

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE COMMITTEE
ON HIGHER EDUCATION

June 25, 2019
Start: 1:35 p.m.
Recess: 5:37 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: MARK TREYGER
Chairperson

INEZ D. BARRON
Co-Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL
JOSEPH C. BORELLI
JUSTIN L. BRANNAN
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.
LAURIE A. CUMBO
DANIEL DROMM
BARRY S. GRODENCHIK
BEN KALLOS
ANDY L. KING
BRAD S. LANDER
STEPHEN T. LEVIN
MARK LEVINE
FARAH N. LOUIS
ALAN N. MAISEL
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
DEBORAH L. ROSE
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.
ERIC A. ULRICH

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 2

2 A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

3 Tomas Hanna
4 Chief Human Capital Officer at the New York City
Department of Education, DOE

5 Rod Bowen
6 Senior Executive Director of the Office of
Teacher Development within the Office of the
7 Chief Academic Officer

8 Amy Way
9 Senior Executive Director for Teacher Recruitment
And Quality

10 Ashleigh Thompson
University Dean for Education at CUNY

11 Michael Middleton
12 Klara and Larry Silverstein Dean of the School of
Education at Hunter College of the City
University of New York

13 JoAnne Simon
14 Assembly Member representing the 52nd Assembly
District

15 Christina Collins
16 Director of Research and Policy at UFT Teacher
Center on Behalf of Evelyn DeJesus, Vice
17 President for Education

18 David Saltonstall
19 Associate Comptroller for Policy at the Office of
New York City Comptroller Scott M. Stringer

20 Frank Pignatosi
21 Clinical Assistant Professor at New York
University's Steinhardt School of Culture,
Education and Human Development

22 Jacob Easley
23 Dean of the Graduate School of Education, Touro
College

24 Aimee Katembo
25 Director at the Office of Teacher Education at
Teacher College, Columbia University

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 3

2 A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

3 Karen DeMoss
4 Executive Director of Prepared to Teach:
5 Sustainable Funding for Quality Preparation at
6 Bank Street College

7 Alan Singer
8 Former High School Teacher, Teacher Educator at
9 Hofstra University on Long Island

10 Trina Lynn Yearwood
11 Associate Dean of the School of Education at Long
12 Island University Brooklyn Campus

13 Jennifer Pankowski
14 Assistant Professor and Coordinator of Special
15 Education for Pace University, Lower Manhattan

16 Thomas Sheppard
17 Parent of Six Children, Parent Member of District
18 11 Community Education Council, CEC, Education
19 Advocate in the Bronx

20 Paullette Healy
21 Parent in District 20, Member of the Citywide
22 Council for Special Education

23 Paula L. White
24 Executive Director of Educators for Excellence
25 New York

Rachel Fishkis
High School Teacher in the Bronx

Daniel Gannon
High School Educator in the South Bronx

Denny Salas
Director of Public Relations and Development for
The Bronx Charter Schools for Better Learning,
BBC

Maggie Moroff
Coordinator of Arise Coalition, Special Education
Policy Coordinator at Advocates for Children

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

4

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lori Podvesker
Lead for Policy Work for Include NYC

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 5

2 [gavel]

3 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, good

4 afternoon. I am Council Member Mark Treyger, Chair of
5 the Education Committee. I'd like to welcome you to
6 today's joint hearing on teacher preparation and
7 training. I'd like to thank Council Member Inez
8 Barron, Chair of the Committee on Higher Education
9 and who's also a former teacher and principal and she
10 is my education mentor here so I want to thank her
11 for her leadership and for partnering with me to lead
12 such an important conversation. Studies continue to
13 show what many of us know to be true, among school
14 related factors teachers matter the most or matter
15 critically for student achievement but we know
16 teachers do much more than help their students
17 perform well on a test. They are also critical in
18 promoting positive social and emotional wellbeing and
19 overall act as role models for our students. We're
20 here today to learn more about how these
21 professionals will have such a huge impact on our
22 city's children, are trained to take on this vital
23 role. We will hopefully learn about some of the
24 shortcomings of current teacher preparation programs
25 and have an honest conversation about how we can best

1

6

2

address these problems in order to ensure that our

3

children... our students have the best possible

4

teachers in their... in their classrooms. Our... as, as a

5

result by the way of high teacher turnover rates

6

especially in our highest needs schools thousands of

7

New York City students are taught by a first-year

8

teacher each year. While we should be able to

9

guarantee that these teachers are fully prepared on

10

their first day, that is currently not the case.

11

Also, you know our school children come from all over

12

the world and from all different backgrounds and they

13

all have unique needs. While we can say that we value

14

these differences it is our teachers who must

15

substantiate and validate this claim in the classroom

16

but if 85 percent, percent of our students are

17

students of color what message do we send when the

18

majority of our teachers are not? I actually have a

19

bill, Intro 1554 that will report on demographics of,

20

of school staff which we'll... we did have a hearing on

21

and will be advancing in the fall. What message do we

22

send when these, these diverse children... to these

23

diverse children when their teachers are also not

24

adequately trained in culturally responsive education

25

from their very first day in the classroom? What

1
2 message do we send if, if teachers are not adequately
3 prepared to help English language learners or
4 students with IEPs in city schools? Matter of fact
5 the graduation figures for ELLs in city schools is
6 now about 35 percent of the kids graduate on time.
7 Too often we depend on professional development to
8 better our educators and this is reflected in the
9 millions of dollars we spend on it each year and
10 while this is valuable in ensuring constant growth
11 and improvement, every school day is critical for
12 student achievement so teachers need to be effective
13 from their first day in, in the classroom. I... as a...
14 as a former high school teacher myself I remember
15 yearning for additional pedagogy training in, in my
16 teacher program and I am... I, I'm, I'm proud of, of
17 all the schools I, I've attended and gone to but
18 there were certainly areas that I wish I could have
19 learned more. I believe that one of the issues that I
20 saw was that there was an imbalance in terms of more
21 content and pedagogy, I wish I could have received
22 more pedagogical training than, than content training
23 during my schooling, I wish I could have reached
24 students on the first day of, of, of teaching. I
25 don't believe you could PD your way out of all these

1
2 issues. PD is used to maybe reinforce something that
3 you should have learned during your preparation
4 program, it should not be used as a... as, as a
5 mechanism to teach you something for the first time
6 ever, if that's the case then we have a lot of work
7 to do. I know it is our student's and their parent's
8 rights to have a fully prepared teacher in their
9 classroom from the second the first bell of the
10 school year rings and it is a teacher's right to know
11 that their years of dedication to their own schooling
12 has made them ready for that moment. It is these
13 teacher preparation programs in the Department of
14 Education's responsibility to ensure that these
15 rights are recognized even before a teacher spends
16 countless hours and we spend countless dollars on
17 professional development. A person who completes the
18 requirements and is hired by our schools should not
19 want to leave after just one or two years and there
20 are... I know there's a variety of factors why that
21 happens but we, we do need, need to address these
22 issues. That is why our conversation today is so
23 critical, we hope to gain greater insight on these
24 issues today from DOE as well as from CUNY and
25 private teacher education programs. I want to extend

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 9

2 my thanks to you all for coming today to discuss this
3 critical issue. In fact, I hope this hearing is just
4 the start of a broader dialogue and I'd like to
5 invite the teacher preparation programs that have
6 come out today to meet with me at a later date to
7 continue this important discussion. I also want to
8 thank everyone who is testifying today, I want to
9 thank the City Council staff who is incredible. We
10 just went through a budget process and they're still
11 here working hard; I really want to thank them all
12 for all the work that they've put into today's
13 hearing, Malcom Butehorn, the Committee Counsel, Jan
14 Atwell, Policy Analyst; Kalima Johnson, Policy
15 Analyst; Charlotte Saltzman, Education Intern who's
16 doing a great job; Kaitlyn O'Hagan, Fiscal Analyst
17 and Chelsea Baytemur, Baytemur, I'm sorry, Financial
18 Analyst. I also want to thank my Chief of Staff Anna
19 Scaife and my Policy Director Vanessa Ogle and of
20 course I want to turn it over to my Co-Chair and
21 colleague, Council Member Inez Barron and thank her
22 and her staff as well.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Council
24 Member Treyger. Good afternoon everyone. I'm Council
25 Member Inez Barron, I'm the Chair of the Committee on

1
2 Higher Education and welcome to today's oversight
3 hearing on teacher preparation and training. First
4 let me take this moment to give commendations to two
5 classman teachers that I had in my career who have
6 made an impact not only on my education but on my
7 life and that would be Miss Ann Yearwood who was my
8 teacher in grades four, five and six at PS 20 in
9 Brooklyn and Dr. Leonard James who was my African
10 American history instructor when I took a sabbatical
11 from teaching at DOE and he was my professor at New
12 York City Technical College. Two people who had a
13 profound impact on my life and I'm sure if I asked
14 you, you could think of at least one teacher that was
15 outstanding during your elementary school education.
16 You never forget the impact of that teacher, it might
17 have been your kindergarten teacher or your first
18 grade or your seventh-grade math or whatever but
19 there's always one teacher that stands out in your
20 mind, at least one. The Committee on Higher Education
21 last held a hearing on the topic... on this topic in
22 January of 2016, at that hearing we addressed the
23 teacher shortage and how the city and CUNY are
24 working to address it as well as increase the number
25 of teachers of color in the classroom. At that time

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

11

1 Arthur Levine, former president of Columbia
2 University's teachers college said that at the
3 schools that prepare teachers to teach, quote
4 "teacher education is regarded by university
5 professors and administrators inside and outside of
6 the education school as one of the poorest quality
7 campus units", end quote. In New York City which has
8 one of the largest and most diverse student
9 populations in terms of race, culture, class and
10 ability, it is essential that we have well educated
11 and prepared teachers and specifically teachers of
12 diverse backgrounds to ensure that we can increase
13 student learning and academic achievement. Indeed,
14 prep... teacher preparation is one of the strongest
15 factors in independent... in student learning. The
16 quality of a teacher's preparation program can have a
17 greater impact on student outcomes than even poverty.
18 Furthermore, student of color who study with a
19 teacher of color perform three to six percentile
20 points higher on reading and math tests than those
21 without. However, there are increasing concerns about
22 how well teacher education programs are preparing
23 perspective educators for working with students in
24 Department of Education schools. I am particularly
25

1
2 concerned about such preparation... how such
3 preparation may be lacking in the area of culturally
4 responsive education. Moreover, despite the
5 significant representation of students of color in
6 DOE schools, teachers of color are significantly
7 underrepresented. If, if teachers are to be
8 effective, they must be sure that they are sensitive
9 too and address the various expressions of
10 intelligences such as described by Gardner and
11 include visual and special, verbal and linguistic,
12 logical and mathematical, bodily and kinesthetic,
13 musical, interpersonal, intrapersonal and naturalist.
14 Teachers must help children realize and utilize their
15 metacognitive styles. Equally important teachers must
16 fully be cognizant of the stages of child
17 development. White educators account for more than
18 half of the teacher population on average in every
19 borough but the Bronx where the average ratio fell
20 just below 50 percent from 2015 to 2016 and more than
21 half of all Brooklyn school teachers are white in the
22 2015/16 school year although white students comprise
23 18 percent of the student population yet the totals
24 of black, Latino and Asian students all surpass their
25 educator counterparts. On June 1st... June 11th the

1

2 Mayor together with Chancellor Richard Carranza
3 endorsed a series of recommendations offered by the
4 school diversity advisory group. Of the 62
5 recommendations meant to improve diversity in New
6 York City public schools only six focused on the
7 teachers. Now with a new CUNY Chancellor whom I'm
8 looking forward to meeting I look forward to hearing
9 CUNY's plan to increase and improve teacher
10 education. In particular I'm interested in an update
11 on New York City Men Teach, an initiative that was
12 recently launched to support the preparation,
13 recruitment and professional development of a
14 thousand men of color across nine CUNY campuses. From
15 both CUNY and the private institutions that are here
16 today, I'm interested in learning how you are working
17 to increase one, the number of teachers, particularly
18 the number of black teachers; two, ensure teachers
19 receive appropriate training and preparation and
20 three, increase the number of teachers of color in
21 the DOE schools. I want to acknowledge my colleagues
22 from the Higher Education Committee who are present,
23 Council Member Maisel, Council Member Rodriguez and I
24 also want to thank Joyce Simmons, my Chief of Staff,
25 Ndigo Washington, my CUNY Liaison and Director of

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 14

2 Legislation; Chloe Rivera, the Committee's Policy
3 Analyst; Paul Sinegal, Council to the Committee and
4 Michelle Peregrin, the Committee's Finance Analyst,
5 thank you so much Mr. Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Thank you Chair and
7 I also just want to recognize all the members who are
8 here I see also we've been... there's some overlap
9 Council Member Grodenchik, Council Member Maisel,
10 Council Member Lander, Council Member Cornegy,
11 Council Member Rodriguez, Council Member Dromm,
12 Council Member Rose and Council Member Borelli and I
13 believe we'll now have the, the first panel be called
14 up and we'll have them sworn in, is that right? We
15 have Tomas Hanna, Chief Human Capital DOE; Rod Bowen,
16 Senior Executive Director of Teacher Development and
17 Amy Way, Senior Executive Director of Teacher
18 Recruitment.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
20 hands? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
21 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
22 before this committee and to respond honestly to
23 Council Member's questions?

24 TOMAS HANNA: I do.

25 ROD BOWEN: I do.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

15

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

AMY WAY: I do.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Please state your names
for the record.

AMY WAY: Amy Way.

TOMAS HANNA: Tomas Hanna.

ROD BOWEN: Rod Bowen.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: There you go, go
ahead.

TOMAS HANNA: Thank you so very much.

Good afternoon Chairs Treyger and Barron and members
of the Committees on Education and Higher Education.

My name is Tomas Hanna and I'm the Chief Human

Capital Officer at the New York City Department of

Education. I'm joined by Rod Bowen, Senior Executive

Director of the Office of Teacher Development within

the Office of the Chief Academic Officer and I'm

joined by Amy Way, Senior Executive Director for

Teacher Recruitment and Quality. Thank you for the

opportunity to testify today. We appreciate the

opportunity to discuss the critically important issue

of strengthening our teaching workforce in this

venue. Since this is my first time before a Council,

I'm very appreciative of it, I would like to share a

little bit about my background. As an educator with

1 more than 25 years of experience, I've had the
2 pleasure of serving school communities in two large
3 urban districts, including New York City, since 2011.
4 I have served in a variety of school-based roles such
5 as substitute teacher, teacher and principal, as well
6 as a deputy and associate superintendent and other
7 senior leadership roles in central offices. The
8 quality and retention of our teachers are core
9 components of Chancellor Carranza's priority to
10 develop people and the city's equity and excellence
11 agenda for all as a whole. We are deeply committed to
12 supporting the growth and development of our
13 teachers, from preservice... from preservice training
14 to in service professional learning and we've made
15 unprecedented investments and implemented a number of
16 new initiatives. As a result, we have a holistic set
17 of support systems for every teacher from before they
18 enter the classroom through their entire career. For
19 example, we have increased peer to peer teacher
20 support and transformed our educators' career ladder
21 into a career lattice with nearly 2,000 new teacher
22 leader positions in our schools. We have created new
23 innovative pathways and strategies to increase
24 teacher retention and strengthen resources in our
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

17

1
2 historically underserved communities through the
3 Bronx Plan, our Teaching Fellows program and 80 new
4 teacher preparation academies. We have developed the
5 new teacher development facilitator positions in the
6 United Federation of Teachers contract, establishing
7 leaders who provide ongoing support to teachers
8 during their preservice training. And through the NYC
9 Men Teach initiative, we have increased the diversity
10 of our teaching force, over 1,000 men of color have
11 entered the teaching pipelines since that effort
12 started just three years ago. As a result of these
13 and other initiatives, overall teacher retention and
14 new teacher retention across New York City public
15 schools remain consistently higher than national
16 averages. And in recognition of our investments in
17 teacher leadership and professional development
18 opportunities, in 2017 the National Council on
19 Teacher Quality named the New York City Department of
20 Education... of Education as a great district for great
21 teachers. While we are pleased by our progress, we
22 know there is more work to do to ensure that all new
23 teachers are well prepared and trained. The DOE has a
24 workforce of approximately 80,000 teachers, serving
25 students from birth to grade 12 in district schools

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

and NYC early education centers. As a system, we welcome approximately 5,000 new teachers into our schools every year. All newly hired teachers in New York City public schools are prepared through schools of education and we depend on the traditional pathways at institutions of higher education to prepare most of our new hires every year. We recruit from over 100 universities nationwide and are more deeply involved with the smaller subset of primarily local institutions of higher education. Over 60 percent of our new hires graduated from, and received their preservice teacher preparation at, New York State public and private universities. Over 30 percent of our new hires graduated from a university in the CUNY system. Helping aspiring educators' transition to our schools requires a strong partnership with the UFT, higher education institutes, and the New York State Department of Education. together we've strengthened student teacher preparation requirements, so that our newest educators are better prepared to enter and succeed in the field. DOE has multiple touchpoints with these key partners, including quarterly steering meetings... committee meetings and monthly meetings with the UFT,

1
2 institutions of higher education and NYSED. I want to
3 share several key steps we are taking with our
4 partners to improve teacher preparation. Number one,
5 increase the number of teacher candidates prepared to
6 teach in our schools aligned to our subject area
7 needs. We have engaged universities in a shared
8 vision for teacher preparation called the criteria
9 for new teacher readiness. These are the skills and
10 knowledge that we expect every New York City teacher
11 to have prior to entering our classrooms. Through the
12 DOE's grant funded teacher preparation transformation
13 center, we are collaborating with preparation
14 programs at three universities; Lehman College,
15 Brooklyn College and Touro College, around these
16 criteria. Part of this work is also building upon
17 current initiatives to increase recruitment in hard
18 to staff categories, such as teaching special
19 education students and multilingual learners. We are
20 proud that we've been able to work with our partners
21 to create subsidized teaching programs in these
22 areas, through the subsidized bilingual extension
23 program and the secondary students with disabilities
24 certification program, in addition to the Teaching
25 Fellows program and the Bronx Plan. Two, second,

1
2 expand clinical experiences to provide meaningful and
3 genuine opportunities to practice skills with our
4 students in our schools. We are working with the
5 National Center for Teacher Residencies and US Prep,
6 two nationally renowned leaders in residency-based
7 teacher preparation, to increase the amount of
8 student teaching and clinical preparation candidates
9 receive before entering the classroom. We had 500
10 preservice teachers trained through a half year
11 residency this year and are looking to strengthen and
12 expand these efforts. Additionally, in partnership
13 with key stakeholders across the state, we
14 successfully lobbied, lobbied NYSED to change
15 regulations to require prospective teachers to spend
16 more time in DOE schools for student teaching prior
17 to graduating from their programs. Those regulation
18 changes significantly increased the required student
19 teaching time to one semester from the previous
20 requirements of 40 days. Third, culturally responsive
21 sustaining education. Chancellor Carranza is making
22 culturally responsive sustaining education a
23 cornerstone in everything we do. Students must see
24 themselves in the lessons we teach, and that is why
25 we are expanding our culturally responsive sustaining

1

2 curriculum options and in-service trainings, as well
3 as putting forward the first unified definition of
4 culturally responsive sustaining education in DOE
5 history. In addition, we are working with our higher
6 education partners to infuse more culturally
7 responsive and implicit bias content into their
8 curricula in order to better prepare their graduates
9 to teach New York City public school students. Before
10 I turn it over to my colleague Rob Bowen, who will
11 speak about the experience of, of teachers after they
12 are hired, I would like again to thank the New York
13 City Council Committees on Education and Higher
14 Education for the opportunity to speak today. We
15 appreciate your shared recognition of how important
16 this work is; a single teacher can have an enormous
17 impact on the lives of many students. There is much
18 work to do and together we have the momentum to build
19 upon the progress we've made to advance equity and
20 excellence for all New York City students. Thank you.
21 Rod.

22

ROD BOWEN: Thank you Tomas. Good

23

afternoon Chair Treyger, Chair Barron and members of

24

both the New York City Council Committee on Education

25

and Higher Education. My name is Rod Bowen and I

1
2 serve as the Senior Executive Director of the Office
3 of Teacher Development which is within our new Chief
4 Academic Office as part of the Division of Teaching
5 and Learning. I come to this role having been a
6 classroom teacher, a founding principal of an arts
7 high school in the Bronx and the leader of the Office
8 of School Quality. That last role in particular put
9 me in hundreds of classrooms observing teaching from
10 kindergarten through 12th grade across our city and I
11 bring that understanding of the strength and
12 challenges that exist in our classrooms to my current
13 role. Great teachers are the cornerstones of great
14 schools and I would like to discuss the strategies we
15 use to support the growth and development of our
16 teachers as they can better serve our 1.1 million
17 students. Our Chief Academic Office, led by Dr. Linda
18 Chen, is leading essential work across the Divisions
19 of Teaching and Learning, Multilingual Learners and
20 Specialized Instruction and Student Supports to
21 provide all schools with the resources and
22 professional develop... professional learning necessary
23 to create inclusive, rigorous instruction for every
24 child, in a safe, welcoming and affirming
25 environment. As part of this effort, the focus of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

23

1
2 office that I lead is to support the growth and
3 development of our teachers so they can ultimately
4 sustain a long term and successful career in our
5 schools. As a system, our professional development
6 efforts are wide ranging and available in many
7 different forms to meet needs of each district and
8 school. Across the department, including academics
9 and the borough citywide offices, teams organize
10 opportunities for thousands of teachers to learn and
11 share targeted content specific classroom practices.
12 Generally, these events are focused on the use and
13 implementation of curricula and pedagogical
14 approaches and provide valuable learning for our
15 teachers as well as opportunities for them to
16 continue to grow and develop. In addition, we know
17 that our newest teachers need ongoing, targeted
18 support and development. That is why even before
19 their first school year begins, new teachers are
20 invited to three days of professional learning, which
21 introduce them to the expectations of the New York
22 City schools along with the supports and resources
23 available to them. This fall, for the first time,
24 this training will be required for all new teachers.
25 After teachers attend this new teacher week, they,

1 they participate in our new teacher mentoring
2 program. All teachers receive a trained mentor upon
3 entering their school. This is important because
4 research shows that when teachers receive ongoing
5 school-based support from an experienced and talented
6 mentor, they are more likely to be satisfied on the
7 job as well as teach long term. Each year, we train
8 600 new teacher mentors and there are now 3,500
9 mentors citywide. In order to sustain the long-term
10 growth of educators and drive school wide
11 improvement, teachers and school leaders continue to
12 come together for 80 minutes of rigorous, weekly
13 professional development, a key result of our 2014
14 contract with the United Federation for Teachers.
15 During this time, school teams engage in deep work
16 around targeted professional learning focused on
17 specific needs and strengths of each school. As Tomas
18 already, already mentioned, teacher development goes
19 hand in hand with our equity and access for all
20 agenda, the Mayor and Chancellor's plan to put all
21 students on the path to college and meaningful
22 careers. Teachers who are willing to step up and
23 expand their classroom practices are central to this
24 mission. For example, there are teachers being
25

1

2 developed to teach new advanced placement courses,
3 computer science courses and implement a college
4 going culture at their schools. These 21st century
5 skill... teaching skills are essential for putting all
6 students on the path to success. We are committed to
7 continuous improvement and in particular, we are
8 focused on strengthening our university partnerships,
9 as well as the culturally responsive sustaining
10 pedagogy of every educator, so that they can leverage
11 the knowledge of their students' identities and
12 diversity as assets in the classroom. These elements
13 of our work will be essential to the long-term
14 success of our students, our schools, and our
15 communities. Thank you for your partnership and for
16 the opportunity to testify before you today. We will
17 be happy to answer any questions you may have for us.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Okay, thank you,
19 thank you very much and, and also just to note for,
20 for, for the public I, I will at some point soon have
21 to turn it over to my Co-Chair to, to run the full
22 hearing because my niece is graduating high school
23 today and I am in big trouble if I don't make it so I
24 will ask some key questions, do some follow up but I
25 will be reading all testimony, my staff will be here,

1
2 this is a topic of great importance to me both
3 professionally and personally and... on behalf of the
4 children of New York City and so I will be following
5 up from this and I want to thank my Co-Chair for, for
6 her leadership and for accommodating this, this day
7 for me. I, I just want to just have a, a... some quick
8 questions just...

9 [off mic dialogue]

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yes, I mentioned
11 we've been joined by Council Member Dromm, yes,
12 absolutely. Just want to ask first does... what, what
13 are the most common PD requests made by newly hired
14 teachers in our school system, does, does someone
15 keep track of that over in, in the DOE?

16 ROD BOWEN: Well we do survey new
17 teachers at the end of the year and classroom
18 management comes up a lot and we tend to just make
19 sure that we're focusing on it and to student
20 engagement which can take many forms so student
21 engagement and classroom management.

22 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, you're saying
23 that the DOE provides a survey to newly hired
24 teachers, is that correct?

25 ROD BOWEN: Yep.

1
2 TOMAS HANNA: We do, we survey new
3 teachers at about the six-week period when they're
4 with us and yes sir and we ask them how, how things
5 are going for them and at the end of the year as
6 well.

7 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And so, what are...
8 so, you mentioned classroom management as one, what
9 are some of the other items or areas of concern,
10 areas... or areas for growth that teachers are
11 requesting help with?

12 TOMAS HANNA: A couple of areas would be
13 working with multilingual learners as you called out
14 earlier in... when we started and working with students
15 who have IEPs, students with disabilities to try to
16 sort of meet, meet their needs.

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: And how long has
18 the DOE been conducting this, this survey with newly
19 hired teachers?

20 TOMAS HANNA: Amy?

21 AMY WAY: We've conducted this survey for
22 about three years, but we can confirm that for you as
23 a follow up.

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, because I, I
25 don't remember filling out that survey, but I did

1
2 teach a while ago, so, it's been over five, five
3 years. It's interesting because some of the areas
4 that you mentioned, classroom management I was taught
5 that if there's an issue with classroom management
6 that means that there are gaps in the lesson plan,
7 there's an old expression if, if you fail to plan and
8 you plan to, to fail, right and so if there's... if
9 each minute is not planned accordingly there could be
10 gaps and that's when some management issues might
11 occur but that's a part of pedagogy training, working
12 with students, multilingual learner students, I was
13 in that situation where a first year teacher assigned
14 to a bilingual class and it was challenging for me
15 and some of you who know me know that I like to... I
16 like to talk at times, it's too teacher centric I get
17 that but it's hard to teach when the majority of your
18 students in front of you speak a language other than
19 English in, in the classroom and I don't speak their
20 language and so I was sent to a number of PDs but as
21 I mentioned in my opening remarks you can't PD your
22 way out of all these issues. I wish I could have
23 received more training in terms of how to reach my
24 students before I stepped foot into the classroom and
25 I learned the most effectively when I observed

1
2 veteran teachers who I was very fortunate to work
3 with and I want to thank our experienced veteran
4 educators in our school system who don't get enough
5 thanks in my opinion who mentored this younger... this
6 new teacher who came into the building and through
7 those observations I took out... those practices back
8 into my classroom. How does the... how does the results
9 on that survey inform your work with the teaching
10 preparatory institutions?

11 TOMAS HANNA: We... so, we... as we said in
12 testimony, we actually meet regularly with, with our
13 partners and engage them and here's what we're
14 learning from the field, what might you be able to do
15 to, to sort of fill those gaps as, as it were. I'd
16 also share that we, we... I'll also share with you that
17 that information we also provide internally to
18 executive superintendents, to superintendents, to
19 principals so that they too can plan their work in
20 their buildings to be sure that they're filling those
21 gaps as well so we are sharing the information...
22 [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Is that data
24 publicly available?

25

1
2 TOMAS HANNA: We, we have kept... that data
3 we've been using internally to inform our partners
4 sort of in a more intimate setting because we think
5 that's, that's, that's a really strong way to, to
6 ensure that we're, we're being open and honest and
7 transparent with, with them so that they get what
8 they need so that they can make the changes
9 necessary.

10 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I mean I, I'm
11 respectful of privacy, names, information but
12 certainly I think the common areas are of great
13 public interest and so if that could be shared with
14 our committees I would greatly appreciate that, just
15 the common areas that are... that are in need of
16 additional addressing... [cross-talk]

17 TOMAS HANNA: Very well.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Also in addition to
19 teacher surveys, you know you have supervisors
20 whether... assistant principals or principals observing
21 new teachers, I'm curious to know how the DOE works
22 with school leaders on their feedback, they have the
23 power to issue observation reports, that's a part of
24 their, their requirements, I'm curious to know are
25 there commonalities that we're seeing in observation

1
2 reports made by supervisors to, to new teachers and
3 how that's being addressed by the DOE?

4 ROD BOWEN: So, my office is responsible
5 for working with a group of folk who's, who's goal is
6 to go out into the field and, and train principals on
7 how to give quality feedback and how to take
8 advantage of the advanced system, it's not only being
9 an evaluative piece but a, a development,
10 developmental experience with teachers and so that's
11 ongoing work, there's so many principals throughout
12 the system who are at various levels of experience
13 and I would just name that one of the things that we
14 are be... a concerted effort to work with them is with
15 the quality of their feedback, making sure that when
16 a teacher regardless of their level of experience who
17 reads that report that they're very clear on what
18 their next steps are for improvement.

19 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: So, I, I appreciate
20 that answer and if I heard you correctly these
21 mentors or folks work with the principals on how to
22 provide quality feedback to... [cross-talk]

23 ROD BOWEN: To new teachers... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...new... to, to
25 teachers...

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ROD BOWEN: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: My question is what quality feedback are they bringing back to DOE saying look, these are the common areas that we're, we... that we're being asked to address in these schools across the city, what can we do better to provide more support to them and also to future educators, is that information also being shared with your teaching preparatory institutions?

ROD BOWEN: I want to make sure I understand the, the question... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right... [cross-talk]

ROD BOWEN: ...you're asking what feedback are we getting from principals?

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Correct.

ROD BOWEN: That's a great question and my response is that they're deep, deepening their understanding around the use of Danielson Framework for Teaching which is our uniform tool for development and evaluation is the big ask and, and constantly norming and deepening their understanding of that, that tool has been... has been an ask on their part and there's been a lot of appreciation for looking at something they've been seeing for years

1

2 and seeing it with a new lens that's the ongoing work
3 of coaching in the schools with, with a team of, of
4 coaches and so just a, a better understanding of the
5 tool and the work moving forward is to work to ensure
6 that teachers including new teachers are also using
7 that same tool to... as a tool for self development and
8 not to see it as something that's evaluative.

9

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right. I... because

10

I, I speak to folks in the field still, I'm... I still

11

speak to my teacher colleagues, I have, you know

12

friends and folks who work as principal assistants,

13

principals across the city and anecdotally what

14

they're telling me is what I'm hearing today that a

15

lot of the new staff need help in areas of teaching

16

multilingual learners need help in terms of

17

recognizing student's needs and how to best

18

accommodate their needs in the classroom and I just

19

feel that this has been a conversation that we're

20

having over and over and over again and how we're

21

kind of breaking the cycle and so my question also is

22

in addition to working with our teaching preparatory

23

institutions has there been sort of more of an

24

intense look at the coursework and the materials in

25

these teaching preparation programs because one of

1
2 the things.. and I, I want to again state, I love my
3 experience, I had great professors, I had a great,
4 great time but I do believe if, if, if you ask for my
5 feedback I had content training here, pedagogy
6 training here, I wish quite frankly I had a little
7 bit more pedagogy training here and, and I love
8 history, I will always.. I'm a student of history but
9 it's hard to teach history when you can't read your
10 kids and so has there ever been sort of like a.. an
11 analysis done by the coursework whether it's CUNY or
12 whether it's private institutions to kind of, you
13 know identify best practices that can be shared
14 across the board, across all institutions, if you
15 could speak to that?

16 AMY WAY: Yep, so I'd be happy to jump in
17 on this. So, we have a set of partnerships with
18 higher education that are convened by national
19 partners, Tomas mentioned US Prep and National Center
20 for Teaching Residencies, both of these partners are
21 supporting DOE and higher education to have exactly
22 the conversation that you just mentioned what is
23 anchoring that conversation is the criteria for new
24 teacher readiness which is something that we've
25 developed recently in this administration at.. in

1
2 response to very much what you've said around our new
3 teachers not necessarily having the opportunity to
4 develop the skills to support our students and so the
5 focus of the criteria includes some elements of
6 Danielson and then other areas that we're calling the
7 connected practices and that tool came out of
8 conversations and looking at information and
9 understanding what should we be doing to make clear
10 to our partners what's important to DOE and so we
11 think that this is just the beginning of that work
12 through those partnerships but that that vision
13 allows us to have a common ground around what
14 readiness looks like and when looking at curricula
15 and other elements to be able to say where are we
16 seeing the development of skills that are aligned to
17 this work.

18 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Now do you feel
19 that state regs and state mandates are sufficient as
20 far as what's required of teachers to obtain in their
21 quest to obtain a, a teaching license like for
22 example in the DOE I know that the DOE is required by
23 the state to teach a certain number of hours of
24 physical education and, and, and health and so forth,
25 do you feel that there are, are sufficient

1
2 requirements in terms of state mandates, in terms of
3 teaching preparatory coursework?

4 AMY WAY: So, New York State is a very
5 important partner in our preparation of teachers and
6 I had the pleasure of serving on a committee to
7 revisit the clinical preparation regulations and that
8 led to having us extend the number of student
9 teaching days from 40 days to half a semester that
10 Tomas spoke about in his testimony, what we think
11 there is opportunity... you know there's opportunity
12 for growth and work with high... with higher ed and New
13 York State around those regulations, I think our
14 partners would agree that we need to look at this
15 suite of what is required within those regulations
16 that we've done some good work looking at advancing
17 the student teaching component but we could be
18 looking at the full package together and
19 understanding ways to potentially revise.

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I mean for example
21 are there certain amounts of hours required or
22 coursework required for special education regardless
23 if my license is in special education everyone should
24 have a general understanding because I was required
25 to teach an ICT class and I have a gen ed license but

1
2 I should know the needs of all my kids, I don't look
3 at kids whether they're gen ed or special ed, they're
4 all my children but I wish I could have received more
5 training on how to best meet all of their needs but
6 is... are... is there a requirement in, in state... in
7 state regs that require institutions to teach a
8 certain number, number of hours or courses in special
9 education, can you speak to that?

10 AMY WAY: So, I, I can speak to it, but I
11 think it's also a good question for our partners in
12 higher... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I will be... yeah,
14 sure, yes... [cross-talk]

15 AMY WAY: So, we... so, there... recently New
16 York State did increase the number of hours for
17 student... for student teachers to prepare and there is
18 a multi... literacy for multilingual learners and there
19 are other baseline requirements but I think this is
20 part of the review that we would be excited to do in
21 conjunction with New York State and higher ed would
22 be to say what do we know about the needs of our
23 students, what do we think our teachers need to know
24 and to take a hard look at those requirements.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

HIGHER EDUCATION

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right and you mentioned that they've increased the number of fieldworks that's required... [cross-talk]

AMY WAY: The student teach... it's student, student... [cross-talk]

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...student teaching, the one thing... and again it... things could have changed since my time so forgive me if, if, if I have old information but one of the things I think would be helpful is structuring that field work more because sometimes I've heard from folks that they might not... they might know a friend in the system that they'll observe their class and do teach... student teaching with, that's great but quite frankly if I could redo my time and I, I worked in a... I visited a number of schools but I probably would have spent a lot more time with teachers who are seasoned and experienced in teaching multilingual learners or, or teachers who are teaching ICT classes, I didn't know I was going to get assigned those classes so... I didn't know in advance, is, is there any effort to kind of make that field work more structured in terms of they can't just pick anybody in the school system, they should be working a certain number of hours and

1

2 days with certain types of educators if, if that
3 makes sense?

4

AMY WAY: Yep, so the quality of those
5 teacher educators whether they're within higher ed or
6 within our schools is very important that's why we've
7 recently negotiated the teacher development
8 facilitator in our UFT contract, the intention behind
9 that role is to create some level of kind of
10 standardization across those roles where we can say,
11 you know who is selected for those positions, how are
12 they trained, how are they supported and we see a lot
13 of opportunity in that new element in our contract.
14 The new state regulation also requires training of
15 teacher educators and so I think that would get at
16 some of what you're mentioning but we are just at the
17 beginning of implementing that new regulation, it
18 doesn't go into... it was just voted on and approved by
19 the regents this spring.

20

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Alright, I just
21 have a couple more and then I'll turn it over to my
22 Co-Chair. In August 2013, the DOE released a teacher
23 preparation program reports TPRR analyzing the
24 effectiveness of teacher preparation programs based
25 on the quality... quote, "quality, distribution and

1 retention of new teacher hires", end quote, who
2 graduated from such programs, the TPPR provided an
3 analysis of graduates from the 12 teacher preparation
4 programs that supplied the most educators to New York
5 City public schools between 2008 and 2012. Since that
6 initial 2013 release DOE has not publicly released
7 TPPR data, does DOE still compile and track TPPR data
8 if not, why not?

10 AMY WAY: So, under Chancellor Farina's
11 administration, we made a shift to be more
12 collaborative with institutes of higher ed so we
13 stepped away from having the public reports released
14 and instead we share information through our partners
15 and so that's work that we do in conjunction with the
16 national partners I mentioned in the monthly and
17 quarterly convenings that we have with CUNY and other
18 education partners, we look at information around our
19 overall pipeline and how... who's hired, what are some
20 of the problems that we need to solve around that
21 pipeline together but those conversations happen in
22 conjunction with those... that partnership rather than
23 through a public report.

1

2

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: But would you agree

3

that that report contains policy and budgetary

4

implications?

5

AMY WAY: If I recall the report did not

6

show much differentiation across the institutions so

7

I think for our purposes we find that the partnership

8

work is a much more meaningful way to advance the

9

conversation.

10

CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, I mean I, I

11

would just respectfully disagree and say that as

12

policy makers we want to always improve policy and if

13

there's budgetary needs we need to increase supports

14

for DOE or our higher ed because quite frankly a lot

15

of this conversation will require in the end more

16

resources to better meet the needs of, of our kids

17

and I get that but certainly we need to know where

18

we're falling short or where... or, or who has

19

something that is worth pursuing and sharing with,

20

with other partners and so I, I, I do believe that

21

this is a result of I think those... federal

22

legislation or mandates passed down to require some

23

sort of reporting on, on teaching preparatory

24

institutions but I do think that there are budgetary

25

and policy implications that we need to... especially

1
2 if you're confirming to us today that there are areas
3 that we need to continue to grow teachers in, we need
4 to know, we need to know that and we need to figure
5 out how to always strive for improvement and add more
6 resources, you know and so I, I would request that
7 the DOE go back and reevaluate that decision and at
8 least to share it with the City Council because we
9 are partners in the budget process and we could make
10 an impact in this... in this area. According... I'm just
11 following up on the TPPR, according to the DOE's
12 press release the TPPR was compiled as a first step
13 for the city and university education programs to
14 open a dialogue aimed at developing a long term
15 strategy to improve preparation for aspiring teachers
16 before they ever step into a DOE classroom, what can
17 you share with us now about that dialogue if it...
18 you're saying it, it happens, what can you share with
19 us now concretely that has changed as a result of
20 this dialogue?

21 AMY WAY: Sure, so we are actively
22 engaging in conversations about the design of the
23 curriculum within teacher preparation, we are
24 engaging in ways to align around our vision for
25 teacher educators, what does... what should we value in

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 43

2 those individuals who are either hosting student
3 teachers or teaching courses and we are sharing the
4 criteria for new teacher readiness and providing
5 supports to higher education to be able to make
6 adjustments to their curriculum. So, we are really
7 proud of the work that's underway, you know this is
8 complex work, teaching is a challenging profession
9 and we want to bring all groups together in order to
10 make these improvements.

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Right, I... one last
12 follow up and then I'll, I'll turn it over to my Co-
13 Chair. With regards to professional development for
14 new teachers, is there any type of quality review
15 that's conducted for the providers of that PD since
16 many teachers require extensive PD over and over
17 again, so can you speak to that and how does the DOE
18 evaluate the performance of the PD that's being
19 offered and provided to new teachers and have changes
20 been made if providers, you know we're not doing an
21 adequate job?

22 ROD BOWEN: Yeah, I'll start, so just to
23 name that... PD is offered, not something new to, to
24 all teachers on the various levels, we have district
25 level PD, we have central PD and we have school-based

1
2 PD. I can speak for the PD that my office actually
3 facilitates and we provide, again its kind of surveys
4 and evaluations that we look at the data and analyze
5 at... quarterly to, to inform how we move forward with
6 similar PD that we're going to offer moving forward
7 that's just one example. I can't speak to what the
8 various other parts of our organization do in terms
9 of collecting feedback and data on their... on their
10 professional learning at this point...

11 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: Yeah, I mean to be
12 clear I, I know that the state mandates for... in order
13 for teachers to get their license and to maintain
14 their license they, they mandate a certain number of
15 hours... of hours... [cross-talk]

16 ROD BOWEN: Yes... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...of PD to renew and
18 to, to refresh their license, I get that, I'm talking
19 about the certain PD where it's targeted PD where
20 teachers in school communities are saying I need help
21 in these areas and I know that teachers are
22 evaluated, schools are being evaluated but who's
23 evaluating the folks who are supposed to provide,
24 provide the support on whether it's working or not,
25 are there surveys for that and how is that data

1
2 informing your decision whether to continue that PD
3 provider or find a new PD provider, I'm just curious
4 to know how, how this works?

5 ROD BOWEN: So, I would say the, the
6 singular consistent means of supporting new teachers
7 is the supervision and support they get from their
8 supervisor, that is across the board taking place in
9 every school, there is no external provider who's
10 giving fresher learner for teachers across the
11 system. So, we have lots of means of accountability
12 and quality control for that, when I say that I mean
13 the quality of feedback that, that they're getting
14 from their supervisors but again there's no other
15 uniform, coherent way of providing support to all
16 teachers...

17 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: I guess I'm going
18 to put my UFT delegate hat on for a second... [cross-
19 talk]

20 ROD BOWEN: Yep... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...because I worked
22 in a very large high school, a lot of kids... [cross-
23 talk]

24 ROD BOWEN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

1
2 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...overcrowded and my
3 department had over 25, 26 teachers in it, very hard
4 for my assistant principals to provide meaningful one
5 to one support to every single teacher in that
6 department especially when he had to observe us a
7 number of times and so I am mindful of my educator
8 family that its not... it's a very tough job and so to
9 put it just on one AP or one principal is, is not
10 fair either, they certainly... that's part of their job
11 is to provide ongoing support but I do remember being
12 sent to an... you know I, I asked for a certain number
13 of PD supports and my, my question was... some of it
14 was useful, some of it quite frankly the, the muffins
15 were better than the PD and... but I, I wish I could
16 have had better training in some of them so I'm just...
17 this is a conversation I'd like to kind of... [cross-
18 talk]

19 ROD BOWEN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON TREYGER: ...follow up on with
21 the DOE but I'll, I'll pause here and turn it over to
22 my, my very patient colleague and Co-Chair, Council
23 Member Barron, thank you.

24 ROD BOWEN: Thank you.

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Council
3 Member Treyger, thank you to the panel for coming. I
4 just have a few questions because I know there may be
5 other members who want to ask questions as well. So,
6 to follow up on the questions that Council Member
7 Treyger asked about the teacher preparation program
8 report, is it your position that that report should
9 not be made public and I ask that question in terms
10 of improving transparency between what's going on at
11 the DOE and having people in the public know what's
12 going on in the DOE?

13 TOMAS HANNA: I would say we, we want the
14 information to, to have an impact and so the, the
15 relationship we have with, with our partners is one
16 that, that we value, right, we... as we said earlier
17 we... it's partnerships, universities, the DOE and, and
18 our university so we think that there's an
19 opportunity to use that data, to, to see... to see
20 improvement. I do think to the... to the recommendation
21 around sort of like what are the patterns, right, I
22 think there's an opportunity to sort of engage in
23 that kind of conversation is like what, what to, to,
24 to the point earlier, what are the conversations that
25 are happening and what's actually changing so I think

1
2 there's an opportunity, you know to be able to do
3 that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, do you think
5 that that partnership that exists as I hear you
6 describing it between the DOE and the schools of
7 training... teacher training that's sufficient to just
8 have those two partners or are there other partners
9 that have a more public, public input...

10 TOMAS HANNA: I didn't mean to interrupt,
11 I apologize. I, I, I don't... it's not... it's not just
12 the DOE and the partners alone sort of figuring this
13 out, I, I... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, who are the
15 other partners?

16 TOMAS HANNA: The partners... it would be
17 schools, it'd be principals, it'd be executive
18 superintendents, it'd be teachers themselves, it
19 could be our partners at the UFT who've engaged in,
20 in doing professional development as well so being
21 able to share... to share what we're learning about
22 that with sort of a broader group of folks would,
23 would... I think would help position us better to be
24 sure that we're meeting... that we're meeting the
25 needs.

1

2

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Would that

3

partnership also include parents in some capacity?

4

TOMAS HANNA: Absolutely would... [cross-

5

talk]

6

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: How, how are they

7

a part of that partnership?

8

TOMAS HANNA: Well... how, how would they...

9

how would they be would be how it is at... sort of we,

10

we, we would share the information, certainly schools

11

would have a sense of... [cross-talk]

12

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, are they

13

actually now at this point a part of the partnership,

14

I guess that's a more precise question?

15

TOMAS HANNA: I don't... Rod, I'm going to

16

turn it over, I don't know.

17

ROD BOWEN: I think this is a... coming out

18

of an administration that purposely pulled away from

19

sharing information publicly, I think we're in a

20

different time where we can definitely take the idea

21

and the consideration that would be more inclusive

22

around the information that, that we're sharing in

23

that particular report.

24

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, great, I

25

think that that would be important... [cross-talk]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ROD BOWEN: I think you're right.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And then in your testimony you indicated that all newly hired teachers have come through an education training... all newly hired teachers are prepared through schools of education, is that... is that correct?

ROD BOWEN: Sure... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So... is... does that also apply to teachers who come through teach for America or teaching fellows programs that they have been prepared and if so to what degree... and I want to acknowledge we've been joined by Council Members Ulrich, who's a member of the Higher Education Committee and Council Member Kallos. So, back to the question, those who come through the alternative teacher program... [cross-talk]

ROD BOWEN: Yes... [cross-talk]

AMY WAY: Yes, so all alternative certification programs also have a component where those participants are engaging in teacher preparation coursework, they do some portion of that before they start as educators and then they complete it in an ongoing capacity usually over two to three years.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, before they
3 begin teaching what is the extent of the preparation
4 that they have?

5 AMY WAY: So, it depends on the program
6 but based on the regulations from New York State for
7 transitional B certificates which all of those
8 teachers are teaching under that credential, there's
9 an initial preparation which involves a number of
10 coursework hours and time in kind of a student
11 teaching like environment.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And what's the
13 extent in terms of hours before they actually are
14 able to go into a classroom, how many hours have they
15 received this preparation before they step into a
16 classroom in September?

17 AMY WAY: So, I'd have to get back to you
18 on the exact regulation but I can tell you for our
19 New York City teaching collaborative which is one of
20 the transitional B programs that's sponsored by the
21 DOE the number of hours is... it's a half a semester of
22 supervised student teaching along with coursework
23 before becoming a full teacher of record in the fall
24 but it does... it varies by program, we'll have to get
25 back to you on the state reg.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, I'm just
3 concerned, I want to understand, someone who did not
4 complete a standard teacher education program at a
5 college who now is in the classroom in September I
6 want to understand what preparation they have had, to
7 what extent, how many hours, how many courses, there
8 may be... so if someone graduated in May and then June
9 1st decided I want to go into teaching and they have
10 not had preparation for that, what do they get during
11 the summer or do they have to wait and not start in
12 September but postpone it till February, you said a...
13 I think you said a half a semester so I want to
14 understand exactly what that is and, and just so... for
15 the record I began teaching in September of 1967
16 without any education preparation, there was a great
17 need for teachers at that time and I applied and
18 based on my minor in psychology those teaching
19 education courses were waived and the psychology
20 classes that I had taken were accepted in lieu of
21 that but there was of course the understanding that I
22 had to get a masters in education which I did and got
23 from Bank Street and I understand Bank Street is in
24 the audience today so I, I understand that, I just
25 want to be clear as, as... because your testimony as I

1
2 read it would have made me think oh, everybody who is
3 coming into the system has been prepared and I don't
4 know that that's actually the case of, that's why I'm
5 going into this to find out to what extent, how many
6 hours, how many courses before they step into the
7 classroom.

8 ROD BOWEN: Right.

9 AMY WAY: So, the testimony does state
10 that it's a certain portion of our new hires have
11 completed that traditional teacher ed program. The...
12 [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm talking about
14 the phrase that says all newly hired teachers in New
15 York City public schools are prepared through schools
16 of education, I... in reading that at its face I would
17 think oh, everybody in every classroom the first day
18 that they're stepping in has been... that's what I
19 would read this to say and I just want to be clear
20 if, if that in fact is the case.

21 AMY WAY: So, all teachers who begin at
22 the DOE have completed some preparation through our
23 higher education partners and we are following the
24 regulations from New York State for the transitional
25

1
2 B certificate, which I know is not what you want to
3 hear, I, I think what... I understand... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: All I want to
5 hear... [cross-talk]

6 AMY WAY: ...your question... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...is what is it
8 actually, factually... [cross-talk]

9 AMY WAY: ...yes... [cross-talk]

10 ROD BOWEN: Right... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...you know
12 concretely... [cross-talk]

13 AMY WAY: So, there are... [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...that's what I
15 want to hear... [cross-talk]

16 AMY WAY: ...I think seven different
17 alternative pathway programs that the DOE
18 participates in and then any number of other
19 registered programs... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
21 talk]

22 AMY WAY: ...across New York State... [cross-
23 talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...I don't want to...
25 [cross-talk]

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

AMY WAY: ...so I think there's... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...prolong that, if you could... [cross-talk]

AMY WAY: ...there's no one answer is what I'm trying to say... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: If you could get that to us... [cross-talk]

AMY WAY: Yep... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...in some written form I, I would... I would appreciate it... [cross-talk]

ROD BOWEN: We'll, we'll follow up, thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I don't want to be laid with that point. Do my colleagues have questions? I have a list, Council Member Rodriguez, thank you. He left, Council Member Dromm followed by Council Member Borelli.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, great, thank you very, very much. Welcome, good to see you. I do have some questions in regard to your testimony and I believe that it was... I'm sorry, the second person who gave testimony, I'm forgetting now...

ROD BOWEN: I'm Rod, how you doing?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Yeah, okay. In your testimony the last... second to last paragraph you said that as well as the culturally responsive sustaining pedagogy of every educator so that they can leverage the knowledge of their student's identities and diversity and I'm very supportive of that and very supportive of the work that the Chancellor has been doing particularly around CRE and implicit bias so... but one of the concerns that I do have is how are we dealing with LGBT issues and training of teachers in the schools and principals as well because I'm hearing and I... and I've said this to LaShawn Robinson as well that some of the teachers say that they're... that that issue is not being addressed even in the implicit bias and in the culturally responsive education. so, do you know how that issue is being addressed with those programs and other programs or anything throughout the DOE?

ROD BOWEN: I appreciate that question, so we are currently in the midst of really putting a concerted effort into CRSC and there's no denying that when you look at the history of that pedagogical movement it starts predominately looking at the needs of, of children of color however when you look at the

1

57

2 intent of it it's really about making sure that the
3 learning the kids experience is reflective of who
4 they are and all their identities so part of the
5 expectation is not to simply stop at the racial and
6 cultural and ethnic identities but all of who they
7 are, their linguistic experiences and all of it and
8 so though there is not... it has not been pulled out
9 and named it is an expectation that when done well
10 cultural responsiveness attaches all... looks at all
11 those identify pieces and I'll also say that the
12 reason for starting with race is because a lot of our
13 data that we use to assess our effectiveness with our
14 children in educating them is racialized data, right,
15 so we talk about black and brown youth and the so
16 called achievement gap and so forth and so that's why
17 it's that starting point but it is no way meant to
18 exclude all of the ways in which kids identify
19 themselves.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: That's shocking to
21 me.

22 ROD BOWEN: Which part?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: That you don't
24 mention it, how could that be?

25 ROD BOWEN: Well... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 58

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I mean do you
3 think that all LGBT people are white?

4 ROD BOWEN: No, not at all and I'll...
5 [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, what are you
7 saying, I mean all the LGBT people and a, a large
8 number of them in the public-school system there's
9 the intersectionality of that...

10 ROD BOWEN: Absolutely...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, how are you
12 addressing that?

13 ROD BOWEN: How are we addressing
14 intersectionality?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: You're saying that
16 you don't really identify or use those words.

17 ROD BOWEN: So, what I said was and I
18 want... I want to be clear is that culturally
19 responsive and sustaining education when done well
20 looks at all the aspects of student's identities, all
21 the aspects so that is not just... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, how are you
23 doing that?

24 ROD BOWEN: So, so, I'm, I'm going try... I
25 want to repeat myself for the sake of... I'm going to

1
2 repeat myself for the sake of clarity, the, the
3 reason why race is a starting point and again we are
4 in the early stages... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: How are you doing
6 the LGBT? I get the race and I'm supportive but what
7 I'm trying... [cross-talk]

8 ROD BOWEN: So, we, we are not... [cross-
9 talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...to say is how do
11 you... [cross-talk]

12 ROD BOWEN: ...we are not... in response...
13 [cross-talk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...how do you inject
15 LGBT and the intersection thereof when you're
16 teaching or doing... you can't do implicit bias
17 separately and not mention LGBT.

18 ROD BOWEN: So, I want to acknowledge and
19 then I'm going to ask Tomas to... so the implicit bias
20 training is... we shouldn't conflate that with
21 culturally responsive sustaining education they're
22 actually two different... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I understand that...
24 [cross-talk]

1 HIGHER EDUCATION 60

2 ROD BOWEN: ...things so the implicit bias
3 training and Tomas you can speak to this is talking
4 about all types of bias, right and that's the work
5 that we do with all adults within our system... [cross-
6 talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, how do you do
8 it?

9 ROD BOWEN: Do you want to speak to that
10 Tomas?

11 TOMAS HANNA: Well we, we are... we're
12 ensuring that as you said having folks understand
13 sort of their biases, where it is, they're coming
14 from to, to take a look at themselves as they're
15 engaging in the work.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So, how... that's
17 very vague...

18 TOMAS HANNA: Well... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I mean how do you
20 talk about it?

21 TOMAS HANNA: It's, it's... as you've heard
22 it's very... it's very difficult, right, there are
23 folks who are... who are feeling in some cases very put
24 off because of the types of conversations that are
25 happening... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 61

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: On race is what
3 I've heard.

4 TOMAS HANNA: Well... [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: But I've not heard
6 that you're even discussing LGBT identities with
7 those folks either... [cross-talk]

8 TOMAS HANNA: And, and, and... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...and that's
10 concerning to me... [cross-talk]

11 TOMAS HANNA: Yeah... [cross-talk]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...because unless
13 you fight all of those prejudices at the same time
14 and, and, and I believe this is the Chancellor's
15 belief also because I've had some conversations with
16 him about this, you're not going to defeat that bias.

17 TOMAS HANNA: You're correct and we agree
18 and what I would say is that this initial series of
19 trainings that we've been doing we're, we're, we're
20 identifying as foundational, right that we're... it's...
21 [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: But how is LGBT
23 not a part of the foundation?

24 TOMAS HANNA: It, it is... it is, we have...
25 we have... we are taking feedback and we're going to

1
2 address and ensure that as we move forward how, how
3 it is that we're, we're including... inclusive of all
4 of our... of our... of all of our, our team.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Well I find that
6 really, really shocking. We just put a million
7 dollars into the DOE budget, I, I was responsible for
8 that, they're supposed to have another 500,000 in the
9 budget for Jared Fox's position and we hope that some
10 of that will be used for the intersectionality of
11 what... of the issues that you're talking about.

12 TOMAS HANNA: And, and if I... I might say
13 one of the pieces that, that I neglected to mention
14 is the fact that sexual orientation is in fact one of
15 the identities that, that we engage in and that we
16 discuss so, so we're, we're, we're beginning... it's,
17 it's, it's a beginning point conversation.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay, I, I, I...

19 [cross-talk]

20 TOMAS HANNA: And... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...I hope that it's
22 not being left out because that's what I heard
23 before.

24 TOMAS HANNA: No.
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 63

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And it's, it's
3 included?

4 TOMAS HANNA: It's, it's, it's
5 foundational, we are looking to, to... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Is it included?

7 TOMAS HANNA: ...add... that it... it includes
8 sexual orientation is being discussed... [cross-talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And what about
10 transgender and gender identity?

11 TOMAS HANNA: We, we will have to get
12 back to you in terms of like the entire curriculum of
13 what that looks like of that.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Wow and you're in
15 charge of this training but you don't know the
16 answer?

17 TOMAS HANNA: I do... I do... we do a part of
18 it. We, we... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: This is shocking...
20 this is shocking... [cross-talk]

21 TOMAS HANNA: ...we will... we will get back
22 to you...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Absolutely
24 shocking that you can't describe to me how you're
25

1 training teachers on this, I'm, I'm sorry, this... it's
2 absolutely... [cross-talk]

3
4 TOMAS HANNA: ...in this... in this... [cross-
5 talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...shocking that you
7 would come in here and do that in this day and age
8 knowing that we have a, a gay Speaker, a gay Finance
9 Chair, an LGBT caucus that we've given you a few
10 million dollars over the last few years and where are
11 the results of it or that it's being... you know it's
12 not part of the foundation, this, this is absolutely
13 unacceptable, I'll have to meet with the Chancellor
14 on this, do you have any LGBT people on the school
15 diversity advisory group?

16 TOMAS HANNA: I, I... right now I don't
17 know the answer to that here sir.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: You don't know the
19 answer to that either, wow. And does the survey that
20 you put out... [cross-talk]

21 TOMAS HANNA: And Council Member... [cross-
22 talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...include any
24 questions on LGBT folks?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

HIGHER EDUCATION

TOMAS HANNA: It, it's... that is an... and, and I've overstepped because it's not an area that, that's, that I'm responsible for doing but as the DOE we are responsible, I would want to be sure that the right person is... addresses that so that you have the answers to your question.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Well this should be system wide, if you're here to talk about implicit bias... you, you spoke about it not me, you brought it up and if you're here to speak about those issues and then you can't talk about it then you have to differ it to somebody else it's just totally unacceptable... [cross-talk]

TOMAS HANNA: We look... we look... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...it's, it's neglect, it's educational neglect, it is. Those LGBT kids and there are at least ten percent in the school system you're ignoring and the teachers on top of it who are afraid to say it because you guys are not willing to do it, it's not on the survey, is it on the pre-employment application, do people when they apply for a job have an opportunity to check off how they identify?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 66

2 TOMAS HANNA: Have an opportunity..

3 [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: LGBT... [cross-talk]

5 TOMAS HANNA: Have an opportunity to
6 self-identify as I understand it, yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: They have what?

8 TOMAS HANNA: An opportunity to self-
9 identify.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: On which form?

11 TOMAS HANNA: I be... if I'm not mistaken,
12 I believe on the employment form.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: On the employment
14 form?

15 TOMAS HANNA: Right, I believe, I want... I
16 have to confirm sir. We, we... one of the issues for
17 today was to sort of talk about teach, teacher prep
18 certainly and, and the work we're... [cross-talk]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Yeah but part of
20 teacher prep would be to know how many gay teachers
21 you have, how many gay students you have and I had
22 legislation which I passed and the Mayor signed that
23 says you're supposed to be counting that, are you
24 counting that?

25

1

HIGHER EDUCATION

67

2

TOMAS HANNA: I will... we will get back to

3

you with that data.

4

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Do you know?

5

TOMAS HANNA: I, I don't have it right

6

off the... [cross-talk]

7

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: How could you...

8

[cross-talk]

9

TOMAS HANNA: ...top of my... [cross-talk]

10

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: ...as the Director

11

of these programs not know?

12

TOMAS HANNA: It's not... okay...

13

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And this is

14

unbelievable, what do you do with the principals? Do

15

you train the principals in any of this?

16

TOMAS HANNA: Rod do you want to talk

17

about principal training?

18

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: And now we're

19

going to have to have a big time... I mean this is...

20

this is absolutely shocking to me and this is a

21

perfect example of what it is that I'm talking about,

22

okay and when CUNY comes up, I hope CUNY is teaching

23

the teachers or the perspective teachers on these

24

issues as well. This is a definite priority for this

25

Council, we have made this very clear to the DOE,

1
2 very, very clear and it's unacceptable that you've
3 come in here and not be able to answer these
4 questions. Thank you, Madame Chair.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Council
6 Member Dromm, Council Member Borelli.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you, I
8 want to stay on the same line of... subject thing...
9 subject for a minute that Council Member Dromm began
10 because your answer Mr. Bowen to one of the questions
11 about the implicit bias training was that we all have
12 implicit biases and race is a starting point can you
13 summarize what my implicit biases are?

14 ROD BOWEN: I don't know you sir.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: So, but as an...
16 as an organization the DOE assumes that we all have
17 implicit biases and then spends money to educate
18 teachers and faculty about those, why is it hard to
19 identify mine?

20 ROD BOWEN: So, we all have implicit
21 bias, you asked me what your implicit biases are, I,
22 I don't know... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Yeah, but you,
24 you said race was a starting point, so you had a
25

1
2 criterion of there is implicit bias against race but
3 not LGBT as, as... that was the whole... [cross-talk]

4 ROD BOWEN: No, can I... may I... [cross-
5 talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: ...conversation...
7 [cross-talk]

8 ROD BOWEN: ...may I... may I clarify?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Yep.

10 ROD BOWEN: Race is a starting point for
11 the implementation of the CRSC pedagogical approach,
12 that's, that's a starting point, the implicit bias
13 work which I was separating every that... every adult...
14 every adult is having implicit... that is not regulated
15 to race, it's just the idea that as a citizen in this
16 society we've all received messages on how we see the
17 world and just to interrogate that and to ensure that
18 whatever those implicit biases might be and they
19 could be different across different individuals that
20 they not come into play as you work with children.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: So, just staying
22 with the culturally responsive sustaining education,
23 I... yes, I had to look it up but one of the principles
24 was high expectations and rigorous instruction so I
25 want us now just talk about that for a second and I...

1
2 now Debi will never vouch for anything I say except
3 for this, I did ask you to give me a random number...

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I did, I did.

6 So, I picked a random... a random school, in this case
7 we ended at IS 68, the DOE's rigorous instruction
8 rating that you gave yourself presumably says its
9 excellent meaning how well curriculum and instruction
10 are designed to engage students, foster critical
11 thinking, you guys rated yourself excellent, how
12 interesting and challenging is the curriculum,
13 excellent; how effective is the teaching and
14 learning, excellent; how well does the student... the
15 school assess what students are learning, excellent;
16 that's fine but then when you go to student
17 achievement you see that in this particular school
18 you've also said that 88 percent of kids are ready
19 for the next level and yet the only sort of objective
20 test in, in the metrics is performance on state tests
21 and... you know I don't... I won't surprise you but this
22 particular school has an 18 percent passing rate in
23 English, a 16 percent passing rate in math, both less
24 than half the city average, both less than half of
25 the borough average, this is in both cases I think,

1
2 how do we marry the two ideas that we have rigorous
3 instruction, that our teachers are extremely
4 effective, that all the kids are ready for the next
5 grade but then on the objective metrics, the state
6 exam, they, they seem to fail, I mean 22 percent... I'm
7 sorry, 82 percent fail.

8 ROD BOWEN: So, knowing that our
9 department is made up of various offices that have
10 very specific functions there are offices that deal
11 specifically with how the matrixes that we use to
12 evaluate our schools, we are prepared to talk in
13 depth about teacher preparation so I'm not prepared
14 to respond to that question at this time.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Who, who is
16 responsible for the failure of students... let me ask
17 you a different way, in this particular school what
18 will the PD program be like for a school that clearly
19 has trouble having students pass the state exams,
20 what is the PD like, is it... do you guys dictate from
21 the top down and say hey you should focus on
22 different types of pedagogy that will address this or
23 are we doing for example the implicit bias training
24 which may have nothing to do with why these students
25 are failing?

1
2 ROD BOWEN: So, essentially we do not
3 dictate professional learning at the school level,
4 the, the person who is best positioned to make those
5 decisions would be the school principal and then the
6 person who... next in line would that be the... would be
7 the superintendent who's the supervisor of that
8 principal so they would be the ones to, to really
9 shape and form the content and the specific... [cross-
10 talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: The principal
12 only got it good so that's a step down, the principal
13 may, may not be making the step in the... the, the
14 perfect decisions because he or she only has a good
15 rating whereas the teachers are excellent. Who, who
16 is responsible for the performance of a school like
17 this, the Mayor spent a lot of his political capital
18 in Albany fighting for extensions of Mayor, Mayoral
19 control, is the Mayor essentially responsible for
20 some of these test scores?

21 ROD BOWEN: There's no one person
22 responsible for test scores.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: The Mayor wanted
24 accountability, I think most of the stuff he spoke
25 about Mayoral control rested on how the system needs

2 to have accountability of someone who's elected, I
3 mean is the Mayor then not responsible?

4 ROD BOWEN: I, I don't know if this is
5 the binary approach to the questioning is, is going
6 to... I don't know if it's serving students, I mean I
7 think there's definitely increased accountability
8 with this new administration with the introduction of
9 executive superintendents to supervisor
10 superintendents and so forth and so on so there's
11 definitely accountability. Collectively, collectively
12 I would say that we're all responsible.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Yeah, right... no,
14 I mean that, that's... I, I think that's a theme is
15 that we should blame society and everyone else but
16 the Mayor has had control of the Department of
17 Education essentially for almost six years now, we
18 still have a school, my staff wasn't able to get me
19 the ELA... the, the English and math test scores from
20 six years ago but I'm going to go on a limb and say
21 maybe they're not any better. If you were here six
22 years ago, your predecessors or someone from the DOE
23 you would have come with an equally ambitious plan
24 for addressing low test scores in schools at some
25 point and again it can't be the... it can't be the

1
2 teachers and it can't be the principal because you
3 told me that they are good and excellent so if it's
4 not the teachers, its not the principal where does
5 the accountability lie, does it lie with the
6 Chancellor, does it lie with the Mayor or is it
7 society? I know it's tough, but you said... Mr. Hanna
8 you said you, you like to have the tough... the tough
9 conversations.

10 TOMAS HANNA: What I said was the, the
11 conversations are difficult, this, this, this... one of
12 the things we'd argue is that this is the work,
13 right, the, the work of teachers and principals and
14 an entire system coming together to figure out those
15 items that you've... that you've laid out and it, it is
16 the work, it's difficult work, it's complicated work
17 and, and we, we are trying to take it... and we are
18 taking it on, we are taking it head on and, and, and
19 trying... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you...

21 [cross-talk]

22 TOMAS HANNA: ...to improve them.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I, I, I just
24 think... I have no more questions, I just think that
25 when we talk about improving schools and we say it's

1
2 really tough to have certain conversations the
3 conversations that we're not having that are more
4 difficult are that many schools are failing and I
5 just, just for my own curiosity I looked at the
6 school, the high school where the majority of these
7 students from IS 68 go and, and unsurprisingly only
8 39 percent of the zoned high school where these kids
9 go are going to produce students that are ready to
10 meet the standards set out by CUNY meaning they
11 wouldn't need remedial classes so I think when we
12 talk about the hard conversations that need to happen
13 I think the hard conversations are on the quality of
14 education that so many of our schools are giving
15 students and the, the lack of, of self-awareness of
16 that problem. Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Council
18 Member Borelli. I just have a final question because
19 we've got lots of other people who want to testify.
20 Your project for men to... Men Teach... [cross-talk]

21 ROD BOWEN: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You, I believe in
23 your testimony said your identifying 1,000 people,
24 1,000 young men, can you give me a status of where
25 they are, how long the program has been in existence,

1

2 of those who have completed the program how many have
3 actually gone on to teach?

4 AMY WAY: So, we've been able to meet
5 that initial goal of the 1,000 men of color entering
6 the teaching profession and there are different
7 stages, many of our partners within CUNY are
8 supporting participants in that program and I'm... hope
9 you will hear more about that today. Others are
10 participating in high school to teaching programs,
11 community based organization pathways into teaching
12 and we've recruited individuals who have come from
13 other school based roles like paraprofessionals and
14 school aides so the trajectory is between one to five
15 years is what we're looking at for those individuals
16 to enter the classroom. We can say that of the work
17 we've done to build, increase our recruitment of men
18 of color who are ready to teach in any given school
19 year as well as building that longer term pipeline
20 which is something we're very committed around that
21 we've seen an increase in the percentage of men of
22 color who we've hired each year go from eight percent
23 to 13 percent over the duration of our efforts so we
24 see that as a success that we're both identifying,

25

1
2 people to enter the profession and supporting them
3 along the way and seeing that hiring number increase.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Directly as a
5 result of the program can you give me a number of
6 young men who have gone into teaching, perhaps that
7 first cohort which now I... you've been... it's been in
8 existence I think for six years?

9 AMY WAY: It's been three years.

10 ROD BOWEN: Three years... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: It's been three
12 years.

13 AMY WAY: Yeah.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, so perhaps
15 they haven't finished yet and there are people who
16 are still at the gate trying to come out and will get
17 in. Okay, good. And I would appreciate the data going
18 forward. And lastly, can you tell me... can you
19 disaggregate the data of those new teachers by, by
20 black, Latino, Asian, white, I have a stat which
21 talks about people of color and if you don't have it
22 now that's fine, if you could send it to me I would
23 appreciate it. okay.

24 ROD BOWEN: Thank you... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 78

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I just want to
3 thank you for coming and you've got some questions
4 that we expect you'll get back to us... [cross-talk]

5 ROD BOWEN: Absolutely... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...and we look
7 forward to getting those answers, thank you for
8 coming.

9 TOMAS HANNA: Thank you.

10 AMY WAY: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: At this time,
12 we're going to call the second panel. Thank you,
13 we're making some adjustments here but we are going
14 to call the CUNY panel next and we're going to have...
15 if they would come forward and I, I promise that my
16 questions will be focused because there are others
17 who are on a tight schedule that we do want to hear
18 from after you so please come forward and we're ready
19 for your testimony. Swear them in, you haven't sworn
20 them in?

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Please raise your right
22 hands? Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole
23 truth and nothing but the truth in your testimony
24 before this Committee and to respond honestly to
25 Council Member's questions?

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

79

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

[panel affirms]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Please state your names
for the record. Please turn on your microphone.

ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Ashleigh Thompson.

MICHAEL MIDDLETON: Michael Middleton.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You may begin.

ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Good afternoon. On
behalf of this panel from the City University of New
York, I would like to thank Chair Treyger and Chair
Barron as well as members of the Committees on
Education and Higher Education, for the opportunity
to speak to you on the topic of teacher preparation
and training at CUNY. My name is Ashleigh Thompson
and I serve CUNY as University Dean for Education. In
this role, I oversee teacher education programs
across the university. I am pleased to tell you about
our support of students in this important academic
and workforce area, which contributes to CUNY's role
as the leading provider of teachers to the New York
City Department of Education. I am joined today by
Dr. Michael Middleton, Dean of the School of
Education at Hunter College. Hunter was CUNY's first,
and today is one of our largest schools of education.
Our testimony will describe CUNY's efforts to provide

1
2 New York City with well prepared, diverse urban
3 educators, committed to teaching in our city's public
4 schools. CUNY enrolls more than 18,000 students in
5 education programs across the university, from
6 associate to doctoral degree programs at 16 campuses.
7 More than 7,000 students pursue graduate study, and
8 education is CUNY's largest discipline across
9 master's level programs. CUNY prepares teachers for
10 certification in nearly every subject area licensed
11 in New York State. In the past five years, through
12 concerted effort, CUNY has seen growing undergraduate
13 enrollment in education, and a ten percent increase
14 in our numbers of graduates. The majority of CUNY's
15 education students are people of color; 63 percent of
16 teacher candidates and 70 percent of education
17 students overall. CUNY's education cohorts are
18 growing more diverse each year. From 2018... 2010 to
19 2018, teacher candidates of color have increased from
20 61 percent to 73 percent of bachelor's students and
21 37 percent to 53 percent of master's students. CUNY
22 has invested targeted resources to recruit and
23 support teacher candidates of color through state
24 education's teacher opportunity corps and NYC Men
25 Teach. Since 2015, more than 1,000 students have

1 received programmatic and financial supports across
2 now 15 campuses through New York City Men Teach at
3 CUNY, which aims to promote academic momentum and
4 completion, certification and hiring. Facilitation of
5 the transfer process enhanced clinical experience and
6 seminars on culturally relevant education are
7 hallmarks of the program. New York State and New York
8 City depend upon the diverse teaching force educated
9 by CUNY. In 2016/2017, CUNY comprised 21 percent of
10 all New York State's graduates of classroom teacher
11 programs, but 36 percent of the state's graduates of
12 color. In 2017/2018, CUNY prepared 48 percent, almost
13 half, of all teachers in the state who earned a
14 license in bilingual education; this was up from 41
15 percent the previous year. As an example of bilingual
16 education, which content areas our preservice and in-
17 service teachers are able to pursue grows and deepens
18 each year to support the needs of our city's schools.
19 CUNY has launched new programs in physical education
20 and health education proactively addressing needs
21 described by reports from the Office of the
22 Comptroller; new residencies focused on computational
23 thinking aligned with computer science for all; and
24 new online advanced certificates in high need areas
25

1

2 like special education, TESOL and bilingual
3 education. As New York State Education Department
4 will soon increase the number of student teaching
5 hours required, CUNY explores ways to expand
6 financial aid available to support undergraduate and
7 graduate candidates. We have developed initiatives to
8 prepare students for state certification exams,
9 including those which focus on teaching students with
10 disabilities and English language learners. A strong
11 local P-20 partnership undergirds these connections
12 between CUNY and our schools of education and the New
13 York City Department of Education and its districts
14 and schools. CUNY and DOE engage in deep, deep
15 teacher pipeline work, especially as it connects to
16 teacher diversity, recruitment, and hiring, to better
17 address teacher supply and demand. Leadership teams
18 focus on innovative approaches to increasing
19 preservice clinical preparation, joint funding
20 opportunities, new programs to meet hiring needs,
21 state certification and communication. We share data
22 with the aim of better supporting teachers in both
23 preservice and in-service roles. Collaboration
24 centers on a commitment to continue to improve
25 outcomes for students. CUNY provides many pathways

1
2 into a professional teaching career for thousands of
3 candidates from a wide range of backgrounds and
4 starting points, more affordably and with less debt
5 than other New York State institutions. From
6 welcoming new cohorts of teaching fellows, adult
7 learners excited to change careers and enter the
8 classroom; to celebrating CUNY graduates honored as
9 Big Apple Award winners; to supporting faculty with
10 ideas for curricular innovation, CUNY is committed to
11 teachers' clinical readiness, lifelong development,
12 and career success. Thank you.

13 MICHAEL MIDDLETON: Good afternoon. Thank
14 you to Chair Treyger and Chair Barron as well as
15 members of the Committees on Education and Higher
16 Education for the opportunity to speak with you this
17 afternoon. My name is Michael Middleton and I serve
18 as the Klara and Larry Silverstein Dean of the School
19 of Education at Hunter College of the City University
20 of New York. Since our founding in 1870, Hunter
21 College has been dedicated to educating deeply
22 thoughtful, knowledgeable and highly effective
23 teachers, administrators and counselors, future
24 professionals who, on a daily basis, make a
25 significant and positive impact on their students and

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

84

1
2 on the city of New York. we have been the recipient
3 of the American Association of State Colleges and
4 Universities Christa McAuliffe Excellence in Teacher
5 Education Award, which honors exemplary teacher
6 education programs. All our programs in teacher
7 preparation are currently accredited by the Council
8 for Accreditation of Educator Preparation. In the
9 fall 2018, we enrolled 2,787 students in teacher
10 preparation programs 78 percent of whom identify as
11 female and 54 percent as non-white. We graduated
12 approximately 1,200 students in teacher preparation
13 programs this year, with over 1,000 recommended for
14 state certification. Recent numbers obtained from
15 CUNY show that 62 percent of completers of graduate
16 education programs from Hunter, and 47 percent of
17 completers of undergraduate programs, were employed
18 by the New York City Department of Education. We are
19 committed to preparing professionals to meet shortage
20 areas... short, shortage area needs for the city. In
21 2018, 19 percent of our graduates were, were from
22 bilingual education or TESOL programs, seven percent
23 from adolescent math or science education and 32
24 percent across special education programs, including
25 work with blind, deaf and hard of hearing students,

1
2 those students, those students with severe or
3 multiple disabilities, and students with learning and
4 behavioral challenges. Forty nine percent of our
5 graduates who applied to the Department of Education
6 were hired, and more than half of those, 54 percent,
7 were hired in shortage areas of math, science,
8 Spanish, ESL or special education. over the last five
9 years, I'm proud to report that more than 50 percent
10 of the degrees awarded by the School of Education
11 have been in these teacher shortage areas. Hunter is
12 committed to educating reflective, knowledgeable and
13 highly effective candidates as future professionals
14 who will make a significant impact on the academic
15 achievement, as well as the intellectual, social, and
16 emotional development of their students. Today I'd
17 like to highlight two elements of our programs, our
18 clinical practice work and our commitment to
19 educating a diverse student population. Our clinical
20 experiences in all programs are intentionally
21 structured so that teacher candidates have initial
22 field experiences focused on observing teachers and
23 students in diverse classrooms, more extensive
24 intermediate experiences where they begin to work
25 with small groups of learners, including students

1
2 with disabilities and those for whom English is a new
3 language and culminating student teaching experiences
4 of 14 weeks, which exceeds the current requirements
5 by the New York State Education Department. During
6 student teaching, our assessment criteria align
7 closely with those utilized by the New York City
8 Department of Education for evaluation of classroom
9 teachers. The combination of coursework at Hunter,
10 purposeful clinical experiences at three levels and
11 focused support from our faculty and mentor teachers
12 help ensure that teacher candidates who graduate from
13 Hunter College are well prepared as classroom
14 teachers to serve New York City public schools. at
15 the Hunter, we are deeply committed to educating
16 professionals who are prepared to meet the
17 opportunities of teaching our students... our schools'
18 diverse population and approach this commitment in
19 several ways. All teacher education students are
20 required to take courses in special education and the
21 social foundations of education, which cover
22 multicultural education and teaching in ways that are
23 responsive to the diversity in our teacher
24 candidates' future classrooms. Our students also take
25 coursework in child development that covers not only

1
2 children's cognitive and physical growth, but also
3 their social and emotional learning, first and
4 language second.. first and second language
5 acquisition and other topics especially relevant to
6 the diversity in our city. Finally, to support the
7 linguistic diversity present across New York's
8 schools, the Hunter school of education offers
9 bilingual programs in Spanish, Chinese and French for
10 early childhood and childhood education teachers,
11 counselors and school personnel who want to be
12 prepared and certified to work with their dual
13 language students. This curriculum serves as the
14 basis for our many partnership programs with
15 districts and organizations and specifically in our
16 work with the New York City Department of Education,
17 since effectively serving students by supporting
18 their diversity across race, language, disability and
19 other categories is our shared goal and mission. We
20 have worked with the teaching fellows' program for
21 over a decade, supporting over 2,000 students as they
22 became teachers and grew as professionals in special
23 education, TESOL, and bilingual education programs.
24 We worked to prepare more early childhood educators
25 to respond to the Mayor's universal Pre-K initiative

1
2 and we work with current teachers to enhance their
3 math knowledge to more effectively teach students in
4 the algebra for all initiative, a critical entryway
5 to achieving college readiness. Hunter also engages
6 outside experts for short term work with our faculty
7 and students to advance our understanding of how to
8 teach in ways that support all New York City
9 students. And over the past two years alone, Dr.
10 Django Paris, a national expert in multicultural
11 education, Dr. Marianna Souto-Manning, whose research
12 examines how to address inequities through early
13 childhood education and Dr. Sonja Nieto, who has
14 expertise in the education of students of culturally
15 and linguistically diverse backgrounds, have come to
16 Hunter to hold workshops and lectures that supplement
17 our coursework and provide distinct learning
18 opportunities for our students, faculty and current
19 school teachers. In addition to supporting the
20 children in the New York City public schools through
21 producing high quality professionals, we also
22 recognize and believe in the importance of recruiting
23 and supporting teachers who reflect the diversity of
24 our city. Hunter has a campus chapter of the Mayor's
25 New York City Men Teach initiative, whose specific

1 mission is to recruit and unite black, Latino and
2 Asian men committed to educating the city's diverse
3 population. We've also been awarded a second round of
4 funding from the New York State Education Department
5 for a Hunter Teacher Opportunity Corps to increase
6 the participation of historically underrepresented
7 individuals in teaching careers and to prepare
8 teachers to address the learning needs of all
9 students. As a result of our efforts, 54 percent of
10 our... of students in our teacher preparation programs
11 identify as non-white; whereas the national average
12 is approximately 20 percent. I'd like to conclude my
13 comments with two brief examples that illustrate our
14 work. In learning methods for teaching literacy, our
15 childhood education students go into their students'
16 neighborhoods to identify literacy examples in the
17 local community. Our teacher candidates then reflect
18 on what they've learned about the literacy resources
19 across different communities, and how that knowledge
20 helps teachers support literacy development. And
21 finally, I'd like to share the story of a Hunter
22 graduate whose family immigrated from Afghanistan. He
23 was a New York City public school student who
24 attended Hunter College. He dreamed of being a
25

1
2 teacher because he felt he could understand the
3 struggles of many of the city's students. He was
4 recruited to and applied to our master's program,
5 receiving support from the New York City Men Teach
6 initiative. With our support, he successfully
7 completed his degree and is now a second-grade
8 teacher in an elementary school in the Bronx. And
9 last week he brought his young students to visit
10 Hunter College because he wants to give them the
11 dream of higher education and to show them how their
12 work in his classroom is an important step on that
13 journey. Hunter has been preparing teachers for this
14 great city since 1870. As we enter the second half of
15 our second century in operation, I am proud I can
16 speak for our faculty and staff and say to the
17 Council that we are more committed than ever to
18 ensuring that New York City's children all have a
19 well prepared, effective educator to guide their
20 development. High quality public education from Pre-K
21 through graduate school has been, and will continue
22 to be, the engine driving the incomparable success
23 and unending dynamism of the city of New York. Thank
24 you.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

91

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you for
3 your testimony. I have some very focused questions
4 and if you could be concise in your answers, I would
5 appreciate that because we want to make sure we hear
6 from all of the panels. Now we know that CUNY has a
7 multitiered system in terms of the requirements for
8 entrance to some of the senior colleges and a higher
9 requirement for SAT than some of the other colleges
10 in CUNY, we know that there are a greater
11 concentration of black students in the community
12 colleges than in the senior colleges, what is being
13 done to help facilitate students who are in community
14 colleges where they can't complete all the
15 requirements to be able to become a certified
16 teacher, what is being done to create a stream where
17 they can transfer directly to that, we know that at
18 community colleges their, their completion rate is
19 much lower than at senior colleges so we have a
20 greater concentration of blacks at community
21 colleges, what are we doing to encourage students at
22 community colleges to come to the senior colleges and
23 complete that, do you have any data as to the number
24 of students that are transferring particularly to the
25 teacher education programs, teacher prep programs?

1

2

ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: I can give you a few

3

examples and some data. So, the first thing I'll say

4

is that students who begin in a community college are

5

actually overrepresented in education than in other

6

majors so I will double check these data for you

7

Chair Barron but in the... in the typical CUNY majors I

8

think the community college students comprise about

9

45 percent of the graduates and in teacher education

10

its about 55 percent so it's a... it's a higher

11

percentage. It's one of the reasons why it was

12

important to expand NYC Men Teach and make sure that

13

it was robust at the community colleges so students

14

received the supports there and then got specific

15

advisement to connect them with the senior colleges

16

so the 15 colleges represent both community colleges

17

and senior colleges and there's a close framework to

18

help transfer. Articulation agreements are another

19

mechanism that are strong in education and they're

20

always growing, we're always developing new ones so

21

that the coursework that students take in the

22

community colleges connect well to the senior

23

colleges and dual degree programs are another

24

mechanism we use and we have some good examples of

25

success.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Is the Men Teach
3 initiative at all of the community colleges?

4 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: All of the community
5 colleges except for Guttman.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, except for
7 Guttman and in terms of the question that I addressed
8 to DOE, is there a program that you are aware of
9 where persons who have not completed a teacher prep
10 teacher education program at a university or college
11 but who will be placed in a classroom in September,
12 is there a program that you engage with, with the DOE
13 that provides them with some training about what to
14 expect when they step in the classroom and if so can
15 you describe how that program operates?

16 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: All of the programs
17 that, that we would offer at CUNY are credit based
18 to, you know get teachers certified to go into the
19 class... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-
21 talk]

22 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: ...room...

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right but DOE
24 said that they reach out and have some training, some
25 preservice training for those who are going to be in

1
2 the classroom who have not gone through a, a teacher
3 education program, do you know of any programs that
4 CUNY provides to DOE which is, you know... [cross-talk]

5 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: We're a partner in
6 teach... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...the microwave
8 version of how to be a teacher... [cross-talk]

9 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Right, right, so we
10 do have teaching fellows at CUNY but they... those
11 students are enrolling in summer coursework, they're
12 getting certified before they enter the classroom in
13 the fall.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, you have
15 teaching fellows at CUNY?

16 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Uh-huh.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And how do... can
18 you describe that program for me?

19 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Sure, so we have
20 currently four colleges at CUNY who enroll teaching
21 fellows and they're in various high need areas, this
22 summer we welcomed about 440 students in this new
23 cohort. Since the program began, I think we've had
24 about 12,000 students enrolling in teaching fellows,
25 we have a long history with the DOE and the programs

1
2 differ campus by campus and by content area depending
3 on what the requirements are.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, these are
5 persons who are already teaching and who are now
6 going for certification so that they can become
7 permanent teachers, is that correct?

8 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: No, the teaching
9 fellows' program would... and all the recruitment and
10 screening first is done by the DOE and then CUNY,
11 these are individuals who have a baccalaureate
12 degree, they're applying to the program and then they
13 enroll in CUNY for summer coursework.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Is all of the
15 coursework done over summers or... [cross-talk]

16 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: The initial but they
17 complete a master's degree as part of the program.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, they're not
19 yet teachers?

20 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: They're not yet
21 teachers.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And how many... how
23 extensive is the summer coursework?

24

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 96

2 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: It would vary, I
3 don't know Michael if you have examples of what the
4 teaching fellows do at Hunter.

5 MICHAEL MIDDLETON: In our program we've
6 tried to align the summer curriculum in anticipation
7 of the classrooms they'll be in, in the fall and so
8 for example in our special ed classroom we've moved
9 our methods courses in special ed to the summer so
10 that when they enter classrooms in the fall they're
11 more prepared with the challenges of facing the
12 diversity of students in those classrooms.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: How many classes
14 or credits or how many hours do teaching fellows have
15 to take during the summer?

16 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: I can check for you
17 and get back to you on that.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. Alright,
19 I'd appreciate that. Now the teach grant program from
20 the feds are grants to eligible HI... AH... IHEs,
21 institutions of higher learning, higher education and
22 it gives a grant of up to 4,000 dollars annually to
23 eligible teacher preparation candidates, how, how
24 extensive is that program with CUNY and I understand
25 that there's some new requirements and some new

1
2 evaluations that are going to be coming forth and do
3 you have any idea of how you're going to operate with
4 that, it says the first year for which programs might
5 lose teach grant eligibility is 21/22, 2021 through
6 2022, so what is your status at this point with those
7 teach grants?

8 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Yes, thank you. So,
9 CUNYs in the process of actually expanding the number
10 of students who will be able to access teach grants,
11 this is something we're beginning for fall 2019 that
12 it would be open to undergraduate students, previous
13 to this graduate students have been eligible for
14 teach grants but we think more students could benefit
15 so we'll expand the pool of eligible students..

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, teach grants
17 are for undergrad as well as grad?

18 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay.

20 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: According to the
21 federal definition. So, in 20... in academic year
22 2016/2017 I think we had about 55 students who were
23 able to access teach grants of various amounts, it's...
24 they have to complete the FASFA as part of their
25 financial aid.. [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION 98

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-
3 talk]

4 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: ...process and for this
5 year we're... we still have students who are being
6 packaged because it rolls until September, I can get
7 you those numbers, but it's been relatively small.
8 It's restricted by the content areas, it's only for
9 high need fields... [cross-talk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh... [cross-talk]

11 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: ...and students once
12 they graduate have to get certified and hired and
13 then they have to stay as a teacher if they don't do
14 the things that the federal government ask it reverts
15 to loans so I think there... one opportunity we have
16 for fall is to not only really work closely with
17 students to make sure that they do everything they
18 need to do to access the grants but make sure that
19 students who might be loan averse can really take
20 advantage of the resources for them.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Is the grant
22 eligible for subsequent years or is it a one-time
23 grant?
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

HIGHER EDUCATION

ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: I can check that and get back to you, but I think they can access it for more than one year, I will check.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay.

MICHAEL MIDDLETON: Chair... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL MIDDLETON: I can also... back to your teaching fellows' question, the teaching fellows at Hunter College take between nine and 12 credit hours in their first summer in the program. With regard to the teach grant, at Hunter College we've had 38 recipients of teach grants since, since the program has begun, it's open to graduate students who commit to teaching in a high need subject area as Dean Thompson has said and are committed to four years of post-graduation work in high need schools, they also have to maintain a 3.25 J... GPA... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: What's the GPA?

MICHAEL MIDDLETON: 3.25... [cross-talk]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

MICHAEL MIDDLETON: ...and within the 75th percentile on their GREs so, in the past three

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 semesters at Hunter we've had in spring 2018 13
3 students, in fall 2018 12 awardees and in spring 2019
4 13 awardees, most of those have been from our
5 adolescence special education program.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. I have
7 other questions but I, I do want to respect the
8 audience and the other panels that are coming up so
9 we will prepare them and send them to you and we look
10 forward to a response as we always do get from CUNY
11 and of course for the record I am a graduate of
12 Hunter and it was because of the, the psychology
13 classes that I took at Hunter that I was able to be
14 excepted in lieu of having had... not having had
15 education courses but it did me very well and I'm a
16 proud alum and grateful for the opportunity to, to
17 have been at Hunter and was only able to go because
18 at that time CUNY was tuition free, if you graduated
19 with a B or better average you went tuition free, you
20 had to pay for books and other costs that we know but
21 that's what I'm working towards bringing CUNY back
22 tuition free and it seems to be in the atmosphere,
23 there are other folks who are talking about getting
24 to that state as well so, I look for your cooperation
25 in that regard as you might. Thank you so much.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 MICHAEL MIDDLETON: Thank you.

3 ASHLEIGH THOMPSON: Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Okay,
5 thank you, we're calling our next panel, we're going
6 to have Assemblywoman JoAnne Simon, New York Assembly
7 Member, let me thank you for your patience; David
8 Saltonstall, the New York Comptroller's Office and
9 Christine Collins, the Director of Teacher Centers at
10 UFT. Thank you. Thank you so much, you can begin in
11 whatever order you'd like to start. Oh, I'll defer to
12 the Assemblywoman because you've been waiting, and I
13 know you have sometimes ago.

14 JOANNE SIMON: Thank you. Good afternoon
15 Chair Barron and members of the Committee who are not
16 here. I want to thank you for this opportunity to
17 address this important topic, the training of our
18 teachers in who's care we entrust our children,
19 another words, the future of this country and of the
20 world. I'm Assembly Member JoAnne Simon representing
21 the 52nd Assembly District comprising the
22 neighborhoods of Boerum Hill, Brooklyn Heights,
23 Cobble Hill, Carroll Gardens, Dumbo, Fulton, Ferry
24 Landing, Gowanus, Vinegar Hill, most of Park Slope
25 and parts of Prospect Heights. I'm also a former

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 teacher of the deaf and a former president of the New
3 York branch of the International Dyslexia Association
4 now known as Everyone Reading and a founding member
5 of the Arise Coalition who I believe you'll be
6 hearing from later today. As a disability civil
7 rights attorney, I have also represented families in
8 special education matters in the past although I
9 don't currently practice in that area. I'd like to
10 share with you some of my experiences and efforts to
11 help improve teacher training in New York.

12 Unfortunately some of what I am about to say I've
13 been saying for the past 30 years, we simply must do
14 a better job of providing our preservice teachers,
15 our current teachers and ongoing at the elbow
16 supports to our New York City public school teachers
17 so that they are prepared to provide all students
18 including those with dyslexia and other disabilities
19 with appropriate evidence based effective literacy
20 instruction that is grounded in the science of
21 reading. There are evidence-based programs on the
22 market but many of them do not work and are not
23 effective. As an educator it's been my experience
24 that American teacher preparation programs fail in
25 two main areas, the teaching of reading and behavior

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 management. I'll confine my remarks to the teaching
3 of reading and the early identification of reading
4 problems and I want to say that I'm not panning every
5 teacher preparation program, we have some very fine
6 programs in this state but we don't have enough
7 consistency or enough breadth of, of teacher
8 preparation programs that adequately address issues
9 of reading. So, a lot happens in the brain when we
10 learn to read, it becomes a complicated and daunting
11 task when letters and numbers become mixed up because
12 neuro systems involved are wired differently from
13 non-disabled readers. Approximately 15 percent of
14 children have dyslexia, brain-based learning
15 disability that makes word recognition, spelling and
16 reading success a very difficult task. About 85
17 percent of children with learning disabilities have
18 dyslexia making it the most prevalent learning
19 disability in children yet most parents, teachers and
20 administrators do not know how to recognize its
21 symptoms. How many of our Pre-K to 12 teachers know
22 that a child who does not like Dr. Seuss books is at
23 risk for dyslexia for example. Children naturally
24 love rhyming, children with dyslexia don't get it,
25 ask any dyslexic they'll tell you. I believe our top

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 educational priority should be teaching our kids to
3 read and that will not happen unless we teach our
4 teachers how to teach reading. Too often teacher
5 preparation programs teach students about reading but
6 not actually how to do it. They do not teach their
7 students about structured multisensory language-based
8 instruction in reading. Our teachers simply must be
9 familiar with effective approaches for helping
10 struggling students learn to read, write, and spell
11 and while my experience is primarily with dyslexia, a
12 structured multisensory language-based approach will
13 certainly help all students and particularly ELL
14 students. So, the schools should look to the national
15 reading panel's findings which were issued in the
16 year 2000 and which identified the five pillars of
17 reading; phonemic awareness, phonics, morphemic
18 awareness, vocabulary and comprehension. Few teachers
19 could identify these terms. Research has consistently
20 shown that only 25 percent of America's teachers can
21 tell a morpheme from a synonym. There's no reason to
22 believe New York's teachers are any different. How
23 can they teach reading if they don't know this
24 information or know that there are 44 phonemes in the
25 English language or what a phoneme is, yet phonemic

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 awareness and morphemic awareness are among the basic
3 building blocks of reading for all children? Explicit
4 and systematic instruction in these skills has
5 repeatedly been found to be beneficial for all
6 students and absolutely essential for those with
7 dyslexia. The consequences of an inadequate ability
8 to read have a huge impact on our society fueling the
9 school to prison pipeline is only one such impact.
10 Children need the basic ability to read and write to
11 become successful members of society. I had started
12 this... I found a typo. Okay, so if we want to hold our
13 schools and our teachers accountable for the
14 education of our students, we must give teachers the
15 knowledge and tools they need to teach reading. We
16 need this yesterday, it's not the student's fault
17 that they can't read and it's not the teachers either
18 if we haven't... they haven't themselves been taught.
19 Too many teacher education programs teach students
20 outdated methods or no methods of... at all. Whole
21 language for example was never intended to help kids
22 who need explicit instruction in reading and not
23 surprisingly it has not worked for them. Roughly 40
24 percent of our kids are reading poorly, they're
25 simply following the national reading panel's

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 recommendations would help all children. We can make
3 a difference and I bring to your attention two bills
4 that I carry in the State Assembly, A5259-A which
5 requires the schools in New York State to implement a
6 program of early screening for kids at risk for
7 reading failure, it requires a simple evidence based
8 effective method of identifying children at risk be
9 implemented by teachers themselves, very brief, very
10 little training is required but the byproduct of
11 teachers doing this is that they will become aware of
12 what are the kinds of questions, what are the kinds
13 of answers that children will give them and they'd be
14 able to better identify just by having engaged in
15 that practice. Another bill I carry which is A6450
16 would require that every institution of higher
17 education that offers a graduate or undergraduate
18 degree or certification program in education or
19 educational administration located within the state
20 to incorporate evidence based effective methods of
21 teaching reading which shall include instruction in
22 direct and explicit structured multisensory
23 approaches also known as structured literacy not
24 balanced literacy, structured literacy within the
25 current required literacy curriculum. Finally, I

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 believe that as you go about your important work, we
3 must recognize that not every reading program sold is
4 being research based is research validated or
5 effective. When it comes to purchasing decisions, we
6 need to be doing our research and at least check the
7 what works clearinghouse which is in... on the state...
8 the federal education department's website. Programs
9 in use in our schools today some of them lack any
10 evidence based effectiveness such as foundations,
11 balanced literacy and teach for America and of course
12 many programs that desperate parents seek out on
13 their own like Hooked on Phonics, the list of
14 programs with little or mixed effectiveness and those
15 with no effectiveness is twice as long as those with
16 possible or potential effectiveness but they all
17 advertise that they are evidence based. So, I suggest
18 that we stop wasting the public's money and our
19 children's precious few years to acquire reading
20 skills and have the adults do their homework first.
21 Thank you very much and I'm happy to answer any
22 questions you might have, thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, next
24 panelist.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 CHRISTINA COLLINS: Thank you, my name is
3 Christina Collins, I'm Director of Research and
4 Policy for the UFT Teacher Center and I'm here on
5 behalf of Vice President of Education and Executive
6 Director of the Teacher Center, Evelyn DeJesus. On
7 behalf of Vice President DeJesus and our 190,000
8 members, we just want to thank the City Council
9 particularly Chair Barron and Chair Treyger for
10 holding this meeting today. And we'd also like to
11 recognize City Council Speaker Johnson and the rest
12 of the Council for your strong leadership and
13 particularly for passing the most recent City Council
14 budget. I'd like to speak first today about the
15 matter of teacher preparation and how we believe we
16 can improve our current system. One of the things
17 that you may notice that New York City like many
18 urban districts has a very difficult time retaining
19 its newest teachers and when we speak with new
20 teachers one of the things we hear constantly
21 especially from those who are struggling in their
22 first year is that I didn't learn this in education
23 school and what we believe is that we need a new
24 paradigm for training of new teachers, one that
25 mirrors the medical profession and gives our

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 prospective teachers a student residency of working,
3 teaching and learning inside a New York City school.
4 And so, because of this we've been in talk with the
5 DOE as well as with the City University of New York
6 about how such a residency program could be
7 structured. Each year New York City has been hiring
8 above 4,000 new teachers and we do support a
9 residency program that would absorb as many of these
10 new hires as possible. New York City Comptroller
11 Stringer just yesterday proposed a residency program
12 that would build on the existing alternative
13 preparation program, the New York City Teaching
14 Fellows and we believe that with so many public
15 school advocates now calling for a vigorous residency
16 program we hope that it's an idea that's... who's time
17 has come. Next I'd like to turn to the work of the
18 UFT Teacher Center which we very much again value the
19 City Council's recent commitment to ensuring that our
20 teachers are adequately prepared to succeed but also
21 that they receive meaningful learning opportunities
22 throughout their careers that help them grow into and
23 remain exceptional educators for our students and so
24 we would particularly like to thank the City Council
25 for their support in their recent investment in the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 UFT Teacher Center in the most recent City Council
3 budget. The UFT Teacher Center is an award-winning
4 program that's been around since 1979, we're a school
5 based professional development program that's a
6 collaboration of the UFT, the State Ed Department,
7 the DOE as well as individual schools and districts
8 as well as other cultural institutions. We currently
9 at the Teacher Center operate across all five
10 boroughs of New York City and we have dedicated
11 school embedded professional learning specialists in
12 over 115 schools that are there full time working
13 with those staffs on professional learning and we
14 also have 25 very experienced New York City educators
15 who serve as our Teacher Center field staff and field
16 liaison working with those schools as well as
17 coordinating citywide professional learning
18 opportunities and we draw from current research and
19 best practices to create with those teachers and
20 those professional learning specialists activities
21 that are designed and taught by educators for
22 educators across New York City. They're designed to
23 deepen content knowledge across all subject areas
24 including shortage area subjects such as math and
25 science which I'll speak to a little bit later.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 They're designed to enhance all teacher's pedagogical
3 skills and they're designed to support teachers to
4 better serve all students including multilanguage
5 learners and students with special needs. So, our
6 activities that we create and carry out throughout
7 the district include intensive in classroom support,
8 after school study groups, citywide networks,
9 conferences and seminars and we have deep experience
10 in the design and offering of high quality
11 professional learning in collaboration with, as I
12 mentioned both the DOE and with outside partners. We
13 have a long history of bringing innovative, new
14 content into district schools and pedagogical
15 practices directly to classroom teachers in schools
16 across the city and working then side by side with
17 them throughout the school year to support engaging
18 instruction for their students. As I mentioned we
19 have a network of 115 school-based sites as well as
20 our conferences and during the 2017/18 school year we
21 provided professional learning to over 246,000
22 participants in our activities, these include to
23 teachers, administrators, paraprofessionals, school
24 staff and parents across the city. We believe that
25 now more than ever, the Teacher Center is uniquely

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 positioned to play a leading role as New York State
3 moves to create and implement its new next generation
4 learning standards and related resources and
5 curricula. The Teacher Centers have and will continue
6 to play a vital part in developing New York's
7 professional development plan requirements and
8 helping educate classroom teachers across the city so
9 that their work in the classroom aligns with new
10 standards. I'll mention that we also support national
11 boards certification, we serve as an approved state
12 partner for providing continuing teacher and learn...
13 leader education, CTLE credits to teachers, we have
14 partnerships with six local colleges and universities
15 and with NYSUT, the New York State United Teachers
16 College partners including Brooklyn College and the
17 New York Institute of Technology to offer teachers
18 additional professional learning opportunities
19 through them as well. So, then I'll just end by
20 offering a few specific examples of great projects
21 that our Teacher Center site staff have worked on.
22 One focuses on students with special needs, our
23 Teacher Center school based site inside PS 396, which
24 is a special education program located inside PS 532
25 in Crown Heights recently opened, it just opened in

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 April of this year, 2019 and already the site has
3 been working with educators from four other district
4 75 locations and effects more than 1,600 special need
5 students in kindergarten through eighth grade. Our
6 colleague, our site person there Shameeka Hill is...
7 has already been planning multiple presentations
8 about how the new state learning standards in ELA and
9 math can be used to apply to special need students.
10 As she describes herself, I am a resource to these
11 students and their teachers and by May 19... 2019, the
12 teachers at those locations were already... remember
13 this site had just opened in April, reporting that
14 the Teacher Center site was providing them with hands
15 on materials for their students and were thrilled to
16 have this content because they were already using it
17 to write curriculum for their special need students.
18 Next, I'll move on to our civic education work. We
19 would... we are currently supported by a small pilot
20 grant from the AFT, the National Union to meet with
21 educators from K to 12 classrooms across the city to
22 meet with them to discuss their vision for civics
23 education in New York City schools and we're planning
24 to write recommendations to present to the New York
25 State Board of Regents in the fall to inform their

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 civic education work. That recommendation... those
3 recommendations will inform the state's K to 12
4 framework for civic participation which we believe
5 goes beyond just educating high school students in
6 democratic responsibilities such as jury duty and
7 voting but also support students of all ages in how
8 they should behave and interact with each other and
9 with their communities. For example, working with
10 sixth graders to practice how to show respect in
11 classroom debates regardless of your opinion on
12 someone else's viewpoint. Finally, as educators we're
13 no... we know we're preparing students for a world we
14 can barely dream of around issues of science
15 technology and math and so our Teacher Center folks
16 have the ability to work with teachers so that
17 students have fun exploring these fields as well. So,
18 educators at PS 28 in the Bronx just worked with
19 their Teacher Center coach to design and build
20 structures that could prevent an ice cube or at least
21 slow an ice cube from melting in the sun and so teams
22 of teachers evaluated their design, improved their
23 design, built the design and then worked with their
24 Teacher Center coach to see that experiment through
25 the eyes of both a teacher and a student and then

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 will go back and work with their kindergarten
3 students to recreate the experience of building those
4 structures as well as learning state based scientific
5 standards and vocabulary about the effects of
6 sunlight on the earth's surface. So, in closing I'd
7 just like to say that we understand that providing
8 all of our students with a world class education
9 means that our educators must be well prepared and
10 afforded consistent professional development. We're
11 committed to providing our members with substantive
12 and meaningful learning opportunities throughout
13 their careers and strongly believe that now is the
14 time to engage in a conversation about both
15 implementing residency programs and to continuing to
16 support our signature professional learning
17 opportunities through the UFT Teacher Center to
18 guarantee that our New York City students are served
19 by the best educators that they can be. So, I thank
20 you for your time and I'm happy to answer whatever
21 questions you may have.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, next
23 panelist.

24 DAVID SALTONSTALL: Thank you Madame
25 Chair for giving us this opportunity to testify. My

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 name is David Saltonstall and I'm the Assistant
3 Comptroller for Policy for New York City Comptroller
4 Scott Stringer. Yesterday, Comptroller Stringer
5 issued a report, I believe the Sergeant at Arms has
6 shared it with you, examining an issue at the... at the
7 core of today's hearing, which is the persistent
8 problem of high teacher turnover rates. The
9 Comptroller's report provides a new analysis of the
10 scale and the scope of teacher turnover in our city
11 and shows the disproportionate impact of high
12 turnover across school districts. Ultimately the
13 report reveals that a staggering 41 percent of all
14 teachers hired in the 2012/13 school year left their
15 posts within five years, that's more than 1,800
16 teachers gone since the day they signed up five years
17 ago. In many districts' teacher turnover is even
18 higher like in school district 12 in the Bronx which
19 lost 31 percent of its teachers last year alone. The
20 problem as we outline in our report in our opinion is
21 that the DOE is not doing enough to prepare new
22 teachers who enter the classroom through alternative
23 pathways. Indeed, today's teacher fellows often get
24 just a few weeks of in class training before they are
25 handed the keys to their own classroom. So,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 Comptroller Stringer is calling on the DOE to
3 establish a large-scale paid residency program to
4 expand in classroom experience providing teacher
5 candidates an affordable pathway to high quality
6 preparation. A residency program gives new, new
7 teachers a full year to work alongside a master
8 teacher and gain the experience needed to manage
9 their own classes. Not everything can be learned in a
10 textbook and that includes teaching, giving new
11 teachers a full year to understand the social and
12 educational challenges that every teacher face will
13 improve their chances of staying in the system over
14 the long haul. We know this because similar paid
15 residencies like those we are proposing are already
16 succeeding in Boston, in Denver and even here in New
17 York City where new visions for public schools,
18 Teachers College and the Museum of Natural History
19 have run small but very successful residency programs
20 for years. It's important to remember that teacher
21 turnover isn't just an HR challenge, it's, it's an
22 educational disaster for students, a revolving door
23 of inexperienced teachers is particularly damaging
24 for the city's most vulnerable students. In New York
25 City schools with high concentrations of poverty

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 often experience both higher percentages of new
3 teachers as well as higher rate, rates of turnover
4 compounding other deep inequities in the system. When
5 fully scaled we believe a teacher residency program
6 could place a thousand resident teachers in city
7 schools each year significantly improving the quality
8 and stability of the teaching pipeline. We believe
9 the system... we believe this would cost the system an
10 additional 40 million dollars over and above the 22
11 million dollars we are spending on today's teaching
12 fellows program but we also anticipate that over time
13 the city would regain some of the initial investment
14 through cost savings from improved retention.

15 Providing teacher candidates an affordable pathway to
16 high quality preparation is key to improving teacher
17 retention as well as diversifying the ranks of the
18 teacher workforce. By minimizing financial obstacles
19 and giving new teachers the training and support they
20 deserve we can lift up not just our schools but our
21 kids as well and we are grateful for the UFT's
22 support in, in, in this residency model. So, that's,
23 that's all we have for today, thank you again for the
24 opportunity to testify and I'm of course eager to
25 answer any questions you might have.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, just
3 very briefly, the Comptroller's proposal is for what
4 candidates at what level and at what point for them
5 to be in residency?

6 DAVID SALTONSTALL: I mean it would
7 essentially build off the current teacher fellows
8 program but instead of managing their own classroom
9 in that first year they would be shadowing a, a
10 master teacher for a full year and, and then when
11 that year is over they would be essentially first in
12 line to be... to be hired as, as teachers.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, okay, thank
14 you. I had a Teacher Center in my school so I know
15 the value of that and to Dr. Simon we thank you,
16 that's when I was able to understand how to teach
17 reading when I attended Bank Street and so much of
18 the teaching philosophy techniques and as you talk
19 about multisensory that's so important to be able to
20 get children to understand what reading is and, and
21 that it's an interaction and find the way that each
22 child learns so I want to thank the panel very much
23 for coming, for your patience and for your
24 presentation. Thank you. And we'll call our next
25 panel Sergeant at Arms may need to get us more chairs

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 because it's going to be a large panel. We're going
3 to have Alan Singer from Hofstra University; we're
4 going to have Aimee Katembo from Teachers College
5 Columbia University; Karen DeMoss from Bank Street;
6 Frank Pignatosi from NYU; Jennifer Pankowski from
7 Pace University; Jacob Easley from Touro College and
8 Dr. Trina Lynn Yearwood from Long Island university.
9 So, these are the folks who are going to tell us what
10 it is that their institutions are actually doing so
11 that we can see how we can interact with them and
12 what we can do to make it more effective in terms of
13 preparing our teachers and share the great
14 information that they have. So, I... we'll start on my
15 right and we'll go straight through and again thank
16 you for your patience, push the button, the red light
17 is... [cross-talk]

18 FRANK PIGNATOSI: Is this on?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Now it is.

20 FRANK PIGNATOSI: Thank you Chair Treyger
21 and Chair Barron and all the Council Members. My name
22 is Frank Pignatosi, I'm Clinical Assistant Professor
23 at NYUs School of Culture, Education and Human
24 Development and I'm happy to testify on how we
25 address teacher prep and teacher training. To go to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 straight to the point I think our challenge is to
3 rethink the model. I often see the, the relationship
4 that the DOE and other school districts and teacher
5 prep programs have had as partners is shuffling
6 candidates to one another from preservice status to
7 in service status much as divorced parents do with
8 their children where they collaborate but never in
9 the same place, right, so they're... the, the input is
10 always in, in separate venues. And the onus of the
11 partnership too often falls on the single candidate
12 to negotiate the input they're getting from one
13 agency or from the other agency. So, one of the
14 things that NYU has done is to rethink the model and
15 in the larger world of residency rather than just
16 delegating the candidates to school spaces is really
17 to co-share and to co-inhabit those school spaces.
18 So, where... we've created a residency model where our
19 faculty work every week in schools with the school
20 administrators, the school teachers and co-coach, we
21 work with the students directly, we work with the
22 inters and we also work with the teachers and we
23 learn also from the curriculum leads and the
24 assistant principals in the schools so that we can
25 create a feedback loop that is, is continuous. I,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 myself am, am one of the residency directors that
3 works with some of the schools here in the city in
4 the Bronx and Brownsville and Bushwick and Canarsie
5 and we've been working also with districts around the
6 country and it is a residency model that is based on
7 hiring, employing the intern for that full year while
8 they're taking... and co-sharing the cost through
9 scholarships and, and contribution to the masters
10 program. The, the other piece is also very much
11 what's important about this program and our general
12 approach is really moving away from quantity and much
13 more towards quality. For example, our belief around
14 teaching students with disabilities is not only about
15 certifying more teachers that are ready to teach
16 students with disabilities but it's about really how
17 do we prepare teachers who are not certified in
18 special ed to work across the board and how do we get
19 them to understand the racial disproportionality that
20 exists already in the referral process and how to
21 work towards focusing on those students who need to
22 be referred and helping students outside of the
23 referral process to, to, to benefit and, and, and to
24 improve their out... their outcomes and similarly when
25 it comes to emergent bilinguals I think... I think it's

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 important that we... it's about really understanding
3 communities and starting from communities and not
4 only from the coursework. In our program students are
5 required to work with communities with community
6 members and create projects that bring them into the
7 communities at a time when more and more of our
8 teachers rarely work in the community... rarely live in
9 the communities where, where the school... their
10 schools are located so how does that begin and how
11 therefore there's the multilingual presence in the
12 community begin to impact and shape the way they're
13 thinking about their students and about interacting.
14 And we, we started working where our special ed
15 majors and our non-specialized majors who actually
16 collaborate on the planning during their internship
17 here rather than having one only delegate to the
18 other when it comes time to, to differentiate. And I,
19 I, I think it's important that rather than wasting
20 the expertise we... both agencies have and only working
21 in, in, in creating partnerships in rooms and co-
22 crafting curriculum that we actually share the space
23 within schools and begin to co-collaborate rather
24 than again handing off one, one to the other.
25 Finally, I, I think it's, it's, it's important that

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 if we... you know we've made great efforts to not only
3 assign our students to work in schools in, in
4 different communities but clearly also to change the,
5 the approach of who are the candidates we're, we're
6 bringing into the field. Already this was a
7 transition that was occurring on, on the campus
8 programs but even more in this residency program or
9 on the national level we have 60 percent of
10 candidates who identify as of color and then in New
11 York City it's well over 90 percent who identify of
12 color with the small number of minority still being
13 men of color, right, though that is a growing number.
14 But I also want to really... the importance that we...
15 and I was also on the state clinical practice group
16 that looked at revising the student teaching
17 requirements and one of my challenges that we focus
18 again more on quality and quantity and it's real
19 difficult to eliminate the inequity of our school
20 system and then to base our admissions process on the
21 grades that come out of that school system, it's,
22 it's a little difficult to amend the struggle to
23 attract teachers from diverse backgrounds and then to
24 increase the requirements like student teaching hours
25 without looking at the quality which really makes it

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 difficult for someone to generate income so that they
3 can stay within a full time program. I will stop
4 there and honor the presence of my colleagues; I
5 thank you very much for the time and I'm very happy
6 to answer any further questions.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, I
8 think I'll perhaps ask questions after each of you
9 finish. Did you mention that you're working in
10 Brownsville?

11 FRANK PIGNATOSI: We... in New York City
12 we're working largely with Charter networks that are...
13 and so we're working in the Bronx, Brownsville...

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Do you know the
15 school in Brownsville?

16 FRANK PIGNATOSI: We... in the... this year
17 we were working with Brooklyn Ascend.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, great,
19 thank you. Next panelist.

20 JACOB EASLEY: So, good afternoon to our
21 Chairs Treyger and Barron and to the Council Members
22 for providing this opportunity for us to address the
23 issues in educator preparation in particular. So, I
24 am Jacob Easley, I am Dean for the Graduate School of
25 Education, Touro College and I'm providing testimony,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 testimony today regarding educator preparation in
3 higher education specifically particularly related to
4 diversity of teacher... the teacher workforce and
5 meeting the challenges of New York City's hard to
6 fill licensure areas and classrooms and in doing so
7 Touro stands alone as a stand-alone institution, is
8 on record for one of the largest providers of special
9 educator teachers... special education teachers
10 prepared and hired by NYC DOE along with other high
11 needs areas and we're also number one... number nine in
12 the nation according to Diverse Issues in Higher
13 Education for graduating minority teachers in
14 education at the graduate level and a recent report
15 by Education Trust reveals that our graduates who are
16 in DOE have a student achievement growth rate that is
17 above the overall average of New York City teachers
18 and as our colleagues from DOE mentioned earlier
19 we're also one of those new partners around US prep
20 which is a collaborative effort to redesign the
21 clinical practice looking both at curriculum on both
22 sides of the aisle in how we coordinate our supports
23 of new teachers. So, Chairperson Barron like you I
24 also was not a traditional, traditionally prepared
25 and I was a teacher and as Dean I now oversee

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 operations of over 2,400 students annually and about
3 20,000 alumni and of course as you know we work
4 tirelessly to ensure that our candidates are highly
5 prepared. So, part of that includes partnering with
6 DOE and as I share these perspectives, I hope that
7 they are food for thought for all of us here, my
8 colleagues in the room as well as those on the panel...
9 I mean those on the... on the Commission. So, I want to
10 talk about educator preparation, so I think it is an
11 unfounded belief that all EPPs at least in the higher
12 education level are of poor quality or lack
13 accountability. So, as you know all of our programs
14 have to be approved by the state, in addition to that
15 we're currently by state legislation are required to
16 undergo national accreditation which is currently on
17 a seven year cycle and I mentioned earlier about an
18 annual reporting to the federal government that's
19 under title two. So, there are efforts and, and
20 systems in place to ensure that we are accountable
21 but I do believe that in the event that there are
22 individual institutions that do not meet state or
23 national expectations for effectiveness they must be
24 identified, supported and are sanctioned by following
25 state policy so that's the first thing that I would

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 like to talk about. In the area of teacher diversity
3 in high need areas there are numerous advantages as
4 we know from the research on having a culturally,
5 linguistically and racially diverse teaching force
6 and we're seeing that that benefit is not only on
7 student learning but also in the overall school,
8 culture and climate and like many of my peers who are
9 here today, Touro College has established a, a
10 strategic plan to identify, recruit and develop
11 talented minority and linguistically diverse teachers
12 for New York City schools. We have learned that in
13 order to be successful in this area however we must
14 collaborate not only with universities and schools
15 but also... and, and districts but also with other
16 stakeholders. So, legislative financial and
17 curricular programing much of which have been
18 proposed today need to be aligned to achieve the, the
19 desired results for teacher parity, innovation is
20 also a key so we know that for example New York City
21 has over 28,000 paraprofessionals and, and tapping
22 into that natural pipeline may be one, one effort. I
23 don't have a solution to it we just know that this is
24 something that we need to continue to work at and
25 that's the beginning work that we're... that we have

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 ceded with New York City DOE through US Prep. Data
3 sharing and continuous improvement. So, continuous
4 improvement is essential for an agile and
5 sustainable... agile and sustainable systems for their
6 advancement as a profession. The potential for
7 effective improvements is hindered by lack of
8 systemic and ongoing data sharing between New York
9 City Department of Education and, and our programs.
10 As EPPs our... and our accountable... we are accountable
11 to the public and of course to the national
12 accreditation but we are significantly handicapped
13 and I'm saying this globally, not necessarily in the
14 one off institutionally by a lack of transparency of
15 data that could be used to inform our practice. For
16 example, consist... regularly understanding the impact
17 of our alumni as they go and work in schools would
18 tremendously help us. So, we have to work together,
19 together to reverse this impediment and then the last
20 would be ongoing advisement and evidence based and
21 responsive legislative action so, it's great that
22 we're having this conversation today but how do we
23 make this systematic. So, too many... on too many
24 occasions well intended legislative... legislation has
25 yielded unintended consequences that create barriers

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 to innovation and access to quality programs for
3 talented teacher aspirants. For example, currently it
4 costs almost... up, up to even more than 1,000 dollars
5 for a teacher to become certified that's from kid to
6 kaboodle and we add program fees and etcetera that's
7 even more. So, these are real barriers that our
8 candidates face, and they directly affect the ability
9 to recruit talented and a diverse pool. In a national
10 study by the American Association for State Colleges
11 and Universities, 40 percent of deans indicated that
12 state departments do not regularly consult their
13 peers across the state on policy issues and while
14 we're talking about the state level, this is probably
15 something that you will hear common with most of our
16 deans is that we need better communication and
17 collaboration across those partners. And so, I will
18 stop here because you have the rest of my report but
19 thank you for this opportunity to have a forum with
20 you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, next
22 panelist.

23 KAREN DEMOSS: Good afternoon Chair
24 Barron, thank you to both of you as Chairs and to all
25 of the honorable members of both committees for

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 allowing us to testify today. I'm Karen DeMoss and I
3 lead a project called Prepared to Teach out of your,
4 your alum institution Bank Street College. There are
5 actually three parts of Bank Street; there's a school
6 for children, the graduate school and a Bank Street
7 education center which works externally on the kinds
8 of challenges that you all have brought to bear to
9 this conversation today and that's the domain that I
10 work in, I'll be sure and say your hellos though to
11 the people over at the graduate school when I get
12 back. In the interest of time because you have so
13 much of the information already that is the research
14 portion of the work that we do, I will start my
15 testimony towards the bottom of page two where it's
16 entitled the importance of clinical practice. As with
17 any other profession that requires practitioners to
18 make complex decisions in situations defined by
19 unique contextual and individual factors, becoming an
20 effective teacher requires practice, specifically
21 linking the ever growing knowledge base on human
22 development, learning sciences, and effective
23 pedagogy with guided, supervised practice that
24 enables deep critique and reflection. In fact, it's
25 the clinical practice portion of preparation that

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 creates the link between questions of quality and
3 diversity. Without strong clinical practice before
4 they become teachers of record, novice teachers are
5 less effective than they could and should be. When
6 the novice teacher of color... when novice teachers of
7 color are among those who are under prepared, they
8 actually are more likely to leave the profession
9 quickly. I believe earlier you were looking for the
10 number of hours of practice that are required as a
11 minimum by the state, it is 40 hours, one full time
12 week. Pharmacists architects, doctors, engineers,
13 hairdressers, nurses; all these professions require a
14 minimum of 1,500 hours of meaningfully supervised
15 professional practice in New York before aspirants
16 are allowed to operate independently. For teachers
17 though, alternative routes allow the individual to be
18 hired with as little as 40 hours of preservice work
19 in a classroom often unsupervised. Federal data
20 indicate that alternative programs in, in New York
21 average 90 hours of practice before they... before they
22 are being hired and traditional programs average over
23 500. The prior requirement for traditional programs
24 was only 260 so traditional programs even before the
25 raising of the standard to 455 on average were

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 already exceeding what the state has as a
3 requirement. While still much less than the level of
4 required practice for entry into other professions in
5 New York, traditional programs provide candidates
6 with much more extensive opportunities to build their
7 skills. Graduates from those programs are more likely
8 to stay in the field as teachers, reducing turnover
9 costs that run into the billions every year, that
10 billions are a national number not a New York City
11 specific number. Without supported, extended clinical
12 practice before becoming a teacher of record,
13 aspiring teachers have insufficient opportunities to
14 master the complexities of teaching and learning, to
15 practice applying the growing knowledge base of how
16 children and young adults learn, or to reflect on how
17 to adult... adjust their practices to address all
18 student's needs. They lack the time to learn and to
19 apply research-based practices that support students
20 with exceptional needs and emergent bilinguals. They
21 have to rush through important concepts around
22 relationship building, trauma informed care and
23 culturally sustaining practices. Learning to teach
24 takes time and the city's students should not have to
25 learn under teachers who themselves had not had the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 opportunity to learn to teach. The problem is the
3 economic barriers. Addressing the opportunity to
4 learn gap for future teachers is largely an economic
5 issue, this is why our project, Prepared to Teach
6 exists, is to address the economic challenge of
7 people coming into the profession through quality
8 routes. Most aspiring teachers have had.. have a hard
9 time pursuing their teaching credentials because the
10 required clinical practice is unpaid. Other
11 professions allow entrants to earn money while they
12 are doing their supervised training, but teachers
13 have historically been required to do their full-time
14 semester long student teaching for free. That reality
15 creates strong incentives for candidates to enter
16 through quick, cheap pathways since fully 40 percent
17 of undergraduates and 76 percent of graduate students
18 work full time while going to school and 20 percent
19 of students who work have dependents, they cannot
20 afford to quick working during clinical placements.
21 These economic realities are even more prominent for
22 candidates of color. Recent national data shows that
23 candidates of color enrolled in teacher preparation
24 programs come from homes that have rough incomes of
25 about 45,000 dollars which is less than half of what

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 candidates coming from white backgrounds have on
3 average. To ensure that novice teachers are well
4 prepared to teach and do not opt for quick entry
5 programs which provide them a salary and benefits
6 immediately and to reflect the full diversity of the
7 city we have to find ways to minimize financial
8 barriers to entering the profession through strong
9 preparation pathways that set novice teachers up for
10 success with all students in the system. So, practice
11 allows them to succeed. These mutually beneficial
12 partnerships which we did hear some discussion of
13 from some of my colleagues on the panel already they
14 actually do make a difference in the funding. Through
15 this hearing the City Council is asking an important
16 question of how the New York City Department of
17 Education is working with teacher preparation
18 programs to address the city's needs for better
19 prepared and more diverse teachers. The NYC DOE and
20 its partners can point to many examples of high-
21 quality partnerships that reflect the kinds of
22 preparation opportunities and focus on areas of high
23 need for the city's new teachers. We applaud these
24 efforts and Bank Street College counts itself among
25 such participants with the New York City DOE. This

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 summer we're launching a new TESOL certificate
3 residency program which will prepare new, highly
4 qualified teachers for the city's emergent bilingual
5 students in collaboration with the Internationals
6 network and other public schools. candidates will
7 have a full year of co-teaching alongside an
8 accomplished licensed teacher while being supported
9 with aligned deep learning and reflection associated
10 with Banks Street programs. Evidence shows that they
11 are more likely to stay, 70 to 90 percent of people
12 who go through residency programs are still in their
13 positions five years later compared to 30 to 60
14 percent of people entering through other programs.
15 Most of the residency programs that are currently
16 available in New York City are either unfunded for
17 the candidate meaning they just have to work longer
18 in their student teaching for free or they are funded
19 through grants. What our project is working to do is
20 figure out ways to more sustainably fund this kind of
21 work. The Comptroller's Office estimate of about
22 another 40 million dollars on top of the, the
23 teaching fellows' dollars is a really good estimate,
24 there are also some cost savings approaches which
25 many of our partnerships that we support have been

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 able to figure out. They figure out these cost
3 savings through really deep work for a year co-
4 designing programming. When you have a program that's
5 embedded inside a school they are able to figure out
6 ways to streamline the curriculum because the
7 candidates are immediately applying what they're
8 thinking about, they're actually seeing their work in
9 practice, they're actually learning what their, their
10 practices do with their students and the, the
11 programs find that they actually can reduce the
12 amount of coursework that they have to have, this has
13 happened in several of our partnerships and because
14 the candidates are truly working in the schools the
15 schools are able to actually fund the candidates for
16 part of this work. One of the partnerships on Staten
17 Island with the... with the College of Staten Island
18 has found 15,000 dollars per year for eight
19 candidates to be residents inside the school from
20 existing budgets; they're re-staffing lines, they're
21 reportioning things like professional development
22 dollars which was, was one of the questioning lines
23 earlier on and they're able to provide this to
24 candidates and in addition they're able to streamline
25 some of the coursework which of course reduces the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 tuition debt for the candidates and also helps people
3 become teachers more quickly. So, this is a kind of
4 partnership work that through discussions with the
5 DOE, through new structuring, through reallocation
6 and then through the sort of cost savings that
7 happened because you're not constantly doing the
8 churn our students will no longer have as much need
9 for remediation, they won't any longer be held back
10 because they didn't have quality teachers and they
11 will be more college and career ready when they
12 graduate from our high schools. Thank you very much,
13 I'm happy to answer questions.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, next
15 panelist.

16 AIMEE KATEMBO: Good afternoon... can you
17 hear me? Good afternoon Chairperson Barron and all
18 Council Members present. My name is Aimee Katembo and
19 I'm the Director of the Office of Teacher Education
20 at Teachers College Columbia University. I'm honored
21 to testify today. As administrators and teacher
22 educators at Teachers College Columbia University we
23 are so pleased that the New York City Council is
24 centering this important discussion about the needs
25 of students with disabilities, English language

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 learners and students of color. We share your
3 commitments and we come to the conversation to offer
4 two additional perspectives on how to strengthen
5 teacher preparation in New York City. First, it is
6 essential to recognize that learning to teach does
7 not and cannot happen over the course of a single
8 preservice academic program but rather teachers
9 continue to learn and grow as they teach. Second,
10 diversifying the teaching force requires a sincere
11 financial commitment on the part of our city and
12 state policy makers. Today I'd like to highlight some
13 of the work that is happening at Teachers College and
14 offer recommendations on how to strengthen our
15 partnerships. Teachers College is the first and
16 largest graduate school of education in the United
17 States. Today TC has more than 5,000 students and we
18 prepare more than 500 preservice teachers annually,
19 the majority of these teachers stay and teach in New
20 York City public schools, the very schools where they
21 did their student teaching. At Teachers College, all
22 teacher education students regardless of content and
23 grade level engage in coursework and field
24 experiences that focus specifically on the needs of
25 students with disabilities. We proudly offer a robust

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 degree programs in early childhood and special
3 education, elementary inclusive and special
4 education, applied behavior analysis, intellectual
5 disabilities and autism, bilingual and bicultural
6 education, and teaching English to speakers of other
7 languages to name just a few. In addition, we share
8 New York City's commitment to recruiting and
9 preparing teachers from backgrounds that are
10 currently underrepresented in the teaching force,
11 this commitment is manifested in recruitment and
12 admissions decisions across Teachers College's 20
13 plus teacher education programs and is formally
14 supported through scholarships, our Teacher
15 Opportunity Corps Program and a growing number of
16 opportunities for all members of our community to
17 develop their own racial literacy and for aspiring
18 teachers of color to find support, community and
19 affirmation at Teachers College. We have identified
20 two opportunities to strengthen teacher preparation.
21 The first is, we find that teachers and particularly
22 those serving students with disabilities or students
23 for whom English is a second language benefit from
24 structured induction support and professional
25 development opportunities long after TC grad.. their

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 TC graduation date. We don't see this as a failure of
3 our degree programs but rather a fact about the
4 nature of teaching; learning to teach effectively
5 takes more than a couple of semesters. We are already
6 engaged in induction with our TR at TC program that's
7 been mentioned here today. Across the first nine
8 years of the program, 97 percent of TC grads continue
9 to work in induction related fields. We also see a
10 tremendous opportunity to increase public funding
11 aimed at diversifying the teaching force. Strong
12 programs which can benefit from additional funds are
13 already in place. For example, the Teacher
14 Opportunity Corps is a state funded program
15 specifically designed to increase the number of
16 teachers from underrepresented backgrounds. At
17 Teachers College this program allows us to support 20
18 aspiring teachers of color with tuition support,
19 mentorship, professional development opportunities,
20 seminars with faculty and internships in New York
21 City public schools. What if we had enough funding to
22 support 100 aspiring teachers of color? What if we
23 were able to offer full scholarships to all Teacher
24 Opportunity Corps interns? Our infrastructure is
25 strong and we're ready to grow. There are areas in

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 which we are already poised to support New York City
3 teachers with their in-service learning. We currently
4 offer a wide variety of professional development
5 services for in service teachers including workshops
6 on designing accessible curriculum through the
7 Teachers College inclusive classrooms project,
8 induction support through our center for professional
9 education of teachers, powerful lectures and learning
10 opportunities through our annual reimagining
11 education conference on the teaching and learning in
12 racially diverse schools and the certification
13 extension in bilingual education just to name a few.
14 In sum, Teachers College has the expertise and the
15 structures to support New York City and its work to
16 teach and affirm all learners and we stand ready to
17 help. We have templates for strong induction support,
18 and we'd be happy to collaborate with the New York
19 City Department of Ed in developing in service
20 professional development supports for a broader range
21 of teacher candidates. Possibilities include
22 connecting New York City teachers with the many
23 effective workshops and conferences that Teachers
24 College has to offer, co-constructing induction
25 pathways that support and affirm our next generation

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 of teachers and above all funding the aspiring
3 teachers whom we must want to see in our classrooms.
4 Thank you.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, next.

6 ALAN SINGER: What do I... we all want to
7 thank you for staying, we now know who really
8 believes these issues are important. My name is Alan
9 Singer, I'm a former New York City high school
10 teacher, I, I taught... I went to CCNY, I taught at
11 Jeff, I taught at Lane, I taught at IS 292 and I
12 worked at the United Community centers for many years
13 in your district. I'm a teacher educator now at
14 Hofstra University on Long Island. Many graduates of
15 our school of education become New York City
16 teachers. Speaking today I represent my views not the
17 views not the views of the university. We need to
18 dispel some myths about education and teacher
19 preparation. One, education and teacher preparation
20 are not miracle cures for massive social upheavals.
21 We can make our schools better, but that will not
22 address the over 100,000 New York City school
23 children that are homeless at some point during the
24 school year, the interrupted education of many young
25 people arriving from war zones, the deterioration of

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 public housing, and gentrification that produces
3 overcrowding and general economic distress in poorer
4 minority communities like East New York. Two, initial
5 teacher preparation in a school of education is not
6 like a one-time vaccination good for the rest of the
7 someone's career. At the completion of student
8 teaching, a graduate of a school of education program
9 is only a certified beginner. The problems described
10 in the call for this meeting, especially better
11 instruction for students with disabilities and
12 English language learners, means an investment in
13 ongoing teacher staff development and daily time set
14 aside for planning teams to coordinate how they will
15 address student learning needs. One teacher in a
16 classroom is not sufficient. New York City needs to
17 hire more teachers. New York State recommends but
18 does not mandate inclusion teachers with two teachers
19 in a classroom. Only specifically designated
20 classrooms with high numbers of students with
21 registered disabilities have an additional teacher.
22 Given the large number of struggling students in New
23 York City's schools, 15 percent are English language
24 learners, more than 20 percent of IEPs and many more
25 require 504 support, more than half score in the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 third to eighth grade less than satisfactory on math
3 and reading tests, almost every classroom needs a
4 second teacher whether students have certified
5 disabilities or not. Four, charter schools are not a
6 solution; they are a big part of the problem.
7 Charters are permitted to hire untrained, uncertified
8 people and call them teachers, undermining teacher
9 preparation and schools of education. The charter
10 chains run a peace corps type operation, recruiting
11 people from elite colleges, predominately white, who
12 want the New York City experience, who follow scripts
13 and then leave before they learn how to teach. Five,
14 high stakes multiple choice qualifying tests for
15 teacher certification do not improve the quality of
16 teaching, instead they block potentially excellent
17 minority candidates, especially people who were
18 English language learners themselves from the
19 teaching profession. Drop the tests. Let schools of
20 education prepare and evaluate candidates. Six,
21 politically connected alternative certification
22 programs like Teach for America and the Teaching
23 Fellows, are the Uber of education. They look good
24 until the consequences become clearer. They
25 circumvent efforts by the city and state officials to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 improve teacher preparation and many of the people
3 they put in classrooms are temps. And then last, if
4 New York City wants to increase the number of
5 minority educators, it will have to make teaching
6 more financially attractive for people from lower
7 income families. Provide opportunity scholarships and
8 forgivable loans for local high school graduates that
9 cover living expenses for college students who commit
10 to student... to teach in New York schools and
11 especially in high needs areas. When I student
12 taught, I had to go on food stamps. Salaries... I live
13 in the South Bronx and I student taught in the South
14 Bronx. Salaries must go up significantly. A one-
15 bedroom apartment in a less desirable area of
16 Brooklyn rents for 2,500 dollars a month, three...
17 30,000 dollars a year, more than half of a starting
18 teacher's salary. It will not be easy to address the
19 problems that your committee has called to our
20 attention. A useful start is to at least recognize
21 the depth of the difficulties and the cost of
22 potential solutions. Thank you very much.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you and our
24 final panelist. Oh, okay.

25 ALAN SINGER: Hear you go.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Not finalist,
3 next to final. And we... when, when it's your turn
4 we'll ask people to shift down so that you'll be able
5 to actually have a seat at the table.

6 TRINA LYNN YEARWOOD: Good afternoon
7 Council Woman Barron, thank you to both Committees on
8 Education and Higher Education for the opportunity to
9 present today. My name is Trina Yearwood, I am a
10 proud product of the New York City public schools, I
11 started my career as an educator, as the teacher...
12 English in the New York City public schools 20 years
13 ago, I've served the profession as a classroom
14 teacher, literacy coach, a teacher educator and I am
15 currently the Associate Dean of the School of
16 Education at Long Island University Brooklyn Campus.
17 Like Alan, even though I am here as the Associate
18 Dean I am representing my own views. As we know the
19 majority of the teacher workforce remains
20 predominately white, middle class and female although
21 US classrooms are becoming increasingly diverse.
22 While there are programs aimed at diversifying the
23 teacher workforce such as New York State Education
24 Department's Teacher Opportunity Corps grant and the
25 New York City Men Teach there must be intentional

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 efforts to diversify teacher education leadership and
3 faculty because the lack of diversity in classrooms
4 mirrors the lack of diversity in teacher education.

5 According to the 2017 American Association of
6 Colleges for Teacher Education, AACTE, colleges of
7 education report, 84 percent of deans are white and
8 the average dean of a college of education is a white
9 woman in her late 50s. Also, approximately 80 percent
10 of full-time teacher education faculty across ranks
11 are white. Across the nation districts and education
12 agencies are developing and implementing policies to
13 meet the needs of diverse students. In New York State
14 the Board of Regents recently introduced the
15 culturally responsive sustaining education framework
16 to ensure that our students have equitable and
17 inclusive learning experiences. Similarly, right here
18 in New York City the Department of Education's 2019
19 to 2020 comprehensive education plan seeks to focus
20 education around strengthening models of inclusion
21 and equity where all students can learn and thrive.
22 These initiatives are a good start but not enough. To
23 truly ensure that all students in New York City have
24 access to equitable learning experiences regardless
25 of race, ethnicity, socioeconomic status,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 orientation, disability, or zip code we must
3 diversify teacher education leadership and faculty
4 and earlier Council Member Treyger he mentioned his
5 desire in wishing that he had other opportunities
6 prior to entering the classroom and just now Alan
7 just talked about some of the issues that our
8 students face; homelessness, poverty, they are
9 immigrants, we need to have a diverse teaching
10 education faculty as well as leadership to ensure
11 that our candidates are being prepared from those
12 diverse backgrounds. Teacher preparation programs
13 prepare the next generation of teachers, if we are
14 truly to prepare teachers who are qualified to teach
15 all children then attention must be given to the
16 leadership and faculty of teacher preparation
17 programs to ensure they possess the critical
18 consciousness, racial awareness and cultural
19 competence that we expect of our teachers and our P12
20 students. I will close by adding, you know when I was
21 a... in a teacher preparation program I didn't have one
22 black faculty member and I did not learn about
23 culturally responsive pedagogy or culturally relevant
24 teaching until I was in a doc program and if we are
25 really, really committed to ensuring that all of our

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 students are receiving the education that they need
3 and that the teachers that are in front of them are
4 highly qualified to teach them we need to ensure that
5 we also consider diversifying the teacher education
6 faculty and leadership. Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you so much
8 and next panelist.

9 JENNIFER PANKOWSKI: Thank you very much
10 for the opportunity to testify. My name is Jennifer
11 Pankowski, I'm an Assistant Professor and Coordinator
12 of Special Education for Pace University in Lower
13 Manhattan. As a former city teacher of special
14 education and an individual with disabilities myself,
15 this call is particularly compelling. Advocacy in the
16 areas of inclusion for students with disabilities
17 have changed the landscape for how today's classrooms
18 function. Teacher education programs must adjust to
19 the means to meet the needs of the ever-changing
20 classroom dynamic. At Pace University, the commitment
21 in preparing every teacher to work with a diverse
22 student body is something we take very seriously. In
23 2015, Pace redeveloped its core coursework to address
24 inclusive education and supports for students with
25 disabilities in all of our major programs not just

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 those who are pursuing degrees in special education.

3 In addition students receive coursework and classroom
4 management and student autonomy, as well as

5 assessment courses which help prepare every single

6 teacher candidate to understand the special education

7 referral process, the continuum of services and how

8 to ensure every student is being well educated in the

9 least restrictive environment regardless of the

10 content area they will be teaching as a certified

11 teacher. We have also included the term inclusive

12 education in all of our programs and we have focused

13 our efforts in the area of TESOL, teaching English to

14 students of other language and language learning for

15 all programs as well with the inclusion of coursework

16 that is focused on early language development and

17 teaching reading to students with disabilities. As

18 someone with dyslexia myself, I can appreciate what

19 has been commented upon earlier that the key to

20 helping support these students lies in early language

21 development. Pace students have several language

22 courses in... and also a sensitivity to global

23 perspectives in all of their coursework. Another

24 opportunity is one of our faculty members recently

25 received a grant to help support individuals looking

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 to seek certification in TESOL and bilingual
3 education that is supported by the state because we
4 understand that that is a limitation for... of many
5 individuals in this area wanting to pursue degrees.
6 We also have strong partnerships in the Department of
7 Education through our director of school partners and
8 we have early intensive field experiences that are
9 scaffolded for both graduate and undergraduate
10 programs. For undergrads we start placing them in the
11 field in their sophomore year, one day per week and
12 that escalates until their senior year where they're
13 in the field every single day all day. And our
14 graduate program we have similar scaffoldings where
15 they begin observing in the classrooms from their
16 very first semester until they're in full time
17 student teaching in their second year or third year
18 depending on how intensive their program is meaning
19 how many classes they're taking at a time. Finally, I
20 wanted to address the concern of this committee with
21 regard to representing our students of color and our
22 teacher educators of color and diverse backgrounds. I
23 can recall when I first started at Pace six years
24 ago, the New York City Teaching Fellows had a subway
25 campaign and I continued to see that the fellows

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 represent our most diverse workforce. So, it's
3 important for us to look and see why they're
4 recruiting such a diverse group while in our
5 traditional settings they remain to be predominately
6 like myself, white, middle class, female. It is
7 important for us as institutions of higher education
8 to focus on how to support diverse teachers and
9 diverse teacher candidates by exploring what is
10 important to these candidates and where we can be
11 part of their lives. There are great programs like
12 Men Teach but I don't think they're widely enough
13 recruited for and advertised so I think that it's
14 important for us to continue to advertise these
15 programs to pursue a wider audience. Another thing
16 that is an interesting perspective on diversity in
17 the classroom is when I was a classroom teacher in
18 special education I noticed support staff was always
19 diverse, paraprofessionals always represented various
20 ages, races, religion and gender yet somehow that's
21 being lost with continuing to become full time
22 classroom teachers. So, I think that we need to
23 explore more supports for these individuals to
24 continue on to becoming fully certified teachers.
25 Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very
3 much all of you for your testimony. I do have
4 questions for you and if you could each answer them,
5 if you have the information that would be very
6 helpful. So, do you track your students after they
7 graduate and if you do what percent, I know one of
8 the panelist gave us the percentage of those that
9 remain in education fields but do you track your
10 graduates and if you do, do you know what percentage
11 of them remain in education either in the classroom
12 or education related fields and do you know what
13 percent go to New York DOE schools? So, if you go in
14 the same order then I'm trying to record it so that
15 I'll have it.

16 FRANK PIGNATOSI: We do, I don't have it
17 directly, so I'll have the... I'll... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
19 talk]

20 FRANK PIGNATOSI: ...check, check with our
21 research center and send it on.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, great.

23 JACOB EASLEY: I'll have to check as well
24 so I, I just... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
3 talk]

4 JACOB EASLEY: ...finished one year but I
5 do know from one report 80 percent of our... pretty
6 much 80 percent of our graduates are in DOE.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Are in DOE, okay.

8 KAREN DEMOSS: We have a recent
9 evaluation of Banks Street's historic programs and
10 we'll send that on to you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay.

12 AIMEE KATEMBO: We do not track all of
13 our grads, but we do track the teaching residents'
14 program which was the number that I gave... [cross-
15 talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right... [cross-
17 talk]

18 AIMEE KATEMBO: ...earlier and there's
19 roughly 97 percent.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay.

21 AIMEE KATEMBO: And it's all Department
22 of Ed schools.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Uh-huh...

24 JENNIFER PANKOWSKI: Sorry, do I have to
25 push this? We, we do track up to six years, I don't

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 have that information with me, but I can send a link
3 that's all... [cross-talk]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
5 talk]

6 JENNIFER PANKOWSKI: ...public information
7 because we're going through our CAEP Accreditation so
8 that's on the Pace School of Education website, but
9 we track program completers up to six years after
10 they leave us... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
12 talk]

13 JENNIFER PANKOWSKI: ...most of our
14 students in New York City go into the Department of
15 Education, we are a dual campus, our Pleasantville
16 campus has fewer students that are going into the
17 Department of Education but they also have students
18 that are going into areas like the Bronx in that
19 location.

20 TRINA LYNN YEARWOOD: We do not track but
21 the majority of our graduates go into the New York
22 City Department of Education.

23 ALAN SINGER: Given the tuition that they
24 pay they all stay in teaching, about 20 percent go
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 into New York City schools but Hofstra is on Long
3 Island.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay. Thank you
5 and what's the demographic breakdown, breakdown of
6 the teaching faculty at your institutions, someone
7 made reference to that towards the end so... and we
8 know that it's a problem in the DOE so at your
9 institution where teachers are being prepared to go
10 into inner city or... being prepared to go into
11 teaching situations, what percent of your
12 institution?

13 [off mic dialogue]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I don't think
15 your microphone is on.

16 JACOB EASLEY: Sorry.

17 FRANK PIGNATOSI: I'm so used to having a
18 loud voice that I don't...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes, it is but we
20 need to get it... [cross-talk]

21 FRANK PIGNATOSI: No, no and I'm hear...
22 [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...on the record...
24 [cross-talk]

25 FRANK PIGNATOSI: ...other... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yeah... [cross-
3 talk]

4 FRANK PIGNATOSI: We... just under 70
5 percent of our faculty like look as I do, are...
6 identify as white, we have... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And then in your
8 answer also tell me if your institution has any plans
9 or programs... [cross-talk]

10 FRANK PIGNATOSI: Yeah... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...to... [cross-talk]

12 FRANK PIGNATOSI: We, we made significant
13 I would say in the last five to ten years significant
14 changes, what keeps the number so high is that we... is
15 the lack of retirement so I can get you the exact
16 data but a much higher number of most recent hiring's
17 in the teacher education faculty and full time is
18 significantly not white compared to... but we still
19 have a large... older faculty that keeps that
20 percentage higher.

21 JACOB EASLEY: So, again I'm just
22 finishing my first year predominately white, I would
23 say in the single digits non-white... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
25 talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 JACOB EASLEY: ...but we do have a
3 strategic initiative so for each search committee the
4 committee has to be diverse racially and ethnically
5 that sometimes is a challenge because we often will
6 have faculty members or staff members from other
7 units on the committee and the pool of applicants who
8 are recommended to my office has to be diverse as
9 well so we have seen a shift in our staff staffing
10 lines but not so much faculty because we don't have
11 a, a high turnover rate of faculty.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay.

13 KAREN DEMOSS: At Banks Street the staff
14 and the students are primarily white and female, the
15 institution has a very robust racial... race and
16 culture... race, culture and equity orientation that...
17 actually we have a representative here who leads that
18 work across the institution in the school for
19 children, the graduate school and the, the Banks
20 Street Education Center and the school has increased
21 since the strategic planning effort for the 100th
22 year anniversary fund raising so that people can
23 afford to come to Banks Street from all sorts of
24 backgrounds.

25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 AIMEE KATEMBO: I would say that Teachers
3 College is very similar to NYU with our older faculty
4 members being predominately white but there's a great
5 deal of change now and we have more and more teacher
6 faculty members of color.

7 JENNIFER PANKOWSKI: At Pace we have a
8 fairly small full-time faculty, roughly 20
9 individuals, of that 75 percent make up our Caucasian
10 or white faculty, ten percent African American, five
11 percent middle eastern, five percent Asian and five
12 percent Hispanic. Like some of the other universities
13 we are seeing a strong shift here. Also, one of the
14 things that we're doing is recruiting a lot of our
15 diverse former students and inviting them in to
16 become adjunct faculty. Last year I had three African
17 American male former students that now are adjuncts
18 and they're teaching our graduate courses so we're
19 seeing a shift in that quicker than we are for full
20 time faculty primarily because of the small number of
21 people who hold that degree.

22 TRINA LYNN YEARWOOD: Of our full-time
23 faculty about 75 percent are white and.. [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: About what...
25 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 TRINA LYNN YEARWOOD: ...25... 75 percent are
3 white, 25 percent black and Latino.

4 ALAN SINGER: In, in the Hofstra
5 department of teaching or in technology one third of
6 the tenured full-time faculty are non-white.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: About one third
8 non-white, is that what you said?

9 ALAN SINGER: Non... one third is non-
10 white.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay and what
12 kind of efforts, do you know what kind of efforts are
13 being made to... [cross-talk]

14 ALAN SINGER: Made... well at, at this
15 point we, we haven't hired anybody in a couple of
16 years, the... look it depends on who's in charge, right
17 now I'm Chair of the Department, I put the priority
18 on people with long term teaching experience, I... a
19 lot of the adjuncts are people I taught with in, in
20 New York City schools and so we want people who work
21 in... to teach teachers who have worked in these
22 schools. Our major partnership district is Uniondale
23 which has a demographic very similar to Brooklyn
24 actually and so our, our students have significant
25 experience working with immigrant students, with

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 English language learners and working with African
3 American Caribbean students.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay and, and I
5 do have to say that when I went to Banks Street I did
6 get a partial scholarship at Banks Street and since I
7 went to a school that was in a high needs area I was
8 able to get the loan canceled each year that I worked
9 so I wound up not having to repay that in financial
10 terms and just finally, how would you... how would you
11 give me a breakdown if you can of how your
12 institution balances the, the Chair had talked about
13 pedagogy versus the content area, how would you say
14 your institution balances that out, the pedagogy
15 versus or compared to the content area?

16 FRANK PIGNATOSI: So, I think
17 traditionally we actually lean more towards the
18 pedagogy than the, the content, we've actually tried
19 to... in... again a most recent masters residency program
20 balance it out where each intern has two mentors, a
21 pedagogical directors who visit... who's regularly in
22 the schools and a content specific, I call them the
23 so what faculty, that every time they're studying
24 something tries to contextualize it to teaching in
25 that content and then the pedagogical faculty who's

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 in the schools supports that working with the schools
3 directly.

4 JACOB EASLEY: So, we're actually... this
5 is a good question because we, we are revamping all
6 of our curriculum since I arrived and we have the
7 model of leading and learning from practice which is
8 the integration of theory and practice and serving
9 with compassion and so actually this Friday we will
10 be doing the deep dive of looking at all of the
11 courses and, and what's in those courses according to
12 standards and, and... etcetera but our survey results
13 from clinical practice are pretty high in terms of
14 students feeling as though they're well prepared.
15 There... but we're still looking at those issues of... on
16 the faculty because I think faculty have also raised
17 that question of what is the, the talk between the
18 two that is not something necessarily is resting in
19 the hands of faculty but that we make it transparent
20 for our candidates as well.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Right, okay.

22 KAREN DEMOSS: All of Banks Street's
23 programs use what you probably remember, the
24 developmental interactive approach and in that kind
25 of work each student where he or she is whether

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 that's your graduate student or a student in your P12
3 school each student's developmental level becomes
4 part of the curriculum and the pedagogical
5 opportunity and need and so through reflective
6 practice, through trying to understand where a
7 particular student is, your graduate student because
8 it's only graduate programs at Bank Street or your
9 P12 student understanding how you interact with where
10 that person is in terms of where that person needs to
11 go is the framework for all of the... both content and
12 pedagogy work at Bank Street. I would say though; I
13 would defer to one of my faculty members if he or she
14 corrected me.

15 AIMEE KATEMBO: And at Teachers College
16 it's more pedagogy than content, each program differs
17 slightly with our teaching residency having the most
18 pedagogy out of all the programs.

19 JENNIFER PANKOWSKI: At Pace we're
20 negotiating both, a collaboration of content and
21 pedagogy. We are a... an accredited university and
22 we're preparing teachers to be state accredited so
23 it's important that we provide them with the content
24 but we're also very clinically rich program, we even
25 have opportunities for our graduate coursework to be

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 taught in the field at schools to have that
3 clinically rich experience while also negotiating the
4 content being important for the state exams.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, they.. all,
6 all of the institutions has got to meet those
7 standards to make sure the students are, are prepared
8 for the exams that's ultimately how we're going to
9 get there but... so would you... how would you present
10 the balance between them, is it.. were you saying
11 50/50 or you're going to say more one than... [cross-
12 talk]

13 JENNIFER PANKOWSKI: Percentage wise I
14 would say it's probably a one thirds, two thirds...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: One thirds..
16 [cross-talk]

17 JENNIFER PANKOWSKI: One third based on
18 content and two thirds based on pedagogy... [cross-
19 talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
21 talk]

22 JENNIFER PANKOWSKI: ...a lot of our
23 students are graduate students so they're receiving a
24 lot of the content in their bachelor's degree..
25 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay... [cross-
3 talk]

4 JENNIFER PANKOWSKI: ...however when they
5 need those supports, we offer workshops if we need to
6 fill in any missing components that they didn't
7 receive either in high school or in their bachelor's
8 degree prior to coming to us but it's very clinically
9 rich so pedagogy is incredibly important.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay.

11 TRINA LYNN YEARWOOD: Same thing, it's,
12 it's more focused on the pedagogy, most of our
13 students are graduate students as well, they are
14 required if they are deficient to, to make up those
15 credits in the content areas but there is mostly a
16 focus on pedagogy.

17 ALAN SINGER: We have a, a 37-credit
18 master's degree, 37 credits nine credits in social
19 studies or in any of the secondary areas focuses on
20 content but the other 28 credits is basically on
21 pedagogy. I'm the Chair of the Department but my
22 primary responsibility is secondary social studies.
23 One of the ways that we integrate pedagogy and
24 content is I do the field supervision for the student
25 teachers, I'm out in the schools with them and when

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 they're... they... most of their cooperating teachers are
3 my former students so there's a seamless presentation
4 and when I'm in the schools I also do demonstration
5 lessons with the middle school and high school kids
6 to show the preservice teachers how you translate
7 content and skills into classroom practice.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, thank you
9 so much, I appreciate... [cross-talk]

10 ALAN SINGER: Thank you... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I, I appreciate
12 your input and your staying and your patience and we
13 look forward to using this information as we go
14 forward, this is not just a panel to just say okay
15 this is what it is but to look to see how your
16 information can help us shape moving forward that we
17 can improve the teachers that are coming in, that
18 they're better qualified, more confident and
19 comfortable and say yes, this is where I want to be,
20 this is what I want to do. So, thank you so much.

21 AIMEE KATEMBO: Thank you...

22 ALAN SINGER: Thank you.

23 [off mic dialogue]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And we're going
25 to call our next panel. Our next panel is Thomas

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 Sheppard from District 11; Paullette Healy from
3 District Parent CCSE; Paula White, an educator from...
4 an educator for Excellence; Phillippa Bishop
5 Alexander from Equador... Educators for Excellence;
6 Rachel, I think that's Fisher, you can correct me
7 when you get up, E for E, Educators for Excellence
8 New York and Dan Gannon also Educators for
9 Excellence.

10 [off mic dialogue]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I'm going to ask
12 Mr. Sheppard to go first because I understand you've
13 got some young ones with you and we appreciate you
14 staying and if you can make your presentations in a
15 concise manner we would certainly be appreciative
16 because we still have another panel to come behind
17 you. Thank you, Mr. Sheppard, you want to begin? And
18 if you have to leave after you do that because of
19 your children we understand that.

20 THOMAS SHEPPARD: Good afternoon... [cross-
21 talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Good afternoon...
23 [cross-talk]

24 THOMAS SHEPPARD: I'd like to thank the
25 committee for offering me the opportunity to testify

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 before you. My name is Thomas Sheppard, and I'm a dad
3 of six children, three of which are current students
4 in New York City public schools. I am a parent member
5 of the district 11 Community Education Council and an
6 Education Advocate in the Bronx. As a parent, I've
7 been advocating of issues equal access to education
8 for families in my community for several years. Among
9 those is the issue of ensuring that all of our
10 schools and especially those in our most underserved
11 communities in the Bronx have access to highly
12 qualified teachers. Schools in the Bronx in general,
13 District 11 in particular have well over 90 percent
14 black and Latin X student populations. In District
15 11, our students and families represent cultures from
16 the Caribbean, central and South America, Africa, the
17 Middle East, Eastern Europe, Asia and various places
18 throughout the United States. With these cultures
19 come many different languages, customs and
20 traditions. But with the richness and diversity in
21 our community also comes some very big challenges.
22 The chief among those is poverty. Physical inequities
23 such as food, housing and economic insecurity;
24 underfunded and dilapidated schools and social
25 inequities such as the schools to prison pipelines

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 exist in part because of the lack of teacher
3 development in our community. For example, student
4 achievement is directly linked to curriculums that
5 educators are responsible for teaching to our
6 children. If educators are unprepared to teach that
7 curriculum to our children then student achievement
8 declines and the achievement, achievement gap widens.
9 The implementation of common core standards is a
10 prime example of this. Teachers were almost
11 completely unprepared to teach this curriculum to our
12 children and every measure of student achievement
13 reflected it. A priority.. a priority of Chancellor
14 Carranza is the implementation of a culturally
15 responsive and sustaining education for all New York
16 City public school students. A successful
17 implementation of this type of education model hinges
18 on teachers being prepared to teach it. and not in a
19 haphazard way, but in a deliberate and planned way
20 that includes giving our schools and teachers the
21 resources they need to do this in a way that does not
22 repeat the mistakes of the past. While this committee
23 cannot address all of the social and economic
24 barriers that exist in our community, it can address
25 the barriers that make it extremely difficult for our

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 children to receive the education they need to
3 transcend poverty and have a better life as adults.
4 Again, I want to thank the Committee for allowing me
5 the opportunity to testify and I will be happy to
6 answer any questions the Committee may have for me in
7 response to my statement.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, next
9 panelist.

10 PAULLETTE HEALY: Thank you. Thank you
11 very much for having this oversight hearing and
12 allowing parents to lend their voices to this
13 particular subject. Teacher preparation and training
14 is incredibly important... [cross-talk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Could you give us
16 your name for the record please.

17 PAULLETTE HEALY: I'm so sorry, my name
18 is Paullette Healy, I am a parent in District 20, my
19 son attends a District 75 school, my daughter attends
20 the Bay Ridge School of Arts in Bay Ridge and I am a
21 newly elected member of the Citywide Council for
22 Special Education. That being said I've learned a lot
23 just sitting at... as an audience member in this
24 meeting and hearing the amazing solutions that are
25 being presented. What I don't hear is any

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 accountability for administration or district leaders
3 to be held accountable for the same training that the
4 teachers are being held accountable for. You can give
5 every teacher who applies and goes into the program
6 the best training and the best certifications that
7 you could possibly give them but if the leader in the
8 schools are from a different mind frame and that is
9 the person who is steering the ship it can contradict
10 all of the training that these teachers are coming in
11 for and unfortunately in our district we are seeing
12 that, we are seeing the same type of disparity that
13 we're seeing in terms of our, our administrators are
14 not reflecting the, the demographics within their
15 schools, they are... they need more bias training than,
16 than the teachers do at this point and it's really
17 unfortunate. The state released two different reports
18 in the past two weeks, one in regard to recognition
19 schools and one in regard to IEP compliance and
20 District 20 was reflected in both. We had schools
21 that showed up in recognition which is for our gifted
22 and talented programs and the fact that we have a
23 very low opt out rate in our district but in terms of
24 IEP compliance we were one of the worst. The citywide
25 average is 24 percent and District 20 ranked at 38

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
HIGHER EDUCATION

1
2 percent non-compliance for IEP. So, this is a
3 reflection of where the district is putting their in...
4 their emphasis which is on gifted and talented
5 programs and they are failing our children with
6 special needs. That being said, our own experience
7 within our schools has been incredibly divisive, we
8 have a large air of community within our, our
9 demographics, we have a large Latin X community
10 within our school population and their needs are not
11 being addressed, there is no cultural diversity in
12 our school, we do not celebrate black history month,
13 we do not celebrate Hispanic heritage month, we have
14 schools that are literally three blocks away from us
15 that are so every school, their leader is being.. is
16 allowing to dictate the cultural references in their
17 schools and there should be some type of consistency
18 throughout our district. So, being that this emphasis
19 has been on making sure that our teachers are getting
20 the racial diversity trainings and the sensitivities
21 for not only cultural and racial and gender and IEPs,
22 but our administration and our district should be
23 held to the same standard as well. And thank you for
24 allowing me to speak.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, next
3 panelist.

4 PAULA L. WHITE: Good afternoon and thank
5 you Committee Chairs, I know one is in absentia,
6 Committee Chairs Treyger and Barron and the members
7 of the Committees on Education and Higher Education
8 for hearing my testimony today. My name is Paula L.
9 White, I am the Executive Director of Educators for
10 Excellence New York, we're an educator led teacher
11 advocacy organization with over 14,000 New York City
12 public school teachers as members. I know that
13 teacher preparation and training is one of many
14 issues that you are called to focus on but it is of
15 paramount importance to my work and to all educators.
16 As a former teacher myself and as a school
17 improvement leader I know that teachers want to get
18 teacher training right and I know that students need
19 us to get teacher training right. Teachers choose the
20 profession for the best of reasons and so we owe the
21 best to them in return. But so far that's not what
22 they've got and that is why over the last year E for
23 E New York Members came together to select teacher
24 preparation and professional development as the next
25 critical issues to address. A team of 23 educators

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 developed a series of recommendations and published a
3 paper which we have submitted for the record, ready
4 for day one and beyond on how the city and state can
5 ensure that all teachers entering our classrooms are
6 prepared and continually supported throughout their
7 career. The New York City Department of Education
8 hires approximately 6,500 new educators yearly, but
9 they overwhelmingly do not share the backgrounds of
10 the students that they are teaching. Eighty three
11 percent of the city's students are students of color
12 compared to 39 percent of teachers being teachers of
13 color, almost 20 percent of our students are students
14 with disabilities and the city's student population
15 is one of the most linguistically and
16 socioeconomically diverse in the country. New
17 educators are expected to meet the needs of these
18 students but in far too many instances inadequate
19 preparation and poorly designed field experiences
20 fail to equip them to do so. But it doesn't have to
21 be this way. When New York City and New York State
22 policy makers prioritize fixing these problems
23 educators will be ready for day one in the classroom.
24 Today, three educators for excellence New York
25 members will share their personal experiences that

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 underscore why the recommendations our members are
3 proposing are so critical for driving improvement.

4 Phillippa Bishop-Alexander, a middle school educator
5 in Brooklyn will tell you why the New York City

6 Department of Education must invest in partnering

7 with and incentivizing teacher preparation programs

8 to train more excellent teachers of color to work in

9 our schools. Rachel Fishkis, a high school English

10 teacher in the Bronx will share her experience in a

11 teacher residency program and how the expansion of

12 such programs will ensure that educators bring

13 extensive classroom experience to their first

14 official day leading a classroom. And finally, Dan

15 Gannon, a high school social studies educator in the

16 Bronx will talk about his experience preparing to

17 become an educator and how the city and state must

18 push for better results and support from teacher

19 preparation programs. These teacher's stories are not

20 unique, rather they serve to amplify the voices of

21 many in their profession who are not here with us

22 today. Our members February 2019 report, ready for

23 day one and beyond has been submitted to the

24 Committees for your consideration. We know what works

25 and we're here to help. As you move forward E for E

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 stands ready to provide additional testimony and
3 connection to educators in the field. Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

5 PHILLIPPA BISHOP-ALEXANDER: Good
6 afternoon.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Good afternoon.

8 PHILLIPPA BISHOP-ALEXANDER: And thank
9 you Committee Chairs Barron and Treyger and the
10 members of the Committee on Higher Education for
11 hearing my testimony today. My name is Phillippa
12 Bishop-Alexander, I am currently an educator in
13 Brooklyn, I'm here to highlight and elevate an issue
14 that teacher preparation programs can and must be a
15 part of the solution to the diversity of our city's
16 workforce. I moved to New York City as an immigrant
17 when I was 11 years old and I spent my time as a
18 seven... and now I've spent my time as a 17-year
19 veteran in the education field in the New York City
20 Department of Education. I'm proud to be both a
21 teacher and a product and a part of our public-school
22 system. When I moved to New York City I was alone
23 without the support of my parents, neither of my
24 parents knew how to read or write but they instilled
25 in me at a very young age the need for education. I

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 threw myself into learning, luckily, I had teachers,
3 coaches and counselors at my New York City public
4 school, I was fortunate enough to go to Wingate, I
5 was bussed across town because that was my choice
6 looking for a great opportunity. There were a dynamic
7 group of educators who showed me the beautiful
8 complexity and uniqueness of humanity, lessons that
9 couldn't be taught but came from knowing me as a
10 student more deeply. Unfortunately, in most of the
11 diverse cities in the world nearly all of the
12 teachers are white. The beautiful complexity of
13 humanity I learned in New York City public school was
14 missing a crucial aspect. I've studied in Japan, I've
15 studied in Synagogue, West Africa, I've been
16 fortunate enough to study across continents. Teachers
17 of color are needed in every classroom, teachers that
18 look like me and teachers that look like each and
19 every diverse student in our classroom. As I grow
20 older, I started questioning why the leadership in my
21 classrooms lacked the racial diversity that I know I
22 needed in my classroom as a student and now as an
23 educator. Those questions led me to become an
24 educator myself. As a veteran educator I now get to
25 see how having a diverse school staff impacts all

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 students. I've had the pleasure of working in the
3 Bronx for 14 years, two years in Brooklyn and heading
4 back to the DOE in the Bronx. When a teacher shares a
5 similar background to a student, they're able to
6 infuse that shared experience into the curriculum and
7 the learning experience we provide to students become
8 more powerful. Studies back this up, John Hopkins
9 found that the black students who have... who have just
10 one black teacher in elementary school makes them not
11 only significantly more likely to graduate high
12 school but also enroll in college. Despite these
13 advantages our city teachers work, workforce is only
14 39 percent teachers of color while our student
15 population is an incredible 83 percent students of
16 color. New York City can make a difference. Every
17 year New York State... New York State prepares nearly
18 10 percent of all-American educators and our city
19 recruits and hires thousands of new educators into
20 our schools, enough new educators to staff entire
21 school districts in our cities. I believe that if the
22 New York City Department of Education uses its power
23 as the largest employer of educators in America to
24 partner with teacher preparation programs that are
25 excellent and I have a teaching fellow's background

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 so I do support teacher preparation programs such as
3 the teaching fellows, in America to partner with
4 teacher preparation programs that are excellent at
5 not only recruiting and enrolling future educators of
6 color but also preparing them not just in the
7 beginning of their career but in the middle and at
8 the end to be the excellent educators the, the
9 statistics I shared with you would shift
10 dramatically. In New York City in the Department of
11 Education it sets the expectation that programs that
12 prepare educators to teach in New York City public
13 school have plans, strategies and a focus on
14 recruiting great teachers of color. We can begin to
15 close the educator racial diversity gap in New York
16 City and across the country and more little girls
17 like myself will have teachers at the front of their
18 classrooms who look like them. We have that power and
19 I believe it's time for us to make it a priority.
20 Thank you for listening to my testimony.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, next
22 panelist.

23 RACHEL FISHKIS: Good afternoon. Good
24 afternoon and thank you Committee Chairs Treyger and
25 Barron and the members of the Committees on Education

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 and Higher Education for hearing my testimony today.

3 My name is Rachel Fishkis and I am a high school

4 teacher in the Bronx. Today I'd like to talk about

5 how the city can ensure every educator is ready on

6 day one by promoting and growing teacher residency

7 programs. When I entered in 2015 as a full-time

8 instructional leader, I walked in with two years of

9 instructional experience under my belt. That was

10 thanks to my participation in the Blue Engine/RELAY

11 Graduate School of Education Residency Program, a

12 program that partners with the New York City

13 Department of Education to provide future educators

14 the experience of becoming an instructional leader

15 through real world, in schoolwork as an educator.

16 Traditional preparation programs place a heavy focus

17 on theoretical coursework that often feels

18 disconnected from the realities that teachers face

19 when they enter the classroom for the first time.

20 Despite this emphasis, Educators for Excellence New

21 York found in a survey of New York City educators

22 that only 29 percent reported feeling well prepared

23 to provide rigorous instruction as a first-year

24 educator. Furthermore, the vast majority of

25 preparation programs in the state of New York provide

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 limited classroom experience to future teachers and
3 that experience is often in classrooms that do not
4 reflect the range of socioeconomic, racial and
5 ability diversity that is typical in a New York City
6 public school. In the first year of my residency I
7 worked to support an experienced teacher and taught
8 full time as a small group instructor. I was able to
9 grow and continually receive feedback from excellent
10 educators at my school. In my second year, I
11 continued as a small group instructor but started
12 taking graduate school coursework and began lead
13 teaching certain classes. Like any good educator,
14 they were able to support me as I grew in
15 instructional confidence and gradually released me
16 into additional responsibilities as an educator. My
17 role in the classroom continued to grow, while still
18 being supported by a mentor who gave constant
19 feedback, until I was nearly a full-time classroom
20 teacher. My classroom was a classroom. From the first
21 day of my residency I was in classrooms and
22 supporting students with disabilities, students who
23 are learning English as a new language, and students
24 representing the incredible diversity of our city's
25 schools. On my first day as a full-time educator in

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 2015, I was neither shocked nor overwhelmed by the
3 complexities of teaching in New York City public
4 schools because I had two entire years of experience
5 that prepared me to be a successful classroom leader.
6 Throughout that first year, my colleagues were often
7 surprised to learn that I was a new teacher. This
8 doesn't seem like your first year, they would tell
9 me, because, thanks to my residency training, it
10 really wasn't. In our neighborhoods with the most
11 students of color and highest rates of poverty nearly
12 25 percent of educators have fewer than three years
13 of experience, compared to just 15 percent in
14 communities with more white, affluent students. That
15 means the teacher burnout and turnover in these
16 schools is a very real problem. Because of my
17 experience in a residency program, my first years in
18 the classroom were not spent on the exhausting
19 exercise of attempting to marry the pedagogical
20 theory provided by most preparation programs with the
21 realities of teaching. Instead, thanks to my
22 practical residency training, I was able to confront
23 the majority of the challenges of being a new teacher
24 and I was able to dodge the early career burnout that
25 afflicts so many of my more traditionally trained

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 peers. I am proud to say that, thanks to the solid
3 foundation provided by my residency experiences, next
4 year will be my sixth year at the same school and I
5 plan to continue teaching in the Bronx for as long as
6 possible. Because of New York City's size and number
7 of new teachers it hires each year, it can play a
8 significant role in financially investing in growing
9 and expanding teacher residency programs. By creating
10 in house programs or partnering with high quality
11 organizations, the New York Department of Education
12 can ensure that every new teacher walking into our
13 schools is ready on day one. Thank you for your
14 consideration and I look forward to partnering with
15 you to ensure that more educators are able to
16 experience the quality training I received in my
17 teacher residency.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, what
19 did you say was the name of the residency program?

20 RACHEL FISHKIS: It was the Blue
21 Engine/RELAY Graduate School of Education Program,
22 it's mostly through RELAY Graduate School of
23 Education.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, thank you,
25 next panelist.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 DANIEL GANNON: Good afternoon and thank
3 you Committee Chair Barron for hearing my testimony
4 today. My name is Daniel Gannon and I'm currently a
5 high school educator in the South Bronx. I would like
6 to speak with you today about the need to hold our
7 teacher preparation programs accountable for being
8 transparent and providing a high-quality education to
9 New York City's future educators. Our future teachers
10 and most importantly our future students deserve the
11 improvements I'm speaking to you about today. I was
12 trained as an educator in a graduate education
13 program based in Westchester County. At the time I
14 had no reason to doubt the quality of the preparation
15 I was receiving. I had just finished my undergrad
16 degree and chose to stay at my school because it
17 seemed good enough and would certify my in the field
18 I wished to teach, which was high school social
19 studies. It was only until well into the program that
20 I began to see some of its flaws. The program
21 included two portions of in classroom experience, a
22 two-week internship at a school and a 12-week formal
23 student teaching experience. Neither opportunity
24 provided me the chance to work extensively with a
25 diverse group of educators... students but what was

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 most disappointing was that half of my preparation
3 experience was spent in a classroom that did not
4 align with my certification area. Finally, when it
5 came time to search for a job the messaging from my
6 preparation program was explicitly, go cut your teeth
7 in the city for a few years and then come back to
8 Westchester. That was the extent of the job placement
9 support I received. Now, as a veteran teacher, I am
10 able to see how this sort of advice creates a system
11 where brand new teachers with minimal experience are
12 funneled to our most high need schools to merely
13 leave after two to three years and return to
14 classrooms that are coded as easier to educate.
15 Often, we look to schools to solve high teacher
16 turnover, but the reality is that the educators are
17 being embedded with the expectation that short stints
18 in high need schools is the norm before they even
19 step foot in a classroom. I rejected that advice and
20 continued to proudly work in the South Bronx nine
21 years later. My experience led me to joining the
22 Educators for Excellence New York educator led policy
23 team focused on improving teacher preparation. I
24 believe that New York City Department of Education
25 and the New York State Education Department must

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 require that preparation programs that prepare
3 teachers for our public schools be transparent with
4 the experience and outcomes they produce for
5 educators. Right now, in New York, an aspiring
6 educator has no access to any information about
7 teacher preparation program outcomes. There is no
8 public data about the demographics of program
9 participants, where and what type of school's
10 graduate end up teaching in, what their average
11 salaries are, what certification areas do educators
12 graduate and begin their career in, or how long their
13 graduates remain in education. All of these helpful
14 data points are easily accessible in New Jersey and
15 many other states, yet not in New York. With the
16 sunlight of additional preparation program
17 transparency, educators like myself can make informed
18 decisions about which preparation programs fit the
19 type of educator they wish to become. Ideally, I
20 could have selected a program that has real life
21 training experience, high rates of graduation and
22 placement in communities like the Bronx, ensuring
23 that I was ready on day one of my teaching careers to
24 help my students get the type of education they
25 rightfully deserve. Being a teacher is already an

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 extremely difficult job to do but improving our
3 preparation programs by becoming more forthcoming
4 with information about these programs should only
5 help educators start their careers on a strong
6 foundation and put the best prepared professionals in
7 front of our students on day one. Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you to the
9 panel, we appreciate your testimony and we hope that
10 we'll be able to come forth with some really
11 pertinent changes that will address the issues that
12 you brought and based on your experiences that you've
13 shared with us about how successful the residency
14 program was. Thank you so much, we do appreciate it.

15 THOMAS SHEPPARD: I have a quick question
16 and it's not like a question towards you, it's just
17 more like a, a statement, it's, it's funny that in
18 district 11 for example we have about 45 schools and
19 then 42 of them are like title one schools, right and
20 a condition for a school receiving title one funding
21 is that the teachers in those schools be highly
22 qualified not just certified but highly qualified and
23 I've been listening to testimony all day about this
24 revolving door of teachers and for me it just seems
25 like there's... we're not drawing a distinction between

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 teachers that are certified and teachers that are
3 highly qualified and in the Bronx for example when,
4 you know some schools have a quarter or more of their
5 teaching populations walk out of the door every year
6 and it just seems to me like we'll never have a
7 school full of highly qualified teachers and I just...
8 I'm trying to figure out in this where do we go to
9 make sure that whatever we put in place or however we
10 structure this addresses this in not just a, a sort
11 term way but in a long term sort of sustainable way
12 where we don't have to continue to revisit or
13 recreate the wheel.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I think a part of
15 that solution is what we've heard here today in terms
16 of being able to retain highly effective teachers,
17 not have teachers come in and do their introductory
18 teaching and then go off which means we've got to
19 make teaching a much more lucrative profession in
20 terms of the finances and be able to retain teachers
21 and yes in fact devise a way in which we can assign
22 highly effective teachers to those title one areas
23 which is in fact what they're supposed to have in
24 terms of making sure that they can boost their
25 student's performance. So, that's what we have to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 look at. Thank you. Thank you so much. And we're
3 going to call the next panel Denny Salas, Bronx
4 Better Learning Charter School; Penny Marzulli,
5 Prospect Charter Schools; Crystal McQueen-Taylor,
6 Uncommon Schools; Lori Podvesker, Include New York;
7 Maggie Moroff, Arise Coalition; Tasfia Rahman,
8 Coalition for Asian American Children and Families
9 and Gregory, Greg Waltman, G1 Quantum. This is our
10 last panel, yes and as I did with the previous panel,
11 I do ask that you be succinct in your presentation,
12 thank you so much.

13 [off mic dialogue]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you so much
15 and as I have been, I'll start with the panelist on
16 my right. Thank you.

17 DENNY SALAS: Good afternoon Chairman
18 Treyger, Chairman Barron and the rest of the
19 Committee members present here today. I'm Denny
20 Salas, Director of Public Relations and Development
21 for the Bronx Charter Schools for Better Learning
22 otherwise known as BBL and I'm pleased to be here
23 today to testify on teacher preparation and training.
24 BBL is a charter school located in city school
25 district 11 in the Northeast Bronx serving over 700,

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 750 students from Pre-K through fifth grade at our
3 two locations. For the 2015/16 school year, the
4 2016/17 school year and the 2017/18 school year, BBL
5 was recognized as reward school by the New York State
6 Education Department, which means we are a high
7 academic achievement school rated, rated among the
8 top 20 percent in the state for ELA and math
9 performance. Moreover, for this past school year, the
10 18/19 school year, we were recently identified as a
11 recognition school by the New York State Education
12 Department placing us among the top 12 percent of
13 elementary schools in New York State. Recognition
14 schools display high academic achievement,
15 significant student progress and strong graduation
16 rates. Our students' success and progress could never
17 be realized if our institution did not place a
18 premium on teacher preparation and training. At BBL,
19 we have a professional development staff comprised of
20 four individuals who spend around 50 hours a week on
21 development and training. In addition to our
22 professional development staff, we have ten academic
23 leaders comprised of teachers who excel in the
24 classroom, who serve as an extension of our
25 development team. We also have six consultants that

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 work with both our entire academic staff and
3 professional development team throughout the year.
4 During the course of the year, our principals,
5 professional development team and academic leaders
6 perform classroom observations that vary in frequency
7 depending on how long the individual teacher has been
8 with our school to, to determine... to... excuse me, to
9 determine if additional training and preparation are
10 needed. A newer teacher is typically observed weekly
11 by our professional development staff and four times
12 a year by our... by our principals. A teacher with over
13 five years of service at BBL are typically observed
14 on a bi-weekly basis by our professional development
15 staff and once a year by principals. If a teacher is
16 struggling in the classroom, our professional
17 development team and academic leaders work with the
18 teacher to determine where their area of improvement
19 lies. If it is a classroom management issue, our
20 academic leaders will assist the teacher in
21 developing better system and structures or help the
22 teacher create a behavior plan if it is in regard to
23 a disruptive student. If it is determined to be a
24 lesson execution and content knowledge issue, our
25 academic leaders and professional development team

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 will rearrange a teacher's schedule and work with
3 them to solidify their mastery of the subject matter.
4 In addition to the aforementioned, our professional
5 development team and academic leaders have weekly
6 lunch meetings and weekly after school meeting to
7 discuss any training and preparation needs. These
8 sessions are primarily used to solicit feedback from
9 our teachers on classroom performance and share best
10 practices. The bottom line is our school
11 administration and board of trustees will do whatever
12 we can to ensure our teachers are fully prepared and
13 ready to succeed in the classroom. We do this because
14 we know that it... that if our teachers are succeeding
15 then our students will succeed and that is what
16 matters most to us. Thank you for the opportunity to
17 provide this testimony to the committee and we hope
18 our City Council can extract information from schools
19 like ours and apply those successes to the schools..
20 district schools everywhere. The student, wherever
21 they are, deserve the best teachers and the best
22 educational instruction possible to reach their full
23 potential. I look forward to your questions.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you for
25 your testimony, next panelist.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 MAGGIE MOROFF: Good afternoon Council
3 Member Barron, thank you for sticking with us. I'm
4 Maggie Moroff, I'm the Coordinator of the Arise
5 Coalition. Our members... we have over... almost 40
6 organizational members and over 50 individual
7 members, have been working together for over ten
8 years to push for systemic changes to special ed here
9 improving the day to day experiences and long-term
10 outcomes for students with disabilities in New York
11 City public schools. I also happen to work as the
12 Special Education Policy Coordinator at Advocates for
13 Children but I'm here today on behalf of Arise and
14 I'm here to talk about the need to train and provide
15 ongoing support to public school teachers to prepare
16 them to give all students including those with
17 dyslexia and other disabilities appropriate, evidence
18 based literacy instruction grounded in the science of
19 reading. I am not going to read my entire testimony
20 but I'm going to give you some highlights from it
21 because ensuring that all students learn to read
22 needs to be one of the city's top educational
23 priorities, teachers need to be prepared with the
24 skills that they need in order to provide instruction
25 in phonemic awareness and phonics both of which as

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 Council... as Assembly Member Simon said before
3 research has definitely shown beneficial for all
4 students and absolutely necessary for students with
5 dyslexia. Students who can't read are going to
6 struggle in all academic areas beyond reading,
7 they're going to avoid reading and they're going to
8 fall quickly behind their peers who are reading on
9 grade, grade level. The further they fall behind the
10 more likely it is that they're going to leave school
11 unprepared for adult life. And far, far too many
12 students with and without specific literacy-based
13 disabilities are currently in danger of doing exactly
14 that. So, it's critical that we don't blame the
15 students or their disabilities. Again, as Assembly
16 Member Simon said before more often than not the
17 issue is that their teachers haven't been taught
18 effectively to teach the students the skills that
19 they need to learn to read. And the answer here is
20 pretty simple, teachers need the skills to teach
21 literacy across the spectrum of learners and across
22 grade levels and just as students aren't expected to
23 teach themselves neither should their teachers be
24 expected to figure it out for themselves. We suggest
25 that the city look at places like the teaching

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 fellows' program and teacher training programs at
3 CUNY where it can influence teacher preparation so
4 that teachers come to their classrooms better
5 prepared as we've heard from so many today. We also
6 suggest that the city consider creating paid
7 apprenticeships in literacy at the DOE. We support
8 the DOE's current efforts to improve literacy
9 instruction for students in early childhood grades
10 but we also remind everybody that we can't neglect
11 the students in third through 12th grades who still
12 struggle with foundational reading skills and most
13 often as I said before that's because they haven't
14 been given the proper instruction in the earlier
15 grades. Arise members are, are confident that with
16 adequate resources, with dedicated teacher
17 preparation and a strong commitment from all that
18 school staff won't be left alone to try to teach
19 their students to read, that students won't have to
20 struggle and their families won't need to turn to
21 private schools and to private tutors when and where
22 they can because they fear that their children are in
23 danger of leaving school not reading. Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you for
25 your testimony, our next panelist.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 LORI PODVESKER: Thank you Madame... sorry.

3 Thank you, Madame Chair, for holding this important
4 oversight hearing on teacher preparation and
5 training. My name is Lori Podvesker and I lead the
6 policy work for Include NYC. We testify today to
7 highlight the need for the city to better address the
8 gaps in teacher education programs and provide
9 ongoing training and support to all teachers,
10 paraprofessionals and substitutes so they are
11 adequately prepared to educate and assist the nearly
12 300,000 students with disabilities in New York City.
13 We believe there is a direct relationship between the
14 lack of formal education and continuing disability in
15 special education, professional development with the
16 inferior proficiency in graduation rates of students
17 with disabilities. Additionally, robust teacher
18 preparation and ongoing training would allow for the
19 integration of students with disabilities with their
20 general education peers supporting the least
21 restrictive environment for all students. According
22 to the American Community Survey, an annual survey
23 conducted by the US Census Bureau, the overall
24 percentage of people with disabilities in the United
25 States in 2016 was 12.8 percent yet over 20 percent

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 of the 1.1 million students in New York City public
3 schools are classified as students with disabilities.
4 We believe general education teachers may over refer
5 students for evaluation for special education
6 supports and services because teacher preparation
7 programs lack sufficient education on identifying the
8 basic characteristics of learning, behavioral and
9 cognitive disabilities and how to distinguish
10 students who may be falling behind for other reasons
11 such as limited English language skills. As a result
12 of the city's special education reform initiative
13 launched in 2012 to increase the time students with
14 disabilities spend in general education classrooms
15 more students with disabilities than ever before are
16 being educated in integrated co-teaching classrooms
17 in New York City. While we applaud this integration
18 in addition to adequate teacher preparation, general
19 education teachers also need ongoing professional
20 development on how to meet the academic and
21 environmental needs of students with diverse learning
22 styles, so they are able to support all students in
23 their classrooms. And again, this should include all
24 professionals working with our students including
25 paraprofessionals and substitute teachers in which

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 district 75 has the highest percentage of teachers
3 who are absent in the entire pool of teachers in the
4 city. Although ICT school placements have grown,
5 57,000 students with disabilities in New York City
6 still spend more than 40 percent of their school day
7 in self-contained classrooms in the most recent data
8 released to you folks from the Department of
9 Education. We believe more students with disabilities
10 could be educated in less restrictive environments if
11 teachers, paraprofessionals, and substitutes were
12 better prepared, prepared with additional curriculum
13 and behavioral training and support. As a result we
14 recommend that the Department of Education require
15 annual professional development and ongoing school
16 based support on basic characteristics of
17 disabilities especially learning, emotional,
18 intellectual, physical, ADHD and sensory processing
19 disorders, differentiated instruction, behavioral
20 supports, interventions and strategies, effective co-
21 teaching, value of inclusion and in creating an
22 inclusive school and classroom environment and how to
23 partner with parents in their child's education. I
24 was saying earlier how we could have submitted the
25 same testimony 20 years ago, ten years ago, 30 years

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 ago, these issues are ever green and just something
3 of note. Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, our
5 next panelist.

6 CRYSTAL MCQUEEN-TAYLOR: Good afternoon
7 Chairwoman Barron, thank you for sticking it out with
8 us and I appreciate the opportunity to offer
9 testimony on this important subject. My name is
10 Crystal McQueen-Taylor, I'm the Regional Senior
11 Director for Uncommon New York City. We operate 24 K-
12 12 public charter schools in Central Brooklyn in
13 school district 16, 17, 18, 19 and 23. I am also a
14 former New York City Department of Education teacher
15 and I was also for several years the Program Director
16 of the New York City Teaching Fellows Program that
17 has been talked about extensively today. So, this
18 topic of teacher education, teacher preparation has
19 been core to my entire professional career and its
20 core to the success of our schools and our students
21 and at every step in my career in education
22 regardless of program or role, regardless of it it's
23 a district school or a charter school an investment
24 in our teachers and their preparation is one of the
25 biggest commitments that we can make to our students.

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 There's countless research that shows the impact of
3 one high quality teacher and what they can do on our
4 student's long-term life outcomes. And too often
5 teacher preparation, the conversation about teacher
6 preparation is often focused on quantity, the number
7 of hours, the number of classes, the number of
8 sessions and not enough focus on quality, what are
9 actually teachers learning and what are they leaving
10 those sessions and trainings able to do the next day
11 in classrooms with students. And that does not only
12 happen in graduate programs or in outside
13 professional development but in the ongoing work of
14 being a teacher and getting feedback and continuing
15 to hone practice once in the classroom because
16 teaching is an ever evolving area of practice as you
17 know as you're a former teacher. So, at Uncommon
18 Schools we are obsessive about studying high quality
19 teaching practice. When there is a teacher who is
20 getting significant results we flock to that
21 teacher's classroom to study what they are doing
22 well, we record it, we try to codify it and actually
23 name the things that that teacher is actually doing
24 well that is having results with students and then
25 we're... we bottle it in a way and then we're able to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 then share and disseminate those practices with other
3 teachers through trainings and different professional
4 developments that we do throughout the year. Our
5 teachers receive about three weeks of professional
6 development regardless of where... whether they are
7 coming to our schools for the first time or they're
8 returning for their tenth year. Before they get into
9 the first day of school when students arrive and then
10 every single week teachers are continually receiving
11 training that is based on what is going on in
12 classrooms and in student work that week so wherever
13 we're seeing gaps in practice or in student learning
14 they are getting continued development on that every
15 single week so we're always helping our teachers to
16 hone their practice. And in addition to the work that
17 we're doing in our classrooms once teachers come to
18 our programs, to our schools, excuse me, we also have
19 specific programs in place to recruit more teachers
20 of color to join us in the classroom through our
21 summer teaching fellows program where we bring in
22 rising college seniors to do a summer of training
23 with us where they're able to go through professional
24 development and get some experience in the classroom
25 under the tutelage of a master teacher and at the end

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 of the summer they're able to get a conditional offer
3 to actually come back to teach once they graduate
4 from college if they had decided that is a pathway
5 that they want to pursue for their professional
6 career and that has led.. that has been a significant
7 factor in, in the increasing the diversity of our
8 teaching force where 52 percent of our teachers are
9 of color across our schools in New York City. So,
10 while we're extremely proud of the work that we're
11 doing within our schools, we, to serve our 9,000
12 students we also know that that's not enough and if
13 there are things that are going well inside of our
14 walls in terms of teacher preparation we think that
15 it's important and it's our responsibility as anybody
16 who has something good to share it. When I was
17 teaching often hear the saying that you should beg,
18 borrow and steal and we're trying to flip that on the
19 head to say that we should beg, borrow and just
20 share. So, over the past five years Uncommon Schools
21 has actually partnered with the Department of
22 Education particularly with the Office of District
23 Charter Partnerships and through several of our
24 neighboring district superintendents to come together
25 to offer professional development and training to

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 over 1,000 teachers over... in the past five years and
3 the things that we've come together to focus on are
4 not going to be of surprise because it's areas that
5 we're always trying to continue to improve for our
6 students. So, we've heard a lot about reading
7 instruction, we've focused on how to help our
8 emerging readers develop foundational reading
9 practices, how to get our middle, middle school
10 readers to closely comprehend text and how to
11 continually check for student understanding
12 throughout lessons. And these... the things that we
13 focus on they're not district or charter issues,
14 these are just issues that are important for us all
15 to work on for the benefit of all of our students.
16 And so, it is... I think it's critically to continue to
17 find opportunities regardless of where the practice
18 is coming from for us to come together as educators
19 in service of our students. Thank you for the
20 opportunity to speak on this issue.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you so
22 much, our next panelist.

23 TASFIA RAHMAN: Good afternoon, thank you
24 so much Council Member Barron for holding this
25 important hearing on the issue of teacher preparation

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 and training. My name is Tasfia Rahman and I'm a
3 Policy Coordinator at the Coalition for Asian
4 American Children and Families, I'm also speaking as
5 a former public education student, I'm a product of
6 the system and part of the Asian Pacific American
7 community specifically the Bangladesh community. CACF
8 is the nation's only pan Asian children and family's
9 advocacy organization and leads the fight for
10 improved and equitable policies, systems, funding and
11 services to support those in need. The Asian Pacific
12 American population comprises over 15 percent of New
13 York City, over 1.3 million people. Yet the needs of
14 the community are consistently overlooked,
15 misunderstood and uncounted, unaccounted. In...
16 concerning the education of our young people, we need
17 our teachers well trained and supported to help
18 immigrant youth who struggle with English language
19 proficiency, the pressures of the acculturation
20 process and the inadequate academic preparation.
21 Despite the Asian model minority myth Asian Pacific
22 American immigrant youth come from families that face
23 high rates of poverty, live in linguistic isolation
24 and lack the knowledge of available systems and
25 resources. In the New York City Department of

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 Education schools, one of every.. one of every five
3 APA students does not graduate from high school on
4 time or at all. Nearly two thirds of APA students in
5 New York City come from homes where languages other
6 than English are spoken. One of four English language
7 learner students are Asian Pacific American. Asian
8 Americans also have the highest rate of linguistic
9 isolation of any group in the city at 42 percent,
10 meaning that no one over the age 14 in the household
11 speaks English well. Forty percent of New York City
12 APA youth are not college ready upon graduation from
13 high school. So, with that in mind I, I highlight
14 three points of consideration. One, equip teachers
15 with the tools and techniques to better engage
16 immigrant students but also their immigrant parents
17 particularly parents of English language learners
18 slash multilingual learners. Many of our parents feel
19 unwelcome, uncomfortable and often embarrassed to be
20 in school spaces, I know mine were. As a result, they
21 are unable to be as involved in their children's
22 education even at the classroom level. Because of
23 their limited English proficiency, many parents
24 depend on the children themselves to navigate the
25 school system. We need to provide our teachers with

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 the knowledge, awareness and support to be more
3 inclusive of immigrant parents, especially those of
4 our ELL/MLL students. Two, provide more responsive
5 professional development in, in response to everyday
6 teacher and student needs rather than solely fill
7 compliance. Our students face... our teachers face new
8 challenges every day in the classroom that are not
9 often covered in standard professional development.
10 There are needs... there needs to be a way in which
11 teachers can receive training that is more relevant
12 to the unique academic issues our students may be
13 facing. Three, more training and support for
14 collaborative co-teaching. Our students especially
15 are English language learner and multilingual learner
16 students and students with disabilities, benefit from
17 having more than one teacher in the classroom.
18 However, if teachers are not supported and not given
19 enough time to even adequately prepare and coordinate
20 lesson plans between each other, our students do not
21 receive all the benefits of having multiple teachers.
22 Thank you so much for the opportunity to testify and
23 we look forward to working with City Council to
24 ensure that our educators have the training and
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 resources necessary to prepare and support our
3 immigrant youth.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you for
5 your testimony, next panelist.

6 GREG WALTMAN: Chair Barron and general
7 council, Greg Waltman representing the Clean Energy
8 Company. My family is all teachers and in New York
9 State city and just speaking, you know kind of in, in
10 lockstep with my colleagues here it, it seems that
11 the, the problem with newer teachers and assimilating
12 them into needs schools it... is, is one of creating
13 opportunity whether it be monetary or financially
14 based incentives to keep, you know and retain
15 teachers not, not just teachers to get... you know get,
16 get, get to tenure and then allow for different types
17 of financial based incentives to create exceptional
18 faculty and staff and again creating pilot programs
19 to retain the type of talent necessary would be
20 another fiscal and budgetary concern of the Council
21 and again we remain steadfast in yesterday's comments
22 pertaining to asset origination pertaining to solar
23 contracts, private and partner... excuse me, private
24 and public partnerships to create the type of fiscal
25

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH COMMITTEE ON
1 HIGHER EDUCATION

2 opportunity for those types of pilot programs to
3 become accessible. So, with that I thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you and
5 you're the troopers that stayed here and hung in and
6 gave us your testimony, we do appreciate your
7 presentation and you can be dismissed, thank you so
8 much and with that there being no other indicators of
9 testimony to be giving, this hearing is adjourned,
10 what is the time, 5:37.

11 [gavel]

12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

July 11, 2019