

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

----- X

December 4, 2018
Start: 10:20 a.m.
Recess: 1:46 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Fernando Cabrera
Costa G. Constantinides
Chaim M. Deutsch
Ruben Diaz, Sr.
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Peter A. Koo
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Carlos Menchaca
I. Daneek Miller
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Deborah L. Rose
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Andy Byford, Chief Executive Officer
New York City Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Sarah Meyer, Chief Customer Officer
New York City Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Tim Mulligan, Senior Vice President for Operation
Support, New York City Metropolitan Transportation
Authority

Ellen Shannon, Associate Director of Permanent
Citizens Advisory Committee to the MTA

Paul Goebel, Transportation and Policy Analyst for
Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer

Anna Lynn Courtney, Orientation & Mobility
Instructor, Vision Services for the Blind

Kate Slevin, Senior Vice President, Regional Plan
Association

Monica Bartley, Community Outreach Organizer Center
for Independence of the Disabled New York, CIDNY

Valerie Joseph, Brooklyn Center for the Independence
of the Disabled BCID

Justinia Torres, Brooklyn Center for the Independence
of the Disabled BCID

Jaqi Cohen, Campaign Director, NYPIRG Straphangers
Campaign Representing the Bus Turnaround Coalition

Liam Blank, Advocacy and Policy Manger, Tri-State
Transportation Campaign

Colin Wright Advocacy Associate, Transit Center

Jack Davies, Policy and Campaigns Manager
Transportation Alternatives.

2 [sound check] [pause] [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Welcome to this
4 hearing of the City Council's Committee on
5 Transportation. I am Ydanis Rodriguez the Chair of
6 this Committee. Today, the Committee will be
7 conducting and oversight hearing on the plan to fix
8 the New York City's mass transit system, the plan
9 Fast Forward. I've got to say my first with Andy
10 Byford was very impressive to understand that he know
11 the frustrations of riders, visitors, and his
12 commitment to the only assignment that signed to do
13 here is to fix our train system in New York City.
14 So, personally took his word. I know that that day
15 he took the A train to 177, and walked to my office
16 at 177 and Washburn (sic) and he was not someone that
17 can going to do more—I have experience. I have done
18 it before, and I'm committed to do it here to New
19 York City. So, at the New Yorkers a father of two
20 daughters 5 and 11, I want to leave a legacy to that
21 generation that New York City can be that city that
22 not only have a \$1 trillion value transportation
23 system, one of the largest—the largest one in the
24 nation, the one that is run 24 hours, but the one
25 that should be defined by being efficient and safe.

2 Early this year under the leadership of Andy Byford
3 and the MTA released the Fast Forward Plan to
4 modernize New York City Transit. The plan lays out
5 the 10-year timeline to modernize the system—modern
6 the system by upgrading signals, making more stations
7 accessible, and increasing transparency in the
8 agency's communications with customers. The overall
9 goal of the plan should be as has been described to
10 improve the performance and reliability of the
11 system. Jumping to the train should be the best
12 experience for the 8.5 million New Yorkers and the 65
13 million tourists that come here. This plan, however,
14 will not come cheap. It will require funding. When
15 it was first released earlier this year, estimated
16 the cost of the plan at approximately \$19 billion.
17 Recent estimates have put the overall cost at
18 approximately \$40 billion. Again, recent estimates
19 that put the overall cost of this plan at
20 approximately \$40 billion. I believe that we lift
21 not necessarily the new leadership of the MTA, at
22 least the New York City Transit, how the Second
23 Avenue started with \$4 billion and ended with double
24 that amount. We cannot repeat that, and wanted to
25 assure that at the end of the day, when the plan is

2 adopted, we should be focused on real dollars with a
3 real plan only using two companies to do most of the
4 work but to look for the 10 companies that we have
5 worldwide that they capable to do this project on
6 time and focus should be only maintenance and repair.
7 That's a lot of money, but it is the result of
8 decades of mismanagement and lack of infrastructure
9 funding from previous administrations. I always say
10 that sometimes countries (sic) have laughed at
11 America on how third world countries misuse funding,
12 but when I am being here only for—since 1983, but
13 more 35—for more 35 years, I can compare and I can
14 now understand how we are so expensive to build. How
15 we mismanagements—by doing some mismanagement or so
16 much funding in the past decade. So, the time came
17 and New Yorkers expect more in the new leadership.
18 They know that they—that we need to respond to that
19 perception. I remember the days when the trains were
20 covered by graffiti, and it was really unsafe to ride
21 the subways. Of course, the 1 Train most of the time
22 no heat, no air condition when thousands and
23 thousands of hardworking individuals they need it to
24 go to work. Yes, we were able to both those
25 situations around with—with power, determination and

2 creativity. I believe we can do the same today with
3 the program that currently hailed the transit system.
4 Since the release of the Fast Forward Plan there have
5 been a couple of developments that have alarming.
6 The first one was that the MTA announced a potential
7 fare increase. I say loud and clear not fare
8 increase. Working class and middle-class cannot
9 afford any additional tax, and that's what a fare
10 hike means for hardworking and middle New Yorkers.
11 We need to focus and our vote on other another source
12 of revenue, but fare hike should be, must be out of
13 the table. And the one other option, the base fare
14 for the single ride could go up to \$3.00 from the
15 current \$2.75 and with a Metro could up to \$33 and a
16 monthly pass could increase to up to \$127 from the
17 current \$121. That's a big increase for working
18 class. It probably doesn't have anyone—anything for
19 a millionaire, but for someone who relies on the
20 minimum wage, this is a lot, and we have opportunity
21 to look for the sources in another way. The other
22 alarming development was that the MTA indicated that
23 even with a planned increase that I just mentioned,
24 that it will have significant budget shortfalls over
25 next several years that may result in steep service

2 cuts. We cannot go backward. We cannot think that
3 riders will support any cuts that are so essential
4 for them to go to work or go to school or go to a
5 medical appointment. The New York State
6 Comptroller's Office recently indicated in one of the
7 reports that the MTA is planning budget reduction of
8 \$539 million in 2019 with 409 positions already
9 targeted for elimination. The report also indicated
10 that the MTA faced a previous (sic) operating budget
11 of \$634 million in 2022. That's why we need to be
12 creative and think outside the box to explore
13 additional streams of revenue that may make our
14 transit system better. Real estate own a lot of
15 property. They have so much other ways of how they
16 also can reduce costs like controlling all the
17 vehicles that are also entering Manhattan's business
18 district and design-designating that revenue, which
19 is estimated at more than \$1 billion annually to the
20 MTA, but also it cannot be the congestion plan of the
21 millionaire. It must be both. When the state go
22 back in session in January, I hope that the Blueray
23 (sic) that make the statement—the State Senate
24 Democrat Majority, they should take as a number one
25 priority to work with both initiatives, congestion

2 plan and the millionaire taxes. If we do that, they
3 wouldn't have to go for another fare increase. It is
4 my hope that during today's hearing, we will get the
5 latest update for New York City Transit and the Fast
6 Forward Plan. I also hope to hear additional ideas
7 on what steps we can take here in the city to improve
8 the transit system, and increase the revenue that
9 can be used by the MTA to make those necessary
10 investments. I support for the city to increase the
11 contribution to the MTA, and the state should do the
12 same thing if those resources are going to be used
13 only for mending and repair and if the MTA put the
14 best plan ever to control the cost. With that, I
15 also would like to acknowledge that we're here with a
16 good friend Assemblymember Blake who is also sitting
17 in the audience there. So, thank you for your
18 service and—and for your service at the Assembly. At
19 this time, I would like to be—to welcome the
20 representatives of the MTA that are here with us
21 today, and will comprise our first panel, but first,
22 let me acknowledge my colleagues who are here Council
23 Member Diaz, Richard, Koo and Rose, and now I will
24 ask the Committee Counsel to administer the

2 affirmation, and then invite the MTA panel to deliver
3 your statement.

4 LEGAL COUNSEL: Please raise your right
5 hand. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
6 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
7 before this committee, and to respond honestly to
8 Council Member questions?

9 ANDY BYFORD: I do.

10 LEGAL COUNSEL: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

12 Okay. Thank you very much, Mr. Chairman.
13 Thank you for that introduction, and introduction and
14 I'm very encouraged (a) that you have invited us here
15 today. I think that sends a strong message of the
16 intent of City Council to bite bullet, and do what's
17 necessary to modernize transit in the city in
18 conjunction with the state and other partners. For
19 most, I am encouraged by your—your belief or initial
20 belief in the—from what we've—what we've discussed so
21 far because I—I certainly don't intend to—to let you
22 down in terms of that initial impression that I've
23 certainly come here with a view to modernizing
24 transit, and that's what I intend to impart in the
25 next few minutes as I take you through a

2 presentation. So, I appreciate that some of you have
3 seen this before, but there are elements that are
4 updated. So, I will through it reasonably quickly
5 because obviously the whole point is that you get the
6 chance to ask questions of us, but you'll understand
7 the context. Back in 2017, the Governor rightly put
8 the MTA into a state of emergency as a result of the
9 number of very high profile incidents and a decline,
10 a long-term decline in the reliability of the system
11 that culminated in those very high profile incidents.
12 At that time, I was the CEO, the Chief Executive of
13 the Toronto Transit Commission, and I actually served
14 on the panel or appeared on the panel for that
15 preceded the Genius Challenge. So, I was present
16 when the state of emergency was announced. I knew
17 that I was in the running for this position, but it
18 didn't phase me because I've—I've in 30 years of
19 transit, I've always been attracted to challenges.
20 The challenge doesn't come any bigger than New York,
21 and this is a city that I've loved since the first
22 time I—I came here in 1994 on honeymoon, actually.
23 It's a wonderful place. It's somewhere I've always
24 wanted to live, and this is the job to which I always
25 aspired, the—the biggest, toughest job in world

2 transit right now. But I certainly don't
3 underestimate it, and I recall very clearly arriving
4 into this position on January the 17th of this year,
5 and I thought very carefully about what I would say,
6 and having done my due diligence, I—what I said was
7 the following that the—the challenge really wasn't
8 tinkering with the system. It wasn't that it needed
9 to be tweaked; a few improvements here and there.
10 What was needed was a top-to-bottom modernization of
11 New York City Transit in every aspect of its
12 operations. It's custom service, it's prevailing
13 culture, it's infrastructure and it's processes, and
14 that we needed to focus on four things, and those I
15 will outline in this presentation. We needed to
16 transform the subway, and by doing that, we need to
17 bite the bullet and completely re-signal the subway
18 to provide exponentially greater reliability, and to
19 provide more capacity. We need to get people back
20 riding the buses because there's been a precipitous
21 decline in bus ridership driven largely by
22 alternatives from forms of transit, but also by the
23 fact that the streets are so congested. The third
24 element I think that people would have predicted that
25 I would have said the first two. The third element I

2 think caught some people by surprise. I feel very
3 strongly that we should push on to make the subway as
4 fully accessible in as short a timeframe as possible,
5 and the fourth element, which is kind of my signature
6 piece it's the glue that holds everything together.
7 Anyone can modernize a transit system, but to make it
8 truly world class, you also have to have the right
9 culture, the right accountability and the right
10 transparency and the right processes. So then
11 there's need to be that fourth element, and again, I
12 will talk about those in-in turn, but certainly, I
13 would say that at the moment we're still in that
14 state of emergency. We still have more to do, and
15 everyday the system literally gets older, the
16 infrastructure gets older, the pressure on the system
17 increases. So, the need to bite the bullet and to
18 deliver this plan becomes ever more compelling. When
19 I arrived, the Subway Action Plan was already
20 underway. That was instituted by former Chair Joe
21 Lhota back in the summer of 2017, and the Subway
22 Action Plan, which is part funded—jointly funded by
23 both the city and the state, and we're very grateful
24 for the city to—for coming forward with its
25 contribution to the—to the funding effort has largely

2 focused, and right focused on stabilizing the system.
3 In other words on stabilizing the system. In other
4 words arresting that precipitous decline in subway
5 reliability, and addressing largely infrastructure
6 issues. So, you can see on the scree there some of
7 the statistics. I won't read them all out, but we
8 have been fixing leaks. We have been tightening up
9 on the way we manage track defects, fix-fixing signal
10 defects, maintaining our cars in a more reliable
11 fashion all with a view to not only arresting that
12 decline in-in reliability and punctuality, but in
13 turning the corner, and the good news is that that
14 focus on-on infrastructure is bearing fruit. So,
15 you'll see from the performance trends in the middle
16 of the slide before you that major incidents are down
17 by more than one-third since the Subway Action Plan
18 was initiated. Major incidents' definition being
19 incidents that delayed 50 trains or more. On-Time
20 Performance: Back in October we announced that on-
21 time performance had hit a 3-year record high.
22 That's for weekday performance, for weekend
23 performance that actually hits a 4-year high. I set
24 my team a target. Some are an arbitrary target, but
25 it was deliberate. It was provocative. I set my

2 team a target of cutting the number of delay
3 incidents by 10,000 every month by the year end, by
4 the end of this year. For the third month in a row
5 we have beaten that target, and so monthly delays are
6 trending down. In addition to Subway Action Plan,
7 which largely focused on what I would call fixing
8 thing, we've also instituted a real back to basics
9 campaign where we are looking at the—the basics of
10 running a subway thing that I've learned over 30
11 years of working in subways in London on British Rail
12 in Rail Corp. in Sydney Australia, in the Toronto
13 Transit Commission and here, and that I making sure
14 that you get your dwell times right. In other words
15 the time spent in stations. In getting to the root
16 cause of delays, and not focusing on euphemisms like
17 customer overcrowding. Overcrowding is—is the result
18 not the—the root cause. So, we've been really
19 focusing on root cause. In addressing why the signal
20 system has less capacity than it used to have. So,
21 we've been progressively taking out unnecessary speed
22 restrictions. We've run a system—a campaign called
23 Save Safe Seconds, and that is what has driven the
24 reduction in delay incidents. We're most certainly
25 still prioritizing safety, but I don't think that

2 speed and safety are incompatible. In addition to
3 all of that, we've also focused on the customer
4 experience, and I should have said in starting that
5 to my left here, to your right is my Chief Customer
6 Officer, Sarah Meyer, and to my right is Tim-Tim
7 Mulligan who is our Senior Vice President for
8 Operation Support, and Sarah's job is to advocate for
9 our customs. Her job is to stick up for the
10 customers and to drive forward elements of customer
11 experience. So, more on that to follow. So, that
12 was the Subway Action Plan, but what I did notice in
13 arriving here, again back to my earlier point, it
14 wasn't about tweaking things. It wasn't just about
15 the Subway Action Plan. The Subway Action Plan is
16 good in that it-it maintains-it-it-it arrests the
17 decline and it gets back to where we can be within
18 the limitations of current infrastructure, and that's
19 key point. It can only do as-as-as best as the
20 current infrastructure allows. It only allows us to
21 go so far in terms of improving New Yorkers'
22 experience. What's really needed isn't maintaining
23 the status quo. It's pushing on and completely
24 modernizing this system in as short a time frame as
25 possible, and for that we needed a plan and this is

2 that plant, the Fast Forward Plan. People said to me
3 when I first got here, Well one of the problems with
4 the MTA is you don't really have a plan. You talk
5 about the need to improve, but there's no plan.
6 There's a budget, but there isn't a plan. That plan
7 was put together within 100 working days of us coming
8 together as new senior team, and it is a
9 comprehensive plan. It's an ambitious plan, and it—
10 within a remark—within a record time scale, it can
11 deliver world class transit to the city. So, what
12 does it do? It completely modernizes New York City
13 Transit from top to bottom in every aspect.
14 Obviously, it does what you'd expect it to do, it
15 overhauls the infrastructure, and will come onto talk
16 about that momentarily, but in addition to improving
17 the infrastructure, which to me is only a third of
18 the challenge, it also overhauls our processes, which
19 talks, Mr. Chairman to your point about you need to
20 see that our processes are indeed overhauled that we
21 are more transparent, that we can be trusted to spend
22 the money that you give us that we can be trusted to
23 be transparent and—and crystal clear in everything
24 that we do, and—and upfront with our customers, now
25 stakeholder, but also that we overhaul existing

2 culture so that you truly feel valued as customers
3 hen you ride the system. So, my-my mantra has always
4 been that to modernize the transit system it's about
5 people, it's about processes, and it's about culture.
6 You need to do all three. So, let's cut to the chase
7 then, In the first five years of Fast Forward
8 subject to funding, we will be able to modernize
9 signal-the signaling system. The single most
10 transformative that we can do for this subway is to
11 trans-is to re-signal it, to provide completely
12 modernized signaling. And where not so long ago--and
13 I'll come onto this point in further detail--someone
14 made the point that if we continue to just re-signal
15 one line at a time, and each line takes about 7
16 years, if you do the math it's going to take about 40
17 to 50 years, which is ridiculous. So, we've revisited
18 the way that we-we would re-signal, and we're saying
19 that within five years, subject to funding, we can
20 modernize the signaling on another five years--on
21 another five lines. We would really push along with
22 modernizing our fleet, new subway cars, new buses.
23 We would make more than 50 additional stations
24 accessible, and that is a doubling of the current
25 rate. We're doing around 25 at the moment. So, we

2 would double that to 50. We would redesign all of
3 the bus routes in all five boroughs. We've
4 redesigned the Express Bus Network in Staten Island,
5 and Council Member Rose and I were hearing a site
6 where we heard much about that, but we will push on
7 and redesign all 321 bus routes in five-within three
8 years. We'd introduce a new fair payment system. No
9 more Metro Card, a modern fit for purpose Smart Card
10 system whereby you tap and go, and we would introduce
11 more buses.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] All
13 that is, you know, we-we need to, you know, bring the
14 card from 2 to 5. (sic)

15 ANDY BYFORD: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So that card-that
17 is-[on mic] I wanted to interject now--

18 ANDY BYFORD: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --you know mine
20 is not a plan to stop for you to finish, but looking
21 at this number right now, and I know that the signal
22 system is one of the top priorities that we both
23 understand that have to be done. So, what-how many
24 cars should be upgraded the signal system-and-and

2 this number how can we compare that 1,200 to whatever
3 total--

4 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Okay.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --you've
6 submitted?

7 ANDY BYFORD: Okay, if you—if you let me
8 just go a couple more slides, I'll answer that
9 question because at the moment we have two lines on
10 CBTC. This is equipping cars to to—to accommodate
11 CBTC Communications Based Train Control within five
12 years. Just bear with me. So, just setting the high
13 level scene a bit further, within the following five
14 years—I'm sorry—within the following five years,
15 another six lines our modern signaling for a total of
16 11 over the 10 years. Another 130 stations made it
17 accessible, and that's 180 stations over the 10
18 years. Another 150 stations completely renovated.
19 So that plus the 150 in the first five years is 300
20 stations completely modernized within the 10 years,
21 and by modernized, I'm not talking about aesthetics.
22 I'm not talking about cosmetics. I'm talking about
23 fundamental rebuilds of stations to make them modern,
24 to make them pleasant and safe and fit for purpose
25 for the next 50 to 100 years. Another 3,000 new

2 subway cars, another 2,100 brand new buses, and so
3 let's talk about signaling then, and I can now answer
4 your question, Mr. Chairman. In the next few slides
5 So, the—as again and I reiterate the single most
6 transformative thing we can do to transform the
7 subway itself and the subway rider's experience is to
8 re-signal the subway. Yes, we need new track. We
9 working on that. We need to maintain the drainage,
10 we need to maintain station, we need to maintain
11 pumps and all the various other things that you need
12 to make a subway work. But the thing that's holding
13 us back is the signaling system because the signaling
14 system as it—as it stands is safe, but it's very—it's
15 very constrained in the number of trains that you can
16 you run, and it's very constrained in terms of its
17 inherent reliability because it's now—in—in some
18 places nearly 100 years old. We have signal frames
19 that are nearly 100 years old. That is
20 unprecedented. So, we need to bite the bullet. So,
21 we have reorganized the way that we're going to re-
22 signal this subway. If you recall, I said doing the
23 current math, it would take about 50 to 60 years.
24 When I came in, I said to my team: Why? Let's start
25 afresh. Let's—let's look at this in a fresh

2 perspective. Work on new assumptions, assume you can
3 do more than one line at once. Assume that you will
4 get multiple weekend closures in order to undertaken
5 the work. Minimize the amount of customization of
6 the product. The more you fiddle and—and the more
7 you customize a product, the signaling product, the
8 more risk you introduce, the more time you introduce,
9 and the more cost you introduce. Minimize the
10 interfaces between the signaling system and the cars.
11 Keep it simple, and also don't just focus on the
12 state of good repair, which was the—the running order
13 in which we were doing the lines. So, doing the
14 oldest ones first. Also, we should look to address
15 those with the greatest need for additional capacity.
16 So, that's what we're going to do. So, this diagram
17 shows you the current number of lines with CBTC, and
18 it's very up-to-date because we just this week or
19 last week actually we just completed the initial
20 installation of CBTC onto the 7 Line. We already had
21 it on the L Line the Canarsie Line. The Flushing
22 Line No. 7, the purple line up there has just—we just
23 finished the final rollout the final cutover of CBTC
24 on that line. We still have some further software
25 upgrades to do, but that's now two lines on modern

2 signaling. So, to your question, we currently have
3 enough cars, CBTC equipped to operate those two
4 lines. What we also need is more power on the L Line
5 to run the full number of trains to the full capacity
6 of that signaling system. So, one of the upsides of
7 upcoming tunnel closure for the—for the L Line
8 between Brooklyn and Manhattan, one of the upsides is
9 we will be increasing the number of substations so
10 that we can run more trains. But the—the as-is
11 situation today is that there are 900,000 daily
12 customers on CBTC lines. To keep an eye on the map,
13 within five years this is what the map could look
14 like, and that takes us up to now 3 million daily
15 riders, daily customers on CBTC lines, and what
16 you'll see in is a number of the very heavily used
17 lines. So, the 4, 5 and 6, which you can see there
18 in the middle of Manhattan, 149th Street Grand
19 course—Grand Concourse to Nevins Street we can have
20 that upgraded to CBT. The core trunk section of the
21 Lexington Line can be upgraded within that first five
22 years. Plus, as you've seen elements of the E, F, M
23 U & R Lines, the F Line, the A, C and the E and the G
24 Line. Colleagues around the world have already said
25 to me: Are you sure you can do that? That is

2 unprecedented. So, I do want you to understand that
3 we are really pushing the boundary here, but we
4 believe that that is a—that is achievable. We can do
5 that within five years. If you watched map, this is
6 what can be achieved within the second five years for
7 a cumulative total of ten. So, we've now moved from
8 900,000 riders a day to 5 million daily riders on
9 modern signaling out of the total of 5.7 million. So
10 that's 90% of customers of the New York City Subway
11 will be on modern signaling. So two further points
12 to make: You may well be sitting there thinking well
13 hang on a minute, what about those—what—what about
14 the other sections of line? Well, again, I reiterate
15 that there's a science behind the way we've chosen
16 the lines. It's based upon an amalgam of state of
17 good repair, how old the existing system is, and also
18 the greatest need in terms of capacity. So, those—
19 those bits that aren't shown on this map are either
20 in a better state of good repair, they're more modern
21 or they have less capacity constraints, and they
22 would be addressed in the—in the third tranche of
23 five years so that within 15 years the entire subway
24 was remodeled. However, here's the good news. It's
25 possible that we could re-signal the whole subway

2 more quickly, more cheaply and less intrusively if as
3 I think is increasingly likely an emerging technology
4 called Ultra-Wideband does prove to be safe and
5 viable, and when I first hear about Ultra-Wideband, I
6 was somewhat skeptical because it seemed too good to
7 be true. You don't need to do so much work on the
8 cars. You don't need to put much equipment in the
9 tunnel and, therefore, it's quicker, cheaper and less
10 intrusive to install the equipment. So, contained
11 within my plan, although the plan is predicated on
12 known technology and it has to be. We have to go
13 with what known and—and proven from a safety
14 perspective right now. If Ultra-Wideband dose prove
15 to be viable, then we can reduce the cost and we can
16 get the—the lines re-signaled more quickly and with
17 way less week-end interruptions. So, that's good
18 news. So, we're—we're following a parallel path or
19 progressing with CBTC whilst actively working with
20 two suppliers to see if Ultra-Wideband is, indeed, a
21 viable alternative technology. It's not all about
22 re-signaling, and transforming the subway is also
23 about getting exponentially better at the bases, and
24 I've largely covered these point. So, the fact that
25 reliability is turning the corner, we are—we have now

2 just hit three months in a row of reduced subway
3 delay incidents. We have a much better handle of
4 root cause of-of those incidents so that we tackle
5 the right things, and we-we-we assign the appropriate
6 remedies. We're complete and went more quickly does
7 meant that progressively my job, our job as a team is
8 day-by-day to make things better. So, what have we
9 done so far? This is progress for 2018. We've
10 introduced-we talk about accountability. If you go
11 to any subway station today, you will see a poster up
12 on the wall, which went up within the last two months
13 with a photograph of the group station manager. It's
14 a job I used to do. It's a job I did in London. I
15 was the group station manager for Kings Cross Station
16 the busiest trip station in London, and it is a-it's
17 a role that assigns around 20 stations to 22
18 different group station managers so that you as
19 Council Members have a one-stop shop for what goes on
20 in your community. Just talk to your local group
21 station manager. They're responsible for two-two
22 angles or two lines of work: To make sure that we
23 deliver excellent customer service through the
24 customer facing employees and that we drive up the
25 appearance and the maintenance and the cleanliness of

2 the stations under the agreement. So, what have they
3 been up to? Already we have cleaned stations. We
4 are having blitz on customer restrooms, and we have
5 improved the facilities at six stations so far and
6 more to come. We've been making repairs at over 25
7 of our most problematic switches. Again, going back
8 to root cause, you should look on a pro rata basis on
9 a-what's the specialty, a-that's a-that's a very
10 crooked. It's Pareto basis. Sorry, Pareto basis
11 where you look at which are your worst performers and
12 you assign the corrective actions of the work
13 performers, which are the most impactful switches,
14 and which are the ones that cause you the most
15 problems. So, we-we now assign what's called Pareto
16 Analysis to make sure that we do that properly. We
17 have corrected and made signal modifications to those
18 signals that weren't working properly and they
19 unnecessarily delayed customers. So, we've just
20 increased the speed on a number of lines, and we've
21 also made some operational changes to safely speed up
22 service. So, that's subways, and buses. The second
23 of the four priorities that I announced. I've
24 already mentioned that we will redesign the bus
25 network in all three-of all five boroughs over the

2 next three years. We're working very closely with
3 the city to-on-on the NYPD to improve traffic
4 enforcement. Existing bus lanes far too often use
5 buses regularly far too often are blocked by
6 delivery-people delivering stuff, by people double
7 parking, by people dropping other people off, and bus
8 lanes are there for a reason. Obviously, we've got
9 to help businesses do-try, but the bus lanes must be
10 kept clear if our buses are to have a fighting chance
11 to getting through traffic. In addition, working
12 with our colleagues at the DOT installing more
13 traffic signal priority equipment on traffic lights
14 so that that that gives buses priority getting
15 through key intersections. We've announced that once
16 the Smart Card is installed, we will speed up
17 boarding by-by allowing rear door boarding. There
18 wasn't going to be readers on the back doors, which
19 is ridiculous. So, we've instituted a change and
20 said there must be readers installed on the back
21 doors for no additional cost. We can accommodate
22 within the budget, and so that once Smart Card is
23 available, you can legitimately board at the back.
24 We're having targeted action on corridors to look at
25 where the delays are happening to bus routes, and

2 typically, it's not the whole route. There tends to
3 be bottlenecks on the routes. So we're addressing
4 those, and we're pushing on towards an all-electric
5 fleet as quickly as we possibly can once the
6 technology is proven. Again, progress already. I
7 touched—touched on some of this. I'm very grateful
8 to NYPD for the work that they've done with us to
9 date on targeting improvements on specific bus
10 routes. We've relaunched or redesigned the Staten
11 Island Bus Express Network and that's still very much
12 a work in progress. Some people love it. Some
13 people aren't so happy. So, we're continuing to make
14 changes to that—to that network. We've kicked off
15 the Bronx Bus Network Redesign, and that's the first
16 of the major borough redesigns. We've done the
17 Express Network for Staten Island. We'll come back
18 and do the local—local network later. We've expanded
19 our peak service on five routes. We are continuing
20 to do the traffic signal priority upgrades on
21 particular bus routes across the city, and pushing on
22 making sure that our priority routes are improved
23 across the whole city not just in particular
24 boroughs. Accessibility: this was the third of the
25 four priorities, and it is just plain wrong that our

2 subway system is not fully accessible. We must
3 address that for the city. It's an equity issue.
4 It's something I feel very strongly about. Right
5 now, we have 119 accessible stations. In itself,
6 that sounds like quite a lot, and if you compare it
7 to other networks, it's probably the most in terms of
8 quantity (sic) but we have 472 stations, and so,
9 therefore, the actual percentage is nowhere near so
10 impressive. It's only around 25%, and that's simply
11 not acceptable. However, with targeted action we can
12 within five years get to this position where you are
13 no more than two stops away from an accessible
14 station, no more than two stops away from an
15 accessible station within just five years. How do we
16 do that? By scientifically infilling gaps. So, we
17 look at demographics, we look at where there are gaps
18 in the accessible network, and we look at key
19 interchange stations and we—and consult with the
20 accessible community to make sure that we—we do the
21 right stations. What else are we doing? We want to
22 see more direct Access-A-Ride routes. The—at the
23 moment a regular complaint from Access-A-Ride riders
24 is that you get taken on a very circuitous routes
25 around the boroughs. So, we're—we're redesigning the

2 network to give you more direct routes. We launched
3 on that so that you can know where your ride is when
4 it's coming, and we are providing sensitivity
5 training to all 50,000 employees of New York City
6 Transit including executives. Let's have another
7 look at the map. These—this is—these blobs represent
8 where the current stations are, the existing
9 stations, the 119 and as you can see, there are huge
10 gaps in the network. Please watch the map. Within
11 just five years, and this is indicative. This isn't
12 saying where they will go, but it's to prove a point
13 of what the network could look like. This is what
14 the network could look like within 5 years with an
15 additional 50. As you see, the—the—the blobs have
16 increased, and that would take you to no more than
17 two stops away from an accessible station, which is
18 light years from where we currently are. If you keep
19 watching the map, this is what we could have within
20 just 10 years with another 130, which means we will
21 be within striking distance of a fully accessible
22 network and rightly so. What have we done to date?
23 In a first for the MTA, we have a full-time
24 Accessibility Advisor a guy called Alex Elegudin who
25 used to be the TLC Accessible—Accessibility Advisor,

2 himself a wheelchair user. Where Sarah represents
3 the customer, Alex represents the accessibility of
4 the disabled community, and he has already initiated
5 a raft of activity. We've been undertaking surveys
6 of all the remaining inaccessible stations to
7 identify what the cost would be to update them, and
8 to upgrade them to make them accessible and how
9 complex that would be. We've been working on the
10 existing system providing better static signage at
11 the stations, providing better information, e-
12 information, information on your phone so that you
13 know if an elevator is not working what your
14 alternatives are. We've been pushing ahead on making
15 the existing elevators work more effectively keeping
16 them in service and keeping them clean, and we've
17 been pushing them with the—the design of new stations
18 as part of our existing capital program. Nearly
19 done. Finally, the fourth of the four priorities is
20 the glue that holds this all together is to engage
21 and empower employees. There's 50,000 of us. I think
22 the—the staff that work at Transit are fabulous.
23 I've been very impressed with the employees that I
24 now work with, but I've been equally determined that
25 we should all up our game. Every single one of us

2 needs to up our game to provide consistently
3 excellent customer service that is worthy of the—of
4 the service that we should provide to New Yorkers.
5 So, we've reorganized the executive. It's very
6 important that we have a structure with the right
7 people in the right jobs with the right skillsets and
8 the right mandates. We equally are paying great
9 attention to show the employees that we value them.
10 I believe that a happy workforce gets things done. I
11 don't believe in coercion. I don't believe in big
12 state management. It might achieve things in the
13 short-term but we're revising the way we've—we
14 provide discipline to be more corrected rather than
15 punitive. We're listening to our employees in terms
16 from getting their ideas and getting them to
17 innovate, and we're also pushing them with
18 accelerating our approaches to diversity and
19 inclusion. There are three themes that run through
20 the whole plan, and you touched upon one in your
21 intro. You will not trust us with the money that
22 we're seeking for Fast Forward if we do things the
23 way we've always—always done them, and we get that.
24 We have to change the way we do things, and that's
25 not just for New York City Transit. It's for the

2 whole of the MTA. So, we've already taken steps to-

3 to make ourselves more accountable. We've launched a

4 number of new dashboards. Certainly for New York

5 City Transit we have revised our actual Gold Pack

6 that gets seen publicly every-every month. We're

7 overhauling under the leadership of Pat Foye, the

8 President of the MTA. We're overhauling our

9 processes to make ourselves more efficient. We're

10 streamlining procurement to attract more businesses,

11 more delivery partners to come and work with us.

12 We're addressing the need-the needs of innovating,

13 setting up an innovation unit so that we get more

14 companies wanting to work with us, and adopting best

15 practice from across the world and we've introduced

16 new dashboards so that you, the stakeholders, and the

17 public representatives can see what we're doing.

18 Safety and security and resiliency are obviously are

19 absolutely critical. It's not an initiative. It

20 runs throughout the whole program, working with NYPD

21 in addition to the group station manager programs we

22 now have neighborhood community officers (sic) at

23 each of our stations, and those people's contact

24 details are again up at the stations next to the

25 Group Station Mangers. We've launched a Safety

2 Hotline. We have—we continue to do work post Super
3 Storm Sandy to make our system more reliable, and we
4 are increasing our focus on the sustainable practices
5 to make ourselves more environmentally friendly.
6 Four more slides. Under Sarah's Leadership we have
7 an ongoing theme--it's not an initiative--of excelling
8 at customer service. So, we—we have increased the
9 amount of customer service that we're—the training
10 that we're doing. We've increased the number of
11 people at the Rail Control Center who put out real
12 time information via social media. We have been
13 increasing the amount of announcements that we made
14 both on trains and stations and improving employee-
15 community engagement through the deployment of Group
16 Station mangers. So, again, a quick update on
17 progress. We're not holding back. A lot of—a lot of
18 what needs to be done we can do right now. Sarah is
19 appointed. We launched a MY MTA Map—App—sorry—so
20 that you can see in real time what's happening on
21 your—on this transit system. We've reduced the Metro
22 Card claim processing times by 70%. It just to be
23 something like 21 days to get a—to get your claim
24 processed. It's not 7 days. We've launched the
25 Customer Commitment and consistently with we said

2 about improving information. Remarkably, around 70
3 stations didn't customer--didn't have public address
4 facilities at all. So, we've progressively begin
5 installing that equipment in those stations that
6 don't currently have it. So this will be my summary.
7 We're at a crossroads. We could stop. We could
8 continue doing what we're doing. In terms of the
9 Subway Action Plan, things will definitely get
10 better, but they will be held back within the
11 limitations of the current capital plan and the
12 limitations of the current signaling system. So,
13 yes, things would be better. They would be
14 stabilized, but they would be nowhere near the world
15 class system that New York really needs, or we can
16 adopt the Fast Forward Plan. As the Chairman said,
17 it comes with a cost. Now, my view would be the--the
18 real cost is not to bite the bullet. If we don't
19 bite the bullet, the infrastructure will only get
20 older. The pressure on it will only get more intense
21 as New York grows, and the population increases and
22 the cost of it--because the need won't go away--the
23 cost will only get higher, but if we bite the bullet,
24 we have the opportunity, ladies and gentlemen to
25 mover from a state of emergency to state-of-the-art

2 transit within 10 years, which put another way is
3 less than 4,000 days. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
5 you, Andy. [on mic] Thank you to your team for
6 [coughs] for--for also you were doing the transit tour
7 that with the---and--and everyone up from Moreno (sic)
8 Team, the whole team that you very helpful as we have
9 spent 24 hours in the trains a few months ago
10 listening from the riders. I've got a few questions,
11 but my colleagues one of them they've got to leave
12 and they're going to having the opportunity first and
13 then I'll get back into my own questions. Council
14 Member Diaz. [off mic] We thank you panel.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [off mic] Thank
16 you. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Good morning. Okay,
17 next let me--let me quick who's your boss?

18 ANDY BYFORD: My boss is the Managing
19 Director of the MTA Ronnie Hakim.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: And who's
21 responsible also for the--right now?

22 ANDY BYFORD: I'm sorry. Can you--?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Who's responsible
24 right now? I mean who's the big boss?

2 ANDY BYFORD: Well, ultimately, the way I
3 look at it, it's Cy Vance, but ultimately New Yorkers
4 are my boss because I've come here to--to transform
5 transit, but on a purely hierarchal basis, my boss is
6 the Managing Director of the MTA, ultimately the
7 Chairman of the MTA and the Board set the direction
8 for me.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Let me, let me, let
10 me see if you could invest a lot of time to get here.
11 On June 29, 2017 Governor Andrew Cuomo declare the
12 subway system was in a state of emergency. Do you as
13 of now--do you think that that statement still on or
14 have improved or come down or we--or--or--or it has
15 gotten worse?

16 ANDY BYFORD: Well, technically, the
17 state of emergency hasn't been rescinded. So,
18 technically the--the --the executive order still
19 applies, and that--that order was put into place so
20 that the MTA could take expedited action to address
21 the deficiencies that led to the imposition of the

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [interposing] But,
23 it was--

24 ANDY BYFORD: -- state of emergency.
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [interposing] But--
3 but--

4 ANDY BYFORD: My-my view would be that
5 we-our state we're doing what the Subway Action Plan
6 was set-was set out to do. We have stabilized the
7 system. The number of major incidents as an average
8 is down.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [interposing] My
10 question is-my question is this getting worse or
11 better?

12 ANDY BYFORD: No, it's getting better.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Getting better.

14 ANDY BYFORD: The-they-so, the service-
15 so, I you look at the data, the service is improving.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [interposing]
17 Well, I know, you give it more time. I would-just
18 yes or no.

19 ANDY BYFORD: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: It's gotten better?

21 ANDY BYFORD: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: According to you,
23 it's gotten better?

24 ANDY BYFORD: Yes, and lots more to do.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: On July 25, 1927—no
3 2017, Chairman Lhota announced a plan to stabilize—
4 stabilize and improve the subway system. The plan
5 was called Subway Action Plan.

6 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Since that time up
8 to July of—of this—of this year, they indicate that
9 that plan has spent \$333 million and it hired an
10 additional 1,100 workers.

11 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] We hired--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: However, however,
13 the two metrics that we use to—to—to make sure the
14 improvement where something called Wait Assessment
15 and the other was called On-Time Performance.

16 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: But according to
18 the report, both of those the Wait Assessment and the
19 On-Time Performance they have gotten worse.

20 ANDY BYFORD: No, not. So, Council
21 Member, in October we announced in October—they—I—I'm
22 familiar with these statistics. In October, the
23 average for the—for the wait time was the best for
24 three years for week days, the best for an On-Time
25 Performance. So, it was the best for three years on

2 weekends, on weekdays, and the best for four years on
3 weekends. The average wait time on-both on platforms
4 and stations was decreased, and the number of major
5 incidents was also decreased.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [interposing] Let
7 me read the source of the city.

8 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] It does
9 fluctuate, and I have said that.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [interposing] Let
11 me read it. In 2016, the Wait Assessment was 78.1%.

12 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: In 2017, it was-is
14 it came down--

15 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Yeah.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: --to 75.9. Now,
17 this year, it went to 71.9%. So, how could-how-how--

18 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] So, the
19 figure--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [interposing] How
21 do you call that improvement?

22 ANDY BYFORD: --the figure I'm quoting
23 is I'm comparing free SAP to post-SAP figures and the
24 October data does show that the number of major
25 incidents was decreased, the wait time was decreased

2 and the on-time punctuality was the best for three
3 years. That's the October statistics as publicly
4 reported.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: So, these--so these
6 statistics are wrong?

7 ANDY BYFORD: I-I don't have the benefit
8 of seeing what you are looking at. I can only go on
9 these--the publicly declared statistics at the October
10 Board meeting.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: So, according to
12 the Wait Assessment time as--as--

13 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] For--for the
14 October data, which shows an improvement in the Wait
15 Time Statistics, correct.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: And what about the
17 On-Time Performance?

18 ANDY BYFORD: On-Time Performance was the
19 best for three years on week days, the best for
20 weekends for four years. So, we're not saying the job
21 is done. What we are saying is that because of this
22 relentless attention to detail by the Subway Action
23 Plan, and the complementary Back to Basics Campaign
24 that we've introduced because I felt that was
25 missing, progressively although it does fluctuate.

2 It is beginning. It is turning the corner and
3 getting better, but you won't get the step change
4 unless we bite the bullet and do what's really
5 necessary, which is re-signal and renew the
6 infrastructure.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Two more questions
8 and I'm finished. Since you--since--since the action--
9 the Subway Action Plan took effect to now--

10 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: --what--what would
12 you say would be the--the--the percentage of
13 improvement on the--on time performance?

14 ANDY BYFORD: Sorry. Say again. What's
15 the increase in on-tome?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: [interposing] Yes,
17 the percentage of improvement according to you?

18 ANDY BYFORD: Well, so let me give you
19 some statistics. Major incidents have decreased
20 11.7%. Average platform and average train time have
21 improved 2018 versus 2017. Service delivers has
22 reached the highest level since the measure was
23 introduced and is now at 95.8% and the subway car
24 average [bell] mean distance between failure has
25 improved. It's now 122,000 instead of \$115,000. So,

2 it's important to look at suite of measures because
3 where on-on-time performance I get is what people
4 understand because it's "Is my train on time or not?"
5 On-Time Performance measures, i.e., does the train
6 reach its destination, the end of the line on time?
7 It is one measure. It's not the only measure. You
8 need to look at all of them.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you. My time
10 is up. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
12 Council member. Just to be clear, first of all, like
13 a great plan, great vision--

14 ANDY BYFORD: Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --But do you also
16 understand that you took a leadership position in the
17 agency where riders with all rides are frustrated?

18 ANDY BYFORD: Very much so.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And that we
20 expect the action and progress--

21 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --as yesterday.

23 ANDY BYFORD: I am crystal clear on that,
24 gentlemen.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. So, I-I
3 think that's—I can that for me and for many New
4 Yorkers, you know, it is difficult to earn the trust-
5 -

6 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --in our city
8 because New Yorkers by definition were are
9 individuals with hard opinion, you know, strong
10 opinion, and we all participate and during the time
11 of social media, which is, you know, the leadership
12 and actual view I trust Freddy Faray (sp?) for his
13 contribution that he had made in our society and as a
14 Latino who I am, he made me very proud also to know
15 that we have someone also from the same Caribbean
16 Islands where we're coming from that in a good
17 leadership position, but I think that the most
18 important things, and the Governor said in his speech
19 when he presented some of these directions for where
20 the MTA should be going--

21 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --which is we
23 need to take this system and we need to fix it, and I
24 feel that in a society where we are being able to
25 make the basic day the Fair Fare to build the Mayor

2 Cuomo Bridge to take like—see La Guardia going to
3 important progress, I think that this is one of the
4 legacies that all of us should make it, and I think
5 that we need to do whatever it takes to really work
6 on these five years. The question is, you know, what
7 is the experience? What are you putting in place,
8 and I get the discretion with the plan. For me like
9 it wasn't only in the '80s and the '90s that to be
10 able to tell this (sic) because like \$500 that's what
11 the orders said. Like still to day I see the MTA—I'm
12 not talking about the new plan because now it's al
13 about presenting the vision, presenting the plan. We
14 need to get the revenue in place, but how can we
15 guarantee the taxpayer that we will be spending—we're
16 going to be focusing only on repair and manage—in
17 maintenance. I think that we're going to be giving
18 the best use to every single dollar of the taxes.

19 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm. Yeah. So, and-and
20 and we are very clear on that, Chairman. The—the new
21 leadership at the MTA and if you think about it,
22 pretty much everyone in the senior positions is new
23 to their—either new to the company or new to their
24 role. Certainly, the five agency presidents. We're
25 very clear that we need to change the way we do

2 business. We have various work streams underway.
3 We've got a working group that's looking at
4 transparency and the way that we share what we do
5 with you. We've got another group that's looking at
6 cost containment to tackle this—this much documented
7 issue around the fact that NYC jobs and—and major
8 projects cost more than they do comparatively in
9 major cities elsewhere in the world. We've got
10 another work stream going to look at our procurement
11 practices to not only streamline them, to make them—
12 to make them shorter so that we procure things more
13 quickly, but also and this speaks to already a point
14 from your press conference to attract other bidders
15 back into the mold. So that where other companies
16 have given up on dealing with the MTA, we want to
17 attract them back because now it's easy to do
18 business with us, but we are more dynamic, but our
19 processes and our procurement is that much more
20 streamlined. And then the final stream would be with
21 the various—the various transparency measures. So
22 we've taken things like that dashboards. You should
23 be able to, and you should demand to see pretty much
24 in granular detail how we're spending the money. The
25 one point I would make is that, you know, what comes

2 first, the chicken or the egg? If you—if you are so
3 concerned about the past because you feel that we
4 haven't been transparent enough, or we haven't proved
5 worthy of your trust that you won't now invest, we'll
6 we're kind of grinding to a halt. We—we won't make
7 the change. Someone has to make a leap of faith.
8 We've got the plan. We've got new management and
9 with new transparency tools and means—means by which
10 you can hold to account absolutely hold us to
11 account. This is our golden opportunity, and we
12 shouldn't miss—miss it, but someone has to take that
13 leap of faith or we are condemning New Yorkers to the
14 status quo, and I don't think anyone wants to do
15 that.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Do you think that
17 based on the numbers, and I don't know if you have
18 that in front of you, and now you can share with us.
19 Have we—have we seen a reduction of crimes in the
20 train stations or is the number the same?

21 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] But there's
22 different ways of measuring crime. Gen—generally,
23 subway levels of crime are at a low level, a record
24 low level. The—the—the individual constituent parts
25 of the different types of crime get report every four

2 weeks at the New York City Transit Committee, and
3 the-the -Police Chief is-is held to account for that.
4 But generally, it's very safe system actually, and
5 when you look at statistics, yeah, we carry 8 million
6 people a day. The actual number of crimes is very,
7 very low.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, it is-do you
9 think that the number has been reduced let's say tis
10 year and also we are getting close to our 2018.

11 ANDY BYFORD: Yes, the crime rate has
12 come down.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Yeah, okay so
14 enforcement especially in bus lanes, how-and you talk
15 about that you have discussed with the NYPD on how
16 they will improve their role to do enforcement.

17 ANDY BYFORD: I think this--

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing] And
19 how does--

20 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] More so.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --can you
22 describe what the new-what those discussions is-was
23 about, and how does that translate into new changes
24 that we-that we will see in the street--

25 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: ---you know,
3 again those drivers that they are parking. It
4 doesn't matter who they are--

5 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --NYPD, city
7 workers, any drivers unless it is an emergency should
8 not be parked in a bus lane. So, how that plan--

9 ANDY BYFORD: Sure.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --how that new
11 way of enforcement would translate into? What should
12 we expect to see?

13 ANDY BYFORD: Okay. So that [coughs] we
14 have to get the message across that parking in a bus
15 lane is unacceptable that it's selfish, and that it
16 won't be tolerated. It-it's just-it's not acceptable.
17 The bus lane is there for good reason. It's to get
18 the buses through. So, to me you need to have a
19 suite of measures in order to make that happen.
20 You've got to make sure that people understand that,
21 that you've got adequate signage. You've got to have
22 the police properly targeted to treat it as a
23 priority. You know, you see NYPD throughout the city
24 so I won't need to take a very active role not to be
25 passive, but to be actively looking out for

2 infiltrations of bus lane blockages that people
3 shouldn't be doing it. They should be being told to
4 move on straight away. I think there should be a
5 very robust penalty mechanism for people particularly
6 if they're repeat offenders, people who keep parking
7 in bus lanes, and then finally, we want to seek more
8 authority to have both static cameras observing bus
9 lanes in particular key interchanges, intersections,
10 but also to have forward facing buses on our cameras
11 such that you could in real time record offenders
12 because the police can't be everywhere, but to have a
13 mechanism whereby we actually have recordings of
14 vehicles that are offending. I think it would send
15 the messages: If you park in a bus lane, you are
16 all-you are almost certain to be found-found out and
17 there will be a very hefty penalty. So, you need the
18 two elements, the deterrent and the penalty.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That's great.
20 What I will add and I translate it into the question
21 is will we expect an increase of men and women
22 dedicated to enforcement?

23 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Well, I--

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And I don't and
25 not-I don't expect-I'm not asking for--

2 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --a police office
4 to be--to leave a scene of a crime where he or she are
5 assigned, and then just go and do anything else. But
6 yesterday, you talk about--I mean the MTA as an
7 agency--

8 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --you address
10 like the millions of dollars that they agency is
11 losing because some people are not paying their fare,
12 right?

13 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What was the
15 amount?

16 ANDY BYFORD: The amount is \$215,000 of
17 crime.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, I--I think
19 that it is important also to quantify--

20 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Yeah.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --you know, the
22 negative impact of those driving--drivers who are
23 blocking the buses.

24 ANDY BYFORD: Absolutely.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And--and put the
3 dollars amount--

4 ANDY BYFORD: Sure.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --on the value of
6 time that how many individuals on average do we
7 expect are getting late because people are blocking
8 our buses--

9 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --and at the same
11 time if we put the dollars amount, do we need to
12 create a new unit only to be dedicated to
13 enforcements?

14 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And if we
16 dedicate a new unit just to do that in the bus lane,
17 can we be able to raise the revenue to pay for that
18 group of people that the only thing they will do is
19 enforcements. Can the New York City traffic as we
20 are now not going to see it in the budget, come to us
21 and say we need additional 100 individuals only to be
22 dedicated to enforce in the bus lane?

23 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And for me it's
25 about like three years ago there were so measures

2 that they came through, you know, from different part
3 of the world (sic) and one of the questions that I
4 asked in this case of Vision Zero was about what do
5 you think about an area where the city can do better
6 to get our goal to reduce to zero the number of
7 people being killed by—in a crash? And the answer
8 was enforcement.

9 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, if we know
11 that enforcement will make a big difference to take a
12 rider on time and, therefore, it can incentivize and
13 provide a better experience for people saying no I'm
14 not going to be just walking because sometimes I get
15 from a—one point to the other faster just walking
16 because the bus is being blocked by drivers.

17 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, I just wanted
19 to highlight that.

20 ANDY BYFORD: That's good. So, in answer
21 and to respond to that, and as a team and I hope this
22 came across in the presentation. We're not saying to
23 the New Yorkers, Sorry folks. You have to wait 5
24 years, 10 years. You have to spend billions of
25 dollars in order to get improvement. A lot of

2 improvement on both the subway and the bus can
3 happen, and it happening right now, and that is
4 through better management focus and in the context of
5 what we're now discussing better direction to our
6 colleagues at the—at the police NYPD and particularly
7 the Transit Bureau to direct them on what we want
8 them to focus on. So, we are focusing them
9 increasing—we have been and—and still are and we'll
10 continue to do so, and—and actively managing bus
11 lanes and actively managing fare evasion, but let me
12 just come back to bus lanes. One of the advantages
13 of having worked elsewhere is you see what—what works
14 elsewhere, and one thing I think we should consider,
15 in the UK there are different ways of managing what I
16 call arterial routes, key—key routes, and on some
17 roads there are yellow lines. On some lines—on some
18 roads there are double yellow lines, but in London
19 you also have what are called red routes. A red
20 route and the lines are painted on the road red
21 deliberately to denote that it's red route and
22 there's signage around it. A red route every
23 Londoner, you go and ask any Londoner what is a red
24 route and they know. Don't even think about stopping
25 on red route. You will definitely get caught. You

2 will almost certainly get towed, and the fine is
3 huge. Don't even think about it. So, the red routes
4 in London work really well because they're there for
5 a reason. They're to keep the traffic flowing and
6 they're to keep public transit flowing. So, it might
7 be something we want to consider so that it's very,
8 very clear don't even think about stopping in that
9 particular corridor, and I think that's the kind of
10 message that we've got to get across. So, I think
11 your idea about quantifying the impact of selfish
12 parking is a--is a good one. I certainly am about
13 intuitive thinking. I wouldn't rule out having a
14 dedicated enforcement unit with our colleagues at DOT
15 with our colleagues at NYPD. Whatever it takes. We
16 are pushing NYPD very hard with early results on key
17 routes. We're doing them one at a time to figure out
18 where are the bottlenecks on each route to keep the
19 buses moving. We will never get people back riding
20 the buses while they're hopelessly caught in traffic.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Do you
22 understand why most New Yorkers don't support a fare
23 hike?

24 ANDY BYFORD: I-I-I-fare hikes aren't
25 popular anywhere, anywhere like where? No one wants

2 a fare hike, and people certainly don't want a fare
3 hike when they don't think they're getting the
4 service. The dilemma we face at the MTA is that
5 absent new revenue streams, we have a looming budget
6 gap that we have to fill. So, you know, what we
7 urgently need a new sufficient, affordable,
8 sustainable revenue streams.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But, I-I-and
10 again, I know that your role is to be the management
11 of the agency and put in the vision, translate the
12 vision in to the changes that we need, or that we
13 have to play or raising the revenue, and-and-but I-I
14 as I said before that I understand that there's a
15 real concrete plan on the table on congestion price,
16 taxis on millionaire that if we are able to get
17 incentives and the Governor's support with those
18 plans, we will-we don't have to move on the fare
19 hike--

20 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --and I think
22 that the time when we are saying to New Yorkers that
23 they should support this plan, that they should trust
24 the leadership, I feel that as we are in the middle
25 of great, too, plan on the table, you know, this is

2 not yet a traditional time. I know that fare hikes
3 go through the process. We have been hearing people
4 talk. At the end of the day, we know that will
5 happen. This proposal is happening at the time.

6 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But we are asking
8 also New Yorkers there, too, a vision or plan.

9 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: If you live in
11 Queens and you if you live at Brooklyn, yes that's
12 the reason why you're not concerned about congestion
13 price. You need to know that how that money will be
14 reinvested--

15 ANDY BYFORD: Absolutely.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --in your
17 district, and I feel, and that's why I support it
18 because I feel that with this plan we will see real
19 reinvestment of the money--

20 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Absolutely.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --that working-
22 class, middle-class we benefit with our congestion
23 price. So, I think that--I hope and I've been saying
24 over in the hearing I hope that, you know, you as a
25 board understand, that if we want to make a case, or

2 building and no support, trans support, the other
3 plan where we can raise the largest amounts of
4 revenue that is that is needed from the MTA. So, I
5 hope that you really--and again as a whole board
6 reconsider--

7 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Sure.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --the Proposal
9 for a Fare Hike.

10 ANDY BYFORD: Understood and--and I hear
11 you. We--and let me just make a couple of points by
12 way of response, if I may. First of all, and I--and I
13 appreciate, you all know this, as the--as the
14 President of New York City Transit, I do not have a
15 say in the fare raise. The fare raises are for the
16 Board to the MTA and--and that process is still
17 ongoing. We're doing the fare hearings. We're
18 listening to what the--or what New Yorkers say, what
19 they think the fare raise or what other options they
20 might have. So, that is a matter for the board, and
21 what I do know, though, and what I will say is again
22 reiterate what we--we--we absolutely urgently need is
23 sustainable, affordable, predictable revenue streams
24 to come in not only to cover the operating
25 expenditure, which is the day-to-day fares, but also

2 to cover the capital cost of things like Fast
3 Forward. So, people often assume that a fare raise
4 is going to pay for Fast Forward. It isn't.
5 Congestion pricing is absolutely one of the
6 mechanisms that will pay for Fast Forward because it
7 will give us that predictable, substantial revenue
8 stream that we need. So, I'm very encouraged to see
9 that there is a real momentum I think now behind
10 congestion pricing. My answer would be that it's not
11 the panacea. It's not in itself. It doesn't cover
12 all of our needs. There will need to be other
13 options looked as well, and—and you as stakeholders
14 and with your colleagues in state government and the
15 feds for that matter all have a part to play in that.
16 And what I will—can also say is I lived in London
17 when the—when the congestion charge—charge was
18 brought in. It was striking to see the impact on day
19 one, absolute striking and I remember in the run-up
20 to the congestion charge being rolled out. There
21 siren voices people saying it's not going to work.
22 People won't pay it. People will cover up their
23 license plates. The cameras won't work. People will
24 get charged the wrong amount. Actually, it worked
25 remarkably efficiently, and I remember the first day

2 walking—I lived in Central London—seeing the streets
3 were practically empty. It was remarkable how well
4 it worked, and over time, though, the-the traffic
5 levels did rise up again a bit, but not the levels
6 they had been, and—and where London has succeeded is
7 that you have now a sweet spot between fewer vehicles
8 on the road because people don't want to pay the
9 congestion charge so that's good because there's less
10 congestion, less pollution, the buses can get through
11 the streets. But equally because a lot of people are
12 paying the congestion charge, that fee goes straight
13 to transit. It cannot be siphoned off for anything
14 else. It's lock-boxed to go to transport for London,
15 and that's the model that we should adopt. So,
16 again, I'm not saying congestion charging is the only
17 solution. We need more than that, but that's the
18 real answer to the MTA's funding woes.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I—I feel that
20 we've been selling the drink to New Yorkers for
21 decades that we will upgrade the transportation
22 system.

23 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, it's not the
25 first time. I can say that this time around in my

2 few decades to being here that this is like the more
3 concrete one.

4 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: At the beginning
6 of the 2000, MTA came around, and they—they say that
7 the—that the system up later by 2017--

8 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --and then in
10 2017, we were saying that it would 40 years. They
11 know--

12 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Because they
13 know what's being done.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --so this is
15 about the lack or control that is real because it's
16 based about coming over and over, and it's more or
17 less the lack of resources because the MTA also been
18 going through a lot of it. You know, and that we New
19 Yorkers who owe them money. So, I think that, you
20 know, we—I can see a great combination right now.

21 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: You as a leader
23 being able to accomplish something that you did for
24 the city to earn the trust. Now New Yorkers want to
25 see results.

2 ANDY BYFORD: Definitely.

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: The residents of
4 Staten Island they're saying: We need SBS, we need
5 DOT. It cannot be that the only train line that we
6 have there our buses are connected with the train

7 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, this is
9 something that is needed. It's important. As we
10 have in in our Vision Zero goal by 2030 to reduce to
11 zero the number of individuals being killed. When?
12 What is the year that we can say and this can be the
13 initial of the plan. We say all stations will be
14 accessible.

15 ANDY BYFORD: When? You're asking when
16 will they be? Will be able to that.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It voids--

18 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] So, so-right.

19 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It's almost as
20 you're saying can we maybe in your-your plan make a
21 lot of progress.

22 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But let me put it
24 this way: Diamond (sic) Street, and I said before if
25 you were someone with disability and you need to go

2 to 231st in the 1 Train, and you live in the Diamond
3 Houses, you know where you need to go? You need to
4 go take the A Train, the 1 Train where there's only
5 one elevator going downtown that's—that's there, and
6 the elevator (sic) needs to go to 96th Street.

7 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That's the next
9 station going downtown with the elevator.

10 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Going to 96th
12 Street in order to take that 1 Train back to go to
13 231st.

14 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And the thing is
16 they're frustrated, there are pieces about even to
17 put that elevator you need to fight and to also where
18 we have 900,000 New Yorkers who are on disability.

19 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, I think that,
21 you know, I'm ready to fight with my colleagues here
22 to say let's go—let's make the case. I'm bound to
23 say if there's a reapplying I see the lights in this
24 plan in order to say we need to raise the money. I
25 don't want to say only that it is the congestion. I

2 know that I don't know what the whole thing is about
3 in this establish, but it's all about it's one or the
4 other. I feel it should be both plans, congestion
5 and the taxes to the millionaires, but when it comes
6 to the-making the station accessible, do you think
7 that we should have year in our plan that we can say
8 in the next five years, of course, I know that
9 there's a plan for the next five years. When can we
10 promises New Yorkers that we're going to be working
11 to turn all stations as accessible as they should be?

12 ANDY BYFORD: Absolutely. So, so-right.
13 So, let me just unpack that a bit if I may and I'll
14 answer that question. You-you asked earlier why
15 should you trust, not you personally that certainly,
16 but you collectively, why-why should New Yorkers
17 trust the MTA because, you know, we heard it all
18 before, but the difference is it happens. You now
19 have fresh thinking. Why is it that the re-thinking
20 of the subway has been cut, the time line? Why is it
21 that that's being cut by 75%. 60 years to-to 10?
22 Because we are-we are approaching this in a different
23 way. We're saying that there is a different and
24 quicker way of doing it, and it could be quick to get
25 if UWB comes to pass. Why is it that suddenly we are

2 saying that we can get to more—no more than two stops
3 away from an accessible station within five years,
4 and be within striking distance of fully accessible
5 system within 10 years? Again, it's because of fresh
6 thinking and fresh thinking also includes things like
7 one of the reasons why elevator installations so much
8 is because the MTA has in the past tended to have
9 this spoke designs for each station, and in the
10 design itself I would argue is somewhat gold plated.
11 So one of the things I've instructed my team to do is
12 to come up with a robust still for purpose. We're
13 not talking about some cheap installation, but robust
14 cookie cutter design that we could say go in and
15 install one of those and just keep doing it,
16 contractor or contractors, just keep doing it. Work
17 along the line. Just keep doing it. Innovative
18 thinking like maybe even have modular construction
19 where the majority of the elevators the shaft, et
20 cetera is built off site and then you bring it in,
21 and rapidly fit it at the location. So, within that
22 ten-year timeframe, if you do the math we could have
23 the current 119 plus 50, plus 130. You will be
24 almost—almost complete of the 472 stations on New
25 York City Transit. I'd just like to make one other

2 point, and this is where you come in particularly
3 because you represent City Council and, therefore,
4 you represent communities within this great city.
5 The Fast Forward—being blunt, the Fast Forward plan
6 will grind to a halt if everything we try to do,
7 every installation we try to make, every elevators or
8 every substation because you need—you need to provide
9 more trains to get them—the benefit of new signaling,
10 you need to, basically your you can with new
11 signaling you can run more trains. In order to run
12 more trains, you need more power. In order to get
13 more power, you need more substations. The trouble
14 is no one wants a substation in their community.
15 Quite often, people don't want an elevator
16 installation on their corner. If we have to have a
17 six-month standoff for every single installation,
18 that plan will not happen within the time frame. So,
19 I-I absolutely have to make that point. I need your
20 help to do that, but if we—if we do bite the bullet
21 with the fresh thinking that I hope you see in front
22 of you, this is entirely achievable. This is our
23 golden opportunity if we pull together and co-fund
24 this project.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, I-I just
3 can know that probably as someone that had to go
4 through all the briefing, you know, before you
5 started from day 1 on running this agency, one
6 particular piece I would say that whoever gave the
7 briefing was not accurate. This is about Council
8 Members want to see elevators in this station, and
9 they vow and the support it. We've been down to put
10 capital to help on that one. What happened is that
11 when I asked let's say for elevators in Diamond's
12 (sic) transit, well, it takes \$25 million. What the
13 hell \$25 million bucks. What has to be changes on
14 procurement? What has to be changed and reasons
15 (sic) they have to be cut to reduce that amount? But
16 I feel that as again as we have a goal by 2030 of
17 reducing the number of people killed by car drivers
18 here. I think it is important if we also continue
19 looking at this plan, and this is a right direction
20 to go to see if we say that by 2040 all the stations
21 that we make all the stations accessible, you know,
22 and I'm just suggesting that you continue working
23 with your plan, but put a date, put a year on when we
24 should expect to talk to those advocates for the
25 disability of the community.

2 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Not only will we
4 see a number of stations being accessible now, but we
5 have a goal on when we complete and make all of them
6 accessible.

7 ANDY BYFORD: It's entirely within our
8 gift. It really is. We're—we—we as I've said, by
9 the 10-year mark, we would be within striking
10 distance of having made all of the stations
11 accessible. It would not take much longer to then
12 finish the job off. There may be the odd station
13 that is just physically impossible or because it
14 would require a tenement building to be demolished.
15 It would just be impossible, but I think it's
16 entirely within our gift to have that fully
17 accessible subway within pretty much that 10-year
18 time frame, and that—and so I didn't—I chose my words
19 carefully on that first day. You know as the
20 President of Transit, you know you are going to be
21 quoted. I was deliberately provocative in that
22 respect because, you know at the end of the day, this
23 is meant to be a bold vision. It's not meant to be
24 a—a sort of steady-as-she-goes plan. It's meant to
25 be, and let's hear from provocative and—and

2 transformative. So that--that was the reason I--I
3 listed a fully accessible transit system as one of
4 the four priorities that I described--

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
6 Okay.

7 ANDY BYFORD: --to you earlier.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And my last thing
9 before Council Member Koo and Richards has a
10 question, what I want to bring to your attention is
11 one piece related to the presentation on engagement
12 and empowerment in employment--employees.

13 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And my suggestion
15 is having in mind that New York City especially those
16 of us who are black and Latino when it comes to see
17 our people have an opportunity to go through
18 promotion in the leadership, and aside from me
19 starting up to say we have a great entering chair who
20 is Fernando Farray (sp?) but as an organization, they
21 are stronger than one individual, and I feel that
22 when it comes to a city where let's say Angelo Falcon
23 who died he just put it very well: New York City has
24 10,000 leadership positions and only 200 are Latino.

25 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And when you look
3 to agencies they say lack of black and Latino and
4 female and women in leadership positions. So, how
5 can in your leadership what should we expect to see
6 when it comes to that diversity--

7 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --in leadership
9 positions of the MTA

10 ANDY BYFORD: Okay. So, this is a subject
11 I feel very strongly about. I absolutely believe in
12 promotional merit. I don't believe in quotas because
13 I-I feel that quotas can rebound against you in that
14 they--they can be somewhat insulting to the people
15 that you're trying to help, but what I do think you
16 can do is take positive action on where there are two
17 people of equal merit up for one job and that--that
18 one of the people in that sum--in that competition
19 comes from an underrepresented group. That's the
20 definer and so if I'm--I always say actions speaker
21 louder than words. If I could just describe my time
22 and that Toronto Transit Commission, my previous job.
23 I--I arrived in 2012. There had never been a woman
24 ever on the Executive of the Toronto Transit
25 Commission since its inception in 1921. When I left

2 the TTC, the Executive was 50/50 men and women. How
3 did we do it? In exactly the way I just described.
4 Where there were candidates of equal merit, and that
5 was assigned both on gender and ethnicity. The
6 under-representative group got the—got the position.
7 Fast forward to our now New York City Transit, I said
8 to you earlier there had never been a person with a
9 disability, a visible disability on an executive.
10 There is now. I have a full-time accessibility
11 advisor. That is an innovative first for the MTA.
12 We have someone who himself is a wheelchair user. He
13 got the job on merit. The Chief Custom Officer a
14 female, the Chief People Officer, a female. We have
15 people from ethnic minorities on my executive. So,
16 again I stress that it's done on merit. I think it's
17 insulting to do otherwise, but I do believe in
18 positive action and you can expect that to continue
19 under my tenure.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: This the area
21 that you need to be ready for my kids to be pushed
22 back from me and many others because this isn't about
23 quota. This is about recognizing that we live in a
24 society where if you are Black and Latino, you don't
25 have the same opportunity.

2 ANDY BYFORD: No.

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: It doesn't matter
4 if you are—you can be a detective working a field,
5 but you're going to be doing the same job, and you
6 can see many faces of people being promoted. This is
7 part of New York City.

8 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: If you work in an
10 agency, you know, even though Latino is 29%, and
11 African-Americans are 27%, it doesn't translate into
12 their employment, (sic) governmental, or the private
13 sector even though the merit is there.

14 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, unless we
16 have that uncomfortable conversation, that we live in
17 the city where it still is segregated based on
18 opportunity in many fields, we will not address that
19 problem.

20 ANDY BYFORD: Understood.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But I hope that
22 you can look at it and, you know, with a fresh ear,
23 but there's a reality.

24 ANDY BYFORD: So--

25

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing] We
3 have people who are top engineers, top architecture.
4 They are ready to perform as the same as others, but
5 many times they are the first generation who are
6 professionals.

7 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: They don't have a
9 grandfather who was the profession the father needed,
10 and those people sometimes when it comes to
11 leadership I'm not talking about the low-the entry
12 jobs. We need to push that in the law, and as this
13 is important, you know, any pieces this is all about
14 running the transportation system efficient and safe-
15 -

16 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --getting the
18 first, the best men and women to do the job--

19 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --based on merit.

21 ANDY BYFORD: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But we need to
23 push in the same conversation of the merits to bring
24 leadership to every single seat to that we have at
25 the MTA.

2 ANDY BYFORD: Understood. So, I just
3 want to assure you, Chairman, and--and the best way I
4 can assure you is to look at my chat record as a
5 leader. If you look at the Executives I have set up,
6 they--they absolutely are diverse. I recognize the
7 benefits of diversity. I also believe that New York
8 City Transit should--its--its make up should reflect
9 the city that it serves. So, there's--again the
10 science behind why one-quarter of Fast Forward in
11 addition to the bus element the subway element, the
12 accessibility element. There are fourth--I could have
13 stopped there, but the fourth element is about
14 management of people. It's about leadership,
15 inspiration, development of people, and there is--
16 there are explicit commitments to furthering their
17 diversity cause within the Fast Forward Plan.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Thank you.
19 Council Member Koo followed by Council Member
20 Richards.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Chair and
22 thank you, President. I'm Councilman Koo. I'm from
23 Flushing, Queens. We have seven train stations--

24 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: --which is River
3 Base is railroad (sic) based stations. So, I want to
4 talk about something about the CBTC.

5 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: For most people they
7 don't know what CBTC stands for. So this is
8 Communications Based Train Control, right?

9 ANDY BYFORD: Correct.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So--so on April 5th,
11 2016, I attended a 7 Train town hall meeting hosted
12 by Council Member Van Bramer. During this meeting we
13 were given the hand-outs, which included information
14 on the communication based train control. On page 18
15 of the hand-out from the MTA states that the CBTC
16 installation will be complete by the end of next
17 year. The meeting was in 2016. The system was
18 supposed to be installed by the end of 2017. The
19 system is finally done and it's already 2018 now. My
20 questions--I have three questions. So, let me ask you
21 all of the questions first because of the time limit,
22 right. Why was the installation delayed by over a
23 year? The second question is during the first week
24 of CBTC, there were huge delays on the 7 Train. How
25 does the MTA plan on addressing this so that it

2 doesn't happen again? The third question is MTA
3 looking to increase the number of express routes for
4 Queens residents to alleviate congestion on the 7
5 Train, but personally I was delayed on the train a
6 few times. One time I was the second last out. I
7 would stay there. The train was stuck there for half
8 an hour of 15 minutes. You know, I can walk home,
9 you know, with that time, but I was just too tired to
10 walk, you know, and sometimes it stays stop at
11 Woodside, which is many stations away. You know, it
12 just stops there for a half hour. So, I don't—I
13 don't see why would the new system or the trains
14 often get delayed now. So how do you alleviate those
15 problems?

16 ANDY BYFORD: Okay. Those are all
17 extremely legitimate and very topical questions,
18 Councilman. So let me just answer those in turn, but
19 a little bit of—a tiny bit of background first of
20 all. If you recall, when I talked about the way that
21 we are approaching CBTC now and the way that we have
22 reduced the timeframe from what was talked from 50 to
23 60 years down to ten. One of the elements I talked
24 about was minimizing customization and min—and
25 simplifying interfaces, and the reason that's

2 relevant in my answer to you is that I think we have
3 have learned lessons from the way that the CBTC
4 installation has been done on Line 7, and the-going
5 forward, I-I want to do that a different way. The-
6 the-what any signal contractor will say to you is
7 it's-well, let me-let me put this a different way.
8 I'm saying to signal contractors if you've got a
9 signal system in Hong Kong, in Singapore, in London
10 in Berlin or wherever that works really well, I want
11 one of those, and my guarantee will be we won't try
12 and customize it and try to change it too much to-to-
13 to adapt it to our particular needs. I think one of
14 the complexities with the 7 Line, which has had
15 various challenges throughout its-its-its duration
16 not including the fact that Super Storm Sandy caused
17 quite a delay in the rollout of the Line 7 signaling.
18 I do think it's overly complicated. Now, we are
19 where we are. The job when I took over was to get
20 this thing across the line, and last week we finally
21 got the final cutover section done, but it is being
22 done in a very complex manner. It's a bit of an
23 amalgam between modern signaling, but still relying
24 on-on track circuits. It's-it's a bit technical, but
25 there's still what are called track circuits there.

2 Going forward, I want to use a different technology
3 called Axle Counters where you don't need track
4 circuits. It-and it takes out a lot of the
5 complexity, and a lot of the single points of
6 failure. So, the-it-I arrived too late to change
7 that for Line 7. Imminently I will be announcing the
8 appointment to New York City Transit of a world class
9 CBTC Practitioner who we're head hunting. We're
10 bringing him in. I should be able to announce him
11 imminently, and-and his mandate for me will be full-
12 minimize or roll out the rest of the CBTC, but make
13 sure we do it working with the contractor keeping it
14 simple. Not customizing things, minimizing the
15 interfaces. So, there are-there are reasons why it
16 was it was delayed by a year. I think the fact that
17 we have delays at the moment are indicative of the
18 fact there are still bugs in the software. I have
19 the contractor on speed dial. I speak to them once a
20 week every week, and we go through what remaining
21 deficiencies there are in the software that still
22 need to be addressed. Once they have stabilized that
23 software, which will happen in coming weeks, then we
24 can-it's not so much increased the express routes,
25 what we will look to do is do two more things. (1)

2 move to what's called Automatic Train Operation,
3 which is where the operator doesn't even drive the
4 train, the same as on the L Line. The—the operator
5 presses a start button and the train drivers
6 automatically. So, you get very easy space—very
7 regular space in between the trains, and it's no
8 secret, by the way, but L Line is by far the most
9 punctual on the New York City subway. It's by far
10 the—it's regularly 90% plus on-time running. So,
11 with 7 we'll get that. The other thing that we'll do
12 once this things is stabilized and in the spring
13 we're adding more trains. So, we'll be able to run
14 more trains on your—on Line 7. There will be more
15 line capacity.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: What about the
17 express bus service?

18 ANDY BYFORD: I don't--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [interposing] The
20 Queens.

21 ANDY BYFORD: Oh, I'm sorry. More—oh, I'm
22 sorry. Express Bus Route design. I think you meant
23 Express Routes on—on signaling.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah, Express Buses.

2 ANDY BYFORD: So, Express Bus-Express
3 Buses, every route and every borough bus network is
4 being redesigned over the next three years. We're
5 currently in the Bronx. Queens will be assessed, and
6 as part of that exercise, we will be looking to see
7 what-what stakeholder, what communities went by way
8 of more SBS. So, we are looking to roll out more
9 SBS. In fact, next year we will roll out five more
10 SBS routes largely around the L Line project, but
11 Queens we will listen to what the community wants.
12 If the community wants more SBS routes then that can
13 go into that thinking.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Yeah. Thank you for
15 your leadership.

16 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Council member
19 Richards followed by Council Member Miller and
20 Reynoso. I also would like to acknowledge that we
21 were joined by Council Member—we are joined by
22 Council Members Miller, Salamanca, Deutsch, Reynoso,
23 Levin, Levine, Espinal, Cabrera, Levin,
24 Constantinides, Lander and Menchaca.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you Chair
3 and thank you for holding this important hearing, and
4 thank you Mr. President for all the work that you're
5 doing. I want to congratulate you on coming up with
6 an actual plan. So, I want to move into—so in
7 October of this year there were about 56,139 delays.

8 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Does the MTA
10 study the impact of delays on revenue and—and if so,
11 can you speak to the correlation between delays and
12 revenue that's being lost whether it's to Lyft and
13 others or—or ride hails?

14 ANDY BYFORD: Not directly with revenue.
15 I mean we do, we do look to see if there's been a
16 correlation between ridership and revenue. So,
17 effectively that would be indirect because obviously
18 if your ridership drops then you would have an
19 adverse impact on revenue. But the—the main thrust
20 has been to identify the root cause of those delays,
21 and then to progressively assign corrective actions
22 against each of them such that we can eliminate them.
23 And so, we have different parts of—of actions against
24 each of the—the delay categories, but, you know,
25 undoubtedly there is a—there is a linkage between

2 unreliable service and ridership as if you just don't
3 think you're going to get reliable service, there is
4 a real risk that you will migrate to something else.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
6 But you will see a decrease in revenue because less
7 people are riding?

8 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah, if-if people migrated
9 onto other means such Uber, for example, then you
10 would see a decline in revenue. So, you have to
11 address that, and-and arrest it.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And is there a
13 correlation between fare hikes and fare evasions? So
14 I want to hop into that because I did hear some of
15 your comments this morning on fare evasions, and I'm
16 just interested in hearing a little bit more about
17 that. In the past has the MTA looked at the
18 correlation between fare hikes and fare evasion?

19 ANDY BYFORD: Well, I think it-I think
20 just logically if-ore the higher the fare goes, the
21 more risk you run of people saying I just can't
22 afford it, but-but it's-but for which-for which
23 reason I think it's encouraging, very encouraging.
24 We very much welcome the action taken by City Council
25 to introduce the Fair Fares Policy so that people on

2 the lower incomes do benefit and rightly so—do
3 benefit from a reduced fare. You know, evading the
4 fare really shouldn't be the option because you're
5 putting yourself at risk of arrest if you do. So,
6 there should be a lower fare available to people on
7 lower incomes and we very much welcome the action you
8 took to address that.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, we agree
10 that addressing the fare—fare evasion issues largely
11 needs to be—not that it's such, it's Fair Fares and
12 solutions such as that, correct?

13 ANDY BYFORD: That—that plus how they
14 call enforcement. I mean you—you still have to have
15 enforcement because it's not—it's not accurate to say
16 that all fare evasion is by people that can't afford
17 it.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, and—and so
19 where do you—how do you make that that judgment call?

20 ANDY BYFORD: Um, well, I mean in terms
21 of the draft report--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
23 Yeah, the data that backs that up.

24 ANDY BYFORD: Well, I think there's a—
25 there's a limit to how much you can continue to ask

2 people to pay more. I—I think that's, you know,
3 that's a—a safe statement to make that obviously
4 people can—can only afford to pay so much. That and—
5 and it's for board to just—to—to determine against
6 the backdrop of the—of the MTA's funding requirements
7 the tipping point, and whether that's being reached.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: And so, take me
9 through what your station managers or whomever would
10 oversee this process. I read that you'll—they'll
11 block entrances. Is that correct?

12 ANDY BYFORD: Sure. That—so that was my
13 suggestion. What—what we're aiming to do is—is to
14 show New Yorkers the vast majority of whom do pay
15 their fares, that we aren't just passively saying oh,
16 well, never mind, fare evasions are phenomenon across
17 the world. It just happens. I—I don't think that's
18 fair to the people that pay. So, what I'm advocating
19 and it's something that we've done, and I've
20 certainly participated in the UK and in Australia, is
21 that we would on a rolling basis have senior
22 managers. You know, the volunteers, people that want
23 to do it--and I'm—I'm saying that I will do it—stand
24 on gateways to just greet customers to—to be—to be
25 visibly there to act as a deterrent to people who are

2 chancing fare evasion. I, you know, it's getting
3 that balance right, absolutely being sensitive to
4 those people that can't afford the fare, and again,
5 it's good that there's an option for them now. But
6 equally, we can't just give the impression to those
7 people that do pay that we're not taking action and,
8 thereby--

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
10 Okay, I have a few--just to wrap it up. So, it is
11 your belief, and I think we--I'm hearing a commonality
12 here that jailing low-income [bell] black and brown
13 largely New Yorkers for a low-level offense, which
14 puts them back in the system, which eventually means
15 that they won't be able to gain access to a job,
16 which then means that to even get to a job
17 appointment, you would need to have a job or-or
18 access to-to money to actually get in the system.
19 So, I just want to be--point out that we should be
20 very cautious--

21 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] I agree.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --in putting
23 that message out--

24 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] I agree.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --because the
3 revolving system means that they'll never pay, and
4 that will be permanent as we create an under cast
5 system--

6 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] I agree

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --which is
8 already being created in New York City--

9 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Sir--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: --will
11 permanently mean that they will never be able to get
12 on the train, and my last question is do-do you
13 believe that--so we pay for a service. When you pay
14 for a service, that means you should get the service,
15 correct? So, if you go out and you buy a product,
16 you would hope that that product works, correct?

17 ANDY BYFORD: Absolutely, 100%.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, if your
19 train systems are not largely working, should New
20 Yorkers have to pay for something that's broken and
21 not necessarily working?

22 ANDY BYFORD: Okay, so I just want to
23 make one final point on--in--in response to your
24 previous point. I--I do understand we must be
25 desperately careful to get the balance right between

2 making sure that, you know, we're not just saying to
3 people who do pay it doesn't matter if people don't
4 because that--that's not fair to the--to the people
5 that do pay, but equally be very, very careful and--
6 and we will be explicit in our instruction or
7 direction to the NYPD to be very, very careful not to
8 target certain communities. I cannot stress that
9 enough. You have my commitment, and word about that.
10 (sic)

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
12 But we have no guarantee that that would happen so--

13 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Well, well, so
14 that--that--that would be a matter for the police. So,
15 we will--but--but we will be very careful to--to not
16 give the wrong signal. So, you know, I say that in
17 public, in public for it. Actually, that is not--
18 that--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
20 Has that signal already been sent?

21 ANDY BYFORD: --that is not our
22 intention.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: So, we should
24 just--

2 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] That is not
3 our intention.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Okay, okay.

5 ANDY BYFORD: But in terms of should
6 people not pay if they don't get the service that
7 they expect. I think we've just got to be careful
8 there because you will if you're not—if you're not
9 careful you will end up in a massive downward spiral
10 because people they're not paying means there's less
11 money to provide service, which means service
12 degrades, which means even fewer people pay, which
13 means service degrades even further. No one, I'm
14 sure, you saw some—some of that.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [interposing]
16 Got you. This is the last question before the
17 Chairman kicks me off, though. So, should people
18 receive a fare hike? Last question: fare hike when
19 service is horrible. Should we—I've never seen a
20 scenario where we mark up the price on a—for example,
21 a lemon, would you mark up the price on a—a lemon. A
22 lemon is considered a hoop deal, a horrible car.
23 Would you mark the price—price up on a lemon times
24 five if the lemon could barely start? Would you
25 charge people the amount for a Mercedes Benz, the—the

2 same amount of a lemon? So, the point I'm getting at
3 is that the service has been horrible. It's not
4 been—I mean we've seen some modest improvements, but
5 to mark—to say we should now do a fare hike on the
6 back on New Yorkers when service where we still saw
7 56,000 delays in October I think is—is a poor move,
8 and it doesn't show that we are getting at the crux
9 of the issue, and that we're going to continue to
10 charge and increase fares on the backs of New Yorkers
11 who largely—the majority who are doing these fare
12 evasions can't afford a fare hike, but to say we
13 should now incorporate a fare hike rather than
14 getting at the—the systematic issues one within the
15 MTA, but secondly looking at the other scenarios such
16 as congestion pricing, the millionaires tax, whatever
17 scenarios we want to play with, but to say we should
18 do a fare hike—a fare hike at this point when the
19 product has been doing what it's supposed to do, I
20 think is—is a poor judgment call. So, that's my
21 opinion.

22 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Okay, so
23 there are two points on that. One, a fare hike
24 whether we have one or not is not a—is not something
25 that I can determine. That is a matter for the MTA

2 Board, and that that decision will only be taken once
3 the fare hearings have been concluded and once the
4 various public feedback has been received. That is a
5 matter for the board. That's not a judgement call by
6 me. Secondly, though, you—you slightly preempted
7 what I would have said, which is what—what we really
8 need is sustainable, affordable, predictable,
9 sufficient revenue streams.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
11 Councilman. Let me interject with two questions
12 before call Council Member Miller. On the CBTC—on
13 the 7 Train, and—and it's—the question is more to see
14 if you can give some light to what happened. Even
15 after the signal system was already the new one put
16 in place on the 7 Line--

17 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --there was an
19 announcement going to be late. Were you able to look
20 at that delay? Were you able to correct--

21 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Sure.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --and can you
23 explain to us what happened in Queens that day when,
24 you know, as anything you have is in place, there is
25 also space for readjustment. So, where did the New

2 York Signal System fail or needed to be improved in
3 the 7 Line that produced that delay?

4 ANDY BYFORD: Okay. So, can I just be
5 clear. Are you talking about a specific failure or
6 general problems that we've had on the subway?

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: General on the 7
8 Line.

9 ANDY BYFORD: General. Okay. So, there—
10 there have been a number of problems on the 7 Line in
11 its first week of—of operations since it was—since
12 the final cutover happened. Some were not CBTC
13 related. We had a fatality one afternoon. We had
14 switch failure on another occasion, which were
15 nothing to do with the CBTC system, but others
16 absolutely were to do with it. The primary problem
17 that we've been experiencing there's—there's one
18 particular signal that—that is giving us problems
19 that's has the contractor working on. The second
20 problem relates to what's called a loss of
21 localization, which is where the computer, because
22 this is a—basically a computer driven system. The—
23 the way this—the modern signaling works, the—the
24 computer must know where trains are in proximity to
25 the each other, and what their relative speed is

2 because that's how you maintain safe distance. You
3 need to know where—where a train is in—in—in
4 comparison to the one in front or the one behind, and
5 what the—what the speed is that they're doing. So, a
6 number of trains were losing what's called
7 localization particularly around 34th Street on the
8 west side of Manhattan. We how have work around
9 that. That problem will be fixed with a further
10 software drop on the 15th of December, but—and we've—
11 we've identified what the problem is with the
12 contractor, and that problem is now contained.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And—and with
14 Access-A-Ride that is so important especially for the
15 community that with disability. We know when we look
16 at the MTA they reported that Access-A-Ride have \$392
17 million in service contract in 2017, and anticipate
18 that service of contract will reach \$548 million in
19 2022, an increase of nearly 40%. Between '22 and
20 2016, Paratransit trade have also grown. So, with
21 that increase, with that services that in the past,
22 again, it was something that there was no trust--

23 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --and we had to
25 deal with that—with cleaning those dirty clothes

2 because this is about here we are a new idea, a new
3 approach, but understanding that people are
4 frustrated, have been frustrated.

5 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, with, with
7 the pilot of E-hail program costing nearly half as
8 much as Access-A-Ride, is the MTA still expecting new
9 application for the pilot and does the MTA have any
10 plan to expand the E-Hail Pilot?

11 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah. So, the issue with
12 the E-Hail is that the actual unit cost of an E-Hail
13 ride is around 50% of a big van ride. So, the—the big
14 vans that you see driving around New York cost double
15 the amount of an E-Hail ride. So, in theory, people
16 would say well that's great. E-Hail is a massive
17 cost saving. However, for—for valid reasons it is
18 extremely popular because it does give people
19 spontaneity. It does mean that they can, you know,
20 call up an E-Hail ride and enjoy the benefits that
21 other people can enjoy, and—and why not, but—but that
22 does mean that demand is surging. The pilot that we
23 currently have, which is unlimited for the
24 participants. We have a number of participants in the
25 trial. They are not limited in the numbers of rides

2 that they can call for, that they can request, and
3 the-the-the demand is surging such that the-the
4 actual dollar amount has exceeded what we would have
5 now paid for the big van rides. So, we're still
6 evaluating that. No decision has been taken. We
7 definitely need to seek further funding in order to
8 do what we want to do and definitely what the
9 community wants to do. There is an absolute clear
10 demand from the community to not only maintain E-Hail
11 but to expand it. That comes at a cost, and we would
12 like to find ways of accommodating that demand.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great, and I got
14 to say to my only Spanish speaking audience, and
15 since Spanish is my only-is my native language.
16 [Speaking Spanish] With that, Council Member Miller
17 followed by Council Member Reynoso. [background
18 comments]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Chair
20 Rodriguez and President Byford. Good to see you and
21 your-your team as well. So, I obviously I-I echo the
22 sentiments of all of my colleagues about the
23 Transit's new ambitious Fast Forward Plan, but it
24 also comes with a-with a bit of skepticism because I
25 spent 25 years in the Authority as well as had the

2 opportunity to work in Washington's Metro Bart CTA,
3 and even TTC as well as in Toronto. I've seen
4 changes or the lack thereof, and—and what I'm
5 concerned with here, honestly I think we can
6 absolutely accomplish this on so many points if we
7 had the type of cooperation that is—that is
8 necessary, but my concern is—is the time table of—of
9 the plan, and whether or not—we—we—we are neglecting
10 the state of good repair, whether or not we are
11 putting certain communities over others, and my
12 colleagues mentioned transportation equity.
13 Transportation is the great equalizer, and there are
14 communities such as the one that I represent, Council
15 Member Richards that this was a two-hour commute out
16 for me this morning. It was an hour and 40-minute
17 commute here to City Hall one way. One would think
18 that those communities, those transportation deserts
19 would be the priority. This plan does not prioritize
20 Southeast Queens and other communities such as that,
21 and—and I'm not going to touch too much on trains,
22 but it does not include the J Train, which
23 supplements the E, the F, the L, which is going on
24 now. It runs on a regular local line. I think that
25 we can do because of its—has not reached its

2 capacity. One of the few lines. There is more that
3 we can do with that that would impact the other
4 lines. I want to talk about buses. The--the--the
5 depot that--that's in the Capital Plan hopefully we'll
6 see it knocked down in the next few months--

7 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: --service is
9 about 75% of Southeast Queens riding community.
10 Everybody takes a bus to the train, but we can't get
11 there for so many reasons. You have the oldest, the
12 most antiquated depot in the system. I read in one
13 of your reports that the duty time of the buses were
14 12 years. At Jamaica Depot, one-third of the--of the
15 fleet is from 1998.

16 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Right. They leak
18 when it rains, and it's a problem. On the other
19 side, as we procure new equipment, it seems to me
20 that we are more focused on customer amenities WiFi
21 than safety. The Chair had mentioned Vision Zero
22 whether or not we have the property mirrors, whether
23 we have the oil system that many fleets have that ask
24 people to step away from the bus as they make turns.
25 These are the things that we should be focusing on to

2 keep safe, but I also notice that the older models
3 seat 43. The ones that have been purchased over the
4 past five years seat 36, seat 31, seat 34, which
5 impacts load guidelines and the amount of people that
6 the you can sit on there. As to Councilman Richards
7 mention-mentioned loss of revenue. We have the
8 largest proliferation of commuter vans, dollar vans,
9 underground transportation systems simply because
10 people can't access buses. And so that's-not only is
11 it a serious loss of revenue, but it is denying
12 people-while other folks are getting ferries and
13 trollies and all these other things, it appears that
14 there are other communities that their transportation
15 options are illegal and unlawful dollar vans. And so
16 how do we address that?

17 ANDY BYFORD: Okay, I didn't quite catch
18 the question, but I was just checking on it.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: [interposing]
20 How do we-how-how-how do we make up for the loss of
21 service that we have here that-that is obviously
22 going? You mentioned Lyft, but in this case we have
23 a proliferation of illegal vans that carry people--

24 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Absolutely.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: --unsafely
3 throughout the city.

4 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah. Okay, I-I might just
5 comment there just generally on one the points you
6 made at the start. In terms of community equity the
7 Fast Forward Plan it may not be overt as it-it should
8 have been, but it is designed to be equitable across
9 the whole of the city in that. The elevators will be
10 installed across the whole of New York all five
11 boroughs. The bus improvements are-are meant to
12 address the whole of the five boroughs by the-the
13 redesigns, the--the borough redesigns that we do.
14 New vehicles will be spread throughout the five
15 boroughs. Station renovations will be [bell]
16 undertaken throughout the five boroughs, and even the
17 CBTC. I get the point that you make about save the J
18 in some of the extremities, but (a) don't forget what
19 I said if EWB is a goer, then we might be able to do
20 things more quickly; and (b) people who live in some
21 of those communities will still benefit from when
22 they hit the core section, which has been addressed.
23 And in terms of focus on amenities, I agree with you.
24 Absolutely state of good repair is job one. I've
25 always said that. In every job I've done, state of

2 good repair should take precedence over expansion,
3 and it should most certainly take its--precedence
4 over nice to have aesthetics if you like. So,
5 certainly new buses we're not fitting as they come
6 into service will be fitted with things like turn
7 announcements on them. The dollar vans are a--are an
8 issues. I mean I understand why they're there. What
9 we need to do is redesign the bus provision such that
10 we make bus travel exponentially more attractive so
11 that it's affordable. The vehicles are modern, the
12 service is frequent, the service is reliable, and
13 that you get vehicles commensurate with the demand.
14 So we know that Jamaica Depot does need to be
15 reconstructed. I was just checking that that is
16 being awarded. That will be awarded in 2020. The--we
17 know that depot--that depot is an absolute priority
18 for New York City Transit to get it reconstructed
19 such that your community gets the vehicles it
20 deserves.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Could I just--
22 Chair, just finally, we talked about enforcement.
23 Right now New York City Transit police don't have
24 oversight on buses, and so an incident occurs and--and
25 we have to--although you're transmitting with Radio

2 Command Center, they then coordinate with NYPD. Why
3 not New York City Transit and have dedicated folks.
4 As he said, the Chair--

5 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: --buses--if the
7 main transportation hub cannot get to the curb
8 because vans are parked there, people are forced to
9 load and unload in the middle of the street in the
10 rain and the snow, and on top of that, to add insult
11 to injury and irony, that's bus lane. And so, they
12 come out, and they're debating whether or not they--
13 they ticket for being in a bus lane or standing or
14 parking or whatever it is. There has to be some
15 continuity around enforcement and--and it really has
16 to happen now. So, what I was saying in terms of the
17 plan, I get the plan, but are we putting the--the
18 chronological line of the plan above of the needs of
19 the community that had the highest need, and--and I'd
20 like to see that take off.

21 ANDY BYFORD: Sure, and you make a very
22 valid point. Sarah and I attended a town hall in
23 Jamaica fairly recently, and I saw first hand the
24 issue called by the dollar vans. I saw them all lined
25 up, and I've heard first hand from both customers and

2 form operators about the problems that can be—can be
3 caused by them. For example the fact that they also
4 just can't get to the curb. So, we are looking at
5 different options with police. At the moment the
6 precincts deal with street level policing rather than
7 MTA police or the Transit Bureau, but it's something
8 that's very much a hot topic within the organization
9 right now. It's on my to-do list. We are determined
10 to make things better at places like Parsons/Archer
11 where I was just the other day with Sarah where we
12 looked at what was going on with the dollar vans. So,
13 rest assured that doesn't need the Fast Forward Plan.
14 It doesn't need five years. It certainly doesn't
15 need 10 years. It's something that we're focused on
16 right now, and I'd be happy to keep you apprised on—
17 on how we're going with dealing with that.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

19 Thanks. You know what is—what we're missing in that
20 piece is to be concrete as all pieces of your plan.

21 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What New York, as
23 you know, we will increase the signal system--

24 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] I understand.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --but this number
3 in this lane. How many minutes will--from--from
4 traffic will be designated to enforce in bus lanes.
5 People like--people need to hear that.

6 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Because what
8 happens is that if we live and say NYPD will be
9 enforcing, will do the enforcement. Put it in a
10 survey. Do you feel that the men and women of the
11 NYPD should be responding go a crime or enforcing in
12 the bus lane.

13 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

14 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: All of us were
15 saying the crimes. So, my thing and that's my
16 suggestion that as you are able to put your number
17 say because the large numbers of people they're not
18 paying their fare when they get into the bus. We are
19 losing close to \$300 million. Well, how can we use
20 \$50 million, or I mean \$50 million of those to
21 enforce using technology and other things?

22 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

23 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: So, if we are
24 able to do an assessment, you know, that say, as I
25 said before with the impact or the lack of

2 enforcement in the bus lane, and we've translated
3 those hours that people are losing to go to work, to
4 go to school, to go any place, any destination. I
5 feel that we can work together, and support the
6 creation of dedicated bus traffic enforcement units
7 to be able to—after anyone who block a bus.

8 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And it's not a
10 creation of a unit, which I would—which I call for at
11 least to be specific.

12 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: To come back as
14 you're going to be moving in the—the approving of the
15 budget, and say we had this conversation with NYPD
16 and from now on there's going to be 50 men and women
17 only dedicated to enforcement. Unless that happens,
18 people will not trust because there had not been
19 enforcement when it comes to drivers blocking buses,
20 and because of that, we've been seeing a reduction of
21 riders using buses. It's not because of Uber. It's
22 not because of Lyft. It's because it takes so long--

23 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --for the bus to
3 go to the destination. So, whatever we can do, and I
4 know that that's experience.

5 ANDY BYFORD: Understood.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: But I'm calling
7 to create a-a dedicated bus traffic enforcement unit
8 as a solution to know who are responsible to go after
9 those drivers who are blocking our-our lane everyday.

10 ANDY BYFORD: May I just comment on that,
11 Mr. Chairman--the and just put your mind at rest. I
12 mean the job one for me was to get the plan out, and
13 to get it socialized to go out, which we've done, and
14 to to-to wet New Yorkers' appetite for that plan, and
15 I think we've largely been successful on that basis.
16 It's received a very good response from the advocacy
17 groups. It's received generally a very positive
18 reaction from stakeholder groups from customers
19 actually at town halls, but we absolutely know that
20 to make the case, we need to-to-to really make the
21 case we need to do a couple of things. Number one,
22 we need to make sure that we've really nailed the
23 case for the associated budget, the finances and we
24 need to give assurance that the figures are robust
25 and that they're well thought through, and that you

2 can trust them, and that you can hold them to us. And
3 number 2, to your point and—and your—and the comments
4 you just made. We are now quantifying thee benefits
5 the various elements of Fast Forward will bring.
6 Some of them are fairly obvious because we can say
7 definitively that within five years you could be no
8 more than two stops from an accessible station, which
9 is a strong statement and—and definitive. But what
10 we really want to do is things like if we get this
11 line converted to CBTC, this is the impact on you as
12 an individual. It will mean you get a train every X
13 minutes instead of the current every Y minutes. In
14 other words, we'll be increasing the trains per hour
15 by whatever percent. Typically, it's around 10%. We
16 would—to your point about bus lanes, I think you—you
17 make a valid point. It would be good if we would be
18 able to quantify, if this bus on this route, if the
19 bus lane was entirely clear end-to-end the journey
20 time reduction would be X number of minutes. So I
21 think that's a good suggestion.

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]

23 Okay.

24 ANDY BYFORD: With that—with that we
25 should be able to quantify and it was always on our

2 to-do list to come up with that quantifiable data as
3 part of the selling case in the Seminole (sic) run-up
4 to the—to the budget discussions in Albany in the
5 spring. We're on the case.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. Thank you.
7 Council Member Reynoso followed by Council Member
8 rose.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you,
10 Chair. Thank you, President Byford for being here.
11 It's always good to see a state laid-let agency show
12 up to the City Council first and foremost. I—I want
13 to say—ask a couple of questions. The first is your
14 concern about having to—to take on let's say a six-
15 month timeline to install and elevator due to like a—
16 I guess an ULURP processes or some type of processes
17 that—that are slowing down. In your state of
18 emergency, do you not have the authority to move
19 forward with the building of let's say elevators for
20 accessibility without consent or—or—or the need to
21 get authority from I guess the Council or from the
22 Mayor or from the state?

23 ANDY BYFORD: No, to assert—the—what if
24 the state of emergency, you know, 168 gave us the
25 ability to expedite procurement so that you could—you

2 could fast track certain elements of procurement and
3 fast track certain elements of gaining more
4 authority, but that did not circumvent or replace the
5 normal consultation timelines, which we would
6 normally have to follow with local communities. So,
7 that—that—that's why I made the point I did earlier.
8 We would still need your help to make that happen.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: So, I just want
10 to first say I'm here letting you know that every
11 elevator you want to build in my district I will do
12 everything I can to make sure that you have full
13 authority to do it as you wish.

14 ANDY BYFORD: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: If you want to
16 start in Williamsburg and Bushwick and Ridgewood, you
17 have full authority. I will never stop you from
18 doing one. It's the right thing to do and we
19 shouldn't be bureaucratizing you to a place where you
20 can't get things done.

21 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Another thing
23 that I just want to make not to you, the fare evasion
24 situation is a problem especially for communities of
25 color. Not because people shouldn't be paying their

2 fare. There's a car culture here in the city of New
3 York where having a car has you at a certain standard
4 or—or you're held to a different—a different
5 standard. If you cover your license plate and you
6 run over a toe, the worst case scenario you would get
7 is a ticket from a police officer. If you're a black
8 kid and you jump over the turnstile, the worse thing
9 you can get is going to jail--

10 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: --and there
12 seems to be an inequity as to how we deal with fare
13 evasions depending on where you are, whether you're
14 taking the train or whether you're in a vehicle and
15 crossing over the GW or the George Washington Bridge
16 for example. So, understand that these equity issues
17 really are a concern for us because we're not
18 targeting more affluent car owners, but instead
19 targeting mostly young people of color. So that is
20 the equity issue is the problem, not necessarily the
21 fact that you need your money. I want to ask related
22 to your issues on the congestion pricing. Obviously,
23 we have nothing to do here. That's a state issue.
24 The state has to agree to do it. We've already
25 actually had a quite unanimous program within the

2 Council for you to get your congesting pricing to
3 move forward. I want to ask is there something else
4 that you might--is congestion pricing the answer to it
5 all? And if not, what else can we do to be helpful
6 in our capacity as the City Council?

7 ANDY BYFORD: Okay.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yeah.

9 ANDY BYFORD: Sure. So, on congestion
10 pricing will--will go a long way to--to helping our
11 needs. It will provide a revenue, a regular--sorry--
12 revenue stream which would likely be absolutely
13 dedicated to transit. It couldn't be syphoned off
14 for anything else. It will be lockbox to provide a
15 specific to find out what's in back of that. (sic).

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [interposing]
17 You say that. I just want to--you say that it's got to
18 be lockbox, but what's the guarantee?

19 ANDY BYFORD: Well, I'm sorry. I should
20 caveat that. My belief is it should be--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [interposing]
22 Okay, so touched then. (sic)

23 ANDY BYFORD: --and money then, which I
24 think is good practice is it was. So, London has had
25 the confidence that the congestion charge they were

2 paying could not go anywhere else. It had to go into
3 London's transport system and it did. So, that's--

4 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [interposing]

5 So, this is the State of New York, though. I just
6 want to be clear.

7 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Well--

8 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: They like to
9 take money and move it around to its priority.

10 ANDY BYFORD: So, I'm not—I'm not making
11 a political comment. I'm giving you my professional
12 opinion.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay. I
14 appreciate that.

15 ANDY BYFORD: And will that, though,
16 suffice? No, and that will not in itself in
17 isolation cover the totality of what's required for
18 both Fast Forward and the broader--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Yes.

20 ANDY BYFORD: --MTA and even New York
21 City Transit State of Good Repair funding issues. We--
22 we still will need other mechanisms, and--and, you
23 know, obviously that's more of a--a decision for
24 stakeholders and some--some of it equally we can
25 generate ourselves. We need to be looking

2 imaginatively at different delivery models. We need
3 to be looking at different funding mechanism whereby
4 we—we might be able to raise more through bonds or
5 through other—other procurement methodologies that
6 would—would contribute to the overall figure, but
7 I've heard various proposals bandied about. It will
8 be ready for stakeholders to determine which are the
9 most appropriate. All I know is--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [interposing]
11 Okay.

12 ANDY BYFORD: --we need more money.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Okay, so you are
14 going to need more money, and the last thing I'll
15 leave you with is the enforcement on bus lanes it
16 speaks back to our car culture. There's a privilege
17 [bell] that drivers in the city of New York--

18 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: --drive around
20 with. That makes this so that running over a red—a
21 red painted bus lane or double parking is just a
22 privilege that and a blind privilege that they drive
23 around with, and you—it's not your fault. It's a New
24 York City infrastructure problem. We also have
25 issues in our leadership here in the Administration

2 that doesn't understand that. So, while we want the
3 buses to move, so long as we continue to endorse and
4 support car culture, it's going to be very hard. So,
5 just saying it's not all your fault. You're doing
6 everything you can. Enforcement won't necessarily
7 work. It truly is about breaking car culture, but I
8 thank you for your time here, and thank you, Chair,
9 for this--

10 ANDY BYFORD: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: --for this
12 hearing. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
14 you. Council Member Rose.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. That
16 took as long as it takes a commuter to get to Staten
17 Island on the Express Bus.

18 ANDY BYFORD: [laughs]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'm sorry.

20 President Byford, I think last night you heard a
21 resounding cry that Staten Islanders don't want a
22 fare hike or a toll hike. Staten Islanders feel
23 that, you know, that if there's--if the services were
24 delivered, then it would warrant an increase, but the
25 lack of service does not warrant an increase, and the

2 bridge toll is already ridiculously high and that we
3 shouldn't be paying to subsidize other systems. So,
4 the complaints that we've heard about the Fast
5 Forward Bus tracking is that people have to walk on
6 busy streets with unpaved walkways to bus stops that
7 are, you know, really far distances, and it creates a
8 problem for people who have mobility issues. Our
9 rides have increased 60 minutes each way, which makes
10 it 120-minute increase than it was before especially
11 the Midtown routes, the Fifth Avenue route, the X14
12 and that we need more buses because people are
13 standing now on the buses, and the afternoon
14 schedules start or resume too late that people who
15 are religious observers, people can't get home in
16 time for the Sabbath before sundown. So, while I
17 have to say, I have to give you credit you've been
18 responsive to our constituent complaints as we relay
19 them, and some adjustments have been made. It just
20 seems as if the changes were made without enough
21 input from—from the commuters. For example, we were
22 constantly asking and calling MTA to put notices on
23 the buses that, you know, about the changes, about
24 the hearings and—and everyday, we would get, you
25 know, feedback that there were not notices on the

2 buses that people were actually taking to work that
3 would have informed them of the changes. So, I want
4 to know how many people ride the Express Buses to and
5 from Staten Island and how many did we hear from
6 during this process when you were formulating the
7 plan? And if in hindsight in retrospect do you think
8 that the plan was rolled out before you really
9 addressed the riders' concerns, and how many
10 complaints have you received and, you know, to what
11 extent have you tried to address them?

12 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And if, in fact,
14 there were any lessons that you've learned from, you
15 know, the fallout from Staten Island Express Bus
16 riders, and have you formulated a way to do better
17 outreach with the redesign of the systems for--for the
18 other boroughs?

19 ANDY BYFORD: Sure. Okay, so thank you
20 for the question, and I--I enjoyed being back on
21 Staten Island last night, and yeah, absolutely I
22 heard what--what people had to say and that was the
23 whole purposed of what is at the end of the day a
24 town hall. So, there are 36--I think it's 36,000 trips
25 that are taken daily on Staten Island Express Buses.

2 So, that's trips. That's not individuals, but that's
3 trips. So, it might be returning any sort of
4 community.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] So
6 that's buses going back and forth?

7 ANDY BYFORD: Yeah, sure so 36,000 trips
8 and while I don't have the exact number to hand we're
9 just checking to see if we can get the complaints
10 number, and you asked how many people did we consult?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yeah.

12 ANDY BYFORD: Again, I'd have to take
13 that on notice, but I came into this process about
14 halfway through, and certainly if my experience is I
15 need to go by, I went to a number of the town halls
16 that we had numbered the consultative sessions, and-
17 and I would say that we-I can confidently say we
18 consulted with certainly thousands of people in
19 various ways. There were people who were consulted
20 face-to-face at various community centers on Staten
21 Island, and through various other media. Do-would we
22 do things differently? I think what has to be said
23 is this is the first we've ever done this. We-we've
24 set out to respond to what we were hearing from both
25 Staten Islanders, elect-to a certain extent elected

2 officials, but certainly from operators themselves
3 [bell] who were telling us that there was an
4 overriding desire to change the bus network to make—
5 to make it quicker to get off the island because each
6 of the—of the average—the average number of stops to
7 get off the island is something like 27. So, the
8 buses went on this hugely circuitous routes around
9 the island before you even departed the island, and
10 that was frustrating people. So, we aimed to
11 straighten some of the routes. What was also
12 frustrating people was the—what happened when the
13 buses got to Manhattan, that there was a feeling that
14 the buses didn't adequately serve Midtown or West
15 Street, and that they got hopelessly caught up going
16 around the loop at the south side of Central Park,
17 which is why—why the—the—redesign happened in the way
18 it was. Did we get everything right? Well, I think
19 the evidence would suggest no we didn't because while
20 there's a lot of people who have said they do like
21 the new service and typically you don't hear from
22 them, there is—there is definitely still a vociferous
23 group that don't like the new service that feel for
24 them the service has degraded. We can point to the
25 fact that the average speed of the bus network has

2 increased. We can point to the fact that the
3 punctuality has--has improved, but I recognize that
4 for some people they don't see that, and that's why
5 we're continuing to make changes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: You know, I-I-I
7 would-I would agree with you if it was a small number
8 of people that were--were dissatisfied, and if we were
9 just talking about the fact that their walk to the
10 bus stop increased, you know, somewhat, but we're
11 talking about the elimination of that whole Midtown
12 route, and that people's ride has increased
13 exponentially over what they were getting home
14 before, and that there are a lack of buses in the
15 evening where the service started earlier in the
16 afternoon, that doesn't exist. So, we've taken, you
17 know, we--you've done a wonderful job with the
18 circuitous routes, but by eliminating them, it just
19 seems as if you streamlined the--the--the pro--the bus
20 routes to save costs and not really looking at what
21 the need was for the ridership, and, you know, and I--
22 I don't know. Have you saved any costs?

23 ANDY BYFORD: No, if that---

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: -by these--

2 ANDY BYFORD: No, no, no, no. it's
3 actually costing us more, and-and so that the primary
4 driver wasn't actually to save costs. The primary
5 driver was to-to attempt to streamline the-the routes
6 and to-to give-to have a fresh look at the network to
7 give people what they wanted now in 2018 rather than
8 route network that was designed years ago, and
9 arguably was no longer fit for the purpose, which is
10 effectively the philosophy behind the whole of the
11 bus redesigns. So, I thought--

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] So,
13 why are-why are people standing on the buses? I-I
14 mean in-in the community that comes Mariners Harbor
15 people are standing--

16 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Understood.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: --for the duration
18 of the trip.

19 ANDY BYFORD: So, we are-we are looking
20 at that, and there's a further raft of changes
21 happening next month in January to try to further
22 address that. The one, Councilor, I would put
23 forward is I think some people, and I'm say this with
24 the greatest respect, some people to a certain extent
25 view the former network, through rose tinted

2 spectacles and that it was always on time. There was
3 never anyone standing. Well, there was and, you
4 know, it's not as though this is a new phenomenon.
5 Sometimes people did stand on the old deck(sic)
6 network, My commitment to you--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] But
8 not the same volume.

9 ANDY BYFORD: My--my commitment to you and
10 to the borough president is we will not let up until
11 we get this Staten Island bus network as good as it
12 can be, and if I really thought that the answer was
13 to say, right, you know, no shame. Sorry. Let's
14 just scrap it. Let's go back to the X network.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] No.

16 ANDY BYFORD: --then I would, but--but I'm
17 not going knee-jerk to do that because there are
18 equally people who tell u s they really like the new
19 network. For them it's worked. So, the outstanding
20 challenge is to still address those deficient points
21 that still exist, and my commitment to you is that we
22 will not let up until we've done that.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'm glad to hear
24 that. I'll be in touch.

25 ANDY BYFORD: Sure.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

3 ANDY BYFORD: Oh, and the number of
4 complaints, by the way, was 888 for October.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] How
6 many was it? (sic)

7 ANDY BYFORD: 888 for October

8 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [on mic] Thank
9 you. [off mic] I'm hearing and I asked it before.
10 [on mic] You know, I have been, and I was always
11 being advocating for—for New York to provide
12 especially for the residents of Staten Island that I
13 need to have available services, and they only had
14 like one short line train that also they neither—they
15 neither had the best connection with SBS or any buses
16 from the station to the their destination. And for
17 the residents of Staten Island I also signed in my
18 place to be a vocal against the fare hike not only in
19 the train, but also for the toll, which is the only
20 source—way that they have on how to go back for those
21 that have to drive back to a Staten Island. So, with
22 that, Council Member Deutsch followed by Council
23 Member Menchaca.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,
25 Chair. First—firstly, I want to thank you,

2 President. Under your leadership I feel pretty
3 confident and hearing all your--your Fast Forward
4 Planning and have other hearings that you--you came
5 down here to City Hall, but I--I have to say that I
6 have started taking the train, the subway now, and
7 just last week I took the subway twice under your
8 leadership, and I'm looking forward to continuing to
9 doing this. One thing I see is that people on the
10 train might be sometimes a little moody. I don't know
11 if this something that you know, because I walk into
12 the train. When they're walking--before they walk in
13 they're smiling and everything. Once they go
14 underground they get kind of moody so I try to cheer
15 people and go inside and this pulls out these ear
16 plugs just not to listen to me. But, you know, maybe
17 we could find a way to make people more, you know,
18 cheerful once they're underground and my trains were
19 not running late. They we on time, and I went from
20 Point A to Point B in a timely manner. I'm just--I
21 just find that people are just moody in the train.
22 But I--I want to talk about the fare hike on the
23 Verrazzano Bridge--

24 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --and one thing
3 is that first of all there was a public hearing which
4 ended up on Hanukkah and--and I always feel that when
5 it comes to the state of the city, I had certain
6 instances just recently where the city put out a
7 public job opportunity on a holiday, and they ended
8 up switching it or giving them extra days that was a
9 non-holiday. This would give everyone an opportunity
10 to attend these public hearings, which is--which are
11 very important. So, I wanted to see the one that has
12 that has--that one was I believe last night, which was
13 on Hanukkah. If we could do it on alternate days, I
14 know a lot of people are not tech savvy to go online
15 and to testify online or even to send emails
16 especially sometimes you find senior citizens. So, I
17 wanted to see if we can get an alternate date on
18 that. That's number 1. Number 2 is that the cost
19 for Staten Islanders to come into Brooklyn I just
20 feel that it would be fair to just charge them one
21 time for 24 hours because I have spoken to people who
22 carpool their children into Brooklyn. They make it
23 back to Staten Island and then they come in later on
24 to pick up their child. Sometimes they do shopping
25 or sometimes with 24 hours they visit family. So, it

2 just disenfranchises people living Staten Island from
3 coming into Brooklyn and if they have to do their
4 shopping they would rather go to Jersey than come
5 into Brooklyn. So, I think like a one-shot fare
6 within 24 hours would—would be kind of fair for that,
7 and thirdly I just want to touch upon what someone
8 mentioned. I think it was Donovan—Donovan Richards
9 that if transportation is no good, people shouldn't
10 be charged. Sometimes you're sitting on the bridge
11 or getting to the bridge and there's a broken down
12 vehicle, disable vehicle and people sit in traffic
13 literally for hours, and when it's the fault of
14 something that happens on the bridge, maybe people
15 shouldn't be charged for that, and because, you know,
16 you're charging people for going over the bridge and
17 that's a toll. It's a toll for them to get they're
18 quicker even like tunnel. You want to get to the
19 tunnel opposed to going over the Brooklyn Bridge, you
20 expect to get there quicker, right, but if you're
21 sitting in the tunnel for three hours in traffic,
22 then it becomes, it becomes an issue and now you're
23 being charged for sitting in the traffic when
24 sometimes the Brooklyn Bridge may be clear. You

2 can't always rely on—on our front ways all the time.
3 So, those are the three things.

4 ANDY BYFORD: Okay, thank you. First up,
5 the—the point came through loud and clear. When we
6 were at the hearing last night, a number of people
7 did make the point about Hanukkah. So, that—that was
8 certainly—that resonates it with me. There is
9 another opportunity not by—by on—online, but there is
10 a video—a means of providing video testimony at Saint
11 George's Terminal between 7:00 and 10:00 a.m. today
12 is that?

13 SARAH MEYER: Tuesday.

14 ANDY BYFORD: Tuesday.

15 SARAH MEYER: Next Tuesday the 11th.

16 ANDY BYFORD: Next Tuesday the 11th. So,
17 we'll make sure that is well advertised, next Tuesday
18 the 11th, Saint Georgia's Terminal. People can
19 supply video testimony 7:00 'til 10:00 a.m. The—the-
20 the point you make about the Verrazzano Bridge, I'll
21 pass that back as part of our collective feedback.
22 Again, it's the board that will decide on [bell] on
23 fare increases and also toll increase. But we are
24 gathering feedback and gathering people's opinions.
25 So, that will add to the general comments about the—

2 the bridge last night, which again came through loud
3 and clear. And then in terms of not paying when
4 service isn't provided, again, I do get the concept
5 absolutely. I—I totally understand the concept. I
6 think we've just got to be careful that you don't get
7 into a downward where—because people then say well,
8 I'm not paying for that because I didn't get the
9 service I wanted. That's even less funding for the
10 already deficient public service, deficiently and
11 funded public service such that then things
12 deteriorate even further. So, even fewer people pay
13 so the service gets even worse. You've got to watch
14 you don't get into death spiral. That's my only--

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah, so on the
16 13 (sic) I just want to say we had that—we had that
17 snow storm the few inches of snow, and the George
18 Washington Bridge there was 20-car accident that was—
19 it basically crippled our city.

20 ANDY BYFORD: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, when there
22 is a no toll charge lets say on the George Washington
23 Bridge then maybe those cars would been moved
24 quicker.

25 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Right because
3 people sat in traffic literally for hours. So, no,
4 people should pay, but then we're going to hold the
5 state and the city accountable for their actions to
6 make sure that they would know that if they don't do
7 their job properly, then they're going to suffer.
8 It's a penalty.

9 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: So, um--

11 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Understood.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --that's one of
13 the reasons why I vote up, but I-I agree with you the
14 money, the funding needs to come in, but we need to
15 hold those agencies accountable that on their parts
16 if they don't do their job, and they're not competent
17 when it comes to a crisis, then they need to be
18 penalized.

19 ANDY BYFORD: Understood.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Yeah, and thanks
21 President for everything you do. You have a great
22 team, very responsive--

23 ANDY BYFORD: Thank you.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: --and always
3 accessible. So I want to thank--give a shout out to
4 Tim for always being available.

5 ANDY BYFORD: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you.

7 ANDY BYFORD: You're very kind. Thank
8 you.

9 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Council
10 Member Menchaca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you Chair
12 and thank you, Mr. Byford for being here today with
13 us. I want to also thank you and your team for your
14 work. We've done a lot of work in the district, and
15 I also want to thank all the workers, the TWU--

16 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --that show up
18 everyday in the crisis that we're in, and do the work
19 with honor. I want to talk to you a little bit about
20 Southwest Brooklyn and the district that I represent
21 I think is--can tell us a lot about the future and the
22 plan that you're working on. When I think the ferry,
23 a city driven plan, but a transportation as well.

24 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: How have you
3 studied the ferry in terms of the work that you're
4 doing to improve things on land and how is that
5 impacting your work, and I want to think about Red
6 Hook as an example. You and I have spoken about this
7 before with your team about a mini-bus that would
8 take Red Hook residents and workers to and from
9 Manhattan and bring them into the kind of center of
10 Lower Manhattan, and--and kind of thinking a little
11 bit about--about how the ferry impacts that--that
12 analysis, the costs of that. I think your team is
13 going to work on some cost analysis on--on that, and
14 then [pause] okay, let's go over there and then I
15 have two more questions.

16 ANDY BYFORD: Okay. So, one of my
17 mantras, persona mantras is anything is possible,
18 and--and what I--

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
20 Okay.

21 ANDY BYFORD: --what I'm, trying to do in
22 Transit, New York City Transit is bring fresh
23 thinking where it doesn't matter what's gone on
24 before, a blank sheet of paper. Let's--nothing is a
25 bad idea. Let's have a look at everything, and--and

2 our default should be yes and yes unless we can
3 rather than no unless we can't, and yeah, yes, unless
4 we can't. So-so yes, unless we can't so I'll get
5 that right. I want it to be a positive reaction that
6 at least you'll get to-to hear-we'll get to listen o
7 you. You'll get-you'll get a fair hearing with us,
8 right. You know, so if you've got new ideas, we'll-
9 we'll hear you out. It won't be a case of sorry, we
10 know best. We're no prepare to countenance new
11 ideas. So, that's the mindset that I'm trying to
12 install within Transit. So, bus connections with
13 ferries we have been working on. When we-I
14 appreciate it's the other end of the city, but we've
15 just provided some extra bus connections to the new
16 ferry service in the Bronx. So, certainly we-we
17 should be looking at bus connections with ferries in
18 South-Southwest Brooklyn. In-in light with-of that,
19 or consistent with that comment I made about
20 philosophy, we don't-we haven't used many buses. I
21 have asked my team why don't we. Mini-buses or for
22 that matter middy buses, which is kind of a-sort of
23 middle-a middle size bus, you know, maybe a 20-
24 seater, because particularly for local communities
25 where the streets are very narrow or where the

2 ridership wouldn't want a big bus, why wouldn't we
3 look at some new technology. I think we need to be
4 fresh in our thinking. So, again, that philosophy
5 will be we'll hear you out.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And—and again
7 the—the ferries—the—the ferries have offered another
8 transportation route and it has impact on the—not
9 just for connections, but for need, and one of the
10 things that I feel let's stay on philosophy what—
11 what's your responsibility when you think about a
12 project, and other city project like the BQX and—and
13 this is I think an example of where the emperor has
14 no clothes. I feel like the Mayor just does not
15 understand this is a terrible project, and you have a
16 specific role in really advancing I think not only
17 robust visionary plan, but--

18 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --but is in
20 conflict I think with this idea that no one likes,
21 except for developers and—and have an impact, a
22 negative impact on your plan if so much energy is
23 going from an agency into this plan that nobody likes
24 except this person, this one singular person that
25 happens to be the Mayor of the city of New York.

2 What is your role and responsibility in digesting
3 that, and in terms of the larger conversation about
4 the future planning--

5 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Okay, so I'll
6 say I'm --

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: --plus vision
8 planning.

9 ANDY BYFORD: --I'm not going to get into
10 the politics of it, but I would say that my role--

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
12 Philosophy. Let's stay on—I know politics is
13 philosophy, but help me understand what your role and
14 responsibility is.

15 ANDY BYFORD: Philosophy is mind set, and
16 that's why I made the comment about philosophy.
17 Philosophy what I was talking about was the
18 prevailing mindset at New York City Transit on my
19 tenure will be can-do approach and to consider new
20 ideas. That's out of respect. I'd say that certainly
21 my British definition is--

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [interposing]
23 sure.

24 ANDY BYFORD: --mindset is different than
25 philosophy in—in the point that I'm making, and so

2 I'm-sorry-different from politics. So, I'm not going
3 to get into the politics of it. I'm aware of the
4 BQX. I'm crystal clear on my two biggest priorities.
5 That is and so those are: No. 1: To make the
6 existing transit system work exponentially better for
7 New Yorkers right here today to make it [bell] to
8 keep it safe, to make it work properly, to do-to
9 drive that, relentlessly drive that performance
10 across all three modes: Para Trans, subways and
11 buses. The second key role is what we've been
12 talking about to day to create a plan for the future
13 to-to-to make a case for that future, and then if you
14 give me the money to deliver on it.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: And what I'm
16 telling your right now is that I'm aligned with your
17 goals except we have someone that is not, and I think
18 we can work together on the philosophical, and we'll
19 stay away from the politics and really bring that-
20 that nature that is clear and can have positive
21 impacts, and let's-let's do that together. So I'd-
22 I'd like to-to to take the mini, the middy bus
23 concept, and figure it out, and what funding can come
24 out of our budget negotiation to fund some of these
25 things. It would be great for people that want some

2 transit solutions. The last thing I want to ask is
3 the Accessibility Plan for ten years includes some
4 dots and roads in Southwest Brooklyn at 59th Street.
5 Can you give us an update on the 59th Street elevator
6 plan, if you have that? And I'll—I'll end there.

7 ANDY BYFORD: [background comments] I
8 have a lot of stats to remember. So, we've got them
9 right. [background comments] Yeah, okay. So, that
10 is within 59th Street and Fourth Avenue. It's within
11 the 2015-2019 Capital Program so that that this
12 happening, and we're—we can get you an up-to-date
13 status report, a more detailed status report off
14 line.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Great.

16 ANDY BYFORD: We'll send that to you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you so
18 much. That would be wonderful. Great news for the
19 neighborhood the neighborhood impacting.

20 ANDY BYFORD: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you so
22 much for your work..

23 ANDY BYFORD: Thank you.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks Council
3 Member. Just a few questions and then we will let
4 you go and thank you for your time.

5 ANDY BYFORD: Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Did the MTA
7 already choose the new company who will be designing
8 the new payment system?

9 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm. It's, yeah, we are-
10 just, yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
12 Replace—the replacing of the Metro Card.

13 ANDY BYFORD: Yes. So that's happening
14 right now. That is a project that is being—it's
15 being executed as we speak. It—it takes place over a
16 3-year period, and seeds the progressive replacement
17 of Metro Cards where they fit for purpose a Smart
18 Card, which also means you'll be able to pay using
19 you're phone, your credit card just by tapping on a
20 reader.

21 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: What—when will
22 we see the initial use of the new technology?

23 ANDY BYFORD: Okay so the first roll-out
24 begins with a number of stations on the Lexington
25 Line. I'm just finding my notes on this. So, the—

2 the—the Lexington line 16 stations on the Lex from
3 42nd at Grand Central down to Atlantic Avenue,
4 Barclay Center in Brooklyn and also on local and
5 express bus routes on Staten Island. So, we're doing
6 this in a phased manner, and then progressively we
7 will then roll out that technology at the remaining
8 bus—on the remaining bus services and all the
9 vehicles and at the remaining subway stations.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And what—what
11 were the criteria for using for choosing those
12 stations?

13 ANDY BYFORD: Um, I'd have to check that.
14 I—I—I--

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay and if
16 there's not--

17 ANDY BYFORD: Area.

18 SARAH MEYER: What do you mean by post-
19 area? (sic)

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Well, how those
21 stations were chosen. Like I want to see my—one—my
22 station being a 168 and Broadway and the 1 Train that
23 is heavily used.

24 ANDY BYFORD: Okay.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: By building (sic)
3 by station by students like--

4 ANDY BYFORD: I'll take a punt at that.
5 I can't claim to be an expert on--on this specific
6 item.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [interposing]
8 Okay.

9 ANDY BYFORD: You know, I--I hope you--I've
10 come across this as well as briefed on this. My
11 understanding is that because it's very hard, and
12 I've--I've seen it done elsewhere. It's very hard to
13 implement a brand new system big bang and do it all
14 at once. You've got to make sure that it works, and
15 so you want to choose a couple of areas, which are
16 typical of--of the rest of the network if you'd like
17 or indicative of the rest of the network so that you
18 can be certain the think works properly before you
19 roll it out everywhere. So, by doing a number of
20 subway stations on a busy line, you get plenty of
21 usage. You get to--to find out what are the bugs,
22 does it work properly? Do people know how to use it?
23 Is it intuitive, et cetera, et cetera, and clearly we
24 have to choose somewhere, one of the boroughs to--to
25 try the validators on the buses, and it just so

2 happens we've chosen Staten Island, and I
3 appreciate. That's a bit of a general answer. I can
4 find out more specifics and get them to you.

5 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, so I mean
6 and if there's any chance to add another station, I
7 would like to suggest 168 and the 1 and C and A train
8 as a potential one if the opportunity is there. At
9 the same time I also want to bring to your attention
10 that As we are working with your team or, you know,
11 and taking the rest for sharing information to the
12 residents of Norther Manhattan as the elevator-the
13 new elevator will be build at 168, you should be-as
14 usual, there's going to be also inconvenience. We
15 want to have the best system in place so that we
16 bring utility (sic) buses if that's possible, but
17 most important I hope that we don't lose-lose the
18 opportunity to explore the possibility to put a ramp
19 in the 1681 station from the elevators to the stair,
20 and I know that I have to follow the Federal
21 Standards. I know that the distance, the wide and
22 the length have to be taken care, but for me as a
23 million dollars investments for the new elevators is
24 what happened there. Please, you know, relegate your
25 team, bring your engineer to look at that possibility

2 to see that at the same time when that elevator--new
3 elevator will be installed, if there's the
4 opportunity also to install. I'm not asking for what
5 it will give to the stairs. I heard the argument
6 that there's a lot of rock that it's difficult. If it
7 will be possible we'll say now that we bring the new
8 elevators, want to leave it only to the level of, you
9 know, where the level is right now when we can take a
10 balance--

11 ANDY BYFORD: [interposing] Uh-hm.

12 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --to the stair,
13 and we deal with a station, as I've said, you know,
14 heavily used. A lot of people use it, and only
15 residents, doctors, patients and the students.

16 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: My only
18 suggestion is at the local level at 181st we have
19 many buses like seven buses that they go from the
20 Bronx to Manhattan. There's not one bus shelter in
21 that area, in that corridor, and when you pass by,
22 there's a lot of senior citizens that they use it.
23 As you know, a lot of people they move from
24 Washington Heights and Northern Manhattan to the
25 Bronx, and I hope again if you think and look at

2 that, as something at the local level to be
3 addressed, that's also very important. There's now
4 like seven buses crossing to Manhattan from the Bronx
5 and no—and not a single block with the bus shelters.
6 I that it should be something that we should look at
7 it.

8 ANDY BYFORD: Just as a general comment
9 on that 168 Station the—I mean as a general comment
10 where we've been doing these surveys to—across the
11 whole of the network to see what needs to be done to
12 make each individual station accessible. We're
13 certainly closed minded to ramps. Ramps are a—are an
14 option in some cases, and the issue is the—is looking
15 to see what space have you got available to—to make
16 sure the—obviously you don't want the ramp to be too
17 steep. So, it depends how much space you've got
18 available to—to—to provide a ramp that compliant with
19 ADA Standards. That is a very difficult station
20 because of the geographical challenges it faces, but
21 rest assured I'm not going to be—I'm not going to go
22 to you and say it's impossible until I'm certain that
23 that's the case. I would ask for independent
24 analysis to make sure that we're not missing
25 something.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: I've just been in
3 previous experience and let's Diamond Street when the
4 elevator was installed there, and missing the
5 opportunity to say here we can work to have both-
6 elevators in both direction, and even if some
7 opportunity like the Uptown 1 Train is in the-is in
8 the street level, it only would take to work an
9 agreement with the Property owner and immediately can
10 exit-put an exit in the uptown level there. So, I
11 see you as more, you know, open to ideas and--

12 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --and--and you know
14 we work in a cultural way so here we are. This is
15 where--that we have to do business, and we don't move
16 from there, and here we are, the 168 haven't been
17 used. We bring in new elevators because it's going
18 to be going through a lot of inconvenience from this
19 period of time because it usually happens, but we are
20 trying to fix what isn't working. The elevators have
21 been broken. We need to put a new one. As we are
22 making that big investment, let's address at the same
23 time the other challenges I take: How we can make
24 that station where the challenge is only from the
25 elevator to the stair.

2 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

3 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: That's what stop
4 anyone that's 168 in a wheelchair to be able to move
5 from the stair to the elevator so-

6 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --please. I hope
8 that you can definitely look at that one. My last-my
9 other thing is about the question related to section
10 rights. As I asked on-with the pilot E-Hail program
11 and you explain how people, you know, E-Hail now is
12 more popular, but question is, is the MTA still
13 accepting new applications for the pilot?

14 ANDY BYFORD: Not at the moment. We have
15 a closed list of participants, but that's-that's-
16 that's not set in stone forever. We're-we're
17 evaluating still our options going forward and
18 particularly how we can fund the very obvious latent
19 demand.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay and part of
21 the-of the-of the Fast Forward Plan, which I
22 personally and my colleagues we supported-the
23 decision was made by the New York City Transit to
24 expand the use or enforcement camera-now it was based
25 on information that we have now they've been

2 installed in 16 roofs. So, is the MTA committed to
3 continue using that tool for installing those cameras
4 in the buses--

5 ANDY BYFORD: Uh-hm.

6 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: --and go beyond
7 those 16 roofs?

8 ANDY BYFORD: Yes, we-we do believe that
9 they're a very useful technology. They certainly
10 enable us to help them force compliance on bus lanes,
11 so we would--certainly would like to see that
12 installed and further expanded.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay. So, we
14 give Metro another question Metro North coming from
15 Westchester connecting other places. One particular
16 example, we get to Marble Hill, and from Marble that
17 would be a great opportunity for a rider to say: If
18 I pay the same fare, I should be able to use the
19 Metro North and go to 125th, go to Midtown and
20 Bayside. Have you guys been open to--ore is there any
21 possibility that we make some changes, that MTA makes
22 some changes that when the riders you the Metro North
23 during five borough jurisdiction for the fare to be
24 the same as the other Metro Card that we pay right
25 now?

2 ANDY BYFORD: Well, I think we're always-
3 we've always welcomed proposals from elected
4 officials about different fair product and different
5 local arrangements in the way that we have in
6 Brooklyn with and Queens with the Atlantic ticket.
7 So if you've got a proposal, Chairman, that you'd
8 like to make to with certain others, have my experts
9 have a look at it.

10 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Okay, so with
11 that, thank you, and I hope that we will continue
12 working together. As I said before in summary, the
13 Council you heard from the Speaker before. We are
14 committed. We are open to continue working with you.
15 I personally will lead an initiative to make the
16 voice loud and clear that the city should be open to
17 include—to increase the contribution as the state
18 should do the same thing, but that money should be
19 dedicated only to the MTA, and that money should be
20 only used for maintenance and repair, which I hope
21 that in close, this is something that we agree that
22 this plan needs to mainly focus on maintenance and
23 repair, right?

24 ANDY BYFORD: Well—well maintenance and
25 repair but also added capacity, increased capacity.

2 So it' an-it's absolutely, it's maintenance repair
3 for state of good repair, but what Fast Forward does
4 is leap frog from the existing system to a modern
5 system, which is exponentially more reliable, and has
6 way more capacity. That's the difference.

7 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Great and you
8 promised last time when we talked. I hope that we
9 will continue working before and during the time that
10 you served here we worked together to have a one-
11 payment system so that with one payment, riders
12 should be able to transfer from a bus to a ferry and
13 for the bicycle.

14 ANDY BYFORD: That's absolutely the plan.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

16 ANDY BYFORD: That's exactly what's
17 happening. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

19 [pause]

20 ANDY BYFORD: Thank you. [pause]

21 LEGAL COUNSEL: Ellen Shannon, Paul
22 Goebel, Anna Lynn Courtney. [background
23 comments/pause]

24 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [on mic] Please
25 be—so that Tina Marino that there is someone from the

2 MTA. That you show us all from the MTA who is
3 staying here to also you sent your testimony with the
4 rest of the panel. Yes. [background comments/pause]
5 [off mic] You may begin. [door bangs] [on mic] Anyone
6 of you whoever goes first. We're putting the timing
7 in two minutes as usual. So it takes longer. Please
8 summarize, but it is under the two minutes. So the
9 clock is on two minutes. [pause] Turn on your
10 microphone up there.

11 ELLEN SHANNON: I got it? Yeah. Okay.
12 Good morning. My name is Ellen Shannon. I'm the
13 Associate Director of Permanent Citizens Advisory
14 Committee to the MTA, which was established in New
15 York State—in the New York State Legislature in 1981
16 and is the official voice of New York State Transit,
17 Metro North and Long Island Railroad riders. The
18 transit system we all rely on is severely stressed.
19 To remain a world class city it is important—more
20 important than ever to have a reliable system that
21 keeps trains and buses moving smoothly to their
22 destinations. The Transit Network has yet to fully
23 recover from the 2010 service and workforce cuts let
24 alone the damage sustained in 2012 from Super Storm
25 Sandy. We cannot afford to let the transit system go

2 any further backwards to the old days. It's time to
3 move forward. Therefore, we appreciate the
4 opportunity to discuss the steps necessary to improve
5 the Transit System and the merits of New York City
6 Transit's Fast Forward Plan. The timing is
7 particularly relevant as the MTA is holding its fair
8 hearings. While raising the fare will help with the
9 budget cap, substantially more funding is needed to
10 set it on the right path. We recognize that New York
11 City and the state stepped up to fund the Subway
12 Action Plan, and subway performance has improved or
13 stabilized, but as the Fast Forward Plan, which goes
14 much further in addressing the system's needs, and
15 it's critical that it be fully funded. The magnitude
16 of the problem that has occurred from decades of
17 insufficient funding is simply larger than a one-shot
18 approach. The answer must be in finding recurring
19 and sustainable funding, but not only from congestion
20 pricing as that's not enough. Restoring and
21 improving the subway system requires a bold new way
22 of thinking accompanied by increased commitment of
23 resources. Some of those resources must come from
24 [bell] places like Amazon, which attracted—are
25 attracted to the city partially due to the vast

2 transportation network. Long Island City would
3 greatly benefit from such investments. More people
4 will mean more congestion in stations that are sorely
5 in need of repair and upgrade. Similarly, there's
6 great opportunity in capturing and adding value that
7 transit brings from many real estate developments,
8 and we strongly support all effort in this area.
9 It's also important that everyone pay their fair
10 share. Fare beating costs the system hundreds of
11 millions of dollars and putting added pressure on
12 fares and service hurts all New Yorkers. The MTA
13 needs also to focus reducing waste and
14 inefficiencies. We believe important light will shed
15 on the topic through the two board working groups on
16 Procurement and Contracting. We encourage all
17 Council members to look at the June MTA Board meeting
18 where presentations on these two topics and actions
19 being taken were provided by Commissioners Scott
20 Rechler and Charles Moerdler, but a ship as large as
21 the MTA does not turn on a dime. That work is ongoing
22 and is integral to gaining public trust. At the end
23 of the day, it is in the interest of both the city
24 and state to ensure that the system functions well,
25 and that it is appropriately funded. We cannot

2 afford to wait decades for modernization efforts such
3 as improve signal system to be completed and must
4 find ways to accelerate them, which is what's laid
5 out in the Fast Forward Plan. Subway and bus riders
6 need the city and MTA to work as partners so that
7 they transportation system remains the life blood of
8 the region. We look forward to a vigorous discussion
9 of what needs to be done and how to pay for it, and
10 encourage the members of the City Council and this
11 committee to fully participate in this dialogue. The
12 Fast Forward Plan cannot be implemented without the
13 state and the city's financial support and
14 commitment. We look forward to any questions you may
15 have. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
17 you.

18 PAUL GEOBEL: Good morning. My name is
19 Paul Goebel and I'm the Transportation and Policy
20 Analyst for Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer.
21 Thank you Chair Rodriguez for—and members of the
22 Transportation Committee for holding this crucial
23 hearing. President Byford's Fast Forward Plan calls
24 for sweeping and long awaited changes to overhaul or
25 public transit system through accelerated

1 modernization of our subway signal system, an
2 increase in accessible subway stations and the
3 redesigning of our bus routes. My office is excited
4 about the results President Byford has promised and
5 believes the first funding source we must tap into is
6 congestion pricing. The question that many New
7 Yorkers share is not if the work is needed but if the
8 MTA can be trusted to do it within reasonable budgets
9 and sensible time frames. While President Byford's
10 plan is justifiable ambitious, we must look at past
11 MTA work to see the full picture, and MTA works
12 typically the installation of CBTC on the 7 Train
13 does not show promising results. Research from the
14 Good Government Non-Profit Reinvent Albany shows that
15 the MTA exceeded its projected timeline for their
16 project by five years and its projected by-by \$157
17 million. Moreover, in a study my office requested
18 from our city's Independent Budget Office, they found
19 that of the 33 signal related projects in MTA Capital
20 Plan 2005, 19 of them were delayed. A core tenant of
21 the Fast Forward Plan and the major source of which
22 city funding would be dedicated toward is the
23 installation of CBTC on the majority of our subway
24 lines. Given the MTA's difficulties in delivering
25

2 CBTC to just the 7 Line, I would like to echo the
3 calls of Reinvent Albany for President Byford to
4 release an analysis of the 7 Train project and
5 present it to city legislators. Specifically, the
6 analysis should look at how the project is seated,
7 its projected costs and timeline, and how the MTA
8 will avoid the same mistakes during future
9 installations. For the city to provide a substantial
10 share of the \$40 billion required to modernize our
11 transit system, we must be absolutely sure that its
12 funds will be spent wisely. Lastly, as some of you
13 may already be aware, my office [bell] sits in
14 disappointment to the MTA's recent decision to renege
15 on their promise to upgrade two or three more SBS
16 routs a year, and specifically to defer the upgrade
17 of the M 96 from 2019 to as late as 2023. The MTA's
18 stated reasons for SBS deferral, budget constraints
19 and borough wide redesigns do not apply to M96. The
20 shortness of the route makes it inexpensive to
21 operate and unlikely to change under a bus route
22 redesign. The reality is that every upgrade in
23 service must cost \$40 million. In the case of the
24 M96, the upgrade would only cost \$1.8 million. The
25 M96 takes 14,000 daily riders who serve to benefit

2 from the results seen on other SBS routes.
3 Specifically for the M79, which happened over just a
4 year ago, riders saw an 8% decrease in travel time
5 and a 9% decrease in in ridership. As ridership
6 decrease, has been a problem for the MTA's finances,
7 this projected increase for the M96 should be of keen
8 interest to us all. In the end while the Fast
9 Forward Plan promises fantastic results, we must look
10 realistically at past MTA outcomes in deciding how-
11 how to allocate potential city funding, and the
12 changes we need to ask for to ensure funding is spent
13 well. President Byford should present the city with
14 plans as to how the MTA will avoid the pitfalls
15 involve in the 7 Train CBTC installation, and he
16 should agree to upgrade the M 96 to SBS in 2019 as
17 was-as was originally planned in order to show how
18 the MTA will sensibly spend potential city funding
19 for the Fast Forward Plan. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
21 you.

22 ANNA LYNN COURTNEY: My name is Anna Lynn
23 Courtney. I'm an Orientation and Mobility Instructor
24 at Vision Services for the Blind, and I'm going to
25 ask for just one thing. When the subways are being

2 made accessible, the accessibility feature that a lot
3 of blind people would like is to know how to find the
4 conductor's Booth or the Conductor's car, and the
5 best way to do that is by putting down a tactile
6 guideway across the subway platform perpendicular to
7 the tracks. At Visions we've worked with DOT
8 testing. Our consumers and our instructors have
9 tested some of the tactile guideways they use, and as
10 you're sitting there thinking what is the cost
11 benefit? How many blind people versus how much
12 these—the guideways will would cost. Consider that
13 the truncated domes on the sides of the platforms
14 keep everybody away from the edge and the tactile
15 guideway telling you were the conductor can be found,
16 would help everyone. It would help people who want
17 the safety of riding in the car with an MTA employee.
18 It would help people who want information. So,
19 that's what I'm asking for.

20 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Thank
21 you. So, my—what I can say to all of you is that
22 we're looking to continuing to working together. WE
23 know this this conversation will never stop, and it's
24 about the level of advocacy that we have to continue
25 doing. It's never—that's all we choose to do, and it

2 doesn't matter if the road is from this side or from
3 your side. Our city deserves to have our
4 transportation system to the 21st Century taking the
5 workers, middle, upper class in time to whatever the
6 submission they have, and as I said before I hope
7 that we can continue advocating to stop wanting any
8 fare any fare hike to make all the stations
9 accessible, and also to be sure that the MTA will
10 have other resources and with a plan to control the
11 cost. So, with that, thank you. No, we're calling
12 the next panel.

13 LEGAL COUNSEL: Monica Bartley, Susan
14 Dooha, Valerie Joseph, Yesenia Torres, and Kate
15 Slevin. [pause] [door bangs] [background
16 comments/pause]

17 KATE SLEVIN: Good afternoon. I'm Kate
18 Slevin, Senior Vice President at Regional Plan
19 Association. I'm here today representing RPA along
20 with Fix Our Transit Coalition, which is a coalition
21 of over 100 civic business, industry, environmental,
22 community labor and social justice organizations from
23 across the region that are working together to build
24 public and political support for new state funding
25 for transit with congestion pricing as its lynchpin.

2 By now you've heard all the benefits of the Fast
3 Forward Plan for more and faster subway and bus
4 service including transitioning the fleet to electric
5 buses to more elevators, enhanced customer service
6 and better project delivery at the MTA. Our groups
7 many of whom are often critical of the MTA strongly
8 believe Fast Forward is credible and doable and is
9 the right plan to modernize the city's transit
10 system. The Fast Forward Plan is also a roadmap to
11 modernizing New York City Transit to allow it—allow
12 it to deliver the kind of high quality service that
13 the fits a region that is powered by transit and the
14 millions of riders who want and deserve better. This
15 is why all these organizations have come together to
16 push for congestion pricing in order to implement the
17 proposals in Fast Forward. We believe congestion
18 pricing is equitable and realistic choice to get the
19 system moving again. We have had over 100 meetings
20 with community organizations and elected officials
21 over the past six months, and we can attest that this
22 support for Fast Forward extends far beyond our
23 organizations, and when you look at the statistics
24 you will see why. Transit delays and unreliability
25 are forcing New Yorkers to pay more to get around

2 either with their pocketbooks or with their time.
3 For example, the growth in very long commutes is
4 particularly upsetting. For example in the Bronx,
5 the number of people community more than an hour to
6 work has grown from nearly 34% in 2010 to nearly 38%
7 in 2017. And transit system in decline drags down
8 our region's economy, threatens he livelihoods of
9 individuals and small business and damages the health
10 and quality of everyone who lives or work in the MTA
11 12-county [bell] service area. I threatens to
12 increase transportation emissions at a time when we
13 need to be doing everything we can to aggressively
14 cut pollution. These delays hurt those who are most
15 relying on subways and buses and those who cannot or
16 who are unable to own cars. Nearly 60% of low-income
17 New Yorkers from the outer boroughs depend on transit
18 to get to work. In fact, less than 2% of low-income
19 commuters from the outer boroughs would regularly
20 face the new congestion charge. Nearly 40-40 times
21 as many low-income New Yorkers will benefit from
22 improved transit that congestion pricing revenues
23 would bring. All drivers will benefit from less
24 traffic inside and outside the Central Business
25 District. Any new proposal for funding Fast Forward

2 will be controversial and challenging to implement
3 but we have to get it done. We thank the Council
4 especially Council Member Rodriguez for his
5 leadership in supporting congestion pricing as a way
6 to fund Fast Forward, and we urge you to continue to
7 be a strong advocate and work with state colleagues
8 to get this done in 2019. Congestion pricing won't
9 fix all of our problems, but it is the cornerstone of
10 any long-term plan to shift course and create a
11 fairer more sustainable city. To learn more about
12 Fix Our Transit, go to fixourtransit.org. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

14 MONICA BARTLEY: Good afternoon. My name
15 is Monica Bartley Community Outreach Organizer at the
16 Center for Independence of the Disabled New York.
17 CIDNY, and I am representing Susan Dooha. Thank you,
18 Council Member Rodriguez for the opportunity to
19 testify in relation to the plan to fix New York
20 City's mass trans system fast forward. As you may
21 know, the Center for Independence of the Disabled is
22 a plaintiff in the two lawsuits seeking to remedy the
23 inaccessibility of the subway system and ensure that
24 the accessible features of the subway system are
25 maintained. We believe that we may not be assured of

2 reaching true accessibility without a binding and
3 enforceable commitment. We believe that the time has
4 come for the MTA to acknowledge that it has for years
5 violated the civil rights of people with disabilities
6 and that the time has come for the court to compel
7 them to change. New York City Human Rights Law makes
8 it unlawful to deny people with disabilities full and
9 equal enjoyment on equal terms and conditions of
10 public accommodation. Nonetheless, the subways are
11 according to former MTA Chairman and CEO Pendergast
12 the most efficient way to get around town. However,
13 according to the American Community Survey, 41% of
14 people with no disability use the subway to get to
15 work, whereas only 7% of people with mobility
16 disabilities use the subway. Inability to reliably
17 use the subway impedes the employment, access to
18 education, healthcare, community participation,
19 worship and completion [bell] of simple errands.
20 Even if the accessibility goes or fast forward remit,
21 and the current legal obligations to produce 17 more
22 stations plus an additional 50 stations, plus another
23 one-third of stations were reached, then only 65% of
24 the subway system would be made accessible. This
25 would be a gain, but would leave New York behind

2 other major cities in the United States including
3 Sand Francisco, Washington, D.C., Boston,
4 Philadelphia and Chicago. The MTA insists that it
5 must receive funds for its sure equal priorities.
6 The shores (sic) will commit toe the accessibility
7 goals. However, in the 1982 *EPVA v. MTA Elevator*
8 case, Supplemental Agreement requiring installation
9 of elevators preceded the sate allocation of capital
10 funding the complete the work. We believe that it is
11 time to acknowledge that remedying these civil rights
12 violations is a first priority, and that the MTA make
13 a detailed and enforceable agreement to do so in a
14 timely way. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

16 [background comments/pause]

17 VALERIE JOSEPH: Good afternoon. My name
18 is Valerie Joseph and this is my colleague Justinia
19 Torres. We are here from BCID. Thank you for the
20 opportunity to testify about the MTA New York City
21 Transit's Fast Forward MTA Plan. We represent the
22 Brooklyn Center for the Independence of the Disabled
23 an advocate for people with disabilities for more
24 than six decades. For the people with disabilities
25 the Fast Forward Plan is unprecedented. For the

2 first time the MTA makes a commitment to
3 accessibility and calls one of its four equal
4 priorities along with transforming the subway a re-
5 imagination of the buses and empowering the MTA
6 employees. Fast Forward also outlines an inhibition
7 program of improvement from a rapid expansion of the
8 number of subway elevators to an improved Access-A-
9 Ride system to better communication. These new
10 commitments are welcome and long overdue, but we want
11 more than a few pages in 74-page document. After
12 all, we know the MTA's history far too well. Fierce
13 legal battles to make buses and 100% subway stations
14 accessible in the 1970s and the 1980s. Losses in the
15 1990s to get the MTA to adhere federal law for
16 Access-A-Ride, major cutbacks in bus service 2010,
17 not commitment to adding elevators after 2020. No
18 innovation in Access-A-Ride service until last year.
19 It is a sorry record, but we—we learned our lesson.
20 For the first two Fast Forward promises we'll—we'll
21 discuss, we call on President Byford and the MTA to
22 settle [bell] Subway Access lawsuits from the
23 disability community, including BCID. We know that
24 while funding from state and city offices is

2 essential, only a legal settlement will guarantee and
3 will have us—get us our success.

4 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you.

5 JUSTINIA TORRES: Continuing the
6 testimony. I'm going to bring out like bullets of
7 information of that we're very interested in bringing
8 about. It says Subway Station Accessibility. BCID
9 has joined several other disability groups in a state
10 lawsuit charging the MTA in violating New York City
11 Human Rights Law because of the lack of accessible
12 stations. Only 24% of the systems, 472 stations are
13 accessible, but the two of us and for more than
14 200,000 Brooklynites this a basic civil rights
15 question. If stations don't have elevators, we
16 cannot travel in our city with that subway systems.
17 That's just wrong. Fast Forward commits to 15 new
18 elevators and a fully accessible system. It must be
19 backed by a legal agreement. In elevator maintenance
20 we've also sued the MTA over its poor maintenance of
21 the subway elevators. We've both encounter out-of-
22 service elevators and even had to be carried out of
23 one station. The elevators are often dirty beyond
24 belief. Fast Forward promised to make elevators more
25 reliable, but only a legal settlement will keep the

2 authority honest on bus redesign. The MTA buses are
3 the slowest in the nation according to the Fast
4 Forward. Who could argue? We support always ways of
5 giving buses priority in traffic. The installation of
6 150 audio capital bus signs, better bus lanes
7 enforcement and other improvements, but we are
8 concerned about the plan to re-the plan to raise-
9 rationalize (sic) bus stops, which is transit speak
10 for reducing the number of stops. The MTA must
11 reconsider this priority since [bell] since stops
12 that are further apart are likely to make bus rides
13 harder for people with disabilities. In addition,
14 the MTA and the city DOT must make the placements of
15 bus benches at every bus stop. On Access-A-Ride.
16 BCID is the core member of the Access-A-Ride Reform
17 Group or more known are AOF (sic), Aging of
18 Frustration, but both Access-A-Ride can tell that
19 there's nothing like being stranded at 2:00 a.m. in
20 the morning because of bad service. Under pressure
21 from our groups and many other riders, the MTA has
22 finally begun to make fixes. For example, most
23 Access-A-Ride riders must call for a ride a day in
24 advance, which no other MTA rider needs to do, but
25 the MTA starts-started an On-Demand pilot program a

2 year ago, which has been like transforming for the
3 1,200 lucky participants for the first time. Access-
4 A-Ride can travel around the town with little or
5 notice just like any other riders. Finally, we have
6 worked closely with the MTA to get Access-A-Ride
7 rider vehicles permission to use bus lanes so far.
8 The DOT has agreed only to let about 800 dedicated
9 Access-A-Ride vehicles in the lanes, but there are
10 still a thousand more dedicated vehicles that should
11 have the right as well. I have also testimony on
12 behalf of the United Spinal Association and I have
13 the copies if you would like or I could read it for
14 them.

15 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And the—the
16 sergeant here will take it.

17 JUSTINIA TORRES: Okay, so--

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Give it to the
19 sergeant and he will pass it to us.

20 JUSTINIA TORRES: Okay. So should I read
21 it for them?

22 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Just give it to
23 him and he will put it in the record.

24 JUSTINIA TORRES: [interposing] Okay,
25 beautiful. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. Thank
3 you so and with that I've got to say that your fight
4 is our fight, and you're fighting not only for the
5 900,000 New Yorkers who need a better and more
6 accessibility in our stations, but it is a fight for
7 parents who they need accessibility when they are
8 carrying a kid with a stroller. It's a fight for
9 senior citizens. It's our fight because at some point
10 all of us will need to rely in an accessible station.
11 So, thank you and we will continue working together.

12 JUSTINIA TORRES: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thanks.

14 JUSTINIA TORRES: Okay, thank you.

15 LEGAL COUNSEL: Next we have Jackie
16 Cohen, Liam Blank, Chris Pangilinan, Colin Wright and
17 Jack Davies. [door bangs] [background comments]

18 JAQI COHEN: Thank you. Good afternoon,
19 Chairman Rodriguez and the committee. I'm Jaqi Cohen,
20 Campaign Director for NYPIRG Straphangers Campaign
21 and I'm here representing the Bus Turnaround
22 Coalition, which also includes the Riders Alliance,
23 Transit Center and Tri-State Transportation Campaign,
24 and I'm joined to deliver testimony with my
25 colleagues Liam Blank from Tri-State. We appreciate

2 the opportunity to offer feedback on the city's role
3 in making MTA's Fast Forward Plan a success for New
4 York's 8 million daily transit riders. Now, in short
5 the city's role in Fast Forward is to fix bus
6 service. MTA buses operate on city streets. Buses
7 serve every city neighborhood. The city needs to
8 prioritize the more 2 million New Yorkers who ride
9 MTA buses each day. Bus riders are more likely to be
10 elderly, immigrants, people of color and lower income
11 than subway riders and New Yorkers at large.
12 Improving bus service is essential to enhancing
13 economic opportunity and promoting social inclusion.
14 It isn't just a matter of efficiency. It's a
15 progressive imperative. It's impossible for New York
16 to become the fairest city in the country as Mayor de
17 Blasio has promised without better bus service. So,
18 now I'm going to turn it over to my colleague Liam
19 Blank who will elaborate on the specifics that our
20 city must take to improve bus service and help ensure
21 the success of Fast Forward moving—moving on. Thank
22 you.

23 LIAM BLANK: Good afternoon, Chair
24 Rodriguez and committee members. I'm Liam Blank,
25 Advocacy and Policy Manger for Tri-State

2 Transportation Campaign. Last July the Bus Turnaround
3 Coalition released Fast Bus Fair City, a proposed
4 complement to the MTA's Fast Forward Plan that
5 highlights exactly what the city needs to do to
6 improve bus service. Fast Bus Fair City calls for
7 100 new dedicated bus lane miles in the next five
8 years including 60 new miles during the de Blasio
9 Administration. We called for a rapid expansion in
10 transit signal priority to all applicable bus routes,
11 and we also called for bus shelters at every bus stop
12 and automate bus lane enforcement. We urge you to
13 join us in pushing the Administration towards
14 adopting this bold progressive plan to improve bus
15 service. With the Council's help we look forward to
16 the creation and implementation of a citywide
17 approach to improving the networks so riders can
18 finally have fast, efficient and reliable service.
19 Thank you.

20 COLIN WRIGHT: [coughs] Good afternoon.
21 Thank you Chair Rodriguez and members of the New York
22 City Council Transportation Committee for the
23 opportunity to testify in support of Fast Forward
24 this morning. I'm Colin Wright Advocacy Associate at
25 Transit Center, and I'm joined by my colleague Chris

2 Pangilinan, Program Director at Transit Center.
3 Transit Center is a research and advocacy foundation
4 dedicated to improving public transportation in New
5 York City and in cities across the United States.
6 Our position as a national organization lends us a
7 broad perspective on what makes transit succeed or
8 fail in cities. We find that transit is best served
9 when city leadership is a partner with its transit
10 agency and providing the tools it needs to flourish
11 along with the oversight necessary to keep the public
12 agency accountable to the public. That's why we're
13 pleased the City Council is conducting a hearing on
14 the Fast Forward Plan. If funded and imple-it funded
15 and implemented the Fast Forward Plan would run more
16 trains on crowded subway lines, replace aging subway
17 cars, reorganize the city's vast bus network and
18 install hundreds of elevators at inaccessible
19 stations. These are critically important
20 improvements that will help riders' everyday
21 commutes. Our subway and buses are foundational to
22 life in New York City yet they are crumbling under
23 decades of mismanagement and underfunding. Transit
24 delayed, buses are stuck in traffic and riders are at
25 the end of their ropes. We has the New York City

2 Council to partner with the state to make the Fast
3 Forward Plan becomes reality. The city has not only
4 the opportunity, but also the obligation to make sure
5 New York subways and buses serve your constituents.
6 New York won't continue to prosper unless the state
7 and city leaders do their part to fix our transit
8 network. Further, as stewards of the public's money
9 and trust, it's incumbent upon this Council to stand
10 up for riders by asking the MTA to take steps toward
11 reform by, for example, reigning in exorbitant costs
12 and reforming archaic procurement rules. Indeed,
13 getting agency costs under control is the only way we
14 can afford to restore and expand our trans network on
15 the scale necessary today.

16 CHRIS PANGILINAN: Thank you. Good
17 afternoon [bell] My name is Chris Pangilinan with
18 Transit Center and as Colin said, we're here to
19 testify in support of New York City's Transit--New
20 York City's Transit's Fast Forward commitment to
21 install elevators at hundreds of subway stations
22 around the city. Hundreds of thousands of New
23 Yorkers require elevators to access the subway every
24 day. People with disabilities like myself and our
25 friends in the audience here, parents pushing

2 strollers and travelers carrying luggage as well as
3 residents suffering from injuries. Today, however,
4 New York City Transit operates the least accessible
5 subway system in the country and nearly 30 years
6 after the passage of the Americans with Disabilities
7 Act in 1990, only a quarter of the city's subway's
8 elevators—city subway stations have elevators, and
9 even when they have elevators these—these break down
10 often rendering even the few stations accessible for
11 those with mobility needs. And during the most
12 recent quarter New York City Transit elevator data
13 shows that 255 elevators in the subway system
14 experienced over 4,000 outages. Now what does this
15 actually mean? What I want to do is just relate this
16 on a more personal level, and what this really means
17 is that for me and for people with disabilities it
18 means that we're missing out on vast swaths of the
19 city being unable to go to parts in Brooklyn,
20 Manhattan, Queens and the Bronx, and being—and
21 unfortunately missing out on events such as birthday
22 parties, employment opportunities and—and places we
23 can live. And rally what this is when it comes down
24 to it is—it means we're being excluded from the very
25 fabric of—of New York life that nearly everyone in

2 this room takes for granted, but all New Yorkers
3 including those with disabilities deserve to be
4 included in. It was exciting that the Fast Forward
5 Plan aims to correct these injustices. It commits a
6 clear a timeline for station accessibility,
7 installing 50 stations in the next 5-year Capital
8 Program with the goal of achieving maximum
9 accessibility in the next 15 years. This plan will
10 put new York in league with our peers in Boston and
11 Chicago, which are also two century old systems that
12 nevertheless have more than twice the station
13 accessibility of New York, and also have real estate
14 plans to reach 100%. The Fast Forward commitment
15 promises that instead of lagging behind the [bell]
16 other cities, we will actually help set the pace.
17 So, but to give us the best chance at system
18 accessibility the Fast Forward Plan must be fully
19 funded, and history shows that in competition among
20 many priorities station elevators lose every time,
21 and this is why we have so few today. The city has
22 an obligation to correct this long standing injustice
23 for transit accessibility where it can. In exchange
24 for whatever tools our resources the city provides
25 the MTA, you have the prerogative to demand

2 accountability from this agency. Fast Forward
3 ensures that every New Yorker will finally be able to
4 access all that make our remarkable city able to
5 offer, and lets make this plan a reality. Thank you.
6 [pause]

7 JACK DAVIES: Good afternoon. Thank you
8 for convening the hearing for the chance to testify.
9 My name is Jack Davies. I'm the Policy and Campaigns
10 Manager for Transportation Alternatives. Our
11 transportation-transportation system is in a state of
12 crisis. Cuts to basic upkeep have crippled the subway
13 and bus networks. Delays in the subway have tripled.
14 Over the last five years subway stations are
15 crumbling to pieces and aging trains and signal
16 systems can't keep up with growing ridership, but we
17 now have a golden chance to comprehensively alleviate
18 this crisis by enacting the Fast Forward Plan, but
19 this plan is inseparable from the congestion pricing.
20 It's the only realistic solution to fairly and
21 sustainably raising the majority of the billions
22 needed to fund Fast Forward. We must make fixing the
23 subway and congestion pricing our city's first
24 priority this year. New Yorkers simply cannot afford
25 to wait to see action on this serious plan to fix our

2 subways and tame the region's traffic. Under
3 congestion pricing everyone will contribute something
4 to fixing the New York City's broken transit network
5 and everyone will get something in return that
6 prioritizes the fundamental needs of a vast majority
7 of regular New Yorkers particularly lower-income
8 workers, out-of-borough residents and seniors who
9 rely on public transit. The complexity of planning
10 for the New York City's future required bold action.
11 New Yorkers deserve better than crippling traffic and
12 unreliable public transit and across the five
13 boroughs they're ready to support Fast Forward and
14 Congestion pricing and return our city to its
15 rightful place as the worldwide leader in
16 transportation equity, sustainability and safety.
17 Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. I got
19 to say that in this group here and many allies we
20 have the voice of the voiceless. You know we have
21 probably one in city even though we have the biggest
22 challenges to make our stations accessible. I think
23 that we also have in the city and you represent with
24 your—the members of the institution that you've been
25 organizing tirelessly the last couple of months and

2 couple of years. The hope that we have to turn our
3 transportation system to the 21st Century. So, I
4 think that the moment is now. The crisis reached a
5 point that there's no turning back. It's not only
6 the 8.5 million residents who we are, but it's the 65
7 million visitors that they come from London, they
8 come from Shanghai, they come from Tokyo, and they
9 come and they compare. And as we have a lot of
10 advancement in different places, when it comes to
11 transportation it is one of those, but I personally
12 would like, you know, to continue working and being
13 your partner as a voice here to be sure that
14 transportation is the centerpiece of any policy that
15 we put in place because it affects the life of
16 everyone. Now, I remember having my two daughters,
17 you know, relying on the elevator, and if not there
18 was an elevator, you know, here I had to be relying
19 on someone that help with the stroller. The same
20 thing also is that 100,000 of people they're leaving
21 our city every week. So, as—as I say, when we
22 advocated to make all the stations accessible it' not
23 only for the 900,000 individuals who live a
24 productive life who rely on the wheelchair to go to
25 work, to visit a friend, to go the museums, it's for

2 the parents. It's for the senior citizens. It's for
3 myself who in the future it doesn't matter the amount
4 of time. I also will rely on a station with an
5 elevator and we fought together to-for Fair Fares.
6 We know that we also have a city that it has a lot of
7 transportation deserts. Many schools they're missing
8 to attract good teachers because sometime during the
9 winter season how someone that would like to make a
10 difference would choose between a school from where
11 they have to walk 10, 15 blocks from the train
12 station or the school that is like two or three
13 blocks from there . So, thank you for your
14 partnership and we will continue together until we
15 turn our system to a 21st Century one. Thank you.

16 JACK DAVIES: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON RODRIGUEZ: And with that,
18 this hearing is adjourned, but before I would like to
19 thank the great team and staff that we have, James
20 from-and the Counsel, James (sic) Giovanni our
21 Counsel, Emily Rooney, Senior Policy, Rick Ello (sic)
22 Policy Analyst, Chima Obichre who is our Financial
23 Analyst and Joan Basile, Financial Analyst, and I'm
24 sorry. I don't have my glasses right now. Thank
25 you. With that, this hearing is adjourned. [gavel]

1 COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION

175

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 3, 2019