

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

-----X

January 31, 2013
Start: 10:59 a.m.
Recess: 11:20 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway
Committee Room, 16th Floor

B E F O R E:
LEROY G. COMRIE, JR.
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria del Carmen Arroyo
Inez E. Dickens
Joel Rivera
Daniel R. Garodnick
Jessica S. Lappin
Ruben Wills
Robert Jackson
Vincent Ignizio
Diana Reyna
Peter Koo
Mark Weprin
Stephen Levin
Charles Barron
Rosie Mendez
Jumaane D. Williams
Brad Lander
Daniel J. Halloran

1
2 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay. We are
3 ready to start the full Land Use Committee meeting
4 for today, Thursday, January 31st, 2013. We are
5 joined by Council Members Maria del Carmen Arroyo,
6 Inez Dickens, Joel Rivera, Daniel Garodnick,
7 Jessica Lappin, Ruben Wills, Robert Jackson,
8 Vinnie Ignizio, Diana Reyna, Peter Koo, Mark
9 Weprin, and--

10 FEMALE VOICE: Levin.

11 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Yeah, Steve
12 Levin. Huh?

13 [Laughter]

14 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: No, I'm...

15 [background noise]

16 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: No, I was just
17 choking, for some reason the S is making me choke
18 today, I don't know.

19 [Crosstalk]

20 FEMALE VOICE: --Wills would like
21 you to know this is his first time here.

22 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Council Member
23 Wills wants to note that this is his first time at
24 the full committee, so he didn't remember that new
25 committee members are responsible for breakfast

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

for the entire committee, so--

FEMALE VOICE: What?

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: That new
committee members are--

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: He didn't
bring it?

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: He didn't
bring it, so--

[Crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: --get
that.

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: I don't
understand, so--

[Crosstalk]

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: --off the
committee.

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: There we go.

[Crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: We have some
items to be discussed today. Land Use items 749,
750, and 751 are related to the Durst development
at West 57th Street. They're all Land Use item
numbers C 120396 CZM, C 120397 CZSM, C 120398 ZSM,
and they're all within Manhattan Community Board

1
2 4. This is regarding the development of the Durst
3 building on 57th Street between 11th and 12th
4 Avenues.

5 Then we have in Council Member
6 Mendez district, the East Village Lower East Side
7 Historic District, Land Use item number 752 in
8 Manhattan Community Board 3. Item number 20135179
9 HKM, this is dealing with the extensive area of
10 the Lower East Side Historic District. I want to
11 remind people that all of these things were vetted
12 in the subcommittee meetings and if you have any--
13 all of the specific points were talked about in
14 the subcommittee meetings.

15 We also have a sidewalk café in
16 Speaker Quinn's district, Manhattan Community
17 Board 2, Land Use number 753, item number 20135162
18 TCM, known as El Toro Blanco to continue to
19 establish an unenclosed sidewalk café at 10
20 Downing Street.

21 Then we have in Council Member
22 Darlene Mealy's district, Land Use item number
23 719, a ULURP, the ULURP number is 20135098 HAK,
24 address is 1416 Eastern Parkway Extension and 1413
25 Pitkin Avenue for the UDAAPs.

1
2 And I believe that's everything on
3 today's agenda. The next subcommittee meetings
4 will be held on February 12th, not February 11th
5 because, as you should know, the mayor is having
6 his State of the City on February 11th, so we had
7 to move the--

8 FEMALE VOICE: Oh, no, the Speaker,
9 the Speaker.

10 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: The City, oh,
11 oh, the Speaker, somebody is having it. The
12 Speaker is having her State of the City on
13 February 11th, so we had to move the subcommittee
14 to February 12th.

15 With that, unless any member has a
16 comment on today's agenda, we will call the roll.

17 We've been joined by Council Member
18 Barron.

19 At this point, we'll ask the clerk
20 to call the roll. I recommend a yes vote. I want
21 to thank the Durst organization for everything
22 they did to work out this project, know there were
23 extensive conversations that were held and I want
24 to thank them for getting to a point where we can
25 vote the project today.

1
2 We've also been joined by Council
3 Member Rosie Mendez.

4 Billy, the clerk, if you can call
5 the roll. I recommend a yes vote on everything on
6 today's agenda.

7 WILLIAM MARTIN: William Martin,
8 Committee Clerk, roll call vote, Committee on Land
9 Use. Council Member Reyna.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye.

11 WILLIAM MARTIN: Jackson.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Aye.

13 WILLIAM MARTIN: Lappin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Aye.

15 WILLIAM MARTIN: Comrie.

16 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Aye.

17 WILLIAM MARTIN: Rivera.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.

19 WILLIAM MARTIN: Barron.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye. Aye.

21 WILLIAM MARTIN: Arroyo.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

23 WILLIAM MARTIN: Dickens.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

25 WILLIAM MARTIN: Garodnick.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

WILLIAM MARTIN: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Mr. Chair,
could I just make a few comments? Mr. Chair?

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Yes, I'm
sorry.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you.
Today we're voting on the Historic District in the
Lower East Side East Village. It was six years
worth of work, meeting with lots of residents and,
you know, I'm very proud that we are at this
point, and I proudly vote aye on this and all
other matters. Thank you.

WILLIAM MARTIN: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yes.

WILLIAM MARTIN: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

WILLIAM MARTIN: Weprin.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.

WILLIAM MARTIN: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye.

WILLIAM MARTIN: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Yes, as is
my custom, I'm voting no on 752 due to the

1
2 opposition of some of the local owners, I vote aye
3 on all others. But I still love Rosie.

4 [Pause]

5 WILLIAM MARTIN: All items on
6 today's agenda have been adopted by a vote of 15
7 in the affirmative, zero in the negative, and no
8 abstentions, with the exception of Land Use item
9 752, which has been adopted by a vote of 14 in the
10 affirmative, 1 in the negative, and no
11 abstentions. Council Members, please sign the
12 committee reports.

13 [Pause]

14 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: We are--

15 [Crosstalk]

16 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: What, did we
17 forget somebody?

18 FEMALE VOICE: Everybody voted.

19 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Dickens voted;
20 yeah, Dickens voted.

21 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please.

22 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: All right,
23 quiet, please.

24 [Crosstalk]

25 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Council Member

1
2 Williams is coming down and--quiet, please. We
3 have a couple of members that are on their way, no
4 one else has text me to ask. Council Member
5 Jumaane Williams is in the hall.

6 MALE VOICE: Yeah, he's coming up.

7 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: I can see him.
8 So are we expecting any other members we can hold
9 the roll open for ten minutes?

10 FEMALE VOICE: Why don't we adjourn
11 and hold it open--

12 [Crosstalk]

13 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: [Interposing]
14 Yeah, we're going to adjourn the meeting for
15 February 31st, Land Use Committee meeting--

16 [Crosstalk]

17 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: We're
18 adjourning the meeting for January 31st, the Land
19 Use Committee meeting--

20 FEMALE VOICE: Oh, yep, Council
21 Member Williams.

22 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: We're going to
23 hold the roll open for ten minutes. Council
24 Member Jumaane Williams is here, the meeting is
25 adjourned.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[Gavel]

MALE VOICE: I am.

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: No, we're
holding the roll open for--

FEMALE VOICE: [Interposing] Just
for ten, yeah--

[Crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: --hold it for
ten minutes.

FEMALE VOICE: --after ten minutes,
the votes--

[Crosstalk]

MALE VOICE: Hold the roll open.

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Ten minutes.

MALE VOICE: Ten minutes.

[Pause]

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Where's Brad,
isn't he in the building?

[Crosstalk]

FEMALE VOICE: Are we still... We're
open.

MALE VOICE: You're done?

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Yeah.

WILLIAM MARTIN: Council Member

1

2 Williams.

3

4

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Excused
to explain my vote?

5

6

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: You want to
explain your vote?

7

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Yes.

8

9

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: All right, go
ahead.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote
aye on all. I just wanted you talk about the
Durst property, I was very concerned about, not
sure how I was going to come and vote. I'm voting
aye on all, including that one. I do have some
concerns about the affordability. I am happy that
there were some last minute additions to the
affordability, like getting it to be stabilized,
some money put into affordable housing home, but
it is frustrating every time we do this piecemeal
and I'm hoping at some point we'd have some basis
that's beyond piecemeal to work off of. And it
seems to me that they almost just paid \$1 million
instead of trying to do something better, which is
also frustrating. I think there's a way we can do
these that are not just 80/20, maybe 70/30, maybe

1
2 60/40. I don't see a reason why they couldn't
3 have done it for 99 years if they couldn't do it
4 forever.

5 So all those things still frustrate
6 me. This is a little bit better than it was
7 before, but it's still quite concerning. But at
8 some point, I'm not going to be able to vote for
9 these if we don't make some significant changes in
10 the affordable housing units on these projects.

11 Thank you.

12 [Pause]

13 WILLIAM MARTIN: Lander.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: What he
15 said. Aye.

16 [Long pause]

17 WILLIAM MARTIN: Council Member
18 Halloran.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Aye on
20 all.

21 [Long pause]

22 WILLIAM MARTIN: Final vote on the
23 Committee on Land Use now stands at 18 in the
24 affirmative, zero in the negative, no abstentions,
25 with Land Use item 752 being adopted by a vote of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

17 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative, no
abstentions. Thank you.

[Pause]

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: The Land
Use hearing of January 31st, 2013, is now
adjourned.

[Gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Tammy Wittman, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature *Tammy Wittman*

Date February 13, 2013