1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

Committee on Economic Development

----- X

Wednesday, April 27, 2022

Start: 1:07 P. M. Recess: 2:58 P. M.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 3)

B E F O R E: Hon. Amanda Farías, Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Alexa Avilés Jennifer Gutiérrez Ari Kagan Kevin C. Riley Rafael Salamanca, Jr. Nantasha M. Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Sabrina Lippman,
Senior Vice President at the New York City Economic
Development Cooperation

Nicholas Stabile, EDC's Assistant Vice President for Legislative Affairs

Spiros A. Moustakas, Executive Agency Counsel and Market Manager at NYC Business Integrity Commission

Phillip Grant,
Chief Executive Officer at the Hunts Point Produce
Market

Arthur Goldstein, Government Relations at the Hunts Point Produce Market and Fish Market

Andrew Sussman,
President of The Hunts Point Market; President of
Plymouth Beef Company

Daniel Kane,
President at Teamsters Local 202

Committee on Economic Development [BLANK PAGE]

```
1
                Committee on Economic Development
2
        SERGEANT POLITE: Recording to the pc all set.
        CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: I can... I can gavel in?
3
4
     (CROSS-TALK)
5
        SERGEANT SADOWSKY: Recording to the... Recording
6
     to the cloud all set.
        SERGEANT POLITE: Good afternoon, and welcome to
8
     the remote hearing on Economic Development.
9
        Will council members and staff please turn on
     their videos at this time?
10
11
        To minimize disruptions, please place all cell
12
     phones and electronic devices to vibrate or silent
13
    mode.
14
        To send testimony, please send to
15
     testimony@council.nyc.gov , one again that is
16
     testimony@council.nyc.gov .
17
        Chair we are ready to begin.
        CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Good afternoon and welcome to
18
19
     this oversight hearing of the Economic Development
20
     Committee of the New York City Council.
21
        Today is Wednesday April 27, 2022. My name is
2.2
     Amanda Farías, and I am the chair of this committee.
23
        The purpose of today's hearing is to discuss the
24
     impact that the Hunts Point Food Distribution Center
25
     has on the City in terms of the services it provides,
```

Committee on Economic Development the resiliency of its property, and the people it employs on the Hunts Point Peninsula in the Bronx.

The Hunts Point Food Distribution Center, or FDC for short, is one of the largest food distribution centers in the world. It is comprised of three large cooperative markets selling meat, fish, and produce as well as other large food distributers. The land used for the markets is mostly City owned, and parcels are separately leased to each of the cooperatives and food distributers via the City's Economic Development Corporation [NYCEDC].

The EDC and The Meat Cooperative recently negotiated a 40-year lease term in 2018. The Produce Market's lease was just extended by 10 years to 2031 and the Fish Market's lease does not expire until 2054.

In spite of the lease renewals, several lingering issues remain at Hunts Point. These include the need for continued facility improvements and space, overlapping or duplicate regulatory burdens for food businesses, and ongoing climate resiliently concerns due to much of the FDC's location being within the City's 100-year flood plan.

2.2

2.3

During Hurricane Sandy in 2012, the area around Hunts Point lost power for roughly 36 hours, which mercifully did not result in catastrophic losses to the regional food supply. However, if the power was out for much longer, there could have been \$2 million in daily direct economic loss for the markets and the local economy.

It is terrifying to consider that such a vital part of our City's food and economic systems could have been so vulnerable to climate damage.

Part of what the committee looks to discuss today is the new administrations plans to fortify Hunts Point against future catastrophic storms.

Here I would like to acknowledge the tireless work being done by my colleague Council Member Rafael Salamanca, who represents District 17 in The Bronx, and has worked towards improving the Hunts Point wholesale and residential communities during his time at The Council. I know Council Member Salamanca has worked with both the current and previous administrations to improve the climate resiliency of Hunts Point, and has also sought to ensure that the markets continue to employ people from the area in

2.2

2.3

Committee on Economic Development 7 stable, quality jobs that allow them to support their families.

The goal of today's hearing is to determine how the largely new City Council can partner with the new administration to build upon the work done under the last mayor towards protecting Hunts Point.

Mayor Adams' new blueprint has dedicated \$100 million towards improving the market and an additional \$40 million to the neighborhoods around the market.

We hope to partner with The Mayor and EDC to ensure the appropriate utilization of this funding as well as additional funds from State and Federal sources.

We also plan on discussing what ongoing steps the new administration is taking in the areas of flood proofing and energy resiliency; how union labor is being employed at the markets; and the challenges the markets are facing with respect to expansion and further infrastructure development.

In addition to The Economic Development

Cooperation, we look forward to hearing testimony
today from The Business Integrity Commission, which

2.2

2.3

1 Committee on Economic Development 2 plays a vital role at the market in its enforcement 3 capacity. With that said, I would like to take a moment to 4 5 acknowledge the other council members present today: Council Member Salamanca, as I mentioned, and Council 6 Member Ari Kagan. I will now turn the floor over to my colleague 8 Council Member Rafael Salamanca to say a few words. COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Chair, before we send it to 10 11 Council Member Salamanca, I am just going to turn it 12 to one of the sergeants real quickly, because we are 13 having a minor tech problem in the background. CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Sounds good. 14 15 DIRECTOR OF SECURITY: It will just take a minute. COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you. Thank you, 16 17 Chair Farías. Sergeant At Arms, let me know when I 18 can give my brief statement. 19 DIRECTOR OF SECURITY: As soon as we get the 20 situation corrected, we will let you know. 21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you. DIRECTOR OF SECURITY: Council Member Salamanca, 2.2 2.3 you can continue. COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, uh, thank 24

25

you Sergeant At Arms.

First I want to thank Chair Farías for putting
together this important hearing on The Hunts Point
Food Distribution Centers as a whole.

2.2

2.3

You know, the markets at Hunts Point as a whole and the markets have played an important role in my life just like it has played an important role in thousands and thousands of New Yorkers' lives.

My dad was, uh, worked at the Hunts Point Produce Market for over 18 years. And he was a proud member of Teamsters Local 202. And, it was through that good paying job as a union member, that he was able to provide the food on our table. It was through that job, that union job that my dad had where he had benefits, health benefits especially, that helped out my sister, my mom, and myself.

And, so, I know what it is to have a good paying job, having a dad or a parent as a union member with a good paying job and being able to provide for their families. And, so that is why I take the employment and the market so seriously, because it provides for thousands and thousands of families.

In Hunts Point, we have the Meat Market, Fish
Market, Produce Market, and over 700 businesses, and
they keep our city fed. And, so we as a council have

a responsibility to ensure that they have all the resources necessary, and especially an updated facility so that they can continue to provide this

core service to New Yorkers.

So, today, I look forward to hearing from EDC on a variety of things. First, I wanted... I would like us to get an update as to where we are with the new facility for The Produce Market especially in terms of funding. I know that past administrations have allocated capital dollars. And hopefully EDC can give us a total amount of what is actually in the bank.

I would like to get an update from EDC as well as to where they are with the capital needs that The Meat Market needs? You know, they need a new façade; they need a new system in terms of cold air.

But most importantly, years ago, in the past administration, in conjunction with my office, we allocated funding in The Meat Market for a power grid. I would like to get an update EDC as to -- is the power grid working? If not, why is it not working?

2.2

2.3

1 Committee on Economic Development 11 2 And, I also would like to get an update from EDC 3 in this hearing, in terms of where are we with the capital needs for The Fish Market? 4 And, finally, I am excited to see that there is someone here the Business Integrity Commission (BIC). 6 7 BIC plays an important role, because they have oversight ensuring that, you know, there is no 8 organized crime, and that things are being done the way they should be done --legally. 10 11 But, I am interested in knowing BIC's oversight now in terms of the fees that they charge every 12 business, the fees that they are charging every 13 14 individual employee that works at these businesses. 15 And, finally, I want to talk about the overzealous enforcement from officers from BIC in 16 17 terms of their behavior in the markets. 18 And, with that, I am going to hand it over you, 19 Chair Farías, thank you for the opportunity to speak. CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Thank you so much, uh, 20 Council Member Salamanca -- and for being here. 21 2.2 know this is an important space for you and in your 2.3 community.

Before we turn the floor over to the administration, I would like to thank The Economic

24

6 for their continuous work with me.

1

2

3

4

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

I will now turn it over to our moderator, Alex Paulenoff, to go over some procedural items.

their hard work in putting this hearing together and

And, right before that, I'm sorry, Alex, I would like to acknowledge, Council Member Kevin Riley, who has joined us.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you Chair Farías. As The Chair said, my name is Alex Paulenoff, and I am counsel to the New York City Council's Committee on Economic Development.

Before we begin, I would like to remind everyone that you will be on mute until you are recognized to speak, at which time you will be unmuted by the Zoom host.

If you mute yourself after you have been unmuted, you will need to be unmuted again by the host.

Please be aware that there could be a delay in muting and unmuting, so please be patient with us.

The first panelist to give testimony today will be Sabrina Lippman, The Senior Vice President at the

Senior Vice President Lippman?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: I do.

24

Market Manger at the Business Integrity Commission.

15

2 The the Hunts Point Food Distribution Center,

3 which you will see on the slide in front of you, also

4 known as the FDC, is the single largest geographic

5 cluster of food sources for the City. It sits on

about 329 acres. Simply put, Hunts Point feeds the

tristate area.

1

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

We estimate that 4.5 billion pounds of food is distributed through the FDC every, single year. And about 50% of the food that passes through Hunts Point Food Distribution Center ends up New York City, while the other half ends up in cities across the eastcoast and beyond.

The FDC is comprised of over 100 public and private wholesalers, distributors, and manufactures, including the Hunts Point Terminal Produce Market,

The Hunts Point Cooperative Meat Market, and the New Fulton Fish Market. Close to 50% of the customers at the FDC are independent restaurants and cafes, 20% are bodegas, 18% are supermarkets, and 14% are food markets.

The FDC provides food to more than 23,000 restaurants and engages with over 2,500 green grocers annually. Together the FDC is home to approximately

2.2

2.3

2 8,300 direct jobs -- most of which are good paying,

3 family sustaining jobs proudly filled by Bronxites.

Previously, home to steel mills and power plants, the Hunts Point neighborhood experienced a radical shift in the 1960's as economic trends impacted legacy industry on the peninsula. At that time, the City released a bold plan to create a food distribution center on Hunts Point. The location was well-positioned for the movement of goods at different and many avenues, including rail, highway, and water. And, by locating New York City's primary facilitates for meat and produce wholesalers at one full-service hub, it became exponentially easier for the venders to purchase all of the food they needed in one single location.

Less than a decade later, the Hunts Point

Cooperative Market and Hunts Point Terminal Market

were born, which are known today as The Meat Market

and The Produce Market respectively.

Over the last 50 years, the way in which goods and merchandise have been moved and stored at these facilities has changed significantly, and we continue to work with the tenants at the FDC to meet these changing needs.

The City has made significant investments in

securing and ensuring that the food supply chain

remains strong -- including \$150 million commitment

from the de Blasio administration -- to bring

6 different parts of the FDC into a state of good

7 repair. This investment supports FDC-wide

1

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

8 infrastructure improvements, remediation, the

9 construction of the new GrowNYC facility, fish and

10 meat market improvements, and includes an allocation

11 | for The Produce Market's redevelopment.

We are now seeking to redevelop The Produce

Market, which opened in 1967, in to a modern,

resilient and Food Safety Modernization Act Compliant

Facility with expanded warehouse capacity, which will

be critical in reducing emissions and improving

traffic circulation within the FDC.

Last month, Mayor Adams committed \$100 million to The Produce Market redevelopment. In the administration's blueprint for economic recovery, redevelopment of The Produce Market will protect and strengthen the food supply chain on the city, regional, and national levels; it will retain the 2,000 quality jobs at The Produce Market; it will reduce emissions and improve traffic circulation on

18

2

3

4

6

8

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

city-owned land in the environmental justice neighborhood of Hunts Point; it will support produce market business growth and achieve more efficient land use; and will create a global architype for 21st century urban food distribution.

We are especially pleased to be working closely with Council Member Rafael Salamanca on The Produce Market redevelopment.

We are also actively working to make sure that the FDC is not only prepared for climate change but also sustainable. Since our last hearing in 2019, in partnership with our tenants, we have made significant strides towards these goals -- including providing backup power to The Meat Market to maintain energy continuity, HESCO barriers at The meat markets protect against storm surge, installing solar on the roof of Krasdale to power the building and provide clean energy to the community, and working with each of our tenants on emergency operational plans so that they can respond to a disaster.

Fortunately, many of the buildings that the FDC are naturally elevated limiting their exposure to Sandy-like storm surge. We are also advancing the backup power to The Produce Market at 600 Food Center

19

2 Drive in case of a power outage. And we are in the

3 beginning stages of a comprehensive energy study at

4 The Food Distribution Center -- a plan that will

5 provide diversified recommendations about to make the

6 campus as environmentally sustainable as possible.

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

Together our work at the FDC will grow this cluster of commerce and jobs and ensure that local residents continue to benefit from the presence of this concentration of market and food manufactures as well as prepare the FDC for climate change and energy sustainability.

Thank you so much for the opportunity to talk about The Food Distribution Center and Hunts Point today. We are here to answer any questions you may have.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Miss Lippman.

I will now turn it over to questions from The Chair.

And panelist from the administration, please stay unmuted if possible during this question and answer period, uh, and a reminder to Chair Farías, you will be in control of muting and unmuting yourself during this period.

Uh, Chair Farías, you may begin when ready.

1 Committee on Economic Development CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great, thank you. You're

20

3 putting me to work today, I have to unmute myself,

2

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

too! No, I'm just kidding.

Hello, good afternoon, thank you so much for testifying again. The Hunts Point Food Distribution Center is one of the largest food distribution centers in the world, uh, we are very proud of that in The Bronx. It is comprised of three large cooperatives, The Produce, Meat, and Fish Markets and other large distributors like Baldor.

Could you give us an overview of the land at the FDC, how much is City land versus State, Federal or private land?

And, how does the FDC work with the State to coordinate any use of the land at Hunts Point if at all?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: [THIS TESTIMONY HAS STATIC AND INAUDIBLE AUDIO THROUGHOUT] absolutely, and thank you so much for that question, Chair Farías. I'm sorry, I am having audio issues on my side.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: That's okay.

vast majority of the Hunts Point Food Distribution

Committee on Economic Development 22

Center, and very few development parcels remain for the futre. So, we are definitely laser-like focused on finding ways to ensure that every piece of land is

2.2

2.3

activated.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great, yeah, if we... I mean, if we can get a followup with just ,like, how much is unused and....

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely. We will definitely circle back with your team on the exact acreage that's unuded.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Thank you. I'd like to acknowledge Council Members Nantasha Williams and Jennifer Gutiérrez that have joined us here.

So, can you give us an overview of the food distribution businesses with separtate leases that are not a part of the three cooperatives? How many separately leased businesses are there?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely. So, we have 10 tenants in total at the Food Distrution

Center, uh, three of which you just named are the,

uh, three cooperatives that we have there. The other

seven tenants, are Baldore, which it I think was

mentioned earlier. We have also have, uh, Dairyland,

The Chefs' Warehouse, that is their own business; we

23

2 have Krasdale, Anheuser-Busch, which is also on its

3 own parcel, Sultana, and Citarella are two businesses

4 that are within what we call the 600 Food Center

5 Drive, which is an EDC operated building, uhm, then

6 last, but not least, of course GrowNYC, which we are

7 so excited to see open.

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Can you explain roughly how restaurants and markets in the City benefit from having the markets in such a close proximity?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: I am so sorry, I just... I couldn't hear that. So, can you repeat the question, Chair Farías?

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Explain roughly how restaurants and markets in the City benefit from having the markets in such a close proximity?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely, it is incredibly beneficial to have geographic clusters of food distrubutin. And, the reason for that is it...

They all benefit from the proximity of one another, because as you can imagine, whether it's a grocer or a restaurateur, it allows for a single point and a singular hub where different restaurants and businesses can be clients and be able to deliver and receive produce -- meat, fish, and other

Committee on Economic Development 24 nonperishilbe items -- in one single location. So, it reduces truck traffic, it kind of is a one stop shop, if you will.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Alright, and what is the nature of the relationship between The Market and EDC? I have a couple of questions that I can run through. Well, let's start there with the relationship between the two. And, then I will run through the four.

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: So, the relationship is a landlord/tenant relationship. So, we are the landlord for the 10 tenants that we just described -- all of which are on differing varietal of terms of leases. And, so we are what we call the master, uh, landlord, and then tenants have significant rights and responsibilities for their land, since most of them are on long-term ground leases.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: And, if the cooperative at
The Markets wish to do any capital improvements,
what's the approval process for EDC as the landlord
for any improvements or infrastructure investments?
Like, can they make them as of right?

2.2

2.3

Thev

They can.

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: They

3 absolutely can make their own improvements as of

4 right. Every lease if different, so there is

5 different -- so there are different levels to that,

6 so I do want to preface that. But, I am unbelievably

7 proud of the relationships we have built, especially

8 | in the recent years, with not only the three

9 cooperatives, but all of the companies and businesses

10 that are operating out of the FDC. And, so, as

11 partners, we work with them very closely to determine

12 what their needs and to ensure that we are able to

13 | advocate for the infrastructure need that they might

14 need.

1

2

15 CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great, thank you. Can you

16 talk a little bit about the day to day repairs and

17 upkeep that EDC makes to The Markets if any at all?

18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: So, uh, if we

19 | specifically look at the three markets, uh, each one

20 | has different engagement with EDC. So, I will start

21 | with The Fish Market. We are most involved in The

22 | Fish Marker, because we, in their recent lease,

23 understood that they needed some support in

24 operational maintenance. And, so we actually operate

25 and maintain that facilities common area.

2 For The Meat Market and The Produce Markets, both 3 of those markets, under their leases, are responsible

4 for operations and maintenance of the asset.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay, and if there is any emergency expenses, like damaged roofs, flood recovery, is that landlord responsibility or tenant responsibility for payment?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: I'm so sorry, Chair Farías, if there is any damage on?

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: If there are any damages for like emergency preparedness [INAUDIBLE 00:26:33]... (CROSS-TALK)

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: [INAUDIBLE 00:26:34] like roofs or anything like that?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: So, again, each lease is, uh, is unique in how it, uhm, delineates responsibility, but when it comes to emergency preparedness, as I mentioned in the testimony, we are absolutely laser like focused in being partners in this arena. So, we have worked with each tenant to help prepare their emergency plans. We ensure that we have met the needs of each tenant in terms of

2.2

2.3

2.2

2.3

2 working closely with them to identify what those

3 elements are that they need and advocate for those.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great. And, does the EDC meet with Market board members, if so, how often?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely. It also... That also varies per lease. But, we sit on The Meat Market board meetings. So, Bruce and Andy, who I know are on the call, see me pretty often along with my team, on a monthly basis. I know Phil is on the call. Phil and, us, over at The Produce Market, we are in constant communication and just meet with their board on a regular basis — especially with the conversation that we are having with the redevelopment. And, because we operate The Fish Market, we are constantly onsite there.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Awesome.

Alright, can we... Can you give me an idea on, like, recent upgrades EDC has made to the markets or is maybe planning to make? Any upgrades to a refrigeration systems or any energy generating systems, building structure upgrades?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely. So, maybe a good place to start is at The Meat Market, since a part of their, uh, part of the \$150 million

Committee on Economic Development 28
revitalization, we made some significant investments.
We are incredibly proud of the strong partnership we
have built there. And, we have several ongoing and
upcoming City capital infrastructure improvements
happening at The Meat Market. We have done hot water
system upgrades. We are in the process of starting
up paving and site improvements. Uh, as Council
Member Salamanca mentioned, we have some significant
façade improvements that need to be there. We are
undergoing one building upcoming and are looking to
hopefully secure additional funding for the remaining
three. We have been able to install a backup
generator, which is absolutely, as you have heard
over and over again, critical to ensuring that the
food supply chain, particularly at The Meat Market is
saved and preserved. So, that scope is completed,
and we are, in the coming weeks, turning that
generator over to The Meat Market. But, it is
connected to The Meat Market should anything happen.
A replacement of an elevation of the electrical
equipment is a part of this scope; central plant
upgrades, uh, as mentioned, we are also very
interesting in ensuring that we can secure subsidy

1 Committee on Economic Development 29 and funding to improve Brine tunnels, which is the 2 refrigeration piece.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great.

3

4

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

I would like to talk a little bit about the individual markets themselves. I can start off with produce. The City and The Produce Market negotiated a 10-year lease extension in 2021 that expires in 2031. Could you provide us with details of the new lease extension? What is the long-term plan for this lease on The Produce Market -- and if there are currently ongoing lease negotiations beyond the 10year?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely. as I mentioned earlier, we are just so incredibly thrilled with the announcement that our mayor made of \$100 million down payment towards the redevelopment of The Produce Market.

The Produce Market lease is part of a 45-year lease that they have had since, I think, early 1980's. And, so, they exercised their last 10-year option, that's the 2021 amendment -- is the ability to exercise that last 10-year option. So, which brings us into 2031. And, as a part of that extension, part of that the language in that

amendment, is to work together to ensure that we can find a way to redevelop this produce market and ensure its ability [LOST AUDIO] [INAUDIBLE 00:31:08] and remain place for the long term. And, so, as we are seeking to redevelop The Produce Market in to this modern, resilient, FISMA compliant facility, with expanded warehouse capacity, we are in constant conversation with them about... And, our... candidly, in the early stages of ensuring that we

2.2

2.3

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great, thank you.

build the right market for the cooperative.

Most of the loading docks and The Produce Market are used as extensions of the vendor space and refrigerated trailers running on diesel fuel, this has an adverse impact on the respiratory health, not only of the market workers, but on neighboring communities as well. I grew up in Soundview and have grown up with asthma since the age of nine, it's really, really close -- across the water from the market -- so, what plans, if any are in the works to reduce the number of diesel truck trailers used as storage space, uhm, and will the redesign of The Produce Market enlarge and enclose these spaces and eliminate the need the for the trucks?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely. And, Chair Farías, we share your concern about the asthma rates in the local neighborhood. And, we are working to advance several environmental justice elements and initiatives in the Hunts Point neighborhood.

At the FDC, we are 100% committed to working closely with The Produce Market. And, I am, uh, very, very adamant about, as EDC is, about the fact that this redevelopment of The Produce Market will eliminate every, single diesel emitting stationary TRU (sp?) that is currently onsite. The expanded warehouse capacity will allow for all of those TRUs to come offline. And, the cold chain compliance will also support reducing the emissions. Not only that, the redevelopment also significantly improves both traffic circulation to reduce the amount truck idling that happens in just ,you know, the traffic congestion that we have there, and it improves the efficiency of rail use, which we want to encourage.

And, so we are very, very excited that this redevelopment will achieve those goals.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great, that is really great to hear. I kind of was not expecting to hear the elimination of all of this, so that is every exciting

1 Committee on Economic Development 32 2 But it does bring up, do we have a rough 3 timeline and a cost estimate of what that really 4 [LOST AUDIO] [INAUDIBLE 00:33:42] is for the market? SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Yes, this is the right question to ask. We are still in the early 6 7 stages here, and we are working continuously with The 8 Produce Market to identify that scope and design, which will ultimately give us that answer. Right? It will give us the construction schedule; it will 10 11 give us the exact need for in terms of size of 12 subsidy needed. The, again, the \$100 million down 13 payment is critical to moving this project forward, 14 but we are definitely looking to our friends at the 15 State and the Federal level to help make this project 16 a reality. 17 CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Yeah, that's great. Please 18 keep us in the loop of all that, as I know you will. 19 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely. CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: So, as we mentioned, EDC 20 announced plans to redevelop The Produce Market in 21 2019, The Mayor's blueprint announced the \$100 2.2

million for the markets redevelopment, and \$40

million for the nearby Bronx neighborhoods, what

details can you share about The Produce Market's

2.3

24

33

3

4

2

5

6

7

8

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

redevelopment plans? Particularly, also, how will the \$40 million for the neighborhood be spent -- the locality, the local surrounding communities are really important to me in terms of how that money is disseminated, and for what are its uses? \$140 million allocation separate from the amount reserved for the markets lease extension?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Yes, the money is separate from... Well, we have a \$100 million that came from Mayor Adams just last month. That is in addition to the \$30 million that was allocated in the Mayor de Blasio administration. So, from the City perspective, it's a \$130 million total that we have allocated directly for the redevelopment of The Produce Market. The \$40 million allocation is stemming from our Hunts Point Forward plan that we are unbelievably excited about. And my colleagues who are driving that have just really launched a remarkable initiative there. And, so that plan is due to be released very soon, and I know that our team will circle back with you, Chair Farías, and The Committee, as we get closer to that announcement. And, that is the place where they will be able to disseminate how the \$40 million is, in conjunction

1 Committee on Economic Development 34 with the community's needs, going to be distributed. 2 3 But, the \$130 million that we currently have allocated for The Hunts Point Produce Market 4 5 redevelopment is what we currently have allocated for that project, and are always looking for additional 6 sources of funding. CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great, thank you for that 8 response. In 2012, the City, State, and Federal governments 10 committed a combined \$172.5 million investment in 11 12 improvements at the produce market. Are there any remaining funds that have not been used or put to use 13 14 from this pot of money? 15 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Can you reference 16 the pot of money again? What... 17 CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Oh, one second... 18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Is that the \$100 19 The \$150 million from de Blasio and... administration that was allocated? 20 CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Alex, would you happen to 21 have that in front of you in terms of the \$172 total? 2.2 2.3 I think it was during the lease negotiations in 2012. They secured \$172 million in funding for 24

redevelopment at Hunts Point. It included \$50

```
1
                Committee on Economic Development
                                                       35
2
     million from the State, $87.5 million in capital in
3
     tax incentives from the City $10 million from the
4
     Department the US Department of Transportation, uh,
5
     for a grant for freight rail improvements on the
    market, and then $25 million from the Federal
6
7
     Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement
8
     Program.
        SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: We...
                                                (CROSS-
10
     TALK)
        CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: For the $172.5
11
12
        SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: That's where...
13
     Okay, we do have the $25 million Congestion Air
14
     Quality is funding that we consider State funding,
15
    because it's like our State CMAQ grant, so that will
16
    be fully allocated. We are working with our friends
17
     at State DOT to ensure that we can allocated those
18
     funds to The Produce Market Redevelopment. So, yes,
19
     that is there. The State funding piece I'm not
     directly familiar with -- the $50 million.
20
        CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay.
21
        SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: As well as...
2.2
2.3
     So, that I do need to just go back and come back to
     you, Chair Farías... (CROSS-TALK)
24
```

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great.

Committee on Economic Development 37
conversations with The Meat Market in regards to that

2.2

2.3

site.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Awesome. In 2012, US DOT, as I just mentioned, awarded a \$10 million grant for freight rail improvements at The Produce Market, were these improvements, uh, are there other freight rail improvements that the City is seeking to make through FreightNYC?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Yes, those improvements were made to the Sawtooth Rail back then, and those improvements were completed. And, it allowed for us to be able to increase rail capacity there for more efficient, transfer of, like, potatoes and onions from those rail cars that come in from the west coast. And we are always... The movement of goods by rail and freight is critical for us and helps us reduce emissions. And, so we are excited with the redevelopment to make sure that we have that type of progress built in.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Awesome. The next question I have is around Marine stock. I am particularly interested in how we get back on waterways.

So, in March of 2019, EDC issued and RFP for an operator to develop a marine terminal on the Hunts

1 Committee on Economic Development

2 Point Peninsula to encourage barge shipping to and

3 from Hunts Point. Did EDC end up selecting an

4 awardee for the marine terminal development? And, if

38

5 so, how is it progressing?

6 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely.

Thank you for that question.

I am sorry to report, in that specific instance, that RFP process failed. And that was primarily due to the COVID-19, uh, it really was the factor that did not allow that RFP to be successful.

However, the movement of goods by water will provide a vital backdoor to the Food Distribution

Center and helps reduce local truck trips. So, we are... We are seeking to find ways to ensure that we can leverage its proximity to the water. And, I know that the team is working on a pilot project currently with a local distributor to start doing case studies -- Right?-- to only strengthen that... strengthen the case for that, and we are excited to circle back and give you the results of that project... that pilot.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay, great. Is there any interest or plans to reissue the RFP?

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: That is actually... One of my colleagues is running that.

So, I will... I can circle back with you in terms of what the next steps are for the RFP process.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay, great, yeah, I... I'd like to know just because I... I would also make the assumption that the EDC allocated a pot of funds to that development of a barge, and if that pilot failed and we don't have an RFP, then how is that money getting reutilized or reallocated in to an area for either movement of stuff by freight, or if that effort is going towards going back on to the water even if it is without a barge. So, uh, awesome, yeah, any information on that would be great.

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: I would like to ask a little bit about workforce. How many of the employees at each market are union members?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: We don't have an exact number for you, but I can tell you over...

And, I'm sure ,you know, Phil, and now I'm looking at Danny, uh, will have tons of answers for you there, because they have a significant Teamsters Local 202,

1 Committee on Economic Development

2.3

_ 1

uh, stronghold on The Produce Market. And, the vast majority of the employees are part of that union.

The Meat Market has a meat packing union onsite as well, where a significant number of employees are doing that. The Fish Market has the United Seafood Workers Union, Local 359. And, so we are incredibly proud of these good paying family sustaining jobs that FDC is able to provide. And, we are excited to continue to find ways to expand that.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay, great, thank you.

Before I continue on, because I am going to reorganize some of my question, I see that Council Member Salamanca has his raised, so we will let him ask some questions.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, uh, hello everyone. Thank you, Chair Farías, uh, for allowing me to speak.

Uh, Sabrina, I really want to thank you and your team. You know, I do have some tough questions for you, uh, but I want to say how delightful it is to work with yourself, Nate, and Fernando Ortiz on first Hunts Point Forward Plan, which I am extremely excited about. And, I am extremely thankful, and I have let The Mayor know, on his investment in Hunts

1 Committee on Economic Development 41 Point of the \$140 million announcement that he made 2 3 last month. 4 Now, I want to get straight the funding for The 5 Produce Market. How much... What is the dollar amount that we have today in the bank for a new 6 7 facility for The Produce Market? 8 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: We have \$130 million from the City, uhm, in City subsidy. And, we have \$25 million in a State [BACKGROUND NOISE] 10 11 [INAUDIBLE 00:44:37] CMAQ Grant that we expect will 12 be allocated. 13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: And, that's what you 14 have in the bank right now as we speak? 15 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Correct. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright. How... 17 The... Now this \$130 million, is that including the 18 \$100 million from the Eric Adams, Mayor Adams? 19 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Yes, sir. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, so, prior to 21 The Mayor's announcement, you only had \$30 million from City dollars for the market? 2.2 2.3 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Specifically

allocated to the redevelopment, that is correct.

Committee on Economic Development 1 42 2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: How much funding did 3 then Mayor de Blasio, allocated to the market in his eight years? But, just specifically just for that 4 5 project? The Produce, uh, The Produce Market... (CROSS-TALK) 6 7 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Specifically... Specifically for The Produce Market redevelopment, it 8 9 was \$30 million in the funds. Which is the \$30 million that I am referencing. 10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Just the \$30 million. 11 12 And, so, okay, so, de Blasio puts in \$30 million, Eric Adams puts in \$100 million, how did, Mayor 13 14 Bloomberg, uh, put in at the time? 15 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: That is a great 16 question, Council Member, I would have to look back 17 and circle back with you on that number. 18 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Now, the funding that 19 is there, because I know that there have been capital 20 improvements done in the markets. Uh, the rail was done, I don't know what other work, but I know rail 21 2.2 work was done. Where did that money come from? 2.3 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: So, there is a combination of funding for the rail. I was 24

25

generally... [LOST AUDIO]

okay, I can see you now. Alright, thank you.

Hey, first, I would want to congratulate the new
BIC Commissioner, and look forward to working with
them, and having a one on one and maybe doing a tour

5 of The Market.

2.2

2.3

I am not going to be able to express all of our concerns here today, uh, but I do have some concerns on some of the operations regarding the oversight that BIC has in the markets. And, I just want to have this open dialogue like I had with the prior administration there.

So, BIC, you've played an important role. I remember my dad working in the markets, and my dad coming home and saying, "Hey, they came in, and they just arrested a bunch of people for organized crime." And, the BIC served its purpose. You came in, you cleaned house and ensured that ,you know, that businesses were abiding by the law.

Now, I know that you have been there ever since. My question is, you charge every business fees to operate. Right? And, you charge every individual a fee to have a BIC license -- you may have the right word for that. What is the dollar amount that you charge every business?

three years.

```
1
               Committee on Economic Development
                                                      46
 2
        COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Every three years?
 3
     So, every three years businesses have to pay $4,000?
 4
        EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Yes, sir.
 5
        COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Now, is this a flat
     fee? So, you may have a business that has 15
 6
 7
     employees compared to a business that has 300
 8
     employees?
 9
        EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Correct.
                                                       The
     application is for the entity -- for the business
10
11
     that is applying. So, it is a flat fee for the
12
     application, but there is, I believe you were trying
13
    to discuss photo identification? [INAUDIBLE
     00:49:43]... (CROSS-TALK)
14
15
        COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yes, that was my next
16
     question, because I know... The businesses...
17
     (CROSS-TALK)
18
        SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired... (CROSS-TALK)
19
        COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: as a whole have to
20
     apply. And, then you have the individual employees
21
     that have to apply. And what are your... (CROSS-
     TALK)
2.2
2.3
         EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Yes, that is
    correct.... (CROSS-TALK)
24
```

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: What are their fees?

2.2

2.3

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Thank you for that question, Council Member. That fee is \$150.00, but it is a one-time fee. It is a fee that we then review that individual, and just to give you an example, a couple of years ago, we had an individual that applied for a photo identification, when we did the background on it, we found that individual was associated with organized crime. And, therefore, we denied that person's photo identification. So, that fee goes towards that background. But, there are two separate things. The application fee is for the company, and the photo identification is for the employee.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yes, yes.

Now, how often do they need to the... How often does an employee have to renew is identification?

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: They never have to renew it. Once they receive... One we review it and we determine that they do not lack good character, honesty, and integrity, they are permitted to operate in the markets.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay. So, it's...
Okay, alright, that's good.

2.2

2.3

is their role?

What is your policy in coming in to a business and asking to see the employee's I.D.? And, the reason I ask is, born and raised here, have many friends that are in the markets, I have heard many complaints about... And, I mentioned this in my opening statements, overzealous enforcement officers just walking in, stopping shop, putting everyone against the wall, and basically just asking them for their I.D. And, so, I just wanted to know, what is your... How often do your enforcement officers enter these businesses, and what... Break it down. What

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Sure, so the market agents' role is to go through the markets, and they patrol their area either on foot or in a vehicle. Right now, we are talking about photo identifications in the market, so when they are patrolling by, you know, walking around the markets, they do inspections of a location, because we have had situations where companies do not tell us that employees are working there. And, then, it is because those individuals most likely would not get a photo identification, because they have problems with their possible criminality or things that would

1 Committee on Economic Development 49 2 prevent them from getting a photo identification. 3 So, we have to do inspections to make sure that the 4 people who are working at the market, are individuals 5 that won't cause safety concerns to the rest of the customers and the market as well as the other 6 7 employees. So, we make sure that everyone who is there` has a photo identification and has been 8 reviewed and has a background, again, does not lack good character, honesty, and integrity. 10

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, alright... (CROSS-TALK)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

often, Council Member. I can tell you that, like, the inspections for photo identifications, they are on a case by case basis. It will be because we have information that this certain business has 10 employees that have been disclosed to the commission, yet we see 20 employees walking around. Based on that discrepancy, 10 employees are not being disclosed, so we have to take a look at that.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, alright.

Well, I want to thank you for answering my questions. And, again, uhm, if you can, uh, someone from your office can reach out, I want to connect

Committee on Economic Development 50 with your office, so that we can have a one on one, uh, you know, meeting with your commissioner.

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Council

Member, Elizabeth Crotty just came to this

commission, as you know, as appointed by Mayor Adams.

She is here. She is excited to have a relationship,

not just with the markets, not just with the

companies, but she wants that relationship with the

City Council, and have your input with respect to the

important matters that effect your constituency. So,

she and I would look forward to the opportunity to

discuss any issues with the market that you have.

And, we would love to meet with you at the earliest

convenience.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you.

Uh, Madam Chair, is it possible that I can ask, uh, EDC a few questions. I don't want to overstep CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: No, you sure can. That's okay.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: We're co... We're cochairing now... (CROSS-TALK)

2.2

2.3

1 Committee on Economic Development

51

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Sabrina... Uh,

3 Sabrina, so I want to go back to the question that we

4 had for Sabrina. She just needs to be unmuted.

There you go...

5

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

6 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Thank you, there

7 | we go. Can you hear me, Council Member?

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yes

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Thank you, sorry about that. I promise that wasn't on purpose. You know, I... I expect nothing less than to answer your questions, because they are all coming from a very good place. I know that.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, so we were discussing the dollar amounts for The Produce Market, the facility itself. And, I was trying to get an understanding of... Well, you mentioned that there is a \$130 million that we currently have from the City -- \$25 million that is available that the State has that's available for us.

Uh, and I am just trying to... What I am trying to get at is, what's the cost of the facility? Do we have an accurate cost of it? What would it cost to give The Produce Market a state of the art facility?

2 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely.

like I mentioned earlier to Chair Farías, and as you

know, Council Member, this is going to be a 4

significant project. And infrastructure project that

is without a doubt is going to need the multiples of 6

7 the already committed funding. However, until we

8 have a better sense of the scope of the project, and

that is what we are working so closely with the co-op

produce market to identify, until we have a true 10

11 scope and design, it is very difficult to be able to

12 give a number.

1

3

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

I think we are... I am not saying that we are not close, I think we are close, but until we have that scope and design, I would hate to throw out numbers without knowing more about the building that is getting built.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA:

there. Where are we?

Where are with the scope and the design? remember pre-pandemic, there was a sit-down with then President James Patrick that we had with the leadership in the market. And, we sat down, and there was an RFEI, I believe that was being put out

2.2

2.3

right. So, we released and RFEI for this project in August of 2019. We had respondents to this. We have been working with a respondent alongside The Produce Market cooperative the entire time. Where we are currently, is nailing down -- What is that scope? -- What is that final design? -- So that we can attach a number to it, and we can attach a construction timeline to it. That isn't stopping us from going out and talking to our friends at the State and Federal level to find additional subsidy. But, we really need to kind of fine tune that scope in order to be able to get that number.

I would say we are likely... You know, to us, we are going to be circling back with you, with the Committee, you are one of the first folks... we are going to circle back, once we have a better sense of the amount that we are talking about.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Alright, do we have a timeline as to when we will have the scope and design ready?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: I mean, a lot of that is dependent on how the conversations with the cooperative go in terms of the needs that they have

Uh, in 2015, EDC and [BACKGROUND NOISE]

Committee on Economic Development 55

[INAUDIBLE 00:58:31] convened an advisory working

group of Hunts Point stakeholders to develop

priorities and make recommendations for Hunts Point

resiliency improvements. The working group

recommended that the City focus on power, energy, and

coastal protection as it moves forward with the

improvements. EDC decided to launch a pilot project

for power and energy resiliency.

2.2

2.3

Can we get an update on The Hunts Point Energy Resiliency Pilot Project?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely, and thank you for asking that.

So, as we have stated, we are absolutely committed to energy resiliency. In regards to The Energy Resiliency Pilot Project, we are looking to build our solar and storage components of this project, which has been made challenging due to evolving legislation and supply chain issues. So, similar to what I am sure you have seen firsthand, COVID-19 had a significant impact on that supply chain. But, we are back at it and looking for ways to advance the energy resiliency as much as possible.

We have been working closely to do all of the due diligence necessary to ensure that we are doing what

Committee on Economic Development 56

is best for the project and what will be the most

3 effective use of the funding.

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

In the time that has gone by, we are excited to finally be at a place where we are formally moving forward to get this project done.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Awesome. To we have progress of the tri-generation micro grid?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Yeah, so in the time that we initially had the tri-generation micro grid come up, there have been significant changed circumstances specifically for the tri-generation portion of this. And, primarily, the main factor has been legislation at the City and State level that are moving towards decarbonization, which of course we are supportive of. And, so because of the legislation change and the moving away of decarbonization, uh what tri-generation does is use natural gas. But, that is the burning of fossil fuels, which if we install the tri-generation in its original concept, we would be burning those fossil fuels in the long-term. And, so that is... We are pivoting from that strategy, and we are looking at how we can build a grid that is based on clean energy generation as much as possible. So, that harkens

Committee on Economic Development 57

back to the solar piece of this, the battery storage

piece of this, which is critical. [INAUDIBLE

01:01:18]... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great. And is this...

Sorry, go ahead?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Oh, and focusing on the backup energy piece.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Perfect.

What is the progress of implementing the solar and storage at, particularly at M.S. 424 and P.S. 48?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Uh, we are moving full steam ahead and looking to find ways to accelerate the timeline to be able to implement that piece of the project, and we are excited to come back to you with what that timeline looks like.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great, and has the EDC supplied mobile emergency diesel generators to FDC markets?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: We have, as I mentioned earlier, we have implemented permanent backup power at The Meat Market. And, we are looking to include backup power for 600 Food Center Drive as well as The Produce Market at this time.

2.2

2.3

_

,

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great. In 2019, EDC decided to move forward with building flood proofing or hardening over other coastal resiliency measures.

Could you provide details on the decision to choose hardening over any of the other recommendations? I know there were quite a few. And, can you provide an update on the progress of building flood proofing at The Meat Market, Krasdale, and 600 Food Center Drive?

So, uh, we want to ensure that the FDC, Hunts Point, and the City are protected from Sandy-like storm surges.

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely.

We have been able to analyze the risks posed to the FDC from multiple types of disasters. Based on the current risks, a tailored approach to at risk buildings is most the appropriate response, not necessarily coastal protection. We were able to engage in conversations with all tenants, so that they understand the risk and create those emergency actions -- action plans -- as well as mitigation efforts.

So, in the imminent term, in the immediate term, the FDC and Markets' floor level is naturally already elevated due to loading docks. Which is a very good

Committee on Economic Development 59
thing, because it protects the food supply. As, I
mentioned we are advancing those backup power
projects at The Produce Market, uh, and we were able
to achieve backup power for The Meat Market in
addition to HESCO barriers and Tiger Dams that they

2.2

2.3

have onsite.

We are also, to your point of building specific, actively looking for Federal grant funds to harden both 600 Food Center Drive and The Meat Market power building, which are the two buildings most at risk for storm surge.

In terms of The Fish Market, there is a bulkhead already there, and thankful their infrastructure -- electric infrastructure -- is on their mezzanine level and out of the flood plain.

So, in the long term, we are going to continue to seek funding to further protect the food supply.

Obviously climate change is such a huge risk for the entire city, so we need to continue to work cooperatively with City government, State, and Feds to ensure that we can protect the FDC.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Yeah, please keep us in the loop of any addition resiliency efforts that are made. You know, FEMA will be issuing their new flood

Committee on Economic Development 60 plain lines really soon. I know my district is going to be impacted as well in that we are within the flood plains, so this infrastructure is too important to the eastern seaboard, too important to the tristate area for us to not make sure that it is protected.

2.2

2.3

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: And, sorry, I just wanted to... Just in terms of the hardening and these projects, I just wanted to make sure if the estimated costs are available, and if so, is there current funding committed to building the hardening right now?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: We are actively submitting applications for Federal funding in order to be able to do that. And, I am looking into the costs, so I can get that to you potentially in the next few minutes.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great.

And, do you foresee any huge challenges going forward in terms of coastal resiliency for the markets? I know, like, there is a lot of times when we look at peninsulas with building seawalls or bulkheads or things like this, where we do have to

Committee on Economic Development 61 evaluate, like, ricocheting of water in another direction or different things like that.

So, do you see or foresee any challenges going forward?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Currently I think we have the right plan in place. And, you know, I think there is always... It is something that we are constantly looking at. And, to your point, Chair Farías, as the Feds release, as FEMA releases those flood plans, that is somewhat that we are laser like focused in ensuring that we feel that the FDC is protected.

In addition to that, one of the things we are, you know, also as you think about climate change, for us here at the FDC, power outage -- right? -- is where we are more concerned. And, so we are really proud that we are kicking off an energy master planning project that is going to evaluate the current opportunities for energy efficiency and decarbonization in the FDC, and find strategic pathways for implementation of the City and State's long term goals here. So, I think that's... That's an area of focus.

2.2

2.3

_

And, I did get the number for the building hardening. It is about \$20 million that we would need to harden those buildings.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: I'm sorry, I just wanted to... Just want to look at something really quickly.

Uh, in terms of the \$20 million that is needed, do we have any update on... I thought in the resiliency plan for this, there was an awarded \$20 million for The Community Development Block Grant, was that awarded for this project, or was that awarded for something else. Because, I know there was an additional allocation from the City in \$25 million.

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: I, uh, I don't want to speak... Oh, okay, the \$25 million was for the energy resiliency program. So, that is that battery, solar, storage, and the new concept for the tri-generation micro grid.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay.

Okay, great, we will follow up on questions around that.

So, just to go back to workforce, and then we will see if my colleagues have any questions.

In 2015, the previous mayor announced \$150 million investment in The Produce Market that would create 500 permanent jobs, 900 unionized construction jobs, expand rail capacity, remediate underutilized properties for new buildings, expand and modernize existing buildings, and strengthen those building against flooding.

What types of jobs did this investment create?

Have those jobs been created and sustained? And are the jobs expected to be created by The Produce Market redesign?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely. It's a fantastic question. And, for us jobs are so vital and critical to The Food Distribution Center, good paying jobs. That funding helped retain -- again, we have 8,300 jobs out of this distribution center. So, that helped retain the 2,000 in The Produce Market, the 2,500 that are located in The Meat Market, and the close to 1,000 jobs in The Fish Market.

Outside of that, that funding also helped bring in GrowNYC, so, the New York Regional Food Hub, which we are really excited is topping off as we speak, and we will be adding to the job numbers.

The redevelopment of The Produce Market, we anticipate will have job growth, and we are excited to share those numbers with you soon for sure.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great, thank you.

So, I asked earlier about what the percentage of the unionized workers were. My followup is, what is the relationship between the unions representing market workers and the EDC?

and I get along really well. But, uh, in all seriousness, we look to establish strong partnerships across the board. Whether that's with our tenants and each cooperative, uh, whether that is with the businesses that lie within those cooperatives, uh, we also have very strong partnerships. Uh, and I think we are doing a much better job now of building and forging stronger partnerships with Local 202, uh, and are looking forward to continue to build those partnerships with other, uh, unions located within the Food Distribution Center.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: That's great. Is there a commission or any other entity for all three markets to work together in negotiations with the City?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: That's a great question. I'd love the chance to just think about that a little bit more and circle back with you on that.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Sure.

And, are the wages of the markets competitive?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Yes, the wages of the markets are competitive, thankfully, because the vast majority are union. And, I would say that COVID-19 has definitely highlighted not only the importance of these markets, but the importance of the workers that are there, uh, keeping it going. They didn't close for a single day. And, so, yes, they are very competitive... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Yeah.

Great, uh, in 2021, there was a union labor strike at the market. I know Council Member Rafael Salamanca and I were there, if not every... every day then almost every day, along with other elected officials supporting our neighbors.

I just want to ask some questions for the record in terms of what that strike meant for our city.

How did that impact the regional food supply?

2.2

2.3

jobs are for these essential workers, I guess going

forward, it's... And, maybe that is involving and thinking a little bit more about, is there something that unifies the negotiations. But, you know, how can we ensure negotiations and fair contracts going forward for these essential workers are prioritized, as we do not want to be in a situation like this

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely, and I couldn't agree more. And, we are excited, I mean, we met with Danny a few weeks ago to talk about The Produce Market redevelopment and expect him to be at the table along with the cooperative, Phil was there as well, uh, to ensure that we are aligned when we look at this redevelopment.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Awesome. And, by any chance, do we have the percentage of the workforce at the market that our New Yorkers that live nearby or Bronxites particularly?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Uh, we know that that percentage of Bronxites is well above 50%. When you look at the entire Food Distribution Center, not just The Produce Market, as each... (CROSS-TALK)

CHATRPERSON FARÍAS: Mm-hmm

2.2

2.3

again.

as unregistered activity. So, unregistered activity

1 Committee on Economic Development

69

2 is when a company does not go through the process,

does not apply with the commission, starts to operate

4 | in the markets, and then, therefore, The Commission

5 has to take action. We issue them an unregistered

6 activity violation, and that is then, uh, sent to The

7 Office of Administrative Trials and Hearings to be

8 litigated. And, hopefully by issuing that violation,

9 they get the point, and we then also issue them the

10 application and have them apply with The Commission.

11 CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay, just for... I guess

12 | for myself and probably a lot of other people, how

13 available is this information in terms of

14 registration? Or, like, I guess the initial question

15 | that came mind was, how could someone operate within

16 the market without knowing that they have to be

17 registered?

21

25

18 EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Well, if you

19 | are can operate in the three, let's say The Produce

20 | Market or The Fish Market or The Meat Market, there

is cooperative.

22 CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Right.

23 EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: And, it's

24 pretty common knowledge that you must have a

registration to operate in those markets. All of

1 Committee on Economic Development 70 that information is available on website as well as 2 3 BIC has a presence there vis-à-vis a trailer outside 4 of the New Fulton Fish Market, and any documentation 5 that anyone requires, they can get it there. Or we actually send market agents to the location with the 6 7 applications to give it to them in case there is a language barrier or anything of that nature. 8 CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Got it. And do most of your

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Got it. And do most of your documentation -- is there multiple languages? I am assuming Spanish speaking is probably one of the most common, but in The Bronx we have many.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Our applications are not in multiple languages. But, we do have individuals here at The Commission that speak Spanish. So, if there's any questions we have a Spanish speaking individual who will, you know, answer any questions anyone has... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: And, that is for other languages, too.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay, great, I mean, yeah, I don't know what level of interest BIC has in terms of taking their documentation and making them beyond monolingual. You know, nuance is really important in

Committee on Economic Development 71 languages, and sometimes just not be able to read documentation or better understand. I am someone who spoke Spanish first, and I am scared to do Spanish media, so let alone what someone is with an entire registration or application process. Uh, so I would appreciate it the consideration of looking at how you folks can have that and at least the most common languages spoken.

2.2

2.3

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Absolutely.
CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Thank you.

And, then my last followups are, what the relationship like is between markets and BIC? How does BIC interact with other agencies that regulate part of EDC like USDA doing food safety inspections?

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Okay, uh, so the relationship with The Commission and the markets, we have a couple of different ways. The BIC agents who are there, typically when they start their tour, they check in with the security staff of each, you know, the three respective markets so the agents on the ground know what's going on. In addition to that we also have where our investigation supervisors, they speak to the counterparts in the respective markets. So, the supervisors are always constantly

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair Farías.

my time and questions, and pass that back over to my

2.3

24

25

moderator, Alex.

```
1
               Committee on Economic Development
                                                       73
        We will now turn to Council Member Salamanca for
 2
 3
     a second round of questions.
 4
        Sergeants, we will be limiting the second round
 5
     of questions to five minutes.
        COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, awesome, thank
 6
 7
    you. And, thank you, uh, Chair.
        I have a question, a few questions for BIC.
 8
     is your jurisdiction exactly? (CROSS-TALK)
        EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Sure...
10
11
     (CROSS-TALK)
12
        COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: in terms of the
13
    businesses?
        EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Yep, so it's
14
15
    the three markets that we have discussed. The New
16
    Fulton Fish Market, The Produce Market, The Meat
17
    Market, as well as that area that is, let's say,
    north The Fish Market and west of the two other
18
19
    markets, which is called Hunts Point Adjacent Area.
20
        COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: But, they are...
21
     Those areas are not owned by the City.
        EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Correct.
2.2
2.3
    That is [INAUDIBLE 01:20:15]... (CROSS-TALK)
24
        COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: So, how... How...
    How... Why does BIC have jurisdiction over an area
25
```

Committee on Economic Development 74 that is not owned by... That is not run by the City? Who set those lines?

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: That is in our law. The administrative code designates the area where The Commission has jurisdiction. We also have jurisdiction over the Brooklyn Meat Market for example. We have jurisdiction over six wholesale market areas and four of these essentially lie in The Bronx.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, I would... I would like... I know you probably don't have this now, but if you can provide my office with a map of... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: of the catchment area?

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I am interested in

knowing what areas, you know, you actually have

Uh, now my other question is, undocumented individuals, when you come in and you do these spot checks, well are undocumented individuals, are

they... Do... If they apply for employment in one

2.2

2.3

jurisdiction over.

Committee on Economic Development

of the markets, uh, does BIC provide them with

3 | identification?

2.2

2.3

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Citizenship status plays no role in our determination of whether an applicant can, uh, receive a photo identification. It is strictly based on whether they have or lack good character, honesty, and integrity. So, if a person is undocumented, that doesn't matter. We provide the application to everyone.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, alright.

Alright, thank you. Thank you, thank you very much.

EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL MOUSTAKAS: Absolutely.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Those are two questions for the, uh, for BIC.

I just have a few more questions for EDC, uh, and then I am done.

I just want to know, what's the status of the generator for The Meat Market?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Yeah, the...

Thank you, Council Member. So, as you know, because we have been in constant communication on the backup generation for The Meat Market, we are very happy to report that those generators are in place, that they are connected to The Meat Market. And, in the event

2 of a disaster where the power is out, those 3 generators can be turned on and will provide the 4 backup power. We are still a few weeks away from the delivery of that to The Meat Market. So, we are closing out what we would call a punch list, and 6 7 then, when that punch list is closed, The Meat Market 8 can fully adopt the generators. COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: When did this project commence? 10 11 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: This project 12 commenced, uh, I have to look up the year, but it was 13 several years ago at this point unfortunately. 14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Yeah, that's 15 frustrating to know that, you know, years have gone 16 by, and we are still talking about when this project 17 will be complete. 18 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: I completely 19 share that frustration with you, Council Member. 20 And, I am... Although I am, uh, pleased to know that

Committee on Economic Development

76

1

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, and finally, the, uh, The Meat Market capital needs, I know that

the market is now protected for backup power, I

completely agree with you and am in line with your

frustration on how long it has taken to get here.

1 Committee on Economic Development

2 there is an \$11 million need for their cooling

3 system. Uh, then, I believe there is another...

77

4 help me... the façade is that in the [INAUDIBLE

5 01:22:36]... (CROSS-TALK)

6 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Yes, the façade replacement... (CROSS-TALK)

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: million dollars?

Yeah. Are there any plans, uh, from EDC to allocated capital funding to address these two issues?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: We are very happy that we are going to be addressing the building that is in worst condition at the market, and we are already underway to begin that process of replacing that entire façade for that one building. Uh, and as you know, we have been working closely with your office. We have also had the opportunity to meet with The Mayor, uh, to let him know the urgent need for both the brine system as well as the remaining funding needed for the façade replacements.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Okay, alright, thank you very much. Thank you, Madam Chair. I am done with my line of questioning.

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

have a vested interest in understanding how EDC is

Committee on Economic Development 79
envisioning some kind of support for the market in

[LOST AUDIO] [INAUDIBLE 01:25:25] in Williamsburg,

4 which actually I am already doing a walkthrough with

5 | you all soon.

2.2

2.3

But, I am particularly interested in a piece -and I was late -- but I do know that you have drafted
the individual lease agreements with the particular
vendors. Can you explain --if you did that already,
I'm so sorry -- but can you explain a little bit
more, because I think what I heard was saying that it
was, uh, every kind of vendor has a different lease
agreement, different terms, can you explain a little
bit more about what that policy is? Uh, and if and
when you all use uniform, uh, lease agreements -polices?

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely. And, Council Member Gutiérrez, excited to address you and to see you a little bit later this afternoon.

Yes, to answer that question, that's exactly right. Every lease is treated uniquely and differently based on the tenant that we are working with. The vast majority, we have 10 tenants that represent over a 100 business. Each cooperative what we consider one tenant. And, so the way those leases

1 Committee on Economic Development 80

are structured vary, but the vast majority of them are what we call ground leases. They range from 3

4 anywhere between 45-year leases up to 99 years, which

is the longest terms of disposition that we are able

to do. And part of that is to allow each business --6

each tenant -- to have the opportunity to almost play

8 owner of the space and to allow them to invest in

their own space, to find the financing in order to do

that, and that term allows them the flexibility to be 10

11 able to know that they have a significant amount of

term to play with. 12

2

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, thank you. just so you can re-emphasize, I think Chair Farías asked about the opportunity for capital investments for each individual vendor, uh, what is that process like for a vender who is interested in wanting to invest in their own site. And, what is the, I guess, the marriage look like between EDC and, I think,

SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Absolutely. that also varies depending on the lease provisions. There are certain tenants that undergo their own capital infrastructure improvements that we simply approve and ensure that it is aligned with the lease

landlords on the site, and then the vendor?

1 Committee on Economic Development 81 provisions. And, then there are other tenants such 2 3 as the cooperatives, all three of them, uh, that 4 serve such a vital function to the New York City food supply chain. So, what we do, is we work with them constantly. Uh, at The Meat Market, we sit, as an 6 7 example, on their board and learn about what their infrastructure needs are, and then be able to work 8 with them in order to make those new need capital requests. And, so it's really lockstep where we put 10 11 together the project list, uh, and we jointly go and 12 look for the City for funding. COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Well, thank you. 13 Those are my question, because I am serious about how 14 15 similar models can go throughout the other EDC 16 properties. 17 Uh, but, thank you so much for this opportunity, 18 and those are all my questions. Thank you, Chair. 19 SENIOR VICE PRESIDENT LIPPMAN: Thank you, 20 Council Member. 21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Council Member Grodenchik. 2.2 2.3 Uh, now we will turn it back to Chair Farías

before moving on to the public portion of our

24

25

testimony.

1

Committee on Economic Development

82

2

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: I don't have any other

3

additional questions, so I am kicking it back it you.

4

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great, thank you, Chair. And,

5

thank you to the members of the administration for

6

the testimony today.

We will now move on to public testimony.

8

I would like to remind everyone that unlike in

9

our typical council hearings, we will be calling on

10

individuals one by one to testify.

11

three minutes each. You may begin your testimony

Today we will be limiting public testimony to

12

13

14 For council members who have questions for a

once the sergeants have started the timer.

15

particular panelist, should use the Zoom Raise Hand

16

Function, and I will call on you after the panelist

17

has completed their testimony.

18

of our staff will unmute you, and then the Sergeant

For panelists, once your name is called, a member

19

20 At Arms will set the timer and give you the go ahead

21

to begin. So, please wait for the sergeant to

2.2

announce that you may begin before delivering your

2.3

testimony.

24

The first panelist we will hear from today will be Phillip Grant, followed by Arthur Goldstein, and

4 | then Bruce Reingold.

2.2

2.3

Mr. Grant, you may begin when the sergeants announce the time.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

PHILLIP GRANT: Good afternoon, my name is Phillip
Grant, and I am the Chief Executive Officer at the
Hunts Point Produce Market - the largest wholesale
produce market in the nation. Thank you to Chairwoman
Farías and to our very own council member, Rafael
Salamanca, as well as the other esteemed members of
the Economic Development Committee for organizing
this hearing around such a vital topic as food
infrastructure.

The Hunts Point Produce Market has been an essential part of New York City's food Infrastructure with its roots going back to 1790 and continues to do the important work of keeping New York City fed -- keeping New York City fed for over four generations.

The Market was originally located in Manhattan and relocated in 1967 to our current site, a 113 acres in the Bronx. The Hunts Point Produce Market along with several other large public markets, is

1 Committee on Economic Development

2 known as the Hunts Point Food Distribution Center

3 (FDC). We are major employers of Bronxites, and the

4 jobs at the Food Distribution Center are largely

5 | composed of Union Labor and have historically

6 provided salaries more than one third higher than the

average of other industries in the Bronx.

2.2

2.3

The Hunts Point Produce Market is an essential intermodal freight facility that provides 25% of New York City's produce. Every year, more than 2.5 billion pounds of produce - sourced from 49 states and across the globe - pass through the market, feeding New Yorkers and the greater region.

The Market has a customer base that includes the corner push carts to the neighborhood bodegas, to 2500 independent green grocers, to Wegmans and Wholefoods and everything in between. We like to say that if you're eating an apple - it very likely came from our market.

The Hunts Food Produce Market employees nearly 2,000 direct workers, 65% being Bronx based union labor, while also supporting an estimated 7,000 indirect jobs in the region. As I mentioned before, the market was built in 1967. The market continues to work hard in an aging facility to keep pace with

2 New York City's ever growing food demand in the most

3 diverse city in the world. That is why we are

4 grateful to Mayor Eric Adams for making the Hunts

5 Point Produce Market a priority within his first 100

6 days in office and committing \$100 million to the

7 market's redevelopment.

2.2

2.3

We have been working closely with New York City
Economic Development Corporation -- thank you,
Sabrina and team -- the goals of this redevelopment
project are to strengthen and expand our food supply
chain by building a food safety and cold chain
compliant facility able to keep up with the demands
our growing city, work to make food more accessible
to food insecure communities, and support the
development of new jobs and small businesses. The
redevelopment project is estimated to create 1,000
net new direct jobs, most of which will be union
labor and supporting 3,500 net new indirect jobs at
the market.

Again, thank you Chair Farías, and the esteemed members of the Economic Development Committee, for the opportunity to discuss the incredible impact the Hunts Point Produce Market has on New York City. I look forward to one day having you tour our market so

Committee on Economic Development 86
that you can see with you own eyes our complex and

3 massive operation. Thank you; I welcome questions.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Thank you so much for your testimony, Phillip. I am looking forward to coming by one day. I know that it will be soon. The Mayor did put me in a freezer for a press conference a couple of weeks ago. So, I have seen some of it.

I have two questions, just from your perspective, what are the top issues facing the markets today.

And, what does long term success look like for you at the FDC?

PHILLIP GRANT: The two issues facing us... And, once again, thank you, Council Member Rafael

Salamanca, thank you, Sabrina and team, and thank you to The Mayor for this \$100 million investment.

The top issue facing us now is space. You know, we have outgrown our facilities -- so space and age. Our infrastructure has aged. We have been here since 1967. We are well past a useful life. The City, you know, as I said earlier, we are working to figure out what works for our merchants. When we look at what works, we are thinking about the next 55 years. You know? And that is some of the hard work that we are

2.2

2.3

```
1
                Committee on Economic Development
                                                        87
     doing closely with EDC, alongside the council member,
2
3
     to figure out what works here.
4
        The next issue that is challenging for us here,
     is just really working to continue to keep up with
     our labor. Labor has always been a thing... Labor
6
7
    meaning retaining and finding folks outside of the
     [INAUDIBLE 01:34:35] so, those are some of the things
8
     that we are looking towards.
        CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Great, thank you.
10
11
        COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great, thank you, Mr. Grant.
12
        And, next up, we will hear from Arthur Goldstein,
13
     followed by Bruce Reingold, and then Dan Kane.
14
        Uh, Mr. Goldstein, you may begin when the
15
     sergeants call time.
        ARTHUR GOLDSTEIN: Thank you, I apologize...
16
17
     (CROSS-TALK)
18
        SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now... (CROSS-
19
     TALK)
20
        ARTHUR GOLDSTEIN: my... My video is not working.
21
        I work with, uh, Phil Grant, uh, doing government
     relations. And, I just want to say I look forward to
2.2
2.3
    having committee members visit The Produce Market.
    And, I also happen to represent The Fish Market, so
24
```

hopefully you could visit there as well.

But, in terms of the rebuild for the market, we are going to need an incredibly strong partnership, which we already have with the city of New York, uh, with Andrew Kimble and Mayor Adams, and the work that Sabrina is doing and her team. And, we are going to need the State and the Federal governmental. There is no way to meet the numbers that we are projecting without a strong partnership, a united city council, borough president, understanding the value of The Produce Market. We will have to work together to communicate that to the State and Federal level to have an excellent rebuild.

Thank you for your time, appreciate it.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Mr. Goldstein.

Next we will hear from Bruce Reingold, followed by Dan Kane, and then Andy Sussman.

And, Mr. Reingold, you may begin when the sergeants call the time.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time

ANDREW SUSSMAN: Yeah, hi, Andrew Sussman, I am

President of The Hunts Point Market. Mr. Reingold,

who is our general manager had to step away, and he's

unable to make a statement today.

2.2

2.3

But, I can make it on behalf of The Hunts Point

Meat Market.

1

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

I am president of the market, and I am president of Plymouth Beef Company, one of the 42 vibrant businesses that operate within The Hunts Point Market. So, I am speaking from a business standpoint as well as market management standpoint.

I appreciate the opportunity to speak to you all today. I appreciate the ongoing support of Councilman Salamanca, who is a good friend to all the markets. And, I don't want to be redundant, a lot was said about our markets, but understand that, again, 42 vibrant businesses, we feel that it is a great place to do business. A lot of these businesses had opportunities -- and could still have opportunities -- to relocate to other locations with more modern facilities than we have in Hunts Point, but because New York City is such a great place to do business, with proximity to both the City itself and the region -- because this market not only serves the City of New York, but it serves the region as well. Most of us have stayed here, invested here. I am a New York City resident. I was educated here, and I have kept my business here.

2.2

2.3

So, 40% of the protein, ,you know, again, we are talking about various different markets, the beef, chicken, pork -- protein that is distributed, whether it's to all of the supermarkets, restaurants, schools, hospitals, hotels, and other feeding institutions runs through this market. As well as, it wasn't mentioned, the New York City Food Bank operates within the Hunts Point Meat Market, which is a historic and very important resource for the City of New York, and the underserved, and the underfed. And, that operates here within The Meat Market.

COVID obviously was a huge left hook to these businesses, but they were deemed essential. We operated during COVID. We made sure that there was meat on the shelves, whether it's a supermarket, the various home delivery services that cropped up -- not only through our city but our region. And, we were here to support them. We managed these businesses when people obviously were sick. We had to provide transportation. We really did the best we could to serve our city. And, because The Hunts Point Market exists, the food shortages that existed -- and in some cases, exist to this day, because of inflationary pressures, were not as acute as they

```
1
                Committee on Economic Development
                                                        91
     could have been if the City had to be pulling its
 2
 3
     food sources from outside of the city, because we're
 4
     right here. We all have relationships with the
     direct large agriculture companies, whether it's a
     Cargill, or a Tyson, a Swift, they ship directly.
 6
     The state of New York is... (CROSS-TALK)
        SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired... (CROSS-
 8
 9
     TALK)
        ANDREW SUSSMAN: as you all know... Uh, that's
10
11
     too bad, because there are some more important points
12
     to make here.
        Could I... Could I extend for... (CROSS-TALK)
13
        CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: You can finish.
14
15
        ANDREW SUSSMAN: two minutes?
        CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Yes.
16
17
        ANDREW SUSSMAN: Because, there is a lot of
18
     repetition.
19
        The state of New York is doing a great job.
     mean, we are all sitting traffic now. Unfortunately,
20
     it's affecting the diesel that's running, and work
21
     hours with the traffic. But, they are, you know, as
2.2
2.3
     you all know, the DOT is providing direct links to
    the Brøchner and to the Sheraton, in to our market,
24
```

so the trucks no longer have to run through the

Committee on Economic Development 92 neighborhood increasing asthma rates, which is a concern to all of us. And, it will also help the

businesses that operate here on The Point.

2.2

2.3

As stated, the markets operate on City land. EDC is our asset manager. You know, if we look at a 20-year, uh, you know, ark of relationship going back to the Bloomberg administration and before, quite frankly, not so terrific. But, the last... At the end the de Blasio administration in to this administration, uh, EDC is way more engaged with the markets for its improvement, for its employees, and the relationship has never been better -- as Sabrina has indicated.

Look, the markets... This New York City, the greatest city in the world. This market should be on par, and when I say market, it's the meat market, produce market, and fish market, plus the other 700 food businesses that operate on The Point. At the end of the day, this market should be on par with its peer markets nationally and quite frankly internationally. I don't knock it, because I have a huge investment here, but I mean, if you saw the markets in London, to the markets in Los Angeles guys, it's a disgrace.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

And, finally, a forum like this is coming along. Investments are being made. Because, again, the businesses can only maintain the market and take care of our spaces, and that's what we do. But, we can't rebuild the market. The history of the market was this thing was built in the 60's. So, we have the original refrigeration system. So, that's why when we talk about challenges and capital needs, which are being talked about on this call, and I can only speak to The Meat Market, right now. You know, our refrigeration systems need to be upgraded. Our masonry is falling apart. If you visit here, you will see netting over buildings E and F. I mean, that's just sitting there waiting for a solution. The masonry is coming down. As long as... tremendous amount of site work, uh, you know, whether it's paving or other things here, you know, you are running... When the market was designed, you know, you were dealing with 25-foot straight job trucks. We're running 55-foot trailers now in to this market, and the infrastructure is completely falling apart.

So, all of that. You have companies here that are prepared to expand, to spend private dollars to expand, which is more employees. We of the 8,500

1 Committee on Economic Development 94 employees mentioned earlier, uh, represent 2,500 of 2 3 them, primarily Hispanic, primarily African-American, 4 uh, primarily union jobs. We have Local 342 and a teamsters' local here. They're Bronx residents. 5 They're making a living wage. And, there's 6 7 opportunity for expansion. But, we need the support of The City Council, more people than just Council 8 Member Salamanca. And, finally, we are having some traction with 10 11 Gracie Mansion, which is actually very exciting. 12 The other thing, which is a big challenge, and we are dealing with it, and I'm... (CROSS-TALK) 13 14

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: I don't... I don't mean to cut you off, Mr. Sussman, but if you can do this in the next 20 seconds... (CROSS-TALK)

ANDREW SUSSMAN: I'm wrapping it up, I'm wrapping it up... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Okay.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

ANDREW SUSSMAN: Two more quick points... One is the red tape. Even when there are public funds that are shown to us, the red tape and The Mayor, we had a call with The Mayor last week, he's, like, there's red tape. We don't even know why there's red tape. There is so much red tape wit OMB to any of these

And, then, also, uh, you know, not to throw anybody under the bus, but when you hire people like McKissack (sp?), this is what happens.

So, that's all I have to say, and I appreciate your time. I speak frankly, and, you know, I'm in the meat business, and I am a loyal New Yorker... (CROSS-TALK)

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Well, we... I appreciate your testimony, and I took lots of notes. Thank you so much.

ANDREW SUSSMAN: Okay.

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

25

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: And, you can count me in as someone, along with Council Member Salamanca, who is here to support everyone at the market. So, feel free to reach out to me as well.

ANDREW SUSSMAN: Thank you, and I appreciate your time. And, this, uh, you know, these are abc's of me, but thank you for your time. It was a pleasure to be here today.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: For sure.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Mr. Sussman.

at Hunts Point in 1981 as a teenager, and then came

Committee on Economic Development

to return to work there afterwards. It is a place

2.2

2.3

3 that does provide hope and opportunity and a future

4 people -- for working class people, and people who

6 This is a place that lifted my family out of poverty,

struggle to retain regular, fulltime employment.

and I want to see that happen for future generations.

That being said, those are interests that we have all spoken about here today. We spoke about the climate interests, and the infrastructure interests that we need to improve. We need to move in to the 21st century with how we distribute these products. They are essential products, and they are important.

But, sometimes I think what we don't realize is
the impact that the market has. The market is a
unique place. Many cities in this country do not
have a market system to distribute these products,
and therefore limits the diversity of the products
sold. So, New York is one of five or six cities in
this country... It has the most diverse food line in
the country. And, culture in our city is very
important. These markets are the backbone of the
culture of our city. The city's number one industry.

One of the top industries is tourism. People come to New York City because of its culture. They

1 Committee on Economic Development 98 2 come to New York City because it's New York. 3 one of the things we love about living here. that manifests itself in food. And these markets 4 provide a diversified palette -- and I think sometimes in all of the other stuff that we talk 6 7 about, which is very important, my members are 8 important and all of the other workers are important, there's other teamsters that work there -- but just imagine a New York City with only three or four food 10 11 service companies that would provide the food and the 12 product line to New York City. Those cities do exist 13 in this country. And, while I represent people at US 14 Foods, and while I represent people at Sysco, which 15 are the biggest food service companies in this 16 country, The Markets have a more diverse food product 17 line that directly effects this city's large industry 18 of tourism. And, we can never forget that. Yes, all 19 those other things that we spoke about, and I can 20 speak to them for a very long time, and I will not 21 take up your time, because everybody spoke about what 2.2 the jobs mean, what the infrastructure, what the 2.3 climate change... We all know that those things have

to be addressed. But, I think sometimes we miss this

one. People come to a Broadway show, they stay three nights, they eat three times -- they go to one show.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

2.2

2.3

DAN KANE: Very, very important to understand that what it means to the macro economic situation in this city of New York. All of those other interest are important. I want to see these markets stay here, so that people have these opportunities. But, remember what it means to the five boroughs and beyond.

Thank you. If anybody has any questions for me on any one of those issues, I'll gladly answer them, but I am trying to stay within the time.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: I appreciate that.

I did not have any questions, but I do want to continue the conversation on the connection between food and tourism and our cities economy along with our food economy and the State offline, Dan if that's good?

DAN KANE: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: And, I see we have a little issue with Alex. But, I am happy to move on to the next testimony. Uh, Wendy O'Shields (sp?)? If you can unmute yourself, you are up.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

1 Committee on Economic Development 100 WENDY O'SHIELDS: I am actually not testifying 2 3 today, everyone. I was just listening in. CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Oh, okay, great, well, thank 4 5 you so much. WENDY O'SHIELDS: Thank you. 6 CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Sure... (CROSS-TALK) 7 8 WENDY O'SHIELDS: Okay, thank you. CHAIRPERSON FARÍAS: Seeing no other hands from any of my colleagues, I will move to close. But, 10 11 before I do, quickly, are there any procedural items 12 before I give my closing? 13 I am going to take his silence as a, no. 14 So, thank you, to everyone who testified today on 15 this really important and critical issue for The 16 Bronx, Hunts Point and our food economy and our city. 17 This hearing has highlighted the many projects we 18 have going on and the need for follow up on each of 19 them for the betterment of the critical distribution 20 center we have here in our city and our critical essential workforce. 21 I look forward to this continued conversation on 2.2

oversight on projects and the investments that are

2.3

24

being made.

Committee on Economic Development Thank you to all of my colleague, members of my committee who came and asked questions, Council Member Rafael Salamanca, my committee and office staff for today. This hearing is now adjourned at 2:58. [GAVELING OUT] [GAVEL SOUND] Thank you so much everyone. Have a good rest of your day, goodbye.

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 14, 2022