

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

November 13, 2024

Start: 2:20 p.m.

Recess: 3:24 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams, Speaker  
Amanda Farías, Majority Leader

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana Ayala  
Shaun Abreu  
Joann Ariola  
Alexa Avilés  
Chris Banks  
Joseph Borelli  
Erik D. Bottcher  
Justin L. Brannan  
Gale A. Brewer  
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers  
Tiffany Cabán  
David M. Carr  
Carmen N. De La Rosa  
Eric Dinowitz  
Oswald Feliz  
James F. Gennaro  
Jennifer Gutiérrez  
Shahana Hanif  
Kamillah M. Hanks

COUNCIL MEMBERS: (continued)

Robert F. Holden  
Crystal Hudson  
Rita C. Joseph  
Shekar Krishnan  
Linda Lee  
Farrah N. Louis  
Kristy Marmorato  
Christopher Marte  
Julie Menin  
Francisco P. Moya  
Mercedes Narcisse  
Sandy Nurse  
Chi A. Ossé  
Vickie Paladino  
Keith Powers  
Lincoln Restler  
Kevin C. Riley  
Carlina Rivera  
Yusef Salaam  
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.  
Pierina Ana Sanchez  
Lynn C. Schulman  
Althea V. Stevens  
Sandra Ung  
Inna Vernikov  
Nantasha M. Williams  
Julie Won  
Kalman Yeger  
Susan Zhuang

A P P E A R A N C E S

INVOCATION DELIVERED BY: Rev. Dr. Frankco  
Harris, Mt. Olivet Baptist Church of Hollis  
located at 202-03 Hollis Avenue, St. Albans, NY  
11412

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Check one, two. This is  
3 a pre-recorded sound test for today's Stated Meeting.  
4 Today's date is November 13, 2024. It's being  
5 recorded by Michael Leonardo in the Council Chambers.

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: At this time, please  
7 place all electronic devices to vibrate.

8 Madam Majority Leader.

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Good afternoon,  
10 and welcome to the Stated Meeting of November 13,  
11 2024. I am Majority Leader Amanda Farías, and I'd  
12 like to thank you for joining us.

13 If you would like to follow along, the  
14 agenda for today's meeting is posted on our website.

15 On behalf of the Body, I welcome the  
16 members of the public who have joined us today.

17 During Stated Meetings, only Members of  
18 the Council may speak. Members of the public shall  
19 remain silent. If you wish to express your support of  
20 any remarks, you may make the silent approval  
21 gesture.

22 I want to remind my Colleagues that  
23 decorum is to be respected at all times. Insulting  
24 each other is not appropriate. All remarks are to be  
25 addressed to the Chair, and Members shall not speak

2 unless recognized by the Chair. It is essential that  
3 even if we disagree, we treat each other with  
4 respect.

5 CITY CLERK: Please join us for the Pledge  
6 of Allegiance.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise!

8 ALL: [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE]

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Roll call.

10 CITY CLERK: Abreu.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Present.

12 CITY CLERK: Ariola.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Here.

14 CITY CLERK: Avilés.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Presente.

16 CITY CLERK: Ayala.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Here.

18 CITY CLERK: Banks.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Presente.

20 CITY CLERK: Bottcher.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Present.

22 CITY CLERK: Brannan.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.

24 CITY CLERK: Brewer.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.

2 CITY CLERK: Brooks-Powers. Cabán.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Here.

4 CITY CLERK: Carr.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Here.

6 CITY CLERK: De La Rosa.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Here.

8 CITY CLERK: Brooks-Powers.

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: She identified  
10 herself as present earlier.

11 CITY CLERK: Thank you. Dinowitz.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Here.

13 CITY CLERK: Feliz. Gennaro.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.

15 CITY CLERK: Gutiérrez.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Presente.

17 CITY CLERK: Hanif.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Here.

19 CITY CLERK: Hanks.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Present.

21 CITY CLERK: Holden.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

23 CITY CLERK: Hudson.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Present.

25 CITY CLERK: Joseph.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Present.

3 CITY CLERK: Krishnan.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Here.

5 CITY CLERK: Lee.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Here.

7 CITY CLERK: Louis.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present.

9 CITY CLERK: Marmorato.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Present.

11 CITY CLERK: Marte.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Present.

13 CITY CLERK: Mealy. Menin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Here.

15 CITY CLERK: Moya.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.

17 CITY CLERK: Narcisse.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Present.

19 CITY CLERK: Nurse.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Present.

21 CITY CLERK: Ossé.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Present.

23 CITY CLERK: Paladino.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Present.

25 CITY CLERK: Powers.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

3 CITY CLERK: Restler.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Here.

5 CITY CLERK: Riley. Rivera.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

7 CITY CLERK: Salaam.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Present.

9 CITY CLERK: Salamanca.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

11 CITY CLERK: Sanchez.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Present.

13 CITY CLERK: Schulman.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Here.

15 CITY CLERK: Stevens.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Here.

17 CITY CLERK: Ung.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Present.

19 CITY CLERK: Vernikov.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Present.

21 CITY CLERK: Williams.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Present.

23 CITY CLERK: Won.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Present.

25 CITY CLERK: Yeger.



2 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

3 CITY CLERK: Zhuang.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Here.

5 CITY CLERK: Borelli. Borelli.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Here.

7 CITY CLERK: Farías.

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Present.

9 CITY CLERK: Speaker Adams.

10 SPEAKER ADAMS: Present.

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. We  
12 will now have today's invocation, which will be  
13 delivered by Reverend Dr. Frankco Harris of Mount  
14 Olivet Baptist Church of Hollis, which is located at  
15 202-03 Hollis Avenue in Queens.

16 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise!

17 REVEREND DR. FRANKCO HARRIS: Lord, on  
18 today, we thank you for another day that we've never  
19 seen before and we will never see again. Help us to  
20 take advantage of the time that you have given to us  
21 and make the world that we live in a better place. We  
22 ask that you will be with our City leaders and  
23 officials as they make decisions and policies for the  
24 people of this great city. We ask that you meet the  
25 needs of this city and multiply our resources, that

2 there is no lack in any area. We also ask that you  
3 give us good health, abundant finances, and astute  
4 cognitive ability to navigate the vicissitudes of  
5 life. We acknowledge that we are better together and  
6 we strive to live in peace and harmony with one  
7 another. Help us to be a support system for one  
8 another when we are in need and to share our surplus  
9 with individuals that may lack. Thank you that our  
10 best days are ahead of us and we need shades to see  
11 this bright future. The Lord bless thee and keep  
12 thee. The Lord make his face to shine upon thee and  
13 be gracious unto thee. The Lord lift up his  
14 countenance upon thee and give thee peace. And  
15 everyone said amen.

16 ALL: Amen.

17 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. I  
18 would now ask Council Member Nantasha Williams to  
19 spread the invocation on the record.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,  
21 Majority Leader. It is my honor to introduce a  
22 remarkable leader and community servant, Pastor  
23 Reverend Dr. Frankco Harris of Mount Olivet Baptist  
24 Church in St. Albans, who is originally from  
25 Montgomery, Alabama, the birthplace of the Civil

2 Rights Movement, was raised with strong faith by his  
3 parents, Deacon and Missionary Eddie F. Harris.  
4 Pastor Harris now calls Mount Olivet Baptist Church  
5 in Hollis, Queens home. A talented musician, Dr.  
6 Harris received a full scholarship to Alabama A and M  
7 University, where he excelled in music and  
8 performance. Yet feeling a divine calling to  
9 ministry, he went on to earn advanced degrees in  
10 religious studies and worship, including a doctor of  
11 ministry. His electrifying preaching and dedication  
12 have grown Mount Olivet in membership and spirit. In  
13 addition to his pastoral work, Dr. Harris founded  
14 FAME, Frankco's Academy for Music Education, to  
15 promote music education for inner-city youth  
16 alongside his wife, Valerie, a New York City teacher  
17 and their two children. He continues to uplift and  
18 inspire the community. He's also a constituent, and  
19 we love Mount Olivet Baptist Church as they continue  
20 to be a pillar of the Southeast Queens community  
21 under his dutiful leadership so please join me in  
22 welcoming Pastor Reverend Dr. Frankco Harris as he  
23 leads us in today's invocation, or as he led us, and  
24 with that, I will make a motion to spread today's  
25 invocation on the record.

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: We will now have  
3 the adoption of minutes by Council Member Chi Ossé.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: I make a motion that  
5 the minutes of the Stated Meeting of November 13,  
6 2024, be adopted as printed.

7 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Messages and  
8 Papers from the Mayor.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: M79, Corporation Council  
10 appointment.

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: Rules, Privileges, and  
12 Elections.

13 Communication from City, County, and  
14 Borough Offices.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Petitions and  
17 Communications.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

19 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Land Use Call-  
20 Ups.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Thank you. We  
23 will now have Communication from Speaker Adrienne  
24 Adams.

2 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Madam  
3 Majority Leader, and good afternoon, everyone.

4 Last week, voters across our city, state,  
5 and nation took to the polls to make their voices  
6 heard. It's important that we acknowledge the real  
7 fear and anxiety that people are feeling about the  
8 results of the presidential election. While  
9 respecting the results of an election and the  
10 peaceful transfer of power, we must remain vigilant  
11 to prevent the potential negative impact a second  
12 Trump presidency could mean for the protection and  
13 progress of civil rights. While I am disappointed by  
14 the outcome of the election, we remain prepared to  
15 protect New Yorkers and our diverse city. Our city  
16 has consistently persevered in the face of adversity,  
17 and this will be no different. We emerge stronger by  
18 standing together and, by working to protect each  
19 other, we can safeguard our rights and our shared  
20 values. Let me also say this. New York City is a city  
21 of immigrants. We are home to rich immigrant  
22 communities who built our city and power its economy,  
23 and New York City will continue to be a beacon for  
24 them. We are also proud to be a safe haven for  
25 abortion and reproductive care, which New Yorkers

2 affirmed by overwhelmingly approving Proposition 1,  
3 the Equal Rights Amendment. With their vote, New  
4 Yorkers enshrined our reproductive and civil rights  
5 into the State Constitution, ensuring that access to  
6 life-saving healthcare is protected in New York.

7           It is also noteworthy that Proposals 2  
8 through 5 passed with the narrowest margin of any New  
9 York City ballot proposal in at least 15 years. The  
10 Mayor's recent Charter Revision Commission composed  
11 solely of his appointees rushed the process to put  
12 Proposals 2 through 6 on the ballot without any  
13 meaningful input or consideration from New Yorkers.  
14 This hasty process undermined the public's ability to  
15 engage with these proposals then used misleading  
16 language in posing the questions to voters. New  
17 Yorkers deserve more transparency and respect for  
18 democracy than was characterized by those proposals  
19 and the Commission that created them. My bill to  
20 establish a Charter Revision Commission is aimed at  
21 restoring these democratic norms that were undermined  
22 last summer as well as the trust in City government  
23 that has been harmed by the events of the past  
24 several months. Local elections matter and have a  
25 profound impact on our lives. I thank New Yorkers for

2 getting out to vote and will always encourage all of  
3 our neighbors who can vote to exercise that right.

4           The Council will continue to prioritize  
5 the protection and strengthening of democracy, civil  
6 rights, and safety in our city, ensuring the dignity  
7 of all New Yorkers is upheld as we continue working  
8 towards a more equitable future for all.

9           On October 24th, a 56-year-old woman  
10 passed away in a deadly fire in Council Member  
11 Williams' District. A 64-year-old man was also killed  
12 after a fire broke out at NYCHA's Frederick Douglass  
13 Houses in Council Member Abreu's District. That same  
14 day, another fatal fire took place in Council Member  
15 Feliz's District, leaving a 34-year-old man dead and  
16 another one injured. This marks the fifth death due  
17 to a lithium-ion battery fire this year. While the  
18 Council has passed key legislation to regulate the  
19 licensing and sales of lithium-ion batteries, we know  
20 more must be done to prevent these fires and achieve  
21 the safety that New Yorkers deserve. Earlier this  
22 month, there was yet another fatal fire, taking the  
23 lives of two New Yorkers in Council Member Williams'  
24 District. Losing someone you love is devastating. My

2 prayers are with all of the grieving families,  
3 neighbors, and victims, and friends of the victims.

4 November is Puerto Rican Heritage Month.

5 I want to honor the many contributions and  
6 accomplishments of our Puerto Rican communities who  
7 helped shape our city into what it is today. Join us  
8 for our Puerto Rican Heritage Chamber event next  
9 Monday, November 18th, in honor of the late and  
10 beloved Carlos Carillo Higgins. Carlos served the  
11 Council for 25 years, joining as a Member of Central  
12 Staff in 1999 and working for every Speaker in the  
13 city's history. He was the heart of our Community  
14 Engagement Division and most recently served as Co-  
15 Director of the Community Outreach Unit. Carlos was  
16 deeply proud of his beloved Puerto Rico, and he  
17 channeled that love into improving his community.  
18 Carlos lived by the code that we should strive to  
19 lead a place better than we found it, and he always  
20 did just that.

21 November is also National Native American  
22 Heritage Month when we uplift the history and  
23 cultures of Indigenous peoples. It's critical that we  
24 recognize that we are currently in the homeland of  
25 the Lenape. As a city and country, we must commit to



2 meeting the needs of our Indigenous communities and  
3 confronting the disparities they continue to face.

4 I want to acknowledge November also as  
5 National Alzheimer's Disease Awareness Month. This  
6 disease affects more than 6 million Americans. It's  
7 critical that we recognize them and all families and  
8 caregivers who support their well-being. Thank you to  
9 our Committee Chair on Aging, Council Member Crystal  
10 Hudson, for all you do to advance the care for older  
11 adults in our city.

12 On November 11th, we observed Veterans  
13 Day. I thank all of our veterans for their widespread  
14 contributions to our country. My father, my father-  
15 in-law, and my husband all served in the United  
16 States Air Force, so this is a very important day for  
17 my own family, as it is for all families of veterans.

18 November 19th is World Day of Remembrance  
19 for Road Traffic Victims, when we remember the  
20 victims of traffic violence. We lose too many  
21 residents to preventable traffic crashes each year,  
22 which underscores the importance of the work ahead to  
23 make our streets safer for pedestrians, cyclists,  
24 drivers, and all road users alike.

2           On November 20th, our nation will observe  
3 Trans Day of Remembrance, which honors those we have  
4 lost to anti-trans violence. As a city, we remain  
5 focused on supporting and uplifting all LGBTQIA+ New  
6 Yorkers.

7           Finally, I want to wish a happy birthday  
8 to Council Members Kevin Riley and Keith Powers, who  
9 share a birthday on the 16<sup>th</sup>, happy birthday, and  
10 they're sitting together.

11           CHAMBERS: [APPLAUSE]

12           SPEAKER ADAMS: Now, let's move on to our  
13 stated agenda.

14           First, we'll vote on the following  
15 Finance items. Resolution 627, sponsored by Council  
16 Member Justin Brannan, will set the date, place, and  
17 time for a public hearing on legislation to increase  
18 the annual expenditure for nine Business Improvement  
19 Districts; Resolution 630, sponsored by Council  
20 Member Keith Powers, will set the date, place, and  
21 time for a public hearing on legislation to increase  
22 the annual expenditure for the Madison Avenue  
23 Business Improvement District and amend the  
24 District's plans method of assessment; a Pre-  
25 Considered Resolution sponsored by Council Member

2 Justin Brannan, authorizing a 40-year Article XI tax  
3 exemption for the preservation of seven affordable  
4 senior housing buildings in Council Member Rivera's,  
5 Menin's, and Powers' Districts; a Pre-Considered  
6 Resolution sponsored by Council Member Justin  
7 Brannan, authorizing a 40-year Article XI tax  
8 exemption for the preservation of one HDFC co-op  
9 building in Council Member Abreu's District; and a  
10 Transparency Resolution approving new designations  
11 and changes of certain organizations receiving  
12 funding in the expense budget.

13           Next, we will vote on the Mayor's  
14 appointments of Michael Espiritu and Vanessa  
15 Rodriguez as Directors of the New York City Health  
16 and Hospitals Corporation.

17           We will also vote on the following Land  
18 Use item. The Council will approve La Catrina's  
19 application for a revocable consent to operate a  
20 sidewalk cafe in Council Member Holden's District.

21           Today, we will also vote on the following  
22 pieces of legislation. Resolution 441, sponsored by  
23 Council Member Kristy Marmorato, would designate  
24 March 29th annually as Vietnam Veterans Day in the  
25 City of New York in honor of the bravery and

2 sacrifice of the Americans who served and in  
3 recognition of the past and present dedication of  
4 their families and their caregivers. We thank you to  
5 our Staff Member Regina Paul.

6 Resolution 95, sponsored by Council  
7 Member Shahana Hanif, would call upon the New York  
8 City Department of Education to consult with faith-  
9 based organizations to develop and provide all grade  
10 levels with a curriculum that focuses on religious  
11 diversity and to provide professional development  
12 focused on religious diversity for teachers, staff,  
13 and administrators; Resolution 13, sponsored by  
14 Council Member Rita Joseph, would designate the  
15 second Friday in March annually as Social and  
16 Emotional Learning Day in the City of New York. We  
17 thank our staff member Chloe Rivera.

18 Introduction 663-A, sponsored by Council  
19 Member Erik Bottcher, would empower the Department of  
20 Transportation to set standards for the size, shape,  
21 and materials of news racks. This bill would also  
22 restrict news racks from being placed too closely to  
23 City infrastructure located on sidewalks. We thank  
24 our Staff Members Mark Chen and David Lowenstein.

2 Introduction 130-A, sponsored by Council  
3 Member Gale Brewer, would expand the Council's  
4 organic waste diversion efforts, specifically in  
5 parks, by requiring the Department of Parks and  
6 Recreation to establish composting facilities for  
7 plant waste within at least two parks in each borough  
8 by July 2026 and at least three parks in each borough  
9 by July 2027 and at least five parks in each borough  
10 by July 2028. We thank our Staff Members Chris  
11 Sartori and Patrick Mulvihill.

12 Next, Introduction 1088-A, my bill to  
13 establish a Charter Revision Commission that  
14 prioritizes improving City government and  
15 transparency. The Commission would consist of 17  
16 members appointed by the Speaker, Mayor, Public  
17 Advocate, Comptroller, and all five Borough  
18 Presidents. Registered lobbyists would be ineligible  
19 to serve on the Commission. The Commission would be  
20 required to conduct an extensive outreach campaign to  
21 solicit ideas from civic and community leaders and  
22 encourage the public to participate in the hearing  
23 process. In contrast to the Mayor's Commission that  
24 rushed completion of the process in less than two  
25 months, the proposed legislation would provide at

2 least eight months for the Commission's work before  
3 its earliest submission of proposals for a general  
4 election in 2025 and up to 20 months for the 2026  
5 general election. Through an open, transparent, and  
6 inclusive process, it will actively seek input from  
7 across communities ensuring that proposed changes to  
8 the City Charter, our Constitution, reflect the needs  
9 and priorities of the public. This Commission will  
10 have the time and mandate to focus on the long-term  
11 well-being of the entire city, not the short-term  
12 political gains of any current officeholder. The main  
13 goal of this Commission is to rebuild New Yorker's  
14 confidence in City government and re-establish model  
15 standards for these commissions. We thank our Staff  
16 Members, Jayasri Ganapathy, David Seitzer, and Erica  
17 Cohen.

18 Introduction 360-A, also known as the  
19 FAIR Act, sponsored by Council Member Chi Ossé, would  
20 ensure that renters are not forced to pay a fee for  
21 the services of a real estate broker they did not  
22 hire. It would prohibit brokers from passing their  
23 fee onto tenants when the broker is exclusively  
24 representing the landlord's interests. Landlords or  
25 their agents would be required to disclose the fees

2 that the tenant must pay in their listings and rental  
3 agreements. The Department of Consumer and Worker  
4 Protection would enforce this bill and would conduct  
5 education and outreach. Any person who violates this  
6 bill would be subject to a civil penalty or civil  
7 action. We thank our staff members, Rachel Cordero,  
8 David Seitzer, Natalie Meltzer, and Sarah Swaine.

9 Thank you very much for your attention,  
10 Colleagues. Now I turn it back over to our Majority  
11 Leader.

12 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you,  
13 Speaker Adams.

14 We will now move into Discussion of  
15 General Orders, and I'd like to recognize Council  
16 Member Brewer followed by Ossé.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very  
18 much. I'm calling your attention to number 130-A,  
19 which is on the agenda today. It will establish  
20 composting facilities in city parks to manage plant  
21 waste sustainably, modeled after the Riverside Park  
22 composting facility, which is so fabulous that people  
23 come just to see it, and it is powered by solar. This  
24 initiative aims to reduce the amount of organic waste  
25 sent to landfills, improve soil health, and decrease

2 greenhouse gas emissions, create green jobs, because  
3 they'll have to have jobs to operate the sites. The  
4 implementation plan calls for at least one compost  
5 facility in two parks per borough by July '26, one  
6 compost facility in three parks in each borough by  
7 July '27, one compost facility in five parks in July  
8 '28. I definitely want to thank Parks Chair Shekar  
9 Krishnan, the Compost Coalition, like Eric Goldstein  
10 of NRDC, Justin Green of Big Reuse, and my staff,  
11 certainly Shula Puder and Cynthia Hornig, and Council  
12 Legislation Staff, Patrick Mulvihill and Chris  
13 Sartori, and I say, go compost. Thank you very much.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. I'd  
15 like to recognize Council Member Ossé followed by  
16 Bottcher.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you, Majority  
18 Leader. I would like to speak about Intro. 360-A, or  
19 the FAIR Act. Today is the culmination of over a year  
20 and a half of work. My team and I collaborated with  
21 renters, Council Members, lawyers, workers, brokers,  
22 and so many more individuals and groups to create  
23 this piece of legislation. We built a coalition  
24 spanning the five boroughs who recognize the gravity  
25 of the housing crisis we face and are committed to



2 finally bringing fairness to apartment and rental  
3 expenses. The FAIR Act is simple. It requires that  
4 whoever hires a broker in a rental transaction,  
5 whether landlord or tenant, pays the broker fee. In  
6 too many millions of cases across our city and  
7 decades of history, tenants have been forced to hand  
8 over thousands of dollars in fees to brokers they  
9 never hired nor wanted. The harm of this practice  
10 cannot be overstated. Families seeking to grow forgo  
11 having children because they can't afford to move  
12 into a larger place. Children aging out of their  
13 parents' homes are pushed into different  
14 neighborhoods or even cities because they can't  
15 afford to rent an apartment in their own community.  
16 Workers are unable to live near their jobs. Victims  
17 are unable to leave domestic abuse. People are unable  
18 to bring their talent and drive to our amazing city  
19 because of forced broker fees. Today, we end that  
20 cruel and archaic practice. I want to thank Speaker  
21 Adams as well as advocacy groups, unions, my  
22 Colleagues, and everyone else who got us to this  
23 moment. Of course, Sarah Swaine, Legislative Counsel,  
24 Natalie Meltzer, Policy Analyst, Rachel Codero. In  
25 addition to that, today is a win for the people of

2 New York as we make official what has long been  
3 common sense. You get what you pay for and you pay  
4 for what you get. I urge all my Colleagues to vote  
5 yes on this bill.

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Thank you. I'd  
7 like to recognize Council Member Bottcher.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Today, we're  
9 passing legislation to address those plastic sidewalk  
10 newspaper boxes. This is something that New Yorkers,  
11 we've got a love-hate relationship with them in true  
12 New York fashion. We love having easy access to free  
13 periodicals on the sidewalk. We don't love that  
14 they're frequently neglected, vandalized, broken,  
15 filled with garbage, tipped over, causing sidewalk  
16 congestion, and just plain eyesores, and many of them  
17 aren't even for newspapers, but promotions for  
18 commercial enterprises. Until now, the City hasn't  
19 had many tools to address this issue because the  
20 current regulations don't empower them to. So today,  
21 we're voting on City Council legislation that'll  
22 clarify and strengthen the regulations regarding the  
23 siting, design, and maintenance of sidewalk news  
24 racks. This will empower the DOT to develop standards  
25 regarding where they're placed, installed, design

2 standards, size, shape, and appearance. It also  
3 clarifies that they shouldn't be used just for  
4 advertising and promotional purposes. The owners of  
5 the news racks will have to affix contact information  
6 so we know who to call when they're not being  
7 properly maintained. I want to thank Speaker Adams,  
8 Majority Whip Selvena Brooks-Powers, Sandra Ung, the  
9 prime co-sponsor of this legislation, and all the  
10 organizations and residents who came forward to help  
11 support this legislation. Together, we'll keep  
12 working to improve life for New Yorkers in ways large  
13 and small.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. Seeing  
15 no one else signed up to speak. Report of Special  
16 Committees.

17 CITY CLERK: None.

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Reports of  
19 Standing Committees.

20 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
21 Consumer and Worker Protection, Intro 360-A, Rental  
22 Real Estate Broker Fees.

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on  
24 General Orders.

2 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
3 Finance, Resos 627 and 630, Business Improvement  
4 Districts.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

6 CITY CLERK: Pre-Considered Reso. 641,  
7 Organization Funding.

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

9 CITY CLERK: Pre-Considered LU 189 and  
10 Reso. 646 and Pre-Considered LU 190 and Reso. 647,  
11 Tax Exemptions.

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

13 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
14 Governmental Operations, State and Federal  
15 Legislation, Intro. 1088-A, Charter Revision  
16 Commission.

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on  
18 General Orders.

19 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
20 Land Use, LU 161 through LU 172 on page 6, Various  
21 Applications.

22 SPEAKER ADAMS: Approved with  
23 modifications and referred to the City Planning  
24 Commission pursuant to Section 1970 of the New York  
25 City Charter.

2 CITY CLERK: LU 188 and Reso. 648,  
3 Sidewalk Cafe.

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

5 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
6 Parks and Recreation, Intro. 130-A, Composting  
7 Facilities.

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on  
9 General Orders.

10 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
11 Rules, Privileges, and Elections, Pre-Considered  
12 Reso. 643, Approving the Designation for Appointment  
13 of Michael Espiritu, Health and Hospitals  
14 Corporation.

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

16 CITY CLERK: Pre-Considered Reso. 644,  
17 Approving the Designation for Appointment of Vanessa  
18 Rodriguez, Health and Hospitals Corporation.

19 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

20 CITY CLERK: Report of the Committee on  
21 Transportation and Infrastructure, Intro. 663-A, News  
22 Rack Requirements.

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Amended and coupled on  
24 General Orders.

2 I now ask that the Clerk take a roll call  
3 vote on all of the items coupled on today's General  
4 Orders calendar.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Joseph.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Aye on all.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Abreu.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ariola.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Aye on all with  
11 the exception of 360-A for which I am a no.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Avilés.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Aye on all.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ayala.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank

17 you. Banks.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BANKS: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Bottcher.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Brannan.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Brewer.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye on all.

25

2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Brooks-  
3 Powers. On behalf of Majority Whip Brooks-Powers, I  
4 will disclose for her, I am disclosing for the record  
5 that the NYC Department of Education is funded in the  
6 Transparency Resolution we are adopting, and my child  
7 and sister are associated with that entity.

8 Council Member Brooks-Powers. We'll come  
9 back to Council Member Brooks-Powers.

10 Cabán. Carr.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: I vote no on Intro.  
12 360-A and aye on the rest.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: De La  
14 Rosa.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
17 you. Dinowitz.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Feliz.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Permission takes  
21 for my vote. Granted maybe, maybe not. Permission to  
22 explain my vote.

23 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission  
24 granted.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you. Thank  
3 you so much. Proud to vote aye on, especially proud  
4 to vote yes on the broker bill, a bill that is based  
5 on good policy and based on common sense. Anytime we  
6 talk about any industry, an individual selling or  
7 renting a product, generally it's that individual  
8 doing the renting or the selling of that product who  
9 would pay for the advertisement of that product. How  
10 is it possible that in the City of New York, a city  
11 where we're clearly in a well-documented housing  
12 crisis, we're going to put additional obstacles on  
13 those that want to rent? We need to make sure that we  
14 create a better housing system for everyone,  
15 including for low-income families that are struggling  
16 to find an apartment. For that reason and for many  
17 other reasons, proud to vote aye on that broker bill  
18 and on all, and I want to congratulate Council Member  
19 Ossé on getting that to the finish line.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
21 you. Council Member Brooks-Powers. Once again, I'll  
22 read her disclosure. I'm disclosing for the record,  
23 NYC Department of Education is funded in the  
24 Transparency Resolution we are adopting, and my child



2 and sister are associated with that entity. Council  
3 Member Brooks-Powers, how do you vote?

4 For the record, Majority Whip Brooks-  
5 Powers has signaled her affirmative vote remotely.  
6 Thank you, Council Member.

7 Gennaro.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Madam Majority  
9 Leader, I wish to speak on my vote.

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission  
11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you. I'm a  
13 proud co-sponsor of the Speaker's bill, 1088-A. I  
14 wish to be associated with her good remarks on that  
15 bill. This will be an opportunity to right a really  
16 horrendous wrong, and I urge everyone to support this  
17 good bill and to be vigilant as we go forward to  
18 protect the integrity of this institution. Thank you  
19 very much. Oh, and I vote aye on all.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
21 you. Gutiérrez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: I vote aye.  
23 Congrats to all my Colleagues, especially Council  
24 Member Ossé. Thank you.

25

2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
3 you. Hanif.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Aye on all.  
5 Congrats, Chi.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Hanks.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Aye on all and  
8 congratulations, Council Member Ossé.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Holden.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Hudson.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Aye on all.

13 Congratulations to Council Member Ossé and to all New  
14 Yorkers who will now avoid paying a broker fee that  
15 they didn't hire a broker for.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Krishnan.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Aye on all.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Lee.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Aye on all.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Louis.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye on all.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN:

23 Marmorato.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: I vote aye on  
25 all with the exception of 360-A.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Marte.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: I vote aye on all.

4 Congrats, Chi.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Mealy.

6 Menin.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Moya.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank

11 you. Narcisse.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Permission to

13 explain my vote?

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission

15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: I want to say

17 thank you, thank you, Majority Leader, and thank you,

18 Madam Speaker. 1088, people probably don't understand

19 why I clap because it's so important to have all our

20 community involved in the process of democracy.

21 Democracy is not one person. I came from a country

22 that was still struggling for democracy and, when I

23 see democracy, I enjoy it, every second of it. I

24 probably can overdo it at times. I was on the street

25 to educate people. People need to be part of

2 government. We have it right here because that's the  
3 way we have to live our lives and for all the Staff  
4 that worked on it, that pushing us to do it every  
5 day, remind us that we are here for the people, for  
6 the work of the people so I want to vote aye and  
7 congratulation to all my Colleagues and Madam  
8 Speaker.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
10 you. Nurse.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: I vote aye.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ossé.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Permission to  
14 explain my vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission  
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Aye on all, and I  
18 want to add that today is a win for all New Yorkers  
19 and proof of what progressive governance can  
20 accomplish. Finally, after over a year and a half of  
21 work, after a seemingly endless fight against a  
22 relentless and ruthless real estate lobby hell-bent  
23 on fleecing the people of our city, we passed the  
24 FAIR Act. Housing is the largest cost for New Yorkers  
25 and our number one political concern. For too many

2 decades, tenants have been forced to hand over  
3 thousands of dollars and fees to a broker they never  
4 hired or asked for, straining their budgets and  
5 restricting their freedom of movement. This paradigm  
6 has always been unacceptable, and now we vote for it  
7 to end. This victory did not come easy. Again, we  
8 built a coalition of labor unions, advocacy groups,  
9 electeds, New Yorkers of all backgrounds and, yes,  
10 even brokers. We mobilized the people through a  
11 social media campaign that garnered millions of  
12 impressions, providing and proving the potential for  
13 a new and more democratic era of mass politics and we  
14 won through unity. I want to thank Speaker Adams,  
15 Jeremy John, and Council Member Shaun Abreu and  
16 Oswald Feliz for their early belief in this project  
17 and all of my Colleagues in this Body. I also want to  
18 thank the unions, groups, and every organization  
19 whose advocacy made this possible and, of course, I  
20 wouldn't be here without my staff. I want to thank my  
21 former Chief-of-Staff Naomi Hopkins who was there  
22 when we launched this campaign and my current Chief-  
23 of-Staff Arlean Gillin who is here to finish it.  
24 Thank you to my Legislative Director, May  
25 Vutrapongvatana, who shepherded this bill through the

2 Council, and thank you to my Director of  
3 Communications, Elijah Fox, who crafted and executed  
4 the communications, political, and social media  
5 strategy that won this fight against a million-dollar  
6 lobby and for the people of our city. We fought for  
7 New York and today we win for New York. This one's  
8 for you. Thank you so much.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank  
10 you. Paladino.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I'd like to  
12 explain my vote.

13 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: So ordered.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Thank you. I  
15 vote aye on all except for 360-A, and here's my  
16 explanation. Let's give another side to 360-A. We  
17 talk a lot here about the affordability crisis. Yet,  
18 here we are with yet another law that will only make  
19 life more expensive in the end. These fees aren't  
20 going anywhere. They are now just going to be built  
21 into rents, and rents will go up as a result, all  
22 while hurting small business people in this city who  
23 make their living helping tenants find housing. This  
24 bill will force thousands of housing units to go  
25 unadvertised, greatly limiting transparency and

2 cutting the general public off from potential housing  
3 opportunities. Because new units will not be  
4 advertised and the limitations placed on them by this  
5 new law, potential tenants won't have the leverage to  
6 negotiate the best possible deal between competing  
7 brokers. This will fundamentally break the rental  
8 market, driving up prices and limiting availability,  
9 and then in a few more years we'll all sit here again  
10 and wonder why housing is even more expensive and try  
11 to pass yet another dumb command economic solution  
12 destined to fail this city. At what point is everyone  
13 here going to realize that we're only going to make  
14 things worse. I sincerely hope that the real estate  
15 industry sues to have this law stopped. Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Cabán.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER Cabán: Congratulations to  
18 Council Member Ossé, and I vote aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank You  
20 Council Member. Powers.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Restler.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Big (INAUDIBLE)

24 and gratitude to Council Member Ossé for his

2 leadership. Proud to vote aye on all. It's a good day  
3 for tenants in New York City.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Riley.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Just want to state  
6 for the record on the Transparency Resolution, both  
7 of my daughters attend a DOE school, and I vote aye  
8 on all and congratulations to my brother, Council  
9 Member Ossé.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Rivera.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye.

12 Congratulations to my Colleagues.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Salaam.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: I vote aye on all.

15 Congratulations.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN:

17 Salamanca.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Sanchez.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Permission to

21 explain my vote.

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: Permission

23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you, Madam

25 Leader. I just want to say there is a saying in



2 Spanish that Translates to that person who invites,  
3 pays, and that is what this bill is doing (SPEAKING  
4 SPANISH) Congratulations to Council Member Ossé. You  
5 really created possibility here, and it's a lesson to  
6 all of us. We can build and do a lot for New Yorkers  
7 in our city. Congratulations. I vote aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Schulman.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Aye on all.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Stevens.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I would like to  
12 disclose for the record that my daughter attends CUNY  
13 and works at New York Presbyterian Hospital, and I  
14 would like to vote aye and all and congratulations,  
15 Chi, on an amazing bill that I do not believe is  
16 dumb. Thanks.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ung.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Vernikov.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: No on 360-A and  
21 aye on the rest.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Williams.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote aye and  
24 congrats, Council Member Ossé. I know you worked  
25

2 really hard to get this done, and I'm very proud of  
3 you.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Won.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Aye on all.

6 Congratulations, Chi Ossé.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Yeger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,

9 may I be excused to explain my vote?

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Permission

11 granted.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you very

13 much. Sometimes what might seem like a fair and

14 reasonable law, a good idea, a commonsense concept is

15 nonetheless outside the purview of this institution

16 and this Body adopt, and that happens because we are

17 a creature and a creation of the State of New York,

18 and we don't have the authority as much as we would

19 like it to regulate every single part of this city,

20 notwithstanding the fact that we are the City's

21 Legislature. This is a particular example of that.

22 New York State Law, the Real Property Law, Article

23 12a regulates brokers, regulates the fees that they

24 accept, regulates the method by which they can accept

25 commissions, regulates their licensure. The State has

2 opined on this topic. They've said that they will  
3 control this topic. That takes us out of the mix. It  
4 doesn't mean that we can't propose a good idea. It  
5 just means we don't have the authority legally to  
6 adopt it and, over time, over the last several years,  
7 and this time will soon come to an end, I have opined  
8 on this topic and sometimes the courts have agreed  
9 with me and sometimes they haven't, and we don't know  
10 what will happen, but I like to err on the side of my  
11 reading of the law and on 1088, I can't agree that  
12 the Council has the legal authority to pass this bill  
13 so I vote no on Intro. 360. I also vote no on Intro.  
14 1088 for reasons that I stated five years ago on this  
15 exact topic. I don't believe we should outsource our  
16 work to a commission of players to be named later,  
17 and I think if we want to amend the Charter, we ought  
18 to do it here and we do it in every single meeting or  
19 virtually every single meeting of this Council, we  
20 amend the Charter in various ways so we can do it  
21 here. We should do it here. That's what we get paid  
22 for. I also vote no on Resos 627 and 630. You're  
23 probably tired of hearing why but BIDs are taxes and  
24 I don't like to increase taxes on New Yorkers. I'm

2 not going to do it now. Thank you very much, Madam  
3 President.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Zhuang.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ZHUANG: Aye on all except  
6 Intro. 360-A.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Borelli.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all except  
9 360-A.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Farías.

11 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: I vote aye on  
12 all. Congratulations, Council Member Ossé.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Speaker  
14 Adams.

15 SPEAKER ADAMS: Aye on all.

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: I'd like to  
17 recognize Council Member Sanchez.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank You, Madam  
19 Leader. I would like to say for the record that my  
20 sibling Works at CUNY BMCC. I forget the exact  
21 language.

22 MAJORITY LEADER FARÍAS: That's good.  
23 Thank you for stating your disclosure.

24 All items on today's General Order  
25 Calendar are adopted by a vote of 50 in the

2 affirmative, zero and the negative, and zero  
3 abstentions with the exception of Intro. 360-A which  
4 was adopted by a vote of 42 in the affirmative, 8 and  
5 the negative, and zero abstentions, and Introduction  
6 1088-A which was adopted by a vote of 49 in the  
7 affirmative, 1 in the negative, and zero abstentions,  
8 and Resolutions 627 and 630 which was adopted by a  
9 vote of 49 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative, and  
10 zero abstentions.

11 Introduction and Reading of Bills.

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: All bills have been  
13 referred to Committee as indicated on today's Agenda.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you.

15 We will now move into the Discussion of  
16 Resolutions, and I would like to recognize Council  
17 Member Marmorato.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Thank you,  
19 Majority Leader. As I stated during the Veterans  
20 Committee, it's a privilege to bring this Resolution  
21 forward, one that holds deep significance for me and  
22 so many in District 13. Today, we vote to designate  
23 March 29th as Vietnam Veterans Day in New York City,  
24 a gesture that may seem simple but has a profound  
25 meaning for our veterans and their families. The

2 inspiration for this Resolution came from a  
3 conversation with one of my constituents, Oscar Ruiz,  
4 at a veterans' breakfast in Morris Park. Oscar shared  
5 with me the struggles he and so many Vietnam veterans  
6 have faced for years, especially the pain of  
7 returning home to a city that did not offer them the  
8 recognition or support that they deserved. Hearing  
9 his story was a powerful reminder that, as a city, we  
10 have the responsibility to do so much better. By  
11 designating March 29th as Vietnam Veterans Day, we're  
12 making a promise to our Vietnam veterans and their  
13 families that their sacrifice, service, and  
14 resilience will never be forgotten. This day will  
15 serve as a constant reminder that New York City  
16 honors them and sees them, values them and their  
17 contributions...

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member,  
19 your time has expired.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Okay. Thank  
21 you. I'd like to thank Regina Paul and my Chief-of-  
22 Staff and all of my Council Members that vote yes.  
23 Thank you.

24 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: I'd like to  
25 recognize Council Member Hanif.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you. Thank  
3 you to Speaker Adams for including Resolution 95 on  
4 today's agenda. I also want to thank the 35 sponsors  
5 of this Resolution, including co-prime sponsor,  
6 Council Member Schulman, and Education Chair Joseph  
7 for their support. This Resolution calls on the  
8 Department of Education to consult with faith-based  
9 organizations to develop and provide all grade levels  
10 with the curriculum that focuses on religious  
11 diversity. I encourage all my Colleagues to vote in  
12 favor of Reso. 95 and for New York City Public  
13 Schools to develop and implement this curriculum  
14 immediately. Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Seeing no one  
16 else signed up to speak, we will now have a voice  
17 vote on today's resolutions. If you wish to vote  
18 against or abstain from any of today's Resolutions,  
19 please notify the Legislative Documents Units by  
20 email or by approaching the dais.

21 I'll now read today's Resolutions into  
22 the record. Resolution 13 designates the second  
23 Friday in March annually as Social and Emotional  
24 Learning Day in the City of New York and recognizing  
25 the importance of ensuring that pre-kindergarten

2 through 12th grade public school students acquire the  
3 social emotional competencies needed to succeed in  
4 life. Will all those in favor say aye?

5 CHAMBERS: Aye.

6 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: All opposed say  
7 nay.

8 CHAMBERS: (SILENT)

9 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Any abstentions?

10 CHAMBERS: (SILENT) The ayes have it.

11 Resolution 95 calls upon the New York City Department  
12 of Education to consult with faith-based  
13 organizations to develop and provide all grade levels  
14 with curriculum that focuses on religious diversity,  
15 to provide professional development focused on the  
16 religious diversity for teachers, staff, and  
17 administrators, to ensure accurate classification of  
18 hate crimes in annual school reports, and immediate  
19 notification and fulfilled disclosures to parents of  
20 hate crime statistics, and to ensure that schools  
21 take actions to condemn bullying and harassment based  
22 on religious clothing, food requirements, and the  
23 need for prayer space and time year-round. Will all  
24 those in favor say aye?

25 CHAMBERS: Aye.



2 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: All opposed say  
3 nay.

4 CHAMBERS: (SILENT)

5 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Any abstentions?

6 CHAMBERS: (SILENT)

7 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: The ayes have it.

8 Resolution 441 designates March 29 annually as  
9 Vietnam Veterans Day in the City of New York in honor  
10 of the bravery and sacrifice of the Americans who  
11 served and in recognition of the past and present  
12 dedication of their families and caregivers. Will all  
13 those in favor say aye?

14 CHAMBERS: Aye.

15 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: All opposed say  
16 nay.

17 CHAMBERS: (SILENT)

18 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: Any abstentions?

19 CHAMBERS: (SILENT)

20 MAJORITY LEADER FARIAS: The ayes have it.

21 We will now move into General Discussion, and I'd  
22 like to recognize Council Member Louis followed by  
23 Ariola then Salaam.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, Majority  
25 Leader. Today, I am proud to introduce Intro. 1107, a

2 bill aimed at expanding flexibility for our city's  
3 one- and two-family homeowners to provide short-term  
4 rentals alongside Speaker Adrienne Adams and Council  
5 Members Narcisse and Riley. While we support Local  
6 Law 18's goal of safeguarding our housing stock, we  
7 must ensure that we are not marginalizing responsible  
8 small homeowners. These families are the backbone of  
9 our city. These are union workers, service providers,  
10 and hard-working individuals. Local law 18 overlooked  
11 the reality faced by these homeowners, families who  
12 like so many across the city are now in an economic  
13 crisis. Rising costs and mortgages coupled with the  
14 increase in lack of affordable housing have left them  
15 struggling to make ends meet. For many, short-term  
16 rental income has become a vital resource to help  
17 cover these escalating mortgage costs. In fact,  
18 single and two-family homes now account for 66  
19 percent of foreclosures in New York City, with  
20 neighborhoods like East Flatbush and Canarsie seeing  
21 the highest rates of foreclosure. These homeowners  
22 are not large corporations. These are everyday  
23 families who live in diverse mixed-income  
24 neighborhoods from Crown Heights, Southeast Queens,  
25 parts of the Bronx, Harlem, and beyond. These

2 homeowners pursuing the American dream are being held  
3 back by a policy that treats them as if they are  
4 commercial enterprises. Intro. 1107 addresses these  
5 change these challenges, allowing homeowners to rent  
6 out their properties responsibly. We are committed to  
7 working collaboratively with the Hotel Association  
8 Unions and advocates to ensure this legislation  
9 serves the best interests of all New Yorkers. I  
10 encourage and urge my Colleagues to support Intro.  
11 1107 to keep the American dream alive in our city and  
12 to help bring urgently needed relief to those who are  
13 struggling to maintain their homes. Thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. And  
15 just as a friendly reminder for those that are  
16 remaining in Chambers, if you are going to leave  
17 Chambers, please do so as quietly as possible.

18 I'd like to recognize Council Member  
19 Ariola followed by Salaam and Narcisse.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you,  
21 Majority Leader. I'd like to talk about Reso. 5. It  
22 was discussed yesterday at Dem Conference, and I've  
23 had conversation with some of you individually today.  
24 I'd like to take a moment to clarify the intent and  
25 content of the bill in the legislature that the Reso.

2 5 supports. As all of you know, I've been fighting  
3 for the City workers who have been unable to return  
4 to work due to inequitable practices of the New York  
5 City Law Department. Many City workers who did not  
6 take the COVID-19 vaccination were never removed from  
7 their jobs, even without reasonable accommodation  
8 requests, and others returned when the mandates were  
9 lifted without signing any waiver of their civil  
10 service rights. There is a remaining group of workers  
11 that are not being allowed back to work without  
12 signing away their rights. There is no protocol or  
13 explanation as to why some were able to return  
14 without it and some were not. This is an unfair  
15 practice and one that we, as representatives of this  
16 City, should not be allowing to continue. Reso. 5  
17 supports legislation in Albany, A9196, that would  
18 remove this inequity. It would simply allow everyone  
19 to return to work in the same manner that others  
20 have. It is not an anti-vaccination bill nor is it a  
21 bill that is giving the workers any back pay for days  
22 they were not working. It would just end the unfair  
23 practices of the Law Department and make sure that  
24 all workers are being treated equally. I ask you to  
25 carefully look over both pieces of legislation and

2 reach out to me if you have any questions. Please  
3 help me right the wrong that thousands of workers are  
4 still facing. Do it for firefighter Rashad Taylor,  
5 Firefighter Sikhu Abdul, Paramedic Corinne Rosado,  
6 and all of the first responders and City workers that  
7 just want to return to work, many of whom have  
8 testified before this body sharing their hardships.  
9 Thank you for the time.

10 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: I'd like to  
11 recognize Council Member Salaam followed by Narcisse  
12 and Stevens.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAAM: Thank you. Good  
14 afternoon, esteemed Members of this great Legislative  
15 Body and the honorable Speaker. Today, I'm proud to  
16 introduce Resolution number 645 calling on the New  
17 York State Legislature to pass and the Governor to  
18 sign S182-A/A710, crucial legislation to edn  
19 qualified immunity for public officials who violate  
20 constitutional rights. First, I want to extend my  
21 heartfelt thanks to Senator Robert Jackson and  
22 Assembly Member Pamela Hunter who have championed  
23 this legislation in the New York State Legislature.  
24 Their commitment to justice and accountability is  
25 instrumental in advancing this important cause. I

2 also want to acknowledge the tireless advocacy of the  
3 Innocence Project. Their work has shined a light on  
4 the barriers to justice faced by too many and has  
5 been vital in the movement to end qualified immunity.  
6 As public servants, we are entrusted with the welfare  
7 and safety of every New Yorker. Yet, that trust  
8 cannot exist without accountability. Qualified  
9 immunity has been a barrier for far too long,  
10 allowing officials to evade responsibility for  
11 actions that harm the very people they are meant to  
12 protect. This legislation represents a chance to  
13 bridge that gap. It ensures that families and  
14 individuals seeking justice have a fair hearing and  
15 that no one, regardless of position, is above the  
16 law. This Resolution is not merely a policy matter;  
17 it is a moral imperative. Our communities deserve to  
18 feel safe and to trust that their rights will be  
19 upheld without exception. By supporting S182-A/A710,  
20 we affirm that public officials must meet the same  
21 legal standards as every citizen. This step forward  
22 is essential in our fight for a fair, just, and  
23 equitable society. Let us work together to build a  
24 New York that upholds justice for all. Thank you.

2 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: I'd like to  
3 recognize Council Member Narcisse followed by Stevens  
4 and Sanchez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Thank you,  
6 Madame Majority, and thank you, Madame Speaker.  
7 Colleagues, I urge your support for Intro. 948 and my  
8 Colleague Farrah N. Louis, 1107, two bills that  
9 address the urgent need for greater housing  
10 flexibility and affordability in our city by updating  
11 the definition of family in our Building and  
12 Administrative Code. Intro. 948 allows single  
13 individuals and families to open their homes to up to  
14 four borders, roomers, or lodgers. Intro. 1107  
15 further enhances housing accessibility by providing  
16 additional measure to support affordable housing  
17 options to New Yorkers. These measures are small but  
18 vital steps toward alleviating housing pressure. I  
19 know that firsthand because I have a part of my  
20 District that the highest foreclosure. Now, this is  
21 for particular communities that's facing rising costs  
22 and limited space. This bill helped ensure that our  
23 city remains adaptable to the evolving housing needs  
24 to New Yorkers. Together, these bills aim to create a  
25 more flexible and sustainable housing landscape for

2 all New Yorkers. I respectfully ask for your support  
3 in making this much-needed changes in realty because  
4 we know how difficult it is. We heard the bill today  
5 that it is hard for our New Yorkers so let's make it  
6 possible and let democracy run in this Chamber, too.  
7 Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: I'd like to  
9 recognize Council Member Stevens followed by Sanchez,  
10 Hudson, and Borelli.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: It is my pleasure  
12 to introduce legislation alongside Council Member  
13 Lee, Intro. 1112, which requires each police precinct  
14 in New York City to develop and implement a special  
15 needs plan for identifying and responding to  
16 individuals with special needs such as Alzheimer's  
17 disease, dementia, Down syndrome, and other relating  
18 conditions. The precinct plan would include processes  
19 to identify individuals with special needs within  
20 their communities and establish a precinct-specific  
21 respond protocol for interactions with them. As a  
22 City, we to recognize the urgent need to address  
23 mental health concerns in our community. When it  
24 comes to public safety, we should not leave it up to  
25 one agency as we are a city with diverse needs. This



2 legislation aims to foster a safe and more  
3 understanding environment for individuals with  
4 special needs, prioritizing partnerships between law  
5 enforcement, families, healthcare providers and, most  
6 importantly, non-profit organizations who are on the  
7 front line and doing this work. I invite my  
8 Colleagues to sign on to Intro. 1112 as we must  
9 continue to take steps forward together to ensure  
10 that we create a holistic solution to keep residents  
11 safe while providing support and mental health  
12 resources for individuals with special needs. Thank  
13 you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Recognizing  
15 Council Member Sanchez followed by Hudson then  
16 Borelli.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you, Madam  
18 Leader. Today, I'm proud to introduce with Council  
19 Member Hanks, Intro. 1110, which will require the  
20 Department of Education to annually report on safe  
21 passage routes in place at different NYC schools.  
22 Safe passage routes consist of designated walking  
23 routes established in coordination with community-  
24 based organizations or law enforcement to ensure  
25 safety of students who travel to and from school.

2 Violence across New York City is uneven. While some  
3 parts of our city can feel like havens, others can  
4 feel like war zones. In fact, official NYPD data  
5 shows that shootings occur on the same blocks year  
6 after year. Just 4 percent of New York City's 120,000  
7 blocks account for nearly all of the city's shootings  
8 according to this data. As we continue to pursue  
9 strategies that make our community safer and make our  
10 community members feel safer, 1110 is a tool in the  
11 arsenal to protect our youngest. In Chicago, where  
12 they've had safe routes and they have analyzed the  
13 outcomes of the program because they had good data,  
14 which is what 1110 would do for us, schools that had  
15 the program for more than two years showed a 20  
16 percent decline in violent crime and all crimes  
17 overall. I hope my Colleagues would join me in  
18 signing on to this legislation so we can receive  
19 better data and expand use of safe passage in the  
20 communities that need this program.

21 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Council Member  
22 Hudson followed by my Minority Leader Borelli.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you so much.  
24 Last session, we made tremendous progress, passing  
25 our first Age-in-Place NYC package that included laws

2 to expand the Right-to-Counsel for older tenants,  
3 mandate universal design in City-funded housing, and  
4 expand access to telemedicine and culturally  
5 appropriate programming at older adult centers. These  
6 are major steps toward a more inclusive city that  
7 values its older adult population, but the fight  
8 isn't over. This session, we're pushing forward with  
9 even more critical reforms, stronger coordination  
10 across City agencies to support older adults, more  
11 options for home-delivered meals, expanded support to  
12 keep older adults connected in a digital world, and  
13 new tools to help seniors protect themselves from  
14 fraud, and we're working on policies that will help  
15 lay the groundwork for a comprehensive universal  
16 elder care system across all five boroughs. The  
17 reality is that we would all be fortunate to age in  
18 this great city and aging is a privilege. It's not  
19 just our responsibility to support our older adults  
20 today but into their future. You can help protect  
21 them by signing on to the Age-in-Place 2.0 package.  
22 Thank you.

23 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you. Now  
24 recognizing Minority Leader Borelli.

2                   MINORITY LEADER BORELLI: Thank you. I  
3 rise today to offer a congratulations to a former New  
4 Yorker, President Trump on his reelection. I want to  
5 also extend that congratulations to the new Members  
6 of our House Delegation, Rep-elect Gillen and Rep-  
7 elect Riley. And why do I mention those three?  
8 Because all three have committed to trying to end the  
9 cap on the SALT Tax, and I think if they can work  
10 together on it, certainly, that's a lesson for all of  
11 us. I want to also congratulate some New Yorkers who  
12 have been asked to be in the Trump Administration.  
13 First and foremost is former Rep Lee Zeldin. I'm  
14 hopeful that as head of the EPA, he can end the  
15 threat from this horrible scam called congestion  
16 pricing which proves to do nothing for my community  
17 other than to add more congestion and more pollution.  
18 Just ask the MTA's own report. I've just found out  
19 the Governor intends to reinstate it with a December  
20 29th start date and, unfortunately, it's things like  
21 this that really validate the criticisms from the  
22 biggest cynics of government. When you scrap  
23 something before an election and then reimplement it  
24 a week later, it really does validate why people hate  
25 government just so much. Finally, I'd like to

2 congratulate Elise Stefanik, the new UN ambassador.  
3 She's made the fight against antisemitism one of the  
4 foremost things she's done in the House of  
5 Representatives. I think the UN can use a voice like  
6 that. Actually, last but not least, will give a  
7 Congratulations to Steve Witkoff who is going to  
8 become the special envoy to the Middle East. Now, as  
9 someone who was a real estate developer and the owner  
10 of thousands of units here in New York, I think he'd  
11 see Mideast peace as sort of a retirement job after  
12 dealing with us in the City Council. I don't know  
13 about you. I don't think the ayatollah has much on  
14 Mr. Restler and his friends. That's a joke. Thank you  
15 very much.

16 MAJORITY LEADER FARIÁS: Thank you, and  
17 I'll take a moment to recognize and congratulate our  
18 Council Member Kalman Yeger for winning his election  
19 this November 5th as well.

20 Seeing no one else signed up to speak,  
21 I'll now call on Speaker Adrienne Adams to close  
22 today's Stated Meeting.

23 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you. The Stated  
24 Meeting of November 13, 2024, is hereby adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date November 15, 2024