

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE 1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON  
GENERAL WELFARE

----- X

June 27, 2018

Start: 2:37 p.m.

Recess: 6:02 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 16<sup>th</sup> Fl.

B E F O R E: MARK TREYGER  
Chairperson

STEPHEN T. LEVIN  
Co-Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

ADRIENE E. ADAMS  
ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL  
DIANA NORIEGA AYALA  
INEZ D. BARRON  
JOSEPH C. BORELLI  
JUSTIN L. BRANNAN  
ANDREW COHEN  
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.  
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH  
DANIEL DROMM  
VANESSA L. GIBSON  
MARK GJONAJ  
BARRY S. GRODENCHIK  
BEN KALLOS  
ANDY L. KING  
BRAD S. LANDER  
MARK LEVINE  
ANTONIO REYNOSO  
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
DEBORAH L. ROSE  
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

RITCHIE J. TORRES  
ERIC A. ULRICH

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

3

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lorelei Atalie Vargas  
Deputy Commissioner for Child and Family Well  
Being at the Administration for Children Services  
ACS

Josh Wallack  
Deputy Chancellor for Early Childhood Education  
And Student Enrollment at the Department of  
Education, DOE

Rosemarie Sinclair  
First Vice President of the Council of School  
Supervisors and Administrators, CSA

Lois Lee  
Vice President of Early Childhood at the Council  
Of School Supervisors and Administrators, CSA and  
Part of Chinese American Planning Council, CPC

Lisa Caswell  
Senior Policy Analyst for the Day Care Council of  
New York

Stephanie Gendell  
Associate Executive Director for Policy and  
Advocacy at Citizens' Committee for Children of  
New York, CCC

Shilshila Limbu  
Mother of a Four-Year-Old with Autism, Resident  
Woodside, New York

Faith Behum  
Advocacy and Policy Advisor at UJA Federation of  
New York

G. L. Tyler  
Political Action Director Speaking on Behalf of  
Kim Medina, Executive Director at DC 1707

Betty Baez Melo  
Attorney and Project Director of the Early  
Childhood Education Project at Advocates for  
children

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

4

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1  
2  
3 Gregory Brender  
4 Co-Director of Policy and Advocacy at United  
5 Neighborhood Houses, UNH

6  
7 Carlyn Cowen  
8 Chief Policy and Public Affairs Officer of the  
9 Chinese American Planning Council

10  
11 Debra Blowe  
12 Assistant Teacher at Parkside Head Start

13  
14 Harriet Larry  
15 Assistant Teacher at Parkside Catholic Charity,  
16 Stop and Shop Steward

17  
18 Diana Noriego  
19 Chief Program Officer at the Committee for  
20 Hispanic Children and Families

21  
22 Michelle Paige  
23 Associate Executive Director, Early Childhood  
24 Programs at University Settlement Society of New  
25 York

Susan Ochshorn  
Founder and Principal of ECE Policy Works

Anna Succes  
Certified Teacher of Pre-K in Queens, New York

Fran DeJong  
Certified Teacher in Queens, New York

Alex Ortega  
On the Board of Directors at Belmont Community  
Day Care Center

George Penaherrera  
Director at East Calvary Day Care Center

Leonie Haimson  
Executive Director of Class Size Matters

Chris Treiber  
Associate Executive Director for the Interagency  
Council for Developmental Disabilities Agencies

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

5

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, good

afternoon and welcome to today's joint hearing on the implementation of UPK and 3-K expansion and the transition of Early Learn NYC to the Department of Education. I want to thank Chair Levin for Co-chairing this hearing with us today and, and I know that he is... he is on his way. The Education Committee is also hearing Resolution Number 358 sponsored by Council Member Lauri Cumbo calling upon the city to eliminate the disparity in compensation paid to teachers, staff and directors at community based Early Learn New York City centers as compared to the compensation paid to Department of Education instructors for similar employment. Thank you to the members who are with us today. Before we begin, I, I want to note that DOE announced some major restructuring and staffing changes this morning that I'm very interested to learn more about the Department's plans and intentions as far as though changes are concerned. We have a lot to discuss today but I hope to learn more about that very soon and I just want to note for the record that the council, this committee... both committees and staff worked

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

around the schedule of the DOE to get this day and time, so I am disappointed that I'm, I'm learning this morning that the Deputy Chancellor has to head over to a press conference at four p.m. but it's my understanding that, that the Deputy Chancellor will return after, after that press conference but again I just want the record to reflect that this committee accommodated the DOE to the extent that we could around their schedule and we appreciate that moving forward that we all keep to those commitments to advance our critical work. The benefits of early childhood education are well established, we've seen studies that show that by five-year olds the children of lower income parents made it out of school so far behind their peers that they may never be able to catch up and we have seen studies which show that providing the earliest supports possible for kids in turn helps parents and provided better outcomes for all including long term positive effects on economic measures and social, behavioral development. I commend the administration on the good work that has been done implementing Pre-K for All and now 3-K for All programs and I look forward to hearing more today about how the city is effectively working to ease the

1  
2 burdens on families of early childhood care and  
3 helping children thrive in this critical moment of  
4 development. I am encouraged that this administration  
5 is working to further support all early childhood  
6 services by moving Early Learn NYC from ACS to DOE.  
7 Until now low-income parents enrolled in head start,  
8 Pre-K or home-based day care for example have had to  
9 navigate four different city agencies for child care.  
10 If we proceed thoughtfully, consolidating programs  
11 under DOE could simplify this process and create  
12 amazing benefits for families and young children. So,  
13 we find ourselves with a major opportunity to build  
14 on and learn from past mistakes and provide a strong,  
15 successful system to our youngest most vulnerable New  
16 Yorkers and their families. I look forward to hearing  
17 from DOE today on, on the plans that are underway to  
18 ensure the transition will be as smooth as possible.  
19 In particular I look forward to hearing how DOE is  
20 working with ACS to manage this new diverse range of  
21 programs that DOE has not previously overseen as the  
22 department's portfolio expands to children as young  
23 as zero to three years old. I'm interested to hear  
24 details relating to DOE's management of these  
25 contracts and whether they will release a concept

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

8

1  
2 paper in advance of issuing a new RFP. I understand  
3 that ACS is continuing to oversee the voucher  
4 programs that help families afford child care and so  
5 I hope to hear about the plans for interagency  
6 coordination in keeping the process as simple as  
7 possible for, for families going forward. I'm also  
8 interested... very interested in... to hear about how DOE  
9 plans to address the discrepancies in pay between  
10 educators in city run and privately-run centers. The  
11 city needs salary, salary parity, this is a chief  
12 concern that will now fall to DOE to resolve. As I  
13 stated earlier the Education Committee is hearing  
14 Resolution 358 today on this issue, the salaries for  
15 certified early childhood teachers at CBOs need to be  
16 the same as at DOE, it's that simple. And I just want  
17 to note that because we don't have parity I keep  
18 hearing about the vacancies that exist in these  
19 centers and we're dealing with a, a young population  
20 going through the formative years of their lives that  
21 are looking to build relationships and that's a big  
22 part of learning at that age; social, socialization  
23 skills and building relationships, how do you do that  
24 when the adult in the room keeps changing or, or  
25 leaves because of economic reasons and then there's



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

difficulty recruiting and keeping and retaining that educator in that classroom and there, their requirements are the same for any DOE based teacher. So, it's as simple as saying equal pay for equal work, equal pay for the equal amount or qualifications necessary to be an educator. So, I want to thank Majority Leader Cumbo for her Resolution and for her leadership on this issue. Though the implementation and expansion of UPF and 3-K programs and the evolution of Early Learn NYC have not been without issue, the consolidation of these systems creates an opportunity to build a strong structure for an equitable and sustainable early child care landscape. I hope we can have a productive conversation today about the opportunities to make all these programs better and make thoughtful investments in our city's children and families. I'd like to thank our Committee Counsel, Beth Golub; Policy Analyst, Jan Atwell, Kalima Johnson; Finance Analyst, Kaitlyn O'Hagan, Elizabeth Hoffman; and Community Engagement Liaison, Mili Bonilla. I'd like to also thank my staff; Anna Scaife; Vanessa Ogle; and Eric Faynberg. I just want to acknowledge the members that, that are here; Council Member Brennan,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

Council Member Barron, Council Member Levin, Council Member Ulrich, Council Member Lander, Council Member Cohen, Council Member Grodenchik, Council Member Adams, if I missed anyone I apologize but with that we'll now hear from the... I'd like to just swear folks in if, if that's okay?

COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right hand? Do you swear to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony today and to answer honestly to Council Member questions? You may begin.

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Good afternoon Chairperson Treyger and members of the General Welfare and Education Committees here today. My name is Lorelei Atalie Vargas and I'm the Deputy Commissioner for Child and Family Wellbeing at the Administration for Children's Services. I'm joined by Josh Wallack, Deputy Chancellor for Early Childhood Education and Student Enrollment at the Department of Education. thank you for this opportunity to discuss our work to support New York City's youngest children and their families. This is an exciting moment to further strengthen and align the early care and education system and set the next generation of New

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 Yorkers on the path to success. New York City has  
3 made major investments in high quality, free and  
4 affordable early care and education programs over the  
5 last decade including Early Learn at ACS and Pre-K  
6 for All and 3-K for All at DOE. With the essential  
7 partnership of community-based organizations  
8 including Head Start, child care agencies and family  
9 child care providers these initiatives represent the  
10 city's deep commitment to early childhood and to  
11 supporting the needs of children and families at a  
12 critical moment in development. The city council has  
13 been a crucial advocate for and supporter of these  
14 programs and together we have been able to give  
15 hundreds of thousands of children a strong start in  
16 school and in life. Building on these historic  
17 investments, in 20... in April 2017, Mayor Bill De  
18 Blasio announced the transition of Early Learn from  
19 ACS to DOE to create a stronger and more unified  
20 birth to five early care and education system in New  
21 York City. In September 2017, ACS Commissioner David  
22 Hansell expanded the ACS Division of Early Care and  
23 Education to create the Division of Child and Family  
24 Wellbeing, CFWB, a new ACS division focused solely on  
25 primary prevention of abuse and neglect. CFWB aims to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 engage families in the community before they ever  
3 reach the child welfare system with resources and  
4 services to help them thrive. This new division  
5 focuses on the factors that contribute to family  
6 wellbeing, including quality education, health care,  
7 housing, culture, and employment; and uses place  
8 based and population-based approaches to engage  
9 families and communities. This is part of an ongoing  
10 effort to disrupt disparity, establish access  
11 resources for at risk families and promote  
12 opportunities for children to reach their full  
13 potential. To do this, CFWB is working  
14 collaboratively with other city agencies, including  
15 the Department of Education, as well as the  
16 Children's Cabinet, ACS provider and community  
17 partners and community advocates. Our new division is  
18 built on the strengths of our continuing work in the  
19 early care and education system. Over the past  
20 several years, we've been able to infuse a high level  
21 of quality into our Early Learn contracted system. We  
22 developed and implemented monitoring protocols that  
23 allow for uniform support and oversight of all Early  
24 Learn programs and we provide targeted technical  
25 assistance and regular training for our programs. Due

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 to these efforts, ACS passed three audits, two  
3 announced and one unannounced by the Federal Office  
4 of Head Start between 2015 and 2016, each one with no  
5 findings and corrective action required. This is a  
6 major milestone and, and is the first time in New  
7 York City.. this is the first time New York City has  
8 had such positive results. We are proud to transition  
9 the Early Learn system at this high point. In  
10 addition to investing in the quality of the system,  
11 we have also made investments in innovative programs  
12 that use a two-generation lens, wrapping services and  
13 supports for social emotional learning and economic  
14 supports, around the entire family. One  
15 accomplishment we'd like to highlight is the  
16 implementation of Trauma Smart. In partnership with  
17 Thrive NYC, Trauma Smart is designed to address the  
18 wide range of experiences impacting our children and  
19 families, by using our child care programs as hubs of  
20 trauma informed care in our communities. As of this  
21 month, over 14,000 providers have been intensively  
22 trained in this model. When we consider the thousands  
23 of children and families who are touched by these  
24 providers, we can appreciate the incredible depth and  
25 reach of this innovative program. We are pursuing

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 other innovative initiatives as well. Beginning in  
3 2016, ACS partnered with CUNY's Professional  
4 Development Institute to fund education for the  
5 parents of Head Start students to become accredited  
6 teachers for infants and toddlers. We know that  
7 economic supports are critical for our low-income  
8 families, and this program supports and encourages  
9 parents to pursue their Child Development Associate  
10 degree or a CDA by creating a... by... and it also  
11 creates a critical professional pipeline for infant  
12 and toddler classrooms across the city. By supporting  
13 the educational advancement of our parents, we are  
14 supporting the economic mobility of their families.  
15 Graduates of the CDA program are now employed at  
16 Early Learn centers and many continue to pursue  
17 further education. In fact, two weeks ago we  
18 graduated our fourth cohort of parents from this  
19 successful program. I am pleased to share with you a  
20 small sample of how ACS has strengthened our Early  
21 Learn system during the course of this  
22 administration. We strongly believe these changes to  
23 the early education system and the creation of this  
24 new Division at ACS will benefit children, families,  
25 educators, program staff, and New York City as a

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

whole and we look forward to detailing these benefits in today's testimony. At this point, it is my pleasure to turn it over to Deputy Chancellor Josh Wallack. Thank you for having us here today.

JOSH WALLACK: Good afternoon Chairs

Treyger and Levin and all the Council Members here today. I am Josh Wallack, Deputy Chancellor for Early Childhood Education and Student Enrollment at the Department of Education. I'm very pleased here.. to be here today to discuss our work to ensure that all New York City children have access to high quality early childhood care and education. I want to say I'm.. I apologize for the last-minute schedule change and appreciate your understanding when I do have to leave briefly the Chief of Staff of the Division Emmy Liss will be here and can continue to answer questions until I return and then I'll be back as I possibly can to continue. As you know, the city's investments in early care and education recognize that high quality programs improve children's performance throughout their school experience. These investments have been made through several initiatives. The Early Learn system of contracted early care and education launched in 2012 at ACS serves over 30,000 children

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

from six weeks to five years old in center based and home-based settings. And Early Learn is funded by the federal Head Start grant, state Child Care Development Block Grant and city tax dollar... city tax dollars. As Lorelei detailed, these programs have had a strong positive impact for low income children and their families. In 2014, New York City launched the Pre-K for All initiative at the Department of Education, within four years, the number of four-year olds receiving free, full day, high quality pre-K increased from 19,000 to nearly 70,000 today, including the 10,000 children served in the Early Learn system. We utilize a mixed delivery model to offer our programs in both district schools and community-based organizations, and we support program quality with on site support from approximately 146 Instructional Coordinators, experienced early childhood educators that coach on site and 140 Social Workers. In 2017, the city began expanding its early education offerings to provide two years of free, full day, high quality preschool through 3-K for All. After launching in community school districts 7 and 23 in 2017, 3-K for All will expand this fall to serve approximately 5,000 three-year olds in school



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 districts 4, 5, 7, 16, 23, and 27. The programs will  
3 expand to school districts 6, 9, 19, and 31 in 2019  
4 and school districts 12 and 29 in 2020; every  
5 district will take two years to get to universal  
6 access for every three-year-old whose family wants a  
7 seat. And with our planned expansion, we will serve  
8 over 19,000 three-year olds across all five boroughs.  
9 Our aim is to take 3-K for All citywide in 2021 with  
10 support from our partners in state and federal  
11 government. In July 2019, the Early Learn system will  
12 transfer from the Administration for Children  
13 Services to the Department of Education. The goal of  
14 the transition of Early Learn to the DOE is to unify  
15 and further strengthen the early care and education  
16 system in New York City. We want to make New York  
17 City an even more supportive place for families  
18 raising young children, and for more children to have  
19 access to high quality early care and education.  
20 Creating a more unified birth to five systems will  
21 benefit children, families and early education  
22 providers as: children will have more seamless  
23 supports through their early care and education  
24 experience starting at birth, this included seamless  
25 connections and greater curricular alignment between

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 early childhood programs and K through 12 educations.  
3 Families will have access to a range of programs to  
4 meet the varied needs of their children, aged zero to  
5 five, and expanded access to information about their  
6 choices. Providers will have a better aligned set of  
7 supports and consistent quality standards for their  
8 programs, access to integrated data, a single  
9 contracting relationship for age zero to five  
10 services; and less administrative burden. As part of  
11 the Early Learn transition, the Department of  
12 Education will apply to be New York City's Head Start  
13 grantee through the Federal Office of Head Start's  
14 free and open grant competition this fall. The DOE's  
15 management of New York City's Head Start and Early  
16 Head Start programs is dependent upon our... on our  
17 successful application and award. The funding and  
18 services that come from the Head Start grant are  
19 critical for ensuring the city is able to best meet,  
20 meet the needs of the most vulnerable children and  
21 families. We will be in touch with you about how you  
22 can support those efforts over the next several  
23 weeks. The July 2019 Early Learn contract transfer  
24 timeline aligns with the Head Start grant competition  
25 timeline. The Office of Head Start announced earlier

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 this year that grants will be awarded to begin in  
3 July 2019. Current Early Learn contracts will be  
4 extended through June 2020 to ensure there is no  
5 disruption to services for children and families  
6 during this time of transition. The DOE will run a  
7 procurement for new contracts to start in summer or  
8 fall of 2020. The contracts awarded through this  
9 procurement will replace all of the current contracts  
10 the city holds with providers of early care and  
11 education, including current Pre-K, 3-K, and Early  
12 Learn contracts. DOE has been conducting extensive  
13 outreach to hear about early childhood providers'  
14 experiences under the current system. And we know  
15 that while providers will not experience significant  
16 change at the time of the initial transfer, the  
17 creation of a more unified birth to five system will  
18 represent a real programmatic and contractual change.  
19 And towards this end, we will run an extensive  
20 outreach effort to ensure that providers are fully  
21 informed about the RFP process and the timeline for  
22 new contracts that will begin in 2020. We will hold  
23 briefings for your offices and with other partners  
24 like the Day Care Council and DC 1707. We will make  
25 this process as simple and accessible as possible and

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 will seek your partnership to ensure all providers in  
3 your districts know when and how to apply. The  
4 transition of Early Learn to the DOE presents an  
5 especially meaningful opportunity to integrate  
6 services for children with developmental delays,  
7 delays and disabilities in early childhood. Research  
8 shows that interventions and inclusive learning  
9 opportunities can build the foundation for  
10 educational success if they are provided at this age.  
11 The DOE is committed to collaborating closely with  
12 our partners to identify solutions to longstanding  
13 challenges. We've been collaborating with the  
14 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to better  
15 support families as they transition out of Early  
16 Intervention systems to the Department of Education.  
17 We are also working closely with our office of  
18 special education to improve early services for  
19 children with disabilities who are three or four  
20 years old. We are working to improve early childhood  
21 data systems, align policies, expand program  
22 offerings and provide quality services for children  
23 regardless of which program serves them. We are also  
24 focused on supporting staff recruitment and retention  
25 at our many community-based organizations, more of

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 whom will be contracting with the DOE following this  
3 transition. We greatly value our early education  
4 teachers and the important work they do, and the DOE  
5 is committed to helping all providers recruit and  
6 retain a talented work force and grow that work force  
7 over time. We will continue to offer our community-  
8 based partners access to lead teacher retention  
9 incentives and support in certified teacher  
10 recruitment and hiring. Over the past year, staff at  
11 ACS and the Department of Education have engaged in a  
12 productive process of close coordination and  
13 collaboration to prepare for the transfer of Early  
14 Learn contracts. In the spring and summer of 2017, we  
15 launched interagency working groups to promote cross  
16 agency learning and collaboration and began monthly  
17 joint meetings between agency staff. We have engaged  
18 key stakeholders across the city to solicit guidance,  
19 feedback, and ideas on the creation of a birth to  
20 five system. Starting in the fall of 2017, this has  
21 included direct engagement with Early Learn providers  
22 through more than 60 one on one meetings with program  
23 leaders, as well as an ongoing series of  
24 approximately 30 roundtable meetings. We convened two  
25 key advisory groups, comprised of advocates,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 researchers, policy experts, early childhood  
3 education providers and others to weigh in on our  
4 ongoing program design process, including as that  
5 process relates to home-based providers and infant  
6 and toddler care. We've met with parent groups,  
7 family groups to provide updates and find  
8 opportunities for collaboration and held focus groups  
9 with the families of three-year olds. Current ACS  
10 staff who support Early Learn programs will  
11 transition to the Department of Education when... as,  
12 as the contracts do in July of 2019. We are working  
13 closely with the Office of Labor Relations and the  
14 unions who represent these staff to ensure a smooth  
15 transfer. Our department is excited to welcome our  
16 incoming colleagues and work to leverage our combined  
17 expertise, resources, and field presence to offer  
18 broad technical assistance and supports for all  
19 providers to foster high quality, developmentally  
20 appropriate care for families choosing home or  
21 center-based care for children birth through five. In  
22 collaboration with ACS, we have been providing  
23 support to Early Learn programs through instructional  
24 coaching, visits from social workers, and  
25 professional learning. Our outreach team has been

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1 supporting Early Learn programs across the city  
2 through enrollment trainings and direct connections  
3 to interested families and is able to leverage the  
4 investments made in family outreach and engagement  
5 for the expansion of Pre-K for All and 3-K for All.  
6 In addition, our Office of Teacher Recruitment and  
7 Quality works collaboratively with institutions of  
8 higher education to support all Pre-K and 3-K  
9 providers in finding high quality teachers for their  
10 classrooms, including at Early Learn programs. They  
11 host recruitment events throughout the year and serve  
12 as a resource to both potential teachers and  
13 providers. As part of this transition, we plan to  
14 extend support to Family Child Care Networks in the  
15 city building on a recent pilot program by the  
16 Administration for Children Services in partnership  
17 with an organization called All Our Kin. This support  
18 includes on site coaching, professional learning and  
19 business workshops for participating providers. Our  
20 city's ambitious goals for children's earliest years  
21 also include ensuring that all children are reading  
22 on grade level by the end of second grade. To align  
23 our investments in young children even further and  
24 create a continuum from birth to age eight, the  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 administration's Universal Literacy initiative has  
3 become part of the Division of Early Children  
4 Education at the Department of Education. This  
5 initiative has built a team of over 200 coaches who  
6 work with teachers in kindergarten through second  
7 grade to advance their early literacy skills. And  
8 this fall, the workforce will grow to over 400  
9 coaches as we fulfil the Mayor and Chancellor's  
10 pledge to support every elementary school in the  
11 city. Over time, we will work towards greater  
12 alignment between all of those early learning  
13 programs from birth through the Universal Literacy  
14 program in second grade. Thank you for being  
15 passionate advocates for early childhood education.  
16 We are proud to expand access and improve the quality  
17 of the city's early care and education programs  
18 through the creation of this more unified birth to  
19 five system, and we're grateful for your continued  
20 support. We look forward to your ongoing partnership.  
21 Thank you again for the opportunity to testify today  
22 and we're happy to answer any questions.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
24 much both Deputy Commissioner Vargas and Deputy  
25 Chancellor Wallack. I want to apologize for my being



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 late, I had another hearing off site, so I want to  
3 thank my Co-chair for getting the hearing started and  
4 you for your testimony, which I've been able to read  
5 over during... while you were reading it. I want to  
6 acknowledge members who have arrived as well; Council  
7 Member Cornegy, Council Member Ampry-Samuel, is  
8 anyone else... that wasn't acknowledged... Council Member  
9 Rose and so is that are on both committees get double  
10 credit for being here. So, I, I want to just to say a  
11 couple of opening words and then I'll turn it over to  
12 my colleague, my Co-Chair for, for his questions. I  
13 want to thank everyone for being here. As has been  
14 said ACS currently administers the largest municipal  
15 child care system in the nation, Early Learn NYC. The  
16 Early Learn is an early education model that merges  
17 subsidized child care, head start and universal Pre-K  
18 into a single system for delivering education  
19 services to children six weeks to four years old. In  
20 the city where child care is one of the greatest  
21 expenses for low income families with children, the  
22 Early Learn NYC program provides affordable at no  
23 cost care for eligible families five days a week up  
24 to ten hours a day. Early Learn was launched in  
25 October 2012 and has been administered by ACS, ACS

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

since then. The program was developed with the ambitious goal of improving quality standards, enhancing professional development, and providing full day, day... full day care. However Early Learn has faced challenges since it's inception, many providers struggle to achieve full enrollment, some providers that were awarded contracts had to withdraw seats due to difficulties in implementation, the decrease overall capacity by... this... increase... decrease to overall capacity by thousands of slots. The ratio of enrollment to capacity in the contracted care system continues to be lower than it was in the year prior to Early Learn being launched. Today our hearing is going to be focusing on the shift from ACS to DOE but we're all going to... also going to highlight the, the gap in pay and work hours between programs provided in public schools versus programs at community-based organizations, teachers are doing the same job but getting paid different salaries. At the CBOs, recruitment and retention of staff is a growing challenge, this challenge may be further compounded by the administration... as the administration rolls out 3-K for All which could intensify competition for teachers and this is an... a note about that. We cannot

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 in good conscience continue to have a two-tiered  
3 system for paying compensation and benefits within  
4 our early childhood education system. It is... it is to  
5 the great detriment of the overall system to have  
6 these two tracks, it has been incredibly difficult  
7 for community based organizations to be able to  
8 maintain both their enrollment but also their ability  
9 to recruit qualified teachers and, and it's a... it's  
10 a... both a moral obligation but it's also in the  
11 city's interest as we're looking at moving this  
12 system over to the Department of Education to be able  
13 to have a long term vision and goal that, that is  
14 going to have to require adequate and equivalent pay  
15 across the system, we cannot absolutely not any  
16 further have a two tiered system which is what we  
17 have today. So, we're going to continue to insist on  
18 that and I'm going to ask questions about that during  
19 this hearing. I think we would all agree that our end  
20 goal is achieving a quality early childhood education  
21 system however it's a... it's not clear exactly how  
22 we're going to be achieving that goal and so I hope  
23 that this hearing will afford us the chance to in,  
24 inform the process leading up to July 2019 when the  
25 contracts move over from ACS to DOE, this would

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 include issuing a concept paper and I know that  
3 that's not standard for the Department of Education  
4 but that is what happened when... in 2010 when, when,  
5 when ACS initially rolled out Early Learn and so I  
6 think a concept paper is absolutely essential beyond  
7 having community engagement sessions. I think an, an  
8 official concept paper that has a, a formal process  
9 to, to inform this RFP from providers and from the...  
10 from the overall child care system that... people that  
11 are working in that system, organizations and, and  
12 advocacy organizations as well. I think this is, is  
13 essential, I know it's not standard but, but moving a  
14 large system like this over from one agency to the  
15 other is also not standard so we should be... we should  
16 be taking that... this opportunity to do that and that  
17 was... it was... it was useful in the past, it will be  
18 useful in the future. I also want to just acknowledge  
19 Deputy Commissioner Vargas's efforts in, in, in  
20 really making great strides with, with the head start  
21 system here in New York City. When she took over as  
22 Deputy Commissioner they were facing major challenges  
23 from the federal government and she took on that,  
24 that issue with a, a lot of professionalism and  
25 responsibility and from, from what we're being

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 reported... what we're hearing reported it's, it's been  
3 largely successful, so I want to just acknowledge the  
4 effort that you've done and your done in making that  
5 a success. Before we would... before we get back to my  
6 Co-chair's questions I want to thank Committee staff  
7 who helped put this together today; Counsel, Aminta  
8 Kilawan; Policy Analyst, Tonya Cyrus and Crystal  
9 Pond; Finance Analyst, Daniel Kroop; and Finance Unit  
10 Head, Dohini Sompura. I'd also like to thank my  
11 staff, the, the Education Committee staff for their  
12 work as well as my Chief of Staff, Jonathan Boucher;  
13 Policy Director, Edward Paulino; and Legislative  
14 Director, Elizabeth Adams. And I'll turn it back over  
15 to my Co-chair, Mark Treyger.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much  
17 Chair Levin for, for your leadership on, on this  
18 issue way before this hearing and we look forward to  
19 our partnership together. I also just want to note  
20 that we've also been joined by Council Member Gjonaj.  
21 So, I, I appreciate the remarks we've heard from the  
22 Deputy Commissioner, the Deputy Chancellor, certainly  
23 the remarks were filled with some of the positive  
24 highlights of, of the transition. What I didn't hear  
25 is how we're addressing the challenges that are also

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

traveling along with this transition to the DOE. We are here to address and solve problems and, and so I just want to get right to it, I, I didn't hear anything about addressing the parity issue. I... and so I just want to... one of the most significant challenges to the city's early childhood education programs is the wage disparities between teachers and community-based organizations and Department of Education schools. What is the Department of Education doing to address this issue.

JOSH WALLACK: Appreciate the question

very much. So, we understand that this is an important issue that we've been hearing about from providers as we go around the city learning about the best ways we can make this transition successful and we believe... we want to help all of our providers recruit and retain the very best talent to teach our youngest children and that's why the administration has made some steps since the launch of Pre-K for All to address this issue. First by adding money into the budget, about 16 million dollars when we initially started Pre-K for All to raise the salaries of some educators in our community-based organizations and then the city was part of the discussions between the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 day care council and local 1707 that resulted in a  
3 new contract with increased salaries and better  
4 access to healthcare for our early childhood  
5 educators. So, we have made some strides on this  
6 issue. With that being said, we hear from providers  
7 and from advocates and others that there's still more  
8 to do and so as we are discussing the transition  
9 we're listening and learning about the dimensions of  
10 that issue. At the same time, we're very aware that  
11 if and when there is a resolution to that issue it  
12 will be worked out at the bargaining table between  
13 the day care council which represents the management  
14 of those organizations and 1707 which represents the  
15 workers. Of course, the city is a part of that  
16 conversation but ultimately the solution will be  
17 worked out as part of the collective bargaining  
18 process.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, I just want to  
20 just ask some further clarification questions. Are  
21 the requirements to be a DOE teacher as far as... I'm  
22 sorry, the requirements to be a CBO head teacher are  
23 the same for a DOE teacher?

24 JOSH WALLACK: The answer is that... first  
25 of all everybody who is at the head of a classroom is

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 part of the early care and education system, is a  
3 qualified excellent teacher we believe in that.  
4 Legally the requirements are slightly different,  
5 teachers in Department of Education classrooms are  
6 all certified, in C... in community-based organizations  
7 some are certified, some are on their way to being  
8 certified and in... a part of a study plan to become  
9 certified over time. With that being said again all  
10 of them are qualified, excellent at their jobs and  
11 both agencies do a lot of work to support those  
12 teachers and help them continue to develop  
13 professionally so that they're at their very best in  
14 front of the classrooms for our kids.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right but to be  
16 clear the, the head teacher and the CBO is, is also...  
17 is fully certified?

18 JOSH WALLACK: Is certified or on their  
19 way to being certified, that's right.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And the same thing  
21 with the DOE teachers, they are... they are on their  
22 way to getting a master's degree as well... [cross-  
23 talk]

24 JOSH WALLACK: Some of them... [cross-talk]

25



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...there's, there's a  
3 way to get permanent certification which I had to go  
4 through which I am very much aware of, so they have  
5 to go through the same rigorous process and what is  
6 the starting salary for a DOE teacher?

7 JOSH WALLACK: I don't know the exact  
8 because it's changed over time, so I'll have to get  
9 back to you with the exact figure.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Deputy Chancellor  
11 you're a Deputy Chancellor... [cross-talk]

12 JOSH WALLACK: Yes... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and, and that is a  
14 question that quite frankly should be answered here...  
15 [cross-talk]

16 JOSH WALLACK: Yes, I just don't have it  
17 in front of me, I, I know that... what we did in the...  
18 in the negotiations... what we did in... and what  
19 occurred in the last round of negotiations between  
20 the day care council and 1707 is that the start... we...  
21 they came to an agreement that the starting salaries  
22 for lead teachers in community based organizations  
23 would increase to 44,000 dollars for a teacher with a  
24 bachelors and 50,000 for a teacher with a teacher  
25 with a masters in 2020 and those starting salaries

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 were roughly in line with the starting salaries for  
3 DOE teachers represented by the United Federation for  
4 Teachers at the time that agreement was met. That's...  
5 those are the numbers I know well because that's the  
6 way we thought about how to get that in line and  
7 those, those salaries were in line. Since then I know  
8 there have been some adjustments and I'll have to get  
9 back to you with the... with the exact figures.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I would just say  
11 that a big part in... big driving force behind this  
12 hearing is this issue of parity and how it has a  
13 profound... a significant impact on the ability of  
14 providers to attract, retain educators because of the  
15 disparity issue where folks go to the DOE system so  
16 in, in order for us to have an honest conversation we  
17 should know what the salaries are and, and so do you  
18 have the figure for the, the starting salary for a  
19 CBO teacher?

20 JOSH WALLACK: What I just mentioned the  
21 44 and 50,000 is what was agreed to and I'll just... I  
22 want to add if I might that as we're looking at this  
23 issue though I understand it's important and I don't...  
24 this is not meant to minimize but just to add to it,  
25 in an additional effort to address the issue you're

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 pointing to we also at the Department of Education  
3 made available a set of signing and retention  
4 incentives to help increase the compensation of the  
5 qualified educators in our community based  
6 organizations and also provide a sort of rich array  
7 of professional learning supports to those teachers  
8 and I think again the bottom line for us is we know  
9 that we could not succeed in rolling out Pre-K for  
10 All, 3-K for All or any of the other ambitious  
11 programs that we want to have for our youngest  
12 children without the hard work and dedication of the  
13 workforce all across the system and so we've made a  
14 number of efforts to try to increase the compensation  
15 but also the opportunities for professional  
16 development for our educators across the system and  
17 that commitment will continue. I... we understand that  
18 this is an ongoing issue and concern and as we go  
19 around the city we're learning more about it and  
20 listening but we're making those efforts and have  
21 made those steps in the direction.

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Deputy Chancellor

23 I, I just have... I cannot... first of all we should have  
24 figures and numbers here to work with but I also just  
25 want, want to stress if, if we are promising people a

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 quality education we need to make sure that we  
3 attract, retain quality folks who have gone through  
4 all the licensing requirements and training and, and,  
5 and the best way to, to keep them and to attract them  
6 is to pay them equal to what the DOE pays there,  
7 their starting teachers which is higher than what  
8 CBOs are currently required to pay. When the DOE  
9 issues a new RFP will you be reopening the collective  
10 bargaining agreements with CBOs?

11 JOSH WALLACK: The, the contract that  
12 currently is in place operates through 2020 and the  
13 schedule for collective bargaining and the schedules  
14 for procurements are, are different things.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Does... is there  
16 anything that prohibits the administration from  
17 engaging in good faith collective bargaining before  
18 2020?

19 JOSH WALLACK: At this... I mean as I said  
20 we are... we... as we go around the city planning for  
21 this transition we're having a lot of conversations  
22 and understanding this issue but at the moment... but  
23 the... this contract lasts through 2020 and we are  
24 anticipating a procurement that has services

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

beginning in 2020 so those are the timelines we're

3

operating under at the moment.

4

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, again just

5

to reiterate my question was is, is there anything

6

that legally prohibits the DOE from... the

7

administration from engaging in good faith collective

8

bargaining prior to 2020?

9

JOSH WALLACK: I'm, I'm not trying to...

10

I'm just say... I'm not... I'm not a lawyer and don't

11

know what, what is prohibited legally or not but at

12

the moment there is no plans to engage in collective

13

bargaining ahead of that timeline. I think in

14

general... [cross-talk]

15

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, I mean... [cross-

16

talk]

17

JOSH WALLACK: ...but, but... so, so, just

18

to... sorry, go ahead.

19

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Deputy Chancellor

20

then you... then you are contradicting with your

21

earlier statement because you had mentioned before

22

that you want to... that this issue should be resolved

23

through collective bargaining, we want to address

24

these issues now, we're seeing a transition next

25

year, I believe and, and your testimony talked about

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 the benefits and the highlights of that transition  
3 but nowhere in these five pages, six pages did I hear  
4 anything about addressing the pressing existing  
5 challenges and we're going to hear from a lot of  
6 providers, a lot of folks who are on the ground in  
7 impacted communities about their inability to attract  
8 and retain educators because of this disparity issue  
9 and I want to thank Beth Golub my Committee Counsel  
10 here, the, the starting... according to the DOE's own  
11 website Deputy Chancellor... I'm sorry and to the UFT  
12 the starting teacher salary with a bachelor's degree  
13 for the DOE teacher is 56,711 dollars and I think I  
14 heard you before mention for that for the CBO it's  
15 44,000... [cross-talk]

16 JOSH WALLACK: That's with a bachelors,  
17 that's the agreement that was struck between the Day  
18 Care Council and 1707. [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Correct, so just,  
20 just, just for the record and for, for my colleagues  
21 and the public to hear, the starting DOE teacher with  
22 a bachelors, 56,711 dollars and a starting teacher  
23 salary again same requirements for a CBO, 44,000  
24 dollars, that is a major issue, that is a major part  
25 of this problem because folks who have gone through

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

all the schooling and the licensing and building up their credentials they are moving to the DOE system understandably so because they have families of their own to take care of, bills to pay, student loans to pay back and that's why CBOs are having a very, very difficult time making ends meet and again I don't think I've heard, you know an answer to the question maybe it's intentionally that there's nothing that legally prohibits the administration from entering in good faith collective bargaining prior to 2020 and I'm urging the administration and check with... check with lawyers but I think nothing prohibits you from engaging with folks in good faith collective bargaining and resolve the disparity issue once and for all. What efforts are being made to address the high teacher turnover rate and do you have any data with you about the number of vacancies and the, the retention rates in CBOs?

JOSH WALLACK: I don't have that, I don't

have information with me here about that. I will say that we worked very closely with our program leaders, with our colleagues at the Administration for Children Services, what we do is work on a constant basis with community based organizations using the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

same human resources tools that are used for district school teachers so our, our office of human resources goes out and recruits the finest candidates, the finest early educators we can find and then helps them connect both with district schools and with community based organizations through hiring fairs and by sending resume books, etcetera and helps them make those, those connections and we keep in touch with the CBOs to make sure that they're fully staffed and work with them until we... until they tell us that they are and then at the same time as I mentioned we make signing and retention bonuses available both to help them attract those teachers and to help them retain them over time along with the professional learning efforts that we, we provide.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Deputy Commissioner

do you have any data with you since... I mean about the number of vacancies that exist and the retention rates?

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: I don't have the

data, I don't have the data on me but I'm sure if we... you know we can connect after this and we could pull that data for you.



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right but, but  
3 this... but this speaks to the oversight of, of the  
4 program because... I mean these are... the, the... some of  
5 the biggest pressing challenges with the program.  
6 This is not a new issue, this has been ongoing and so  
7 I'm very disappointed that folks came here unprepared  
8 and I, I don't think that's a coincidence and I also  
9 don't think it's a coincidence that folks have to  
10 leave early, early here as well, this is a very  
11 serious issue.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Now I have a couple  
14 more and then I'm going to turn to my colleague, so I  
15 want to be mindful of their time as well. Can you  
16 describe the staff at DOE whose responsibilities will  
17 include early childhood education, how many people  
18 will have oversight over this program area and what  
19 will their level of expertise look like?

20 JOSH WALLACK: Sure, I think one of the...  
21 one of the tremendous opportunities of this  
22 transition is to bring together two incredible teams  
23 that have a great deal of expertise in early  
24 childhood education. So, the staff that has been at  
25 the Administration for Children Services and I'll say

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 a couple of sentences and then I'll, I'll turn it  
3 over to Lorelei after I finish describing DOE but  
4 we're excited because, you know as we discussed  
5 they're a team that has moved the city, you know  
6 miles in... particularly in managing head start but  
7 also in managing a set of incredibly complicated and  
8 successful programs for children birth to five,  
9 they'll be coming over to, to join a team that has  
10 also accomplished a great deal in launching Pre-K for  
11 All and 3-K for All so I'll say broadly speaking what  
12 we have is a mix of, of, of early childhood educators  
13 that have worked in a mix of district schools some  
14 have worked in district schools, some have worked in  
15 community based organizations including head start  
16 and early head start and child care and both teams  
17 have that range of experience, both teams have a, a  
18 range of experience in working with children from  
19 birth through five and even older than that and, and  
20 social workers on... again from both teams at the  
21 Department of Education they have a growing expertise  
22 in early childhood mental health and in partnering  
23 with families to help engage them as partners in  
24 early learning and as Deputy Commissioner Vargas  
25 mentioned the social workers there have been

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1 implementing a Thrive program which she'll describe.  
2  
3 So, all in all an incredibly rich set of backgrounds  
4 that will come together to be able to support early  
5 care and education programs that really address child  
6 development in a holistic way so not only building  
7 early cognitive skills but also social emotional  
8 skills and empower families to work with us as the  
9 primary partners in their children's education and as  
10 families that'll have real voice in the early care  
11 and education system and in our public-school system.  
12 We also have and I'll... and then I'll stop, a, a team  
13 of people who help with business operations for child  
14 care and head start providers and an incredible team  
15 of outreach workers who help fan out to communities  
16 across the city, informed them about the benefits of  
17 early care and education and help them navigate the  
18 enrollment process and there's others as well but  
19 that's... those are just some of the teams that will  
20 come together as part of this transition.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Anything to add  
22 Lorelei?

23 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: I, I would only  
24 add to that that, you know ACS is also with our staff  
25 where, you know we have staff as well that, you know

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

run the gambit in terms of BA, MA, you know masters

3

in social work, even... we have even a couple of

4

lawyers on the team who have worked in the early

5

childhood space and they're bringing to DOE not only

6

deep competency and experience in the early childhood

7

space but also deep relationships with the providers

8

that they've built over the years.

9

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I just want to make

10

clear on this point is that, that as we're shifting

11

from ACS to, to DOE I, I imagine there will be a

12

shift in expectations and there will be a shift in

13

who is going to be interacting with the providers and

14

the educators there, if there's going to be some

15

superintendent or some position in the DOE that now

16

has to be the person overseeing the program, you know

17

to make sure that the providers first have time to

18

process the expectations of the... of the Department of

19

Education because you just... you can't just rush

20

things and, and, and... you know I want to just make

21

clear that folks from the DOE have expertise in this

22

field that there are clear expectations that are

23

passed on to provider even before it, it, it takes

24

place, that should already be happening quite frankly

25

and to minimize any disruption to instruction. I have

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1 one more question then I'll turn it to my Co-chair.

2 One of the primary concerns for the expansion as well

3 Pre-K and 3-K is the potential exacerbation of

4 overcrowding in DOE school buildings while a majority

5 of, of, of Pre-K and 3-K students may currently be

6 served in CBO, a large number enrolled in DOE

7 facilities primarily elementary schools, 57 percent

8 of which are already overcrowded according to

9 reports. What percentage of Pre-K and 3-K students

10 are currently, currently attend programs in DOE

11 facilities?

12 JOSH WALLACK: So, for Pre-K it's about

13 40 percent in district school facilities and about 60

14 percent in community-based settings, for 3-K so far,

15 we're close... we're closer to 50/50 though, it will

16 vary especially as the new districts come online so

17 I'll give you information as we go there.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And are any Pre-K

19 programs located in buildings that over capacity?

20 JOSH WALLACK: We... so, we believe... so,

21 the short answer is there are... there are... all of our

22 programs are located in buildings where the school

23 leader and school community feel like they can do a

24 good job providing Pre-K and 3-K and we work very

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 care, carefully with school leaders, with  
3 superintendents and with local elected officials such  
4 as yourselves to make sure that we're striking that  
5 balance and so if there are particular issues in any  
6 of your districts that you want to raise we're wide  
7 open to working with you on those but the short  
8 answer is we believe that they're all in spaces that  
9 can handle it and where leaders are enthusiastic and  
10 teachers are too.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I just want to  
12 make clear for the record that capacity in... capacity  
13 in school does have a very big impact on instruction  
14 and there are some school districts that we can't  
15 even fulfil the promise of UPK or 3-K because they're  
16 so overcrowded and so in, in my... in my part of town  
17 and Council Member Brennan could also attest to this  
18 district 20 is one of the most overcrowded districts  
19 in New York City, they can't... they are having a very  
20 hard time finding sites so you can't fulfill the  
21 promise of universal when it's not universal across  
22 the five boroughs in every region of the five  
23 boroughs so this is... this is a big issue but I want  
24 to be mindful of my colleagues and their time so I'm  
25 going to turn it over now to Co-chair... Chair Levin.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very

much Chair Treyger. So, I can't help but be very  
disappointed with the answers regarding pay parity  
that we just received. First off, the UFT pay  
schedule is posted on the UFT website that is  
certainly information that you all should have in  
preparing for this testimony... this hearing so, you  
know I'm... I have half a mind to adjourn the hearing  
and get that information and, and bring it back but I  
think in the interest of everybody's time I will ask...  
but just in general what I did not hear was an  
acknowledgement big picture that we have a  
significantly disparate pay structure compensation  
structure, benefit structure between UFT represented,  
DOE, early childhood education teachers and 1707  
representatives, representatives, the CBO early  
childhood education teachers. Now keep in mind and we  
all know this but I want to say this for the record,  
the CBO teachers, the 1707 teachers are working 12  
months a year, they're working till six o'clock at  
night so they don't get to... they get... they work more  
hours for less money, are, are... do you have with you  
a comparison chart that shows year over year what the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

pay disparity is between these two... the UFT teachers and the 1707 teachers both with BAs and MAs?

JOSH WALLACK: I don't.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, I do...

[cross-talk]

JOSH WALLACK: Okay...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, I want to thank Citizens Community for Children for providing this but obviously if they got it we could have it and so I'll just read it out... now actually this is based on May 2018 numbers and so the schedule that we read off just now for UFT teachers is... has actually been updated so the, the disparities actually increased from this but I'm just going to read this onto the record. First... this is for, for bachelors accredited teachers, salary progression, first year 1707 CBO 41,265; UFT DOE 55,059 so that's about... you know it's about a 14,000-dollar difference, starting salary with the bachelors. That second year, DC 1707 CBO, 41,765 and UFT, DOE 56,153 so they both increased by... you know a few hundred bucks. The next year, third year, 42,265 versus 56,618. The following year, 42,765 versus 57,437; the next year it's 43,465 versus 58,147. The next year it's 44... this is now



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2 year six, 44,065 versus 61,150. The next year, year  
3 seven 44,065 so that pay doesn't even increase versus  
4 66,515. When you get to year eight for a bachelors  
5 accredited teacher in the CBO 1707, 44,065 versus  
6 74,207, that is a 30,000 dollar a year difference  
7 when you get to year eight, that's with a bachelors.  
8 Then we go to masters. The masters first year 46,920  
9 versus 61,894 so that's about a 15,000-dollar  
10 difference... 14,000-dollar difference. The next year  
11 is 47,220 versus 62,998. The next year is 47,520  
12 versus 63,453. The following year is 47,820 versus  
13 64,272. The next year is 48... so now we're on year  
14 five 48,320 versus 64,982. The next year, year six  
15 48,920 versus 67,985 so there at that point we're at  
16 a 19,000-dollar difference. The following year, the  
17 same is... with a bachelors 1707 stays the same between  
18 years six and seven; 48,920 versus 73,350. The  
19 following year, year eight same... the, the... DC 1707,  
20 CBO teacher stays the same, 48,920 and now I know  
21 that this is... this has gone up for a, a masters to  
22 hit 50,000 in 2020 but this is today... [cross-talk]

23

JOSH WALLACK: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

24

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...and the masters

25

year eight, UFT 81,042 so that difference is now

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

32,000 dollars a year difference. It is so wildly  
disparate that it... on it's face is so obvious that it  
undermines the effectiveness of this system. We  
cannot, cannot have a two-tiered system where you  
have... I mean why would anybody, why on earth would  
anybody want to work when they're career path shows  
them that after eight years of dedicating themselves  
working seven a.m. to six p.m. every day, taking care  
of our children in a CBO setting making sure that  
parents don't have to leave work at three o'clock,  
you know putting in all of that time why on earth  
would anyone want to do that when they're... when  
they're, they're set to make 30,000 dollars less than  
their counterpart, why wouldn't they just say... the  
city's expanding the UPK program, they're expanding  
the 3-K programs, of course I'm going to go work at  
the... at the DOE why would I go work at a CBO, I mean  
it's just... it's, it's on its face, I mean people  
would have to... you know they, they, they'd have to  
really be dedicated to working in a CBO setting to do  
it for, for 30,000 dollars a year less every year,  
every year, you take that out over the course of an  
entire career, I mean that's... you know you're working  
for 20 years, 30 years, 30,000 dollars a year less,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

you know that's, that's a... that's a house. So, I, I just... I, I, I... I mean it's New York City, it's... but really, I mean I just don't get the sense, I'm not blaming you all, I don't... I mean just to your point also about well this was the deal between the Day Care Council and 1707, I've talked to the Day Care Council and 1707 they weren't given the resources to negotiate a fair contract with 1707, the Day Care Council would obviously want to have pay parities in their interest to have pay parity, the city of New York, Office of Labor Relations, the Mayor of the city of New York did not give the Day Care Council enough resources to negotiate a contract that was on par with, with, with the DOE teachers so I'm not blaming you all but I just have not never, never in year... in several years of talking about this issue, never gotten an acknowledgement from the city that they really see this as a serious problem that has to get fixed. The only way it gets fixed is with funds, resources, money dedicated to this and so I guess my question is and I hope you have the answer to this, to get on full parity, full parity how much would that cost per year, do we know that?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 JOSH WALLACK: I don't, I don't, and I  
3 think... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: We need to find  
5 out.

6 JOSH WALLACK: I, I don't know the answer  
7 to that and a lot of what we're... you know I think a  
8 lot of what we're doing as we go around the city is  
9 we're learning and listening about the dimensions of  
10 this problem, so I don't have the answer.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, it's... this  
12 is so essential to the health of this system because  
13 I'm, I'm concerned and I applaud UPK, Pre-K for All,  
14 I, I applaud all the work that you did to implement  
15 that, I applaud all the work that Lorelei has done to  
16 stabilize Early Learn, I mean I, I, I'm looking at  
17 the numbers here of enrollment in contracted care  
18 between FY '10 and FY '14, '15 when Lorelei came in  
19 that system contracted by 35 percent maybe, I mean it  
20 went from 48,609 to 30,422 and it stabilized since  
21 then but it dropped so precipitously. I am concerned  
22 that, that all of these wonderful options that we're  
23 providing in our school system are going to totally  
24 undermine the, the, the contracted care system. So,  
25 that's a big, big concern so I, I guess... so... sorry,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 that's my soapbox, what, what, what lessons have,  
3 have, have we learned going into this process from  
4 the first Early Learn contract and from how UPK  
5 effected Early Learn so like this two-part question;  
6 what, what's, what are the two.. what are the  
7 takeaways from each of those circumstances at this  
8 point?

9 JOSH WALLACK: I'll take the second part  
10 which is the UPK or part of the second part rather,  
11 which is the part about the interaction between UPK  
12 and Early Learn. I think that the approach that we're  
13 taking.. that we've taken and will continue to take is  
14 again to acknowledge that the organizations that have  
15 been providing these services and supports in our  
16 communities for years and sometimes decades are  
17 really the cornerstone, the lynch pin of this effort  
18 and so as we go out for example to expand 3-K we  
19 begin by talking with the existing community based  
20 providers with Head Start and child care agencies,  
21 Early Learn contracted agencies to see if they want  
22 to expand and that's our first stop. It's only after  
23 we've exhausted those opportunities that we then look  
24 for spaces in district schools to try to add to the  
25 system to add the capacity we, we want to add. So,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 we're trying very hard as we go, we won't get it  
3 perfectly and we'll need your help I think to, to, to  
4 do it even better, we'll need your input and advice  
5 and your connection to providers but our goal here is  
6 to add to an incredibly high performing system to add  
7 capacity. So, to take what exists and put more on top  
8 of it to increase access, that's one of the main  
9 lessons I think DOE has learned from our work with  
10 Early Learn.

11           LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: So, I mean we've  
12 learned a lot around Early Learn and through our work  
13 with Early Learn, you know I think... even where we are  
14 today versus where we were when Early Learn was first  
15 launched we know more about the importance of early  
16 childhood education, I mean there's way more research  
17 that tells us that these are the important years and  
18 these are the years where we need to be investing  
19 heavily and so, you know this administration has  
20 taken that on in terms of, you know the investments.  
21 With that being said I think, you know we, we've  
22 certainly seen, we've gone through growing pains and,  
23 you know when I... when I first came in and, and Pre-K  
24 was being implemented it was the same and, you know  
25 we immediately partnered with the Department of

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

Education to figure out how do we minimize some of

3

the stressors that some of the providers were

4

experiencing because of the dual systems and we've

5

worked very closely together over the course of the

6

last three, three years to try to minimize kind of,

7

you know multiple standards and you know different

8

regulations as much as we could, you know I think

9

ultimately what, what we know and appreciate as a

10

system is that at the core of these, you know child

11

care centers are families who have very real needs

12

and communities that have very real needs... [cross-

13

talk]

14

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-huh... [cross-

15

talk]

16

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: ...and so, you know

17

the work that we are doing over at ACS and the launch

18

of the division of Child and Family Wellbeing is

19

really focused on, you know the belief that there are

20

needs but there are incredible strengths in these

21

communities as well and what we need to do is look at

22

those strengths and figure out how do we build on

23

those strengths and partner with other city agencies

24

to leverage existing investments that are being made

25

and systems that exist and so, you know we've learned

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 a lot, you know over the course of the last three  
3 years. It is... you know we've gone through some real  
4 growing pains but there has never been a lack of  
5 desire to try to sit down and figure it out.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I'm, I'm going to  
7 turn it over to my colleagues who have questions and  
8 then... and then I'll come back on a second round.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Council Member  
10 Lander...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Council Member  
12 Lander.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you to both  
14 Chairs and to, to all my colleagues and I'll just  
15 associate myself both with the praise for the work  
16 that has been done around early childhood education,  
17 the extraordinary steps forward that have been taken  
18 and with the passionate commitment to getting the pay  
19 parity for all the reasons that we're talking about  
20 both because it's the right thing to do and because  
21 the system doesn't work otherwise given the  
22 incentives that are created but my question is on a...  
23 another element of the early childhood system and  
24 it's one that we've also been working together on for  
25 quiet some time now around integration across



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

socioeconomic and racial and ethnic groups in our systems and we are starting to make some good progress on that in middle schools and high schools. There are some real challenges... and there's some wonderful things like the K-280 program at PS10 which is an extraordinarily integrated Pre-K program, obviously there have been some, some of those programs which are really integrated and some which are not, it is especially challenging in the Early Learn and, and two and three year old systems, there are some wonderful programs like the Helen Owen Carey program that, that we've talked about in the past which is half subsidized and half private pay so you both expand the number of seats and achieve really integrated early childhood education and I would just like to know what if any steps are being taken as we expand the system to try to make that more the reality because if we don't do that then we're certainly going to wind up with a fully segregated early childhood system where in some places there's 100 percent subsidized education for low income kids and in other places there's 100 percent market rate fee based education for some other kids which will mean they're... and they don't show up equally ready in

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 a lot of cases and in any case we lose on a lot... a  
3 lot on the... excuse me, we lose out on a lot of the  
4 opportunities.

5 JOSH WALLACK: So, I'll start, I would  
6 say first of all we agree with the... with, with the  
7 goal we would like to see greater diversity in early  
8 childhood programs and classrooms because we believe  
9 that children learn more and better in diverse  
10 programs and classrooms, so we share that goal with  
11 you. I think... there are two things I would say, one  
12 is we have started in... at the Department of Education  
13 with some diverse... what we call diversity in  
14 admission pilot programs in early childhood programs  
15 which started in K through 12 where programs are  
16 intentionally setting priorities for students that  
17 meet certain criteria that are low income in  
18 temporary housing or face another type of hardship or  
19 crisis in their lives. I think going forward this is  
20 an area we would like to explore further with you, I  
21 think as we ramp up to do a new... a new procurement  
22 for birth to five services with a new contract  
23 starting in 2020 we are looking hard at ways that we  
24 can make it easier for programs to integrate their  
25 programs in classrooms and the way that we can make

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 the structures work better to facilitate that. So, I  
3 think we'll be coming to you with some more concrete  
4 ideas about that in the months ahead, so we look  
5 forward to that discussion, but we share that goal.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: So, I'll just end  
7 with this, I think perhaps the Chair's idea of a  
8 concept paper that looks at some of these questions  
9 seems to be that things might be able to go together,  
10 there are certainly plenty of places where parents  
11 are already paying a meaningful amount more than the  
12 Early... the Early Learn contract provides for child  
13 care, I don't know what that looks like at Helen Owen  
14 Carey and they're schedule fits in but it just seems  
15 to me we should look at these things together because  
16 this, this is not just a diversity in admissions  
17 question, this is also a funding streams question,  
18 obviously when we can get the 3-K for All that's a  
19 different issue but so long as non-low income New  
20 Yorkers are paying for child care then the  
21 opportunity to grow the system in inclusive ways that  
22 achieve the goals that we have for pay parity but  
23 also the goals we have for high quality integrated  
24 education will be good to try to meet together so I  
25 hope we can work on that. Thank you very much.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Council Member  
3 Grodenchik.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you  
5 Chair Levin and thank you Chair Treyger. I just want  
6 to follow up with what the Chairs have said and what  
7 my colleague Brad Lander has said and put some  
8 historical context into this, I started working on  
9 this issue when I first attended a meeting for my  
10 mentor hero, former boss Nettie Mayerson in 1987, the  
11 meeting was at Varick Street and it was at DC's  
12 1707's headquarters when they were located on Varick  
13 Street and I say that just to give you some idea how  
14 long people have been pushing, this is over 30 years  
15 now and that's when I got to the fight, I don't know  
16 how much further it goes back but this is a  
17 generational fight and we can't have fundamental  
18 fairness in this city and the Mayor talks about this  
19 all the time and we believe in fundamental fairness,  
20 we, we...

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: It's a slogan...

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: ...it's a  
23 slogan, right, so I'm a kid who grew up in public  
24 housing, I don't think I went to a CBO, I kind of  
25 remember maybe but I went to New York City public

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

schools and we have got to have fairness and we need to know what it's going to cost, we need to know these answers and we don't want to be... I don't want somebody who succeeds me a generation from now to be talking to the future Mr. Wallack or... you know whoever is sitting in that chair we've got to deal with this issue now and we absolutely need to know what it's going to cost. This is a city with a big heart, I think we are doing a tremendous disservice certainly to the teachers and certainly to the students when we have a two-tiered system, so we need to get going on this and we need to get going on this now and I want to thank... I don't have any questions for you, but I just wanted to put a historical context on this. I don't know where you were 30 years ago, I know where I was, I don't know where my Chairs were, they were probably still in grade school but that's okay but I'm a little older and a... and a little... I don't know if I'm wiser but maybe a little more seasoned so I... early grade school. I thank you for listening to me and I'm very happy, I have to leave now to attend some meetings, but I want to thank you for being here today and I certainly want to thank both of my Chairs for holding this hearing

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 on this very, very important topic for our children,  
3 thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Council Member  
5 Barron.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you to the  
7 Chairs and thank you to the panel for coming. You  
8 know I used to teach school, I was an assistant  
9 principal and a principal and if you had come to my  
10 class as you came today not having hard data you  
11 wouldn't have gotten an A for the day because you  
12 would have been in my opinion unprepared, knowing  
13 what the topic was and knowing what our focus was to  
14 not bring that data so... I always believe in doing  
15 better so next time you come hopefully you'll be  
16 prepared and have all those kinds of data's and have  
17 brought reports that have been issued by advocates  
18 and done an analysis of that and given us some  
19 direction on how you intend to improve. The Board of  
20 Education... I'm, I'm dating myself, the Department of  
21 Education has been experiencing a downward trend in  
22 the number of black and Latino faculty, teachers and  
23 administrators what do you show if you have the data  
24 as the number of black and Latino teachers in these  
25 early childhood programs?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

JOSH WALLACK: I don't have the exact

3

figures with me, but I will... I will get you what we

4

have. I would just say that... just quickly that in our

5

effort to recruit and retain the very best part of

6

that is recruiting a diverse workforce, a diverse

7

group of teachers that represent all parts of New

8

York City, so we agree with that goal.

9

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And following up

10

perhaps in the trend of my colleague Brad Lander in

11

talking about how schools are so very much in columns

12

and in silos based on ethnicity, what are the

13

requirements or what is the opportunity for a parent

14

living in a particular zip code of registering her

15

child or his child in a zip code close to where they

16

may work and they'll be able to have the opportunity

17

to bring the child home when the leave work?

18

JOSH WALLACK: So, at the moment in Pre-

19

K... in Pre-K for All a family can choose a program

20

anywhere in the city so they fill out an application,

21

they can work with one of our outreach workers to

22

find a location that's convenient to their home,

23

where they work, where a relative lives or works,

24

they fill out their preferences and they're matched

25

with a program, the highest choice program that has a

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

spot and we have a good track record of providing people with their top choice or one of their top three choices and for 3-K we are building that system as well. So, the goal I think is to provide as much flexibility for families as possible both to increase access and also to increase the opportunities to create diverse and integrated classrooms and programs.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And do you have

any data as to the number of parents who choose to place their child outside of their immediate community?

JOSH WALLACK: I don't have the exact

figures here, but I will say that a lot of families choose... to choose a program or setting very close to home so... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, then I would

like to know how many who would like to have one away from home...

JOSH WALLACK: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...are satisfied

and, and get that.

JOSH WALLACK: I'll, I'll look at the...

[cross-talk]



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'd like to know  
3 that... [cross-talk]

4 JOSH WALLACK: ...I would say overall each  
5 year we wind up with a figure somewhere in the 70's  
6 or 80 percent range of, of families that get their  
7 top choice or one of their top choices, so we are  
8 able to work with families who want to have a program  
9 that's close to where they work for example as well.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And what is the  
11 ratio of parent... of... the child teacher ratio in these  
12 two programs?

13 JOSH WALLACK: So, I, I think it's the  
14 same across the board, it's, it's two adults for 18  
15 kids for four-year olds and 15 kids for three-year  
16 olds and if you add more than that to the number of  
17 students you add you have to add another adult and  
18 the total cap for four-year olds is 20 and for three  
19 year olds is I believe 18... 17, sorry, 17.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I think that  
21 ratio... that's the same as what a kindergarten teacher  
22 has, a teacher with a para, we had paras and we had  
23 about 15 to 20 students in a class with... especially  
24 if it was a half day. I think that seems kind of  
25 high. As I think back to my sons when they were three

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

years old I think that I would not have felt

3

comfortable with knowing that there was one adult who

4

was charged with an additional seven children to take

5

care of... well there are two so... [cross-talk]

6

JOSH WALLACK: There are two adults...

7

[cross-talk]

8

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...it's... right, so

9

there are two adults so one... [cross-talk]

10

JOSH WALLACK: ...per 15... [cross-talk]

11

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...basically is

12

taking care of seven and the other's taking care of

13

eight, yes?

14

JOSH WALLACK: There are... there are two

15

adults for 15 kids, I think they work as teams...

16

[cross-talk]

17

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right and if we

18

divide it up, they may work as a team... [cross-talk]

19

JOSH WALLACK: ...but, but yes... [cross-

20

talk]

21

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...but if we do...

22

[cross-talk]

23

JOSH WALLACK: I agree... [cross-talk]

24

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right, if we do

25

one to one to think that there's one person who's

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

looking at my three year old along with seven other children sometimes I think that it's a difficult choice for parents to do that, to realize that that's the ratio that might not be sufficient and especially talking about three year olds that need a lot of nurturing, perhaps some cuddling and I don't know how that's going to play out, you know in this day and age where it's basically hands off, that may need some cuddling and encouragement so I'm concerned that that's the ratio that you have, I would have liked to have seen it a lower ratio.

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Council Member

Barron if I... if I could add that in our Early Learn programs, you know the ratios that we use are, are set by the Department of Health through Article 47... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: ...however in many Early Learn programs we have programs that have great partnerships with universities, partnerships with senior centers where volunteers come in and add to that because we do need cuddle's, children do need, you know hands on interaction and so, you know we, we

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2 find that a lot of our programs and frankly when I  
3 ran a program I also depended very heavily on  
4 volunteers as well to, you know to kind of fill, fill  
5 the gap sometimes when you need a couple of extra,  
6 you know adults to hold a child's hand or sooth a  
7 child if they're crying or they're upset so, you know  
8 we find that a lot of our programs do that and they  
9 tap into programs across the, the city whether it's,  
10 you know universities and colleges who have students  
11 who want to come and, and do work in the center or  
12 aging... you know senior programs, DFTA where seniors  
13 want to come in and do a story time or they want to  
14 come in and just sit with the kids during circle,  
15 circle time or..

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And in terms... in  
17 terms of opportunities to explore some of the great  
18 cultural centers that we have here in this city what  
19 is the provision for that, are children taken on  
20 trips, do they have school buses that would transfer  
21 them and how often does that occur?

22 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: So, I'll start.  
23 In... with Early Learn programs you might remember a  
24 couple of years ago we switched to having a line item  
25 budget, we encouraged our providers to include

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

programs like that, trips, additions for children so that... you know we live in New York City and we want the children to be able to experience the city. With that being said they are very little kids and, and so, you know when we think about school trips like in a K through 12 program it is a little different than, you know thinking about an early childhood program... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: ...in buses we need car seats... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh okay... [cross-talk]

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: ...yes and so, you know the... you know how programs go about obtaining car seats, purchasing car seats, keeping car seats, storing car seats that sometimes becomes a barrier... becomes a barrier. Now we live in New York and we have a great public transportation system and so we have programs that will do things like for example if they're with the Head Start curriculum if they're learning about flowers they might take a trip to the local community garden, they might take a trip in

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

their community so that the children can become more and more familiar with their community, they might go visit the fire department so there are a lot of that kind of local trips so that children become familiar with their community and their surroundings and other residents become familiar with the children as well and you know there are also opportunities and we have programs that have, you know been able to get children on a train to go to the Bronx zoo or to take... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-talk]

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: ...them to see a special movie or, you know to take them to see some of the other cultural institutions in the city.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

JOSH WALLACK: Thank you. I'm sorry, I have to leave now but I'll be back, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I have a question for the Deputy Commissioner. We asked... we asked earlier about the number of vacancies, is it just that you didn't have that with you today or you don't collect that data in general?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: No, we don't

3

have... I don't have it with me today, so I don't want

4

to give you a number that's not accurate but I'm

5

happy to share an accurate number with you.

6

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And putting aside

7

the, the accurate number, have you heard from

8

providers and from communities about the high number

9

of vacancies and the teacher retention issues?

10

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: So, we work very

11

closely with our programs, it's not... it's not

12

something that, you know comes to us as a surprise to

13

us, we have heard, you know programs have raised

14

concerns that it is difficult to, to retain staff and

15

with those programs we, you know have done a variety

16

of different things, we've connected them to DOE as,

17

as Deputy Chancellor Wallack was sharing before to

18

see if they can, you know help with their HR office

19

in terms of attracting teachers and we just provide

20

as much support as we can to, to those programs but

21

yes, we, we, we have heard that concern...

22

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, I mean I

23

imagine dealing with DOE HR they're dealing with

24

folks who want to work with the DOE at DOE rates and

25

salaries, I mean that's, that's, that's the issue.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 It's... I... you know again the Early Learn was... has been  
3 under ACS, this was not over... this was not under the  
4 helm of DOE until next year but I'm just trying to  
5 figure out the quality review and from, from, from  
6 your department when you consistently hear feedback  
7 from providers that they're having difficulty  
8 attracting, retaining people if... I, I imagine someone  
9 from your office visits sites, is that right?

10 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Uh-huh, yes...

11 [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: How often?

13 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: We go out about  
14 every six weeks.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and has  
16 anyone you're your staff ever, ever reported back to  
17 you that this provider still has a vacancy or there's  
18 vacancy concerns here, have you heard that?

19 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Again, we do  
20 track... we track vacancies in our system.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Can you provide  
22 that data to us after, after... to this committee?

23 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Sure, as I  
24 shared... I'd be happy... [cross-talk]

25 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right... [cross-talk]



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2           LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: ...to kind of share  
3 that information.

4           CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay and so what  
5 feedback do you... how do you then ensure quality  
6 early, early childhood education when there's no one  
7 there or when they have difficultly filling in these  
8 gaps?

9           LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Well one, I  
10 wouldn't say that there's no one there, we have many  
11 incredible and highly qualified teachers who work in  
12 our system and as somebody shared earlier, you know  
13 it is... they are showing up every day, they are there  
14 12 months a year, they're with the children, they're  
15 supporting the families so I wouldn't say that we  
16 don't have anyone there, you know have we... have we  
17 had issues with, with teachers, you know moving over  
18 into the other system, yes and that's an issue as  
19 Deputy Chancellor Wallack said is one that, you know  
20 as we're hearing trying to figure out how do you  
21 resolve that, that particular issue but also from an  
22 ACS standpoint how do we support the program to  
23 ensure that quality... that the level of quality we've  
24 been able to bring the system up to is sustained.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and I'm not  
3 suggesting that there's no adults in the room but  
4 there's a... there's, there's different position  
5 titles, is that correct?

6 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, there's head  
8 teachers, is that right?

9 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: There are assistant  
11 teachers, is that right and... right, so I... what I'm  
12 saying is that these are the head teacher positions  
13 that folks are having difficulty retaining, is that...  
14 is that right?

15 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: I, I can't say  
16 for sure.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right. Now have  
18 you... and so hearing feedback from people that work  
19 for you and visit providers have you raised this  
20 issue with... so who do you report to as far as... ACS  
21 Commissioner, have you had conversations, who's the  
22 Deputy Mayor that oversees for example ACS?

23 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: It's a Dr.  
24 Herminia Palacio.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and have conversations reached to her level?

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: I don't... I don't meet with her directly, my Commissioner does.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, but have you heard... have you asked your Commissioner to raise this with superiors in the past?

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: I've shared these issues, these, these issues are not secret... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right... [cross-talk]

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: ...it's not a surprise... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right... [cross-talk]

LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: ...these are issues that are well known in our system and I think our advocates and our providers are well aware, you know the issues have been documented by advocates and so, you know it's an issue that, that we are aware of and again from an ACS perspective as we're going through this transition our focus has been in trying to maintain the quality that we've been able to bring to this system, you know because we are cognizant of the fact that we are serving children, you know across

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

the city and we want to make sure that the quality of

3

Early care and education services that these children

4

receive is up to par.

5

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and, and I...

6

and I appreciate all that it's just that when I deal

7

with other agencies and departments... for example when

8

I deal with cases of NYCHA for example the former

9

NYCHA chair would say she would bring it to the

10

attention of folks who oversee her to ask for more

11

money and ask OMB for more money so we just passed an

12

89 billion dollar budget in the city council in our

13

budget response and we did push for the issue of

14

parity, I am not clear why the administration did not

15

get this done when clearly the money is there, if

16

anyone could speak to that.

17

EMMY LISS: I think again as has been

18

said this is an issue that we believe will be

19

resolved... should be resolved at the bargaining table

20

and we are... we are aware of the challenges and

21

continue to go and visit with providers as the Deputy

22

Chancellor and Deputy Commissioner have said.

23

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I'm going to

24

inter... [cross-talk]

25

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...interject for a  
3 second, the, the recent announcement that UFT did  
4 with the Mayor last week around paid parental leave  
5 was that done... was that a contract amendment or was  
6 that something that was like done as part of a new  
7 contract with the UFT?

8 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: I'm not familiar  
9 with the specifics of, of the agreement.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, I'm pretty  
11 sure that that was a contract amendment as far as I  
12 know, I mean I don't know anyone else know in this  
13 room whether the UFT contract is up or that this was  
14 done as part of a... or whether this is a contract  
15 amendment, I'm pretty sure it was contract amendment  
16 so I, I... just to kind of answer for my Co-Chair's  
17 question from before I don't... I don't think that  
18 there's anything that precludes the administration  
19 from entering into negotiations around pay parity  
20 during the course of a contract and not waiting until  
21 a contract negotiation is.. you know that there's a  
22 whole new contract negotiation, but I mean I don't...  
23 I'm pretty sure that that's not what just happened  
24 with the UFT on, on paid parental leave.

25 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Sorry, I know.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Do you... well are  
3 you testifying... signed up to testify?

4 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: I mean I...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Sorry, we don't...  
6 we don't... you could... if you want to maybe write it  
7 down and we'll... I'll read it into the record. Okay,  
8 thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, it, it's my  
10 understanding that nothing in the law prohibits the  
11 administration right now from engaging in good faith  
12 conversations with stakeholders to address this issue  
13 and what, what I am trying to grapple with from the  
14 DOE's point of view is that when superintendents and,  
15 and people from Tweed visit schools today... [cross-  
16 talk]

17 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Uh-huh... [cross-  
18 talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...teacher retention  
20 is a measurable item that they hold schools  
21 accountable for, that's a major issue because it  
22 speaks to the stability of the school...

23 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Uh-huh... [cross-  
24 talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...so, if this is now  
3 all being transferred over to DOE and we're hearing  
4 that there are people with expertise and experience  
5 who know what they're doing who are going to be  
6 overseeing this how in good conscious can we say that  
7 we are providing, you know the best opportunities for  
8 kids knowing that there's already retention problems  
9 right now? That's, that's what I am trying to... trying  
10 to grapple with here...

11 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Uh-huh...

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: We know this  
13 problem exists, this is nothing new. As we heard from  
14 the Deputy Commissioner, the advocates and folks have  
15 known about this for quite some time. You can't say  
16 that the city doesn't have money because the city's  
17 budget has blossomed to close to 90 billion dollars  
18 now and everyone's talking about a... you know at this  
19 time the revenue is coming in. We keep hearing about  
20 equity and excellence for all but apparently except  
21 for CBO providers, teachers. They're not a part of  
22 the fairness equation at this point and again as I  
23 mentioned before this has a reverberating effect for  
24 their financial bottom line but also, we have to  
25 speak up for the kids who see turnover and

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 communities that are promised these programs that  
3 can't really deliver what they're saying there,  
4 they're promising to deliver. So, you have families  
5 here who are impacted financially, you have  
6 communities that are being shortchanged and you have  
7 programs not being given the ability to fulfil the  
8 promise of, of what they've pledged to do so.. and if  
9 it's one... it's one thing if we knew that there's,  
10 there are no... there are no funds, the Co-Chair and I  
11 sit on the budget negotiating team in the city  
12 council, there's a lot of money. This is a matter of  
13 doing just the right thing and it's the right thing  
14 to resolve this issue now once and for all.

15 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Now I want to  
17 recognize we've been also joined by Council Members  
18 Ayala, Gibson, Deutsch, Reynoso and Salamanca and I  
19 just... any other of my colleagues have any questions?  
20 Council Member Reynoso.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So, I just... I  
22 don't want to beat a dead horse here, but I just  
23 don't want us to look back at this in six months and  
24 actually have the parity and that a lot of the  
25 testimony and the work that we did here is for not,



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 so I just want to lend my voice to, to what I'm  
3 hearing from our Chairs for, for this hearing. This  
4 is... this is not an if it's going to happen but when  
5 it's going to happen so it's just better that we, we,  
6 we're mindful of that, many times in like NYPD policy  
7 people, you know they dig their heels in and then two  
8 months later we come out and you know we're not  
9 arresting people for marijuana. This pay parity stuff  
10 is definitely something that has to happen and that  
11 it is going to happen so it's just unfortunate that  
12 you have to sit here today like on the wrong side of  
13 that and, and that's part of what I just would want  
14 to make sure I, I, I echo with my, my colleagues so I  
15 just wanted to make that statement in general  
16 regarding this hearing and then I have more questions  
17 later on for, for a different panel but thank you,  
18 thank you Chairs.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Question for the  
20 DOE with regards to capital needs for sites, I  
21 understand that DOH provides the, the licensing, is  
22 that correct?

23 EMMY LISS: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: But I imagine that  
25 the DOE might have its own set of expectations that

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

might be similar or different than the expectations

3

of ACS, is that correct?

4

EMMY LISS: DOE and ACS both follow the

5

Department of Health's Article 47 regulations for our

6

facilities.

7

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, there's

8

complete alignment with regards to expectations of

9

the physical space?

10

EMMY LISS: We both fully follow the

11

Health Code.

12

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, but I'm just

13

saying is... a visitor from the DOE going to come visit

14

a site and say where's this, this shouldn't be here

15

because these are already providers that are kind of

16

stretched thin... [cross-talk]

17

EMMY LISS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

18

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and if they are

19

being required to make any type of capital

20

improvements or capital changes I'm just wondering if

21

there's any capital support that goes along with this

22

transition?

23

EMMY LISS: For existing providers there

24

are no changes in the code that they are required to

25

follow, when new providers apply to work with us

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

through the procurements that we've run in the past

3

or future procurements we do offer the opportunity

4

for providers to apply for start up funds if there

5

are specific elements of their facility that they

6

need support to upgrade.

7

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, I mean I

8

think that we've pretty... we've made our case here

9

pretty clear, I think you've heard it from, from our

10

colleagues, the city council will not stop focusing

11

and fighting on this issue because it, it has

12

enormous impact beyond just this room, this reaches

13

our communities and we, we want to make sure the

14

administration at the highest level understands that

15

and we will continue to make our voices heard to

16

provide fairness and equity. Again, I go back to my

17

original statement, equal pay for equal work, it's an

18

issue of fundamental fairness in a city that boasts

19

that it's the big... the fairest city in the country.

20

With that my, my Co-Chair will close it out.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I just want to

22

amend that, it's, it's equal pay for more work...

23

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right...

24

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...they work more

25

hours and more months out of the year. This, this...

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

first off I want to just acknowledge that the person that... in, in the audience that spoke up is... said that they're... they are a UFT teacher and that the, the contract process was actually moved back several months in order to allow for this announcement... this, this negotiation to happen between the administration and OLR and, and the UFT so it moved back from November '18 to February of '19 so there's... there is I think flexibility within the contract negotiating process to allow for something like this to happen. Again, I just want to say that I've been talking to the Day Care Council for years about this, they would be thrilled to be able to provide 1707 with a contract as pay parity of... with, with UFT teachers, they were not given the resources by this administration to be able to do that. That's, that's a... that's... so it's, it's, it's not on them, they didn't have... they can't print money to be able to do that so... and they don't control... they don't control the, the city budget. So... sorry, with, with regards to just the process here is there a... is there any federal approval that is needed whether moving federal CCDBG or state child care block grant funding approved from the state or the federal government

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 that is required to allow for these programs to move  
3 over from... and that goes also for Head Start, moving  
4 from ACS which is part of the social services  
5 district to the Department of Education?

6 EMMY LISS: So, for Head Start the grant  
7 that ACS currently holds with the Office of Head  
8 Start is expiring in 2019, the DOE will be applying  
9 this fall through the Head Start open competitive  
10 grant process to receive the grant funds for the new  
11 grant that would begin in July of 2019, for the child  
12 care block grant dollars we have submitted a proposal  
13 to the state to seek their approval for our plans.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Is there... are  
15 there any other federal approvals that would be  
16 needed?

17 EMMY LISS: No, not at this time.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And are there  
19 contingencies... I mean are we expecting those  
20 approvals to be granted or are there contingencies  
21 for if they're not granted, if they're not granted I  
22 imagine it will be very hard to do this entire  
23 transfer?

24 EMMY LISS: For the transfer of the block  
25 grant dollars we have been working closely with the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

state office of Children and Family Services and will continue to engage in discussions with them over the next year to plan for a successful transition.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: There... with regard to the direct lease sites... [cross-talk]

EMMY LISS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...those are currently overseen by DCAS so anybody that's been on the council long enough like has gotten somehow involved in a direct lease site for an early childhood program and we all kind of all know what that's like, it's a... I, I imagine it takes up a whole lot of Lorelei and Allison's time and that is... that's a DCAS... you know that's a DCAS, they're the lead agency on that, with DOE I mean it... DOE I'm assuming does not directly lease private space, I mean is there anything in the DOE portfolio where it involves leasing private space and, and do you oversee that or do you contract with D, DCAS, I mean or do you... do you... do you allow DCAS to be the lead agency or is that an SCA, I mean what's the... what's the mechanics of that?

EMMY LISS: The DOE primarily works with the School Construction Authority on leased sites.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, so that  
3 would be the process moving forward, I mean these  
4 leases are with DCAS, right, so some of these leases  
5 are like ten, 20-year leases?

6 EMMY LISS: Yes, we are going lease by  
7 lease as we go through this transition process to  
8 work through the process to transition those over as  
9 part of the broader Early Learn transition.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: To SCA leases?

11 EMMY LISS: We're working with DCAS and  
12 SCA to determine the specifics of how we'll execute  
13 the transfers.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And that'll be the  
15 same across the board or that will be site by site,  
16 some sites will have a DCAS lease some sites will  
17 have an SCA lease or is it going to be kind of a  
18 standard operating procedure on the... [cross-talk]

19 EMMY LISS: It'll be a standard but  
20 because the leases expire at different times and many  
21 of them are up for renegotiations over the next year  
22 we're going... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-huh... [cross-  
24 talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 EMMY LISS: ...through them in more of a  
3 rolling process.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, DCAS has  
5 experience with this, I don't... does S... I mean does  
6 SCA have a lot of... what else... what... give an... can you  
7 give an example of what else in the DOE's portfolio  
8 is a direct lease site?

9 EMMY LISS: Sure, for example the Pre-K  
10 centers that... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-huh... [cross-  
12 talk]

13 EMMY LISS: ...exist across the city, the  
14 stand-alone facilities that serve four-year olds and  
15 in some cases now three-year olds, many of those are  
16 leased sites.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay and those are  
18 SCA?

19 EMMY LISS: Yes, SCA holds those leases.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. So, taking  
21 another direction here for a moment. What are we  
22 doing to ensure that 3-K for all, if the plan is to  
23 move that out across the city by 2021 is not, you  
24 know taking children away from the CBO contracted  
25 sites, how does... how, how does that... how are we



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 expecting to maintain... I guess the question is how do  
3 we expect to maintain a level of enrollment in the  
4 CBOs with 3-K for all coming down the pike and then  
5 what are our target numbers for contracted care as,  
6 as DOE's taking over this system, do we know... do...  
7 have we determined what the target number is?

8 EMMY LISS: So, we measure demand as we  
9 look across the city for 3-K based in part on the  
10 patterns we've seen in Pre-K applications over the  
11 last couple of years... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-huh... [cross-  
13 talk]

14 EMMY LISS: ...and as we calculate both the  
15 demand that we see for 3-K services and the supply  
16 that will be needed in each individual neighborhood  
17 to meet that demand we take into account the existing  
18 CBO capacity because we want to ensure that those  
19 providers are able to maximize their enrollment and  
20 continue to run sustainable businesses and so as we  
21 expand we are continuing to use a mixed delivery  
22 model where we're working with CBOs including current  
23 Early Learn providers and current DOE providers as  
24 well as new providers who are able to come in as we  
25 run procurements and then we look to space in our

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

district school facilities as well but all with an eye towards ensuring that our CBO providers who are a vital part of our expansion are able to maximize enrollment.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, then do you... do you anticipate that there will be an enrollment of 30,000 contracted spots in Early Learn programs when DOE takes over this, this, this system?

EMMY LISS: Our goal is to maximize enrollment to capacity in the Early Learn programs as we take over the system.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, then that would be 30,000?

EMMY LISS: Yes, though that includes the full age range of six weeks to five years old that... in that 30,000 number.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, then does... are we looking at expanding infant and toddler slots throughout the system when DOE takes those over?

EMMY LISS: So, as we take over the current contracts they will remain as they are, over time we would... we would like to with available resources of course see an expansion as we know there

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

is a great need across the city for high quality free

3

and affordable infant and toddler care as well.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. So, then...

5

so, then we... just to be clear we do not anticipate a

6

decrease in the capacity of contracted sites when

7

Early Learn moves over from ACS to DOE?

8

EMMY LISS: No, we do not anticipate a

9

decrease.

10

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Can you describe

11

right... is, is, is DOE open to the idea of doing a

12

concept paper?

13

EMMY LISS: I think we are committed to

14

ensuring a transparent and fair process for

15

procurement and we are looking at the best way to

16

roll that out to ensure providers and community

17

members understand how to apply.

18

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, I strongly

19

recommend... I, I'm going to give you my perspective,

20

I'm, I'm in my third term with the City Council, my

21

first term was when Early Learn rolled out... [cross-

22

talk]

23

EMMY LISS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

24

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...and throughout

25

that term dealing with the fallout from Early Learn

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2 took on more and more of a prominent space in my and  
3 my staffs lives because, because of, of what happened  
4 through that contracting process, it didn't go well  
5 and we had providers that were 40 year providers that  
6 lost a contract by two points, I had one provider  
7 that scored an average of 82 and then they... there was  
8 some disparity between their three scores so then  
9 they went back and they got scored again and that 82  
10 went down to 65, they lost their contract, they were  
11 a 40 year provider, that's not that unusual. I had  
12 providers who lost their contract because one  
13 provider got 17 contracts, you know because they just  
14 applied for everything and just got awarded 17  
15 contracts. It, it really... it was... I mean it was a  
16 real... it was a real problem and it took up a lot of  
17 people's time. At a certain point this city council  
18 took on 60 million dollars' worth of, of early  
19 childhood education contracts because we had to keep  
20 programs running and afloat while Early Learn got  
21 cleaned up. So, I strongly recommend doing a concept  
22 paper, now that actually had a concept paper... [cross-  
23 talk]

24

EMMY LISS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...but I strongly

3

recommend having an earnest effort and system to

4

ensure that that doesn't happen again because it, it

5

took a long time and a lot of effort and a lot of

6

extra money that this city had to put into the

7

system, 60, 60 million dollars extra a year to keep

8

the system... to keep programs from, from closing their

9

doors, it's just not a way to, to run a system if you

10

have an opportunity here to, to make sure that a

11

transition goes smoothly and so I strongly, strongly,

12

strongly recommend having everybody around the table

13

in a very formal process so that there are no

14

unanticipated problems and unintended consequences

15

that could really make for, you know real problems

16

down the line.

17

EMMY LISS: Uh-huh...

18

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, I, I strongly

19

recommend that a concept paper be implemented here, I

20

know that DOE doesn't do concept papers, I think this

21

is one instance... this is unusual... this is an unusual

22

circumstance here, I think that... I think that we

23

could make an exception to the rule. Staff moving

24

over from ACS to DOE... [cross-talk]

25

EMMY LISS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...how is that

working, does, does staff... is staff given a choice to stay at ACS or go to DOE or how is that kind of... how many staff are we talking about moving over from one agency to the other and kind of how is that playing out or is, is that still in process?

EMMY LISS: We're still in process, we're working with the Office of Labor Relations, with DCAS and with others throughout the administration to execute a functional transfer process since the functions will be moving from one agency to the other.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-huh. Okay, last question, we actually.. this, this administration put forward recommendations in 2015 on what to do, I have the report here, it was the New York City Early Care and Education Task Force recommendations from June of 2015. Are we looking to adopt all of the recommendations from this task force report as this transition happens?

EMMY LISS: I'm not familiar with all of the recommendations in that report but we would be happy to take a look and have a deeper conversation about it.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. Okay, I  
3 would appreciate a follow up to that, okay. I'll turn  
4 it back over.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I think... thank  
6 you very much my colleague and I, I also just... the  
7 concept paper doesn't sound that difficult, what a...  
8 what a concept. We... the, the DOE has a 30-billion-  
9 dollar budget, they certainly are... have capacity to  
10 produce a concept paper. If, if there's no, on other  
11 questions then I thank the panel for their time.

12 EMMY LISS: Thank you.

13 LORELEI ATALIE VARGAS: Thank you.

14 [off mic dialogue]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: So, we have a, a,  
16 a lot of... a lot of speakers, numerous panels so I  
17 think we're going to keep testimony to two minutes if  
18 that's okay, I apologize in advance, but I think with  
19 two minutes we're looking at all being here for  
20 another hour at least so try to keep it at two  
21 minutes.

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, we'll call  
23 up Rosemarie Sinclair; Lois Lee; Kim Madina; Lisa  
24 Caswell; and Inez, Inez Chillous.

25 [off mic dialogue]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Guess we'll work  
3 our way down, you could begin from... we'll make sure  
4 that the Sergeant has the clock started and you may  
5 begin.

6 ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: Hello, good, good  
7 afternoon. Oh, it's not on, sorry. Good afternoon  
8 Chairman Treyger and Levin. I just want to thank you  
9 and everyone else that's here for the opportunity to  
10 speak to you on behalf of our early childhood daycare  
11 directors and assistant directors. My name is  
12 Rosemarie Sinclair and I am the first Vice President  
13 of CSA, the Council of School Supervisors and  
14 Administrators. We represent over 16,000 members  
15 active and retired, leaders for public school and our  
16 daycare centers. As you know that highly effective  
17 early childhood education has a positive impact on  
18 students, communities and neighborhoods and I totally  
19 agree with, as you discussed about 1707 the teacher's  
20 pay parity but I'm here today to talk about the  
21 directors and the assistant directors of Early Learn.  
22 And we see that well trained leaders as well as, as  
23 teachers are very important for the process of having  
24 highly effective early education and we know that in  
25 order to attract and retain the best educators we



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 need adequate, adequate and fair pay. However,  
3 fairness remains a challenge in New York City,  
4 specifically salary disparities among Early Learn  
5 Directors and Assistant Directors compared to our DOE  
6 counterparts. This jeopardizes effectiveness of early  
7 childhood across the board and we are grateful for  
8 Council Member Laurie Cumbo raising the awareness  
9 around disparities and introducing Resolution 358,  
10 which calls for New York City to eliminate this  
11 disparity. We also want you to know that it is  
12 unfortunate that majority of our early childhood  
13 directors and assistant directors are minority women  
14 and these people actually commit themselves to make a  
15 better community, have great programs for children  
16 and we know that it is needed for them to have pay  
17 parity. It is important for them to not feel  
18 minimized or feel that they don't have the right to  
19 have the right amount of monies to satisfy what is  
20 needed today as far as pay parity. We feel that the  
21 disparities that runs counter to the DOE's mantra of  
22 equal equality and excellence. We don't see that when  
23 it comes to our Early Learn directors and assistant  
24 directors. Clearly CSA strongly supports Resolution  
25 Number 358 and we look forward to helping bridge the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

salary gap and consulted in the transition of Early

3

Learn New York City to DOE. We respectfully request

4

that the city council stand with us to demand equity

5

for these leaders and educators who have been taken

6

for granted for far too long. Thank you.

7

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and I just

8

want to just quickly apologize and make sure that I

9

am clear that the parity issue must extend to

10

directors and assistant directors as well. I, I know

11

we heard a lot... [cross-talk]

12

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: Yes... [cross-talk]

13

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...about educators

14

and us deeply... we're all educators... [cross-talk]

15

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: Yes... [cross-talk]

16

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...but this is issue

17

it definitely extends to directors and assistant

18

directors as well because leadership is absolutely

19

critical on this issue so thank you very much, thank

20

you for... [cross-talk]

21

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: Thank you.

22

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure.

23

LOIS LEE: Hello, my name is Lois Lee, I

24

represent CSA, I'm the Vice President of Early

25

Childhood and I'm part of Chinese American Planning

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 Council. I really love that Steve Levin who has been  
3 in this issue for many years, we were a part of the  
4 60 million dollars that you had to bail us out  
5 because we had the culturally competent people  
6 embedded in the community and yet we were not awarded  
7 the contracts for four of our CPC sites, that was a  
8 travesty. Then I love that Mark Treyger, you're  
9 really on top of the education issue so for the two  
10 of you to really collaborate and have this joint  
11 meeting was like unbelievable. So, now I'm just... I'm  
12 going to tell you that you know of our overworked...  
13 you can ask me questions about how we have to do  
14 observation, evaluation, work with special needs,  
15 enrollment, budgets, CACFP, DOB, DOH, DOE, ECERS  
16 class, ESIR and parent engagement, that's many of our  
17 other responsibilities that we do daily in taking  
18 care of kids. I want to put a, a personal touch in  
19 here, the DOE... I have worked many years, 47 years to  
20 be exact and so I can see the DOE curriculum that we  
21 do for Pre-K right cannot be a model that is for 3-K,  
22 we cannot do a stepping up or graduation ceremony, it  
23 is in big print, no stepping up or graduations. So,  
24 at three o'clock in our after care and our afterhours  
25 guess what we did, stepping up and, and graduation,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

why, because we told the parents this is the first of

3

many celebrations and this is reason to celebrate,

4

you graduated and you're going to kindergarten and

5

they are well prepared. Now DOE says you may also not

6

teach the alphabets so now the kindergarten teachers

7

are saying they are not coming in knowing their

8

alphabets, guess what we do in the back room after

9

care after the Pre-K hours are over, we teach the

10

alphabet and how to write your names, they are well

11

prepared to go into kindergarten. And then the

12

cultural competence I have to say something about

13

that, the Chinese and the West... and the Eastern and

14

the Western style of teaching, guess what, Chinese

15

kids they don't have a gene for math, they learn

16

times tables when they're in second... in kindergarten

17

so we want to blend the both of the two best cultures

18

in our education system so I want you to see the

19

whole view of what CBOs do that is very, very

20

different from the DOE and really have us on the

21

table so that we can tell you about how best to do

22

these programs. Thank you very much.

23

G.L. TYLER: Good afternoon. My name is

24

G.L. TYLER Tyler, I'm speaking on behalf of Kim

25

Medina, Executive Director who was called away

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

because of the Janus decision that, that came down today, but you have my written testimony. And one of the things I... I'm just going to emphasize really quick is that there is not a two-tier system but a multisystem; Head Start, U Pre-K, Early Learn all are different structures far below what the UFT gets and the expansion of U Pre-K has been made on the backs of my members. When the planning and qualifications for the planning of early childhood education commenced it was based on not parity but super exploitation of these women who are predominately women of color and heads of households, it has to be recognized plus I have some other notes I want to say is that no Mayoral administration since Lindsay try.. has tried to resolve parity. CBOs that exist are retrofitted and are available to take children without spending millions of dollars on such things with the public-school system plus in the last 12 years prior to the Bloomberg administration... the De Blasio administration we sent... spent 12 years fighting Early Learn with Bloomberg and, and other things. In the course of trying to save the system we lost over 70 systems and 3,000 workers. This guy was a disaster to, to early childhood education and when

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

Early Learn was first implemented he registered that

3

more than 10,000 children would lose their standing

4

so basically what we're saying is that we want to see

5

the will of this administration to enact parity, we

6

haven't seen it yet and thanks to the city council I...

7

you know we're hoping that together with the

8

advocates of the unions we can see some results

9

during this period. Thank you.

10

LISA CASWELL: Hi, my name's Lisa

11

Caswell, I'm the Senior Policy Analyst for the Day

12

Care Council of New York. I just want to thank you

13

sincerely for the depth of commitment that you have

14

exhibited. We're all on the same side of the table

15

over here and its really good to have you with us. I

16

just want to say that our job... our work goes back 70

17

years and we have 91 members serving 200 child care

18

programs and we are responsible for negotiating the

19

labor contract on behalf of the city with these two...

20

these two unions here. We just want to thank you for,

21

for your seriousness. We want to also strongly

22

support the resolutions that you put forward, without

23

salary parity we'll continue to face the challenges

24

of maintaining optimal program operations while

25

trying to hire and retain qualified teaching staff in

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 the face of ongoing professional staff competition  
3 with the DOE. DOE at this time in our system, entry  
4 level early childhood education teachers who have  
5 their master's degrees and they are state certified  
6 are paid 16,000 dollars less than their entry level  
7 counterparts. I've brought the labor contract, I  
8 brought the highlights, they're available.. [cross-  
9 talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: A plus for  
11 preparation unlike.. [cross-talk]

12 LISA CASWELL: Thank you.. [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ..the Deputy  
14 Chancellor.. [cross-talk]

15 LISA CASWELL: Yeah, we, we know.. [cross-  
16 talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ..and Deputy  
18 Commissioner.. [cross-talk]

19 LISA CASWELL: ..what the be.. we know what  
20 the.. [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ..Principal Barron  
22 would approve.

23 LISA CASWELL: Thank you, we know what  
24 the UFT salaries are right now and we also know  
25 there's an internal gap between certified U, U..

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1 certified UPK teachers in the CBOs are making 3,080  
2 dollars less than their counterparts teaching younger  
3 kids. What we... what we really want you to think about  
4 is the fact that we're prepared to come up with that  
5 number that you've been asking for and we're prepared  
6 to do it within the next 30 days. These calculations  
7 will be based on the UFT's collective bargaining  
8 agreement salary scales with specific attention to  
9 cost of living adjustments and longevity increases  
10 and in calculating this funding consideration must be  
11 given to the current employee benefit structure... I'm  
12 sorry about this, which includes salary FICA, a  
13 pension and health insurance. Our goal is to produce  
14 a figure that is as close to accurate as possible. We  
15 also want to have the city commit to salary levels  
16 for early childhood education sector that are  
17 comparable with the UFT going forward. We cannot  
18 successfully eradicate this problem without being  
19 prepared to maintain a commitment over time. So, as  
20 they go up we need to go up at the same level. We  
21 have... we brought these issues to your concern before,  
22 we have serious concerns about the multi-year impact  
23 on program operations of not having certified  
24 teachers, you... they can't... we can't open classrooms  
25



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

without certified teachers and the average vacancy rate for those teachers, we've done research that goes back three years, is at least six months that we hold those vacancies without being able to fill them. We also have some problems right now that we're working with the DOE to address, we understand that UPK seats are supposed to be split 50/50, they have been making a pretty serious effort to try to stop what was happening which was a recruitment of children directly from our settings to fill UPK seats and they have reversed that policy and we expect that to be improved but it has been very difficult to have parents who chose nonprofit settings and then they often times thought that they could get a kindergarten seat for their child the next year so they've been working very hard on that but it was really problematic. Some teachers had to... some centers had to reseal their classrooms four times in September and October. We also want to just talk to you about the fact that we're in... we're, we're in... we've just finished some very good productive round table meetings with the DOE, we set them up, they asked us to and the full range of issues were discussed and there were already a bunch of meetings

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

with Head Start that happened, it was very productive but we expect to be asked back again and there was no sufficient discussion on program models, it, it was a very good start but based on the length of expertise and the superior performance that you've seen in your research of the non profit sector we expect that we would have ongoing input and not just the first time around. We've been assured that that will happen but we, we want to have the system be held accountable for that and then finally the facilities issues that raised, I know you know about this because we've testified we'd get NYCHA settings that are in deep need of repairs, we are wasting money right now with, with fines being paid to DOHMH unnecessarily and we've already support from this administration on that issue, it's a very hot topic citywide but we're in some serious trouble with our facilities and, and related to that we would like to have you consider that every new affordable housing project for moderate and low income families have a child care program in it and you could do it with elderly, elder programs as well, do true multigenerational initiatives. So, we just want to say that we know that the city can do it, we know we got the money,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

but we have the will power and there's so much solidarity and, and this is a tremendous opportunity, but your leadership has been incredible, and we really appreciate it.

[applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Lisa and, and G.L. TYLER and every... our, our, our partners at, at CSA for all presenting such an important unified front here, I mean... so, I just, just want to just to make clear because Deputy Chancellor Wallack kind of made reference to this, it wasn't the Day Care Council's idea to not provide salary parity, the Day Care... [cross-talk]

LISA CASWELL: No... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...Council provided a certain amount of funding to be able to negotiate a contract on behalf of the city...

LISA CASWELL: Well the city has always sat at the table and they had control over the purse strings and our job has been to, to represent management and our concerns as management was very much in line with labor... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

LISA CASWELL: ...there was never any

3

question about the need to maintain stable operations

4

and salary parity was the foundation of that, so we

5

worked very hard to push it as far as we could and

6

we're continuing in that process.

7

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And you made

8

reference to this issue of... I, I call it poaching of,

9

of, of students from contracted care to DOE...

10

LISA CASWELL: Yeah... [cross-talk]

11

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...that, that was...

12

I... my understanding was that that was a, a... happened

13

aggressively by, by principals, is that... or, or by

14

and I'm sorry... [cross-talk]

15

LISA CASWELL: I think there were staffs

16

that were supposed to fill seats in the... [cross-talk]

17

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay... [cross-talk]

18

LISA CASWELL: ...DOE and I think it went

19

overboard and I want to just be respectful to them

20

but... [cross-talk]

21

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yeah... [cross-talk]

22

LISA CASWELL: ...it did not work for many

23

of our members.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, because I

25

heard that it was... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

LISA CASWELL: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...a big... major...

[cross-talk]

LISA CASWELL: It was a real problem.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Maybe it wasn't...

[cross-talk]

LISA CASWELL: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...principals but it

was... it was... [cross-talk]

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: No, that, that was

just about the... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, okay, sorry...

[cross-talk]

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: ...city and the

principal.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: It was... it, it...

but, but... [cross-talk]

LISA CASWELL: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...it was... there

was... [cross-talk]

LISA CASWELL: It was DOE staff

responsible... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...DOE staff...

[cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 LISA CASWELL: ...for recruitment and I...  
3 and I know... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay... [cross-talk]

5 LISA CASWELL: ...they have addressed that,  
6 and they took it very seriously and we expect them to  
7 follow through, there's been changes to... with regards  
8 to protocol so there's been a lot of challenges  
9 related to this, but it was really hard for us to  
10 lose kids where the parent chose us in the first  
11 place.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right, because  
13 there is... [cross-talk]

14 LISA CASWELL: Yeah... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...a strong... I mean  
16 in areas where, you know there's overcrowding in the  
17 schools, parents seeing the opportunity to get into a  
18 kindergarten seat... [cross-talk]

19 LISA CASWELL: Right... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...you know may, may  
21 opt to go into a Pre-K seat in that school just to  
22 be... [cross-talk]

23 LISA CASWELL: Right... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...able to have... be  
25 first in line... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 LISA CASWELL: Right but they have a...  
3 they have... they've, they've really tried to look at  
4 this as just... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay... [cross-talk]

6 LISA CASWELL: ...it didn't go well the  
7 first time... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Just moving in the  
9 right... [cross-talk]

10 LISA CASWELL: ...around, yeah.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Moving in the  
12 right direction.

13 LISA CASWELL: Yeah.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, I so much  
15 appreciate all of the work that you all have done  
16 collaboratively and making sure that, you know we are  
17 well informed and, and that we're, you know on the  
18 same page with you all, I am strongly recommending to  
19 everybody involved that, that, that level of  
20 communication be maintained in a very, you know in a  
21 very intense way over the coming months...

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yep... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...and just to... and  
24 appreciate all the work that you all do.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah and I just

3

have one quick... and thank you Chair, I just have one

4

quick question, you heard me ask the administration

5

this question and I would love to hear your take on

6

this because I, I used to be a union delegate and

7

just want to hear from my union sisters and brothers.

8

Is there anything that prohibits the administration

9

right now from speaking now with, with folks in good

10

faith and saying let's resolve this parity issue once

11

and for all, is there anything in the law that

12

prohibits them from saying we want to help solve this

13

issue?

14

LISA CASWELL: I don't know of anything.

15

G.L. TYLER: There is nothing in the way

16

of doing it.

17

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: We want to resolve

18

this issue.

19

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And that's, that's

20

my take as well because I don't think the law is

21

stopping us, I know that money is not stopping us

22

it's just a matter of doing the right thing. Thank

23

you very much.

24

LOIS LEE: I have to say something about

25

the pay parity for supervisors...



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes...

LOIS LEE: ...they need to be at least,  
I'm, I'm going to throw out numbers don't put this in  
gold... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Uh-oh... [cross-talk]

LOIS LEE: ...seven to ten percent above  
the highest paid teacher that we supervise.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, so...  
alright, so that... so, we're going... we're going to  
leave those discussions at the collective bargaining  
table because good faith bargaining... [cross-talk]

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: Yep... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...involves good  
faith bargaining so... [cross-talk]

G.L. TYLER: But what you need to  
remember is low... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, right...  
[cross-talk]

G.L. TYLER: ...again the expansion of  
early childhood education... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Absolutely... [cross-  
talk]

G.L. TYLER: ...since Lindsay... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

G.L. TYLER: ...was based on the super exploitation of this labor and again predominately women and women, women of color and communities of need and we cannot forget that.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I agree and, in the backdrop, today of a devastating supreme court decision that aims to.. directly aims to hurt working families and the power of labor to protect working families I think this is the time now more than ever to come to the table, strengthen labor, strengthen... [cross-talk]

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: Yes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...families and strengthen... [cross-talk]

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: ...we agree... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...our community... [cross-talk]

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: ...we totally agree.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much.

LISA CASWELL: Thank you...

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1 ON GENERAL WELFARE

2 LISA CASWELL: Just... can I say one more  
3 thing, your, your idea of a concept paper that's  
4 really important.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Do you all  
6 support... [cross-talk]

7 LISA CASWELL: Yes... [cross-talk]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...not just being  
9 involved in a conversation... [cross-talk]

10 LISA CASWELL: Concept paper... [cross-  
11 talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...but having a  
13 concept... [cross-talk]

14 LISA CASWELL: Yeah, yeah... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...paper... [cross-  
16 talk]

17 LISA CASWELL: It... people have to react...  
18 [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...formal... [cross-  
20 talk]

21 LISA CASWELL: ...to something and they  
22 have to hear from people in a formal context.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Yes, okay... [cross-  
24 talk]

25 LISA CASWELL: Yes... yep.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay... [cross-talk]

ROSEMARIE SINCLAIR: Thank you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: It's on the record, thank you.

LISA CASWELL: Thanks again.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, next we have Faith Behum; Leonie Haimson; Stephanie Gendell; Shilshila Limbu; yeah, that's it.

STEPHANIE GENDELL: Good afternoon, my name is Stephanie Gendell, I'm the Associate Executive Director for Policy and Advocacy at Citizens' Committee for Children. Thank you for holding this hearing and for your unwavering commitment to early childhood education. thousands of children are in early childhood education programs now because of the city council. We do also thank the Mayor for his commitment to early childhood education. Our testimony includes a lot of background including the charts of the pay scales at... they were already in the record so I'm not going... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you...

STEPHANIE GENDELL: You're welcome, so I'm not going to read that instead I'm going to focus

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 on our recommendations because we're at a really  
3 critical juncture, the transition, the... maintaining  
4 the vouchers at ACS, salary parity, etcetera,  
5 etcetera. So, to start with we agree there should be  
6 a concept paper. We often submit comments to a  
7 concept paper, we should have a full discussion about  
8 those comments. Often those comments are then not  
9 adopted. The recommendations of the early childhood  
10 education task force that was started by Bill De  
11 Blasio, Mayor De Blasio in response to advocate  
12 concerns should be looked at. The last recommendation  
13 in there is that there be a tracking system for  
14 keeping track of the recommendations and their  
15 implementation, that has not been done as well as  
16 many of the other recommendations. As we think about  
17 the needs of children and families we look to ensure  
18 the viability of eight to ten hours a day of care as  
19 well as summer care during July and August 3-K and  
20 Pre-K do not provide that whereas Early Learn and  
21 other programs do and that's critical for many  
22 families. We need to expand capacity to serve infants  
23 and toddlers. We need to make all homeless children  
24 eligible for child care based on being homeless, that  
25 is not the case right now and we need to then do more

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 to get those children into early childhood programs.  
3 We need to ensure that childhood... that early  
4 childhood system expands options including  
5 nontraditional hours, I will hurry up. We need to  
6 ensure salary parity as you all talked about and that  
7 needs to include all staff and all different levels  
8 of staff including those serving children under  
9 three. We need to where possible reduce the parent  
10 fee or eliminate it Early Learn programs since  
11 there's no parent fee for 3-K and Pre-K. We need to  
12 maintain programs like Trauma Start... Trauma Smart  
13 that addresses the needs of the children. We need to  
14 work with the family child care providers to ensure  
15 they receive the training and the coaching that they  
16 need and as we've talked about we need to make sure  
17 we hold on to those direct lease sites, I was a  
18 little concerned about some of that conversation, but  
19 we need to make sure we don't lose them during this  
20 transition which sounds like multiple transitions  
21 with the School Construction Authority. We hope the  
22 School Construction Authority can help with some of  
23 the facilities issues perhaps in NYCHA. As discussed,  
24 we need to seize upon opportunities such as the  
25 development of affordable housing to build more

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 capacity and we need to ensure that we don't  
3 replicate errors that were made in Pre-K for 3-K, one  
4 of them has been segregating children by income and  
5 classrooms and programs because Early Learn children  
6 have an income requirement and Pre-K and 3-K children  
7 don't so in some programs you have the lowest income  
8 children in a separate classroom by... which I don't  
9 think was anyone's intent but that's been the result.  
10 We need to ensure we don't lose any child care  
11 capacity when we roll out a new RFP and that we're  
12 able to maintain the programs providing high quality  
13 care. I know that seems obvious but that did not  
14 happen the last time and we need to make sure that  
15 the new Early Learn rate whatever it is not only  
16 provides for parity but enables classrooms to invest  
17 in materials and technology and we should then index  
18 the Early Learn rate to inflations so that we don't  
19 have this ongoing issue and lastly, I just want to  
20 mention that we also need salary parity for the pre-  
21 school education teachers. My colleague from  
22 Advocates for Children is going to talk more about  
23 that so thank you.

24 [off mic dialogue]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

SHILSHILA LIMBU: Okay, good afternoon

and thank you for the opportunity to speak with you.

My name is Shilshila Limbu and I live in Woodside. I

am the mother of Dean, a four-year-old child with

autism. I am glad that the city is expanding public

preschool programs, but the city must not forget

about children like mine who have disabilities. I

first referred my child, Dean, for preschool special

education evaluations more than one year ago at the

suggestion of Dean's pediatrician. When the DOE sent

me a list of evaluation sites, I made call after

call, but the evaluation sites told me that because

my family speaks Nepali at home, they could not

evaluate my child. I reached out to the DOE several

times to ask for help, but the DOE did not help. In

fact, the DOE did not schedule evaluations for Dean

until I got a lawyer from Advocates for Children

involved, many months after I started the process.

Even after evaluations began, the DOE delays

continued. The DOE began evaluating Dean on January

25<sup>th</sup>, but did not hold an IEP meeting until April

20<sup>th</sup>, three months later. At the IEP meeting in

April, the DOE determined that my child needed a

small preschool special education class, as well as



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 speech therapy, occupational therapy, and physical  
3 therapy. However, more than two months have passed,  
4 and the DOE has not been able to find a seat in a  
5 preschool special education class for my son. The DOE  
6 does not have enough preschool seats for all the  
7 children with disabilities who need them. I feel  
8 lucky to live in a city that is building more 3-K and  
9 Pre-K classes, but my child needs a classroom too and  
10 he has the right to be in a preschool special  
11 education class. I wonder what progress Dean would  
12 have made this year if I... if he had been in class  
13 with a special education teacher. Would he be  
14 starting to talk to me, would he be able to play with  
15 other children? I'll never know because Dean had to  
16 sit at home all year with no special education  
17 instruction or services. My child deserves better. We  
18 must change this situation and make sure that every  
19 preschooler with a disability gets the evaluation,  
20 services, and classes they need. Thank you for taking  
21 the time to listen to me today.

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much  
23 for that testimony.

24 FAITH BEHUM: Good evening Chairperson  
25 Treyger, Chairperson Levin. My name is Faith Behum

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 and I am an Advocacy and Policy Advisor at UJA  
3 Federation of New York. UJA is grateful to the  
4 council for including the need to correct salary  
5 disparity that exists across the early childhood  
6 education system in their response to the fiscal 2019  
7 preliminary budget and we are especially thankful to  
8 Council Member Cumbo and Chairperson Treyger for  
9 introducing Resolute, Resolution 0358. We urge the  
10 city council to pass this resolution and call on the  
11 administration to end this unequal payment system and  
12 invest in the Pre-K workforce by establishing salary,  
13 salary parity for teachers, staff and directors  
14 between DOE schools and CBOs. So, I hear a lot from  
15 our providers, our UJA nonprofit partners about the  
16 issues they have in their Pre-K programs and a lot of  
17 that they deal with is they look at... they're in a  
18 very interesting position because they look at DOE as  
19 both their boss and their competitor so, in general  
20 many of the CBOs I interact with feel their programs  
21 are expected to meet different standards than DOE  
22 programs. So, for instance immunization audits of the  
23 records of CBO, UPK programs are time consuming and  
24 costly to providers if violations are found. Recently  
25 there was a requirement to place a child care

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 performance summary report card at the entrance of  
3 CBOs, UPK, UPK programs, it didn't take into account  
4 that the entrance to the program is different from  
5 one multiservice agency to another. It did however  
6 include information on how much CBOs would be fined  
7 if their card was missing, improperly placed or  
8 deemed damaged making clear the increased likelihood  
9 of fines at multiservice agencies. Many of my  
10 providers at the DOE programs have these same  
11 repercussions and from what DOE said it sounds like  
12 they do but we still just don't feel like we're being  
13 treated the same way as some DOE providers are. So,  
14 this is just a small sampling of the issues CBOs have  
15 dealt with since the implementation of UPK and  
16 honestly the announcement of 3-K for All has  
17 increased anxieties for our community-based  
18 organization early childhood education providers  
19 across the city forcing many to wonder if the  
20 implementation of 3-K will worsen the competition  
21 between CBO and DOE providers. Many may wonder why  
22 community-based organizations particularly  
23 multiservice agencies continue to host UPK programs  
24 or even interested in becoming 3-K providers, simply  
25 CBOs recognize the unique educational opportunity

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 they provide young children and want to continue to  
3 offer this in their communities but as we heard  
4 earlier some changes must be made to the current UPK  
5 system in order for our CBO, UPK programs to survive.  
6 Thank you for your time.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank, thank you  
8 all for your really powerful and very informative  
9 testimony. Just a quick question, I'll start with  
10 you... with regards to this parent fee for Early Learn,  
11 can you... is this for every parent regardless of  
12 income... can you speak to this please?

13 STEPHANIE GENDELL: Sure, because Early  
14 Learn, it's the child care portion of Early Learn  
15 that requires a parent fee from the federal  
16 government and there's a sliding scale fee structure  
17 that's actually somewhat complicated and so for kids  
18 who go to... it started with Pre-K and now we have it  
19 for 3-K, if they're in an Early Learn Pre-K their  
20 parent has to pay a fee. The city has taken steps  
21 over time to reduce that fee in part because it's not  
22 the whole day anymore, part... only part of the day is  
23 child care, they need to continue to reduce the fees  
24 to something more nominal, these are the lowest  
25 income families in the city who are in the Early

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 Learn programs and also do the same thing for 3-K  
3 that they've done for Pre-K in terms of reducing the  
4 fees.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I appreciate  
6 this and I, I will circle back and get more  
7 information, I, I deeply appreciate that feedback. A  
8 question with regards to your, your child, how, how  
9 old... how old is he?

10 SHILSHILA LIMBU: He's four.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: He's four and what  
12 type of intervention service or what, what... how did  
13 this even start with regards to even a meeting, the...  
14 obviously they failed to follow up and they, they,  
15 they failed you and your family but how did this  
16 begin as far as even getting a meeting to discuss  
17 this issue?

18 SHILSHILA LIMBU: Because my child he's  
19 autistic so they need to evaluate him in order for  
20 him to actually be placed in a school.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right...

22 SHILSHILA LIMBU: So, with the evaluation  
23 sites that they gave me they were like specific, they  
24 were specific, it had to be like Spanish and English  
25 or yet... it had to be specific languages so my family

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

we speak Naipaulian English, so they didn't have a site that did Naipaulian English so yeah, we had to get a translator involved and everything so...

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and how old when... was this... was he when this was all happening?

SHILSHILA LIMBU: My son was three.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Three and, and you went... you contacted the, the, the DOE?

SHILSHILA LIMBU: Yes, the district... I forgot the district but, but yeah...

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Were you able to identify a private... a private school that he could... that would accommodate his language needs?

SHILSHILA LIMBU: A private school?

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: What... so, under, under the Carter Cases there... for, for special ed Pre-K I think your child should be entitled to a reasonable accommodation if they can't meet those accommodations in a private school and the city's required to, to pay those...

SHILSHILA LIMBU: Well, I, I don't know, I, I don't...

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: We could talk  
3 offline... [cross-talk]

4 SHILSHILA LIMBU: Yeah.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah. Yeah, I, I  
6 just... because... just, just so you're aware one of the  
7 questions that I've asked folks here internally here  
8 at the council and I... and I will continue to is... and  
9 I touched upon this with the administration, if  
10 particular issues are identified with children in  
11 Early Learn how is that accounted for in the  
12 transition to the DOE, well first of all is Early  
13 Learn... do they have the capacity to provide the  
14 adequate intervention and support because the DOE  
15 we're still holding them accountable to providing  
16 adequate intervention and support for, for their  
17 students right now and so I'm concerned because one  
18 of... you know I agree as a former educator that the  
19 earlier we could identify any types of... you know  
20 whether it's a challenge, if... the earlier we address  
21 it the better outcomes down the road but are we doing  
22 enough right now in Early Learn and how are we going  
23 to account for those needs during this transition  
24 process if you could speak to that?  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

STEPHANIE GENDELL: So, some Early Learn

3

sites provide integrated pre-school special education

4

services where children are integrated so some

5

children with special needs and some children don't

6

but Early Learn in and of itself isn't for pre-school

7

special education, the Department of Education

8

provides or pays for and Randy has better words, for

9

the pre-school special education programs separate

10

and apart from Early Learn and the other thing about

11

Early Learn is there's an income restriction on it so

12

anyone above the 200 percent of poverty is not

13

getting into Early Learn even though there are plenty

14

of three and four year olds who need pre-school

15

special education who wouldn't be eligible for Early

16

Learn but DOE is required to provide them, in theory

17

required to provide them with pre-school special

18

education and part of the issue is that there is not

19

enough capacity in the DOE's system for pre-school

20

special education slots and part of that issue is

21

actually related to the salary disparities that exist

22

for pre-school special education teachers.

23

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, you see how

24

this has a, a ripple effect, cascading effect across

25

so many different areas and, and again what's, what's



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

so heartbreaking is that we know there's money and..  
quick question for, for UJA, is that right... so, do  
you have any data to share about when there are  
difficulties filling a position and how long can it  
go because obviously it's an issue of... we heard it  
could be months for, for some folks, any particular  
data that you can share with us?

FAITH BEHUM: You mean filling the  
position for the children or filling the... [cross-  
talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Staff, staff  
positions... [cross-talk]

FAITH BEHUM: ...staff positions... [cross-  
talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes.

FAITH BEHUM: Because we've had kind of  
actually both for one or our providers that there was  
actually the increase of numbers of kids to the UPK  
program, one of our providers actually was saying  
that they didn't really know where the numbers for  
their district were coming from because they were  
like we don't know where these kids are coming from  
but the other part of it I would have to get back to  
you as far as that.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sure... [cross-talk]

FAITH BEHUM: So, I get an F on that.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: But again, thank  
you all for your very powerful testimony here today,  
thank you so much.

FAITH BEHUM: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: The next panel  
Betty Baez Melo; Maria Cappio; Gregory Brender;  
Christopher Treiber. You may begin.

BETTY BAEZ MELO: Thank you for the  
opportunity to discuss the implementation of Pre-K  
for All, the expansion of 3-K and the transition of  
Early Learn to the Department of Education. My name  
is Betty Baez Melo, I'm an Attorney and the... and the  
Project Director of the Early Childhood Education  
Project at Advocates for Children. As the city  
expands early childhood education it must ensure that  
these programs serve all children including children  
who are homeless, dual language learners and students  
with disabilities. In my written testimony I address  
all three of these populations but today given the  
limited time I want to focus on students with  
disabilities. The city's expansion of early childhood  
education allows it to identify children with

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1 disabilities at a younger age and to intervene early,  
2 when services have the greatest impact. Already, more  
3 than 31,000 preschoolers in New York City have  
4 individualized education programs or IEPs mandating  
5 special education services. The majority of these  
6 children can attend the same 3-K, Pre-K, and Early  
7 Learn programs as their typically developing peers.  
8 However, in order for these programs to properly  
9 serve these children, the city must build the  
10 capacity to promptly evaluate the students, hold  
11 timely IEP meetings, secure services... and secure  
12 service providers who can work with the students in  
13 these classrooms. Despite legally mandated timelines,  
14 we have heard from families who have had to wait  
15 months for an evaluation appointment, an IEP meeting  
16 or for the start of services causing children to miss  
17 out on much needed intervention. Now when a preschool  
18 student with significant disabilities cannot properly  
19 be served in a 3-K, Pre-K, or Early Learn program,  
20 the DOE has a legal obligation to provide them with a  
21 preschool special education class. However, we've  
22 heard from families and you've now heard from a  
23 family... a parent whose children have IEPs mandating  
24 preschool special education classes, but they've  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 remained home for months throughout this year because  
3 the DOE... the DOE did not have enough seats in special  
4 education in preschool special classes. Many of these  
5 children are diagnosed with autism are no... nonverbal  
6 and have delays in multiple areas of development.  
7 These children stand to benefit significantly from  
8 early childhood services and the city cannot leave  
9 these children behind. The city must ensure that  
10 preschool students... that preschool special class seat  
11 for every child for the upcoming year. Finally, we  
12 support Resolution 358 to provide salary parity, but  
13 we ask that the city also ensure salary parity for  
14 teachers of DOE contracted preschool special  
15 education programs. Thank you for the opportunity to  
16 speak with you today and I'm happy to answer any  
17 questions.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, before  
19 we move over to the next speaker I just want to ask  
20 you, so if, if DOE is not able to meet the special  
21 education or language needs of the child requiring  
22 Pre-K special ed the Department of Education is  
23 legally mandated to, to pay for a private setting to  
24 do that, right?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

BETTY BAEZ MELO: Well... so, and, and there are different needs, right, so the Department of Education definitely has the responsibility for ensuring the evaluations of the child having... hold, holding the IEP meeting and recommending the services if a child's IEP recommends a preschool special class seat the Department of Education is obligated to open that seat with regards to private options and the DOE paying for tuition for those programs unfortunately there's a very limited amount of private preschool special... of schools that have private preschool programs that do special education and we don't want to create a lot of litigation in the area, we don't want that to be the default, we're hoping that...

[cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Right... [cross-talk]

BETTY BAEZ MELO: ...instead the DO... the Department of Education will open more preschool special classes.

[off mic dialogue]

BETTY BAEZ MELO: With... the... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Alright, okay, we get... we can... we can... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

BETTY BAEZ MELO: ...because the DOE is

3

obligated to... [cross-talk]

4

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...we can continue

5

the conversation... [cross-talk]

6

BETTY BAEZ MELO: ...provide a special

7

class seat, yes, there is litigation... [cross-talk]

8

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: The state is... the

9

state... [cross-talk]

10

BETTY BAEZ MELO: ...possible... [cross-talk]

11

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...has a legal

12

obligation that make sure that each child has an

13

appropriate setting for their education?

14

BETTY BAEZ MELO: Yes.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, okay.

16

Go ahead.

17

CHRIS TREIBER: Good, good afternoon, so,

18

my name is Chris Treiber, I'm the Associate Executive

19

Director for the Interagency Council for

20

Developmental Disabilities Agencies and basically, we

21

represent about 45 nonprofit preschool special ed

22

providers and so, you know I guess like two minutes

23

you have my testimony, it's pretty comprehensive, it

24

has a lot of data in it. Just really three-real

25

points. One is all preschool special ed providers are

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 certified, same quality, same requirements and  
3 qualifications as, as New York City DOE, they get  
4 paid between 25 and 30,000 dollars less. We have  
5 turnover rates in our schools that are about 25... 23  
6 and 25 percent for our teachers right now, these are  
7 teachers who work with kids with autism. New York  
8 City is aggressively recruiting our teachers, they're  
9 taking them all the time, any teacher that has  
10 experience working with kids with autism or others  
11 are gone within a year or so. We have brand new,  
12 inexperienced, new teachers in our schools and all  
13 the administrators who were supposed to be mentoring  
14 them are teaching classrooms. The other thing that's  
15 really alarming and you can see it in our testimony,  
16 we recently did a survey, we have vacancy rates that  
17 have literally doubled in regard to our certified  
18 teachers and teacher assistants in our schools in a  
19 year and a half. The, the vacancy rates and you can  
20 see it's in here, are up to 28 percent for certified  
21 teachers, that means that 28 percent of the current  
22 special ed teachers who are needed in the classrooms  
23 are vacant, they're being taught by administrators,  
24 subs or others. These are kids who have the highest-  
25 level needs, the, the agency that I... we represent are

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 mission driven agencies who serve kids with cerebral  
3 palsy, autism and very high levels of need. These  
4 classrooms are not being served... these children are  
5 not being served by certified teachers and really the  
6 city is failing to basically provide an appropriate  
7 education to those kids, you know you could see a lot  
8 of the other information that I have in here. the  
9 other thing that I just want to mention really  
10 briefly is the city council in 2015 passed a law in  
11 special ed reporting that required the New York City  
12 DOE to have to report this specific data regarding  
13 school aged kids, it excluded preschool special ed  
14 kids from this data. We tried to FOIL the data from  
15 the city to get it, to find out how many kids don't  
16 have service right now and they haven't given it to  
17 us. We know from Advocates for Children and others  
18 that there are many parents and you heard one  
19 there's... children are sitting at home right now  
20 because they don't have seats and really part of the  
21 issue really is this pay parity issue that has to be  
22 addressed otherwise these preschool programs won't  
23 survive. If CBOs are given this parity and our  
24 teachers aren't we'll have no teachers left in our  
25 schools.



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Sorry, can I ask why has that doubled in the... in the last year and a half?

CHRIS TREIBER: We think that part of it is, is that the DOE has been aggressively recruiting our teachers, we think that part of it is that our teachers are getting paid 30,000 dollars less for 12 months versus ten months and I'll just be really honest with you, we had a big rally on Monday, we had 400 teachers and parents at a rally and what we heard from most of the teachers who testified and you know spoke up was they didn't want to leave but if they got called by the DOE tomorrow they would for, for 30,000 dollars and a benefits package that's triple what we can offer and you know they're really is right now no light at the end of this tunnel, we're very concerned that, you know there are many, many children in New York City just so you know put out a needs request for 700 preschool special ed seats to be filled by July 1<sup>st</sup>. Our programs can't meet that need, we don't have certified teachers, that number is going to continue to grow and you're going to hear more and more stories like the parent here who have

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

children with significant needs and there's no seats for them.

GREGORY BRENDER: Good afternoon, thank you Chair Treyger and Chair Levin not just for holding this hearing on this great topic but for both being such fierce advocates on all these issues especially around years of fighting on salary parity. I have some written testimony with our recommendations which are really based on the idea of making a truly unified system successful and what does it take to do it all. I'll go through them briefly and obviously the first one is, is salary parity. Our member agencies, which are New York City Settlement Houses are on the front lines of really fighting for a fairer city and it's just heartbreaking to the people working there that it's the actual staff who are in some cases bearing the brunt of this unfairness. So, we really thank you for this Resolution and all the... I, I don't know how many rallies you've both been to and, and the million things you've done. Some of our other recommendations are kind of in a few different categories. One is to keep with the some of the progress that actually ACS has made, there have been some real good improvements

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

that they have made since Early Learn came out in 2012 which includes moving towards a line item budgeting system eliminating a provider match requirement which was always ridiculous, pre-licensing visits that actually help clear some of the regulatory hurdles, hurdles with DOHMH and other city agencies and also with what Deputy Commissioner Vargas mentioned the implementation of Trauma Informed Care which actually gives a... every staff member not just teachers and the assistant teachers but even cooks and janitors the ability to recognize and defer responders to childhood trauma. The other sort of part of immunity is increasing access to things that DOE has, the CBOs don't have access to so we think it would be very important for CBOs to have access to capital funds to the School Construction Authority particularly in NYCHA developments which are such a huge portion of the CBO system operating in public housing developments that because of NYCHA's funding crisis are not able to support many of their own apartments much less keep programs that meet the very stringent Health Department requirements for child care centers, loan forgiveness programs and also just more access to city data bases

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 to ensure the enrollment of children. Lastly, I know  
3 I heard the bell so I'll... but we also want to work to  
4 improve enrolment and this includes making the fees  
5 that Early Learn parents pay nominal which can be  
6 done under federal law and we want to work with the  
7 state as well as with the city to see the elimination  
8 of BEDS dates that require community based programs  
9 to fill their enrollment by a certain date so that if  
10 you do lose children in the middle of the year you  
11 can continue to enroll later. The last thing since  
12 you both asked about whether there were legal hurdles  
13 to raising salaries on the basis of collective  
14 bargaining, I know there's already an answer that  
15 there's not, I also wanted to add it wouldn't  
16 actually be unprecedented, on April 14<sup>th</sup>, 2014 there  
17 was an increase in salaries that was actually  
18 announced at a press release by the De Blasio  
19 Administration covered in the Daily News for four  
20 year old teachers which included those teachers in  
21 Early Learn settings whose programs had Pre-K and it  
22 was done years before a collective bargaining  
23 agreement was negotiated. Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you as  
25 always for your thoughtful testimony Gregory.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1 GREGORY BRENDER: Thank you.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you for this  
3 very helpful report that you produced back in 2016.

4 GREGORY BRENDER: Thank you, yeah, we  
5 thought there was going to be a concept paper then  
6 and we're so happy to hear you push for a concept  
7 paper now.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Much appreciated,  
9 thank you very much.

10 GREGORY BRENDER: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: The next panel;  
12 Debra Lewis; Harriet Larry; Miss Deborah Blowe;  
13 Carlyn Cowen. Alright, you may begin.

14 CARLYN COWEN: Good afternoon, my name is  
15 Carlyn Cowen, I'm the Chief Policy and Public Affairs  
16 Officer of the Chinese American Planning Council.  
17 Thank you so much to Chair Treyger for the  
18 opportunity to testify today and for Chair Levin for  
19 your leadership on these issues. I am here to support  
20 the words of my colleagues and the other advocates  
21 and particularly Lois Lee who testified already so I  
22 have... just have a couple of quick items to share so  
23 we can move along our way. I would urge you to read  
24 our full testimony which has several points. The  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 points in this testimony come down to the idea of  
3 fully funding the work that needs to be done through  
4 our contracts especially as we move from ACS to DOE.  
5 A couple of highlights that I want to share,  
6 currently the budget only pays for seven and a half  
7 hours out of a ten-hour day which is particularly  
8 difficult when it comes to supervision, we're urging  
9 the city council to push for early childhood  
10 contracts to be fully funded for their actual hours  
11 in the transition. Currently UPK and 3-K provide six  
12 hours and 20 minutes of service while Early Learn  
13 provides ten hours of service. Currently UPK and 3-K  
14 operate from September to June, whereas Early Learn  
15 offers year-round, we urge for these to be fully  
16 funded and changed in the transition. And then  
17 lastly, we recommend that the 2000... or the September  
18 2020 RFP offer options for funding for full day and  
19 extended day programing in order to meet the needs  
20 and then of course amplifying the very important  
21 issue of salary parity for our early childhood  
22 educators. It's important that we be clear when we're  
23 saying this, that the city is paying our early  
24 childhood educators a lower wage than their DOE  
25 teachers in CBOs and this is a matter of utmost

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 importance to us CBOs. Thank you very much for the  
3 opportunity to testify today.

4 DEBRA BLOWE: Good afternoon to the  
5 council committee. My name is Debra Blowe, I am an  
6 assistant teacher at Parkside Head Start, Mark  
7 Treyger is my Councilman of my district and I would  
8 just like to share with you, last week we rally, and  
9 this was my poster. We were called to teach our  
10 children to read, solve math and science experiments.  
11 I have been a teacher in the classroom for 18 years  
12 and my salary is a joke, I am struggling as a parent  
13 with a child that's in a college away in Georgia, my  
14 daughter attends Clark Atlantic University in Georgia  
15 and myself had to stop going to school and I'm three  
16 classes away from completing my degree... my bachelor's  
17 degree to put my daughter through school because I  
18 had to make the sacrifice to send her to finish... to  
19 go to school and for me to take time off. It's a  
20 struggle but it's a struggle that I know that is  
21 well... will be well deserved at the end. I teach  
22 because I love the children I teach. Teaching is a  
23 passion that's in my heart, I can't even believe that  
24 I'm doing this because when I came out of high school  
25 I went to work on Wall Street and the salary that I

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

made on Wall Street compared to what I'm making now

3

my friends laugh at me, that... those who've retired

4

from Wall Street and they say Debbi I can't believe

5

you took that job to do... and I say it's not the fact

6

of what the, the salary... yes, I would like parity

7

very much so but I also enjoy what I'm doing and I

8

know my time is up, I don't have a script to give you

9

because I'm talking from my heart and I'm talking

10

from what we do in the classroom. The teachers in DOE

11

couldn't even do half the stuff we do. When those

12

kids come there to them they're well nourished,

13

they're well prepared because of the work we do, and

14

we work some long hours, okay and that's all I have

15

to say.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: What... thank you,

17

what, what are those hours?

18

DEBRA BLOWE: My hours, our hours can go

19

from 8:30 to 5:30 or six.

20

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Everyday?

21

DEBRA BLOWE: Everyday...

22

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: 12 months a year?

23

DEBRA BLOWE: Yes, sir.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you and have

25

a good... [cross-talk]



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 DEBRA BLOWE: We're like the postman, you  
3 know.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And thank you for  
5 the amazing work you do.

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah but you  
7 actually deliver, yes.

8 DEBRA BLOWE: Yes, we do. Yes, we do.

9 HARRIET LARRY: Hi, my name is Harriet  
10 Larry, I'm also an Assistant Teacher at Parkside  
11 Catholic Charity and also a Stop and Shop Steward. I  
12 have been working in day care since 1994 and the  
13 salary that I'm getting now is a joke because from  
14 1994 to 2018 I shouldn't have to be saying okay, I'll  
15 pay this bill this week and pay this bill the next  
16 week and take care of my grandchildren. One bill... I  
17 pay my light bill or either take my grandchildren  
18 out, one or the other, it's a joke. When I'm taking  
19 care of other people's children; cough, sneezing all  
20 over me, changing pullups daily, 12 two-year olds  
21 daily, go to work sick, can't afford to be sick but  
22 we go every day, take the pressure from parents, take  
23 the pressure from outsiders but we do it every day.  
24 It's not because of the pay, it's because our heart  
25 because some children... what we give them some parents

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

can't give them. They will come hug us before they

3

hug their parents and some parents will say Miss

4

Larry thank you very much... [cross-talk]

5

DEBRA BLOWE: That's right... [cross-talk]

6

HARRIET LARRY: ...you know so hopefully

7

the city will appreciate us... [cross-talk]

8

DEBRA BLOWE: Yes... [cross-talk]

9

HARRIET LARRY: ...and I have a letter from

10

a parent which is a... it's a long letter I'm not going

11

to read it, but I'll pass it on to you. The same with

12

the parent that was here that was talking about her

13

child having autism and this lady she fought and

14

fought to get services for her son so I'll pass it on

15

to the other parent, I gave her, her information so

16

when she can speak to her and get help for her child

17

but this lady in this letter I'm going to give it to

18

you, you can read it yourself, she fought hard for

19

her children, we have her young son in our classroom

20

now but her four year old, Logan like we said he was

21

diagnosed being... having autism also but... for... thank

22

god that he's able to... oh thank you... thank god he's

23

able to function now in the classroom. So, thank you

24

for listening to us.

25

[applause]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much  
and we greatly and deeply appreciate the work that  
you do everyday and we know it comes from your heart  
and it's going to be up to us and this administration  
to give you that respect not just in words but  
through actions and through that paycheck.

HARRIET LARRY: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, Diana I think  
Noriega; Susan Ochshorn; Erik Joerss; Christine Wicks  
and Lisa Paul. Since there's only two up we'll... I  
guess we'll just call the, the final panel just so we  
can get this all in. We have Petal Propheti,  
Prophete; Beverly Campbell; Michelle Paige; and Anna  
Succes

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: And if anybody  
wants to testify and we didn't call your name you can  
speak to the Sergeant At Arms right now and you can  
also come up on this panel because otherwise this  
will be the final panel.

[off mic dialogue]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Oh, was your name  
call... oh, up, up on the panel, yep but... in order to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

testify you have to... okay, you did, okay, got it,  
okay. Okay.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, whoever wants  
to begin...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Whatever order.

DIANA NORIEGA: Good afternoon, my name  
is Diana Noriega, I'm the Chief Program Officer at  
the Committee for Hispanic Children and Families and  
thank you for convening today particularly to talk  
about the early care transition. We know that we  
don't have a lot of time so we're going to kind of  
jump straight into our conversation and we've given  
you a longer written testimony. So, a report from the  
Center for Law and Social Policy did a close look at  
the number of children receiving child care subsidies  
in New York State and found that in 2016 only 122,233  
children were served and that was only 20 percent of  
those that were eligible to receive subsidy. This  
means that an estimated 80 percent of children are  
denied subsidies and support. If we look at the OCFS  
facts and figures for 2017, we find that roughly 20  
percent of New York children that receive subsidies  
of them 64 percent are attending a program that is  
not center based and that's the conversation I've not

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 heard today. What are we doing around family child  
3 care providers that are not in the centers? So, 64  
4 percent of children are relying on legally exempt or  
5 license based home based child care providers for  
6 high quality education, that is a significantly high  
7 number that's not covered in the conversation when  
8 we're talking about pay parity. So, in the context of  
9 professional investment and development considering  
10 the impacts of the 3-K expansions and that center-  
11 based programs are being prioritized in this  
12 conversation we are not talking about low income,  
13 working class, women of color that are having these  
14 programs in their homes and the impact that this will  
15 have on their sustainability. So, what we know for  
16 certain is that the majority of the workforce is  
17 women and over 50 percent of them are women of color,  
18 so, 25 percent are Hispanic, 23 percent are black,  
19 and six percent are Asian. So, while 64 percent speak  
20 English, 23 percent speak Spanish, two percent speak  
21 Chinese of the children that are being served. So, 40  
22 percent are immigrants and 46 percent of all  
23 immigrant early childhood educators are classified as  
24 limited English proficiency. The average income of an  
25 early childhood educator who's a family-based

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 provider is 27,000 dollars a year. Let me underscore  
3 that these women are doing this work and living in  
4 poverty while doing this work. So, when we talk about  
5 pay parity we have to and cannot forget about the  
6 impact of family child care providers who are not  
7 eligible to receive the DOE contract because they're  
8 not in centers, but we know that they are also  
9 represented by unions and they're being left out of  
10 this conversation and they are... they also work ten,  
11 12 hours a day in their homes overseeing these  
12 children and they staff employees. So, you're talking  
13 about women this is their livelihood, their  
14 sustainability. So, what we know in New York City in  
15 particular that 93 percent of the providers serving  
16 at least one child would have found... and this is... we  
17 talked about New York State, New York City it's 93  
18 percent are in home-based centers, home based care,  
19 that's 93 percent so the conversation that's being  
20 had today around pay parity is only focused on a  
21 small percentage of those being served in New York  
22 City. So, I have a longer testimony again that you  
23 can review, we're more than happy also to meet with  
24 council staff if they have any questions.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I just want say I very much appreciate that testimony, it was on my list of questions that I didn't get to around family child care providers but it's, it's certainly an important part of the system and we want to make sure that it is addressed as this entire process is concerned, I really appreciate you bringing that up with your testimony and we, we won't... we won't leave it to the side, we're going to address that.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, and I just have a quick question, so they... and I also thank you very much for that powerful testimony. So, it's my understanding that the voucher... the, the voucher cases remain under ACS, is that, that, that's correct. Now you mentioned... and, and I appreciate that, that these are... these are not center based but you're saying that they are still represented by unions?

DIANA NORIEGA: They are.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Can you speak to me... can you explain to me why are... why is this not a part of the greater parity conversation from your point of view?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 DIANA NORIEGA: I mean we, we are not a  
3 union so we can't say per se why it's not a part of  
4 the greater conversation but we do provide services  
5 to about 1,500 family child care providers per year  
6 and so often times when we're meeting with them  
7 they're expressing their concerns about the fact that  
8 they, they don't feel like they're being seen or  
9 heard in these conversations not only around pay  
10 parity but even the streamlining of the systems and  
11 the transition from ACS to DOE. So, we know this is  
12 going to have a significant impact and what's so  
13 important about this is no one thinks about the  
14 unintended consequences and how women of color are  
15 always the last to be considered and are always  
16 failed by our systems as we professionalize these  
17 sectors, it is so important to lift up our immigrant,  
18 immigrant women and women of color in this process.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And just to be  
20 clear the union that's representing family child care  
21 workers is the United Federation of Teachers,  
22 correct?

23 DIANA NORIEGA: That is one union, yes,  
24 there was a...



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That's one, what  
3 others?

4 DIANA NORIEGA: There's one other, we,  
5 we... yeah, I can't remember, that one I'm... CSA  
6 upstate, yes...

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, yeah, well  
8 because clearly, we have... and I say we, us here, we,  
9 we have some work to do to make sure that every  
10 single person and their... I mean this is... this is not  
11 just parity here, this is just basic equity,  
12 fairness, justice in more ways than one, I think the  
13 way you've, you've laid it out is, is profound and  
14 very powerful and this must be a part of this  
15 conversation, no question about it and thank you so  
16 much for your powerful testimony.

17 DIANA NORIEGA: Uh-huh

18 MICHELLE PAIGE: Hi, good evening and  
19 thank you for having me. As I was preparing for  
20 tonight I decided to speak for my staff on behalf of  
21 them, I'm also happy to say that I've worked with  
22 many people in this room on the statistics and you  
23 know I've been in the field so thank you for having  
24 me. My name is Doctor Michelle Paige and I represent  
25 University Settlement Society of New York. As an

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1 administrator for community-based organizations  
2 throughout New York City for the past 18 years I've  
3 had a front row seat to the various transitions early  
4 childhood has faced. These changes that New York City  
5 has already endured and will soon face are cause for  
6 great concern. Equal pay for equal work and salary  
7 parity are not just catch phrases or clever sound  
8 bites, they bring to life the disparities our staff  
9 face in CBOs, early childhood programs in particular.  
10 Preschool teachers in community-based organizations  
11 represented by a large contingent of women of color  
12 have longer work days, longer program years all while  
13 fulfilling the requirements of multiple funders that  
14 often have conflicting expectations. This is not a  
15 Tale of Two Cities as Ramirez says, it's a tale of a  
16 fractured city. This system has created a great  
17 divide in which professionals have not choice but to  
18 leave their families and communities they love in  
19 order to peruse a livable wage to sustain their own  
20 families. The mass exodus that this has created  
21 ultimately leaves agencies no choice but to close  
22 classrooms and in some cases entire programs.  
23 Children and families are the ultimate sacrifice to  
24 this wage and workforce issue. If you could imagine  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 building a structure, a house and upon inspection the  
3 contractor noticed a crack in the foundation, the  
4 right thing to do, the ethical thing to do is to halt  
5 all work and fix the crack. Building upon a faulty  
6 foundation whether metaphorically or literally will  
7 guarantee instability with the entire structure. DOE  
8 cannot continue to ignore the faulty foundation, the  
9 DOE should not move forward with the expansion of 3-K  
10 for All until the foundation of the system is fixed  
11 enabling the early years of education to flourish and  
12 create successful lifelong learners, turn our  
13 advocacy into action, do the right thing and create  
14 compensation that is equitable and respectful. Thank  
15 you.

16                   SUSAN OCHSHORN: Hi, my name is... me... yes,  
17 hello. My name is Susan Ochshorn, I'm the Founder and  
18 Principal of ECE Policy Works and I just want to  
19 thank you, I wish you fellows had been around when  
20 I've been looking at these issues for a couple of  
21 decades starting with my tenure at the New York City  
22 Professional Development Early Childhood Professional  
23 Development Institute. I'm a writer and I'm a Policy  
24 Analyst and really now an activist and advocate for  
25 the whole child and really putting the whole child at

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 the center of education reform. In my books,  
3 Squandering America's Future, I chronicled the  
4 history of De, De Blasio's implementation of  
5 Universal Pre-K. I want to say right up front that I  
6 was a main booster of it, I publicly said so, I was  
7 thrilled to, to see Universal Pre-K finally coming to  
8 pass... to pass, there was a great appetite for it and  
9 ironically a lot of people don't know that it was a  
10 republican governor, George Pataki who enacted it  
11 into legislation. I also saw De Blasio's Pre-K for  
12 All as a lever for change in a time of political  
13 sclerosis and it was really confirming early  
14 childhood as a public good. So, I have very little  
15 time and everyone has talked really eloquently and in  
16 great detail about wage parity, that has been very  
17 close to my heart so, I'll leave that out, it's in my  
18 testimony but I will talk about two issues that have  
19 become of, of, of growing concern to me as we look at  
20 the transition from Early Learn to the Department of  
21 Education and we bring our three year old children,  
22 our... not our youngest but very young and tender into  
23 this, this education system. And early, early  
24 childhood's merge with the... with the public-school  
25 system has been kind of a Faustian pact because in

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

return for legitimacy and investment, what has happened is the earliest years have not been protected from standards-based accountability, notable the common core. So, what we're seeing, and we are seeing these in kindergarten... we're seeing this in kindergarten in New York City, I mean we're seeing this all across the country, in New York City and increasingly in preschool children are being assessed including on laptops, they are not being allowed to, to explore and to... you know to really have creative rich experiences, that children of more affluent parents have access to. And most disturbing and this is very close to my heart, is the absence of play, play has disappeared, and play is the primary engine of human development. So, this is a real problem and for our most vulnerable children; immigrants, those with disabilities, children of color and also living in poverty of whom of course New York City has many this trend is adding toxic stress and a sense of failure to our most vulnerable children. And second which I call the Achilles Heel of this whole... of De Blasio's initiative and in fact the city's education system and I'm not alone in this, is segregation and it's not starting in the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 upper grades, it is starting very... I mean one can  
3 argue it starts prenatally or with birth, but it is  
4 starting in, you know at the age of three and four  
5 and really... I mean you know about UCLA's civil rights  
6 project, you know in 2014 and they deliver the news  
7 that New York City, the largest school district in  
8 the country is the most segregated. So, we also had  
9 the Century Foundation in 2016, which published an  
10 analysis of data from 2014 to '15 that year, which  
11 showed New York City's pre-kindergarten classrooms to  
12 be among the city's most racially divided. So, we  
13 have major challenges here and I am delighted that  
14 all of these issues came up in your deliberations and  
15 I am thrilled that we have, you know the two of you  
16 leading this committee on the city council because  
17 I've been... I was a career changer, I'm a former  
18 journalist and I... so I came in in the late 90's but  
19 all of this has been going on for decades as your  
20 colleague said, longer than I've been even in the  
21 field and so in order to ensure equity, social  
22 justice and the kind of outcomes that De Blasio and  
23 his... and all of his deputies are, you know seeking, I  
24 mean this Tale of Two Cities, right, that's the  
25 troupe well we're not going to get them unless we

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

level the playing field and I see that as both

3

figurative and, and, and literal and so I... it is my

4

hope that you will continue to, to really, you know

5

keep your nose to the grindstone of these issues and

6

I thank you for this opportunity.

7

ANNA SUCCES: Hi everybody. This is my

8

first city council hearing. I just found about it

9

like yesterday and I really wanted to be here. My

10

name is Anna Succes, these are my kids. This little

11

one just finished Pre-K the other day and she also,

12

Alesia finished at the same school where I teach, and

13

it just so happens I'm teaching at the same school

14

that I attended as a four-year-old. So, I've lived in

15

Queens my entire life, I'm a New York City native,

16

next year I'll be starting my 18<sup>th</sup> year of teaching,

17

I started, you know straight out of college like a

18

lot of people. I taught kindergarten for 11 years in

19

both public, charter and a little bit in a preschool

20

for children with disabilities, both in Queens and

21

Manhattan. I'm licensed, I'm certified, I have a

22

master's degree and because it's my first year

23

teaching Pre-K for All I make 50,000 dollars with no

24

benefits, yes, no benefits and I have a family so,

25

yeah, it's my first year teaching Pre-K but my 18<sup>th</sup>

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

year will be this coming year so after taxes and after paying out of pocket for health insurance I won't tell you what I bring home but it's... you know for a teacher who's been really... you know I just became a teacher really because I was blessed with a really good education and really want to pass that on to my own students. Anyways, I wanted to say that in my humble opinion I don't think that this Pre-K for All and 3-K program should be expanded yet until like Doctor Michelle said really the cracks are fixed, I mean we have teachers that aren't getting paid that have absolutely no benefits and yet we want to expand this program and offer this free education when the teachers are really struggling. Just a couple more quick things, additionally the Director of the school where I work is in her 80's, she was there when I was four years old, she as well has no benefits and no pension because she's not part of the system so when she leaves she leaves with nothing and she has dedicated her life to teaching three and four year olds and you guys know who I'm talking about, she's just an amazing... really incredible director, she's been at our school for 53 years. My... the teacher in the classroom where I work, my co-teacher has been



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

teaching in the school for 32 years, she's a widow,

3

she also has no benefits...

4

[off mic dialogue]

5

ANNA SUCCES: Yes, but we're there

6

because we love the school, we love our neighborhood.

7

Let me tell you she doesn't know if she can ever

8

retire because she's alone and she has no health

9

insurance, absolutely nothing just her paycheck which

10

is significantly lower than what the city is

11

offering. And the last thing I wanted to say was, I

12

don't know if this is a, a very bold or not bold

13

thing to say but I like the idea of Pre-K for all and

14

3-K for All however I feel that families that can pay

15

something or, or full tuition should pay and I wonder

16

if families that can afford to pay something if that

17

could help maybe offer teachers benefits, we know

18

there are plenty of families in the city that cannot

19

pay but we also know there are a lot of families that

20

can pay. So, for example, in the school where I teach

21

our threes pay a tuition, which is not... which is a

22

lot of money and then when they move into the Pre-K

23

they pay zero, these families happen to be families

24

that could afford to pay something for Pre-K but yet

25

they're getting it for free, which is great for them,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

I mean it's wonderful but what if those families paid

3

something into this Pre-K, I'm just wondering if that

4

could help alleviate some of this, you know being

5

able to offer teachers benefits and being able to

6

expand this program and that's just something that

7

I've been thinking about, I'm sure people have

8

different opinions on that but I do think about it

9

because they go from paying a full tuition for a

10

three year old to paying zero. Thank you very much.

11

ANNA SUCCES'S CHILD: Good job mom.

12

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Really powerful

13

stuff and congratulations on, on, on graduation and..

14

that's awesome. Just to tell you that it doesn't even

15

have to get to that because there are billions of

16

dollars in reserves here in New York City's budget,

17

there is more than enough money to get this done

18

right now, there is nothing that's stopping... that

19

could... [cross-talk]

20

ANNA SUCCES: Yeah... [cross-talk]

21

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...within the law or

22

money... [cross-talk]

23

ANNA SUCCES: If we don't have to that's...

24

[cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...to get... [cross-  
3 talk]

4 ANNA SUCCES: ...much better.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah... [cross-talk]

6 ANNA SUCCES: Just a suggestion.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, there's,  
8 there's... [cross-talk]

9 ANNA SUCCES: Yeah... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...more than enough  
11 money to get this done right now and the former  
12 teacher delegate in me hearing your testimony it's  
13 very hard to hear this because when we hear about  
14 teachers choosing, choosing this profession, it's a  
15 calling, it's more than a job, it is a calling you  
16 have to love kids, if you don't love kids and working  
17 with kids you should not go into the teaching  
18 profession and when I'm hearing teachers talk about  
19 not having benefits and just being so grossly  
20 underpaid we have a lot of work to do, we have a lot  
21 of work to do but we're not going to stop fighting  
22 until this gets done and you have Chair Levin who's  
23 done an outstanding job in his committee and you have  
24 the full weight of the Education Committee that has  
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 your back. Thank you very much for your powerful  
3 testimony.

4 ANNA SUCCES: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And I think this is  
6 the, the final panel; Alex Ortega; Fran DeJong; and  
7 George Penaherrera.

8 FRAN DEJONG: Hello. Hi, my name is Fran  
9 DeJong and I teach at the same school as Anna Succes  
10 and I wasn't planning on speaking, this is my first  
11 council meeting and I also want to say that I'm glad  
12 that I know about this meeting and I think a lot of  
13 teachers would have attended if they had known and if  
14 we could get the word out I think that would be  
15 great. I'm a parent of a kindergarten student, I have  
16 a master's degree in childhood education and early  
17 childhood education. For 13 years I worked in  
18 elementary school in childhood education and this is  
19 my first year as a preschool teacher because of the  
20 fact that my daughter went to this school and it's a  
21 great school and there was a retiree and there was an  
22 opening so I took it because it was literally five  
23 minutes from my house and the wonderful school, the  
24 best school I've seen but two... as soon as I  
25 negotiated my salary I went down 30,000 dollars to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

work at this school and I think that's crazy, you know the difference between teaching kindergarten and teaching five year olds and then teaching three year olds you lose an entire salary... I mean it's such a ridiculous thing and I will say as a person who has taught first grade, second grade, third grade, fourth grade and now the threes, threes are a lot harder. I can't even tell you, it's... you know kids sneezing on you, wiping up messes, bathroom issues that you never had to incur in third grade, you know I had... I dealt with third grade testing and it was a lot easier than that and honestly like I do not see myself staying at this school because of the disparity... you know the disparity in pay, there is no union, you know there's no pension, my sick days are different, the hours are different. If my kids have... you know are sick I literally would rely on my husband who works for the DOE to take a sick day because I cannot take a sick day and I think that's ridiculous. The last thing I want to say... well two things, one is I think this is a minority issue, I am a women of color and I think this is an issue that women of color and women in general are working at these schools and we're not being taken seriously in Pre-K in general and day

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1

ON GENERAL WELFARE

2

cares because... and I think that it's not an issue

3

because men are not working at these schools and it

4

would be such an issue of disparity of pay and the

5

last thing as a parent of a kindergarten student and,

6

and you know a person who knows a lot about education

7

I am very concerned with the lack of play in the Pre-

8

K program. The... kindergarten and the DOE is set up

9

for a lot of worksheets and test prep while private

10

schools are being focused on play and just the

11

curriculum is a world of difference. Our music play

12

versus test prep, reading in kindergarten, learning

13

vowels, you know it's just so different and I think

14

that if people know that they'd be very concerned

15

with that, you know so...

16

ALEX ORTEGA: Hello, my name is Alex

17

Ortega, I'm on the Board of Directors of Belmont

18

Community Day Care in the Bronx. I wasn't going to

19

speak initially then I got a little troubled by the

20

lack of information that was prepared by the Deputy

21

Chancellor and the Deputy Commissioner, which kind of

22

reinforced some speculation that I had initially. The

23

speculation was that I was fearing that the, I guess

24

the long-term goal of the Department of Education was

25

to effectively make the, the CBOs as an overflow sort

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

of situation. We've been kind of looking at this and thinking what possible reason is there to not either be willing to engage a renegotiation or to kind of keep things as they are turn a blind eye and not be willing to even acknowledge the fact that this is a real hurdle that we have to face and, and overcome and the only thing we could really think of is that they want to make the Department of Education or then the, I guess the public schools the primary source of, I guess preschool education whereas the CBOs within become an overflow where it's, it's not effectively a... and again this might be jsut cynical, cynical speculation on my end but I, I fear there, there isn't a desire for parity because there's no motivation of that desired parity. It's, it's their concentration of, of, of dollars are being controlled by the DO, DOE and then the overflow of these other organizations which happen to exist which politically can't get rid of but at the end of the day well that's just kind of what's there and that's, that's fearful to us because again our, our center and what we've demanded as being a, a board member is, is the best and, and we're in a very, very poor area economically disadvantaged area but we've always

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE  
ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 pushed for everyone gives their all, the entire way  
3 and we're on the Board of Directors, none of us get  
4 paid and, and at the end of the day it's very hard  
5 for us to push that but we require it because we feel  
6 our children in our communities deserve that. So,  
7 just, just to the city council I, I ask just to kind  
8 of keep that in mind and bear that in mind as things  
9 progress forward that, that that's a real fear that  
10 we're seeing that it might become that structure of  
11 overflow as opposed to everyone working together.

12 Thank you.

13 GEORGE PENAHERRERA: My name is George  
14 Penaherrera, Director at East Calvary Day Care  
15 Center, a center in Upper Manhattan, definitely it  
16 was not ready but after hearing some of what's gone  
17 on and, and having heard that this meeting was taking  
18 place is the first time I'm actually speaking like  
19 this so just have a little patience. I'll be short, I  
20 can only tell you that my experiences as a director  
21 has been over 30 years following the path of the  
22 world of day care, my wife on the other hand has  
23 followed the path of the DOE and I can tell you she's  
24 been like a thorn in my side every year telling me  
25 when are you're going to come over, when are you



COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

going to come over and, and, and I think what has kept me in the world of day care is the, the philosophy, it's very different and it's becoming more evident now in watching all of the changes that have gone on and I thank you guys so much because with what we went through with Early Learn, previously with the last administration I just hope that something like that doesn't repeat again with what I kind of see, it's just the DOE once again not being prepared and they're going to rush it and it's going to have a detrimental effects in a lot of programs. So, for my situation with child care standalone programs, unlike Head Start we don't have those support mechanisms in place. It is crazy when I tell you that teachers wear different hats to be in compliance, they become family workers, we become counselors all the things that right now the DOE is providing and supporting for us it's been happening already because we've had to be in compliance with other agencies like the Department of Health or else we would not be in existence so it's always been this upward struggle to be in compliance and now it seems like more is going to occur where the teachers again are going to be pressured, I'm not going to beat a

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

dead horse about the parity because that's absolutely the main reason why we have this going on but at the same time what I fear the most is just like with UPK, I believe that teachers in our programs, directors in our programs are the experts in these agents of three and four, what is very new to the DOE and we saw it coming with the fours where they came out and they kind of learned from us and they got all of what classrooms should look like and what it should be like and then somehow it went into effect into the public schools. Now the same thing is going to occur with the threes, they're coming out and yes, we welcome them and we know it's just a matter of time before we fall into that system but they have to kind of really... you guys need to pressure them into making them understand that the worlds are very different and, and we have many different set ups in our world, we have Head Start, there's just so many different types of programs and when they just keep focusing on, on the teachers and that okay, very little do I hear about the roles of the directors and how they're going to play a role in the vision of where the DOE is going to go in two years, what's going to happen, you know many directors we've gone through the path

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

like I said, we reached the cap, we've been in the classroom from assistants to, to group teachers to directors for many years that's just the path that we followed and we're there so now we are a little shaky as to hearing, okay, we are part of CSA but we're not part of CSA when its in discussion regarding UFT with principals and vice principals, they all want to be there, that's fine but they need to recognize us in some way what our role is going to be to work in the settings that we're in now especially when three.. you know the three year old moves forward to 3-K for All moves forward. I believe we're the experts in that field but I am not hearing us being recognized in a way that they.. Mr. Wallack will say that they're out in the programs and they're kind of hearing and taking it all in but I've seen them in many ACS meetings where he has not had answers and that's not just today but he hasn't had answers before because they don't really know where they're heading themselves but we're just kind of being brought into it. so, you know I think to, to keep it short I do ask that you keep that pressure in the DOE, I think the concept paper is a must, they need to.. we need to know what is exactly.. how this is going to all play

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

ON GENERAL WELFARE

1  
2 out in the end, please also keep in mind that many  
3 directors, you know we grow professionally too, many  
4 directors took what is a certificate which is the C-  
5 PAC which is a credential which is the children's  
6 program for administration credential, it's a  
7 certificate that was two years of, of work that  
8 directors went to in, in a college, an accredited  
9 college, we received certificates that we found out  
10 later on were all only recognized by the state not by  
11 the city so we said uhm that's interesting, went  
12 through two years of school, did all these credits in  
13 administration to further our professional growth and  
14 now we find out that there... it's not recognized by  
15 the DOE or in the city. So, what they do recognize is  
16 a CBO school building leadership certificate... for  
17 SBO... I'm sorry, SBO, which again it's something that  
18 is from a different world which many of us are not  
19 connected to because our experience is not in that  
20 public school setting, it's not... like I said it's not  
21 part of our world so I was just hoping that at least  
22 that is noted that there has been certificates that  
23 directors have accomplished that have been more  
24 related to the world of early childhood in... you know  
25 in the early childhood scope. So, I think I'll keep

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

it short just keep asking those tough questions,  
don't let them... you know don't let them off the hook,  
don't let them just take over. I thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank, thank you so  
much. Yeah, I, I... before I ran for council I  
completed my courses and I got the SBO but it does  
not compare to your credentials and, and to your  
experience and I think that's a very, very valid fair  
point about who's asking for your expertise, who is  
reaching out to you because quite frankly they're  
talking internally amongst themselves those are  
actually who aren't learning from you and asking all  
the right questions so thank you for your outstanding  
work and advocacy and, and we... as we appreciate, you  
know your wife's... she's lobbying you to, to, to  
switch... [cross-talk]

GEORGE PENAHERRERA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Stay here... [cross-  
talk]

GEORGE PENAHERRERA: I believe... [cross-  
talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and let's continue  
this fight together for parity and fairness and  
justice once and for all. Thank you all very much.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ON GENERAL WELFARE

GEORGE PENAHERRERA: Thank you... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Absolutely, sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: There we go.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And with that we are adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

July 19, 2018