

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH THE
COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY

December 18, 2019

Start: 1:12 p.m.

Recess: 3:43 p.m.

HELD AT: Shepard Hall Building, City College
Of New York-Room 250, 2nd Fl.

B E F O R E: INEZ D. BARRON
Chairperson

HELEN K. ROSENTHAL
Co-Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

DIANA AYALA
LAURIE A. CUMBO
BEN KALLOS
BRAD S. LANDER
ALAN N. MAISEL
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ
ERIC A. ULRICH

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 2

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jayasri Ganapathy
Counsel for the Committee on Women and Gender
Equity, Reading Statement of Council Member Helen
K. Rosenthal

Vincent Boudreau
President of the City College of New York, CUNY

Sherry Cleary
University Dean for Early Childhood Initiatives

Jacqueline Ebanks
Executive Director of New York City's Commission
On Gender Equity

Jamell Henderson
CUNY Rising Alliance Coordinator

Shepard McDaniel
Co-Chair of the Black Student Union at Hunter
College Alumni Committee, Member of Executive
Committee

Timothy Hunter
Student Government President of New York City
College Technology, University Student Center
Chairperson and Student Trustee for CUNY

Lankau Tsinghua
Resident of Harlem, Alumni of City College, Nurse
Midwife, Teachers College

Nefatiti Tsinghua
Daughter of Lankau, Studied at City College of
New York and Hunter College, Student at SUNY

Frantzy Luzincourt
President for Undergraduate Student Government at
City College of New York

Fay Yanofsky
Elected Brooklyn College named Delegate to USS,
Vice Chair of Fiscal Affairs at USS

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 3

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Joseph Robertson
Transferred from SUNY Buffalo State College as
EOP Student, Current Student at Queensboro
College

Casa Calon Manjin
Black Studies Major at City College of New York,
Graduate from BMCC

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 4

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We're going to improvise because we don't have a gavel. Good afternoon, my name is Inez Barron and I am the Chair of the Committee on Higher Education and today we are conducting an oversight hearing on CUNY's childcare centers and we are holding this hearing jointly with the Committee on Women chaired by my esteemed colleague, Council Member Helen Rosenthal, she is however unable to attend, she is ill but her counsel is here and will read her open statement at the appropriate time. Invited to testify today are college president Vincent Boudreau and the new University Dean of Early Childhood Initiatives Miss Sherry Cleary. Also invited to testify today are children and women's advocacy organizations, student organizations and other interested parties. I want to especially thank President Boudreau for the hospitality extended to us by City College to conduct our hearing on campus and for the earlier tour of the City College Child Care Center construction site. Although I was not personally there my Legislative Director Indigo Washington was there and she gave it great reviews and if she gives you a good thumbs up

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 5

1 you've earned it and all three of her children
2 attended that center so she has certain standards
3 that she does hold in place. Before I get to the
4 topic of today's hearing, I do want to recognize that
5 this month marks the 28th anniversary of a tragic
6 event that occurred here on campus not very far from
7 this hearing room. On December 28th, 1991 5,000
8 people, many of them students converged on campus, a
9 venue located at 138th Street and Convent Avenue to
10 attend the Heavy D, Puff Daddy charity basketball
11 game. The venue could only accommodate 2,700 of the
12 5,000 who sought to attend the event. Amidst the
13 confusion and lack of control a crushing stampede
14 took the lives of nine young persons ranging in age
15 from 15 to 28. So, I just wanted us to reflect on the
16 solemn anniversary and to take a moment to remember
17 those in attendance and not to forget those who lost
18 their lives 28th month... 28 years ago this month.
19 Also, I just to before we start on this topic
20 acknowledge the dedicated work, the committed work of
21 USS and TC... PSC, the students and the professors as
22 it relates to battling the constant lies in student
23 tuition at CUNY. We've got to call the CUNY board of
24 trustees, Governor Mario Cuomo and the state
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 6

Legislature to task for their continued annual increases in tuition and instituting new fees are... that are a burden to students and we are sure that we understand that students should not be the ones to finance the education of public education here at CUNY. As I've stated many times previously in the past, I'm a graduate, a proud graduate alum of Hunter College and I got an excellent education there and the only reason that I was able to get that education was because I did not have to pay tuition although both my parents were working we didn't have any extra cash for tuition costs so I graduated from a city high school, had a B or better average and was entitled to the education at CUNY without having to pay tuition and that's what I'm continuing to fight for. We need to fundamentally change the narrative when it comes to higher education and truly support our college students and instead of normalizing tuition increases and institution of fees at our colleges and universities we should normalize a free CUNY and just as at the end of the agricultural era as we were moving into the industrial era we instituted a higher education... the senior education beyond the primary education, we instituted the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 7

2 secondary education. Now that we are living in this
3 age of technology and... we need to institute a program
4 that says no, 12 years of education is not sufficient
5 and we need to normalize what will be public
6 education extending beyond secondary school and it
7 should not be born on the backs of student tuition
8 and I'm looking to see how the Governor's going to
9 make sure that the funding for the well deserved
10 increases for faculty how that gets appropriated in
11 the budget and I urge us all to be mindful and look
12 at that. The topic of today's hearing is a recent and
13 familiar one but is also very important. Student
14 parents struggle to balance parenting and school
15 often to the detriment of their schooling and it
16 frequently takes them longer to complete their
17 studies that is if they complete them at all. Indeed,
18 they may not perform as well academically, and they
19 frequently drop out of school altogether, but
20 parenting students should not have to choose between
21 caring for their families and going to school. As I
22 have emphasized before the whole point of obtaining a
23 college education for most parents is to improve the
24 quality of life for their children. A college
25 education leads to better jobs and higher pay, it can

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 8

make a difference between a job with health benefits for one's family and one without, it can also lead to better outcomes for their children and CUNY has generally taken steps to address some of the child care needs of parenting students through programs at a majority of its undergraduate campuses. Notably one particular program was founded by a black studies professor Geraldine Price also known as Momma Jerry and it was here that as a professor at City College in the education department, she trained teachers to be responsive to the needs of black children. She also became a renowned and sought after specialist in the field of early childhood education, she was the founding director of quote, "as a twig is bent", an African centered daycare center affiliated with Lehman College in the Bronx from 1970 to 1976 and she went on to become the founding director of a child development center right here at City College where she remained for 17 years from 1977 until 1993. Sadly, this flagship center has been closed since 2015, that's nearly five years and that is completely unacceptable. To recap the timeline all of which is documented in the joint report of our committees, City College closed it's child care center in May of

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 9

2015 to remediate certain ADA and other building compliance issues all with the expectation and statement that the center would reopen within one year, I do not want to minimize the importance of complying with these important regulatory standards but to me within one year means that the center should have been reopened for the students and their children by May of 2016 yet when our committees jointly conducted a hearing of CUNY Child Care Centers in June of 2018 the center still remained closed, it's been over three years at that point. Nevertheless, our committees received testimony on the record that City College was addressing the delays and expressed.. expected the center to be open by the latest of January 2019. Today as we all know is December 18th, 2019 and still there is no operational City College Child Care Center. As I have mentioned earlier in, in my remarks it is in fact still a construction site. While I appreciate the opportunity to tour the construction site earlier today, I do want to express my profound disappointment at the lengths to which we had to go to receive this tour. When this hearing was deferred from its originally scheduled date in October CUNY

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 10

2 offered our committee the opportunity to privately
3 tour the site in lieu of rescheduling the public
4 hearing however the importance of highlighting the
5 issues that come withing these committee's purview on
6 the record through public hearings should never be
7 taken lightly thus our imperative to proceed with
8 both a tour and a hearing was of paramount importance
9 in highlighting the nearly five year closure of the
10 City College Child Care Center. Needless to say, I
11 personally took umbrage when we... after we rescheduled
12 the hearing, when we were told no, you can't take a
13 tour because of occupancy and permit issues. If there
14 was a legitimate occupancy and permitting issues
15 preventing the tour in October then why did we defer
16 the tour in lieu of a hearing to begin with,
17 something just didn't seem right. I also want to
18 highlight that when you go to City College's Child
19 Care Center website which to be fair has been
20 significantly updated since our last hearing, one is
21 greeted with images of children presumably though...
22 presumably those of students who are happy at play
23 and that's a good thing, their happy playful pictures
24 are captioned in words in all caps, campus child care
25 coming soon, spring 2020 grand opening. This caption

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 11

is vague as excuses and assertions which are received about the reopening of the center and I would be remiss if I did not point out that the skin colors of the children depicted in the updated website do not reflect the black and brown realities of the students who most need these child care services at City College. Out of the 20 children depicted on this site between two images of a rock wall and a classroom I counted three maybe four black and brown children, three out of 20 and that certainly is just a scent of the frustration that we have as to why the delays and when we'll be open and how will those students... how will the students who perhaps now have even graduated and gone on but how will other students presently in the colleges be able to benefit. There seems to be a lack of transparency in CUNY's failure to indicate a reliable date for reopening the center, spring 2020 is not a date and I really would like to know when we can have a date, a day, a month to expect to have a grand ribbon cutting deserving of the great center that will be coming and most importantly the students need to... the students who need these services and want these services and rely on them want to know as well. I do at this time want to turn the mic over to

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 12
2 the counsel for Council Member Rosenthal so that she
3 can read the Council Member's statement.

4 JAYASRI GANAPATHY: Thank you Chair
5 Barron. My name is Jayasri Ganapathy, my pronouns are
6 she, her and hers. I am Counsel to the Committee on
7 Women and Gender Equity and I'm reading this opening
8 statement on behalf of Chair... Council Member Helen
9 Rosenthal who is the Chair of the Women... Committee on
10 Women and Gender Equity. Thank you to everyone who is
11 here today for this very important hearing about the
12 status of childcare services within the City
13 University of New York's system. CUNY is a critical
14 New York City institution providing New Yorkers with
15 an affordable and accessible education. CUNY is a
16 gateway to the middle class especially for
17 nontraditional students such as student parents. With
18 a degree from CUNY these parents can access more job
19 opportunities and increase their earning potential.
20 College graduates are more likely to have health and
21 retirement benefits, they are also better able to
22 prepare their children to pursue an education. At its
23 heart, access to child care provides care givers the
24 opportunity to more fully participate in our city and
25 society, this is incredibly important especially

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 13

2 considering the fact that 71 percent of CUNY's
3 student parents are women and 51 percent are students
4 of color but access to child care remains one of the
5 biggest hurdles that student parents face when
6 pursuing higher education and that's why we are here
7 today. CUNY's childcare services are not just
8 important to students, they are also essential
9 services for faculty and staff. In a city where child
10 care can cost up to 21 percent of a family's income,
11 CUNY's child care centers play a pivotal role in
12 ensuring that student parents are able to complete
13 college and that faculty and staff are able to
14 provide the time and quality education that CUNY
15 students deserve. We know that CUNY strives to offer
16 its students childcare during the day, evenings and
17 on weekends being culturally diverse as well
18 developmentally at age appropriate settings. These
19 efforts and services are commendable, and we are here
20 today to learn more about how CUNY's childcare
21 programs are functioning, had expanded and can
22 continue to do so. During the 2019/2020 academic
23 year, funding for CUNY's childcare centers totaled
24 nearly 16.9 million dollars which includes
25 approximately 1.6 million dollars in city support. In

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 14

2 addition, for the same two years the Council has
3 provided 1.2 million dollars in funding to the CUNY
4 childcare initiative which support all of the
5 centers. This funding can potentially be used to
6 support expanded moments, extended hours and
7 additional teachers, for higher salaries for
8 childcare workers. Through high quality education and
9 childcare offered by CUNY we can support student
10 parents throughout our city in reaching their full
11 potential. I am interested in learning how the
12 allocated funding would be used in 2019. I also look
13 forward to hearing the qualitative dimension of
14 student parents speaking to their experiences at CUNY
15 including ability... their ability to access childcare.
16 Finally, I would like to hear how the current CUNY
17 childcare programs can be improved to fit the needs
18 of CUNY's faculty, staff and student parents. I would
19 like to thank Marisa Maack my Chief of Staff, Madhuri
20 Shukla my Legislative Director and Committee staff
21 for their work in preparing this hearing. Jayasri
22 Ganapathy, Legislative Counsel; Chloe Rivera, Senior
23 Policy Analyst, Monica Pepple, Financial Analyst and
24 the Council Member wanted to acknowledge Committee
25 members who are present. Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 15

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much. I
3 also want to acknowledge those who've been working so
4 diligently on preparing this hearing, that includes
5 my Chief of Staff Joy Simmons; my Legislative
6 Director Indigo Washington, Chloe Rivera, the
7 Committee's Senior Policy Analyst; Paul Sinegal,
8 Counsel to the Committee and Michele Peregrin the
9 Committee's Finance Analyst and with that I will now
10 ask for my Counsel to swear the panel in after I call
11 them. The first panel will be composed of Vincent
12 Boudreau, President of City College, CUNY; Sherry
13 Cleary, the University Dean for Early Childhood
14 Innovation at CUNY and Jacqueline Ebanks, the
15 Commissioner on Gender Equity located in New York
16 City. Thank you. Thank you.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Good afternoon, would
18 you please raise your right hands. Do you affirm to
19 tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the
20 truth in your testimony before this Committee and to
21 respond honestly to Council Member's questions?

22 VINCENT BOUDREAU: I do.

23 SHERRY CLEARY: I do.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Would you please state
25 your names for the record?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 16

2 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Vincent Boudreau.

3 SHERRY CLEARY: Sherry Cleary.

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Jacqueline Ebanks,
5 Commissioner on Gender Equity, Office of the Mayor.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, you may
7 begin.

8 SHERRY CLEARY: Thank you. Good afternoon
9 Chairwoman Barron and Committee members from the
10 Committees of Higher Education and Women and Gender
11 Equity. I am Sherry Cleary, University Dean for Early
12 Childhood Initiatives and it is my distinct pleasure
13 to appear before you this afternoon having been asked
14 by CUNY Chancellor Felix Matos Rodriguez and
15 Executive Vice Chancellor and University Provost Jose
16 Luis Cruz to include CUNY's campus child care centers
17 in my portfolio. This represents a strong
18 acknowledgement of the integral role that campus
19 childcare plays at the City University of New York.
20 Over the last eight weeks I have become acquainted
21 with the central staff dedicated to the campus
22 childcare centers and have begun to familiarize
23 myself with the opportunities that abound. Also, in
24 my portfolio is the new CUNY family empowerment
25 community college program, a pilot initiative that

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 17

1 provides support to students for balancing the
2 demands of being in college with the responsibilities
3 of being a parent. CUNY's borough of community..
4 sorry, borough of Manhattan Community College, Bronx
5 Community College, Hostos Community College and
6 LaGuardia Community College received a total of two
7 million dollars over three years to serve
8 approximately 160 student parents each year. As part
9 of the program each college offers a comprehensive
10 system of customized supports which include free on
11 campus childcare, participation in Aesop, intensive
12 personalized advisement, tutoring, family support,
13 guidance, career counseling, access to other campus
14 resources such as food pantries and counseling
15 services and assistance in transferring to a senior
16 college upon degree completion. If the pilot is
17 deemed a success plans will be made for the
18 initiative to expand to more CUNY campus schools
19 going forward. Funding for this initiative is part of
20 Andrew Cuomo's 2019 Women's Justice Agenda. I have
21 been at CUNY for 13 years leading the work of the New
22 York Early Childhood Professional Development
23 Institute which focuses on all aspects of the early
24 childhood workforce across the city and state, a co-

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 18

2 chair, Governor Cuomo's early childhood advisory
3 council and I worked as one of a six member team to
4 help Mayor De Blasio design the Pre-K expansion. My
5 office leads the statewide implementation of quality
6 stars New York, New York's quality reading and
7 improvement system, Aspire, New York State's
8 workforce registry database and coordinates the New
9 York City early childhood research network. We also
10 operate New York Works for Children, the state's
11 workforce system and we pilot innovative approaches
12 here in the city to replicate, replicate elsewhere.
13 We, we run the early childhood career center and
14 leadership initiative here in the city and are in the
15 processes of scaling these initiatives in four other
16 communities across the state this year. Our office
17 created the 12-credit child development associate
18 credential and we support head start mothers through
19 the course of study to secure employment throughout
20 early head start programs across... throughout the
21 city. We also offer an 18-credit graduate program for
22 early childhood directors. Our commitment to the
23 early childhood and predominately female workforce
24 includes the launching of brand... of a brand-new
25 scholarship targeting individuals who work 20 hours

1
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 19
3 or more in licensed early childhood centers to attend
4 CUNY two- and four-year schools to ensure career
5 mobility. There are many other initiatives that come
6 under my office, but I'd like to dedicate the rest of
7 my comments to the work that lies ahead focusing on
8 CUNY's campus children's centers. Prior to coming to
9 CUNY, I taught at the college and university level
10 and ran two separate childcare centers myself one at
11 a community college and then one at a research
12 university. I also served as President of the
13 National Coalition of Campus Children's Centers for
14 an extended term, I was honored when our new
15 university administration asked me to provide
16 leadership and guidance to the soon 17 campus
17 childcare centers that CUNY supports. Over the last
18 four years I become acquainted with many of the
19 Directors here at CUNY and certainly some I've come
20 to know and respect the leadership of many more of
21 the CUNY sites. I look forward to working with each
22 campus to realize the potential of each program. I'm
23 also delighted to welcome onto my existing team both
24 Kisha Fuentes and Gian Luca Perizah [sp?] who are
25 right there who have... excuse me, who have been
serving in support roles over the last few years,

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 20

we've already spent considerable time together collecting and analyzing data and outlining our next several months of work. After the first of the year I'll be visiting each campus center that I haven't already visited to become acquainted with all aspects of the program. At the same time, we will be meeting to determine what supports and services my office can provide to elevate the scope of services and better position our programs to serve more student parents. Some of the work we will consider includes creating a comprehensive directory of campus childcare programs available at CUNY, creating a centralized website for student parents to use as they determine their childcare needs, centralize marketing to enhance campus based recruitment efforts to ensure that every student at CUNY is aware of childcare and availability, develop tools and more efficient use of real time data to understand usage, operation, student retention and student graduation rates and other key factors, exploration of expansion possibilities with a special emphasis on infants and toddlers, we'll also be looking at other campuses that currently do not have centers, an analysis of staff salaries and qualifications to determine

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 21

2 opportunity and need to recruit and retain a highly
3 qualified and well paid contra of teachers and
4 leaders, participation in quality stars New York and
5 incentives for programs earning ratings of four and
6 five stars, revision and use of a parent survey to
7 inform strategies and program improvement, supporting
8 the transition of children served as they leave CUNY
9 and move into primary schools, exploration of shared
10 services establish, establishing a central job bank,
11 succession planning, purchasing and other services.

12 Once I become completely acclimated and have had a
13 few short months to make an assessment of all the
14 areas of opportunity I will share my findings with
15 university leadership and chart a course of supports
16 for all childcare centers. While student parents have
17 even more challenges and manage more obstacles than
18 their peers without children, they are often more
19 motivated to make the best of their educations making
20 them worthy of every kind of support we can muster.

21 Previous research tells us that the retention rate of
22 student parents who use campus childcare can be as
23 high as 94 percent. There is an additional... there is
24 additional data to indicate that graduation rates are
25 also positively affected when student parents have

1

2 the supports that traditional extended families
3 historically provided. I've often referred to the
4 campus childcare center as the student's extended
5 family for this reason. As I read past testimony of
6 City Council hearings it became clear that the
7 Council Members surely appreciate the promise of
8 higher education and degree attainment and fully
9 appreciate the integral role that campus childcare
10 has in moving students to success. And a most recent
11 allocation of 600,000 dollars has made a significant
12 difference in the capacity of the child.. of the
13 college facilities to focus on childcare needs of our
14 student parents. Adding a staff person to focus on
15 data has been a true asset to the work, you will see
16 that some campuses extended hours and established
17 parent support services while others made much needed
18 changes to their physical plan. The number of
19 children served increased rather dramatically and new
20 data from this semester indicates the trend towards
21 increasing capacity continues. We have provided some
22 graphic information in your folders to demonstrate
23 the increase in enrollment due to the City Council's
24 generosity by providing graphic representation of age
25 and number of children served. I had some urgency to

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 23

2 determine... to determine how well the center staff
3 mirrored the diversity among the children we served.
4 Our preliminary data just demonstrates that each of
5 the centers serves a very diverse population and that
6 the teaching staff mirror that diversity accordingly.
7 I am in the process of examining staff salaries and
8 will consider, consider the implications of the new
9 Pre-K teacher compensation agreement and its impact
10 on our Pre-K teachers as well as our teachers who
11 serve children of other ages. We're also examining
12 the distribution of resources across the centers and
13 look forward to providing you with greater detail at
14 future hearings. It was my honor to meet you today
15 and I would be happy to respond to your questions.
16 Thank you.

17 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Madame Chair it's my
18 great pleasure to welcome you to City College and I
19 am personally gratified for the attention that you
20 are devoting to our childcare center on this campus.
21 I'd like also to welcome in absentia Chair Rosenthal
22 and members of the Higher Education and Women and
23 Gender Equity Committees. I'm pleased at the
24 opportunity to testify at this hearing, I've always
25 understood student wellbeing to be a key factor in

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 24

2 academic success. Indeed, among the students in need
3 it can be an overriding determinate of their success.
4 The mission we've undertaken as a college and as a
5 university system to help people from working class
6 origins develop into middle class and beyond cannot
7 be seen as strictly a classroom undertaking. The
8 achievements that CUNY campuses, CCNY among them have
9 made in the realm of social mobility require that we
10 accept the challenge of easing social burdens that
11 our students have including helping them secure
12 childcare as they pursue their education. The
13 construction of the CCNY childcare facility has been
14 long delayed to the frustration of our campus
15 community. it would be a mistake to fail to
16 acknowledge this fact. When I became Interim
17 President in late 2016 the campus was already
18 impatiently awaiting the delayed opening of the
19 childcare center. Every town hall I have hosted since
20 then has featured at least one student asking for an
21 update on the facility and I have for three years
22 been forced to report on a variety of delays. This
23 has at times been personally embarrassing to me
24 particularly because truly every delay has had its
25 roots in an unwieldy procurement process over which

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 25

the campus has had little control. What has never been in question is the quality of the facility that we will receive when we have our final certification of occupancy. The facility features play and learning areas both inside and outside, the classrooms are equipped with beautiful furniture and multimedia equipment and stage and performance spaces. The children will be taught in an historic building that has been beautifully remodeled and we're proud of that. We're also proud of the fact that our education facility will be given a role in developing and maintaining the curriculum at the childcare center so that the children will receive the most effective, most professional education possible and I should add there will be opportunities for student interns and, and, and student teaching as well. CCNY has a top ten nationally ranked early childhood development program and we look forward to bringing the expertise of that program into play in this new facility. We are finally pleased that those who taught in the former childcare facility will have the chance to be interviewed for possible employment in the new childcare center and indeed those conversations have already begun. We want to make sure that qualified

1 and available instructors who once worked at CCNY
2 will have the opportunity to renew that association
3 under new management. The facility is relatively
4 small and our primary commitment in renovating it is
5 to assist students with childcare needs. When
6 possible, that is when students do not occupy all of
7 these slots, we will make positions available to
8 staff, to faculty and to members of the community.
9 Still we imagine that the primary contribution of
10 this childcare center and it's main contribution to
11 the campus lies in its ability to provide support to
12 young parents who want both to carve out a brighter
13 future for their children and to make sure that those
14 children are well taken care of in the interval. I
15 fully expect our childcare center when it opens to
16 meet this need beautifully.

18 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Good afternoon Chair
19 Barron and good afternoon and thank you for hosting
20 this hearing. I am Jacqueline Ebanks, Executive
21 Director of New York City's Commission on Gender
22 Equity. In this role I also serve as an advisor to
23 the Mayor and First Lady on policies and issues
24 impacting gender equity in New York City for all
25 girls, women, transgender and gender nonbinary New

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 27

2 Yorkers. I also want to take a few minutes now, just
3 a few moments to thank Council Member Rosenthal and
4 Committee Members Ayala and Rivera, they are members
5 at the Commission on Gender Equity and their
6 leadership and partnership in helping us move a city,
7 our city towards greater gender equity is deeply
8 appreciated. The De Blasio administration has been
9 steadfast in its commitment to promote equity,
10 excellence and fairness for all New Yorkers from
11 providing free full day pre-kindergarten to all four
12 year olds and expanding this program to three year
13 olds to enshrining rights for pregnant and parenting
14 New Yorkers among other important efforts. It is
15 within this dynamic context that CGE works to create
16 a deep and lasting institutional commitment to
17 tearing down equity barriers across New York City
18 guided by our three focus areas; economic mobility
19 and opportunity, health and reproductive justice and
20 safety. Throughout my testimony I will discuss the
21 intersection of gender equity and childcare provision
22 and highlight the work the De Blasio administration
23 is doing to advance childcare access in New York.
24 access to high quality childcare can help sustain a
25 caregiver's participation in the workforce which in

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 28

turn increases their ability to build their assets
and grow their wealth. For parents pursuing a higher
education the impact of childcare access is of even
greater importance since having such access can
impact their ability to complete their higher
education studies in addition to impacting their
ability to participate in the workforce. Studies show
that students with bachelor's degrees earn six to
eight percent more and are half as likely to be
unemployed as those with a high school degree. Thus,
it stands to reason that a parent's ability to access
high quality and affordable childcare while pursuing
higher education can have a real impact on their
ability to complete their education and improve long
term outcomes for themselves, their children and
their families. Nationally 22 percent of college
students are parents with 72 percent being mothers
and 62 percent of those mothers being single parents.
Eighty nine percent of single student mothers are low
income earners and or have limited funds to cover
their higher education expenses let alone provide for
child.. for childcare costs. These single parents are
also more likely to incur substantial student debt
with the high cost of childcare being a contributing

2 factor. Research also shows that parents with pre-
3 school aged children who are enrolled in higher
4 education spend more time completing their degrees
5 and are more likely to drop out than their peers
6 without children despite being highly disciplined
7 students. Research attributes these outcomes to the
8 lack of time, also known as time poverty, that
9 parents pursuing higher education experience when
10 completing schoolwork compared with their peers
11 without children. It is important therefore to
12 consider the lived experiences of parents pursuing
13 higher education alongside the high cost of high-
14 quality affordable childcare when addressing the
15 childcare needs of these parents. I will now turn to
16 discussing the efforts of the De Blasio
17 administration to address childcare access in the.. in
18 New York City. The administration is committing to
19 putting an end to economic and social inequalities
20 and has consistently focused on developing high
21 quality and affordable childcare for all New Yorkers
22 regardless of their background or family income as a
23 key strategy to driving the end to economic and
24 social inequity. In 2014 the administration launched
25 the nation's largest expansion of universal pre-K

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 30
3 known as Pre-K for All and in its first year doubled
4 the number of children previously enrolled. Since
5 2014 this program has served over 320,000 four-year
6 olds with full day, high quality pre-K programming.
7 Building on this success, in 2017 the administration
8 launched its 3-K for All program serving 5,000 three-
9 year olds in its first year and 20,000 during the
10 2019 to 2020 school year. We expect that in 2021 to
11 2022... the school year of 21/20... 22, I still can't say
12 those years, the city plans to bring 3-K for All to
13 additional two... to two additional districts for a
14 total of 14 school districts in all five boroughs.
15 Pre-K and 3-K are offered at CUNY campuses across the
16 city and serve children of students. In an early... in
17 addition to early learning benefits, Pre-K provides
18 families with children enrolled in free, full day
19 Pre-K programs, quality and advanced learning
20 opportunity and save an, an average of an annual
21 10,000 dollars on child, childcare costs. In addition
22 to Pre-K and 3-K, the New York City Department of
23 Education oversees the city's early learn programs.
24 Early Learn provides childcare and education services
25 in a center-based setting for children age six weeks

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 31

1 to four-year-old and hold their settings for children
2 age six weeks to three years old. Early Learn
3 includes the city's early head start program and
4 provides early care and education programs to... and
5 services to pregnant mothers, infants and toddlers
6 for at least eight hours a day. Over 100,000 children
7 and families are served each year through the
8 Division of early childhood programs. Our
9 Administration for Children Services administers
10 childcare vouchers to eligible families which allows
11 them to independently identify and pay for childcare.
12 On average, ACS administers anywhere from 65,000 to
13 75,000 vouchers annually to low income families or
14 those on cash assistance. Since 2014, the
15 administration has also advanced a number of policies
16 and legislation that promote New York City parent's
17 abilities to adequately care for their children in
18 spite of life's circumstances that may arise such as
19 paid sick leave and paid parental leave and hopefully
20 proposed paid personal time off. Turning to our work
21 at the Commission, CGE recognizes how crucial it is
22 that New York City families have access to high
23 quality, affordable childcare and has engaged in
24 efforts to study this need. Advancing high quality
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 32

2 childcare for all New York children and their
3 families for squarely under CGE's economic mobility
4 and opportunity focused area through which CGE seeks
5 to ensure all New Yorkers live economically secure
6 lives and have access to opportunities to thrive.
7 Under our economic mobility and opportunity area CGE
8 will examine opportunities to decrease the negative
9 impact of paid and unpaid caregiving on building
10 assets and growing wealth over time for girls, women,
11 transgender and gender nonconforming New Yorkers. The
12 exorbitant costs of care giving that many families
13 very often women led households and those households
14 already earning low wages cannot afford often drives
15 care givers to leave the work force and limits their
16 abilities to pursue higher education. This exit from
17 the workforce and limit on higher educational
18 opportunities to care for a child and others can
19 greatly compromise a person's, most often women's,
20 ability to meaningfully build their assets and wealth
21 over time. CGE will continue to partner closely with
22 city agencies and community partners as well as
23 leading researchers in the field to contribute to
24 discussion on the most effective solutions to
25 advancing high quality and affordable childcare in

2 New York City for all New York children and their
3 families. Thank you for inviting me to speak today, I
4 look forward to continued conversations to exploring
5 this issue further.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to thank the
7 panel for your testimony, and I want to also
8 acknowledge that we've been joined by Council Member
9 Ben Kallos joining us on this hearing. Thank you so
10 much for all that you've shared with us and I guess
11 I'll start with the specifics of the childcare center
12 here at City College. So, President Boudreau, what's
13 the date for the grand opening?

14 VINCENT BOUDREAU: So, we will start to
15 show the center after the fire alarm system has been
16 tested, the date for that is February, February 20th,
17 is that it... no, February 19th that's the point when
18 we can safely bring people into the childcare center.
19 What will... what will happen from that point on the
20 Health Department then needs to certify the center
21 and they will likely give us things that we need to
22 do to remediate it so we believe that we will be
23 signing people up over the course of the spring
24 semester to fully occupy the center at the start of
25 the fall semester. So, that is a delay.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's
disappointing.

VINCENT BOUDREAU: To all of us.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, we can't expect
that the students who will be enrolled here this
spring will have an opportunity to take advantage of
the center?

VINCENT BOUDREAU: What I've been told is
the following; is that when a child care center is
opened then the Health Department comes in and they
do an inspection, at that point we will then have to
go in and remediate whatever they've seen that, that
is... that is... still needs to be remediated. We
originally thought we might be able to occupy the
building in May but by that point in the semester it
almost makes sense to, to do a clean launch at the
beginning of the fall.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Is there any way we
can speed up all of the things that need to be done
and not overlook or neglect or short change those
issues but still speed the process up, is there
anything the City Council can do or any of the
agencies can do to facilitate getting that date
earlier?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

VINCENT BOUDREAU: I think... so, what we're, we're waiting right now for the delivery of one thing which is handrails that need to be installed and, and what I learned earlier today is that the, the previous contractor wasn't able to order them, everything else is on site. So, there's furniture that can be unpacked, the outside won't be finished, the garden area but we can actually start occupying the, the interior before. I think if it is possible, I mean the two big delays or the, the big question marks we have coming forward is how long will it take for a building inspection and how long will it take for the Health Department to certify it and so if there is anything that the Council can do to speed up those processes because as I say we're only... we're now at two, two short months away from the final pieces of equipment being installed so from that point forward we're simply waiting for approvals and licensing.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'm sure that the Council will facilitate that so that all of that gets on the fast track... [cross-talk]

VINCENT BOUDREAU: Yeah... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 36

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...because this is a
3 project that is sorely needed and delayed, delayed,
4 delayed so I'm sure that the... I, I will make a
5 commitment just as the City Council has given 600,000
6 dollars for child... we understand that it's important...
7 [cross-talk]

8 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Yes, it is... [cross-
9 talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...and I think that
11 that testimony is, is validated by the fact that we
12 put money into making these programs viable so we
13 will certainly make sure that we do that. As you need
14 us let us know, if you can give me a summary at the
15 end of this, my Counsel will work with us to make
16 sure that we speed up all of that so that we can move
17 through that and just for the record, what caused
18 this three year delay?

19 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Yeah, so... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Four-year delay?

21 VINCENT BOUDREAU: I, I, I think it makes
22 sense to talk about it in, in, in two maybe three
23 phases, the, the first phase, when, when the original
24 ADA adjustments were going to be made what I
25 understand from that is that people thought they

2 could do some pretty minor things and bring the, the,
3 the building up to code. What they found first was
4 that the level of asbestos remediation that had to be
5 done far outstripped what their early estimates were.
6 Then looking at it they discovered that the floors
7 in, in different parts of the building were rotted
8 through and so they had to replace the entire
9 flooring in, in, in the building and then finally
10 they looked at the... you know masonry had to be
11 replaced and actually some of the original stone
12 blocks had to be replaced so, so the building was
13 actually in much worse disrepair than originally
14 thought. So, what began as a fairly simple ADA
15 remediation became a full redesign of the building
16 and, and that redesign has yielded a number of
17 things. So, for instance on the second floor there
18 was a, a, a kind of rickety staircase that went down
19 to the west, it was so rickety in fact that it was no
20 longer in use but building code required that there's
21 egress from the second floor directly out so when we
22 have a chance to show you the, the, the building what
23 you'll see is a brand new spiral staircase outside
24 on... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 38

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh, yes... [cross-
3 talk]

4 VINCENT BOUDREAU: ...the East side of the
5 building... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I've seen it, uh-
7 huh.

8 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Yeah, so at, at, at
9 that point the, the level of redesign required an
10 architect and building bidding so, so at that point
11 the one year project became the three year project
12 that we all anticipated and the original finishing
13 date was the end of the year 2018 and then we get
14 into some of the issues that deal with the
15 procurement process, you know we have a state
16 procurement process, the original contractor who was
17 the lowest bidder on this contract was working on it
18 and then ran out of money so he stopped paying his
19 subcontractors, all work stopped and it took a little
20 while before the, the college even caught the fact
21 that nothing was going on inside that building. We
22 had to terminate his contract, DASNY stepped in and
23 rebid and found another contractor and in that
24 process we found that work that we thought was
25 getting done on time hadn't been completed so a new

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

contract, so that, that puts a pretty significant delay in the... in the construction and then the new contractor comes in finds out that work that was supposed to have been completed hadn't been completed. So, work then resumes and about six months ago as we were thinking that this building... that this would be available at the start of the spring semester the new contractor allowed his license to lapse and so work once again stopped and I will say that DASNY and CUNY stepped in and took what could have been a, a two month process of relicensing the contractor and, and, and got it done expeditiously but this was another long delay and, and, and so from our estimate of January of this year we've added another six months because of those delays and, and, and what I will say is this, in retrospect the fact that these specific contractors had the kind of delays that, that, that manifest themselves in the construction process wasn't a surprise to anybody but we have a blind state contracting system and this was the lowest bidder and state law requires that we draw out the lowest bidder and, and so this is a system that I think it's beyond the childcare center but it,

2 it deeply affected the progress on this... on this
3 project.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you for that
5 explanation but in terms of the work that's being
6 done on campus I think I heard you say that there was
7 a period of time where you didn't even realize that
8 there was not work actually being done on site. So,
9 who has the oversight of going in and checking to
10 make sure not that they can assess what the work is
11 but the fact that work is being done on an ongoing
12 basis, is that the state or is that the city,
13 somebody should be, you know... [cross-talk]

14 VINCENT BOUDREAU: So... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...someone said if
16 it's not inspected its neglected.

17 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Yeah, yeah...

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, who is... what's
19 the body or the entity that should be checking?

20 VINCENT BOUDREAU: So, the dormitory
21 authority of the state of New York manages those
22 contracts, I will say that they may have known things
23 that we did not know about the progress of, of... on
24 the building so I can't... I can't speak for, for what
25 they knew and when they knew it, but it took us a

2 period of time before we were able to accurately
3 communicate to our community what the status of the
4 center was.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, does CUNY have
6 any involvement in that as well, I heard you say
7 DASNY, but does CUNY have any person on their staff
8 that would be, be also checking?

9 VINCENT BOUDREAU: We have... I mean on
10 campus we have a Vice... an AVP of facilities, CUNY of
11 course has a... has an Associate Chancellor for
12 Facilities as well. I, I don't know how in the weeds
13 the CUNY leadership gets, I, I think the... they... and...
14 you know I think the assumption is that, that the
15 people on campus who are tasked with managing
16 construction are managing construction but, but...
17 yeah...

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what does part
19 Bob Lamier who's a lead architect, what part does he
20 play in this?

21 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Well Bob's not the
22 lead architect I think, he is a... he is... he is... he, he
23 might be the number two at CUNY reporting to the
24 Associate Chancellor for Facilities. More of a... I...
25 more I think of a... of a project manager and

2 construction manager than an architect, the
3 architecture on this was, was bid out to an external
4 firm and that's standard practice.

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, thank you so
6 much for that, that detailed information, it doesn't
7 sage our feelings of disappointment but at least now
8 we have more information and perhaps we can look to
9 see how we can't put structures in place that will
10 prevent this from happening moving forward and
11 certainly we want to get a, a date certain by which
12 we will come and cut the ribbon and watch the
13 children go in and enjoy that but one other question
14 I have. Do you know if there is a... there was not an
15 elevator included, was there a reason why there was
16 not an elevator included, I know it's a two story
17 building but... and I've been told that the children
18 are going to be generally on the first floor but even
19 perhaps facility or staff person... [cross-talk]

20 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Yeah... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...might have needs
22 that would require an elevator, so do you know why an
23 elevator was not considered in the plans?

24 VINCENT BOUDREAU: I can only speculate,
25 I took... I, I will say this, it's a relatively small

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 43

2 facility, it's a historic facility, it, it... both the
3 old childcare center and the new childcare... the old
4 childcare center could accommodate about 45 children...
5 [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

7 VINCENT BOUDREAU: ...we originally thought
8 the new one would accommodate 45, I think we have
9 some questions about whether we need to put a barrier
10 in front of the cooking area and that may mean that
11 we go to a, a lower number of children for the sake
12 of, of the safety of them, an elevator... there was no
13 elevator shaft in the building and I just wonder how...
14 what the occupancy would be like if the footprint was
15 further reduced by an elevator shaft. I will say
16 this, the upstairs is exclusively for staff and
17 faculty, children will not be on the second floor but
18 your, your, your ADA point is well... is well taken, I,
19 I, I don't know why an elevator wasn't considered.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, did the original
21 plans call for an elevator, I heard you say there was
22 an elevator shaft... [cross-talk]

23 VINCENT BOUDREAU: No, I'm saying that...
24 [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 44

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...there was not an
3 elevator... [cross-talk]

4 VINCENT BOUDREAU: ...there is no elevator
5 shaft... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

7 VINCENT BOUDREAU: That's right.

8 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, great, thank
9 you so much and now generally back to just questions
10 about our childcare centers. If you can explain to me
11 the relationship between the city's Pre-K and 3-K
12 being located on campuses and the childcare centers
13 that are on campus is what's their relationship?

14 SHERRY CLEARY: So, the campus child..
15 children centers have been invited to apply for Pre-K
16 funding when and if there was capacity in the centers
17 to accommodate three and four year old children that
18 would fall under Pre-K and so some of the centers
19 have applied for Pre-K dollars and, and formally run
20 Pre-K within the centers and of course then are able
21 to provide before and after school child care for
22 those kids that need it.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, are you saying..
24 [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 45

2 SHERRY CLEARY: Not, not all... [cross-
3 talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...that... [cross-talk]

5 SHERRY CLEARY: ...campuses have Pre-K.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Right, they have to
7 apply?

8 SHERRY CLEARY: They have to apply to
9 the... to the DOE...

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh...

11 SHERRY CLEARY: Like every other
12 childcare center would have to apply, a site visit is
13 conducted to make sure that its acceptable and then
14 those programs are... receive funding to operate Pre-K
15 within the setting so those Pre-K classes for the,
16 the six hour and 20 minute of Pre-K is free to the
17 parents and then if they need additional hours they
18 can use the center as well for that, before and
19 after.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: How does that impact
21 with the... so that's additional money, how much money
22 is it that, that would come with an acceptance of
23 getting that... [cross-talk]

24 SHERRY CLEARY: I can't... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 46

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...dollar amount...

3 [cross-talk]

4 SHERRY CLEARY: I, I can't tell you what
5 the entire amount that each campus gets for... [cross-
6 talk]

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...right, but... [cross-
8 talk]

9 SHERRY CLEARY: ...Pre-K but it's about...
10 [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...per child... [cross-
12 talk]

13 SHERRY CLEARY: ...ten thousand dollars a
14 child.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: About ten thousand
16 dollars... [cross-talk]

17 SHERRY CLEARY: On average, yeah.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And that's annual or
19 by semester or... [cross-talk]

20 SHERRY CLEARY: It's, it's for ten
21 months.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Ten months... [cross-
23 talk]

24 SHERRY CLEARY: For the ten-month school
25 year.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 47

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay and so does CUNY conduct an outreach to students so that every student on every CUNY campus knows that there's this opportunity for them to apply, how is the word spread?

SHERRY CLEARY: Well every campus at the moment does it their own way and thinking about that going forward is... falls under my purview and we'll be looking at ways to communicate with all student parents that come to CUNY to try to help them figure out what is the supports that they need including campus childcare but every campus right now does their own marketing and communicates to student parents in their own ways, we will be starting in, in the new year working to streamline some of that to make sure that all programs are meeting as many need.. as much need as possible and, and filling programs not just every seat but every seat all day and, and into the evening.

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, do you plan to have a standard template that you will use or are you still going to have each campus decide how they want to get the word out to students?

1
2 SHERRY CLEARY: That's a great question,
3 we'll probably do both.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

5 SHERRY CLEARY: We want to give the
6 campus sites autonomy where they excel at it and we
7 want to help them to really meet the need and so
8 we'll be doing some central office work to publicize
9 the availability of the programs where they are, how
10 they work so we'll create a... an entire directory and
11 the staff have been working on the template for that
12 so we'll, we'll do our part from the central office
13 perspective and then we'll be working with individual
14 directors to make sure that their always running
15 full, that they're maintaining a waiting list, that
16 they're... that they're building out their capacity to
17 serve children even in what might be considered
18 downtime so downtime can be study time for parents
19 and they may be able to use extra hours in that way
20 and we're going to encourage those programs that
21 haven't yet mastered that and we're going to use
22 programs that have mastered that as the model.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: On page three of
24 your testimony you list some of the goals that you
25 have and it includes a directory of campuses, a

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 49

2 centralized website, campus based recruitment effort
3 tools, to use real time data to understand usage...
4 [cross-talk]

5 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...expansion
7 possibilities and several other items that you have
8 here, an analysis of staff salaries, qualifications
9 and I'm pleased to see that because these are some of
10 the issues which we had raised in previous hearings
11 and did not have really a clear... [cross-talk]

12 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...answer to how that
14 happens so do you have a timeline, it says... [cross-
15 talk]

16 SHERRY CLEARY: Yeah... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...it had a few short
18 months to make an assessment, that you will share
19 your findings so... [cross-talk]

20 SHERRY CLEARY: Yeah... [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...do you have a time
22 by which... [cross-talk]

23 SHERRY CLEARY: Sure... [cross-talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...you think you'll be
25 able to have that, that groundwork done?

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 50

2 SHERRY CLEARY: Yeah, so I think I'm in a
3 honeymoon period right now with our new
4 administration and I'm not going to squander it, so
5 some of the funding that the City Council
6 appropriated in... that eight... that 600,000 that you
7 provided to the... to CUNY and the campus children's
8 centers we've used to identify a data person and that
9 data person is working day and night beginning to...
10 well not beginning but building out data systems and,
11 and data, I'll call them systems to enable us to
12 really collect data, make some analysis and then make
13 very specific recommendations to the Chancellor and
14 the Executive Vice Chancellor, I met with them
15 yesterday and we'll be meeting with all the directors
16 in January and hopefully by the middle of March we'll
17 have some very specific recommendations but we will
18 also have quite a few of these pieces in place so the
19 directory, the website, those things we'll, we'll,
20 we'll do into the late winter and early spring and
21 then hopefully by late spring all of our
22 recommendations will be made. Just examples... big
23 things in my mind are, are salaries and parity across
24 centers, managing this new Pre-K funding and what it
25 does, you know it's, it's a wonderful thing to raise

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 51
2 Pre-K teacher salaries and CBOs, those Pre-K teachers
3 are working side by side by... with, with other
4 teachers who have the same or similar credentials so
5 we at CUNY are going to want to look at that and how
6 we address that so there are many things that we have
7 tremendous urgency in terms of addressing them and
8 then talking about funding.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, in terms of that
10 salary difference for people who are basically doing
11 the same thing and working side by side... [cross-talk]

12 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...what... how do you
14 plan to address that, will we find more money in the
15 budget, is the Board of Trustees going to put forth a
16 budget that says look, based on what we see here's
17 how we need to increase those salaries, are they
18 going to go to Governor... [cross-talk]

19 SHERRY CLEARY: Well that's certainly...
20 [cross-talk]

21 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...Cuomo and ask...
22 [cross-talk]

23 SHERRY CLEARY: ...one strategy... [cross-
24 talk]

25 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...him for that money?

2 SHERRY CLEARY: Excuse me, that's one
3 strategy to talk about the budget, clearly we're as
4 sensitive as you and, and everybody else is about
5 raising tuition and, and fees and all of that so the...
6 but, but we would make budget recommendations to the
7 administration and try to figure out where... what are
8 the ways to increase funding... [cross-talk]

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: To the city
10 administration?

11 SHERRY CLEARY: To... first, I will be
12 submitting my recommendations to CUNY's
13 administration, that's my charge.

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay...

15 SHERRY CLEARY: Is to take a look...
16 [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

18 SHERRY CLEARY: ...at all of these things
19 and to give them recommendations that of course have
20 fiscal implications, some of these don't have serious
21 fiscal implications, others do and we'll be making an
22 analysis providing recommendations and then the
23 discussions will begin about how to... how to identify...
24 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 53

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I think we... [cross-
3 talk]

4 SHERRY CLEARY: ...resources... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...have to have
6 dedicated funding streams for these programs if
7 they're really going to be effective, we can't just...
8 [cross-talk]

9 SHERRY CLEARY: I agree... [cross-talk]

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...keep talking about...
11 [applause]

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: We can't just keep
13 talking about we're going to do this and the
14 Governor's talking about we're going to have food
15 pantries and there's no money... [cross-talk]

16 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...you know these are
18 unfunded initiative... unfunded mandates that give
19 people a grand stage to stand on and say what they're
20 going to do and there's no money attached to that so,
21 we've got to... [cross-talk]

22 SHERRY CLEARY: That is true... [cross-
23 talk]

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...make that push...
25 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 54

2 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

3 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...and go to the state
4 as well as the city... [cross-talk]

5 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...because we know
7 that it's, it's under the Governor's purview so we've
8 got to really have people put their money or dedicate
9 the money to those things that they say are important
10 otherwise its just...

11 [applause]

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...otherwise it's just
13 talk, we've got to make that, you know and it sort of
14 gets back to what I said, we can't expect student to
15 keep getting burdened with, with manning these but
16 you do have a page here which talks about City
17 College childcare and it totals the 600,000 dollars
18 so... [cross-talk]

19 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...is this the money
21 that City Council... [cross-talk]

22 SHERRY CLEARY: Yes... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...contributed?

24 SHERRY CLEARY: Yes, we wanted to provide
25 you with some degree of detail about how that money

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 55

2 was allocated the first year and so you'll see that
3 each campus received an allocation and then you'll
4 see how they used that money and whether students
5 were direct... all... you know students were impacted but
6 there was some cases where students were directly
7 impacted and some cases where actual additional
8 student... children were served so some of the campuses
9 extended hours, some engaged family support help to
10 really support families as they pursue their degrees,
11 some made some improvements in their physical plant
12 so that they could serve families better.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, how, how do we
14 explain the differences, generally most of them are
15 in the 20... 20,000, 25,000 thereabouts but how do we
16 explain the ones at the top end that more... is it
17 based on the number of students that they serve...
18 children that they served or...

19 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh, enrollment, how,
20 how big the sites were, what they needed, so there
21 are some differences you'll see, LaGuardia is one of
22 our largest programs... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, did the schools,
24 does each campus decide or request a specific amount
25 or was it done from... on high and said... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 56

2 SHERRY CLEARY: You know... [cross-talk]

3 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...this is what it is?

4 SHERRY CLEARY: So, in, in the office

5 this proceeded my coming to this... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

7 SHERRY CLEARY: ...coming to this work but

8 my understanding is that the, the Kisha Fuentes who,

9 who oversees the, the funding for, for these programs

10 made a... used her form... the formula she uses and, and

11 made these... [cross-talk]

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Well I'm pleased to

13 see this accounting of where the money went and I'm

14 sure that my colleagues would appreciate seeing this

15 as well and I'll be sure to share this with them and

16 who knows we perhaps will encourage them to give even

17 more money in the next cycle... [cross-talk]

18 SHERRY CLEARY: Yeah... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...I do have more

20 questions but I'm going to ask my colleague if he

21 would like to... [cross-talk]

22 SHERRY CLEARY: I would... I would only say

23 one thing and that is that the programs that I have

24 visited thus far have, have initiated without my

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 57

2 asking their deep appreciation for this additional
3 resource... [cross-talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Sure... [cross-talk]

5 SHERRY CLEARY: When I asked, you know
6 what's happened in the last year they were really
7 happy to point out that there is this additional
8 money that came from the City... from the City Council,
9 not only did they put it to good use but they felt
10 truly valued by... [cross-talk]

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Good... [cross-talk]

12 SHERRY CLEARY: ...that contribution they
13 thought somebody actually gets what we're doing..
14 [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I just want to put
16 on the... [cross-talk]

17 SHERRY CLEARY: ...so thank you... [cross-
18 talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...record Speaker
20 Corey Johnson was spearheading this and the Committee
21 and my colleagues as well, so we do... [cross-talk]

22 SHERRY CLEARY: Thank you... [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...believe in
24 childhood care centers.

25 SHERRY CLEARY: Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 58

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: My colleague Ben
3 Kallos.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I want to start
5 with a thank you to... as... Council Member, Chair Inez
6 Barron for having a hearing on this important issue,
7 a new father of a 22 month old at home, child care
8 expenses of my district start at 30,000 for the
9 programs that might be less competitive and they go
10 up to 60 or 90,000 for the most competitive programs
11 and I will say I would not be able to do my job today
12 without childcare and I can't imagine trying to get
13 through an educational curriculum. I want to also
14 thank you for doing this on site and I want to thank
15 all... if the record could recognize that I see a lot
16 of young people and people of all ages in the
17 audience, this is very well attended for a City
18 Council hearing so I want to thank everyone who is
19 here in attendance so thank you, we don't always
20 clap, we twinkle in the council so thank you and then
21 for those who are filming this is actually being live
22 streamed at council dot NYC dot gov and you'll be
23 able to download a copy of this entire hearing
24 probably minutes after it is concluded and you can
25 edit it however you like. I want to just say to

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 59

2 Sherry Cleary thank you for... some, some say in god
3 they trust but all others bring data, thank you for
4 bringing the data, this is literally what all of my
5 questions were going to be about. I've been pretty
6 focused on Pre-K, it's one of the issues I, I ran on
7 and so did the Mayor and it's something that I was
8 proud to stand with him on. We just got universal
9 Pre-K in my district this year, in September we
10 finally got enough seats so I guess my question for
11 Sherry Cleary first is just in terms of the numbers
12 that you've given which are very good and impressive,
13 how many... is... are, are you at capacity, are you under
14 capacity or do you need more capacity?

15 SHERRY CLEARY: That's the consequential
16 question, we are... we are at capacity, we could
17 probably double in size, that's probably in the
18 immediate not realistic. My work in the next few
19 months will be to really look at space and
20 utilization of seats in these programs. I'd like to
21 point out that most student parents don't need 40 or
22 50 hours a week and they should be encouraged to be
23 with their children as much as they want to be with
24 them so campus child care is somewhat unique in that
25 it can fill one seat with up to three children a day,

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 60

2 you know somebody's taking morning classes,
3 somebody's taking afternoon classes and somebody's
4 taking evening classes and so what we're going to be
5 looking at is what are ways that we can use our
6 existing seat capacity and the hours that programs
7 are open so many of our programs are, are full day,
8 five days a week but we have several programs that
9 also operate in the evenings, we have one campus
10 that's open seven days a week, four nights a week so
11 we're looking at how best to use the existing
12 capacity and how to grow capacity and... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I like the last
14 model you mentioned, the seven days a week... [cross-
15 talk]

16 SHERRY CLEARY: Yeah... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...four nights a
18 week... [cross-talk]

19 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...as being the
21 most expansive and... [cross-talk]

22 SHERRY CLEARY: Yeah... [cross-talk]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...also offering
24 full time at... are any of the locations actually free

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 61

2 or do all of them require either a sliding scale
3 subsidy or like a full payment by the parents?

4 SHERRY CLEARY: As best I understand it
5 still some seats at each campus... [cross-talk]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Uh-huh... [cross-
7 talk]

8 SHERRY CLEARY: ...are very, very low cost
9 and then some campuses have sliding scales, there's a
10 new... [cross-talk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Some of the
12 campuses charge more than the private day care that I
13 have to pay for on the East side, I think.

14 SHERRY CLEARY: I think maybe you might
15 be referring to the graduate center that charges
16 parents 45 dollars a day but that's because those
17 parents are not eligible for the typical subsidies
18 that undergraduate parents are eligible for and so
19 they don't have the funding to offset those costs and
20 so they do charge more, the other side of that is
21 that some graduate students are working during the
22 day and coming in the evening and they actually have
23 a little bit more of an income but our goal would be
24 to really look at how to mitigate those costs.

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And, and the
3 reason I, I like the seven days a week plus evenings
4 is just if you're asking for students to pay, pay for
5 the childcare then that means its... so, it's...
6 standard course load is 15 hours a week, is that
7 correct?

8 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And so... and then
10 is, is there academic learning that happens outside
11 of the classroom that's associated with those 15
12 hours, is it... perhaps the... somebody from CCNY can
13 answer it because I remember in my school it was a
14 recommendation of three hours for every hour... [cross-
15 talk]

16 SHERRY CLEARY: Yes... [cross-talk]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...in the
18 classroom, is that still the... what is the going rate
19 nowadays?

20 VINCENT BOUDREAU: It's an aspirational
21 goal for our students but we, we encourage them all
22 to aspire to that, yes, you have to do reading and
23 homework and writing and essays and all of that...
24 [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 63

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I remember SUNY
3 Buffalo Law School was about six hours for every hour
4 in the classroom so you've, you've got that and then
5 you also need to have a part time job to cover the
6 child care costs so it, it seems like... [cross-talk]

7 SHERRY CLEARY: Some students... [cross-
8 talk]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...more... [cross-
10 talk]

11 SHERRY CLEARY: ...pay as little as five
12 dollars a day and some students... [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Still need income
14 to pay that five dollars a day... [cross-talk]

15 SHERRY CLEARY: That's right and some
16 students pay nothing because they... the, the campus
17 may have a federal grant or they may have the new
18 state family empowerment project grant so it, it's
19 different for every program and every family. I want
20 to... [cross-talk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So... [cross-talk]

22 SHERRY CLEARY: ...just add to the
23 President's comments that in most campus childcare
24 programs the enrollment process advises the parents
25 to add additional hours for study time when they

2 detect that a student is having an academic challenge
3 they would perhaps recommend that they go to the math
4 lab and take a couple hours more into their schedule
5 to accommodate that. There is a lot of support given
6 to, to families which is why it's so important that
7 people have access to campus childcare.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: So, so now is a
9 good time to be big and to be bold like our Mayor who
10 came up with doing the universal Pre-K and is now
11 talking about 3-K for All, it seems that based on the
12 numbers you have and I'd still love to see some of
13 the, the numbers you believe that you could
14 accommodate doubling... [cross-talk]

15 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...the number of
17 seats and, and I guess the question is if you doubled
18 the number of seats would that accommodate just the
19 students, the student need?

20 SHERRY CLEARY: Interesting, every campus
21 is a little different, so some campuses have elected
22 to serve 90 percent children of students and 10
23 percent faculty and staff... [cross-talk]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Uh-huh... [cross-
25 talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 65

2 SHERRY CLEARY: ...others... [cross-talk]

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: That's, that's
4 where I... [cross-talk]

5 SHERRY CLEARY: ...solely serve... [cross-
6 talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...headed... [cross-
8 talk]

9 SHERRY CLEARY: ...students. There is
10 advantages to both models, if you serve only students
11 you're meeting a greater need for students, if you're
12 serving faculty and staff you're also meeting a
13 campus need and those individuals pay more and so
14 they can help subsidize the cost for students. So,
15 people across the country and I've worked with campus
16 programs across the country, have... adapt different
17 models, most... [cross-talk]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: The, the
19 universities... [cross-talk]

20 SHERRY CLEARY: ...campuses have... [cross-
21 talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...in my district
23 give education that waivers for free to their faculty
24 and staff so I, I guess one question is so you're
25 saying doubling would either meet the need for

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 66

2 students and in some places ten percent, how, how
3 many seats would we need if we wanted to serve all
4 the students and then all the staff including
5 nonprofessional staff... [cross-talk]

6 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...all the faculty
8 and then my mom was an adjunct so if there was no
9 child care for me I was going to have to sit in the
10 back of the classroom and I heard way too many
11 lectures on Floyd and I, I gave up on raising my hand
12 to say no, I don't have that complex, that's not
13 right so what could we do... what would be the right
14 number if we were going to say we have a commitment
15 to not only provide for all of our students but all
16 of our staff both professional, nonprofessional and
17 all of our academics including the huge group of
18 adjuncts that you have and the fact is women face a,
19 a ceiling in academia and we need to make sure that...
20 and, and childcare is a... as much as childcare is an
21 issue in every field its especially a tough issue in
22 academia?

23 SHERRY CLEARY: Well you know I love your
24 question; I would love to think that we could build
25 capacity to meet all of those needs that you've

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 67

2 listed, I... I'm going to start with student parents
3 and on our list is to craft a much more inquisitive
4 student survey and get a better sense of what the
5 need is on each of the campuses. In addition we have
6 to do some work with our CUNY central data system,
7 there are campuses like Monroe Community College in
8 Rochester which actually codes students as they enter
9 as having young children so they have data that they
10 can use to track so Kisha and I are going to be
11 working to see if we can't get those data set pieces...
12 [cross-talk]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I'm going to... I
14 want to thank the Chair, I'm going to try to wrap
15 with I think two or three final pieces which is just
16 if you could use the FASFA data that should give you
17 the number of children, their ages in the household
18 and if in your proposal that is coming if you can
19 break it down by student need, professional need and,
20 and faculty need... [cross-talk]

21 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...that way at
23 least we know what you're asking for but you're also
24 telling us what the universe is. For Jacqueline
25 Ebanks you're talking about the, the success of Pre-K

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 68
2 and 3-K, unfortunately at this point it is up to the
3 Mayor to determine who gets 3-K and which districts,
4 could the Mayor... he... I'm asking for it in district
5 two which is my district, we were the last ones to
6 get Pre-K, it seems like we should be the first ones
7 to get 3-K, I would love that but at the very least
8 you could offer 3-K to the CUNY campuses so that they
9 can enroll so that the faculty... sorry, that the
10 students, staff and faculty could have access to
11 free, all day, high quality 3-K and 4-K, is that
12 something you could bring back to the Mayor and or...
13 [cross-talk]

14 JACQUELINE EBANKS: We, we certainly...
15 [cross-talk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: ...agree to now...
17 [cross-talk]

18 JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...can, I, I do want to
19 point out I think when we talked with our colleagues
20 in DOE if I'm not mistaken here that we do have some
21 3-K programs at some CUNY centers currently and so...
22 but the expansion of need and the prioritization we...
23 we'll certainly speak with our colleagues at DOE.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: And then just to,
25 to bolster the Chair's offer to CCNY we started with

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 69

2 very... with 153 Pre-K seats in my district, we have
3 opened... we're now up to 1,100 Pre-K seats, we work
4 with providers to get their fire permits, to get
5 their DOB permits, to get the temporary fire watches,
6 my office is no stranger to this, we did it to... for
7 four centers this year alone to get them open in
8 September, I would not wait till next September
9 because the spring semester is the spring semester so
10 you have the Chair's commitment and, and you have my
11 commitment and you also have a, a member of the
12 Mayor's administration if, if the three of us can't
13 get it done I don't know who can so let's get it
14 done, if you're having trouble with a railing for two
15 months bring one of your folks from facilities in,
16 get something temporary in, let's get it done at...
17 ASAP and I'd love to join the Chair and anyone you'll
18 have to cut a ribbon next week if possible. Thank
19 you.

20 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Thank you, we won't
21 wait a second once those permits are in place, I
22 guarantee it.

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, thank you
24 Council Member Kallos. I just have a few more
25 questions and I want to focus back again on the

1
2 finances. So, yet the City Council gave some money
3 but what are all of the components that factor into
4 financing a campus based childcare center and are
5 there outside resources that contribute to that as
6 well?

7 SHERRY CLEARY: Yeah, so the, the big
8 chunks of money that, that are committed to each
9 campus childcare center are these; there's the city
10 allocation about 1.6 million, there's the state
11 allocation, 3.675 million, there's a federal
12 allocation that is about 2.16 million, CUNY gives...
13 puts forward a 500,000 dollar cash commitment but
14 there's an... a massive in kind commitment and there's
15 a... there's a... there's a cash in kind. So, for example
16 CUNY pays about 1.8 million dollars in addition to
17 the 500,000 that covers some salary, mostly for
18 directors. So... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Say that again, CUNY
20 pays... [cross-talk]

21 SHERRY CLEARY: Sure... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...how much?

23 SHERRY CLEARY: At, at least... in my... you
24 know in my quick math about 1.8 million and possibly
25 closer to two when you think of some programs have

2 more than one staff person that is paid directly
3 through CUNY so, they're subsidizing these programs
4 in a very, very significant way, that's not counting
5 rent, heat, other utilities and cleaning services and
6 a whole range of other supports that CUNY provides
7 and then there's Pre-K dollars. If a program does
8 have Pre-K contracts that money is in addition and
9 helps to offset the cost of services for children,
10 there are very modest parent needs in almost every
11 case and then there are Sea campus grants which are
12 grants that individual campus centers write through
13 the federal government and, and they.. and those are
14 four year grants that help them provide free or very,
15 very, very reduced service costs for, for student
16 parents and those are only student parent focused.

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And what would you
18 say has been the trend of the amounts in each of
19 these categories, have you seen that there has been
20 an increase over the years, or would you say they've
21 been stagnant?

22 SHERRY CLEARY: I would say.. this is a..
23 this is a good time to ask that question because from
24 where I sit as somebody new just looking at this,
25 having not looked at it for quite some time now, it

1
2 appears to me that the cost... that each of the
3 allocations have gone up. So, the... CCDBG money, the
4 childcare development block grant and the federal
5 government went up last year for the first time in
6 many, many, many years...

7 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: So, that was last
8 year it increased?

9 SHERRY CLEARY: Yes...

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: You said the first
11 time in many... so, the trend hasn't been to go up just
12 that last year it increased?

13 SHERRY CLEARY: Last, last year... the
14 federal money went up last year, the state money went
15 up a bit, I think the, the CUNY money goes up every
16 year because these people get increases every year...
17 [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

19 SHERRY CLEARY: ...and their costs go up
20 every year, the City Council certainly went up in
21 their... in their commitment last year which really
22 made an impact. The Sea Campus grants across... that
23 come from the federal government they have gone up
24 and down and up and down over the years and I always
25 want to acknowledge that the Sea Campus grants that

1
2 are about... they're more than 30 years old, that was
3 started by a director of a city... a CUNY campus
4 childcare center and Chris Dot. They... the two of them
5 cooked this idea up and got it funded and it remains
6 funded all... after all these years and so campuses
7 across the country benefit from this but our campus
8 childcare center directors have been quite successful
9 in writing these grants.

10 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: To Commissioner
11 Ebanks in your testimony you talked about vouchers
12 and you talked about... well particularly related to
13 vouchers... [cross-talk]

14 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...what's the average
16 value of a voucher and is it... does it... is there a
17 scale or does everybody get the same amount and how
18 do people apply for that?

19 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I, I don't have that
20 information on me but would ask... contact ACS and
21 bring that to you in follow up.

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I'd appreciate
23 that because I think that's important and then as you
24 talked about... also in your testimony you talk about
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 74

2 the Mayor's initiative and you mentioned the early
3 learn programs... [cross-talk]

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...there was an issue
6 with the programs under the previous administration
7 in that these RFPs went out and people responded and
8 groups that had no ties or understanding to the
9 children in the community that they were applying to
10 be... to be directors of the programs, there was a big
11 disconnect... [cross-talk]

12 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...and a lot of
14 community based organizations that had delivered
15 services for years lost funding, didn't qualify,
16 didn't make the cut and then we had our children in,
17 in programs that were administered by people who had
18 no cultural connection to the students and in fact
19 had to then go and ask the previous program operators
20 how do you do this... [cross-talk]

21 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...can you come and
23 work on my staff under my program... [cross-talk]

24 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 75

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...and that's a
3 problem... [cross-talk]

4 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Yes...

5 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's a problem so
6 what are we doing to ensure that the staff that's
7 teaching our children has a sense of cultural
8 awareness, respect for the history of the children
9 that they're teaching, what are we doing to ensure
10 that that's happening?

11 JACQUELINE EBANKS: I can only speak to
12 the fact that that is indeed the approach of the
13 current Chancellor and the Mayor right... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Oh, definitely the
15 current Chancellor... [cross-talk]

16 JACQUELINE EBANKS: ...that's the... that's...
17 [cross-talk]

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...definitely...

19 JACQUELINE EBANKS: Cultural competence
20 is key, a key strategy to building equity and
21 excellence in our schools and in our entire what I
22 consider educational system from early childcare on
23 up. The details of it however I'm not aware of at
24 this moment and that's something as I would
25 definitely reach out to DOE and bring back to you as

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 76

2 a follow up in terms of how are the addressing those
3 concerns in the early learn centers at this time.

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And the same
5 question goes to CUNY and, and particularly in terms
6 of the fact that as a child care center is going to
7 be opened soon, sooner rather than later, I
8 understand that it's going to be contracted, I
9 believe in a previous conversation I was told that
10 it's going to be contracted which is different from
11 the way that it functioned previously so if you could
12 talk to that please.

13 SHERRY CLEARY: So, this has been a
14 concern for us across the board, do the children have
15 teachers that know them, understand them, look like
16 them and, and is that something that we model as a
17 city university of New York and I want to recognize
18 Gian Luca Perizah who is our data person because we
19 have really spent a lot of time looking at those
20 details, who are the children, what is their race,
21 race and ethnicity and who are our teachers and
22 leaders and what is their race and ethnicity and does
23 it match and I am... I will make a commitment to you
24 that next time we'll bring you a picture of that but
25 we have been looking at that data for several weeks

1
2 now and I am really proud to say that in fact at this
3 moment and clearly for the last several years it, it
4 does... it does look great, that is something we are
5 really proud of that, that when you look at staff and
6 children there is this connection. How that works
7 with a, a, a site that's doing contracting, the best
8 I can tell you is that this contractor has another
9 contract with another campus at CUNY and we have
10 analyzed their child and staff race and ethnicity and
11 it's... and it's intact, it is matching and it is
12 strong and so we are expecting that at this campus
13 the same will be the case that they will hire with
14 that mindset guiding their choices.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'll, I'll be
16 looking to see that and I would expect that that
17 would happen because as I look at the institution of
18 CUNY and as I look at the... those who are in the top
19 echelons, presidents, provost, the deans, they do not
20 in fact reflect the student population so I'll be
21 looking very carefully... I've talked to the Chancellor
22 and he's indicated that he's very much aware of that
23 and that that's a priority of his and we know that
24 there's a grand opportunity with so many vacancies in
25 presidencies in CUNY campuses so that's what we're

2 looking for, that's what we're looking for because
3 there's been a steady decline in the number of blacks
4 who are in significant upper, upper echelon positions
5 in CUNY and we're looking to see that that is
6 corrected and if you could please give us... you gave
7 us this great chart with the child care center
8 enrollment numbers, if we could have that
9 desegregated by ethnicity or race for each of the
10 centers that you have we would appreciate.. [cross-
11 talk]

12 SHERRY CLEARY: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...that as well.

14 SHERRY CLEARY: I will do that.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.. [cross-talk]

16 SHERRY CLEARY: Thank you, we're working...
17 we're... it's, it's almost done.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, that's...

19 [cross-talk]

20 SHERRY CLEARY: So, we're working on it...

21 [cross-talk]

22 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...that's fine. There
23 are a lot of technical questions which I think
24 perhaps we can put on paper, I don't want to extend
25 that time and there are other, others that are here

2 so all of the questions that I have stars next to on
3 my question sheet I will put them to paper and ask if
4 you would... oh, student activity fees, that one I do
5 want to ask. Okay. So, particularly for childcare
6 centers it says that there's a two dollar fee for
7 child development per semester and previously that it
8 included the same amount per semester for the
9 childcare center during the time that the center here
10 was closed and we know some people say it's only two
11 dollars but as I said when I... when I was attending
12 Hunter I didn't have to pay tuition but I had to get
13 that 15 cents for that token to be able to get to
14 school, the little token with the little Y in the
15 middle so two dollars is two dollars so did you
16 collect that fee of two dollars and if you did what...
17 where did it go since there was not a childcare
18 center here or how was that money applied?

19 VINCENT BOUDREAU: So, the money hasn't
20 been spent, the money was collected... was collected
21 during those years, it is intact in an account and
22 will be used to, to make the cost of childcare for
23 students more affordable.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: But I would think
25 that students would want the benefit of their fees

2 during the time that they're students not putting it
3 into a trust or to be used later, it doesn't seem
4 that that's fair that they're charged the fee and
5 they don't get to benefit what they're paying that
6 fee for.

7 VINCENT BOUDREAU: I think if we were at
8 the start of the process and we knew how long it
9 would have taken we probably would have gone a
10 different way I, I agree that its... that it... in
11 retrospect it seems like we probably could have done
12 something differently. I will say that, that we now
13 have a, a good fund that will be entirely devoted to
14 students using the, the childcare facility so..

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Students used it..
16 oh, the childcare center... [cross-talk]

17 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Yeah, it's... it only
18 goes to remediate the cost of childcare for students
19 using the facility... [cross-talk]

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... but again I
21 think that, you know again some might... some people
22 might say it's only two dollars but I think that it
23 would have shown an acknowledgement hey, we don't
24 have a childcare center so this two dollars you get
25 to keep... [cross-talk]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 81

2 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Could go back... [cross-
3 talk]

4 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...for a snack or
5 whatever it is. And does CUNY have an opportunity or
6 do you refer students who are parents to facilities
7 or will you be able to do that going forward if
8 there's not enough space on campus to identify a
9 nearby facility that could provide those kinds of
10 services?

11 SHERRY CLEARY: Absolutely.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay... [cross-talk]

13 SHERRY CLEARY: So, one of my visions is
14 this, every CUNY campus childcare center is an
15 exemplar in the community and that other programs can
16 see that program as the highest quality program but
17 at the same... so, at the same time I would hope that
18 our campus childcare centers would be getting... would
19 be building relationships with their neighborhood
20 counterparts and help fill those sites as their sites
21 become full so yes, that seems like the most logical
22 thing to do as we're trying to build out our, our
23 massive capacity at CUNY, yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'm sure that I've
25 overlooked some important questions but I think I've

2 gotten most of them in and once again those that I
3 overlooked I will ask my counsel to put in writing
4 and send to you... [cross-talk]

5 SHERRY CLEARY: Please... [cross-talk]

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: ...but I do thank you
7 for coming and for your testimony and look forward to
8 coming back soon for the ribbon cutting.

9 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Be happy... we'll be
10 there.

11 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much.

12 VINCENT BOUDREAU: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: And we will now call
14 our next panel. Thank you. Timothy Hunter from USS;
15 Shepard McDaniel from Morales-Shakur Center and
16 Jamell Henderson, CUNY Rising Alliance Coordinator.
17 There's four? That's it, just those three, okay.

18 [off mic dialogue]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: CUNY is leaving
20 somebody behind, right? They usually do because CUNY
21 usually leaves somebody to hear the rest of the
22 testimony, see they're probably just ushering those
23 out and somebody from CUNY I'm sure will come back.
24 Okay, okay, somebody from CUNY is still here. Okay,

1
2 thank you, you can give us your name, I'll start on
3 my far left. Jamell you can start.

4 JAMELL HENDERSON: Okay. Good afternoon,
5 my name is Jamell Henderson, I am the CUNY Rising
6 Alliance Coordinator and I am a proud four-time CUNY
7 graduate receiving degrees from the Borough of
8 Manhattan Community College, Baruch College, Brooklyn
9 College and most recently the Graduate Center. I'm
10 here on behalf of the CUNY Rising Alliance which is a
11 coalition of 30 plus organizations and growing that
12 are focused on asking the city and state to fully
13 fund CUNY once again. What's happening right now
14 Madame Chairperson is that the world is beginning to
15 see the real CUNY experience. For many years there's
16 been a lot of overshadowing of the great, wonderful
17 work that respected campuses are doing; Baruch,
18 Brooklyn College highlighting all these favorable
19 statistics of their diversity, their opportunities
20 and their programs but yet the public does not
21 realize the everyday experience that students are
22 facing. I want to say publicly and as I've said
23 before and I'll say it again as long as I am here on
24 this earth that the students of the City University
25

1 of the... of New York are the most powerful and boldest
2 students anywhere on earth.
3

4 [applause]

5 JAMELL HENDERSON: And the reason why I
6 say that is because unlike any other campus across
7 this country they have to deal with the reality of
8 the concrete jungle known as New York City. Many
9 campus students who go away to campus they deal with
10 whatever is happening on their campus, they don't get
11 to go and deal with the hustle and bustle of life,
12 students do and when we're looking at an issue of
13 understanding the real CUNY experience there are
14 single mothers right now, there are single fathers
15 right now on campuses that do not have child care in
16 the City University of New York and they are trying
17 to figure out what to do in the midst of finals week.
18 This is going on right now. The mere fact that the
19 City College of New York, the flagship college for
20 CUNY which focuses on the mission to be a vital
21 importance as a vehicle for the upward mobility of
22 the disadvantaged of the City of New York. I find it
23 disheartening that while the mission says to help the
24 disadvantaged, administration is taking advantage of
25 the disadvantaged. There is a problem that in 2019

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 85

1
2 parents who are black and brown students in the city
3 of New York are still being taking advantage of while
4 they're trying to have the opportunity to pursue
5 higher education. Earlier, you know the President
6 said there's things still working in progress, a mile
7 down from here is a prestigious elite college known
8 as Columbia University and I asked myself the
9 question, I wonder if the parents who are students at
10 that university have to deal with one tenth or one
11 percent of the experiences that student have to deal
12 with here and the answer is no, not be... just because
13 of the fact that it is a private university and that
14 they receive, you know private funding but because
15 when students say that they need a service it is
16 taken care of for the integrity of the university and
17 yet here we are almost 170 years later in an
18 environment that has rapidly changed in a historic
19 village known as Harlem, students are still
20 experiencing lack of childcare, it is not their fault
21 that students who have children should not be able to
22 find an opportunity where they can place their child
23 safely, where they can learn while their mother or
24 father is leaning. These are the everyday hustle and
25 bustle and grit that mothers and fathers that are

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 86
3 black and brown in our communities consistently deal
4 with. The administration should be ashamed of itself
5 for constantly lying blatantly and subliminally to
6 the students of City College, it makes no sense that
7 now students have to hear today that their funding is
8 apparently safe when classes of 14, 15, 16, 17, 18
9 and most presently 19 have come and gone without any
10 childcare service, this is unfair and this is
11 unacceptable and on behalf of the entire alliance we
12 say to the administration, we say to the people of
13 the city of New York that what's happening here and
14 other campuses across CUNY is unacceptable and this
15 is exactly why we're going to be consistently
16 committed to fighting for full funding of CUNY. Thank
17 you very much.

18 [applause]

19 SHEPARD MCDANIEL: Good afternoon, my
20 name is Shepard McDaniel, I'm here representing both
21 as the Co-Chairperson of the Black Student Union at
22 Hunter College Alumni Committee and also a member of
23 the Executive Committee for the glamor Morales-Shakur
24 Center at City College which is still in exile right
25 now. First and foremost, I would like to recognize
the late, great Professor Jerry Price who was the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 87

Director for a number of years of the original
childcare center here at City College, she lived
right on Convent Avenue, was part of the community
which I think is extremely important that we
recognize the connection between the community and
this campus here. Having attended Hunter College we
didn't have a campus so City College was always our
brother/sister campus and we did a lot of our work
here even to the point of during the 80's we did a
fundraiser for the childcare center out of Hunter.
Some of you might remember a play called the Diary of
Black Men that was out there in that time and we
actually organized a... two features sold out to
benefit the children and the staff and the faculty of
City College at that center and that said its
extremely important that we maintain those facilities
that we have on these campuses and that we
continuously protect them and increase the existence
of these facilities for our students and for the
communities that these campuses rely on. This campus
must have that center back again, it's important for
students, many students have graduated from this
facility that were able to utilize the childcare
center, childcare is an extremely important aspect to

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 88
2 student life, many students have had to leave college
3 because they were unable to take care of their
4 children due to the finances that exist so we have to
5 put all of that into perspective as we move forward
6 with this. I want to thank the City Council and
7 Council Chair Inez Barron and the rest of the folks
8 who have put this together right here on this campus
9 which for us is still ground zero with our struggle
10 to bring back the Morales-Shakur Center one every
11 campus, we need to have facilities where students are
12 able to organize, to congregate and to love the... and
13 work with each other like we did back in the 70's
14 when I was at Hunter, peace.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

16 TIMOTHY HUNTER: Good, good afternoon
17 everyone. My name is Timothy Hunter, I'm the Student
18 Government President of New York City College
19 Technology, the University Student Center Chairperson
20 and Student Trustee for CUNY. I see a lot of friends
21 and familiar faces in the crowd and I'm really
22 disappointed that we couldn't have the rest of CUNY
23 stick, stick around for this because I think that
24 there's some important things that I want to discuss
25 and highlight today especially in regards to the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 89

2 childcare center, you know I think Jamell brought up
3 a good point about the history of CUNY and like City
4 College being a flagship college and I know Council
5 Woman Inez Barron, you know thank you for having us
6 here today but I also want to thank you for bringing
7 up history, you know today she talked about, you know
8 what happened 28 years ago where those nine students,
9 those young people lost their lives and a lot of
10 other people, you know has experienced history here
11 in a much more radical way as well. When we look back
12 at open enrollment, you know that fight was started
13 on this campus... [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's right..
15 [cross-talk]

16 TIMOTHY HUNTER: ...so just to remind
17 everyone of the context is... and the historical
18 significance of now having a women of color who has
19 benefited from CUNY sitting in a space where she can
20 make decisions and kind of like impact, you know CUNY
21 on a much higher level than anyone could have
22 fathomed back then, I'd just like to thank you for
23 having us one more time. There's... you know I'm, I'm
24 going to try to keep it brief because the fellow
25 students that I have here they have finals and

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 90

2 they're here during finals week after a crazy day on
3 Monday so again thank you all for coming out and also
4 I think that there's just three things that I want to
5 touch on and it's not even bringing up new things,
6 it's just some echoing the sentiments and
7 highlighting some key questions that the Council
8 Woman had asked and since CUNY isn't here to hear it
9 we'll just... I'll just address it to the crowd. The
10 number one... the first question that she asked was
11 about the, the demographic of the students that this
12 childcare center is, is serving. I think that that's
13 a super, super, super important highlight because as
14 it is, you know promotion of student support services
15 are, are never really prevalent in our university and
16 sometimes a lot of these things, a lot of these like
17 you know referendums, a lot of these things that are
18 done are done through students and when those
19 students that put that there leave there's no
20 institutional knowledge to keep the other students
21 aware of what's been happening. So, like if a student
22 decides like hey, listen we're going to get all these
23 people around, we're going to do a referendum, we're
24 going to get... I don't know let's say a vending
25 machine for everybody just hypothetically speaking

1
2 and everybody knows that that vending machine is
3 there for those couple years, someone is going to
4 maintain it, two years pass, three years pass, four
5 years pass and then the next you know the vending
6 machine is not getting filled, next thing you know
7 the vending machine breaks and no one cares to fix it
8 because a student put it there and administration
9 declines and neglects to maintain it, you know the
10 Council Woman said a failure, failure to inspect is
11 kind of like... is basically like you're neglecting it,
12 right. The second question that I want to bring up is
13 much more around the, the factors of the funding of
14 the childcare center. I think that this is super
15 important and it needs to be highlighted because
16 Jumaane Williams did a tour, I'm not sure if some of
17 you have heard of York College and.. where he looked
18 at facilities and he's also a former Council Member
19 but he looked at facilities all across the school,
20 York College is one of our senior colleges in Jamaica
21 Queens serves a, a particular demographic of students
22 coming from low socioeconomic areas across the city
23 and they have their student governments pretty much
24 funding a lot of the things that should be like
25 funded by the colleges, right. So, according to, you

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 92

know Student Government President Kershman [sp?] and everybody else their... the computer lab is running student government basically, you got what I'm saying. A student activity fee is being used in ways that in my opinion shouldn't be used and I think that this highlights my big question about where that money is and who's benefiting from that money but also the transparency. Every single time I speak to the Chancellor, every single time I speak to elected officials I just... I try to harp on transparency because we're here and we just don't know what's happening. Believe it or not like there's CUNY bylaws that mandate for student activity fee that there's an association, right so you're supposed to have association, they're supposed to be if my memory is serving me correctly here, two administrators, two faculty members and then I think two independent directors and then at least up to six students, right but this is the only thing like out of all the fees that we have this is the only... up until recently with the tech fee is the only like board that we have where students have the majority because it's their money so every single student that's paying the student activity fee and then the student government

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 93

president and the treasurer is mandated to sit on the board both of whom for City College we have here and will be testifying and then after that they would have other students that were elected they basically make decisions on behalf of all the students here. So, what happens on some campuses is the president or the designee chairs the meeting, they go about what's been spent the previous years, they have a spread sheet, they project enrollment, they tell student government how much their budget is, how much the budget is for things like CUNY athletics, things like the childcare center, etcetera, etcetera and sometimes it's very detailed and they have votes and then they like going back... a little bit confrontation sometimes, how about other campuses the student government president will enter the room with their members, they would see some numbers on the paper and then it's like do you have any question and you just came in as a new student government president so you don't know anything and you don't know what CUNY bylaws is, you haven't read it yet, you just got elected because you wanted to, you know bring the childcare center back and you don't realize all the other bureaucracies that, that like come with that

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 94

2 and then you know they just tell you okay let's vote
3 on it, is there any questions, you vote on it, the
4 quickest meeting of your life, you walk out of there,
5 you have your budget, they let you spend the money on
6 your parties and everything like that but deep down
7 there's five or six earmarks that have been
8 unchecked, right and I think that knowing that and
9 knowing the fact that someone can like, you know kind
10 of like sit here and like just clearly say like you
11 know like hey we're just going to be saving the money
12 for the next group, I mean I really hope that that
13 childcare center is the best childcare center in the
14 city because the amount of money that's been like
15 saved up for that I think that the students deserve
16 to benefit and don't get me wrong I'm pretty sure the
17 students would want to see other students succeed and
18 allow them to like to have a space for their like you
19 know... for their, their fellow students and their
20 children to kind of like stay and like play and learn
21 while they're also learning but at the same time I
22 realize that this may be a bigger conversation about
23 what other things haven't been checked, what other
24 earmarks are being just rolled over, how can we make
25 sure that we're maximizing the student experience

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 95

2 here because there are some campuses again like I
3 said they're walking into a room, they're just voting
4 on something and they're walking out and its, its,
5 its kind of hard to, to realize that because I myself
6 have benefited from like the right use of student
7 activity fee through USS, through gaining leadership
8 experience, I myself have benefited through that by..
9 you know one of my Senators just threw a law of
10 paralegal studies workshop to kind of like, you know
11 allow students to kind of never work with lawyers
12 that like... you know and all of them were black women
13 lawyers so like knowing that and knowing that we
14 could provide those experiences why are we
15 shortchanging the current students that are paying
16 those things, right so I would call for proof as... I'm
17 going to request that Council Woman Barron, you know
18 ask for those receipts, let's make sure that the
19 money is spent there because what's supposed to also
20 happen is if you want to access those reserves like
21 all the reserves are supposed to go into a line item
22 and currently according to like, you know the fiscal
23 accountability handbook which like I don't really see
24 it on the website right now but don't worry I have it
25 downloaded on my phone, the reserves are not supposed

1
2 to exceed a certain amount and a certain percentage
3 and however I can almost guarantee that on all the
4 campuses those reserves are pretty much like, you
5 know going a little bit above what that fiscal
6 accountability handbook is set forth. I also want to
7 just highlight that if this is going to be something
8 that we're going to do here I think that, you know
9 whoever is watching should also realize that, you
10 know this is not something that I'm taking lightly
11 because people fought for this to be here, USS people
12 fought for that, student government people fought for
13 that. At BMCC Assata Shakur used to very involved
14 with everything that happened on campus and I think
15 that's something that we want to create more of these
16 students that are like minded that understand why,
17 why it's so important to be engaged and involved on
18 campus because when we're not utilizing the student's
19 money the right way... it's one thing to take the money
20 from the students, it's another thing to like use it
21 in a way that's not beneficial to them, you know and
22 that's why I'm, I'm, I'm so vehemently against, you
23 know the, the, the wellness fee, I'm, I'm all for
24 health and wellness but knowing that the history of
25 fees if they're put there and they're never really

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 97

2 maintained even with tech fee at one point, you were
3 getting inside a room where like the faculty showed
4 up and they said well there's a tech fee, all
5 students are collecting this, the faculty is like we
6 knew this, knew this, knew this and the students are
7 just sitting there like okay, like you know you're
8 paying 100... almost 100, 100 and change every single
9 semester to basically maintain the technology
10 infrastructure of the school, why don't you have more
11 say, why don't we... like you know like why don't we
12 have pencils or something, like why is it that I can
13 only print ten copies a day when I'm spending 100
14 dollars and so like why is that going to go towards
15 something else that I'm not seeing directly and it's
16 the same thing with student activity fee, there's no
17 reason why we should be here saying that oh, listen
18 like I know it's finals week but I got to come
19 testify to let Councilwoman Barron know that even
20 though its in reserves that we need to make sure
21 we're asking for proof from it because we don't know
22 where that money is, right and I'm going to guarantee
23 you, you're going to hear from people that are..
24 their, their job is to figure out where that money is
25 and I'm, I'm pretty sure that they haven't got those

1 clear cut answers they were supposed to get either.

2 So, again I just want to highlight this as an issue

3 not only here but across all of CUNY, I think that's

4 something that we could probably take a close look

5 at. I know with the new Chancellor there I'm going to

6 be talking to him and having a conversation with him

7 about it as well because I think that, you know he

8 has a chance to do some, some big things here and

9 like you know put the university on the right path

10 for success but you know we face tuition hikes and

11 that goes towards labor reserves, we face fees upon

12 fees upon fees, there's no reason why a student

13 government president and a treasurer or anybody for

14 that matter can't go in there and get like

15 clarification on that, you know that's like my money

16 is going there, there's... like you know like you

17 should be able to just at least know, that should be

18 on a website, we should be able to see these things

19 like with two clicks of our phone, we shouldn't have

20 to come here and ask questions and get promises that

21 we don't know where our money is or its... you know and

22 secure account somewhere I guess but that's it for

23 me. Thank you.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 99

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I want to thank the panel for coming and for raising the issues that you have, I agree that students are powerful and they can make significant change as has been noted that's how we got open admission and I think that we need to continue to mobilize students, organize students and have them to actually cantonize the power that is sort of dormant or there but not really concentrated and a great... a great person, Assata Shakur, the Morales-Shakur Center... Assata Shakur Morales Center is important because those are people who were fighter people who challenged the system and made significant changes and in terms of the issues that you raised about reserves, I'm glad you raised them and as we get ready for the budget season those will be questions that I will include and will let them know in advance so that they can come prepared to answer those questions and I invite you to come to those budgetary... week in, in February... March, begin in March, okay so thank you very much for your presentation and if the Sergeant at Arms could add two more chairs to the table, one on each end then we will call the next panel.

[off mic dialogue]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 100

2 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: That's okay. And the
3 next panel will be Casan Calon Manjin [sp?], Nefatiti
4 Tsinghua [sp?], Frantzy Luzincourt and Rafael Smith
5 and Lankau Luca Laco Tsinghua [sp?]. I want to thank
6 our Sergeant at Arms and we want to thank the IT
7 people who came and prepared this hall for us so that
8 we would be able to have our hearing here, there's a
9 lot of work involved in the preparation for this set
10 up and we do thank them and acknowledge them. Oh, is
11 somebody not coming, I think I called..

12 FRANTZY LUZINCOURT: She couldn't make it
13 because she had to pick up.. [cross-talk]

14 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.. [cross-talk]

15 FRANTZY LUZINCOURT: ...her son and I'm
16 going to include that.. [cross-talk]

17 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay.. [cross-talk]

18 FRANTZY LUZINCOURT: ...I'm going to speak
19 on her behalf.

20 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, great, thank
21 you.

22 FRANTZY LUZINCOURT: So.. [cross-talk]

23 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Okay, I'll start on
24 my far left, you can begin with your testimony.

25 [off mic dialogue]

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 101

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Yes.

LANKAU TSINGHUA: Oh, alright. Well my name is Lankau Tsinghua and I'm a lifelong resident of, of Harlem, I'm also an alumni of City College, I'm a nurse midwife, I have a... my masters of education from Teachers College and my children attended this child development center back when it was... well its open and I'm, I'm very concerned, I, I didn't realize that the center had been closed for five, five long years depriving the students of, of such an essential service here. I, I attended City College and I couldn't have attended here if I didn't have a center that provided such a vital service. My children attended this, this center and their learning was so greatly enhanced at the child development center because the demographic of the, the teachers reflected the experiences, the ethnicity of the child development center. We fought long and hard, I remember we fought long and hard to keep the center open and now to see after five, five years of, of, of being deprived of the center, I'm, I'm really, really concerned about it. I'd also like to say that this, this daughter here she attended the child development center and I can remember how happy I was

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 102

2 the day that I got the notification that the twins..
3 I, I... they were twins, they are twins rather that
4 they could attend her. This, this child... this, this
5 young lady adult learning will graduate in May with
6 her doctorate in medicine so I, I, I can sort of see
7 how long ago and how... and the, the tenacity, the
8 perseverance I think was cultivated with Mama Jerry,
9 Geraldine Price at the child development center so we
10 must have our, our develop... our, our child
11 development center and I'm going to fight hard and
12 let my, my Council people know what, what is going on
13 her, I'm really appalled and, and I insist that we
14 have our development center because this here... this,
15 this person here and other students who followed her
16 have made an impact upon our... in, in our community.
17 Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

19 NEFATITI TSINGHUA: So, thank you so much
20 for, you know having us here, thank you honorable
21 Councilwoman. So, my name is Nefatiti Tsinghua [sp?],
22 daughter of this beautiful woman right here. I am a
23 proud alumni of child... sorry, I'm a, a proud alumni
24 of the child development center and when I heard
25 yesterday that the center was not open for, for

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 103

2 parents to, to take part in to, you know have their
3 children there I was extremely, extremely
4 disappointed and very... and angry actually. So, I also
5 studied at City College of New York on... years ago.
6 I've also been a student at BMCC, I've been a student
7 at Hunter College, I've been a professional student
8 and that just shows my tenacity in terms of, you know
9 working towards my goals and I'm also as my mom said
10 I'm, I'm also a student at City... at SUNY upstate
11 finishing up my medical school and graduating in a
12 few months. So, all that to say thank you so much,
13 all that to say is that programs like these early
14 childhood development programs are essential, they're
15 essential for the children of Harlem, they're
16 essential for our community and there needs to be a
17 level of urgency and making sure that these
18 institutions are open and they're allowing our
19 children to grow. Before I came here, I went to... I
20 went to pick up some bubble, bubble tea at a nearby...
21 a nearby spot, there was a child, a young black man
22 who ended up grab... ending up grabbing a, a cell phone
23 behind the counter, he was sort of lingering around,
24 it just... it, it, it just makes sense to me that like
25 these children need support, they need to be in

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 104

2 school, he was maybe 13, 14 years old, they need to,
3 you know have important programing, they need to have
4 arts, they need to have institutions like the child
5 development center which Mama Jerry founded and
6 directed and put so much love and so much energy
7 into, they need to have programs like these. It's
8 really important that we enrich our communities with
9 institutions like these and it's, it's, it's vital. I
10 know that... if I did not have the foundation that I
11 did at the childcare... at the child development center
12 I would not be where I am today, I can tell you that
13 right now. I would not be here; I would not have
14 been... I would not have gotten this far if I had not
15 had the, the sort of love, the nurturing and what
16 mean by that is that the child development center is
17 a special place, it was always a special place, I
18 felt nurtured, I felt that my... I felt... I felt
19 positive in terms of the, the sort of... I felt
20 positive in terms of how my cultural heritage was
21 appreciated and was honored, learning how important
22 it was to love myself, all of these things are super
23 important vital for, for children who look like me
24 and many of you here. It's important that they have...
25 it's important that they, they have, you know love

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 105

2 and appreciation for their culture for who they are
3 and the, the work of Mama Jerry and all of the
4 faculty there, brother Ralph, these individuals
5 instilled positive self-esteem in our children. We
6 must continue to have institutions like this, and we
7 must continue to fight for, for this as well. I'll
8 stop there, thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you.

10 FRANTZY LUZINCOURT: Good afternoon. My
11 name is Frantzy Luzincourt and I have the pleasure of
12 serving as the President for the Undergraduate
13 Student Government here at the City College of New
14 York. First and foremost, I would be remiss to say,
15 if I did not say rather that it takes a lot of
16 courage, a lot of dedication and a lot of commitment
17 for students to come here on this cold Wednesday
18 during finals... [cross-talk]

19 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Uh-huh... [cross-talk]

20 FRANTZY LUZINCOURT: ...to fight for a
21 service that their predecessors and they have paid
22 for that they actually do not have access to, right.
23 A lot of students in this room that were here
24 including myself and the students next to me we did
25 not come here out of convenience, but we came here

1
2 out of necessity, right. I have a final tonight, I
3 have a final tomorrow and I'm on two hours of sleep
4 and that's the similar story of a lot of people in
5 this room but we decided to come here today because
6 we understand the importance of the childcare center
7 and what that can do for CCNY students. And it was a
8 little disappointing to see that a lot of the members
9 of the CUNY administration could not stay to hear our
10 voices especially when we're the ones with the
11 pressure of finals that we have to deal with. Second
12 I would like to also highlight that the elected
13 student leaders on this campus who would love to have
14 the opportunity to join you at that tour of the
15 childcare center, we were never... besides today we did
16 not even know the tour... a tour was a possibility and
17 we look forward to cherish the opportunity to see the
18 childcare center firsthand and what we can do to help
19 make that process as expeditious as possible
20 especially when us as students are the ones paying
21 each year for this service and to this day despite
22 our continued efforts and our continuous reaching out
23 to the different administrators on this campus we
24 still do not know the exact money in the reserves and
25 I'm not going to beat a dead horse but we echo the

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 107

1
2 sentiments that we need to see those numbers as soon
3 as possible. I will now spend the rest of my time
4 reading the testimony on behalf of one of our
5 Senators, Rafaela Smith who could not make it today
6 because she had to pick up her son from school, right
7 and it is important that we hear her voice and
8 elevate her voice because her story is what we're
9 here to fight for, to fight for her future, her
10 graduation and her family. So, I will start and again
11 this Rafaela Smith. As a transfer student I have
12 great love and appreciation for the opportunity I've
13 been given to realize my educational and personal
14 goals at the City College of New York. That being
15 said the greatest difficulty I have had and continue
16 to have as a working single mother is secure
17 childcare. As a result, I have had to... I've had... I
18 have had to bring my son to class which many
19 professors have been obliging even though it was a
20 huge distraction to them and my fellow students.
21 Because there is no childcare on my campus my son is
22 usually found in the halls when I'm in class or I end
23 up missing them altogether to avoid disruption. What
24 have made matters worse are the professors that is
25 not on... that are as not understanding of this problem

1 causing me to delay my graduation a full year at
2 great economic hardship for myself. I'm going to
3 repeat that sentence, what have made matters worse
4 are the professors that are not as understanding of
5 this problem causing me to delay my graduation a full
6 year at a great economic hardship for myself. My
7 education is supposed to push myself and my family
8 further not hamper those goals of generational
9 economic growth. So, we have a story of a single
10 mother, a black woman from this community who's a
11 student leader, a senator of Undergraduate Student
12 Government who has had their graduation pushed and
13 additional economic... an additional academic year
14 which adds an additional economic burden knowing that
15 each year tuition is going up because of the
16 struggles they faced because they could not find a
17 place to place their child because there was no
18 childcare center. If you take anything from what I've
19 said over the last few minutes understand that you're
20 hurting people like Rafaela from getting their degree
21 because the childcare center is not open and each
22 year that this delays there are going to be more and
23 more people like this. So, thank you for your time
24 and I really do call on everyone in this room to hold
25

1
2 ourselves accountable, hold the necessary people
3 accountable to open the childcare center as soon as
4 possible, thank you.

5 CASAN CALON MANJIN: Greetings everybody.

6 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Greetings.

7 CASAN CALON MANJIN: My name is Casan
8 Calon Manjin [sp?], I'm a black studies major here at
9 City College, I'm also a graduate from BMCC, my
10 mother also attended BMCC and when I... when we were
11 about two years old me and my twin brother she would
12 take us to class so we were sitting in the math class
13 now I clearly remember yelling out the number four to
14 answer the professor's question, I don't know if that
15 was right but she only has six credits, she wasn't
16 able to complete her degree but she was able to
17 complete her degree. Education is an exponential
18 factor and my family would be in a much different
19 position if she had an associate degree and that's,
20 that's a fact. Currently I serve as the Vice
21 President of Finance for Undergraduate Student
22 Government and in my capacity its, it's my task to
23 monitor where the finances are going on this campus
24 and I've taken that job very seriously some people
25 might say too serious but I say that's not your

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 110

1 business and doing this I've seen that the finances
2 is, is, is not what it seems. We come to the campus
3 and we pay our tuition, we pay our fees and we expect
4 to, to, to get services out of it. The majority of
5 the services that we're supposed to receive we aren't
6 and the students that should be deciding where these
7 funds are going are not included in all the
8 conversations and on several occasions I've asked,
9 requested, demanded financial information on
10 different services on this campus, where is the money
11 going, how is it being managed and a lot of times,
12 you know they play the, the, the goose chase and
13 throw me some... throw me to another office and... I mean
14 these are the games they play but understanding that
15 they can't play this forever like at some point
16 you're going to have to show the information, you're
17 going to have to show the finances maybe not to us
18 but the students coming after us may not be as kindly
19 requesting and looking at the, the documentation,
20 the, the... president Boudreau he mentioned that the
21 situation going on with DASNY, I acknowledge this,
22 yes, it is a... it's a blind process, you're getting
23 the lowest bid, it's not always the best... you're
24 getting the lowest bid, you're not going to get the
25

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 111
2 best... the best person to do the job, it's going to be
3 a low quality job, it's probably going to take longer
4 than it has to and as students in CUNY we don't
5 deserve low quality, we deserve the best quality. So,
6 looking at, at DASNY's, DASNY'S current active
7 contracts with, with the City College of New York you
8 can see that... you can... you can go on the website
9 right and you can look it up, it's, it's up to date...
10 I mean the, the dates change every month so if you
11 look at the childcare center it's always going to say
12 it's going to open next month, it's going to open
13 next month, it's going to open next month but the
14 numbers aren't, aren't... the numbers are also
15 changing, the numbers are increasing because as, as
16 the projects are, are being continued the, the cost
17 of, of these operations is, is inflating and.. I mean
18 of course it's going to benefit the contractors, it's
19 going to benefit anybody that's like constructing
20 this but it's not benefiting the students so the
21 childcare center is only one of these projects going
22 on so if you're going to invest in... investigate in
23 what's going on in the childcare center you have to
24 investigate in all the other contracts going on here
25 at City College also. So, looking at the numbers you

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 112
2 got the, the Steinman and Shepard hall elevator to be
3 upgraded for 12 million, you got the Marshak pool and
4 locker-room renovation to be upgraded for 17 million,
5 you got the NAC Central Plant phase two to be
6 upgraded for 51 million, Baskerville Hall interior
7 six, six million, the essential upgrade in NAC that's
8 at 33 million and that projects been going on since
9 2004 and it's not expected to finish until 2020. So,
10 I mean looking at, at a project like that it makes me
11 wonder if the daycare center might not be done for
12 another 16 years so then, then, then you got the
13 Schiff House daycare center renovation that's looking
14 at 8,000 dollars which was... [cross-talk]

15 [off mic dialogue]

16 CASAN CALON MANJIN: Eight, eight, eight
17 million dollars and that was started in January of
18 2018 and it, its said to be completed December 2019.
19 Last... two months ago, so it was going to be completed
20 November 2019 so everything is pushed in the back,
21 pushed in the back so really we have to look at all
22 the projects because it's just not a, a single issue,
23 I mean it's a... it's a... it's a very important issue
24 but it, it comes even closer to how is our, our
25 finances being managed, how are the people that we

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 113

2 entrust to make decisions on our behalf making these
3 decisions and is it really on our behalf like are,
4 are we ones that, that they have in mind when, when
5 they're having these discussions and, and a lot of
6 times it's in, in closed rooms where the students are
7 not even invited or if, if, if the, the meeting takes
8 place they strategically put it at times where the
9 students cannot attend. So, the student activity fee
10 as mentioned so we do pay the two dollars. As, as
11 student government we sit on the... on the, the SSC
12 which is the Student Services Committee and, and
13 that's the committee that is, is charged with
14 overseeing the, the budget for the childcare center
15 so you got 57,000 dollars coming in every year and it
16 rolls over as a surplus but then when I go to the
17 talent of the student services committee I'm like
18 where is that money is going, she's like well it's
19 not in my jurisdiction so then I go to the accountant
20 of, of the... of the... of the campus of the auxiliary
21 and the Vice President of Finance I'm asking these
22 questions they're like well we don't really know so
23 I'm like give me the documentation of when the
24 childcare center went bankrupt, nobody wants to give
25 me that information either so the questions that,

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 114

2 that, that come about is where is... where is the two
3 dollars that we're giving in every year going which
4 over the past five years is coming up to about
5 250,000 dollars, that's 250,000 dollars that students
6 could be using today, that's 250,000 dollars that
7 students could be using to eat, for transportation,
8 for, for housing, for scholarships, right. The
9 services that, that we need the money doesn't have to
10 be just for child care, it could be allocated to, to
11 whatever is needed for today and if, if, if its not
12 being used it should have been suspended and this,
13 this is only hinting at the fact the fact that the
14 student activity fees are not being utilized in ways
15 that the students want it to be so we get the
16 technology fee that comes in, the... our, our
17 Chairperson he spoke on that and we get the health
18 and wellness fee that's coming in. So, the health and
19 wellness fee is, is going to be very similar to this
20 but soon I think we'll be able to decide where the
21 funding is going but half of that is going to be
22 going to personnel, it's going to be going to pay for
23 operations for the campuses and really the students
24 should not be paying for operations, we should not be
25 paying for personnel, we should be paying for our own

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 115

2 services and there's, there's a... there's a person
3 that I want to acknowledge historically and that's
4 Shirley Chisholm as a... as a graduate from Oakland
5 College, as Director of, of childcare and then as
6 founder of SEEK so she's, she's paved, paved the way
7 for leaders like myself and for childcare programs
8 and, and, and EOP programs and student services to be
9 available for students today and to be able to, to
10 create a better future you have to acknowledge the
11 leaders from the past that, that have done this
12 already and what I... what I'll, I'll finish... I'll
13 finish with this, all the service that... all of the
14 services that we should be receiving is a human
15 right, education is a human right, child services is
16 a human right, to have a hot meal is a human right,
17 to have some place to sleep at night is a human
18 right, to feel like the people around you care about
19 you is a human right so why are we being denied these
20 rights on this campus, why are we being... why are you
21 being divided, why are the forcing us to fight each
22 other for the finances that we contributed to this
23 institution while they take the finances and move it
24 to their own salaries, move it to their, their own
25 initiatives and I would also for, for the Council I

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 116
2 would suggest looking into, into the ACS program, the
3 admission there that's taking place on this campus, a
4 lot of funding is being contributed.. allocated to, to
5 that initiative, it's, it's... in theory it's a great
6 initiative, you have foster children who, who, who
7 are, are receiving housing, they're receiving food
8 and.. but it, it... I believe that it should be more
9 closely monitored, more closely audited and just,
10 just to understand how it fits in the greater scheme
11 of, of this campus. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you and we've
13 been joined on this panel by Fay Yanofsky..

14 FAY YANOFSKY: Fay.

15 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: I'm sorry, Fay
16 Yanofsky and I'm going to ask the Sergeant at Arms if
17 you can bring one more chair and we'll ask Joseph
18 Robertson to join and he'll be the last person so
19 that we don't start another one, if you can add one
20 more chair. Sorry you're not really at the table but
21 everybody scoots down a little bit they could make a
22 little room for you, always room for one more, right?

23 FAY YANOFSKY: Yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you, so at
25 this time we'll hear from Fay.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 117

2 FAY YANOFSKY: Good afternoon, my name is
3 Fay Yanofsky, I am the elected Brooklyn College named
4 Delegate to USS and I'm also the Vice Chair of Fiscal
5 Affairs at USS. I, I wanted to, to open by saying
6 thank you for your questions Chair Barron and thought
7 you asked excellent questions to the administration
8 and, and I, I really appreciate your questions. It's,
9 it's... you don't... you don't find... it's, it's not that...
10 it's very hard to find a bold leader who will ask
11 straight questions and I... and I really want to
12 applaud you and express my appreciation for your
13 questions. What, what I personally believe today is
14 I, I saw something and I witnessed something that I,
15 I have never seen before and I'm... and I am saying
16 this because I don't go here but I, I do represent... I
17 do represent the students on the university student
18 senate, and I have not seen an administration be so
19 disrespectful to the students with my own eyes, I
20 mean that was all I had to see to understand that
21 there's no fiscal accountability here because this is
22 a hearing on childcare centers that have not... that
23 have been charging students money from 2015, 2016,
24 2017, 2018, and 2019, they have provided no services
25 and when you ask them questions about accountability

1
2 it didn't reserve... I mean that's unacceptable from...
3 I'm, I'm the Vice Chair of Fiscal Affairs and I'm
4 saying that that's unacceptable because I've never
5 seen any... I mean there's, there's just no
6 transparency with, with finances, I've never seen
7 something like that, I've never encountered such a
8 disrespectful administration to the students so
9 that's just something that I wanted to say and I have
10 never seen an administrative... an administration stand
11 up and leave the room when students are speaking,
12 I've never seen that before so that's all you need to
13 know and report back and, and when, when you... when
14 you say that we need to have people that, that, that
15 look like the students and I agree and that's very
16 important and I also want to say that when we have
17 presidents, when we have an administration and
18 students particularly low income students are looking
19 for leadership, we're looking for role models and
20 when you have something like this occur on a campus
21 this is not a good... this is not a good model of
22 leadership, I've seen very good models, I'm, I'm
23 particularly impressed with my model at Brooklyn
24 College that I've not seen a model like this where
25 there's such disregard for, for student's opinions,

2 I've never been disrespected like this before so I
3 just wanted to express that. For the issue on
4 childcare at Brooklyn College it took my mom two
5 years, three years maybe, I don't know exact... I know
6 it took my mom seven years in total to graduate from
7 Kingsborough Community College in Brooklyn and
8 Brooklyn College and I would... and when my mom would
9 take me to her classes in Brooklyn College so... and,
10 and it's just... it's just a... it's, it's excellent that
11 I'm able to be here to talk about childcares today
12 and it's a very important issue but really what this
13 comes down to is fiscal accountability because I, I,
14 I don't know... I don't know what that was and when,
15 when you are looking to appoint people to these
16 positions we need to find people with good character
17 that we can look to emulate, role models for students
18 and diversity as well but I'm just saying that we
19 need to have ethical leadership leading us and
20 listening to the students and amplifying our voices
21 and working together with us. So, I want to say thank
22 you very much, thank you.

23 JOSEPH ROBERTSON: Hello everyone, my
24 name is Joseph Robertson. I want to say thank you to
25 Chairwoman Barron and I didn't initially plan on

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 120

2 testifying or speaking, this is my... well I
3 transferred in from SUNY Buffalo State College as an
4 EOP student and I'm current, currently attending
5 Queensboro Community College and as I'm sitting down
6 listening to everybody speak and hearing about the
7 numbers and while I'm sitting there I had to think
8 about my own experiences as a student. I myself I do
9 not have children, but my siblings are like my
10 children and I couldn't count how many times I had to
11 sacrifice sleep or me coming to class late because I
12 had to take care of my siblings. I'm currently also a
13 student organizer with CUNY Alliance and honestly I'd
14 like to thank them because they saved my life,
15 Currently upon me attending college I had to quit my
16 job in order to take classes and still make time to
17 be there for my siblings, my mother's health isn't
18 the best so it's like... and I'm the oldest of, of the...
19 of, of my siblings and it's like I'm more of a father
20 figure in their lives and it makes me think about
21 those students who don't get to switch roles, it
22 makes me understand the level of... even last night
23 when I had two finals due, five essays due all at 12
24 midnight and I'm at home and I can't focus because
25 there's a two year old who needs to eat, there's a, a

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 121

2 four year old running around who needs help with her
3 homework, there's also an 11 year old in the house
4 who has to play parent if I'm not around or if my
5 mother isn't feeling so well and those pressures roll
6 back onto the low income students and the, the people
7 who are really being affected by policies that don't
8 even know what's going on and I feel... I thank god
9 that I'm in this position because I'm at a point to
10 be educated, what about those students who don't have
11 answers, how do we communicate that message to them
12 if it's not broke has us to a point where people who
13 are making... the administration is, is literally like
14 blindfolding us and I feel like as a student who is
15 often forced to really sacrifice missing a class
16 because wow my mom's not home, now I have to take
17 care of my siblings, the students who are parents
18 can't make that discretion, it's like they don't...
19 they don't have that room for that comfortability, I
20 don't... I don't... they don't get to... okay, they can
21 take my... somebody can take my child there, they don't
22 have that and for a childcare center to not be
23 present on a campus that is so historic to the
24 community how is that acceptable and how do you still
25 have the decent... how do you have the integrity to,

1
2 to, to speak on how highly you rank the City
3 University's education when you can't even
4 demonstrate its capabilities to students who is
5 effected by it and I feel like as a low income
6 student who literally had to like... I remember taking
7 one summer not to work so I could really watch my
8 siblings like when I went away for those four years
9 when I was in Buffalo State College and I was away
10 for so long, only have to think about how is my
11 siblings doing, how are the children doing, how is
12 the baby doing and it's like if I'm a student who is
13 the mother of this child or the father of this child,
14 what am I to do, who am I focusing on, my, my thought
15 is not about my exam, my thoughts is not about... and
16 that's, that's, that's... even if I have the financial
17 accountability to not have to work so now I have to
18 balance maybe one or two jobs, I have to balance
19 class and that's even if I'm taking classes full time
20 or if I'm taking part time that means I'm not getting
21 full aid to cover my classes and now that's even more
22 room for other's expectations that I do not have and
23 for a childcare center not to be present for me to
24 make use and make, make at least some kind of formula
25 for me to have some sort of like action plan on how

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

1 COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 123

2 to take a, a course or a semester to a point where I
3 can see it accomplishable, what am I to do and I feel
4 like I just couldn't sit in my seat and not voice my
5 concerns for those students who don't get to speak
6 for students who aren't even here and I think god
7 that... and by me being an intern and being a student
8 organizer thank god that this is my... this is my job,
9 I wouldn't even call it my job, this is my life
10 because it was a moment where it's like I have to
11 just work. There are students like... I, I... at least I
12 get to be here now for me and it's like there are
13 people who, who don't have that, that access, they
14 don't have the access to opportunity or access to
15 these kind of knowledge and it's like as a student
16 how do we empower those others... as, as student
17 leaders how do we empower our students when they
18 don't even have the time to pay us attention and I
19 feel like it needs to be some sort of administration
20 formula where those kind of things are to the side of
21 the classroom, where we are present with what's going
22 on with our students, when we are present with how
23 these students are being affected, when there are
24 fees or tuition hikes that these students need to
25 know what's going on instead of just putting things

1
2 under the rug and whatever happens, happens and I
3 feel like as a student I'm tired of having all these
4 questions and no answers and not knowing where to run
5 to when I feel like by me being in a position that I
6 am now it only makes sense for me to speak up for
7 those who can't. So, thank you.

8 [applause]

9 CHAIRPERSON BARRON: Thank you so much, I
10 want to thank the panel and just a couple of
11 comments. Yes, the... sorry, the President and his team
12 did leave but we always have representatives from the
13 CUNY administration so I do want to acknowledge them,
14 they always stay through all of the testimony and
15 they do relay comments, questions, problems that are
16 brought up back to the appropriate level so I do want
17 to acknowledge that because I do appreciate that and
18 I think its important. Secondly I want to say
19 congratulations to our upcoming doctor, that's a
20 great accomplishment and is that your mom, that's
21 your mom, mom, that's your mom, congratulations mom,
22 you did a great job as well and to, to... now your gear
23 says Hunter, right? I don't have my glasses... [cross-
24 talk]

25 FAY YANOFSKY: CCNY.

COMMITTEE ON HIGHER EDUCATION JOINTLY WITH

COMMITTEE ON WOMEN AND GENDER EQUITY 125

CHAIRPERSON BARRON: CCNY, so you're at...

you're at... here and I appreciate all of that and I

hope that you can come to the hearing that we have

and perhaps you can even reach out to my legislative

director, I don't see her... oh, there she is and give

her some of the points that you raised, that's Indigo

Washington, she's my CUNY liaison and we would love

to have some of those questions that you raised

included when we have the hearings on budget that

will come up in February... no, March, I keep saying

February and, and certainly it's the panel such as

yourself and the panel before that are the whole

purpose and the significance of CUNY being here. Yes,

we know faculty does a great job and they bring forth

good information and they present stimulating skits,

scenarios and questions and get you going but

certainly you are the whole impotence and the whole

purpose for CUNY being here so we always appreciate

panels that are composed of students and advocates,

they bring a particular perspective which is why I

try to not put time limits on them but we do

appreciate your coming and sharing your expertise and

your experience and I'm so pleased to hear you say

very powerful statement that you made, you said CUNY

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

rising.. CUNY saved your life so that, that's a
powerful statement and, and we're so glad that that
opportunity did come to you and we wish you all the
very best as you go forward and seeing no other
persons who wish to testify, we all got... on our
phones and we will now conclude this hearing, this
hearing is adjourned. Thank you, we don't have a
gavel, so we'll improvise.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

December 31, 2019