

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

January 16, 2019
Start: 1:07 p.m.
Recess: 5:11 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: MARK TREYGER
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
- INEZ D. BARRON
- JOSEPH C. BORELLI
- JUSTIN L. BRANNAN
- ANDREW COHEN
- ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.
- CHAIM M. DEUTSCH
- DANIEL DROMM
- BARRY S. GRODENCHIK
- BEN KALLOS
- ANDY L. KING
- BRAD S. LANDER
- STEPHEN T. LEVIN
- MARK LEVINE
- YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
- DEBORAH L. ROSE
- RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.
- ERIC A. ULRICH

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1
2
3 Lindsey Harr
Executive Director of the Office of School
4 Wellness Programs within the Division of School
Climate and Wellness
5
6 Donald Conyers
Senior Superintendent in the Office of the First
Deputy Chancellor
7
8 Chris Tricarico
Executive Director, Central Operations at the New
York Department of Education, DOE
9
10 Roger Platt
Director of School Health in New York City
11
12 Marion Thomas
Senior Program Manager at the New York City
Department of Education, DOE
13
14 Gale Brewer
Manhattan Borough President
15
16 Eric Adams
Brooklyn Borough President
17
18 Dr. Ethan Ciment
Podiatric Physician and Surgeon, Chelsea
19
20 Amie Hamlin
Executive Director of the Coalition for Healthy
School Food
21
22 Moria Byrne-Zaaloff
Program Coordinator of Bronx Health REACH
23
24 Tom Shamy
Parent of Two Manhattan School Students
25
26 Dr. Robert Graham
Physician and Chef, Co-Founder of FRESH-Med
27
28 Bill Telepan
Executive Chef of Wellness in Schools, Executive
Chef of Oceana in Midtown

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

3

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Claire Raffel
Deputy Director at the Laurie M. Tisch Center for
Food, Education and Policy, Program in Nutrition,
Teachers College Columbia University

Pam Cook
Speaking on Behalf of Meredith Hill, Assistant
Principal from Columbia Secondary School for
Math, Science and Engineering

Yadira Garcia
Chef, Educator, Activist in the Bronx

Maria Muhammad
Former Student in the Bronx

Andrea Strong
Parent at PS 261 in Brooklyn

Mirem Villamil
Parent of Two Children in New York City Public
Schools

Andrew Barrett
New York Program Director with FoodCorps

Chloe Coscarelli
Vegan Chef and Cookbook Author

Gail Mayer
Registered Dietitian

Marisa Miller Wolfson
Parent in Process of Writing Cookbook with Kid
Friendly Recipes, Director of Documentary Called
Vegucated

Robyn Kenul
Registered Dietitian

Dr. David Dunaief
Internist Specializing in Integrative Medicine

Andrew Sta. Ana
Director of Legal Services at Day One

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

4

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Zoe Ridolfi-Starr
Policy Co-Chair for the Sexuality Education
Alliance of New York City

Edita Birnkrant
Executive Director of NYCLASS

Emily Kadar
Representing the National Institute for
Reproductive Health, NIRH

Allie Taylor
President and Founder of Voters for Animal Rights
Brooklyn

Chenel Trevellini
Registered Nurse, Holistic Health Coach

Lianna Levine Reisner
Parent of Three School Aged Children, Upper West
Side

Maggie Neola
Registered dietitian with the Physicians
Committee for Responsible Medicine

Nicole Jennings
Program Director at the Women's Housing and
Economic Development Corporation, WHEDco in the
South Bronx

Amaku Ukpong
Resident of Brooklyn, Former Public School
Student, Nutritionist

Ora Kemp
Program Manager for the New York Common Pantry's
Policy System and Environmental Teame

Enrica Sacca
Native New Yorker

Dr. Meryem Bencheikh-Ellis
Co-President of PTA Board at the Clinton Hill
School

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Katerina Trabazo
New York City Certified Teacher and Vegan

Rachael Peters
Executive Director of Peer Health Exchange,
Public School Parent, Member of PS 10's School
Wellness Council, District Wellness Advisory
Council at the Co-Chair for the Health Education
Committee

Gary Edwards
Student at Khalil Gibran High School in Brooklyn,
Intern at the Children's Defense Fund New York

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay. Good

afternoon and welcome to today's hearing. I am Council Member Mark Treyger, Chair of the Education Committee. Today we will be examining health and wellness instruction in New York City public schools and we will hear testimony on the following legislation. Introduction Number 365 sponsored by Council Member Salamanca, Introductions Number, Number 560 and 1283, which I am proud to sponsor, and Pre-Considered Introduction Number 3611 sponsored by our Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo as well as Resolution Number 238 sponsored by Council Member Cabrera, Resolution Number 632 sponsored by Council Member Barron and Resolution Number 716 sponsored by Council Member Levin. Before we get started, I'd like to recognize the members of the Committee who are here so far, some are on the way; Council Member Cabrera thank you for getting the gold star here today, that's right, wellness and promptness, right. The importance of instruction in health education in our schools cannot be overstated, by promoting awareness of healthy behaviors and encouraging prevention of disease instruction in health education

1 arms our city's young people with the power to
2 preserve their health in their everyday lives.

3
4 Research shows that establishing healthy behaviors in
5 younger people is easier and more effective than
6 efforts to change unhealthy behaviors already
7 established in adults. For that reason, instruction
8 in physical, mental, social and emotional health can
9 improve the quality of life for individuals, families
10 and communities at large. School health education
11 programs are a vital opportunity to teach students
12 basic skills and information about healthy lifestyles
13 as well as provide an opportunity to engage in
14 healthy behaviors. With the opioid crisis we're
15 experiencing here in New York City like so many
16 cities across the county, with ongoing rates of
17 sexually transmitted infections and teen pregnancies
18 that are far higher than they should be and with the
19 high incidents of obesity and diabetes while our
20 nation's president boasts of serving a feast of fast
21 food to elite athletes, it is clear that we must
22 ensure our students are, are receiving sufficient
23 instruction in health education as appropriately
24 required by federal guidelines and state law and I'd
25 also just point out that those federal guidelines and

1
2 state mandates are themselves insufficient and the
3 fact that we're not even meeting those guidelines and
4 mandates speaks volumes. I look forward to hearing
5 today about the DOE's health in education curricula
6 and the department's plans for and progress towards
7 meeting state health education requirements. In
8 addition to our conversation about health education
9 instruction we're also hearing legislation that
10 relates to providing our students with opportunities
11 to engage in healthy behaviors and ensuring our local
12 school environments promote health. Intro 365
13 sponsored by Council Member Salamanca would require
14 the DOE to stock opioid antagonist in all school
15 buildings, Naloxone or Narcan as a nasal spray that
16 quickly reverses an overdose from heroine and
17 prescription pain killers, a life saving measure such
18 as this one should be available in the case of an
19 emergency in our school buildings. We're also hearing
20 my bill, Intro 560 which would create a task force to
21 study the feasibility of starting middle schools and
22 high schools after 8:30 a.m. in order to reduce
23 adolescent sleep deprivation. As a former teacher of
24 a 7:30 a.m. regents' class I know very well how tough
25 it is for students, parents and school staff alike to

1 start the school day so early in the morning. In
2 Seattle in the 2016/2017 school year the official
3 school start time was moved from 7:50 a.m. to 8:45
4 a.m. and research found students got an increase
5 amount of sleep, grades improved, and tardiness and
6 absences were reduced. Intro 560 would require a task
7 force including at least a, a high school student, a
8 parent of a middle school student and a parent of a
9 high school student, a middle school teacher, a high
10 school teacher, an administrator, a labor rep and a
11 rep from DOE to review our official school start
12 times and submit an annual report with
13 recommendations to the Mayor and the Council for five
14 years. Introduction 1283 which I'm also proud to
15 sponsor in conjunction with the Manhattan Borough
16 President, would require the DOE to submit annual
17 reports on nutrition education in our city's schools.
18 The report would specify whether nutrition education
19 is combined with other health related education and
20 whether it is provided by an external nutrition
21 education provider and just a note to the DOE that
22 will be testifying here today as a former high school
23 teacher I already know some of the answers to these
24 questions, hint, hint. The report would also include
25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 information about the number of certified dieticians
3 teaching nutrition in each school. The data in the
4 report would be provided by school and within each
5 grade level in each school the data would be
6 desegregated by race, gender, and free or reduced-
7 price lunch status. Pre-Considered Intro, Intro 3611
8 which is sponsored by Majority Leader Cumbo and which
9 I am a proud co-sponsor would amend DOE's current
10 reports on health education instructions in school to
11 require more detailed information. The bill would
12 require DOE to report on the amount of health
13 education including HIV/AIDS education and sexual
14 health education received by students at each school,
15 the amount of compliance with state health education
16 requirements at each school and the number of
17 certified health education instructors at each
18 school. The committee is also hearing three
19 Resolutions today and Resolutions just for the public
20 to be aware are non-binding, but they certainly
21 provide a platform for issues to, to be discussed and
22 to be advanced. Resolution Number 283... 238, I'm
23 sorry, sponsored by Council Member Cabrera calls upon
24 the DOE to ban processed meats from being served in
25 New York City public schools. Resolution Number 632

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 sponsored by Council Member Barron calls upon the DOE
3 to create a diabetes and pre-diabetes health-based
4 curriculum and Resolution Number 716 sponsored by
5 Council Member Levin calls upon the DOE to adopt all
6 of the policy recommendations of the Mayor's sexual
7 health education task force and provide comprehensive
8 sexual health education on a regular basis across all
9 grade levels. This task force was convened pursuant
10 to Local Law 90 of 2017 which was also sponsored by
11 our Majority Leader Council... Laurie Cumbo. The task
12 force recommendations seek to establish... to ensure
13 students at DOE schools get a comprehensive sexual
14 health education that includes medically accurate and
15 age appropriate lessons on sexual health. It is
16 disappointing that the DOE has not yet adopted these
17 recommendations and I hope we will hear today about
18 plans to change this going forward. I'd like to thank
19 the Education Committee staff Beth Golub, Kalima
20 Johnson, Jan Atwell and Kaitlyn O'Hagan. I'd like to
21 also thank my staff Anna Scaife, Vanessa Ogle, and
22 Eric Feinberg and now I'll... now ask the Committee
23 Counsel to administer the oath.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
25 hand. Do you swear to tell the truth, the whole truth

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

and nothing but the truth in your testimony today and to respond honestly to Council Member questions? You may begin.

LINDSEY HARR: Good afternoon Chair Treyger and members of the Education Council. My name is Lindsey Harr and I'm the Executive Director of the Office of School Wellness Programs within the Division of School Climate and Wellness. Thank you for the opportunity to discuss comprehensive health education in New York City schools and the proposed legislation. I'm joined by my colleague Donald Conyers, Senior Superintendent in the First Deputy Chancellor's Office and by Dr. Roger Platt, CEO of the Office of School Health. Supporting the whole child is a central component of this administration's equity and excellence for all vision and we've made significant investments in the arts, physical education, social-emotional well learning, health education and mental health. Health education is a core component of the whole child model and we have a lot of work ahead to ensure that all our students are consistently receiving this essential skills-based instruction. I'd like to thank the Council for their leadership on health education and I look forward to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 continuing our work together on this important
3 matter. New York State requires health education at
4 each grade level. Students are required to have
5 health instruction every year in elementary school,
6 and they are required to take a 54-hour health course
7 once in middle school and again in high school. The
8 state also requires all K to 12 students to have
9 annual lessons on HIV and AIDS. New York City
10 requires the inclusion of sexual health topics as
11 part of the health class required for middle and high
12 school students. The DOE's inclusion of sexual health
13 education goes beyond the New York State requirement
14 for comprehensive health education and is something
15 we've mandated since 2011. Schools are in a unique
16 position to help students lead healthy lives now and
17 in the future. Through comprehensive health
18 education, students have the opportunity to learn
19 about a wide range of topics that are key to
20 wellness, including mental, emotional and social
21 health; nutrition and physical wellbeing, disease and
22 illness prevention, tobacco, alcohol and other drugs,
23 personal health and safety, age appropriate growth
24 and development including identity and how to access
25 health services and resources. Lessons that are

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 grounded in developing essential health skills like
3 communication, goal setting, decision making, self-
4 advocacy, stress management, and understanding media
5 and peer influences can help prepare students to
6 navigate a range of health-related matters throughout
7 their lives. Sexual health lessons, as part of
8 comprehensive education, provide students with age
9 appropriate, medically accurate, inclusive and
10 skills-based instruction about human growth and
11 development, protecting their health, understanding
12 gender and identity and safely navigating
13 relationships. In addition, since 2015, male and
14 female condom demonstrations may be included in high
15 school health education class because we know that
16 correct and consistent condom use is key to
17 preventing unintended pregnancy, HIV, and other STIs.
18 Our high school condom availability program offers
19 high school students access to free condoms and
20 supports from specially trained school staff. Another
21 important component of health education relates to
22 nutrition and food. students learn about topics such
23 as the relationship between food and health, food
24 groups and nutrition, beverage choices, and reading
25 food labels. This takes place at all grade levels in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 the context of healthy choices, self-management,
3 planning and goal setting. I'd like to acknowledge
4 our many partners who, who promote the importance of
5 food and nutrition education in schools, providing
6 professional learning for teachers, programs for
7 students and families, and resources for engaging the
8 school community. we look forward to continuing and
9 are expanding our work together. Because supporting
10 the whole child is so important to our Equity and
11 Excellence for All vision, Mayor De Blasio and
12 Chancellor Carranza have made an unprecedented 24
13 million dollar investment in the new Health Ed Works
14 initiative, which supports the Office of School
15 Wellness programs in helping schools understand what
16 quality comprehensive health education is, why it is
17 important and how to provide it for all students.
18 Through Health Ed Works, we are establishing
19 comprehensive health education so that school leaders
20 prioritize health instruction; prepared teachers
21 provide inclusive, age appropriate lessons;
22 instructional materials are medically accurate, age
23 appropriate, inclusive and culturally relevant; and
24 wrap around programs engage families and community
25 partners in supporting student wellbeing. Our two-

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 pronged strategy increases support for all schools
3 citywide, while focusing intensively on a cohort of
4 500 Health Ed Works focus schools that will model
5 best practices by June 2022. We will also increase
6 the number of teachers with a health ed, education..
7 excuse me, certification. We know there's a lot of
8 work to do, while nearly all graduating high school
9 students are scheduled for the required health
10 course, many middle school students are not receiving
11 the necessary amount of health education. In 2017 to
12 18, 60.2 percent of eighth graders were scheduled for
13 health instruction and 37.2 percent received the
14 full, 54-hour course. Through Health Ed Works, we
15 will improve the quality of health instruction and
16 ensure that all middle and high schools meet state
17 course requirements by June 2022. To achieve these
18 goals, we rely on the input and collaboration of
19 partners, educators, students, and families. Our
20 district wellness advisory council, for instance, has
21 provided invaluable feedback on our health education
22 scope and sequence and other instructional materials
23 that we are currently developing. Our school wellness
24 council grant program, which is in over 200 schools
25 across the city, helps family members, students,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 school staff, and other community members come
3 together to target wellness related priorities in
4 their school. In the current school year, more than
5 half of our grantee schools proposed a nutrition
6 related project. Through Health Ed Works, we will
7 expand existing relationships with outside
8 organizations, develop new partnerships, and increase
9 coordination with other city agencies in order to
10 address the unique needs of each school. We will also
11 help the 500 Health Ed Works focus schools establish
12 school wellness councils, with an emphasis on student
13 leadership in middle and high school. Guiding our
14 health education instruction is a comprehensive
15 curriculum that is aligned with state and national
16 learning standards. We select this recommended
17 curriculum through a rigorous and collaborative
18 review process. Our K to 12 health education scope
19 and sequence, which is rolling out this school year,
20 will provide administrators and teachers with clear
21 and more detailed guidance about what students should
22 know and be able to do at each grade level. Working
23 with teachers and content experts, we will continue
24 to identify, review, and develop curricular resources
25 that are responsive to our teachers and our students'

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 needs. Through Health Ed Works, we will also expand
3 professional learning opportunities, provide
4 instructional coaching, and launch new professional
5 learning communities in order to better support
6 teachers in providing standards based, inclusive
7 health education. I want to take a moment to thank
8 Council Member Cumbo and the Council for creating the
9 sexual health education task force. The ongoing
10 dialogue with the task force was critical to
11 developing Health Ed Works. Many of the task force's
12 recommendations are reflected in this initiative.
13 Those suggestions centered on improving a culture of
14 sexual wellness and inclusivity in all schools;
15 ensuri9ng that students are served by well prepared
16 and supported health teachers; improving the content,
17 substance and methods of sexual health education; and
18 strengthening accountability and reporting. The task
19 force will reconvene lather this month and we plan to
20 have an update on the recommendations that we are
21 still reviewing. We look forward to continued
22 partnership with the task force. I will now turn to
23 my colleague Donald Conyers in the Office of the
24 First Deputy Chancellor, who will discuss how these

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 initiatives are supported by Superintendents and
3 Borough Offices.

4 DONALD CONYERS: Thank you. Good
5 afternoon Chair Treyger and members of the Education
6 Committee. My name is Donald Conyers and I am the
7 Senior Superintendent in the Office of the First
8 Deputy Chancellor. I'm excited to speak about Health
9 Ed, Ed Works and how the Office of the First Deputy
10 Chancellor supports the goals of this important
11 initiative. Since this is the first time before the
12 Education Committee, I would like to share a little
13 about my background. I am a product of the public
14 school's system and since 1983, I have been proud to
15 work for the Department of Education in many
16 different capacities. I began my career as a special
17 education and general education teacher then advanced
18 to become an assistant principal, a principal in the
19 South Bronx with 13 years in the same school, local
20 instructional superintendent, community
21 superintendent of district 23 in Brownsville,
22 Brooklyn, high school superintendent and now Senior
23 Superintendent in the Office of the First Deputy
24 Chancellor. Under the new streamlined Department... DOE
25 leadership structure put in place by Chancellor

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Carranza, the Office of the First Deputy Chancellor
3 oversees Executive Superintendents, who in turn... who
4 in turn oversee Borough Offices and Superintendents,
5 to ensure all aspects of the DOE are working hand in
6 hand to best serve schools and students. This new
7 system, coupled with the Health Ed Works investment,
8 enables us to prioritize comprehensive health
9 education so we can strengthen and increase high
10 quality health education for every New York City
11 student. It's not just enough to have the right
12 structures in place, we know that we need to work
13 closely with schools to change the culture around
14 health education and address long-standing barriers
15 to implementation. While in the past some schools or
16 principals may not have understood the value of
17 health education, our new leadership structure,
18 combined with the goals of Health Ed Works, allows us
19 to clearly communicate to schools why this is a
20 critical component to supporting the whole child and
21 why it must be a priority now. While this renewed
22 focus and 24-million-dollar investment... with this
23 renewed focus and 24-million-dollar investment, we
24 expect significant improvements in the reach and
25 quality of health education. In our monthly

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 programming for Equity and Excellence work group, we
3 work on each... we work with each Borough Office, the
4 Office of Academic Policy, the Office of Compliance
5 Services, and the Office of School Wellness Programs
6 to analyze health education data. Based on that data,
7 we provide support and hold schools accountable.

8 Equity and Excellence.. and Excellence cannot be
9 achieved without supporting the whole child. I will
10 now like to turn it back over to Lindsey. Thank you.

11 LINDSEY HARR: I would now like to
12 discuss the legislation under consideration today.
13 Intro Number 365 requires DOE to stock opioid
14 antagonists in all school buildings. The well being
15 of students and staff is our top priority. Substance
16 abuse prevention and intervention specialists provide
17 schools with a wide range of drug prevention and
18 intervention services. It is also important to note
19 that there has not been a known overdose of a student
20 in school. We look forward to further discussions
21 with the Council on the proposed legislation. Intro
22 Number 560 requires the creation of a task force to
23 review current middle school and high school start
24 times and determine their effect on adolescent health
25 and wellbeing. Currently, about 50 DOE schools start

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 before eight a.m. Last year, the DOE worked closely
3 with five schools that voluntarily moved their start
4 times to later in the morning. We will expand the
5 pilot this spring to gather and assess more
6 information prior to making any system wide
7 decisions. While we support the goals of the
8 legislation to ensure that middle and high school
9 students receive adequate sleep, we believe the task
10 force is duplicating work already underway. Intro
11 Number 1283 requires DOE to report on food and
12 nutrition education. While we share the Council's
13 goal of ensuring that all students receive high
14 quality health education that includes lessons on
15 food and nutrition, we have several operational
16 concerns with the proposed legislation. The DOE does
17 not track individual units within a course in any
18 subject area. Much as we do not track when a
19 particular topic is taught in science, we do not
20 track when a teacher teaches nutrition, which is a
21 topic within comprehensive health education. In
22 addition, we do not centrally record which schools
23 work with external food and nutrition education
24 providers. The pre-considered bill sponsored by
25 Council Member Cumbo requires DOE to provide

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 information on health education, sex education, HIV
3 and AIDS lessons, whether schools are using DOE
4 recommended curriculum, and report on the number of
5 full and part time certified health education
6 teachers. We would like to work with the Council to
7 ensure that this legislation is aligned with what we
8 currently track in our data system. However, it is
9 important to note that, similar to Intro 1283, the
10 DOE... the DOE does not track individual topics within
11 a course, nor does DOE require schools to report on
12 which curriculum they use. Thank you again for the
13 opportunity to testify today. We share the Council's
14 commitment to supporting the whole child, and that
15 includes comprehensive health education. We look
16 forward to working with the City Council on this
17 important issue. With that, we would be happy to
18 answer any questions you may have.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, I just want
20 to note that we've also been joined by Council
21 Members Levine, Lander, Salamanca and Ampry-Samuel,
22 Rose, Cornegy, Ulrich, Cohen and Levin, forgive me if
23 we missed, missed anybody. So, I'll, I'll, I'll just...
24 I'll just begin by... a couple of things in your
25 opening statements I just want to follow up on, you

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 mentioned in your concerns about legislation for
3 example sponsored by Council Member Cumbo with
4 regards to health education and the task force that
5 the DOE does not track or monitor what courses are
6 being taught but some of these courses like for
7 example topics such as HIV/AIDS these are state
8 mandates that are required for us to be... to teach in
9 our schools and how do we measure if we're in
10 compliance with, with such subjects?

11 LINDSEY HARR: The DOE does track courses
12 that students are scheduled for, it's the individual
13 topics within those courses that we do not currently
14 track.

15 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, how do we know
16 H... if HIV/AIDS is for example being taught in our
17 schools?

18 LINDSEY HARR: The HIV/AIDS lesson
19 requirement from the state is that every student K to
20 12 receive either depending on their grade level
21 either five or six lessons per year so when a student
22 is scheduled for health education which is not an
23 annual requirement in middle and high school those
24 lessons may be part of the health ed course. In the
25 years when the student does not have a health ed

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 course those lessons are taught in a different
3 setting.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and again and
5 I appreciate that answer but how do we know it's
6 being taught if, if these are mandates?

7 LINDSEY HARR: Per this legislation we
8 are tracking in the system the provision of those
9 specific five and six lessons and I think we'd be
10 happy to talk with the Council about this legislation
11 and, and figure out what we can do to meet the goals
12 of the Council.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Well I mean I'll,
14 I'll point something out that in, in the... in the
15 wellness policy advisory group it was my
16 understanding that the scope and sequence curriculum
17 was supposed to be due at... due in the previous school
18 year and it's... in your... in your testimony today I'm
19 hearing that it's still not out and that you're
20 hoping to get it done by the end of this year, is
21 that correct?

22 LINDSEY HARR: We are rolling out the
23 scope and sequence this year for both physical
24 education and health education, K to five will be out
25 later this month and then the secondary levels will

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 be out later this spring. Part of the reason is that
3 we've been engaged in a pretty intensive process with
4 teachers, with partners, with content experts getting
5 feedback on that scope and sequence and working to
6 identify curricular resources that align with them.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right but, but this
8 is a result of an advisory council product that said
9 they were supposed to be due out in the last school
10 year and this advisory council is actually... it's,
11 it's a federal mandate that each school, school
12 district across, across the country have them and a
13 scope and sequence for, for the public to understand
14 it's very helpful for educators to have because that
15 ensures that they have materials and kind of guidance
16 on what should be taught in, in our classrooms and so
17 the fact that it's not out yet is concerning and it
18 will be a very helpful tool for, for our children in
19 our... in our classrooms. Can you please explain the
20 difference between state certification in New York
21 City, licensing for teachers, to be more specific the
22 distinction between DOE licensed health education
23 teachers and those who are certified by the state to
24 teach health education and does the DOE track
25 licensing and certification of teachers separately?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

LINDSEY HARR: Sure, so teachers receive a state certification and then in New York City teachers receive a license in a particular area and teachers teach under a license, you can only be teaching under one license whereas you could hold multiple state certifications. DOE tracks teacher licensure because that shows what a teacher is teaching under. I'm so sorry, you had a second part to your question.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Does the DOE track licensing and certification of teachers separately?

LINDSEY HARR: Yes, sorry, so the DOE tracks licensure, the state tracks and provides information on certification.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and so how many certified health education teachers do you have to teach health education in middle and high school grades as required by state law?

LINDSEY HARR: Based on the state data that we have it's around 600 certified teachers with a health ed certification.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: 600 and what percent of health teachers do not hold state certification to teach health?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

LINDSEY HARR: I don't have that number in front of me right now, we can get back to you on that.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Well the Comptroller's audit report did have that number and it reported that over 90 percent of our middle school and high school teachers do not possess the required licensure, license to teach health education in our schools, have you seen that report?

LINDSEY HARR: I have seen that report and I didn't remember that particular number.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: It was a very sobering figure and you might not... I'm, I'm just going to ask these questions if you don't have the answers with you today I would appreciate that we do have them and quite frankly we should have had them today because the subject is on health and license... an... health reporting but how many middle and high school schools have no teacher on staff who is state certified or licensed by the city to teach health?

LINDSEY HARR: So, we... there are... or as of last school year which is our most recent complete data that there were 165 licensed health ed teachers meaning that they were teaching under their health

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 education license. One of the things that we are
3 looking at is whether teachers with a health
4 certification are also assigned to teach a health
5 education course.

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, who teaches the
7 subject in middle school and high school where you
8 don't have a certified health education teacher?

9 LINDSEY HARR: If a school does not have
10 a certified health education teacher that course is
11 often assigned to a teacher without a health ed
12 certification.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And in my
14 experience many times this would fall under someone
15 who might teach phys, phys ed but they're not
16 actually licensed to teach health and nutrition and
17 if the Comptrollers report is accurate and over 90
18 percent of the teachers... of our teachers are not
19 licensed in this area that means the overwhelming
20 majority of our students in middle and high school...
21 in high schools are not getting the quality and
22 critical education which they, they deserve and quite
23 frankly is mandated by the state of New York where
24 it's another example of just non-compliance and I'll
25 also point out that the state mandates for elementary

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 schools don't even require a licensed health teacher
3 to teach health to our children which really speaks
4 volumes because it's almost as if the state is
5 suggesting that elementary school grade students
6 cannot learn these subjects or somehow they, they
7 can't comprehend when very much they can. There's a
8 school in my district, PS216 that has an edible
9 school garden and they're doing some extraordinary
10 things at a very young age that some, some of our
11 older kids may.. might not be able to do. So, it's
12 really almost insulting that the state would, would
13 almost suggest that young kids cannot learn such
14 critical concepts in, in, in skill building at, at
15 their critical age that.. these are the formative
16 years of their lives and we are depriving them and
17 denying them a very important education and skills
18 that they can bring with them for the rest of their
19 lives but I would also point out that the city of New
20 York sometimes says we're not going to wait for
21 Albany to act, we're going to show leadership, we'll
22 lead the way, we'll lead others will follow so just
23 because they don't require us to have licensed health
24 teachers doesn't mean that we have to follow that,
25 nothing in state law says we can't just make sure

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 that we have that requirement so I would urge the DOE
3 to show initiative and show leadership in making sure
4 that we have folks who are licensed in these critical
5 areas teaching such critical subjects to our students
6 which leads me to my next question. What, what is DOE
7 doing to increase the number of certified or licensed
8 health education teachers, does DOE offer any
9 incentive programs for teachers to get certified in
10 health education as they do for other understaffed
11 areas such as paying tuition credits... tuition credits
12 or exams?

13 LINDSEY HARR: This is an important
14 component of our Health Ed Works initiative that I
15 mentioned in testimony which is helping teachers and
16 providing them with the financial support to get
17 their health ed certification, we agree that this is
18 an issue and it's something that we're taking on.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and do you
20 believe from your own personal professional opinion
21 that in the state mandates it says for middle school
22 and for high school 50... 54 hours are required to
23 teach health, is that correct?

24 LINDSEY HARR: Correct.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Do you believe from your professional... personal professional opinion that that is sufficient?

LINDSEY HARR: I think that the topics and skills that are covered in health education are very, very important and I think that we need to think about not only about meeting what the state requirements are but thinking about how we create schools where health education and wellness is prioritized not just within any one class regardless of how long it's required but truly throughout the entire school community and throughout a student's learning experience.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright and so if I'm hearing you correctly you believe that teaching health and nutrition to our students is important?

LINDSEY HARR: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And you would agree with me that someone who is not licensed to teach these subjects spending time with our children that is a problem.

LINDSEY HARR: We have to make sure that our teachers who are providing health education have the training and the background and the knowledge and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 quite frankly the comfort level that they need to
3 teach these topics and that's why we've invested in
4 Health Ed Works and why we are going to be focusing
5 on supporting our teachers in making sure that
6 they're able to teach the full range of topics and
7 skills that are part of comprehensive health
8 education.

9 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I, I appreciate
10 your answer, I would just add we need more than just
11 comfort level. When I had to teach high school social
12 studies comfort level was not sufficient I had to
13 pass exams and take courses and take the
14 prerequisite, you know classes at CUNY to teach
15 history and I think that that's what's really
16 necessary and required here too, we need folks who
17 know what they're doing and know what they're
18 teaching to teach these critical subject matters
19 especially when we're seeing the prevalence of such
20 health related issues facing our city or... I mean just
21 as I pointed out in my testimony, you know just this
22 week the president of our country was boasting and
23 celebrating a feast of big macs and Domino's Pizza
24 to, you know elite athletes, I mean what a... just...
25 what, what a message he's sending to our... to our... to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 our country and, and around the world. Outside we had
3 a rally before where we were chanting broccoli and
4 sofrito and... we showed a table of broccoli and
5 sofrito for the... for the athletes, right but these
6 are... these are serious issues and these are serious
7 challenges and I... and I... and I, I understand the
8 school system many, many times is shaped around
9 what's not being measured, it's not always being
10 invested in but our children's health it's worth it,
11 we need to go well above and beyond I believe the
12 mandates and hold ourselves even more accountable.
13 Now do you have any data or information with you
14 about how often is nutrition education offered in, in
15 elementary schools, middle schools and high schools?

16 LINDSEY HARR: As I had noted in the
17 testimony DOE does not track specific topic areas
18 within a course so no, I don't have that information.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, if I'm hearing
20 you correctly its important but we don't know if it's
21 being taught, Is that right?

22 LINDSEY HARR: That's correct and that's
23 part of the reason that we're focusing on helping
24 schools establish comprehensive health education
25 because there are a number of critically important

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

topics that are part of health education and so we want to make sure that our principals and our teachers and our students and our families understand what, what, what truly comprehensive health education is, why its important and how to make sure that all of our students get it.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Does DOE have any survey data or any other metrics that provide evidence of the quality of health or nutrition education instruction, are there any.. is there a question on health and nutrition on parent learning surveys, is there a question on it when superintendents visit schools, is there any evidence that you can point to that we ask these questions to, to our school communities?

LINDSEY HARR: Quality of health ed instruction is something that my team and I are very focused on so through our professional learning, our work with teachers, our work with principals, we're really focusing on not just is the course scheduled but, but what is the quality of it, we are working closely with our superintendents and borough offices as well to help them understand what health education is and to coordinate our efforts around ensuring that

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 schools are providing quality and comprehensive
3 health education.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: But you're not...
5 you're not sure if, if any questions on nutrition
6 and... or health in general are in any of these surveys
7 or materials when folks ask parents whether or not
8 their child feels safe at school, is there a question
9 about the health and nutrition... [cross-talk]

10 LINDSEY HARR: I'm not aware of a parent
11 survey question on that but I will double check and
12 we'll get back to you.

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Are you familiar...
14 you're familiar with the... obviously the comprehensive
15 education plans each school is required to have a
16 CEP, are you... are you aware do CEPs have goals
17 related to health in, in education and if not why
18 not?

19 LINDSEY HARR: They do, that's actually
20 something that we've been working... my team has been
21 working with, with the Department of Education's team
22 that supports CEPs to help schools integrate wellness
23 schools and more about a health and wellness focus.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, I sat on my
25 school's school leadership team and I'm familiar with

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 at least my school's CEP and I've met with other
3 school communities with regard to their CEPs many
4 times it all boils down to, we have to create goals
5 to pass tests and last year we might have had a
6 certain number of kids passing a test and the goal
7 for next year which we heard from our superintendent
8 and we heard from our school leaders pass... we want
9 the passing rate to increase by this much, we didn't
10 hear much about health and nutrition as being a goal
11 that's being measured and tracked so I just want to
12 just point it out and I'm sure maybe it happens in
13 certain... in, in some schools but it's, it's not
14 happening across the board and I have pointed out
15 before that in my district we have an elementary
16 school that has an edible garden and in, in the high
17 school in my community we're investing money to build
18 a culinary kitchen to kind of create a pipeline of
19 kids in elementary school to high school focusing on
20 food sustainability, cultural competency as well but
21 the approach has been in Peace Meal it's not
22 happening across the board in New York City and there
23 are certain communities in New York City that don't
24 have access for example to fresh food and produce and
25 it is these same school communities that historically

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 have been marginalized strictly communities of color
3 in more ways than one so when their communities are
4 lacking in certain fresh produce and food and their
5 school is lacking in, in those same types of these
6 opportunities and discussions we're just exacerbating
7 these problems and inequities in our school system. I
8 have one more follow question about my bill, a
9 separate bill and then I'll turn it to my colleagues
10 for their comments and questions. I... it's my bill
11 with regards to the studying the school time... school
12 start times, you mentioned in your testimony that
13 there are 50 schools that have start times before
14 eight a.m., is that correct?

15 LINDSEY HARR: That is what.. yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Do you know how
17 many schools have start times before 8:30 a.m.?

18 LINDSEY HARR: I think for questions on
19 this I'm going to ask my colleague Chris Tricarico to
20 come up and join us.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: We'll just swear
22 him in.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
24 hand. Do you swear to tell the truth, the whole truth
25 and nothing but the truth in your testimony today and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to respond honestly to Council Member questions?

3 Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, the question
5 was we heard in the opening statement that there are
6 50 schools that have a start time at eight a.m., is
7 that correct?

8 CHRIS TRICARICO: It's roughly 50
9 schools.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Roughly 50 schools
11 and how many schools have start time before 8:30
12 a.m.?

13 CHRIS TRICARICO: Most schools start
14 between eight and 8:20, 90 percent of the schools do,
15 we have some schools that start before eight a.m. and
16 some schools that start before 8:30 a.m., the schools
17 that we have that start before eight a.m. are the
18 schools that we engaged in a small pilot this year to
19 study the effects of students arriving to school too
20 early.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, let's say 8:20
22 a.m., do you have data on how many schools start at
23 8:20?

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHRIS TRICARICO: It's about... I don't know the exact number but the majority, 90 percent of schools start between eight and 8:20.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, the majority of our schools start between eight and 8:20... [cross-talk]

CHRIS TRICARICO: A.m., correct.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and when did you start this pilot?

CHRIS TRICARICO: We started the pilot last school year, we engaged the schools and discussed the option of them pushing back their start time to later in the day.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And have you... do you have any data with regards to what that has shown, what that has... what we've seen from that change in start time?

CHRIS TRICARICO: So, the schools that are in the pilot we've been monitoring their attendance and student lateness, we have some early anecdotal data, most of the attendance looks positive where the attendance is a little higher, student lateness has decreased, we are continuing

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 conversations with these schools and we're looking to
3 expand this pilot next year.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you for
5 proving the merits of my bill.

6 CHRIS TRICARICO: You're welcome.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Because I as
8 mentioned before taught a regents class at 7:30 in
9 the morning and that means on, on a practical level
10 for folks is that I had students that had to commute
11 across the city on an unreliable MTA system and they
12 would have to wake up at sometimes almost 4:30, five
13 o'clock in the morning to make sure that they can get
14 to class on time and that would deprive them of, of
15 quality sleep and research and, and, and.. this is a
16 committee and this is a Chair that believes in
17 science, I believe in research and the city of
18 Seattle used some more research to say that they
19 wanted to provide their students with more.. excuse
20 me, the adolescence age more time to sleep and in the
21 previous school year they moved their start time to
22 8:45 in the morning and their data is showing
23 improved attendance, decrease in lateness and better
24 student outcomes and so we really need to make sure
25 that our schedules are tailored around the needs of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

children and not around the conveniences maybe of others. Our kids have to be first and foremost when we make these, these decisions so if you're telling me 50 schools still have a start time at around eight a.m. how many children attend these schools?

CHRIS TRICARICO: I don't have that number in front of me, but it is obviously large.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: It's obviously large and I would venture to... do you know how... of these schools how many of them are, are high school, do you have that data?

CHRIS TRICARICO: The majority of the schools that start earlier than eight o'clock are middle schools and high schools.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Correct and again try teaching a regents course at seven o'clock in the morning... 7:30 in the morning, chronic lateness because of MTA delays and other, other issues and kids that do come it's... there was a lot of evidence of, of sleep deprivation and it's kind of hard to, to discuss why Peter the Great chopped off his beard to show evidence of westernization when the kids are still thinking about sleep and so I, I thank you for helping to reinforce some of the points of the bill

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

and we'll have further discussions on that piece of legislation and with that I will turn it over to my colleagues who've been very patience. Also, I just want to point out we've also been joined by Council Members Borelli and Grodenchik and the first member for questions... and we'll just put the clock up just in the interest of time because we have a very packed house here today, I think we'll, we'll, we'll do about three minutes for questions, Council Member Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Mr.

Chair for convening this hearing on such an important topic, the health of our kids is really on the line. I remember when I was in middle school I was taught that peperoni pizza was a health dish because it had all four food groups, thank goodness science has now established that healthy eating is in fact more fresh fruits and vegetables, less meats, less processed, hyper processed packaged foods, less sugar, more whole grains, more legumes, we now know what is good for our bodies and for the bodies of our young people. It is so important that as the Chair mentioned with hamburgers being served in the White House that we teach kids what true healthy diet is

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and my question for the administration is to what
3 extent are we ensuring that when, when nutrition is
4 taught in the schools that its based in science and
5 current science along the types of principles which I
6 just mentioned?

7 LINDSEY HARR: In our recommended
8 comprehensive health education curriculum nutrition
9 education is a topic and we work to ensure as do the
10 publishers of the curriculum that those lessons are
11 medically accurate, up to date, reflect the latest
12 science and promote healthy decision making around
13 food and beverages.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: So, so you, you...
15 earlier in your testimony talked about how little you
16 monitor specific lessons within health curriculum
17 with the exception of HIV/AIDS, which has a special
18 legislation mandating it that makes me worry that in
19 nutrition the... there's, there's no quality control to
20 ensure that kids are actually taught current up to
21 date science on this.

22 LINDSEY HARR: I think... in our... we
23 happily promote our recommended curriculum to
24 schools, we provide it for free to teachers who come
25 to our free trainings. The... our scope and sequence

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 that's coming out this year will provide additional
3 guidance around nutrition education and
4 recommendations for up to date lessons and other
5 curricular resources and I would also say that
6 nutrition and food education is a topic I think of,
7 of very high awareness in our schools and in our
8 community, in our school wellness council grant
9 program for instance wellness councils can come
10 together and focus on a, a wide range of wellness
11 topics, more than half of them this year have
12 specifically identified a nutrition or food education
13 related project that they want to take in... on in
14 their school so this work is not only going on in the
15 health education classroom its going on in physical
16 education, it's going on in the work that schools are
17 doing holistically.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: To what extent
19 does your office have input on the menus being served
20 in school cafeteria and to what extent can you ensure
21 us that those menus are also based on the kind of
22 science that we're laying out here?

23 LINDSEY HARR: My office provides support
24 for physical education, health education instruction,
25 I think for questions specific to school food and the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

menu I would have to ask Mr. Tricarico to come back up if that's... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Sure, so this is considered an operation question not a health question then based on, on how the chart seems to be organized.

LINDSEY HARR: I think they're both I just don't have over... I personally do not have oversight of school food.. [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: But, but... [cross-talk]

LINDSEY HARR: ...itself but we work collectively and collaboratively around wellness and, and these topics.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay, I'm, I'm curious to know who is the dietary scientist, the health expert who is offering you guidance to help determine the menus?

CHRIS TRICARICO: Well we... the Office of Food and Nutrition Services is the one that develops and puts menus in the schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: And to what extent can you ensure us then that those menus are

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

based on the kind of principles that we're laying out here?

CHRIS TRICARICO: Well the health and wellbeing of our students is a top priority, we meet or exceed the USDA standards at all school food meals, and we offer a variety of healthy and nutritious options including over 1,400 schools now have salad bars.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay, my time is up but the USDA standards are not enough, there's decades long history of the food industry distorting those standards not to the benefit of the health of kids...

[applause]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, I, I... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: So, my time is up... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...I just want to just point out I, I thank you... just for our passionate audience we have this great tradition in the council rather than clap we snap our fingers, or we can just do this cheer so thank you... thank you... [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Mr. Chair, we, we have to do much better than that and this is a subject perhaps for another hearing, but we must make sure that while we're teaching kids what healthy eating is that we're modeling it based on what we serve, that should be the highest standards of healthfulness.

CHRIS TRICARICO: We're always looking to update our menus with healthy options... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Okay. Alright, thank you. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, thank you very much. Just a note we've also been joined by Council Member King and now for questions we'll turn to Council Member Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Chair Treyger, thank you all for your testimony. I've introduced here and we're hearing resolution 716 which is calling on DOE to adopt all of the policy recommendations of the Mayor's sexual health education task force and provide comprehensive sexual education on a regular basis across all grade levels. First off do you support that resolution being that it is a mayoral task force?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

LINDSEY HARR: This administration does not comment on resolutions in hearings.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay, has the Mayor's Office or DOE had an official response to the recommendations out of the Mayor's task force?

LINDSEY HARR: So, the recommendations, the full set of recommendations which are quite extensive... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Comprehensive... [cross-talk]

LINDSEY HARR: ...and I think I should probably preface this by saying again that we really appreciate the work of the task force and the work has been incredibly important, I think has really pushed us particularly with the development of Health Ed Works so in terms of the recommendations which are quite extensive those have been under a review process, many of them are reflected in the Health Ed Works initiative and the task force is reconvening near the end of this month where we're planning to provide an update on the recommendations that are still under review.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay. So, one of the... a couple of statistics I find very concerning,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 one is that the curriculum on sexual health education
3 while its not mandated we have heard reports about
4 varying quality in terms of what's being taught in
5 schools, DOE does provide an evidence based
6 curriculum free if a teacher goes to a DOE training
7 but the rate of teachers going to sex ed training is
8 only 7.6 percent of health ed teachers or instructors
9 are receiving the professional development so that's
10 less than one in ten of those that are teaching
11 health ed are receiving the DOE curriculum for how to
12 do it, I mean does the DOE find that to be enough,
13 adequate, I'm assuming the answer is no.

14 LINDSEY HARR: The answer is no which is
15 a big part of the reason that the Mayor and the
16 Chancellor have made this investment in Health Ed
17 Works with a focus on significantly increasing
18 professional learning and also other instructional
19 support for teachers doing one on one instructional
20 coaching, ensuring that more teachers have access to
21 more training and providing more curriculum materials
22 and resources for teachers.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Has the DOE
24 considered whether to apply this... the intendance of,
25 of this curriculum towards a principal's accounting

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 metric or... so... where the principals are... another
3 words one of the concerns that we have is that
4 principals are not sending teachers because it means
5 a teacher is taking a professional day, principals
6 are not incentivized to have teachers attend this
7 curriculum, what is the DOE doing to incentivize
8 principals to send their teachers to receive this
9 professional development curriculum?

10 LINDSEY HARR: So, so, one of the things
11 that we're doing through Health Ed Works is that we
12 are providing schools within that group of, of 500
13 schools with per diem coverage as well as procession
14 to help make it easier for teachers to go to training
15 so we're helping schools provide coverage for those
16 days or that time that a teacher is out of the
17 building to go to a training. We're also working
18 closely with principals to help them understand what
19 comprehensive health and sex ed are and why
20 professional learning and ongoing professional
21 learning is so... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Uh-huh... [cross-
23 talk]

24 LINDSEY HARR: ...important in terms of the
25 quality that's being provided to students.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Okay because that
3 7.6 percent number is, you know so woefully
4 inadequate it's... I mean there's, there's no way
5 anybody could stand by that and obviously that number
6 should be 100 percent so, long way to go there and I
7 would hope that we can in the coming months see that
8 metric continue to go up in the right direction
9 because I know things, things can move in the right
10 direction with the appropriate actions by DOE, DOE is
11 the only one that can do this, we can't mandate that
12 you do it so we really need DOE to, to step up to the
13 plate and provide the right incentives or mandates to
14 make sure that that number is, is, is commensurate
15 with the, the seriousness of the issue. Thanks.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very
17 much, just to note we've also been joined by Council
18 Member Barron and next I'll turn it over to my
19 colleague who also has a bill being... that's being
20 considered here today, Council Member Salamanca.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you
22 Chair Treyger. Before I begin with my questions, I
23 just want to give a big shout out to wellness in
24 schools. We were at PS 93 a few weeks ago where the...
25 I was with the Universal Pre-K kids and they made

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 hummus, which was really cool, the kids and the chef
3 and I saw firsthand how these chefs work with the
4 school cafeteria cooks on integrating healthy options
5 and fresh products into the student's meals so
6 congratulations and I'm a supporter of your program.
7 First I would like to thank you for being here, I, I...
8 my, my bill is Intro 365 which will require Naloxone
9 in all public schools, you know I introduced this
10 bill in August of 2017 and... which again will require
11 that DH... DOE to stock opioid antagonists such as
12 Naloxone and Narcan in DOE facilities and just three
13 months after I introduced that bill on November 30th
14 of 2017 a teacher in my district at PS 811, X 811
15 Mathew Azimi he overdosed in a school bathroom at the
16 end of the school day and he was just 36 years old,
17 could we have saved his life should we had Narcan in
18 that school, maybe, I don't know but it's just an
19 example of what we could have done if we did have
20 Narcan there. I noticed that in your statement it
21 says that it is also important to note that there has
22 not been a known overdose of a student in a school,
23 so my question is, in the last five years how many
24 overdoses has there been in public-school building or
25 surroundings other than a student?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

ROGER PLATT: Good afternoon, I'm Dr.

Roger Platt, the Director of School Health in New York City. We look very carefully at the issue of Naloxone and in doing so we not only look internally but we consult very closely with the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene that is responsible for helping us with policy on health-related issues including substance abuse of all kinds. In answer to your specific question we are not aware of any death in a student in a school, we track what's in a school, we use our data bases to... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I, I

understand that, not in a school, I, I have limited time, how... what about adults, what about parents, teachers, I just gave you an example of a teacher, volunteers in its surroundings outside of the school, do you track that?

ROGER PLATT: We don't track data outside the school building, we would be aware of any incident within the school building.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Do you track if the student gets hurt in front of a school?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

ROGER PLATT: I'd have to get back to you about exactly what the reporting requirements are for that for principals, I can't answer that.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Mr. Chair can I have a few more minutes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes...

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you. How many DOE schools have a substance abuse prevention and intervention specialist on site?

ROGER PLATT: Yes, I'm going to ask Mr. Thomas to answer that question.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right hand. Do you swear to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony today and to respond honestly to Council Member questions?

MARION THOMAS: I will.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

MARION THOMAS: Yes, good afternoon, my name is Marion Thomas and I'm the Senior Project Manager for Substance Abuse Prevention in the schools, we currently have 275 assigned SAPIS in schools, many of them cover more than one school so actually around 350 schools have coverage but

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

specifically 275 substance abuse prevention
intervention specialists.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: How many
public schools do we have in the city of New York?

MARION THOMAS: I believe it's 1,800.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, we have
1,800 public schools and you're telling me that its
efficient to have 275 substance abuse prevention
intervention specialists so therefore Narcan won't be
needed because you have 275 individuals to cover
1,800 schools?

MARION THOMAS: Well what, what we do is
with those specialists our focus is on prevention so
what I... what I do... you asked a question about the
surroundings to the school any, any fatalities we
provide a lot of workshops and, and trainings for
parents and for school staff and we've partnered with
coalitions as well as treatments agencies to come in
and do workshops for parents so that they're aware of
resources that are available for what you say in
terms of where Narcan can be available so we, we
provide parents and staff with the information that
they need in order to get help if there.. if there's
an incident of.. [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: You're

3 providing them with information but you don't have it
4 on site to help if someone were to overdose, you know
5 in the city of New York overdoses that have resulted
6 in death continue to rise, 2016 there were 1,374
7 overdose... unintentional overdose, drug overdoses and
8 in 2017 there were 1,441 of overdoses and in the
9 Bronx we have the highest rate of overdoses than in
10 any of the five boroughs and what's most troubling is
11 that, you know there's a report from the American
12 Society of Addiction Medicine it reports that 276,000
13 adolescences between the ages of 12 and 17 were
14 currently on non-medical... were non-medical users of
15 pain relievers and 120,000 teenagers have an
16 addiction to a prescribed pain reliever. I don't
17 think it's too much to ask just like every school is
18 required to have a defibrillator on site that every
19 school right next to the defibrillator they have
20 Narcan where you can train every individual in the
21 school, it's no more than a half hour training and
22 it's something that can save a life.

23 MARION THOMAS: Well we're, we're

24 committed to really getting information to families
25 to, to save those lives, again we're, we're providing

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

the information through workshops, through community meetings and we're committing to, to continue to do that.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Now my, my other question and I'm going to wrap up here Mr. Chair, out of the 1,800 schools that we have in the city, public schools that we have in the city of New York how many of these schools have an onsite nurse, have a nurse on site that is there during school hours not rotating but in, in the school?

MARION THOMAS: Virtually all of our schools, about 97 percent have either a nurse on site or have a school-based health center.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, 97 percent of the schools in the city of New York have someone... you have a register... you have a nurse... [cross-talk]

MARION THOMAS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: ...or you have a school-based center that's on... [cross-talk]

MARION THOMAS: That's correct... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: ...site, okay. Alright with that I thank you Mr. Chair.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Is that five days a week nurse or that's someone that's... [cross-talk]

MARION THOMAS: That's a five day a week nurse.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright. Alright. Next, we'll turn to Council Member... actually we've also just been joined by very quickly by Council Member Rodriguez and Council Member Dromm and next for questions Council Member Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so much to the Chair. Let me just make a comment regarding what my colleagues said and then I'll get into my resolution really quickly. SAPIS, I'm a former SAPIS, I actually had an opportunity to work with Mr. Thomas and it's good to see you here today... [cross-talk]

MARION THOMAS: It's good to see you too Councilman... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...working different schools in the Bronx, it's a joy to see you here... [cross-talk]

MARION THOMAS: Good to see you... [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: But SAPIS are not trained to deal with an overdose, I mean that's not their job so the justification that I, I read here makes absolutely no sense that since we have SAPIS therefore we shouldn't have opioid antagonist in the schools, so I just don't see the correlation there but I just wanted to give that thought because I got a limited amount of time... [cross-talk]

MARION THOMAS: I, I just want to say we're... it's there because we're working... we're aware of the, the issue around opioids and we're getting the word out, we're giving the information, we're getting awareness out so we're really putting it out there that's... we're not just sitting back on this.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I hear you and you guys are the best, there's nobody doing the job better than what you do but you're good about, about what you do, do and what you've been trained to do, you haven't been trained to deal with this so I, I take, you know opposition to the fact that they're making it sound like since there were... you have SAPIS workers there that they're able to deal with an overdose case and all it takes is the first one to happen and then we'll be coming back over here and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 they'll say oh, oh Council Member Salamanca your bill
3 is a good idea so let me get into asking regarding
4 processed foods, what kind of processed food... meats
5 actually are we serving in public schools now a days?

6 CHRIS TRICARICO: Good afternoon again.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Good afternoon
8 sir.

9 CHRIS TRICARICO: The health and
10 wellbeing of our students is our top priority, we
11 provide a variety of healthy and nutritious options
12 and our food is safe to eat, the only processed meats
13 we have on the menu are deli meats and premade
14 sandwiches and we're currently working with our
15 vendors to add healthy options to our menu.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So, you know
17 you're, you're full aware that these meats have been
18 found to cause cancer, heart diseases, diabetes and
19 other illnesses and the world health organization,
20 we're talking about the best has classified processed
21 meats as a group I carcinogen for humans so I'm
22 curious why we're sell... why are we offering this to
23 children when the world health organization has
24 classified them as a... as a group I carcinogen for
25 humans especially for the little ones who have less

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 of an ability to process these types of foods, can we
3 just ban the bologna? Let's just get rid of it, it
4 makes no sense, you have a school right now that
5 deserves a five star recommendation right now where
6 they're plant based just solely plant based and
7 they're doing... those students since the start of the
8 plant base they're doing better in school, we know
9 what works, why, why are we offering this, I'm, I'm
10 just really curious to hear the answer.

11 CHRIS TRICARICO: Well we meet and... or
12 exceed the USDA standards in all our food, our food
13 is... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I hear you...
15 [cross-talk]

16 CHRIS TRICARICO: ...safe, the premade
17 sandwiches are an option on the menu they are not the
18 only option for students to take... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: But you know
20 that the kids are going to go after them because
21 those meats are made... the way that they're made is to
22 get kids addicted to them, you know that and you know
23 that the research that just came out last year, two
24 different research that came out it clearly states
25 that the chances of getting a heart attack increases

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 by 50 percent if you just eat the stuff twice a week,
3 I know I had 99 percent of my widow maker artery
4 blocked for eating this stuff and I'll tell you it
5 was a scary... I'm smiling right now because I'm alive,
6 but it was a horrible experience and it starts when
7 the... where the... I'm, I'm still a baffled why are we
8 offering something that the world hurt... health
9 organization has clearly said that is a level... we're
10 talking about a group I carcinogen for humans
11 especially when it comes to little kids, please for
12 the love of these little children get rid of it, you
13 know it... they, they eat enough of that stuff outside,
14 we know what works, let's catch up with the data and
15 the research is already out there and I'll tell you
16 we'll be glad and you will be praised for it, you
17 know by... later on, the next generation you will leave
18 a... your legacy, thank you so much Mr. Chair and thank
19 you for the extra time.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you and just
21 before, before you leave with regards to the school
22 food, did you see the picture of 45 with the, the big
23 mac feast at the table... [cross-talk]

24 CHRIS TRICARICO: Yes, I did.
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: You did. I'm not sure if this is the time for us to be boasting that we're meeting USDA standards when quite frankly we have a lot of work to do at the federal level and as I pointed out before when you look at the federal guidelines and, and the state mandates they're insufficient and I'm just curious, I, I think you mentioned the director of school health is a doctor and I, I take it that you're familiar with some of these federal and state mandates with regards to health education and nutrition, would you agree with me that they are insufficient and outdated?

ROGER PLATT: Well I haven't reviewed them recently, I'd like an opportunity to do that, but I think your general comment about the federal government is one I would agree with.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and so I would just point out that nothing prohibits us from going beyond what they're saying the, the base level is. What they're giving us is the floor it's not the ceiling and so nothing stops us or prevents us from going well above and beyond what this president is, is almost boasting about at, at the White House so I just want to point that out. We've also been joined

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 by Council Member Kallos and next for questions
3 Council Member Lander.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very
5 much Mr. Chair and I really want to in part just join
6 my comments to what have been said by prior
7 colleagues here on this critical topic and you know
8 we appreciate the distance that the DOE has traveled
9 because there has been real progress but there is so
10 much further to go for real bold leadership and the
11 difference it will make in the health of New York
12 City as well as to sustainability is just enormous
13 and so, you know I just like taking... these... you just
14 can't take the federal government seriously on
15 sustainability or on health issues, we know where we
16 need to get and we could be so much bolder and we
17 look back a few years from now we will really be glad
18 if we did and we didn't we'll think we were behind
19 the curve and I think that's the whole turn of this
20 hearing and I say that as a family who's health and
21 eating has been dramatically affected by the health
22 and wellness programs of New York City schools, I'm
23 lucky to have a, a kid who went to a wellness in the
24 schools, elementary school but it wasn't until last
25 year as a freshman at a New York City public high

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 school that as a result of her health curriculum
3 being delivered in her advisory she came home and
4 said you know what, I'm going to stop eating meat and
5 she said you know the teacher actually presented it
6 really... it was not a teacher who was a vegetarian so
7 she was not proselytizing but she presented the
8 science and the facts and my daughter who maybe had
9 been prepared by her wits curriculum at an earlier
10 stage decided to stop eating meat and of course that
11 has affected our whole family as a result of my not
12 cooking meat for her I have stopped eating meat so
13 you guys get credit for that too, I still eat fish,
14 I'm a pescatarian, she calls herself a flexitarian
15 because she can't give up smoked salmon which I'm
16 also grateful for so... but like you've changed my
17 families eating habits through New York City
18 education and that could be happening for... I think
19 that's happening for maybe hundreds or thousands of
20 families, it could be happening for millions of
21 families so I just think we really want to push the
22 envelope further and I guess my... the question I just
23 want to ask is this in addition to just adding my
24 voice to like let's be bold, is about how we
25 integrate different parts of our wellness program

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 here because... and I get that you got a big system so
3 it is not easy to put together what's being taught
4 because it's critical to do in the curriculum, what's
5 happening in the cafeteria, what's happening in
6 school gardens where there's amazing garden programs
7 and what's happening in physical education but
8 obviously what we would like to have is something
9 which while standards in science based and mandated
10 in as many ways as possible and integrated with the
11 menu obviously our kids will learn so much more if it
12 can be connected so it's not just what they're
13 getting in a classroom its that they're connecting to
14 how the food is being prepared and whet they're
15 eating, they're seeing it in their gardens, they're
16 understanding it as part of their health curriculum
17 and if we could do that we really would just... like we
18 could have transformative impact on what the future
19 health of our city looks like so can you just talk
20 about how we're trying to achieve that integration
21 across all these different parts of the school's
22 health and wellness system?

23 LINDSEY HARR: So, I want to thank you
24 for sharing that story, it's great to hear... it's
25 great to hear about the power of education

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 particularly around health and wellness. I think... you
3 asked a, a big question and I think it's a... it's an
4 important so one thing that I... that I think may be
5 helpful in responding to your question is to talk
6 about our work around school wellness councils
7 because I think you're exactly right that it's not
8 just... it's not only about having nutrition education
9 in a classroom, it's not only about what's served in
10 the cafeteria but how do we integrate these things
11 and how do we help our schools become places that
12 comprehensively and holistically not just promote
13 wellness but really model it throughout the school
14 building and the school community and I think some of
15 our work with school wellness councils is really
16 exciting in this way because school wellness councils
17 are structured within the school that brings together
18 educators, school staff, folks from school food,
19 sometimes nurses, students, members of community
20 based organizations and others to really focus on an
21 area of wellness priority for that school. Many of
22 our schools as I've noted do focus on nutrition and
23 food education and integrate that in really
24 interesting ways, you know working on creating a
25 school garden and then matching that with cooking

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 classes and then students are making healthy snacks
3 from the food in the garden that they've learned
4 about that's then available to other students
5 throughout the school so I think that can be... that's
6 one example of the way that we're really looking to
7 try to integrate this and you're also right that
8 there is... we have a, a long way to go and a lot more
9 work to do to ensure that, that that kind of culture
10 and integration is in place in every one of our
11 schools and that's what we're committed to doing.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Mr.
13 Chair and then just... I'll just add by noting it
14 occurs to me given that answer it might be worth
15 looking at these bills and thinking about if we're
16 going to get a report that we get a report that
17 brings together the different domains we're talking
18 about like what's... [cross-talk]

19 CHRIS TRICARICO: Right... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...being covered in
21 the curriculum, you know Intro... the... whichever one it
22 is, 1283 but where there's a WITS program, where
23 there's a school garden, where there's a wellness
24 council that we get a, you know a report that's
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

really as comprehensive as it can be on the totality of the health and wellness work that's taking place.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and just to... just to ask and thank you for... my colleague for those powerful... sharing that powerful story and, and your advocacy, the school that you were talking about is in your district, is... that talked about the teacher... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: The elementary school with WITS was PS 107 that's in my district, my... her high school she goes to Bard Manhattan which is in... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Excellent... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: ...Council Member Rivera's district.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Excellent and, and I just... I just point out again that the example that we gave before is that these are great things, I agree but they're happening in Peace Meal, it's not happening across the board, across every community but we applaud the Council Members leadership in his district and he's shown great leadership on, on this issue and... but we need these types of programs

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 beyond, you know Park Slope, Brooklyn Heights or
3 parts of Bensonhurst, we need them across the five
4 boroughs, across every neighborhood whether it... where
5 you're in Brownsville, whether you're in South Bronx,
6 whether you're in Southeast Queens, everywhere
7 because these are communities that historically have
8 been marginalized in more ways than one and so again
9 we need it across the board, each school, each
10 community regardless of your zip code. Thank you very
11 much again to my colleague. Next, we'll hear from
12 Council Member Borelli.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you to the
14 Chair. I just want to speak more about Council Member
15 Menchaca's Intro Number 560 and continue sort of the
16 line of questioning that he was giving, just start
17 out by saying I, I don't... I don't necessarily... or
18 rather I didn't necessarily start out in politics
19 hoping to be a co-sponsor of a bill to require
20 Naloxone in public schools but nonetheless here we
21 are, and I would urge the majority of the members of
22 the Council to also become co-sponsors of the bill.
23 You said that there were no deaths in New York City
24 public schools regarding... with, with respect to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 overdoses, how often does the New York City DOE
3 declare someone dead on site?

4 ROGER PLATT: Well the New York City DOE
5 doesn't declare anybody dead but if you're asking how
6 many people have been declared dead in schools, I'll
7 have to get back to you with that. In general, what
8 happens when somebody is critically ill is 9-1-1 is
9 called and the individual is transported... [cross-
10 talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Right that's,
12 that's my next question... [cross-talk]

13 ROGER PLATT: ...out... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: How many times
15 was EMS called to a school with conditions that later
16 proved to be an overdose, is there a way... frankly
17 with HIPAA laws would you even know that?

18 ROGER PLATT: To the best of my knowledge
19 the answer to that is zero.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Okay, so despite
21 some newspaper reports and, and things you don't
22 think that there was ever a child who was... an
23 ambulance was called in a public school... [cross-talk]

24 ROGER PLATT: For a narcotics overdose...
25 [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: ...for, for
3 narcotics use and overdose?

4 ROGER PLATT: Not to... not to our
5 knowledge.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Is there an
7 outright ban on teachers and administrators carrying
8 Naloxone in... [cross-talk]

9 ROGER PLATT: No... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: ...schools... do you
11 know of any incidences where a teacher who happened
12 to be carrying it outside of the official scope of
13 DOE policy used Naloxone?

14 ROGER PLATT: I am... I do not, no.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: What is the
16 protocol for a suspected overdose in, in a school?

17 ROGER PLATT: Well the, the, the general
18 protocol when you have a... somebody who's unconscious
19 or seems to be seriously ill is to call 9-1-1
20 immediately.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Just a rule of
22 thumb do you... do you know what EMS does when they
23 come upon a suspected overdose when they arrive?

24 ROGER PLATT: Well I, I think you should
25 ask EMS exactly what their protocols are but

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

obviously as a physician I will tell you that the first thing you want to do is to identify any life-threatening reversible situations and treat those.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: So, a lot of times they administer Naloxone and the FDNY just instituted a new policy of leaving kits with families and individuals who were revived using that particular drug, just wouldn't it by a rule of thumb though be better than if an administrator on site had a possible life saving drug that has no known negative side effects or impacts or poses any danger to the person, another words you can inject someone you suspect of having an overdose with no bad ramifications, isn't that good?

ROGER PLATT: Well I think... we, we have based our decisions so far on whether there have been incidences in the school and that, that has been the, the decision to date is that we really have not had an issue and therefore a city-wide program is not justified.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much, next we'll hear from Council Member Barron.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you to the

3 Chair and thank you to the panel for coming and I

4 particularly want to talk to you about a Reso that I

5 have introduced, its Reso 632 which talks about a

6 diabetes and pre-diabetes curriculum in our schools,

7 have you had an opportunity to read that? Okay, so we

8 know that diabetes is a major chronic condition and

9 that there are many causes or many conditions that

10 lead to people developing diabetes so what we want to

11 know is in terms of the health start program that

12 you're offering it starts in middle grades so don't

13 you think and it says in your... in your description

14 that only one of the lessons or an examination of the

15 health start curriculum shows that only one of the 99

16 lessons covers disease prevention and includes both

17 infectious and non-infectious diseases and that

18 diabetes is only mentioned as an example of non-

19 infectious chronic disease. Do you think that that's

20 adequate, do you think that fifth grade is the

21 appropriate grade to start to talk about eating

22 habits and talking about the dangers of having too

23 much sugar in the blood and don't you think that the

24 earlier we can get children to understand that the

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

eating habits that they are forming in those early, early years has a great impact on going forward?

LINDSEY HARR: I absolutely agree that teaching students from a very young age about healthy eating and physical activity and the impact on their health is incredibly important. One of... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Very good then that means you're going to be supportive of the resolution... [cross-talk]

LINDSEY HARR: We are very happy... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...solves that all... [cross-talk]

LINDSEY HARR: ...to talk with you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...we can move forward... [cross-talk]

LINDSEY HARR: ...about it.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, I'm sorry, go ahead.

LINDSEY HARR: One point of clarification that I wanted to make is that health smart is our recommended... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Exactly, it's not
3 even... [cross-talk]

4 LINDSEY HARR: ...you know and... [cross-
5 talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...required.

7 LINDSEY HARR: Yes, I... the point I just
8 wanted to make though is that the health smart
9 curriculum is recommended for middle and high school,
10 we have a different curriculum that's not health
11 smart that is recommended for elementary schools so
12 we do have training and curriculum and guidance
13 around nutrition education and physical activity
14 education in the elementary level... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right but
16 particularly talking about diabetes and pre-diabetes
17 and the fact that it is so prevalent particularly in
18 the black community and all of the health concerns
19 that result from people developing diabetes which in
20 many cases is reversible when you know what to do or
21 even preventable so I think that it needs to be
22 targeted more than... about ten percent of the United
23 States population is diabetic or pre-diabetic and
24 perhaps had we been more expansive in getting the
25 information, now you're beginning to see commercials

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 that say there's what, 18 teaspoons of sugar in a
3 soda but people perhaps still don't need to... still
4 don't understand the impact of that excessive sugar
5 in their lives; the heart conditions that develop,
6 the damage to kidneys, eyes, the liver, the hearing
7 leading to Alzheimer's diseases so I think that
8 because the... because the impact is so far reaching
9 that it's really an issue that needs to be singled
10 out and addressed in the curriculum that's introduced
11 beginning in Pre-Kindergarten or Pre-K or 3-K
12 whenever so that we don't have these kinds of
13 situations and we look forward to your endorsing the
14 Reso so that we'll know that we'll have it in our
15 curriculum.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: No objection Mr.
18 Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I'll tell you
20 Council Member Barron you are an effective
21 legislator, I, I have to... so fast to get endorsements
22 on, on bills, such... to your credit.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: But I look
24 forward to getting your support on this Reso.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and just to kind of piggy back off of that and just, you know return to my colleagues if... just if... just to paint the public a picture at the previous hearing that, that I believe you attended and which I appreciate we, we learned that over 200,000 students in our school system are not receiving the mandated physical education classes which they're required to under state regulations and mandates most of which in, in the elementary school grades, here we're learning that the majority of our students are not receiving required, adequate nutrition health education courses, look at the picture we're painting for our city, we're saying health and wellness is important but yet we're just not providing children with those opportunities in, in education that's, that's, that's a big problem for me. Next, we'll... also we, we've just been joined by Council Member Brannan and next we'll hear from Council Member Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you Mr. Chairman, good afternoon everybody, glad we can all snap together here. I want to associate myself first and foremost, I'm sorry I, I missed the beginning of the hearing, I was at Chair Eugene's hearing where we

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 introduced a resolution on the holocaust today but I
3 did want to add my voice and once my Council says
4 it's okay, I hope to add myself to Intro 365,
5 certainly we should have Naloxone in every New York
6 City public school, hopefully it will never be used
7 but it should be there. The other thing that I want
8 to talk about is Intro 560, I represent Eastern
9 Queens in the New York City Council, good to see you
10 Mr. Conyers. Martin Van Buren High School which is my
11 only renewal school which has had a magnificent turn
12 around under principal Sam Sochet, we've gone from a
13 45 percent graduation rate six years ago to nearly 80
14 percent this year and I'm hopeful it will continue to
15 rise of course. Many of the children there live in
16 far off communities not like in Westchester or New
17 Jersey but in Far Rockaway and other parts of New
18 York City and given that we live in a death valley of
19 transit, mass transit deserts in Eastern Queens which
20 is not the Department of Education's fault but I am
21 concerned about the time that a young person has to
22 get there by eight o'clock, I don't get up that early
23 to be honest with you, some days I do but it is a
24 long way to go to keep children motivated at that
25 hour of the day. So, Mr. Chairman I am hopeful that

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we will be able to move this bill to take a look at
3 this because to get from Far Rockaway to Eastern
4 Queens by bus is probably several buses, you got to
5 leave your house to be safe so that you're not late
6 to your first class by 6:30 in the morning and if you
7 live in one of the far reaching corners of the city
8 of New York it's not how long it takes you to get
9 somewhere but how much time you have to leave so that
10 you're not late. So, these kids are probably early
11 many days like I am usually here because I allow
12 myself an hour and a half to get here to City Hall,
13 it's... we also don't have any specialized high schools
14 in Eastern Queens so my children that are going to
15 those schools whether they're Brooklyn Tech or Bronx
16 Science or Stuyvesant are allowing two hours to get
17 to school and it's just not fair to young people. I
18 did want to ask you since we have, and this is really
19 some title here but the Office of School Wellness
20 Programs within the Division of School Climate and
21 Wellness, wow that's a lot, how about reintroducing..
22 I know we've done it in some schools, cooking in
23 schools, we used to.. I like that, good, keep
24 snapping. I'm old enough to be a graduate of Jamaica
25 High School along with others such as Leroy Comrie,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 State Senator Comrie, State Assemblyman David Weprin,
3 former Councilman... that's not for me right Mr.
4 Chairman... four... but I'd like to hear from, from our
5 experts here on how we can introduce more fresh
6 foods, we... if we could do it in the 1970's when I was
7 in junior high school and high school why can't we do
8 it as we're approaching the end of the first fifth of
9 the 21st century just it bothers me when I see all
10 the prepackaged foods that come in every single day,
11 I'd much rather be seeing healthy fruits and
12 vegetables being cooked, my Council's mother cooked,
13 her... his father was in... a school lunch aid, we can do
14 this in New York City so I'd like to hear what you
15 have to say about that.

16 CHRIS TRICARICO: Good afternoon again.

17 I'd like to remind everyone and I mentioned it before
18 that we do have 1,400 schools with salad bars which
19 are fresh produce available every single day, we also
20 through the Office of Food and Nutrition Services and
21 under this Chancellor have now begun a pilot at the
22 Morris campus in, in the Bronx where it's complete
23 scratch cooking, we're cooking everything from
24 scratch, we're looking to expand that. We're in
25 discussion now, we're looking forward to having more

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 schools participate in that pilot, we should have
3 more results from what it looks like in the
4 participation as we continue into the school year, we
5 are looking forward to putting more... putting more
6 scratch kitchens in our schools as well as continuing
7 the salad bars.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I would love
9 to see that, I'll volunteer one of my schools and I
10 even have a farm in my district so we can go right
11 from the Queens County Farm museum right to a school.
12 Thank you very much Mr. Chairman and thank you for
13 your answers today.

14 CHRIS TRICARICO: I'd also like to let
15 you know I'm... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Yes... [cross-
17 talk]

18 CHRIS TRICARICO: ...a graduate of Martin
19 Van Buren.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: And two Nobel
21 prize winners from that school, not bad for New York
22 City public school that's just a... you know just a
23 neighborhood school, thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Next we will hear
25 from Council Member King.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Good afternoon and thank you again for always coming and giving us education Mr. Chair, thank you. I got to ask you a question, I'm going to go personal, how many of you have children or grandchildren or nephews or nieces or neighbors who have children, okay, there we go, alright... [cross-talk]

LINDSEY HARR: And nephews and nieces, sorry about...

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: You know about 100 years ago there was a part of American society who would have to eat pig intestines to survive, possums, squirrels just to make ends meet on the plate to feed their children, I'm trying to understand.. you know you could take your foot and put some butter sauce and some... and it would taste good but that doesn't necessarily mean that we're supposed to eat it so I'm trying to figure out how have we gotten from 100 years ago to 2019 that we're still feed, feeding our children feet with salt and butter sauce on it because basically I'm in the schools and the number one thing that children hate is lunch time, they try to do everything else, they try to run out of schools get to the bodegas, they try to do everything else

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 other than eat what's being served at lunch time,
3 something is wrong with that because if we're
4 committed to saying that our children meet education...
5 we... our children need to be healthy then for all of
6 us who have neighbors who have children,
7 grandchildren if we wouldn't feed it to our house we
8 shouldn't feed it to anybody else's house and I'm
9 asking you all, this legislation is all about taking
10 care of our children, the resolutions, I'm asking you
11 as the adults in the room to do the right thing by
12 our children not figuring out how to protect the
13 system because the system is about dollars and cents
14 but at the end of the day our children won't be
15 around to count anybody's dollars and cents if we
16 don't give them the food in their body to help them
17 think and be smart and be better so I'm asking you
18 when it comes to processed food if you got an example
19 then that's got to be the norm, we can't talk about
20 it's a pilot. If we're going to start a pilot then
21 there should have been a pilot starting at 20 schools
22 at one time, now we know that it really works because
23 you know if you're used to eating fresh fruits and
24 you like a piece of fish our children would love so
25 too. So, as Cabrera was saying can we just get rid of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

the bologna, let's get rid of the bologna and talk through here and help our children out. If we can get your commitment today on anything it's a good thing because if you're agreeing that our children need better health conditions to... better food then it's okay to say yes, don't worry about us not liking you because we already love you, if you can say yes that's okay and I know for one thing if it takes me an hour and a half to get to City Hall I know I'd be twisted as a 13 year old if it takes me that long to get to school and the start of the day and have to... and have to learn fractions so I'm asking you all on behalf of the children of the city... who go to city schools please make a decision just to do the right thing and don't worry, worry about the economic cost. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Council

Member King, next we will hear from Council Member Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very

much, it's good to be back at an Education Committee hearing, thanks Miss Harr for coming in and it's good to see you again. My question has to do with sexual health education. So, recently I read in the New York

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Post that the 2017 youth risk behavior survey
3 actually showed that only 75 percent of students or
4 that they surveyed identify as, as cisgender, the
5 other 25 percent fall somewhere in the spectrum of
6 being LGBT plus and I thought those numbers were,
7 were, were fascinating, it seems that more and more
8 students are coming out as lesbian, gay, bisexual,
9 transgender, intersex or being gender fluid or having
10 you know different gender identities. So, my
11 questions really are about the, the sex education
12 courses that you're teaching. How is that going and
13 how are you addressing those issues specific for
14 those students?

15 LINDSEY HARR: Yeah, thanks for that
16 question and thank you also for your leadership on
17 this issue for many, many years. I think within
18 sexual health education helping children at all ages
19 in an age appropriate way learn about gender
20 identity, sexual orientation is, is critical as is
21 helping our teachers in our schools create health
22 education classrooms that are inclusive for all of
23 our students so this is reflected in our health
24 education and sexual health education work in a
25 number of different ways. In our recommended

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 curriculum which I think we've spoken about before
3 there are... the lessons are designed to be inclusive,
4 we have a, a whole section of the recommended
5 curriculum called understanding self-identity, we
6 have professional learning for our teachers to help
7 them understand how to create inclusive and affirming
8 classrooms for all of our students, we have our out
9 first safe school's badges program which I'm happy to
10 report is, is going strong and I think through the
11 Health Ed Works initiative we are looking to expand
12 and to build upon the work to date and to expand it
13 significantly and to help our schools expand that
14 work as well in combination with working with many of
15 our great partners in the city who work in this area.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, are you
17 tracking that and are you doing any data collection
18 on the number of LGBT plus students in the system? I
19 know... I passed legislation in 2016 requiring the DOE
20 and other agencies to begin to collect that and I
21 don't know if that's trickled down to you or if
22 you're aware of that because I think that information
23 will help to drive some of your instruction when you
24 know how many LGBT plus students there are... that are
25 willing to self-identify like that.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

LINDSEY HARR: I am aware of the legislation, I am not aware of where we stand with that, so I think... I can check and get back to you, but I think to your larger point that, yes, critically important and we want to make sure that all of our teachers and principals and school community members are prepared to really support our young people.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, just I would like to just say that when we... when you come back for the budget hearings, I'm definitely going to be looking for numbers particularly as it relates to LGBT students, how many you have tracked and where they are. Thank you.

LINDSEY HARR: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank, thank you Council Member and next we'll hear from Council Member Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Hi, can Christopher please join the stand. Christopher how many schools currently serves... have salad bars?

CHRIS TRICARICO: Schools with salad approximately 1,400.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Would you believe me if I said that I don't believe that that is the honest answer that I believe the honest answer is 627 school sites based on a local law report that we received from DOE Local Law 215 of 2017 that I authored?

CHRIS TRICARICO: I'm not sure about that report.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I, I just need to know are you telling the truth or did the DOE not tell the truth in its Local Law 2015 report about salad bars?

CHRIS TRICARICO: The information that I have today is 1,400.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay and... I, I have concerns about the fact that I have gone to schools in my district and I have not found salad bars in every single school, I've also found varying qualities, have you ever had occasion to go to a salad bar to find... not, not find any fresh produce but instead find items that came from a can?

CHRIS TRICARICO: I don't recall seeing items that have come from a can, I do recall seeing salad on the menu as well as... [cross-talk]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So, you have
3 never seen canned items in a salad bar?

4 CHRIS TRICARICO: I'm not sure how to
5 answer that question...

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Yes or no, do you
7 serve canned or do you serve fresh produce?

8 CHRIS TRICARICO: Fresh produce and I
9 believe some of the vegetables come out of a can.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay, do you... do
11 you believe that fresh produce might have... be
12 superior to canned produce?

13 CHRIS TRICARICO: Fresh produce is
14 superior to canned produce.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you, we
16 agree, can we set a goal of not serving children
17 canned produce when we can have it available in fresh
18 produce?

19 CHRIS TRICARICO: We will work with our
20 vendors to make sure we provide the healthies option
21 for our students.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: In the Local Law
23 215 report you only listed four items that are
24 canned, and I've personally seen canned corn in salad
25 bars and at schools and so I have serious questions

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 about that report. My next question, does every
3 single public school in the city of New York in their
4 health education have a curriculum that includes LGBT
5 curriculum?

6 LINDSEY HARR: DOE doesn't centrally
7 track curriculum in every school but in our
8 recommended curriculum which is what we recommend and
9 provide to teachers who come to training, yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Do you think it
11 is important that children... so, okay if a school
12 doesn't follow the recommendation, recommendation
13 that you're providing is the default a
14 heteronormative sex education?

15 LINDSEY HARR: Not based on our... on the
16 standards and guidance, no.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So, the materials
18 you've provided to every school in the city of New
19 York is going to include not only intercourse but
20 between male and female but intercourse between male
21 and male, female and female, transgender?

22 LINDSEY HARR: We don't provide
23 curriculum to every school in the city, DOE policy
24 allows for schools to develop or to choose their own
25 curriculum as long as it meets standards, so part of

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

our work is to help principals and teachers understand what those standards are and what quality inclusive affirming health education is for students.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Do you believe that DOE should have a stronger role in mandating that every single school include a health education that includes different sexual identifies and different gender identities and that it shouldn't be more than just a recommendation, it should actually be mandated, and do you have that power?

LINDSEY HARR: This is part of the work that we're doing through the Health Ed Works initiative to really focus intensively and in a much deeper way with schools across our city on the quality of their health education and their sexual health education in middle and high school.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I'm, I'm going to conclude with this remark which is and I thank Chair Treyger for indulging me here, last term we had a hearing on bullying led by Chair Dromm around children being bullied because of their gender and sexual identity as a result we had a group of children come to both of us around forming gender sexuality alliances in their schools, we passed that

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 legislation, there's now training for teachers,
3 there's supposed to be a list of the GSAs throughout
4 the city, we'd like that information as soon as
5 possible but during that conversation we learned from
6 the children that the reason they wanted these GSAs
7 is so that they could teach each other about their
8 sexual identities and their gender identities because
9 they weren't getting at their school and thank, thank
10 god for tenure and a principal with courage but we
11 came to the DOE and said we need to have this LGBT
12 sexual health education, we went to the PTA, they
13 were supportive and the school in my district as far
14 as DOE is telling me is the first school in the city
15 of New York that's doing it and they're working on
16 this curriculum this year for this school year in
17 2019... 2018/2019 so can you correct me if I'm wrong or
18 are we really sitting here 2018/2019 school year
19 where we're for the first time looking at a middle
20 school that actually has a LGBT health curriculum?

21 LINDSEY HARR: I'm, I'm... can you repeat
22 the last part of your question?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Are there any
24 schools before 2018/2019 that had an LGBT health
25 curriculum that you know of?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

LINDSEY HARR: Our recommended curriculum for many years has included LGBTQ topics.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Are you disturbed to learn that I am telling you that it hasn't happened in any of the schools and the first one was in my district for this year?

LINDSEY HARR: I would love to find out more about this school in your district and to learn more about the curriculum that they've developed, it sounds amazing.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you to Chair Treyger and to Chair Dromm on his partnership on all of this and to the Committee staff.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much to my colleague and I'll just reiterate again that... well actually I'll, I'll share in my wrap up comments about some of the... respectful of my colleague's time but Council Member Rose next for questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you Chair Treyger. Is the development of wellness policies a collaborative process?

LINDSEY HARR: If you're referring to the DOE wellness policy.. [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes... [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

LINDSEY HARR: ...yes, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And who, who sits or, or what entities are on the wellness advisory councils?

LINDSEY HARR: It's a... it's quite a large group with a number of representatives, it ranges from folks in different parts of the Department of Education, colleagues in the Health Department, family members, students, members of community based organizations and other wellness content experts, organizations, I'd be happy to share the full list with you if you'd like that... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I would like that. Is SCA a member of the... of the advisory councils?

LINDSEY HARR: I'm... I believe so, yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: They are...

LINDSEY HARR: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And so have... or, or have you explored or even discussed with SCA the importance of having kitchens in schools as opposed and in terms of looking at it in terms of wellness as opposed to these warming stations that serve prepackaged food that does not give all school

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

children access to fresh produce and, and freshly
cooked food?

LINDSEY HARR: I think I'm going to ask
Mr. Tricarico to answer that on behalf of school
food.

CHRIS TRICARICO: Would you mind
repeating that question again please?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So, have you had
this discussion with SCA in terms of policy about
not... about building schools... of not building schools
without kitchens so that children are not exposed to
these schools where they have just warming stations,
they don't have access to fresh produce and they're,
they're served prepackaged foods?

CHRIS TRICARICO: There are ongoing
conversations with SCA about this specific topic.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So, is this
advisory council able to mandate that there be... that
all schools have operational kitchens?

CHRIS TRICARICO: I think we should
continue the conversations with SCA about making this
a priority for our schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Well how do we
advance it beyond a conversation because I've had two

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

schools already in my district that have these warming kitchens or meals brought in and I fought really hard not to have that happen and I think we're, we're being hypocritical when we talk about wellness and fresh foods and, and access for all students across the board to fresh foods and we still allow SCA to build schools that automatically setting them up not to be able to meet that goal.

CHRIS TRICARICO: We would like to continue to partner with the council to discuss this with SCA.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Well I, I, I personally will continue this conversation because it is a bone of contention for me.

CHRIS TRICARICO: We look forward to it, thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much colleague. I, I have some just follow up questions and some final remarks and then we'll... we... I want to acknowledge that we've been joined by very patient and very dedicated Borough President from Manhattan and Brooklyn, Borough Presidents Gale Brewer and Eric

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Adams are with us today and they will be testifying
3 next and we thank them, if we could snap our fingers,
4 alright. I just want to... have some follow up
5 questions very quickly. Local Law 14 of 2016 requires
6 DOE to provide the total number of percentages... and...
7 number and percentage of students in grades six to 12
8 who have completed at least one semester of health
9 education, however, the data provided by DOE
10 indicates how many students were scheduled for at
11 least one semester of health instruction. Please
12 explain in DOE terms what does scheduled for mean in
13 this context and how the information reported
14 complies with Local Law 14 requirement to report the
15 number who have completed at least one semester of
16 health education?

17 LINDSEY HARR: The report... the report on
18 the semester course is the number of students who
19 have been scheduled for and who have on their
20 transcript that semester or more of health education.

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, so you're...
22 you... the way... the data that came to us is based upon
23 students who, who reported that health course on
24 their transcript, is that correct?

25 LINDSEY HARR: Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Local Law 14 also requires DOE to provide the total number and percentage of students who have completed the mandated number of HIV/AIDS education lessons, in this instance DOE reports the number and percentage of students in grade six who have received H... five HIV/AIDS lessons and those in grades seven to 12 who received six HIV/AIDS lessons, does this indicate the number that completed the lessons or scheduled for to receive the lessons?

LINDSEY HARR: That indicates the number that the schools reported providing those lessons to their students.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, the schools have to report to the DOE that they provided those lessons and through... and... so they're self-certifying, is that correct, there's no one that actually comes down to check to see if that's, that's the case, is that just sort of a compliance checklist item?

LINDSEY HARR: They enter it into the DOE central scheduling system which is... it is also called STARS.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay. According to DOE's wellness policy the district wellness advisory

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 council will, will compile and publish an annual
3 report in March to share basic information about the
4 wellness policy and report on DOE's overall progress
5 implementing wellness goals. The annual report is
6 supposed to be available in ten languages on the DOE
7 website, but council committee staff was unable to
8 locate this report, has DOE published this annual
9 report and if so, where can it be found?

10 LINDSEY HARR: Since that annual report
11 is a requirement of our newly revised wellness policy
12 which was just published actually just about a year
13 ago in January of 2018 so it will be this March that
14 the wellness advisory council publishes their report
15 on the first full year under the revised wellness
16 policy.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and where,
18 where, where could they find that report once its up?

19 LINDSEY HARR: It will be on the DOE
20 website and we're happy to share the link when its
21 up.

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And it will be
23 available in ten different languages, is that
24 correct?

25 LINDSEY HARR: Yes.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: USD... USDA rules
3 require districts to conduct an assessment of their
4 wellness policy every three years at minimum, this
5 triannual assessment must include the extent to which
6 schools are in compliance with the wellness policy
7 and provide a description of the progress made in
8 attaining the goals of wellness policy, the
9 triannual... the triannual progress report is also
10 supposed to be available on the DOE website but we
11 were unable to locate this report, has the DOE
12 conducted this triannual assessment if so is it
13 currently available to... on the DOE's website, if not
14 when will this assessment be conducted and made
15 available to the public as required?

16 LINDSEY HARR: The triannual, triannual
17 report is under the old wellness policy, have been on
18 the website DOE is undergoing a website redesign and
19 I believe that they came down during that process,
20 but we'll follow up and get those to you and then the
21 next triannual report under the new wellness policy
22 will be coming up in about two years.

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, so you'll
24 let us... because that's, that's information that we,
25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we definitely do want here in the council so please
3 follow up and... [cross-talk]

4 LINDSEY HARR: Yeah... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and just some of
6 my closing remarks and then we'll turn it over to the
7 next panel as well. What is mandated from the federal
8 level is that every local educational agency or LEA
9 is the acronym they used, in this case it's, it's our
10 city DOE create a district wide, citywide wellness
11 advisory council, that's mandated, out of this
12 wellness advisory council body there is supposed to
13 be a scope and sequence report already issued to our
14 schools that would provide guidance and materials to
15 educators in our schools to make sure that we at
16 least cover subjects in health and nutrition and the
17 difference between cover and taught, when you cover
18 something it's different than teaching it, sometimes
19 educate... education folks will tell me that oh this
20 was covered, giving a kid a handout is not teaching,
21 that is not education and unfortunately you're
22 speaking to someone that was a teacher so I know the
23 difference here and so I know when someone just says
24 here read this someone could say that that's the...
25 that's... we're meeting the requirements of, of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 teaching a class, no you didn't teach anything, you
3 just covered something by putting a handout on
4 student's desk and so the scope and sequence is not
5 even being made available to our schools right now.
6 Over 90 percent of educators who are covering health
7 classes are not actually licensed to teach health in
8 middle school and high school as the Comptrollers
9 Audit found. Elementary school teachers are not
10 required or mandated to have a health license at all
11 so basically they're just... we, we think that they're
12 covering this subject, we have... we're not even sure
13 about it and I believe in my personal opinion that
14 this is also one of the direct impacts of a test
15 culture that we have in our country and, and being
16 perpetuated in our city as well that if something is
17 not being measured its not being invested in and when
18 folks come into our schools they ask questions about
19 exams and about the passage of students passing... how
20 many kids are passing tests, they're not really
21 asking questions about health and wellness but yet
22 we're hearing from leaders that health and wellness
23 is so important but yet we're seeing so many kids
24 denied and deprived of this important education and
25 opportunities, we need to break this obsession with

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 our test in culture and make sure that our children
3 are first and center at our education policies and
4 goals. This is really important, health care begins
5 with self-care and we are not properly preparing our
6 students for all the success that we're promising
7 them from the DOE, we're not and again I'll just
8 point out that we have state and federal mandates to
9 meet but those mandates are insufficient nothing
10 prohibits us from going well and beyond those, those
11 mandates and we hear about whether it's a salad bar
12 or whether it's about some great edible garden that..
13 and we love our edible gardens, every school should
14 have an edible garden and should have access to
15 because the kids are learning things and again it's
16 incredible and I think some of our state colleagues
17 might be here, I think I saw State Senator Salazar
18 who was in attendance earlier, earlier here today and
19 I appreciate her attendance. It's incredible and it's
20 insulting that the state of New York doesn't even
21 require licensed health professionals to work with
22 our kids at early ages, that's incredible to me,
23 that's insulting. They know more about... I would argue
24 elementary school kids know more about health and
25 nutrition than the President of the United States.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 So, we need to go above and beyond even, even those
3 requirements so again I want to thank all of my
4 colleagues here and I want to thank, thank the panel
5 for your testimony today. Thank you very much. Now
6 I'd like to welcome a very patient, dynamic leaders,
7 please welcome Manhattan Borough President Gale
8 Brewer and the Borough President from the great
9 borough of Brooklyn Eric Adams. This is a great
10 question about who goes first. Please... [cross-talk]

11 GALE BREWER: Thank... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Welcome, yes, thank
13 you Borough President.

14 GALE BREWER: Thank you, I am delighted
15 to be here, I'm Gale Brewer, I am the Manhattan
16 Borough President and I want to thank you Chair
17 Treyger and the members of the committee. I'm here to
18 testify in support of Intro 1283-2018, it's a bill
19 that I am proud to sponsor with the Education Chair
20 and as you know it will require annual reporting on
21 food and nutrition education in all New York City
22 schools and as somebody who when I was in the
23 council, as you know was the author of the Open Data
24 Bill, we don't have enough data and this would be an
25 example where we desperately need it. I think we've

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 heard a lot today that eating a nutritious diet leads
3 to better health for today and fewer health problems
4 in the future, we all know that. School based food
5 and nutrition education is increasingly regarded as a
6 key component in a whole child approach to education,
7 giving our students confidence to navigate
8 challenging food environments and resist the
9 pervasive marketing of unhealthy foods which is also
10 pervasive. Yet students often do not receive
11 adequate, or in some cases, any food and nutrition
12 education to equip them with the tools to become
13 healthy eaters for life and again much discussion
14 earlier. With the largest public education system in
15 the United States, the DOE administers more than
16 1,700 or 1,800 schools, different people have... seem
17 to have different numbers and serves 1.1 million
18 students. Yet according to the March 2018 study
19 conducted by the Laurie M. Tisch Center for Food,
20 Education and Policy at Teachers College at Columbia
21 University and I want to thank them for all of their
22 work, 44 percent or 815 of these schools do not offer
23 any nutrition education program known as NEP or NEP
24 to their students and I'm sorry that in the Borough
25 of Manhattan, I don't know about the Borough of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Brooklyn but in Manhattan 42 percent or over 150
3 schools do not have any Nutrition Education Program.
4 And when we met with the Tisch Center to understand
5 the context behind the numbers we realized that even
6 the information we currently have does not truly
7 paint a complete picture of the types and qualities
8 of the programs that our students receive that's why
9 we need this bill desperately. For example, a school
10 that operates a year round greenhouse and we have
11 many of them and proactively incorporates urban
12 agriculture and nutritional studies into its
13 curriculum would count as offering one NEP while
14 another school that sends a single class on a one
15 hour trip to a community garden which is a great
16 thing but that too would also register as having
17 offered one NEP so that's apples and oranges and you
18 cannot compare them and they're not comparable and we
19 need the data. Without data that is measured using a
20 common standard and collected at regular intervals,
21 we will not have a true understanding of the state of
22 food and nutrition education in our schools. This
23 Intro 1283 would require data on overage frequency,
24 average minutes per week, and percentage of staff
25 time dedicated to teaching nutrition. The data will

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 establish a baseline and enable the city to identify
3 gaps in this kind of education and we would make sure
4 that it was available on the web and not lost which
5 seems to be some of the studies that we're discussed
6 today. Another goal of Intro 1283 is to encourage
7 more education, NEPs in New York City schools both in
8 partnership with healthy food organizations or do it
9 in house. Citywide, over 40 nonprofit organizations
10 and there are many of them here today and they're all
11 terrific offer external NEPs to schools through
12 partnerships and collaborations. Many of these
13 organizations are eager to work with more schools.
14 And as Manhattan Borough President, I really want to
15 see much more than just 24 Manhattan public schools
16 receiving NEPs from these organizations. But we need
17 the data before we can know where and how to deploy
18 resources and we also need data on schools that are
19 excelling in offering NEPs to set the standard for
20 other aspiring schools and I always say as an example
21 when you go to a school with a garden or any kind of
22 hydroponics young people have not only learned the
23 science they've learned the cooking, they've learned
24 what pesto is, they know how to make it and they've
25 learned how to eat the amazing whatever vegetables

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 are being grown, it's a really phenomenal experience,
3 I've been there many times and it's very special and
4 it should be. I support empowering schools to offer
5 NEPs internally as well, particularly of interest is
6 this Intro 1283's ability to inform the City Council
7 Members and the Borough Presidents of the impact of
8 their capital investment in approving healthy food
9 access before... through, before and after data
10 captured year over year. To date just like many of us
11 in the room I've allocated millions of dollars in
12 capital funds to public schools across Manhattan for
13 the construction and expansion of hydroponics,
14 greenhouses and gardens. These green classrooms and
15 they really are green, and they really are classrooms
16 encourage students to eat their vegetables because as
17 I stated they grew them. I am also committed to
18 funding the construction of enhanced cafeterias or
19 school dining halls, this came up earlier, that have
20 the capacity to serve a variety of healthy foods.
21 Schools with enhanced cafeterias will be fitted with
22 structures that will display foods in fun and
23 engaging ways. Even just having a booth as opposed to
24 some horrible table makes a big difference. Schools
25 with enhanced cafeterias will be fitted with

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 structures that will display foods in fun and
3 engaging ways. Students will move away from the
4 passive process of being given food and toward a food
5 selection process like ordering from a takeout
6 restaurant. It's my understanding that the enhanced
7 cafeterias are popular with students because I've
8 seen them, and they love them and they are choosing,
9 best part, more fresh items. It is really important
10 to watch students flocking to the really good salad
11 bar for lettuce, but I don't want anything from a
12 can, that they cultivated through the school's
13 hydroponics unit. These students will eat healthier,
14 know why eating healthier is good for them and
15 develop lifestyles that reduce chronic diseases and
16 hopefully live forever. I'd like to point out that 43
17 percent of external NEPs, educational for nutrition
18 in partnership with New York City schools are less
19 than a decade old and that means that this is a very
20 exciting movement. It's a program that has started
21 most of them 2011 or later, these amazing programs
22 many of whom are here today. this statistic is
23 indicative of an emerging movement that is committed
24 to meeting the NEP needs across the city, making this
25 an ideal time to capture the data in our schools and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

I know many of them are here, the one that I've been involved with the most is wellness in the schools but they're all fabulous. So, I strongly urge the committee to support Intro 1283-2018 and move toward improved health not just for our students but for all of New York City. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Borough

President Brewer, thank you very much for your powerful testimony and next we're going to hear from Borough President Adams from, from my home borough of Brooklyn who has a very powerful personal story to share as well, I just want to point out Borough President Adams who if you've checked him out and the polar, polar bear plunge in Coney Island new year's people were talking about his, his level of fitness for a President, pretty, pretty cool and also inspiring story how you were able to defeat diabetes through your plant based diets and your leadership in working with our hospital system to have meatless Mondays in hospitals as well so I want to credit you for your leadership as well, both Borough Presidents here have really been at the front lines and I thank them both and next we'll hear from the Borough President Eric Adams.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

ERIC ADAMS: Thank you, thank you Council Person... can you hear me?

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah...

ERIC ADAMS: Yeah, thank you very much to you and both Councilman Cabrera has been amazing as we think about how far we have come and just your receptivity to this conversation. I reflect back in 1984 those years when I was a police officer and we were having 2,000 homicides a year, Brooklyn just celebrated having less than 100 homicides in our borough where we used to have 800, it became the norm and the journey that Jack Maple and Bill Bratton did, one of the most important things that they did they removed middle management in the police department who couldn't see and didn't believe. We are failing not because the people want to be healthy, we've failing because the over bureaucracy of non-believers, people believe that we can't go beyond just as they believe we couldn't go beyond 2,000 homicides a year, they don't believe that our children could be healthy and we need to be clear on that because you can't map out a real plan if we don't realize the unbelievable bureaucracy of the wall, today we're taking down that wall one brick at

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 a time. These intro's that you are introducing it has
3 a major impact and these are low hanging fruits, this
4 is not complicated. Just a thought that we4 can
5 actually justify still serving processed meat to our
6 babies in school. I don't want to hear about the FDA,
7 anytime we're following the standards of individuals
8 who are co-opted by the pharmaceutical and meat and
9 dairy industry and they're using that for our babies
10 and using that as a standard that is insulting. The
11 WHO has indicated. For the first time in my life I
12 bought a pack of cigarettes, they said processed meat
13 is a type one carcinogen, the only other items in a
14 type one is asbestos and cigarettes, nothing, nothing
15 else, you know we're not talking about uncertainty,
16 it develops habits that has a strong potentiality of
17 leading to cancer, cancer. If we're not lighting up
18 Newport's in the morning for our babies then why are
19 we serving them food in school that's going to start
20 bad practices, this is not even a conversation. And
21 let me tell you what's really interesting, everyone
22 knows my story, type II diabetes, lost my sight in my
23 left eye, was losing it in my right eye, permanent
24 nerve damage in my hands and feet, five doctors in
25 this city told me you'll go blind in a year, you're

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 going to lose your fingers and your toes, your family
3 is diabetic, your mother is diabetic, your sisters
4 and brothers are diabetic that is the way it is, it's
5 hereditary. No, it was not hereditary it was dietary,
6 it had nothing to do with my... where I was born it was
7 my breakfast, it wasn't my DNA, it was my dinner, it
8 was what I was eating that I learned how to eat in
9 school. Just imagine this for a moment, little
10 Johnnie from Brownsville or South Jamaica Queens or
11 East New York they leave their home every day without
12 a healthy meal, they stop by the fast food chains at
13 Kansas, to Kentucky, the colonel, they believe that
14 shrimp fried rice is the way of their nutritional
15 balance, they believe vegetables are ketchup and that
16 is what they eat and they consume then they come to
17 the school building where for... in many places in our
18 community the school is the only place where a child
19 has some form of a meal, if they're not eating a
20 breakfast or a lunch they're not eating so if they're
21 not getting healthy food in the homes that they're
22 leaving and then not... they're not getting healthy
23 food in the schools that they're going to, there are
24 children in this city that receive no nutritional
25 meal at all. Little Johnnie eats a hamburger he's not

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 going to get cancer tomorrow, no, he's developing the
3 habit and he's eating the food that is giving him
4 some serious crisis and it... you know have to... I don't
5 have to be a doctor to understand it, darn it I'm a
6 cop, I know how to do investigation and I know how to
7 read and the reports are clear on what the food that
8 we feed people is doing and so when you look at
9 doctors like doctors that are here today, Dr. Hunter
10 and Dr. Daneuv their practices... their practices are
11 around how do we reverse the diseases not how do we
12 live with that disease, how do we reverse diseases in
13 a very real way, we're so attached to these
14 procurement contracts and we're so concerned about
15 protecting them and we're not protecting our babies
16 and we're not and we need to be real about this
17 conversation. Let me tell you what happened when
18 Bellevue Hospital opened up... opened it's first, first
19 in the country plant based clinic, we sent out a
20 newsletter by the Department of Health to all the
21 city employees who for the most part we could poster
22 children for bad health, we sent it out to 400,000
23 people each... a, a month all we asked the Department
24 of Health to do was to include in the, the newsletter
25 the e-newsletter the announcement of the pilot

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 project we're doing so that city employees can have
3 an opportunity to participate in it. The top
4 management of the Department of Health told us no
5 that's not possible, city program, city newsletter,
6 letter, city heads of the agency said we couldn't
7 send out to make that announcement, I had to call
8 City Hall to say what is wrong with these guys,
9 agency after agency after agency they're not on board
10 with what we are attempting to do. Anytime you have
11 one agency talks about fighting childhood obesity,
12 childhood diabetes, childhood asthma and then you
13 have another agency who are feeding our children what
14 causes childhood obesity, childhood diabetes,
15 childhood asthma, we have a schizophrenic city agency
16 acting in a schizophrenic manner feeding our crisis.
17 That's what this is about and so listen, I'm not
18 trying to live a... live a popularity contest with
19 these managers that sit here and tell us that we're
20 doing a good job. I'm tired of going to dialysis
21 centers and seeing our seniors and our elders and our
22 children spending three hours a day three days a week
23 in dialysis, diabetes is the number one cause of
24 blindness, number one cause of non-limb amputation,
25 one of the number one causes of heart disease. All of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 these diseases are born out of diabetes and the birth
3 of these bad eating habits not only start in our
4 homes but it starts in our city institutions and at
5 the heart of the poster child of dysfunctionality and
6 health system is our Board of Education, the food
7 they're feeding our babies, it's time to stop the
8 bologna and get rid of the darn bologna. It's not
9 even a conversation anymore, how can we be even
10 having this conversation of that, is it okay, is it
11 not okay, we're following standards, we're doing the
12 best we can, the jury is still out, what courtroom
13 are you in? The verdict is clear, this food is
14 killing our communities particularly in the inner
15 city, this was an embarrassing testimony that came
16 from the Department of Education. Stop it and hats
17 off to the Chancellor as he attempts to peel back
18 this bureaucracy in this over bloated system, hats
19 off to him but he has a challenge, he has a whole
20 middle management that's going to wait him out and
21 say we got... we're not going to change this. I got
22 news for them, these children are ready, they're so
23 far ahead of those who are making the decision,
24 they're starting to demand that their food is right,
25 and we need to listen to them and to these young

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 people who are here and across this country, the
3 wings of change were always born by young people. The
4 same people who said it was not possible to stop
5 smoking to not have cancer, lung cancer, and other
6 cancers, the same doctors who told them it was
7 impossible to do so they were able to change it and
8 that's where we are now in this conversation. So, I,
9 I am clear on this that we need to finally start
10 addressing these issues, broccoli California is doing
11 it, Canada is doing it, all over the globe people are
12 realizing what an overconsumption of meat is doing to
13 our community, killing our environment, a number one
14 cause of the issues we're having in our environment
15 is connected to our consumption of meat. We can do
16 better so what I want... what am I doing as I conclude.
17 We spent over three million dollars in the Department
18 of Education to build green farms and greenhouses in
19 our... in our school system, this year we did over one
20 million dollars as what my colleague Borough
21 President Brewer has stated we're putting the money
22 where our mouth is. We have a program in democracy
23 academy which is very interesting, we teamed up with
24 a group called farm shelf where they're using
25 hydroponics and pods and drip irrigation to grow food

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 right in the classroom in a device about the size of
3 a refrigerator, we gave them 20 units, the children
4 have a camera inside the units to watch the food
5 grow, they're then going to harvest the food and
6 they're going to identify the food in security areas
7 in their community and NYCHA and they're going to
8 start delivering it to the families in NYCHA so they
9 are finding the problem then they're fixing the
10 problem and that school democracy academy was an
11 alternative school, the children did not want to go
12 to school there, they were missing days of school now
13 they can't get the children out of the school, they
14 are so encouraged and impacted but they're doing
15 something real inside their community. We are going
16 to continue to put money in the system and to
17 educate, we're teaching people how to cook food, food
18 not only must look good, not only be good but darn
19 it, it has to taste good and we're going to look at
20 the cultural norms, there's no reason we can't learn
21 how to cook those foods that are identical or
22 identifiable to the various communities. You don't
23 have to... only have to walk around with grass in your
24 pocket, you can make food that's tasty and that's
25 enjoyable at the same time as healthy. So, we are all

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

in, it's time to turn the corner but the beginning process of turning the corner is to get rid of the non-believers. We want believers and if you're not a believer you need to leave this system and let us save our babies. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I think... I think... oh goodness I think we're going to have to join the collective snap your fingers for the very powerful testimony from, from both of our Borough Presidents, thank you very much for both of your leadership. I think my colleague has a... has a question, Council Member Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you Mr. Chair. Mr. Chair I want to first thank you for lending the opportunity that's my fire... I think in the last nine years that I've been here this has been the most comprehensive hearing on this topic, so I salute you, I thank you and I know it's coming from the bottom of your heart. Borough President Gale Brewer it's good to see you... [cross-talk]

GALE BREWER: Thank you... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: ...I know we served together here in the Council some years ago and you're one of the hardest working Borough

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Presidents that I know and to... and for Borough
3 President Eric Adams I want to thank you, I want to
4 take a moment to thank you because it... the branch out
5 of this resolution 238 came from you so I want to
6 give you an open credit for bringing this attention
7 of the Council and, and so we could have a concerted
8 voice regarding this particular issue that I know
9 affected your personal life, affected mine, it's
10 affected many people, I, you know am from Bronx, I...
11 Council Member King could attest to this, my
12 colleagues that we are... I, I never seen so many kids
13 becoming obese so fast. My grandfather a World War II
14 veteran, a happy man, I never saw him so sad until he
15 lost his leg because he became diabetic and so this,
16 this is a... an issue that I, I want to thank you for,
17 you know being a champion and being a voice. I wanted
18 to ask you because I would love to replicate what you
19 did in school with hydroponics, what was the cost for
20 that program because I, I see Council Member also
21 wanted to... we want to steal your idea, come on?

22 ERIC ADAMS: And we should... we should... we
23 should duplicate success because I think the numbers
24 as you stated speak for, for itself, you know when
25 you look at... in Brooklyn 700,000 children are dealing

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 with the issue of obesity, over 300,000 are diabetic,
3 we need to think outside the box. In fact... not think
4 outside the box, we need to destroy the darn box and
5 we need to be aggressive at how we go about moving
6 this. The entire project that we put together we gave
7 the school I believe five units or more, we could get
8 it to you but it only costs 20,000 dollars, the units
9 are extremely inexpensive, they're very attractive
10 and the children are very much... the principal of that
11 school came and was part of it, my goal is to put it
12 in every school in my district and in, in the borough
13 where our children can really be serious about not
14 only identifying the issue of food insecurity but
15 coming up with the solution. Noah did not just
16 predict rain he built a darn ark, let's build the ark
17 and let's help people survive.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you. Thank
19 you so much and we are definitely going to duplicate
20 that and looking forward to getting it in all the
21 schools in my district, to be honest with you that's
22 very little money for the output and the outcome that
23 we're going to get so looking forward to working with
24 your office regarding this and Council Member Brewer
25 thank you for really being the data champion.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

GALE BREWER: Thank you but there's a group called New York Sun Works and they can help you with the hydroponics, New York... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Sun... [cross-talk]

GALE BREWER: New York Sun Works and they can help you, we've done hundreds and hundreds of hydro, hydroponics either a room or you can do a larger space but it works and then in the summer you got a lot of lettuce and we work with the senior centers and the seniors come over and get the lettuce because the kids aren't there so there's so many opportunities for collaboration on fresh food and vegetables.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: That's fantastic, looking forward to getting it down in the boogey down Bronx. Thank you so much.

ERIC ADAMS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very much to, to my colleague and I, I thank again the Borough Presidents for their leadership, and I would just echo some of their very powerful stories. I, I, I... yes, thank you, thank you to both Borough President Adams and, and Brewer, yes, if... you forgot your

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Newport example... I think that was... made history
3 Borough President, I've never saw Newport's at the
4 City Council here before but we thank them again and,
5 and also just to... on a personal note I, I shared be...
6 earlier at a rally today that I actually used to...
7 used to weigh over 300 pounds and, and battled with
8 childhood obesity most of... most of my... all my life
9 and during... you know during the school meals of
10 course you would... used to enjoy those hamburgers, it
11 wasn't until in my... later in my middle to late 20s
12 where I enjoyed a black bean burger rather than a
13 hamburger and as a former history teacher we should
14 be also educating kids about some of the ancient
15 grains that were taught... Quinoa was available to the
16 Incas, the Incas know more about our current... than,
17 than the current population today, farrow such
18 critical grains, healthy grains that were available
19 thousands and thousands of years ago so history
20 already has many of the answers we just have to heed
21 the lessons from history but thank, thank, thank the
22 leaders for their testimony. I'd like to now welcome
23 our, our, our panels and we'll begin with Kimberly
24 Watkins; Cynthia King; Amie Hamlin; David Eisenbach;
25 and Moria Byrne-Zaaloff. Okay, if... we could try to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 get more folks if some folks left, we can just call
3 up more folks, so we could have a full panel so then
4 we'll call up Tom Shamy and Ethan Ciment as well as
5 Robert Graham. I think... I think... I think we have room
6 for one more...

7 [off mic dialogue]

8 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Oh, okay. I guess
9 we could start from this direction and move our way
10 down. You may begin, sure just make sure the mic is
11 on, you see the red light on the mic.

12 DR. ETHAN CIMENT: Thank you. Good
13 afternoon, my name is Dr. Ethan Ciment and I'm a
14 podiatric Physician and Surgeon who works here in
15 Chelsea. In 2015, the World Health Organization
16 classified processed meat; pepperoni, bacon, deli
17 meats as carcinogenic. They cited a major study that
18 found that just one hot dog or two strips of bacon a
19 day increased the risk of colorectal cancer by 18
20 percent. Unfortunately, it's not uncommon for us to
21 see these same foods on our student's lunch trays
22 regularly here in New York City schools. Colorectal
23 cancer is the second deadliest cancer in the United
24 States and rates are already rising in young people.
25 It's not just our student's futures that we should be

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 worried about. As a health care provider, I'm
3 concerned about how common it is... common it is to see
4 these chronic diseases already affecting our kids.
5 We're seeing more and more children struggling with
6 childhood obesity, type II diabetes and even risk
7 factors for heart disease, like high cholesterol and
8 high blood pressure. Serving our kids processed
9 meats, which on top of being carcinogenic, is packed
10 with saturated fat and cholesterol, is only
11 exacerbating this trend. It is past time that we get
12 these foods out of our New York City schools. New
13 York has long been a leader in providing great
14 learning environments for our students so it's time
15 for us to take a step further and be a leader in
16 serving them high quality foods that can protect our
17 student's health. Thank you.

18 AMIE HAMLIN: My name is Amie Hamlin and
19 I'm the Executive Director of the Coalition for
20 Healthy School Food. We have a formal and productive
21 partnership with the Office of Food and Nutrition
22 Services in a number of schools where we provide
23 nutrition education and resources including family
24 dinner nights that feature plant-based menus and our
25 weekly food on earth curriculum which includes

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 cooking in elementary schools. we started our
3 partnership with the Office of Food and Nutrition
4 Services 11 years ago. We've brought a number of
5 resources to the partnership including arranging for
6 20 high level administrators to take the Colin
7 Campbell plant-based nutrition course through
8 eCornell, providing medical doctors for upper level
9 staff trainings and bringing chefs into school
10 kitchens to assist with training and to create new
11 scratch made recipes. Most notably, we launched the
12 first four public vegetarian schools in the country,
13 something that has brought the Office of Food and
14 Nutrition Services and the schools much positive
15 press. Our approach is from a health, social justice,
16 and sustainability perspective. The healthfulness of
17 New York City school food actually far surpasses the
18 federal standards and most schools in the country. We
19 applaud the many positive changes including free
20 meals for everyone and clean labels. We are
21 supportive of removing processed meats from the
22 school menus, it is a logical progression toward the
23 clean menu they strive for. We offer our support to
24 help with product or recipe ideas and believe that
25 the processed meats should be replaced with plant-

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 based options not other types of meats. We understand
3 that an operation that provides nearly one million
4 meals per day, that change is a gradual process.

5 Getting the new products on the menu generally takes
6 two years, and so due to time and resources necessary
7 there has to be a transition plan. It will involve
8 finding alternatives, student feedback, reworking the
9 menus and a lot of education. Our greatest request is
10 that the city provide additional financial resources
11 necessary to support the Office of Food and Nutrition
12 Services in this transition.

13 MORIA BYRNE-ZAALOFF: Good afternoon

14 Chairman Treyger and members of the Committee. Thank
15 you for the opportunity to testify here today in
16 support of Intro Number 1283 reporting on food and
17 nutrition education. In the interest of time I will
18 read a brief statement, our complete testimony has
19 been submitted for the record. My name is Moria
20 Byrne-Zaaloff and I am the Program Coordinator of
21 Bronx Health REACH, a program of the Institute for
22 Family Health. We coordinate the New York State
23 Department of Health's Creating Healthy Schools and
24 Communities Program for the Bronx, working with 91
25 public schools in four districts of the South Bronx

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to improve student health outcomes and eliminate
3 racial and ethnic disparities. Our long-term
4 partnership with schools has given us firsthand
5 experience with the health challenges of our students
6 that they are currently facing. Bronx Health REACH
7 has spent the past four years working with teachers
8 from nearly half of our New York City public school
9 partners to integrate nutrition education and food
10 literacy into core curricula. Using a model developed
11 by Teachers College, Columbia University, last year
12 13 of these teachers participated in a pilot to
13 integrate four lessons each in their classrooms. Both
14 parents and teachers were pleased with the results,
15 children asking for and eating healthier meals and
16 snacks. Many of the teachers and school staff we
17 approached about nutrition education, the nutrition
18 education pilot were already integrating nutrition
19 and healthy eating lessons yet we watched as
20 countless self-motivated teachers and staff were
21 blocked by barriers of too little resources and
22 professional development training, incomplete
23 guidelines from the DOE, limited class time and lack
24 of administrative support to run sustainable
25 nutrition education programming. Without a tracking

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 system of nutrition education programming in place it
3 is unclear how many teachers in schools in New York
4 City face these challenges. Collecting and reporting
5 data about which schools are complying with the
6 federal mandates would bring us one step closer to
7 addressing the problems at hand. By creating one set
8 of standards in nutrition education that schools are
9 held accountable to follow and track we can measure
10 the success of schools as well as identify the
11 barriers and challenges, develop an action plan for
12 improvement, better support teachers that are already
13 committed to teaching about food and nutrition and
14 encourage other teachers to feel enabled to do the
15 same.

16 TOM SHAMY: Good afternoon, my name is
17 Tom Shamy and I'm a parent of two Manhattan public
18 school students, I have a third grader at, at PS 314
19 Muscota and a, a sixth grader at Columbia Secondary
20 School. I first want to thank the Brooklyn Borough
21 President and the City Council members who worked
22 together to sponsor this very important resolution. I
23 believe that our schools should serve children
24 healthy, nutritious meals with wholesome ingredients.
25 As a class I carcinogen, processed meat should have

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 no place in school simply. My children are lucky;
3 they learned from a young age to eat and enjoy a
4 variety of fresh fruit, vegetables, whole grains,
5 beans and other healthy foods and... that promote
6 wellness. When my son was in fourth grade, he
7 volunteered one day in the K to two lunch period in
8 his school. He came home upset and he said to me,
9 dad, guess what? 90 percent of the young kids are
10 drinking chocolate milk and throwing out their fruit.
11 So, as a member of the school wellness committee I
12 worked successfully to remove chocolate milk from
13 service and replace it with a water dispenser. That
14 was two years ago, and the kids are now better
15 hydrated and eating more fruit. Education doesn't
16 stop at the cafeteria door. Children expect that what
17 they are served in school is what they should be
18 eating. This resolution to ban processed meat is a
19 very important first step towards bringing school
20 food service in line with that current nutrition
21 research tells us is best. But there is still a long
22 way to go. A significant percentage of kids in school
23 now will develop diet related chronic illnesses like
24 diabetes or become obese or both. Most school meals
25 are still heavy on meat and cheese which are high in

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 saturated fat and cholesterol and have no fiber. I
3 want my children eating food that keeps them healthy;
4 whole food, plant-based meals, so I pack them
5 lunches, but school should be a place for all
6 children to thrive and where children like mine, who
7 want to make healthy food choices, have better meal
8 options. There is progress being made and the New
9 York City Office of School Food is incorporating some
10 truly healthy lunch entrees a few days per month on
11 the alternative and vegetarian school menus like
12 roasted chickpea tagine, that sounds good doesn't it?
13 Veggie tacos, pasta fagioli with whole grain pasta
14 and tofu and bean burritos. This is great, but
15 healthy meals should not be alternative, they should
16 be the main stay of what we serve to all kids because
17 the healthy habits they learn in school will stay
18 with them for life. Thank you for your consideration
19 in making healthy foods more accessible for the
20 school children of New York.

21 DR. ROBERT GRAHAM: Good afternoon and
22 thank you so much for, for the opportunity to share
23 my thoughts with all of you today. I actually was
24 thinking about this as the panel was talking and I
25 call it one doctor's food fight. Dear patients and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 parents, my name is Dr. Robert Graham, I'm a son of a
3 farmer and of an immigrant from Jackson Heights,
4 Queens, New York. I am both a physician and a chef
5 for over ten years. I'm the proud Co-Founder of
6 FRESH-Med where we advocate... where I advocate for a
7 healthcare model that puts the emphasis on healthy
8 foods, simply put we put food first in our treatment
9 plans. In medicine we call it culinary medicine. I
10 strongly believe that the food we eat and the
11 lifestyle choices that we... and the lifestyle choices
12 can significantly improve one's life. On the
13 contrary, eating foods that are unhealthy such as
14 processed meats are known to cause illnesses, you
15 heard it here today. Diet related illnesses like
16 heart disease, type II diabetes, obesity and many
17 forms of cancer are largely preventable and
18 reversible if we pay attention to what we eat. I've
19 hit an interesting cross road between a doctor and a
20 chef, I urge the board to pass Resolution 238 to
21 remove processed meats which are labeled as class I
22 carcinogens, it is the same as asbestos in
23 cigarettes. I have trained hundreds of medical
24 professionals, professionals how to prepare foods by
25 taking them out of the hospital and into the kitchen

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to teach them how to cook at the natural gourmet
3 institute. They... these meals are both healthful and
4 delicious. This kind of model that values food as
5 medicine needs to be demonstrated in our schools.
6 Students need to learn that food is medicine and what
7 better way to do that than removing foods that harm
8 them like processed meats and replacing them with
9 whole food plant-based things like fruits,
10 vegetables, whole grains and legumes. The cafeteria
11 is as much as a learning environment as the
12 classroom, it's time we demand more from our schools
13 and hospitals. When we know better, we should be
14 doing better. Over the past 15 years I have been
15 driven by a simple hypothesis, it... if the food is
16 part of the problem it must be part of the solution.
17 Researchers predict that by 2030 the incidence of...
18 incidence of rates of people, people among 20 to 34
19 will increase by 90 percent for colon cancer and 124
20 percent for colorectal cancer. Let's change that
21 statistic today. In closing, let this be the time
22 that future generations say that our hospitals,
23 schools, doctors, chefs, farmers and policy makers
24 finally got this right. As the Borough President,
25 Brooklyn Borough President mentioned, and Mr. Cabrera

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 mentioned so eloquently this afternoon, lets ban the
3 bologna. Thank you so much.

4 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very
5 much. Just a, a quick question and I, I applaud you,
6 I think parent family advocacy in schools is so
7 critical and across the board. You had mentioned that
8 in your school you were able to remove chocolate milk
9 and replace it with a water dispenser, is that
10 correct?

11 TOM SHAMY: I was able to remove
12 chocolate milk from being served in the lunch...

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Being served in the
14 lunch room... [cross-talk]

15 TOM SHAMY: ...in the lunchroom.

16 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right...

17 TOM SHAMY: ...and I had a water jet
18 installed to give the kids the incentive to still
19 drink but drink water instead.. [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and, and how,
21 how was that water jet installed, who, who funded it,
22 who paid for it?

23 TOM SHAMY: It's from the Department of
24 Ed.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: DOE funded the water jet?

TOM SHAMY: Yes, they have them available to any, any school that asks for them.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And the question is do schools even know they have the ability to ask for that and which in many cases... and I... again I applaud you but this is the... this is the issue I raised before about things happening in Peace Meal not happening across the board, folks not knowing... you know not... there's an expression I, I, I've learned sometimes you don't know what you don't know and you don't even know it and, and how do you know to ask such a question, you know and that's, that's, that's really key and I just also thank the health professionals who are here with us as well, you know I've always believed... not always believed but after I was able to lose 100 pounds I learned... you know health care begins with self-care and daily practices and, and so I thank you for turning your profession into really an advocacy platform on prevention because many times we look to kind of manage things, we need to actually solve it at the root level and so thank you very much and I thank all of the advocates

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and the families here.. who are here, thank you,
3 appreciate you. Next panel we'll call up Claire,
4 Claire Raffel; Pamela Koch; Mirem Villamil; Maria
5 Mohammed; Andrew Barrett; Yadira Garcia and Andrea
6 Strong. Are there enough chairs, let's make sure the
7 Sergeant at Arms if we can make sure.. just make sure
8 your mic is on.

9 CLAIRES RAFFEL: Is it on now, yes. Bill
10 do you want.. here Bill why don't you go first..

11 BILL TELEPAN: Can I go first?

12 CLAIRES RAFFEL: Yeah..

13 BILL TELEPAN: Sorry..

14 CLAIRES RAFFEL: No, that's fine.

15 BILL TELEPAN: Yeah. Thank you so much..

16 [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: If, if you could
18 just introduce your name so we'll, we'll get your
19 slip.

20 BILL TELEPAN: Sure, my name is Bill
21 Telepan, I'm from Wellness in the Schools..

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Great.

23 BILL TELEPAN: I just have to do dinner
24 service tonight up at Oceana so as the Executive Chef
25 of Oceana in Midtown but more importantly as the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Executive Chef of Wellness in the Schools for the
3 past decade which is... it's a nonprofit organization
4 that brings food and fitness programming to public
5 school communities. I testify on behalf of Intro
6 1282, which we absolutely support which requires
7 public schools to report annual, annually on food and
8 nutrition education. With childhood obesity
9 continuing to rise our children deserve much better
10 and we support transparency and equality for all. Our
11 program partners with the DOE where it trains cooks
12 to... on the... in the implementation of the alternative
13 menu which includes more scratch cooking and
14 unprocessed meals to over 100 public schools here in
15 New York City. We also teach cooking classes that
16 provide food and nutrition education in these
17 schools, but 100 schools are not enough, there are
18 1,200 school buildings and all children deserve what,
19 what WITS schools receive, a healthy menu that is not
20 the alternative but the norm. Thank you.

21 CLAIRES RAFFEL: Good afternoon Councilman
22 Treyger. My name is Claire Raffel and on behalf of
23 the Laurie M. Tisch Center for Food, Education and
24 Policy at Teachers College Columbia University and
25 the Program in Nutrition, I want to thank you for

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 this opportunity to share our views on Intro 1283. I
3 also want to thank you Council Member Treyger as well
4 as Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer for
5 introducing this important legislation. And I want to
6 start with one of my favorite quotes from Teachers
7 College Emeritus Professor Joan Dye Gussow which I
8 think really sums it up, she said "teaching food and
9 nutrition might be viewed as the single most
10 important educational activity of a society, if
11 persons do not learn to obtain and consume food so as
12 to sustain themselves and their dependents, all other
13 learnings are irrelevant." That's all we need to
14 know. Too many New York City students especially
15 those at the intersection of race and poverty
16 struggle with health and educational disparities that
17 we can prevent. Great food and nutrition education is
18 a critical ingredient in a healthy school community.
19 Through engaging activities, students become
20 motivated and empowered to make food choices that
21 promote health, ecological sustainability and social
22 justice. They gain confidence to navigate our
23 challenging food supply and advocate for better food.
24 All New York City students deserve healthy,
25 equitable, sustainable and culturally, culturally

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 responsive food access and education. Yet currently,
3 we know this is not the case. Research we published
4 shows that nearly half the city's schools lack access
5 to external food and nutrition education programs.
6 That's why we're behind Intro 1283. The Department of
7 Education needs to shine a light on the gaps in food
8 and nutrition education so that parents, students,
9 educators, advocates and policy makers can craft
10 policies that direct resources to the schools and
11 students that need them most. Thank you again for
12 allowing us to express our support for this bill and
13 we look forward to working with you to pass this
14 legislation.

15 PAM COOK: Good afternoon, my name is Pam
16 Cook and I'm speaking on behalf of Meredith Hill,
17 Assistant Principal from Columbia Secondary School
18 for Math, Science and Engineering. It is with great
19 enthusiasm that I support the nutrition education
20 bill. When I began teaching English in 2007, it was
21 clear that many of my urban students lacked
22 understanding of where their food comes from and what
23 it means to be nourished. I expanded my sixth grade
24 English to extracurricular after school courses on
25 Seed to Fork; Growing, Eating and Celebrating Food

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and Nutrition. As an English teacher literacy was
3 always at the heart of what I did. Students wrote
4 about their gardening and cooking experiences, read
5 relevant literature and developed class publications
6 on food. One student asked why can't we learn like
7 this every day, when we educate students about what
8 they put in their bodies the very fuel they get their
9 daily energy they not only gain a knowledge but also
10 a power, the power to make healthy choices and to be
11 educated consumers. The sense of ownership builds
12 enthusiasm for learning. With the bill to report on
13 food and nutrition education in schools, it is my
14 hope that all students can experience the power of
15 understanding their food and have a voice for their
16 own healthy life. While some may argue that schools
17 have other priorities like test prep, I'd argue that
18 a solid understanding of food and nutrition isn't
19 mutually exclusive. Strengthening our curricula with
20 the food and nutrition education gives students the
21 fuel they need, both the food and the academic
22 engagement, to in turn influence their test scores
23 too. When we talk about leaving no child behind, we
24 can only do that if all children have the nourishment
25 to stay in the race. Just like reading and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 mathematics are tools that students can do... use to be
3 productive and successful global citizens, so too is
4 the knowledge of growing, cooking and eating healthy
5 nutritious food.

6 YADIRA GARCIA: Hi, my name is... hello,
7 can you hear me... no, hey. Hi, my name is Yadira and
8 I'm a chef, educator and activist, I created a
9 platform called Happy, Healthy Latina not because I
10 wanted to but out of necessity. First and foremost
11 I'm a product of public schools, I am from the Bronx
12 and I'm my ancestor's wildest dreams that we get to
13 get up and do these things every day and I want to
14 acknowledge that we're very privileged to even be
15 here today to have this platform because I truly
16 believe that if every parent and child could be here
17 today we'd have to have a sleepover in City Hall
18 because they would all be here to talk about the
19 importance of this. So, we may come as one or as ten
20 but really I say we come as ten million and ten
21 thousand and we carry the weight of our communities
22 with us and I just want to say that, you know even
23 with the 40 organizations that are creating
24 nutritional education programs in this city, the
25 proliferation rate of that is not fast enough and as

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we wait to pass legislation and measures that's
3 another child that ages out of the system or that
4 gets another chronic illness and it affects the
5 quality of life and the baseline so we can't wait
6 around for years or for reports or for moments to
7 come up, you know we really have to take the time to
8 stop and break out of these silos because it even
9 increases the equity, equity gap when we some
10 organizations busting in some school districts and
11 others that are still underserved and marginalized.
12 So, part of what I do is really focus on empowering
13 youth and working with community based organizations
14 to activate spaces that already exist, right, we
15 don't have to reinvent the wheel but we do have to
16 honor that we need cultural, reverberance and respect
17 in these communities because it's not just about
18 pushing kale, right and bok choy and broccoli, those
19 are great too but so is sofrito and sazón, right,
20 when made from scratch. So, I just... I'm very
21 passionate about being here today and I'm thankful
22 for the platform to share, I think we already know
23 why it's so important and it's kind of sitting in our
24 face and I'm glad we're here today.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And, and it is not too late to enter the race for president by the way... just saying.

YADIRA GARCIA: And today we have a student here.

MARIA MUHAMMAD: Hello, my name is Maria Muhammad and it's such a privilege to be here to testify today. I was born and raised in the Bronx where I went to school and my parents trusted the educational system to protect me but that's not what they were doing. I grew up eating school lunch every day because my mom didn't have time to cook for me and even with the school lunch that I had I always had to jug it down with chocolate milk, milk, milk... it was milk every day, there was no water so I had to stand in line to get fountain water and it's really ridiculous that it took me 19 years to figure this out that I really had to meet children's aid and work with Yadira with the Health and Nutrition section to be able to understand that what I was eating was bad and it wasn't my fault because ignorance is bliss, we do not know but if we know we need to make a change, we need to make amends, we need to do better for our children. I have 14 year old sister at home and right

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

now she has knee pain, she's just 14, what are we doing, we need to do better, we need... our kids are looking up to us to give them a perfect future and a, a free atmosphere but if we can't do that now what are we going to... what are we going to tell them five years from now that I'm sorry I let you down, I'm sorry I put you in the hands of this and that. People... there are like teenagers here that have diabetes, type II diabetes and it's really ridiculous that it's because of us, processed food is bad and we know it but yet we feed it... we eat grade F foods why, why are we doing this, what are we going to tell our children like ten years from now. So, we need to do better. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you.

ANDREA STRONG: Good afternoon Councilman Treyger, thank you very much. My name is Andrea Strong, I am a parent at PS 261 in Brooklyn, my kids are Emily and Sam, Emily is in fourth grade and Sam is in kindergarten and I'm... would like to testify on behalf of both bills so if I can get four minutes, I'll take it. With regard to processed meats, I want to tell you all that I am food writer, I am not a vegan or a vegetarian, I'm an omnivore but I'm here

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 to tell you this government should not be in the
3 business of feeding the health crisis. We cannot
4 allow the Office of Food and Nutrition Services to
5 feed 850,000 children foods like bacon, sausage, ham,
6 processed ham, deli meats that have been shown by the
7 World's Health Organization to cause disease and
8 carcinogenic and yet that is what we are doing every
9 single day. Eliminating processed meats in public
10 schools can and will help ensure that our students
11 stay healthy instead of feeding the health crisis we
12 will be fighting but processed meats are just the tip
13 of the iceberg or kale or sofrito. Our kids are in
14 crisis, we've been talking about this all day. One in
15 five New York City kindergarten students is obese. If
16 you look at head start that goes to one in four. The
17 New York City Healthy School Food Alliance which I
18 founded with hundreds of other parents in New York
19 City is fighting to push for holistic school food
20 reform. We need to first of all reduce overall beef
21 consumption. Once again I'm not a vegan or a
22 vegetarian but I'm sure we're all aware that the
23 oceans temperatures are rising and that cattle
24 farming harms the climate more than the combined tail
25 pipe emissions from every plane, train, car, bus and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 boat in the world and here's a crazy but seriously
3 meaningful fact that I hope this Council will not
4 ignore, if New York City public schools swapped out
5 one beef burger for a plant based protein once a
6 month this city would emit 375,000 pounds less carbon
7 dioxide... carbon dioxide into the atmosphere per year.
8 The city of Oakland reduced its meat and dairy
9 purchases by 30 percent over two years it reduced its
10 carbon footprint by 14 percent and saved 42,000
11 dollars a year, I'll take that money and I'll put it
12 into scratch cook sofrito but there's more. We're
13 talking about chocolate milk, chocolate milk has to
14 go, I'm done, I took it out of my kid's school but
15 why am I taking it out of my kid's school and Tom who
16 was here before took it out of his, his kid's school,
17 inequity again. Chocolate milk, eight ounces, 20
18 grams of sugar, plain milk, 12 grams of sugar, two
19 teaspoons difference. Let's get those water jets and
20 put them in every school, I'm tired of this inequity,
21 it is infuriating to me as a parent. And processed
22 foods, thank you Maria, I mean we are... we are feeding
23 the health crisis every single day, we need scratch
24 cooked meals, wellness in the schools has a menu they
25 are ready to roll it out in every school, there are

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 170 schools in this city that are ready to scratch
3 cooking. Next year is a good year to start, I'm...
4 brigade is in one school, mazel tov, we have a whole
5 city. So, I am here, one day at a time, I am here to
6 work with the council, and I want to make a different
7 future for school food and for our children. Now with
8 regard to nutrition education, sorry I'm going to
9 keep going. Nutrition education, if knowledge is
10 power then nutrition education is... gives children the
11 power to change their world as we've spoken about. It
12 helps them make informed choices about what they eat
13 understanding how what they eat can help them sit
14 still, can help them learn, can help the quality of
15 their life and the length of their life. And if some
16 kids have it and other kids don't, we perpetuate
17 inequities which cannot be tolerated by New York
18 City. Let me share one example, my daughter Emily's
19 fourth grade class had... Lucille was the educator,
20 she's here, they... we, we brought in the Beecher's
21 Foundation to do a food detective workshop where for
22 two and a half hours the fourth-grade class learned
23 how to become food detectives. They were each given
24 a, a box, some got Annie's, organic bunnies, some got
25 Cheetos, some got fruit loops and they learned how to

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 read that label, what's a portion size, why, why is
3 it important that the ingredients are in this order,
4 what does it mean that there's a funny looking
5 cartoon saying oh, we're healthy, they learned to
6 push away marketing messages and really read a label
7 and understand what that food can do to them and then
8 we made veggie chili and we sent the kids home with
9 the recipe and it was amazing but my kids got that at
10 261 because I'm a freelance journalist and I can sit
11 there and parse through the grants saying oh this is
12 free and I can get spoons across America to come and
13 so now PS 261 has nutrition education in every grade
14 and that's because I have time on my hands because
15 I'm privileged but there are parents in this city
16 that work three jobs and they don't have time to go
17 through the grant database and figure out how to get
18 nutrition education at their schools and that's why
19 this bill is so critical because if we understand
20 where the gaps are we can fill them and then every
21 child has the same chance at a future, right now they
22 don't. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, two more
24 yeah, okay.

25 [off mic dialogue]

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 MIREM VILLAMIL: I'll go first.

3 ANDREW BARRETT: Okay.

4 MIREM VILLAMIL: Hello, yes. Hi, it's an
5 honor and a privilege to be here. I'm... all the points
6 that have been said have been really fantastic to
7 hear, thank you so much. I'm just giving a personal
8 point. I'm the mother of two kids in the New York
9 City public school system, I'm Puerto Rican, food has
10 always been what brings my family together and it was
11 a shock to me to realize that many of the kids in New
12 York City don't actually get proper meals. In fact,
13 one of the first classes that I taught as a... as a
14 food educator, I asked them to draw their favorite
15 meal and a lot of the kids didn't know what a meal
16 was. So, I have my own personal medical history as
17 well so I'm very convinced that we need.. we each
18 individually need to know how our food affects us but
19 beyond that, you know food is central to the
20 environment to the local community to understanding
21 other cultures, to our economy, our choices, our
22 individual choices have very far reaching effects. I
23 wanted to bring one other thing to the table which is
24 that over the past eight years I've been at Edible
25 school yard NYC, I'm a head garden teach.. garden

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 manager there, before then I started school gardens
3 in other schools, and I was at 261 the other day just
4 talking about their garden. One of the things that
5 I'm bringing to the table here is that when kids
6 start learning about food it's not a top down thing,
7 they make the decision about whether they like
8 something or not and whether they're going to try
9 something or not, they bring to the table what
10 they've experienced in their families and in their
11 lives and we learn from them. So, at Edible School
12 Yard, you know in the beginning we, we had some ideas
13 about what they should be eating and what they
14 shouldn't be eating, I'm happy to say that we've,
15 we've turned that around. So, part of nutrition
16 education is listening, getting to know our kids and
17 learning from them and empowering them to teach us.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: I'm sorry, can you
19 please just state your name for the record.

20 MIREM VILLAMIL: Oh, my name is Mirem
21 Villamil.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

23 ANDREW BARRETT: Hi, good afternoon. My
24 name is Andrew Barrett, I am the New York Program
25 Director with FoodCorps. Through our direct service

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 program in schools and also broader food systems and
3 procurement work including partnership with Urban
4 School Food Alliance, FoodCorps serves to connect
5 healthy food to... kids to healthy food in school.
6 First, I'd like to thank the Education Committee
7 Chair Treyger and all the members of the City Council
8 Education Committee for holding today's hearing on
9 this reporting bill, 1283. FoodCorps shares the City
10 Council's interest in creating a future which... in
11 which all our city's children; regardless of class,
12 race, or geography, know what healthy food is, care
13 where it comes from and eat it every day. We believe
14 that the knowledge provided by a reporting bill will
15 be a first step toward that future. FoodCorps began
16 our direct service program in New York City in 2015
17 and several of our school partners serve districts
18 represented by members of this committee, including
19 Council Member Salamanca, Council Member Cornegy,
20 Council Member Barron. I'm also a proud kindergarten
21 parent and a constituent of Council Member Lander. As
22 FoodCorps continues to grow our programs over the
23 next few years, the information provided through this
24 reporting will allow us to better understand the gaps
25 that exist in access to food education. We will be

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 able to make more strategic decisions about where and
3 how to invest our resources and to more effectively
4 align our efforts, efforts with all our partners,
5 many of them are here. We'll also be able to
6 celebrate schools that are providing food education
7 to their students and I think that's probably even
8 more important. We can learn from the teachers that
9 are effectively integrating food into their academic
10 subjects. We can celebrate school staff that create a
11 welcoming cafeteria environment and principals that
12 help guide a schoolwide culture of health. As a
13 participant in the Food Ed Coalition, FoodCorps
14 supports the Coalition's position that all New York
15 City students deserve a healthy, equitable,
16 sustainable, and culturally responsive food access
17 and education. In order to achieve this goal, we have
18 to have a better understanding of food education in
19 schools and a reporting bill is a strong first step.
20 As we look to balance this important data with the
21 administrative burden that it could create for
22 schools, FoodCorps supports changes to the bill as
23 outlined and provided to the committee by the
24 Coalition. We're grateful to the City Council for its
25 commitment to food and nutrition education in New

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

York City schools and we look forward to working with you to continue growing healthy New York City students and families. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I just want to say thank you again and just to let folks know I might have mentioned this earlier but in, in my district in, in Southern Brooklyn Edible Garden... Edible school gardens, the students love it, it's at... it's, it's at PS 216, you know I used to teach high school history and one of the elementary school students asked a great level four question, level four was the old DOE chart, the depth of knowledge, DOK chart, critical thinking question, why are fruits and vegetables so expensive, for a young person to already ask that question at the elementary school level is powerful, that's more powerful than any textbook probably that they have during the course and so I... and, and to... and to note that the state doesn't even mandate educators at that... at that level to even have the proper licensing really, really does speak volumes and I... in a local high school in my community, John Dewey High School we just invested over three million dollars to build a state of the art culinary kitchen classroom because I am a big

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 believer in food education and also obviously the
3 health benefits and, and the education part of it but
4 also the careers out of it, you know food
5 preparation, food... it's, it's one of the most booming
6 industries that we have in, in New York and, and
7 across the country in food and hospitality and so
8 we'll be connecting our, our high school students
9 with local restaurants as well so they'll, they'll be
10 asking great level four questions, learning about how
11 to grow food. They also asked a question, why isn't
12 this grown here and that leads to science, climate,
13 geography, history, so many great level four
14 questions, they will do better on the regents if we
15 teach this so, I, I fully, fully agree with you, I
16 applaud you and we have more work to do. Thank you so
17 much, appreciate you..

18 MIREM VILLAMIL: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you. We've
20 also been joined by Council Member Deutsch who is
21 here and the next panel. We have Chloe Coscarelli;
22 David, I think... I'm... forgive me if I mispronounce the
23 name, David Dunaief; Gail Mayer; Marisa Miller
24 Wolfson and Robyn Kenul.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHLOE COSCARELLI: Good afternoon. My
3 name is Chloe Coscarelli, I'm a vegan chef and
4 cookbook author. I've been vegan for 15 years and
5 have tons of experience making meals that taste
6 fantastic without using any processed meat. I support
7 the passing of Resolution 238 to remove processed
8 meats from schools to benefit the health of students
9 and staff. I am confident that the food service staff
10 can create delicious, healthful meals without any
11 processed meat, and I would be pleased to personally
12 lend my expertise in menu development. It is critical
13 that we take action now to pass this resolution. We
14 cannot afford to backtrack. More than 50,000 people
15 in the United States die each year from colon cancer
16 which has been directly linked to processed meats and
17 this will worsen if nothing changes. Exposure to
18 healthful foods like fruits, vegetables, legumes,
19 whole grains at a young age will help kids develop
20 lifelong healthy eating habits and lower their risk
21 for cancer. From a culinary perspective, there is no
22 reason to use processed meats in school meals.
23 Instead of sausage crumbles, kids could enjoy black
24 beans in burritos which have tons of fiber and
25 protein. Instead of hot dogs and pepperoni pizza, we

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

can make easy kid friendly recipes like buffalo cauliflower wings or spaghetti with mushroom meatballs. Schools around the country would be inspired to follow if they saw New York City take a stance today. Thank you.

GAIL MAYER: My name is Gail Mayer and I'm a Registered Dietician. The list of documented reasons to pass Resolution 238 and remove processed meats from schools is quite long. To name a few, studies have found that every serving of processed meat per day increases the risk of the two most common causes of death; heart attack and cancer, including colorectal cancer, esophageal, gastric, and bladder cancers. One daily serving of processed meat also increases the risk of hypertension and stroke. Feeding processed meat to children in schools impacts not only their long-term health, but also their current health through increased risk of developing type II diabetes. This is of particular concern here in New York City because the number of children in New York City living with type II diabetes is more than double the national rate and diabetes rates continue to rise. Studies indicate that diabetes onset before age 30 can shorten one's life span by 15

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 years and young onset is associated with higher risk
3 of comorbidities and complications including kidney
4 failure and blindness. Because schools have
5 particular responsibility to protect children from
6 harm, it is imperative that the food served to them
7 in school does not put them at increased risk of life
8 threatening and debilitating health conditions.
9 Rather, as a matter of public health, we should
10 strive to serve students the most health promoting
11 foods possible because we owe every single child the
12 opportunity to enjoy a long, healthy life free from
13 degenerative chronic disease. Thank you.

14 MARISA MILLER WOLFSON: Hello, my name is
15 Marisa Miller Wolfson, I'm the Director of a
16 Documentary called Vegucated and now I'm a New York
17 City parent and I'm in the process of writing,
18 writing also a cookbook with kid friendly recipes and
19 I'm here because I believe that our schools have no
20 business serving this stuff because in reality
21 they're not kid friendly at all, we know about the
22 cancer links, I don't need to repeat anything you
23 just said and you know and what kids eat early on
24 really does set the stage for what they eat later on.
25 Two days ago, there was an article on CBS about the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 rollbacks on the... on the healthier, you know lunch
3 initiatives from the Obamas and, and it says... I'm
4 going to tell you what the last paragraph was, it
5 says, the changes are considered a victory for food
6 companies that count on schools as a steady source of
7 revenue and an opportunity to shape the buying habits
8 of future consumers, yikes. Yeah, so my parents... my
9 children are in a private school and there's no
10 processed meats, they have a plant based entrée every
11 day so that's great, why should private school kids
12 not be in harms way and public school kids be more in
13 harms way, it just... it's not fair to me and it's
14 interesting as I write my cookbook it's being, being
15 made even clearer to me that we... that parents are
16 obsessed with, with keeping their babies and their
17 toddlers really healthy, I mean everything is
18 organic, right, all the baby food stuff is like
19 organic, whole foods and then what, you send them to
20 preschool and suddenly that changes and you give them
21 cancerous foods like that, that makes no sense. So,
22 no, so, so it's, it's making a parent's job harder to
23 feed our kids healthfully when they... you know they're
24 friends are eating this stuff at school and instead
25 we need to extend the level of care past the baby,

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 toddler years into elementary school and beyond. In
3 some public schools like PS 244 in Queens and 344 in
4 Lower Manhattan have already banned this, they're
5 having great participation rates and they're doing
6 really well so, so why don't we just follow their
7 lead, you know this is a no brainer and thank you so
8 much, you've been such an amazing listener through
9 this whole thing and I just have to thank you. Thank
10 you all.

11 ROBYN KENUL: Hello. Hi, my name is Robyn
12 Kenul and I'm a Registered Dietitian supporting
13 Resolution 238 and I'm going to be reiterating some
14 things that we've already said today but I think it's
15 very important to drive it home and unfortunately a
16 lot of people that I meet with, a lot of my patients
17 don't know this stuff yet, it's not common knowledge,
18 we have a very educated room here tonight... today but
19 most people I speak to about processed meats have no
20 idea about the risks. You ask somebody about
21 cigarettes, everybody knows. So, we need to make this
22 more main stream. The research clearly shows
23 processed meats cause colorectal cancer, diet is
24 linked to cancer deaths in as many as 70 percent of
25 colorectal cancer cases. I advocate for a menu change

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 that not only removes carcinogenic foods but replaces
3 them with plant-based foods which fight cancer thanks
4 to their fiber and high antioxidant content. Colon
5 polyps which are a precursor to colorectal cancer
6 could be reduced by increasing fiber intake, every
7 ten grams of dietary fiber consumed cut the
8 likelihood of having a polyp by nine percent
9 according to a study published in gastroenterology.
10 Eating 50 grams of processed meat daily also
11 increases the risk of prostate cancer, pancreatic
12 cancer and overall cancer mortality. With one third
13 of all cancer deaths being diet related, it is
14 critical to make a menu change for the better. I hope
15 that New York City will take action to fight a
16 largely preventable disease and, and in by doing so
17 everyone will be educated of why we took it out of
18 the school system, and everybody will know the risks
19 of processed meats at home. Thank you.

20 DAVID DUNAIEF: I feel old, I feel like
21 I'm the only one who's using cheaters, am I older
22 than everybody else or what is it? But what she said,
23 Robyn because what I'm going to say is very similar
24 to what she said but... and I thought it was
25 wonderfully done but I'd like to thank you for the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 opportunity and it's an honor to be here as well. My
3 name is Dr. David Dunaief, I'm an Internist who
4 specializes in integrative medicine which combines
5 conventional medicine with lifestyle changes
6 including a nutrient dense diet. Most of my patients
7 I work with are seeking to reverse disease. We have
8 the opportunity to prevent it thus I'm here to
9 support Resolution 238 to remove processed meat from
10 schools. As a physician, I know the research links
11 processed meat to colorectal cancer and that the
12 incident rates are rising in young people. What we
13 think of as age-related diseases or chronic diseases
14 like obesity, cancer, heart disease and type II
15 diabetes are becoming prevalent in younger
16 populations. Why is that? What we eat from a young
17 age over time impacts our health. If a child begins
18 with unhealthy foods like processed meats their,
19 their risks increase for developing chronic disease
20 earlier in life. We are also planting the seed for
21 poor eating habits later in life because when we
22 think about processed meats we have to ask ourselves
23 two questions; where are the nutrients, processed
24 meats lack nutrients and that's what we should be
25 looking for; where is... and number two, where is the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 fiber, for everything that has fiber has protein but
3 not everything that has protein has fiber. So, I hear
4 this all the time, where's the protein, it should be
5 where's the fiber. Why is fiber so important, it
6 helps to prevent, treat and reverse chronic diseases
7 like colorectal cancer, diabetes, heart disease,
8 obesity and so on. One way it does this is through
9 tamping down inflammation, the basis of most chronic
10 diseases, we are woefully deficient in fiber but it's
11 an easy fix through more of an emphasis on a whole
12 food, plant-based diet. So, remember the commercial
13 in which... remember the commercial in the 80's with
14 the elderly woman asking where's the beef and
15 everybody chuckled, it should have been where's the
16 fiber and other nutrients. We cannot continue to harm
17 our bodies at an early age by serving processed meats
18 in schools, we need to replace them with foods that
19 promote health like fruits, vegetables, whole grains
20 and legumes. This is important not only for one's
21 physical health but also mental and emotional. When
22 someone is diagnosed with a, a disease they
23 unwillingly have to take on a new and degrading
24 identity, their disease. Coping with a new diagnosis
25 has caused many of my patients' turmoil and not just

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 them but their friends and family around them as
3 well, the patient, the caregiver, the friend, the
4 neighbor each of these people are hit like a ripple
5 effect when the disease has taken hold. My
6 grandfather died of colorectal cancer at age 71, it
7 was too late for him to turn his fate around. As a
8 ten-year-old boy I, I myself feared getting the same
9 disease, I panicked when I thought I had systems of
10 colorectal cancer too. I'm so thankful that I didn't
11 let the genes determine my fate but rather learned to
12 eat healthfully early on. Put yourself in the shoes
13 of someone with a disease and think about the
14 burdensome feelings that you get, what if we... what if
15 we can help stop that diagnosis from ever occurring
16 in the first place and then early detection is not
17 enough, we need prevention, we need processed meats
18 out of schools and high fiber plant based foods to be
19 the stars of the plate. In fact, when it comes to
20 colorectal cancer early detection in young adults is
21 rare or doesn't even exist, we don't look at young
22 people between the ages of 20 and 50 for diagnosis,
23 we start diagnosing people at 45... maybe 45, it's 50
24 technically but now we're starting to bring it down
25 to 45. So, the people who are between the ages of 20

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 and 50 they have double or quadruple the rise of
3 having a virulent form of colorectal cancer. Let's
4 give our children, our neighborhood, our city a
5 healthy start so they don't have to figure out how to
6 change bad eating habits later when it might be just
7 too late, we need to make the grass roots change
8 ourselves today in this meeting room and create a
9 ripple effect that's positive for our community and
10 our society, thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much,
12 I, I wish that these discussions could be broadcast
13 to every classroom in, in New York City because this
14 is such powerful testimony and as I was listening I
15 just want to note that for example we have some chefs
16 here and cookbook authors which is... and... which is
17 phenomenal and excellent and health care
18 professionals and advocates so take for example, I
19 mentioned before quinoa, I represent Coney Island for
20 example, not many of our neighborhood stores carry or
21 have quinoa but we know that there are certain health
22 benefits from... moving quinoa away from a pasta for,
23 for example but I see our schools as the great
24 equalizer because we've mentioned before that your
25 zip code should not determine your fate so when you

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 enter a public school that's supposed to be a place
3 where we break through barriers and that all these
4 great educational tools that we're hearing about
5 today permeate the school cafeteria, permeate that
6 place and also we heard before about the physical
7 space of our... of our food places in schools, it's the
8 old factory model in many of our schools. Food should
9 be a socializing experience as well where kids... our
10 children celebrate a socializing time. There are
11 three forces I've learned as an educator... I'm, I'm a
12 former high school teacher, that I learned that
13 brought our kids together more than anything; food,
14 art and music and those are the three areas we're
15 lacking probably the most in our schools. So, I
16 applaud all of you and we have much more work to do
17 and I thank you for your partnership and leadership,
18 thank you so much. The next panel we'll call up Emily
19 Kadar; Zoe Ridolfi-Starr; Edita Birnkrant; Gary
20 Edwards; and Andrew Santa Ana. If there are folks
21 missing, we'll call up some more. We'll call up Allie
22 Taylor, Allie is here, we can call up Allison Chenel
23 Trevellini and do we have room for one more. Okay,
24 alright that's good.

25 ZOE RIDOLFI-STARR: Great thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 ANDREW STA. ANA: I can start, okay. Well
3 the moment is finally here. Thank you so much. Thank
4 you for the Council Members for drafting legislation
5 to address comprehensive sexual education
6 legislation. I'm here on behalf of Day One, an
7 organization based out of New York City that works
8 with young people age 24 and under who've experienced
9 dating and sexual violence. Each year Day One assists
10 more than 18,000 youth under the age of 24 through
11 education and services around dating and sexual
12 violence through the workshops we provide which
13 include young people of all genders, LGBTQ folks,
14 people of color, immigrants, students, parents and
15 children and survivors of trauma and violence. We are
16 mindful that not all young people are provided age
17 appropriate medically accurate education about their
18 bodies and their rights. At Day One we work to create
19 systems that provide young people to obtain knowledge
20 that not only further their support for their own
21 health in choices but also towards understanding
22 boundaries and communicating when they experience
23 discomfort, tension, and communicate when another's
24 behavior is not consensual. With this in mind we
25 offer the following testimony in support of bills

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 3611 and Resolution 0716 because we believe that
3 these are important steps towards advancing the
4 health and safety of New York City students. With
5 respect to bill 3611, we are highly supportive of it.
6 At Day One we recently launched an early relationship
7 abuse prevention program in September of 2018, we
8 provided 132 workshops to middle schoolers on the
9 topics such as healthy relationships, consent and
10 coercion. We recognized simultaneously that this
11 education and these workshops are also appropriate
12 for ages... through kindergarten through fifth grade so
13 there are conversations that you can have with young
14 people about boundary setting, about consent, about
15 respecting what it is to say no. similarly we are
16 also supportive of the Resolution 0716, which would
17 push the DOE to adopt all the policy recommendation
18 of the Mayor's sexual health education task force.
19 More particularly within those recommendations
20 there's information around... recommendations around a
21 public awareness campaign and requiring professional
22 development for instructors to ensure that students
23 are receiving high quality education. These were
24 things that were addressed earlier in the hearing and
25 we want to just bolster that support because we

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

believe these are not only healthy for the health of our students but also for their safety as well. Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Sorry, could you also identify yourself please.

ANDREW STA. ANA: Sure, my name is Andrew Sta. Ana, it's spelled S T A period, capital A N A and I'm the Director of Legal Services at Day One.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

ZOE RIDOLFI-STARR: Hi, good afternoon... is this on? Good afternoon, my name is Zoe Ridolfi-Starr, I serve as the Policy Co-Chair for the Sexuality Education Alliance of New York City. Thank you for the opportunity to testify and for your leadership on this issue. We are pleased to be here and express our support for Council Member Cumbo's bill 3611 and Council Member Levin's Resolution 0716 and to offer some suggestions for strengthening these proposals. In the interest of time we're going to condense our time... our testimony but we've submitted a more detailed written testimony. We support bill 3611. In New York City students are supposed to receive sexuality education in their health class however as reports suggest and as many have noted

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 here today many schools fail to provide it. Existing
3 reporting requirements under Local Law 14 require the
4 DOE to report annually on the provision of health
5 education but no reporting is required on sex
6 education specifically which makes it impossible for
7 us to know whether students are receiving the sex
8 education they need and to which they are legally
9 entitled. This bill will help address the problem and
10 it will enable city officials, parents and advocates
11 to better understand which schools are meeting their
12 legal obligation to provide sex education and take
13 action to address non-compliance. In order to ensure
14 this bill serves it's intended purpose, we propose
15 three changes. We think that section 21-966(b) should
16 be revised to include elementary schools in each
17 reporting requirement. As you noted earlier students
18 in grades K through 12 are supposed to receive health
19 education each year and because health education in
20 middle and high school builds on learning standards
21 from elementary education it's important to capture
22 data on sexual health education in grades K through
23 five. Further, if the Department of Education were to
24 implement the task force's recommendations as the
25 bills today are urging, then K through five schools

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 will be required to offer... or to provide sex
3 education so we will want to have data on tracking
4 that. Do you mind if I offer our two remaining
5 proposals? Thank you. We also believe that the bill
6 should be revised to include in section six the
7 number of teachers who are not certified health
8 instructors but did teach health education as well as
9 the number of teachers who have attended zero DOE
10 trainings on health and or sexual health education in
11 the last two years but did provide health education.
12 In addition to the certification issues you raised
13 which are significant, there are also issues in lack
14 of training specifically training in sexuality
15 education and this becomes particularly important on
16 topics like LGBTQ issues where language, culture and
17 sensitivity issues evolve rapidly and many of the
18 older educators who are providing this education are
19 working with extremely out of date information. This
20 is the reports that we hear from our students as well
21 as our educators that are a part of our coalition.
22 And finally, we think that section four (iii) should
23 require schools to report on whether they include any
24 measure of student satisfaction in assessing the
25 efficacy of their health education curriculum and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 instruction. Assessing student satisfaction and
3 comfort can help measure the curriculum's cultural
4 competency and LGBTQ inclusivity of both the
5 curriculum and the instruction. And we also support
6 0716 and as many have stated it is urgent, it is
7 imperative, students need a comprehensive mandate for
8 K through 12 sexuality education in New York City,
9 thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank, thank you
11 very much and I'll just note for the record that when
12 you don't have a licensed educator in front of
13 students teaching these important subjects what
14 happens is that, yes, you might have someone who's
15 out of licensed and I hear... because I'm a former
16 teacher, I hear it from my colleagues that there...
17 some, sometimes there's a fear of teaching these
18 subjects... [cross-talk]

19 ZOE RIDOLFI-STARR: Absolutely... [cross-
20 talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...because they might
22 say something that is inappropriate, might get them
23 in trouble, might create controversy and so they
24 believe it's important to teach these subjects, but
25 they don't... they acknowledge they don't have the, the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

credentials, the licensing and the skills to teach
it... [cross-talk]

ZOE RIDOLFI-STARR: Right... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...and so that's,
that's a real problem and so you need folks who know
what they're doing teaching these very critical
subject matters which are mandates as you point out,
thank you so much, appreciate it.

EDITA BIRNKRANT: Thank you Councilman
Treyger. My name is Edita Birnkrant and I'm the
Executive Director of NYCLASS, an animal advocacy
nonprofit organization based in New York City with
supporters in all five boroughs and I'm a resident of
Queens and a lifelong graduate of New York City
public schools. And NYCLASS is in strong support of
Resolution 238, which calls upon the Department of
Education to ban carcinogenic processed meats from
being served in public schools. New York City school
kids deserve a healthy start in life and during their
school day and indeed there is a proven correlation
between healthy eating including nutrient rich
vegetables and fruits and improved test scores,
better attention spans and energy levels for
students. However, the Department of Education

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 currently serves around 900,000 meals to students
3 every day which regularly includes processed meats
4 and as we have heard the world health organizations
5 international agency for research on cancer has
6 ranked the same processed meats being served in New
7 York City schools as a group I carcinogen, the same
8 as the Newport cigarettes that Eric Adams brought in.
9 And we know that this classification indicates
10 scientific evidence proving that processed meats can
11 increase the risk of several cancers, diabetes, and
12 respiratory illnesses and obesity. Resolution 238
13 provides the easy solution of removing unhealthy
14 processed meats from public school cafeterias and we
15 would recommend that they are replaced with plant-
16 based options. Many children rely on free school
17 lunches as an important part of their nutrition for
18 the day so passing Resolution 238 is necessary to
19 protect the health and wellbeing of the nearly one
20 million kids eating school lunches in New York City
21 and this Resolution benefits human health as well as
22 the health of the environment. A reduction in meat
23 eating will help reduce the environmental devastation
24 caused by meat production and of course the violence
25 inherent in meat production to animals. NYCLASS

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 commends Brooklyn Borough President Eric Adams,
3 Council Member Cabrera and, and the other sponsors of
4 this Resolution for this true investment into our
5 future. Thank you.

6 EMILY KADAR: Good afternoon, thank you
7 Chairman Treyger and the rest of the Committee for
8 the opportunity to speak today. My name is Emily
9 Kadar and I'm here representing the National
10 Institute for Reproductive Health, we're a
11 reproductive rights organization that builds power at
12 the state and local level to change public policy,
13 galvanize public support and normalize women's
14 decisions about abortion and contraception. And we
15 include support and advocacy for comprehensive
16 sexuality education as part of that goal. We are also
17 a very proud member of SEANYC and so most... much of my
18 testimony will be backing up what Zoe said but I
19 would just like to add that since 2011, as was
20 explored at this hearing, DOE has required that
21 sexuality education include in the two semesters of
22 health education mandated by the state.

23 Unfortunately, we've seen both in the independent
24 surveys that's been referenced and, in the DOE's, own
25 data that this education is just not happening as it

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 should. Two years ago the Council passed a bill
3 creating the sexual health education task force and
4 that group of experts and stakeholders studied that
5 issue and published their recommendations and around
6 that same time I think as a result of the data that
7 was put out because of the Council's action in sort
8 of forcing that release, DOE announced the creation
9 of Health Ed... of the Health Ed Works initiative to
10 improve health education and all of these
11 developments are steps in the right direction but
12 there is so much we need to do and so I am very happy
13 to testify today in support of 3611 and also
14 Resolution 716. As I said I think Zoe did a really
15 good job going through some of the recommendations to
16 enhance Council Member Cumbo's bill, so I won't
17 repeat them, but I do just want to reiterate that we
18 support that bill and we also really do support
19 implementation of the recommendations of the sexual
20 health task force. That report was published six
21 months ago, and I understand that there is a review
22 period, but it includes some really tangible steps
23 the city can take to require comprehensive age
24 appropriate sexuality education that begins in
25 kindergarten, occurs regularly through the end of

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 high school, is taught by qualified educators and is
3 consistent with the national sexuality education
4 standards. What we're asking for here is not like
5 some wild fantasy it is just really consistent,
6 reliable education that makes sure that young people
7 are set up to be healthy and safe and empowered and
8 really successful going forward and so I want to
9 thank you again for holding this hearing, hearing,
10 exploring this important issue and we're very excited
11 to continue working with you on it.

12 ALLIE TAYLOR: Thanks. My name is Allie
13 Taylor and I'm the President and Founder of Voters
14 for Animal Rights based in Brooklyn, we're a grass
15 roots organization representing more than 60,000 New
16 Yorkers who care deeply about the humane treatment of
17 animals, the environment and the health of our fellow
18 New Yorkers. We are grateful that the City Council
19 and the Committee on Education, Chairman Treyger,
20 along with Council Member Cabrera, Council Member
21 Rosenthal, Council Member Brannan and Speaker Johnson
22 have prioritized the health and wellbeing of New York
23 City's public-school children. VFAR wholeheartedly
24 supports the passage of Reso 238, which advocates for
25 prohibiting public schools from serving toxic

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 carcinogenic processed meats in our schools while
3 recommending healthy sustainable plant-based options
4 for in school meals. This is pragmatic public policy
5 solution which would mean better quality food for
6 students, and a major reduction in New York City's
7 dependence on animal agriculture which would save the
8 lives of millions of animals while drastically
9 reducing New York City's carbon footprint. We urge
10 swift passage of this Reso and urge the City
11 Department of Education to adopt these
12 recommendations as soon as possible. I also wanted to
13 just really briefly share a letter written by one of
14 our supporters, Alison Timko who is the president of
15 the Parent's Association at Grover Cleveland High
16 School in Ridgewood, Queens, she wrote this letter
17 with input from her two teenage daughters who are
18 currently in school. And Alison wrote, after learning
19 the facts of what I was feeding my own children at
20 school I knew I had to get involved and speak up for
21 them. As a mom of two teenage vegan girls, I've seen
22 and felt the difference firsthand. We're a much
23 healthier family and my daughters and I are rarely
24 sick which less time out of school and better grades
25 for my daughters. As I meet more and more kids at

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Grover Cleveland High School, I see and hear their
3 interest in eating a plant based vegan lifestyle but
4 it's just that there's not enough options for them.
5 They do have a salad bar in this school, but kids
6 aren't eating and just... kids aren't interested in
7 eating just salad. I know more and more children are
8 finding it difficult to stick to plant-based eating
9 because of the lack of support from home but if they
10 had those options in school it would make it much
11 easier for them to eat healthier. Eating a plant-
12 based lifestyle will help children feel less sick and
13 spend less time out of school which can mean better
14 grades which is better for the school overall.
15 They'll feel much better after they eat because they
16 won't be as tired and drained from digesting animal
17 products, they'll be more awake in class, pay better
18 attention and get better grades. And most important
19 to me is making children much more compassionate. Not
20 only are they taking responsibility for their own
21 health but also for the health of our environment and
22 more compassion towards other students which in this
23 day and age we need and if not to mention of course
24 the billions of animals who are suffering. There's no
25 down side to a plant-based lifestyle, its only what

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 we perceive it to be. Fostering a plant-based
3 lifestyle is a first and big step to telling children
4 as adults that we care about your health, we care
5 about the planet and we care about compassionate
6 humans and no animals need to suffer unimaginable
7 horror every day. Please, we need to pass Reso 238.
8 Our kids need this big significant step in the right
9 direction. Thank you, from Alison Timko, President of
10 Grover Cleveland High School Parent's Association.

11 CHENEL TREVELLINI: Hi, my name is Chenel
12 Trevellini and I'm a registered nurse and also a
13 holistic health coach. I am here in support of
14 Resolution 238 and I'd like to start out talking
15 about colorectal cancer just a little bit, I know
16 we've talked about that quite a bit today but we have
17 eight people per day in the state of New York that
18 are dying from colorectal cancer, that's, that's just
19 in the state of New York so, colorectal cancer we
20 know is linked to processed meat consumption. And as
21 Eric Adams said earlier today that we're really
22 planting the seed in our schools so these people that
23 are dying from colorectal cancer right now are not
24 these children, this is to come so we have the
25 opportunity to prevent these deaths. I just really

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 want to talk to you briefly about how processed meats
3 are known to... are known cancer causing agents and ask
4 that you take immediate action to protect our
5 children by removing processed meats from our
6 children's school lunches. We know that the world
7 health organization has classified processed meats in
8 the same category as asbestos, tobacco... and tobacco
9 products. Just as schools educate students on the
10 risks of tobacco, we should also be educating
11 students on the risks of consuming processed meats
12 while also removing them from the menu. As a
13 registered nurse I specialize in the care of patients
14 with digestive disorders, I have encountered hundreds
15 of patients during my career that have colorectal
16 cancer. Most of these patients require surgical
17 procedures to remove the cancer as well as
18 chemotherapy and radiation therapy. Many times, the
19 treatment options cause major disruptions in the
20 person's normalcy of life. On average children ate 22
21 grams of processed meat per day, serving processed
22 meat on the menu even once a week increases the
23 child's risk of colorectal cancer. Colorectal cancer
24 is the number three type of cancer in the US
25 predicted as of 2019 with over 51,000 deaths expected

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

this year alone. Please take immediate action to protect our children by removing processed meats from the New York City school lunches. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you very... thank you very much. We'll now call up the next panel Amaku Ukpong; Nicole Jennings; Maggie Neola; Ora Kemp; Lianna Levine Reisner.

[off mic dialogue]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: You may begin.

LIANNA LEVINE REISNER: My name is Lianna Levine Reisner speaking in support of Resolution 238. I live in the Upper West Side, district six, have three school aged children who now eat a whole food plant-based diet. Cancer runs in my family. My mother survived an aggressive non-Hodgkin's lymphoma in her mid-40s. The experience of having cancer in our home was tragic and life changing for me. My grandmother and her mother had breast cancer as well. Until recently I had thought that cancer would be around the corner for me, assuming that I should be screened to determine what's in the cards and whether to prepare my family should I suffer the same fate as my mother. However, in just the past two years I've become aware of the growing body of scientific

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 evidence implicating what we eat in most common
3 chronic diseases including cancers of the breast and
4 prostate, leukemia and lymphoma and digestive
5 cancers. It turns out that cancer is not only about
6 unlucky genes. Studies have demonstrated that animal
7 protein may prompt cancer cells to progress into
8 larger tumors. Observational studies of cancer rates
9 around the globe show that those communities eating
10 low fat diets with very minimal animal products and
11 processed foods are communities with very low rates
12 of cancer. With this knowledge I reversed my
13 endometriosis. If you told me that my kids would be
14 handed a cigarette or exposed to asbestos at school I
15 would obviously be livid. Since processed meat is a
16 class I carcinogen like those substances there's no
17 good reason to feed it to our children.

18 Unfortunately, hot dogs and bologna sandwiches are
19 associated with childhood, they're easy to prepare
20 and they're cultural icons, hot dogs may be all
21 American, but they are by no means a health food.
22 Most parents don't know this, and the schools have a
23 role in educating families. As a plant-based health
24 activist through Plant Powered Manhattan, I want to
25 ensure that everyone knows the connection between

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 food and chronic disease and to seek out societal
3 changes that help the average person take charge of
4 their own health destinies. This city has the
5 opportunity to make it easier for millions of people
6 to live healthier lives by changing what's on the
7 menu and who better than to start with our children.

8 MAGGIE NEOLA: My name is Maggie Neola
9 and I am a Registered Dietitian with the Physicians
10 Committee for Responsible Medicine. We are a global
11 nonprofit supported by laypeople members and over
12 12,000 doctors. On behalf of our New York City
13 members, I testify today that we advocate for the
14 passing of Resolution 238. In September of 2018,
15 Santa Barbara Unified School District in California
16 decided to remove processed meats from their district
17 with our support. We are here to support New York
18 City public schools in making the same change. In the
19 words of Santa Barbara's food service director, Nancy
20 Weiss, carcinogens don't belong on the menu and I
21 couldn't agree more. What does belong on the menu are
22 fruits, vegetables, whole grains and legumes, the
23 very foods that can prevent the 70 percent of
24 colorectal cancer cases that are linked to cancer
25 deaths. Diets high in cholesterol, saturated fats and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 highly processed foods cause disease whereas diets
3 high in vitamins, minerals and antioxidants prevent
4 and reverse disease. Just one hot dog or a few strips
5 of bacon consumed daily increases cancer risks by 18
6 percent. And the more one eats of these processed
7 meats the greater their risk is. So, let's eliminate
8 the risk entirely caused by processed meats and
9 thereby encourage the entire country to do the same.
10 The Physicians Committee is eager to help New York
11 City schools and others make healthy menu changes
12 just like this each step of the way. Thank you for
13 listening.

14 NICOLE JENNINGS: Good afternoon Council
15 Members. My name is Nicole Jennings and I'm a Program
16 Director at WHEDco, the Women's Housing and Economic
17 Development Corporation in the South Bronx. We're
18 thrilled to see the Council taking up the issue of
19 health education in schools specifically as it
20 relates to sexuality education. Recently high-profile
21 media stories and trending hashtags have raised
22 awareness of the problem many of us in the field know
23 well. The instances of sexual assault and domestic
24 abuse are all too common. Here in New York City for
25 young women between the ages of 15 and 24, more than

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 one in five dating relationships are characterized by
3 physical violence, about two thirds of young women
4 experience coercion and more than one third
5 experience four sexual experiences. WHEDco is working
6 to counter these trends in the Bronx, the borough
7 with the highest per capita rates of domestic
8 violence incidence in the city to give... to, to give
9 students the skills they need to develop and maintain
10 healthy relationships, relationships throughout their
11 lives. In our peer led workshops called Just Ask Me
12 or JAM, trained high school students educate middle
13 school students about consent and healthy
14 relationships as well as other important topics like
15 anatomy, safe sex, pregnancy and pregnancy
16 prevention. We arm students with medically accurate
17 facts about their bodies and provide a safe space for
18 a dialogue about what they hear in the world and see
19 online. The feedback from students has been
20 incredibly positive, it turns out that kids and their
21 parents are hungry for this information and we know
22 it works. The post assessments for sixth grade
23 students in 2018 who participated in JAM showed a 90
24 percent increase in their subject knowledge. And
25 because we found that so many middle school students

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 were coming into our... who were coming into our
3 program with misinformation and health... unhealthy
4 messages about sex, relationships and their bodies we
5 realized we needed to start earlier to give younger
6 students a better foundation of knowledge on these
7 topics. We developed a special program for third
8 through fifth grade students called JAM JR where we
9 talk about basic respect for other people's bodies
10 and boundaries in ways that they can understand.
11 Unfortunately, far too many New York City students
12 aren't given opportunities to learn about and discuss
13 these vital issues in age appropriate ways. While
14 current city law requires sexual health to be
15 included in school health curriculums as we have
16 talked there is a lack of detail as to what, what
17 should be... there... as to what should be included or
18 how extensive the lessons should be. And as we've
19 heard from the New York City Comptrollers Office that
20 often it's not at all. WHEDco strongly supports the
21 proposed law that I won't restate but additionally we
22 recommend that the improved curriculum include
23 consent as a mandated topic. When young people have
24 the tools to articulate their boundaries and to
25 respect other people's they will grow into adults who

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 believe in and practice this. We.. if we formulize
3 discussions around consent early and often and create
4 spaces for kids to ask questions and explore the
5 concept, we may be able to prevent another generation
6 of saying me too. Thank you.

7 AMAKU UKPONG: Press this button... okay, I
8 do. Hi, so my name is Amaku Ukpung, I'm Brooklyn born
9 and raised, graduated John Dewey High School, went to
10 public school in Brooklyn, Clinton Hill and I heard
11 about this last minute so I don't have anything typed
12 up and I'm, I'm not going to read from a paper
13 because I can't even read my handwriting, so.. but I'm
14 here, right. So, we heard a lot of testimony today
15 about a few topics within the schools; we heard about
16 sleep deprivation and how maybe school time should
17 start later, and we heard about having Naloxone
18 available in schools in case of opioid overdoses. I'm
19 here in support of Resolution 238 because I'm a
20 nutritionist and I have a holistic wellness practice
21 and I know that food is connected to everything so I
22 wanted to just more ask questions as opposed to tell
23 you guys statistics, you've heard a lot of statistics
24 today, they're available online, they're available
25 everywhere but what if, you know processed meats and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 it's addictive substances are somehow connected to or
3 would, would predispose someone for developing other
4 addictions later in life such as opioid addictions.

5 Let me backtrack a little bit because a lot of
6 research is suggesting that meat especially red meat
7 and most definitely processed meats are addictive
8 substances because our bodies think they are... they're
9 opioid like substances contained within them. So,

10 what if by feeding our, our children processed meats
11 we sort of make it more likely that they're going to
12 develop opioid addictions later in life, right. So,

13 I'm here supporting Resolution 238 because I think
14 food, you know is the beginning of everything, food...
15 it starts with food, really and in my practice, you
16 know food isn't just about physical health and about,
17 you know healthy organs but food is also

18 psychological and nutrition is psychological, it's
19 emotional, it's spiritual and so it's much more, its
20 so, so much broader than, you know what we... what

21 we've come to realize. I just need a few more
22 seconds, I want it to be very quick. So, I, I, I

23 invite you guys to do some research on the
24 connections between processed meats and opioid
25 addiction and maybe there's something there.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Actually, there's a study that's available to the NIH
3 where they treated people with addiction drug called
4 Nalbuphine and the... these subjects who took
5 Nalbuphine their salami consumption went down 25
6 percent, their ham consumption went down 10 percent
7 and their tuna consumption went down 50 percent and
8 you know canned tuna is still processed meat in my...
9 I'm a vegan so, so there's something there and I
10 think we need to really investigate that. I think
11 people think that food is such a small issue but food
12 and drug addiction and sleep deprivation what... you
13 know and let me backtrack with that too, you know
14 what if our students didn't need nine... or eight hours
15 of sleep because they're eating healthier so they
16 only need five so maybe we wouldn't be fighting so
17 hard to have school start later if we can start and
18 work on the nutrition part. So, I think that's it,
19 right so I hope you guys remember that and, and you
20 know have some mental notes and go on google scholar
21 and research some of these studies and I'm radical,
22 you know what I mean this is why I don't work for
23 anybody, I have to work for me. I'm actually for... raw
24 vegan nutritionist and a chef and so I'm... I... my ideas
25 have always been radical when it comes to nutrition

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

so, you know I invite you guys to be radical too because that's what we need right now because the world is increasingly more dangerous for our, our children and in school that is a problem too because they come to school and they eat food that is predisposing them for a lot of health conditions and that's dangerous, that's putting our children in danger. So, I invite you to join the radical train that I'm on so that I'm not by myself, it's a little lonely and... yeah, I appreciate you guys, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, I think we have one more...

ORA KEMP: My mom appreciates you, thank you. Council Members, my first memories of magic taste like salt. The lacking diversity of food options in my neighborhood growing up displayed in the form of a goiter on my grandmother's throat. Caused by an iodine deficiency, the golf ball sized lump would make frequent appearances; snack times of sliced cucumbers and tomatoes sprinkled with salt would last for days following. It was my first memory of the magic of food and it sparked a life centered on the power of nutrition. As the Program Manager for New York Common Pantry's Policy Systems and

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 Environments Team, I work with neighbors and families
3 that share the same barriers that I faced in
4 accessing fresh, nutritious food. We support our
5 communities by teaching them the tools to make
6 healthier lifestyle choices, collaborating with
7 schools and partners to fill the gaps in education
8 and resources. Outside of the school setting, bodegas
9 and corner stores are more accessible than green
10 stands and produce carts. So, the school becomes the
11 ideal environment for students to learn the benefits
12 of food as a tool for prevention, equipping them with
13 the knowledge to fight disease before it manifests.
14 The Department of Education's School Wellness Policy
15 was drafted with the goal of ensuring that all
16 students graduate knowing how to take care of their
17 minds, their bodies, and those around them. Community
18 based organizations like ours partner with schools in
19 teaching the skills to be healthy contributors to
20 society. Documenting our work, outreach and outcomes
21 is an essential piece of the feedback process. It
22 enables us to strategically plan our partnerships, to
23 equitably distribute resources, and measure the
24 impact of our efforts. Nutrition education reporting
25 is not just a good idea, it's a fundamental

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

requirement to be effective, giving necessary insight and, and advising on how and where we can improve as an ally and advocate for school and community health. Reporting on food and nutrition education is how we show our commitment to the health and prosperity of our children. My name is Ora Kemp and I urge you to consider today's testimony and accept the addition to section 1 Title 21-A of the administrative code of the city of New York for Introduction Number 1283. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank, thank you so much again, very powerful stuff from this panel and I heard that you're a graduate also of John Dewey High School... [cross-talk]

AMAKU UKPONG: Yes... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...in my district, we don't have many vegan restaurants out in South Brooklyn so... [cross-talk]

AMAKU UKPONG: You know what if I only had the time... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright... [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

AMAKU UKPONG: ...I, I have a vegan restaurant concept and it's, it's in my head and if anybody wants to work together...

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I, I'd love one in Coney... [cross-talk]

AMAKU UKPONG: ...and make that a reality, yeah.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: That's great, wonderful, thank you so much for all your powerful advocacy, thank you so much... [cross-talk]

MAGGIE NEOLA: Thank you... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I appreciate it. And this is the final panel. We have Rachael Peters; Dr. Meryem Bencheikh-Ellis; Michael Walsh; Katerina Trabazo and I believe Enrica Sacca.

[off mic dialogue]

ENRICA SACCA: Hi, I'm a native New Yorker, my parents came to the US from Southern Italy in the late 1950's. A bowl of pasta and fagioli and a fresh fruit was their typical meal. Once in the United States their diet changed to meat at least three times a week and always a sandwich for lunch. Well, within ten years my father gained 50 pounds and develops type II diabetes, my mother triggered an

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 autoimmune disease and ended up with a liver
3 transplant. And me, I had colitis, I remember
4 spending more time in the bathroom than in class. I
5 grew up hearing my mother saying you have nothing if
6 you don't have your health. In our home we thought we
7 were eating right, the good old American way. A few
8 years ago, I was fed up with being sick. I learned
9 more about diet and health through the work of T.
10 Colin Campbell and others, which allowed me to clear
11 up a lifetime of colitis, something that I never
12 thought was possible nor that doctors indicated was
13 even an option. While the interplay of colitis,
14 cancer and food is not perfectly clear, what I do
15 know is that many bowel issues are reversible with
16 food, as my story demonstrates. Let us not wait for
17 children to grow up and develop these terrible
18 diseases; let us help them avoid them to begin with
19 by taking processed meat out of school lunches.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Sorry, can you just
21 identify yourself for the record?

22 ENRICA SACCA: Enrica Sacca.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

24 DR. MERYEM BENCHEIKH-ELLIS: Good
25 afternoon, it's a privilege, I'm very honored to be

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 here. As the... I would like to thank you Mr. Treyger
3 for chairing this Committee, it's really long
4 overdue, we are in 2018. My name is Dr. Meryem
5 Bencheikh-Ellis, I have a PhD in molecular biology,
6 molecular cellular biology and biochemistry and I
7 defended my thesis on human breast cancer in France
8 and then I came here to do a trial research at
9 Columbia University. I'm a mother of five kids,
10 public school, South Brooklyn, Midwood, Brooklyn
11 Tech, etcetera. I decided to leave all my time for my
12 kids and lately I've been even more involved,
13 spending more time especially in the school that is
14 opening the cafeteria so I could see, and I could
15 volunteer in the cafeteria and I of course noticed
16 that the kids are not interested in the salad bar.
17 The salad bar when I, you know tried to test the,
18 the, the... come on... you know the dressing, full of
19 sugar, I would like to say sugar equals poison. I
20 raised my kids with PBS documentaries, poison... sugar
21 is poison period. So, stay away from sugar but it's
22 very difficult because the kids go under the, the
23 peer pressure and we cannot go... we cannot be always
24 behind our kids. So, fortunately my kids became like
25 all the other kids a bag of chips at the end of the

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 day and Arizona and when they reach puberty, right
3 now I have two in high school, one in middle school
4 and my elementary baby, so they see the, the... you
5 know the, the pounds adding and I, I start reminding
6 them what do we say about sugar, what did we say,
7 okay. I'm here in favor of banning the meat...
8 processed meat and I have to say I don't even... my
9 kids because we are Muslim, we do not... I tell my kids
10 do not... we cannot eat meat, it's not Halal but that's
11 not the point, I'm here to ban that processed meat
12 because I see the kids in the morning in the
13 cafeteria when they take the sausage and sit there, I
14 don't think it's healthy... it's not healthy. I know
15 about colorectal, carcinogenic stages etcetera, one
16 of the best research scientist is Dr. Vogelstein from
17 the NIH, that was my first slide for PhD thesis with
18 all the stages and my... when I had my first baby I had
19 a baby sitter and the son of this baby sitter
20 beautifully graduated from John Jay as a police
21 officer and boom, at 24 years old got hit by colon
22 cancer, colon cancer and when she... when I called the
23 mom... the, the mommy, their background is... was... and I
24 was telling her about my baby, that was back in 2010
25 and I said oh well how are you... how are you and so

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 on, she said well Nomea [phonetic] which is how she
3 used to call him, Nomea [phonetic] has cancer and I
4 said what cancer and she colorectal, that is a
5 disaster. When I hear colorectal I, I have enough
6 background in cancer research for me it was just a
7 final and he's gone and so that's a reality and all
8 the, the results and all the science so, boom... I
9 passed my time, I want to say we should ban the meat,
10 we should be proactive about this, we should do it..
11 like I'm talking... I'm on my speech right now because
12 tomorrow morning I'm going to see the kids again
13 taking their breakfast with the sausage and I will be
14 willing to tell them, actually I have a PTA meeting
15 this afternoon at six p.m. and I will tell this to
16 the other parents but we have to be proactive, we
17 have to stop the, the chocolate milk in all the
18 schools, this is... the... this has to happen, we cannot
19 just continue talking about it and it's difficult to
20 move things in the schools with the parents,
21 everybody wants to vote about every single move but
22 this is a matter of life... come on dear... you know a
23 matter of life, thank you very much, thank you for
24 everything you're doing.

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you, thank
3 you very much for your powerful testimony.

4 KATERINA TRABAZO: Good afternoon, my
5 name is Katerina Trabazo, I'm a New York State
6 certified teacher and a proud vegan. Interestingly
7 enough I taught a health class my first year of
8 teaching and I wish I knew then what I know now. I'm
9 here in support of Resolution 238. Recently New York
10 City came out with an ad against sugary drinks
11 comparing these to cigarettes; however, as a society
12 we are failing to admit the health risks in eating
13 death. All the while we have life to eat such as
14 fruits, grains, vegetables, etcetera. We are
15 allowing... we're still allowing the meat industry to
16 compromise our health and our intelligence. We are
17 also subsidizing these industries. I'll remind you
18 all that the strongest mammals are vegan such as
19 cows, elephants, giraffes, gorillas, horses,
20 etcetera. And as Brooklyn Borough President Eric
21 Adams mentioned diseases are not hereditary, our, our
22 eating habits are hereditary. If we're still... if
23 we're... if we're so concerned for our children's
24 education, we need to start by prioritizing their
25

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 knowledge of what is actually food and I want to
3 thank you for the opportunity to be here.

4 RACHAEL PETERS: This is on... yeah, okay.
5 Thank you Council Member Treyger for convening this
6 riveting hearing, I've been to many hearings and have
7 so appreciated your leadership today. I'm pleased to
8 be here to express support for Council Member Cumbo's
9 bill and Council Member Levin's Resolution. My name
10 is Rachael Peters, I'm here today representing Peer
11 Health Exchange where I'm the Executive Director, I'm
12 also a public-school parent and I serve as a member
13 of PS 10's School Wellness Council and I also serve
14 at the District Wellness Advisory Council as the Co-
15 Chair for the Health Education Committee. Peer Health
16 Exchange is a not... is a nonprofit organization that
17 works to empower young people with the knowledge,
18 skills and resources to make healthy decisions. We
19 train college student volunteers to teach a skills-
20 based health curriculum in... to 6,400 New York City
21 ninth graders in over 50 New York City public high
22 schools. We exist because students are not getting
23 the health education they deserve as has been
24 highlighted today by many Council Members. Peer
25 Health Exchange is a proud member of the sexual

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 education Alliance of New York City and I'm not going
3 to repeat what Zoe and Emily shared but there are
4 proposals for ways to change the, the bill I third. I
5 was at the edge of my seat listening to the questions
6 asked by you around who'd teach health education so
7 I'm skipping ahead in my testimony to talk about that
8 but the rest of it is in my written testimony. So, we
9 support T2019 and I'm, I'm pleased to see that this
10 bill is asking about what grades health education is
11 being taught instead of just is it being taught in
12 high school. We know that... many of us know that it's
13 too late to receive your first health education class
14 about alcohol or consent or pregnancy in 11th or 12th
15 grade if you're getting it at all. Lindsey Harr
16 mentioned earlier that there are 600 certified health
17 educators, I'm not sure where that number comes from
18 because in the data that was released it says 165 but
19 regardless as you pointed out we don't know how many
20 teachers are teaching out of certification. So,
21 something I've been sort of obsessed with lately and
22 I've attached what I've researched around incidental
23 teaching provision to my testimony that I submitted.
24 I think that we're, we're allowing teachers to teach
25 using the incidental teaching provision as a loop

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 hole and I'm not sure how we're getting away with it
3 but I'm interested in, in figuring out more and I'm
4 calling on the Council during a part of this with all
5 of the questions that were asked today to figure out
6 more about how we are allowing our students to be
7 receiving health education not taught by people who
8 are trained in it. I think about the data that we
9 learned from the Local Laws that the City Council has
10 passed so that we're able to understand what exactly
11 is happening in our school and see that only 17
12 percent of those teaching health education received
13 any training in the past two years that means that
14 all of us here today who have sat through this
15 training and learned about opioids and about sleep
16 and about sex education and about carcinogens in our
17 meats which I didn't know about and how I have to
18 change my diet have learned more and know more up to
19 date information than the teachers that are teaching
20 our children about health education, that's
21 ridiculous, our children deserve better and we can do
22 better. Thank you.

23 GARY EDWARDS: Good afternoon everyone,
24 my name is Gary Edwards and I'm a current student at
25 Khalil Gibran High School in Brooklyn. I'm also an

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 intern at the Children's Defense Fund in New York.

3 I'm here to testify about the connection between

4 health and wellness and the school to prison

5 pipeline. As a young individual attending high

6 school, I witness my school struggle with a host of

7 challenges, including a lack of necessary resources

8 and support to help students exceed to the highest

9 level especially students with unmet needs. Health

10 and wellness mean the ability to strive for

11 accomplishments without any unjust barriers or

12 inequalities. Wellness determines whether students

13 can progress through life and stay engaged in school.

14 There are many demands on students even outside of

15 school that have an impact on student health and

16 impact the way that they think or participate in

17 school, including lack of sleep, anxiety, depression,

18 etcetera. Student health has an impact on how they

19 participate in the classroom and can often lead to a

20 negative situation. If a school does not have

21 positive supports for students, they sometimes will

22 experience more school safety agents and security

23 guards to be present in a school, however we need to

24 dig deeper for a solution and resolve the conflicts

25 that are going on. For example, there need to be

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 better consequences instead of arresting a young
3 individual and incarcerating them. this makes
4 everything worse. Arrests are traumatizing. It can be
5 very horrific, especially if it's your first time.
6 You can have a seizure, you can have a panic attack,
7 you can be so anxious to the point where you can't
8 breathe. It would be... it would change your state of
9 mind, it will also make you so overwhelmed and
10 stressed and over time that could really make you
11 perform badly in... bad in school. It also stays with
12 you through, throughout time. The city needs to
13 invest in alternatives to the harsh treatment of
14 students. This could mean guidance counselors,
15 clinical social workers, nurses, even after school
16 programs and other opportunities for students.
17 Schools need more resources. As an example, a
18 guidance counselor could have sessions with students,
19 identify their enthusiasm and emulate the qualities
20 that they have, supporting a student's progress,
21 making sure that they are engaged in school.
22 Supportive staff help you solve problems and also to
23 prevent you to have any problems from happening and
24 prevent arrests. I believe the City cannot continue
25 to be spending resources that are not beneficial to

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

our student's future, instead we need to make that funding and put it into investments that will transform and proceed to help our students succeed. Thank you everyone for my opportunity to testify.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you so much and you can trust that this City Council and this particular Chair a big fan of social workers and guidance counselors in our schools, we need so much more. We fought in the budget last year to get more but we need so much more I agree with you and you know my staff taught me how to... how to pin a tweet and if you check out my pin tweet that's exactly what we talk about. There are more NYPD school safety agents than social workers, guidance counselors and school psychologists combined in the entire city of New York, we have to reverse that ratio so I thank you so much for your testimony and I also want to just note and just to, to wrap up there's a difference between a resolution and an introduction in a bill. An intro means that we can actually pass a, a law in New York City, a reso technically is nonbinding and if you ask... so for example the resolution about processed meats or about the sexual health education these are technically just the sense

1 COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

2 of the body but we don't have... actually have the
3 power at the local level to mandate the change
4 because it's a power that the state kind usurps from
5 us. So, this is a year that, you know Mayoral control
6 has to be reauthorized of the school system, the
7 state will have a conversation about what type of
8 power locality should have over its school system,
9 these are great, great issues to really bring up
10 during the course of that conversation. New York City
11 should have more, you know say over, over these types
12 of matters and these are very powerful, enriching
13 conversations and I think that certainly the health
14 benefits are number one but there's so many
15 educational benefits as well for, for our children
16 and as I mentioned earlier there is this... there is
17 this insulting belief at the highest levels that
18 elementary school grades cannot have or should not
19 have these very powerful conversations, they are...
20 they're already having it even outside of the
21 classroom, it's better they get their education in
22 the classroom than from the outside and, and so I
23 again I cannot thank you all enough for sharing your
24 powerful personal stories and, and your advocacy from
25 our young people, our professionals, our parents, our

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

advocates. This, this.. we're just still getting started here but thank you so much for your powerful voices and advocacy, thank you so much and I think with that thank you, yes... [snapping] we'll go back to the beginning broccoli sofrito, I'm going to add Quinoa to that mix as well, right. Thank you all so much and with that this hearing is adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

February 11, 2019