

**Testimony from NYCHA's Chief Executive Officer Lisa Bova-Hiatt**  
***Preliminary Budget Hearing – Public Housing***  
**Committee on Public Housing**  
**Tuesday, March 12, 2023 – 1 p.m.**  
**New York City Hall Committee Room**

Chair Chris Banks, members of the Committee on Public Housing, other distinguished members of the City Council, NYCHA residents, community advocates, and members of the public: good afternoon. I am Lisa Bova-Hiatt, NYCHA's Chief Executive Officer. I am pleased to be joined by Chief Operating Officer Eva Trimble, Executive Vice President of Finance and Chief Financial Officer Annika Lescott-Martinez, Chief Asset and Capital Management Officer Shaan Mavani, and other members of NYCHA's team. Thank you for this opportunity to present the Authority's adopted budget, which was approved by NYCHA's Board of Directors in December. I would also like to discuss our work to transform NYCHA as an organization and enhance residents' quality of life.

I would first like to commend the hardworking members of our Finance team – for the 20<sup>th</sup> year in a row, NYCHA was recognized for excellence in financial reporting by the Government Finance Officers Association of the United States and Canada.

### **The Impacts of Declining Rent Revenue**

My colleagues and I are intensely engaged in the efforts to improve how NYCHA functions so we can better deliver services to our residents and ensure the Authority remains a vital resource of affordable housing in our city. We have made progress in key areas that most impact residents – from lead and mold abatement to comprehensive building and apartment renovations through our housing preservation initiatives. However, we are contending with considerable financial challenges – in addition to the mounting impacts of decades of federal disinvestment, we are grappling with significant rent arrears.

Rent arrears now total \$482 million across 70,000 households – a \$357 million increase from 2019. NYCHA is collecting only 60 percent of the rent owed (including arrears) over a 12-month period; HUD expects public housing authorities to collect 100 percent of the rent. Since NYCHA's primary mission is to keep residents housed, we conducted a campaign to inform residents of the various ways they can get help with paying their rent, and we work with residents experiencing economic hardship. We are also proud of our advocacy in collaboration

with many partners, including residents and elected officials, to ensure residents received their fair share of Emergency Rental Assistance Program (ERAP) funding from the State. To date, NYCHA has received \$136 million in ERAP funding from the State and applied \$90 million to residents' accounts; we will continue to credit residents' accounts as funds are received. Thanks in part to the ERAP funding, rent arrears have decreased since last year and are stabilizing.

Rent payments fund one-third of NYCHA's operating budget and are critical to our ability to maintain our developments and provide residents with the quality of life they deserve. Compounding the challenges is the fact that our rapidly aging developments have nearly \$80 billion in major capital needs. Despite the funding constraints, we are leveraging creative funding strategies and using all available resources to make critical investments that improve residents' quality of life and provide safe and healthy homes.

## **Budget Outlook**

### *Operating Budget*

I would now like to take you through a few details related to NYCHA's budget. Please note that as a public housing authority, NYCHA's budget runs on a calendar year rather than the City's fiscal year. For 2024, with expected operating revenues of about \$4.961 billion and an expected \$4.996 billion in operating expenses, we anticipate a year-end deficit of about \$35 million. We believe we can close this gap – we will continue to closely monitor our spending and implement cost-saving measures, as we did to close the budget gap in 2023. However, with the increasing needs and expected growing losses in rent revenue, the annual deficit is expected to persist in the coming years.

Two-thirds of NYCHA's operating revenue comes from federal sources. This year, we expect to receive about \$1.3 billion in federal operating subsidy. As noted, rent revenue accounts for the other third of our operating revenue, and we expect to collect about \$959 million in rent this year – about \$117 million less than we should be collecting. Our 2024 budget assumes a proration factor of 93.5 percent for the operating subsidy – \$91 million less than what NYCHA is eligible for. Our 2024 budget anticipated \$205 million in City operating funds – and the City has since increased our funding to \$234 million.

We expect to receive about \$1.88 billion for Section 8 vouchers, and the associated administrative fees, this year. NYCHA is receiving the previous year's expenses plus a Section 8 administrative fee that is estimated to be prorated by 90 percent. Along with program reserves, NYCHA will be appropriately funded to issue more Section 8 vouchers for extremely and very low-income New Yorkers.

Our projected expenses for 2024 include about \$1.9 billion in Section 8 payments to landlords; \$1.7 billion in salaries, fringe benefits, and overtime; \$414 million in contracts; \$643 million in utility payments; and \$378 million for expenses such as leases, supplies, vehicles, and equipment.

Chief Financial Officer Annika Lescott-Martinez will now provide some additional information about NYCHA's 2024 budget and financial outlook.

***[Budget presentation from Chief Financial Officer Annika Lescott-Martinez]***

*Capital Investments*

Thank you, Annika. I would now like to discuss NYCHA's capital investment program. In 2024, about \$3.13 billion is available for capital investments in our properties, including approximately \$752 million in expected 2024 federal capital funding; \$1.1 billion in City capital funding available in the 2024 City Fiscal Year; and other federal, State, and City funds allocated from prior-year awards. We appreciate the City's support, which is helping us improve residents' homes. We are also grateful for the State's commitment of \$485 million, which we will invest in façade restoration and heating systems improvements.

While the capital funding we receive is a fraction of the nearly \$80 billion in repairs and upgrades our buildings need, we are making a difference for residents with the funding we do receive. Last year, we expended over \$1.1 billion dollars on capital projects and completed construction for 100 projects; more than 600 capital projects are currently underway across the city, and we are targeting \$1.5 billion in expenditure and completion of 150 projects this year. As of the end of 2023, we have spent more than \$3 billion on Sandy recovery work, providing thousands of residents with new roofs, floodproofed electrical equipment, boilers, backup power generators, flood protection, as well as exterior lights, CCTV cameras, and security systems. In

support of our HUD Agreement targets, we have replaced 98 boilers and 84 elevators through capital investments; in 2024, construction work is underway at scores of developments to replace an additional 85 boilers and 80 elevators. At the same time, we have renovated 284 interior trash compactor rooms with new equipment, and have 110 in construction as well as 7 waste yards with new exterior compactors. We have replaced 415 roofs through our roof replacement program, and 89 additional roof replacements are in progress.

Additionally, we have completed or advanced a range of smaller projects – such as CCTV, lighting, playgrounds, and community and senior centers – funded through Mayoral, discretionary City Council, or Borough President allocations. This includes five of the City Council-funded projects that we had to pause one year ago due to staffing constraints – and we plan to restart the remainder of the paused projects beginning in July and over the subsequent 12 months. Overall, our City capital funds commitment rate stands at 31 percent, and should exceed last year’s capital commitment rate of 56 percent once the submissions already with or approved by OMB are approved and/or registered.

Over the next five years, we plan to invest \$1.1 billion for Comprehensive Modernization projects; \$1 billion to upgrade heating systems; \$740 million to repair roofs; \$698 million for lead, asbestos, and mold abatement; \$500 million to replace elevators; \$333 million to repair facades; \$269 million on waste management systems; and \$123 million for plumbing upgrades – among many other important capital improvements.

### **Transforming NYCHA and Residents’ Quality of Life**

While we invest strategically in residents’ homes with the limited funding available, we are also improving our organization so we can better serve residents. Our Transformation Plan is the lodestar for this work, which is evident in areas across the Authority. For instance, the Transformation Plan’s Neighborhood Model created smaller property management portfolios that are easier to manage while bringing more accountability and resources to developments. We re-oriented centralized functions such as heat and pest management to the Neighborhood Model to increase oversight and foster better coordination with property management. Thanks to our Work Order Reform initiative, borough-based skilled trades staff reduced the work order backlog by over 23,000 work orders, and we have met and exceeded the annual demand for new work orders in the past year. Property management reduced the time it takes to conduct initial

mold inspections from around 12 days at the beginning of last year to around 4 days currently, and they have completed over 42,000 mold inspections since the beginning of 2023. Mold complaints are down, thanks to our work to replace 8,400 roof fans, clean vents in nearly 74,000 apartments, and install nearly 10,000 fire dampers. We continue to reduce both the number and duration of heat and elevator outages, tangibly improving residents' quality of life. And to foster a safe and healthy living environment, we abated lead-based paint in more than 6,700 apartments and tested over 68,000 apartments using the City's stricter standard for determining the presence of lead-based paint.

Our various sustainability initiatives are helping to address the climate crisis while benefitting residents. This includes the Clean Heat for All Challenge to develop a new energy-efficient heating and cooling product for apartments; the Induction Stove Challenge to produce energy-efficient electric cooking systems; the graduation of the first two cohorts of residents from the Clean Energy Academy (which prepares participants for "green-collar" careers); installation of 30 megawatts of rooftop solar at our properties; and obtaining tens of millions of dollars in grants for decarbonization and resiliency work as well as the installation of e-bike storage and charging infrastructure.

Notably, we are bringing billions of dollars of investment to our buildings through creative, and critical, housing preservation programs. To date, 20,000 apartments have been converted to PACT, and a record \$1.8 billion in financing for capital repairs was closed in 2023 across four PACT deals. And after five years of extensive resident engagement and planning, residents of Fulton and Elliott-Chelsea Houses expressed their preference to entirely rebuild their campuses as part of PACT. Overall, 138 developments comprising over 37,000 apartments are in either the engagement or pre-development process, under construction, or have received comprehensive repairs through PACT. We aim to bring dramatically improved quality of life to a total of 62,000 NYCHA families through the PACT program.

In December, a third-party election administrator certified the results of the first resident vote at NYCHA. Nostrand Houses residents selected the Public Housing Preservation Trust as the path forward for their homes. I am pleased that the Trust will renovate Nostrand residents' homes and buildings from top to bottom. The resident voting process has also commenced at Bronx River Addition.

Developed in collaboration with residents, both the Trust and PACT bring developments the more stable Section 8 federal funding, which is worth nearly double what Section 9 apartments receive. These initiatives also ensure that NYCHA developments remain public and that residents maintain their rights and protections, including permanently affordable rent.

Our Comprehensive Modernization program will also complete holistic capital improvements instead of simply repairing individual building components. Launched at four developments so far, the program is supported by \$678 million in our City Capital Action plan and \$200 million from the Gowanus Neighborhood Rezoning. Design-build teams have been selected to carry out the renovations at Saint Nicholas and Todt Hill Houses.

### **Partnering for Success**

The challenges are indeed significant: The majority of NYCHA buildings are more than a half century old, and the historic lack of investment is driving up the costs to simply maintain them. But NYCHA is home to hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers, making our mission to preserve and strengthen this vital resource of affordable housing so critical.

And so we must continue to work together with all of our partners to advance creative solutions like PACT and the Trust, which generate billions of dollars to revitalize and transform residents' homes. True change takes time – but with our shared vision and commitment, we will ensure that NYCHA can continue to serve our city for the decades to come.

Thank you. We are happy to answer any questions you may have.

(\$ in millions)

	2024 Jan – Dec
<b>Sources</b>	
Tenant Rental Revenue	\$959
Operating Subsidy	\$1,310
Section 8 Program Subsidy	\$1,879
Capital Transfer/Mgmt. Fee	\$263
City Funds	\$205
All Other	\$344
<b>Total Sources</b>	<b>\$4,961</b>
<b>Uses</b>	
<b>Personal Services (PS)</b>	
Salaries	\$869
Overtime	\$111
Fringe	\$665
All other Salaries	\$13
<b>Total PS</b>	<b>\$1,659</b>
<b>Other than Personal Services (OTPS)</b>	
Leases	\$60
Supplies	\$109
Utilities	\$643
Contracts	\$414
Section 8 Landlord Payments	\$1,901
All Other OTPS	\$209
<b>Total OTPS</b>	<b>\$3,337</b>
<b>Total Uses (PS &amp; OTPS)</b>	<b>\$4,996</b>
<b>Surplus/(Deficit)</b>	<b>\$(35)</b>

## 2024 Sources and Uses

- Projecting \$959 million in tenant rent revenue as rent collection losses continue. Assuming \$58 million of additional ERAP funding
- \$4.96 billion in revenue from local and federal sources
- \$5.00 billion in expenses
  - \$1.66 billion for PS provides over 12,000 full-time positions
  - \$3.34 billion for OTPS
- Anticipating \$35 million deficit in 2024
- We will closely monitor the deficit and provide a mid-year update to the NYCHA Board

(\$ in millions)

## Five-Year Sources and Uses



NYCHA is anticipating a \$35 million deficit in 2024 with deficits growing in the outyears. We will closely monitor spending and implement additional cost saving measures as needed.

	2024	2025	2026	2027	2028
<b>Sources</b>					
Tenant Rental Revenue	\$959	\$896	\$895	\$896	\$915
Operating Subsidy	\$1,310	\$1,350	\$1,321	\$1,369	\$1,400
Section 8 Program Subsidy	\$1,879	\$2,234	\$2,439	\$2,568	\$2,699
Capital Transfer/Mgmt. Fee	\$263	\$263	\$263	\$263	\$263
City Funds	\$205	\$207	\$210	\$211	\$211
All Other	\$344	\$279	\$166	\$156	\$151
<b>Total Sources</b>	<b>\$4,961</b>	<b>\$5,229</b>	<b>\$5,295</b>	<b>\$5,465</b>	<b>\$5,639</b>
<b>Uses</b>					
<b>Personal Services (PS)</b>					
Salaries	\$869	\$875	\$907	\$902	\$902
Overtime	\$111	\$110	\$108	\$108	\$108
Fringe	\$665	\$676	\$694	\$715	\$732
All other Salaries	\$13	\$13	\$13	\$13	\$13
<b>Total PS</b>	<b>\$1,659</b>	<b>\$1,673</b>	<b>\$1,723</b>	<b>\$1,738</b>	<b>\$1,755</b>
<b>Other than Personal Services (OTPS)</b>					
Leases	\$60	\$62	\$62	\$64	\$64
Supplies	\$109	\$107	\$106	\$105	\$105
Utilities	\$643	\$641	\$579	\$579	\$579
Contracts	\$414	\$407	\$403	\$400	\$400
Section 8 Landlord Payments	\$1,901	\$2,197	\$2,314	\$2,436	\$2,558
All Other OTPS	\$209	\$195	\$169	\$165	\$165
<b>Total OTPS</b>	<b>\$3,337</b>	<b>\$3,610</b>	<b>\$3,634</b>	<b>\$3,749</b>	<b>\$3,872</b>
<b>Total Uses (PS &amp; OTPS)</b>	<b>\$4,996</b>	<b>\$5,283</b>	<b>\$5,358</b>	<b>\$5,487</b>	<b>\$5,627</b>
<b>Surplus/(Deficit)</b>	<b>\$(35)</b>	<b>\$(54)</b>	<b>\$(64)</b>	<b>\$(22)</b>	<b>\$12</b>





**JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS**

---

**STATEMENT OF PUBLIC ADVOCATE JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS  
TO THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING  
MARCH 12, 2024**

Good afternoon,

My name is Jumaane D. Williams and I am the Public Advocate for the City of New York. Thank you very much to Chair Banks and members of the Committee on Public Housing for holding this hearing and allowing me the opportunity to provide a statement.

The affordability of New York City's current housing stock is the focal point of the ongoing housing crisis here. New Yorkers are enduring an increase in evictions and rent, long waits for repairs, and predatory landlords. Everyday we are seeing more than 50% of New Yorkers who are currently rent burdened and rent stabilized apartments are disappearing. The state of it all has further exacerbated due to the pandemic.

It has been horrifying to witness the various catastrophes that occurred within NYCHA during the past two years. It started off with my office and I releasing a report on NYCHA called, [\*How the Other Half Lives in Public Housing\*](#), which highlighted the unjustified and dangerous conditions at NYCHA developments that we witnessed during our 5 Borough Tour in 2022. The same day when we did our report unveiling at Jacob Riis Houses, we learned that NYCHA discovered arsenic in the tap water. A few days later, the resignation of ex-Chairman Gregory Russ was announced. Fast forward to the past month, about 70 current and former NYCHA employees are charged for taking bribes in exchange for providing contracts for construction and repair works at their buildings.<sup>1</sup> There was also a case where a NYCHA resident who resided in Brownsville's Langston Hughes Houses died because of Legionnaires' disease. To tie this all together, NYCHA has been the city's worst landlord for at least six years in a row.

NYCHA has always created an environment that was dangerous and unhealthy for its residents. Whether that is with the mold, leaks, and rodent and insect infestation. There is a constant presence of excessive filth in their homes that lead to unsanitary conditions and illnesses. The recent indictments of NYCHA workers had a disheartening effect on residents and further pushed them away from ever trusting NYCHA again.

For this year's budget hearing, we must adequately invest in NYCHA to ensure they have the resources to address the residents needs along with the aging infrastructure of its buildings. This will allow us to be one step closer to an inclusive and just city. Further, I want to spotlight several recommendations I have been calling for the past two years:

1. Amending Local Law 55-2018, the Healthy Homes Act, to include NYCHA;

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://ny1.com/nyc/all-boroughs/news/2024/02/06/nycha-employees-charged-with-bribery--extortion>



**JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS**

- 
2. Amending Local Law 127-2021 to mandate automatic inspections by NYC inspectors and the issuance of any building or housing code violations; and
  3. The metric used to hire contractors should be improved. NYCHA should develop a reliable list of contractors that can be used within their developments. The current hiring system is unreliable and NYCHA may hire someone who they know with the lowest price, which results in NYCHA's crippling housing infrastructure; and
  4. NYCHA should develop a reliable list of contractors that can apply through the RFP process to do work within their developments; and
  5. Approval by the NYC Office of Management and Budget to allow NYCHA to utilize the Job Order Contract (JOC) for certain capital eligible projects that will assist in fast tracking much needed capital work so it is not subject to the long delays that are inherent in the federal procurement process; and
  6. Create an administrative process for residents to follow in disputing closed tickets when the work has not been completed. The process should conclude with a written document that determines whether the work was completed and, if not, a return date for repairs must be scheduled, and a referral to the supervisors of the employee who closed the ticket without doing the work; and
  7. NYCHA should provide training to their staff and to all Resident Association leadership on the use of the Service Interruption Portal; and
  8. Complaints to 311 must trigger dispatching city inspectors to inspect NYCHA apartments, independently assess complaints, document housing authority violations as part of the city's violation databases, and be given a letter grade for each violation with the assigned time to cure the violation or incur monetary fines.

Too often, residents are resolving the issues themselves and never receive assistance from NYCHA. If someone does provide help, it is not addressed properly and the problem continues to occur. I hope during today's hearing we are able to learn more about NYCHA's goals this year and the plans they have to meet everyone's needs. NYCHA residents deserve safe and quality housing. Thank you.



520 Eighth Avenue, New York, NY 10018

p. 646 386 3100

f. 212 397 0985

[innovatingjustice.org](http://innovatingjustice.org)

Courtney Bryan. Executive Director

## **Table of Contents**

---

Page 1

- Center for Justice Innovation New York City Program Map

Page 2 - Page 10

- Written testimony for submission to 3/12/24 City Council Preliminary Budget Hearing of the Committee on Public Housing

Page 11 - Page 12

- Summary of FY25 Center for Justice Innovation Proposals

The Center for Justice Innovation is a non-profit organization that seeks to transform the policies and practices of the justice system to make it fair, effective, and humane. The Center operates the following sites throughout New York City.

- Family
- Criminal
- Community Development
- Civil/Housing

Click on the name of any program to learn more.

**STATEN ISLAND**

- 1. Staten Island Justice Center

**MANHATTAN**

- 2. Harlem Community Justice Center
- 3. Headquarters
- 4. Manhattan Justice Opportunities
- 5. Midtown Community Court

**MULTI-BOROUGH**

- 6. Legal Hand (Bronx, Brooklyn, Queens)

**BRONX**

- 7. Bronx Child Trauma Support
- 8. Bronx Community Justice Center
- 9. Bronx Community Solutions

**BROOKLYN**

- 10. Brooklyn Justice Initiatives
- 11. Brooklyn Mental Health Court
- 12. Brownsville Community Justice Center
- 13. Neighbors in Action
- 14. Red Hook Community Justice Center
- 15. Supervised Release Program

**QUEENS**

- 16. Queens Community Justice Center (Jamaica and The Rockaways)



**Citywide**

- Access to Justice
- Alternatives to Incarceration
- Driver Accountability Program
- Gender and Family Justice
- Neighborhood Safety Initiatives
- Parent Support Program
- Project Reset
- Restorative Justice Practices
- RISE Project
- Strong Starts Court Initiative
- Youth Action Institute
- Youth Impact

For More Information  
 Shane Correia  
 correias@innovatingjustice.org



520 Eighth Avenue, New York, NY 10018  
p. 646 386 3100  
f. 212 397 0985  
innovatingjustice.org

Courtney Bryan. Executive Director

**Center for Justice Innovation  
New York City Council  
Committee on Public Housing  
March 12th, 2024**

Good morning, Chair Banks and esteemed members of the Public Housing Committee. My name is Ross Joy and I serve as the Director of Housing and Civil Justice for the Center for Justice Innovation (the Center). Thank you for the opportunity to testify today on behalf of our work supporting NYCHA Residents.

Housing is the foundation for strong communities. Access to safe and affordable homes creates economic and community stability. Responding to the wide array of challenges people living in public housing confront, with a goal of improving safety and security for everyone, requires a holistic approach that works both inside and outside the legal system to advance policy reforms while connecting families and individuals to the services and resources they need to access a safe, secure home.

At the Center for Justice Innovation, we work to prevent evictions, respond to hazardous repair conditions, and increase tenant financial and legal empowerment. By addressing issues early, we help keep people safely housed and avoid legal system involvement that can affect employment, family security, and future access to stable housing. The Center often serves as a bridge between the court system, city agencies, legal service providers, and communities, developing comprehensive strategies to advance access to housing and reduce housing insecurity. Our neighborhood-based work supports tenants taking actions on repairs, rent and lease issues in New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA).

Today, I would like to highlight two particular issues that tenants are facing, and how the Center is working to address them. We urge Council to ensure that the Center and the city agencies doing this essential work are adequately funded in this year's budget.

**Rising Eviction Threats for Rent**

During the pandemic, too many public housing tenants experiencing hardships struggled to obtain rent adjustments from their NYCHA property management office and were otherwise discouraged from applying for New York State administered ERAP rental assistance. Now

eviction actions against tenants for rent debt accrued during the pandemic are on the rise with almost half of households in arrears.<sup>1</sup>

While NYCHA's 40,000 residents have their rent capped at 30% of their income before taxes, the average annual income for NYCHA households is just \$24,000, leaving little left over for food, utilities, medical expenses and other necessities. When families have an unexpected expense or loss of income, they can easily fall behind on rent. Once in arrears, NYCHA residents can find themselves in a hole that is almost impossible to crawl out of. Greater coordination between the Human Resources Administration and NYCHA is needed to ensure residents have some form of rent debt relief in the form of Cash Assistance, One Shot Deals, or Homebase eviction prevention.

As the Center's Executive Director Courtney Bryan wrote, evictions affect communities, "disrupting the ties that make them resilient and safe." For families evicted from NYCHA, the next stop is often the shelter system. Homelessness is associated with a wide range of harms, especially for children, not to mention the substantial cost to the city.<sup>2</sup>

## **Deepening Repairs Crisis**

Decades of disinvestment from NYCHA have led to uninhabitable living conditions in many buildings and apartment homes. Lengthy repair wait times and chronic plumbing failures pose habitability, safety, and health risks to families and their neighborhoods. Aging infrastructure, mismanagement, and systemic underfunding have made NYCHA chronically delinquent in responding to residents' requests for repairs. Tenants must navigate a confusing process to obtain repairs and address serious health hazards like mold, gas leaks, lead paint hazards, asbestos exposures, and lack of heat and water.

Housing conditions at NYCHA buildings have drawn sharp attention in recent years, including federal court orders requiring the agency to remedy hazardous living conditions in public housing. These conditions in NYCHA, where 90 percent of residents are people of color, reflect a continuing pattern of marginalization that perpetuates economic and racial discrimination. Despite federal efforts to bring about accountability, the City's designated Housing Maintenance Code enforcement agency, the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD), continues to largely turn a blind eye to its enforcement duties of this Council's Local Laws on minimum housing repair standards. HPD is currently refusing to comply with a New York State law passed in 2022 to publish Open Data in the same manner as with private landlords of Maintenance Code Violations issued at NYCHA citywide.

In Spring 2020, the Red Hook Community Justice Center's Housing Resource Center partnered with Columbia Law School's Community Advocacy Lab to review four years of court filings (2016-2020) and corresponding apartment inspection reports by the Code Enforcement

---

<sup>1</sup> Center for Justice Innovation. (2023, March 8). Housing is Justice.

<https://www.innovatingjustice.org/about/announcements/housing-justice>

<sup>2</sup> Bryan, C. (2023, February 28). The urgent need to fund public housing residents.

<https://www.gothamgazette.com/130-opinion/11848-urgent-fund-public-housing-residents>

Division of the city's Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD). The report found the following:

**Public housing tenants are subjected to living conditions and legal procedures that private tenants are not.**

- The repairs process for NYCHA residents is fundamentally flawed, resulting in unnecessary delays and stark disparities in repair timelines and housing conditions.
- Unlike private tenants who can call 311 to request an inspection, NYCHA tenants can request inspections and re-inspections only through housing court and must return to housing court for a new inspection date even when the original date was missed due to HPD's own error.
- Based on data from 2019, the average repair timeline for private landlords was 17 days. For NYCHA, it was 125 days.
- When completed, repairs are often inadequate and result in the same issues reoccurring. HPD does not conduct follow up inspections or hold NYCHA accountable as they do with private landlords.
- Courts are often hesitant to sanction NYCHA for failure to respond to court ordered inspections and complete repairs because they are a government agency.<sup>3</sup>

While the Center applauds efforts by NYCHA to repair vacant units, there remain long delays for lead and asbestos removal and basic “turnover” repairs. NYCHA has seen a 640% increase in units deemed vacant and available for move-in from January 2022 to 2023.<sup>4</sup> Folks currently living in New York public housing who have requested apartment transfers—due to severe repair needs, domestic violence, or other imminent safety issues—are being stalled across the city. This presents active harm to tenants with pending approved apartment transfers for domestic violence, victimization, tenants with disability accommodations, overcrowded families and in-need individuals waiting to move into NYCHA from city shelters or aging out of foster care.

NYCHA has been chronically under-resourced for decades, causing challenges throughout the authority, including unfilled staff positions that would help maintain and turnover units between tenants. While recent initiatives like NYCHA's Work Order Reform Initiative hold promise, tenants are still waiting nine months to years for basic trade work from carpenters and plasters. There is a pressing need for city, state, and federal capital and operational funding to NYCHA to bring the agency back into a position to provide habitability for its residents. City

---

<sup>3</sup> Burin, A., Bush, Z., & Gomez-Reichman, M. (2020, April 30). *Achieving Equality for New York City Public Housing Residents*. Center for Justice Innovation.  
[https://www.courtinnovation.org/sites/default/files/media/document/2021/Handout\\_RHCJC\\_Columbia\\_03092021.pdf](https://www.courtinnovation.org/sites/default/files/media/document/2021/Handout_RHCJC_Columbia_03092021.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> Feldman, A. E. (2023, February 22). Vacant NYCHA units jumped more than 600% in a year, stranding residents. NY1.  
<https://ny1.com/nyc/all-boroughs/politics/2023/02/22/vacant-nycha-units-jumped-more-than-600--in-a-year--stranding-residents>

Council must ensure NYCHA tenants have access to minimum protections under the city’s Housing Maintenance Code, including tenants’ request for Housing Preservation and Development inspections at NYCHA if uninhabitable conditions persist. We know that Local Laws on housing and buildings can make a positive impact on NYCHA, as evidenced by 2016’s Local Law 152 on Department of Buildings gas line inspections, which increased local oversight of NYCHA conditions.

## **CJI’s Approach to Housing Justice**

The Center works both within courts—offering help to litigants—and within communities— helping tenants apply for benefits, rental assistance, and lease adjustments, working with landlords to address habitability issues, and co-creating safe, vibrant neighborhoods with community. Through housing, financial, and legal assistance, we have helped thousands of New Yorkers resolve the issues they are facing to remain in their homes.

Eviction and housing instability are a significant cause of stress that can lead to homelessness, poor health and behavioral health, and even institutionalization, making housing courts as high stakes a legal venue as criminal courts. For that reason, the Center adamantly supports Right To Counsel for NYCHA residents facing termination of tenancy and eviction in housing court. However, when Right To Counsel attorneys are not available due to limited funding, the Center actively supports unrepresented NYCHA tenants in the neighborhoods we serve as they navigate housing court and find solutions to keep their families housed.

Since 2001, the Center has operated two neighborhood-based housing courts, in Harlem and Red Hook, Brooklyn. Here, the Center’s housing resource staff provide court navigation, one-on-one assistance, and direct connection to a variety of resources and legal services for tenants. Over the past 23 years, staff have conducted over 41,000 intakes for residents in Red Hook and Harlem with housing concerns. In just this past year, our housing resource centers worked with 1,753 residents to help them remain safely, affordably housed.<sup>5</sup> Building off of this, the Center has expanded our housing work to Mott Haven and Far Rockaway based out of our Bronx and Queens Community Justice Centers.

The Center’s housing resource staff provide court navigation, one-on-one assistance, and direct connection to a variety of resources and legal services for tenants. Our housing resource centers help tenants, supporting them in documenting and tracking their repair needs, as well as accessing and navigating the court system when needed to hold NYCHA accountable. We also work to achieve systemic reform through advocacy for open data on NYCHA’s housing code violations and for improvements to NYCHA’s work order systems. In partnership with the Office of Court Administration, the Center operates the Virtual Court Access Network in Harlem and Red Hook, helping tenants respond to housing court notices and file Housing Part Actions for repairs.

---

<sup>5</sup> Center for Justice Innovation. (2024). Justice Center Application and Reset referral database. [Data file].



The Center also runs Legal Hand out of a collection of storefronts in Brooklyn, Queens, and Bronx communities. Legal Hand is staffed by highly trained volunteers including both local residents and law students, trained to provide free legal information, assistance, and referrals. While they support visitors with a range of problems including public benefits, immigration, domestic violence, debt, and employment, support with housing concerns is the main type of help offered.

### **Red Hook Community Justice Center**

The Red Hook Community Justice Center's Housing Resource Center supports public housing residents by providing access to justice and procedural justice in housing court with the goal of preserving safe and affordable public housing in Red Hook. The Housing Resource Center staffs a Help Desk that is open daily on a walk-in basis to community members seeking assistance with repair issues, rental arrears, or support navigating their housing court cases. Staff members work to connect tenants to critical services that address the underlying issues that may contribute to, or arise from, their housing instability. These services can include counseling, case management, mediation, employment, victim services, and legal and financial assistance that can help them remain in their homes and prevent future eviction proceedings. The Housing Resource Center also uses proactive outreach strategies to educate residents on public housing rights and regulations; public health issues and the dangers posed by unhealthy living conditions; and the resources offered at the Justice Center more broadly. In 2023, the Housing Resource Center helped almost 930 residents address pressing housing needs and concerns.<sup>6</sup>

The Justice Center's physical presence in the community, outreach, and approach have improved access to justice for NYCHA residents in Red Hook. In 2019, the Housing Resource Center served 43 percent of all Red Hook NYCHA households and created greater access to justice in filing tenant-initiated actions in Housing Court. Their collaborative approach and strong working relationships with NYCHA facilitated some emergency repairs being addressed more promptly than the traditional HP court process would otherwise allow. In addition, the Housing Resource Center's court attendance initiatives and local outreach helped reduce the number of default judgments by minimizing the number of tenants who fail to appear for their court date. In 2019, the last full calendar year before the COVID-19 pandemic which altered court dockets, less than one percent of Red Hook cases resulted in default judgment, compared to 14 percent in all of Brooklyn.<sup>7</sup>

### **Harlem Community Justice Center**

---

<sup>6</sup> Center for Justice Innovation. (2024). Justice Center Application and Reset referral database. [Data file].

<sup>7</sup> Burin, A., Bush, Z., & Gomez-Reichman, M. (2020, April 30). *Achieving Equality for New York City Public Housing Residents*. Center for Justice Innovation. [https://www.courtinnovation.org/sites/default/files/media/document/2021/Handout\\_RHCJC\\_Columbia\\_03092021.pdf](https://www.courtinnovation.org/sites/default/files/media/document/2021/Handout_RHCJC_Columbia_03092021.pdf)

The Harlem Community Justice Center's Housing Help Center uses a problem-solving approach to assist tenants in public housing and privately-owned housing in an on-site Housing Court. Help Center staff work to preserve safe and affordable housing in Harlem, providing daily walk-in services to community residents. The Help Center partners with the New York City Housing Authority to resolve repair and leasing issues outside of court proceedings and to address underlying issues that contribute to housing instability.

In April 2023, the Harlem Community Justice Center launched the Virtual Court Access Network (VCAN) in partnership with the New York City Office of Court Administration Office of Justice Initiatives and the New York County Housing Court Clerk's Office. VCAN meets a critical need in the East and Central Harlem community by facilitating access to housing court clerk desk services and support filing while addressing underlying and complicated needs with the range of on-site Help Desk resources. The design allows tenants and the Help Center to interface directly with court clerks at New York County Civil Court to help tenants file Housing Part “HP” Actions against their landlords for repair hazards or harassment, answer Eviction/Landlord-Tenant petitions, file Orders to Show Cause, and initiate cases of illegal lockouts and roommate holdovers. In 2023, 199 litigants used VCAN services at the Harlem Community Justice Center.

In 2023, the Harlem Community Justice Center help desk received 824 people seeking assistance in 1,438 visits for housing matters and assisted with 1,242 housing issues, including legal services referrals, repair follow-ups, and financial assistance helping tenants to remain in their homes and prevent future eviction proceedings.<sup>8</sup>

In August, the Harlem Community Justice Center hosted a Housing Resource Fair that connected local residents with a wide range of agencies and providers to help them access key services, such as rent relief, critical home repairs, and legal services to fight evictions. The fair showcased the tremendous demand for housing stability services in the East Harlem community and the Justice Center’s ongoing efforts to help residents access resources and tenant protections close to their homes. More than 300 people attended the fair, which took place in Harlem Art Park, adjacent to the Justice Center.

## **Housing Navigators**

Building off of the impactful program models in Red Hook and Harlem, at the beginning of the year, the Center launched a city-wide housing navigator initiative. Housing Navigators are now working in public housing communities throughout the City to address the most pressing issues threatening the housing stability of public housing residents including, rental arrears, evictions, health and habitability. Navigators are based out of Community Justice Centers in East Harlem; the South Bronx; Far Rockaway, Queens; and Red Hook, Brooklyn. Simultaneously, the Center has been partnering with the Center for Urban Pedagogy (CUP) and artists to create high-quality, multi-lingual, informative guides for public housing residents navigating lease and

---

<sup>8</sup> Center for Justice Innovation. (2024). Justice Center Application and Reset referral database. [Data file].

rent issues. The process and product have been driven by resident input, feedback, and priorities and will culminate with final products ready for distribution in May 2024.

## **Legal Hand**

Legal Hand trains volunteers from the communities it serves to provide free legal information, assistance, and referrals to help New Yorkers resolve civil legal issues that affect their lives. Volunteers, who are not lawyers, operate out of easy to find, neighborhood storefronts, and are supervised by attorneys from partnering legal services organizations. While Legal Hand offers assistance in areas like family, immigration, domestic violence, and benefits, by far, the greatest area of support given is on housing. Our trained local volunteers directly support eviction prevention, addressing habitability issues and assistance finding housing. In 2023, Legal Hand helped residents address nearly 850 housing concerns by providing legal guidance.<sup>9</sup>

Our Legal Hand project has become a model in the city for increasing access to justice for tenants outside of the courts by bringing justice to the neighborhoods they live in. Legal Hand empowers community residents to support their neighbors with free legal information. Civil legal problems, if left unresolved, can seriously harm low-income New Yorkers, forcing people out of their homes, separating families, and imposing devastating financial burdens.

Our volunteers are neighbors helping neighbors. Legal Hand's recruitment and training of community volunteers on civil legal issues informs our understanding of new developments in legal issues and on-going education throughout the community. Many of our volunteers know someone who has been through similar situations as our visitors or have been affected by housing issues themselves. A study conducted by Legal Hand in 2016 found that 76 percent of Crown Heights residents interviewed had experienced at least one legally actionable problem in the past year, and over 50 percent had experienced more than one such problem.<sup>10</sup>

Today, Legal Hand provides assistance to thousands of New Yorkers with housing issues through storefronts in Jamaica, Queens; Brownsville and Crown Heights, Brooklyn; and Highbridge and Tremont in the Bronx. Legal Hand is also engaged in community outreach and conducts Know-Your-Rights sessions and workshops. This is more important now than ever as residents face rocky transitions under RAD/PACT and Trust lease conversions.

## **Eviction Diversion Initiative**

To prevent the devastating harms of eviction, the Center for Justice Innovation worked closely with New York State's court system to launch the Eviction Diversion Initiative (EDI), providing financial assistance, legal guidance, and referrals to local services for over 150 tenants

---

<sup>9</sup> Ibid.

<sup>10</sup> Center for Justice Innovation. (n.d.-b). Legal Hand Overview.  
[https://www.innovatingjustice.org/sites/default/files/media/document/2021/LH\\_Factsheet\\_10252018.pdf](https://www.innovatingjustice.org/sites/default/files/media/document/2021/LH_Factsheet_10252018.pdf)

at risk of losing their homes in Brooklyn to date.<sup>11</sup> EDI has been operating in Brooklyn Housing Court for just over one year, working with tenants facing eviction who receive a rental subsidy such as public housing residents, Section 8 or recipients of a range of City-issued subsidies. The majority (60 percent) of our clients are CityFHEPs recipients. Even when our clients have an attorney and us as advocates, the process of fixing the subsidy issue is confounding and made even more inaccessible for Seniors and non-English speaking clients.

## **Conclusion**

Secure housing is the foundation of strong, healthy communities. Our holistic approach to issues that deeply affect residents' lives is the type of problem-solving, individualized approach to safety and justice that our Justice Centers are designed to provide to their communities—and have for nearly 30 years. With rent being owed, new petitions being filed, and homes in need of essential repairs, it is critical to ensure housing courts and resource centers are accessible, fair, and can provide much-needed resources. Community-based justice centers are tried-and-true solutions that can help bridge the gap in services and assistance to help individuals maintain safe, stable housing and resolve legal cases in their own neighborhoods. The Center for Justice Innovation looks forward to continuing to partner with Council to ensure New Yorkers can live safely and securely in their homes. Thank you for the opportunity to testify today.

---

<sup>11</sup> National Center for State Courts Monthly Report.

Courtney Bryan. Executive Director

## **FY25 Center for Justice Innovation Proposals**

- **#172167 - Center for Justice Innovation (formerly Center for Court Innovation) - \$750,000**

### **Innovative Criminal Justice Programs (Renewal/Expansion); Speakers Initiative**

**Description:** This is an application to support the continuation of the Center for Justice Innovation’s innovative criminal justice responses, community-based public safety initiatives, and access to justice programs across all five boroughs in New York City. City Council’s support allows us to serve tens of thousands of New Yorkers with mental health services, family development, youth empowerment, workforce development, and housing, legal, and employment resource services. Our goal continues to be improving safety, reducing incarceration, expanding access to community resources, and enhancing public trust in government to make New York City stronger, fairer, and safer for all.

- **#169900 - Midtown Community Justice Center: Straus Houses and Council District 2 Community Engagement - \$25,000**

### **Community Safety and Victims Services (Renewal)**

**Description:** Midtown Community Justice Center (MCJC), formerly the Midtown Community Court, seeks support through the Community Safety and Victim Services initiative to enhance its community engagement work in the Straus Houses NYCHA development and throughout Council District 2, including tailored and highly responsive community engagement events. This work will build on existing community relationships to address the identified needs and have lasting impact. City Council funds will provide the means for Midtown Community Justice Center to uplift local community stakeholders and community-based organizations to provide critical supports and services, along with enriching skill building workshops, to community members and increase public safety.

- **#172374 - Midtown Community Justice Center: Community First - \$50,000**

**Community Safety and Victims Services (Renewal)**

**Description:** This funding would ensure continuity of Midtown Community Justice Center’s (MCJC’s) Community First program, which serves community members experiencing varying levels of housing insecurity and homelessness in the Times Square area. The program likewise serves housing insecure participants from across MCJC’s programs, including the Manhattan Misdemeanor Mental Health Court, the Emerging Adult Court, and Project Reset. While New York City is service-rich, the field often operates in silos, creating a disjointed system of care for the most vulnerable populations. Often, those who need support exist under the radar until a moment of crisis like an arrest or an emergency room visit forces a response. As a pre-crisis intervention, Community First seeks to facilitate continuity of destigmatizing and client-centered care for some of the city’s most disconnected residents through mobile case management, street outreach, and assistance for court-involved and diversion participants. Community First’s Community Navigators share lived experience with participants, offering peer support to help clients achieve participant-identified goals such as obtaining transitional and permanent housing, substance use treatment, mental and physical health care, identification, financial benefits, employment, and legal assistance. MCJC requests funding to support the Community First program through City Council’s Community Safety and Victim Services Initiative.

- **#171658 - Red Hook Community Justice Center: Housing Resource Center - \$50,000**

**Community Safety and Victims Services (Renewal)**

**Description:** The Red Hook Community Justice Center’s Housing Resource Center seeks funding from the City Council’s Community Safety and Victim Services Initiative to help seniors, non-English speakers, and other public housing tenants in the Red Hook Houses obtain critical home repairs, preserve affordability, prevent evictions, and find justice and fair treatment in housing court.



240 West 35<sup>th</sup> Street ■ Suite 302 ■ New York, New York 10001

## **Testimony on the New York City Housing Authority and the City's Preliminary Fiscal Year 2025 Budget**

Submitted to New York City Council Committee on Public Housing

*March 12, 2024*

*Sean Campion, Director of Housing and Economic Development Studies, Citizens Budget Commission*

Thank you for the opportunity to testify about the New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) and the Fiscal Year 2025 Preliminary Budget. I am Sean Campion, Director of Housing and Economic Development Studies at the Citizens Budget Commission (CBC), a nonpartisan, nonprofit think tank and watchdog devoted to constructive change in the finances, services, and policies of New York State and City governments.

NYCHA comprises New York City's largest and most important supply of deeply affordable housing. The Housing Authority's operations must be both effective and cost-efficient for New York's public housing to remain viable.

NYCHA continues to face the same challenges this year as last year: a large operating budget gap caused by rising expenses and weakened rent collections; deteriorating physical conditions; and an urgent need to continue to implement fully its plan to improve and modernize management.

Over the past year, progress on addressing these challenges was mixed, with some evidence of progress, such as NYCHA's moving Section 8 conversions under Permanent Affordability Commitment Together (PACT) projects forward. However, many critical steps should be taken quickly to stabilize NYCHA's budget and improve physical conditions.

## **NYCHA's Precarious Operating Budget Outlook Remains; One-Time State Funding Helped Balance the 2023 Budget**

The shortfall in NYCHA's public housing operating budget remained steady in 2023, as some improvement in revenue was more than offset by rising expenses. The gap between its public housing expenses and core operating income (rents and federal operating subsidy) reached \$791 million in 2023, roughly unchanged from 2022's \$789 million shortfall. NYCHA remained reliant on subsidies and non-recurring revenue to balance its budget. These revenues supported 27 percent of public housing operations in 2023, roughly the same share as in 2022.<sup>1</sup>

Rent revenue was flat year-over-year, though rent delinquency continued to increase. The share of households behind on their rent increased very slightly from 45.4 percent in October 2022 to 46.5 percent in October 2023.<sup>2</sup> Weak rent collections were offset by a \$100 million increase in federal operating subsidy. NYCHA also advocated for and received a one-time infusion of revenue from the State's Emergency Rental Assistance Program (ERAP) funding for back rent. The ERAP funding relieved NYCHA from having to draw down its reserves or request additional City subsidy in 2023, as it had done in prior years.

However, despite those positive developments, NYCHA's significant operating gap remained unchanged.

Operating expenses rose 3 percent per unit to \$1,510 per month, which remains far greater than the costs of landlords who manage rent stabilized buildings and NYCHA developments converted to Section 8 through PACT.<sup>3</sup>

Labor expenses accounted for most of that growth. Personnel costs totaled \$1.5 billion in 2023, half of NYCHA's \$2.9 billion public housing operating budget. On a per-unit basis, labor costs increased 7 percent from 2022, reaching \$760 per unit per month. Unfortunately, the most recent collective bargaining agreements with NYCHA's largest unions do not appear to have included reforms to allow more flexible work rules, improve accountability, or reduce operating costs. NYCHA also did not realize its goal of reducing overtime in 2023; instead, overtime increased year over year.<sup>4</sup>

## **NYCHA Residents Continue to Face the Worst Housing Conditions in the City**

The 2023 New York City Housing and Vacancy Survey (HVS) found that 43 percent of public housing residents surveyed reported three or more housing condition issues, such as heat outages or mold. One encouraging sign is that the share of public housing households reporting three or more housing problems is the same as in 2021.<sup>5</sup> While the City has not yet released data from the 2023 HVS on whether specific problems have improved, this suggests that recent investments by NYCHA may have stemmed the decline in housing conditions.



## **The 2023 Physical Needs Assessment (PNA) Demonstrated the Rapid Deterioration Happening at NYCHA Developments**

NYCHA's 2023 PNA revealed that an increasing number of developments are reaching the point at which they are no longer cost-effective to repair. In 2018, [CBC estimated that by 2023](#), based on the historic rate of deterioration, 5 percent of units would be at or very close to the point at which they cost more to repair than to build new.<sup>6</sup> Now, in 2023, with the increase in costs, [almost one-third are at or close to the point at which they cost less to build new than to repair](#)—a six-fold increase from 2017.<sup>7</sup> Increasingly, more detailed inspections of building conditions, such as at the Fulton, Elliott, and Chelsea Houses in Manhattan, have found that conditions already passed the point at which it is more cost effective to redevelop properties than to rehabilitate them.

This stark reality is reflected in the substantial per-unit needs at most NYCHA developments. NYCHA's five-year capital needs now total \$60 billion, or \$373,000 per unit, more than double the \$180,000 per unit for those same properties in 2017. Twenty-year needs have reached \$78 billion, or \$483,000 per unit, up from \$255,000 per unit in 2017. NYCHA attributed the increases to cost inflation and scope additions to reflect more accurately the extent of repair work needed.

## **Progress on PACT Is Promising, but Resources for Capital Investment Are Insufficient**

NYCHA has kept pace with renovations funded through PACT, despite a challenging construction cost and interest rate environment. But for the remaining Section 9 developments, resources are insufficient to address NYCHA's daunting physical needs.

PACT represents the most effective strategy for rehabilitating NYCHA buildings and developments. To date, more than 20,000 units have converted to Section 8 under PACT, with another 20,000 units in the planning pipeline. NYCHA's Preservation Trust also has State authorization to convert 25,000 units, though this program remains untested. NYCHA has proposed two potential conversion projects, though the Trust model's operating program is still in development.

For the developments remaining in the Section 9 program, NYCHA's capital budget will help stabilize some buildings in the short term, but its funding is insufficient to reverse extensive deterioration evident in the 2023 PNA and the HVS. Only conversions to Section 8 under PACT or the Preservation Trust will deliver the amount of capital funding necessary to fully renovate NYCHA developments.

NYCHA's \$8.2 billion five-year capital plan for 2024 to 2028 will fund only 14 percent of its \$60 billion five-year capital need, with nearly half coming from City and State funds. NYCHA will also address the capital needs of an estimated 25,000 units through PACT and the Trust by 2028 outside of the \$8.2 billion capital plan. But this leaves as many as 135,000 units, with five-year needs exceeding \$50 billion, in Section 9 without sufficient capital funding for comprehensive rehabilitation.

Also of concern, NYCHA diverted \$511 million of federal capital funds in 2022 and 2023 to fill its operating budget gap. This diversion is indicative of the challenges NYCHA faces. The agency must balance its massive capital needs with its operating budget needs—including the unfunded mandates of the 2019 federal settlement agreement and its high cost, and sometimes inefficient, operations. While permissible under HUD regulations, the capital diversion illustrates the tradeoffs NYCHA makes to balance these obligations.

### **The Progress and Impact of NYCHA's 2021 Transformation Plan to Improve Management and Operations Are Unclear, Absent Public Data Needed to Track Progress**

Under the mandate of its settlement agreement with the U.S. Housing and Urban Development Department (HUD) and the Southern District, NYCHA agreed to overhaul its management and operations. However, despite entering the fifth year of the monitorship and NYCHA's mandated organizational changes either implemented or in process of being rolled out, the data needed to determine whether NYCHA's Transformation Plan is working is unavailable.

NYCHA's previous monitor did not track consistently and publicly whether NYCHA was meeting the benchmarks identified in the settlement agreement. Similarly, despite some reports of improved conditions and efficiencies by NYCHA, its data dashboards and reporting in the Mayor's Management Report do not yet align with the metrics included in the settlement agreement. Systematically tracking NYCHA's progress in a clear, publicly accessible format is needed not only to determine what aspects of the turnaround plan are working, but also to restore public trust in NYCHA's ability to improve living conditions for its residents and to become an effective property manager.

### **Improving NYCHA Is One of the Most Urgent Policy Challenges Facing New York City**

Preserving NYCHA's deeply affordable housing requires not only an infusion of capital funding but also the transformation of NYCHA into an effective, efficient property manager—one that sustains its operations with recurring operating revenues and provides high quality housing and services to its residents.

Our four recommendations for NYCHA remain unchanged:

- Fix or replace deteriorating buildings with PACT and the Preservation Trust;
- Improve management effectiveness and efficiency, and publicly track progress and impact;
- Negotiate savings, boost productivity, and modernize property management through collective bargaining; and
- Overhaul the rent collection process.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify, and I look forward to answering any questions.

###

## **CBC NYCHA Research Summary and Links**

### **Capital**

- Stabilizing the Foundation (2018): <https://cbcny.org/research/stabilizing-foundation>
- NYCHA's Untapped Assets: How NYCHA Can Maximize the Value of Infill Development (2018):  
[https://cbcny.org/sites/default/files/media/files/INFOGRAPHIC\\_NYCHAINFILL\\_09282018\\_6.pdf](https://cbcny.org/sites/default/files/media/files/INFOGRAPHIC_NYCHAINFILL_09282018_6.pdf)
- NYCHA 2.0: Progress at Risk (2019): <https://cbcny.org/research/nycha-20-progress-risk>
- Testimony on the New York City Housing Authority's 2023 Physical Needs Assessment: <https://cbcny.org/advocacy/testimony-new-york-city-housing-authoritys-2023-physical-needs-assessment>

### **Operations**

- Cleaning House (2015): <https://cbcny.org/research/cleaning-house>
- Room to Breathe (2017): <https://cbcny.org/research/room-breathe>
- Making the Most of Monitorship (2022): <https://cbcny.org/research/making-most-monitorship>

Uncertain Future, Urgent Priority (2023): <https://cbcny.org/research/uncertain-future-urgent-priority>

---

<sup>1</sup> Meeting minutes, New York City Housing Authority Board of Directors (December 19, 2023), <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/nycha/downloads/pdf/board-minutes-12192023.pdf>; and CBC analysis of

---

data from Office of the New York City Comptroller, “Checkbook NYC Data Feeds” (accessed January 4, 2024), New York City Housing Authority Expense Budget Transactions and Revenue Transactions.

<sup>2</sup> New York City Mayor’s Office of Operations, Preliminary Mayor’s Management Report (February 2024), p. 344, <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/operations/downloads/pdf/pmmr2024/nycha.pdf>.

<sup>3</sup> CBC analysis of data from Office of the New York City Comptroller, “Checkbook NYC Data Feeds” (accessed January 4, 2024), New York City Housing Authority Expense Budget Transactions and Revenue Transactions; and Sean Campion, *Uncertain Future, Urgent Priority: Fix NYCHA’s Operating Budget Now* (Citizens Budget Commission, May 19, 2023), <https://cbcny.org/research/uncertain-future-urgent-priority>.

<sup>4</sup> Meeting minutes, New York City Housing Authority Board of Directors (December 19, 2023), <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/nycha/downloads/pdf/board-minutes-12192023.pdf>.

<sup>5</sup> New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development, “2023 New York City Housing and Vacancy Survey: Selected Initial Findings” (February 4, 2024), <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/hpd/downloads/pdfs/about/2023-nychvs-selected-initial-findings.pdf>; and New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development, “2021 New York City Housing and Vacancy Survey: Selected Initial Findings” (May 16, 2022), <https://www.nyc.gov/assets/hpd/downloads/pdfs/services/2021-nychvs-selected-initial-findings.pdf>.

<sup>6</sup> Sean Campion, *Stabilizing the Foundation: Transforming NYCHA to Address its Capital Needs* (Citizens Budget Commission, July 3, 2018), <https://cbcny.org/research/stabilizing-foundation>.

<sup>7</sup> Sean Campion, “Testimony on the New York City Housing Authority’s 2023 Physical Needs Assessment Submitted to the New York City Council Committee on Public Housing” (Citizens Budget Commission, September 22, 2023), <https://cbcny.org/advocacy/testimony-new-york-city-housing-authoritys-2023-physical-needs-assessment>.

## Testimony of New York City Employment and Training Coalition (NYCETC)

New York City Council Budget and Oversight Hearings on the Preliminary Budget for Fiscal Year 2025

PUBLIC HOUSING COMMITTEE

Submitted by Gregory J Morris, CEO

March 12, 2024

I'd like to thank **Council Member Banks** for his leadership and the opportunity to provide testimony. I'm Gregory J Morris, CEO of the New York City Employment and Training Coalition (NYCETC) - *the largest city-based workforce development association in the country*. NYCETC serves as the 'industry voice' of more than 220 workforce development providers in New York City who are counted on to provide job training to more than 500,000 New Yorkers each year — *primarily individuals who live in under-resourced and underserved neighborhoods*. **The most recent survey of our membership indicated that the majority of providers were focused on meeting the needs of women, young adults, NYCHA residents, immigrants/refugees/asylum seekers, and justice-involved individuals.** It is our coalition that is relied upon to connect New Yorkers - of all ages - in every borough - to quality jobs and a living wage; and the services and support necessary to secure long-term, family-sustaining employment.

To achieve an effective and sustainable workforce development ecosystem in NYC, NYCETC is called upon to take three actions:

1. Track the value/impact of the commitments that the City administration makes in support of job readiness and training;
2. Serve as a resource to employers and employer intermediaries seeking talent; and
3. Advocate for the budgetary, legislative, and regulatory action items that maximize access and equity in the programs and services that are central to our efforts. *These efforts include industry specific skill development, college and career exploration, internships and apprenticeships, reskilling/upskill options, as well as, employment placement, retention and advancement assistance.*

Specific to the [Fiscal 2025 Preliminary Plan and the Fiscal 2024 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report for the Department of New York City Housing Authority](#), we want to highlight/comment on the following:

*FROM THE REPORT: "Resident Job Placements. Resident job placements rose by 15 percent to 948 in the first four months of Fiscal 2024 from 821 in the same period last year, which itself was an increase from the 676 placements in the first four months of Fiscal 2022. NYCHA made 343 direct placements through its Office of Resident Economic Empowerment and Sustainability (REES) and Human Resources Department, along with 605 partner placements. The Administration reports a significant jump in the number of Jobs Plus placements due to a clearer focus on outcomes by the Human Resources Administration (HRA) and vendors." (p.9)*

COMMENT: It is worth noting here that during yesterday's City Council Committee on General Welfare, the Department of Social Services confirmed that it planned to close two of its JobsPlus sites. Based on survey data that was shared by REES, residents have identified a desire for assistance finding jobs that will support their economic mobility. Any desire to reduce tenants' access to training and career assistance sites and services undermines this communicated desire for assistance.

**New York City's workforce is the backbone of its economic success.** Whether it's the New Yorkers who drive our local economy today, or the young people who will make up our future workforce, the City of New York does better when its people have access to the resources and education they need to access good paying jobs that sustain them and their communities. New York City's workforce development system is as diverse and ambitious as the city itself, yet there are still too many systemic barriers and disconnections that hold us back from a truly inclusive economy. To equalize opportunity for all New Yorkers, I respectfully request that the Council invests in workforce development now while leading efforts to increase access to quality jobs over time by following this 10 point plan:

- **Commit to restoring all reductions in job training and workforce development opportunities for unemployed and underemployed New Yorkers.** In [Executive Order 22](#), this administration identified investment in the City's talent and workforce development system as *"critical to an inclusive economic recovery that benefits City residents, employers, and the economy."* PEGS that reduce or eliminate programs and services focused on preparing New Yorkers - especially economically disadvantaged New Yorkers - for current and future employment opportunities are misaligned with the priorities of the administration and will have a deleterious effect on the City's economic growth. An independent analysis on the [Return of Investment \(ROI\) on Industry-focused Job Training Programs](#) detailed the value of these programs: 1) These programs lead to 1) significant increases in earnings over time; and 2) have both positive returns in 5 and 10-year ROI estimates;
- **Protect the pathways to continuing education and literacy in New York City including CUNY and public libraries.**
- Address the [municipal job vacancy rates](#) by establishing a [Small Business Services and Workforce Development Initiative](#) that will result in a **first-of-its-kind Civil Service Pathways Apprenticeship** for young adults interested in the city workforce.
- Provide funding for existing or planned **business-training providers networks that can serve as "one-stop shops" to support job seekers** in neighborhoods where there is either planned economic development and/or the absence of targeted workforce development resources like Workforce1 Center and/or Jobs Plus.
- **Equip City Council District Offices** with up-to-date information about job training/hiring within the district and borough to connect constituents to connect constituents to accessible job training and employment placement opportunities;

- Expand the capacity of job training providers serving new arrivals to meet the current and future needs of employers with significant vacancies through **contextual training opportunities and coordinated work authorization effort**.
- **Increase Access to Commercial Delivery Licenses (CDL)** by funding programs that expand and diversify the pool of trained drivers with an important focus on attracting young people and individuals from underserved and immigrant neighborhoods in New York City.
- Assist public assistance beneficiaries to secure credentials and certification through a **[“Bridge to Tech” program](#)** focused on academic remediation, training in the foundational skills required for a career in IT services, and access to on-going supportive and retention services.
- **Launching a City Council Sub-Committee [Task Force] on Workforce Development Results/Outcomes** - The Adams administration has identified a desire to reach 5,000,000 jobs by 2025. This interest follows the completion of the **[Pathways to an Inclusive Economy: The Future of Workers Task Force Blueprint](#)**. Currently, there is no accountability at any level of NYC government specific to employment outcomes and results. A sub-committee could track employment, wages, return on investment, and equity and inclusivity measures related to occupations/industries in NYC.
- **Invest in a 5% COLA for Human Services Workers** - We thank the City Council for the \$100M workforce investment for the last two years and the \$50M investment next year, which is a step in fairly compensating frontline workers. However, the workforce investment is not a true cost-of-living adjustment (COLA) with a guaranteed percentage increase for all contracted human services workers. A COLA is a significant step to address the historic underfunding and lack of investment in the human services sector as these workers do some of the most important jobs in our communities yet are underpaid and undervalued.

**All of the above efforts and initiatives are central to the interests and expertise of the NYCETC members.** A short summary of NYCETC’s accomplishments over the last year are provided on the following pages. Please accept my sincere thanks for the opportunity to testify. I am accessible through email [gmorris@nycetc.org](mailto:gmorris@nycetc.org) and phone/text - 646-469-2683.

## NYCETC ACCOMPLISHMENTS IN 2023

In the last year, NYCETC accomplished the following:

- Connected with membership (through the [conference](#), [happy hours](#), and [member orientations](#)) and improved [communications](#). NYCETC's primary communication tool- [Workforce Weekly](#) reaches an audience of more than 6,000 each each week.
- Positioned as a partner to key intermediaries ([NYATEP](#), WPTI, JobsFirst), developed relationships with [elected officials](#), and collaborated with research institutions ([Center for New York City Affairs](#) and Center for an Urban Future (CUF)) NYCETC serves as a partner on CUF's Borough Series - *Helping New Yorkers Access Tech Careers*.
- Worked with the [current administration](#) and [challenged it](#) as a member of the [Future of Workers Task Force](#). NYCETC has cultivated relationships with key agencies (DYCD, SBS, HRA, DDC, and DCAS) as well as MOCS and the Mayor's Office of Nonprofit Services. NYCETC partners with the [Mayor's Office for Economic Opportunity](#) to develop an employer-facing digital "front door" to strengthen the public workforce system and [NYCEDC](#) to support community hiring initiatives.
- Launched a new employer network (modeled on LESEN) on the west side of Manhattan West Side Work Coalition) in partnership with the City Council Speaker's Office and Council Member Erik Bottcher. Media related to the announcement can be found using the following links: [amNY](#) and [Patch](#). To support outreach to employers/organizations and community members, the Council Member's Office put out an email blast that can be found [here](#).
- NYCETC has engaged in regular briefings with local and state officials since October 2022 and attended the National Skills Coalition Summit in Washington, D.C. to meet with federal legislators in May 2023.
- In September 2023, NYCETC hosted a [briefing](#) on the cannabis industry for the Black, Latino, Asian Caucus of the City Council.
- NYCETC attended [SOMOS](#) in Puerto Rico in November 2023. NYCETC served as a program partner at the Human Services Reception and the AAPI reception.
- In December 2023, NYCETC hosted the [2023 Annual Conference](#), "Creating Quality Jobs through Partnership and Policy" featuring nearly 400 guests and more than 60 panelists. This [event](#) was co-sponsored by Civic Hall and City & State. The event began with a legislative breakfast attended by Council Members. Featured speakers included Deputy Mayor Maria Torres-Springer, Chancellor Felix Matos Rodriguez, Chancellor David Banks, Kevin D. Kim, Commissioner, New York City Department of Small Business Services, Douglas Lipari, Executive Director, Community Hiring, City of New York, and Dawn Pinnock, Commissioner, New York City Department of Citywide Administrative Services. Video of featured sessions from the conference can be found [here](#). Abby Jo Sigal, Executive Director, NYC Mayor's Office of Talent hosted a specific panel on the workforce development ecosystem with all relevant city agencies. Video of that session can be found [here](#). James Parrott, Director of Economic and Fiscal Policies at the Center for New York City Affairs at The New School presented on the current state of the post-pandemic recovery. Video of that session can be found [here](#).





**Testimony of Alia Soomro, Deputy Director for New York City Policy  
New York League of Conservation Voters  
City Council Committee on Public Housing  
FY25 Preliminary Budget Hearing  
March 12, 2024**

My name is Alia Soomro and I am the Deputy Director for New York City Policy at the New York League of Conservation Voters (NYLCV). NYLCV is a statewide environmental advocacy organization representing over 30,000 members in New York City. Thank you, Chair Banks, and members of the Committee on Public Housing for the opportunity to comment.

The New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) has been long-neglected due to significant underinvestment and mismanagement. Chronic issues such as lack of heating and hot water, mold, lead paint, rats and other pests, and little to no recycling access have plagued NYCHA residents for years. Compounding this, NYCHA residents are disproportionately impacted by climate change. Many campuses are located in flood zones, exposing residents to sea level rise, coastal storm surge, and inland flooding. Many NYCHA campuses also lack access to air conditioning, leaving residents, especially seniors, more vulnerable to heat-related illnesses and death during extreme heat events. NYLCV stands with advocates calling for increased funding for long-needed building upgrades and public health improvements, as well as significant funding to address the impacts of climate change.

As advocated in NYLCV's recently-released [2024 NYC Policy Agenda](#), the City must prioritize safeguarding the health and safety of NYCHA residents by (though not limited to) eliminating lead-based paint, mold, and pests from NYCHA residences, all of which contribute to adverse health impacts such as asthma and lead poisoning. We echo calls by the New York City Coalition to End Lead Poisoning (NYCCELP) advocating for sufficient funding for NYCHA's [Lead-Safe Housing Policy](#) (Lead-Based Paint Abatement and Dust Wipe Sampling), [XRF Testing Initiative](#), and the [Team for Enhanced Management Planning and Outreach \(TEMPO\)](#).

NYLCV also echoes the call by the Council for New York State to increase its capital contribution for NYCHA restoration and maintenance. As the Public Housing [Committee's Report](#) states, "The SFY 2025 Executive Budget did not include additional funding for ERAP, other expenses, or capital funds for NYCHA. The Council has regularly called for greater State contributions to the Authority to preserve affordable housing opportunities for New Yorkers." Moreover, as stated in the [Report](#), "NYCHA has a five-year Capital Plan for 2024-2028 totaling \$8.21 billion, which is approximately \$399 million lower than its 2023-2027 Capital Plan of \$8.61 billion." However, according to the Report, this five-year Capital Plan addresses only \$8.21 billion, or 10.3 percent, of the estimated \$80 billion needed for capital repairs over the next

twenty years. NYLCV calls on the City to work with New York State and Federal agencies to identify more funding for operating and long-term capital repairs, including heating and cooling systems, and lead and mold removal.

The City should also identify long-term capital funding to make permanent [a pilot program that switched out gas stoves for electric induction ones](#) at 20 NYCHA apartments in the Bronx. The program, run by WE ACT, in partnership with NYCHA, the Association for Energy Efficiency, Columbia University, and Berkeley Air Monitoring, saw a significant improvement in air quality compared to households with gas stoves. NYLCV applauds the Governor's and Mayor's commitment to electrify NYCHA housing through the [Induction Stove Challenge](#), which promises to deploy 10,000 induction stoves in NYCHA apartments, and encourages the implementation and expansion of projects like this, as a step in the right direction.

Relatedly, NYCHA should explore opportunities to pair building capital repairs such as elevator improvements and mold and lead abatement with energy efficiency retrofits and zero-emission heating, cooling, and cooking systems installation. While the Public Housing [Committee Report](#) states, "NYCHA is taking steps towards Local Law 97 compliance, to reduce its greenhouse gas emissions, by decarbonizing heating systems, gas stoves, and improving insulation," the City must ensure that NYCHA is sufficiently funded in order to continue implementing its [Sustainability Agenda](#) and to ensure that NYCHA campuses are on track to meet emissions reduction targets and procurement commitments for renewable energy, such as reducing greenhouse gas emissions by 80 percent by 2050. NYLCV also urges NYCHA to explore the possibility of investing in thermal energy networks to decarbonize campuses to aid in reaching these emissions reduction goals. The City also must work with State and Federal agencies to identify sustainable funding streams to make NYCHA campuses resilient to climate hazards such as sea level rise, storm surges, and extreme rainfall. This includes protecting mechanical, electrical, and plumbing infrastructure, floodproofing buildings, and installing new, more efficient boilers and back-up generators.

NYCHA should continue working with DEP to fund and improve NYCHA's stormwater management and implement green infrastructure projects such as permeable pavement, porous asphalt, porous concrete, rain gardens, and subsurface storage systems. Funding should also be prioritized for mitigating extreme heat for NYCHA residents. In addition to increasing and maintaining NYCHA's tree canopy and comprehensively retrofitting NYCHA buildings, there should be funding allocated to restart the [Get Cool NYC Program](#), which provided air conditioners, free of charge, to senior residents who are 65 or over or have a qualifying underlying condition. This program was [found](#) to help seniors who participated less likely to report feeling sick from the heat compared to those who didn't participate in the Get Cool NYC Program. To complement this program, the City should also identify funding sources to help qualifying residents in this program with their summer utility bills. NYLCV urges the City to provide long-term funding for composting and recycling for all NYCHA campuses, especially as the City plans to roll-out the curbside organics program in the next few years. An organic waste collection program that leaves out NYCHA cannot be called a citywide or universal program.

Lastly, as with other City agencies, NYLCV calls on the City to prioritize long-term hiring and staffing at NYCHA. As of February 2024, NYCHA had 699 vacancies, (a 5.8% vacancy rate). However, as stated in the [Committee Report](#), “the bigger decline in headcount is budgeted for 2025, when headcount is planned to drop to 11,477, a decrease of 632 positions (5.2 percent) from the 2024 budget. NYCHA has stated that its projected revenues cannot sustain continued staffing increases and plans to decrease property staff through attrition as public housing developments convert through PACT... this could hinder NYCHA’s ability to maintain and operate its aging infrastructure and provide adequate services to its tenants.”

With historic underinvestment and constant quality of life issues, NYCHA residents deserve significant funding and investment not only to address existing public health and building maintenance problems but to prepare for the impacts of climate change.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment.



March 14, 2024

**Founders**

Vernice Miller-Travis  
Peggy M. Shepard  
Chuck Sutton

**Board of Directors**

*Chair*

Jeff Jones

*Secretary*

Nancy E. Anderson, Ph.D.

*Treasurer*

Ken P. Mak

*Members*

Lakeisha M. Aquino  
Peter Bokor  
Dennis Derryck, Ph.D.  
David Evans, Ph.D.  
Abiola Fasehun, Esq.  
Eric A Goldstein, Esq.  
Neetin Gulati  
Christy Loper  
Sarangi Iyengar  
Marielle Villar Martiney  
Crystal Romeo Upperman  
Vernice Miller-Travis  
Phillip Morrow  
Dart Westphal

*Executive Director*

Peggy M. Shepard

**Testimony of WE ACT for Environmental Justice  
to the New York City Council Committee on Public Housing, on March 12,  
2024 regarding Fiscal Year 25 Preliminary Budget.**

Dear Chair Chris Banks and Committee on Public Housing,

WE ACT for Environmental Justice, an organization based in Harlem, has been fighting environmental racism at the city, state, and federal levels for more than 30 years. WE ACT convenes a group of members living in New York City Housing Authority developments to discuss and organize around the various environmental health hazards that currently exist in their homes and communities.

New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA), faces a myriad of problems – most of which are tied to the fact that it has been chronically underfunded for years. As a result, the New Yorkers who rent apartments in NYCHA developments often have to endure environmental challenges such as mold, lead, and pests along with substandard service in terms of repairs and other basic issues.

In 2021, NYCHA released a new [Sustainability Agenda](#), a “5-year roadmap for creating healthier, safer, and more comfortable homes for residents” with Goal #2 being to “Cultivate healthy and resilient communities based on design excellence”. In this agenda NYCHA acknowledges that they are “...responsible for ensuring that its apartments are comfortable, safe, and free of lead, mold, and pests. Any city funding cuts to NYCHA would perpetuate and exacerbate existing environmental health issues and hinder any progress of NYCHA’s sustainability efforts.

**The City should restore and/or increase funding for any programs that:**

- expands mold management program to address water infiltration through capital upgrades;
- upgrades mechanical ventilation systems for mold prevention;
- performs lead outreach and remediation;
- completes XRF testing and lead-based paint reporting;
- ensures every NYCHA family with a newborn or infant has a safe home and is connected to available supportive resources by



evaluating the conditions of the apartment for key environmental hazards such as lead, mold, pests, and asbestos and;

- expands paper, metal, glass, plastic, and organic waste recycling to all NYCHA developments.

**In addition, the City should invest \$7.5 billion to fund the cost of Local Law 97 compliance** and decarbonization efforts and must continue implementing and increase funding for NYCHA's [Sustainability Agenda](#) to ensure that NYCHA buildings are on track to meet emissions reduction targets and procurement commitments for renewable energy; advancing electrification and deep energy retrofits. We are pleased to see in the Committee Report that, "NYCHA is taking steps towards Local Law 97 compliance, to reduce its greenhouse gas emissions, by decarbonizing heating systems, gas stoves, and improving insulation" in there 2024-2028 Capital Plan Strategic Investments; however, the City should contribute more funding to these efforts. According to NYCHA's 2023 [PNA Technical Report: Physical Needs Assessment](#), "NYCHA's second-most costly short-term needs are found to be heating systems, including decarbonization technologies for domestic hot water as well as space heat. The total short-term need for decarbonization is estimated to be \$7.53 billion, or roughly 12.48% of NYCHA's total needs burden. Space heat accounts for \$5.18 billion and Domestic Hot Water accounts for \$2.35 billion of the \$7.53 billion."

NYCHA should incorporate electrification whenever developments undergo major upgrades, renovations, or complete demolition/reconstruction. Similarly, NYCHA should require properties that go through a Permanent Affordability Commitment Together (PACT) or Public Housing Preservation Trust agreement to fully electrify as a part of comprehensive renovations. This will allow the maximum benefits to quality of life.

Lastly, WE ACT is urging the City to prioritize long-term hiring and staffing at NYCHA. As of February 2024, NYCHA had 699 vacancies, (a 5.8% vacancy rate). However, as stated in the Committee Report, "the bigger decline in headcount is budgeted for 2025, when headcount is planned to drop to 11,477, a decrease of 632 positions (5.2 percent) from the 2024 budget. NYCHA has stated that its projected revenues cannot sustain continued staffing increases and plans to decrease property staff through attrition as public housing developments convert through PACT [...] this could hinder



NYCHA's ability to maintain and operate its aging infrastructure and provide adequate services to its tenants.”

NYCHA residents are disproportionately impacted by disasters – whether storm surges, flooding, extreme heat, or air quality emergencies. Therefore, the City must work with State and Federal agencies to prioritize making NYCHA campuses and residents resilient to climate hazards by identifying vulnerabilities and integrating resiliency and sustainability measures in the planning process. It is crucial that the New York City Council provides the funding NYCHA residents need to improve their health, safety and quality of life.

Sincerely,

**Lonnie J. Portis**

NYC Policy and Advocacy Manager

lonnie@weact.org

646-866-8720

From: Alexa Cruz <alixacruz@icloud.com>

Sent: Thursday, February 29, 2024 11:14 AM

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Nycha section 9 Chelsea Elliot and Fulton no demolition

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe. Report suspected phishing emails with the Phish Alert Button or forward them to [phish@oti.nyc.gov](mailto:phish@oti.nyc.gov) as an attachment.

I feel we are discriminated if low to lowest income we need protections for us the minority the tenants association has a lot of influence with essence related and elected official from district 3 there are reasons I feel is discriminatory disrespectful to us from Eric botcher admitted in Facebook live he is ashamed of nycha from the Fulton Elliot and Fulton that Google building the Hudson yards. We are human beings I made low income from employers I try challenging for more money but I have worked on my my family mom and siblings. I am unmarried and retired society security I am scare how this city is not being fair with the low to the lowest income. We are being mislead by private developers too under elected official and board members 4 I feel that bad feeling we are not welcome 🙏 for us. Tenants association is no help and also manipulating the situation with nycha there are tenants that are not happy with this changes and want section 9 no demolition my understanding is that they want the land grab from the Hudson yard and Google etc..I want to you to make it secure for us tenants and stop the harassment and violence crimes of tenants for not want to change I don't believe in the section 8 private developers 1-20 years contract there are bribing people for new appliances and misleading offers I don't feel that not even the mayor is for the people of tenants he is making it difficult for us as tenants to outsource out of our city. I am not a very intelligent woman with college degree but I am smart enough to know after so many years that as a Hispanic heritage of Puerto Rican born in New York City I need my rights my dignity not only for me but to all low income families who are we the people have worked and paid taxes I don't want to lose my home and other tenants don't want to loss it. Please 🙏 ##### help us

Sent from my iPhone

The allocation of funding for NYCHA is indeed a critical issue, and ensuring that resources are directed toward Section 9 rather than PACT/RAD Private developers is of significant importance. Section 9 funding is essential for maintaining and improving public housing developments while preserving the land, thus safeguarding the interests of residents and communities.

PACT/RAD initiatives, on the other hand, involve the transfer of public housing properties to private entities through long-term leases resulting in the loss of direct NYCHA and HUD oversight and control. While these initiatives may offer short-term financial incentives and tax breaks to developers, they can also raise concerns about long-term affordability, resident displacement, and accountability.

Moreover, public land is a valuable asset that should be managed responsibly to serve the needs of the community. Directing funds towards Section 9 ensures that they are used to benefit current and future generations of public housing residents.

Stakeholders and decision-makers need to prioritize funding mechanisms that support the preservation and improvement of public housing under Section 9, while also exploring alternative strategies for addressing funding gaps and revitalizing NYCHA developments. By investing in Section 9 and maintaining public control over land assets, we can work towards ensuring the long-term viability and sustainability of public housing for all residents.

The lack of investment in NYCHA should be considered Demolition by neglect which refers to the practice of allowing a building to deteriorate. Whenever the chair speaks about the improvements she speaks about the outside of the buildings and not the inside where people live. Property owners sometimes intentionally neglect their hoping it will lead to permission for demolition. They may argue that the cost of repairing the deteriorated building is prohibitively expensive, creating an economic hardship. The neglect of maintenance and repairs not only compromises the quality of life for residents but also undermines the long-term viability of public housing developments. It's crucial to focus not just on cosmetic enhancements to the exterior but also on addressing the fundamental issues affecting the interior spaces where people reside.



Investing in NYCHA's infrastructure and addressing the maintenance backlog is imperative to ensure that public housing remains a safe, healthy, and dignified living environment for all residents. By prioritizing the needs of residents and committing to comprehensive repairs and renovations, we can combat demolition by neglect and preserve the integrity of our communities for generations to come.

[stopfecdemolition.org](http://stopfecdemolition.org)

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Shaan Mavani

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: NYCHA Chief Asset & Capital

Address: Management Offices

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: 3/12/21

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: GREGORY J MORRIS

Address: [REDACTED] BKLYN 11217

I represent: NEW YORK CITY EMPLOYMENT & TRAINING COALITION

Address: 121 6th AVE, NYC 10013

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Celine Miranda

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Name: Ronee Kelt (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Name: Sean Campion (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: 240 W 35<sup>th</sup> St, M<sup>o</sup> NY

I represent: Citizens Budget Commission

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor  in opposition

Date: 3/12/24

Name: Ross Joy (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: [Redacted] [Redacted] Bklyn, NY 11231

I represent: Center for Court Innovation

Address: 520 8<sup>th</sup> Ave, 11<sup>th</sup> floor, New York, NY

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms



**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

*Appearance Card*

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor     in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

**(PLEASE PRINT)**

Name: Jonathan Gouveia

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: NYCHA EVP For Real Estate

Address: Development

*Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms*

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

*Appearance Card*

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_

in favor     in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

**(PLEASE PRINT)**

Name: Lisa Bova-Hiatt

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: NYCHA CEO

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

*Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms*

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

*Appearance Card*

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_  
 in favor     in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

**(PLEASE PRINT)**

Name: Eva Trimble

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: NYCHA COO

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

◆ Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms ◆

**THE COUNCIL  
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

*Appearance Card*

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. \_\_\_\_\_ Res. No. \_\_\_\_\_  
 in favor     in opposition

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

**(PLEASE PRINT)**

Name: Annika Lescott-Martinez

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

I represent: NYCHA EVP & CFO

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

◆ Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms ◆