



**Citywide Administrative
Services**

Good morning Chair Miller and members of the Civil Service & Labor Committee. I am Lisette Camilo, Commissioner of the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) and I am joined today by Dawn Pinnock, Deputy Commissioner for Human Capital.

Thank you for this opportunity to discuss DCAS' role in the oversight and administration of civil service for the City of New York.

As you know, I was appointed Commissioner of DCAS in January of this year. During my two-month tenure, I have come to realize that the administration of the City's civil service system is one of the most important, complex and challenging aspects of DCAS' mission, as well as one of the most visible. With multiple stakeholders, we strive to provide a level playing field for New York City's workforce, meet the business needs of City government and ensure compliance with State and local laws. We are committed to ensuring that the City's workforce is diverse and inclusive, and that all communities are offered opportunities to apply for civil service jobs. For these reasons, it is critical that we operate the civil service system competently, fairly and expeditiously. In the de Blasio Administration and in partnership with other City agencies, elected officials, unions and community constituencies, we have made significant inroads to accomplishing these multiple goals while making the system more user friendly. Through the

efforts of our Human Capital line of service, DCAS will continue to work diligently to introduce system improvements, strengthen collaborative partnerships, and reduce the provisional workforce as required, all while we keep New York City working. As the new Commissioner, I am working with my team to review and recalibrate current plans to make civil service even more efficient, effective and accessible. I look forward to sharing some of these new strategies with the City Council in the near future.

Civil Service Administration Enhancements

Core to Human Capital's work to enhance the administration of the civil service system is to improve service delivery to current and prospective municipal employees and client agencies. Through our commitment to increase automation and create greater access and transparency, service delivery enhancement has and will continue to have a significant impact on increasing employment and permanent status opportunities.

Increased Automation

Starting in August 2015, candidates for all computer-based multiple-choice tests and many paper-based multiple-choice tests were able to submit their protests via computer for the first time. While the protest period serves as a critical phase in the exam administration process, depending on the nature and scale of the exam, the time involved with the submission and review of protests has been historically lengthy. With this new technology, protests submitted electronically are

automatically collated, which allows the Test Validation Board (TVB) to meet sooner and final answer keys to be developed more expeditiously.

Another automated enhancement was implemented in October 2015, with the addition of the scheduling feature to the online application system. This new, customer-friendly functionality allows candidates to apply for and schedule themselves for the many computer-based exams that are administered at the CTACs on a regular basis. The previous walk-in model, which was “first come, first-served,” has been replaced. Now, the new self-scheduling feature allows candidates to guarantee themselves a seat in advance, thus eliminating the need for candidates to stand in long lines hoping to secure a test seat. Through the development of these two technology enhancements, we are expediting the time from exam administration to list establishment. Viable lists will be more readily available so agencies can hire permanent civil service employees where there is a hiring need.

Greater Access and Transparency

Other key tenets intrinsic to our oversight strategy are improved access and greater transparency to foster a fair and equitable civil service system. Toward that end, DCAS is creating a civil service “footprint” throughout the City with an emphasis on historically underrepresented communities. Our “footprint” is reflected in our increased capacity to administer examinations and to share

information with the public about the civil service system and the myriad of career opportunities available in the City.

With support from the City Council and other partners, DCAS received funding to expand seating capacity at our existing CTACs located in Manhattan and Brooklyn. The expansion of these sites increases our testing capacity from 213 to 378 candidates per session – an increase of 77% per session. We also received funding to establish a new Queens CTAC which will add another 153 seats this fall; increasing our overall testing capacity by almost 150%. Work is also underway to finalize plans for CTACs in the Bronx and Staten Island.

Access to civil service information has also increased as a result of DCAS' establishment of the Office of Citywide Recruitment in May of 2015. The Office of Citywide Recruitment provides current and prospective employees with the tools they need to successfully navigate the civil service system. Using workforce data including, but not limited to, gender and ethnic distribution across job categories, retirement eligibility and attrition, the Office targets its outreach to historically underserved and underrepresented populations in New York City. The Office has collaborated with community-based organizations, elected officials, and academic institutions to provide information sessions covering the history of civil service, eligibility and application requirements for City employment, and upcoming civil service exams.

Human Capital has also made information more accessible to Agency Personnel Officers -- the City's Human Resources community. Agency Personnel Officers and their teams are charged with making hiring decisions at the agency-level and play a critical role in civil service compliance and workforce planning. In our role as the City's oversight with respect to civil service and policy, we believe it is incumbent upon us to provide HR professionals with clear and accurate information to support their work. We have developed and conducted mandatory training programs covering the civil service and examination processes and developed guidelines for the civil service list call process. We have also redesigned and launched a human resources portal, which serves as a forum for human resources professionals to receive policy guidance and access to articles on best practices.

Review of the Provisional Reduction Plan Extension

In August 2014, the State Legislature approved a two-year extension, expiring at the end of this calendar year, to further reduce provisionals. In October 2014, DCAS filed a proposed *Provisional Reduction Plan Extension* with the New York State Civil Service Commission. The *Plan Extension*, which was drafted with input from various external stakeholders, set out to address up to 8,600 provisional appointments through competitive examination and the evaluation of titles with 20 or fewer incumbents for potential reclassification. As required by the State, we submit status reports every four months on the number of provisional employees, and share this information on our website.

Current Status

At the beginning of the *Plan Extension*, there were 22,954 provisionals serving across the City. As we have executed elements of the *Plan Extension*, we have experienced both successes and setbacks. We were successful in reducing the number of provisionals to a low of 21,416 in December 2014. Despite our efforts, there has been a slight uptick in the overall number of provisionals. Over the last two years, the provisional count has grown by 98 to 23,052, since October of 2014, as vacant positions have been backfilled and new roles have been created to support citywide programming initiatives.

Creating More Permanent Status Career Opportunities

The Human Capital line of service is continuously balancing multiple – and at times competing -- goals and priorities. Nowhere is this manifested more than in the implementation and enforcement of the Long Beach mandate. Due to our enforcement role, we are clear that every decision we make has an operational impact. Therefore, we have applied a multi-faceted, solutions-oriented strategy to generate permanent status attainment opportunities while allowing agency flexibility in meeting their workforce needs. Thus far, our implementation plan has focused on examinations, enforcement and reclassification.

Examinations

Over the course of the *Plan Extension* rollout, provisional reduction has primarily been achieved through an aggressive examination schedule that targets titles with

a large number of provisionals and by maintaining the momentum necessary to ensure that many titles continue to have zero or very few provisional appointees. Over the course of the extension, we have administered 290 exams, which represent a record high for this agency. At the beginning of the *Plan Extension*, there were 7,044 provisionals in 37 titles. Through the administration of 25 out of the 37 exams to date, as of February 29, 2016, we have 5,602 provisionals in the same titles; a decrease of 1,442 provisionals. Through the certification of lists and the administration of exams slated for the remainder of 2016, we will address another 5,233 provisional appointments by the end of the extension.

Through our continuous administration of exams, we have been able to significantly limit provisional hiring in many titles across the City, including titles such as Staff Analyst, Associate Staff Analyst and Principal Administrative Associate. Besides administering exams to address provisional hiring, DCAS is also responsible for the administration of exams for other titles critical to City operations, such as our February 2015 administration of the Sanitation Worker exam to over 78,000 candidates, and our multi-month administration of the Correction Officer exam.

Enforcement

To ensure compliance with civil service law and to limit provisional hiring and retention, DCAS works closely with client agencies. We recognize that the City has a host of moving parts and must maintain operations while sustaining

compliance with civil service law. For example, when an agency has a vacancy in a job title where an exam has already been given but a list has not yet been established, we have instructed agencies to state on the job posting that the vacancy can only be filled by a candidate that has already taken the civil service exam in that title or someone with permanent status in the title. By doing so, the City and our client agencies are effectively balancing the daily needs of the City workforce and civil service law. In addition, each month, we send the Deputy Mayors and agencies a report listing their provisionals serving in titles with existing civil service lists and require agencies to submit plans with timeframes to address the situation.

Reclassification

Another component of the *Plan Extension*, reclassification provides DCAS with an opportunity to appropriately streamline the City's title structure to a manageable number of competitive class titles for which we can administer regular exams.

At the beginning of the *Plan Extension*, we identified 389 titles that had 20 or fewer employees. We reviewed the titles and made an initial determination as to whether the titles should be competitively tested for, consolidated or broad banded into another title, earmarked for present incumbents only and deleted when vacant, or classified outside of the competitive class. In our last report submitted to the State on December 31, 2015, we finalized our work on five of these titles. The titles of Steam Fitter and Supervisor Steam Fitter were deemed by Human Capital to

require competitive examination and are tentatively scheduled for FY17. For two other titles, Marine Electronics Technician and Port Marine Engineer, our reclassification proposal was approved by the State Civil Service Commission at their September 15, 2015 meeting. Finally, for the titles of Supervisor of Bridge Operations and Bridge Operator, we consolidated the two titles into one title with four assignment levels. While at first glance, this appears to only affect five titles with few incumbents, this also represents a decrease in titles for which we need to develop examinations.

Administration Challenges

While the *Plan Extension* has merit and has realized initial results, it does have its limitations because it does not account for many external factors. The City is faced with a number of operational challenges that it must meet on a daily basis. The City continues to hire to address the fulfillment of mandates and new priorities. Therefore, when an agency needs to meet an operational need and there is not a certified list for the appropriate title and/or an exam has not yet been scheduled for the title, agencies have no choice but to hire provisionally.

Conclusion

I would like to thank the Council for the opportunity to testify today and for their support over the last eighteen months. I know that there are challenges ahead but I firmly believe that with your support, DCAS will continue to build on its successes and deliver on the goal of administering a civil service system that is fair, accessible and equitable for all New Yorkers.

**Testimony of
Gerald Brown, Second Vice-President
New York Administrative Employees**

Local 1180

**Communications Workers of America, AFLCIO;
to the New York City Civil Service and Labor Committee**

March 30th, 2016.

Regarding the New York City

Department of City-wide Administrative Services

methods and means to reduce the number of provisionals.



Good afternoon, Chairman Miller and members of the Civil Service and Labor Committee. My name is Gerald Brown, Second Vice President of New York Administrative Employees Local 1180 of the Communications Workers of America, AFLCIO representing over nearly 9,000 workers of which approximately 8,500 are civil servants working for the City of New York and it's affiliated public employers. I am testifying today on behalf of Local 1180's President Arthur Cheliotas who had a scheduling conflict.

Local 1180 strongly believes that the Commissioner of DCAS must use every tool available to reduce the number of provisionally appointed city workers. One such tool is the clear authority stated in The Personnel Rules and Regulations of the City of New York under

**RULE V-APPOINTMENTS AND PROMOTIONS
SECTION I--APPOINTMENTS AND PROMOTIONS
GENERALLY**

RULE 5.3.6. Citywide Lists.

The commissioner of citywide administrative services may establish citywide promotion lists which shall not be certified to an agency until after the promotion eligible list for that agency has been exhausted.

This union believes that by creating citywide promotional lists the number of provisionally appointed city workers citywide will be reduced. By making citywide promotional lists a routine practice together with the current citywide open competitive lists city agencies will have pools of qualified candidates to fill vacancies rather than provisionally appoint untested candidates.

Our experience at Local 1180 on methods of reducing provisional appointments began less than a decade ago with the title of Principal Administrative Associate which topped the list of city civil service titles with the greatest number serving provisionally. We asked DCAS to hold both promotional and open competitive examinations and they agreed. After both lists were established and appointments made the number of Principal Administrative Associates serving provisionally dropped from over 2,000 to a handful.

In past administration the commissioner of citywide administrative services had no desire to use Rule 5.3.6., though Local 1180 preferred that a citywide promotional list was also created. Since many members are in agencies with few Principal Administrative Associate positions available for promotion they were forced to pay examination fees twice to be on both the open competitive list and their agency promotional list. This improved the possibility of appointment as a Principal Administrative Associate. After exhausting their promotional Principal Administrative Associate lists City agencies have made appointments from the open competitive list with over 5,122 candidates initially. To date the highest number appointed from the list is number 2,505.

We are now experiencing a growth in those serving provisionally in the title of Administrative Manager. The November 30, 2015 Quarterly Provisional Report showed that there are 566 serving provisionally in the title citywide. While there are 17 agencies with qualified candidates on languishing on promotional lists for Administrative Manager. In the 17, the top 5 have a total of 939 qualified individuals waiting to be called: HRA-520, ACS-151, NYPD-119, DOHMH-80 and DEP-69. All 17

agencies have a total 1220 qualified individuals waiting to be appointed.

If DCAS used Rule 5.3.6 the citywide promotional list for Administrative Manager would reduce the number of provisional appointees citywide. We ask that the members of this New York City Council Labor Committee encourage the commissioner to use Rule 5.3.6. in this instance and others as one of many tools available to offer qualified candidates to agencies and reduce the number of provisional appointees.

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card



I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 3/30/16

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: GERARD BROWN

Address: 6 Han St

I represent: CWA LOCAL 118

Address: 6 Han St, NYC

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card



I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 3/30/16

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Lisette Camilo

Address: 1 Centre St NY NY

I represent: DCAS

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card



I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

in favor in opposition

Date: 3/30/16

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Dawn Pinnock

Address: 1 Centre St NY NY

I represent: DCAS

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms