

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

December 10, 2013  
Start: 2:18 p.m.  
Recess: 3:01 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway  
Committee Rm, 16th Fl.

B E F O R E:  
LEROY G. COMRIE, JR.  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Maria del Carmen Arroyo  
Charles Barron  
Inez E. Dickens  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
Sara M. Gonzalez  
Robert Jackson  
Jessica S. Lappin  
Rosie Mendez  
Annabel Palma  
Diana Reyna  
Joel Rivera  
Albert Vann  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark S. Weprin  
Jumaane D. Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Vincent M. Ignizio

Peter A. Koo

Ruben Wills

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

3

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay, quiet please.  
We are ready to start the meeting. Good afternoon.  
I'm Leroy Comrie. This is the full Land Use  
Committee for December 10th, 2013. We're joined by  
Council Member Al Vann from Brooklyn, Robert  
Jackson from Manhattan, Jessica Lapin from  
Manhattan, Mark Weprin from Queens, Jumaane  
Williams from Brooklyn, Stephen Levin from  
Brooklyn, Inez Dickens from Manhattan, Charles  
Barron from Brooklyn, Rosie Mendez from Manhattan,  
Diana Reyna from Brooklyn and Queens. I like  
claiming the Queens part. Annabel Palma from the  
Bronx, Joel Rivera from the Bronx, Fernando Cabrera  
from the Bronx, and Maria del Carmen Arroyo from  
the Bronx, and Peter Koo. We have a quorum, we  
have a meeting. I have to run through the items.  
If we can just have some attention. We have a few  
items to be spoken about. In Queens, we're  
starting with a rezoning then known as the Ozone  
Park rezoning encompasses Councilman Ulrich and  
Rose's districts, Community Boards 9 and 10. It's  
Item Number C 140079 ZMQ, is to rezone all or  
portions of approximately 530 blocks in Ozone Park  
encompassing portions of Community Boards 9 and 10

1  
2 in the borough of Queens. We have a sidewalk cafe  
3 in Speaker Quinn's district, Land Use Number 975,  
4 known as Le Pain Quitidien in Manhattan Community  
5 Board 2, Item Number 20145095 TCM which is to  
6 continue to operate a sidewalk cafe. Land Use  
7 Numbers 951 through 953 are related. It's in  
8 Council Member Reyna's districts. Sorry, if you  
9 can... we need to read this into the record so if  
10 members can please curtail their excitement about  
11 the holidays. It's in Brooklyn Community Board 4,  
12 Item Number C 080322 ZMK. It's an amendment for  
13 the zoning map. It's an amendment of the zoning  
14 resolution and a text amendment and an amendment to  
15 the city map all involving the Rheingold Project  
16 known in the Bushwick area. We are laying all the  
17 Item Numbers 961 through 963 which are related  
18 dealing with Council Member Levin's project, 77  
19 Commercial Street. We are then... Page 10, we're  
20 working on Land Use Numbers 964 through 967 which  
21 are related, all dealing with the Kingsbridge  
22 National Ice Center in Council Member Cabrera's  
23 district, Bronx Community Board 7, Item Number C  
24 140035 ZSX, C 1400 ZMX, and 140034 ZRX, and C  
25 140036 PPX, all dealing with the disposition of

1  
2 city-owned property, the amendment to the zoning  
3 map, the amendment of zoning resolution and the  
4 granting of a special permit, all related to the  
5 new plan for the Kingsbridge National Ice Center in  
6 the Bronx. And we have Land Use Numbers 9731  
7 through 974990 which are related, back with Council  
8 Member Steve Levin. It's known as Greenpoint  
9 Landing in Brooklyn Community Board 1, Item Number  
10 C 140019 HAK, Item Number N 140028 ZRK, Item Number  
11 N 140022 ZAX. It's an amendment to the zoning  
12 resolution, an HPD application, and a... what is  
13 another one? Oh, sorry, test one, two, sorry.  
14 And, oh, sorry, oh there's more. And then two  
15 other item numbers related to this application, N  
16 140020 ZAK, amendment to the zoning resolution and  
17 a new school, 20145125 SEK to site a 640-seat  
18 primary intermediate school within this area in  
19 Greenpoint Landing, all within Council Member  
20 Levin's district. Then we have in the Speaker's  
21 district, Land Use Item Number 998 known as Fulton  
22 Housing. It's an amendment to the zoning map in  
23 Manhattan Community Board 4, C 140001 ZMM. Then in  
24 Council Member Reyna's district, we have a UDAPP  
25 project, Land Use Number 991, 503 Onderdonk. I

1 never say that right, Onderdonk, how do you say  
2 that, Council Member Reyna, Onderdonk? Onderdonk  
3 Avenue right off Woodhaven Boulevard in Queens  
4 Community Board 5, Item Number 20145166 HAQ. It's  
5 for property at 503 Onderdonk Avenue. And finally  
6 we have in Council Member Wills' district, Land Use  
7 Number 992, 154-11 118th Avenue. It's a real  
8 property tax exemption in Queens Community Board  
9 12, Item Number 20145167 HAQ. That is everything  
10 on today's agendas. I'll ask the council members  
11 in the affective projects if they have any  
12 statements. Council Member Cabrera, Council Member  
13 Reyna, Council Member Levin. Ladies first. The  
14 projects have been fully vetted in the subcommittee  
15 meetings. I want to thank all of the subcommittee  
16 chairs for having thorough and complete hearings.  
17 I want to thank all of the members that were  
18 involved in working with the members that have  
19 negotiated the various projects, and if we can have  
20 some quiet so that Council Member Reyna, Levin and  
21 Cabrera can say a few words?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you very  
23 much, Mr. Chair. I just wanted to take this  
24 opportunity to thank our subcommittee chair on  
25

1  
2 Zoning Mark Weprin who has done a tremendous job  
3 just trying to juggle so many applications. If I  
4 can have quiet in the room? The Zoning and  
5 Franchise Subcommittee today has approved a private  
6 UDAPP application submitted by Read Property Group.  
7 This proposal rezones what would be the remaining  
8 land of what was once known as the Rheingold  
9 Brewery in Bushwick Brooklyn where Bushwick was  
10 known as the epitome of brewers. Over the past  
11 several months, during the public review process  
12 and many community meetings, Read has demonstrated  
13 that they are committed to responsible development,  
14 comprehensive planning, and community engagement.  
15 I am proud and very excited to see that with the  
16 collaboration of community stakeholders we were  
17 able to work with the developers to understand the  
18 importance of the different concerns that were  
19 raised including and not limited to the integration  
20 and permanent affordable housing throughout the  
21 project of its market rate. Total units being  
22 built for affordable housing will be 30 percent.  
23 Local hiring commitments for both construction and  
24 building operation and maintenance; minority and  
25 women-owned business enterprise and LBE local

1 business enterprise goals for construction  
2 contracts; investments in the neighboring public  
3 elementary schools and public park, support and  
4 tenant services and senior services; community  
5 facility space available for free of charge to the  
6 public. There's also concerns about parking and  
7 traffic mitigation issues that will be resolved as  
8 the construction and development of the housing  
9 along with its parking will be set aside for  
10 homeowners that have raised those concerns for a  
11 first come, first serve of any leftover spaces, and  
12 this rezoning represents what would be in the best  
13 interest of our district and community working  
14 together to achieve these many areas of interest  
15 that were at first concerns have now been resolved,  
16 and I want to thank the members of this committee  
17 and ask and urge you to vote in support of this  
18 UDAPP. Few communities know the impact that  
19 unchecked development can have on our working  
20 families no better than my own, and today we are  
21 proud in collaboration with Read and community  
22 stakeholders to have a terrific example of  
23 development that is fair and accountable to people.  
24 I want to thank my staff, Malcolm Sanborn Hamm  
25



1  
2 [phonetic] as well as my staff member working on  
3 this project and Bushwick representative Kevin  
4 Worthington. I could not have had better staff  
5 representing this project as well as the team of  
6 consultants and lawyers who all spent to the very  
7 last second on this project on making sure they  
8 understood we were holding our ground on making  
9 sure that our community's interest was of first  
10 priority. I'd like to thank Ed Wallace and  
11 Jennifer and Mitch Corby and John Masolino  
12 [phonetic], and with that I turn it over to you,  
13 Mr. Chair.

14 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Thank you. Council  
15 Member Cabrera said he would speak on the floor  
16 about his project, and he has to speak also to  
17 pre-stated Council Member Levin.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Mr.  
19 Chairman. Being that I've already made everybody  
20 late already today I'll refrain from remarks that I  
21 did comment in the Subcommittee hearing, but I  
22 neglected to acknowledge my staff who's worked so  
23 hard on this project, Ashley Thompson, my Chief of  
24 Staff, and Robbie Mino [phonetic], my legislative  
25 director. Thank you.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Seeing no others that wish to speak, then I would recommend a yes vote on everything on today's Land Use calendar, reminding members that the last Subcommittees will be December 16th for Landmarks and Planning and December 17th for Zoning, remembering that the last stated meeting for this council will be December 19th. So, with that I would recommend an aye vote on everything on today's calendar and I would ask the clerk, Bill Martin, to call the roll.

COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk. Roll call vote, Committee on Land Use. Council Member Comrie.

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rivera.

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Reyna.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: May I be excused to explain my vote? Mr. Chair... Mr. Chair, would you stop the disrespect occurring behind my back

1  
2 here? I'm a very sensitive person. This bothers  
3 me.

4 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: I understand, I  
5 understand. I feel your pain. They have been  
6 acting up all day. [Interpose]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: My feelings are  
8 being hurt, especially this one back here. And I  
9 was a Black Panther so I might resolve to my  
10 Panther days if I get that upset. [Interpose] My  
11 colleagues, in all due seriousness, I am going to  
12 explain my vote. If you all would stop talking  
13 then I can talk. I'm voting no on 972, 973, 974,  
14 990 Greenpoint. I think the Council Member did a  
15 good job to get as much affordability as he could,  
16 but I have difficulties of voting for a project  
17 that has a percentage of the housing at 125 percent  
18 of the AMI which holds a \$100,000 income. I have  
19 very, very problems with that when the area median  
20 income for that area is \$35,000. So, that's how  
21 our neighborhoods gradually get gentrified. So  
22 that's 971, 972, 973, 974, 990. On Rheingold, I  
23 think you did a good job getting 30 percent, but  
24 that means 70 percent is market, 70 percent is  
25 going to be an extremely high AMI in another area

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

where the AMI is very low, and then as far as Kingsbridge is concerned, really that's too much skating. Nine arenas, no Black and Latino people skate that much. We don't even have... we don't even have... we don't have even that many in hockey so, you know, they can learn with four arenas or five arenas, but on a serious note some community activists would have preferred a more sports complex other than just skating rinks, and I hope in the 52,000 square feet you have left that you put the hip-hop museum in that area. That would be a good idea, but that's just a little bit too much ice skating in an area that could use other things other than skating. Five arenas and some other kinds of things would be good so I vote no on 964, 965, 966 and 967, and for Rheingold, no on 951, 952, 953. Thank you very much. And aye on all the rest. All that's left, all of it, aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Jackson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vann.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Mr. Chair,  
permission to explain my vote?

CHAIRPERSON VACCA: So ordered.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: I'm going to  
vote aye on all, but just so that Council Member  
Barron would understand that Brooklyn may not be  
reigning any longer in the affordable housing  
department. That Harlem still retains its crown,  
so I want to commend Council Member Cabrera. I  
think it's a great thing. We had an opportunity a  
few years ago on it and we turned it down then and  
I'm glad we're not turning it down this time. So I  
just thought I'd remind Council Member Barron of  
that. Thank you. And I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lappin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of 18 in the affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions, all items have been adopted with the exception of the following Land Use Items 951 through 953, Land Use Items 964 through 967, and Land Use Items 971 through 974 and Land Use Item 990 have been adopted by a vote of 17 in the affirmative, one in the negative and no abstentions.

CHAIRPERSON VACCA: Sergeant of Arms, quiet please. Quiet please, we need to restart the tape. It's started, thank you. We're going to

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

adjourn the meeting but we're going to hold the roll open for 15 minutes because we know a couple of members are on their way with all of the ebb and flow that is going on today. We want to give them an opportunity to get here. So the meeting for December 10th, Land Use Committee 2013 is hereby adjourned.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Continuation roll call, Committee on Land Use. Council Member Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Final vote, Committee on Land Use. All Items have been adopted by a vote of 19 in the affirmative, zero in the negative, and no abstentions, with the exception of the following Land Use Items, LUs 951, 952, 953, 964, 965, 966, 967, 971, 972, 973, 974 and 990 have been adopted by a vote of 17 in the affirmative, one in the negative and no abstentions. Thank you.  
Correction. Those items have been adopted by a vote of 18 in the affirmative, one in the negative, and no abstentions.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 27, 2013