

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

October 31, 2017
Start: 2:01 p.m.
Recess: 3:54 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
The Speaker of the Council
LETITIA JAMES
The Public Advocate

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONTINUED)

David G. Greenfield
Barry S. Grodenchik
Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Bill Perkins
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Pastor Sharmine F. Byrd, Sr.
Pastor Greater Mt. Carmel Cathedral &
Worship Center

1
2 **TRANSCRIPTION NOTE:** Recording begins
3 already in progress. Spanish spoken by Mendez at
4 **[00:57:00]** and Rodriguez at **[01:18:56]**.

5 [sound check]

6 [pause]

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: ...that does work
8 all across this wonderful city, which almost all, if
9 not all of our districts are benefiting from their
10 work, so it's wonderful to be able to support them.
11 So if you are a Council Member, come on, join us up
12 here and join our Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer,
13 who is leading this ceremonial, who is honoring today
14 the Sports and Arts in Schools Foundation, right?
15 [cheers, clapping] For 25 years of inspiration to
16 young people and for serving more than 26,000 New
17 York City public school students. So it's a pleasure
18 to have you here today. [background comment] Yes,
19 **[inaudible]** applause. And I wanna hand it over to
20 our Majority Leader so that he can talk to us about
21 the wonderful work this organization does and why we
22 are celebrating them in this chamber today.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
24 very much. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker and
25 thank you to all the Council Members who are joining

1
2 us. The Sports and Arts in Schools Foundation is a
3 group that many of us know well; many of us have
4 supported. I am thrilled that they are based and
5 located in Woodside, Queens and [background comments]
6 right off of Queens Boulevard, but the truth is,
7 their programs and services reach all of our
8 districts and all of our schools and all of our
9 children benefit from them. They are 25 years young
10 serving school children in the City of New York. All
11 of you look so good for 25 [laughter] I wanna say to
12 all of you, and I know Jim has done some great work
13 over the years, and little known fact; I bought the
14 home that Jim grew up in several years ago
15 [laughter]. True story; we found that out when we
16 met discussing this very program; he grew up in
17 Sunnyside Gardens. So it's a great honor and
18 privilege for all of us Council Members to support;
19 we know that when young people have after-school
20 activities; when they have both sports and the arts
21 in their lives they are better for it and better
22 educational outcome.

23 So I wanna thank -- I know we have some
24 of the founders of the organization here, so many of
25 the people who are essential to this organization, so

1
2 a big congratulations to all of them on your 25th
3 anniversary; may you have another 25 years impacting
4 in a very positive way the lives of all of our school
5 children, so thank you very much. And with that,
6 we'll read the Proclamation.

7 CITY CLERK: Council, City of New York
8 Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is
9 proud to honor the Sports and Arts in Schools
10 Foundation for 25 years of inspiration to young
11 people.

12 And whereas, founded in 1992, the Sports
13 and Arts in Schools Foundation is dedicated to
14 provide children with a safe and nurturing
15 environment and to help them learn and thrive
16 academically so that they are encouraged to reach
17 their potential. Today it is one of the largest
18 providers of the after-school movement in both New
19 York State and the nation and currently serves more
20 than 26,000 young people who attend New York City
21 public schools.

22 And whereas, over the last two decades,
23 the Sports and Arts in Schools Foundation worked
24 diligently in partnership with the New York City
25 Council to change the lives of children by providing

1
2 a wide range of quality sports, arts and academic
3 enrichment activities, offering after-school, weekend
4 and summer programs at public schools in impoverished
5 neighborhoods across the five boroughs.

6 And whereas, the Sports and Arts in
7 Schools Foundation has improved the lives of
8 countless people, making New York City a better and
9 brighter place to live for all families, particularly
10 through participation in its many free programs which
11 currently include the Champions Club, Center for
12 Sports and Wellness, High School Today College
13 Tomorrow, Middle School Today High School Tomorrow,
14 and City Council Sports and Arts Summer Camps and
15 Clinics.

16 And whereas, the Sports and Arts in
17 Schools Foundation has created outstanding special
18 events to highlight a wide variety of student
19 achievements, including the 3-on-3 Presidents' Week
20 Basketball Tournament, the Elementary School Spelling
21 Bee, Speak Week, the Step Competition, Girl Redesign
22 Fashion Runway, and the performance event, The Spring
23 Arts Showcase, and their Sports and Wellness Weekend
24 Leads.

1
2 And whereas, after this great milestone,
3 it is a great privilege to recognize the Sports and
4 Arts in Schools Foundation's incredible effective use
5 of sports and arts to support academic excellence
6 among our young students and to reaffirm our support
7 for its continued success in the years ahead.

8 Now therefore be it known, that the
9 Council of the City of New York gratefully honors
10 everyone at the Sports and Arts in Schools Foundation
11 in celebration of their 25th anniversary and their
12 outstanding service and contributions to New York
13 City and the students they serve. Melissa Mark-
14 Viverito, Speaker for the Entire Council; Jimmy Van
15 Bramer, Majority Leader, 26th District, Queens.

16 [applause]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER:
18 Congratulation.

19 FEMALE: Thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And now to
21 say a few words on behalf of the [background comment]
22 organization... [background comments]

23 FEMALE: Thank you. Thank you. So it's
24 such a great honor for us to be here; I want to thank
25 you, Council Member Van Bramer and Speaker Mark-

1 Viverito; thank you so much to the entire Council.
2 So many of you have supported us and encouraged us
3 and attended some of those events that were mentioned
4 -- the competitions across the City between all the
5 students in the various boroughs coming together --
6 and without you we could not have done this, so thank
7 you for this wonderful Proclamation celebrating our
8 25th anniversary.
9

10 I'd also like to thank the board; we have
11 many of our board members here, including our
12 Chairman, Francis Greenburger, Vice Chair Jeff
13 Ravetz, and also founding members of the board, who
14 have been with us for 25 years; we have here Roger
15 Alcaly and Ross Sandler, and I think, Michael, you
16 said you've been involved from the beginning as well,
17 and Niko Elmaleh, his father and now he is here
18 representing the Elmaleh family, who have taken this
19 dream with you and made it a reality.

20 I just wanted to mention that it was 25
21 years ago that the Sports and Arts in Schools
22 Foundation was created actually [background comment]
23 as a result of the Council's desire to provide free
24 summer programming for the youth of our city. And
25 it's from those very humble beginnings, serving about

1
2 100 students, and thanks to your vision and
3 generosity, partnering with this board and the
4 leadership -- the staff here, Jim O'Neill, a founder,
5 and other staff members -- that SASF has grown now to
6 be the largest provider of school-based summer and
7 after-school programming in the nation, and so we
8 want to -- this journey has been a wonderful one
9 together and we thank you on behalf of the students
10 -- more than half of our work is academic and we've
11 added steam and leadership and many programs that you
12 can hear more about, read more about, but I don't
13 want to take too long; I just wanna say that whenever
14 I see the children visiting all of these schools in
15 your districts, you see the joy, the enthusiasm for
16 learning and our future leaders right there who are
17 learning like you to give back to the community and
18 rebuild their communities. So thank you again on
19 behalf of everyone we; we hope we can partner again
20 for another 25 years.

21 [background comments, applause]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
23 very much. And as we all get closer to take the
24 picture, I wanna point out that Council Member
25 Koslowitz was there when this program began at the

1
2 City Council, [background comments] so thank you
3 Karen Koslowitz for your foresight.

4 [background comments]

5 [pause]

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
7 chambers. [background comments] Please find a seat;
8 please the doors; if you are leaving, please leave
9 now. [background comments] Quiet in the..

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Could I have your
11 attention, please? At this time please place all
12 electronic devices, all electronic devices to
13 vibrate. Will all non-Council employees, non-Council
14 employees please leave the main floor of the
15 chambers. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Can
17 we please close the back door, please? We thank you
18 all for coming. All those in the balcony, if you
19 could find a seat that would be greatly appreciated.
20 Thank you. [background comment] Yes, please find a
21 seat. Thank you, guys. Quiet in the chambers.

22 [background comment]

23 All rise for the pledge of allegiance.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

25 [pause]

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 12

2 CITY CLERK: Barron.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

4 CITY CLERK: Borelli.

5 [background comments]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Present.

7 CITY CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

9 CITY CLERK: Cohen.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

11 CITY CLERK: Constantinides.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

13 CITY CLERK: Cornegy.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.

15 CITY CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo. Deutsch.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

17 CITY CLERK: Dromm.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

19 CITY CLERK: Espinal.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

21 CITY CLERK: Eugene.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

23 CITY CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

24 Garodnick.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

CITY CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

CITY CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

CITY CLERK: Greenfield. Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

CITY CLERK: Johnson. Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

CITY CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

CITY CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

CITY CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

CITY CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

CITY CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

CITY CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

CITY CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

CITY CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 14

2 CITY CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

4 CITY CLERK: Mendez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

6 CITY CLERK: Miller. Palma.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

8 CITY CLERK: Perkins.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Here.

10 CITY CLERK: Reynoso. [background

11 comment] Richards.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

13 CITY CLERK: Rodriguez.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

15 [background comments]

16 CITY CLERK: Rose.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

18 CITY CLERK: Rosenthal.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

20 CITY CLERK: Salamanca.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

22 CITY CLERK: Torres.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Present.

24 CITY CLERK: Treyger.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

CITY CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

CITY CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

CITY CLERK: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

CITY CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

CITY CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
chambers.

All rise for the invocation.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The invocation
will be delivered by Pastor Sharmine Byrd, the Senior
Pastor at Greater Mt. Carmel Cathedral and Worship
Center at 1585 Fulton Street in the great borough of
Brooklyn. All rise.

PASTOR BYRD: Gracious God and creator of
all things, we come before you to thank you for
allowing us to see a brand new day. We thank you for
us being in good spirits and having sound mind; now

1
2 we ask that those who are chosen to lead be granted
3 fortitude, strength, knowledge, and wisdom. We ask
4 for abundant blessings upon and for our Council
5 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and our Public Advocate
6 Letitia James. We ask your hand of protection over
7 us as we move and travel this day. We ask that you
8 hear, accept, and grant these petitions as we say
9 amen.

10 [background comments]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

12 A motion to spread the invocation. Council Member
13 Cornegy.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you so
15 much, Madam Public Advocate... [crosstalk]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me,
17 Council Member. Shhhhh. Quiet in the chambers,
18 please; Council Member Cornegy has the floor.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: That sounded
20 good. Thank you so much... Thank you so much, Madam
21 Public Advocate. It is my pleasure to read this on
22 behalf of the great borough of Brooklyn and the
23 specific community of Bedford-Stuyvesant.

24 Pastor Byrd accepted Christ as a personal
25 savior at the tender age of 6 years old; here journey

1
2 in Christ began at the Mt. Carmel Baptist Church of
3 Brooklyn, New York under the pastoral leadership of
4 Dr. V. Simpson Turner, Sr. A Kingdom worker for her
5 youth, she served as usher, junior missionary Sunday
6 school teacher, chairperson of Woman's Day, Women's
7 Ministry President, administrator, evangelist, and
8 minister. Pastor Byrd worked vigorously in her
9 church conventions and associations; she has served
10 as the recording secretary of the Progressive
11 National Baptist Youth Department. In the PNBC
12 Eastern Region she serves as the vice president at-
13 large of the youth department, young adult women's
14 department; corresponding secretary of the Ushers
15 Department. She served as the vice president of
16 youth and youth adult department in the NYBA; she
17 served as the president, adviser, and supervisor of
18 the youth and youth adult ushers; she served as the
19 president of the MYMBA Ushers Ministry.

20 In 2008, the Lord gave vision and
21 provision for Pastor Byrd to form and organize Women
22 in Ministry, a covering place of sharing and refuse
23 for women who are actively in ministry.

24

25

1
2 In 2013, Pastor Byrd organized the Living
3 Waters Mission; the mission would be a safe haven for
4 the wounded and broken.

5 The year 2015 became a year of
6 celebration. God moved swiftly; she was ordained,
7 installed as pastor of the Greater Mt. Carmel
8 Cathedral and Worship Center and received an honorary
9 doctorate of theology. What a year of immeasurable
10 favor.

11 Pastor Byrd has also poured continuously
12 into the lives of others outside the ministry. She's
13 an alumna of Hunter College in New York City. Pastor
14 Byrd majored and mastered in political science.
15 Fulfilling her passion to serve mankind, Pastor Byrd
16 was employed by St. Mary's Community Service Inc. as
17 its executive director. While working over 20 years
18 in the NYCFT program, Pastor Byrd was instrumental
19 in moulding and shaping thousands of productive and
20 successful young adults. Pastor Byrd loves the
21 children, just like me. She operated SMCS After-
22 School Learning Center and Cool Kids in Town SDS for
23 over two decades. Pastor Byrd is a proud mother of
24 Esmony [sp?] A. Fisher during her down time, if
25

1
2 there's any. She loves to cook and spend time with
3 her pride and joy, her daughter.

4 Through all her many accomplishments, her
5 only concern is that people see the god in her and
6 accept Christ as their personal savior.

7 Thank you so much, Pastor Byrd.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
9 Council Member Cornegy, and thank you, Pastor.

10 Adoption of Minutes. Council Member
11 Borelli.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Madame Public
13 Advocate, I make a motion that the minutes of the
14 Stated Meeting of September 7, 2017 be adopted as
15 printed.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: So moved.

17 Messages and Papers from the Mayor.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
20 from city, county and borough offices.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
23 Communications.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 20

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-
3 Ups.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 558 through M 560.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Sorry; was eating
6 a chocolate. Coupled on... [laughter] Coupled on Call-
7 Up vote, and I ask for a roll call vote on all Land
8 Use Call-Ups.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Permission to
13 vote on all Land Use and General Order Calendar
14 items.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you. I
17 vote aye on all except 1307, 1558, 1565, 1568, 1569,
18 1644, and 1724. Thank you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank
20 you. Quiet in the chambers please. [background
21 comment]

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 21

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo.

7 Deutsch.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote yes on all

15 Land Use Call-Ups and with permission, I'd like to

16 vote yes also on all items on the General Order...

17 [interpose]

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Order Calendar

20 and all resolutions.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very

23 much.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 [background comment]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

Grodenschik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson. Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Perkins.

COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso. Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I vote aye on
all Land Use Call-Ups, and with permission, I'd like
to vote aye on all items on the General Calendar and
all resolutions.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I vote aye on all Land Use Call-Ups [background comment] and with permission I'd like to vote aye on all items on the General Order Calendar and all resolutions, with congratulations to my colleagues. Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes. Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I vote aye on all Land Use Call-Ups and with permission, I would like to vote aye on all items on the General Order Calendar and resolutions.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I vote aye on
3 all Land Use Call-Ups, with permission, I'd like to
4 vote aye on all items on the General Order Calendar
5 and all resolutions, with the exceptions of
6 Intro 1568 and 1558, which I vote no.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you,
9 Madam.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Or Spiderman.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield. Matteo.
15 Van Bramer.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I vote aye on
17 all Land Use Call-Ups, and with permission, I vote
18 aye on all General Order Calendar and resolution
19 items.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: **[inaudible]**

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 Today's Land Use Call-Ups are adopted by a vote of 43
25 in the affirmative and 0 in the negative. May we

1
2 have quiet in the chambers, please? [background
3 comment] As we now hear from the Speaker, Melissa
4 Mark-Viverito. Quiet in the chambers.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
6 Public Advocate and good afternoon to all my
7 colleagues.

8 So marking nearly six weeks since
9 Hurricane Maria made landfall, Puerto Rico is still
10 suffering under a lack of electricity, still about
11 more than 80 percent of people still without access
12 to electricity, access to clean water, and a shortage
13 of much-needed resources affecting every corner of
14 the island, and there seems to be a lot of
15 suppression of information; we can't get really up-
16 to-date information on those who have died as a
17 result of Maria.

18 So I wanna thank everyone for the
19 support. Although we are seeing less coverage in the
20 news, this does not mean that the emergency doesn't
21 exist; it is still very critical and an incredible
22 humanitarian crisis. So I wanna thank the City, I
23 wanna thank the State, the Governor, the Mayor, every
24 one of my colleagues that has been supportive of this
25 issue. I know that we had Council Member Cabrera

1
2 talk about it; I know that Council Member and our
3 Majority Leader Jimmy Van Bramer has been down to
4 Puerto Rico, he and his husband Dan have actually
5 bought an apartment in Puerto Rico, so they are
6 definitely invested in what happens on the island,
7 and all of those that have expressed concern -- I
8 know there's a group of us that are looking to go
9 next week; it's really important that we continue to
10 use our voice and our platforms to elevate the voice
11 of the island, which seems to be overlooked so many
12 times. So again, thanks to the members and the staff
13 and who have lent their time and capital to relief
14 efforts, both in Puerto Rico and in the states and
15 island nations similarly impacted this season.

16 I remind the chamber that donations are
17 still being accepted through the NYC Gives program,
18 accessible through the NYCAPS Employee Self-Service
19 portal.

20 And in light of the climate change
21 awareness obviously we are talking about at this
22 time, we've been discussing this as a Council and we
23 just celebrated the unfortunate anniversary of
24 Hurricane Sandy. We know that this city continues to
25 rebuild five years later, so it really is clearer

1
2 than ever that planning for change has become
3 imperative to our mission. So again, I just wanted
4 to raise that awareness and to thank everybody.

5 Moving on to today's docket, there's a
6 lot of bills we're discussing today and that we will
7 be voting on today; we're gonna begin by voting on
8 multiple land use items, including the rezoning of
9 the Pfizer Sites in Williamsburg and part of Linden
10 Boulevard in East New York.

11 We'll also be voting on Introduction
12 1685, sponsored by Council Member Margaret Chin,
13 which would authorize certain City entities,
14 including mayoral agencies and the Land Use Committee
15 of the Council to file an application for a zoning
16 text amendment without following the DCP pre-
17 application rules.

18 I wanna thank all the staff in Land Use
19 for those items -- obviously there's a lot of work
20 that went behind all of them.

21 And for the third time this year, the
22 Council will be voting on the co-naming of 70
23 thoroughfares and public places based on the requests
24 of Council Members whose districts include that
25 location. **[inaudible]** the co-namings include sites

1
2 for Assembly Members Dennis Butler, Ivan Lafayette,
3 Barbara Clark, and Geraldine Daniels, and five sites
4 co-named for first responders whose deaths were
5 traced to 9/11-related illnesses.

6 On the staff, I wanna thank Christopher
7 Sartori, Patrick Mulvihill, Kenneth Grace, and Julia
8 Fredenburg.

9 Regarding City schools, the Council will
10 be voting on Introduction 1638-A, sponsored by
11 Council Members Ben Kallos and Danny Dromm, which
12 would require the Department of Education to annually
13 submit a report on the status of gay, straight, or
14 gender sexuality alliances (GSAs) in DOE middle and
15 high schools, the number of teachers and
16 administrators who have received trainings related to
17 supporting LGBTQ and gender non-conforming students,
18 and a narrative description of the training offered
19 by the Department, including training related to
20 GSAs.

21 And Introduction 773-B, also sponsored by
22 Council Member Kallos, which would require the DOE to
23 submit a report including data related to meals
24 served by the DOE to students in schools, including
25 breakfast served before school, breakfast served in

1
2 the classroom, lunch, after school snacks, and after
3 school supper.

4 On the staff side, I wanna thank Terzah
5 Nasser, Andrea Vazquez and Smita Deshmukh.

6 We will also be voting on Intro 1176-A,
7 sponsored by Governmental Operations Chair Ben
8 Kallos, which would require that the Office of
9 Management and Budget at the time the Preliminary and
10 Executive Budgets are submitted to the Council
11 provide the Council with both human- and machine-
12 readable versions of the documents. In addition, for
13 all other budget documents containing data as defined
14 by the Open Data Law that OMB post on its website the
15 legislation would require that within ten days of
16 posting OMB must also post machine-readable versions
17 of the documents on their website and on the Open
18 Data Portal.

19 I wanna thank Rebecca Chasan and Eric
20 Bernstein for help on these bills.

21 And continuing on our work to improve
22 safety standards on construction sites around the
23 city, the Council will be voting on Introduction
24 1307-A, sponsored by Housing and Buildings Chair
25

1
2 Jumaane Williams, which would specify qualifications
3 for Department of Buildings inspectors.

4 And Introduction 1436-A, sponsored by
5 Minority Leader Steve Matteo, which would require the
6 DOB to report on site safety manager and coordinator
7 certificates, the number of sites which required a
8 site safety manager or a coordinator, the number of
9 certificates issues, the number of applications
10 filed, the average time for approval of an
11 application, and the average time for completion of
12 the background check.

13 Staff -- I wanna thank Megan Chen, Jose
14 Conde, Sarah Gastelum, and Jen Wilcox.

15 Next; the Council will vote on
16 Introduction 1066-A, sponsored by Council Member
17 Rafael Espinal, which would require the Department of
18 Homeless Services to maintain a record of all
19 unsheltered homeless persons who are receiving
20 services from or have been contacted by outreach
21 staff.

22 And Introduction 1443-A, sponsored by
23 Council Member Ritchie Torres, which would require
24 training for certain staff working in DHS shelters
25 and HRA HASA facilities in administering naloxone,

1
2 also known as Narcan to individuals who have
3 overdosed on opioids. The bill would also require
4 that training be made available to residents of those
5 facilities and that such facilities must have at
6 least one trained staff member on duty at all times.

7 Next; the Council will vote on Intro
8 1316-A, sponsored by Economic Development Chair Dan
9 Garodnick, which would require New York City Economic
10 Development Corporation to submit fiscal impact
11 statements to the Speaker for every covered project
12 receiving City assistance.

13 Introduction 1337-A, sponsored by
14 Contracts Chair Helen Rosenthal, which would require
15 that NYC EDC submit a project description and budget
16 for covered economic projects to the Speaker for
17 review and comment at least 30 days before holding a
18 public hearing on the project or for projects which
19 do not require a public hearing before the project
20 agreement is executed.

21 And Introduction 1322-A, sponsored by
22 Council Member Corey Johnson, which would require NYC
23 EDC to report on efforts made to recover financial
24 assistance provided to projects which default on the
25

1
2 material terms of the project agreement under which
3 such assistance was provided.

4 For the staff, I wanna thank Alex
5 Paulenoff, Nadia Johnson, Aliya Ali, and Jenn Wilcox.

6 On green issues, the Council will be
7 voting on Introduction 1630-A, sponsored by Council
8 Member Laurie Cumbo, which would require the City, in
9 conjunction with the City University of New York, to
10 develop a plan for encouraging voluntary solar energy
11 use by City employees.

12 And Introduction 1639-A, sponsored by
13 Council Member Peter Koo, which would require the
14 City, in conjunction with CUNY, to develop a plan for
15 encouraging voluntary solar energy use in business
16 improvement districts.

17 And Introduction 1644-A, sponsored by
18 Council Member Donovan Richards, which would create
19 an office of Alternative Energy responsible for
20 establishing a program to assist with and streamline
21 review of alternative energy projects and
22 coordinating with other agencies to ensure that
23 policies are in place encouraging the installation
24 and maintenance of alternative energy projects.

1
2 Staff -- I wanna thank Samara Swanston,
3 Nadia Johnson, Meagan Chen, Paul Sinegal, and
4 Jonathan Seltzer.

5 Prompted by the case of Nunez v. City of
6 New York, the Council will be voting on Introduction
7 778, sponsored by Council Member Rosie Mendez, which
8 would establish a permanent reporting structure on
9 disciplinary actions taken against DOC officers,
10 aggregating all actions into a yearly report,
11 including data on investigations into the use of
12 force and the speed and disciplinary outcomes of
13 these investigations.

14 I wanna thank Brian Crow, Rob Calandra,
15 and Will Hongach for their help on these bills.

16 And moving on; the Council will vote on
17 Intro 1379-A, sponsored by Council Member Ritchie
18 Torres, which would explicitly prohibit
19 discrimination in public contracting by making it
20 unlawful for a City agency to deny a contract based
21 on actual or perceived race, creed, color, national
22 origin, age, gender, disability, sexual orientation,
23 alienage, or citizenship status of the owners of the
24 bidder or proposer and by enabling a bidder or
25 proposer who believes that they have been

1
2 discriminated against by a City agency selecting a
3 contract to protest the agency's determination via
4 rules established by the Procurement Policy Board.

5 Staff -- I wanna thank Alex Paulenoff,
6 Casie Addison, Eric Bernstein, and Rachel Cordero.

7 And exciting news for residents and
8 business owners involved in the City's nightlife
9 industry, the Council will be voting on Introduction
10 1652-A, sponsored by Consumer Affairs Chair Rafael
11 Espinal, which would repeal the New York City Cabaret
12 Law of 1926 but retain crucial security measures
13 vital to more modern nightlife establishments.

14 Staff -- I wanna thank Rob Newman, Rachel
15 Cordero, Balqees Mihirig, Andrew Wilber, and Israel
16 Martinez.

17 A majority of Americans believe that
18 having a gun in their home makes them safer. As
19 numerous studies have conclusively demonstrated, the
20 opposite is true: the risk of suicide is higher in
21 homes with guns; the risk of homicide is higher in
22 homes where an abusive partner owns a gun; and
23 occupants are significantly more likely to die from
24 accidental gunshot injuries in homes with guns.

25 [background comment] As we have seen time and time

1
2 again across this country, firearm reform must be
3 taken seriously at every level and in every
4 jurisdiction. In this state, we have one of the
5 strongest gun laws in the country; I am very proud of
6 that, and here in New York City that means doing
7 everything in our power to make our citizens safer.

8 Today the Council will be voting on two
9 resolutions and one bill which we believe will do to
10 firearm ownership what cigarette warnings have done
11 for tobacco consumption, by igniting a national
12 movement to educate the public on associated risks.

13 First, Introduction 1724-A, sponsored by
14 myself and Public Safety Chair Vanessa Gibson, which
15 would require the NYPD to provide applicants for
16 firearm licenses and permits with a warning
17 pertaining to the increased risk of suicide,
18 unintentional death, and death during domestic
19 disputes in households with firearms.

20 And Resolution 1676 and 1677 of 2017,
21 which oppose H.R.367, accompanied Senate Bill 59,
22 known as the Hearing Protection Act of 2017 and
23 H.R. 38 and related bill S.446, known as the
24 Constitutional Concealed Carry Reciprocity Act of
25 2017.

1
2 Additionally, Introduction 1569-A, also
3 sponsored by Public Safety Chair Vanessa Gibson,
4 would create an alternative to the state's disorderly
5 conduct statute, which would have a maximum
6 punishment of five days, thus creating an additional
7 tool for law enforcement, judges, and prosecutors to
8 make sure that the punishment matches the crime.
9 This bill will also help reduce the risk that a low-
10 level offense will trigger negative collateral
11 consequences, including those related to immigration
12 benefits. This bill was announced in February at my
13 2017 State of the City Address and builds upon this
14 Council session's legacy of criminal justice reforms.

15 Staff -- I wanna thank Josh Kingsley,
16 Brian Crow, Beth Golub, Casie Addison, and Deepa
17 Ambekar.

18 And closing out the day, the Council will
19 vote on a package of bills also first announced at my
20 February State of the City Address that protect the
21 rights of immigrants and help to support our
22 immigrant communities.

23 Indiscriminate immigration enforcement
24 and the threat of mass deportation undermine the
25 public safety, stability and the economic growth we

1
2 have fought so hard to provide for New Yorkers; it
3 results in confusion and fear that extends beyond the
4 individual immigrant; it affects their U.S. citizen
5 and permanent resident spouses, children, parents,
6 and employers.

7 We will continue to work along with
8 federal agencies when there is a genuine threat to
9 public safety, but we will not waste City resources
10 to help immigration authorities destroy our families
11 and our communities.

12 Up first is my bill, Introduction 1558-A,
13 co-sponsored by Council Member Julissa Ferreras-
14 Copeland, would expand the City's detainer laws which
15 prevent the Department of Corrections and NYPD from
16 honoring requests from U.S. Immigration and Customs
17 Enforcement, except in limited circumstances, by
18 placing similar restrictions on the Department of
19 Probation.

20 Next; Introduction 1568-A, sponsored by
21 Council Member Rafael Espinal, would restrict the use
22 of City resources to support the enforcement of civil
23 immigration laws that penalize a person's presence,
24 entry or re-entry into the U.S. Under the bill, City
25 employees would be banned from spending time on duty

1
2 or using City property or information obtained by the
3 City to support such immigration enforcement. The
4 bill also prohibits law enforcement from entering
5 into formal partnerships with ICE through what are
6 known as 287(g) agreements. The bill would expand
7 upon existing NYPD and DOC reporting requirements
8 relating to detainer hold issues by ICE to cover
9 requests for information and informal transfer of
10 custody.

11 And Introduction 1565-A, sponsored by
12 Education Chair Danny Dromm, which would require the
13 DOE to annually distribute information related to
14 students' and parents' educational rights and the
15 DOE's policies and procedures related to interactions
16 with non-local law enforcement, including information
17 about relevant legal resources and would also require
18 the DOE to notify any student and their parents if
19 non-local law enforcement requests access to the
20 student or the student's records.

21 And finally, through Resolution 1638,
22 today we will call for an extension of temporary
23 protected status for the ten countries currently
24 designated for TPS on account of the devastating
25 environmental disasters, ongoing armed conflicts, and

1
2 extraordinary and temporary conditions that prevent
3 nationals from returning safely.

4 For the staff, I wanna thank Elizabeth
5 Kronk, Rob Newman, Kelly Taylor, Smita Deshmukh,
6 Brian Crow, and Indiana Porta.

7 A lot of items on the agenda today. And
8 with that, I end Communication from the Speaker.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Madam
10 Speaker. And now for General Orders, beginning with
11 Council Member "Spiderman" Williams.

12 [background comments, laughter]

13 General Orders discussion, Council Member
14 Williams. [background comments] I'm sorry?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: If no one else
16 is speaking, I will not.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There's other
18 members on there.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay; then I
20 will. I did wanna speak about bill No. 1307-A, which
21 I thank the Speaker for help and her leadership as
22 well. The bill will enable the DOB to hire more
23 inspectors, which is essential to cover the ever-
24 growing expanse of buildings in our city. All new
25 hires must complete a thorough 12-week training

1 process with DOB once they've been hired. This will
2 help expand the talent pool without compromising the
3 high standards for scrutiny and safety. After the
4 hearing on that bill, we did hear from experts in the
5 field that were very concerned that we didn't loosen
6 any requirements for inspectors that directly deal
7 with the safety of the building, so we keep in place
8 existing language for those handling inspectors
9 dealing with medical and natural gas piping systems,
10 including backflow prevention, electrical work, and
11 others. Primarily what we're focused on are
12 inspectors who need to go and check to see if an
13 apartment building is vacant, go and see if a curb
14 cut has been fixed or if there is a curb cut, items
15 like that. The current requirements were not
16 allowing people to be hired fast enough; I think the
17 public has a right and an expectation to expect that
18 anything they bring to DOB will happen expeditiously;
19 that was not. So bringing say the requirements from
20 five years' experience to two years' experience
21 [background comments] to check a curb cut we don't
22 think will endanger anyone, so I'm happy that I'm
23 able to do this; this is something the Commissioner
24 and DOB wanted done for a while to help them hire up
25

1
2 and spend the money that this body gives them;
3 hopefully this will help.

4 Thank you to Commissioner Chandler of the
5 DOB, Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito, the Committee
6 staff -- Meagan Chen, Jose Conde, Sarah Gastelum, and
7 my staff, Mike Twomey.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Just
9 be advised that there are 11 members on the General
10 Order [background comments] section. Council Member
11 Kallos.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I am proud to
13 have worked with Danny Dromm, the tireless fighter
14 for LGBTQ rights as a teacher and now as the
15 Education chair on Introduction 1638, with the
16 students at Eastside Middle School, and the Manhattan
17 Student Leadership Council. If you can please join
18 me in welcoming Enonya [sp?] Roy, Ben Zecaucus [sp?],
19 Valerie Facetti [sp?], Alejandro Forigua, and
20 Principal David Getz, who are joining us in the
21 balcony right here today, and thank you for your
22 efforts. They, among other students -- Clay Shishimo
23 [sp?], Katarina Core [sp?], and Neil Sarkar [sp?] --
24 worked together with us to require reporting on
25 gender sexuality alliances in public, middle and high

1 schools, as well as the teachers and administrators
2 trained on supporting them, so if we can give them a
3 quick round and welcome them to our chambers.
4

5 [applause, background comments] They've worked for a
6 couple of years on this.

7 I also wanna thank Jan Atwell for
8 numerous meetings with the students and Smita
9 Deshmukh for her leadership on the Education
10 Committee counsel.

11 The Council and the public have a right
12 to know how each [background comment] penny of the
13 City's \$85 billion budget is being spent. While most
14 budget documents are posted online by the Office of
15 Management and Budget, they're almost impossible to
16 read; these documents are submitted in a PDF, which
17 makes it difficult for anyone, even our own finance
18 team, to sort through these PDFs because you can't
19 analyze it, let alone search it. Introduction 1176-A
20 requires that when the Mayor submits the budget
21 documents to the Council that we get them in human-
22 and machine-readable formats, and that when OMB posts
23 the budget documents on its website (within ten days)
24 they post it on the Open Data Portal. This
25 legislation also upgrades an obsolete law requiring

1 that the budget be submitted on a floppy disc.
2 Floppy discs haven't been sold in department stores
3 since 2007; Sony stopped making them in 2010 and for
4 the record, the Mayor's Office has never actually
5 submitted the budget to us digitally on floppy disc.
6 [bell] This will bring the City budget to the 21st
7 century.
8

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you Council
10 Member. Council Member Reynoso.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Today is a sad
12 day for North Brooklyn and for those who want to
13 create a New York City that is free of segregation.
14 Today the City Council will vote to approve Rabsky
15 Group's proposed rezoning of the Pfizer properties in
16 Williamsburg, despite the fact that the rezoning will
17 only contribute to a long history of segregation in
18 the Broadway Triangle. In 2009, the Bloomberg
19 Administration rezoned the adjacent blocks of the
20 Broadway Triangle, including both private and City-
21 owned sites from manufacturing to residential. The
22 City's plan, developed with United Jewish
23 Organizations and the Ridgewood Bushwick Senior
24 Citizens Council, with no public bidding process,
25 favored the construction of low-rise buildings with

1 large unit sizes. This meant that the number of
2 affordable housing units was not maximized and the
3 planned units were designed to favor those with large
4 family sizes. A coalition of churches, nonprofit
5 organizations and tenant associations representing
6 the surrounding communities of color in Williamsburg,
7 Bushwick and Bed-Stuy successfully sued the City over
8 this plan for violating fair housing regulations.
9 The judge found that the City's plan would not only
10 not foster integration of the neighborhood, but would
11 perpetuate segregation in the Broadway Triangle. In
12 the course of the lawsuit, Purnima Kapur, then the
13 head of the Brooklyn office of the Department of City
14 Planning, testified on record that while developing
15 zoning plans, DCP does not consider the possibility
16 of racial segregation and does not evaluate whether
17 segregation took place after rezoning is implemented.
18 Despite ongoing negotiations with the City, the
19 lawsuit still has not been settled and the court
20 issued an injunction on development of the two City-
21 owned sites.

22
23 There is currently a restrictive
24 declaration placed on this property that is not worth
25 the paper it is printed on. There are serious

1
2 questions about the enforceability of the declaration
3 and I would challenge the 20 or so speaker candidates
4 to let me know how they expect to chain themselves to
5 these buildings [laughter] when segregation happens.
6 For a document like this to be of any value, it
7 should explicitly acknowledge in the text that
8 tenants, homeowners and community groups surrounding
9 the project have the power to enforce obligations in
10 court.

11 Finally and perhaps most importantly, the
12 restrictive declaration does nothing to address the
13 underlying displacement consequences of the
14 development and inadequacy of affordable housing to
15 be provided. I will hold the rest of my comments to
16 when I vote, and I just want to encourage everyone
17 here; we won this four years ago when Diana Reyna was
18 standing in the same position that I was; let's not
19 have to wait four years to deal with segregation in
20 our city... [interpose]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: when we could
23 deal with hit right now. I encourage everyone to
24 vote no. Thank you.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
3 Council Member Mendez.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you, Madam
5 Public Advocate. I rise to speak on the same issue
6 and matter that my colleague Antonio Reynoso just
7 spoke about. [background comments] In 2009 I voted
8 against the Broadway Triangle and the other day in
9 committee I voted against this project from Pfizer.
10 We cannot go forward and say this is the law now and
11 you're gonna get this amount of affordable housing
12 without going back and looking back at the disparity
13 and inequity that happened years ago that continues
14 to have a very disparate impact in our community, and
15 I say our community 'cause my family still lives
16 there and this is very important to me.

17 I wanna thank Antonio for being a strong
18 voice, as was Diana Reyna was, on this issue and I
19 would like to say that I will be voting no later on
20 on this matter. Thank you. [applause, background
21 comments] If I still have a few minutes -- today we
22 will be voting on some street co-namings and I'm
23 gonna speak on two. Mary Spinks was someone who came
24 to the Lower East Side in the 1970s when it was a
25 hard life in the Lower East Side; she got caught up

1
2 on drugs, went to jail; eventually she turned her
3 life around and she created hundreds; nearly
4 thousands of affordable housing through the Lower
5 East Side People's Mutual Housing Association, and we
6 will co-naming a street on the corner of the block
7 where she lived, next to several of these buildings,
8 and I'm very proud about that.

9 In addition, today we will be co-naming a
10 street in the Bronx; I worked with this with Council
11 Member Annabel Palma, for my friend and mentor Richie
12 Perez. He was an incredible activist on Puerto Rican
13 rights and against police brutality; he was my
14 mentor, and for anyone who was his mentee, we can
15 tell you, he led his life by example; it was do as I
16 do; not do as I say. So with that, all I have to
17 [bell] to say is: **[00:57:00] Spanish**

18 [background comments]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please refrain
20 from any outbursts. Thank you. Council Member
21 Barron.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
23 Public Advocate. Regarding the co-namings, I just
24 want to lend my voice to those who recognize those
25 who have done great work -- Frank Arbell [sp?] --

1
2 great mortician; we wanted to know if he could work
3 on us before we get in the coffin, 'cause he makes
4 people look so good; Barbara Clark my colleague in
5 the Assembly; Helen Marshall, the first African-
6 American Borough President; and Richie Perez, a great
7 friend, a great worker, a great leader, sacrificial,
8 committed, and tireless in what he did, so I add my
9 voice to that.

10 In terms of legislation, I want to call
11 my colleagues' attention to the Linden rezoning
12 project, which is in my district; it's a mixed-use
13 project; it's 511 units of apartments that are
14 affordable to the people who live in my community.
15 The developer has negotiated to go up to 200 parking
16 spaces; he's considered the community's objection to
17 the height on the Loring Avenue side, so it's a five-
18 story building with a setback and a green roof and
19 trees that will be planted there, and the apartments
20 will be available to people who are homeless, and I
21 say that with emphasis 'cause we cannot solve our
22 problem by building more shelters or shuffling them
23 around or giving them another name or another
24 classification; we need permanent housing for people
25 who need homes. So part of the units are for

1
2 homeless, a part of the units are for people earning
3 \$25,000, \$31,000, \$40,000, and \$49,000. There are 25
4 percent of the units set for people who are earning
5 about \$67,000, and that's the income of the people
6 who live in my community. Forty percent of these
7 units are affordable into perpetuity and another 40
8 percent will be protected for 35-60 years [bell]. So
9 I'm very proud of this project -- Salamanca, I'm
10 coming behind you and coming along with you as we
11 fight to make sure that the people who live in our
12 communities are not displaced. [interpose]

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I have other
15 comments; I'll hold them for later. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
17 Council Member King. And again, our condolences on
18 the loss of your father, Council Member.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I'm gonna hold my
20 remarks for...

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: General
22 Discussion?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Yeah.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
3 Chin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Madam
5 Public Advocate. Good afternoon. Today we're voting
6 on [background comments] Intro 1685, legislation that
7 would allow certain land use applications submitted
8 by the City Council and borough presidents to be
9 exempt from the New York City Department of City
10 Planning's time-consumer pre-application process.

11 As many of my colleagues here know, the
12 pre-application process can make community-based
13 planning incredibly difficult, cumbersome and at
14 times seem futile. For far too long the communities
15 I represent in Lower Manhattan have been subject to
16 as-of-right super tall towers; we have seen these
17 humungous buildings rise over our communities with
18 little to no transparency or public review, and as
19 overdevelopment continues to threaten our
20 communities, people with few other low-income housing
21 options often face a scary reality of losing the
22 neighborhood they worked so hard to build. It is
23 clear that we need better tools to give our residents
24 a fighting chance and we need it now. The elected
25 representatives who are chosen by the people must be

1
2 allowed to give our communities a fighting chance
3 against overdevelopment without having to jump
4 through bureaucratic hoops. If the Real Estate Board
5 of New York is threatened by this legislation, good;
6 it's not our job to represent developers; it's our
7 job to give the people a greater voice in their
8 neighborhood, and I know for a fact that this will
9 help my constituents and those all over the city work
10 more closely with their elected official to protect
11 their community.

12 I want to thank our Speaker, Melissa
13 Mark-Viverito and the Land Use Chair, Council Member
14 David Greenfield, for your leadership and guidance
15 throughout this process and I also want to thank
16 Ramon Martinez for his support and I particularly
17 want to thank the Land Use staff, including Raju
18 Mann, Julie Lubin, [bell] and Jeffrey Campagna for
19 their countless hours of counsel and expertise, and
20 of course, my Land Use Director, Roxanne Earley...
21 [crosstalk]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: and my Deputy...

24 [crosstalk]

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Chief of Staff,
3 Vincent Fang.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you so
5 much.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I urge my
7 colleagues to vote aye. Thanks... [crosstalk]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
9 Council Member. Council Member Garodnick.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very
11 much, Madam Public Advocate. I am very pleased that
12 the Council today is voting on three bills coming out
13 of the Economic Development Committee -- 1316, 1322,
14 and 1337. These bills together will ensure that the
15 public gets a clear picture of how the City is
16 distributing funds for economic development. Every
17 dollar we spend on economic development incentives
18 should have a clear purpose and we should have the
19 information we need to ensure that that purpose is
20 being met.

21 Earlier this year the EDC reported 554
22 active projects receiving City investment at a cost
23 of \$1.8 billion to taxpayers; as a comparison, this
24 is more than the budget for the Department of
25 Homeless Services and the Parks Department combined

1
2 for Fiscal Year 2017. It's not to say that these
3 investments do not have very laudable goals; without
4 question, EDC investments create new jobs, expand
5 affordable housing, they improve the quality of
6 neighborhoods throughout the five boroughs, and
7 refurbish sites of cultural significance. But too
8 often these important projects are undertaken with
9 very little public consultation or awareness; it is
10 not always clear where our public dollars go and
11 whether or not these investments achieve their
12 intended objective. This needs to change; we must
13 ensure New Yorkers that they are getting the best
14 bang for their buck when it comes to these programs.

15 My bill is 1316, which will require EDC
16 to submit fiscal impact statements in advance of each
17 project. Council Member Johnson's bill, 1322, would
18 require public reporting on the City's efforts to
19 claw back financial assistance where they don't meet
20 their job creating or other obligations. And Council
21 Member Rosenthal's bill, 1337, would require EDC to
22 submit project descriptions and budgets for public
23 review and comment prior to the execution of an
24 economic development contract.

1
2 It is our responsibility to ensure that
3 City funds are being spent effectively; we need to
4 know exactly what EDC is planning to spend, what they
5 expect to accomplish with that spending, and how they
6 plan to enforce their expectations.

7 So thank you, Madam Speaker and my
8 colleagues, particularly Council Members Johnson
9 [bell] and Rosenthal, and I encourage my colleagues
10 to vote yes today. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
12 Council Member Gibson.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam
14 Public Advocate. Good afternoon colleagues.
15 Diversity and inclusion have always been hallmarks of
16 our great nation and unfortunately, this
17 administration insists that immigrant communities are
18 a threat to American safety. It is absolutely
19 possible and indeed necessary to protect the rights
20 of immigrants without compromising public safety.

21 This afternoon I am proud to prime
22 sponsor Intro 1569 relating to prohibiting disorderly
23 behavior. The passage of this legislation will
24 ensure that low-level, nonviolent offenses do not
25 trigger negative immigration consequences. This bill

1
2 will create an Administrative Code offense that is an
3 alternative to the State's Disorderly Conduct statute
4 and would carry a maximum penalty of no more than
5 five days in jail. This bill would give more options
6 to prosecutors in resolving cases and creating this
7 City offense alternative would not only help our
8 immigrant community, but all New Yorkers and be truly
9 inline with this Council's goal of creating
10 proportional penalties for low-level, nonviolent
11 offenses.

12 I am equally proud to join our Speaker,
13 Melissa Mark-Viverito, in co-sponsoring legislation
14 and resolutions related to commonsense gun control.
15 We know that every day in this country someone is
16 killed and/or injured by gun violence; despite this
17 being an almost every day occurrence, our federal
18 lawmakers refuse to take commonsense action. We in
19 this city have one of the strongest gun laws in the
20 nation and we must do everything possible to pass
21 sensible legislation. We must also stand firm in
22 opposing harmful federal legislation which will make
23 New Yorkers less safe and undermine our efforts to
24 protect this city.

1
2 I encourage my colleagues to vote yes on
3 1724 relating to requiring the Police Department to
4 disclose gun violence information to applicants for
5 firearm licenses and permits, as well as Reso
6 No. 1676, the Hearing Protection Act of 2017, and
7 Proposed Reso 1677, the Concealed to Carry
8 Reciprocity Act of 2017, which all relate to critical
9 safety in our city. [bell] Thank you very much.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 Council Member Koo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Madam
13 Tish [sic]. Today I ask my colleagues to join me in
14 supporting Intro 1639-A to promote an increase in
15 solar energy use within business improvement
16 districts. This bill will create a plan to encourage
17 the voluntary use of solar power within BIDs by
18 facilitating new strategies for bulk purchasing,
19 installation and sharing of solar power within BIDs.

20 The upfront costs of going solar can be
21 daunting, which is why establishing bulk discounts
22 can encourage cost savings for our city's 64 Business
23 Improvement Districts while also providing them with
24 new and sustainable energy alternatives. Solar power
25 is the future of sustainable energy and as a city, we

1
2 must be sure that this in-demand technology is
3 obtainable by our small businesses. This is a unique
4 way we as a city can continue our push to incentivize
5 green industries while at the same time supporting
6 our mom and pop businesses.

7 Thank you to Speaker Mark-Viverito for
8 your leadership, Ramon Martinez, Laura Popa, Ed
9 Atkin, Samara Swanston, Meagan Chen, and Chair
10 Constantinides. I encourage my colleagues to join me
11 in passing this legislation. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Are
13 you ready to dance? Council Member Espinal.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you, Madam
15 Public Advocate. [laughter]

16 I'm proud to stand here today and I urge
17 all my colleagues to please vote on Intro 1652-A,
18 which repeals the almost 100-year-old antiquated,
19 historically notorious Cabaret Law, but importantly,
20 keeping the security measures that will protect
21 patrons in nightlife establishments.

22 For those of you who don't know what the
23 Cabaret Law is, it requires businesses to apply for a
24 license to allow New Yorkers to dance. Many of us
25 can agree that the City's Cabaret Law is outdated and

1
2 unresponsive and has only gotten in the way of New
3 Yorkers' ability to fully express themselves; even
4 pushing dancing into the underground in unsafe and
5 unregulated spaces.

6 From its inception in 1926, the Cabaret
7 Law has been used to target particular establishments
8 and has been enforced unevenly; at times in a manner
9 that was prejudiced, so if you're LGBT, if you're
10 black, if you're Latino, this law has affected you in
11 a negative way. It is time we right this historical
12 wrong and remove New York City's inappropriate and
13 arbitrarily enforced dancing license. By repealing
14 the Cabaret Law we're moving towards decriminalizing
15 dancing in New York City; no longer will businesses
16 have to live in fear of the Cabaret Law being
17 arbitrarily used against them. We acknowledge that
18 this issue goes beyond a license and that reforms to
19 zoning laws are all too necessary, but I'm confident
20 this is a step in the right direction. This bill
21 represents decades of advocacy and partnership with a
22 coalition of folks who want to improve the quality of
23 life and nightlife and increase cultural spaces.

24 I am a proud champion of the historic
25 bill which will right a 91-year-old wrong and take

1
2 this progressive action to support culture in our
3 city.

4 I wanna thank all the advocates who are
5 here today; they truly are the epitome of grassroots
6 efforts making change in local government. Thank
7 you, Dance Liberation Network, the New York City
8 Artist Coalition, Dance Parade, New York City
9 Hospitality Alliance House Coalition, Local 802 and
10 all of the business owners who gave us so much
11 information, and thanks so much to the Speaker's
12 staff and our committee staff -- Rachel Cordero,
13 Balqees Mihirig, Izzy Martinez, and Rob Newman, as
14 well as my own staff -- Rick Arbelo, Lloyd Lesperance
15 and Erika Tanner for all the hard work they put into
16 this bill over the past few months and years. Thank
17 you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
19 Council Member Rose.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Today
21 we have an application for a zoning special permit to
22 allow retail establishments larger than 10,000 square
23 feet and a mapping action that will remove unbuilt
24 mapped streets to prevent development in adjacent
25

1 wetlands on property located at the corner of Forest
2 and South Avenue.

3
4 There has been a lot of misinformation
5 swirling about this development, so I want to set the
6 record straight. All tidal wetlands will be
7 protected and strengthened with the removal of
8 harmful, invasive species and the planting of 2,200
9 native trees and 9,600 shrubs, while preserving more
10 than 1,100 existing large mature trees. I spent
11 hours in meetings with applicants and with land use
12 experts and local residents to arrive at a project
13 that delivers smart planning, environmental
14 preservation, sustainability, resiliency, and
15 economic development; often hosting meetings with the
16 residents to meet directly with the developers and
17 environmental and traffic specialists to address
18 their legitimate concerns.

19 Let me be clear; the applicants can put
20 shovels in the ground tomorrow for a project on the
21 same footprint with no approval from City Council
22 needed, but by understanding the land use process, we
23 now have development that respects the needs of this
24 environmental justice community, increases our
25 resiliency, decreases our carbon footprint, and

1
2 brings jobs to local residents and groceries to a
3 food desert. While the applicant is required by
4 state and federal regulations to manage all
5 stormwater on the site at the same rate as the land
6 currently does, my negotiations have secured a
7 commitment to construct several additional bioswales.
8 These improvements made during negotiations increase
9 the permeable space on the site by 16,000 square feet
10 over the original proposal. These features will
11 manager rainwater from storms that well exceed the
12 rainfall of Hurricanes Irene and Sandy combined.
13 Additionally, [bell] we are including a traffic
14 monitoring program that will be developed..

15 [interpose]

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Madam..

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: for close
18 coordination. I wanna thank Speaker Mark-Viverito..

19 [interpose]

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: and..

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
23 Council Member.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I will.. I'll give
25 my thank yous later. Thank you.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. And
3 our last speaker is Council Member Torres.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: On Intro 1443,
5 New York City finds itself at the dangerous
6 intersection of the two most intractable epidemics of
7 our time -- homelessness and the opioid abuse. The
8 opioid crisis that confronts us is the deadliest
9 public health [background comments] emergency in New
10 York City; nowhere has the crisis been deadlier than
11 in the shelter system, where it has emerged as the
12 leading cause of death.

13 It is not often that the City Council has
14 occasion to pass legislation that will demonstrably
15 save lives, but saving lives is precisely what the
16 City will equip more New Yorkers to do. Under Intro
17 1443, the City will be required to train shelter
18 providers and shelter residents in the administration
19 of naloxone, which has been shown to reverse, in real
20 time, the impact of an otherwise fatal opioid
21 overdose. Those who either provide shelter or live
22 in one can no longer afford to stand on the sidelines
23 of the opioid epidemic. One need not be a doctor to
24 administer naloxone and one need not be an emergency
25 responder to save a life on a moment's notice, all

1
2 that is required is a basic training, a basic drug
3 and a basic show of compassion toward those in
4 crisis.

5 Intro 1443 would not have been possible
6 without the dedication of advocates from VOCAL,
7 Raymond Rodriguez and Daniel Wagner from my
8 legislative office, Andrea Vazquez from the
9 Legislative Division, and of course, my colleague,
10 General Welfare Chair Steve Levin, whose deeply felt
11 advocacy on the subject has been inspiring.

12 On Intro 1379, an analysis by City
13 Comptroller Scott Stringer found that there is no law
14 in the Administrative Code that specifically
15 prohibits discrimination against MWBEs. We have laws
16 that prohibit discrimination against individuals and
17 we have laws that prohibit discrimination in matters
18 of employment, housing and public accommodation, but
19 there are none that specifically prohibit
20 discrimination against MWBEs in matters of public
21 contracting. We are therefore passing legislation
22 that will close the MWBE loophole once and for all,
23 ensuring that our City safeguards against
24 discrimination remain as strong as ever, and I see
25 that my time is running out, so I'll conclude here.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you so
3 much. [bell] Report of Special Committee.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
6 Standing Committees.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
8 on Consumer Affairs, Intro 1652-A, Cabaret Laws.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
10 coupled on General Orders.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
12 on Contracts, Intro 1379-A, prohibiting
13 discrimination in public contracting.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 Coupled on General Orders.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
17 on Economic Development, Intro 1316-A, 1322-A, and
18 1337-A, economic development services.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
20 Coupled on General Orders.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
22 on Education, Intro 773-B, student meal data.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
24 Coupled on General Orders.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro. 1565-A, policies related to interactions with non-local law enforcement.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro. 1638-A, report on gender-sexuality alliance organizations.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Environmental Protection, Intros 1630-A and 1639-A, solar energy use.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1644-A, office of Alternative Energy.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Finance, Intro 1176-A, requiring budget documents to be provided in certain formats.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1698, business
3 improvement districts.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
5 General Orders.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered Reso
7 1699, organization funding.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
9 General Orders.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
11 on Fire and Criminal Justice Services, Intro 778-A,
12 Department of Corrections reports.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
14 Coupled on General Orders.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
16 on General Welfare, Intro 1066-A, unsheltered
17 homeless population.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
19 Coupled on General Orders.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1443-A, training
21 in administering opioid antagonists.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
23 Coupled on General Orders.

24
25

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
3 on Housing and Buildings, Intro 1307-A, building
4 inspectors.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
6 Coupled on General Orders.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1436-A, site
8 safety managers.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
10 Coupled on General Orders.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
12 on Immigration, Intros 1558-A and 1568-A, immigration
13 enforcement.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
15 Coupled on General Orders.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
17 on Land Use, Intro 1685, exemption government
18 entities from zoning text amendments.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
20 General Orders.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 759 and Reso 1701
22 through LU 767 and Reso 1706, special permit and
23 zoning and city map amendments.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
25 General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 768 through LU 770
on page 7 zoning amendments.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approved with
Modifications and Referred to the City Planning
Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of
the Council and Section 197-(d) of the New York City
Charter.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 796 and Reso 1707,
property tax exemption.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 798
and Reso 1708, landmark designation.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 799
and Reso 1709, property tax exemption.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee
on Parks and Recreation, Preconsidered Intro 1744,
naming of 70 thoroughfares and public places.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public Safety, Intro 1724-A, firearm license applications.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: On the General Order Calendar. Intro 1569-A, prohibiting disorderly behavior.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and Coupled on General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 768 and Reso 1710 through LU 770 and Reso 1712, zoning amendments.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Resolution appointing various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on General Orders.

Before I ask for the vote, I did not realize that on the street co-naming Richie Perez was on there; he has been a mentor to me as well over the years and I remember we were fighting many years ago to get that street name renamed and there was some opposition for some reason; it's taken a long time,

1
2 so congratulations to Richie; definitely someone who
3 has an indelible mark on so many lives in this city
4 and who has fought so much for social justice, and
5 against police brutality in particular. So thank
6 you, Rosie for that.

7 And I ask for a vote on all Coupled
8 General Orders.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Can we being the
10 roll call with Council Member Rodriguez?

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Permission to
13 explain my vote.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: First of all,
16 no doubt that when we say that Richie Perez
17 **[01:18:56] Spanish**, for those of us that were there
18 organizing, many of you before I came to this country
19 in '83, but since I landed here, it took me a year to
20 find individuals such as Richie Perez, organizing on
21 many occasions -- **[inaudible]**, **[inaudible]** Rodriguez
22 and many others. So he was a real leader, someone
23 that believed as **[inaudible]** used to say: we need to
24 graduate our young people and we need to bring them
25 back to our community to be a role model so Richie

1
2 Perez will never die on the face of especially
3 working-class, the middle-class that fight for social
4 justice.

5 I would like also to congratulate Council
6 Member Chin for the project that we are voting in her
7 district; Council Member Espinal. I also would like
8 to say that I had expressed my sympathy and
9 solidarity to what Council Member Antonio Reynoso has
10 brought on the rezoning on the Broadway Triangle; I
11 think that there is no doubt that no project and
12 rezoning is perfect; there's still some aspects of
13 that rezoning that I hope that as the project moves
14 on the two colleagues that share that border,
15 especially since this project is taking place in
16 Council Member Levin's, I hope that they continue
17 working and listening to Council Member Antonio
18 Reynoso. I represent a district that is going
19 through many changes and I know how we've been going
20 through gentrification in many communities and I
21 understand what Antonio Reynoso is saying; however,
22 since the Council already has a protocol in which we
23 support the rezoning that the Council Member
24 represents, I believe that... that's the reason why for
25 me I will voting on this project, because since this

1
2 project is in Council Member Levin. And with that, I
3 vote aye.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Can
5 we now call on Council Member Ulrich?

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you, Madam
8 Public Advocate. I have to leave today; it's my
9 daughter's birthday, so I ask for unanimous consent
10 to vote on all land use items first.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye. And
13 on the General Order Calendar I vote aye, with the
14 exception of 1558, 1568, 1569, and 1707-A, and aye on
15 all others. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and
17 happy birthday to your daughter.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
21 explain my vote.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I'm
24 supporting my colleagues [background comments]
25 Reynoso and Mendez as they talk about their

1
2 opposition to the Pfizer rezoning. I think that the
3 reasons that they laid out are quite clear and they
4 are in fact truthful to what the situation is. We
5 can't neglect the history that has gotten us to a
6 particular point and start from that point and move
7 forward thinking that there's not been an impact on
8 what had happened before, so I'm voting no on that
9 rezoning, 761, 762, [applause, background comments]..
10 [interpose]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: and in addition,
13 I'm voting no to the rezoning.. the development at
14 South Avenue in Staten Island, 759 and 760.
15 [background comment] This project will result in the
16 loss of 1,850 trees; it will result in the
17 destruction of 18 acres of woodland, and the
18 developer has said he'll mitigate that by planting
19 new trees, but it will take decades for those trees
20 to mature. The promise of inserting bioswales does
21 not in any way do the work of a natural wetland.
22 I've been told that that area of Staten Island was
23 protected during Superstorm Sandy because of the fact
24 that the woodland and the wetland ecosystem absorbed
25 much of that storm surge. Wit this move we're going

1
2 to remove that protection and environmental advocates
3 who have come to me have indicated that this is a
4 very shortsighted position to take to advance this
5 project and that we will reap the consequences in the
6 years coming because this is a major loss of a
7 natural ecosystem that has offered protection, so I'm
8 voting no on that as well and I'm voting aye on all
9 the rest. [bell] And I wanted to thank the Speaker,
10 Raju Mann... [crosstalk]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Amy Levitan,
13 Brian Paul, Don... [interpose]

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Donovan Richards...
16 [crosstalk]

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: and others; my
19 chief of staff for my bill...

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: would you please
21 bring your comments to a close? Thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes; I wanted to
23 thank those people for the work they did on my bill.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you so
3 much. Continue with roll call.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Ulrich.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I apologize; I
6 have to correct my vote; I meant to say 1307-A; not
7 1707-A; there is no 1707-A on the calendar today. So
8 thank you; I vote no on 1307-A, no on 1558, 1568,
9 1569, but aye on all others.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Could you please
13 call on Council Member Vacca?

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Vacca.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I am abstaining on
21 LU 768, LU 769, LU 799; I'm voting no on Intro 1652-
22 A, and I'm voting aye on all other items on the
23 General Orders Calendar.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Could
25 you please call on Council Member Garodnick?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I vote aye.

Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on

all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Abstain on 1652-

A and no on 1638-A **[inaudible]**.

[background comments]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I'd like to

congratulate my straight super ally Ben Kallos on his

legislation [background comments] regarding gay-

straight alliances in our public school system and

also to congratulate the students who were involved -

- Ben Zacaska [sp?], Valerie Facetti [sp?], Anaya

Roy, and the teachers who were involved, David Getz

and Alejandro Forigua -- and I vote aye. Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: #LetNYCDance. I

vote aye.

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye on
4 all except for 1568-A, for which I abstain.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
7 briefly explain my vote. Thank you. Thank you,
8 Madam Public Advocate. I also wanna draw my
9 colleagues' attention that in the proposed street co-
10 naming before us I am very proud that we're going to
11 honor our fallen EMT Yadira Arroyo by renaming 169th
12 and Boston Road in the Bronx in her honor. Many of
13 you know EMT Yadira Arroyo was tragically killed in
14 the line of duty in March of this year; she
15 passionately served the Bronx and New York City
16 community for 14 years as an EMS in EMS Station 26 in
17 the Bronx. She also volunteered at a soup kitchen
18 during her free time, but most of all she was a
19 loving mother to five sons who continue to epitomize
20 all that she stood for, her incredible leadership as
21 a woman and a woman of color and certainly as a
22 mother and I'm grateful that today we're going to
23 officially vote on making sure that 169 and Boston
24 Road will be named in honor of Yadira Arroyo. I
25 wanna also thank the Speaker for her leadership to

1
2 criminal justice reform and certainly her defense of
3 all immigrants in this city. I wanna thank the
4 Public Safety team of Deepa Ambekar, Beth Golub,
5 Steve Riester, Casie Addison, Brian Crow, Indiana
6 Porta, and Kelly Taylor for assisting on Intro 1569.
7 And with that, I vote aye on all. Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Greenfield.

11 Moving on.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Permission to
14 explain my vote, Madam...

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Madam Public
17 Advocate. I just wanna note today, as the Speaker
18 said, we are honoring some great New Yorkers who have
19 left us and I would be remiss if I didn't remember my
20 former boss Helen Marshall, who was a role model to
21 so many and really in a major way built those
22 communities in East Elmhurst and Jackson Heights that
23 she served so well, having come from the Bronx in the
24 late 1950s. [background comments] And in my own
25 district, Jack Friedman Way, which will adorn the

1
2 corner of Union Turnpike nearest to the Bellerose
3 Jewish Center and the future home of Services Now for
4 Adult Persons. He served on both of those boards; he
5 also served as Executive Vice President for a long
6 time -- not long enough -- for the Queens Chamber of
7 Commerce; he was beloved in our borough and I'm happy
8 to have sponsored that [background comments] street
9 renaming today. I wanna thank you all for your hard
10 work, especially my colleagues Steve Levin and Debi
11 Rose and with that I vote aye on all.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 Council Member Greenfield.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I pass.
15 Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: King.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all except
24 Land Use 761 and 762, no.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Congratulations to all the sponsors of the bills and I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request permission to explain my vote.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: In addition to adding myself to those thanking Council Members Mendez and Palma for the Richie Perez street naming, he was also somebody that was important to me and my social justice career. I wanna flag that we're naming a block of Argyle Road after Jessie Streich-Kest, a friend to some people in this room; it's the fifth anniversary of Hurricane Sandy, and as many of you know, she was killed in the storm. She was also a really extraordinary young leader for animal

1
2 rights; she had just become a teacher at the Bushwick
3 High School for Social Justice. I first met her when
4 she was running the Brooklyn campaign for Attorney
5 General Eric Schneiderman and she had a bright,
6 bright future stolen much too soon, so thank you for
7 supporting that street co-naming. I vote aye on all.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
10 explain my vote.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 [background comments]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
14 much, Madam Public Advocate. [background comments]

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me.

16 Excuse me. Excuse me. Excuse me please. Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Madam Public
18 Advocate, I just... [background comments]

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me.

20 [background comment] Can we... Sergeant at Arms, could
21 you please take over? Thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam
23 Public Advocate. I just wanna thank the Speaker,
24 Melissa Mark-Viverito... [background comments]

1
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me,
3 Council Member... Thank you. Thank you so much.
4 [background comments] Give us one moment, Council
5 Member.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you all for
8 coming. Council Member.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very
10 much, Madam Public Advocate. I just wanna thank the
11 Speaker, her staff, the Land Use staff, my
12 colleagues, Subcommittee Chair Donovan Richards,
13 Committee Chair David Greenfield, as well as Council
14 Member Antonio Reynoso, my colleague, and everybody
15 that came out to express their opinions on this
16 rezoning; it was a complicated rezoning, but at the
17 end of the day I believe serves the interests of all
18 communities in North Brooklyn, and with that, I vote
19 aye on all. Thank you.

20 [background comments]

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

22 [background comment]

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel. Mealy.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Can I explain my
vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I wanna thank 500
Block Association for putting in a street co-naming
for Jackie Robinson Parkway. Jackie Robinson played
for the Brooklyn Dodgers and advanced the cause of
professional African-American athletes. In 1955, he
helped the Dodgers [background comments] reach the
pinnacle of major league baseball by winning the
World Series. He retired in 1957 with a career
batting average of .311, and in 1962 he became the
first African-American to be introduced into the
Baseball Hall of Fame. In 1972, the Dodgers retired
his uniform number of 42. In 1964, he helped
establish the African-American-owned Freedom Bank and
he also served on the board of the NAACP until 1967.
And I want to also give kudos to Inez Barron in
regards that she's bringing affordable housing to her
district, 500 or more units, and I vote aye on all.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you,
6 Madam Public Advocate. So I -- today we have a group
7 of legislative victories that I wanna highlight that
8 really bring out the best in New York. New York and
9 its values, as New Yorkers, we wanna lift everyone
10 and welcome everyone into our great, great city. The
11 immigration legislation that's before you that we are
12 getting some incredible response to is an example of
13 how this committee -- and I wanna thank not only
14 Council Members Dromm and Espinal, but also Council
15 Member Gibson and her work and her committee have
16 really worked to figure out how we get closer to
17 sanctuary city. Becoming a sanctuary city is not a
18 static moment, it is a dynamic force and every time
19 we get hit with something that violates our values we
20 respond, and that is what we're doing right now with
21 these pieces of legislation within the Department of
22 Probation and also making sure that every city
23 resource that is available to us does not go to bring
24 more people into the pipeline of this xenophobic
25 administration in the White House.

1
2 We've done a lot of great work today to
3 promote our LGBT young people -- thank you, Council
4 Member Dromm.

5 But finally, I wanna say that where we
6 have failed today is where both Council Member
7 Reynoso and Council Member Levin have been in
8 discussion, and I will rise to support Council Member
9 Reynoso's work in removing segregation from our
10 housing land use decisions; I wanna vote no on Land
11 Use 761, [applause] Resolution 1703... [background
12 comments]

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me.
14 Please, please. Thank you. Thank you... [crosstalk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Land Use 762,
16 Resolution 1704, and also respect and support all
17 those members that are saying no today. This piece
18 of property has been under a lot of scrutiny for a
19 lot of time and the fact that we're moving this as a
20 council I think is troubling to me and to all places
21 that require us to review with an eye of justice and
22 say yes to housing and no to segregation. Thank you
23 for your time, [bell] I vote on the rest.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Permission to
3 explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you very
6 much. I proudly vote aye on Intro 778 and I wanna
7 thank the Speaker for being a powerful voice on
8 closing down Rikers and reforms that are going on
9 there. This legislation goes a long way by mandating
10 reports investigating the used of force by correction
11 officers on inmates.

12 I will be voting no on Intro 1307-A; I am
13 weary about lessening what's required for building
14 inspectors, seeing what has happened in this city
15 during the last few years. And I will be voting no
16 on LU 761 and LU 762 and the accompanying Resos 1703
17 and 1704; this is in reference to the Pfizer site.

18 And on the street co-namings, there are a
19 few others I wanna mention. In the western part of
20 my district we'll be co-naming near the Public
21 Theater Joseph Papp Way and that is very exciting.
22 And in Corey Johnson's district we've been working on
23 and we will be co-naming Bella Abzug Way.

24 And Madam Speaker, regarding Richie
25 Perez, what happened is -- the holdup was we were

1
2 gonna co-name a street in my district and then CSS,
3 where he worked, moved and there was very little ties
4 to that street and so we are now co-naming a street
5 in the Bronx in Council Member Palma's district, at
6 Monroe High School, where Richie was a public school
7 teacher, and he changed a lot of people's lives,
8 including a young man who's not so young anymore,
9 Vicente Panama Alba, [background comment] who became
10 an activist because of Richie's intervention in high
11 school.

12 And I am very proud of all these street
13 co-namings and all of the legislation we're passing
14 today, and thank you very much, Madam Public
15 Advocate.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to
19 explain, Madam Public Advocate.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Okay. So while
22 we are today acknowledging with the street co-namings
23 a number of individuals, I'd like to acknowledge two
24 phenomenal women; one as in former Borough President
25 Helen Marshall and her many capacities as a public

1
2 servant; she had served the City and State of New
3 York as a first and in so many other capacities we'd
4 like to acknowledge her. And then, my friend,
5 mentor, co-leader, and neighbor, Assembly Member
6 Barbara Clark, for the great work that she has done
7 for Eastern Queens and the State of New York.
8 Certainly these two women, along with all the others
9 that are being acknowledged through street co-
10 namings, individuals; we'd like to congratulate all
11 of them.

12 I will be voting no on 761, 762 and
13 abstaining on 778-A; aye on all the rest.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Perkins.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all;
20 abstaining on 761 and 762.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to
24 explain my vote.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I just wanna say
3 that since the last rezoning that happened in the
4 waterfront of Williamsburg, over 25 percent of the
5 Latino population has now been displaced; a district
6 that was 68 percent Latino is now closer to 48
7 percent Latino, and this all happened in adjacent
8 districts where Council Members ultimately get to
9 decide the fate of other districts adversely impacted
10 by these processes and this Council today is
11 continuing that practice in allowing for districts to
12 be adversely impacted but be holding true to district
13 lines and I just think that as a Council we need to
14 open that conversation and really start talking about
15 extenuating circumstances in which this might have to
16 change and I think this is one of those places.

17 I wanna thank the Broadway Triangle
18 Community Coalition and all my residents that have
19 come here constantly and have expressed themselves in
20 a process that is anything but engaging or allows for
21 their true wishes to be heard or respected, so I just
22 wanna thank you all; I care deeply about you all and
23 thank you from the bottom of my heart for fighting
24 for justice and for housing. So I wanna make sure
25

1
2 that I vote no on Land Use Items 761, 762, and aye on
3 all the rest.

4 And to my colleague Espinal, I hope the
5 first party we throw after this is in my district.
6 Given the amount of economic development that's
7 happening on your dime, because you visit so much, I
8 wanna keep inviting you to it, but again, good job;
9 I'm ready to dance, brother. Take care.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 [clapping, background comments]

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Uh... thank you.

13 Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
16 explain my vote, please.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, Council
18 Member.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I wanna be clear
20 that a no vote to this land use amendment would be a
21 vote that would bring us a development with the same
22 footprint but without any of the prior commitments
23 mentioned. A no vote would mean no increased
24 permeability or bioswales, no solar panels,
25 skylights, and without benches and signage; no means

1
2 to preserve aesthetics, no local and MWBE hiring
3 commitments, and no traffic evaluation or mitigation.
4 Contrary to what some have said, this land use
5 agreement is a win for protecting the environment. I
6 am voting yes and I thank you all who have voted yes
7 for this application, because after months of
8 negotiation, we have a project that represents smart,
9 forward-thinking, environmentally conscious planning
10 in response to the real concerns and needs that I
11 heard overwhelming from the community, and I thank
12 those who have voted yes and I wanna thank Speaker
13 Melissa Mark-Viverito and I wanna thank our Land Use
14 Chair David Greenfield for being very patient and
15 allowing us to go to the last minute to make the best
16 deal possible. I wanna thank Zoning Chair Donovan
17 Richards for his expertise. I wanna thank Ramon
18 Martinez for being Ramon and doing what Ramon does,
19 [laughter] and our amazing Land Use team -- Raju
20 Mann, Amy Levitan, Julie Lubin, and John Douglas for
21 their expertise. And to my staff, who had to endure
22 all the slings and arrows to get us to this point to
23 have a good environmentally safe project.

24 And I just want to acknowledge that we
25 are having a street naming after Samuel Brown, who

1
2 was an African-American who moved into a community
3 and wound up on Staten Island and wound up being
4 burnt out and subsequently started the Staten Island
5 chapter of the NAACP, [bell] we will be honoring his
6 memory by co-naming a street after Samuel Brown.
7 Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
14 briefly explain my vote.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
17 Public Advocate. [background comment] Just very
18 quickly, [background comment] I have a few street
19 renamings I just wanna note for the record -- the
20 Association of **[inaudible]** The America Way, an
21 Italian-American organization in my district that's
22 celebrating Italian-American heritage in New York.

23 Pastor Aquiles [sp?], who is a fixture in
24 the Coney Island community, who we lost [background
25 comments] and we'll be proud to rename a street in

1
2 his honor. And Rosia Wyche Way, who was a pillar in
3 the Coney Island community and a major housing
4 advocate.

5 On a personal noted, I'm sure all of you
6 know Ethan Lustig-Elgrably, who is my Chief of Staff
7 -- Ethan has been with me since the beginning of my
8 Council days; he has been the backbone of the office
9 for nearly four years, he has a demanding job, but
10 for almost four years Ethan's done it all and while
11 maintaining a great sense of humor; he's been an
12 invaluable part of my team and I wish him the best of
13 luck as he heads off to the Parks Department. I'm
14 pleased to announce that my Deputy Chief of Staff
15 Anna Scaife will be taking over as Chief of Staff.
16 Our office is incredibly lucky to have Anna and I'm
17 thrilled to have her as my new chief of staff, and
18 I'm also happy to welcome Vanessa Ogle as my new
19 Policy Director, who has already proven herself as a
20 tremendous asset to my office.

21 And with that, I vote aye on all.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
25 excused to explain my vote?

1 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

3
4 First, I know there's a lot of [background comment]
5 co-renamings, blessed be their memory [sic]
6 [background comments] memory, I didn't know Richie
7 Perez in the way a lot of people here did, but he
8 sounded like an awesome human being and based on the
9 spirit he left in a log of people, just happy and
10 proud to be voting on that as well as many others.

11 I wanted to speak on Pfizer just for a
12 moment. I did vote no in both subcommittee and
13 committee; the struggle is what the right thing to do
14 is here, because in the past I have wanted to make
15 sure that council members and this body do everything
16 that they could in the power that we have and from
17 everything that I've read actually, Council Member
18 Levin has done that. I brought to him; [sic] was
19 trying to make sure we codify fully what the unit
20 size was going to be; that's what was brought to me
21 and It seems like he actually did that and that the
22 Mayor and the Administration is the reason we
23 couldn't have the enforcement power that we have.
24 However, Council Member Reynoso is correct; this will
25 not help segregation; this will probably help further

1
2 it. This body needs to continue the discussions that
3 were brought up, primarily to, one, we are often told
4 there's not much we can do to codify; we see it with
5 restrictive covenants and deed restrictions; there
6 are ways that we can make it mandatory and not just a
7 suggestion. And when it comes to member deference,
8 we have to have an honest conversation. I am saying
9 this as a candidate for the Speaker of this body, so
10 I know very well how controversial it is. However,
11 there are times when what members are voting on runs
12 afoul of what this body says and that has happened
13 time and time again when it comes to segregated city
14 and deeply affordable housing. Member deference is
15 extremely important and something that **[inaudible]**
16 remain; nobody knows our districts more than ours,
17 but we're now at a point where we have to have a
18 conversation of what that means, vis-à-vis,
19 affordable housing in this city.

20 With that said, I'm going to, just in a
21 nod, because I know that Steve Levin did everything
22 he could in his power; I'm going to abstain on LU 761
23 and 762 and I'm going to vote aye [bell] on all the
24 rest.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you;
may I explain my vote?

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you,
Madam Public Advocate. I want to congratulate my
colleagues, especially Council Member Rose for a
significant achievement. As the Council Member
pointed out, this essentially would be an as-of-right
project and for a strip mall she received
improvements on this project, from an environmental
perspective, that have never been done before on
Staten Island; that is certainly historic and to her
credit and I think it needs to be clarified once
again that the choice is not whether or not a project
will go forward; the choice is, what kind of project
will go forward, whether that project will be
environmentally friendly or not and Council Member
Rose is the one who did that.

I do wanna congratulate, once again,
Council Member Levin on the compromise on the Pfizer
site. I think it's important to note that there were
issues that were brought up by individuals during the
hearing and the Council Member responded to that by

1
2 effectively [background comment] creating a deed
3 restriction when it refers to the particular
4 apartments that are going to be affordable and that
5 is the first time that we've done that here in the
6 City Council and that's something that should be
7 acknowledged and it's something that should sudge
8 [sp?] the concerns of many of the folks who had
9 concerns.

10 And then finally, I would like to vote
11 aye on all the projects, with the exception of
12 LU 770, Resolution 1712, Resolution 1699, Intro 1638;
13 Resolution 1442-A, of which I am abstaining on all of
14 those. Thank you.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I am voting no on
17 1307, 1558, 1565, 1568, 1569, 1644, 1724, and aye on
18 the rest.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Aye on all [sic].

21 [pause]

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I wanna thank
23 those in the balcony. Thank you so much. I wanna
24 welcome the Tuskegee Airmen. We're tabulating the
25 votes, just give us some time; we're still in

1 session. [background comments] We're still in
2 session; we're just tabulating votes. Please exit
3 quietly. Thank you. [background comments] [pause]
4 hope everyone has a happy and safe Halloween. Just
5 trying to see time [sic]. Hello, former Council
6 Members in the balcony -- hi, Council Member Weprin.
7 Welcome. Shout-out to everybody else. Hello,
8 welcome to the people's house. Thank you so much,
9 yes.
10

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Just because
12 we've been getting conflicting information, but there
13 is an incident happening; my understanding is the
14 person has been apprehended; I'm not sure if there's
15 anybody else, but that people have been on the West
16 Side Highway; I think shots and possible... [interpose]

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yeah.

18 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: car being used.
19 So I'm obviously hoping everybody is safe, and thank
20 the NYPD for their due diligence, horrific situation,
21 but seems like the person has been apprehended.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Keep those
23 individuals in our thoughts and our prayers, but
24 there's no active threat. And so now we have the
25 results. [background comment] Okay.

1
2 All items on today's General Order
3 Calendar were adopted by a vote of 46 in the
4 affirmative, 0 negative and 0 abstentions, with the
5 exception of Intro 1638-A, which was adopted by a
6 vote of 44 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 1
7 abstention and Intro 1307-A, which was adopted by a
8 vote of 43 in the affirmative, 3 negative and 0
9 abstentions, and Intro 1724-A, which was adopted by a
10 vote of 44 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0
11 abstentions, and LU 761 and accompanying Resolution
12 1703 was adopted by a vote of 37 in the affirmative,
13 7 negative and 2 abstentions, and LU 762 and
14 accompanying Resolution 1704, was adopted by a vote
15 of 37 in the affirmative, 7 negative and 2
16 abstentions and LU 768 and Resolution 1710, which was
17 adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 0
18 negative, and 1 abstention, and LU 769 and Resolution
19 1711, adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 0
20 negative and 1 abstention, and LU 770 and Resolution
21 1712, which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the
22 affirmative, 0 negative and 1 abstention, and LU 759
23 and Resolution 1701, which was adopted by a vote of
24 45 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 0 abstentions,
25 and LU 760 and Resolution 1702, which was adopted by

1 a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 1 negative and 0
2 abstentions, and Intro 1558, which was adopted by a
3 vote of 43 in the affirmative, 3 negative and 0
4 abstentions, and Intro 1568-A, which was adopted by a
5 vote of 42 in the affirmative, 3 negative and 1
6 abstention, and Intro 1644-A, which was adopted by a
7 vote of 44 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0
8 abstentions, and Intro 1565-A, which was adopted by a
9 vote of 44 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0
10 abstentions, and Intro 1569-A, which was adopted by a
11 vote of 43 in the affirmative, 3 negative and 0
12 abstentions, and LU 799 and Resolution 1709, which
13 was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 0
14 negative and 1 abstention, and Intro 778-A, which was
15 adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 0
16 negative and 1 abstention, and the revised Land Use
17 Call-Up vote is 46 in the affirmative and 0 negative.

18 Introduction and Reading of Bills.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills
20 referred to the committees as indicated on the
21 agenda.
22

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now
24 discussion of Resolutions, beginning with Resolution
25 1442-A, a resolution calling upon the New York City

1
2 Department of Education to provide curricular and
3 other supports to protect lesbian, gay, bisexual,
4 queer, or questioning and transgender and gender
5 nonconforming and other vulnerable students and to
6 ensure that administrators, teachers, and students in
7 all middle and high schools are informed that under
8 the Equal Access Act students have a right to convene
9 and participate in a gender-sexuality alliance at
10 school. And the first person who would like to speak
11 in regards to this bill is Council Member Williams.

12 [background comment] Or the other bill, Council
13 Member? [background comment] The resolution calling
14 upon... [interpose]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I want to talk
16 about the... [interpose]

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: 1638?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: 1676 and 1677,
19 but I'm proud to be supporting 1442 as well.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Is
21 there anyone who would like to speak on 1442? See
22 none. All of those in favor say aye. [collective
23 aye] All of those opposed. Any abstentions? The
24 ayes have it.

25

1
2 Resolution 1638, a resolution calling up
3 on the Secretary of State and the Secretary of the
4 Department of Homeland Security to extend Temporary
5 Protected Status designations for El Salvador, Haiti,
6 Honduras, Nepal, Nicaragua, Somalia, Sudan, South
7 Sudan, Syria, and Yemen to provide temporary
8 immigration relief to eligible nationals in the wake
9 of devastating environmental disasters, ongoing armed
10 conflicts and extraordinary and temporary conditions
11 that prevents its nationals from returning safely.

12 Is anyone interested in speaking on that resolution?
13 Council Member Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you so
15 much and thank you for reading those names of those
16 countries; these are countries that are well
17 represented in all our communities in this great city
18 and so I hope that everyone supports this resolution.
19 Thank you.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Any others? All
21 of those in favor say aye. [collective aye] All of
22 those opposed. Any abstentions? The ayes have it.

23 Resolution 1676, a resolution opposing
24 the H.R.367 and S.59, known as the Hearing Protection
25 Act of 2017, eliminating the transfer tax on firearm

1
2 silencers and treating any person who acquires a
3 firearm silencer as meeting any registration or
4 licensing requirements of the National Firearms Act
5 with respect to such silencers. Does anyone seek to
6 speak on that bill? Council Member Williams.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you, and
8 my statement is for 1676 and 1677. I want to thank
9 the Speaker for putting these bills forward; you just
10 mentioned a shooting that occurred; I hope everyone's
11 safe. As I said before, I believe this country has a
12 demonic obsession with guns and the NRA are doing the
13 devil's work; people tried to give them kudos for
14 getting rid of the bump stop and they couldn't even
15 do that. These two resolutions are extremely
16 important; [background comments] most people don't
17 know that this is traveling through -- both of these
18 resolutions referring to silencers and the
19 Reciprocity Act; people don't know this is in
20 Congress right now trying to be passed through;
21 people have already forgotten the 50-something people
22 that were killed and the hundreds of people that were
23 shot and the people who are going to be shot today
24 and tomorrow. We have to do so much more when it
25 comes to guns; this has nothing to do with the second

1
2 amendment; this has to do with what is right -- guns
3 were made to kill people; that's all; we have to
4 treat it like that. You need to do more to drive a
5 car; to be a barber than to own a gun in this
6 country; that is demonic [bell] and I'm happy to
7 support these resolutions.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Any
9 others on 1676? Seeing none. All of those in favor
10 say aye. [collective aye] All of those opposed.
11 Any abstention? The ayes have it.

12 Resolution 1677-A, a resolution calling
13 on Congress and the President to oppose H.R.38, known
14 as the Concealed Carry Reciprocity Act of 2017 and
15 related bill S.446, known as the Constitutional
16 Concealed Carry Reciprocity Act of 2017, which would
17 allow a resident from one state who has a license to
18 carry a concealed handgun to lawfully carry his or
19 her handgun in a different state, regardless of the
20 licensing eligibility standard in the other state.
21 Are there any members who would like to speak on that
22 bill? Seeing none. All of those in favor say aye.
23 [collective aye] All of those opposed. Any
24 abstentions? The ayes have it.

1
2 And now with General Discussions,
3 beginning with Council Member Barron.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
5 Public Advocate. [background comments] Just very
6 briefly. We did hear about the life of Jackie
7 Robinson; how in 1947 he was the first black person
8 admitted to the major leagues. I just wanted to
9 share a quote from his autobiography.

10 "I can't stand and sing the anthem; I
11 cannot salute the flag, because I know that I am a
12 black man in a white world. In 1972 and in 1947 and
13 at my birth in 1919, I never had it made."

14 Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
16 Council Member King.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you, Madam
18 Public Advocate. I just wanna thank everyone here
19 who sent prayers, cards, texts, emails; fruit from
20 the chambers. Thank you, Madam Public Advocate for
21 your kind words at my dad's services. So thank you
22 to everyone.

23 But today was a very important day in the
24 City Council as we stand for public schools, for our
25 young students and they need us, need us to pass

1 bills based on oversight and the means to gain
2 information and learn about our schools, our students
3 and their reality to help our schools make better and
4 also make the path of our students to learn a little
5 bit easier.
6

7 So day I'm introducing Intro 1753,
8 calling on the Department of Education to get more
9 information in regards to travel time for our
10 students. We all know for ourselves as adults, we
11 have challenges sometimes when we have to travel an
12 hour or two back and forth from our job; imagine
13 putting that 13- or that 14-year-old in that same
14 scenario where the DOE is allowed the hour-and-a-half
15 for transportation to get to a school. So we wanna
16 get data on this to figure out if there are different
17 communities, if more kids in certain neighborhoods
18 are traveling than other kids, so we wanna have real
19 information and make sure that the schools in all
20 neighborhoods are the same [sic] we talk about
21 educational equity and making sure all our schools
22 are good so kids don't have to do an hour or hour-
23 and-a-half traveling and then it also takes them out
24 of their community where they can be that much more
25 effective [bell] in their neighborhood if they go to

1
2 the schools in their neighborhood. So with that
3 being said, I wanna thank and ask everyone, and
4 everyone who has a street renaming... [interpose]

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I just wanna say
7 thank you and God bless again... [crosstalk]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. And
9 may your father rest in peace. Council Member Rose.
10 No. [background comment]

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
12 Miller.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
14 Public Advocate. I rise [laughter] today for
15 introduction of a resolution that's being introduced
16 by myself and Council Member Torres that calls on the
17 U.S. Supreme Court in addressing the issue of the
18 plaintiff in Janus v. AFSCME, [background comment]
19 which seeks to marginalize the influence of every
20 union which negotiates on behalf of workers, public
21 workers throughout the country, and it certainly
22 would have a devastating impact on all workers
23 throughout the city. This has been the law of the
24 land for nearly a half century and so we want to
25 ensure that we maintain collective bargaining

1 [background comment] here in the United States and
2 particularly in the State of New York, so this
3 resolution will call on the United States Supreme
4 Court to uphold the rights of AFSCME.
5

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. And...

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now some
9 corrections. Intro 1307-A, which was adopted by a
10 vote of 42 in the affirmative and 4 negative and
11 Intro 1558, which was adopted by a vote of 42 in the
12 affirmative and 4 negative, and Intro 1568-A, which
13 was adopted by a vote of 41 in the affirmative, 4
14 negative and 1 abstention, and last correction,
15 Intro 1652-A, which was adopted by a vote of 44 in
16 the affirmative, 1 negative and 1 abstention.

17 And now closing remarks from the Speaker,
18 Melissa Mark-Viverito.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
20 Public Advocate. We are adjourned and everyone stay
21 safe and happy Halloween. Thank you. Oh, don't
22 forget to vote next Tuesday, obviously [background
23 comments] Election Day -- [background comments]
24 important -- we won't see everybody before then.
25 Have a great one. Bye.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 20, 2017