

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 1
CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE

----- X

April 3, 2024
Start: 1:20 p.m.
Recess: 3:29 p.m.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Amanda Farías, Chairperson of
Economic Development

Selvena N. Brooks-Powers,
Chairperson of Transportation and
Infrastructure

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Alexa Avilés
Erik D. Bottcher
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Inna Vernikov

COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE
COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Joann Ariola
Chris Banks
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Farrah N. Louis
Mercedes Narcisse
Carlina Rivera

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 2

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:

Susan Zhuang

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE 3

A P P E A R A N C E S

Jennifer Sun, Executive Vice President of
Planning for the New York City Economic
Development Corporation.

Mikkel Adgate, Senior Vice President of
Government and Community Relations for the New
York City Economic Development Corporation

Rabbi Garth Marchant, Queens Jewish Community
Council

Bernard Garrett, Queensbridge Cleaning

Raul Rivera, Taxi and Limousine Commission driver
and a TLC driver advocate

Assembly Member Khaleel Anderson

Evidelia Boyd, Rosedale Civic Association

Felipe Ventegeat

3 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: This is a microphone
4 check for the Committee on Transportation and
5 Infrastructure joint with the Committee on Economic
6 Development, recorded on April 3, 2024, located in
7 the Committee Room, by Nazly Paytuvi.

8 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good afternoon and
9 welcome to the New York City Council hearing of the
10 Committees on Transportation and Infrastructure
11 jointly with Economic Development.

12 At this time, can everybody please
13 silence your cell phones.

14 If you wish to testify, please come up to
15 the Sergeant-at-Arms desk to fill out a testimony
16 slip.

17 At this time and going forward, no one is
18 to approach the dais. I repeat, no one is to approach
19 the dais.

20 Thank you for your cooperation.

21 Chairs, we are ready to begin.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Good afternoon and
23 welcome to this joint hearing of the New York City
24 Council's Committees on Economic Development and
25 Transportation and Infrastructure. I am Majority
Leader Amanda Fariás, Chair of the Committee on

2 Economic Development. I would like to thank my
3 Colleague and Co-Chair, Council Member Selvena
4 Brooks-Powers as well as the other Council Members
5 present today, Banks, Louis, and Council Member De La
6 Rosa on Zoom. I also want to extend my appreciation
7 to the New York City Economic Development Corporation
8 and other stakeholders for participating in this
9 important meeting.

10 Today's hearing will examine the progress
11 of the JFK Redevelopment Program, a 19-billion-dollar
12 investment aimed at transforming JFK Airport into a
13 modern, world-class facility. While this massive
14 infrastructure project has the potential to create
15 thousands of jobs and expand business opportunities,
16 it is crucial that we ensure transparency, equity,
17 and accountability throughout the process. We will
18 pause this hearing for a second.

19 Sergeant, should I re-gavel in, start
20 from the beginning, and we are confirmed good to go?

21 [GAVEL] Good afternoon and welcome to
22 this joint hearing of the New York City's Council
23 Committees on Economic Development and Transportation
24 and Infrastructure. I'm Majority Leader Amanda
25 Fariás, Chair of the Committee on Economic

3 Development. I'd like to thank my Colleague and Co-
4 Chair, Majority Whip Selvena Brooks-Powers as well as
5 the other Council Members present today, Council
6 Members Banks, Louis, De la Rosa on Zoom, and Ariola.

7 I also want to extend my appreciation to
8 the New York City Economic Development Corporation
9 and other stakeholders for participating in this
10 important hearing.

11 Today's hearing will examine the progress
12 of the JFK Redevelopment Program, a 19-billion-dollar
13 investment aimed at transforming JFK Airport into a
14 modern world-class facility. While this massive
15 infrastructure project has the potential to create
16 thousands of jobs and expand business opportunities,
17 it is crucial that we ensure transparency, equity and
18 accountability throughout the process. A key issue we
19 will be exploring today is the terms of the City's
20 lease agreement with the Port Authority for JFK
21 Airport. We need to understand how the funds
22 generated by the airport are being used and to what
23 extent they are being reinvested in the communities
24 most impacted by its operations. We will also be
25 examining efforts to meet the 30 percent M/WBE
contracting goal for the redevelopment project. EDC

1 plays a critical role in holding the Port Authority
2 accountable and ensuring equitable access to these
3 opportunities. We want to know what specific steps
4 are being taken to support and empower local M/WBEs.
5 Additionally, we want to hear that meaningful
6 community engagement is part of the redevelopment
7 process. The neighborhoods surrounding JFK have long
8 borne the brunt of the airport's impacts, from
9 traffic congestion to air and noise pollution. We
10 need to ensure that their voices are being heard and
11 their needs are being met throughout the airport's
12 redevelopment. We will also plan to discuss the Port
13 Authority's enforcement of quality-of-life issues for
14 local residents, such as illegal truck parking and
15 idling in residential areas near the airport. While
16 we recognize the vital role the JFK Airport plays in
17 the city's economy, we must find ways to mitigate the
18 negative impacts on surrounding communities.

19
20 Finally, we will be requesting a
21 comprehensive progress report on the redevelopment
22 program. The JFK Vision Plan outlines a range of
23 challenges facing the airport from inefficient
24 terminals to limited transit access. We need to
25 understand how each of these issues is being

1
2 addressed and whether the project is on track to meet
3 its goals. Council Member Brooks-Powers' bill before
4 the Committee today, Intro. 134, would do just that.
5 Intro. 134 would require biannual reports to the City
6 Council from EDC regarding the JFK Airport
7 Redevelopment Project and related Community Benefit
8 Agreements. I'll let my Co-Chair discuss her bill in
9 more detail in a moment.

10 Before we begin, I would like to remind
11 all those present today to please maintain decorum
12 throughout the hearing.

13 If you're here to testify, you will have
14 three minutes to speak when your name is called.
15 Please keep responses concise so that everyone has a
16 chance to be heard. If you are unable to finish,
17 please submit your complete written testimony to
18 testimony@council.nyc.gov.

19 Finally, I would like to thank the
20 Economic Development team here at the Council, Senior
21 Counsel Alex Paulenoff, Senior Policy Analyst William
22 Hongach, and Finance Analyst Glenn Martelloni for all
23 their hard work preparing for this hearing.

3 I will now turn it over to my Colleague,
4 Majority Whip and Chair Brooks-Powers, for her
5 opening remarks.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Good
7 afternoon and thank you for attending this joint
8 hearing of the Committees on Transportation and
9 Infrastructure and Economic Development.

10 Today, we will be focusing on the JFK
11 Redevelopment Program to better understand the
12 progress that has been made on improving and
13 revitalizing one of the busiest airports in the
14 country and the effects these changes are having on
15 the surrounding communities. In addition, the
16 Committee will hear Intro. number 134, sponsored by
17 myself, in relation to requiring regular reports on
18 the redevelopment plans at JFK International Airport.
19 I would like to thank my fellow Co-Chair, Majority
20 Leader Amanda Fariás, for her support on today's
21 hearing.

22 JFK is a major economic engine for the
23 region that supports hundreds of thousands of jobs
24 and generates tens of billions in annual sales and
25 wages. However, for years, the communities adjacent
to the airport, primarily black and brown

1 environmental justice communities, have endured the
2 pollution, noise, and traffic that JFK has produced.
3 Overall, 37 zip codes directly surround the airport
4 so we must ensure that JFK acts as a better neighbor.
5 JFK is leased by the City of New York directly to the
6 Port Authority. Thus, it is critical that we
7 understand how our land is being redeveloped. As
8 such, last year, we held a hearing on JFK airport,
9 but the Port Authority declined to testify before the
10 Council. Today, yet again, the Authority has declined
11 to sit for questions before the City's democratically
12 elected Council. I am once more disappointed in the
13 Port Authority for willfully ignoring the city and
14 communities in which it directly affects. We intend
15 to revisit this topic regularly, and it is my sincere
16 desire that the Port Authority joins us in the
17 future. With that said, I would like to thank the New
18 York City Economic Development Corporation for
19 agreeing to testify before the Committees today on
20 their role as lease manager for JFK.

22 At today's hearing, we will be examining
23 the environmental and community impact of this
24 redevelopment. For decades, the airport has placed
25 burdens on the surrounding airport communities.

Noise, pollution, and traffic all have negative consequences on health and quality of life of residents. JFK is a beneficial asset to the entire metropolitan region so it is imperative that the negative effects of the redevelopment do not fall solely on the airport's neighboring communities.

Next, we will be inquiring about the use of local workers on the redevelopment program. The JFK Redevelopment Program is a 19-plus-billion-dollar investment that will add more than 15,000 jobs to the area with 9,600 direct jobs coming from the redevelopment. As Chair of the Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure, I have focused on the importance of looking at infrastructure through the lens of equity. As such, it is vital that the substantial economic benefits that will come from JFK Redevelopment Program are equitably dispersed to the workers and businesses living near the airport. In addition, JFK redevelopment program has a goal of 30 percent M/WBE utilization across all redevelopment projects. As an advocate for increased utilization of M/WBEs, I believe businesses across the city owned by women and New Yorkers of color deserve the opportunity to obtain major government contracts.

3 Ensuring diverse businesses have equitable access to
4 those opportunities, strengthen communities, and
5 extends economic opportunity across the city. The
6 Committee will be checking in to ensure that
7 redevelopment contracts and projects are being made
8 accessible to M/WBEs.

9 Finally, the Committees will be
10 addressing how City agencies are engaging local
11 communities surrounding the airport. Given the vast
12 investment in the airport and its effects on local
13 jobs, businesses, and traffic, we want to make sure
14 the local communities are kept in the conversation
15 with redevelopment policymakers.

16 Before we begin, I would like to thank my
17 Staff and Committee Staff for their hard work, Kevin
18 Kotowski, Senior Policy Analyst; John Basile, Senior
19 Policy Analyst; Mark Chen, Senior Counsel to the
20 Committee; Connor Mealey, Counsel to the Committee,
21 Adrian Drepaul, Senior Financial Analyst; Jack
22 Seigenthaler, my Policy and Budget Director; Kierra
23 Powell, my Communications Director; and Renee Taylor,
24 my Chief-of-Staff.

25 I will now ask the Committee Counsel to
go over some procedural items and swear in the

3 representatives from EDC, but first I'd like to
4 acknowledge that we have been joined by Council
5 Members Gutiérrez, Avilés, Narcisse, and Bottcher.
6 Thank you.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL PAULENOFF: Alex
8 Paulenoff, Senior Counsel.

9 Will all members of the Administration
10 today please raise your right hand?

11 Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth,
12 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in your
13 testimony today and to respond honestly to Council
14 Member questions?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Yes.

16 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Yes.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL PAULENOFF: Thank you.
18 You may begin when ready.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Good
20 afternoon, Chairs Farías and Brooks-Powers and
21 Members of the Economic Development and the
22 Transportation and Infrastructure Committees. My name
23 is Jennifer Sun, and I serve as the Executive Vice
24 President of Planning for the New York City Economic
25 Development Corporation. I'm joined by my colleague,
Mikkel Adgate, Senior Vice President of Government

1
2 and Community Relations. We are here to testify about
3 EDC's role in the JFK Redevelopment Program.

4 The John F. Kennedy International Airport
5 is critical to New York City's economy and the
6 aviation industry, is one of the largest employers in
7 Queens. JFK supports tens of thousands of direct and
8 indirect jobs and generates over 40 billion dollars
9 in economic activity while connecting city residents
10 to the world and bringing the world to us. According
11 to the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey, JFK
12 directly employs nearly 40,000 workers and generates
13 more than 16 billion in wages and nearly 300,000 jobs
14 across the region. As you may recall from our January
15 2023 testimony, the City of New York owns the land on
16 which both LaGuardia Airport and John F. Kennedy
17 International Airport are located. Through the
18 maritime contract between New York City's Department
19 of Small Business Services and EDC, the City retains
20 EDC to perform services including the promotion and
21 administration of leases for certain City-owned
22 properties which includes publicly owned aviation
23 facilities. As part of this arrangement, we at EDC
24 are the lease administrator for the City's lease
25 agreement with the Port Authority of New York and New

1 Jersey for both airport sites. The Port Authority is
2 a financially self-supporting bi-state agency that is
3 tasked with building, operating, and maintaining
4 critical transportation and infrastructure assets in
5 New York and New Jersey. Port Authority is the lessee
6 of JFK through a triple net lease agreement in which
7 the tenant is responsible for the payment of all
8 expenses related to the site, such as rent and
9 utilities, insurance, and maintenance costs. The
10 purpose of a triple net lease is to make the tenant
11 responsible for everything related to the site and
12 remove the landlord from any involvement in the
13 operations of the tenant at the site. Under these
14 terms, the Port Authority has complete operational
15 control of JFK Airport. Through its operational
16 control, the Port Authority oversees capital
17 planning, such as renovations, as well as the current
18 JFK Redevelopment Program. The Port Authority is also
19 responsible for all aspects of airport functions,
20 including airside operations, asset management,
21 maintenance, customer service, capacity utilization,
22 environmental stewardship, safety, security, and
23 community relations. Many of these activities, it
24 carries out through sub leases, vendor agreements,
25

1 and concessions. The Port Authority has leased,
2 developed, and operated JFK from the City through
3 various leases and amendments dating back to 1947.
4 The current lease agreement for JFK began in 2004 and
5 was set to expire in 2050. However, a lease amendment
6 facilitated by the City in 2021 extended the lease
7 expiration to 2060. As lease administrator, EDC
8 participates on the Airport Board with Port Authority
9 staff. The Airport Board was created in the 2004
10 lease to assist with and inform the administration of
11 the lease. To be clear, the Airport Board is not a
12 reporting, oversight, or enforcement body. Rather, it
13 is tasked to review municipal air terminal operations
14 against certain financial, operational, and
15 performance standards that were established by the
16 City and the Port Authority at the time. With respect
17 to the 2004 lease, the performance metrics shared by
18 the Port Authority at the Airport Board include
19 market share, passenger and cargo service,
20 operations, capital spending, quality of service, and
21 community relations. As part of the 2021 lease
22 extension, the Port Authority agreed to share
23 additional metrics related to environmental
24 sustainability and community initiatives associated
25

1 with the JFK Redevelopment Plan. In addition, EDC on
2 behalf of the City can use Airport Board meetings to
3 raise topics that advance shared goals. For example,
4 at an Airport Board meeting last year, EDC echoed the
5 community's concerns regarding overnight truck
6 parking in residential neighborhoods in South and
7 East Queens. As a member of the Deputy Mayor of
8 Operations Multi-Agency Task Force to Address
9 Inadequate Overnight Truck Parking Throughout the
10 City, EDC was able to use its participation in the
11 Airport Board to support the community's calls for
12 the Port Authority to identify potential acreage for
13 this use. In collaboration, the Port Authority was
14 able to negotiate with its private operator and, in
15 November 2023, received Port Authority Board approval
16 to provide approximately 100 additional spots and 25
17 EV chargers at JFK Airport for overnight truck
18 parking. Although much work remains to address
19 chronic overnight truck parking in residential areas,
20 the expanded-on airport truck parking provided by the
21 Port Authority is supporting the City's effort.

22
23 In 2018, in anticipation of a JFK
24 redevelopment effort, the Port Authority convened the
25 JFK Redevelopment Community Advisory Council, Co-

1
2 Chaired by U.S. Congressman Gregory Meeks and former
3 Queens Borough President Melinda Katz. The Community
4 Advisory Council has representatives from the New
5 York State Legislature, New York City Council, New
6 York City Community Boards, as well as local non-
7 profits and community-focused organizations. The
8 Community Advisory Council convenes regularly and
9 currently receives information regarding the JFK
10 redevelopment and works with the Port Authority to
11 support community outreach efforts and develop
12 community-focused programs to provide meaningful
13 opportunities for local and diverse businesses, M/WBE
14 students, and jobseekers.

15 Between 2018 and 2020, the Port Authority
16 was in negotiations with multiple terminal operators
17 to advance various work streams related to the JFK
18 redevelopment effort. Amidst these efforts, the
19 global COVID-19 pandemic hit, restricting
20 international travel, disrupting global supply
21 chains, and precipitating a chilling effect on the
22 financial markets. JFK traffic volumes were severely
23 affected, and the viability of the JFK redevelopment
24 was jeopardized. Against this backdrop, in February
25 2021, the de Blasio Administration signed an

1
2 emergency executive order to extend the Port
3 Authority's lease of JFK Airport from 2050 to 2060.
4 This occurred in close consultation and coordination
5 with Congressman Meeks and Queens Borough President
6 Richards. By extending the lease, the previous
7 Administration was able to facilitate the viability
8 of the redevelopment projects and their associated
9 community benefits, including nation-leading minority
10 and women-owned business goals, local business goals,
11 and sustainability initiatives.

12 In closing, I wish to turn to
13 Introduction 134, the proposed legislation which
14 would require EDC to produce reports twice a year on
15 the progress of the JFK redevelopment plans. EDC is
16 currently reviewing the legislation along with our
17 colleagues at the Law Department and the Port
18 Authority, the latter of which oversees and is
19 responsible for the JFK redevelopment.

20 Thank you for your time this afternoon,
21 and we'll now take your questions.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Thank you so much
23 for your public testimony today and for being here
24 with us.

3 I'm going to start off with a couple
4 rounds of questions then I'll pass it over to Chair
5 Brooks-Powers.

6 I'd like to go over some of the questions
7 around the lease terms. In 2004, the City and the
8 Port Authority signed a 50-year lease for JFK
9 Airport. At our last hearing, EDC noted that the Port
10 Authority New York, New Jersey pays 153 million
11 annually with a 3 percent escalator every year, and
12 that rent goes to the general fund. In addition, EDC
13 responded that there were traditional remedies if the
14 Port Authority of New York, New Jersey defaults on
15 payments for rents, having done RFPs for different
16 terminal operators, but determined that the PANYNJ is
17 the best one to fulfill these goals. With that, what
18 were the most important takeaways for this
19 negotiation for the City?

20 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Although I
21 think on one hand, neither of us were a party to
22 those negotiations in 2004 or in the more recent
23 lease extension, I think if the question is what did
24 the City of get out of the lease extension most
25 recently from 2021, I think the City working closely
with the Governor's office but also with Congressman

1
2 Meeks and Borough President Richards together, I
3 think there was a concerted effort to ensure that
4 there are strong and specific M/WBE participation
5 goals for not only construction contracts but also
6 professional services contracts, that there is
7 prioritization of awarding contracts to local
8 business entities in priority zip codes around JFK,
9 as well as more specific environmental sustainability
10 commitments and a series of community initiatives to
11 support increasing exposure for high school students
12 to the aviation industry.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Okay, and is this
14 the same deal for rent today?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: As a result
16 of the 2021 lease extension, I believe the City has
17 increased the rent that is received by the City by 5
18 million dollars a year so the total rent payment to
19 the City's general fund is now 183 million dollars
20 annually.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Sorry, say again.

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: The current
23 rent payment to the City is 183 million dollars
24 annually, and that includes the 5 million dollar
25 annual increase negotiated in 2021.

3 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Will that include
4 the 3 percent?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We can
6 confirm whether that includes the 3 percent

7 (INAUDIBLE)

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: (INAUDIBLE)
9 followup. I guess just an alignment here. I know in
10 section 4.10 of the lease agreement, it appears the
11 City has the right to adjust it, at least the rent
12 paid by the Port Authority, and have we made any
13 adjustments outside of the 2021 agreement?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We have not
15 made any other lease amendments since 2021.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Okay, and can you
17 folks speak to what the City specifically does with
18 the funds?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: It's
20 actually not our purview as EDC. Because it goes to
21 the City's general fund, OMB has authority over how
22 those funds are dispersed.

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: And do you folks
24 know to what extent any of those funds are currently
25 redistributed to the communities impacted by the
airport?

2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We do not.
3 We would have to speak with our OMB colleagues to get
4 a fuller accounting.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Could you go into
6 more detail the remedies EDC has in regards to if the
7 PANYNJ defaults on payments for rents?

8 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: The remedy
9 through the lease is to default the Port Authority if
10 it's not performing in accordance to the lease terms.
11 What that would mean practically if we were to
12 default the Port Authority is that either the City or
13 a private operator would need to step into the Port
14 Authority's role in taking over the contracts to
15 operate the airports.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Okay, and what
17 types are...

18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Chair, I'm
19 sorry to interrupt. If I could just add onto that.
20 One thing to keep in mind is that EDC is not a
21 signatory to the lease. The City signs the lease, the
22 SBS Commissioner signed it, and so questions about
23 default and like what the practical reality of that
24 would be would be a City decision and not a New York
25 City Economic Development Corporation decision.

1
2 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Got it. Thank you
3 for that comment. Any type of RFPs have been done for
4 terminal operators before?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Because the
6 Port Authority is responsible for operations and
7 capital planning for JFK, RFPs to support its
8 redevelopment and any capital investment would be
9 happening through the Port Authority, not through
10 EDC.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Okay, great. Thank
12 you. I'd like to talk a little bit about the Airport
13 Board. The lease states that the quarterly updates
14 from the Port Authority to the Airport Board are
15 supposed to include updates with regard to potential
16 collaboration with EDC and the City to foster
17 development opportunities. Has the Port Authority
18 discussed those areas for collaboration with EDC?

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Since I
20 assumed my role at EDC in 2022, we have held two
21 Airport Board meetings last year, in May and in
22 December and, in those meetings, the Port Authority
23 has shared reports that they have also shared with
24 the Community Advisory Council that has provided
25 information about the progress of each of the

terminal projects, M/WBE awards and payments as well as community outreach initiatives.

CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Jst from my knowledge, quarterly updates are, in 2022, you're saying you've had two meetings. Does that mean they've presented you with two reports each of those meetings so there's four reports for the year.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: So to clarify, we've only had two meetings last year so, even though in the lease, it does talk about quarterly meetings. In reality, we have had two meetings.

CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Part of it is because we're building up our capacity on our team to be able to engage more regularly with the Port Authority but, in each of those meetings, we received I think at least one report that again was shared with the Community Advisory Council, and then at a recent meeting in December, we also received an annual air traffic report that is also available on the Port Authority website.

CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Okay. I guess for us here in the Council in terms of accountability and

1 holding the Port Authority to what they're mandated
2 to do in the lease, why are we not pushing harder,
3 one, for the meetings which I know calendars can be
4 complicated so sometimes that's more difficult, but
5 if they're mandated to present us quarterly reports,
6 why isn't that just being sent in an email to the
7 EDC?
8

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We were
10 eager to meet with the Port Authority more regularly.
11 I will I think highlight that this has begun to
12 establish a more regular line of communication.
13 Because of staff turnover at the EDC Transportation
14 Department, we're building back that capacity and
15 establishing a set of working relationships with the
16 Port Authority so our goal is to ramp up towards
17 quarterly meetings this year, and the reports are
18 actually shared with us in advance of the meetings,
19 and then we review them together at the Airport Board
20 meeting so there's a basis for conversation and for
21 EDC to be able to ask questions and followup.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Okay, I mean we
23 would, and I'm sure my Co-Chair will go into this a
24 bit more as well, but quarterly meetings obviously
25 need to happen but, at the very least, quarterly

3 reports should be happening to the Economic
4 Development Corporation, especially if we're only
5 able to schedule twice a year when we know there are
6 four quarters in a year.

7 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Chair, if I
8 could just follow up on that. I think one thing to
9 keep in mind is that the 2004 lease and the creation
10 of this Airport Board at the time didn't really
11 contemplate the massive JFK redevelopment effort
12 that's underway now nor did it really contemplate
13 extensive external engagement so to reiterate
14 something that Jennifer said, all of the materials
15 that have been shared with the Airport Board are also
16 made available to the Community Advisory Council in
17 an external setting in public meetings, I believe
18 Chair Brooks-Powers attends those meetings with her
19 colleagues as well, and those materials are available
20 on the website, and so I think that with the
21 establishment of the Community Advisory Council, it
22 created an additional mechanism of oversight with the
23 community directly in a way that wasn't contemplated
24 in 2004, and I think is reflective of an effort to
25 have more robust engagement with the community on
these critical topics.

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Sure. No, thank
3 you for that. I think I mean for myself, even before
4 this hearing, I went to the website to see what the
5 reports look like. I was only really able to see a
6 PowerPoint that had some of the data analysis and
7 some of the data points but didn't necessarily
8 produce a blanketed report that may be, I guess in my
9 brain, it comes out more so in a document that has
10 all of the data that they're computing and trying to
11 analyze to move forward on their progress or the
12 metrics. If possible, would you folks be able to
13 provide those reports or the report that you've been
14 giving, both the annual and the quarterly?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Yes, we can
16 provide the reports that have been shared with us.
17 You'll see that it's the same reports that are shared
18 at the Community Advisory Council.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Okay, awesome.
20 Thank you for that. Then just one last question on
21 this. What's the current status of the Airport Board
22 Director?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I'm sorry,
24 repeat the question, the current status?
25

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: What is the
3 current status of the Airport Board Director? Have we
4 filled the position full-time?

5 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: I think
6 you're referring to the Aviation Director role at
7 EDC?

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Yes.

9 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Yeah, so
10 when we testified in January 2023, that position had
11 been vacant for some time. Last year, we did fill
12 that role, and so we do have an Aviation Director who
13 was at the last Community Advisory Council meeting, I
14 believe met Chair Brooks-Powers at that time as well.

15 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay, great. In
16 terms of sustainability, how is the JFK redevelopment
17 program incorporating it and resiliency measures?

18 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: The Port
19 Authority is trying to decarbonize its operations
20 through a number of things so it's requiring the
21 terminal developers and operators through best
22 efforts to transition to using electric vehicles
23 during the construction period as well as
24 transitioning the ground service equipment at the
25 airport to electric equipment as well. We also toured

3 with the Deputy Mayor of Operations staff the barge
4 service that's currently in place by the Port
5 Authority to bring construction aggregate materials
6 to the site and to bring out construction demolition
7 materials off the site as a way of significantly
8 reducing truck trips in the local neighborhoods. The
9 Port Authority has also required a minimum of LEED
10 Silver certification for the new terminal buildings.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Are there specific
12 targets for reducing greenhouse gas emissions,
13 improving energy efficiency, increasing the use of
14 renewable energy throughout the project?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: The Port
16 Authority has set specific goals, I think, to try to
17 transition, again, the airport operations to be as
18 low emissions as possible by 2050, but the Port
19 Authority would be in a better position to talk about
20 those specific goals and commitments.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: How will the
22 redeveloped JFK be better to withstand the impacts of
23 climate change compared to the current airport?

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Again, the
25 Port Authority, I think, would be in a better

1
2 position to assess its progress and the difference
3 that it's making through the transition.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Okay, and then I
5 just have two last questions and then I'll turn it
6 over.

7 According to the Airport Advisory Panel
8 projections, JFK's demand for passenger traffic could
9 exceed its capacity by up to three million passengers
10 annually within the next few years. For every million
11 passengers not accommodated, The New York, New Jersey
12 region loses approximately 140 million in annual
13 wages, 400 million in annual sales, and 2,500 jobs.
14 Are these numbers still accurate?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We would
16 have to have a conversation with the Port Authority
17 to understand how they developed those initial
18 projections back in 2017 and how they might evaluate
19 that today against the current redevelopment project.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Just one second.
21 Just my last question. What recourse does the City
22 have if the Port Authority is not adequately meeting
23 the commitments outlined in the Vision Plan?

24 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Our
25 approach is really to strengthen our engagement with

1
2 the Port Authority in these Airport Board meetings,
3 but also outside of the Airport Board meetings and to
4 make clear that we have, I think, a shared priority
5 around really maximizing economic access and
6 opportunity related to the JFK Redevelopment Project
7 as well as community benefits and environmental
8 sustainability so we see our role as maintaining
9 active and sustained engagement.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: I appreciate that
11 response. I do just want to urge you folks to
12 encourage the Port Authority to have a better
13 relationship with the City Council. At the end of the
14 day, you folks are managing the property that they
15 are leasing. We have a lease agreement, and the
16 responsibility will continue to fall on the Economic
17 Development Corporation's hands if their refusal to
18 show up to the Council and answer real questions and,
19 if they're not incorporating you folks in their
20 vision planning or their updates or in any other
21 capacity, this will be a continuation over our tenure
22 as Council Members, and I don't think that's fair to
23 the Economic Development Corporation and so in this
24 process, whether it's through reports and maybe
25 making sure there's consistent communication with us

1
2 and providing us those reports and through obviously
3 the community meetings, through the Advisory Council
4 which are critical to the engagement process and the
5 transparency process, I really urge you folks and for
6 the Port Authority folks watching the hearing today
7 that they do better and show up to the New York City
8 Council's hearings going forward, but thank you for
9 answering my questions, and I'll now turn it over to
10 my Co-Chair Majority Whip Brooks-Powers.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
12 and just underscoring the same sentiment in terms of
13 the need for the Port Authority to be an active
14 participation in this discussion. We recognize that
15 they are a state agency, just like the MTA who comes
16 multiple times before this Body but considering that,
17 in this instance, the airport is operating on City
18 land, there is a level of accountability that is
19 warranted in the discussion but, again, I want to
20 thank you for being here to answer the questions that
21 you are able to, and we hope that the ones that
22 you're unable to answer that you're able to get those
23 answers from the Port Authority and report it back to
24 the Council.

1
2 I'm just wanting to add on some questions
3 as it pertains to the Airport Board adding on to
4 Majority Leader Fariás, so in our last hearing on the
5 JFK Redevelopment Program in January of 2023, EDC
6 noted that in regards to the Airport Board that they
7 were working towards increasing community and Council
8 Member involvement on this board. In addition, EDC
9 said that they would discuss the ability of minutes
10 being published or made public as meetings are
11 currently closed now. Within the past year plus, what
12 has EDC done to make the Airport Board more community
13 and Council oriented?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: As I've
15 learned more about the Community Advisory Council and
16 having attended one of the meetings to understand
17 what is covered in those presentations and then what
18 information is reviewed at the Airport Board
19 meetings, my view is that the Community Advisory
20 Council is a very robust venue for community
21 engagement and an opportunity with the Port Authority
22 and with the terminal developers and operators in the
23 room to have a venue for holding both parties
24 accountable through that sort of process, but also
25 see that there is an opportunity for the Airport

1 Board to complement the Community Advisory Council
2 presentations as well. That said, I think we see the
3 Community Advisory Council as being the appropriate
4 venue for community engagement around the JFK
5 redevelopment project.
6

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Do you know
8 how the Advisory Council meetings are convened? Who
9 calls for the community advisory meetings to take
10 place?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I don't
12 know who technically convenes them.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: The Port
14 Authority.

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Okay.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And the
17 frequency, the date of time, the location is all
18 selected by the Port Authority. How do you imagine
19 the community being able to hold the Port Authority
20 accountable in those spaces? How have you seen it in
21 the one meeting that you have attended?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I see that
23 there's an opportunity to ask questions. Although I
24 recognize it's a very lengthy presentation, there's a
25 lot of information that is shared..

3 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: At what
4 point of the meeting that you attended did the
5 community ask questions?

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I don't
7 remember.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Was it
9 during the different sections of the agenda? Was it
10 at the end? Do you recall?

11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I think
12 there were different opportunities during the
13 presentation whether...

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: It was at
15 the end.

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Okay.

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And like
18 you said, it's a very long meeting and people are
19 coming in from after work, and the agenda is set. Do
20 you know who sets the agenda for the Advisory Council
21 meeting?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Sounds like
23 it's the Port Authority that sets...

24 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: It's the
25 Port Authority. So when we say that there's an
opportunity for the community to hold the Port

3 Authority accountable in the space that they curate,
4 not so much so, but I do appreciate your sentiments
5 on that.

6 In terms of the two reports that you
7 received last year, do you know if the report is
8 identical to the report that's in the minutes that
9 are on the website for a new JFK?

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I can't say
11 that I've compared the presentations to verify
12 whether the same information is being presented.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'd be
14 curious to know if the information mirrors one
15 another or not, because I do know that the
16 information that's presented in the Advisory Council
17 meeting is not necessarily, as the Majority Leader
18 shared, a blanket of information that you could you
19 kind of understand how they get to those numbers that
20 they're presenting or to understand what is being
21 presented. It is curated in a way that it's
22 digestible to the public, but it's not giving the
23 full authentic lens of what is at stake and so I'm
24 curious if EDC's report is the same as that report
25 because, if so, I would argue that EDC is still not
getting the full picture and then, on the flip side,

1
2 if EDC is getting more information, that is showing
3 that the community is not seeing full transparency so
4 I would like to have an idea if you can report back
5 to the Council in terms of the report that EDC
6 receives versus the report that is presented at the
7 Advisory Council meetings, if they're identical, and
8 if not, what the differences are in those reports.

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We're happy
10 to do that comparison. I will say superficially it
11 looks like the same PowerPoint presentation that's
12 shared at the Community Advisory Council. We look
13 forward to a partnership with you and the other
14 Council Members to talk more specifically about what
15 underlying data and additional performance metrics
16 you're interested in seeing and that EDC can play a
17 role in asking for.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And I think
19 that would be helpful and I'm glad to hear you say
20 that and that's where like Intro. 134 looks to do. It
21 looks to be able to pull out the relevant data to
22 help us know, one, that the Port Authority is holding
23 true to some of the tenets in the lease, but then
24 also to have the transparency and accountability
25 that's needed for it.

3 Just going back to the initial question I
4 was asking, just wanting to know in terms of the
5 Airport Board minutes, has that been made published?
6 Has it been published publicly just yet or no?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: We have not
8 been sharing minutes from the meetings, no. We take
9 staff notes. We don't have an official note taker at
10 the meeting to prepare minutes with the possibility
11 of that being shared publicly.

12 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Is there
13 any intention to at some point?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: That is
15 something that we need to talk with the Port
16 Authority respectfully because we're a part of the
17 Board together. It's not a decision that we can make
18 unilaterally, so even if we have the point of view of
19 being comfortable with sharing the information...

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Does EDC
21 have that point of view that you would be willing to
22 share?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: That's the
24 point of view that I have.

25 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So the EDC
has that point of view?

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER BEATON: Yes.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Has EDC
5 asked the Port Authority if they would be okay with
6 making it public yet?

7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We may have
8 had conversations about that in the past. Happy to
9 ask again and push on that.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: That would
11 be great.

12 Are there any new additions since our
13 January hearing to the Airport Board from EDC and/or
14 the community?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: When you
16 say new additions, meaning new representatives from..

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: To the
18 Board..

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: From staff?
20 Yes, from the perspective of, my having participated
21 in the first Airport Board meetings last year so I
22 could be new to the Airport Board in addition to our
23 newly hired Aviation Director who started in June so
24 he participated in the Airport Board meeting in
25 December and then, additionally, so there's four
Mayoral appointees to the Board in addition to four

1
2 Port Authority appointees so to just complete the
3 picture on the EDC side, I'm the EVP of Planning, we
4 have the Aviation Director from the Transportation
5 and Waterfront Department on that Board, we would
6 also have the SVP and Department Head of
7 Transportation and Waterfront representing EDC on
8 that Board and, finally, a Senior Vice President from
9 the Asset Management Department at EDC who we work
10 closely with.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Has EDC
12 considered leveraging one, if not more, of those
13 Mayoral appointments to be a representative from the
14 community to serve on that Board?

15 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Thank you
16 for the question, Chair. After this came up, at our
17 last hearing in January, we did have extensive
18 conversations with the Law Department about a Mayoral
19 appointment outside of the EDC staff. Our
20 understanding is that because this Board functions to
21 help support and facilitate the lease that it is not
22 open to the public in the same way that the Community
23 Advisory Council meetings are so, while we did have
24 discussions about it, the ultimate decision was that
25 the Mayoral appointees will continue to be EDC staff

3 as that series of meetings being about lease
4 administration rather than, as we've discussed
5 earlier, the implementation of the redevelopment
6 plan.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm just
8 curious about that ruling by the City's Attorney, and
9 only because when I think about the Health and
10 Hospital Board, for example, they have members that
11 are appointed from the Mayor on that board, similarly
12 from the Council, that are not necessarily agency
13 staff or bureaucratic in any way, and they deal with
14 leases, they deal with a lot of contracts as well on
15 behalf of the City so I'm not really following the
16 rationale for that finding.

17 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: I'm not
18 familiar with the Health and Hospitals Board. I guess
19 my question back would be is the Health and Hospitals
20 Board administering a triple net lease? So going back
21 to our testimony and the description of the function
22 of that lease, leaving all of the operations to the
23 Port Authority as the tenant rather than to the City,
24 and by extension, EDC as the lease manager so, just
25 based on what you've explained, I imagine that the
structures are different because of this being a tool

1
2 of lease administration. I will also just add,
3 anecdotally, as Jennifer and I have been learning a
4 lot of the history, as you can imagine, a lease going
5 back to 1947 has a lot of ups and downs between the
6 various administrations, both on the Mayoral side and
7 the Gubernatorial side. One of the things that we've
8 come to understand is that when the 2004 lease was
9 negotiated and this Airport Board was established,
10 part of that was to solve a problem with the fact
11 that the City and the Port Authority had a very
12 negative relationship at the time. You think of some
13 of the history of the Giuliani administration
14 threatening to privatize both JFK and LaGuardia and
15 so our sort of reading between the lines of that 2004
16 lease being that the Airport Board was initially
17 established to ensure that both parties were speaking
18 to one another in a way that they had not been. As we
19 had mentioned when we were back here in January 2023,
20 our understanding was that there were also years in
21 the previous Administration where The Airport Board
22 was not being convened, and so what I will say is
23 that under the new Administration, both from the
24 Mayoral side and the Gubernatorial side, is that it
25 has been a goal to have those meetings to ramp up, as

Jennifer explained, and to ensure that there are more open lines of communication than what our predecessors have had.

CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you for that, but I still don't necessarily agree with the outcome of that decision, and I say that because in the lease itself, it also talks about certain community benefits as a component of the lease and who else better than to make sure that the Port Authority is staying true to those commitments but a member of the community so I just still don't agree with that outcome. I'd like to follow up a little bit more. It would be great to see not just agency representation on both sides, right, Gubernatorial and the Mayoral side, but to have someone that is a part of the impacted community on that board.

In the 2021 amendment to the Airport Board agreement signed by the City and the Port Authority, both parties committed to engage in a "process of updating and revising performance standards, including new standards regarding environmental sustainability and community initiatives." Has the Airport Board generated those new standards?

3 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: It's not
4 the responsibility of the Airport Board to generate
5 performance standards. Instead, we do look to the
6 Port Authority to put forward their point of view of
7 the commitments and the strategies for...

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But the
9 lease says both parties.

10 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Again, I
11 think my view is that because the Port Authority is
12 operating the airport, they are in a better position...

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But the
14 lease says both parties...

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Okay, so,
16 again, EDC's role on the Airport Board can be, and
17 what we are doing is reviewing the information that
18 the Port Authority shares about what are their goals
19 and what are their strategies for achieving
20 environmental sustainability and community impact.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So based on
22 what the lease says which prescribes the lease the
23 role that EDC plays, not the role that EDC chooses to
24 play, I think we need to look at how we establish and
25 update these standards as it is laid out in the lease
because it, again, says both parties, and I would

1
2 like to see that from EDC, but a followup to that is
3 how has EDC or how will, in this case, EDC consult
4 with the community or topic area experts to establish
5 these recommendations for the revision of the
6 standards?

7 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Yeah. Thank
8 you for the question, Chair. I think, given EDC's
9 mission for economic development across all five
10 boroughs, we're definitely open to conversations from
11 the community in addition to whatever may be asked or
12 shared at the Community Advisory Council with the
13 Port Authority. We're happy to have those
14 conversations with you. I know that we had reached
15 out in October to try to schedule time with you and
16 your team to discuss this very topic, and so I think
17 there is room for us to work together to better
18 understand what the community's priorities are and
19 then, more specifically, what EDC has the role in
20 venue to help support.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, and
22 thank you for that, and I welcome and have always
23 welcomed meetings with EDC, with the head of EDC who
24 has not been willing to meet with me so we've had to
25 revert to a hearing.

2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: I'm sorry,
3 Chair. I do have to push back on that because I know
4 that President and CEO Andrew Kimball has always been
5 willing to meet with elected officials. I know that
6 we were not able to get it calendared at the end of
7 the year, but I wouldn't characterize it that he was
8 unwilling to meet with you.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: We could
10 agree to disagree because the feedback from my Staff
11 when we requested it was that he was not going to
12 make himself available. We were willing to change the
13 date but, again, I don't want to take up space
14 disputing that. Like I said, I could agree to
15 disagree on that.

16 The next question I have is the Airport
17 Board is empowered to interface with certain City
18 agencies like TLC and make recommendations
19 "pertaining to improved and more efficient traffic
20 management at the New York airports." Has it made
21 such recommendations and, if so, what are they?

22 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We haven't
23 talked about issues that pertain to TLC or improving
24 ground transportation around the airport, but that's
25 an area that we would welcome further conversations

3 with you and other constituents to understand what
4 their concerns are and how EDC can be helpful in
5 bringing TLC to the table to pursue other solutions.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm going
7 to pause because I have more questions, and I want to
8 yield to my Colleagues. I know we have a few members.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Thank you, Co-
10 Chair. I'd first like to acknowledge that we've been
11 joined by Council Members Vernikov and Rivera.

12 We have first up for Member questions,
13 Council Member Narcisse followed by Vernikov then
14 Avilés.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you,
16 Majority Whip, and I want to say thank you for being
17 here. One of the things before I ask my question I
18 want to echo on is the importance, I heard Majority
19 Whip allude to it is the importance for M/WBE to get
20 their fair share of contracts. It's very, very
21 important, and the job opportunity as well, what
22 measures are being taken to ensure that job
23 opportunities are accessible to residents of diverse
24 backgrounds and communities across the city? Can you
25 provide details on any targeted hiring initiatives on
that, ensuring that we have equitable access to

1
2 employment opportunities? Those two questions before
3 I come back to the next one. Yeah.

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: So the Port
5 Authority in its partnership with the Council for
6 Airport Opportunity, which is one of the non-profit
7 organizations that is charged with supporting
8 workforce outreach and placements, I think would be
9 in a better position to talk more in detail about the
10 specific local hiring initiatives that they're
11 undertaking. I will note that our Aviation Director
12 who started last June, he is now on the board of the
13 Council for Airport Opportunity and joined the first
14 Board meeting last fall. I highlight that because I
15 view that as an opportunity, with the Aviation
16 Director's participation on that Board now, of having
17 increased visibility to their activities to have a
18 better understanding of what they're doing and where
19 EDC and the Port Authority with the elected officials
20 can support stronger outreach in the community.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: (INAUDIBLE) some
22 schools, libraries, places of worship, and homes and
23 I experienced significant aircraft noise. How is EDC
24 working with the Port Authority to ensure noise
25 mitigation measures are implemented (INAUDIBLE)

3 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: That is
4 actually one of the areas that we want to learn more
5 about through the Airport Board.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Oh, sorry. I
7 have to repeat my question. I did not put my, I put
8 it off. How will the JFK Redevelopment Program
9 address noise impacts on surrounding communities? Are
10 there plans to (INAUDIBLE) schools, libraries, places
11 of worship, and homes that experience significant
12 aircraft noise? How is EDC working with the Port
13 Authority to ensure noise mitigation measures are
14 implemented in an equitable way?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: On one hand
16 I can't speak to what noise mitigation measures the
17 Port Authority working with the terminal operators
18 are implementing. I will say, though, that is an area
19 that EDC is very interested in understanding more
20 about with respect to what the Port Authority and the
21 terminal operators are responsible for doing. I'm not
22 going to speculate because I don't know.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: But living next
24 to the airport, I can tell you for the, whatever
25 route the plane is taking, you can feel the vibration
even though I'm not that close. I cannot imagine

1
2 people that's so close, and the community has been
3 outraged at me all the time, not knowing that I'm a
4 Council, not in the federal level, but since you're
5 sitting here, I'm saying that I don't know how the
6 decide on the route at a certain time. Yes, we have a
7 break lately, but people in Rosedale, different
8 places, they call me even in Brooklyn to say, what's
9 going on? They never get a break from the noise.
10 Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair. Thank you.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Thank you.

12 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Council
13 Member, may I just...

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Yes (INAUDIBLE)

15 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: response?

16 Thank you very much for the question. It's something
17 I relate to as well. My great grandmother's house is
18 on 135th Street so growing up very close by. One
19 thing to just explain about the jurisdictional
20 boundaries is that from a noise mitigation
21 standpoint, as you mentioned, there is a federal
22 actor as well, the FAA, and so when we think about
23 the various roles and responsibilities while, as
24 Jennifer said, we are looking to learn and understand
25 more what the noise mitigation actions are, how those

1
2 are rolled out, doesn't necessarily mean that EDC has
3 a regulatory function when it comes to noise
4 mitigation in the same way that our colleagues at
5 FAA, the Department of Environmental Conservation,
6 and other federal and state agencies do.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Okay. Thank you so
8 much. Council Member Vernikov followed by Avilés and
9 then Gutiérrez.

10 I'd like to also acknowledge we have been
11 joined by Council Member Zhuang.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Thank you,
13 Chair. I just have a couple of questions. Has EDC had
14 any conversations with the MTA or the Port Authority
15 with regards to expanded service for the AirTrain?

16 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We have not
17 had those conversations in the context of the Airport
18 Boards.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Okay, and is
20 there any allotted funding in the JFK Redevelopment
21 Program to implement increased service and
22 improvements to the AirTrain?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Again, I'm
24 happy to take this question back to the Port

3 Authority, but we haven't discussed that at the
4 Airport Board meetings.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Please, we'd
6 appreciate that. What other alternative transit
7 options are being considered to improve access to
8 JFK?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Sorry, the
10 same response. It's something that I'm happy to take
11 back to the Port Authority.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Okay, we'll look
13 forward to hearing from you. Thank you.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Thank you, Council
15 Member Vernikov. The Port Authority has a lot of
16 questions from us after this.

17 Council Member Avilés followed by
18 Gutiérrez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you, Chairs.
20 Hold on, let me take this out. I can't hear myself
21 through two speakers.

22 Yeah, I guess following along the line,
23 so I suspect you're not going to be able to answer
24 these questions but, again, thank you for being here.
25 It is incredibly unfortunate that the Port Authority
is not present. They should be as is NYCHA as does

1
2 MTA as does multiple other agencies. On the line of
3 the AirTrain, you talked about decarbonizing ways
4 that can further decarbonize operations at JFK, and
5 one thing that occurs to us is workers are
6 incentivized to drive to JFK. They receive free
7 parking. They're not incentivized to by receiving
8 reduced fare on the AirTrain or the subway. In fact,
9 they have to pay for the subway and the AirTrain,
10 which is quite significant, especially since we know
11 a good majority of the workers are low-wage workers
12 so that is a huge burden so I guess one of the things
13 we would like to know is really press the importance
14 of receiving some sort of incentivizing the workers
15 at JFK to take mass transit, to take a reduced fare
16 AirTrain, to flip that incentivizing from driving to
17 using mass transit so that's the first request. We'd
18 like to hear what those plans are in particular, and
19 then I think this would also address the serious
20 traffic congestion that we see particularly in JFK so
21 this is a serious issue in terms of traffic,
22 pollution, workers support, among other things.

23 Additionally, has the EDC and/or the Port
24 Authority envisioned expanded bus service into JFK

1
2 and has it explored select bus service lanes that
3 could be routed into to JFK as well?

4 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Yeah. Thank
5 you for the question, Council Member. I think given
6 the various assets in your District, you also
7 understand the complexity of the relationship between
8 the City, the Port Authority, and EDC as a lease
9 administrator. As part of that role and Jennifer has
10 talked about this in regards to the Airport Board, we
11 do not have any sort of direct role when it comes to
12 traffic planning in and around JFK. That said, we
13 have a lot of interest in supporting public
14 transportation, improving traffic networks, and so
15 always happy to connect with the MTA and the Port
16 Authority on ways to improve that without necessarily
17 having a specific role in that as it relates to the
18 lease administration.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Yeah, I
20 will just add I wanted to thank you for raising this
21 issue and this concern. I think it is a serious one.
22 I will share that I had proximity to this issue when
23 I had previously worked for a non-profit where we had
24 a workforce program in Flushing, Queens, and a lot of
25 the immigrant workers were actually trying to retain

1
2 jobs at JFK Airport but struggled to do so because of
3 the poor transit access, and so I understand that's a
4 real issue, and I'm happy to pursue that conversation
5 with the MTA and the Port Authority.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: No, thank you.

7 We'd love to hear the response and really dive in and
8 address the issue. It's been longstanding ever since
9 I was a kid. We must do better and we have to do that
10 with urgency, particularly if we are serious about
11 climate. This is one clear way. You can charge all
12 you want and try to get people to convert who can't
13 afford those cars. We can do better mass transit and
14 certainly the AirTrain is utterly expensive and a
15 huge problem also. Thank you.

16 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Thank you. Council
17 Member Gutiérrez.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you
19 Chairs. I have just two questions.

20 One is a little bit related to Council
21 Member Avilés' questions about our climate response.
22 Can you just tell me in the kind of multi-year and
23 multi-terminal upgrade of the airport how an
24 environmental study is done and at what point and who
25 is responsible for that, particularly with respect to

1
2 air quality, and then my second question is just in
3 relation to other really big projects in Queens. One
4 that I think will happen soon not too far from JFK,
5 but just with relation to congestion. How is EDC and
6 the Port Authority, and I would ask them but they
7 never come, what is the best way to work through
8 something as massive as a JFK construction project
9 and other really massive infrastructure projects or
10 stadium projects, for example, in the Borough of
11 Queens? What is the response to New Yorkers and
12 particularly Queens residents with regards to an
13 uptick in congestion within the next five to 10 years
14 when these two big projects are happening? Thank you.

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: With
16 respect to air quality monitoring, maybe, which is
17 what you were asking during the construction period
18 of the JFK terminal redevelopment, we would need to
19 ask the Port Authority about what sort of ongoing
20 monitoring and performance management is in place to
21 ensure that the terminal developers and operators are
22 minimizing emissions during the construction period,
23 and then, of course, during operations as well. Then,
24 I think EDC would work closely with the Port
25 Authority and the terminal operators to assess

1
2 whether there is a need for construction coordination
3 in anticipation of large-scale projects in Willets
4 Point, for example, coming online and then, where
5 possible, I think the barge service that the Port
6 Authority has put in place to bring construction
7 materials in and C and D materials out might be a
8 good model for us to explore like where possible to
9 continue to use more alternative modes of
10 transportation to support the construction of JFK
11 project but other projects too.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: What would
13 alternative mode look like, waterways particularly?

14 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Waterways,
15 of course, if there's waterfront access,
16 understanding that's not always the case, or rail,
17 for example, or something that EDC is trying to
18 support the industry to do is to try to transition to
19 alternative fuels or electric trucks.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. And
21 I, just in my seven seconds, just want to uplift what
22 Council Member Avilés said about incentivizing
23 workers to have some kind of a discount so that they
24 can utilize public transportation. Thank you. Thank
25 you, Chairs.

1
2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Chair, can
3 I add some additional information? Thank you for the
4 question, Council Member. I think one thing I would
5 add, and this is my understanding having not been a
6 part of this as the process was being established,
7 but there was an environmental review process, my
8 understanding is with the FAA, again that federal
9 regulator being part of that process. I believe that
10 environmental information is available online,
11 publicly available the same way like environmental
12 review materials for City projects are available and
13 that it did contemplate air quality monitoring, and
14 then I think from EDC's experience with working on
15 large-scale redevelopment projects where we do
16 environmental review, we look at traffic impacts,
17 construction impacts, the longstanding impacts of a
18 specific project, it's our experience that we
19 coordinate with other projects that are nearby to
20 understand sort of the network of what is happening
21 and, while I can't speak directly to what took place
22 back in 2021, I would imagine something similar
23 occurred.

24 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIAS: Thank you for
25 that.

3 Seeing no other Members with questions,
4 I'll turn it back over to Co-Chair Brooks-Powers.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you
6 and thank you to my Colleagues.

7 I did want to follow up on a question I
8 had asked back at the hearing a year ago as it
9 pertains to Open Meetings Law, and I don't think we
10 ever had followup to it. In your opinion, would the
11 Open Meetings Law apply to the Airport Board's
12 meetings?

13 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: This was a
14 question that we took back to the Law Department and,
15 as I explained earlier, the Law Department's
16 determination was that the Airport Board is not
17 subject to Open Meetings Law. Again, because it is an
18 entity between Mayoral appointees and the Port
19 Authority appointees to serve as a function of the
20 lease, it doesn't have the same sort of Open Meetings
21 Law requirements that other public meetings would.

22 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: But one
23 would think by considering the level of public impact
24 that it has that it would be beneficial for the
25 public to have a line-of-sight into some of the
discussions that are happening behind closed doors.

3 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: I think one
4 thing to keep in mind is that EDC administers a lot
5 of leases on behalf of the City of New York with
6 various tenants of various sizes through various
7 different assets. There are different levels of
8 public information, and I will say from my experience
9 coming on in the last couple of years, the JFK
10 Redevelopment Program has some of the most external-
11 facing documents and materials compared to other
12 lease leases that we administer on behalf of the City
13 because of that creation of the Community Advisory
14 Council, and one thing, as I said to Chair Farías at
15 the top, I don't believe that the 2004 lease really
16 contemplated the type of external engagement that is
17 taking place, and I absolutely hear your point about
18 the community looking for more information from the
19 Port Authority at those meetings or looking for more
20 materials to be shared, and I'm curious about the
21 role of Congressman Meeks and the Queens Borough
22 President as Co-Chairs of that body in terms of
23 setting the agenda and partnering with the Port
24 Authority on those meetings and what those...

25 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: They're
still (INAUDIBLE)

3 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: In terms of
4 the topics that we've been discussing today, our
5 understanding is that there's a meeting coming up in
6 a couple of weeks, and it does seem like, whether
7 it's the traffic planning or some of the other items
8 that have been raised, that would be the venue for
9 those to be discussed.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: One, while
11 the Congressman and the Borough President are Co-
12 Chairs of the Advisory Council, the structure in
13 which the agenda is set is that the Port Authority
14 sets the agenda. They review it with the Co-Chairs
15 prior to Advisory Council Meeting but, again, the
16 agenda is set by the Port Authority. As someone who
17 used to craft the agenda, I'm just speaking of that
18 like factually, and while I do think that the
19 Advisory Council has an important role to play, I
20 think it's important to have EDC assume its
21 responsibilities as it's laid out in the lease to
22 help ensure a degree of transparency and
23 accountability on the Port Authority's behalf so
24 that's what we're trying to really ensure is taking
25 place so we understand like the posture of EDC, you
have plenty of lease agreements that you oversee, but

1
2 this is a multi-billion dollar infrastructure project
3 happening in the midst of an environmental justice
4 community, and so we have to make sure that we're not
5 just building an airport for private sector to make
6 more profits while leaving a community behind. We
7 have a real opportunity to be transformative in what
8 happens in those surrounding communities by the
9 benefits that can come out of the redevelopment and
10 also by forging a relationship, which at one point
11 the Port Authority, I know when I talk to some of the
12 elders in the community and hear about projects like
13 the AirTrain project and how they worked with
14 community and what that looked like, we know what is
15 possible in terms of forging a relationship with
16 members of the community and creating space to not
17 only hear them but carry out some of the things
18 they'd like to see.

19 I do want to pivot to M/WBE contracting.
20 Are you aware of any initiatives that the Port
21 Authority has undertaken to meet the 30 percent M/WBE
22 contracting goal?

23 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Our
24 understanding is largely based on conversations at
25 the Community Advisory Council, meaning that the Port

3 Authority has emphasized, for example, supporting
4 capacity building, facilitating JV partnerships
5 between M/WBE firms and established developers or
6 operators so I think those are some of the
7 initiatives that I've seen highlighted as a part of
8 their strategy for supporting terminal developers and
9 operators in addition to doing direct outreach in the
10 community.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Let me take
12 a step back. Just going back to the lease again. The
13 recent extension that took place under, I think it
14 was de Blasio's Administration, what was the reason
15 that lease was renegotiated because it was still in
16 the midst of an existing lease that wasn't to expire
17 until 2050. What triggered that negotiation?

18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Yeah. Thank
19 you for the question, Council Member. It's obviously
20 hard for us to guess about what all of the
21 conversations that were taking place because it was a
22 previous Administration. It was prior to both
23 Jennifer and I's time as well as EDC's President's
24 office. We did have some language in our testimony
25 that explains what we understand was the reason why
that 2021 lease extension took place and, from our

3 understanding, it was very much tied to COVID and I
4 understand that discussions had been taking place
5 about a JFK redevelopment effort and because there
6 were so many challenges at the time, this is on page
7 three.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I see it.
9 Okay. I had it highlighted. Got it.

10 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: So the way
11 that we understand it, because there was restrictions
12 in international travel, because there were so many
13 issues related to the global supply chain, because it
14 was getting more challenging for the terminal
15 operators to access some of the financial markets,
16 the discussions at the time, or our review of the
17 discussions at the time, seems to be that in order to
18 ensure that the redevelopment would be possible,
19 there would need to be some type of change to ensure
20 that the terminal operators would have accessibility
21 to a viable redevelopment, and so I can't speak
22 directly to why it was decided that that was the
23 specific route. We can only just say what I'm sure
24 you're alluding to is that there were likely
25 different paths that may have been available, but
this was the one that was selected.

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Do we know
3 why it extended the lease to 2060 instead of just
4 keeping it at 2050...

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We don't
6 know why but, if I were just to think generally about
7 real estate transactions and our negotiations with
8 developers, there are situations where we might think
9 about a longer lease term because that developer in
10 part through their lenders based on the capital
11 financing, the funding that's being put into place to
12 finance a private investment that's going into these
13 projects, a combination of the developers, the
14 lenders might then require a longer lease term in
15 order to make that financing work to reduce risk so
16 those are potentially some of the variables that are
17 taken into consideration.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And I see
19 from the extension of the timeline and just opening
20 back up the lease, the benefits to the Port
21 Authority, and I hear you because of the pandemic and
22 everything being taken into consideration. What is
23 your viewpoint in terms of what New York City got out
24 of those negotiations?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I can't say because frankly I don't know the details of what the City negotiated and what the City got in addition to rent payment, an additional rent payment and a commitment from the private sector to invest in the redevelopment of an airport that I think we would all acknowledge is an important economic generator for the City.

CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, sticking back with M/WBEs. Thank you for that.

How is EDC helping to hold the State accountable to M/WBE utilization goals? Does the Port Authority report any information about its M/WBE utilizations to EDC and, if so, what information is provided, and is that only in those quarterly meeting minutes or what's the frequency of that information if you do get it?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: The Port Authority has been sharing M/WBE awards and payment rates on each of the JFK redevelopment projects, including the Port Authority's investment in roadways and utilities and presentations that look like the same presentations as what's shared at the Community Advisory Council. They've shared those twice at the

1
2 two Airport Board meetings that were convened last
3 year so we see, for example, a breakdown of awards
4 and payments for M/WBEs and then, within the M/WBE
5 categories, the awards to Asian, Black, and Latino
6 contractors, and then to WBEs and to LBEs based on
7 tiers for the Port Authority, Terminal 1, 8, 4, and
8 6.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And what
10 power does EDC or the City have to enforce, and I
11 know the Majority Leader asked a variation of this
12 question, but what power does EDC or the City have to
13 enforce the Port Authority's compliance, particularly
14 with that goal?

15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I don't
16 think there are specific provisions in the lease that
17 speak to enforcement mechanisms or remedies that are
18 specific to M/WBE performance, either in the original
19 lease and I think in the lease extension.

20 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Chair, if I
21 could just follow up about the M/WBE participation
22 and where and how those numbers are reported. I will
23 say that in my prep materials, we do have the
24 presentation that was shared at the Community
25 Advisory Council meeting back in November, and there

3 are multiple slides that speak directly to what
4 Jennifer just described so there are things about
5 M/WBE and LBE participation all the way through
6 September 2023 so that was made available to the
7 public at that meeting and is now available on the
8 JFK Redevelopment website as well.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: So EDC
10 doesn't get it in advance of those meetings? You just
11 get it when they put it out publicly?

12 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Yeah,
13 that's right. As Jennifer has been describing the
14 Airport Board at this meeting, this function, we get
15 very similar, the exact same information. Of course,
16 we're happy to go back and confirm that those slides
17 are the same but, from a cursory view, all of the
18 material is consistent and publicly available online.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Would we be
20 able to get a copy of one of the reports that you've
21 received from the Port Authority?

22 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Yes, we
23 said to Chair Farías that we're happy to share that
24 while we confirm ourselves as well.

25 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: It's also
my understanding that the Board of Commissioners

1
2 within the Port Authority had softened the penalties
3 for not meeting M/WBE goals during the COVID-19
4 pandemic. Has EDC been following that, and do you
5 know if that decision has been reversed now that
6 we're on the other side of the pandemic?

7 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: I am not
8 aware of sort of the intricacies of the Port
9 Authority's relationship between the Board of
10 Commissioners and the redevelopment. From what I'm
11 seeing about the materials that are made available,
12 it seems that they are tracking based on the
13 commitments made in the 2021 lease extension.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I do think
15 it's worthwhile for EDC to definitely follow movement
16 by the Board of Commissioners as it pertains to JFK
17 in particular because, again, like as a landlord and
18 one that has certain items that are prescribed in the
19 lease, I think this is one of those that kind of
20 speak to that as well. What role does EDC play in...
21 you're saying you don't have a role in overseeing the
22 M/WBE participation because in the lease it talks to
23 the more recent extension, it spoke to like certain
24 community benefits that the Port Authority was to do
25 and to be working in closer collaboration and

1
2 partnership with the City so has any of that
3 happened? I know you're ramping up, but has any of
4 that happened at all yet?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Chair,
6 respectfully, is there a specific community
7 initiative maybe that you can provide as an example
8 of...

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: (INAUDIBLE)
10 community initiatives. I'm just focusing on the M/WBE
11 participation, like how we're holding accountable the
12 Port Authority because, again, the lease leaves room
13 for the Port to work more closely with the City, and
14 it could very well be like the City saying we're
15 going to create access to capital through SBS or it
16 could even be the City that's doing something, right,
17 not saying solely it's the Port Authority, but just
18 wanting to know has any of that happened? What role
19 is EDC taken in that space?

20 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: We've
21 started to have those conversations because in
22 reviewing, I think, the latest M/WBE rates, we
23 noticed that in Terminal 6, for example, they are not
24 achieving the 30 percent minimum M/WBE participation,
25 and so that has prompted a conversation at EDC. We

1
2 haven't had this conversation with the Port Authority
3 yet about better understanding why that's happening,
4 and then naturally we would want to understand what
5 is the Port Authority doing, what is that terminal
6 developer doing in order to shore up supporting more
7 M/WBE participation in that project, and then where
8 there's an opportunity for SBS and the Mayor Office
9 even given their keen focus on increasing M/WBE
10 participation in construction and other contracts,
11 how we might be able to work together to supplement
12 what's happening today.

13 CO-CHAIRPERSON WON: Thank you for that.
14 I'm going to jump to community engagement concerns
15 and then I'll end off with the Intro. 134 questions.

16 In terms of community engagement and
17 concerns, in our previous hearing former Executive
18 Director of the Port Authority, Chris Ward, responded
19 that the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey
20 does not build host agreements into their projects.
21 However, community impact should be taken into
22 account and there should be a community benefits
23 agreement. In addition, an advocate emphasized that
24 projects with CBAs benefit the project and the
25 surrounding communities. Do you know whether or not

1
2 the terminal developers have made any commitment for
3 community benefits agreements on the redevelopment
4 and, if so, what are they?

5 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I'm not
6 aware of community benefits agreements that have been
7 negotiated with the developers.

8 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: What
9 efforts has EDC made to ensure the community's needs
10 are being met as it relates to the airport?

11 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: I'm sorry,
12 Council Member, can you ask the question one more
13 time, please?

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Sure. What
15 efforts has EDC made to ensure the community's needs
16 are being met as they relate to the airport?

17 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: So I think
18 as part of our ramp up on the Airport Board and the
19 conversations about the Community Advisory Council, I
20 think there's been a couple of things. One is
21 reestablishing that those meetings happen, right,
22 because, as we mentioned, they had not been
23 happening, and so creating the space where we are
24 able to not only talk about lease administration more
25 generally but also raise specific concerns that we've

1
2 heard from the community. So in our testimony, we
3 talked about the example on the overnight trucking. I
4 know that's a and I think that was something that you
5 have been leading on for the Council and for the
6 City. We participated in a few of your public
7 meetings on that, and then we're also able to take
8 that into our Airport Board meetings and to encourage
9 the Port Authority to make additional acreage
10 available, and that was something that did occur. I
11 think as we continue to strengthen our connection to
12 the JFK Redevelopment Program, we will continue to
13 look for additional opportunities like that where we
14 are amplifying the voice of the community at the same
15 time as reinforcing EDC's mission in terms of
16 economic development across the all five boroughs,
17 including Queens.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And is the
19 Community Advisory Council meeting the only place EDC
20 is able to learn about the community level concerns
21 with the redevelopment?

22 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: I would say
23 that's the primary way. Jennifer mentioned about us
24 participating in the CAO and other venues. Obviously,
25 my team, the Government and Community Relations team

1
2 at EDC has extensive relationships across Queens with
3 organizations, neighborhood associations, and so on,
4 and so we definitely hear the concerns in a variety
5 of ways but, in terms of JFK Redevelopment-focused
6 entity, the Advisory Council is that.

7 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: EDC noted
8 in their testimony last year that they worked with
9 elected leaders to include a commitment from the Port
10 Authority to create scholarship programs for middle
11 and high school students, an aviation focused STEM
12 program at York College, an expansion of a summer
13 mini-camp collaboration with the Eastern Queens
14 Alliance that educates middle school students on
15 environmental stewardship and sustainability. I do
16 know the status of a few of them. I'm curious on the
17 status of the scholarship piece in terms of that
18 commitment, where things are with it now.

19 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I was going
20 to say I think we need an update from the Port
21 Authority about the status of those initiatives, too.
22 It's going to be a focus for an upcoming Airport
23 Board meeting about the status of those programs.

24 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, and
25 do you know of any new projects have been developed

1
2 since the last hearing and, if so, what is the status
3 of those new projects?

4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I'm not
5 aware of new projects.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Okay, and
7 would you be able to ask them for an update on that
8 as well?

9 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: Absolutely.

10 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: And then in
11 the lease extension, it talks also about the
12 environmental component, and I know the Port
13 Authority has been heavily focused on sustainability,
14 electrification of the buses on the airport and what
15 have you, but there has been, and this is within the
16 redevelopment or even looking beyond the
17 redevelopment and just as JFK as a neighbor in terms
18 of the noise mitigation investments, there hasn't
19 really been anything that I've heard of as it
20 pertains to noise mitigation or monitoring. Is that
21 any part of the conversations that EDC has had with
22 the Port Authority because this has come up in past
23 Community Advisory Council meetings. I think this was
24 before EDC actually started going to them, but I'm
25 not sure if you look back to any of the notes or

3 anything, but has that been a part of any
4 conversations that you all have had?

5 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: As we were
6 saying to Council Member Narcisse, it has not been
7 yet. As we've explained, I think part of our role now
8 is to really think critically about so how to amplify
9 community concerns and those Airport Board meetings,
10 but I can't say that we've gone back to previous
11 Community Advisory Council meetings prior to 2023 to
12 check in on status updates and, again, I would just
13 encourage that with this upcoming Advisory Council
14 meeting that would be a really appropriate venue to
15 ask the Port Authority those kinds of questions
16 directly.

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I hear you,
18 but I think that the Port Authority as a government
19 agency also has the ability to come to a government
20 body and testify just like EDC is doing as well.

21 Pivoting to Intro. 134, what are the
22 current terms of the contract between the City and
23 EDC regarding reporting on JFK redevelopment
24 projects?

25 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: EDC's
26 ability to be responsive to providing the information

1 that you've requested through Intro. 134, I think
2 obviously really relies on the Port Authority's
3 cooperation. When we asked for their initial feedback
4 about what, if any, of this information could be
5 provided to the Council, we received mixed feedback.
6 In some instances, I think they emphasized that a lot
7 of this information is already publicly available so
8 for example, in addition to the M/WBE participation
9 through awards and payments, they do provide a list
10 of companies that actually have been awarded those
11 contracts so that's an example of how, from their
12 view, they're already providing some of this
13 information in a publicly available way. There are
14 other instances where there's some information that
15 they're not willing to share and that we frankly will
16 have to have a conversation with them to better
17 understand why.

18
19 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: How does
20 EDC currently perform reporting to the City just
21 broadly speaking?

22 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: There's a
23 variety of different reports that we submit to the
24 City Council. I'm thinking of, we submit an annual
25 NYC Ferry report that has information like ridership

1 data. I'm honestly trying to think of other reports
2 that we submit, but there are, oh, there's our annual
3 investment report that is also submitted every
4 January, where we provide additional information
5 about annual investments, our real estate
6 transactions, and so on. That's submitted to the
7 Mayor and the City Council. We also participate in
8 the Mayor's Management Report, and so those are the
9 three sort of most substantive reports that come to
10 mind that we submit on an annual basis. I would just
11 point out though with Intro. 134, the difference
12 between those reports are those reports we are
13 reporting on work that EDC actually completes, that
14 we fund, programs that we manage, whereas based on
15 our at least current review of Intro. 134, almost all
16 of the information that the Council is asking for is
17 not produced or developed by EDC, and so it's asking
18 EDC to compel the Port Authority to report so that's
19 the thing that the Law Department is currently
20 reviewing and, of course, we'll happily have
21 additional conversations with the Council on that.
22 But I think it is an important nuance to recognize,
23 but I think it is an important nuance to recognize.
24

2 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, thank
3 you for that that feedback.

4 I just wanted to take, and I know we're
5 joined online by State Senator Leroy Comrie, State
6 Senator James Sanders, Assembly Member Khaleel
7 Anderson, also that have very much been invested in
8 the work that's happening at JFK as well.

9 Again, just wanting to thank you for
10 sitting for today's hearing on an important project
11 that's happening in the City of New York and, as we
12 said before, it's something that we will continue to
13 monitor in terms of what that engagement is. We would
14 love to hear from EDC also, and I guess maybe you can
15 answer this now too, like what are some of the ways
16 that we, from the Council perspective or the State
17 Legislators, are able to help support EDC in
18 fulfilling your responsibilities in the lease? For
19 example, in Intro. 134, talking about how to compel
20 the Port Authority, when we're trying to compel them
21 to come here in the Council, what are some of the
22 avenues that we should be exploring to take in order
23 to make the Port Authority more transparent as it
24 pertains to redevelopment because I think it's beyond
25 crazy that they're leasing City land that they don't

1
2 own but they're dictating the rules of engagement
3 with us and, if you imagine being a renter and living
4 in someone's home, there's still certain guidelines
5 you're still required to adhere even as a renter,
6 right, and the Port Authority is operating on both
7 sides right now, and I think that's wholly
8 unacceptable on their behalf. They are the only state
9 agency that I know of that does this and, quite
10 honestly, it's only under this current leadership,
11 because as I said in the past and as former Executive
12 Director Chris Ward has said, there's no reason why
13 the Port can't come here and answer the questions of
14 the Council. I'm not sure what they're scared of or
15 what there is to hide in terms of the redevelopment,
16 why they don't see fit to come before the Council to
17 be transparent in a space where they're not curating
18 what information is going out and how we're able to
19 receive that information, and I'm curious to hear do
20 you like foresee any ways that the Council or the
21 State Legislators are able to support EDC to fulfill
22 its responsibilities in the lease?

23 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Yeah, I
24 greatly appreciate the question, Council Member. I
25 think that we would have to come back to you on

1
2 thoughts about specifics. I would say your question
3 is a bit grander than we would be able to answer
4 right now. We can only speak to you know the
5 relationship that the current Administration has
6 inherited, and we've talked at length about the
7 things that we've been doing under President
8 Kimball's leadership to continue to improve in our
9 role as a lease administrator. I know I've said this
10 a couple of times, but to reiterate, would just ask
11 you to keep in mind that the 2004 lease did not fully
12 contemplate a massive redevelopment, and I think you
13 yourself have mentioned some of the challenges with
14 the 2021 lease extension and we're not able to speak
15 to how all of those decisions were made for that as
16 well. What we can say is that we're open to continued
17 conversation where we can talk more about ways that
18 we can continue to be supportive in our role as a
19 non-profit corporation that's dedicated to economic
20 development in the City.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: No, thank
22 you for that, and I look forward to hearing from EDC
23 on feedback on what that could look like.

24 I did receive a question from Assembly
25 Member Anderson that I would like to ask of you. In

1
2 2017, the New York State Comptroller conducted an
3 audit of the Port Authority of New York and New
4 Jersey to review their compliance with their lease
5 with NYC EDC. The Comptroller's report found that
6 they were not fully in compliance. Can you share, if
7 at all, any possible actions that took place to
8 ensure that the Port Authority has since been held
9 accountable?

10 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Chair, we
11 honestly cannot speak to a 2017 Comptroller's report
12 from a previous Administration or what actions were
13 taken after that.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I'm curious
15 of the note taken that EDC takes because I know
16 before you were mentioning that during even the
17 Airport Boards of staff notes, but we have to be able
18 for the sake of continuity and being able to pass
19 this information down, because I think about
20 (INAUDIBLE), like being able to look back to not have
21 to go through the same mistakes, and right now we're
22 in an awful position where we have no type of
23 historical perspective in terms of what led to the
24 lease extension or any of these components, and so
25 I'm just curious as to how EDC as an agency maintains

1 records on behalf of the City of New York because
2 these are multi-million dollar lease agreements that
3 are established that generates billions of dollars
4 for the City of New York, but how do we know that
5 one, it's being done in decency and in order the way
6 it's laid out in the lease or not when we can't even
7 look back to 2021, like we're not saying look back to
8 1947, we can't look back to 2021.

10 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: Chair, keep
11 in mind that EDC was not a signatory to the lease in
12 2021. It was the City of New York that signed the
13 2021 lease and the SBS Commissioner who signs on
14 behalf of the City so the City designates EDC to
15 administer the lease on behalf of the City but, while
16 EDC likely participated in meetings and our
17 predecessors were probably a part of that, it's sort
18 of different ball game when you are not the one
19 actually signing it, it's the City of New York that
20 is doing so.

21 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Right, but
22 even still, when EDC starts to assume its role, it's
23 not like SBS is not a City sister agency where that
24 information could be shared across agencies, like
25 it's not like we're talking about the feds or the

1
2 states. We're talking about a sister agency that you
3 could easily say what are the notes on this, like how
4 are we recordkeeping on a lease agreement that took
5 place in the middle of an existing lease that didn't
6 really need to even be touched. There's something
7 there as to why we even extended the lease, and I
8 hear you about COVID, but then when the negotiations
9 happen, what was the posture of the City on behalf of
10 New Yorkers. We don't have any idea of that.

11 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT ADGATE: I agree
12 with you, and I think something to keep in mind with
13 that is it's not quite as simple as only three years
14 ago. It's three years ago with an Administration
15 change, right, and from both a leadership perspective
16 and a posture perspective, we would imagine that
17 goals and tasks changed just by virtue of all of us
18 here coming in shortly after that time, but I do hear
19 your point about what can we do as the sort of
20 contemporary EDC to ensure that we are tracking so
21 that our, I don't know, forebears is the right word,
22 future EDCers are able to answer future Council
23 Members' questions. It's something to think about,
24 and I'm very thankful for Jennifer's leadership in
25 terms of the things that she's been doing to

1
2 establish her Transportation team for very important
3 matters such as this one.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you,
5 again.

6 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT SUN: I'll
7 actually like to add just, I think, to address your
8 question about what we can do moving forward. I think
9 what's come across very clearly to me through this
10 testimony and through this hearing is that you have a
11 long history, you and other electeds, a long history
12 in the community. You will continue to have a long-
13 standing relationship with the Port Authority and the
14 airport because of your proximity to this facility,
15 and your level of care and responsibility is distinct
16 and important so our commitment, I think, today is to
17 work with you and to have followup conversations to
18 really draw upon your knowledge of what has happened
19 in the past, what gaps you continue to be frustrated
20 by in terms of information, and for us to have
21 followup conversations about how we can make these
22 Airport Board conversations more effective and make
23 the most of that venue while recognizing that there
24 are also opportunities, hopefully outside of those
25 Airport Board meetings, as well to strengthen our

3 partnership and ensuring that the JFK Redevelopment
4 Project really delivers on its promise.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON BROOKS-POWERS: I truly,
6 truly appreciate your statement. JFK is a longtime
7 neighbor to myself and the people that I represent in
8 Southeast Queens as well as the Speaker and Council
9 Member Williams, and it's extremely important to make
10 sure that we are reflecting what we're hearing on the
11 ground. Not all the time, people from our communities
12 can make it to a hearing to testify or stay for hours
13 to listen to a presentation and be able to ask the
14 questions that they have so they call us during the
15 day or when they see us at events and they express
16 their frustrations. Whether it's that small M/WBE
17 that continues to go to these events, that continues
18 to apply for opportunity that's not getting an
19 opportunity, when you have Far Rockaway not really
20 seeing anyone in the workforce on the program, and I
21 know that the Port Authority is trying to work to
22 improve those numbers. When you think about how does
23 the community benefit from it? How are we leveraging
24 this project to be transformative in the community?
25 These are the spaces that we have concerns. I
definitely welcome the opportunity to work more

3 closely with Chair Farías as well as EDC to make sure
4 that we are leveraging EDC to fulfill its role that's
5 set out in the lease to make the Port Authority more
6 accountable and more transparent because right now
7 the Port Authority is flying in the dark with no type
8 of ramifications whatsoever, and our community is
9 sitting on the sidelines while the airport is being
10 rebuilt, and that's not okay, but thank you.

11 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Thank you, Co-
12 Chair Brooks-Powers, and thank you, folks, for your
13 public testimony today. This panel is now dismissed.

14 While we wait for folks to make their way
15 out, I'm now going to open the hearing for public
16 testimony.

17 I remind members of the public that this
18 is a formal government proceeding and that decorum
19 shall be observed at all times. As such, members of
20 the public shall remain silent at all times.

21 The witness table is reserved for people
22 who wish to testify. No recording or photography is
23 allowed from the witness table.

24 Further, members of the public may not
25 present audio or visual video recordings as testimony

3 but may submit transcripts of such recordings to the
4 Sergeant-at-Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.

5 If you wish to speak at today's hearing,
6 please fill out an appearance card if you have not
7 done so already with the Sergeant-at-Arms and wait to
8 be recognized. When recognized, you will have three
9 minutes to speak on today's hearing topic, JFK
10 Airport Redevelopment Plans and Introduction 134, a
11 local law in relation to requiring regular reports on
12 the redevelopment plans at John F. Kennedy
13 International Airport.

14 If you have a written statement or
15 additional written testimony you wish to submit for
16 the record, please provide a copy of that testimony
17 to the Sergeant-at-Arms at the front of the room.

18 You may also email written testimony to
19 testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours of this
20 hearing. Audio and video recordings will not be
21 accepted.

22 I'm now going to call the first panel.
23 Please repeat your name before your testimony as I'm
24 reading from what I can read on these cards. Rabbi
25 Garth Marchant, Bernard Garrett, and Raul Rivera.

Rabbi Garth Marchant, you can begin.

1
2 RABBI GARTH MARCHANT: I'm Rabbi Garth
3 Marchant. I belong to the Queens Jewish Community
4 Council and serve several synagogues in Southeast
5 Queens and, as my task, I took it upon myself to get
6 included community in the contracts. Now, we used to
7 live in Rosedale, and I moved further in your
8 District in Far Rockaway, but I lived right there on
9 the edge of Rosedale, and I want to tell you, at
10 night, the airplanes come 10 feet over our house.
11 Boom! You think there's going to be a crash, right,
12 and you can see everybody in the airplane. That's how
13 low it comes down. Noise after noise, and then the
14 airplanes dump the fluid right into the place right
15 around us, and you see the birds with the fluid in
16 there. Sometimes they come in front of our house and
17 they die right there. That's not safe, and nobody's
18 talking about that, right, and throughout the
19 community. Now number two is that I got together a
20 lot of the businesses, not just black, Latino
21 businesses, Asian businesses, to get contracts. Not
22 one response to any one of them, not one. It's a
23 front. They don't respond, and I'm telling you the
24 reason why the Port Authority is not addressing you
25 it's because it's controlled by the Governor of the

1
2 State of New Jersey. Now let me tell you what the
3 City Council and the Mayor of Newark did. They just
4 built a new terminal at Newark Airport. The Mayor,
5 Baraka, forced the Governor to give minority
6 contracts. You know how many minority contracts they
7 got at that one airport? 90 from the community
8 because they had an agreement, and the Mayor, because
9 it's the same agreement like what you had here, the
10 lease agreement, the Mayor said we're not gonna have
11 this lease unless you give our people contracts, and
12 that one small development was like for 2 billion,
13 2.5 billion, 19 minority contracts. Here, we got
14 none. All they're doing is that they're giving
15 contracts to consultants but, as far as contracts to
16 do sheetrocking, contracts to do roofing, not one,
17 and I have brought 20 qualified contractors to the
18 table, and every time you send the information to
19 them, they give you no answer, no answer, and they
20 can't get nothing back to get a contract, and they
21 tell you, oh, we got minority contractors. You know
22 what the minority contractors are, consultants. Not
23 people from the community, consultants, and I need
24 for you to check with the D.A. report from Manhattan
25 D.A. Braggs, where he arrested several people with

1
2 the M/WBE programs as a front. Check the report out,
3 and I need for you to check with the City Council of
4 and Mayor Baraka in Newark, New Jersey, and how they
5 did it to get 90 contracts and we're not getting any.

6 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Thank you so much
7 for your testimony.

8 Bernard Garrett.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: You need to turn
10 the mic on and it needs to be in front of you. Thank
11 you.

12 BERNARD GARRETT: I'm a little bit nervous
13 right now, but thank God that I'm here and thank Him
14 for allowing me to be here to be a part of what's
15 going on today. My company is Queensbridge Cleaning
16 and, thanks to Selvena right there, I am doing work
17 on the JFK terminal as a cleaning contractor and, if
18 it had not been for Selvena when she was working
19 there, it's not easy to run a business and, if you
20 stumble, you might not clean behind the toilet, you
21 might not clean something so I was on the verge of
22 getting terminated so Selvena stood up for me and
23 seen to it that I got another chance and, as a result
24 of Selvena, I'm making millions of dollars at the
25 airport Terminal 4 right now, and I got one small

1
2 problem. They're giving M/WBES a limit as to how much
3 they could make and, because they're scarce, why
4 should they short the amount of money that they can
5 make if they qualify to do the work so I just want
6 them to raise the ceiling a little bit if that's
7 possible because I got several different specs that I
8 can do in the construction industry. Not only
9 cleaning, we provide labor, we provide sheetrock, we
10 provide a number of different services. That's all on
11 my spec so I go to these meetings to meet new people
12 and to share and give other people hope because I've
13 been certified for years and this is the first time
14 that I got the opportunity to work on the airport and
15 I feel good about it. It started with one contract,
16 one contract turned into seven, and I'm still getting
17 more so thank God for allowing me to be here and,
18 most of all, I gotta thank that lady right there
19 because she made it all possible. Thank you.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Thank you for
21 coming today. We always love giving some shared
22 praise for our members so thank you for your
23 testimony.

24 Now, I'd like to call on Raul Rivera.
25

1
2 RAUL RIVERA: Good afternoon. My name is
3 Raul Rivera. I'm a TLC driver and a TLC driver
4 advocate. We know that the topic is regarding JFK and
5 transparency and equity, but it's hard to get hold of
6 our Council Members so sometimes we have to come
7 right here and speak. We'll take our two minutes, our
8 three minutes. About 34 years ago, I was in the
9 presence of a true leader. About 34 years ago, I was
10 in a room in the presence of a true leader. Her name
11 was Rosa Parks, and Rosa Parks was in the room, and I
12 was only 20 years old back then, and I knew who she
13 was and I know what she meant. This Committee, it's
14 not protecting the drivers. You know we're a driver
15 advocate. There's a lot of issues happening. We have
16 bills for the drivers.

17 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Mr. Rivera, you
18 have to stay on topic. We are here talking about JFK
19 Redevelopment Plan and Intro. 134. Do you have a
20 comment on the hearing topic?

21 RAUL RIVERA: My comment is regarding the
22 drivers, the airport. We've been to the airport. I
23 got 23,000 trips. I made plenty of trips to the
24 airport. When we can't have access to our Council
25 Members, we have to come here. That's what we're

1
2 doing. That's what we're doing. We're coming here.
3 You're talking about transparency. We have bills.
4 We've been advocating for our bills for the longest.
5 We've gone from advocating for our bills to filing
6 complaints with the COIB. There is no transparency in
7 this Committee. There's no transparency with many,
8 many Council Members, and that's why we're upset.
9 There's things that are happening. I'm a native New
10 Yorker. I'm not blind. I see things that are
11 happening and, when we file complaints, they are
12 valid complaints. Now we can't hold cell phones. Now
13 you try to censor us, stay on topic.

14 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Can you give us a
15 comment on the driver experience (INAUDIBLE)

16 RAUL RIVERA: I'm here, I'm here to, I'm
17 here to let you know that we filed a complaint on the
18 Public Advocate Jumaane Williams, we filed a
19 complaint on Council Member Avilés, and we filed a
20 complaint on Speaker Adams. That's why we file a
21 complaint. We want to give a copy to the Chair
22 because she's good friends with Adams, and we want
23 you to give her that copy. We want to submit this
24 copy. We're filing complaints. It might not go
25 nowhere, but we're filing our complaints. You guys

3 ain't working for the New Yorker, and that's why we
4 come here and we do what we do.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: You can give that
6 document to the Sergeant-at-Arms in the front, and
7 they will make sure that we receive a copy. Thank you
8 for coming today for your testimony.

9 We will now move to virtual participants.
10 I'd like to now call on our virtual participants.

11 First up in this panel is our Assembly
12 Member Khaleel Anderson.

13 ASSEMBLY MEMBER KHALEEL: Okay. Can you
14 hear me?

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL PAULENOFF: We hear you.

16 ASSEMBLY MEMBER KHALEEL: Madam Chair?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL PAULENOFF: We hear you.

18 ASSEMBLY MEMBER KHALEEL: Okay, let me
19 know when the clock starts.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL PAULENOFF: You can
21 start when the Sergeants call the timer.

22 ASSEMBLY MEMBER KHALEEL: Thank you.

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: You may begin.

24 ASSEMBLY MEMBER KHALEEL: Thank you so
25 much. Thank you to Chair Fariás as well as Chair
Brooks Powers for hosting this hearing today. I'm

3 really grateful that as the State Assembly Member
4 representing the entirety of JFK Airport and the
5 ancillary portions of the airport that lie in our
6 communities, to testify today my experience in
7 working within the JFK redevelopment process. My
8 concern, just as the Chair had conveyed as well as
9 some of the other Members have conveyed, is
10 transparency, and the reality is that the Port
11 Authority of New York and New Jersey has not been
12 transparent throughout the entirety of the JFK
13 Redevelopment Project, whether it is transparency
14 around M/WBE numbers, whether it is transparency on
15 LBE numbers, whether it is transparency about access
16 to employment opportunities and contracting
17 opportunities. There are some concerns about that
18 level of transparency. That's number one.

19 The second thing is there are concerns
20 about the lease extension. There was a lease
21 extension authorized by the past Administration and
22 so that lease extension, which EDC was not able to
23 answer questions about the extension or the current
24 status of compliance with the lease today, they were
25 not able to testify and answer that question. These
are concerns because when we're talking about

1
2 transparency, there is a community benefits agreement
3 that is tied to that lease extension, that 10-year
4 lease extension, and we don't have an accurate
5 reporting or reporting on where the status of those
6 programs named in the community benefits agreement
7 are, and so these are some of the concerns. I know
8 that the Port Authorities are actively working
9 through the redevelopment program, that they offered
10 to make some amends, but they are not reaching or
11 meeting the goals of making those amends, and these
12 are some of the concerns that we have.

13 Again, I'm grateful to the two Chairs for
14 having this joint hearing to discuss, and it is my
15 hope that EDC can come back with some answers.
16 Otherwise, it can be within our discretion to work
17 with other City and/or State agencies to get us the
18 answers that we need.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Thank you so much
20 for your testimony, Assembly Member. We always
21 appreciate when you come to our hearings here in the
22 Council.

23 I'd now like to call on the next
24 panelist, Evidelia Boyd.

25 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

3 EVIDELIA BOYD: Hello, Co-Chair Farías,
4 and good afternoon to Chair and Co-Chair Brooks-
5 Powers. Thank you very much for hosting this meeting.

6 My comment is first of all, I, too, am
7 disappointed that Port Authority did not show up. I
8 was coming here to hear specifics on the job
9 opportunities. It's great to say that there are
10 opportunities, but I wanted to hear specifics and
11 mitigation process that's happening. These are the
12 some of the things that I was coming here to hear
13 more about. The representatives from EDC were not
14 able to give us any specifics on those concerns. They
15 did speak on the space that was recently allotted for
16 the trucks to park overnight, and I was looking to
17 find out exactly how many spaces are now available.
18 She mentioned 100. I wanted to know the total amount
19 of spaces that are available, are they all open, is
20 it filled, is it near full capacity? I wanted more
21 specifics. Also, I wanted to know exactly how are the
22 spaces being used? Is it being used by buses, trucks,
23 trailers exactly, more specifics, and I also wanted
24 to know can NYPD use the space for their towing and
25 enforcement projects that they do when they are
towing those illegally parked trucks in our

1
2 neighborhoods and our streets. They also spoke on
3 community engagement. I was hoping to hear more
4 specifics. I sit on the board of the Rosedale Civic
5 Association, and my community of Rosedale is impacted
6 by JFK with the construction. I have friends and
7 family that lives in Springfield, in Laurelton. Those
8 communities are also directly impacted by JFK so I
9 was trying to learn more and hear more about exactly
10 what is this outreach that they say they're doing
11 because in the Rosedale community, we're not getting
12 the outreach that they're talking about, so I wanted
13 to hear more about that and hopefully, maybe, this
14 can be relayed back to EDC because we certainly need
15 to know in our community about the job opportunities,
16 the noise mitigation, and I heard something about
17 scholarships for students so I'm definitely hoping
18 that we can hear more about this from EDC. Thank you.

19 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Thank you so much
20 for your testimony and for staying within the time.
21 We always love a timely testimony.

22 I'd now like to call on a virtual
23 panelist that's listed as Gabriel Associates
24 Incorporated. Please unmute yourself and state your
25 name for the record.

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.

3 FELIPE VENTEGEAT: Good afternoon.

4 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: We can hear you.

5 Please state your name for the public record and you
6 can begin.

7 FELIPE VENTEGEAT: My name is Felipe, F E
8 L I P E, Ventegeat, V E N T E G E A T.

9 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Thank you. You can
10 begin your testimony.

11 FELIPE VENTEGEAT: So as a minority-owned
12 firm, We have had the opportunity to participate in
13 projects like Arverne by the Sea in that particular
14 case where the developer is the (INAUDIBLE) we're
15 hoping that some of the systems were set up so that
16 it'd be easier for minority- and women-owned
17 businesses to actually participate in the
18 redevelopment of the airport, like they've done, for
19 example, in the Averde by the Sea.

20 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: In terms of how
21 you're trying to get opportunities, have you attended
22 any of the Advisory Council meetings of the
23 redevelopment program?

24

25

1
2 FELIPE VENTEGEAT: Yes, we attended last
3 year, and we're not there presently today, but we are
4 participating by phone.

5 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Okay, and have you
6 been able to meet with any of the developers? Have
7 you had opportunities to participate on the
8 redevelopment to date?

9 FELIPE VENTEGEAT: Have not been able to
10 participate through contractual opportunities yet,
11 but we hope that there will be some in the near
12 future. We also have relationships with
13 subcontractors who are Queens-based, and so, for
14 example, there's the Challenger Corporation, which is
15 based in Queens and have participated as a
16 subcontractor to some of our general contracting
17 opportunities.

18 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Okay, and I
19 believe we have your information so I'm going to have
20 a member of my team connect you with the outreach
21 team from the JFK Redevelopment. Thank you.

22 FELIPE VENTEGEAT: Thank you so much.

23 CO-CHAIRPERSON FARIÁS: Thank you again
24 for your testimony.

3 Seeing no one left in the room to testify
4 and having no one virtually left to testify, we will
5 now adjourn the hearing. Thank you all for coming.

6 [GAVEL]
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 3, 2024