

COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES &  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

1

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES &  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

----- X

Tuesday, April 25, 2023

Start: 10:20 A. M.

Recess: 10:52 A. M.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: Hon. Chi Ossé, Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Eric Dinowitz  
Amanda Farías  
Shahana K. Hanif  
Crystal Hudson  
Rita C. Joseph  
Farah N. Louis  
Francisco P. Moya  
Sandra Ung

Other Council Members Attending: Vernikov

COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES &  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Noam Gilboord  
Chief Operating Officer at Jewish Community  
Relations Council of New York

Christopher Leon Johnson  
Testifying in Support of Resolution 487

Gerard Filitti  
Senior Counsel at The Lawfare Project; Counsel  
and Activist for End Jew Hatred

Towaki Komatsu  
Testimony Unrelated to Today's Hearing

1  
2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: This is a microphone check for  
3 The Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries and  
4 International Intergroup Relations, located in the  
5 Committee Room, recorded by Nazly Paytuvi on April  
6 25, 2023.

7 Good morning, and welcome to today's New York  
8 City Council Hearing for The Committee on Cultural  
9 Affairs, Libraries and International Intergroup  
10 Relations.

11 If you wish to submit testimony, you may do so at  
12 via email at [Testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:Testimony@council.nyc.gov).

13 At this time please place all electronic devices  
14 to vibrate or silent mode.

15 Just a reminder, no one may approach the dais at  
16 any point during this hearing.

17 Chair, we are ready to begin.

18 CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ:

19 [GAVELING IN] [GAVEL SOUND]

20 Good afternoon, I am New York City Council Member  
21 Chi Ossé, my pronouns are he/him/his, and I am the  
22 Chair of The Committee on Cultural Affairs, Libraries  
23 and International Intergroup Relations.

24 Today the committee will hear and vote on one  
25 piece of legislation, Resolution 487, sponsored by

1  
2 Council Member Inna Vernikov, a Resolution  
3 recognizing April 29 as End Jew Hatred Day annually  
4 in the City of New York.

5 We are going to keep this opening statement brief  
6 today, but I want to say that I recognize and honor  
7 the significant of Resolution 487, as it seeks to  
8 address to the serious rise of antisemitism and hate  
9 crimes across the country, as well as right here in  
10 New York City.

11 Judaism is the second largest religion practiced  
12 in our city, and we have the largest Jewish community  
13 of any city in the world. It is no wonder that this  
14 resolution should be important to us.

15 I want to acknowledge some members on this  
16 committee, Council Member Ung, Council Member Louis,  
17 Council Member Dinowitz, Council Member Fariás, and  
18 Council Member Hudson.

19 I would like to turn it over to committee counsel  
20 that we could welcome some testimonies from a panel  
21 of testifiers.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair. Uh, we will  
23 now... We do not have testimony from the  
24 Administration, and we do not have to have read an  
25 oath.

1  
2       So, we will begin with the witnesses for today's  
3 hearing. We have four witnesses registered. If  
4 anyone would like to provide testimony, and they are  
5 in the room, please find a Sergeant at Arms and fill  
6 out a witness slip. Uh, if you are watching this  
7 hearing and would like testify remotely, you can  
8 register at our website [council.nyc.gov/testify](http://council.nyc.gov/testify).

9       I will now read the names of the four witnesses,  
10 Noam Gilboord, Towaki Komatsu, Christopher Leon  
11 Johnson, and Gerard Filitti.

12       If you can please approach the table?

13       Okay, thank you so much. So, we will more in the  
14 order that I just called.

15       The first witness today will be Noam Gilboord,  
16 and we will have a two minute clock. The clock is on  
17 the wall, and you may begin your testimony when  
18 ready, thank you.

19       NOAM GILBOORD: Thank you very much. Can everyone  
20 hear me?

21       COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Uh, just make sure the red  
22 light...

23       UNKNOWN: Press the button and pull it closer to  
24 you.

25       NOAM GILBOORD: How about now?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Hello? There we go, thank you....

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much.

NOAM GILBOORD: Uh, good morning Chair Ossé and members of the committee. My name is Noam Gilboord, and I am the COO of The Jewish Community Relations Council of New Yorker.

The Nation of JCRC, is to build relationships to advance the values, interests, and security of the Jewish community, and to create a more interconnected New York for all.

JCRC serves as the primary community relations agency for the Jewish community in the metropolitan New York area. As an active force in New York civic and communal life, JCRC operates a central coordinating and resource body to be a common table to cultivate understanding and joint action amongst diverse groups within the Jewish community. We cultivate deeper relationships with the broader New York community to address critical issues and engender a shared society for all. And, JCRC ensures the security of the Jewish Community in the face of rising antisemitism.

JCRS speaks in favor of Council Resolution Number 487, recognizing April 29 as End Jew Hatred Day annually in the City of New York.

Recently, The ADL released a report showing a 39% spike in antisemitic incidents in New York in 2022. New York came in first amongst states having the highest number of reported antisemitic incidents. The organized Jewish community has taken steps in response.

Since 2020 UJA Federation of New York has collectively invested millions of dollars in security creating the Community Security Initiative a joint initiative of JCRC and UJA, which is charged with providing proactive and reactive security support. From increasing physical security in buildings to research on the dark web, these efforts work hand in hand with government to increase safety.

Indeed the work of our CSI team has led it to become part of a new umbrella coalition called the Jewish Security Alliance, which will aim to act as the central point of contact for New York City area and New Jersey law enforcement communities on issues affecting all Jewish people.

Moreover [TIMER CHIMES]... Oh, well, okay.

1

2

CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ: You can finish.

3

NOAM GILBOORD: Can [INAUDIBLE] the rest of it?

4

CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ: You can finish.

5

NOAM GILBOORD: I can finish? Great, two more

6

paragraphs.

7

Moreover, as part of our two-pronged approach to

8

addressing antisemitism, JCRC, on behalf of the

9

Jewish community, also works intensively to identify

10

common agendas and build bridges with the other New

11

York City communities, with the belief that learning

12

and working together, created long term and

13

sustainable trust along with deeper levels of

14

understanding that can reduce conflict and fight hate

15

in all its forms.

16

Yet, in 2022, data shows that New York City has

17

become the most dangerous city in America to be a

18

Jew. There are many theories and factors that may

19

underpin this rise in extremism from intolerance and

20

antisemitism nationally and globally, as well as

21

COVID-19 and the many conspiracies that falsely

22

linked Jews and others to it.

23

We believe in the leadership of actions of

24

Speaker Adams, who has always sought to bring diverse

25

communities together and illuminate those issues and



1  
2 beliefs that unite as all, rather than focus on what  
3 divides us.

4 JCRC is committed to partnering with Speaker  
5 Adams, Chair Ossé, Chair of the Jewish Caucus,  
6 Council Member Eric Dinowitz, and members of the  
7 Council, on new and innovative ways to combat  
8 antisemitism.

9 We believe that the more voices there are, the  
10 more voices one lends to the condemnation of hatred,  
11 not only of Jews, but of any group is suffering the  
12 slings and arrows of intolerance and racism, the  
13 better.

14 We commend Chair Ossé and Council Member  
15 Vernikov, Council Member Yeger, Council Member Menin,  
16 Council Member Gennaro, Council Member Richardson  
17 Jordan, Council Member Dinowitz, Council Member  
18 Holden, Council Member Lee, Council Member Carr,  
19 Council Member Ariola, Council Member Borelli,  
20 Council Member Kagan, and Council Member Paladino.

21 And we urge passage of this important resolution,  
22 thank you very much.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, thank you so much.

24 We will now move to our next witness, Christopher  
25 Leon Johnson, thank you.

1  
2 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: All right, Good  
3 morning.

4 My name is Christopher Leon Johnson, thanks for  
5 having this panel, Chair Ossé.

6 First off, I have to say thank you for not  
7 showing up to that presser outside about Bail Reform,  
8 because ,you know, I am going to talk about this  
9 right now, I am for the bill, Intro 487, sponsored by  
10 Council Member Inna Vernikov, because first off, we  
11 have to repeal Bail Reform. The only way you are  
12 going to end Jew hatred is by repealing Bail Reform.  
13 The problem is, you have so many crimes against the  
14 Jewish people, and these DAs of all the five  
15 boroughs, including Melinda Katz, are letting these  
16 people get with this stuff, because they are scared  
17 of pissing off certain voting blocks. That should be  
18 stopped. We have to repeal Bail Reform.

19 The second thing is, we have to push more  
20 Holocaust education inside these schools. We need  
21 mandated Holocaust education inside these schools,  
22 especially in the inner districts, because this is  
23 where the antisemitism is happening the majority of  
24 the time -- it's in those inner districts.

1  
2       The third thing is ,you know, I know there are  
3 only 14 people that are co-sponsoring this bill, I  
4 think that's abysmal. It's horrible. I think it  
5 should be more people co-sponsoring this bill. It  
6 should be a majority that co-sponsor this bill. I  
7 think mostly a super majority should be co-sponsoring  
8 this bill. I know that Thursday we have the vote at  
9 the Stated Meeting, and I will say this right now to  
10 very council member out there who do not want to vote  
11 for this bill, if you want to not vote for this bill,  
12 fine, it's in America, it's a free country, you can  
13 do that. But, remember this ,you know, we're going  
14 to vote you guys out. And I hope that people in the  
15 Jewish community start running people against these  
16 members who vote against that bill and start voting  
17 these guys and gals out. Because, this is going to  
18 be... This is ridiculous where bills like this have  
19 to be introduced to The City Council. This should  
20 have been introduced a way long time ago. And,  
21 that's it, thank you.

22       COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you for your testimony.  
23 The next witness will be Gerard Felitti.

24       GERARD FELITTI: Good morning, My name is Gerard  
25 Felitti, I am an attorney and Senior Counsel at The

1  
2 Lawfare Project, which fights to uphold the legal  
3 rights of the Jewish people worldwide. I am also an  
4 activist and counsel for the End Jew Hatred movement.

5 And I would like to thank you, first and  
6 foremost, for the opportunity to be heard. That is  
7 what End Jew Hate Day is about. It is a day to be  
8 heard. It is a day of empowerment and unity to being  
9 together everyone in a bipartisan that puts politics  
10 aside and addresses the issues that we are facing  
11 right now.

12 I don't need to tell you the numbers. You know  
13 them better than I do. Antisemitism is at  
14 unprecedented levels. Walk up a few blocks to Center  
15 Street, there is someone right now at a hearing who  
16 is charged with violently beating a Jewish man for no  
17 other reason than for wearing kippah. This is the  
18 society we live in. This is New York City today. And  
19 we need unity and empowerment to combat this. End  
20 Jew Hate Day started last year. It started as a  
21 project in way of an initiative of the Holocaust  
22 Museum and Center for Education and Tolerance in New  
23 York. The idea was to select the day after Yom  
24 HaShoah, after Holocaust Remembrance Day, as a day of  
25 empowerment. A day to look back on the struggles of

1 the Jewish people throughout history, but also to  
2 look forward to how we can address the issues that  
3 were still dealing with today -- discrimination,  
4 oppression, violence. We see this not just in New  
5 York City but across the US. End Jew Hate (the Day)  
6 is a day, I keep saying this word, of empowerment.  
7 This year, we have gone from having a few elected  
8 officials, last year, including... Starting with  
9 former Senator, Elijah Reichlin-Melnick, to this year  
10 now having a bipartisan resolution being put forth on  
11 the senate floor of the US Senate. We have Ritchie  
12 Torres; we have so many congressmen. We have  
13 representatives from multiple states and localities.  
14 A little county in Michigan, that I have never heard  
15 of, who wanted to do the right thing, issued this  
16 proclamation yesterday. And they are so proud to be  
17 part of the movement, part of the group of people who  
18 want to fight the hatred that we share. Because,  
19 without unity, without having a [TIMER CHIMES] day...  
20 without having day on which we can look just at the  
21 issues facing the Jewish people, we cannot address  
22 the antagonism, we cannot address the Jewish hatred,  
23 and we cannot move forward.  
24  
25

1  
2 So, I think Council Member Vernikov for her  
3 leadership in this. I thank all of the co-sponsors of  
4 this legislation. And I thank all of you for the  
5 opportunity to be heard. And I encourage all of you  
6 to move this in to a bill, to move this into law, to  
7 have this day of empowerment where the Jewish people  
8 feel heard, respected, and helped, thank you.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for your  
10 testimony.

11 And before we move to Mr. Komatsu, our final  
12 witness, just a reminder, if you are present and  
13 would like to provide testimony, please find a Sergeant  
14 At Arms and fill out a witness slip even if you  
15 registered in advance.

16 If you are watching online and would like to  
17 testify, we are monitoring the inbox, and you can  
18 register to testify and [council.nyc.gov/testify](https://council.nyc.gov/testify). We  
19 also accept written testimony up to 72 hours after  
20 the close of the hearing.

21 Our next and final witness will be Mr. Komatsu.  
22 You may begin your testimony when ready, and the  
23 clock is on the wall, thank you.

24 TOWAKI KOMATSU: Uhm, the person the who just  
25 testified just talked about the right to be heard.

1  
2 Crystal Hudson is using her cell phone illegally in  
3 violation of City Council's rules. I also took a  
4 look at [INAUDIBLE] Louis is also illegally using her  
5 cell phone during this public hearing, public forum.  
6 Mr. Ossé, I just looked at you while you would  
7 using... while you were also using your phone.

8 Prior to the start of today's hearing, I asked  
9 the City Council staff if people could present video  
10 recordings in conjunction with their testimony, in  
11 conjunction with their First Amendment and 14th  
12 Amendment rights; however, they're telling me, sorry,  
13 but we have rules for the council, you have to comply  
14 with them. And, then, this hearing begins, Ms.  
15 Hudson is still on her phone. Uhm, Miss Louis was on  
16 her phone. So, with regards with the right to be  
17 heard at a meaningful time in a meaningful way,  
18 tailored to their circumstances in the capacity to be  
19 heard with regards to a US Supreme Court decision  
20 that itself issued two orders yesterday about  
21 granting petitions for Writ of Certiorari about  
22 public forums. Where is compliance for [INAUDIBLE]  
23 legal standards?

24 Uhm, the point of today's hearing is about  
25 ending, uhm, antisemitism against Jews. Guess what?

1  
2 I'm Jewish. Guess what? Pinny Ringel, he used to  
3 work for The Mayor's Office, he and other Jewish  
4 people, illegally prevented me from attending public  
5 forums and public meetings. That was after personnel  
6 for [INAUDIBLE] illegally stole my April 12th, 2017  
7 oral arguments hearing on the same day I had parallel  
8 litigation. Miss Vernikov, you're attorney, so I  
9 think you, uhm, more than others would understand  
10 what I'm talking about. Meaning if you had an oral  
11 arguments hearing and had a date to appear in court,  
12 you prepared for your hearing, the other side stole  
13 your hearing, stole your first amendment rights, you  
14 would be royally pissed about that. So, the point is  
15 if there was a town hall meeting shortly thereafter,  
16 I tried to walk through the doors, A Public Resource  
17 Hearing meeting, I tried to walk through the doors,  
18 the illegally did not let me walk through those  
19 doors. So, those are Jewish people. I'm Jewish.  
20 That oral arguments hearing [TIMER CHIMES] the legal  
21 adversary, was Jewish. So, with regards to, I  
22 guess...

23 CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ: You're at time, sir.

24

25



1  
2 TOWAKI KOMATSU: I'm sorry, but with all due  
3 respect, you let other people exceed their testimony.

4 CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ: You're at time.

5 TOWAKI KOMATSU: Okay, Second Circuit, void this  
6 hearing, thank you.

7 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you so much for your  
8 testimony.

9 At this point, we have no other witness slips and  
10 no one has registered online. I am checking the  
11 inbox. So, this concludes this panel. Thank you  
12 very much to all of you. I am not seeing anyone here  
13 who is waiting to testify. So, next we will move to  
14 the Chair and our sponsor's, uhm, statement, thank  
15 you.

16 CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ: Thank you, Committee Counsel  
17 and to all of our witnesses this morning.

18 I would like to welcome the sponsor of the  
19 resolution, Council Member Inna Vernikov, and invite  
20 her to provide remarks on her legislation.

21 Council Member Vernikov?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Thank you very much.  
23 Thank you, Committee Chair and my colleagues in this  
24 committee for hearing and voting today on my  
25 resolution to proclaim April 29 as End Jew Hatred

1  
2 Day. I also thank all of my colleagues who signed on  
3 and all of those who came here to testify today. I am  
4 proud of the bipartisan support this resolution has  
5 received.

6 The Jewish community, within five boroughs of New  
7 York City, represents the largest Jewish community of  
8 any city in the world, with nearly half of New York  
9 City's Jew living in the borough of Brooklyn.

10 Judaism is the second largest religion practiced  
11 in New York City, and yet, the Anti-Defamation League  
12 records 2,717 antisemitic incidents which occurred in  
13 the United States in 2021 alone, averaging out to  
14 more than seven incidents per day, representing a 34%  
15 increase in acts of harassment, vandalism, and  
16 assault since 2020.

17 The ADL also found that in 2021, the highest  
18 number of antiemitic incidents took place in New York  
19 State with 51 anti Jewish assaults taking place in  
20 New York City.

21 In 2021, there were more assaults on Jews in  
22 Brooklyn than anywhere else in America. And  
23 according to a report compiled by Americans Against  
24 Antisemitism, 94% of anti Jewish assaults targeted  
25 identifiable Jews.

1  
2 It is unthinkable to imagine that in this modern  
3 day and age, in the great United States of America,  
4 the place of freedom and tolerance, and in the great  
5 New York State, the beacon of democracy, our believed  
6 New York City, the most tolerant and accepting city  
7 in the world, there can be so much hatred against  
8 this ethnic minority. This must end.

9 On April 29, 2022, when the End Jew Hatred Day  
10 proclamation was signed into law in New York State,  
11 and the Nassau County Legislator declared that End  
12 Jew Hatred Day will be recognized annually on April  
13 29th. Our city must do the same. This resolution  
14 will send a strong message that New York City does  
15 not and will not tolerate any form of hate, bigotry,  
16 and specifically antisemitism, and will commit to  
17 working together to end Jew hatred.

18 I ask this committee to vote in support of this  
19 resolution, thank you all.

20 CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ: Thank you, Council Member  
21 Vernikov.

22 Finally, I would like thank my staff as well as  
23 the committee staff and others who worked on  
24 preparing this legislation including Naomi Hopkins,  
25 my Chief of Staff, May Vutrapongvatana, and my Budget

1  
2 and Policy Director, Brenda McKinney Senior Counsel  
3 to the Committee, Regina Paul, Legislative Policy  
4 Analyst to the Committee, Sandra Gray, our Senior  
5 Financial Analyst, and Christie Dwyer, Legislative  
6 Policy Analyst, who drafted the legislation.

7       Since there is no administration today, and we  
8 have already heard from our witnesses, I will now  
9 pass this back to Brenda, so that we can go into a  
10 vote.

11       COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And, just to check, I'm just,  
12 uh, confirming that Council Member Moya is present  
13 online, and Council Member Hanif is also here. We  
14 are just waiting for the clerk. It should just take  
15 one moment, and then we will be moving to the vote.

16       But, we have no other witnesses present or  
17 online, so this concludes the public testimony  
18 portion of this hearing. And we will just be one  
19 moment until the vote. Thank you so much.

20       And just so everyone knows, the clerk is coming  
21 from 250, from another hearing room, so it will just  
22 be one moment, we will be starting again in just a  
23 moment, thank you for your patience.

24       CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ: We are ready for a vote of  
25 Resolution 487.

1  
2 I do want to recognize my colleagues one again,  
3 Council Member Ung, Council Member Joseph, Council  
4 Member Dinowitz, Council Member Vernikov, Council  
5 Member Hanif, Council Member Farías, Council Member  
6 Hudson, and online, Council Member Moya, Council  
7 Member Louis.

8 I want to turn it over to Billy, so that we can  
9 take a vote on this resolution.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin Committee Clerk  
11 Roll Call Vote, Committee on Cultural Affairs,  
12 Libraries and International Intergroup.

13 Chair Ossé?

14 CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ: Antisemitism is on the rise  
15 across the globe and in our city. We see it in the  
16 hate crimes Jews increasingly face while minding  
17 their own business walking down the street. I see it  
18 in my district representing a Jewish constituency.

19 We also see it in the Republican party's attempt  
20 to smear opponents by falsely painting them as  
21 beholden to the Holocaust survivor, George Soros.

22 With perhaps the most significant implication for  
23 public policy, we see antisemitism rear its ugly head  
24 at the top of one of two major party tickets.

1  
2 Indicted former President Donald Trump's  
3 decisions to welcome avowed neo-Nazi's, like Nick  
4 Fuentes, in to his home and into his inner circle, is  
5 terrifying and should be disqualifying. Still he  
6 seems to only continue to consolidate Republican  
7 support nationwide and right here in New York and  
8 within our Council.

9 Recognizing the dangers presented by the virus of  
10 antisemitism in both personal acts of violence and in  
11 the GOP's standard-bearers decision to embrace the  
12 worst offenders, I understand the importance of this  
13 resolution. I vote aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you

15 Council Member Moya?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

18 Council Member Louis?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Congratulations to bill's  
20 sponsor, I vote aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Congratulations to  
23 Council Member Vernikov, and I thank you for bringing  
24 this to a vote, Chair Ossé, and I vote aye.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Fariás?

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Permission to explain my  
3 vote?

4 I am happy to vote in favor of the bill during a  
5 time where we are seeing an increase of antisemitism  
6 and violence against our Jewish neighbors, and hope  
7 to see us continue the fight all other forms of hate  
8 against our AAPI, LGBTQ+ -- especially trans folks,  
9 immigrants, and undocumented neighbors, and Latinos  
10 that go uncounted and underreported. We need to  
11 stand with everyone experiencing unnecessary hate,  
12 violence, in intolerance in this city and everywhere.

13 Thank you, and I vote aye.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you

15 Council Member Hanif?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: I abstain.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Permission to explain my  
19 vote?

20 CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ: Permission.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Thank you.

22 Today I will be voting aye on this resolution,  
23 but I would be remiss if I did not point out the  
24 irony of sending a letter supporting transphobic  
25 legislation that prevents trans kids from playing

1  
2 sports, and then asking this body support legislation  
3 to combat hatred of another marginalized community.

4 To paraphrase Pastor Martin Niemöller, We must  
5 advocate for and speak out against hate of all  
6 marginalized communities, including, and not limited  
7 to, the Jewish community, of which I also represent.

8 We must end hate in all forms and against all  
9 people. And I look forward to working with this  
10 council to meet that goal. I vote aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

12 Council Member Joseph?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: (NO RESPONSE)

14 Council Member Ung?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: I vote aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of seven in the  
17 affirmative, zero in the negative, and one  
18 abstention, the item has been adopted by the  
19 committee.

20 CHAIRPERSON OSSÉ: Well, without further ado, this  
21 hearing... Has commenced.

22 [GAVELING OUT] [GAVEL SOUND]

23

24

25



C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date April 26, 2023