

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

April 25, 2017
Start: 1:40 p.m.
Recess: 3:50 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chamber - City Hall

B E F O R E: LETITIA JAMES
Public Advocate

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Inez D. Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Fernando Cabrera
Margaret S. Chin
Andrew Cohen
Costa G. Constantinides
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.
Elizabeth S. Crowley
Laurie A. Cumbo
Chaim M. Deutsch
Daniel Dromm
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Mathieu Eugene
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Daniel R. Garodnick
Vincent J. Gentile
Vanessa L. Gibson
David G. Greenfield
Barry S. Grodenchik

Corey D. Johnson
Ben Kallos
Andy L. King
Peter A. Koo
Karen Koslowitz
Rory I. Lancman
Brad S. Lander
Stephen T. Levin
Mark Levine
Alan N. Maisel
Steven Matteo
Darlene Mealy
Carlos Menchaca
Rosie Mendez
I. Daneek Miller
Annabel Palma
Bill Perkins
Antonio Reynoso
Donovan J. Richards
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Deborah L. Rose
Helen K. Rosenthal
Rafael Salamanca, Jr.
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Eric A. Ulrich
James Vacca
Paul A. Vallone
James G. Van Bramer
Jumaane D. Williams
Ruben Wills

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rabba Sara Hurwitz
Co-founder and Dean of Yeshivat Maharat
3700 Henry Hudson Parkway
Bronx, N.Y. 10463

2 [sound check, pause]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --started with
4 proclamations, but we need the Council Members here.
5 Alright, Annabel Palma. So we have a—we—we would
6 like to ask the members to join us that are here, but
7 also the cheerleading team that is going to get
8 recognized come on up and join us. [cheers/applause]
9 Council Member Palma is recognizing James Monroe
10 Eagle's Cheerleading team [cheers/applause] for being
11 the first team in the Metropolitan Soundview High
12 School History to make it to Nationals. Wow.
13 [cheers/applause] Wait, Karen, you went to this
14 school. Wow, a small world. You—if some of you can
15 come this way, too, so we can even it out on both
16 sides. It would have been great to set up a video so
17 we could have seen some of your [background
18 comments]—we could have seen some of the performing
19 of the—Alright, I'm going to give it over to Annabel,
20 and [background comments]. Oh, sure, sure. Come
21 behind us. Some of you come behind us so that we can
22 make sure everybody is in the picture. Come on in.
23 Alright, that works?

24 MALE SPEAKER: Yeah, it does.

25

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member
3 Palma.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I'll have you hold
5 this today. Thank you, Madam Speaker for allowing us
6 to recognize the Eagle Cheerleading team as the
7 Metropolitan Soundview High School in the James
8 Monroe Campus. Karen isn't an alum of James Monroe
9 but so am [cheers/applause] and—and so was I at
10 different times obviously, but I think—I—I think our
11 friendship is connected through the district that—
12 that I represent because was born and raised there as
13 well. But I'm proud to have the team here along with
14 Principal Lopez, Coach Frias, Coach Williams and
15 Coach White who did an amazing job at making sure
16 that this team not only competed and gave it their
17 all to make it to Nationals. But once they knew that
18 they were going to make it to Nationals they were—
19 they've got to have the funding to get there and they
20 opened a Go Fund Me Account and raised the \$30,000 -

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [interposing]
22 Wow.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: --and beyond to
24 get to Nationals. [cheers/applause] So now they
25 also have funds to continue to get their team moving

2 forward and—and it was so proud to see—to see them
3 work so hard and put so much effort into the cheers
4 that they—that they did to make sure that they were
5 able to compete in a real way. So we wanted to
6 congratulate you by presenting this proclamation to
7 you today, and to tell you to keep up the good work
8 because the—the dedication that you demonstrated will
9 take your school beyond—beyond your imagination. So,
10 if—if the Clerk can read the proclamation.

11 CLERK: Council City of New York
12 Proclamation. The Council of the City of New York is
13 proud to honor the James Monroe Eagles Cheer Team for
14 their inspirational enthusiasm and outstanding
15 teamwork; and

16 Whereas, Metropolitan Soundview High
17 School, which shares the James Monroe Educational
18 Campus with three other schools began its cheer club
19 in 2013 when Edwin Frias joined the staff as parent
20 coordinator and sought to foster greater community
21 support. The following year, the team was renamed
22 the James Monroe Eagles Cheer Team and became a
23 competitive club. From the start, its members have
24 been indelibly dedicated—incredibly dedicated and
25 they regularly stay after school for up to three

2 hours three or four days each week. Each member is
3 fully committed to spreading joy and optimism; and

4 Whereas, over the past three years, the
5 James Monroe Eagles Cheer Team has participated in
6 many competitions in New York. Their hard work led
7 to a first place win at the Six Flags Cheer Fest two
8 years in a row. They also strengthen moral
9 throughout their school when they won the reginal
10 competition and qualified to compete in February 2017
11 at the National High School Cheerleading Championship
12 in Orlando. Although traveling to Florida seemed to
13 be an insurmountable financial challenge, the team
14 won great support from the community and in the end
15 not only met but exceeded their fundraising goal of
16 \$30,000; and

17 Whereas, now guided to great success by
18 Coach Edwin Frias, Coach Sonya Williams, and Coach
19 Sherry East White the James Monroe Eagles Cheer Team
20 includes 23 amazing athletes: Afua Tanoh, Malay `Ja
21 Heard, Alima Musah, Ashley Alexander, Yomira Infante,
22 Anny Quintana, Maria Arias, Arion James, Ilanyi
23 Ramirez, Jessica Asamoah,, Virkin Jimenez, Tamia
24 Rice, Annbar Bailon, Jeireny Lantigua, Brittany
25 Smith, Thalayana Charles, Larry Maldonado, Paolo

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

8

2 Troncoso, Fatim Diop, Arias Marina, Norcaris Ulloa,
3 Niaja Hatcher, Evelin Murillo.

4 Whereas, raising, leading and maintaining
5 school spirit while supporting athletic programs and
6 leading the crowd before and during games the James
7 Monroe Eagles Team---Eagles Cheer Team has an
8 enormously positive impact in the Bronx and beyond;
9 and

10 Whereas, officially recognized now by the
11 PSA League as an official team for the 2017-2018
12 school year, the James Monroe Eagles Cheer Team is
13 now able to compete with additional high school cheer
14 teams in New York City Schools sports leagues; and

15 Whereas, even with so much time devoted
16 and--and devotion to the club, the members remain
17 firmly committed to excelling academically. Its
18 members have good grades and are active Student
19 Council members, and--and in the National Honor
20 Society and programs that offer college credit in
21 high school.

22 Now, therefore, be it known that the
23 Council of the City of New York is proud to honor and
24 congratulate the James Monroe Eagles Cheer Team for
25 their outstanding teamwork, and wishes them continued

2 success in all their future endeavors. Melissa Mark-
3 Viverito Speaker for the Entire Council, Annabel
4 Palma, Council Member, 18th District, the Bronx.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright.
6 [cheers/applause] So congratulations to all of you.
7 It's very exciting to have you here. Thank you,
8 Annabel for introducing us to this wonderful team,
9 and to the wonderful coaches.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Thank you.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coach White, I
12 believe you're going to speak, right?

13 COACH WHITE: Yes.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And on behalf
15 [laughter] you will say a few words, right?

16 COACH WHITE: [background comments]
17 Alright, first of all, I just want to say thank you
18 so much for having us. I wanted to say thank to
19 Melissa Mark-Viv-

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic]
21 Viverito.

22 COACH WHITE: Viverito. Thank you
23 [laughs] and, of course, Annabel Palma. Thank you so
24 much for everything and believing in us and thank you
25 just again for having us. This was a dream of ours,

2 and it was very far fetched, and we were at a point
3 where didn't think that we were able to do it, and
4 just the community, the world, the people around us
5 believed in us. The outpour came from Canada, from
6 London, the nation. [background comments] We had so
7 many donations, and finally getting down there, it
8 was not just the fact that they were—we were there to
9 compete, it was the experience that we were there for
10 them, and four ourselves, and these lessons are going
11 to carry with them forever. And we're just trying to
12 let them know that just because you're from an
13 environment, you're from a situation or community
14 that may not be the best, doesn't mean that you have
15 to be a product of your environment. You are an
16 evolution of it [cheers/applause] and because of you
17 guys we have shown that evolution matters. So thank
18 you so much for believing in us, and we hope that we
19 make you, the Council—the Council the New York City
20 Council, the city and everyone proud. I can't even
21 begin to thank everybody, and without our
22 cheerleaders we wouldn't be here. So we just want to
23 give them [cheers/applause] the biggest shout-out
24 possible. [background comments]

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Are you going to
3 cheer for us. [background comments] You got a cheer
4 for us.

5 COACH WHITE: We have a cheer for you.
6 Thank you. [background comments]

7 CHEERLEADERS: [perform a cheer] Come on
8 crowd, get it now, go Eagles go. Come on crowd, get
9 it now, go Eagles go. [background comments] Come on
10 crowd, get it now, go Eagles go. [cheers/applause]
11 Thank you so much.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you and
13 thank you—you all. [laughs] Alright. Thank you so
14 much. [background comments] Alright. Levin.
15 [background comments] And as we allow our team to
16 exit, we will be asking the next ceremonial
17 participants to join us up here and this Council
18 Member Kallos who is giving a proclamation to Bike
19 New York celebrating their 40th anniversary.
20 [background comments, [pause] Okay, here you go,
21 Council Member.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Yes.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, wait, hold on
24 the Bike New York representatives. [[background
25 comments, pause] Alright, Council Member Kallos.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Okay, let's
3 everyone up here. Great. Bike New York has been
4 doing a five borough bike tour for the past 40 years
5 starting in 1977 and they bike about 35 miles and to
6 think about who wants to do 35 miles including going
7 across the Verrazona Bridge and there is no shame in
8 walking up that bridge. 32,000 people do it each and
9 every year, and we've committed to work together to
10 next year getting to 35,000. So this would be the
11 largest bike race--

12 MALE SPEAKER: [interposing] In the
13 world.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: In-in the world,
15 and so one great thing about this is I've actually
16 had the pleasure of joining with Progressive Caucus
17 and Antonio Reynoso who's the co-chair. We-we called
18 COIB, which-and we said is it a conflict of interest
19 for us to take this entertainment ticket to bike 35
20 miles? After they finished laughing, they said, no
21 biking 35 miles does not qualify as entertainment and
22 you're welcome to go. What happens to all the money
23 that you raised? You actually go and you teach
24 people how to ride. So folks who come to my office
25 and say, I don't know to ride a bike can actually

2 learn from Bike New York, and I just want to thank
3 you for your partnership, and we present you with
4 this proclamation from the City Council, the Speaker,
5 myself and Ydanis Rodriguez the Transportation Chair.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And we'll as that
7 it please be read.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And if the
9 committee, if the clerk could please read the
10 Proclamation into the record.

11 CLERK: Council City of York
12 Proclamation.

13 In celebration of National Bike Month,
14 the Council of the City of New York is proud to honor
15 Bike New York for outstanding commitment to promoting
16 bicycling and bicycle safety through education,
17 community outreach and events; and

18 Whereas, Bike New York, a not for-a not
19 for profit organization offers free bike education
20 programs throughout the five boroughs to teach kids
21 and adults how to ride a bike, and how to do safety
22 and confidently in the city. From on-bike classes
23 like Learn to Ride and Street Skills at one of a
24 dozen bike education centers to classroom style
25 programs like Bike Safety Assemblies and Family

2 Cycling—Cycling 101, Bike New York teaches bike
3 skills to over 17,000 kids and adults every year
4 making the largest free bike education program in the
5 country. It also organizes many annual events
6 including community and regional bike rides our
7 nation's most exciting consumer bike show, Bike Expo
8 New York as well as America's largest bike ride the
9 TV Five Borough Bike Tour; and

10 Whereas, the history of Bike New York is
11 the history of the Five Borough Bike Tour, and it all
12 started in 1977 when New York City was a forbidding
13 area for aspiring cyclists. Nevertheless, a few
14 passionate dreamers persisted. They began with an
15 audacious plan to take a few hundred high school
16 students on a ride around the city. Today, the Five
17 Borough Tour is the largest bike ride in the United
18 States and one of the largest charitable rides in the
19 world. This annual event held on the first Sunday in
20 May welcomes 32,000 cyclists from every state in the
21 nation, and more than 60 countries to enjoy 40 miles
22 of city streets close to car traffic. In addition to
23 being an empowering fundraising event for free bike
24 education classes and programs, the tour remains one

2 of the best ways for anyone to see and experience all
3 five boroughs of New York city; and

4 Whereas, after four decades Bike New York
5 continues to expand its reach. Bike New York
6 recently launched its first membership program, and
7 also joined forces with another leading New York
8 bicycle non-profit, Recycle a Bicycle to bring bike
9 education programs to an even greater number of kids
10 and adults in the five boroughs; and

11 Whereas, Bike New York has had a
12 tremendously positively impact in countless lives
13 where it has fostered a greater understanding and
14 appreciation for cycling as a safe, practical and
15 sustainable and healthy means of transportation and
16 recreation. In doing so, it has changed not only how
17 we see and experience our city, but also how we work
18 to shape our urban landscape for future generations.

19 Now, therefore, be it know, that the
20 Council of the City of New York is very proud to
21 honor Bike New York in celebration of the Five
22 Borough Bike Tour's 40th Anniversary and its
23 outstanding commitment and contributions to bike
24 education in New York City. Melissa Mark-Viverito,
25 Speaker for the Entire Council, Ben Kallos, Council

2 Member 5th District Manhattan, Ydanis Rodriguez,
3 Council Member 10th District Manhattan.

4 [cheers/applause]

5 MALE SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you,
6 Ben. This is huge. We are so delighted to receive
7 this proclamation. You been a big supporter of ours
8 from day one. Speaker Mark-Viverito we have a bike
9 education center in your district. You've been very
10 supportive, you and your staff. Council Member
11 Reynoso rides in our tour, and he'll be riding again
12 this year. So thank you. We do a lot at Bike York,
13 but including the Five Borough Bike Tour, but we're
14 really most passionate about our education program,
15 making bicycling accessible to New Yorkers from all
16 walks of life, and empowering New Yorkers especially
17 our youth to lead healthier, more active and more
18 productive lives through cycling and because of
19 cycling. We are 40 years old. It's a great
20 milestone, but we have to remember it began through a
21 partnership with the Board of Education and the
22 American Youth Hostels in 1977 when they jointly
23 developed a bike education and safety program. They
24 though hey let's have a great 50-mile ride throughout
25 the five boroughs to-to honor and celebrate all that

2 we've learned. It was a little easier back then, but
3 it wasn't closed streets. It was a police escort in
4 the front and the back, 50 miles throughout the five
5 boroughs. The following year was supposed to be a
6 one-time only event—the following year New York City
7 saw a very bike friendly mayor come to City Hall Ed
8 Koch, and Ed Koch decided hey let's take this Five
9 Borough Challenge, because that's what it was called
10 at the time, call it the Five Borough Bike Tour,
11 because it's less of a competitive event, change it
12 from 50 miles to 40 miles and give you all the police
13 services that the marathon had two years prior, and
14 let's make it a big annual event. So because of
15 Mayor Koch, we have this great annual event. It's 40
16 years old. In 2005, it was transferred from the
17 American Youth Hostels to a new organization called
18 Bike New York and the Board of Directors decided to
19 go back to bike education, which were the roots. So,
20 we are now the largest provider of free bike
21 education in the country. So we have a lot to be
22 proud of. We couldn't do it with the City Council,
23 the Mayor's Office, our more than 3,000 volunteers,
24 and all the people who have help spin our rise. So

2 thank you very much. We appreciate it.

3 [cheers/applause]

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you so
5 much, and congratulations. Forty years is a long
6 time, a lot of history there. Thank you for the
7 service you continue to provide on behalf of all New
8 Yorkers

9 MALE SPEAKER: [off mic] Thank you so
10 much. [background comments] Alright. [background
11 comments] [laughter]

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I've got to get
13 back to that. Okay. Many years ago I trained and I
14 did a tour from Boston to New York on bike. It was
15 pretty amazing. So, it's been a while. Okay, last
16 but certainly not least if we can ask the Girl Scout
17 Troop 6000 to first-to join us up here. As people
18 may know or you've seen the profile in the New York
19 Times and obviously Council Member Van Bramer, our
20 Majority Leader is very proud of all that has been
21 done to make this troop a reality. [cheers/applause]
22 As people remember, this is the first troop in New
23 York City that is designated for homeless girl.
24 [background comments] Alright, Troop 6,000 right?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Yes.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Do you have a—you
3 guys have given yourselves a name or no? No? No name
4 for the Troop yet? Alright, alright. So Council
5 Member Jimmy Van Bramer thank you so much, and let us
6 know, a little bit more about these beautiful young
7 women that are welcome in this chamber. Hold on.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you
9 very much Madam Speaker and to all of my colleagues
10 who are joining. You are—there are Brownies here as
11 well.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, the Brownies.
13 [laughs] Alright, many of you are here.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: You are here
15 in the presence of six young women who have made
16 history in the City of New York. They have literally
17 changed history by joining together with some of
18 their sisters and some of their friends to create the
19 first ever Girl Scout Troop for homeless girls in the
20 City of New York. [cheers/applause] I am proud that
21 all six of these young women including the other 16
22 that they represent all 22 charter members of Troop
23 600 live in my district. We are very, very proud to
24 have all of you, and I want you to know that I feel
25 special honor representing all of you that your home

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 20

2 is in my district. We love so much. We are so, so
3 proud of every single one of you. So—so without
4 further ado, the Speaker and I both think it would be
5 great if all of the girls introduced themselves. Are
6 you ready to do that and—and say your names if I pass
7 the mic to you?

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And how old are
9 they now?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And how old
11 are you? Brooklyn, do you want to start with that?
12 Okay.

13 BROOKLYN: My name is Brooklyn and I am 8
14 years old. [cheers/applause]

15 CHRISTINA: My name is Christina and I'm
16 8 years old.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright,
18 Christina.

19 COKIE: My name is Cokie and I'm 9 years
20 old. [cheers/applause]

21 JESSICA: My name is Jessica and I'm 10
22 years old. [cheers/applause]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: One left.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, here we go.

25

2 CARINA: My name Karina and 11 years old.
3 [cheers/applause]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: So I also
5 want to recognize Giselle Burgess here to my left.
6 Giselle is one of the leaders of this troop. She
7 also lives in the shelter with her five young
8 children in my district, and she is an amazing mother
9 and an amazing woman, and I feel really blessed to
10 have gotten to know Giselle Burgess and the
11 leadership you exhibit. Also, Meredith Maskara to
12 her left also a resident of Sunnyside who works for
13 the Girl Scouts who was a driving force behind
14 creating Troop 6000. We all as a community went to a
15 shelter for women in my district called Pam's Place,
16 which is a different shelter than the one that all of
17 these young women live in right now, and we gave
18 Thanksgiving Dinner out, and the we gave Girl Scout
19 cookies to all the women at Pam's Place. Do you
20 remember that? It was an amazing event, and at that
21 event we had the idea that maybe the Girls Scout
22 would create a troop just for all of the homeless
23 girls in the city of New York. Today there are
24 12,000 homeless girls in the city of New York,
25 12,000. The six women that you see here represent

2 all 12,000 of this, and this story, which has made
3 these young women national celebrities. They were on
4 the Today Show. They have been profiled all over the
5 country. People are donating, and we want more
6 people to donate because we want every single of
7 those 12,000 to have a permanent home in the Girl
8 Scout Troop that they can call their own. So, we are
9 proud as the City Council to celebrate these six
10 trailblazers representing the 22 trailblazers, some
11 of whom are not here obviously, but I just want to
12 say on behalf of my colleagues I think all of us
13 share the belief that each of you are going to go on
14 to do great things.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Right.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: You are all
17 so strong, so powerful, and all of you would go onto
18 make great presidents of the United States of
19 America. [cheers/applause] I would argue that they
20 would make better presidents than the one currently
21 [background comments] in the office, and I mean that
22 today not when they're older. Today. So we honor
23 and celebrate each and every one of you, and with
24 that we'll ask the clerk to read the proclamation.

2 CLERK: Council City of New York

3 Proclamation.

4 The Council of the City of New York is
5 proud to honor Girl Scout Troop 6000 for exemplifying
6 the courage, confidence and character that make the
7 world a better place; and

8 Whereas, the Girl Scouts of the United
9 States of America has been preparing girls to meet
10 their world with courage, confidence, and character
11 since it was founded in 1912. The first New York
12 City troop started in Manhattan in 1913 and was soon
13 followed by new Girl Scout troops in Staten Island,
14 Queens, Brooklyn and the Bronx with the next few
15 years; and

16 Whereas, from the start, Girl Scouts have
17 continued to blaze trails and redefine what was
18 possible for themselves and for girls everywhere.
19 Girl Scout Troop 6000 upholds this tradition today.
20 It is the first troop in New York City designated
21 solely for homeless girls; and

22 Whereas, New York City Council Majority
23 Leader Jimmy Van Bramer and Girl Scouts' Community
24 Engagement Specialist Gisselle Burgess worked to
25 create a troop for homeless girls. In February, the

2 first meeting drew eight girls. At the most recent
3 meeting there were 21 scouts. With children now
4 comprising nearly 40% of the roughly 60,000 people in
5 New York City's primary shelter system, Troop 6000
6 will continue to grow; and

7 Whereas, all members of Troop 6000 reside
8 in-at the Sleep Inn in Queens where the New York City
9 Department of Homeless Services has transformed 10
10 floors to accommodate 100 homeless families. Of the
11 287 people living at the Sleep Inn-

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
13 down, please, keep it down.--

14 CLERK: --155 are under the age of 18;
15 and

16 Whereas like other Girl Scout troops
17 across the five boroughs and beyond, Troop 6000 will
18 offer its members greater opportunities to reach her
19 full potential, to have her eyes open to
20 possibilities for college and careers, to make loving
21 and supportive friends, to learn from caring female
22 mentors, and to chart her own course to achieve her
23 goals. We wish them all continued success.

24 Now, therefore, be it known that the
25 Council of the City of New York proudly honors the

2 founding members of Girl Scout Troop 6000 for their
3 outstanding and inspiring server to Long Island City,
4 Queens and to all of New York City. Melissa Mark-
5 Viverito Speaker for the Entire Council, Jimmy Van
6 Bramer Majority Leader, 26th District Queens.

7 [cheers/applause] [background comments]

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So we have an
9 extra special treat. We are going to hear from one
10 of the girls herself, but first Giselle Burgess.

11 GISELLE BURGESS: Thank you. Thank you
12 everyone who made this possible, who believed in us
13 and thank you Heidi, thank you Mary and thank you,
14 Jimmy for always being there, and always making sure
15 that we have a way to leave an impact in the U.S. of
16 prints and thank you, you girls. I love you so much
17 all of your. I love all-it's actually we have 25
18 now. We had three more registrations at my door so
19 [laughs].

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: You're getting a
21 lot more.

22 GISELLE BURGESS: Yeah, I know and I'm
23 just-I'm just so honored and just so grateful and
24 just proud of all of them, and look at them they're
25 all my own, and really hoping that we can make this

2 possible so many other girls who are currently
3 watching TV and saying I-I want to do that, too, you
4 know, I-I want to make friends, and I want to-I want
5 to make a difference. So, thank you all for your
6 support and hopefully we can make this dream a
7 reality and make sure that we reach all of our girls
8 and-and women as well to make them feel-to help them
9 to feel empowered and let them know that not give up.
10 This is just the season. It will pass. Okay.

11 [cheers/applause] [background comments]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: And last but
13 not least speaking on behalf of the all of the girls,
14 Carina Cabrera. [cheers/applause]

15 CARINA CABRERA: Girls Scouts, this Girl
16 Scouts has mean to meant so much to me because I get
17 to hang out with my sister scouts, and just seeing
18 them every Friday it makes me happy 'cause we're all
19 a group, we're a pact, and if we ever lose one of
20 them we all go down. [laughs] I love all of them so
21 much, and thank you for everything. Thank you Heidi,
22 thank you Mary, thank you Jimmy. Thank you for
23 supporting us. Thank you, mommy, for making this
24 happen, and one of this would have happened without
25 you all of you. [cheers/applause]

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: This is, you
3 know, to—to Giselle but also to, you know, to Jimmy
4 obviously, but you have done an amazing thing here,
5 and this is just so moving and touching that these
6 young women have a place to call home, to feel loved,
7 right, to feel validated, that their dreams are
8 endless and boundless, and you are all wonderful, and
9 not only can you be president, but you can be Council
10 Members, too. [laughter] We need more—we need more
11 women in the City Council. So you could be, you
12 could be the next Jimmy Van Bramer, the next Melissa,
13 right, the next Debbie Rose. We need more young
14 women to think about it, but you are all beautiful
15 and thank you so much for being here with us, and you
16 will be peers to other young women that are coming
17 into the troops, right, and you can be mentors to
18 them as well. So, thank you all for being here.
19 You're always welcome here in the City Hall.

20 [cheers/applause] [background comments, laughter]

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, which
22 [off mic]—each of you tell me which is the 10 or the
23 paths that you're most proud of. Go ahead. What did
24 you do? What does it mean?

2 GIRL SCOUT: [off mic] It's a way—their
3 my counselor and we came together and we made—we did
4 a people thing.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, very nice.
6 [background comments] How about you, Brooklyn, which
7 one do you like?

8 BROOKLYN: This one the blue one.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: The blue one.
10 What does it mean?

11 BROOKLYN: Blue means that you respected
12 it. [laughter]

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: How did you get
14 that one? What did you have to do to get the blue
15 one?

16 BROOKLYN: [off mic]

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: How about you,
18 which one?

19 BROOKLYN: Earn one.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay, you earned
21 it, yes. How about you, which one?

22 GIRL SCOUT: This one here.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: The same one, the
24 blue one?

25 GIRL SCOUT: I have a brown one.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: What does the
3 problem mean?

4 GIRL SCOUT: It means that you—you
5 learned how to do your safety award.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, safety award
7 okay. How about you, which one do you like the most?
8 What does the purple one mean?

9 GIRL SCOUT: It—it means the same as the
10 thing but it's just--

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: A different
12 level?

13 GIRL SCOUT: It's just also about first
14 aid.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, so you—did
16 you—do you know how to do first aid? Wow, you see.
17 How about you, which one do you like?

18 GIRL SCOUT: I like the same one as
19 Josie.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: This one over
21 here?

22 GIRL SCOUT: So we're both juniors.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, alright, well
24 thank you, and you're going to get a lot more on that
25 back. [cheers/applause] Congratulations.

2 [background comments] Alright, what a heartwarming,
3 heartwarming ceremonial. Beautiful. [background
4 comments] Congratulations, Jimmy. This is a
5 beautiful, beautiful thing. Thank you. Alright, we
6 have one more. You all know we don't usually do more
7 than three ceremonials, but there are [background
8 comments] special, special moments that we cannot
9 overlook, and today we are honoring and recognizing
10 Gary Altman. [cheers/applause] More after. Come on
11 all the members come on up, everybody.

12 [cheers/applause] [background comments] Alright, for
13 his 37 years—over 37 years of service.

14 [cheers/applause] Oh, God, don't say that, please.
15 There are many council members here that weren't even
16 born when Gary started service in the Council. It's
17 true, yes. Also, I know that we have a former
18 council member June Eisland here from the Bronx--
19 [cheers/applause] who—who came to bid farewell as
20 well, and she said that she basic—she was in service
21 here as a Council Member the year that Gary first
22 started in the Council. So she came by to—to also be
23 here, and Gary we are so appreciative of everything
24 you have done. You help us run these meetings really
25 on the straight and narrow. [cheers/applause] The

2 timeliness I will take credit for [laughs] but-but
3 you obviously are the one running the ship when it
4 comes to making sure everything is getting done the
5 right way. Thank you for your guidance and for your
6 mentorship, and to many of us there's a lot of staff
7 as well that have served with you many that know you,
8 and we wanted to give you a proclamation to recognize
9 that. If we can hand it to you with all the
10 signatures. [cheers/applause] So very-it's very
11 nice, and it's a glass one. So it's a very beautiful
12 one that we can frame and put up.

13 FEMALE SPEAKER: You can tell by the
14 weight of it.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I know [laughs]
16 and we'll ask the clerk to read it, and so that we
17 hear everything he's done, and then we do-after the
18 Stated-right after the Stated we have a little
19 ceremony or celebration in the Committee Room. So
20 with that, our Clerk will read the Proclamation.

21 CLERK: Council City of New York
22 Proclamation

23 The Council of the City of New York is
24 proud to honor Gary Altman for more than 37 years of

2 excellent service to the Council and to the City at
3 large; and

4 Whereas, Gary joined the New York City
5 Council on October 2, 1979. [cheers] For his first
6 ten years, he served as a Legislative Attorney in the
7 Legal Services Division, and worked with the
8 Committee on Finance, Governmental Operations,
9 Environmental Protection, and Education as well as
10 the Subcommittee on the Recodification of the
11 Administrative Code along with then Chair Peter F.
12 Vallone, Sr.; and

13 Whereas, in 1990, Gary became the Deputy
14 Director of the Legal Services Division and continued
15 to hone his expertise on everything from budgets,
16 housing law, senior programs and benefits and NORCs
17 to management, taxation and community relations to
18 environmental and green issues and more. He has also
19 played an instrumental role in major legislation,
20 including the original Campaign Finance Law, and the
21 City's Anti-Apartheid Laws among others; and

22 Whereas, in 1995, Gary was promoted to
23 Legislative Counsel to the Speaker. For the past 22
24 years a few of his key responsibilities have included

2 preparing agendas for our Stated meetings [cheers]
3 scheduling all committee-

4 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
5 down. [background noise, scuffling]

6 CLERK: --sub and select committee
7 meetings, preparing a daily legislative calendar for
8 members, staff and the public, inviting witnesses to
9 hear-hearings and counseling and advising our
10 Speaker, Council Members, our Public Advocate and
11 others on a wide range-

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
13 down-[background comments]

14 CLERK: --of legislative matters. He has
15 also worked closely with-on a daily basis with all
16 chiefs of staff, deputy chiefs of staff, division
17 heads and staff to ensure the smooth operation of the
18 Council's Legislative, Finance and Land Use
19 functions. In addition to excelling in all of these
20 areas, Gary has generously shared his phenomenal
21 memory about the Council as an institution and its
22 prior legislative actions; and

23 Whereas, over the course of the last four
24 decades, Gary has provided critical support to five
25 visionary leaders: The Late Vice Chairman Majority

2 Leader Thomas Jay Cuite, 1969 to 1985; Majority
3 Leader and Former Speaker Peter F. Vallone, Sr. from
4 1986 to 2001; Former Speaker A. Gifford Miller from
5 2002 to 2005; Former Speaker Christin C. Quinn from
6 2006 to 2013 and Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito since
7 2014; and

8 Whereas, throughout his tenure Gary's
9 contributions have always exceeded his official
10 titles. Overall, he is widely admired for being a
11 municipal maven and all around mensch. [background
12 comments, laughter] Upon-upon his departure he can
13 be proud knowing that his years of support will
14 continue to inform and shape the City Council and
15 strengthen our city for generations to come.

16 Now, therefore, be it known that the
17 Council of the City of New York is incredibly
18 grateful to honor Gary Altman for 37 years of
19 extraordinary service to the City Council and to all
20 our fellow New Yorkers. Melissa Mark-Viverito,
21 Speaker for the Entire Council, Christin C. Quinn,
22 Former Speaker for the Entire Council, A. Gifford
23 Miller, Former Speaker for the Entire Council, Peter
24 F. Vallone, Sr. [applause] Former Speaker for the
25 Entire Council. [cheers/applause]

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, Gary,
3 you're going to have to say something.

4 GARY ALTMAN: I'm ready.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright, oh,
6 alright there we go. [background comments, laughter]

7 GARY ALTMAN: It only be thought better.
8 Okay, it'll be like a long prayer, five minutes.
9 Okay. [laughs] Well, well, I'm very emotional so--
10 [background comments] [coughs] Thank you, Speaker,
11 members, colleagues and friends. I'll probably
12 handed over well over a thousand procs down for the
13 States over the years, and now I can feel what it's
14 like to be on the receiving end of this honor, and
15 it's very much appreciated. In almost 38 years at
16 the Council, I've literally spend half of my lifetime
17 awake time with my Council family, and it's been a
18 great family. I've had the honor to work with four
19 great speakers who so ably carried out their vision
20 of the direction our city should move during their
21 tenure. I first entered City Hall on October 2,
22 1979, and you how old you really are when most
23 people's response is to tell you that they were 3, 4,
24 5 years old, [laughter] and even worse when they tell
25 you they weren't even born yet.

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Exactly, exactly.

3 GARY ALTMAN: And—and one of my dear
4 Council Member friends they're six months old.

5 [laughter] During all these years I've had the
6 privilege to work with so many outstanding public
7 servants, and staff here at the Council and in all
8 branches of government. I truly believe that our
9 Council is the greatest local legislature anywhere in
10 our country. [cheers/applause] Thank you.

11 Countless times we have taken the lead on legislation
12 that had—that has had lasting and groundbreaking
13 effect. I think of this Indoor Smoke Act. I think
14 of the Paid Sick Leave and two that I was deeply
15 involved with were the original Campaign Finance Law
16 when it did protect incumbents [laughs] I will—I will
17 say if you read it [laughter] thank you. We had many
18 cites—we had many cites down at the Campaign Finance
19 Board and I can remember when even Supreme Court
20 Justice Sonia Sotomayor was a Koch appointment and we
21 would be bantering back over some change they wanted
22 to make that I didn't feel was advantageous—

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Wow.

24 GARY ALTMAN: --to my—to—to my—to my
25 members, and also our Anti-Apartheid legislation,

2 which later on also helped with David Dinkins. What
3 Nelson Mandela said was a factor in his ultimately
4 being released from prison and several years later
5 the fall. [cheers/applause] Thank you. The City
6 Council is made up so many dedicated, devoted,
7 committed and tireless elected officials, and a staff
8 that is second to none. I look out at the members'
9 desks, which at various times in tenure had 45, 47,
10 35 and now 51 seats and see not only our great—our
11 current great members, but the faces of so many dear
12 friends who previously feel—filled those seats. June
13 Eisland, but I also see the sadness of so many that
14 have passed on. Helen Marshall and Priscilla Wooten
15 just recently, but also to only name a few who made
16 lasting impacts on my life, Walter McCaffrey, Maslin
17 Propozano, Water Ward, Tom White, Stanley Michaels,
18 Tom Ognibene, Phil Reed, Mike DeMarco, Jerry Caspino.
19 Mr. First Chair Arthur Capsman (sp?) who was
20 succeeded by Karen Koslowitz, and two—and two—two
21 people who along with our current Manhattan Borough
22 President Gale Brewer became lifetime friends on my
23 very first day back in 1979. Mary Pinkett, who was
24 the first African-American woman to serve on the
25 Council, and Herb Berman who was a father, brother

2 and a mentor to me. Herb and I traveled together
3 four times to Israel to show our love and support for
4 the Jewish homeland. I've been blessed with two
5 incredible families. At home my beyond compare wife
6 of 40 years. Fay. We were married at 21, and our
7 four amazing children, Ariel—I have to remember
8 [laughs] Ariel, Alan, Fiorello, who is right there
9 and yeah, the rest of the family will be here later.
10 [cheers/applause]

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you for
12 sharing.

13 GARY ALTMAN: Their—their spouses and
14 three—now—now currently three grandchildren. More—
15 more to come. Fay—fay has infinite love for our
16 family and anyone she comes in contact with.
17 Everyone of our children went from Pre-K through
18 college and graduate school in our extraordinary
19 public schools, specialized high school and SUNY
20 systems. [cheers/applause]

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright.
22 [cheers/applause]

23 GARY ALTMAN: Two Stuyvesant, one Bronx
24 Science and one Eleanor Roosevelt. [cheers/applause]
25 [pause] Okay, at work—at work is my Council family

2 now led by our great Mark-Viverito, and our [laughs]
3 and our stern Father Ramon. [laughter] As-as any
4 good father, Ramon, sometimes offers me advice from
5 his past experiences. Very often he tells me that
6 when I buzz my head I should electric the clippers to
7 the zero setting. [laughter] Actually, Fay does it
8 for me because I would—I would mess up. I've had
9 great colleagues and friends throughout my tenure,
10 amazing people like Jim Karas, Latonia McKinney, the
11 incredible Hata Mahalsas (sp?), Gale Benjamin, Carol
12 Shine, Amy Leviton, Terzah Nasser, Steven Dudley,
13 Jeff Baker, Christine McLaughlin and her great
14 community engagement team, Joe Goldblum. Tough by
15 tender Barbara Scaffidi, right. [laughter] Peg
16 Torro, Maria Pagan, dear, dear Phillip Henderson
17 downstairs [cheers] just great, and my good friend
18 Carl Diabla and so many countless—I'm shaking—and so
19 many countless others whose friendship and
20 camaraderie I will always cherish. My own staff has
21 been amazing and incredibly loyal from John
22 Lanshanski Waltman (sp?), Maggie McGuinness, Vinny
23 Montebono (sp?), Shaneek (sp?) Smith, Antonio Chima,
24 now a Port Authority Police Officer and Kevin Penn
25 who last week graduated from the Fire Academy to my

2 current group of Yvette Molina, Billy Martin, Matt
3 Distefano and Jonathan Ethridge (sp?) I thank you for
4 everything. But there are two people I must single
5 out for very special mention. First is my mentor and
6 like Herbie Berman another father to me Former
7 Speaker Peter F. Vallone who has been one of the
8 major influences on my life and who I am today. Our
9 experiences and time together is made up of memories
10 to last me several lifetimes. The second person I
11 must single out is someone who came to the Council at
12 age 16 before Child Labor Laws took effect,
13 [laughter] and has been a major part of my Council
14 and family life for 35 years, and that is the ageless
15 Ruthie Del Franco [cheers/applause] right over there,
16 who was perhaps the most dedicated, caring, nicest
17 and important Council staffer I have ever met. Her
18 work ethic is impeccable. I promise you that
19 despite the accolades that I have humbling been
20 receiving since my retirement announcement I can tell
21 you that the time to really worry about the Council
22 is when and if Ruthie ever decides to retire. Not one
23 item whether it be legislative, finance or land use
24 gets on the agenda or hearing calendar before it
25 meets and passes Ruthie's scrutiny. She's a very

2 gifted and special person. [cheers/applause] I am
3 the product of my parents who taught me to treat
4 every person with respect no matter who they were or
5 where they came from. They also taught me that every
6 day is an opportunity to help others less fortunate
7 or in need. My grandmother who emigrated from Poland
8 was a very religious observant Jew who alone raised
9 for-alone raised four children including my 97-year-
10 old mother who will be here later [background
11 comments] on a-on a very-very meager ILGWU Seamstress
12 salary during the Depression and World War II. She
13 taught me to always be proud of my Jewish faith. My
14 late father grew up even poorer and was a World War
15 II combat veteran. He is the sole reason I am today
16 working at the Council. Hard to believe that my
17 father with no real connections, but a lot of
18 perseverance that he often used to help complete
19 strangers. I mean just amazing stories, got me hired
20 into a legal division in the Council that I don't-
21 that at the time only had six attorneys in all of the
22 Council. That was the-that was our entire staff. So
23 in closing, I consider myself one of the luckiest and
24 most fortunate people anywhere. I've worked in an
25 institution I love and respect, in a building my wife

2 always says is one of the most beautiful. I have a
3 family I deeply love. I've gotten work with and
4 befriend so many outstanding people, have been able
5 to constantly my parents' advice and help others to
6 the best of my ability, have met and occasionally
7 befriended some of the most revered and renowned
8 world figures, artists and sports figures and have
9 had the opportunity here at the Council to help make
10 changes for the betterment of so many residents.
11 What more can any person wish for or dream about?
12 For this and so many other reasons, I will always
13 cherish my life here at the Council and spending time
14 and working with every one of you. I thank you from
15 the bottom of my heart. [cheers/applause] [Chanting
16 Gary, Gary, Gary] [pause]

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --Gary and very
18 well deserved and so--thank you for those beautiful
19 words. It really was very heart felt and thank you
20 for your endless service to the city, and we're going
21 to be celebrating with you after the--the Stated
22 meeting. So we look forward to meeting the rest of
23 your family. Thank you so much. [cheers/applause]
24 [pause] That ends ceremonials. [background
25 comments] [pause] [background comments]

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Ladies and gentlemen,
3 can I have your attention please. Can I please have
4 your attention? Quiet in the Chambers, please. At
5 this time please place all electronic devices, all
6 electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-Council
7 employers, non-Council employees please leave the
8 main floor of the Chambers. There is additional
9 seating upstairs in the balcony. Thank you. [pause]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Will members
11 please have their seats, may we close the doors.

12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet, please on the
13 floor.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [shushing for
15 quiet] Members please have their seats. Please
16 close the doors. All visitors please find a seat as
17 well. All rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

19 [Pledge of Allegiance] [pause]

20 CLERK: Baron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

22 CLERK: Borelli.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

24 [shushing for quiet]

25 CLERK: Cabrera. Chin.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

3 CLERK: Cohen.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

5 CLERK: Constantinides.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

7 CLERK: Cornegy.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Here.

9 CLERK: Crowley, Cumbo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

11 CLERK: Deutsch.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

13 CLERK: Dromm.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

15 CLERK: Espinal.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

17 CLERK: Eugene.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

19 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland. Garoldnick.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

21 CLERK: Gentile.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

23 CLERK: Gibson.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I'm here.

25 CLERK: Grodenchik.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

45

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

3 CLERK: Johnson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

5 CLERK: Kallos. King.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present and I'm
7 here on time.

8 CLERK: Thank you. Koo.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

10 CLERK: Koslowitz.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

12 CLERK: Lancman.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

14 CLERK: Lander. Levin.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

16 CLERK: Levine.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

18 CLERK: Maisel.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

20 CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

22 CLERK: Mendez.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

24 CLERK: Miller.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.

2 CLERK: Palma.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Here.

4 CLERK: Perkins.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.

6 CLERK: Reynoso.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Present.

8 CLERK: Richards.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

10 CLERK: Rodriguez.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

12 CLERK: Rose.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

14 CLERK: Rosenthal.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

16 CLERK: Salamanca.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

18 CLERK: Torres.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

20 CLERK: Treyger.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

22 CLERK: Ulrich.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Present.

24 CLERK: Vacca.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

2 CLERK: Vallone.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

4 CLERK: Williams.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

6 CLERK: Wills.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Here.

8 CLERK: Matteo. Van Bramer.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

10 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I'm here.

12 CLERK: Sorry, Greenfield.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I'm here.

14 FEMALE SPEAKER: Madam Chair, please.

15 CLERK: We have a quorum.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
17 in the Chambers, please. We've got one-

18 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet please, quiet
19 down.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
21 Matteo.

22 CLERK: Matteo.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
25 Chambers. All rise for the Invocation.

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: All rise.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: The invocation
4 will be delivered by Rabba Sara Hurwitz, the Co-
5 founder and Dean of Yeshivat Maharat located at
6 3700 Henry Hudson Parkway, Bronx, N.Y. 10463.
7 Quiet in the Chambers, please.

8 RABBA SARA HURWITZ: [Speaking foreign
9 language] Lord in Heaven, we are grateful to you for
10 bringing us together on this auspicious day. We the
11 citizens of New York with our diverse religious
12 beliefs, cultures and backgrounds stand here together
13 in harmony to reflect on all that is before us. We
14 are grateful to live a life of freedom in the city
15 with dynamic physicists, houses of worship, community
16 centers, schools, courts, hospitals, police and fire
17 stations, homeless-homeless shelters and countless
18 citizens dedicated to service family and justice. We
19 are blessed with many public servants present in this
20 room who gathered here today to take stock in the
21 goodness of our city and the bounty of our lives.
22 And we are further blessed with leaders who are
23 tirelessly committed to the betterment of our
24 community and to meeting the challenges that face its
25 residents on a daily basis. It is taught that God

2 creates the world anew everyday, and in doing so, you
3 God, have passed the injunction to each of us to pick
4 up the tools or our trade to continue creating,
5 moving and improving our world. Everyday is an
6 opportunity to renew our community, and make this
7 city a better place to live, raise families and
8 prosper. May God give us the wisdom and humility to
9 be thankful for all we have, and to recognize how
10 this city functions, but may God also give us the
11 strength and resources to make further progress to
12 improve our education system, to bring about Rachel-
13 racial equality, to serve the underserved, to created
14 better services for women and girls, and let us build
15 and strengthen the bridges that connect us. Oh, God
16 in Heaven, may every citizen of this city know
17 shelter, warmth, safety and prosperity, but most of
18 all, Oh, God, of peace, compassion and justice.
19 Bless each of us with the capacity to seek peace,
20 compassion and justice, to cloth the naked,
21 straighten the bent and to release the bound. Gird
22 us with the strength of our [Speaking Foreign
23 Language] of loving our neighbor as we love
24 ourselves. May you, God of mercy who bless our
25 ancestors, bless us, bless and protect, guard and

2 help, exalt and uplift all the officials and leaders
3 who are here today, and in this land who dedicate
4 themselves to the service of others. Bless these
5 soldiers of the American military forces who risk
6 their lives for the sake of peace on earth. May the
7 Holy One remove our world illness and grant complete
8 healing, send blessing and success to all the work of
9 our hands [speaking foreign language] May God bless
10 our coming and going now and forever more. Let us
11 say Amen.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.
13 [background comments] [shushing for quiet] Council
14 Member Cohen.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you, Madam
16 Public Advocate, it is my honor to spread the
17 invocation today, and I am going to take just one
18 second to brag about Rabbi Sara Hurwitz. As-as the
19 Public Advocate said--

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 Excuse me, Council Member. May we have quiet in the
22 Chambers, please. [shushing for quiet]

23 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Keep it down.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I apologize.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Thank you very
3 much. She is the co-founder and President of the
4 Yeshivat Maharat and serves on the Rabbinic staff at
5 the Hebrew Institute of Riverdale. Yeshivat Maharat
6 is the first orthodox Yeshivat to ordain women as
7 clergy. She studied for years under the tutelage of
8 the awesome Rabbi Avi Weiss, and was ordained in
9 2009, and it's not just me who thinks that she's
10 awesome. She's a recipient of the UJA Federation,
11 New York Trailblaze-Trailblazers Award in 2016. One
12 of Jewish Leagues 36 under 36, Newsweek's 50 most
13 influential Rabbis, and also a Wexler Foundation
14 Field Fellow. And just as a note that HAR is a
15 tremendous shula in my-in my district that serves
16 over 850 families. She is an outstanding member of
17 the Rabbinical staff there, and I am very grateful
18 that she came down today to give us the ordination.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Than you so much.
20 Council Member Deutsch.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Motion of the
22 Minutes of the Stated Meeting of March 16, 2017 be
23 adopted as printed.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
25 Message and papers from the Mayor.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

52

2 CLERK: M 493, Maritime Lease.

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Land use.

4 CLERK: M 494, Submitting Carlo Silvestri
5 for appointment to the Tax Commission.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules and
7 Privileges-Rules, Privileges and Elections.

8 CLERK: M 495 submitting Debra Scotto for
9 Appointment to the Environmental Control Board.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges
11 and Elections.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Community from
13 City, County and Borough Offices.

14 CLERK: M 496 submitting Joseph Douek for
15 reappointment to the Planning Commission.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Rules, Privileges
17 and Elections.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
19 Communications.

20 CLERK: None.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call
22 Ups.

23 CLERK: M 497, Sidewalk Café.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Roll-roll call.

25 CLERK: Baron.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye.

3 CLERK: Borelli. Cabrera. Chin.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

5 CLERK: Cohen.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

7 CLERK: Constantinides.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: At this
9 time, Madam Public Advocate, may I be allowed to vote
10 aye on all call-ups for permission to—I'd like to
11 vote all coupled general orders.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I'd like
14 to vote aye.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank. [shushing
16 for quiet]

17 CLERK: Cornegy.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

19 CLERK: Crowley, Cumbo.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

21 CLERK: Deutsch.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

23 CLERK: Dromm.

24

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye and
3 with permission I'd like to vote on all general
4 orders.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Espinal.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye.

10 CLERK: Eugene.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

12 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I vote
14 aye.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 CLERK: Garoldnick.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

18 CLERK: Gentile.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Aye.

21 CLERK: Gibson.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

23 CLERK: Greenfield.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Aye.

25 CLERK: Grodenchik.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

3 CLERK: Johnson.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

5 CLERK: Kallos.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye

7 CLERK: King.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Koo.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye.

11 CLERK: Koslowitz.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

13 CLERK: Lancman.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

15 CLERK: Lander. Gentile.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Thank you, Madam

17 Public Advocate and if I may be allowed to vote on

18 all Land Use Call Ups and General Orders.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Levin.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

24 CLERK: Levine.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Yes, with the
3 Public Advocate's permission, I would like to vote
4 aye on all call-ups and vote on all general--coupled
5 general orders.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Maisel.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

10 CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

12 CLERK: Mendez.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye on all.

14 CLERK: Miller.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Affirmative.

16 CLERK: Palma.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Aye.

18 CLERK: Perkins.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

20 CLERK: Reynoso.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Aye.

22 CLERK: Richards.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye.

24 CLERK: Rodriguez.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

2 CLERK: Rose.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

4 CLERK: Rosenthal.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

6 CLERK: Salamanca.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye.

8 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

10 CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

12 CLERK: Vallone.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye and Madam

14 Advocate, permission to vote on all matters on

15 today's calendar.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you and I

18 vote aye.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20 CLERK: Williams.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye on all.

22 CLERK: Wills.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I'd like to vote

24 aye on all call-ups and the coupled general orders.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I vote aye on all.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

4 CLERK: Matteo. Van Bramer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I vote aye
6 and with permission, I'd like to vote aye on all Land
7 Call Ups and General Orders.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote aye.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 Today's Land Use Call-Ups are adopted by a vote of 43
13 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative. Quiet in the
14 chambers as we now hear from the Speaker Melissa
15 Mark-Viverito.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Madam
17 Public Advocate and I would say to my colleagues and
18 actually I would ask that you please rise.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Since our last
21 Stated meeting we've seen the passing of several New
22 Yorkers under truly heartbreaking circumstances. So
23 before we begin today, I want to definitely take a
24 moment to commemorate those lives we've lost. Two
25 weekends ago my district of East Harlem experienced

2 the sudden deaths of Jadoris and John Crawford, a
3 senior couple who fell victim to carbon monoxide
4 poisoning. The Crawfords were married for more than
5 46 years, and have been planning to attend Easter
6 services that Eastwood Baptist that day. Our
7 thoughts are with their congregation and with their
8 daughter Rita. The community of Queens Village also
9 endured an unspeakable tragedy this past weekend as
10 two year-old Chase Woodford, 10-year-old Rashan
11 Matthews, 16-year-old Jada Foxworth, 20-year-old
12 Destiny Doans and 17-year-old Melody Edwards were
13 lost to an uncontrollable house fire. Our thoughts
14 are with the mini-family now coping with these
15 profound losses, and with the community coming
16 together to support them in these unfortunate times.
17 We also thank the FDNY for their diligence in
18 battling the blaze especially as they worked in the
19 wake of the death of one of their own Officer William
20 Tolley who made the ultimate sacrifice while on duty
21 last Thursday. And finally, on April 12th our city
22 and state and our country lost one of it's preeminent
23 legal minds with the death of New York Court of
24 Appeals Associate Judge Sheila Abdus-Salaam, a
25 leading justice and the first African-American woman

2 to be appointed to a seat on our state's highest
3 court. The insight and scholarship she brought to
4 the bench will leave a lasting legacy on legal
5 opinions yet to come, and her contribution will be
6 sorely missed. As we conclude, I would also like to
7 acknowledge that yesterday marked Holocaust
8 Remembrance Day in the United States. New York City
9 has made it a consistent point to stand by in support
10 of its community of Holocaust survivors, and we
11 observe this duty solidarity and respect of the
12 defenseless suffering they endured. As we see
13 troublesome events developing around the world and in
14 this country, remembering the lessons of the past has
15 taken on a renewed necessity. So please join me in a
16 moment of silence for all those whose losses we
17 acknowledge today. [moment of silence observed]
18 Thank you, my colleagues.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: So the Council
21 will begin today by voting on a Mandatory
22 Inclusionary Housing area designation for the Caton
23 Flats Development on Brooklyn's Flatbush Avenue.
24 This designation will allow for the existing Flatbush
25 Caton Market to be replaced with a larger facility,

2 equipped with 251 housing units, over 19,000 square
3 feet of commercial space, and over 11,000 square feet
4 of community facility space including a dedicated
5 business incubator space. Caton Flats is in--

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
7 [shushing for quiet]

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: --Council Member
9 Mathieu Eugene's district, and I would like to ask
10 him to say a few words.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very
12 much Madam Speaker. The Caton Market is located in
13 my district. It is a very important project for my
14 district that would benefit my constituents, and
15 people living in the community. When the proposed
16 project at the very beginning they were saying that
17 there they were going to create affordable housing,
18 but I didn't see the affordability that will allow my
19 constituents to be admissible for those housing, and
20 I worked hard to make sure that they include the
21 affordability for this housing and I'm happy to see
22 that. Now, the people in my district even if that--
23 they are making under \$20,000 a year, they will be
24 qualified to receive affordability for those
25 affordable housing. Another thing that I was

2 fighting for also is job opportunities for my
3 constituents and for the people living in the
4 district, and I was happy to see that they made the
5 modification, the adjustments to create job
6 opportunities in my district. And we know that the
7 market is—was possible because of many people. Among
8 them the vendors. Those people have been in the
9 markets from the beginning. Like all of us, they are
10 looking for their piece of the American dream. This
11 is everything that they have to survive and to
12 sustain their families, and I wanted to see rules and
13 regulations that protect the vendors, and I asked
14 also for the development and EDC to provide a
15 temporary place for those vendors to continue their
16 businesses and that was provided. In addition to
17 that, they will benefit one month rent free for the
18 temporary place, and they will have the right also to
19 return to the big and new market. One of the things
20 that I want to mention also the CACCI Caribbean
21 Chamber of Commerce will have a permanent place in
22 the market. We—it was not easy to negotiate, but we
23 know that in New York City affordable housing is a
24 big housing is a big crisis. When we see that we can
25 provide, we can secure affordable housing for the

2 people who are working very hard every single day to
3 contribute to the economy of the city, we have to
4 support and we have to make sure that the program is
5 devoted and also start. I want to thank EDC and all
6 the partners, and I want to thank also Madam Speaker
7 and thank you very much. With that, I think we about
8 to vote on the project that will benefit not only
9 constituents, but the people living in the community,
10 and I am looking forward to continue to work together
11 with EDC and the developer to make this project even
12 more affordable to the people that I am privileged to
13 serve. Thank you very much.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
15 Council Member. Next, the Council will be voting on
16 Introduction 1311-A sponsored by Council Member Chaim
17 Deutsch, which will help to avoid delayed responses
18 to public safety emergencies by requiring the
19 Department of Transportation to notify the NYPD and
20 the FDNY two days prior to resurfacing work on any
21 street. I want to Faiza Malik, Gafar Zaaloff,
22 Jonathan Masserano, Emily Rooney, Chima Obichere and
23 Brandon West for helping with this bill, and I ask
24 Council Member Deutsch to say a few words.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Thank you,
3 Speaker. When an emergency vehicle is responding to
4 a 911 call, every second counts. Often when rushing
5 to a fire, a crime in progress or an injury, our
6 first responders can get caught in an unaffected
7 traffic jam or redirected because of roads—the roads
8 are closed for work. When each passing minute can
9 mean the difference between life or death for the
10 people waiting for the arrival, it is vital that the
11 emergency providers are well informed about closed
12 streets and unusual congestion in their area. My
13 bill Intro 1311 will mandate notification to the NYPD
14 and FDNY within two days of scheduled road work.
15 This will provide sufficient advanced notice to
16 firefighters, EMTs and police officers who can then
17 ensure that they avoid areas with street closures
18 while responding to calls. I encourage my colleagues
19 to vote in favor of Intro 1311. I want to thank
20 Transportation Chair Ydanis Rodriguez for his support
21 of Intro 1311 as well as Faiza Malik, the Legislation
22 Counsel. Thank you so much.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
24 Council Member. Currently, the Department of
25 Education is required to distribute information about

2 college savings plans to new students as well as
3 students in kindergarten, sixth grade and ninth
4 grade. Intro 1254-A, sponsored by Council Member
5 Mark Treyger would require the DOE to additionally
6 distribute college savings materials to pre-
7 kindergarteners, and would also require the
8 Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to distribute
9 such college savings plan materials to parents and
10 guardians within three months after a child's birth.
11 I want to thank Isa Schaumburg, Smit Deshmukh, Silver
12 Yavana—I'm sorry Sylvester Yavana and Elizabeth
13 Hoffman, and Council Member Treyger will say a few
14 words.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you,
16 Speaker and good afternoon and—and thank you again to
17 the Speaker for giving me the opportunity to speak
18 about Intro 1254-A, a bill I introduced in
19 partnership with the Brooklyn Borough President Eric
20 Adams. This legislation is designed to help new
21 parents save for their child's post-secondary
22 education by raising awareness of New York's 529
23 College Savings Program and other college savings
24 plans and financial literacy resources. As you may

2 know, the 529 College Program is a flexible
3 investment tool-

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Quiet down, please.
7 Quiet.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: --that assist
9 parents in saving for their child's post-secondary
10 education whether their children attend a four-year
11 college, two-year college, a trade school or any
12 other post-graduate degree. This program offers
13 participants an annual \$10,000 deduction, withdrawals
14 which from which can be used for tuition, books,
15 supplies, electronics or room and board. These
16 withdrawals are tax free and the program can provide
17 significant assistance for parents who may otherwise
18 struggle to pay for the rising costs of post-
19 secondary education. Many students already receive
20 college savings plans, materials in school as a
21 result of great legislation previously introduced by
22 our colleague Council Member Andy King. Intro 1254-A
23 would expand this distribution of information on
24 college savings plans to include pre-kindergarten
25 students and add additional information on the cost

2 and scholarships available for our CUNY and SUNY
3 schools as well as other financial planning
4 resources. In addition, this legislation would
5 require the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene
6 to provide substantially similar information to new
7 parents within three months of their child's birth.
8 The bill also contains language access provisions to
9 ensure that all parents are able to receive this
10 important information that will help them plan for
11 their children's futures. Again, as a former
12 educator, I believe strongly that every child
13 deserves the opportunity to pursue some sort of post-
14 secondary educational avenue. There's a lot of
15 people to thank and I just want to just begin by
16 again thanking the Brooklyn-Brooklyn Borough
17 President Eric Adams and his-and his staff Ryan Lynch
18 and-and Saundra Chapman for their work. I want to
19 thank Andy-Council Member Andy King for leading the
20 way on this issue in the last term. I want to thank
21 Chair Danny Dromm of the Education Committee and his
22 outstanding staff for prioritizing this issue. I
23 want to thank the Speaker Ramon Martinez, Laura Popa,
24 Rob Newman, Matt Gawolb, Elizabeth Hoffman, Gary
25 Altman for their assistance. I want to thank Asian

2 Schaumburg, Smita Dishmuchkh and Sylvester Yavanna
3 for their work. I want to thank the Mayor, John
4 Pallupo, Rick Rodriguez and Charles Adenoff for their
5 willingness to find compromise and creative
6 solutions, and I also want to thank Anna Scafe, my
7 Deputy Chief of Staff for steering this bill from an
8 idea to its current version. And again, thank the
9 advocates, the parents and all my colleagues for
10 their support. Thank you, Speaker.

11 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
12 Council Member. The Vendor Information Exchange
13 System also known as VENDEX is maintained by the city
14 to provide background information regarding
15 prospective vendors seeking city contracts. Intro
16 1271-A sponsored by Council Member Helen Rosenthal
17 would require contractors and subcontractors to
18 submit vendor questionnaires electronically. Intro
19 1224-A sponsored by Council Member Rosenthal would
20 increase the VENDEX questionnaire's threshold for
21 city contracts or subcontracts to \$250,000 or more
22 during the preceding 12-month period. And Intro 1324-
23 A sponsored by Council Member Brad Lander would
24 require the Mayor's Office of Contract Services to
25 make public access to vendor information available

2 online on the city's website. I want to thank
3 Council Member Lander and Contracts Committee Chair
4 Rosenthal for their work here. I will have them
5 speak on the legislation. Council Member Rosenthal
6 followed by Council Member Brad Lander.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so
8 much, Speaker. You know, as Public Advocate Tish
9 James already knows, if we're ever going to ensure
10 that Minority and Women Owned Businesses get a fair
11 share and if we're ever going to eliminate waste from
12 city contracts, and if we're going to make it easy
13 and desirable to do business with the City, we have
14 to get into the weeds of procurement. These bills
15 will make it easier for us to spend taxpayer money
16 wisely, and I'm proud as Chair of the Contracts
17 Committee, as Tish was before me to nerd out on these
18 bills. Intro 1271-A will move us toward an all-
19 digital procurement process requiring vendors to fill
20 out their VENDEX procurement questionnaire on line.
21 Intro 1224-A makes the city contracting process more
22 user friendly for small businesses by raising the
23 earning threshold for companies required to fill out
24 a VENDEX questionnaire from a \$100,000 to \$250,000
25 removing a major hurdle for small businesses doing

2 business with city. Procurement reform is never
3 going to be the sexiest issue, but we have to get
4 procurement right if we want to have a chance to get
5 anything else right. I want to thank my fellow nerd
6 Michael Owh, Director of the Mayor's Office of
7 Contract Services. It's been great working with this
8 Administration, which has committed itself to
9 tackling issues like this head on. I also want to
10 thank my Committee Counsels on these bills. First,
11 Eric Bernstein and now Alex Paulenoff, and my
12 Legislative Director Sean Fitzpatrick and I really
13 want to thank Council Member Lander before he starts
14 to explain his bills. But this package of
15 legislation is going to make a real dent moving the
16 ball forward. Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thanks very much.
18 I'm honored to be part of this contract nerd package.
19 I want to give credit to Chair Rosenthal for her
20 focus on making contracting and procurement work
21 better and more effectively, and dragging it into the
22 modern and electronic age. Obviously, an enormous
23 amount of what we do as a city is done through
24 contracts, and the fact that they are not yet easily
25 online that the VENDEX forms haven't been online.

2 It's long past time, and it will make a difference.
3 My Bill 1324-A is really just plain common sense.
4 The VENDEX information is available in the database,
5 but right now if you want it, you have to go down to
6 the office of the Mayor's Office of Contracts in
7 Manhattan and one location only to get it from their
8 system. It can obviously quite easily be put online,
9 and while it may not be the hottest ticket on the
10 city's website, it does mean that journalists and
11 investigators and elected officials and researchers
12 will have access to the information about all of the
13 city's contractors, which is just critical for watch
14 dogs and others to pay attention. You look at
15 something like what the Public Advocate and the Chair
16 and others did around City Time. It is necessary to
17 have watch dogs paying attention. Getting VENDEX
18 online will make that happen. Thanks to the Chair,
19 to the Speaker, to my staff, to everybody who worked
20 on this bill. [pause]

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
22 Council Member. Even though New York City boasts the
23 largest public solid waste system in the world, there
24 are many neighborhoods that remain underserved.
25 Introduction 965-A sponsored by Transportation

2 Committee Chair Ydanis Rodriguez would require the
3 Department of Transportation to conduct a citywide
4 transit study on strategies to improve transit access
5 to neighborhoods underserved by the public
6 transportation system including light rail, bus and
7 subway. Faiza Malik, Gafar Zaaloff, Jonathan
8 Masserano, Emily Rooney, Chima Obichere and Brandon
9 West all helped with this bill, and we'll ask Council
10 Member Rodriguez to say a few words.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Thank you,
12 Speaker. This past Saturday as we hold the Care Free
13 Day, we heard from many New Yorkers especially those
14 living in Queens, in the Bronx that they have a
15 different experience from those New Yorkers who live
16 close to mass transportation, which is they have to
17 be walking 10, 15 blocks to take a bus or to take a
18 train, and that's why we need to address
19 transportation deserts in our city. Thank you and
20 thanks to my colleagues and the Committee staff who
21 worked hard on this bill: Jonathan Masserano, Kelly
22 Taylor, Emily Rooney, Gafar Zaaloff, Matt Gewolb, and
23 also Rosa Murphy and Rosa Lewis and more. When
24 transit deserts are allowed to proceed we are
25 essentially allowing for conditions unhealthy to a

2 well functioning city. There's less access to jobs,
3 education, healthcare, cultural institutions, open
4 space and more. Residents in this area are either
5 forced to buy a car or walk dozens of blocks to reach
6 what can often be unreliable public transit. Intro
7 965-965-A would require the DOT to specifically
8 include in their ongoing transit study information
9 data and recommendations to address our city's
10 transit deserts. As we celebrate a successful Car
11 Free Day over the weekend with areas across the five
12 boroughs close to car traffic and open to people we
13 stress the importance of finding ways to reduce our
14 reliance on personal vehicles. The number one way to
15 do this is to expand and enhance our transit
16 networks. On top of this, a 2015 Harvard Study
17 showed that access to quality transportation is the
18 single greatest factor in escaping poverty. This is
19 something that we must continue to stress to our
20 leaders who control funding to major infrastructure
21 projects and who have the ability to expand access to
22 our poorest residents cut off from the transit
23 network. Thank you again.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
25 Council Member. Small business owners are not always

2 aware of the 311 complaints made regarding their
3 businesses. This can slow down response time to
4 important issues affecting the public. Intro 891-A
5 sponsored by Small Business Committee Chair Robert
6 Cornegy would allow business owners to opt to receive
7 notifications via text or email each time the address
8 of their business is provided as part of a 311
9 request for service or complaint. Nicole Abean,
10 Michael Kurtz, William Paramatang (sp?), Isa
11 Schaumburg and Terzah Nasser thank you for working on
12 this bill, and we'll ask Robert Cornegy to say a few
13 words.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you, Madam
15 Speaker. Today, marks the end of what's-what's
16 considered a long road traveled. When I first became
17 the Chair of the Committee on Small Businesses, I set
18 a goal to lead this committee, which serves the small
19 businesses of our great city in a better place than
20 when I started. It's my belief that Intro 891 will
21 do just that. The original attempt of the bill was
22 to assist bars and restaurants that receive 311 noise
23 complaints by informing their owner of the complaints
24 before they renewed their liquor licenses. However,
25 after spending time consulting with business owners

2 throughout the city, I quickly realized that this
3 service would be beneficial to a variety of different
4 businesses some of which have become frustrated with
5 the city's Open Data Portal. As it is currently
6 written, Intro 891 will require the Department of
7 Information Technology and Telecommunications to
8 create a notification system whereby business owners
9 are informed of any complaint lodged against them.
10 Participation is voluntary and notifications can be
11 received via text message or email. I believe this
12 bill solves the 20th Century problem with a 21st
13 Century solution. Owners should not have to spend
14 their time searching for complaints filed against
15 their businesses. In an age where push notifications
16 have become a common business practice for email and
17 text messages, it is important for our cities to
18 alert business owners in real time of complaints
19 filed against their businesses giving them an
20 opportunity to address or at the very least be aware
21 of potential issues they have in their communities.
22 I'd like to thank, of course, Speaker Melissa Mark-
23 Viverito, and from central staff Terzah Nasser, Asia
24 Schaumburg, Nicole Abean and Michael Kurtz, Greg
25 Bishop and Warren Gardner at SBS, Stephanie Zimmerman

2 my Chief of Staff and my Legislative and Budget
3 Director Daniel Miskin (sp?). Thank you.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
5 Robert. Seeing an opportunity to educate tenants
6 about actions they can take to prevent the spread of
7 bed bugs, the City Council will be passing Intro 648-
8 A sponsored by Council Member Danny Dromm, which
9 would require owners of certain residential buildings
10 to provide annual reports to the Department of
11 Housing Preservation and Development regarding past
12 bed bug infestations that have occurred in the
13 tenants' building as well as information on the
14 prevention, detection and removal of bed bug
15 infestations. I want to thank the staff Guillermo
16 Patino, Megan Chin, Jose Conde, Sarah Gastelum, Jim
17 Wilcox and Ed Adkins for assistance on this bill, and
18 I will ask Council Member Dromm to say a few words.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Madam
20 Speaker. Today the City Council will address a
21 vexing problem facing many New Yorkers, bed bugs. I
22 have heard from many constituents about the enormous
23 disruption caused by these little unwelcome visitors.
24 The best weapon we have against bed bugs is
25 knowledge. The more apartment tenants and owners

2 know, the better prepared they will be to take
3 measures and detect any burgeoning infestations. In
4 2010, the State Legislature passed, and the Governor
5 signed the New York City Bed Bug Disclosure Act.
6 This was a welcomed step forward, but it impacted
7 only vacancy leases. While incoming tenants should
8 now receive disclosure of a property's bed bug
9 infestation history, existing tenants are left in the
10 dark. Intro 648 will fill this gap by requiring
11 disclosure to all tenants through posting or
12 individual notices with leases as well as information
13 on the prevention and detection and removal of bed
14 bugs. Finally, building owners will be required to
15 report to the Department of Housing, Preservation and
16 Development on infestations and eradication measures.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
18 [shushing for quiet]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I want to reassure
20 landlords that there is no need to bug out since they
21 are already disclosing to new tenants. This bill
22 will simply extend that transparency to all tenants.
23 Bed bugs after all do not discriminate between new
24 and long-time tenants. They're just out for blood.
25 [laughter]

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, broad.

3 [laughter] [cheers/applause]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you.

5 [laughter] Let them boom. Let them boom.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I didn't know the
7 floor of the Council had become a comedy room.

8 [laughter]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I would like to
10 thank the Speaker, Chair Williams, Sebastian McGuire,
11 Legislative staff Megan Chin and Jim Wilcox for all
12 their work on 658-A. Thank you very, very much.

13 [background comments, laughter]

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I love it, very
15 cute, very amusing, but obviously bed bugs are not-
16 not a funny thing at all. As paced-and finally
17 obviously in this big package of construction bills,
18 as the pace of construction in New York City
19 increases and construction projects get bigger and
20 more complex, the number of construction injuries and
21 deaths have also increased.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

23 [shushing for quiet]

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: In response, the
25 Council has introduced a package of legislation

2 called the Construction Safety Act, which is aimed at
3 making construction sites safer for everyone
4 including workers in the public. Today, the Council
5 will be voting on a portion of that package. Intro
6 81-A sponsored by Council Member Rory Lancman will
7 require the Department of Buildings to report certain
8 violations of the New York City Building Code to the
9 Federal Occupational Safety and Health
10 Administration. Intro 1421-A sponsored by Council
11 Member Margaret Chin would require all cranes to be
12 equipped with a global positioning system or other
13 similar device, which is capable of transmitting the
14 location of the crane to which it is attached to the
15 Department of Buildings. Introduction 1435-A
16 sponsored by Council Member Alan Maisel would require
17 cranes to be equipped with event recorders to collect
18 the following data: Crane configurations; any
19 overload condition; status of limit switches and
20 operator overrides. This information will be made
21 available to the DOB upon request Intro 1433-A,
22 sponsored by Council Member Ben Kallos, would expand
23 the data that must be reported when an accident that
24 results in an injury or fatality to a member of the
25 public or a construction worker occurs at a

2 construction site. Intro 1446-A, sponsored by
3 Housing and Buildings Committee Chair Jumaane
4 Williams would require hoisting machine operators to
5 obtain a special rating in order to operate
6 particularly large cranes. And finally, Intro 1448-
7 A, sponsored by Council Member Jumaane Williams,
8 which would require that certain buildings under 10
9 stories, excluding one, two and three-family
10 buildings, retaining construction superintendent,
11 among other things, is responsible for maintaining a
12 safe job site. Further, it would require that such
13 building create a site safety plan and keep such plan
14 on site. I want to thank the staff Guillermo Patino,
15 Megan Chin, Jose Conde, Sarah Gastelum, Jim Wilcox
16 and Ed Adkins for their assistance on this package.
17 This is only a portion of the construction safety
18 legislation that we hope to consider, but I'm
19 immensely proud of the work being done here. There
20 are several Council Members to hear from, but we
21 obviously will begin with Housing and Buildings
22 Committee Chair Jumaane Williams, followed by member-
23 Council Member Kallos, Council Member Chin, and then
24 Council Member Lancman. Council Member Williams.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you,
3 Madam Speaker. First, I did want to say thank you
4 Council Member Dromm on his bill. I have heard from
5 some of the small business owners, and he took the
6 time out to make some changes to the bill. I
7 appreciate that and proud to support it. We are
8 voting on part of the package that many of you were a
9 part of hearing a few weeks ago. You may recall it
10 was 21 bills. It was to my knowledge the largest
11 size package we have heard in this Council, which is
12 a testament to how seriously we're taking
13 construction site safety. I have said before I
14 believe we as a city took too long to move, but I am
15 thankful to be part of a body that is moving.
16 Unfortunately, 33 people in the past two years have
17 lost their lives, but I do want to thank the Speaker
18 for her leadership on this issue, and we have said
19 from the beginning it's—it's not a matter of what
20 work site you work on, union or non-union. It's not
21 a matter if you're documented or undocumented. It is
22 a matter that you are safe on that site, and everyone
23 believes we are—we believe that everyone should be
24 safe on the site that they are working on. This—this
25 part of the package that is coming out is consistent

2 with that, and we believe that all of the bills that
3 will come after will also be consistent with it.
4 Today, we'll be passing Intro 1446 and Intro 1448,
5 which are part of the larger package. The two bills
6 that I am sponsoring with this part of the package,
7 one it hosts machine operators to obtain a special
8 rating in order to operate particularly cranes. The
9 bill will go into effect six months after it is
10 signed into law. Intro 1448 requires under ten-
11 stories-buildings under ten stories excluding one,
12 two and three-family buildings retain a construction
13 superintendent to maintain the job site. This bill
14 will go into effect 180 days after it is signed into
15 law. This is a particularly important bill because
16 we have data that shows the vast amount of the
17 accidents and injuries and deaths occur on stories
18 that are 10 and below. We will not accept that
19 because there is an increase in construction, we must
20 accept an increase in deaths or injury. These bills
21 are for all workers who didn't make it home after a
22 day on the job site. My hope is that with due
23 diligence and oversight we can prevent just one more
24 family from losing a loved one and going through the
25 horrors. I want to thank Megan Chin, Guillermo

2 Patino, Jose Conde, Laura Popa, Matt Gewolb, Jeff
3 Baker, Ed Adkins, Jim Wilcox, all of my colleagues
4 who are a part of the package, Mike Toomey from my
5 staff and my former staff Nick Smith who was taken to
6 the other side.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.
8 Council Member Kallos.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: The Federal
10 Occupational Safety and Health Administration, OSHA
11 and Department of Buildings count injuries and deaths
12 on construction sites in different ways. Though they
13 don't have the count, we do and it's been 33 lives in
14 two years. We're voting on Introduction 1433 today
15 to count every injury and every death. Every injury
16 must be counted, every death must be counted and
17 reported in a timely basis. Regardless of whether or
18 not it's a violation of OSHA or DOB, regardless or
19 whether it's construction workers or a member of the
20 public, their lives will count. When someone gets-
21 gets hurt or dies that will trigger reporting to the
22 public within 72 hours, the contractors, details on
23 the incident, work being done, hours on the job, the
24 types of injury. Who was hurt, whether a
25 construction worker was part of a collective

2 bargaining unit, details about the construction site
3 and more. At the suggestion of the Department of
4 Buildings, construction companies that don't report,
5 and hide the truth will face steep fines as much as
6 \$25,000 and daily fines by as much as \$1,000 a day.
7 Thank you to Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for her
8 leadership on construction safety as well as Housing
9 and Buildings Chair Jumaane Williams. Through this
10 legislation we'll be able to see who is getting hurt,
11 where, when and why so that we as a city can make
12 construction safety. We must count every life.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Ben.
14 Council Member Chin and then Council Member Lancman.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Speaker.
16 Good afternoon. Today we will vote on Intro 1421-A,
17 legislation that will require certain cranes to be
18 equipped with Global Position System or GPS. The
19 city is seeing an unprecedented amount of
20 construction in the last couple of years. After the
21 tragic and fatal crane collapse in Lower Manhattan,
22 my constituents are always worried about the next
23 accident. Whenever they see a crane erected near
24 their homes or their workplace, it is up to us in the
25 City Council to make sure that we put the proper

2 regulations in place to assure their fears. One of
3 the many recommendations that the City Crane
4 Technical Working Group made to create after-create
5 safer crane operations, Intro 1421-A, allows for the
6 Department of Buildings to easily locate mobile
7 cranes for real time audits. Furthermore, GPS can
8 allow both the department and construction companies
9 to collect relevant data for operators to determine
10 the best route when moving cranes throughout the
11 city. By passing Intro 1421-A, we will be one stop
12 closer to having the safety standards that our
13 neighborhood and industry deserves. I want to thank
14 Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito and Chair Williams for
15 your leadership on this bill. I also want to thank
16 the staff who worked so hard on this bill: Megan
17 Chan, Jim Wilcox and Guillermo Patino for their hard
18 work on this legislation, and I urge my colleagues to
19 vote yes on Intro 1421-A. Thank you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: [rustling
21 papers, pause] If you insist, Madam Speaker. The
22 Occupational, Safety and Health Administration
23 Notification Act would help protect construction
24 workers at unsafe worksites by requiring the
25 Department of Buildings to report immediately

2 hazardous or major violations of the Building Code
3 Section that deals with safety during construction
4 and demolition of any violation of OSHA training
5 requirements. As we know, over the past two years,
6 more than 30 construction workers have died in New
7 York City, many of them in preventable accidents
8 where federal safety regulations were not adequately
9 followed. Increasing communication between the two
10 agencies will allow OSHA to direct its limited
11 resources towards construction sites where DOB
12 inspectors have already identified safety hazards or
13 training failures. A failure of bureaucratic
14 coordination is not an excuse that we should give to
15 the families of those killed or injured on unsafe
16 construction sites. Thank you.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you,
18 Council Member, and so obviously we had recognized
19 Gary for his years of service here. Again, thank you,
20 Gary. We look forward to the 4:30 reception. We
21 really do hope colleagues will stick around to
22 celebrate with him, and also to celebrate with his
23 family who will be joining us after his 37 years of
24 working in this—in this institution. So thank you
25 again, Gary, for all of that. We look forward to

2 seeing you all at 4:30, and with that, I end the
3 communication from the Speaker.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
5 Congratulations, Gary. We are certainly going to
6 miss you. Discussion of General Orders. Seeing one,
7 Report of Special Committees.

8 CLERK: None.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
10 Standing Committees.

11 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
12 Contracts, Intro 1224-A, VENDEX Questionnaire.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
14 Coupled on General Orders.

15 CLERK: Intro 1271-A, VENDEX Electronic
16 Submission.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
18 Coupled on General Orders.

19 CLERK: Intro 1324-A, Public Access for
20 City Contracts.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
22 Coupled on General Orders.

23 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
24 Education, Intro 1251-A, Distribution of College
25 Savings Plan Materials.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

88

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
3 Coupled on General Orders.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
5 Finance, Preconsidered LU 605 and Reso 1447 and LU
6 660 and Reso 1448 Tax Exemptions.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
8 General Orders.

9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
10 Housing and Buildings, Intro 81-A, OSHA Notification
11 Act.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
13 Coupled on General Orders.

14 CLERK: Intro 648-A, Bed Bug Reporting.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
16 Coupled on General Orders.

17 CLERK: Intro 1421-A, Crane Locating
18 Devices.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
20 Coupled on General Orders.

21 CLERK: Intro 1433-A, Construction
22 Fatality Reporting.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
24 Coupled on General Orders.

25

2 CLERK: Intro 1435-A, Crane Event
3 Records.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
5 Coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Intro 1446-A, Crane Operator
7 Licensing.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
9 coupled on General Orders.

10 CLERK: Intro 1448-A, Construction
11 Superintendents.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
13 Coupled on General Orders.

14 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Land
15 Use, LU 589 and LU 590 Zoning Amendments.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Approve with
17 Modifications and referred to the City Planning
18 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of
19 the Council and Section 197(d) of the New York City
20 Charter.

21 CLERK: [coughs] LU—excuse me. LU 591
22 and Reso 1449 and LU 592 and Reso 1460 Zoning
23 Amendments.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
25 General Orders.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 90

2 CLERK: LU 594 and Reso 1451, Disposition
3 of city-owned property.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
5 General Orders.

6 CLERK: LU 595 and Reso 1452 and LU 596
7 and Res 1453, Economic Development Corporation.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
9 General Orders.

10 CLERK: LU 597 and Reso 1454, UDAAP,
11 Brooklyn.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 General Orders.

14 CLERK: LU 598 and Reso 1455, HPD Special
15 Permit.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
17 General Orders.

18 CLERK: LU 601 and Reso 14656, Sidewalk
19 Café.

20 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled. To be
21 filed pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

22 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Small
23 Business, Intro 891-A, Business notification system.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
25 coupled on General Orders.

2 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
3 Transportation, Intro 965-A, Citywide Transit Study.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
5 coupled on General Orders.

6 CLERK: Intro 1311-A, Notifications
7 concerning resurfacing.

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
9 coupled on General Orders.

10 CLERK: On the General Order Calendar,
11 Resolution Appointing Various Persons Commissioners
12 of Deeds.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
14 General Orders, and at time I ask for a roll call on
15 all items on the Coupled General Order Calendar.

16 CLERK: Eugene.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: [pause] [off mic]
18 I want to request [on mic] I want to request the
19 Commission to—I'm sorry.

20 CLERK: [off mic] How do you vote? (sic)

21 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: [background
22 comments] Oh, aye, aye, aye, aye.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
24 explain my vote.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 CLERK: Council Member Barron.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. First
4 of all, I want to wish everyone a happy Earth Day,
5 and there are some recent birthdays I want to
6 acknowledge: Ndidgo Washington, my Legislative
7 Director [cheers/applause] is celebrating her
8 birthday, and my grandson Solomon just celebrated his
9 second birthday, and he is able to recite the Lord's
10 Prayer in full.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Ah.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: So, Solomon,
13 Grammy loves you.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Bless him.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: As regards LU 597
16 and Reso 1454 and LU 598 and Reso 1455, which is
17 Housing that's coming into my district, it will
18 provide 70 units of housing and 42% of—42 of those
19 units are for people who were formerly homeless with
20 special needs. So they will have an on-site service.
21 They will have the laundry room, they'll have a
22 computer room, they'll have also a multi-purpose
23 room. They'll have a beautiful garden in the back,
24 and I'm pleased to say that the remaining units are
25 available to people at 27% of AMI, 37%, 47% and 50%

2 of AMI. I think that as we're talking bout the
3 homeless crisis that we have, we have to provide
4 opportunities for people who are living in shelters
5 and additionally for families with children living in
6 shelters to have an opportunity to move into
7 permanent housing that they can afford. My
8 hesitation with this project was that it was only
9 300--and average of 300 square feet. I don't think
10 that gives dignity to people, and the fact that it
11 was all studio apartments. But notwithstanding,
12 those limitations [coughing] I am voting in favor of
13 that project--

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: --and I ask all
17 of my colleagues to support that project as well.
18 Thank you. I want to thank the Speaker for pushing
19 it forward. I want to thank Raju--thank Raju Mann,
20 especially Brian Paul who put a lot of time in, and
21 also the Commissioner who realized that I had some
22 very serious concerns about the issue, and gave me a
23 letter with certain guarantees in it. So with that,
24 I vote aye on all. [bell]

25 CLERK: Borelli.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Permission to
3 vote on Land Use Call-ups as well as the General
4 Order Calendar?

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [off mic] Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all
7 except 648

8 CLERK: Vacca.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on
10 all. Thank you.

11 CLERK: Chin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

13 CLERK: Cohen.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic] Aye.

15 CLERK: Cornegy.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

17 CLERK: Crowley.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: [off mic] Aye on
19 all.

20 CLERK: Cumbo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye on all.

22 CLERK: Deutsch.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

24 CLERK: Espinal.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: With
3 congratulations to Danny Dromm for not letting bed
4 bugs bite and to my good friend Alan Maisel, I vote
5 aye.

6 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: With
8 Congratulations to all my colleagues I vote aye.

9 CLERK: Garodnick.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

11 CLERK: Gibson.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: With my warmest
13 congratulations to all our colleagues that passed
14 important legislation today and congratulations to
15 Gary Altman. Thank you for your—

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
17 [shushing for quiet]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: --service and
19 enjoy your retirement. I proudly vote aye on all.
20 Thank you.

21 CLERK: Greenfield.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: May I explain
23 my vote?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: So I'm
3 genuinely hoping—

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
5 [shushing for quiet]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: --that Gary
7 Altman doesn't change his cell phone number. I'm not
8 sure who we're going to call any more when we have
9 questions of what to do or how to do it. Gary has
10 literally trained generations of Council Members in
11 proper procedures, and how to actually get things
12 done, and always with a smile. And really incredible
13 service, decades of service to the city. I don't
14 think the average viewer even can possibly comprehend
15 how important he is to this institution, and the
16 contributions that he's made not just to the
17 institution but to those us as individuals and he has
18 helped me pass countless pieces of legislation. So on
19 a personal level Gary I thank you. Please do not
20 change your cell phone number. I promise not to call
21 you after hours if that's a fair compromise to get
22 you to keep your phone number instead, and I really
23 appreciate and respect all the work that you've done
24 not just for me, but for this body, and I know that
25 you placed this institution above yourself for years,

2 and we're grateful for that. I want to congratulate
3 all of my colleagues for their legislation today. I
4 especially want to congratulate Council Member Eugene
5 for the Caton Flats development, an incredible
6 achievement including a brand new market for vendors,
7 affordable housing. Thanks to Council Member Eugene
8 all the units are going to be affordable, and the
9 lowest tier of affordability will now be 37% of AMI,
10 which is a wonderful achievement, and that—and thanks
11 to his hard work and negotiations skills, and we're
12 grateful for that. I want to welcome back to the
13 Council June Eisland the former Land Use Chair of the
14 New York City Council. It's great to see her here.
15 We thank her for her contributions, and I want to
16 congratulate all of my colleagues and I vote aye on
17 all.

18 CLERK: Grodenchik.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I just want
20 to wish Gary the very best of everything. He's been
21 an inspiration to me and has become friend in a very
22 short time, and I just like Greenfield, I would urge
23 you not to change your cell phone, but my advice to
24 you would be not to answer your cell phone.

2 [laughter] I vote aye on all except for 648-A, which
3 is a no for me. Thank you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Johnson.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: [pause]

7 Permission to explain my vote.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I vote aye on
10 all, but I want to make remarks today regarding a
11 Land Use application and I know we voted on it
12 earlier. In light of a West 23rd Street Text
13 Amendment that's before the City Council today, I
14 want to remark on what's become an increasingly
15 severe problem in my district, and that's the
16 approval of demolition permits for properties special
17 zoning districts that are occupied or otherwise not
18 suited for demolition. My Council District is home
19 to four special zoning districts, which were created
20 to encourage certain types of development often with
21 an eye toward protecting and building affordable
22 housing. While this zoning helps increase the amount
23 of affordable housing we have, it can only do so when
24 our city agencies enforce the protective provisions
25 within these districts. In the Special Clinton

2 District for example, Zoning states that no
3 demolition permit or alteration permit will be issued
4 if it leads to a decrease of more than 20% of the
5 amount of residential floor area. Only if the
6 building is determined to be unsafe, can a demolition
7 permit be issued. Additionally, properties within
8 these districts cannot be materially altered without
9 obtaining a Certificate of No Harassment--

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
11 [shushing for quiet]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: --by the
13 Department of Housing, Preservation and Development.

14 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Quiet
15 please, quiet please.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: These rules
17 protect tenants. They are protecting our housing
18 stock and they are adequately enforced. We will lose
19 affordable housing units if demolition continues
20 illegally. This February I joined the state elected
21 officials and Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer
22 to meet with the Department of Buildings and HPD, and
23 we brought to their attention many cases of-of-in my
24 district of buildings that have received demolition
25 plans or demolition permits from DOB. In almost all

2 cases these were fully occupied buildings that were
3 vacated of tenants or owners. DOB has issued audits
4 on many of these properties, but the city must do a
5 better job to enforce the protective zoning laws that
6 should protect—prevent these issues from arising in
7 the first place. We cannot continue to approve
8 demolitions until a proper evaluation is done to
9 ensure that it complies with zoning law. [bell] It
10 is my goal to ensure the integrity of the zoning for
11 all of these special districts is maintained. I
12 thought it was important to make that statement on
13 the record today in light of this text amendment that
14 I support, and I vote aye on all. Thank you very
15 much.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 CLERK: Kallos.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

19 CLERK: King.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye on all,
21 but I want to say to you, Gary, thank you for your
22 understanding. Thank you for your time. Thank you
23 for your leadership. When I couldn't find the
24 bathroom, you directed me to the other door. I
25 really appreciate you, and everything that you do. I

2 look forward to seeing you again in Israel. God
3 bless.

4 CLERK: Koo.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye.

6 CLERK: Koslowitz.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Can I please
8 be excused to explain my vote?

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye--

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

12 [shushing for quiet]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: --on the those
14 issues. I just want to say that I am going to miss
15 Gary very. I don't know Gary for 37 years, but I
16 certainly know him for 22 years of the 37 years, and
17 he's really been wonderful to I think all of us now
18 and before. And I also want to recognize my former
19 colleague, June Eisland, who was here today to
20 celebrate Gary. Thank you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Happy Birthday.

22 CLERK: Lancman.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye on all with
24 the exception of 658-A.

25 CLERK: Lander.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request
3 permission to explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

6 First, I just want to add my voice in gratitude to
7 Gary for answering all my many, many questions with
8 great patience and often sometimes even more
9 information than I knew I wanted, which I almost
10 always appreciated. So we're really going to miss
11 you institutionally and personally. So thank you.
12 I'm going to be voting no on Land Use Nos. 589 and
13 590. I give great props to Council Member Levin for
14 pushing to make that project more deeply affordable
15 than it was when he got it to start with. But as I
16 had said when we adopted the Mandatory Inclusionary
17 Housing to begin with, I believe that this so-called
18 Option C or Option 3, which only has so-called
19 affordable housing up to as much as 100-

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 Council-Council Member, we're not voting on those two
22 items.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: We referred them
24 to City Planning and they are looking at our
25

2 amendments and coming back to us at the next meeting.

3 I vote aye on all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Levin.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I—permission to
7 explain my vote.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I want to vote aye
10 on all, but I also want to take this opportunity to
11 thank and acknowledge Gary Altman and all the great
12 work that he's done here at this Council and the many
13 years and dedication to the many speakers and council
14 members, and to the integrity of this body. Gary has
15 been available to me late at night, early in the
16 morning, on weekends whenever I needed his help, and
17 he has—in many ways he's, you know, the heart and
18 soul of this institution as well as—as the
19 institutional memory, and we have been very fortunate
20 as a city and as a body to have his expertise and his
21 dedication, and Gary we all thank you. Thanks. Aye
22 on all.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 CLERK: Maisel.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Yes.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

104

2 CLERK: Menchaca.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Gary, thank you
4 so much. Aye on all.

5 CLERK: Mendez.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: [off mic] Yes.

7 CLERK: Miller.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Aye on all.

9 CLERK: Palma.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Aye on
11 all.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Perkins.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Permission to
15 explain my vote.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER I want to vote aye on all,
18 but I guess as much I wanted to thank Gary for his
19 service and the opportunity I've had to experience
20 him twice. [laughs] In the beginning and now.
21 Enjoy. You deserve it.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

23 CLERK: Reynoso.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I'm going to
25 miss you, Gary. I vote aye on all.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 CLERK: Richards.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you,
5 Gary. I vote aye.

6 CLERK: Rodriguez.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ:

8 Congratulations to Gary. I vote aye.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 CLERK: Rose.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye and
12 congratulations, Gary.

13 CLERK: Rosenthal.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all and
15 I particularly want to thank Council Member Williams
16 for Intro 1448-A, which I think will make a
17 significant difference in construction safety. Thank
18 you so much for that.

19 CLERK: Salamanca.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Torres.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

24 CLERK: Treyger.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
3 briefly explain my vote.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I just want to
6 say to Gary so I-I wasn't born yet when you started
7 working here in this Council.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [laughs]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: But as a-I think
10 a couple of us were not born yet, but I want to say
11 as a former history teacher your institutional member
12 and knowledge of the way this body works and the
13 respect that you have for this body and governments
14 is-is weight its weight in gold, and I cannot thank
15 you enough for your intelligence, your knowledge and
16 you always willingness to help even a rookie council
17 member out. So thank you so much, and I wish you a
18 happy and healthy retirement, and I congratulate all
19 my colleagues on their bills today, and I vote aye on
20 all.

21 CLERK: Ulrich.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye on all
23 with the exception of Intro 648-A. Thank you.

24 CLERK: Williams.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be
3 excused to explain my vote?

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I
6 vote aye on all with the exception of 594, 595, 596
7 and the accompanying resolution I'm abstaining. The
8 only reason I'm abstaining is that I haven't the
9 opportunity to look at the AMIs versus the higher
10 AMIs and the public benefit, but I do want to
11 congratulate Council Member Eugene on all the work
12 that he put in there even getting some down to 37%.
13 I am big supporter of CACCI, and the vendors' market.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
15 [shushing for quiet]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: The vendor
17 market is particularly we'll be having temporary
18 space in my district. So this is not an aspersion to
19 it. I just haven't had time to look at it. So I do
20 want to congratulate him and the project and everyone
21 involved, and with that I vote aye on all the rest.

22 CLERK: Levine.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Permission to
24 very briefly explain my vote, Madam Public Advocate.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Well, I'll be
3 voting aye on all, but I want to acknowledge our
4 special visitor who's here with me today, which is
5 our son, Alejandro [laughs] and who is recently
6 admitted to Oswego State and we're very proud of him.
7 [cheers/applause]

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations,
9 Alejandro.

10 CLERK: Matteo.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Thank you.
12 Permission to vote on all Land Use Call-Ups as well
13 as General Orders.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I vote aye on all
16 with the exception of 648 and I vote no. I want to
17 wish my good friend Gary Altman a great retirement.
18 This Council is going to miss you. I'm going to miss
19 you, and with respect to David Greenfield, Gary
20 change your number. [laughter]

21 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

22 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Aye on
23 all. (sic)

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I'd like to
25 invite my colleagues to sign onto a pair of bills

2 being introduced today by Council Member Kallos and
3 myself, Intro 1580 and 1574 creating a retirement
4 security program. This legislation was more than two
5 years in the making, the product of extensive
6 discussions with experts, and New Yorkers of all ages
7 and backgrounds, and we know that few New Yorkers
8 have access to a retirement from their employer. And
9 as a result, workers at all age levels have
10 inadequate savings and face the real possibility of
11 spending their retirement years in poverty. And
12 that's why this program is so important. We know the
13 federal government has already worked to stifle and
14 preempt-preempt such local efforts, but a move that
15 can precipitate the unnecessary and heartless
16 improvement of millions. And so, I urge my
17 colleagues to join Council Member Kallos and I and
18 sign onto these bills. All items on today's General
19 Order Calendar were adopted by a vote 49 in the
20 affirmative, 0 negative and 0 abstentions with the
21 exception of Intro 648-A, which was adopted by a vote
22 of 44 in the affirmative, 5 negative and 0
23 abstentions; and Land Use 594 and Reso 1451, which
24 was adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, 0
25 negative and 1 abstention; and LU 595 and Reso 1451,

2 which was adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative,
3 0 negative and 1 abstention; and LUs-LU 596 and Reso
4 1453, which was adopted by a vote of 48 in the
5 affirmative, 0 negative, and 1 abstention; and the
6 revised-revised Land Use Call-ups the vote I 49 in
7 the affirmative-49 in the affirmative, and 0
8 negatives-votes. Introduction and Reading of Bills.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All bills are
10 referred to committees as indicated on-as indicated
11 on the Agenda.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 There's no resolutions this afternoon, so we will-we
14 will begin our general discussion first with Council
15 Member Barron.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam
17 Public Advocate. I want to call my colleagues'
18 attention to Intro 1559, a Water Filtration system to
19 require that the DOE install filters at each of the
20 sites where there are water-water fountains in the
21 schools. I was very dismayed at the Brooklyn
22 Delegation meeting where the Deputy Chancellor was
23 very dismissive of the fact that there's lead in the
24 water by saying well, it's only in that first
25 exchange of water, release of water, the standing

2 water that's been there. That's unacceptable. So it
3 gave me the impression that the DOE's position is
4 well, that flows out and then those who come behind
5 won't be subjected to whatever lead might be in
6 there. We know that in the instance of Flint,
7 Michigan the people who are responsible to make
8 change and take action were negligent and dragged
9 their feet, and we think that we don't want to have
10 that same description placed on those of us who are
11 here in New York City who have the responsibility to
12 make sure that the water that our children are
13 drinking in schools is safe. So I call my
14 colleagues' attention to that, and ask for your
15 support on 1559. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
17 Council Member Kallos.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Please join me in
19 celebrating Earth Day and fighting Trump's denial of
20 science and climate change with sponsoring Intro
21 1573, which would bring zero waste to New York City
22 20230. Intro 1572, which would mandate recycling and
23 composting in places of public accommodation. Other
24 progressive cities have it. So we should, too.
25 Introduction 1575 introduced in partnership with

2 Council Member Donovan Richards who required that
3 street lights be fully shielded to save energy,
4 reduce light pollution, and so most importantly New
5 Yorkers could get a good night's sleep without street
6 lights shining in their windows. And last, but
7 certainly not least, as the Public Advocate already
8 spoke to a pair of bills we're introducing together,
9 Introductions 1574 and 1580, along with Civil Serve
10 and Labor Chair Miller as well as several colleagues,
11 puts into legislative language something we've been
12 working with the Obama Administration for years with
13 the leadership of our Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito,
14 and Mayor Bill de Blasio and countless calls to the
15 White House Secretary of Labor to make sure that the
16 millions of New Yorkers who don't have access to
17 retirement accounts through their employers can
18 actually save for retirement. And despite the
19 actions of this---

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
21 [shushing for quiet]

22 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: [interposing] Keep it
23 down, please, keep it down.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: --Congress and
25 President Trump, we will continue to resist, and we

2 will fight for progress and making sure that every
3 New Yorker can have retirement. Please sign on.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet
5 in the Chambers. We're still in session. Council
6 Member Miller.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
8 Public Advocate. Today, we're anxious to be
9 introducing two resolutions, Preconsidered 1444, 1445
10 and they are they are worker protections, and one of
11 things that here in New York State these are -would
12 be no-brainers, but one 1.3 million union workers
13 depend on the right to collectively bargain. Intro
14 4-1444 will protect the right to-of collective
15 bargaining and would 1445 will-is a resolution
16 calling upon Congress to vote no against right to
17 work. We have seen the perpetuation of right to work
18 states throughout the country, and states like
19 Michigan and Wisconsin and others that we feel are
20 high density union states that we thought would
21 never occur, there are now 28 states that have right
22 to work. Right to work is exactly the opposite. It
23 is the right to steal the rights of workers. In the
24 case of the-the ability to collectively bargain, what
25 we see here for the 1.3 [million] union members in

2 the City of New York, it provides health care,
3 workers safety and protections, pensions. Wages that
4 sustain the middle-class. Certainly we want to be
5 able to do this. We think that in the environment
6 that we live in we know that these—these rights and
7 entitlements are under siege. We see them come into
8 our city, and we certainly want to protect that. I
9 ask my colleagues to vote yes on these resolutions so
10 that we can protect the middle-class. Thank you so
11 much, and in my 20— You know what, I'll get you when
12 the second comes around. Because I—I do want to talk
13 briefly about the fire that occurred in my district.
14 Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
16 Council Member Williams.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very
18 much. First, I'd like to bring my colleagues'
19 attention to three bills: Intro 1588 co-sponsored by
20 Melissa Mark-Viverito requiring employees and
21 contractors to protect identifying information such
22 as sexual orientation, religion, and immigration
23 status by limiting its disclosure and attention.
24 Intro 1507-A co-primed by Council Members Menchaca,
25 Dromm, and the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito to

2 create an immigration task force. Also a bed and
3 breakfast bill co-sponsored by Council Member
4 Cornegy. Often you are telling one and two-family
5 homeowners that they can legally use sites like a
6 B&B. There are some arcane laws that are causing
7 confusion. We're hoping that this bill will in
8 effect move some bills up. I do want to make mention
9 the budget that was passed in the state I found it
10 somewhat offensive that the government was calling it
11 a progressive budget. I think his use of the words
12 epitomizes the need the need to redefine the word
13 progressive. I would have felt better if he had just
14 called it a budget with some good things it. The
15 Raise the Age, which we didn't get all that we
16 wanted, we did get some, but we were the—I believe if
17 I understand correctly the 49th state. So I don't
18 know what that says about the 48 states that came
19 before, and the free tuition does not impact those
20 who need the most as well as if you're a CUNY student
21 on 90%--90% of CUNY students do not graduate within
22 four years. Therefore, they will not be able to
23 participate or they will have to pay the money back,
24 and the 421-A, we might as well have given billions
25 dollars to developers and not pretend that there is

2 any kind of program. Yesterday was Yamha Shoah.
3 Remember to pay tribute to the Holocaust in the
4 Jewish community. The Jewish community and the
5 African-American community share some horrible
6 experiences. I was—just recently learned about
7 Sophie Shoal, who was part of the White Rose
8 Resistance with some students who fought back. I hope
9 you can provide inspiration for what she faced. As
10 she was on the guillotine at 21 years old her last
11 words were long live freedom. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
13 Council Member Menchaca.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you.
15 Today, we're taking more of the practical step in
16 requiring to maintain and extend protections of our
17 sanctuary city to all New York residents. The
18 Sanctuary City Resolution adopted in this City
19 Council last year in this session really declared
20 with many ideals and actual programs and legislation
21 that we've already passed, but we must continue with
22 specific protections to build on that. Tomorrow we
23 will be holding a public hearing at 11:00 here in the
24 Chambers jointly with my Committee on Immigration and
25 Education and Public Safety. Council Williams

2 alluded to some of them, but Intro 1557, 1558, 1565,
3 1566, 1568 among them will be heard tomorrow through
4 budget hearings or hearings. In many different
5 committees in the last years have really kind of
6 pointed to how we need to think about both ICE non-
7 local enforcement, and schools and property, and
8 these bill really kind of talk to those questions
9 among-before us. I'm really proud that the Speaker
10 and her staff and all the Council Members that are
11 connected to these bills are really pushing for a
12 quick hearing. So that's why we're having that
13 tomorrow, but it's going to really start the formal
14 process to build the kind of legislation we're going
15 to need to be strong as municipality. We know that
16 we have limits in our ability to do the work we do,
17 but we have power, and we want to—we want to flex
18 that tomorrow and we're hoping that everyone comes
19 out, speaks their truth and we will then respond with
20 our work here in this legislative body. Thank you so
21 much.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, and
23 our last speaker again is Council Member Miller.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you, Madam
25 Public Advocate. So, again, I wanted to just speak

2 about the-the tragedy that was-that has occurred this
3 past Sunday with the five lives that was lost. I
4 want to thank you personally for-for being in the
5 district and-and-and really nurturing this situation.
6 So our city and our community is again mourning and
7 remembering the victims of this tragic fire that took
8 place in Queens Village in the 27th District. Five
9 precious young lives are suddenly no longer with us,
10 and-and their families and friends and communities
11 must now summon the courage over the painful reality-

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]
13 [shushing for quiet]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: As these-these-as
15 the details of this devastating event emerge, I
16 encourage all to first and foremost to hug your lived
17 ones extra tight, and then have a frank conversation
18 about fire safety, and what we can do to continue to
19 protect our loved ones. And-and lastly, I remain
20 eternally grateful to our emergency service
21 responders for those who saw it or who was on the
22 same-the work that they had done was phenomenal. The
23 work that they've continued to do to make our city
24 safe and keep us safe is-is greatly appreciated and
25 hope that all that are viewing and all that can hear

2 this continue to value those who serve us so-so-so
3 valiantly. As-as we remember the young lives that
4 were lost, and there is a-going to be a true Gold
5 Friendly Fund (sic) that is going to be sponsored by
6 the Amalgamated Transit Unit of Land Farber. Mr.
7 Alfred Green was one of my members and-and so that is
8 going to happen, and you know that when these tragic
9 incidents occurs they are often exploited and people
10 take advantage of it. So, anyone who wants [bell] to
11 participate in any way can do that, and please reach
12 out to our office and again, I appreciate all of the
13 concerns, and all the support that we have gotten
14 from throughout the city on behalf of the family.
15 Thank you.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May they rest in
17 peace, and now to close, our Speaker Melissa Mark-
18 Viverito.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Oh, consider me
20 sort of a little late thanks to my colleague where
21 I've been here relatively on time as usual. So thank
22 you all. I'll see you all at 4:30 and we're
23 adjourned. [gavel]

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 16, 2017