

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS,  
LIBRARIES AND INTERNATIONAL  
INTERGROUP RELATIONS

----- X

OCTOBER 30, 2015  
Start: 12:16 P.M.  
Recess: 12:58 P.M.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: JAMES VAN BRAMER  
CHAIRPERSON

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
ELIZABETH CROWLEY  
ANDY KING  
STEPHEN LEVIN

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

EDDIE TORRES  
Acting Commissioner of the New York City  
Department of Cultural Affairs

CARL GOODMAN  
Executive Director, Cultural Affairs  
Queens Borough Delegation

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

3

2 Good morning everyone. Good morning and  
3 we are prepared to start this hearing. My name is  
4 Jimmy Van Bramer and I am proud to be the Chair of  
5 the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and  
6 International Intergroup Relations. Thrilled be  
7 joined with my Queens colleague and Committee Member,  
8 Peter Koo and we have several other Members on the  
9 way but I want to get started and with this hearing.  
10 So think everyone here understands the value of our  
11 cultural institutions group members and the amazing  
12 ways that they contribute to the vibrancy and the  
13 well-being of the City of New York and we want to do  
14 everything we can to empower them and also to promote  
15 them and to make sure that all New Yorkers fully  
16 understand all of the benefits of our cultural  
17 institutions group members. Too often people do not  
18 understand just how diverse an audience our cultural  
19 institutions group members are serving. And not  
20 everyone has the privileged of seeing school buses  
21 lined up in front of the Museum of National History  
22 or to see our classes of children from all five  
23 Boroughs coursing through many of these institutions  
24 and many of these kids from families without a lot of  
25 money and so these school trips are their first

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

4

2 expose to museums and science based cultural  
3 institutions as well. So the value of the CIG are  
4 immense and I would also say that the value of the  
5 MMR and PMMR are also immense which brings us to Int.  
6 No. 865 and as someone who use to work for a large  
7 non-profit organization that reported in the PMMR and  
8 MMR, I have some familiarity with this because I was  
9 the one charged with compiling the data and reporting  
10 the data to the City for the Queens Library and I  
11 believe in the value and the importance of these  
12 documents and the reporting is an opportunity I  
13 believe for the organizations to demonstrate their  
14 value and just how much they are doing for the City  
15 of New York. The cultural institution group member  
16 rightfully receives significate support from the City  
17 of New York and they have come to the table in so  
18 many ways through their education programs; IDNYC and  
19 so many other ways. And it is, I believe even more  
20 important than ever then for our cultural institution  
21 group members to have an opportunity to fully  
22 highlight some of the ways that their contributing to  
23 this City. The visitor count is something we already  
24 report is incredibly impressive with 21 ½, nearly 22  
25 million people visiting the CIG. That's an

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

5

2 incredibly important and impressive figure that I  
3 believe when other elected official and other folks  
4 see that number get just how many folks are... are... are  
5 using these services and why it's important to  
6 increase funding for our... our... our cultural  
7 institution member and other cultural institution.

8 But there's more that we should report, there's more  
9 that we should be proud of and that's at the heart of  
10 Int. No. 865 and working with the Department of  
11 Cultural Affairs and the cultural institutions group  
12 members finding which of those markers are important  
13 to report and how best to amplify the message that  
14 the cultural institutions group members are serving  
15 an incredible diverse populations. They are reaching  
16 deep into all five Boroughs, every neighborhood,  
17 every community and in particular with the programs  
18 for students. That's something I want people to  
19 know. I want people who don't have the opportunity  
20 to see those buses lined up outside of the member's  
21 institutions. I want them to know how many students  
22 are being shown these amazing institutions. I,  
23 myself have seen PS76 from my district school that  
24 serves a population that does not have a great deal  
25 of money go through that museum and see the faces of

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

6

2 those young people. Because I've seen it, because  
3 the museum has made sure that I saw it, I know but  
4 not everyone else knows. The MMR and PMMR are ways  
5 in which we can make sure that there's a broader  
6 audience of... of... of elected officials and  
7 institutional players who understand just how much  
8 work is being done and... and so that's at the heart  
9 of... of this bill. I'm anxious to hear from the  
10 Department of Cultural Affairs and the Cultural  
11 Institutions Group as well and I feel confident that  
12 working together we can come up with a plan that  
13 makes sense for everyone that increases the  
14 transparency in reporting but also sees it as  
15 opportunity to amplify the incredible work that is  
16 being done. So I want to thank Aminta Kilawan, Chloe  
17 Rivera and Aliya Ali as well as legal fellow Natalie  
18 Verhagan (sic) for putting together this hearing on.  
19 I want to thank the Cultural Institution Groups  
20 members and now I will ask Eddie Torres the Acting  
21 Commissioner of the Department Cultural Affairs to  
22 bring his remarks. Thanks you. Excuse me one  
23 second, Commissioner we have to swear you in. So  
24 please raise your right hand. Do you affirm to tell  
25 the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

7

2 in your testimony before this committee and to  
3 respond honestly to Council Members questions?

4 EDDIE TORRES: I do.

5 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much.

6 EDDIE TORRES: Oh thanks. So good  
7 afternoon Chairman Van Bramer and Council Member Koo  
8 and all of us. I'm Eddie Torres, Acting Commissioner  
9 of the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs.  
10 As you know Commissioner Frinklepearl (sic) is on  
11 medical leave but he appreciates the opportunity to  
12 have open dialogue with the Council. He sends his  
13 warmest regards to all and especially the Chair Van  
14 Bramer and other members of the Committee. I'm here  
15 to present testimony regarding Int. No. 865 a local  
16 law that would amend the City Charter to incorporate  
17 performance data from the member organizations of the  
18 cultural institutions group into the Mayors manager's  
19 report. I am joined today by a number of my  
20 colleagues from the Agency as well as from the CIG  
21 and as you know the Department of Cultural Affairs  
22 provides program and capital support to some 900  
23 cultural organizations each year that collectively  
24 represent one of the most vibrate creative  
25 communities anywhere else in the world. The agency

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS 8

2 also and directs and engages actively in policy,  
3 advocacy, technical assistance related to the City's  
4 cultural realm. The Mayor's Management Report or the  
5 MMR promotes City's agency accountability and  
6 measures agencies performance on service delivery to  
7 City residence. DCLA section of the MMR first  
8 focuses on the Department's performance with regards  
9 to timely efficient payments and services for the  
10 organizations that receive City funding for operation  
11 and energy support programming and capital projects  
12 as well as increasing the supply of donated materials  
13 available to schools and art groups through materials  
14 for the Arts.

15           The second service tracked by the MMR's  
16 our ability to promote public appreciation for non-  
17 profit arts and cultural. For this we report on  
18 overall attendance at the CIG institutions, which is  
19 something proposed in your legislation but this  
20 aggregated attendance figure is intended to reflect  
21 DCLA efforts in promoting the Art not the effort of  
22 the individual members of the CIG. Taken together  
23 these metrics characterize our ability to support  
24 this diverse cultural sector and our already reported  
25 every year in the MMR. The cultural institutions



1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS 9

2 group or the CIG consist of 33 private independent  
3 non-profit cultural institutions that occupy City  
4 owned property and receive annual subsidies in the  
5 form of operating and energy support. As I've  
6 mentioned the MMR tracks the performance of City  
7 agencies is accountable to the Mayor. Expanding it's  
8 purview to track the performance of private  
9 institutions would be inappropriate and beyond the  
10 mandate of the MMR. With respect to transparency,  
11 accountability and public awareness, all 33 CIG  
12 members are ready subject to substantial amounts of  
13 reporting and tracking by DCLA. It publishes large  
14 amounts of information and compliance with State and  
15 federal financial reporting requirements and also  
16 publicly releases a wide range of information through  
17 annual reports and other marketing and communications  
18 materials designed to explain and promote the  
19 benefits each group confers and it's particular  
20 audiences and communities. We also think that the  
21 proposed tracking requirements would not accurately  
22 represent the CIG institutions performance resulting  
23 in an incomplete misleading snapshot of the  
24 institutions efforts while needlessly draining their  
25 valuable resources. Now each organization is its own

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

10

2 best advocate, able to promote it's strengths  
3 pertaining to its mission and audiences. If the  
4 intention is to compare one group to another using  
5 the same metric to compare organizations as varied as  
6 Staten Island Zoo, American Museum of Natural  
7 History, Flushing Town Hall, Bronx Museum and the  
8 Brooklyn Academy of Music is misleading and may not  
9 be helpful in understanding how each of institutions  
10 operates.

11 I'm sure you and the Council would agree  
12 that the members of the CIG are incredible partners  
13 when it comes to enriching our City. There  
14 extraordinary efforts to make their cultural  
15 resources accessible to New Yorkers include  
16 partnering with the Council and DCLA for the cultural  
17 afterschool adventures program and opening up their  
18 doors to IDNYC cardholders. As of September, New  
19 Yorkers from neighborhoods across the City have  
20 redeemed over 95,000 memberships at CIG member  
21 institutions.

22 In closing I'd like to emphasize that my  
23 agency is dedicated to working with our partners  
24 throughout the cultural community and in the Council  
25 to increase access to public awareness of arts and

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS 11

2 cultural programming offered throughout the five  
3 Boroughs. We also take very seriously our  
4 responsibility to manage the substantial investment  
5 on behalf of the City's 8.4 million residence. This  
6 Committee and the broader City Council have been  
7 strong partners for this agency and for our  
8 constitutes. We applaud your goal of increasing the  
9 visibility of the work being done by cultural groups.  
10 Were open to discussing how to best engage and excuse  
11 me, how best to engage in educate the public on how  
12 our City's investments in cultural organizations  
13 benefits our communities, especially as we look  
14 forward to working with you on New York first ever  
15 comprehensive cultural plan. Thank you and I'll take  
16 any questions you have at this time.

17 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much  
18 Commissioner. So let me clear up a couple of issues  
19 that I have with your testimony.

20 EDDIE TORRES: Sure.

21 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: I'm shocked that you  
22 would even include in your testimony if the intention  
23 is to compare groups to one another, how you could  
24 ever come up with that conclusion I do not  
25 understand. I have never nor would I ever pit one

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS 12  
2 cultural institution group member against another.

3 This is meant to lift all boats not pit members each  
4 other so I'm... I'm shocked that the Department of  
5 Cultural Affairs and City Hall for that matter would  
6 even allow that to be in the testimony. Clearly I am  
7 not pleased with that. And let me just say also  
8 because I would hope that we would come together in a  
9 broader you know appreciation that there could be  
10 some increased reporting in transparency without  
11 pitting cultural groups against each other. With  
12 respect to your... your... your first sort of fundamental  
13 overarching thought about this which you say  
14 expanding the purvey of the MMR to track performance  
15 to this group of private institutions would be  
16 inappropriate and beyond the mandate of the MMR,  
17 cultural institution group members are private  
18 institutions but there is a commissioner that's apart  
19 of cultural affairs to point and responsible to  
20 report back to the Mayor are public libraries are  
21 private institutions that do not have a commissioner  
22 reportable to the Mayor, they are not City agencies  
23 and yet they report extensively in the MMR.

24 EDDIE TORRES: Right so there inheritably  
25 fairly different from the CIG?

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

13

2 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: What's that?

3 EDDIE TORRES: Are you saying that there  
4 different or similar to the CIG?

5 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: I think they are, I  
6 think that they are very similar, clearly they're  
7 differences but if... if the libraries are private non-  
8 profit institutions that are not city agencies but  
9 that... that include, that are included in the MMR and  
10 have significant reporting duties in the MMR why then  
11 wouldn't it be inappropriate for the CIG, not as  
12 individuals but even as a, as a totality, why would  
13 it be inappropriate for them to report a few more  
14 items.

15 EDDIE TORRES: Well you had mentioned  
16 that they don't have a commissioner that they report  
17 to.

18 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: The libraries.

19 EDDIE TORRES: The libraries.

20 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Yes.

21 EDDIE TORRES: So the libraries don't  
22 have a commissioner they report to and so therefore  
23 they are tracked in the MMR right.

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

14

2 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: So that's why you're  
3 arguing that it's appropriate for libraries but  
4 inappropriate for the CIG?

5 EDDIE TORRES: Well they don't have an  
6 agency that they report to one and then the other is  
7 some of them receive about 80% of their operating  
8 budget from the City whereas for the CIG I think the  
9 average amount is somewhere around 10%, some of them  
10 it's less than 1%.

11 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Right, so therefore it  
12 inappropriate to.

13 EDDIE TORRES: Yes.

14 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Ask them to report  
15 some more data.

16 EDDIE TORRES: In the MMR which measures  
17 City agency performance, yes.

18 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: So then based on that  
19 should we, should we not have any reporting of any  
20 CIG data?

21 EDDIE TORRES: You mean beyond what we  
22 already have

23 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Yes.

24 EDDIE TORRES: Which is aggregated  
25 attendance and aggregated free attendance? Why would

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

15

2 there be more than the aggregated attendance and the  
3 aggregated free attendance?

4 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: First of all do you  
5 think it's important that the aggregated attendance  
6 date be reported in the MMR?

7 EDDIE TORRES: The... the information  
8 that's in there, yes.

9 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Yes. Why do you think  
10 that's important?

11 EDDIE TORRES: Well I think that it's an  
12 indicator of the extent to which we promote arts and  
13 cultural to our residence.

14 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Right and so following  
15 along those lines couldn't we report some other data  
16 that would have the same affect?

17 EDDIE TORRES: Well I think that  
18 ultimately the reason that we include that is... is as  
19 an indicator of our agencies effectiveness in terms  
20 of the promotion of this resource but above and  
21 beyond that I guess I'm ultimately confused as to why  
22 it would be an indicator of agency effectiveness as  
23 appose to institutional effectiveness?

24 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: I think if it's, if  
25 it's, if it's makes sense to report back to the City

2 of New York to taxpayers, the effectiveness and the  
3 use as it relates to attendance than it makes sense  
4 to me that we would also want to share some more  
5 information. This is about transparency, this is  
6 about information, I think the Department of Cultural  
7 Affairs has this shockingly wrong and I'm deeply  
8 disappointed with your testimony and with your  
9 approach to this. This is an administration and a  
10 Council that believes in transparency (crosstalk).

11 EDDIE TORRES: (inaudible)

12 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: And I believe that the  
13 cultural institutions group members are stronger and  
14 better understood when people understand just how  
15 much their doing and... and (crosstalk).

16 EDDIE TORRES: I think they're.

17 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: And that's what this  
18 is, that's what this is really about.

19 EDDIE TORRES: I can completely agree in  
20 terms of making sure that people understand what  
21 they're doing. I think that you know and I actually  
22 had the conversation with them a couple of days ago  
23 that I think that the job they do for this City  
24 differently needs to be better understood. I don't  
25 know that the Mayor's management report is inherently



2 the vehicle for that. I think that their promotional  
3 materials.

4 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: It should one of many  
5 vehicles Commissioner. There's no reason for it not  
6 to be one of those vehicles and... and a... a...

7 EDDIE TORRES: I guess I'm speaking you  
8 know putting aside my acting Commissioner hat just  
9 speaking as somebody who actually attends the CIG you  
10 know with my school age children and obviously  
11 sometimes without, when I'm looking for information  
12 on a cultural institution there are many many  
13 platforms I look at. I look at obviously  
14 (crosstalk).

15 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: You're not the only  
16 person in the City of New York that I'm talking to  
17 and you're not the only person in the City of New  
18 York that this is meant for (crosstalk) but let me  
19 just say, they're 8 ½ million people in City of New  
20 York Eddie who care deeply about the CIG and... and...  
21 and you are arguing against more transparency and...  
22 and I'm just shocked that you would do that and... and  
23 I'm really, really stunned that you would take this  
24 position so aggressively on this issue.

2 EDDIE TORRES: No, I agree with you in  
3 spirit, I sincerely do agree with you in spirit, in  
4 terms of the agencies transparency and terms of the  
5 institutional transparency. I actually think the  
6 Mayor's management report is meant to track agencies  
7 that report to the Mayor, I don't think that's true  
8 of the CIG and I think that... that the institutions  
9 getting infinitely more coverage as it were in terms  
10 of the good work they do completely agree. I just  
11 don't know why it would (crosstalk).

12 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: But if you follow your  
13 thinking then we should absolutely remove any  
14 information about the CIG in the MMR.

15 EDDIE TORRES: I don't recall having said  
16 that.

17 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: But if we already  
18 report some information on the CIG in the MMR, is  
19 that inappropriate?

20 EDDIE TORRES: No I'm not saying that's  
21 inappropriate.

22 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Ok so if that's not  
23 inappropriate.

24 EDDIE TORRES: No.

25

2 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Then it's not  
3 inappropriate to perhaps add a few more things to... to  
4 gather information about the CIG.

5 EDDIE TORRES: I don't know if that's  
6 true either.

7 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: I don't think the  
8 logic follows. It... it you either believe it's  
9 appropriate for certain indicators to be reported in  
10 the MMR or you don't. If you do then some are  
11 already in there then it makes sense to work  
12 collaboratively Commissioner to make other  
13 recommendations about what other indicators could  
14 also be included.

15 EDDIE TORRES: But you've also maintained  
16 that the MMR is not the only instrument in terms of  
17 reporting though.

18 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: That's right.

19 EDDIE TORRES: Well I think working  
20 collaboratively to make sure that information is  
21 shared through other instruments I think is an  
22 fantastic idea.

23 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Well I... I think the  
24 MMR is one of those way and it's an appropriate venue  
25 in the City of New York when we are talking about

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

20

2 significate public monies that are being invested in  
3 these organizations and institutions and rightfully  
4 so, I mean I am the biggest supporter of those public  
5 monies that are being allocated to these  
6 organizations they do amazing things with the public  
7 monies. I believe they should receive more public  
8 funding but it is also than appropriate to report  
9 back and since the MMR and PMMR are these essential  
10 vehicles for government to report and understand the  
11 value inherit in these organizations that, that's  
12 appropriate and... and again I think the central sort  
13 of logic question here is if... if it's inappropriate  
14 and... and or illegal from a legal prospective than...  
15 than nothing about the CIG should be on the MMR,  
16 nothing. They should be removed from the MMR. If  
17 you believe that, if you don't believe that and you  
18 believe it is appropriate for attendance and other  
19 things to be included in the MMR, then it is also  
20 appropriate for other items to be included. To me  
21 that serve the fundamental logic question here, so I  
22 am disappointed and in the testimony on those two  
23 levels. One the logic of... of where you're at and  
24 where we can go and then the... the... the comparison or  
25 the competition or the comparing one against the

2 other, I think that's nonsense if I may say so. So..

3 so I guess you ended your testimony by saying that in  
4 a hopeful way that the we can discuss and engage and  
5 educate. I believe that includes the MMRs, so you  
6 know.

7 EDDIE TORRES: And if also I can add to  
8 that, I did want to say on a side note. Well no not  
9 on a side note I'm here very much on the record.  
10 First of all I want to make sure that you do hear  
11 loud and clear the your support to the cultural  
12 community is invaluable to this City. Just speaking  
13 both as an acting Commissioner and just as member of  
14 New York City, we think it fantastic work that you're  
15 doing in these regards and we are very grateful. As  
16 regards to the issue of sharing more information in  
17 spirit we think it's a fantastic idea, I don't happen  
18 to think the MMR is the appropriate vehicle for it  
19 but we are very open to having more discussion about  
20 making sure that we share more information about the  
21 great work that the CIG do. We think they're  
22 fantastic and we know that you know it and know that  
23 you're a supporter thank you seriously.

24 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: I appreciate you  
25 saying that, I just you know once again I think if

2 it's, if it's inappropriate then it inappropriate.

3 If it's, if it's appropriate in some instances than

4 it can be appropriate in others and so I think of you

5 know I... I... I... I read your testimony, I heard it, I

6 listened to it, I fundamentally disagree with it and...

7 and I'm disappointed with the Department with

8 Cultural Affairs taking the position it's taken and

9 voicing it in the way that it has but we will

10 continue our discussion with the administration and...

11 and others about this legislation and some many

12 others, so I don't think we have more questions. I

13 think you've made your... your position perfectly clear

14 and I thank you for being here today.

15 EDDIE TORRES: Thank you.

16 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: And with that I think

17 we're going to hear from Carl Goodman, representing

18 the Cultural Institution Group Members.

19 CARL GOODMAN: Good afternoon Councilmen,

20 Council Member Van Bramer it is a please to be here.

21 My name is Carl Goodman, I'm the Executive Director,

22 do I need to be sworn?

23 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: You are not a

24 Commissioner.

25 CARL GOODMAN: Ok than.

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

23

2 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: And so we do not have  
3 to swear you.

4 CARL GOODMAN: Can I swear.

5 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: I... I... I... I... know and  
6 expect that you'd be 100% truthful in your testimony.

7 CARL GOODMAN: Very good. First of all I  
8 want to express my appreciation but also on behalf of  
9 the CIG for which I serve as a Vice Chair of the  
10 Queens Borough Delegation or group of the City  
11 Council, they're eight of us. I want to express our  
12 appreciation that you and City Council are giving us  
13 the opportunity to communicate and highlight the  
14 great work that we're doing to reach, to teach and to  
15 engage students, schools, families in communities and  
16 neighborhoods throughout New York and all five  
17 Boroughs and also to communicate the success. The  
18 clear success that we're having in do so. Very  
19 quickly the Museum of the Moving Image explores the  
20 art history and technology of movies, TV and video.  
21 Right now we have a group of 6<sup>th</sup> through 8<sup>th</sup> graders  
22 watching In The Heat of the Night learning about the  
23 Civil Rights movement, discussing what it means to  
24 them. We... we see 35,000 students visitors from all  
25 five Boroughs, 300 schools. We have 17 established

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

24

2 school partnerships including ones that the Council  
3 funds for which we are extremely grateful. We  
4 provide free rentals of our facility. A free use of  
5 our facility to neighborhood organizations including  
6 schools and community organizations. We have a new  
7 initiative underway with the Queens Bridge and  
8 Ravenswood Public Housing Developments, Woodside  
9 Next. 30,000 or 15% of our visitors come free of  
10 charge, including 2,500 cold cultural cardholders,  
11 3,000 IDNYC members and growing and of course all  
12 those who takes advantage of our free Fridays, which  
13 you are welcomed to take advantage of today. While  
14 we are unique in our subject matter, we do a share  
15 with the 32 other CIG. Our commitment to serving  
16 schools students in everything that we do. It is  
17 part of the compact that we have with the City  
18 established long ago. The CIG organization see over  
19 20 million visitors per year, 1.7 of them being  
20 schools students. We provide free and low cost  
21 programs for 2 million people annually including a  
22 million school children and thousands of teachers and  
23 seniors. We engage in collaboration with government  
24 agencies on programing for the City's underserved  
25 populations including aged out foster care youth and



2 incarcerated formally incarcerated individuals. We  
3 work with agencies such as the Department of  
4 Education, The Administration for Children Services,  
5 The Department of Probation and many, many more.  
6 Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs among other. Of  
7 course those partnerships in our work is really  
8 driven by our partnership of course and work  
9 collaboration with the DCL and of course with the  
10 City Council. Who support is invaluable as we pursue  
11 as the CIG pursuit their collective missions. We're  
12 especially proud of our partnership with the IDNYC  
13 program as the acting Commissioner mentioned as of  
14 September 31<sup>st</sup> there were 95,183 free IDNYC  
15 memberships to CIG institutions. I'm going to go out  
16 on a limb and say that by today there will over  
17 100,000 and the number of sign-ups are rising each  
18 month by a greater and greater percentage.

19 As per the legislation is you're aware,  
20 the proposed legislation each CIG collects a  
21 significant amount of data upon request by the DCL  
22 that is submitted to the agency annually in an over  
23 50 page report. The data includes information about  
24 audiences served, where audiences visit from,  
25 programming that we offer, outreach efforts. No

2 given our breath different institutions do collect  
3 different information in slightly different ways but  
4 essentially the data that it is being asked to be  
5 submitted through the proposed legislation is already  
6 included in this report to the DCLA in each  
7 individual report to the DCLA. There are some  
8 exceptions essentially one is grade level breakdown.  
9 The Museum of the Moving Image doesn't at present  
10 collect this data. The 6<sup>th</sup> through 8<sup>th</sup> grader  
11 currently filling our theater in order to understand  
12 the grade level breakdown we would have to go to the  
13 teachers upon visitation and have them, and have them  
14 indicate the grade level breakdown. I'm sorry are  
15 those voices in my head? Right, exactly. So to the  
16 best of our knowledge it is already possible for the  
17 information that the CIG provide in each of our  
18 yearly reports to the Department of Cultural Affairs  
19 to be forwarded or they can be forwarded from the DCL  
20 to the administration for inclusion for whatever  
21 materials and in whatever form the administration  
22 releases to the public. We... we feel strongly that  
23 the most efficient and sensible means by which the  
24 data required in... in this proposed legislation would  
25 be made available is through the existing yearly

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS 27

2 report that each of us already complies and submits  
3 to the DCLA. Thank you very much.

4 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Thank you Carl and I  
5 don't know how you drew the short straw for this one  
6 but, but thank you for representing your colleagues  
7 in... in... in doing it well. You know I... I... I see that...  
8 that your museum needless to say I am a huge  
9 component of doesn't request or collect certain data  
10 but you do know how many students you serve every  
11 year and... and... and that's an impressive number I  
12 would imagine both for you and certainly overall for  
13 your colleagues.

14 CARL GOODMAN: Yes.

15 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: And that you would  
16 want that information known to as many people as  
17 possible.

18 CARL GOODMAN: We are very proud of... of  
19 the work that we do and appreciate any opportunity  
20 for that information to be heralded and trumpeted and  
21 conveyed to the public.

22 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: I... I think we share  
23 that feeling and that goal right that, that  
24 information be broadcast as widely as possible and  
25 since you already report all of this date in this 50

2 page report and you do say in your testimony that,  
3 that you'd be comfortable, just as comfortable having  
4 that information forwarded or distributed in any  
5 other way, it's public information essentially,  
6 right?

7 CARL GOODMAN: Yes.

8 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: So... so conceivably  
9 that could also include the MMR.

10 CARL GOODMAN: It could I'm not to  
11 familiar with the document and it's not up I think  
12 for... for me to comment either on behalf of the museum  
13 or the CIG on whether that information should be  
14 mandated to be part of anything. But again we are  
15 very happy with the idea of these results being  
16 shared widely.

17 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Yeah no and I won't  
18 ask you to take positions on... on sort of the... the  
19 bigger questions but I... I think you're already  
20 compiling the data. It's incredibly rich data.  
21 It's... it's great stuff, it's speaks to this amazing  
22 work that being done by... by all of these great  
23 institutions and since your already compiling the  
24 data you know the argument that was previously made  
25 that it would be problematic or somehow burdensome to

2 collect the data, I think is proven false you know  
3 and having worked for a large non-profit institution  
4 you know I thought you know the collection of the  
5 data was actually a good exercise because it... it  
6 allowed the organization to take stock of what it was  
7 doing well and if maybe there were cases where it was  
8 doing something less well then it... it provided an  
9 opportunity for course correction and to get that  
10 done, so I actually having done this again myself  
11 found that exercise of compiling the data incredible  
12 important and I think just like any institution, it's  
13 important to know how you're doing right. You want  
14 to know you're gate count is incredibly important to  
15 you right. Your students coming in is incredibly  
16 important to you and it's important to know that. I  
17 mean you want to know that information and so. Again  
18 let me just say the argument that it would be  
19 burdensome to collect the data seems false because as  
20 you have said you already reporting this data to the  
21 Department of Cultural Affairs and this 50 page  
22 report. So and you didn't make that argument let me  
23 be perfectly clear.

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

30

2 CARL GOODMAN: I... I would say that we  
3 would rather not do the same thing twice and that is  
4 of course something I'm sure is understandable.

5 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Right.

6 CARL GOODMAN: But I certainly wouldn't  
7 use the word burden associated with the... the honor  
8 that we have to do what we do for the City and for  
9 the people of New York.

10 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Yes no... no one's  
11 asking you to do it again I think if you, if you  
12 copied another email on the data that wouldn't be too  
13 burdensome I don't, I don't think.

14 CARL GOODMAN: I'm sorry to interrupt, I  
15 would, I would point out again that this report that  
16 we do fill out contains with the exception of the one  
17 think that I pointed out does contain the data and  
18 that it is a recommendation that this... this report  
19 itself versus shifting the active cutting and pasting  
20 to the institution that this report itself serve as a  
21 source of data for these other activities.

22 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Yes... yes no I think  
23 you know I think that we broadly agree that it's  
24 important to... to collect this data to know the

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS 31

2 information and to make it available to the public,  
3 would you agree?

4 CARL GOODMAN: Absolutely.

5 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: And... and the MMR while  
6 not your expertise is one of those documents which  
7 allows for that to happen and your already included  
8 and you could be included even more if we were all  
9 able to make that happen. Would you agree with that?

10 CARL GOODMAN: We are happy to be  
11 included more or less as the governing bodies of the  
12 City see fit.

13 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: And... and again let me  
14 just say that this... this the goal of this legislation  
15 is to share and shed even more light on some of the  
16 amazing work that... that MMI and your other colleagues  
17 are doing and... and... and as we wrap up, I just want to  
18 say if I was, if I was wanting this to happen before  
19 this hearing, I want this to happen even more after  
20 this hearing and I will fight for it now even harder  
21 after this hearing. Transparency, information  
22 sharing to me those are basic goals of good  
23 government, good government. And... and while again  
24 sort of the funding breakdown of our libraries to our  
25 cultural institutions in terms of the public support

2 are different and some of our public libraries  
3 receive greater percentages of public support.

4 Overall the cultural institutions members receive  
5 significant public dollars and... and again no one's a  
6 bigger proponent of that than I. No one wants to see  
7 more public dollars go to cultural institutions group  
8 members and other cultural more than I. But with  
9 that comes some very fundamental obligation of  
10 reporting and I think that's entirely fair and  
11 appropriate and... and I don't think that anyone should  
12 want to be on the side of arguing against more  
13 transparency and let me be clear there's no doubt in  
14 my mind as with just about every other piece of  
15 legislation dealing with cultural or others that  
16 there can be negotiations that lead to an outcome  
17 that we can all feel good about and coming in guns  
18 are blazing those generally not in approach that I  
19 favor, but it's certainly attacked that some can  
20 take. I don't believe it ultimately gets you where  
21 you want to go. We've been joined by Andy King,  
22 Council Member from the Bronx and though he looks  
23 like the biggest Mets fan in the New York City  
24 Council he is not let me say that 100%. But I  
25 appreciate the solidarity. Andy King and I are maybe



2 two of biggest Mets fans in the New York City

3 Council. So and with that I think I shall let you go  
4 Carl and thank you for your testimony but even more  
5 so for the amazing work you do at the Museum of the  
6 Moving Image and... and thank you for representing your  
7 colleagues here today, I suspect we will be talking  
8 more about this piece of legislation and so many  
9 other things as the days move forward. So... so thank  
10 you and you free to go back to Historia.

11 CARL GOODMAN: Thank you for the  
12 opportunity to speak as I said for all of us the data  
13 is there at an individual level, it's there to be  
14 used, I do sincerely hope that those in conversation  
15 today reach an agreement about how... how best to use  
16 it. But were here for both of you.

17 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Thank you Carl I am  
18 confident that we could do that. So thank you very  
19 much without further ado I think we're ready to  
20 adjourn this hearing unless Council Member King has  
21 any thoughts on the New York Mets and.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: All I just want to  
23 say for the record 1986 will be relived again  
24 tonight. Let's go Mets.

1 COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

34

2 CHAIR VAN BRAMER: Thank you very much  
3 Council Member King and with that this hearing is  
4 adjourned. Thank you very much.

5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 2, 2015