

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

September 14, 2016
Start: 1:36 p.m.
Recess: 3:40 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
The Speaker of the Council
LETITIA JAMES
The Public Advocate

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Inez E. Dickens
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Barry S. Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Imam Souleimane Konate
Council of African Imams in America

Stuart Kaplan
CEO
Selfhelp Community Services, Inc.

Sgt. Hameed Armani
NYPD

Officer Peter Cybulski
NYPD

Captain O'Hare
Times Square Unit
Patrol Borough Manhattan South
NYPD

Chief Comodo
Patrol Borough Manhattan South
NYPD

Dalilah Muhammad
2016 Olympian

TRANSCRIPTION NOTE: [00:15:10] Spanish

by the Speaker.

[background comments]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, we're gonna get started with our ceremonials; we've got three ceremonials... [background comment] three ceremonials, uh starting off with Council Member Vallone, who is issuing a Proclamation to help the Selfhelp Community Services on their 80th anniversary. So if the reps from Selfhelp could please come on up. [background comments, applause] Alright. And I'll hand it off to Council Member Vallone. [background comment]

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you Madame Speaker. Come on up, Selfhelp. It's a great day and all our Council Members have joined us and signed onto this.

So just to give you why we're here; okay, so we are up here with Selfhelp, and along with my fellow Council Members we are presenting a Proclamation to honor and recognize Selfhelp Community Services for 80 years of serving the senior population in New York City. So 80 years ago Selfhelp was founded and began by supporting Holocaust survivors seeking refuge here in America.

1
2 Built on a mission to enable the elderly and other
3 at-risk populations to live their lives independently
4 and with dignity, Selfhelp has grown to become a
5 nationally recognized innovator in in-home care and
6 senior independent housing. Selfhelp provides over
7 three million hours of professional, quality homecare
8 each year and operates 10 award-winning affordable
9 housing complexes -- Shire House, five senior
10 centers, one Clearview Center, four naturally
11 occurring retirement communities, and continues to
12 grow and expand their services.

13 In my district, the Clearview Center and
14 Shire House of Bayside are shining examples of the
15 incredible work and services that Selfhelp provides
16 to our seniors. Together with our Speaker we have
17 expanded to the innovative Virtual Senior Center,
18 which The Speaker's been a big fan of and helping
19 with, allowing more homebound individuals to
20 participate in this program. Now we are launching
21 classes in Chinese, Korean, Russian, and Spanish. We
22 are also proud to announce a brand new transportation
23 alternative pilot program that will serve seniors in
24 Bayside and Northeast Queens. Too often all of us
25 have heard that our seniors are left stranded with

1
2 little or no transportation options; now we have
3 connected our seniors to cultural institutions and
4 the ability to get their medical appointments through
5 with this new pilot program. Selfhelp's continued
6 services in our city will play an enormous role in
7 providing the best services for all of our seniors;
8 congratulations on 80 years of work to Selfhelp.
9 Congratulations everyone.

10 [cheers, applause]

11 [background comment]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: And now we're
13 gonna read the Proc into the record.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council, City of New
15 York Proclamation. Whereas the Council of the City
16 of New York is proud to honor Selfhelp Community
17 Services for 80 years of outstanding service and
18 contributions.

19 And whereas, Selfhelp Community Services
20 was founded in 1936 when a group of German émigrés
21 joined forces to help European Jewish immigrants who
22 had fled Nazi persecution and came to America seeking
23 a better life; its founders knew that with support,
24 new immigrants could use their experiences, skills
25

1
2 and strengths to become independent, dignified and
3 productive in their new country.

4 And whereas, in its early years, Selfhelp
5 worked with successive [sic] waves [sic] of refugees,
6 providing the direct service that has become its
7 hallmark. While the needs of its clients have
8 changed over the years, Selfhelp has remained
9 unwavering in its commitment to maintaining the
10 independence and dignity of seniors and at-risk
11 populations through a spectrum of housing, home
12 health care and social services.

13 And whereas, today Selfhelp serves nearly
14 20,000 men and women every year, helping them to live
15 with dignity and avoid institutionalization; it
16 manages five City-funded senior centers in Flushing,
17 Bayside, Forest Hills and Maspeth that provide a full
18 range of educational and social programming, as well
19 as meals. Selfhelp also offers an Alzheimer's social
20 day program to care for those coping with Alzheimer's
21 and related disorders, as well as to provide much-
22 needed respite for their caregiver. In addition to
23 being a pioneer in developing the concepts for
24 serving naturally occurring retirement communities

1
2 (NORCs), Selfhelp provides comprehensive services for
3 seniors at four NORCs in Queens.

4 And whereas, Selfhelp's new initiatives
5 include the development of a senior center of the
6 future to accommodate all segments of the aging
7 population including baby boomers. They are also
8 expanding cutting edge technology in client homes
9 that will enhance the safety and quality of
10 independent living. At this special milestone we not
11 only reflect upon this organization's great legacy of
12 service, but also we affirm our faith in its equally
13 promising future.

14 Now therefore be it known, that the
15 Council of the City of New York, including all
16 members of its Queens delegation, honors Selfhelp
17 Community Services for 80 years of outstanding
18 service and enduring contributions to New York City.
19 Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the entire
20 Council; Paul A. Vallone, Council Member 19th
21 District; Peter Koo, Council Member 20th District,
22 and many other Council Members.

23 [background comments, applause, cheers]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Stuart, would
25 you like to say a few words?

1
2 STUART KAPLAN: Sure. Wrapping up 80
3 years in only 120 sentences; way to go.

4 I'm Stuart Kaplan; I'm the CEO of
5 Selfhelp. On behalf of all of the staff that are
6 here with me today; the President of our board,
7 Raymond Schragg, the 2,000 employees of Selfhelp, and
8 the 20,000 seniors, of which about 5,000 are
9 Holocaust survivors, many Asian Americans and all
10 others who reflect Selfhelp, the senior population is
11 our heritage, they are why we are here today; we are
12 proud to be serving them, helping them to live with
13 independence and dignity, whether it's with our
14 social workers or the technology or going from hand-
15 holding to high-tech. The Council Members who are
16 here with us today, I thank each and every one of
17 you; you guys and girls have been just tremendous
18 supporters of Selfhelp; we thank you ever, ever so
19 much and Speaker, [applause] thank you very much for
20 this recognition; [background comment] Paul, thank
21 you for carrying it.

22 [applause, background comments]

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So thank... again,
24 thank you and I know you do work throughout the city;
25 wonderful and appreciate it and that is why so many

1
2 of us are standing up here today. So
3 congratulations.

4 [background comments]

5 [pause]

6 [background comments]

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: The second...

8 [background comments] The second... [background
9 comment] ceremonial Proclamation will be Council
10 Member Wills. [background comments] Oh, okay;
11 sorry, I guess the second ceremonial will be one that
12 I am sponsoring; I would like to ask... Definitely we...
13 I would like to ask my colleagues, those that are in
14 the chamber, to join me. It's an honor for me today
15 to have Sgt. Hameed Armani and Officer Peter
16 Cybulski, two officers who exhibited extraordinary
17 commitment to public safety; they are joined here
18 today by Chief O'Hare and Chief Comodo, along with
19 the parents of Officer Cybulski; if we could come up,
20 there we are; they're coming on my left. Hi.

21 [applause, background comments]

22 As many of you know, this past July -- I
23 hope I'm pronouncing... Cybulski [background comment].
24 Okay; got it. This past July Sgt. Armani and Police
25 Officer Cybulski were sitting in a police car in

1
2 Times Square when someone suddenly threw what
3 appeared to be a bomb through the car window.

4 Without hesitation and thinking only of the thousands
5 of New Yorkers gathered in Times Square, these heroes
6 drove the device away and notified the bomb squad
7 when they were both a safe distance away.

8 Thankfully, the bomb turned out to be a hoax, but the
9 courage and bravery displayed by both Sgt. Armani and
10 Officer Cybulski that day and each day they serve in
11 uniform is something we're all extremely proud of; it
12 really is significant and meant a lot to all of us
13 here today to be able to recognize you and you are a
14 reflection of the NYPD and we thank you for the
15 service and your selflessness in keeping us protected
16 each and every day. So we wanted to... at least a
17 small token that we could do is to share this moment
18 with you and to show our appreciation by sharing
19 these Proclamations. I will ask the clerks to read
20 it and then ask the supervisors here as well to say a
21 few words, as well as our Public Safety chair and we
22 thank you so much; it really is a pleasure to have
23 you here. Thank you; we're glad that you're safe and
24 glad that you're keeping us safe. Thank you so much.

1
2 If the clerk could read the Proclamation. [cheers,
3 applause]

4 CITY CLERK: Council, City of New York
5 Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is
6 proud to honor NYPD Sgt. Hameed Armani and NYPD
7 Officer Peter Cybulski for their courageous service
8 to our city.

9 And whereas, every hour of every day the
10 men and women of the NYPD work together to enforce
11 our city's laws, keep out neighborhoods safe and
12 protect their fellow 8.3 million New Yorkers, whether
13 safeguarding property or the general public, these
14 heroes and heroines commit themselves to their daily
15 duties which often necessitate extraordinary risks
16 that few others can fully comprehend; Sgt. Armani and
17 Officer Cybulski are two such heroes.

18 And whereas, on Wednesday, July 20th,
19 2016, around 11:30 p.m., Sgt. Armani and Officer
20 Cybulski were sitting in a parked police van in Times
21 Square near 46th Street and Broadway, there in the
22 crossroads of the world, amid masses of people
23 leaving Broadway shows, an SUV slowly passed them and
24 its driver suddenly threw a device with flashing red
25 lights into the police van's open window; the

1
2 officers believed they were literally sitting with a
3 ticking bomb. And whereas, rather than abandon their
4 vehicle and flee to safety however, Sgt. Armani
5 turned on the lights and siren, hit the gas and drove
6 away from the huge crowds; they were putting their
7 own lives at risk so they could save potentially
8 hundreds if not thousands of people. In the moment
9 they believed their lives could end at any second,
10 but they were determined to save others. Once they
11 stopped their van at a quieter area, Officer Cybulski
12 handed the device to Sgt. Armani, who removed it from
13 the van and put it on the sidewalk, away from the
14 public and buildings. When they were both a safe
15 distance away, they requested the bomb squad;
16 fortunately, the device was soon determined to be a
17 hoax and the mysterious assailant in the SUV was
18 later arrested.

19 And whereas, we commend Sgt. Armani and
20 Officer Cybulski for their incredible bravery and
21 their unflinching commitment to the safety of our
22 city; they are truly among the finest of New York's
23 finest and have earned the esteemed and enduring
24 gratitude of every New Yorker.

1
2 Now therefore be it known, that the
3 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
4 NYPD Sgt. Hameed Armani and NYPD Officer Peter
5 Cybulski for their extraordinary valor and selfless
6 service to the City of New York and the community at
7 large. Melissa Mark-Viverito, Speaker for the entire
8 Council.

9 [applause, cheers]

10 CITY CLERK: I'm gonna ask... I'll ask the
11 sergeant and then the officer to say a few words and
12 the chiefs as well.

13 SGT. HAMEED ARMANI: I just would like to
14 thank everybody, it's really an honor; I'm truly
15 humbled by this experience. Thank you everybody;
16 appreciate it.

17 [laughter, applause]

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And a man of few
19 words.

20 OFFICER CYBULSKI: It's an absolute
21 privilege to be here today; like my Sergeant said,
22 I'm very honored and humbled to be here today. I
23 appreciate you acknowledging our efforts; a normal
24 day in Times Square unfortunately took a turn for the
25

1 worst and I'm just glad everything worked out well.

2 Thank you very much.

3 [applause, cheers, comments]

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And also, the
5 parents are here of the officer; thank you for
6 joining us. [cheers] Chief O'Hare if you wanna say
7 a few words.

8 CHIEF O'HARE: Thank you everybody, uh
9 Captain O'Hare, the Commanding Officer of the Patrol
10 Borough Manhattan South, Times Square Unit. It's
11 truly an honor to be standing with my officers and I
12 wanna thank the Council and the Council President for
13 taking the time out of everyone's day to honor these
14 officers' actions. These officers' actions not only
15 represent the good members of the Times Square Unit,
16 but the NYPD members at large, their dedication is
17 unparalleled and thankfully everyone turned out okay
18 and they look forward to you know -- they certainly
19 represent certainly the finest of the finest and so
20 just wanna thank everyone for being here. Thank you.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Chief.
22 [cheers, applause] Chief Comodo.

23 CHIEF COMODO: Thank you Madame Speaker;
24 thank you everybody. I'd just like to say we
25

1
2 appreciate it very much for the recognition that
3 you're giving these two fine officers today; every
4 day the men and women of the NYPD go out and perform
5 acts of heroism that mostly go unnoticed, but
6 sometimes they do get noticed in a very big way and
7 we appreciate the kindness and the generosity and the
8 recognition that you're bestowing upon these two
9 officers and fine members of the NYPD. Thank you to
10 the parents that are here for sharing your son with
11 us and we'd just like to say, Sgt. Armani, I just
12 learned today -- just a little bit of information
13 about this fine sergeant -- he came to the United
14 States from Afghanistan in the year 2000; he adapted;
15 he's learned seven languages on his own, [cheers]
16 he's a very esteemed and valued member of the NYPD;
17 we wish him all the best; we wish this officer best
18 and Captain O'Hare does a fine job with the Times
19 Square Unit and I'm just privileged to serve the city
20 and to be part of Patrol Borough Manhattan South. We
21 thank you for all your support, ma'am. Thank you.

22 [applause, background comments]

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [00:15:10]

24 **Spanish.** [laughter, background comments] Seven
25 languages, wow. So again, this is just a really

1
2 great moment. I wanna just ask the chair of the
3 Safety Committee to say a few words, Vanessa Gibson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Good afternoon;
5 thank you so much. Thank you to our Speaker, Melissa
6 Mark-Viverito and to all of my colleagues in the City
7 Council. Thank you so much, sergeant and officers
8 and captain, mom and dad; thank you for your service
9 each and every day. This incident certainly
10 highlights the dangers that our officers face each
11 and every day and sometimes there are stories that we
12 don't hear about, they never make it to the paper
13 where lives are saved and so we thank you, we thank
14 you, we thank you, just from the bottom of our hearts
15 for everything you do; thank you for keeping us safe,
16 thank you for your service each and every day when
17 you go to work and serve with honor and integrity, we
18 ask God to continue to keep you safe as you are out
19 there; keep us safe; keep this entire city safe. God
20 bless you and congratulations for saving us and thank
21 you for your work each and every day. God bless you.

22 [applause, cheers]

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.
24 Alright. [background comments]

1
2 Alright, we have one more ceremonial;
3 [background comments] this is quite an exciting
4 ceremonial today, all of us, because we're
5 celebrating an organization that has been providing
6 80 years of service to our community; we're thanking
7 our police officers that keep us safe each and every
8 day for their acts of heroism and now we're gonna
9 highlight a young woman who has accomplished so much
10 [background comment] in sports; we have Council
11 Member Wills here, who will be honoring Olympic track
12 star Dalilah Muhammad, who won the 400-meter hurdles
13 [applause, cheers] at the Rio Olympics, [background
14 comment] from Cardozo High School, [background
15 comments] and I will hand it off to Council Member
16 Wills.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Thank you Madame
18 Speaker. Today is a day that we've been looking
19 forward to for quite some time; we have been given
20 the honor of giving a Proclamation to one of
21 Southeast Queens' own, myself and Daneek Miller and
22 Donovan Richards and Greg Meeks and Vivien Cook and
23 all the others overwhelming with pride. This morning
24 this young lady knocked out three schools and last
25 night she was up at Fashion Week and she just keeps

1 going and going; she's very tired. [background
2 comment] Yeah, and Cardozo, yes, yes... yes, yes, yes,
3 and the Borough President; she's done [background
4 comments] so much in the last few days, but we don't
5 just have her here today; we have her parents, Mr.
6 and Mrs. Muhammad are also here, who spoke at the
7 schools this morning, so we wanna give them a round
8 of applause. [applause] This young lady, when you
9 get to meet her and know her, to be somebody who has
10 actually taken the world by storm is just... she has
11 just a humility of a spirit that I haven't seen in a
12 long time and as far as... she is just physical poetry
13 in motion to see her run; she is inspiring tens of
14 millions of women; she is the first woman to win the
15 400-meter hurdles in... first American woman in history
16 to win it and... [cheers, applause] and as Inez
17 Dickens; I don't know where she's at, but she would
18 have me point out that she is also a black woman, a
19 minority that won that title, so we're... Inez; I got
20 it right? [background comments] That's right.
21 That's right. Well no, Speaker, you're right, but
22 right, Inez; I got that right? Okay, I don't want
23 any problems with these two, so [laugh]... we just
24 wanted to thank you for allowing us to present this
25

1
2 to you today and just extend our thanks for you being
3 committed and dedicated to excellence. She's only 26
4 years old when she did this, y'all, so she should get
5 a round of applause. [background comments]

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We're gonna have
7 the clerk read the Proclamation and then we'll have
8 the other Council Members and obviously [background
9 comments] uh to say a few words, Miss Muhammad.

10 CITY CLERK: Council, City of New York
11 Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is
12 proud to honor 2016 Olympian Dalilah Muhammad for her
13 outstanding achievements in track and field.

14 And whereas, Dalilah Muhammad was born on
15 February 7, 1990 to Nadirah and Askia Muhammad and
16 grew up and attended school in Jamaica, Queens.
17 Dalilah developed her passion for track and field at
18 a very young age while watching such greats as Wilma
19 Rudolph and Florence Griffith Joyner; she too wanted
20 to be among the greats to compete in the Olympics and
21 to win gold for her community and country.

22 And whereas, at the age of 7, Dalilah
23 joined a local track club, the New York Novas and
24 competed in many track and field events -- distance
25 running, sprints, the hurdles and high jump, but it

1
2 wasn't until she attended Benjamin N Cardozo High
3 School that her love and dedication for the sport of
4 track and field began to crystallize, making her one
5 of the premier 400-meter hurdle runners in the
6 nation. In high school she competed in many track
7 and field events and experienced her first
8 international exposure when she won the gold medal in
9 the 400-meter hurdle at the 2007 World Youth
10 Championships, the same year she earned the title
11 Gatorade Female Athlete of the Year for New York
12 State. In 2008 she won the New York State and Nike
13 Outdoor Nationals titles in the 400-meter hurdles.

14 And whereas, in 2008 Dalilah enrolled in
15 the University of Southern California on a sports
16 scholarship and joined the USC Trojans track team.
17 While she remained committed to furthering her
18 education by majoring in business, she continued to
19 excel at track and field. During her first season on
20 the USC team, she competed extensively and she won
21 the silver medal at the 2009 Pan American Junior
22 Athletics Championships in 58.42 seconds.

23 And whereas, when Dalilah ran for the USC
24 Trojans, she became a four-time All-American at the
25 NCAA Outdoor Championships. In 2013 her personal

1 record for the 400-meter hurdles was 53.83 seconds.

2 In 2016 she was the American National Champion; by
3 the end of her college career she had ranked the
4 third fastest ever on the USC Trojans track team.

5
6 And whereas, after graduating college,
7 Dalilah chose to go professional and has represented
8 Nike since 2013; she continued to perfect her craft
9 by increasing her speed and time for the 400-meter
10 hurdle. In July 2016 she won the 400-meter hurdles
11 in 52.88 seconds, earning her a place on the United
12 States Olympics team. At the 2016 Rio Olympics in
13 August she fulfilled her dream of winning the gold
14 medal in the 400-meter [applause] hurdle.. [cheers]
15 and earned her well-deserved spot among the greats.
16 Dalilah is the first American woman ever to earn the
17 top spot in this event.

18 Now therefore be it known, that the
19 Council of the City of New York is proud to honor
20 Dalilah Muhammad for her extraordinary and inspiring
21 achievements in track and field. Melissa Mark-
22 Viverito, Speaker for the entire Council; Ruben
23 Wills, Council Member 28th District Queens; Barry A.
24 Grodenchik, Council Member 23rd District Queens; I.

1
2 Daneek Miller, Council Member 27th District Queens;
3 Karen Koslowitz, Council Member 29th District Queens.

4 [background comments, applause]

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay. So... Did we
6 miss anything, Dalilah? I think we got everything in
7 the Proclamation, but you know on behalf of the City
8 Council, we are 51 members that represent this
9 beautiful diverse city; 27 members out of the 51,
10 which is the majority, represent the black, Latino,
11 Asian Caucus and you are an inspiration to that next
12 generation exemplified in this beautiful young woman
13 that is here and so many others that in your
14 achievements see potential and so thank you for
15 breaking that barrier; thank you for representing us
16 in such a dignified way and we're very proud that you
17 are a New Yorker. So with that, if you wanna maybe
18 say a few words, we would love to hear from you, and
19 I'll hold this... yeah, let me hold this.

20 [applause]

21 DALILAH MUHAMMAD: Yeah, I would just
22 like to say thank you to the Council for this honor.
23 You know I'm so thankful to have brought this home to
24 the U.S.; it has been such an honor to have my hard
25

1
2 work and dedication recognized in such a special way,
3 so thank you.

4 [background comments, applause, cheers]

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So any of the
6 Council Members that signed; are you good? Alright.
7 Daneek.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: So I'm going to
9 thank you so much, Dalilah for your performance, for
10 representing the U.S.A.; for representing Southeast
11 Queens with the dignity and respect that we deserve.
12 Madame Muhammad, Mr. Muhammad, thank you so much for
13 raising this fine young woman in the way that you
14 did, that you have and being the lone member of the
15 Muslim Caucus here and part of the 27th... [background
16 comments, laughter] I... [background comment] yeah,
17 we've gotta get more. Thank you and also, but
18 really, thank you so much and Dalilah, you inspire so
19 man young men and women in Southeast Queens and we
20 look forward to seeing you on the track at Roy
21 Wilkins in the very near future; we... [background
22 comment] we are redoing the track as we speak for
23 Dalilah; we're probably gonna rename it Dalilah
24 Muhammad [background comments] as we speak. We're
25

1
2 just so really proud of her and thank you so much for
3 all that you've done for this city and this nation.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you. Thank
5 you so much.

6 [applause, background comments]

7 [pause]

8 [background comments]

9 [pause]

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Okay, at this time can
11 we please... Could I have your attention, please? May
12 I please have your attention, please? [background
13 comments] Quiet on the floor, please. Quiet on the
14 floor, please. Can I please have the Council Members
15 please return to their seats? [background comments]

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Let's keep it down,
17 please; keep it down.

18 SERGEANT OF ARMS: At this time, please
19 place all electronic devices, all electronic devices
20 to vibrate. Will all non-Council employees, non-
21 Council employees please leave the main floor of the
22 chambers? There's additional seating upstairs.
23 Thank you.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please, quiet in
25 the chambers. [background comment] Everyone please

1
2 take their seats. Please clear the aisle. May we
3 have quiet in the chambers as we all rise for the
4 Pledge of Allegiance? [background comment]

5 [pause]

6 CITY CLERK: Barron. Borelli. Cabrera.

7 [background comment]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

9 CITY CLERK: Chin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

11 CITY CLERK: Cohen.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

13 CITY CLERK: Constantinides.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

15 CITY CLERK: Cornegy.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.

17 CITY CLERK: Crowley.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

19 CITY CLERK: Cumbo.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

21 CITY CLERK: Deutsch.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

23 CITY CLERK: Dickens.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.

25 CITY CLERK: Dromm.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

27

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.
CITY CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.
COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.
CITY CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Here.
CITY CLERK: Garodnick.
COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.
CITY CLERK: Gentile.
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.
CITY CLERK: Gibson.
COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.
CITY CLERK: Greenfield.
COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.
CITY CLERK: Grodenchik.
COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.
CITY CLERK: Johnson.
COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Happily here.
CITY CLERK: Kallos.
COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.
CITY CLERK: King.
COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.
CITY CLERK: Koo.
COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.
CITY CLERK: Koslowitz.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

CITY CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Shhh, quiet in
the chambers, please.

CITY CLERK: Lander.

[background comments]

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

CITY CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

CITY CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

CITY CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

CITY CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

CITY CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

CITY CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

CITY CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

CITY CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

1
2 CITY CLERK: Richards.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Presente.
4 CITY CLERK: Rodriguez.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Yes.
6 CITY CLERK: Rose.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.
8 CITY CLERK: Rosenthal.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.
10 CITY CLERK: Salamanca.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.
12 CITY CLERK: Torres.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.
14 CITY CLERK: Treyger.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.
16 CITY CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.
18 CITY CLERK: Vallone.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.
20 CITY CLERK: Williams.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.
22 CITY CLERK: Wills.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Here.
24 CITY CLERK: Matteo.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

1 CITY CLERK: Van Bramer.

2 [background comments]

3 CITY CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here.

5 [background comments]

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
7 in the chambers. All rise for the invocation
8 delivered by Imam Souleimane Konate, the Council of
9 African Imams in America, located in the Borough of
10 Manhattan. Quiet in the chambers.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All right, please.

12 IMAM SOULEIMANE KONATE: In the name of
13 Allah, the most gracious, the most merciful, oh Allah
14 our god, by you we **[inaudible]** and to you we direct
15 ourselves and **[inaudible]** and only you we wanted, we
16 beg you for nothing but you, our lord and we appeal
17 it to you by the greatness and the grand virtue;
18 there is no god but you, all one only [sic]
19 **[inaudible]** bring peace, love and tranquility into
20 our great city and make the City of New York a place
21 of security and provide its leaders with many
22 blessings and protection, guidance and wisdom. You
23 alone we worship and you alone we ask for help for
24 each and everything, oh lord of Abraham, Moses, Jesus
25

1
2 and Mohammad, **[inaudible]** upon them all oh Allah,
3 lord of power to give the power to whom to please
4 [sic] and who strives [sic] of power from whom to
5 place, to induce [sic] with honor whom to please and
6 to bring love home to please in your empty hand is
7 all good, **[inaudible]** over all things to have the
8 power. Our prayers go to those who lost their
9 families, the loved ones in 9/11; may Allah provide
10 them with comfort and hope. Amen.

11 [background comments]

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.
13 I ask everyone to please silence their cell phones
14 and all electronic devices. I'd like to ask the
15 motion to spread the invocation in full upon the
16 record by Council Member Inez Dickens. Quiet in the
17 chambers.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you Madame
19 Public Advocate and Madame Speaker Melissa Mark-
20 Viverito. I make a motion to spread the invocation
21 in full upon the record; however, I want to say just
22 a few words about Imam Souleimane Konate, [background
23 comments] who is currently the Imam and spiritual
24 leader of Masjid Aqsa-Salam in my community of
25

1
2 Harlem. Under his guidance and leadership, the
3 diverse congregation has grown... [interpose]

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me,
5 Council Member, excuse me. May we... [interpose,
6 background comments] please... please quiet in the
7 chambers. [background comments] Thank you. We
8 apologize, Council Member.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: thank you so
10 much, Madame Public Advocate ...has grown to more than
11 1500 faithful who hail primarily from Lakota Ivory
12 Coast [background comment] in West Africa, building a
13 bridge to the city's growing African Muslim
14 population from French speaking nations, serving as
15 translators and guides to life in America, providing
16 educational, employment and other services to African
17 immigrants. As Muslims from around the city and the
18 world celebrate the Eid al-Adha holiday, which began
19 on Monday and ends on Thursday, marking the
20 willingness of Abraham to sacrifice his son on God's
21 command. Muslims honor this holiday with a grand
22 feast that is shared with the poor of the community.
23 Imam Konate, thank you so much for your leadership in
24 a diverse community that is constantly changing. God
25 bless us all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

Adoption of minutes. Council Member Elizabeth Crowley.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I make a motion that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of August 16, 2016 be adopted as printed.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Message and papers from the Mayor.

COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication from city, county and borough offices.

COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and communications.

COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use call-ups.

COMMITTEE CLERK: M 438 and M 439.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on call-up vote. Roll call.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I would like to vote aye on all call-ups and with permission I'd like to vote aye on all coupled general orders.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madame

Public Advocate, I'd like to vote aye on all call-ups
and with permission I'd like to vote on all general
ordered calendar items today.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: And I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.
4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.
6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.
8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal. Eugene.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.
10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: Aye.
12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.
14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.
16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.
18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.
20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.
22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.
24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Permission to vote
on all call-ups; general order calendar.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.
3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Vote aye.
4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.
5 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.
6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.
7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.
8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.
9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.
10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.
11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.
12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.
13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.
14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.
15 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.
16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.
17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.
18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.
19 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.
20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.
21 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.
22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.
23 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.
24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.
25 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I'd like to vote
aye on all call-ups and with permission I'd like to
vote on all coupled general orders.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Today's land use
call-ups were adopted by a vote of 49 in the
affirmative, 0 in the negative.. quiet in the
chambers, please.. as we now hear from the Speaker,
Melissa Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madame
Public Advocate and good afternoon to all my

1
2 colleagues, and before we start, definitely wanna
3 wish a happy Eid to all of those observing. I wanna
4 thank my colleague, Council Member Daneek Miller for
5 inviting me to his district earlier this week, on
6 Monday; it was... at Jamaica High School; it was really
7 quite moving to see thousands in prayer on that day
8 and as I said when I posted the photos, "A sea of
9 love is what was seen before me." So thank you so
10 much for being able to... was happy to be there and
11 thank you for inviting me.

12 So while the legislation we're passing
13 today makes a lot of gains for New Yorkers, I
14 definitely wanna just take a moment at the top here
15 to acknowledge some recent losses in our city, so
16 we'll please ask members to rise.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise.

18 [background comment]

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So last week we
20 lost Dabney Montgomery, age 93. Mr. Montgomery was
21 distinguished as a Tuskegee Airman, a body guard to
22 Martin Luther King, Jr. and a member of Manhattan's
23 Community Board 10. His work played an important
24 role in aiding the civil rights movement and our own
25

1
2 city and our thoughts and prayers are with his
3 family.

4 Earlier this month two people were
5 senselessly murdered during the West Indian Day
6 Parade J'Ouvert festival, the victims were Tyreke
7 Borel and Tiarah Poyau. Tyreke was 17 years old and
8 a student at Boys and Girls High School in Bedford-
9 Stuyvesant and Tiarah was 22 years old and a graduate
10 student in taxation at St. John's University. It's
11 just the senseless violence that continues and hoping
12 we can come together and change our laws and do what
13 we must to make this end. So I definitely want us to
14 also remember them in a moment of silence.

15 And this past weekend we commemorated the
16 15th anniversary of the horrific events of September
17 11th. New York has not and will never forget that
18 day and ask my colleagues to hold a moment of silence
19 to recognize all the lives that were lost.

20 [moment of silence]

21 Thank you my colleagues.

22 Today the Council will vote on
23 legislation to make our streets safer for
24 pedestrians. Int. 997-A, sponsored by the Public
25 Advocate, Tish James, updates out-of-date regulations

1
2 implemented before the use of countdown clocks and
3 guarantees pedestrians the right-of-way in crosswalks
4 during the entire display of a countdown clock or
5 flashing hand. This bill is the latest in over two
6 dozen bills this Council has passed as part of our
7 ongoing efforts to promote Vision Zero and end
8 traffic fatalities in New York City. Again, this is
9 Public Advocate Tish James' bill; I would like to ask
10 you to say a few words.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you Madame
12 Speaker; I also want to thank Transportation Chair
13 Rodriguez and all of the Council Members who signed
14 on as co-sponsors for their support for this critical
15 commonsense bill that will help protect pedestrians
16 from car crashes. I'd also like to thank the many
17 advocates -- Transportation Alternatives, Families
18 for Safe Streets, AARP and the League of Conservation
19 Voters.

20 If we are ever to achieve Vision Zero, we
21 must ensure that the laws in our books follow basic
22 logic and right now the city is installing pedestrian
23 countdown signals all over the city and these are a
24 great step towards improving safety. But the law
25 regarding these signals is out-of-date and includes a

1
2 dangerous loophole. It says that pedestrians don't
3 have the right-of-way during the countdown phase, so
4 if there are still numbers counting down,
5 technically, as a pedestrian you don't have the
6 right-of-way to cross and this defies commonsense.
7 Today's vote will change that; the bill makes it
8 clear that pedestrians have the right-of-way until
9 there is steady don't walk signal, that red upraised
10 hand, and this will help investigators and law
11 enforcement at the scene of crashes, this will help
12 prosecutors to hold reckless drivers accountable and
13 bring justice to the families of victims, and most
14 importantly, this will help protect our youngest New
15 Yorkers and our seniors who are most often the
16 victims of car crashes. And I wanna thank again the
17 Speaker, as well as the members of the City Council
18 for their vote today. Thank you.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thanks, Public
20 Advocate. I wanna thank staff that work on that bill
21 -- Kelly Taylor, Jonathan Masserano, Gafar Zaaloff,
22 Emily Rooney, and Chima Obichere.

23 And next the Council will vote on
24 legislation to expand bicycle accessibility around
25 the city. As bicycle usage in our city continues to

1
2 surge, we must make sure that we are doing our part
3 to support this sustainable and healthy form of
4 transportation. Currently there are significant
5 restrictions on where and how bicycles can be
6 transported; Int. 695-A, 795-A and 405-A will help
7 expand bicycle access by permitting individuals to
8 transport bikes on passenger elevators in office and
9 residential buildings and will make it easier for New
10 Yorkers to bike to work and to other destinations
11 around the city. Council Members Rosenthal and
12 Williams are sponsors of the three bills and would
13 ask them to say a few words. Council Member
14 Rosenthal, followed by Williams.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you very
16 much, Speaker. I'm delighted to sponsor one of the
17 bills today that will remove unnecessary barriers for
18 people who want to bike to work. Int. No. 405-A
19 would require that office buildings provide foldable
20 bicycle access in passenger elevators. Presumably,
21 if a person can fit into an elevator, so can their
22 foldable bike. Before today let's say you wanted to
23 bike to work with your handy foldable bike, the City
24 is doing all it can to encourage you to do so; we've
25 got over 1,000 miles of bike lanes, over 300 miles of

1
2 which are protected bike lanes, all public modes of
3 transportation allow foldable bikes onboard; the MTA,
4 Metro North; LIRR at all times, including peak rush
5 hours and without a permit, but until now, once that
6 person go to work with their foldable bike, they
7 would've had to go through a lengthy process to get
8 permission to use the freight elevator to take it up
9 to their office or lock it up outside. According to
10 the New York City Department of Transportation, some
11 office buildings shut down their freight elevators at
12 three or four in the afternoon before workers leave
13 for the day and in addition, DOT found instances of
14 office building managers or owners requiring tenants
15 to buy extra insurance or pay a fee to bring their
16 bike or foldable bike on the freight elevator, both
17 of which are against the law. As for locking up a
18 bike outside, over the past four years bike theft has
19 increased by 70%.

20 I wanna thank Speaker Melissa Mark-
21 Viverito and Housing Chair Jumaane Williams for
22 moving this bill along and thanks goes to Meagan
23 Chen, who drafted the legislation; Ben Smith, who
24 during the time he was in the Council helped champion
25

1
2 it, and Sarah Mallory, my Legislative Director, who
3 shepherded it through. Thank you very much.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I wanna thank
5 the Madame Speaker for her leadership on this package
6 and other sponsors of the package; Chairs Rosenthal,
7 Lander and Rodriguez. This bill package, the aim of
8 the bill package is to make biking easier in the
9 city, decrease vehicle usage, decrease the city's
10 carbon footprint, save on gas, and increase health
11 benefits. Though it's difficult to encourage folks
12 to ride bicycles without taking out the encumbrances
13 that prevent them from doing so, our city is growing,
14 but our space to travel on roads are not and so we
15 have to be as expedient as we can. My bill, 795-A is
16 co-sponsored with Council Member Lander; it requires
17 that owners allow bicycles in their buildings and
18 allow tenants to request a way to do so when possible
19 on passenger elevators, and we were careful to make
20 sure that if any fines come the way of the landlord
21 that was not his or her fault, but the fault of the
22 tenant; the tenant will be responsible.

23 I wanna thank again the Speaker, Council
24 Members Rosenthal, Rodriguez, Lander, Ben Smith from
25 DOT, Laura Popa, Matt Gewolb, Jeff Baker, Ed Atkin,

1
2 Jen Wilcox, Meagan Chen, Guillermo Patino, Jose
3 Conde, and Nick Smith. Thank you.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
5 Member.

6 Next the Council will vote on a package
7 of legislation to strengthen and enhance reporting
8 data on sexual offenses, domestic violence incidents
9 and hate crimes. These bills will require the NYPD
10 to report all sex offenses in their quarterly
11 reports, broken up by specific offenses, enhance
12 reporting related to domestic violence and hate
13 crimes and require domestic violence reporting to be
14 disaggregated based on whether the crime involved
15 intimate partners.

16 The increased reporting of these
17 incidents will give New Yorkers a clearer picture of
18 where these crimes are taking place and is a vital
19 step toward increased transparency so that we can
20 help stop these crimes before they occur.

21 I am proud to have sponsored Int. 948-A;
22 will ask my colleagues, Council Members Reynoso and
23 Torres and Cumbo to say a few words about their
24 bills. So Council Member Cumbo, we could start with
25

1
2 you, followed by Council Member Reynoso and then
3 Torres.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Speaker.
5 Two out of three sexual assaults or rape
6 victimizations go unreported to police. In recent
7 years, and unlike in the case of many other crimes,
8 the rate of sexual assaults in New York City has
9 increased. While forcible rape has decreased by more
10 than 10% in other counties in New York State, New
11 York City has a five-year upward trend, with a total
12 of 1,439 reported rapes to the New York City
13 Department in 2015. Think about that; almost 1,500
14 rapes that happen each year and the pain that so many
15 individuals experience as a result of this.

16 Since introduction, we were able to amend
17 the bill to include reporting in our parks, public
18 schools, basketball courts, recreation centers, and
19 playgrounds. Before CompStat, the NYPD provided
20 quarterly reports on seven index crimes including
21 rape, but did not include other felony or misdemeanor
22 sex offenses, which overlooked nearly 20 other sex
23 assault offenses; today we are going to change that.

24 As we know, without proper services,
25 sexual assault victims are at a greater risk to

1
2 psychological, social and behavioral distress, such
3 as shock, denial, depression, posttraumatic stress
4 disorder, attempted suicide, drug use, and strained
5 family relationships.

6 I would like to specifically acknowledge
7 Mary Haviland, the Executive Director at the New York
8 City Alliance Against Sexual Assault for championing
9 this bill. I would like to thank Deepa Ambekar, the
10 Public Safety Legislative Counsel for sticking with
11 this bill and working to modify the bill to speak to
12 the urgent and growing needs of public concerns in
13 our city.

14 Once again, thank you to my very good
15 friend and colleague, Council Member Vanessa Gibson
16 for standing strong with me in partnership and for
17 hearing this bill and keeping it on track to pass.

18 A huge thank you goes to Laura Popa and
19 Matt Gewolb for your leadership and tireless support
20 throughout this process, and I wanna thank everyone
21 that made this possible today and this is for so many
22 who have remained so quiet about an issue that
23 impacts so many New Yorkers. Thank you.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member
25 Reynoso.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you
3 Speaker. I wanna thank you and Chair Gibson for
4 their attention to the issue of domestic violence and
5 the importance of using data to assess what is
6 happening in our communities so that we can be
7 proactive about adjusting it.

8 Last year there were 8,027 domestic
9 incidents reported in my district, that's 22 per day;
10 34% of all felony assaults and 45% of all the rape
11 offenses in my district were determined to be
12 domestic violence related, so I feel compelled to
13 work proactively on this issue and have met with the
14 Mayor's Office to Combat Domestic Violence to do
15 outreach in my district, both to educate and
16 hopefully prevent these incidents and to ensure that
17 victims know how to access services.

18 Tracking these incidents and
19 distinguishing intimate partner violence from other
20 types can give us the ability to target services to
21 meet the needs on the ground. The Office to Combat
22 Domestic Violence and local organizations, such as
23 North Brooklyn Coalition Against Family Violence in
24 my district, provide targeted services for intimate
25 partner violence, both for prevention, such as THE

1
2 Healthy Relationship Training Academy, and for victim
3 services as well. Data can help us figure out more
4 specifically where outreach about these services is
5 needed.

6 Again, I wanna thank the Speaker and the
7 Council Members today for their support and also
8 wanna thank my Legislative Director Lacey Tauber, and
9 I look forward to the day where we don't have to say
10 that these services are needed, but until we
11 eradicate domestic violence from the city, we're
12 going to have to take on bills as this to make sure
13 that these needed services reach our communities.
14 Thank you.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member
16 Torres.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you Madame
18 Speaker. My legislation requires periodic reporting
19 of domestic violence within public housing, not only
20 at the level of police service areas, but also at the
21 level of individual developments. Here in New York
22 City we've made historic strides toward reducing
23 crime, but the one area where progress has been
24 allusive is domestic violence, especially in settings
25 like public housing and there's reason to think that

1
2 the crisis remains as prevalent as it's ever been and
3 so there are few challenges more worthy of our time
4 and resources than domestic violence, which has a
5 well-documented link to adult criminality and
6 juvenile delinquency. We know from social science
7 research that violence within the home has far-
8 reaching consequences beyond the home and that the
9 struggle against DV depends first and foremost on
10 awareness and by disclosing data about domestic
11 violence, we are building greater awareness, a
12 greater sense of urgency by keeping our city, the
13 public continually alert to the changing patterns of
14 domestic violence, particularly in public housing.
15 Thank you Madame Speaker.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
17 Member. I wanna thank, with regards to staff, Jen
18 Wilcox, Meagan Chen, Guillermo Patino, Jose Conde,
19 and Sarah Gastellum.

20 And next the Council will vote on a
21 series of land use items which will facilitate a new
22 mixed-use development in Melrose in Council Member
23 Salamanca's district. The La Central project is a
24 100% affordable housing development containing almost
25 1,000 units of affordable housing; there will be 831

1
2 affordable apartments, 160 supportive housing units,
3 commercial space, a new YMCA, a new skate park and a
4 new observatory for Bronx Science High School. The
5 project is a truly economically integrated one, with
6 AMIs ranging from 30% of area median income to 130%
7 and it will address the housing needs of a range of
8 New Yorkers and also act as a real community hub.

9 I wanna congratulate Council Member
10 Salamanca and all of his hard work on this project;
11 he is our newest member; this is his first big land
12 use vote and congratulate him on all the
13 accomplishments and ask him to say a few words.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you
15 Madame Speaker. Last week, after months of
16 negotiations and discussions, I stood in support of a
17 project that will bring a new community space,
18 including a YMCA, new green space and most
19 importantly, 992 units of affordable housing to the
20 Melrose neighborhood in my district.

21 With this land use item I fought for what
22 I believe my community needed and fortunately, we
23 were able to come to an agreement to where all my
24 concerns were addressed; this including 32BJ being
25 utilized for the development to ensure maintenance

1
2 workers for this project are paid fair wages and have
3 good benefits and are hired locally, manned security
4 present 24 hours a day and gates that will be
5 installed to keep residents safe, and finally, units
6 priced for families making 30% of AMI, including for
7 families in need of two- or three-bedroom units, a
8 price truly affordable for more families in our
9 community. As a result, La Central is a beautiful
10 project and will be truly transformative to an area
11 that has for decades faced a lack of real investment,
12 including quality affordable housing.

13 I quickly want to thank those who worked
14 well with my office on this project, including
15 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, Raju Mann, Amy
16 Levitan, and the Council's Land Use staff, Chairman
17 David Greenfield and Chairwoman Inez Dickens, Bronx
18 Borough President Ruben Diaz, Jr., 32BJ, Bronx
19 Community Board 1, the 40 Precinct, HPD, and La
20 Central development team. I'm happy that we're
21 continuing to move the South Bronx forward. Thank
22 you Madame Speaker.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
24 Member.

25

1
2 And finally, we will be voting on a
3 package of legislation that will provide both the
4 public and city officials with better information
5 with which to hold agencies accountable for meeting
6 the objectives of the city's minority and women-owned
7 business enterprises and those that are involved in
8 the MWBE program.

9 This legislation will promote
10 collaborative efforts, such as training for agency
11 staff and the establishment of an advisory board to
12 encourage greater participation by minority and
13 women-owned businesses in city contracting.

14 Throughout my tenure as a Council Member
15 and now as Speaker, I have made making this city more
16 inclusive to all New Yorkers a top priority; this
17 includes making government contracting more inclusive
18 of historically underrepresented businesses by
19 ensuring that City agencies are utilizing all the
20 tools at their disposal to promote opportunity for
21 minority and women-owned businesses and hold them
22 accountable for meeting the goals of the City's MWBE
23 program. This legislation is a testament to the
24 priority that the Council has made of expanding
25 quality opportunities to women and people of color

1
2 across the five boroughs. With that, I would like to
3 ask Council Members Crowley, Rosenthal and Cumbo,
4 that all have bills in this package, to say a few
5 words; we'll start with Council Member Crowley.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Thank you Madame
7 Speaker, good afternoon.

8 New York City has the largest and most
9 diverse population of businesses in the country, yet
10 our city procurement does not reflect the same
11 diversity. To change this, it is critical our City
12 agencies prioritize MWBE contracting and be more
13 transparent in its goals. My legislation requires
14 the City to publicly share these goals, which will
15 also allow us to identify any agency that is falling
16 short. The legislation would also make public the
17 list of names and titles of agency personnel
18 responsible for implementing these plans, as well as
19 a description of the proposed methods and activities
20 to achieve participation goals.

21 Census data shows the number of MWBEs
22 increase each year; it's our responsibility as a city
23 to accommodate that growth. Currently MWBEs are met
24 with certification hurdles, flawed contract
25 agreements, weak legal guarantees against

1
2 discrimination, a lack of transparency in the bidding
3 process, and more. At a time when income inequality
4 remains in the forefront, it is so important we take
5 these steps to support our MWBEs. We must strengthen
6 what makes our city so vibrant, attractive and
7 unique.

8 I wanna thank Speaker Melissa Mark-
9 Viverito for her unwavering advocacy for equal
10 opportunity, current Women's Caucus co-chairs,
11 Council Members Cumbo and Rosenthal and Council
12 Member Inez Dickens, who championed this issue and
13 cause in the previous council and is still a lead
14 champion on it, and her work -- we were able to usher
15 in the first concrete and substantial MWBE law in
16 this city and she's remained a fierce advocate on the
17 cause as well. And I'd like to thank other
18 advocates, including The Black Institute, for being a
19 strong partner in this fight. So I'm proud to work
20 with my colleagues in government and I'm proud to see
21 this legislation get voted on today.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
23 Member Crowley. Council Member Cumbo.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. Thank
25 you, Speaker. I'd like to thank you all for allowing

1
2 me the opportunity to speak on my two bills, proposed
3 Int. 923 and Int. 981 that are part of the MWBE
4 legislative package, the package of legislation
5 intended to enhance transparency, accountability and
6 opportunities and resources to better serve women as
7 well as those throughout the city of New York.

8 As chair of the Women's Issues Committee
9 and Co-Chair of the Women's Caucus, I am elated that
10 six bills will report on stats and foster new
11 prospects. For far too long we have been a city that
12 has put the priorities of women and minority women-
13 owned businesses out of the spotlight and as I have
14 stated earlier, when we talk about minority and
15 women-owned businesses, we as a people of color
16 continue to refer to ourselves as minority and women-
17 owned businesses, which in fact justifies why we
18 receive a minority share of the resources.

19 "Minorities and women" are actually the majority of
20 the City of New York and need to see themselves as
21 such in order to justify why we should be receiving
22 the majority of New York City procurement
23 opportunities.

24 Today we will unlock the power of data to
25 spur advancement across our city to improve the

1
2 quality of services, programs and opportunities made
3 possible by our City agencies and partners, such as
4 the NYC Economic Development Corporation. Currently
5 "minority and women-owned" businesses only comprise
6 4.6% of procurement opportunities in the City of New
7 York. I'll repeat that again -- 4.6%, which results
8 in about \$751 million, whereas spending for non MWBEs
9 or I should say minority, is \$15.94 billion, the
10 equivalent of 95.4%. This is a dynamic that is
11 ravishing our communities, explains a great deal of
12 the unemployment in our neighborhoods and causes so
13 many of the issues that we see in equality, all the
14 way from small businesses to our schools and
15 procurement opportunities.

16 At this time I would like to thank Laura
17 Popa and Matt Gewolb for their leadership and
18 tireless support throughout this process. I also
19 want to thank Bertha Lewis and The Black Institute
20 for their continued advocacy on this particular
21 issue, but the opportunity to be able to create an
22 advisory council is going to speak volumes; the
23 opportunity to be able to have access and evaluate
24 whether contractors receiving economic development
25 benefits have fully complied with MWBE requirements

1
2 is going to put us on the right track. We have a
3 long way to go; we have an incredible amount of work
4 to do, but I do feel confident with this body that
5 moving forward we are going to continue to
6 dramatically provide more opportunities for the
7 majority of the City of New York. Thank you.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
9 Member. Council Member Rosenthal.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.
11 Int. 1019-A and 1020 not only make technical changes
12 to the Mayor's Office of Contracts' (MOCS) reporting
13 requirements that will present information on the
14 number and total dollar value of contracts with MWBEs
15 in a more useful manner, but will also require a more
16 comprehensive explanation by MOCS of the
17 determination made by the City's chief procurement
18 officer whether or not to divide large contracts into
19 smaller ones that would enhance competition for MWBEs
20 and other bidders. The public deserves to know
21 whether bids and proposals are being formulated and
22 solicited in a fair manner for all of those who maybe
23 able to participate in the contracting process. I
24 believe these changes are important steps in ensuring
25

1
2 that the City is accountable for meeting the
3 objectives of the MWBE program.

4 I would like to thank the administration
5 for working with us on these proposals and commend
6 them for the efforts they have undertaken on MWBE
7 issues; the information we glean from this
8 legislation will lay the groundwork for how we can
9 and will do better by our minority and women-owned
10 businesses.

11 I'd like to thank the sponsors of all of
12 these pieces of legislation -- Council Members Cumbo,
13 Crowley, Cohen and Public Advocate Tish James --
14 sorry, Cohen you're a different one; I take you out
15 -- as well as committee staff. Eric Bernstein, the
16 Committee Counsel, who has very quickly mastered the
17 City's procurement rules and laws, and Casie Addison,
18 our Policy Analyst who similarly has quickly learned
19 from wading into the minutia and the details about
20 all the procurement that happens in New York City;
21 John Russell, Brendan West from the Finance Division
22 and my Legislative Director, Sarah Mallory. Thank
23 you very much... [interpose]

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
25 Member. And just to clarify; I had mentioned at the

1
2 beginning that I wanna thank Council Member Miller,
3 who attended the Eid service in Queens; actually it
4 was Rory Lancman's district and he was there as well,
5 so I just wanted to clarify that; it was good to be
6 there with both of you.

7 And before we end here today, definitely
8 something of note, something that all of us probably
9 are aware of, but we do wanna congratulate our own
10 Minority Leader Steve Matteo and his wife Annie on
11 the birth of their fourth child, [cheers, applause]
12 four and I think it's the last... [laughter, background
13 comment] he's like no, no, we're done... his fourth
14 child, Ryan Matteo, so congratulations to you and
15 Annie. Okay. And with that I end communication from
16 the Speaker.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 Discussion or general orders, seeing none. Report of
19 special committees.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
22 standing committees.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
24 on Contracts, Int. 923-A... [interpose]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the chambers. Shhh...

COMMITTEE CLERK: MWBE annual report.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 976-A, MWBE agency training.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders. [background comments]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 981-B, MWBE advisory board.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 1005-A, MWBE utilization plan.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 1019-A, MWBE reporting requirements.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 1020-A, MWBE agency goals.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance, Preconsidered Res 1194, expense budget.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 464 and Res 1197 and LU 465 and Res 1198.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Housing and Buildings, Int. 405-A, bicycle access in elevators.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 695-A, bicycle access in residential buildings.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 795-A, bicycle access in office buildings.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the committee
3 on Land Use, LU 432 and Res 1199, zoning amendment.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled to be
5 [background comment] filed pursuant to letter of
6 withdrawal.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 435 and Res 1200 and
8 LU 436 and Res 1201, sidewalk cafes.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
10 general orders.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 437 and Res 1202,
12 Special Clinton District.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
14 general orders.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 439 and Res 1203,
16 zoning map amendment.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
18 general orders.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 440 and Res 1204
20 through LU 447 and Res 1211 on Page 5, landmark
21 designation.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 general orders.

24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 448 and Res 1212 through LU 52 and Res 1216 on Page 6, Council District 17.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 459 and Res 1217 through LU 463 and Res 1221, sidewalk cafes.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 466 and Res 1212 [sic] (1222), zoning amendment.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public Safety, Int. 869-A, reporting on sex offenses.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 948-A, domestic violence and hate crime statistics.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 961-A, intimate partner domestic violence statistics.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
3 coupled on general orders.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Int. 968-A, domestic
5 violence statistics in public housing.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
7 coupled on general orders.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
9 on Rules, Privileges and Elections, M 423 and Res
10 1223, approving the appointment of Hari Savitala,
11 Environmental Control Board.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 general orders.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
15 on Transportation, Int. 997-A, pedestrian control
16 signals.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
18 coupled on general orders.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: On the general order
20 calendar, resolution appointing various persons,
21 Commissioner of Deeds.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
23 general orders. And we have been very busy; welcome
24 back from summer. At this time I ask for a roll call
25 on all items on the coupled general order calendar.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera.

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Permission to
explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I just wanna
congratulate all my colleagues on all the
legislation; it's been a busy summer, and also wanna
congratulate Council Member Salamanca on his first
land use item, land use project. And then I also
wanna thank my colleagues for your support on the two
landmark items in my district. I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
in the chambers.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I too would like
to congratulate my colleague, Council Member
Salamanca on his tremendous achievement here of
almost 1,000 units of affordable housing. As I had

1
2 mentioned at a hearing, this lot has been vacant for
3 over 40 years, Councilman Salamanca has been in
4 office for just a few months and now we're getting
5 1,000 units, so congratulations to him and I vote
6 aye.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: First I wanna
13 say congratulations to Council Member Matteo on his
14 new birth; my wife has told me to let you know that
15 if your wife wants to win the war of children, she
16 can continue, but we quit, [laughter] so. As a
17 former international professional athlete and now as
18 a Council Member, I spent time in Israel learning the
19 culture and have developed a good sense of the
20 political climate there. As I vote that Israel
21 should not be condemned, it should not be overlooked
22 and we have a responsibility as legis... [interpose,
23 background comment] Oh never mind. [laughter]
24 Sorry. [background comments] I was ready to..
25 [background comments] Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Would you like to go on the resolution; yes? [background comment] No... No. [background comment] No. [background comments] If you're speaking to the resolution, you're out of order, Council Member; if you wanna speak to any [laughter]...

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: any... Thank you. [laughter, applause]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley.

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Congratulations to Council Member Matteo on the recent birth and to Council Member Salamanca. In addition to the phenomenal work that he did to secure almost 1,000

1
2 units of affordable housing, he also was able to
3 secure, as we talk about MWBEs, 37.5% of equity,
4 ownership by an MWBE within that development. So I
5 wanna give a special shout-out and a thank you to
6 Council Member Salamanca, because that is something
7 that has not been done in the past and I hope that it
8 sets a precedent, and I vote aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: With
11 congratulations to Hari Savitala as a member of the
12 New York City Environmental Control Board and
13 congratulations to him, I vote aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I want
18 to also congratulate our colleague, Council Member
19 Salamanca and Minority Leader Matteo; it is really
20 interesting that four out of the last five births
21 have all happened in this Council three days apart,
22 so between September 9th and September 11th we've had
23 babies, so something's happening in December. I'm
24 just saying. I vote aye.

25 [background comment]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: With my warmest
congratulations to our colleagues who passed bills
today, I wanna recognize Council Member Salamanca on
his first land use item and also want congratulate
our Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito, Council Members
Laurie Cumbo, Antonio Reynoso, and Ritchie Torres on
their bills related to reporting of domestic violence
and hate crime data so that we can continue to do
great work in driving these numbers down and making
sure that we protect all of our families and those
that could be potential victims of domestic violence
in our city and victims of hate crimes.
Congratulations colleagues and I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: May I explain
my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you.
First I want to also congratulate our colleague,

1 Council Member Matteo on the birth of his child Ryan;
2 did you have the name Jimmy yet or we're still at
3 Ryan? Okay, we're just goin' with Ryan; it's an
4 inside Twitter joke. Mazel tov; I'm looking forward
5 to being invited to the bris. And I do also wanna
6 take [interpose laughter] the opportunity -- no bris;
7 are you kidding? We'll have to talk about this
8 afterwards. [laughter, background comments] I wanna
9 take the opportunity as well to congratulate all of
10 my colleagues on their legislation, but especially
11 Council Member Salamanca; I have to say that for a
12 newbie, he was one of the fiercest negotiators that
13 we've seen in the land use world; he ended up with an
14 amazing deal; this is a perfect example of how when
15 the administration, HPD, EDC, the developers; New
16 York City Council work together we achieve better
17 results and as a result of -- I'm gonna repeat what
18 was pointed out already, but I do wanna add that 10%
19 of this project will be at 30% of AMI below and that
20 is really at the insistence of the Council Member;
21 you're talking about two-bedroom apartments and a
22 brand new unit for \$600 a month, 40% is at below 60%
23 of AMI; that's at the insistence of the Council
24 Member; the amenities are gonna be the same in all of
25

1
2 the units; all of the units will have access to the
3 rooftop area and recreational space and this is
4 really testament on how working together we can
5 improve projects. So I congratulate the Council
6 Member and I thank my colleagues and I vote aye on
7 all.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye on all.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Permission to
12 explain my vote. I wanna congratulate Council Member
13 Salamanca, not just on this fantastic land use
14 affordable housing deal he was able to negotiate, but
15 on winning re-election yesterday as well so that he
16 can continue to serve in this body and be of service
17 to his constituents. I wanna congratulate my good
18 friend Steve Matteo on the birth of a beautiful
19 little boy named Ryan. And I wanna thank Council
20 Member Cumbo for this really important piece of
21 legislation, you know too often we don't talk about
22 these incidents that occur in New York City that are
23 traumatic for people and I wanna just thank her for
24 putting this forward and getting it done. And with
25 that I vote aye on all.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I wanna congratulate Council Member Matteo on his new baby and also Council Member Salamanca on his re-election and also on his land use deal. I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: With congratulations to the Minority Leader and to Council Member Salamanca; uh with thanks the sponsors on the DV bills and the MWBE bills and especially on the bikes in buildings bills, thanks to my colleagues for working on those; the folding bike demonstration we had at that hearing I thought was one of the best uses of the chamber. I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: With congratulations to my colleague, Council Member Steve Matteo; congratulations to Council Member Rafael

1
2 Salamanca and to all of the sponsors of the
3 legislation. I vote aye on all.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Ditto to what
6 Council Member Levin just said. Aye on all. Thank
7 you.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

9 [background comments, laughter]

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye on all
12 and all land use call-ups.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: And
15 congratulations to all my colleagues.

16 [background comment]

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Congratulations
19 to my colleagues. I vote aye on all.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Congratulations
22 to Council Member Salamanca, just not for his land
23 use item, but for being re-elected yesterday in the
24 primary and I vote aye on all.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Congratulations to Council Member Salamanca and Council Member Matteo.

I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Congratulations to Council Member Salamanca; congratulations to Council Member Matteo and in the tradition in keeping up with this baby boom and Council Member Reynoso, we are counting on you next. [laughter] I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I wanna congratulate [background comment] my colleague and delegation chair, Steve Matteo for adding to the population of Staten Island; [laughter] we might hit 500,000 soon; keep up the good work, man. And I wanna thank my [background comment] esteemed

1
2 colleagues in this chamber for passing a
3 comprehensive package of MWBE bills which will
4 address the accountability to MWBEs in City agencies;
5 I think it's really time that we've done that. And
6 I'm really pleased that after being calendared for so
7 many years I had three land use issues that were
8 passed, the George William and Adam Curtis House in
9 Staten Island, the St. John's Protestant Episcopal
10 Church rectory and 92 Harrison Street. And I vote
11 aye on all.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Permission to
15 quickly explain my vote... [crosstalk]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

18 Council Member Salamanca, congratulations; I just
19 wanna say that when it comes to land use you'll
20 always remember your first and you did a great job.
21 It's a big deal. I wanna congratulate the sponsors
22 of the domestic violence bills; you will really make
23 a difference; your legislation will really make a
24 difference in the lives of so many women in New York
25 City. Thank you Speaker Viverito, Council Member

1
2 Torres, Council Member Reynoso, Cumbo and Levine.

3 Thank you. And I vote aye on all.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Congratulations
10 to the residents of Councilman Salamanca's district
11 for doing a great job and congrats to my colleague as
12 well for his great victory. Congratulations to the
13 Minority Leader, Councilman Steve Matteo as well. I
14 vote aye on all.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Yes.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all and
21 God bless you Steve and your family.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Congratulations
24 to all my colleagues; Council Member Matteo. Vote
25 aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you all for the warm, heartfelt well wishes; Annie and little Ryan are doing very well at home and with that, must be a good mood so I'm gonna vote yes on all.

[laughter, background comments]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

[background comments]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Van Bramer. Excuse me.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: With congratulations to all, I vote aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations Minority Leader Matteo; congratulations Council Member Salamanca and we welcome Asher Garodnick to the chamber.

[cheers, applause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yeah. All items on today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote of 50 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0 abstentions. The revised land use call-ups are adopted by a vote of 50 in the affirmative and 0 negative. Introduction and reading of bills.

1
2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
3 referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So now we will
5 have a discussion of the resolution. I would like to
6 remind all of the Council Members that the rules
7 state that the discussion of a resolution is limited
8 to one minute and there are at least 15 Council
9 Members who would like to speak... 16, 17, 18,
10 [background comments] 19, 20. And we also have a
11 general discussion calendar as well. So let us
12 begin. The resolution reads as follows... Quiet in the
13 chambers. [background comment]

14 An amended resolution condemning all
15 efforts to delegitimize the State of Israel and the
16 global movement to boycott, divest from and sanction
17 the people of Israel.

18 We will now begin discussion; the clock
19 is now running, beginning with the Speaker, Melissa
20 Mark-Viverito, who of course the rule doesn't apply
21 to.

22 [background comments]

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
24 Cohen.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Okay. Thank you.
3 Thank you, Madame Public Advocate; I'm gonna try to
4 do less than a minute.

5 At its essence, Boycott, Divest and
6 Sanction Israel does not support Israel's right to
7 exist and advocates for policies that would lead to
8 the destruction of the State of Israel and as the
9 hearing made abundantly clear, does not support a
10 two-state solution; that is why we must take a stand
11 as the home of the largest population of Jews outside
12 the State of Israel and as the people who support the
13 only true democracy in the Middle East and the United
14 States' strongest ally in the region. I wanna thank
15 the Speaker as a stalwart supporter of Israel, for
16 her leadership and her personal support. I wanna
17 thank Council Member Rosenthal for her hard work and
18 shepherding this resolution to a very challenging
19 hearing. I wanna thank all of the members of the
20 Jewish Caucus and I wanna thank a super majority of
21 the members of the City Council for co-sponsoring
22 this resolution and I'm gonna yield my remaining 16
23 seconds.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
25 Levine... I neglected to mention the fact that this is

1
2 a voice vote and for those who wish to vote in the
3 negative and/or abstain, you have to approach the
4 desk; otherwise all members will be recorded in the
5 affirmative. Council Member Levine.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Madame
7 Public Advocate.

8 You have a right to free speech and that
9 includes the most hateful forms of speech; you have
10 the right to boycott anyone and anything you want,
11 but we also have a right and actually an obligation
12 to denounce the kind of hateful attacks which are
13 being leveled on people in this city who express any
14 support for Israel. There are so many New Yorkers
15 who whether because of ties of family or faith or
16 ethnic identity or immigration or just their beliefs
17 feel a connection to Israel, they feel affection for
18 Israel and they are being targeted, often in the most
19 hateful fashion. I refer you, as Exhibit A, to the
20 report produced by CUNY just last week documenting a
21 horrifying series of anti-Israel and anti-Semitic
22 attacks on campuses here in our city. There are
23 communities connected to every country on earth here
24 in New York City, but only the community connected to
25 Israel, not any of the other nations led by despots

1
2 around the world, only the supporters of Israel are
3 being targeted; that is unfair and I'm proud we're
4 standing up against it. Thank you.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
6 Council Member Levin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Madame
8 Public Advocate and my colleagues. As somebody who
9 identifies as Jewish, who believes in the State of
10 Israel as a national home for the Jewish people, who
11 believes in a two-state solution with a secure Israel
12 and in independent Palestine in Gaza and the West
13 Bank, who respects our American tradition of protest
14 and right to free speech, who believes in the right
15 of all humans to live in peace, security and self-
16 determination and who believes that peace in Israel
17 and Palestine is achievable in our time, I was and am
18 very conflicted about the City Council taking on
19 perhaps the most impractical issue in the world.
20 During the past few months I have also recalled the
21 time, 21 years ago, when I was 14 years old, learning
22 of the assassination of Israeli Prime Minister
23 Yitzhak Rabin one Sunday morning. I didn't know then
24 why it was so important and so tragic, but in time I
25 came to realize what Rabin's assassination, at the

1 hands of a radical anti-peace Jew had come to
2 represent; it was a victory of hate over love;
3 perpetual discord over peace [bell]. In intervening
4 years we have seen too many times to count bloodshed,
5 avenging bloodshed over and over in a seemingly...
6 [interpose]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coun...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: never-ending
10 cycle. I will take up my comments during the general
11 discussion.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 Council Member Barron.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. It's
15 interesting that when we ask if we could have a
16 resolution about Boko Haram and about what was going
17 of an international state [sic], we were told no. So
18 it's interesting now, for fear perhaps of being
19 labeled as anti-Semitic that this gets to come to the
20 floor, so I'm very much offended by that. For my
21 statement:

22 The Boycott, Divest and Sanctions

23 Movement is an international campaign to bring
24 pressure on Israel to end the discriminatory and
25 deadly oppression of Palestinian people; it is

1 supported by and advanced by collaboration of Jews,
2 Muslims and Christians, along with other faiths.

3
4 Just to jump to the end. Students have
5 traditionally been catalysts in social movement and
6 should in no way be inhibited from participating in
7 sensitive issues. BDS is not about religion or
8 national origin, it doesn't call for [bell]
9 boycotting Jews and thus is not anti-Semitic.. I'll
10 continue in the general discussion.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
12 Council Member Elizabeth Crowley.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I believe that
14 the Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions Movement is
15 simply an act of discrimination and that this
16 discrimination goes beyond criticism of Israel's
17 policies. Democracy is in place to root out
18 discrimination and here in the New York City Council
19 it is our job to do the same. Holding hearings and
20 enacting reform geared towards enhancing
21 opportunities and fairness. Furthermore, at a time
22 when our national security is threatened, we must
23 support our strongest allies and Israel is the only
24 true democracy in the Middle East. We must feed on
25 each other's strengths instead of adopting measures

1
2 to weaken them and that's why I'm proud to support
3 this resolution.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Council Member Mendez.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you. It
7 has been a longstanding practice in this chamber not
8 to vote on international issues, so on process alone
9 we should not be voting on this or we should be
10 voting no.

11 I also want to be associated with the
12 comment of my friend and colleague, Council Member
13 Barron. I just am not sure why we are taking this
14 vote today; I don't think that this is a matter of
15 discrimination; I think this is a matter of just
16 putting something to the floor that is favored by a
17 majority, which we don't always do [background
18 comments] on international matters. So... [interpose]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
20 chambers.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: thank you and I
22 will come up to the front and mark my no vote.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
24 Council Member Lander.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: As a proud
3 active, progressive Jew I feel deeply invested in
4 Israel, the history of our people returning after two
5 millennia of exile and persecution to courageously
6 build the Jewish homeland while also striving, as the
7 Israel Declaration of Independence set out, for
8 equality of social and political rights irrespective
9 of race, religion and sex is a powerful inspiration
10 to me, so I am forthrightly opposed to global BDS,
11 which is incompatible with Israel's right to exist as
12 a Jewish democratic state and pleased to be a co-
13 sponsor. I am proud this Council is expressing our
14 strong opposition to BDS without supporting a
15 blacklist, using the contracting power of the State
16 to punish peaceful political expression goes against
17 core American values and I'm grateful to the sponsors
18 for amending the resolution to make it compatible
19 with constitutional guarantees of freedom of
20 expression. It's also important for me, like Council
21 Member Levin, to make clear that many of the same
22 values that lead me to oppose BDS also lead me to
23 oppose the Israel occupation of the West Bank and
24 Gaza; like Israelis, Palestinians have a right to
25 self-determination and the protection of their [bell]

1 human rights. For nearly 50 years Palestinians in
2 the West Bank and Gaza... [interpose]

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: have been without
5 full rights as citizens and too often subject to home
6 demolitions, land seizures and detention without
7 trial... [interpose, crosstalk]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member;
9 would you like to continue in general discussion?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: or people could
11 read the entire statement on my website, which takes
12 even more time than I'll have in general discussion.
13 Thank you. [crosstalk]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
15 Council Member Kallos.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Members of my
17 family died in the concentration camps during the
18 Holocaust... [interpose]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Is your mic... Is
20 your microphone on, sir?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Members of my
24 family died in concentration camps during the
25

1
2 Holocaust; some who survived made it to the United
3 States, some to Sweden; many to Israel. I love my
4 family who live in Israel, I love Israel; I love the
5 United States and our city and its human rights law
6 which protects against discrimination based on ethnic
7 or nation of origin. I will stand against any
8 discrimination against anyone based on their
9 ethnicity or nation of origin; I'm deeply saddened to
10 see personal attacks in our communities, on CUNY
11 campuses and even here in these Council chambers
12 during the hearing on this resolution. This is what
13 it means to be Jewish and support Israel here in New
14 York City in 2016; I'm proud to join Council Member
15 Andrew Cohen as a co-prime-sponsor of this resolution
16 and urge my colleagues to vote in support of this
17 resolution.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
19 Council Member Williams.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.
21 Even though this is a voice vote, I have a particular
22 constituency I think deserves to hear my vote, why
23 I'm voting on this. Just from the outset, I do
24 support a two-state solution and understand why the
25 Jewish people should have a place, based on the

1
2 history, to call home. Also, most of my issues are
3 based on process; not substance; I do wanna say the
4 wording makes me uneasy, because I believe that in
5 saying we should not boycott and I am a huge
6 proponent of nonviolent resistance, but on process I
7 was... I have an e-mail here where I was rejected from
8 being able to even draft a resolution on the Haitians
9 of Dominican descent; actually I can't say that I
10 wasn't a little relieved; I believe that it would be
11 very divisive here, it was the right decision and I
12 think we should continue that decision as well,
13 including this piece of the legislation and will be
14 abstaining.

15 Also I want to say, many of us took care
16 during discussion, like the Community Safety Act and
17 the Right to Know Act, to make sure we created a
18 space [bell] where people could object without being
19 called racist; I would ask that the same be done
20 here.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
22 Cornegy.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: As a former
24 professional athlete and now as a Council Member, I
25 spent time in Israel learning the culture and I've

1 developed a good sense of the political climate. As
2 I vote that Israel should not be condemned, it should
3 not be overlooked, that we have a responsibility as
4 legislators to ensure that all people are treated
5 with equality and respect; we must call out these
6 injustices, yet in cases of Res 191 that denounced
7 discrimination and violence against Haitian people
8 and in the case of Boko Haram, where approximately
9 276 Nigerian girls were abducted and 219 still remain
10 missing, we failed to expand any political capital.

11
12 Today we are voting on an international
13 issue where in the past we failed to do so for people
14 of color, even domestically we've overlooked some
15 human rights issues as highlighted by the Black Lives
16 Matter movement. We as a body must be consistent in
17 our advocacy and today it should be about equity. I
18 call on this body to look at all issues of human
19 rights, including those affecting people of color.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
21 Reynoso.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I will be
23 abstaining; my abstention is in no way a declaration
24 of support for the BDS movement; I support Israel's
25 right to exist as a Jewish state and a two-state

1
2 solution to the Israel-Palestinian conflict. I
3 simply believe the New York City Council is not the
4 appropriate authority to hear and address
5 international-based policies and movements. Thank
6 you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
8 Greenfield.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you.
10 I'm proud to be voting yes on this anti-BDS
11 resolution today, it's far past time that New York
12 City take a stand to the pernicious and vile BDS
13 movement that has impacted so many people, especially
14 our students on campus. It's also fitting that New
15 York should take this stand, giving our status as the
16 most diverse city on earth and also home to the
17 greatest number of Jews outside of Israel. Jewish
18 people have endured many attempts to destroy us over
19 many thousands of years; some of those efforts have
20 been explicit and brazen, while others have been
21 subtle and devious; you don't have to be Jewish or
22 even a staunch supporter of Israel to see that we
23 must firmly reject the BDS movement. The movement is
24 not merely the product of noble aims led astray by
25 faulty [sic] reasoning; while I believe that some of

1
2 its supporters are good people who are just deeply
3 misguided, an examination of the rhetoric coming out
4 of the BDS leaders will see that it is deeply anti-
5 Israel and often anti-Semitic in nature and we saw
6 this specifically when an entire panel of witnesses
7 told us they do not support a two-state solution,
8 they do not believe in Israel's right to exist as a
9 Jewish state and that is also the [sic] view of the
10 leadership of the BDS and that's why I am proud to
11 vote in favor of this resolution.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
13 Johnson.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you Madame
15 Public Advocate. It's hard to follow Council Member
16 Greenfield, because I agree with much of what he just
17 said. The one thing that I would like to say is that
18 this is a very complicated issue in one of the most
19 complicated places on planet earth and the reason why
20 I signed on as a co-sponsor of this resolution and
21 the reason why I voted for it in committee and the
22 reason why I will vote for it today is because I
23 believe in peace and I'm not saying the people that
24 vote against it don't believe in peace, but for me,
25 the fact that BDS does not believe in a two-state

1
2 solution; the fact that BDS is calling for the
3 delegitimizing of the State of Israel, to me that is
4 pernicious enough, that is so horrific in my mind
5 that I think we need to support this. Jews and
6 Palestinians need to speak with each other; that is
7 not what BDS is about. [bell] I proudly vote aye.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
9 Cumbo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. Today
11 marks 883 days that the 218 Chibok girls have
12 remained in captivity by the Boko Haram regime in
13 Nigeria, 883 days ago, when the entire city, nation
14 and the world united to fight for the U.S. government
15 to exhaust all resources to bring back 276 girls back
16 to their homes; when I requested that a resolution be
17 drafted, I was told that we do not as a body
18 intervene in international affairs. I was angry and
19 I was upset, but I respected that the body decided
20 that this was not the proper space in order to deal
21 with international affairs. I was angry and I was
22 upset. I also feel that the way that this has been
23 introduced to this body has been divisive, without
24 any real thoughtful education, internal conversations
25 and opportunities to speak about the issue free of

1 judgment. I also stand here as a black woman and as
2 a black woman, the fact that I'm here as a City
3 Council member is because my ancestors and the people
4 before me [bell] had the right to boycott. I in good
5 conscience... [interpose]

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member...

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: cannot say or
9 support... [interpose]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,
11 you... would you like to complete your conversation in
12 general discussion...? [crosstalk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: the urging of
14 anyone to deny them the right to boycott anywhere...
15 [crosstalk]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member...

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: in the world...
18 [crosstalk]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: if not for my
21 ancestors... [crosstalk]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I would not be
24 here today.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I stand in support of Res 1058-A. At our hearing last week we heard from more than 30 individuals representing over 20 organizations expressing points of view both for and against the resolution. There's one misconception in particular that I'd like to address and that is the idea that the resolution undermines individuals' freedom of speech. The text of the resolution is plain; it condemns the movement that delegitimizes the State of Israel; the resolution does not prohibit or condemn criticism of the State of Israel. Each individual, no matter their viewpoint on a particular issue, must feel comfortable exercising their First Amendment right. I strongly value these rights and would never attach my name to a resolution that had an impact on the right to free speech or the right to protest. I'm comfortable [bell] supporting.. Thank you very much.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: You're welcome.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
3 Treyger.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: In 1938
5 President Roosevelt convened a conference of nations
6 in France asking the world who will take the Jews
7 that are being persecuted across Europe and almost
8 every nation said no, including the United States of
9 America and had there been a homeland that would've
10 accepted the Jewish people, my relatives and six
11 million other families and relatives might've been
12 alive today. So the goals of BDS call for the
13 paralysis of the State of Israel, which would lead to
14 the end of the homeland and this discussion has been
15 dominated by the fringes of the issue. We support a
16 two-state solution, just like Gandhi did for India
17 and Pakistan and there should be in Israel side by
18 side with the Palestinian State. I proudly support
19 the resolution, like my colleague [bell] Council
20 Member Andrew Cohen.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Buenas tardes.
22 This topic before us today I know is extremely
23 important to many of you; I have received many
24 messages on both sides, from district residents, my
25 colleagues and friends, about the topic of Boycott,

1
2 Divestment, Sanctions Movement; I heard you and I
3 appreciate the energy and commitment and I rejoice
4 over everyone's absolute American right to express
5 opinion and to advocate for positions energetically
6 in a responsible, nonviolent way. My position and
7 the basis for my vote on this resolution is informed
8 by my unwavering commitment to our freedom of speech,
9 the right of any one of us to responsibly express and
10 act upon our view and my commitment to fully engage
11 the whole community. Historically, nonviolent
12 protest movements led by my Mexican, some by my
13 Mexican-American ancestors, at one point were
14 condemned vigorously and many of those helped to
15 usher in a more integrated, diverse New York City
16 Council that today represents flourishing, vibrant
17 communities composed of different ethnicities, races,
18 gender, [bell] sexual orientation and religions..
19 [crosstalk]

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member...

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: living side by
22 side. [interpose]

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: you... Council
24 Member, would you like to...

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I do not want
3 to condemn those who want to have their voices heard
4 in a full nonviolent manner... [crosstalk]

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: would you like to
6 continue your conversation in general discussion?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I do want to
8 uphold our... [crosstalk]

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member;
10 would you like to finish your conversation...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: sworn
12 commitment to the constitutional right and our
13 freedom of expression... [interpose]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I am voting no.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
19 Miller, who is the last... oh, sorry, Council Member
20 Miller and then another member.

21 [background comments]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Madame
23 Public Advocate. While I applaud my colleagues for
24 articulating the inequities that we have seen here in
25 the Council as relates to international affairs, I

1
2 also vehemently dismiss that the labeling of anyone
3 who opposes this resolution as anti-Semitic. Madame
4 Public Advocate, I will be voting for free speech, I
5 will be voting for freedom of expression, I will be
6 voting for the integrity of this body; I will be
7 voting no on this resolution.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And our last
9 Council Member is Council Member Grodenchik.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Someone else.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Uh sorry; one
12 more... [interpose]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I mean one
14 more after me? Okay.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you
17 Madame Public Advocate. I wanna make three very
18 quick points. I am supporting this resolution in
19 support of the most progressive and only truly
20 democratic nation in the Middle East; I want to echo
21 my colleague Helen Rosenthal's comments and I wanna
22 thank her for her excellent leadership last week and
23 a very difficult time in this chamber; nobody's First
24 Amendment rights are being trampled here, we all
25 support the constitution; we have all taken an oath

1
2 to support the constitution and nobody's rights are
3 being trampled here. This is an expression that we
4 are expressing our First Amendment right as elected
5 officials in this city, and third, I want to say,
6 perhaps it's time we revisit our discussion on
7 international issues here; we are the most important
8 city in the most important nation on earth; people
9 look to us still, they still see that lady standing
10 in the harbor; she stands for liberty; we have to
11 stand up for liberty and justice and I am prepared to
12 vote for that today. Thank you Madame Public
13 Advocate.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
15 Torres, followed by Council Member Vacca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Thank you Madame
17 Public Advocate. I am in support of the resolution.
18 I do respect some of the concerns about whether or
19 not the Council is the appropriate forum for debating
20 foreign affairs, but I find that the strangest
21 criticism of the resolution is that it somehow
22 suppresses the free speech of BDS sympathizers; just
23 like the BDS activists have a right to free
24 expression, Council Members in support of the
25 resolution have those same rights of expression and

1
2 we in the Council are not suppressing someone else's
3 right to speak by merely exercising our own right to
4 speak. It is possible to denounce the substance of
5 someone else's speech without denouncing the right to
6 speak and so I think that should not be lost, that
7 today's resolution is a denunciation of substance,
8 not expression.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And the last
10 speaker, Council Member Vacca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: We're talking a
12 lot about process and whether or not we should do
13 this in the future or whether we did that in the
14 past; the reality is, the resolution states that it
15 condemns all efforts to delegitimatize the State of
16 Israel and I vote yes on that condemnation because I
17 don't want to delegitimatize the right of Israel to
18 exist, pure and simple.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Again, now we
20 will take a voice vote. For those who wish to be
21 recorded in the negative and/or abstentions, you must
22 approach the desk. All of those in favor say aye.

23 [collective aye]

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those
25 opposed. Any abstentions; please approach the desk.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

And I believe the ayes have it. Now we'll go to [sic] general discussion... quiet in the chambers; we are still in session... beginning with Council Member Cornegy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I'm good; never mind.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member Steve Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you.
[intervene]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Picking up on my previous comments. We have seen [background comment] over the last 20 years moderate voices on both sides sidelined and mocked; today I proudly stand and say that I am pro peace, I am pro two-state [background comment] Israel and Palestine... [interpose]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me... member, let us get us some order and [background comments] we're still in session. We apologize, Council Member.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I am pro two-state Israel and Palestine and that I oppose any and all efforts that undermine that goal; that means that I

1
2 unequivocally condemn the virulent anti-Jewish
3 positions, incitement and actions of Hamas and all
4 acts of terror and violence aimed at Israeli
5 citizens. I also oppose some basic tenets of global
6 BDS movement. While I respect individuals' rights to
7 engage in boycotts that are focused on occupied
8 territories beyond the green line, which recognizing
9 Israel's right to exist and supporting a two-state
10 solution, the Global BDS Movement's own platform does
11 not recognize Israel's right to exist and many in the
12 Global BDS Movement, including some who testified at
13 the recent Council hearing, do not support a two-
14 state solution. As a matter of bedrock principle,
15 Israel's right to exist as a nation and a state must
16 be explicitly recognized and any equivocation or
17 ambiguity is in fact tantamount to denial; for that
18 reason I am signing on as a co-sponsor to the Council
19 resolution. I'd like to thank Council Member Cohen
20 and Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for amending the
21 resolution at the request of myself and Council
22 Member Brad Lander. But it also means that I oppose
23 the construction of Israeli settlements in the West
24 Bank, the expansion of Israeli settlements in the
25 West Bank and the military occupation of the land

1
2 beyond the green line. My reason is twofold; first,
3 Palestinians living in the occupied territories are
4 and have been for the past 49 years living without
5 their full inalienable rights of liberty and equality
6 as defined in the Universal Declaration of Human
7 Rights; second, if Israel were to annex the West Bank
8 and afford all the equal rights of representation to
9 all Palestinians in the West Bank and Israel proper,
10 Israel would eventually cease to be a Jewish state.
11 There are times that I and many who believe that
12 peace is possible may grow despondent; at those times
13 we should remind ourselves of Yitzhak Rabin and the
14 many other Israelis and Palestinians who have had the
15 courage to risk their lives [bell] and give their
16 lives and stand up, [bell] sometimes to mete [sic]
17 their own countrymen... [interpose]

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: and fight against
20 **(inaudible)** and perpetual discord... [crosstalk]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: please bring your
22 comments to a close.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: to fight for love
24 and peace. As we approach a full century of conflict
25 between Jews and Arabs... [crosstalk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Israelis and

Palestinians over national... [crosstalk]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: aspirations of

both peoples, we need... [crosstalk]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member,

please...

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: some of their

courage. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank

you so much. Council Member Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you Madame

Public Advocate. Today I am proud to introduce

Int. 1265 along with Council Members Johnson and

Dickens. This commonsense piece of legislation would

make it an animal abuse crime to leave a pet outdoors

during inclement weather. This January, during our

historic blizzard, a Brooklyn woman let her dogs

outside in an uninsulated doghouse to freeze in the

bitter cold. Such animal cruelty should be

punishable by law and with this bill the first

offense would result in a fine of up to \$250 or a

written warning if the animal was not injured.

1
2 Subsequent offense within a 12-month period will
3 result in a B misdemeanor; if convicted, the owner
4 would be required to register with the New York City
5 Animal Abuse Registry. Building on State law, this
6 codifying these animal abuse crimes and opposing
7 stronger penalties serve as a strong deterrent for
8 anyone who even thinks about endangering the welfare
9 of a pet. Again I'd like to thank Council Members
10 Johnson and Dickens for supporting this legislation;
11 I urge my colleagues to do so as well.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 Council Member Williams.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thanks. First,
15 just for clarification, if it wasn't made [sic], I
16 abstained from the BDS vote; also not a support or
17 non-support; more on process. And another point;
18 most of my life I have chosen not to cite the pledge,
19 except for rare instances, say the National Anthem;
20 for my time here I've always stood out of respect;
21 earlier today I decided to make a personal protest
22 public in the same way as Colin Kaepernick has;
23 obviously the comments he made of what's going on in
24 the nation is a part of it and I think all of us
25 should be aware and should be listening; I am no less

1
2 American now than I was the day I was born and I
3 believe I am a patriot. What tipped me over were
4 some local things, like the news of the office of
5 Pantaleo's pay raise was particularly bothersome,
6 compounded by the issues of transparency that we're
7 having and finding out what officers... what happens
8 after the investigations, particularly around
9 Pantaleo. Also struggling to get past the Right to
10 Know Act in this body; we are at the swelling [sic]
11 point in this country; nonviolent protest is a best
12 tradition of this country and history approves of
13 those who forfeit justice even though they were not
14 supported at the time, from boycotts to the iconic
15 Olympics; from marches to cities, many romanticize
16 these hard fights and think about what they would do
17 if they were there. It's time now for us all to do
18 what we can where we are, with what we have;
19 minimally we can support those who are trying to do
20 just that. Thank you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
22 Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madame
24 Public Advocate. I wasn't here at the hearing; I had
25 a death of a longstanding friend, Doris Edwards; we

1
2 had been friends for about... I guess about 60 years
3 and she passed, so that's why I was not here, but I
4 did wanna make sure that my statement's on the
5 record.

6 The Boycott Divestment Sanctions Movement
7 is an international campaign to bring pressure on
8 Israel to end the discriminatory and deadly
9 oppression of Palestinian people; it is supported by
10 and advanced by a collaboration of Jews, Muslims and
11 Christians, along with others of various faiths. The
12 BDS Movement seeks to advance peace and improve the
13 lives of Israelis and Palestinians and conduct
14 interfaith dialogue. These tactics, BDS,
15 historically have been successfully using major
16 movements to end oppression, racism and suppression;
17 the civil rights movement gained momentum and
18 expanded through the famous Montgomery bus boycott.
19 Today nations, educational institutions, high-profile
20 entertainers and educated consumers are joining this
21 effort to bring an end to the oppressive conditions
22 that have allowed conditions to exist that have
23 resulted in the deaths of innocent civilians
24 including women and children, destruction of family
25 lives, increased number of orphans, and loss of

1
2 economic opportunities for Palestinian people. Also
3 as Chair of the Committee on Higher Education, I'm
4 particularly sensitive to ensuring that students
5 maintain their right of free speech, even though
6 others may be offended by the issues that they seek
7 to address. Thank you Madame Public Advocate.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
9 Council Member Richards.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you.
11 Just wanted to speak to Int. 1269, which I'm co-
12 sponsoring with Council Member Miller, a bill that
13 would allow community land trusts to enter into
14 regulatory agreements with the Department of Housing
15 Preservation and Development for the development of
16 affordable housing. Currently the Department of
17 Finance will not take affordability restrictions
18 placed on a property into account when doing an
19 assessment unless they are part of a regulatory
20 agreement with HPD. So if this bill were to pass,
21 HPD could form a regulatory agreement with a City
22 land trust requiring that housing built on a land be
23 kept affordable to certain income ranges. Department
24 of Finance would then take these restrictions into
25 account when assessing the property. In order to

1 fully grown and flourish as a city we need to not
2 only build affordable housing, but we must also
3 increase opportunities for affordable homeownership;
4 therefore we need to ensure that the administration
5 and nonprofits have every tool at their disposal to
6 accomplish this goal. I encourage my colleagues and
7 ask them to support both Council Member Miller and I
8 and this legislation. Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And our last
11 speaker is Council Member Cumbo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I want
13 to also state that I abstained on the BDS vote and I
14 also wanna state that we should as a body be
15 consistent on international issues and that we must
16 remain consistent and we must remain equitable.

17 I also wanna state that as an African-
18 American woman it's difficult for us to celebrate
19 holidays like Rev. Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. or
20 individuals such as Rosa Parks who utilized
21 boycotting and the civil rights movement as an
22 opportunity to have the freedoms that so many of us
23 enjoy. Every elected person of color is here because
24 somebody boycotted in order for us to be here. In
25 good faith and in good consciousness, I cannot deny

1
2 anybody the opportunity or the desire to use peaceful
3 means in order to express themselves and I don't feel
4 that this body should exercise any authority in
5 determining how someone should peacefully exercise
6 how they express their means of protest. I have a
7 very large Jewish community in my district; I
8 represent them and I represent their interests and
9 this is not a vote in support of BDS; this is simply
10 me stating that I believe that we should have
11 consistency and equality and we should not deny
12 someone a right such as that.

13 As far as switching gears, as LIU, I just
14 wanna urge and continue all of my colleagues; this is
15 a national issue of higher education; we stand with
16 the faculty, we stand with the students; never before
17 have faculty been locked out of an institution;
18 students are paying \$40,000 in tuition to be taught
19 by TAs and people that have just simply walked off
20 the street without the proper qualifications. We
21 stand with the students and the faculty and we will
22 continue to urge significant pressure in making sure
23 that our colleagues in education [bell] are given an
24 opportunity to have their positions back. Thank you.

25

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member... I
3 apologize, there's two more speakers, Council Member
4 Greenfield.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
6 Madame Public Advocate. With your permission I wanna
7 do something a little bit radical here today; I'd
8 like to actually read portions of the resolution so
9 for those folks watching at home, they know exactly
10 what it is that we're discussing; these are just
11 portions.

12 Whereas as the Global BDS Movement
13 targets Israel and only Israel, while ignoring the
14 world's myriad despotic regimes. And whereas, Israel
15 is far and away the most democratic and open society
16 in the Middle East, with well-established rights for
17 religious minorities, women and LGBT citizens that
18 far exceed those of any other nation. Whereas the
19 Global BDS Movement does not recognize the right of
20 the Jewish people to national self-determination.
21 And whereas, some of the BDS Movement supporters and
22 leaders have trafficked an unacceptable anti-Semitic
23 rhetoric, whereas both the Israelis and Palestinians
24 have the right to live in a safe, secure state, free
25 from fear and violence, with mutual recognition.

1
2 Whereas the Global BDS Movement does not support the
3 two-state solution, a goal which can only be reached
4 through direct negotiation between Israel and the
5 Palestinians. The resolution concludes -- and this
6 is really the critical part -- resolve that the
7 Council of the City of New York condemns all effort
8 to delegitimize the State of Israel and the Global
9 Movement to boycott, divest from and sanction its
10 government and people. I think it's important just
11 to be clear; we are not taking away anyone's First
12 Amendment rights. We in the Council have condemned
13 racism and bigotry and violence; all we are doing
14 today is simply condemning anti-Israel and anti-
15 Semitic activity; you still have -- I wanna be clear;
16 I'm not talking about any Council Member; I'm talking
17 about some of the activists and the positions that
18 we've heard, those activists still have the right to
19 be bigots and they still have the right if they so
20 choose to be anti-Israel and they still have the
21 right if they so choose to be anti-Semitic; all we're
22 saying as a Council today is that to those of you who
23 have those beliefs, we in the Council condemn you and
24 your beliefs and your actions. Thank you.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. And
3 our last speaker, hopefully, is Council Member Rose.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I was outraged to
5 discover that Officer Daniel Pantaleo, who was on
6 restricted duty and under investigation for civil
7 rights and departmental violations, has received
8 thousands of dollars in overtime pay, and thus [sic],
9 I am relieved that this will be reviewed by NYPD, but
10 I don't think that that is enough; otherwise, it can
11 give... it will give New Yorkers the impression that he
12 is being inappropriately rewarded for abusing the
13 public trust that we place in our police officers;
14 this news about his overtime pay only underscores the
15 need for the United States Department of Justice to
16 conclude its two-year-long investigation into this
17 case so that we can move forward toward justice.

18 Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Now to close,
20 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madame
22 Public Advocate. I wanna just also thank my
23 colleagues always for the level of dialogue and
24 discussion that we have on issues that at times can
25 be and are extremely controversial. So I wanna first

1
2 thank Debi for her words right now, because those are
3 sentiments that I publicly expressed with regards to
4 Pantaleo.

5 And on the issue of BDS, I know that and
6 I knew that this was gonna be an issue that was gonna
7 elicit some conversation on the floor. But I think I
8 do wanna just take issue with this idea and concept
9 that people have said that what we're voting on is
10 something that is trying to curtail free speech; I
11 think it's been indicated and the words on the
12 resolution have been read that that is not what we
13 are doing here, and I think words are very important,
14 right; if you have a movement that philosophically is
15 against the right for Israel to exist and its right
16 to self-determination, then any action that is asked
17 us to engaged in has as that premise, right; that
18 Israel does not have the right to exist, and I think
19 that is what we are discussing here and that is what
20 is at the heart of the language of this resolution.
21 And also there has been misconception about what the
22 resolution does or doesn't do, right; it's not
23 targeting any particular group or any particular
24 faith; it is not shutting down dialogue or free
25 speech and I think the comments of Council Member

1 Rosenthal and Torres speak to that. And yes, we do
2 have to have a conversation with regards to this
3 issue and this has been an ongoing conversation since
4 I've walked into the chambers with regards to whether
5 or not we are going to engage in conversations on
6 resolutions that have sort of international
7 implications, but even that, or foreign policy, even
8 that I might have an issue with with regards to this
9 particular issue. The movement is a global movement
10 that is asking us as individuals, as nations, as
11 cities to take action on certain things and so it's
12 not solely a foreign policy matter; it is something
13 that is being asked of us here in the present. So
14 really it is my sincere hope that in our lifetime we
15 do have a stable two-state solution which will allow
16 Israelis and Palestinians to live in peace together;
17 that the rights of each will be respected, and as
18 Council Member Greenfield said, the resolution
19 clearly states that both Israelis and Palestinians
20 have the right to live in safe and secure states,
21 free from fear and violence, with mutual recognition;
22 that is critical; I believe that it's possible and
23 that is why I will support this resolution.
24

1
2 So thank you to my colleagues as we,
3 again, deliberate; we've had a very productive day;
4 we should be very proud of all the work that we've
5 achieved with regards to the legislation that we have
6 passed, very, very substantial bills here on domestic
7 violence, on reporting, on MWBEs, great land use
8 projects, so a lot to be proud of here today and we
9 will continue these conversations moving forward. I
10 take everything you say seriously and we will
11 deliberate further. So thank you all and I think
12 with that we close today's session.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We stand
14 adjourned.

15 [gavel]

16 [background comments]

17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date September 22, 2016