gap continues into supervisor ranks, and the average salary is \$102,253 for a Uniformed FDNY lieutenant and \$70,139 for an FDNY EMS lieutenant." McKinney, Latonia R., Director, et al., Finance Division, "New York City Council Finance Division Note on the fiscal 2022 Executive Budget for the Fire Department of New York", May, 2021, p. 5. <https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2021/05/FDNY-Budget-Note.pdf>

The New York City Council - August 2021 - Bargaining Hasn't Helped

". . . Firefighters and EMS workers belong to different unions yet work in the same agency, resulting in vastly different compensation. EMS workers (predominantly women and Hispanic or Latino, and Black or African American) have attempted bargaining for higher pay but have not been successful, while the FDNY has not faced the same issues " New York City Council Data Operations Unit, "Pay Equity in NYC, Analysis of Pay differences in the New York City Municipal Workforce", August, 2021, p. 63.
http://council.nyc.gov/data/wp-content/uploads/sites/73/2021/08/080221.OC03.PAY-EQUITY-IN-NYC_v8.pdf

More EMS Revenue for NYC - Health and Hospitals (HHC) Financial Statement FY 2021

Net Amounts due to the City at June 30, the balance of third-party reimbursements received by HHC and due to NYC for FDNY Emergency Medical Services provided on behalf of HHC:

2021: **\$345,911,000** ✓

2020: \$375,742,000

Source: Source: Grant Thornton, Report of Independent Certified Public Accountants, "New York City Health and Hospital Corporation (A Component Unit of the City of New York) Financial Statements June 30, 2021 and 2020, October 20, 2021, p. 49. <https://comptroller.nyc.gov/statements/new-york-city-health-and-hospitals-corporation-hhc/>

► **QUESTION:** What were the sources, and the amounts, of other FDNY EMS revenue in FY2021?

The New York City Council - March 2022 - Another Attrition Warning

"FDNY's Emergency Medical Technicians (EMTs) and Paramedics earn less than their counterparts in New York. The starting salary for an EMT at the Department is \$39,386. It is \$53,891 for a paramedic. A first-year firefighter earns \$43,904, 11 percent more than an EMT. . . **The different pay rates for uniformed and EMS create staffing challenges for the Department as many EMS workers apply for a promotion to become a firefighter.**

"According to the Department, the Fiscal 2019 attrition rate for EMS was 13.2 percent, which is 8.6 percentage points higher than the Fiscal 2019 firefighter attrition rate of 4.6 percent. The attrition rate is higher among EMTs than firefighters because of a lower average salary, when compared to other employers in the healthcare field. The attrition rate for EMS was 5.4 percent and 6.7 percent in Fiscal 2020 and 2021 respectively, while it was 4.6 and 4.1 percent for Firefighters in the same years . . . This **raises concerns around the Department's retention** and budgetary strategy for EMS personnel."

Kern, Jack, Financial Analyst, "New York City Council Report on the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Plan and the Fiscal 2022 Mayor's Management Report for the Fire Department of New York City", March 9, 2022, pp. 6, 9-10.

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2022/03/FDNY.pdf?fbclid=IwAR3vnKebyClgsX6tlwJ5s86wUF66ZD9LYAS4PLnkRFQIbInhJG6TIXYNy14>

The New York City Council - April 2022 - Council Wants EMS Pay Parity

"The Council calls on the Administration to take the necessary steps to achieve EMS pay parity. . . it is important to recognize that **pay parity for our Emergency Medical Services workers is still a priority to the Council**; EMS salaries must be competitive with other first responders so that these frontline worker positions can be retained."

"**EMS members are the lowest paid first responders in New York City**, and the Council has consistently advocated for wage equity. We urge the Administration to raise EMS salaries to be competitive with other first responders. Prior to his election, Mayor Adams stated that EMS personnel required parity. The Council requests that the Administration include wage parity in future contract discussions with EMS members. . . The approximately 4,600 members of EMS, including EMTs and paramedics, earn much less than other emergency responders in New York City and other EMS services across the country. Following negotiations in the summer of 2021, the EMS union stated **'the City categorically refused to provide pay parity or anything that approximated pay parity for EMS First Responders in the FDNY.'**" Edwards, Esq., Tanisha S., Chief Financial Officer,

"The New York City Council's Response to the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Budget and Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report", April 1, 2022, pp. 2, 11, 13.

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2022/04/Fiscal-2023-Preliminary-Budget-Response-.pdf>

More EMS Revenue for NYC - Health and Hospitals (HHC) Financial Statement FY 2022

Net Amounts due to the City at June 30, the balance of third-party reimbursements received by HHC and due to NYC for FDNY Emergency Medical Services provided on behalf of HHC:

2022: **\$184,894,000** ✓

2021: \$345,911,000

Source: Source: Grant Thornton, Report of Independent Certified Public Accountants, "New York City Health and Hospital Corporation (A Component Unit of the City of New York) Financial Statements June 30, 2022 and 2021, October 24, 2022, p. 50. <https://comptroller.nyc.gov/statements/new-york-city-health-and-hospitals-corporation-hhc/>

► **QUESTION:** What were the sources, and the amounts, of other FDNY EMS revenue in FY2022?

FDNY Emergency Medical Services Staffing - October 2022



EMS WORKFORCE ANALYSIS

As of today: 10/03/2022

GENDER AND ETHNICITY															
EMS WORKFORCE	MALE							FEMALE							GRAND TOTAL
	W	B	H	A	N	OTHER	MALE TOTAL	W	B	H	A	N	OTHER	FEMALE TOTAL	
CHIEF of EMS	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	1
ASSISTANT CHIEF	1	0	1	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
DEPUTY ASSISTANT CHIEF	4	1	1	0	0	0	6	2	0	0	0	0	0	2	8
DIVISION CHIEF	11	1	2	0	0	0	14	5	2	1	0	0	0	8	22
DEPUTY CHIEF	14	3	6	3	0	0	26	4	5	1	0	0	0	10	36
CAPTAIN	34	6	10	4	0	0	54	15	8	7	1	0	0	31	85
LIEUTENANT	177	50	87	31	1	3	349	40	34	28	7	0	1	110	459
PARAMEDIC	252	97	179	58	2	25	613	86	58	108	11	0	12	275	888
EMT	1030	437	575	85	10	163	2300	188	242	240	14	0	55	739	3039
EMS TRAINEE	2	3	2	0	0	0	7	0	3	0	0	0	0	3	10
TOTAL	1525	598	863	181	13	191	3371	340	352	386	33	0	68	1179	4550
Percentage %	33.52%	13.14%	18.97%	3.98%	0.29%	4.20%	74.09%	7.47%	7.74%	8.48%	0.73%	0.00%	1.49%	25.91%	100.00%

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2023/01/FDNY-EMS-DEMOGRAPHICS-OCT-2022.pdf>

The October 3, 2022 work force analysis above listed 3,957 FDNY EMTs and non-officer Paramedics, **3039 EMTs and 888 Paramedics**. Basic Life Support ambulances are staffed with 2 EMTs and Advance Life Support ambulances are staffed with 2 paramedics. EMS covers the 5 boroughs, 365 days a year, 7 days a week, and 24 hours a day.

The New York City Council - March 2023 - EMS Response Times Increasing

"Civilian EMS make up the next largest portion of the (Fire) Department, with more than 4,300 positions, comprising 25 percent of the Department's headcount.

"The FDNY has nine performance indicators that present response time trends. . .The most notable increase is end-to-end combined average response time to life-threatening medical emergencies by ambulances, which increased from seven minutes and twenty seconds in the first four months of Fiscal 2022, to seven minutes and fifty-five seconds in the same period in Fiscal 2023."

"EMS has historically been more diverse than the Department at large. In Fiscal 2022, the EMS was comprised of 74 percent male and 26 percent female. In Fiscal 2021, the EMS headcount skewed slightly more female, with a headcount made up of 73.63 percent male and 26.37 percent female." Singh, Tanveer, Financial Analyst, "New York City Council Report on the Fiscal 2024 Preliminary Plan and the Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report for the Fire Department of New York", March 13, 2023, pp. 5-10.

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2023/03/FDNY-.pdf>

The New York City Council - April 2023 - No EMS Pay Parity - a Problem for Public Safety

"Another common reason provided for high vacancy rates in particular positions, something that predates the pandemic, is the low pay provided to employees in certain titles. . . **This is an issue of particular concern for the emergency medical service (EMS) workers at the Fire Department. . . Without additional pay parity, service provision will continue to erode, in some cases endangering public safety.**" Lee, Richard, Director Finance Division, et al., "New York City Council's Response to the Fiscal 2024 Preliminary Budget and Fiscal 2023 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report, April 3, 2023, p. 19.

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2023/04/Fiscal-2024-Preliminary-Budget-Response-Final-1.pdf>

The New York City Council - May 2023 - EMS Revenue to Exceed Costs?

"Projected revenue to cover the costs of the EMS is \$367 million, which is \$16.4 million more than the Fiscal 2023 budget at adoption."

NOTE - FDNY EMS assumed the operation of 2 basic life support units previously run by Kingsbrook Jewish Hospital. Singh, Tanveer, Financial Analyst, New York City Council, "Report to the Committee on Finance and the Committee on Fire and Emergency Management on the Fiscal 2024 Executive Plan and the Fiscal 2024 Executive Capital Commitment for the Fire Department of New York, May 17, 2023, pp. 2 & 4.

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2023/05/FDNY.pdf>

2023 New York State Senate Hearing - High EMS Turnover

"There is no denying that New York is facing large labor shortages . . . especially among FDNY EMS personnel . . . Any EMT or paramedic will tell you that these shortages are the result of decades of pay disparity . . . **Poverty wages and truly difficult, if not horrific, work conditions for members result in EMS losing on average 30% of new hires within 3 years; and 50% in 5 years!** That is a massive attrition rate. . ." New York State Senate, Standing Committee on Civil Service and Pensions NYC Public Hearing, October 17, 2023, Testimony of Oren Barzilay, President FDNY EMS Local 2507, DC 37, AFSCME, AFL-CIO.

<https://www.nysenate.gov/sites/default/files/admin/structure/media/manage/filefile/a/2023-10/local-2507.pdf>

FDNY EMS Assumes Coverage of Northwell Health Ambulance Tours - 2023

"Northwell Health, effective Sunday, is reducing coverage in eastern and central Queens, *The Post* has learned. **It cut ambulance tours on Staten Island earlier this year.**

"The cuts include **elimination of advanced life support on night/overnight ambulance tours in Douglaston, Little Neck, Bayside, Forest Hills and Rego Park**, according to a union official briefed on the reduction. . . Barzilay said FDNY EMS had agreed to cover the tours abandoned by Northwell Health . . . This change is in conjunction with FDNY EMS leadership." FDNY had no immediate comment." Campanile, Carl, "Northwell Health slashes ambulance coverage, raising concerns about NYC emergency response", *New York Post*, September 17, 2023.

<https://nypost.com/2023/09/17/northwell-health-slashes-nyc-ambulance-coverage-raising-concerns/>

More EMS Revenue for NYC - Health and Hospitals (HHC) Financial Statement - FY 2023

Net Amounts due to the City at June 30, the balance of third-party reimbursements received by HHC and due to NYC for FDNY Emergency Medical Services provided on behalf of HHC:

2023: \$203,162,000 ✓

2022: \$184,894,000

Source: Grant Thornton, Report of Independent Certified Public Accountants, "New York City Health and Hospital Corporation (A Component Unit of the City of New York) Financial Statements June 30, 2023 and 2022, October 19, 2023, p. 48.

<https://comptroller.nyc.gov/statements/new-york-city-health-and-hospitals-corporation-hhc/>

► **QUESTION:** What were the sources, and the amounts, of other FDNY EMS revenue in FY2023?

The New York City Council - March 2024 - Advocates Wage Equity

"The EMS are consistently the lowest paid first responders in New York City. The Council has long advocated for wage equity for the EMS making their salaries competitive with other first responders.

"Prior to his election, Mayor Adams stated that EMS personnel required parity, this has not yet been accomplished by his Administration." Singh, Tanveer, Financial Analyst, "New York City Council Finance Division Report on the Fiscal 2025 Preliminary Plan and the Fiscal 2024 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report for the Fire Department of New York", March 15, 2024, p. 9.

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2024/03/057-FDNY.pdf>

More EMS Revenue for NYC - Health and Hospitals (HHC) Financial Statement - FY 2024

"The liability for Emergency Medical Services ("EMS") operations represents the balance of third-party payor reimbursement received by NYC Health + Hospitals and due to the City for EMS services provided by the City of New York's Fire Department ("FDNY") on behalf of NYC Health + Hospitals.":

June 30, 2024: \$452,145,000. ✓

Source: KPMG, "New York City Health and Hospital Corporation (A Component Unit of the City of New York) Financial Statements June 30, 2024 and 2023. (With Independent Auditors' Report with Government Standards Thereon)", October 22, 2024, p. 40. <https://comptroller.nyc.gov/statements/new-york-city-health-and-hospitals-corporation-hhc/>

► **QUESTION:** What were the sources, and the amounts, of other FDNY EMS revenue in FY2024?

The New York City Council Committee on Civil Service and Labor - January 2025 - Inequity

"I will reiterate to you our commitment to getting this right when it comes to our EMS EMT workforce. I recognize the inequity and the unfairness that your workforce has had to contend for years, and I remain committed to continuing to work with you on this issue so more to come and I really appreciate you taking the time to come here and to speak about this discrepancy, this unfair treatment that this workforce that is so important, right? If anyone has been in an ambulance, we understand the importance of this workforce and you all should be compensated as such. . ." Carmen De La Rosa, Chairperson, City Council City of New York, Committee on Civil Service and Labor, Transcript of the Minutes of the Committee on Civil Service and Labor, January 27, 2025, pp. 69-70.

<https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=7091565&GUID=B0A93DA2-6836-40CA-B612-52DBFCA863F1&Options=&Search=>

FDNY Commissioner Robert Tucker - February 2025

"In 2024, the FDNY responded to 1.6 million medical calls. About 50% of calls firefighters are dispatched to are medical calls. The future of the FDNY is in emergency medical services, Commissioner Tucker said."

[https://www.nyc.gov/site/fdny/news/Y20625/fdny-commissioner-robert-s-tucker-delivers-2025-state-the-fdny-stronger-better-trained-and-...:text=Tucker delivers 2025 State of the FDNY: 'Stronger, better, to have ready to deploy?](https://www.nyc.gov/site/fdny/news/Y20625/fdny-commissioner-robert-s-tucker-delivers-2025-state-the-fdny-stronger-better-trained-and-...:text=Tucker%20delivers%202025%20State%20of%20the%20FDNY%3A%20%27Stronger,%20better,to%20have%20ready%20to%20deploy?)

NYC Council - March 2025 - Response Times Up - Hiring and Retention Issues to Blame

"Average response time to life-threatening medical emergencies by ambulances (FDNY dispatch and travel time only) increased from 8 minutes in the first four months of Fiscal 2024 to **8 minutes and 48 seconds** in the same period of Fiscal 2025, moving further away from **the Department's target of 6 minutes and 55 seconds**. The Department claims **this increased response time is due to issues** regarding **hiring and retention** of emergency medical technicians and paramedics.

"Response times for life-threatening medical emergencies have worsened, moving further from the Department's target. . . Compounding this issue is a staffing shortage, as **many EMS personnel are leaving to take the Firefighter promotion exam**, further reducing the available headcount. The Council has consistently advocated for EMS pay parity to improve recruitment and retention. . ." Singh, Tanveer, Financial Analyst, "Report on the Fiscal 2026 Preliminary Plan and the Fiscal 2026 Preliminary Capital Commitment Plan for the Committee on Fire and Emergency Management", March, 2025, pp. 6-7.

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2025/03/New-York-City-Fire-Department-1.pdf>

Joann Ariola, NYC Council Fire and Emergency Management Committee Chair

"We've been crying pay parity for a very long time." New York City Council Committee on Fire and Emergency Management Hearing March 14, 2025.

<https://citymeetings.nyc.gov/meetings/new-york-city-council/2025-03-14-1000-am-committee-on-fire-and-emergency-management/chapter/ems-wages-pay-parity-and-retention-challenges/>

The New York City Council - April 2025

"The Council proposes allocating \$50 million in baseline funding to begin addressing **long-standing pay disparities between Emergency Medical Services (EMS) personnel and their counterparts in both the firefighting ranks and other major U.S. cities.**" (The money didn't materialize.) NYC Council Press Release, April 2, 2025.

<https://council.nyc.gov/press/2025/04/02/2827/>

Fiscal Year Ending June 30, 2025 - Staff Shortages Necessitate Overtime

The cost of FDNY Emergency Medical Services **overtime** worked (in excess of 40 hours a week) by Emergency Medical Technicians and paramedics was **more than \$63,000,000 in FY2025.**

Source: Brad Lander, New York City Comptroller, CHECKBOOKNYC.

<https://www.checkbooknyc.com/budget/year/126/agency/74/dept/009>

Where the Responsibility Lies - Stacey Pheffer Amato, Chair - NYS Assembly Committee on Governmental Employees - July 2025

"But **the City Council and mayoral administration's failure to address this situation** has caused us to be in a serious staffing crisis. With some of the lowest numbers of first responders in our city's history, along with recruitment levels at an all time low, no wonder the average response time for life-threatening medical emergencies is 12.35 minutes in 2025, alarmingly up from 11.87 minutes in 2024. I call out the City Council and this mayor for this problem. Their actions, or lack of, have made it so you can be an Uber or food delivery worker and earn \$21 an hour, yet our EMS workers earn \$18 an hour. At the very least, can't the City Council take care of both?" Pheffer Amato, Stacey, "Why isn't the City Taking Care of its First Responders?", *The Chief*, July 29, 2025, p. 5.

<https://www.thechiefleader.com/stories/why-isn-t-the-city-taking-care-of-first-responders,54828?>

FDNY Commissioner Robert Tucker - August 2025 - There Aren't Enough EMTs

"People just don't want to be EMTs anymore ... The only people who are coming to us these days. . . to be EMTs, are people who want to start the clock to become firefighters. After four years, they just go over to fire operations. It was invented before me as a back door to get in. It's now the front door. . . The next 1,500 firefighters in New York City will come from EMS. . . I don't think we have 300 that want to come in."

Ortega, Ralph, "Robert Tucker Clocks in One Year as FDNY's 'CEO'", *City & State New York*, August 8, 2025.

<https://www.cityandstateny.com/personality/2025/08/robert-tucker-clocks-one-year-fdnys-ceo/407332/>

The Council Introduced a Bill for a Separate NYC Department of EMS

"This bill would establish a Department of Emergency Medical Services, headed by a Commissioner of Emergency Medical Services. The Department would be vested with the power to perform functions and operations relating to general ambulance services, emergency medical services and other response services necessary to preserve public health, safety and welfare." Bill sponsors: Adrienne E. Adams, Justin L. Brannan, Lincoln Restler, Tiffany Cabán, Sandy Nurse, Lynn C. Schulman, Farah N. Louis, Alexa Avilés, Gale A. Brewer, Shekar Krishnan, Christopher Marte, Amanda Farías, Susan Zhuang, Diana I. Ayala, Chris Banks, Julie Menin, Crystal Hudson, Joann Ariola, Vickie Paladino, Inna

Vernikov. Committee on Governmental Operations, State and Federal Legislation, New York City Council, Transcript of Minutes, March 7, 2024. <https://legistar.council.nyc.gov/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=6565804&GUID=17A9ADDD-2EDD-43A3-A800-F707E2061843>

Eric Adams and Justin Brannan Supported Pay Parity Years Ago

"Given their sacrifice, and how crucial these workers were to our collective survival, you would think they would be among some of the highest-paid civil servants in this city. The reality could not be further from the truth . . . There's no other way to say it: The way New York City treats our EMS workers is shameful, if not borderline discriminatory.

"The best way to achieve pay parity for EMS workers is to give them their own independent agency, where they are not an afterthought, but the main show . . . Part of responsible governance is acknowledging when something we try simply does not work . . . We've seen enough over the last 25 years to know that the original goals behind merging FDNY and EMS did not materialize. It's time to undo the merger, and give EMS workers the representation, funding, and professionalism they deserve." Adams, Eric and Brannan, Justin, "New York City Needs to Treat EMS Workers So Much Better", *am/NY*, April 21, 2021.

<https://www.amny.com/oped/op-ed-new-york-city-needs-to-treat-ems-workers-so-much-better/>

Appendix A

► Despite Local Law 19 and Council Resolution 1062-2019-A, the "uniformed" FDNY Emergency Medical Technicians and Paramedics are not treated as members of a "uniformed" service in contract negotiations.

► As of 12/28/25, a Sanitation Worker's base pay after 5½ years on the job will be **\$95,316**.
<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/2021-2026/sanitation-workers-12-28-2022-02-27-2028.pdf>

► Working under an expired contract, an EMT's base pay is stuck at **\$30,000 LESS**.

Sources: EMS Memorandum of Agreement 2021. <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/ems-moa-2021.pdf>

FDNY EMS Recruitment website: <https://www.joinfdny.com/careers/ems/>



Renee Campion
Commissioner
Steven H. Banks
First Deputy Commissioner
General Counsel

Office of Labor Relations

22 Cortlandt Street, New York, NY 10007
nyc.gov/olr

Claire Levitt
Deputy Commissioner
Health Care Strategy
Georgette Gestely
Director, Employee Benefits Program

May 5, 2020

Mr. Harry Nespoli
President
Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association
Local 831, IBT
23-25 Cliff Street
New York, New York 10038

Dear Mr. Nespoli:

The City reaffirms its commitment to the existing parity relationship between the uniformed forces of Police, Fire, Correction, and Sanitation, which is measured at the basic maximum salary.

Very truly yours,


Renee Campion

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/2021-2026/sanitation-workers-12-28-2022-02-27-2028.pdf>

Appendix B

**The FY2010-2024 FDNY EMS Salary Increases were Lower
When Compared to other New York City "UNIFORMED" Services
& Did Not Keep Up with "CIVILIAN" Pattern Salary Increases**

	<u>"Uniformed Service"</u> <u>Contract Pattern</u> (United Firefighters Assoc.)	<u>FDNY EMTs & Paramedics</u> <u>Contracts: 2010-2022</u> <u>EMS Locals 2507 & 3621</u>	<u>"Civilian"</u> <u>Contract Pattern</u> DC 37
<u>Fiscal Year</u>	<u>% salary increase</u>	<u>% salary increase</u>	<u>% salary increase</u>
2010	1% on 8/1/10 _____	0%* as of 6/10/2016 _____	0% ** on 3/3/2010
2011	1% _____	0% _____	1% on 9/30/2011
2012	1% _____	0% _____	1%
2013	1% _____	0% _____	1%
2014	1.5% _____	0% _____	1.5% ** + a \$1,000 bonus
2015	2.5% _____	1.5% _____	2.5%
2016	3% on 12/1/2016 _____	2.5% * + a \$1,000 ratification bonus _____	3.00%
2017	2.25% on 8/1/2017 _____	3% on 3/6/17 & 3.03% on 9/5/17	2.00% on 9/26/2017
2018	2.5% _____	2% on 6/29/2018 _____	2.25% on 9/26/2018
2019	3% on 8/1/2019 _____	2.25% on 6/29/2019 _____	3.00% on 10/26/2019
2020	3.25%	3% on 7/29/2020	0% *** bonus in lieu of
2021	3.25% _____	4% ↓ as per 2021 Contract. _____	3% 5/26/2021
	<p align="center">▶ But the 2021 EMS contract re-defined and increased the work week from 37½ hours to 40 hours equivalent to an additional 6.67% hours or 3½ more weeks of work per year starting 9/12/2021.</p>		
2022	3.50%.	contract expired July 28, 2022	3% on 5/26/22
2023	3.50%	contract expired July 28, 2022	3% *** + a \$3,000 bonus
2024	4.00%	contract expired July 28, 2022	3%
2025		contract expired July 28, 2022	3.25% on 5/26/2025

▶ New York City's Local Law 19 of 2001 stipulated: ". . . that those individuals employed by the FDNY as EMT's, paramedics and supervisors of EMT's or paramedics be accorded the same unique bargaining rights as the uniformed forces of the City." Also SEE Appendix A and Appendix C.

▶ The 2021 FDNY EMS contract did not adhere to the spirit of Council Resolution 1062-2019, unanimously passed on May 28, 2020, that called "for the salaries of New York City emergency medical service personnel to be comparable to New York City's firefighters and police officers."

▶ About the 2021 contract, Mayor de Blasio announced, "This agreement conforms to the pattern reached with other civilian unions, and includes productivity enhancements tied to increased work hours . . ." Press Release, Office of the Mayor, "Mayor de Blasio, Commissioner Campion Announce Tentative Contract Agreement with EMS Union District Council 37, Raising Wages for Over 4,500 FDNY Employees, Official Website of the City of New York, August 6, 2021. See Appendix C, pages 19 and 20.

Sources

Williams, Diane S. "4% raises in two-year pact", Public Employees Press, November, 2008.

http://www.dc37pep.net/news/pep/11_2008/2yr_pact.html

Linn, Robert, Commissioner, "2010-2017 Memorandum of Agreement District Council 37 and the City of New York", City of New York, Office of Labor Relations, July 1, 2014.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/cbu-dc37-nyc-moa-2010-2017.pdf>

Campion, Renee, Commissioner, "Executed Contract: Firefighters August 1, 2010-July 31, 2017", NYC Office of Labor Relations, January 17, 2020.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/firefighters-executed-contract-2010-2017.pdf>

Linn, Robert, Commissioner, "EMS Memorandum of Agreement, June 10, 2016", The City of New York, Office of Labor Relations.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/ems-moa-2010-2018.pdf>

"Mayor de Blasio Announces Tentative Contract Agreement with Emergency Medical Service Workers, Bringing over 97 Percent of Workforce Under Contract", NYC Office of the Mayor, June 15, 2016. <https://www.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/536-16/mayor-de-blasio-tentative-contract-agreement-emergency-medical-service-workers->

"Mayor de Blasio and DC 37 Announce Tentative Contract Agreement, Providing A Fair Wage To 100,000 Employees", NYC Office of the Mayor, June 26, 2018. <https://www.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/327-18/mayor-de-blasio-dc-37-tentative-contract-agreement-providing-fair-wage-100-000#/0>

Campion, Renee, Commissioner, "Memorandum of Agreement", August 1, 2017 to July 31, 2020, The City of New York, Office of Labor Relations. December 23, 2021.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/2017-2020-ufa-moa.pdf>

Campion, Renee, Commissioner, "EMS Memorandum of Agreement ", The City of New York, Office of Labor Relations, August 6, 2021.

<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/olr/downloads/pdf/collectivebargaining/ems-moa-2021.pdf>

"Mayor de Blasio, Commissioner Campion Announce Tentative Contract Agreement with EMS Union District Council 37, Raising Wages for Over 4,500 FDNY Employees", August 6, 2021. See Appendix C.

<https://www.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/552-21/mayor-de-blasio-commissioner-campion-tentative-contract-agreement-ems-union-district>

"Mayor Adams, OLR Commissioner Campion Announce Tentative Contract Agreement with Uniformed Officers Coalition", NYC Office of the Mayor, June 15, 2023. <https://www.nyc.gov/office-of-the-mayor/news/420-23/mayor-adams-olr-commissioner-campion-tentative-contract-agreement-uniformed-officers#/0>

DC 37 Press Release, "Mayor Adams and DC 37 announce tentative contract agreement, providing fair wage increases and other benefits to nearly 90,000 employees and securing fair deal for NYC taxpayers", February 17, 2023. https://www.dc37.net/news/newsreleases/2023/nr02_17/

Appendix C

► 3 QUESTIONS - (1) In the above contract years, in what ways were EMT's, paramedics and supervisors of EMT's or paramedics accorded the same unique bargaining rights as the uniformed forces of the City? (2) Did the EMS contracts with years of 0% raises and increased work hours "conform" to even the "Civilian" Contract Pattern?

(3) Until August 2021, which of DC 37's other locals had an increase in work hours to 40 per week?



The Official Website of the City of New York



SHARE

- Facebook icon
- Twitter icon
- LinkedIn icon
- Email icon
- Print icon

Mayor de Blasio, Commissioner Campion Announce Tentative Contract Agreement with EMS Union District Council 37, Raising Wages for Over 4,500 FDNY Employees

August 6, 2021

Agreement covers titles such as EMT, Paramedic, EMS Lieutenant, and Fire Protection Inspector; FDNY will train all EMS staff to respond to mental health calls

NEW YORK—Mayor Bill de Blasio and Labor Relations Commissioner Renee Campion today announced a tentative contract agreement with District Council 37 Locals 2507 and 3621 that will raise wages for over 4,500 FDNY employees, improve recruitment and retention, and allow the City to expand the mental health response pilot program.

"Our emergency service workers are heroes who got New York City through the worst crisis in generations and continue to serve our city every day with honor," said **Mayor Bill de Blasio**. "This agreement increases wages and will allow us to expand our incredible mental health pilot, which has already proven to be an effective way to handle non-violent mental health calls. I thank Commissioner Campion and Henry Garrido for their hard work in coming to this agreement."

“This important agreement is a testament to this Administration’s commitment to treating municipal workers fairly across the bargaining table. We are proud to have reached this agreement with the union that represents our emergency service workers who respond to the needs of City residents each and every day. Thank you to DC 37 Executive Director Henry Garrido and his entire team for working with the City on this contract,” said **Commissioner Renee Campion**.

The agreement covers the period from June 29, 2018 through July 28, 2022, including a six-month contract extension. This agreement conforms to the pattern reached with other civilian unions, and includes productivity enhancements tied to increased work hours and the expansion of mental health responses. Under the agreement, a 6% mental health response differential will be provided to EMS employees who are trained and available to be deployed in the expanded version of the mental-health pilot program that pairs EMS workers with trained mental health professionals in response to non-violent mental health calls.

General wage increases under this agreement are as follows:

6/29/18: 2%
6/29/19: 2.25%
7/29/20: 3%
9/12/21: 4%

Effective on September 12th, employees will also work 2,088 hours per year; the previous contractual work schedule for most unit employees was 1,957 hours per year. Other economic benefits under the agreement are increases to longevity payments, annuity payments, and uniform allowance payments.

The net cost of the agreement by year is as follows:

FY21: \$26.7 million
FY22: \$44.2 million
FY23: \$65 million
FY24: \$73.7 million
FY25: \$79.5 million

The terms of the agreement must be ratified by union membership.

“FDNY EMTs, Paramedics, and Officers are essential to the safety and health of our city,” said **FDNY First Deputy Commissioner Laura Kavanagh**. “Throughout the COVID-19 pandemic they once again bravely demonstrated to the world what we all know to be true - they are the very best and deserve to be compensated for the critical emergency medical care they provide to thousands of New Yorkers each day.”

Media Contact

pressoffice@cityhall.nyc.gov
(212) 788-2958

Did the FY2026 FDNY Emergency Medical Services Budget and Staffing Address the Needs of New Yorkers? **OR** If Everyone Can Tell You the Problems, Why Haven't They Been Fixed?

	2017	2025	% Change
# of Life-threatening (LTEs) 911 calls	563,494 ^a	620,467 ^b	+10%
Number of FDNY EMTs (<i>see charts below</i>)	3,024	2,818	- 7%
Number of FDNY Paramedics	902	967	+7%
Total # possible EMT & Paramedics for Ambulances	3,926	3,785	- 3.6%
Average Response Time (<i>to LTE's</i>) by Ambulances: 8 mins.:56 sec. ^a		11 min.:21 sec. ^b	+27%

Number of Ambulances in Service on November 7, 2024 = 410.

Number of Ambulances in Service on November 7, 2025 = 375.

1 year % Change = -35 ambulances in service or -8.5%.

In the 2025 city fiscal year ending this past June 30th, the FDNY EMS operating budget was **\$435,819,195**, or **13%** less^c than all the income that FDNY EMS treatments and transports for the Health and Hospitals Corporation alone generated for NYC or **\$502,822,000^d**. Where'd it go?

From 2017 to 2025 the 911 call volume for EMS to help those with life-threatening emergencies increased, while the total number of EMS EMTs and Paramedics, those who actually staff the FDNY EMS ambulances, decreased. Hospital Emergency Rooms continue to close across the city; and voluntary hospitals corporations, such as Northwell Health, continue to relinquish their ambulance runs in the 911 system.

Hospital Closures Since 2005 - Fewer ER's mean more crowded ERs, and Longer Turn-around Times, and Longer Ambulance Travel Times to the closest ER. Has the FDNY Made Up for It with More Available Ambulances and Staff on the Streets?

"(FDNY Acting Commissioner Laura Kavanagh in 2022): "it's something we see in EMS when hospitals close there are fewer places for EMS to go Kavanagh said. "We have to go further and wait longer and so that means **the turnaround time for an individual crew is that much longer.**" Hennelly, Bob, "Acting FDNY Commissioner Laura Kavanagh Calls EMS the 'Only Resource' for Many During the Pandemic", *Labor Press*, June 16, 2022.

<https://www.laborpress.org/acting-fdny-commissioner-laura-kavanagh-calls-ems-the-only-resource-for-many-during-the-pandemic-0617/>

- St. Mary's of Brooklyn. Closed 2006. Had an ER.
- Mary Immaculate, Jamaica. Closed 2005. Had an ER.
- St. Vincent's, Manhattan. Closed 2007. Had an ER.
- Bayley Seton, Staten Island. Closed 2008. Had an ER.
- Cabrini, Manhattan. Closed 2008. Had an ER.
- Victory Memorial, Brooklyn. Closed 2008. Had an ER. Replaced by freestanding ER.
- Parkway Hospital, Queens. Closed 2009. Had an ER
- St. John's, Elmhurst. Closed 2009. Had an ER.
- North General Hospital, Manhattan. Closed 2010. Had an ER.
- Peninsula Hospital Center, Far Rockaway. Closed 2012. Had an ER.
- Westchester Square Hospital, Bronx. Closed 2013. Replaced by freestanding ER operated by Montefiore.
- Long Island College Hospital, Brooklyn. Closed 2014. Replaced by freestanding ER, Home Depot/NYU Langone.
- Kingsbrook Jewish Medical Center, Brooklyn. Closed 2021. Had an ER.
- Beth Israel, Manhattan. Closed 2025. Had an ER.

FDNY EMS Ambulance Staff - 2017 *
Total EMTs and Paramedics = 3,926 .

EMS Rank	# of Staff
Chief of EMS	1
Assistant Chief	1
Deputy Assistant Chief	3
Division Chief	10
Deputy Chief	23
Captain	76
Lieutenant	491
Paramedic	902
EMT	3,024
TOTAL	4,531

Source: FDNY; September 30, 2017

The Council of the City of New York Report of the Finance Division on the Fiscal 2019 Preliminary Budget and the Fiscal 2018 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report for the Fire Department, p. 17.
<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2018/03/FY19-Fire-Department-of-New-York.pdf>

FDNY Ambulance Staff - 2025 *
Total EMTs and Paramedics = 3,785 .



EMS WORKFORCE ANALYSIS

0/10/2025

GENDER AND ETHNICITY															
EMS WORKFORCE	MALE							FEMALE							GRAND TOTAL
	W	B	H	A	N	OTHER	MALE TOTAL	W	B	H	A	N	OTHER	FEMALE TOTAL	
RANK															
CHIEF OF EMS	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
ASSISTANT CHIEF	1	0	1	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
DEPUTY ASSISTANT CHIEF	3	0	0	0	0	0	3	4	1	0	0	0	0	5	8
DIVISION CHIEF	9	1	3	1	0	0	14	3	3	1	0	0	0	7	21
DEPUTY CHIEF	12	4	5	2	0	0	23	4	4	1	0	0	0	9	32
CAPTAIN	27	7	8	3	0	0	45	14	12	4	1	0	0	31	76
LIEUTENANT	184	45	93	45	1	8	376	37	36	48	11	0	4	136	512
SERGEANT	8	3	9	2	0	0	22	4	6	2	0	0	1	13	35
PARAMEDIC	234	125	221	56	3	36	675	104	57	108	6	0	17	292	967
EMT	839	469	423	87	15	293	2126	147	242	181	19	5	98	692	2818
EMS TRAINEE	8	5	2	0	0	47	62	0	4	0	0	0	11	15	77
TOTAL	1325	660	765	196	19	384	3349	317	365	345	37	5	131	1200	4549
Percentage %	29.13%	14.51%	16.82%	4.31%	0.42%	8.44%	73.62%	6.97%	8.02%	7.58%	0.81%	0.11%	2.88%	26.38%	100.00%

New York City Council, FDNY Workforce Analysis, October 10, 2025.

<https://council.nyc.gov/budget/wp-content/uploads/sites/54/2025/10/Fire-Department-of-New-York-Uniformed-Personnel-Demographics-Report-1.pdf>

a. Mayor's Management Report FY 2017, p. 72, 73. https://www.nyc.gov/assets/operations/downloads/pdf/mmr2017/2017_mmr.pdf

b. Mayor's Management Report FY 2025, p. 80. <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/operations/downloads/pdf/mmr2025/fdny.pdf>

c. Jiha, Jacques, Ph.D., Director, "Mayor's Office of Management and Budget, Eric Adams, Mayor, The City of New York Executive Budget Fiscal Year 2026, Expense, Revenue, Contract", pp. 80-84.
<https://www.nyc.gov/assets/omb/downloads/pdf/exec25/erc5-25.pdf>

d. New York City Health and Hospitals Corporation (A Component Unit of the City of New York) Basic Financial Statements and Supplemental Schedules, October 17, 2025, p. 41. <https://comptroller.nyc.gov/wp-content/uploads/documents/HHC-1.pdf>

For patients with cardiac arrest (Segment 1), "Survival for patients with an initially shockable (heart) rhythm decreases 10% for every minute delay in defibrillation. . . . When epinephrine is administered (and among first responders, only paramedics can do this) early, (less than 5 to 10 minutes) after arrest onset, it improves neurologically intact survival." Journal of Emergency Medical Services

Archives of the Mayor's Press Office

FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE
Date: Thursday, December 7, 2000

Release #457-00

Contact: Sunny Mindel / Curt Ritter (212) 788-2958
Dave Billing (718) 999-2056 (FDNY)

MAYOR GIULIANI AND FIRE COMMISSIONER THOMAS VON ESSEN PRESIDE AT GRADUATION CEREMONY FOR 141 PROBATIONARY FIREFIGHTERS

Mayor Rudolph W. Giuliani and Fire Commissioner Thomas Von Essen presided at a graduation ceremony at the New York Technical College in Brooklyn for 141 probationary firefighters. The new Firefighters have successfully completed a rigorous 13-week training program that has prepared them for the many challenges they will face in their new careers.

Included in the group were 139 EMT's and Paramedics who were the first ever to be promoted to the rank of Firefighter. The class represents the largest percentage of minority recruits, 28 percent, in any single class to enter the Department's Training Academy. In addition, today's ceremony marks the first Probationary Firefighters class since 1982 to have two female firefighters graduate, Firefighter Aisha Bauman and Firefighter Tracey R. Lewis.

"Today's graduating class represents the most diverse class in the Department's history," said Mayor Giuliani. "This new class of highly skilled Firefighters will repeatedly demonstrate their selfless dedication and their willingness to put their lives on the line to help those in need. Over the last seven years, the Department has continued to build upon its proud history of excellence, setting new standards in virtually every area of achievement. And with the help of these brave individuals who graduate today, that tradition of excellence will endure long into the future."

Fire Commissioner Thomas Von Essen said, "I am proud to stand here today, and to congratulate all of you, as you embark on what I believe to be the most admirable and rewarding profession one can choose. Together, we will work to focus our attention on the basics -- protecting the lives and property of over seven and a half million New Yorkers. It should bring them peace of mind knowing that you have what it takes to respond swiftly and efficiently to all emergencies. I am confident that you will show yourselves to be as skilled in fire operations as you are in emergency medical procedures, and, like all that have come before you, you will continue to give this Department and this city the very best that you have."

Of the 141 new Firefighters, 104 began their career in the Fire Cadet Program. The New York City Fire Department Cadet Program began in 1997 to help encourage inner-city youth to join the ranks of New York's Bravest. Today, the program gives young men and women who possess a New York City high school diploma the chance to gain their EMT certification and work for the Fire Department's EMS Bureau while waiting to take the Firefighter exam. As employees of the Fire Department, the exam was administered as a promotional opportunity.

The class Valedictorian was Firefighter Joseph M. Castellano, the Salutatorian was Firefighter Brian C. Difusco and the Physical Fitness award was presented to Firefighter William A. Downey.

I'm submitting the following in addition to the testimony I gave onsite at today's committee hearing on fire and emergency management. I've included additional information that I would've liked to say while testifying, but I cut down for time. I'd also like to highlight that I felt incredibly disappointed to see so many committee members absent from today's hearing. It felt disrespectful to the FDNY as a whole and to me as a constituent.

Good afternoon. My name is Maleia Sheflin. I am a concerned citizen of New York City and I've done my research using the information readily available on New York City government websites. My following statement consists solely of my views on these issues.

New York City EMS members are struggling to survive. Some have a starting salary of just over \$36,000, which is barely above the city designation of "extremely low income." After five years, it only increases to 59,000. Firefighters make nearly twice that. And for reference, our city's average salary is between 128 to \$155,000.

Meanwhile, all of the council members on this committee, except Mr. Felder, sponsored legislation that would make your own salaries 172,500 dollars - over \$17,000 above the city average. Before this proposed increase, your base salary of 148,500 dollars hadn't been increased since 2016. Hm. Not getting a salary increase for ten years must be frustrating. I can assure you, the members of EMS feel this far more severely than you do, as your previous salary still falls on the higher end of that average range, even ten years later, while their current salaries are less than firefighters made in 2010.

And you have the audacity to ask for more when EMTs and Paramedics are out working on the streets while being harassed, assaulted, and killed for LESS than minimum wage? You should all be ashamed for putting yourselves ahead of our city's actual heroes.

EMS, unlike the other uniformed services, brings in revenue. In 2025, the city collected at least 500 million dollars from EMS calls. The city also collected an additional 2.1 billion dollars in third party reimbursements for EMS services between 2020 and 2025. This money was earned off the backs of the EMTs and Paramedics who are the ones answering those calls and politicians like you reap the benefits while city residents die waiting for an ambulance. Why?

It's easy to follow: EMS response times are increasing because they're severely short staffed, which is because hundreds leave per year - most move to fire for a living wage and a secure benefits package and the rest leave because they're burned out from a minimum of 60-hour work weeks earning poverty pay. And somehow the preliminary budget for 2027 accounts for 41 fewer EMS staff?

With an already crumbling EMS system, a proposal like this makes it seem like the city wants EMS to collapse. Certainly that can't be true, especially with all the legislation city council has proposed already this year.

Ms. Schulman introduced legislation to hold quarterly meetings on maternal mortality efforts. You do realize that the most important factor in these cases is the timing of getting these mothers to the hospital, right? And that the first responders who do so are EMTs and Paramedics? Based on the latest available report from the NYC Dept of Health published Sept 2025, over 24% of pregnancy-associated mortality occurred in the emergency department. With EMS response times increasing, you can expect that number to rise as well. The Maternal Mortality Review Committee determined that 86.4% of these deaths had at least some chance of being prevented.

So it seems logical that if one of your primary concerns is maternal mortality, you would want to provide a solution. The solution is right in front of you. Pay EMS.

And it's not like you don't know how to do it. In fact, Ms. De La Rosa has introduced legislation that would require the dept of education to provide annual workforce stabilization payments to eligible school paraprofessionals in a lump-sum payment of \$10,000, which would be repealed upon the execution of a collective bargaining agreement that provides for an increase in the total compensation for these workers equal to or greater than the stabilization payments. 45 city council members, including eight out of nine in this very committee, sponsored this legislation which, according to the fiscal impact statement, would amount to a total of \$243.9 million per year. And since school paraprofessionals don't bring in any revenue, that cost would fall solely upon the shoulders of the taxpayers.

So you all clearly understand the importance of raising wages for people serving the community and you clearly know how to create legislation to accommodate for the shortcomings of collective bargaining agreements, and yet for the past several administrations, nothing has been done to help the EMS first responders who serve the community in the most vital way. Regardless of where union negotiations have faltered, you all could choose to create legislation like this for EMS. You could give them annual payments to raise their wages to pull them out of poverty until their now four-year-expired contract gets renegotiated to parity wages with that of the other NYC uniformed services. And the major difference is that unlike the school paraprofessionals you're choosing to help, EMS does bring in revenue, which would offset the cost of such a bill.

Meanwhile, legislation (Int 403) sponsored by Ms. De La Rosa, Ms. Sanchez, and Mr. Hankerson seeks to "...create a department of community safety that will be tasked with promoting community safety, and providing emergency responses that support the

preservation of public health, safety, and welfare. This effort will involve collaboration with emergency responders, social service and public health officials, and the maintenance of field operations to facilitate the delivery of services to vulnerable populations and advance a sense of security within a community.”

Creating an entire department costs money and this piece of legislation calls for the collaboration of emergency responders. So you want to spend money creating this department and pay those needed to be administrators for said department, and you want to further stress the already overworked EMS system by having them collaborate with said department, when you COULD create legislation that would instead bolster the already existing EMS. Here’s a budget idea: forgo the rigamarole of creating a new department and focus on the department that already exists and is drowning. Because looking at the summary of 403 begs the question of how this new department will provide said emergency responses when EMS already has rising call times and is desperately understaffed.

This new dept would “facilitate the delivery of services to vulnerable populations and advance a sense of security within a community.” How exactly, do you suppose this will happen? Will this new department magically provide more EMTs and Paramedics driving new ambulances with properly working equipment? Where will those people and that equipment come from? How will this new department pay for all of this when the city says it can’t afford to pay the EMS workers already within their employ?

This piece of legislation is a clear demonstration of the council’s ignorance. If you truly care about the safety and security of the city’s most vulnerable populations, you would work tirelessly to ensure those employed by the city for emergency response had every reason to continue coming to work. You would provide motivation for people to pursue a career in EMS and you would provide incentive for those already working in EMS who are burned out and suffering from PTSD to continue working with better conditions. And the easiest way to start that change is by creating legislation to get them paid.

I’m calling on this committee and the entire city council to re-prioritize the legislation they have in the works. Getting legislation for newsrack requirements to the mayor’s desk for signature while EMS members struggle to survive is embarrassing for you. The fact that city council wasted time and money on such a farce only proves how out of touch you all are to the actual issues our communities face. EMS members are in a state of emergency themselves and it is time for city hall to provide relief. That starts with all of you. Pay EMS now.

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 3/13/2026

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Christian Bahr-Lopez

Address: [Redacted] Hollis NY 11423

I represent: myself

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Michelle Fleurantin

Address: 151 W 30th Street, 11 Floor

I represent: New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

Address: 7

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Chris Blanco

Address: 105 Cadman Plaza East

I represent: NYCEM

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Commissioner Christina Farrell

Address: 165 Cadman Plaza East

I represent: NYCEM

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: JIM BOSI

Address: _____

I represent: UFOA

Address: 125 Meade Lane

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Andrew Farina

Address: _____ 230 1101

I represent: Myself a

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 3/13/76

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: ANDREW ANSBRO

Address: _____

I represent: Uniformed Firefighters Association

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: James Brosi

Address: 125 Maiden Lane

I represent: Uniformed Fire Officers Association

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Suzanne Duque

Address: [Redacted] Poughquag NY 12570

I represent: myself at FDNY EMS B-MEARD

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 3/13/2020

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: MALEIA SHEFLIN

Address: QUEENS, NY 11101

I represent: MYSELF

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 3/13/20

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Vincent Variale

Address: 125 Barclay St. NY, NY

I represent: Uniformed EMS Officers Local 3621

Address: 125 Barclay St. NY NY

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: David Flynn

Address: _____

I represent: FDNY

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: _____

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: _____

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____
 in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: _____

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: ORAN BARZILAY

Address: _____ WHITestone NY 11357

I represent: FONY EMS LOCAL 2507

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: THOMAS LUKAS

Address: _____

I represent: FDNY

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: William Bonfigliore

Address: _____

I represent: FDNY

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: _____

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: _____

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Jeremy Brooks

Address: Deputy Commissioner PONY

I represent: _____

Address: _____

◆ Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms ◆

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

[]

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: William John

Address: _____

I represent: _____

Address: _____

◆ Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms ◆