

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

STATED MEETING

----- X

April 18, 2019  
Start: 1:17 p.m.  
Recess: 3:32 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: LAURIE A. CUMBO  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: ADRIENNE E. ADAMS  
ALICKA AMPRY-SAMUEL  
DIANA AYALA  
JUSTIN BRANNAN  
MARGARET S. CHIN  
ANDREW COHEN  
COSTA CONSTANTINIDES  
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, Jr.  
RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, Jr.  
MATHIEU EUGENE  
BARRY GRODENCHIK  
ROBERT HOLDEN  
BEN KALLOS  
ANDY KING  
PETER KOO  
KAREN KOSLOWITZ  
RORY I. LANCMAN  
CARLOS MENCHACA  
I. DANEEK MILLER  
FRANCISCO MOYA  
BILL PERKINS

KEITH POWERS  
                  ANTONIO REYNOSO (PLEASE  
VERIFY, VOICE VERY FAINT)  
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS  
CARLINA RIVERA  
YDANIS RODRIGUEZ  
DEBORAH ROSE  
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL  
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, Jr.  
MARK TREYGER  
PAUL VALLONE  
JIMMY VAN BRAMER  
KALMAN YEGER  
LAURIE A. CUMBO  
COREY JOHNSON

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Maurice Jenkins  
Executive Vice President  
United Negro College Fund

Cindy Falconer

Dennis Brown

Honorable Mayor David N. Dinkins

Dr. Thomas A. Isekenegbe  
President  
Bronx Community College

Dr. William Lupfer  
Trinity Church  
75 Broadway

2 CLERK: [sound check]This is a test.

3 This is a test. Today's date is April 18, 2019, on  
4 the Stated Meeting, by Steven Sadowsky. [pause]

5 CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Hello and welcome to  
6 the New York City Council. Thank you all so much for  
7 being here. I see you all in the balcony  
8 representing. Today is Green Day and we are so proud  
9 to welcome you all here for our incredible Earth Day  
10 legislation package that is going to be passed today.

11 And we so honored because today is a very special  
12 day. The New York City Council is proud to honor the  
13 75th anniversary of the United Negro College Fund.

14 [applause] So if you all could come up, if the United  
15 Negro College Fund can please come and join us. Good

16 afternoon. I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo. And  
17 we are so proud today because this Black History

18 Month continues to go on and on and on and we're  
19 going to make it a full year, right? [applause] So

20 the New York City Council is proud to honor the 75th  
21 anniversary of the United Negro College Fund for its

22 decades of extraordinary work in advocating for and  
23 providing equal access to college for all, especially

24 students of color. In 1944 UNCF was created as a way  
25 to help more African Americans to attend college.

1  
2 Over the years they have a shining example of what an  
3 organization can do in the fight to make a college  
4 education accessible and affordable to all. UNCF has  
5 raised nearly 5 billion dollars, right? Give it up  
6 for 5 billion dollars [applause] to provide  
7 educational resources and support that have enabled  
8 nearly half a million students to earn college  
9 degrees. UNCF has been recognized nationally as an  
10 organization that helps under-represented students to  
11 become highly qualified college graduates. UNCF has  
12 also launched a billion-dollar national scholarship  
13 initiative established by the Bill and Melinda Gates  
14 Foundation, which awards scholarships to low-income,  
15 high-achieving college students. In a time where  
16 college seems to be moving farther and farther out of  
17 the reach for so many Americans, especially people of  
18 color, UNCF's commitment to helping students of all  
19 backgrounds achieve their educational dreams is all  
20 the more worthy of celebration. Education has always  
21 been viewed as the key to achieving the American  
22 dream and I thank UNCF from the bottom of my heart  
23 for all that you have done to make the dream  
24 accessible to so many students. So I ask Maurice  
25 Jenkins, executive vice president at UNCF, and Lacy

1  
2 Britton, member of UNCF Independent Alumni Council,  
3 to please accept this proclamation as well as my  
4 council colleagues, and this was brought forward by  
5 Council Member Robert Cornegy, as well as Council  
6 Member I. Daneek Miller, who is the chair of the  
7 Black, Latino, and Asian Caucus, and we are just so  
8 proud and honored to have you all here today. I  
9 remember growing up and hearing so much about UNCF  
10 and the work that you do, even when you're a little  
11 child, inspires you to know that an education is  
12 obtainable and any time I would do something bad or  
13 not on the right path, when my parents would sit me  
14 down and give me that lecture, they would always say  
15 a mind is a terrible thing to waste. [laughter] So a  
16 lot of spankings often accompanied that speech. So I  
17 thank you all so much for the work that you do and to  
18 continue to raise up generations of young people who  
19 are benefitting from a college education, and for  
20 basically just laying the foundation for all people  
21 to know that a college education is obtainable, it's  
22 expected, and it's something that is so very  
23 important to our communities. I'm going to now turn  
24 it over to the clerk, who will read the proclamation,  
25 and then I will turn it over to my colleague, Council

1  
2 Member Robert Cornegy, who has brought this  
3 incredible organization here before the City Council.

4 CLERK: Council City of New York

5 Proclamation: The New York City Council is proud to  
6 honor the United Negro College Fund, the UNCF, for 75  
7 years of extra work, lighting the way to making  
8 college education available to minority students.

9 And whereas UNCF was founded in 1944 to help more  
10 African American students attend and graduate from  
11 college. Since then it has raised more than 4.8  
12 billion dollars to provide resources and support that  
13 have enabled more than 450,000 students to earn  
14 college degrees. To serve youth, the community, and  
15 the nation UNCF supports students' education and  
16 development through scholarships and other programs,  
17 strengthens its 37 private member colleges and  
18 universities, and advocates for the important of  
19 minority educate. And whereas from the start UNCF  
20 has been committed to building a robust and  
21 nationally recognized pipeline of under-represented  
22 students who because of UNCF support become highly  
23 qualified college graduates. The organization also  
24 works to ensure that its network of member  
25 institutions is a respected model of best practice in

1  
2 moving students to and through colleague. And  
3 whereas UNCF's north star is to increase the total  
4 number of African American college graduates by  
5 focusing on activities that ensure more students are  
6 college-ready, enroll in college, to persist to  
7 graduation. This is done through a three-pillar  
8 strategy - positioning member institutions as a  
9 viable college option for students and investing in  
10 institutional capacity to improve student outcomes,  
11 creating transformational support programs to ensure  
12 students are enrolling and persisting through college  
13 completely and building awareness of educational  
14 attainment and cultivating college-going enthusiasm  
15 within the African American community. And whereas  
16 UNCF's great legacy of steady progress includes  
17 numerous highlights. After Senator John F. Kennedy  
18 won the 1957 Pulitzer Prize for his book, *Profiles in*  
19 *Courage*, he donated the proceeds to UNCF. In 1972  
20 UNCF launched a public awareness campaign through the  
21 Ad Council around its motto, "A Mind is a Terrible  
22 Thing to Waste", which became one of the most  
23 recognized slogans in advertising history. And  
24 whereas UNCF has continued to make great strides in  
25 recent years, in 1999 UNCF launched the Gates



1  
2 Millennium Scholars Program, a one-billion-dollar  
3 national scholarship initiative established by the  
4 Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, which annually  
5 awards academic scholarships to low-income, high-  
6 achieving college students. The following year UNCF  
7 launched its Technology Enhancement Capital Program,  
8 I'm sorry, Capital Campaign, which raised nearly \$120  
9 million dollars for UNCF member colleagues to  
10 modernize technology platforms and increase access to  
11 PCs among students and faculty. And whereas today  
12 UNCF administers over 400 programs, including  
13 scholarship, internship, and fellowship, mentoring  
14 summer enrichment and curriculum, and faculty  
15 development programs. UNCF also supports more than  
16 60,000 students at over 900 colleagues and  
17 universities across the country. And whereas in an  
18 era when a college education is more expensive than  
19 ever before UNCF's mission has never been more  
20 important. At this milestone we commend UNCF not  
21 only for its longevity but also for its tremendously  
22 positive impact on the lives of countless students  
23 and alumni and colleagues throughout the nation. Now  
24 therefore be it know that the New York City Council  
25 grateful honors UNCF in celebration of its 75th

1  
2 anniversary for its extraordinary work championing  
3 equal access to college for all Americans. Corey  
4 Johnson, speaker for the entire council, Laurie M.  
5 Cumbo, majority leader of the New York City Council,  
6 Robert Cornegy, Council Member 36 District Brooklyn,  
7 and I. Daneek Miller, chair of Black, Latino, and  
8 Asian Caucus.

9           CHAIRPERSON CUMBO: Wow. Thank you for  
10 all that you have been doing all of these  
11 extraordinary years, and so I'm going to turn it over  
12 to Council Member Robert Cornegy.

13           COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you,  
14 Majority Leader Cumbo. It is absolutely my pleasure  
15 to have had a long-term relationship with UNCF.  
16 Today is a testament to the fact that as we have a  
17 conversation, a larger conversation around  
18 standardized high school tests and specialized high  
19 school tests that for over 75 years we've had  
20 organizations who worked diligently to make sure that  
21 black students are taken care of and are present,  
22 primarily in historically black colleges and  
23 universities, and as the husband of a graduate of  
24 South Carolina State, if I didn't mention that I'd be  
25 in big trouble, we, I've gotten to witness firsthand

1  
2 the impact on communities of color around the world  
3 that UNCF has had. So today we are joined together  
4 in honoring UNCF on its 75th anniversary. UNCF was  
5 founded on April 25, 1944, and has continuously  
6 supported private HBCUs, or historically black  
7 colleges and universities, advocated for inclusive  
8 higher education, and aided hundreds of thousands of  
9 students. HBCUs have a vital role in the history of  
10 our country. These schools gave black students the  
11 opportunity to obtain a higher education when almost  
12 no other colleges would. Today HBCUs are an integral  
13 part of the higher education mosaic of the United  
14 States. They provide opportunities for some  
15 Americans who have not otherwise had the opportunity  
16 to attend an institution of higher education. HBCUs  
17 represent only 3% of colleges and universities, but  
18 graduate 20% of African Americans who hold  
19 undergraduate degrees. Today we join with UNCF to  
20 celebrate the lives positively transformed with a  
21 college education. More than 450,000 college  
22 graduates whose educations immeasurably enrich our  
23 shared communities and the more than 60,000 students  
24 attending college each year who will make  
25 contributions to our economy, to our culture, to our

1  
2 scholarship, and to our civic life in years to come.  
3 Today as we continue to work towards opening up the  
4 opportunities a college education represents to more  
5 people, we must celebrate UNCF's outgoing commitment,  
6 ongoing commitment, to investing a future of HBCUs  
7 and offering past, present, and future students a  
8 pathway to higher education. Congratulations to UNCF  
9 on their significant anniversary and best wishes for  
10 many more successful years to come. I just want to  
11 say that this is also a testament to the fact that it  
12 besways the narrative that there are more black men  
13 in prison that there are in colleague. We know that  
14 that's not true. There are more black men on college  
15 campuses across this country studying and preparing  
16 themselves to make contributions to our society, and  
17 we thank UNCF for its participation and continued  
18 support of those young men and women. Thank you.  
19 [applause] And we just like to hear we know that  
20 there are some remarks from Mr. Jenkins that we'd  
21 love to hear today.

22 MAURICE JENKINS: First of all, I want to  
23 say good afternoon to all that have gathered here in  
24 the chamber and especially to the Councilman. Thank  
25 you so very, very much for your support and your

1  
2 leadership. It makes a difference. And I have had  
3 the wonderful experience of being with the United  
4 Negro College Fund for 29 years... [applause]

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Wow!

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Is that my man?  
7 I think I see my man, who's got to join us.

8 MAURICE JENKINS: Yes.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes! Major  
10 Dinkins.

11 MAURICE JENKINS: Mayor Dinkins.

12 [applause] And so I am just so humbled to be here in  
13 this presence and the reason I'm so humbled is  
14 because the United Negro College Fund started in 1944  
15 and incorporated right here in the city and the state  
16 of New York City. So we are incorporated here.

17 [applause] We ran our office here and we were here  
18 for more than, over 50 years before we moved to the  
19 Washington, D.C. area, where we currently reside. I  
20 just want thank you for the impact, the difference  
21 that you make. We know that education is an  
22 equalizer and we know that. And since we know that  
23 and we believe in that, then that's why we work so  
24 diligently to make sure that we provide opportunities  
25 for young men and woman who want a chance. We're not

1  
2 looking for a handout. We're looking for a helping  
3 hand. And so therefore I want to say to each one of  
4 you thank you very much and certainly to our Mayor  
5 Dinkins, who was a big supporter of the United Negro  
6 College Fund throughout the years. Thank you and  
7 thank you for being here. And I want you to hear  
8 from the dividends of what we do, 'cause that's  
9 important, and so Cindy is here and she is now a  
10 employee of the United Negro College Fund and if you  
11 go on our website you will see this young lady who  
12 when an undergrad was talking about the impact and  
13 the difference that the United Negro College Fund had  
14 on her life. So I want her to share that with you.  
15 I think that's important to hear.

16 CINDY FALCONER: Hello, everyone. My  
17 name is Cindy Falconer, a dividend of the United  
18 Negro College Fund and also development associated  
19 with the UNCF New York office, and I am grateful and  
20 honored to be a dividend of UNCF. I have been able  
21 to find my drive and my purpose through the  
22 organization, allowing me to support other students  
23 through their matriculation through college and  
24 allowing me to support them through helping them to  
25 apply for scholarships, helping them to obtain their

1  
2 higher education, while also being motivated to  
3 graduate from HBCUs and contribute to our society  
4 with their knowledge and their drive and motivation  
5 as young black men and women of our country. I thank  
6 you. [applause] I would like to end this statement  
7 with a mind is a terrible thing to waste, but a  
8 wonderful thing to invest in. Thank you. [applause]

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All right. It  
10 has been updated.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I almost forgot,  
12 we're supposed to actually give them then  
13 proclamation.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: So we are going  
15 to now present you with the proclamation and we're  
16 going to take a group photo, and we would love for  
17 the Mayor Dinkins to be a part of this very  
18 auspicious occasion. This has been the most dynamic  
19 Black History Month, longest-running ever, and so we  
20 are so proud to have Mayor Dinkins to be a part of  
21 this today. We are here because of you. [applause]

22 UNIDENTIFIED: I do the proclamation and  
23 then I talk?

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes.  
25

1  
2 UNIDENTIFIED: OK, and then I'll introduce  
3 the...

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes. Hello.  
5 Thank you all so much for being here, and thank you  
6 so much for all of my colleagues who are joining for  
7 this very historical proclamation that is going to be  
8 presented today. Council Member Cabrera has brought  
9 forward one of our great legends, and I am proud as a  
10 New York City Council member to honor the life and  
11 legacy of the late Dr. Roscoe C. Brown, Jr., one of  
12 the legendary Tuskegee airmen and educator who passed  
13 away in 2016. Dr. Brown has made an indelible mark  
14 on the Borough of the Bronx, New York City as a  
15 whole, and an entire grateful nation through his  
16 remarkable life of outstanding achievements and  
17 enduring contributions. As a Tuskegee airman he  
18 became a legend fighting for democracy against  
19 unspeakable evil in World War II as he simultaneously  
20 broke down racial barriers in the army and changed  
21 the way people thought about civil rights and  
22 equality in America. After his military service he  
23 chose to live a life of public service here in New  
24 York City. He continued the fight for democracy on  
25 behalf of New York City students as a tireless



1  
2 activist and educator. He went on to serve as the  
3 director of NYU's Institute of African American  
4 Affairs before becoming the third president of the  
5 Bronx Community College, where he served for 17  
6 years, developing new programs in health, human  
7 services, and technology. He advised countless New  
8 York City leaders and future leaders of our city over  
9 the decades of service that defined his exemplary  
10 life. On top of all that he did to serve his  
11 borough, his city, and his nation, Dr. Brown was also  
12 an avid runner who in 1978 cofounded Run the Bronx,  
13 which later was renamed to Roscoe C. Brown, Jr. Hall  
14 of Fame 10K, 5K, and 2-Mile Walk, and will have its  
15 annual event next month. So I ask Dennis Brown to  
16 come up. Dennis is Dr. Roscoe Brown, Jr.'s son and  
17 he will accept this proclamation on his behalf. I  
18 also am calling on my colleagues that are all here to  
19 join us for this very auspicious occasion and we have  
20 been joined by Speaker Corey Johnson. May we all  
21 hope to lead a life as that of the late, great Dr.  
22 Roscoe Brown. [applause] Wow. I know like many of  
23 my colleagues we can feel the energy and the spirit  
24 here in this room today. I'm going to turn it over  
25 to the clerk, who will read the proclamation,

1  
2 followed by Councilman Cabrera, who has brought us  
3 this incredible opportunity, and followed by Council  
4 Member Corey Johnson, and then we would love to hear  
5 words from you as well as to recognize our Honorable  
6 Mayor David Dinkins. [applause]

7 CLERK: Council City of New York  
8 Proclamation. The New York City Council is proud to  
9 posthumously honor the late Dr. Roscoe C. Brown, Jr.,  
10 for his outstanding achievements and his enduring  
11 contributions to the Bronx and beyond. And whereas  
12 Dr. Brown was a champion for New York City and the  
13 nation, he was an influential advisor to many elected  
14 officials and an inspirational figure, equally  
15 remarkable for who he was, as well as all that he  
16 achieved. Although he died on July 2, 2016, at the  
17 age of 94, his tremendously positive influence  
18 continues to inform and shape our city today,  
19 especially his beloved Bronx community. And whereas  
20 during World War II Dr. Brown flew 68 missions as one  
21 of the Tuskegee Airmen, our nation's belatedly  
22 celebrated [applause] first black military aviators  
23 in the then-segregated US Army Air Corps. Like other  
24 Tuskegee Airmen, he fought for democracy in the skies  
25 over Europe while also combating our nation's own

1  
2 racial barriers that impeded full citizenship rights  
3 in both the army and in society. And whereas when he  
4 returned to civilian life in America, Dr. Brown  
5 continued to fight for democracy in our schools as a  
6 tireless educator and activist. After the war, he  
7 took on a triple major at NYU, where he wrote his  
8 doctoral dissertation on exercise physiology and  
9 before becoming a professor. Later he became the  
10 director of NYU's Institute of African American  
11 Affairs. And whereas from 1997 to 1993, Dr. Brown  
12 served as the esteemed third president of Bronx  
13 Community College, BCC. During his 17-year tenure he  
14 led BCC's outreach to the city's economic and  
15 educational institutions and developed new programs  
16 in health technology and human services. In the mid  
17 1980s he helped New York State establish the Bronx  
18 Educational Opportunity Center to develop vocational  
19 training and skills education. He also created  
20 programs to increase outreach to Bronx junior high  
21 and high schools and other programs to support  
22 minority students going into science careers. And  
23 whereas Dr. Brown, an avid runner who ran in nine New  
24 York City Marathons, was also deeply concerned about  
25 the health of and well-being of the community. In

1  
2 1978 he cofounded BCC's Run the Bronx, later known as  
3 the Roscoe C. Brown, Jr. Hall of Fame 10K, 5K, and 2-  
4 Mile Walk. Today Run the Bronx is a major annual  
5 event in the Bronx and the second-oldest foot race in  
6 the five boroughs, founded on the heels of the New  
7 York City Marathon. On May 4, 2019, this community  
8 health event and health pavilion will welcome more  
9 than 1500 participants around the nation. We extend  
10 our best wishes for all of the 2019 Run the Bron  
11 participants, whether they are running or walking or  
12 cheering on those who do. Now therefore be it known  
13 that the New York City Council is proud to honor the  
14 life and indelible legacy of Dr. Roscoe C. Brown, Jr.  
15 for his many enduring contributions to the Bronx and  
16 to all of New York City. Corey Johnson, Speaker for  
17 the entire council, Laurie M. Cumbo, Majority Leader  
18 of the New York City Council, Fernando Cabrera,  
19 Council Member 14th District The Bronx, and all of  
20 the members of the Bronx delegation of the New York  
21 City Council. [pause]

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Cabrera, thank  
23 you so much.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so  
25 much. I'm so excited about this moment to introduce

1  
2 to you a mayor that had such an impact upon our city  
3 we're still feeling the effects. But, even more, I  
4 know you're coming here as a friend of Dr. Roscoe  
5 Brown, a comrade during World War II. My grandfather  
6 fought in World War II. He told me stories. He was  
7 in the navy, and you're a hero.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Dr. Roscoe Brown  
10 also a hero. [applause] We're among heroes here  
11 today. And I want you to give a big round of  
12 applause to Mayor David Dinkins. Come on, everybody!  
13 [applause and cheers]

14 HONORABLE MAYOR DINKINS: Thank you  
15 very much. Thank you very much. As most of you  
16 know, I was a city clerk for 10 years and I, Mr.  
17 Speaker, I used to sit right here in meeting after  
18 meeting after meeting. And of course I've been to  
19 many, many events here where people were honored.  
20 But there is nothing that gives me more pleasure than  
21 being here today for my friend Roscoe. [applause] He  
22 was quite a guy. And I told the story a while ago,  
23 I'm a Montford Morton Marine, first black hoorah.  
24 There was the occasion when we were awarded the  
25 Congressional Gold Medal and we were supposed to go

1  
2 down to Washington to receive it. And so I called  
3 Roscoe. I said, man, you know, I didn't do nothing,  
4 nobody shot at me. And Roscoe, deservedly, had the  
5 Congressional Gold Medal. And so he told me it was  
6 all right, I could go. So I went to Washington and a  
7 three-star general placed the ribbon around my neck.  
8 [applause] But Roscoe was conditioned to being a very  
9 special human being who accomplished much and helped  
10 so many of us. He was a dear friend to me and I can  
11 say without fear of contradiction I certainly never,  
12 ever would have achieved the Office of Mayor of the  
13 City of New York had it not been for his help,  
14 guidance, and just without it even, it just wouldn't  
15 have happened. And it is appropriate that so many of  
16 you are here to praise our friend. Roscoe was a  
17 very, very special human being and he will not be  
18 forgotten, and I'm delighted that the speaker of the  
19 City Council is here. The speaker, you know, there's  
20 so many events here he can't make them all. But he  
21 said this one he was gonna make [laughs]. [applause]

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so  
23 much. And I'd like to turn it over to Speaker Corey  
24 Johnson.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SPEAKER JOHNSON: It is always a special day in this historic and remarkable building when one of the most amazing public servants that has ever served the City of New York, a history-maker, not just by becoming mayor, but all the stuff he did before he was mayor, and a living legend. He talks about me showing up at an event at City Hall. This man, I see him everywhere, he's like a man about town. He is active, he is vibrant, and he is, as Fernando Cabrera said, a hero to our city. We are always happy to see the amazing David N. Dinkins here at City Hall. [applause] So Mr. Mayor, thank you, thank you very much. I'm not going to repeat the wonderful words from our majority leader and Council Member Cabrera or the mayor about Dr. Brown, but I will just say that it is so appropriate that at any opportunity possible to recognize and remember and salute the Tuskegee Airmen for their valor and service to our country. Segregation is one of the lasting indelible stains on our country and one that we cannot forget, must not forget, but at the height of that, in the face of that, the Tuskegee Airmen were brave, valiant, unbelievable Americans in what they did, serving our country at a time that they

1  
2 were being targeted, discriminated against, and not  
3 treated like the full Americans and full heroes that  
4 they were. So any time we have the opportunity to  
5 talk about that, to remember that, and to talk about  
6 the amazing Tuskegee Airmen from our great city of  
7 New York City is, I'm getting the chills saying it,  
8 it's a great day to be able to remember that history  
9 and so we are so honored that you are here today and  
10 we are honored to remember Dr. Roscoe Brown, so thank  
11 you very, very much. [applause]

12 DR. DENNIS BROWN: I brought one of  
13 Roscoe's airplanes with me. Good afternoon. I can  
14 see from all the energy here that everyone is either  
15 ready to run the 10K, the 5K, or to Cheer People On,  
16 Sit By the Roadside K. Now I want to challenge  
17 everyone here to channel Roscoe Brown. I want you to  
18 channel Roscoe Brown. Now let me give that some  
19 context in Roscoe style. You know what I'm talking  
20 about, my favorite marine. When Roscoe and I would  
21 travel together through all the various  
22 presentations, awards, where he would talk about his  
23 exploits as a Tuskegee Airman, we would relieve all  
24 of his combat missions and details of flying in great  
25 detail of minutia. I'm talking to the point of well



1  
2 what time did you get up? Well, when did you go to  
3 the bathroom? Well, did you have a lot of coffee?  
4 No, because then I'd have to pee. Well then where  
5 did you go to the bathroom in such a small airplane?  
6 Things like that. So now in 2004 we go down to the  
7 Air Force College at Maxwell Air Force Base and we  
8 meet a B-25 pilot. And this B-25 pilot then goes on  
9 to tell us in the same fashion much of the minutia  
10 and details of one of the most important missions of  
11 World War II. For him and for Roscoe, one of the  
12 underlying things that would come forward would be  
13 the underlying narrative of preparation, persistence,  
14 and pride. The person we were talking to is very  
15 special to this day. On this day, April 18, 1942,  
16 the Doolittle Raiders, led by Jimmy Doolittle, 16 B-  
17 25s took off of the deck of the US Hornet and did the  
18 famous raid on Tokyo. Dick Cole was Jimmy  
19 Doolittle's copilot. Every year on this day the  
20 Doolittle Raiders would meet and have a toast to  
21 their fallen comrades. A little cognac for those who  
22 have passed. Just last week Dick Cole, the last  
23 Doolittle Raider passed away at the age of 103. So  
24 before you go to bed tonight, a little cognac for  
25 Dick Cole and the Doolittle Raiders. [applause] Now,

1  
2 April is here. March just passed. March 24th 74  
3 years ago young Roscoe Brown, Lieutenant Roscoe Brown  
4 at that time, saddle up his P-51 and took off from  
5 Ramitelli on the longest mission of the 15th Air  
6 Force. He was breaking in a new flight leader. He  
7 realized even then that the true role of leadership  
8 is to develop tomorrow's leadership. So he assumed  
9 the position of Tail-End Charlie, the lowest and  
10 furthest back position in the flight formation. I  
11 would say to him as he told this story, well, weren't  
12 you scared? He said no, we only had a 1600-mile  
13 round trip. No GPS. No Doritos in the cockpit to  
14 keep you awake. So on they go to Berlin. A little  
15 bit of trivia. I looked up the mission report. The  
16 assignment for the day for the all-black Tuskegee  
17 Airmen was different from everyone else's. Their  
18 assignment was, I quote, penetration with the bombers  
19 to the prudent limit of endurance. Now what the hell  
20 does that mean? That means you will fly until you  
21 die. Everyone else had a specific assignment. Meet  
22 them here. Go back here. Land over here.  
23 Interestingly enough, Ramitelli, on the Adriatic  
24 coast of Italy, is the southernmost Air Force base  
25 for the Army Air Corps. They had the longest to fly,

1  
2 were always on time. For the mission to Berlin two  
3 groups were late. One got lost in weather and one  
4 just left late. But not the Tuskegee Airmen.  
5 Meeting the bombers as they approached Berlin he  
6 could see streaks at 9 o'clock. He knew these were  
7 the German jets. Now, the jets could go 500 plus.  
8 The P-51 at its best 400, maybe 450. A little bit of  
9 flight school for everyone. When two airplanes come  
10 into visual contact for an encounter they try and  
11 out-turn each other so you get on the other person's  
12 6. If the plane is below you, you come from above,  
13 invert, come around on their 6, and make the kill.  
14 But what if you're with a jet? A jet that can go so  
15 fast you can't turn with, and no spiraling here, so  
16 what Roscoe did on his days off, he would take up the  
17 other flyers and they would fly that P-51 to its  
18 envelope, developing new maneuvers, such that he  
19 developed a maneuver that was taught in the Air Force  
20 all the way to Korea. This was called the modified  
21 split S. What you would do is push the throttle  
22 forward, put the nose down, pull the plane up,  
23 invert, don't go level, take it almost to a stall,  
24 then pull the stick back because you're upside down.  
25 It now comes into a screaming red line dive, almost

1  
2 tearing the wings off the plane. He did this split S  
3 when he saw the jets, under the bombers, and right on  
4 to the 6 of the Me 262, a burst, and he takes them  
5 out. And as Roscoe would put it to me in our  
6 conversations in non-technical terms, I was right on  
7 his ass. [laughter] So very quickly he realizes I'm  
8 low on fuel. Now here comes your challenge. Low on  
9 fuel, 800 miles from home, he says I'm not scared.  
10 I'm too prepared to be scared. He went from danger  
11 to the heart and found safety. Now he's in a safe  
12 zone. I've got to get home. So are you scared now?  
13 No fancy maneuvers, Roscoe. He says, no, I got this.  
14 I'm on mission, I'm alert, watching my horizon, and  
15 I'm tapping the gauge. Anyone remember the movie  
16 *Dunkirk*, with the two pilots going over the English  
17 Channel tapping the gauge. Is it just stuck or are  
18 we out of fuel? And they found out at the end of the  
19 movie he was indeed out of fuel, as he coasted to a  
20 landing on the beach. So Roscoe's tapping the gauge.  
21 Now from that safe zone he goes to where everyone  
22 here to do, to his faith zone. Faith in his  
23 preparation, his persistence, and pride. Pride not  
24 only in the Red Tails, on the back of those P-51s,  
25 America's first combat pilots, black combat pilots,

1  
2 but all the way to the double V for victory, victory  
3 over racism at home and tyranny abroad. So whether  
4 you're facing the obstacles of the undulating hills  
5 of the Grand Concourse that Roscoe I ran so many  
6 times on May the 4th in the 41st running of Run the  
7 Bronx go for your safe zone to your faith zone.  
8 Because at the end of the day Roscoe would always  
9 tell us it is our pursuit of excellence that makes  
10 the difference. It is our pursuit of excellence that  
11 will endure and it is your pursuit of excellence that  
12 will overcome obstacles. And if Roscoe were here  
13 today, he would define pride for us in three simple  
14 words I know we've all heard before. And I know the  
15 marine knows this. Duty, honor, country. On behalf  
16 of Roscoe Brown, thank you. [applause]

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Wow, this is the  
18 Black History Month ever! Roscoe Brown. Mayor  
19 Dinkins, would you join us for a group photo with the  
20 proclamation?

21 HONORABLE MAYOR DINKINS: Absolutely.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: And we would now  
23 like to have words from the president of Bronx  
24 Community College. [applause]

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

PRESIDENT ISEKENEGBE: Good afternoon, everybody. What can I say after an excellent speech by Dr. Brown? On behalf of all of our students, faculty, and staff, I just want to say thank you to the speaker of the council, to all of the council members for honoring us and for honoring Dr. Brown. Thank you very, very much. This is a day that will live in our memory in the history of Bronx Community College. Thank you very much. [applause]

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Mayor Dinkins, we'd love to have you front and center.

HONORABLE MAYOR DINKINS: You know, while I'm getting in to this, would you let me tell you something else about, no, really, this is true. The white bomber pilots would request the Tuskegee Airmen, because you may remember they had red tails? They'd say I want them because when they were, the bombers were attacked some of the other fighter pilots would sort of peel off and go chase them, which was the wrong thing to do. You're supposed to stay with them damn bombers. And that's when Roscoe and the others did. You know, it is so important that you all are doing it, it really is. I've been

1 here on many occasions, Mr. Speaker, but nothing more  
2 important than this. [applause]

3 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so  
4 much, Council Member Cabrera, for bringing this great  
5 opportunity forward, as well as Council Member  
6 Cornegy for bringing the United Negro College Fund  
7 today. It's been a historical day. And now we'll  
8 take a photo and get ready to being the Stated  
9 Meeting. [pause]

10 CLERK: Can I have your attention please?  
11 Can I have your attention please? At this time could  
12 I please have the Sergeant at Arms please clear the  
13 main floor of the chambers. We need to start the  
14 Stated Meeting, so if we could please clear the main  
15 floor of the chambers. Thank you. [pause]

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. I  
17 said [pause]

18 CLERK: Ladies and gentlemen. Could I  
19 have council members please take their seats, please.  
20 Council members, please take their seats, please.  
21 Please take all your conversations outside. Could I  
22 have those back doors closed, please. Close those  
23 doors, please. Thank you. At this time, quiet  
24 please, quiet on the floor, please. At this time  
25

2 please place all electronic devices, all electronic  
3 devices, to vibrate. And would all non-Council  
4 employees, non-Council employees please leave the  
5 main floor of the chambers? Thank you. Madam  
6 Majority Leader. [pause]

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: And good  
8 afternoon and welcome to the Stated Meeting of April  
9 18, 2019. I am Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo. Please  
10 rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

11 CLERK: All rise.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I pledge  
13 allegiance to the flag of the United States of  
14 America, and to the republic for which it stands, one  
15 nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and  
16 justice for all. Roll call.

17 CLERK: Quiet please.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Barron. Borelli.

23 Brannan. Chin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen.



2 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

3 Constantinides.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Present.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Cornegy.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Deutsch. Diaz. Dromm.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Present.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Eugene.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Present.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Gibson. Gjonaj.

14 Grodenchik.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Here.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: King.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: KOO.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Lander.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Levin.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.  
COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca.  
COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.  
COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Moya.  
COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Perkins.  
COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Brannan.  
COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Powers.  
COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso.  
COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Richards.  
COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera.  
COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.  
COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Present.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Rose.  
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.  
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.  
COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Torres. Treyger.  
COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: HERE.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Ulrich. Vallone.  
COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Van Bramer.  
COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Yeger.  
COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo. Cumbo.  
MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Present.  
UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.  
SPEAKER JOHNSON: I'm here.

1  
2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We  
3 have a quorum and we will now have today's  
4 invocation, which will be delivered by the Reverend  
5 Dr. William Lupfer of Trinity Church, located 75  
6 Broadway in Manhattan.

7 CLERK: All rise.

8 REVEREND LUPFER: Thank you, Majority  
9 Leader Laurie Cumbo, Speaker Corey Johnson, Public  
10 Advocate Jumaane Williams, and council members,  
11 especially my friend and representative, Margaret  
12 Chin. As you've heard, I'm at Trinity Wall Street.  
13 We've been part of this neighborhood for over 300  
14 years and I'm honored to pray us into session. Let  
15 us pray. God our Creator, we thank you for bringing  
16 us here today in service of the people of your great  
17 city. We thank you for this day and for this work.  
18 We pray that you will guide our council members and  
19 be present in their collective wisdom as they work to  
20 make our neighborhoods places of inclusiveness and  
21 compassion. Bring them together in a spirit of  
22 humility, integrity, and openness as they consider  
23 the issues that affect those who live and work in  
24 this diverse ever-evolving city we love and call  
25 home. Be with them in their deliberations and

1  
2 decisions. We keep in our heart sounds all who  
3 suffer, those who are homeless, incarcerated,  
4 unemployed, sick, or hungry, and all who experience  
5 any need or want, and we also remember in our prayers  
6 those who are seeking to enter our country or our  
7 city in search of safety and a better life for  
8 themselves and their families. We pray that they  
9 encounter compassion in their journey. We give  
10 thanks for all who work tirelessly for social justice  
11 in our city and beyond, particularly those who seek  
12 an end to mass incarceration and the racial injustice  
13 that fuels it, and those who seek to break the cycle  
14 of homelessness. Give them strength to continue  
15 their important work and courage and hope to sustain  
16 them when they are discouraged. We thank our council  
17 members for the gift of their service to their  
18 constituents and to one another. May they be  
19 faithful representatives of their neighborhoods while  
20 serving the good of our entire city. We ask your  
21 blessing upon them and upon this meeting, that their  
22 labor may be fruitful and their decisions wise. In  
23 your name we pray. Amendment. [pause]

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. I'd like to now ask Council Member Chin to spread the invocation on record.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Majority Leader. And I welcome Reverend Dr. Will Lupfer to our City Council. Reverend Dr. Will Lupfer...

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Quiet in the chambers.

CLERK: [inaudible]

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Reverend Dr. Will Lupfer became the 18th rector of Trinity Church Wall Street in New York City in 2015. As rector, he focuses on racial justice, mass incarceration, homelessness, and low-income housing, and is an advocate for new ways to help those without adequate voice in society. He regularly engages with the Trinity community, the wider church of the faith tradition, not-for-profit organization, and leaders in politics and business. Before joining Trinity Reverend Lupfer was the dean of the Trinity at [inaudible] Cathedral in Oregon, an urban congregation of 1800 members from the greater Portland area. When he's not working for the church, the Reverend likes to travel with his wife and their

2 two children. Their mission in life is to build  
3 bridges across culture, race, and custom. And I  
4 wanted to thank Reverend Dr. Lupfer for gracing us  
5 with his invocation today and I make a motion that  
6 the invocation be spread in full upon the record.  
7 Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so  
9 much, Council Member Chin, and thank you so much, Dr.  
10 Lupfer, for that powerful and very calming and  
11 peaceful speech. Thank you so much. We will now  
12 have the Adoption of Minutes by Council Member Adams.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Madam Majority  
14 Leader, I move that the Minutes of the Stated Meeting  
15 of March 13, 2019, be adopted as printed.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
17 Council Member Adams. And now we will have messages  
18 and papers from the mayor.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Communication  
21 from city, county, and borough offices.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Petitions and  
24 communications.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Land use call-  
3 ups.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

5 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. We  
6 will now have communication from Speaker Corey  
7 Johnson.

8 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon. Nice  
9 to see you, Madam Majority Leader. I want to thank  
10 everyone who is with us on this Thursday. We have a  
11 very busy and exciting agenda ahead of us today.  
12 Before we begin, I would like to take a moment to  
13 acknowledge the fire that devastated Notre Dame  
14 Cathedral earlier this week in Paris. This is a  
15 tragedy for Paris, but it is a tragedy for the entire  
16 world, especially at the start of Holy Week. Like  
17 many people, I have been to Notre Dame and I loved  
18 it. It is breathtaking, and it was heartbreaking and  
19 heart sickening to see that fire and the images of  
20 it, and I know I speak for all of us at the council  
21 when I say we extend our deepest sympathies to the  
22 people of France, who are in mourning. I would also  
23 like to remember some of those who have passed in the  
24 weeks since our last Stated Meeting. I am sad to  
25 report, very sad to report, that we have lost three



1  
2 construction workers on the job in New York City in  
3 one week. Nelson Salinas, who came here from  
4 Ecuador, and worked in construction to support his  
5 family; Gregory Echevarria, a father of four, and a  
6 veteran who did four tours in Afghanistan. And Eric  
7 Mendoza, who was only 23 years old and leaves behind  
8 a 5-year-old son in Mexico. The women and men of the  
9 construction industry in New York City build our city  
10 and their work is extremely important. It is a very  
11 dangerous job and this is a reminder to always keep  
12 them in our prayers and to take action here at the  
13 council that continues to protect them. I also want  
14 to remember NYPD highway officer, Mark St. Aramand,  
15 who lost his life last week. Officer St. Aramand was  
16 a 14-year veteran of the NYPD, and he lives behind  
17 his wife, Cecelia and their five young children. Our  
18 hearts are with them and the entire NYPD family  
19 during this difficult time. And finally I would like  
20 to take a moment to acknowledge Humberto Cruz, the  
21 former director of the New York State AIDS Institute,  
22 who recently passed away. Dr. Cruz was a trailblazer  
23 in the public health field and was instrumental in  
24 the fight against AIDS at the height of the HIV-AIDS  
25 epidemic. His activism was recognized by everyone

1  
2 from being honored by the Latino Commission on AIDS  
3 to his appointment to President Obama's advisory  
4 council on HIV and AIDS. As an openly HIV-positive  
5 elected official I am extraordinary grateful for the  
6 work of people like Humberto Cruz. I am alive today  
7 because of the work that he and many others did for  
8 people living with AIDS. He will be deeply missed,  
9 but his legacy of activism and innovation in public  
10 health will never die, and now I would ask everyone  
11 to rise and take a moment of silence for everyone  
12 that we've lost. [moment of silence] Thank you.  
13 This is our lastest Stated before the Easter and  
14 Passover season. These are two incredibly important  
15 and beautiful holidays for the Christian and Jewish  
16 faiths, and I know many of us here today will be  
17 celebrating one or both of these holidays, and so I  
18 wish everyone a Happy Easter and a Happy Pesach.  
19 Let's dive into our agenda for the day. The council  
20 will vote on the following Article 11 property tax  
21 exemptions. One in Prospect Park South Portfolio in  
22 Council Member Eugene's district, will provide a  
23 partial 30-year exemption to eight buildings to  
24 preserve 384 units of affordable housing. The  
25 council will vote on the following land use items:

1  
2 Blondell Commons, applications to facilitate the  
3 development of 172-unit, 100% affordable housing  
4 project in Council Member Mark Gjonaj's district;  
5 2069 Bruckner Boulevard, two mixed-use buildings with  
6 65 affordable home ownership units and 265 affordable  
7 rental units in Council Member Ruben Diaz, Sr.'s  
8 district, and McDonald Avenue Catering, a zoning map  
9 amendment to facilitate the operation of a banquet  
10 facility in Council Member Brad Lander's district.  
11 And lastly, a very exciting site selection for a new  
12 322-seat primary school in Council Member Carlos  
13 Menchaca's district. I want to thank the land use  
14 staff who worked on these items, Jeff Yuen and  
15 Chelsea Kelly. Moving on, the council will be voting  
16 today on the following legislation. We are voting on  
17 the Climate Mobilization Act, [applause] our own  
18 version of the Green New Deal. Our planet is closing  
19 in on a breaking point. We must, we have to  
20 transition from investing in fossil fuel  
21 infrastructure to clean renewable energy. We have to  
22 act decisively and we have to act now. And I am very  
23 proud that this city council is leading the charge in  
24 helping our planet which is an existential threat to  
25 our existence. Our Environmental Protection

1  
2 Committee chair, an amazing, smart, hard-working,  
3 advocate, legislator, and champion, Council Member  
4 Costa Constantinides [applause] has been an  
5 incredible, incredible, incredible leader on this  
6 issue, understanding it in a granular way, fighting  
7 back exemptions that would have weakened the bill,  
8 educating the public on the importance of this, and  
9 working on this issue for years. I am so proud of  
10 this day for him and for our city and for the world,  
11 and you will hear from him soon. Chair  
12 Constantinides has been working, as I said, very hard  
13 and we are very proud to vote on the following bills  
14 sponsored by the chair: Introduction 1253C - this  
15 was a megillah [laughter]. It is going to mandate  
16 that buildings over 25,000 square feet are not  
17 allowed to emit greenhouse gasses at higher levels  
18 than set forth in the legislation. These large  
19 buildings are responsible for 30% of the greenhouse  
20 gas emissions in New York City. This bill would  
21 lower those emissions by 40% by 2030 and 80% by 2050.  
22 The emissions limits are set based on the occupancy  
23 group of the building and are calculated to require  
24 emissions reductions from the highest-emitting 20% of  
25 buildings in 2024 and the highest-emitting 75% of

1  
2 buildings in 2030. The bill will also create the  
3 Office of Energy Emissions Performance within the  
4 Department of Buildings to oversee the implementation  
5 of this legislation and to recommend future policy on  
6 building emissions. Introduction 1252A would  
7 establish the Property Assessed Clean Energy Program,  
8 the PACE Program. With this program, more building  
9 owners will be able to make the alterations required  
10 to reduce greenhouse gas emissions citywide.  
11 Introduction 1317A would clarify the Department of  
12 Buildings' obligation to include wind energy  
13 generation in its toolbox of renewable energy  
14 technologies by establishing additional requirements  
15 regarding the construction, installation, and  
16 maintenance of large wind turbines in the city.  
17 Introduction 1318A would mandate an assessment by the  
18 Mayor's Office of Sustainability or such other office  
19 as the mayor may designate on the feasibility of  
20 replacing in-city gas-fired power plants with battery  
21 storage powered by renewable sources. And  
22 Resolution 845, which would call on New York State  
23 Department of Environmental Conservation to deny the  
24 water quality certification permit for the  
25 construction of the Northeast Supply Enhancement

1  
2 Pipeline, also known as the Williams Pipeline,  
3 through New York Harbor [applause]. This, we have  
4 more bills from other council members, but all of  
5 those bills, each one of them is complicated. Each  
6 one of them requires an enormous amount of attention.  
7 Each one of them has required years of hard work and  
8 study and meeting with many, many, many stakeholders  
9 and advocates, and our chair has done that work  
10 literally day after day, week after week, month after  
11 month. When other people wanted to rush this process  
12 the chair said slow down so we can get this right and  
13 pass the most far-reaching, progressive, forward-  
14 thinking, important piece of climate change  
15 legislation that any municipality will have ever  
16 passed in the world. And so today is a day for  
17 celebration for the City of New York because we are  
18 laying the groundwork for other municipalities to be  
19 able to follow our lead. If we can do it in New York  
20 City, in the largest city in the United States, and a  
21 beacon for the entire world, in a city with a diverse  
22 building stock of small buildings and large buildings  
23 and hospitals and houses of worship, all of these  
24 type of buildings, any other city should be able to  
25 do it as well, and that is because of the incredible

1  
2 staff here who have worked so hard along with the  
3 Mayor's Office of Sustainability, who I see are here.  
4 I want to thank them for their partnership and  
5 helping making today happen, but really we would not  
6 be at this day, less than a week before Earth Day, if  
7 it wasn't for our great friend and colleague, and I  
8 want to give him a big round of applause, Council  
9 Member Costa Constantinides. [applause] And Madam  
10 Majority Leader, I would ask for when we get to  
11 remarks if we could not have a time limit on the  
12 chair's ability to speak on this package of  
13 legislation.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Certainly.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Thank you. Next, we're  
16 going to vote on two bills, sponsored by another  
17 great environmental champion who has done amazing  
18 work in this council, Council Member Rafael Espinal.  
19 Introduction 1031A will require the Office of  
20 Alternate Energy to post and maintain links on its  
21 website to information regarding the installation of  
22 green roofs and resources and materials regarding  
23 green roof systems. And Introduction 1032A will  
24 require the inclusion of a sustainable roofing zone,  
25 which is a photovoltaic energy generating system, or

1  
2 a green roof, in the construction of new buildings or  
3 buildings that are undergoing certain major  
4 renovations. Next, Introduction 276A, sponsored by  
5 Council Member Donovan Richards, would adjust the  
6 requirements of Introduction 1032S, for certain  
7 smaller residential buildings. It would also require  
8 the Department of Housing Preservation and  
9 Development to study the impact that compliance with  
10 Introduction 1032A may have on affordability while  
11 also allowing HPD to limit such requirements for  
12 certain buildings. Next, Introduction 1251A,  
13 sponsored by Council Member Andy Cohen, would address  
14 concerns from building owners that energy, that the  
15 energy grading scale of Local Law 33 of 2018 does not  
16 accurately reflect a building's efficiency. This  
17 bill would adjust the grading scale, assigning higher  
18 grades to efficient buildings, which they would then  
19 be required to post. And Resolution 66, sponsored by  
20 Council Member Steve Levin, will call upon the state  
21 legislature to pass and the governor to sign,  
22 legislation that would increase the real property tax  
23 abatement for the installation of a green roof to \$15  
24 per square foot, which would provide an incentive for  
25 property owners to build green roofs. The staff on



1  
2 this has been amazing. We are so fortunate that in  
3 this council we have unbelievably talented people  
4 that do this work every single day. We can only do  
5 this work because of the talented staff that we have  
6 and many of them are here, and I would love for them  
7 to stand up as I call their names. Some of them are  
8 already standing up. Nicola Ben, Austin Branford,  
9 Somara Swanston, Nadia Johnson, Ricky Chala, Brooke  
10 Frye, Piers Zonaster, Mega Chen, Brad Reed, John  
11 Seltzer, and I'd love the folks from the Mayor's  
12 Office of Sustainability to stand as well, because  
13 this was a very wonderful joint effort between all of  
14 our teams, and I want to give a big thank you to all  
15 the staff who worked on this. [applause] We are also  
16 voting on a bill you may have heard about before,  
17 Introduction 1527, sponsored by Council Members Brad  
18 Lander and Margaret Chin. It will require that a  
19 five-cent fee be imposed start on March 1, 2020, on  
20 paper bags and it would exempt any customer from  
21 paying the fee who uses SNAP Program, Special  
22 Supplemental Nutrition Program for Women, Infants,  
23 and Children, or any other successor programs as full  
24 or partial payment towards the items purchased in a  
25 covered store. I'm really proud we are doing this.

1  
2 The council was at the forefront of the fight to  
3 limit the consumption of single-use plastic bags and  
4 this is an excellent companion bill to the upcoming  
5 statewide bags. Plastic bags are a scourge on New  
6 York City and on our environment. I will leave it to  
7 Council Members Chin and Lander to speak about it,  
8 but they as well deserve an enormous amount of  
9 credit. They have been at this for years organizing.  
10 The council took action on this, but the New York  
11 State Legislature sort of took that action away from  
12 us and then, luckily, we have seen movement at the  
13 state level to ban plastic bags and allow  
14 municipalities to opt in to this five-cent fee on  
15 papers bags, so I'm really proud we're doing this  
16 today. I want to thank the staff who worked on this  
17 as well: Chris Artori, Patrick Mulvale, Nicola Ben,  
18 Nadia Johnson, Tirsa Nasir, Megan Chen, and Brad  
19 Reed. A lot of people want to talk about the price  
20 tag associated with the bills that we are passing  
21 today, and it's a fair question and a question that  
22 we have to be able to answer and discuss in a  
23 thoughtful way, in a way that makes sense. But there  
24 is really no price tag that you could put on the  
25 future of life on our planet and we must reduce,

1  
2 reduce, reduce carbon emissions. It is literally  
3 killing the planet. We are a carbon, we are a  
4 coastal city, and it is time for us to lead. We are  
5 leading today and I am so proud [applause], I am so  
6 proud of all the advocates who are in the balcony  
7 here today who have been fighting on the frontlines  
8 for years, being far ahead of the curve. I've said  
9 it before and I'll say it again. Every major civil  
10 rights movement, movement for progress in the United  
11 States of America, whether it be the anti-war  
12 movement or the movement for LGBT civil rights, or  
13 the movement for African American civil rights, or  
14 the farm workers' movement, or the labor movement,  
15 all of these movements were not led by politicians.  
16 They were led by people. They were led by people who  
17 organized and spoke out and decided that it was time  
18 for significant change. And the people who are  
19 sitting in this balcony and the people who they  
20 represent are the people who are leading this Green  
21 New Deal environmental justice movement and these are  
22 folks that have been at it for years long before it  
23 was a cause that was in the headlines every single  
24 day. And so today is a joint effort between the  
25 administration, the council, the stakeholders who

1  
2 effected by the legislation we are passing today, and  
3 all of the advocates who have really showing amazing  
4 mettle in getting us to today. So I want to  
5 congratulate them as well. [applause] I think that  
6 concludes our agenda for today's Stated Meeting and I  
7 look forward to proceeding with today's votes. Thank  
8 you, Madam Majority Leader.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, thank  
10 you so much Speaker Corey Johnson, and I am now going  
11 to move us into general discussion and on general  
12 orders. I would now like to call up Council Member  
13 Costa Constantinides.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: And, again, Madam  
15 Majority Leader, no clock for the Council Member.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Certainly.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank  
18 you, Madam Majority Leader, and first let me begin  
19 by, you know, Speaker Johnson, I can't thank you  
20 enough for your leadership, your forward-  
21 thinkingness, your desire to make this city a greener  
22 and sustainable place for not just now, but for 40  
23 years from now, when my little boy, in 2050, when the  
24 worst impacts, they said, will be felt, 2050 and  
25 beyond. My little boy will be a man, the same age

1  
2 that I am now. And he will look back on this and say  
3 thank you, Speaker Johnson, for leading. So, really,  
4 thank you, brother. Today I ask my colleagues to  
5 join me and pass the New York City Climate  
6 Mobilization Act. The centerpiece of this act is  
7 Introduction 1253C, which will require buildings  
8 25,000 square feet, of which there are only about  
9 50,000 in the City of New York, to meet emissions  
10 targets beginning in 2024. These 50,000 buildings,  
11 even though they represent a very small number,  
12 50,000 out of a million one, are the worst emitters  
13 in New York City. They are responsible for 30% of  
14 our overall emissions in the City of New York. Under  
15 this bill, the worst 20%, the worst performers, will  
16 have to meet a target based on their benchmarking  
17 they provided to the city, by 2024. Then in 2030 the  
18 middle percentages will have to also retrofit as  
19 well. For this class, however, an advisory board  
20 will be empowered to take a hard look at the metric  
21 and determine based on the experience of the first  
22 class if a different approach might be better. This  
23 new metric, however, must be at least as strict as  
24 our carbon metric and it must get us to the 40%  
25 reduction by 2030. This will apply to all buildings

1  
2 in this class. We as a city can't put stringent  
3 requirements on the private sector and not be held to  
4 the same standard. Finally, we have also ensured  
5 that this does not fall on the backs of the most  
6 vulnerable. That's why rent-regulated and senior  
7 affordable housing will have to follow a set of  
8 prescriptive requirements, such as installing  
9 individual temperature controls and heat sensors,  
10 things that would not cause MCIs. These requirements  
11 will not trigger rent hikes that risk only further  
12 destabilizing our neighborhoods. Parents should be  
13 able to put their kids to bed without worrying that  
14 their homes will be taken away from them by rising  
15 rents or rising seas. Housing of, houses of worship  
16 will also be held to these prescriptive standards,  
17 because while we must reach the 4530 standard we must  
18 be respectful of our city's prayer sanctuaries, many  
19 of which are also landmarked. Hospitals be held to a  
20 specific standard that takes into account their  
21 unique energy needs and the role that they play in  
22 protecting health and the safety of New Yorkers.  
23 And, again, all of the carbon targets in these bills  
24 have been calculated so they can all hit their goals.  
25 No two buildings are alike and all buildings will

1  
2 need help. So that's why in this bill we create the  
3 Office of Building Energy and Emissions Performance,  
4 to oversee the implementation of the building  
5 standards, to give technical assistance to building  
6 owners, and if a building owner is suffering a true  
7 financial hardship, or have made good faith efforts  
8 to buy grid energy credits only to find out they  
9 can't them, for instance, the office is going to be  
10 empowered to help them out and get an adjustment if  
11 really needed. If a building is landmarked they can  
12 also apply to get that assistance. Finally, the bill  
13 will also create a study to see if a cap and trade or  
14 a portfolio model approach might be used to hit these  
15 targets. To help us pay for all this, we're also  
16 passing Introduction 1252, which creates the City  
17 PACE Program. With this program, property owners can  
18 be eligible for loans with little or no upfront cost,  
19 structured on their payoff of the life of the  
20 technology. This way debt service is literally  
21 limited to the amount they end up saving from energy  
22 costs. [inaudible] program worked in other cities  
23 like Chicago, but it's been used across the towns of  
24 New York State. Also in the Climate Mobilization Act  
25 is Introduction 1317, which creates standards for

1  
2 large wind turbines, and Introduction 1318, which  
3 directs the state to study the phase-out of all of  
4 our fossil fuel plants with using solar, battery  
5 storage, and other renewable energies. The speaker  
6 talked about the crossroads we are on. We all know  
7 humanity's role in climate change and the effect it  
8 will have. We know that there is major impact from  
9 stronger hurricanes and increased precipitation will  
10 cause sea level rise, and the impact of our city.  
11 There are talks about the Rockaways, Coney Island,  
12 and neighborhoods in Staten Island literally being  
13 wiped off the map by the end of the century if we do  
14 not act. We see the seriousness of this and have to  
15 take real action. Our children and our children's  
16 children implore us to do this. No single-handed  
17 policy can completely reverse the effects of climate  
18 change. But this policy, when enacted, will be the  
19 largest emissions reduction policy in the history of  
20 New York City or any city anywhere. And I just want  
21 to say how proud I am to work with the advocates,  
22 Henry Gorito in DC 37, Alian Maritiza Silver  
23 Farrell, Pete Secora of New York City Communities for  
24 Change, and all of the advocates. I can't name each  
25 and every one of you, but thank you for fighting for



1  
2 a greener city. Thank you for all my colleagues who  
3 have worked so very hard with me, getting down in the  
4 weeds and making sure that we get this right. We  
5 always will appreciate you, and to the staff, Nicola  
6 Bean, as the speaker said. Nicola Bean, Austin  
7 Branford, Megan Chen, Tiersa Nasir, Samara Swanston,  
8 Nadia Johnson, Jeff Baker, Laura Popa, Brooke Frye,  
9 Rickie Chala, Jonathan Seltzer, my own staff, my  
10 legislative attorney, Nicholas Wizowski, my chief of  
11 staff, Nick Rolson, and Terence Collin, Nicky  
12 Coquinos, Josephine Jermosin, Michael Corbet, Joy  
13 Choudry, and to the Mayor's Office of Sustainability  
14 as well. There's been a lot of sleepless nights. I  
15 can attest. I've been dreaming about this bill for  
16 weeks now and haven't been getting much sleep. But  
17 dreams, dreams, good dreams, good dreams. And, you  
18 know, my little boy, who I talked about before, is 9  
19 years old, and he asked me, he was so excited today  
20 about the bill being passed. But when he becomes of  
21 age, all of our sons and daughters become of age,  
22 what will be the New York we're leaving them? This is  
23 a down payment on their future. The planet that  
24 we're borrowing from them, the city that we're  
25 borrowing from them, I am so proud that we are able

1  
2 to say to them when they ask us what did you do  
3 against climate change? What did you do about the  
4 greatest threat in the history of the United States,  
5 as President Obama has talked about, we can say we  
6 took real, meaningful action. Thank you very much,  
7 Madam Majority Leader. [applause]

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, Chair  
9 Costa Constantinides. Our children and our  
10 children's children children thank you. And now we  
11 will call up Council Member Chin.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Majority  
13 Leader. As a representative of lower Manhattan  
14 neighborhoods, we are still fighting to fully recover  
15 from super storm Sandy. I have seen firsthand the  
16 undeniable urgency to pass legislation to protect our  
17 environment. And I wanted to congratulate and thank  
18 Chair Constantinides and all my colleagues and our  
19 speaker on this Climate Mobilization Act. But when  
20 it comes to plastic bag pollution that regularly  
21 clogs our storm drain, pollute our rivers and litter  
22 our trees and parkland, we know that single-use bags  
23 are not free. There is a cost and that is borne  
24 unfairly by low-income communities of color who have  
25 to deal with the quality of life and public health

1  
2 repercussion of transporting thousands of tons of  
3 plastic bag waste every year. Our council knew this  
4 in 2016 when we passed to bring us closer to our goal  
5 to reduce single-use plastic bag waste. In order to  
6 educate and empower New Yorkers we had to work  
7 against a well-funded misinformation campaign by the  
8 plastic bag industry that sought to hide the true  
9 cost of plastic bags from New Yorkers. I'm pleased  
10 that after pre-empting our law the state has finally  
11 heard our call and allow a sensible measure to limit  
12 the use of plastic bag. But we need to ensure that  
13 plastic bags are not merely substitute by paper bag,  
14 which can be twenty to thirty times heavier. We must  
15 act to impose a modest fee on these and other single-  
16 use bags. Our legislation, Intro 1527, would also  
17 create a multilingual education for all communities  
18 and small businesses, a dedicated fund to distribute  
19 free reusable bags to low-income New Yorkers and also  
20 exempt residents from SNAP and also from WIC. Now,  
21 we have seen other state and country set a global  
22 model to fight plastic bag pollution. It's time for  
23 New York City to emerge as a leader in its own right.  
24 Thank you, Speaker Johnson, for moving this so  
25 quickly, and of course my partner, Council Member

1  
2 Lander and Chair Reynoso for your unwavering support  
3 and of course to the diverse coalition of advocates  
4 who have been there with us from the beginning,  
5 especially our schoolchildren, our youngsters, our  
6 future leader who's been with us all the way fighting  
7 for this, and I urge my colleague to vote for Intro  
8 1527. Thank you. [applause]

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. Thank  
10 you, Council Members Chin and Lander for your bravery  
11 and your courage, but most importantly your  
12 determination. We'll now call up Council Member  
13 meniscus.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I  
15 want to speak and give incredible props to Council  
16 Member Costa Constantinides, the entire team of staff  
17 that have been working on this for so many years.  
18 But I want to also take this opportunity to thank you  
19 all the people on the ground in our neighborhoods. I  
20 represent Red Hook and Sunset Park. You have  
21 organizations like Uprose, who have been fighting  
22 this fight for such a long time, every opportunity to  
23 be heard, bringing young people to the forefront,  
24 creating an intergenerational, ah, space for advocacy  
25 and now on the floor of the City Council we get to

1  
2 pass incredible legislation. During the hearing we  
3 heard so much from young people and everyone,  
4 everyone, but I want to express just the incredible  
5 passionate work that young people have been doing in  
6 our neighborhoods. When we think about the work that  
7 we have to do next I also want to hark and think  
8 about the jobs that are being created that are going  
9 to help get us to these goals and to these caps.  
10 This is going to create a massive amount of jobs and  
11 the people on the ground that are going to be working  
12 are going to be construction workers, including  
13 immigrants and day laborers. We are in the middle of  
14 a situation where we are pushing development because  
15 of the Green Deal, but on top of that we need to make  
16 sure that all these workers are safe. We just heard  
17 from three, ah, the speaker talked about the three  
18 members of our community who died. These are  
19 Latinos. These are immigrants who are dying on our  
20 construction sites. So as we push for these measures  
21 for green economy, we've got to make sure that they  
22 get training and safety and this City Council has  
23 committed to that today to ensure that we get that.  
24 More to come at the next Stated because we will be  
25 pushing legislation to extend the deadline that we

1  
2 have set at the City Council, but also bring you  
3 resources and new ideas for that access to  
4 construction safety education. So let us not forget  
5 those that we just honored today in the deaths of our  
6 construction and let's honor the new workers that are  
7 going to come with incredible safety. Thank you,  
8 Costa, thank you Speaker and the rest of the council.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. I'm  
10 now going to call for Council Member Van Bramer.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
12 very much, and with your permission I'd like to vote  
13 aye on all.

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We're now going  
18 to call on Council Member Koo.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you, Majority  
20 Leader. Thank you to all of those who stopped by  
21 yesterday and supported the students in the historic  
22 first [inaudible] in New York City Hall. Thank you  
23 Speaker Johnson for making it possible. Tomorrow is  
24 the start of Passover and Sunday is Easter, so I want  
25 to wish everyone happy holidays and also today voting

1  
2 on legislation that would impact hospitals. Take  
3 care of our environment is something we must all do.  
4 Hospitals were concerned about this but thank you to  
5 Council Member Constantinides for working with them  
6 on the new targets and compromises. Thank you.

7 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you,  
8 Council Member Koo. Thank you and report of special  
9 committees.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: None.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible] Madam  
12 President, I believe that my name is on the list.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: You are on the  
14 list for general discussions.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: OK, well that was an error.  
16 I apologize. May I speak now?

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Yes, permission  
18 granted.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Thank you, Madam President.  
20 Today we're passing monumental, ground-breaking  
21 environmental protections of which we can and should  
22 all be proud. As I said this morning at committee,  
23 Mr. Chairman Constantinides deserves much credit for  
24 leading his life's work to today's achievements. I  
25 will join in voting for the entire package that is

1  
2 coming out of the Environmental Protection Committee,  
3 I think it's wise, and I am grateful for his  
4 leadership. I arise to speak on another bill that is  
5 coming from a different committee, Introduction 1527.  
6 Mr. Speaker is right that those utilizing the brown  
7 paper bags, ah, if they are using their benefits card  
8 at the time they're making their purchase will not  
9 pay a fee. However, I think there's an important  
10 distinction and as the speaker said when he mentioned  
11 it, it's if their using their card in full or in  
12 part. But as we know, those of us who have been  
13 involved for a long time in the business of helping  
14 people with their benefits, benefits run out in the  
15 middle of the month, sometimes even earlier than  
16 that, and the distinction that we need to note is  
17 that once the benefits run out if somebody who is  
18 poor, somebody who has benefits pays cash for their  
19 products, they will not receive a free bag. The poor  
20 will not be completely exempt. Only when they're  
21 using their benefits card. And I think it's  
22 important to note that because I do believe this is a  
23 tax. I believe it's a tax on the people who can  
24 least afford it. I know there are very good reasons  
25 to do this. I know there are, and the people who are



1  
2 supporting this have their hearts in it for the right  
3 reasons. I believe it and I know it's true. But I  
4 also think that we do need to think about those who  
5 can't afford it, those who are having trouble making  
6 ends meet, those who need a little extra. And they  
7 will have this tax on them and for that reason, Madam  
8 President, I will be voting aye on the entire package  
9 but I will not be able to join in voting for Intro  
10 1527. Thank you for accommodating me and I apologize  
11 for the switch on the list. Thank you. [pause]

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Report of  
13 standing committees.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on  
15 Environmental Protection, Intros 276A through 1318A  
16 on page 2, Climate Mobilization Act.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Happily in an excited  
18 way amended and coupled on general orders.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on  
20 Finance, preconsidered Reso 846, organization  
21 funding.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
23 orders.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Preconsidered LU 395 and  
25 Reso 851, Prospect Park South.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
3 orders.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on  
5 Land Use, LU 369 and Reso 852, McDonald Avenue.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
7 orders.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: LU 373 and Reso 853 through  
9 LU 375 and Reso 855, Blondell Commons.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
11 orders.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: LU 379 and 380, 1640  
13 Flatbush Avenue.

14 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Approved with  
15 modifications and referred to the City Planning  
16 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70B of the Rules of  
17 the Council, and Section 197D of the New York City  
18 Charter.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Excuse me. LU 382 and Reso  
20 856 through LU 385 and Reso 859, Bruckner Boulevard.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
22 orders.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: Preconsidered LU 396 and  
24 Reso 860, school facility.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
3 orders.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Report of the Committee on  
5 Sanitation and Solid Waste Management, preconsidered  
6 Intro 1527, paper bag fee.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on general  
8 orders.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: On the general order  
10 calendar, Intro 720, site safety training.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: We're recommitting this  
12 to the Committee on Housing and Buildings.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Resolution appointing  
14 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Commissioner of Deeds  
16 is coupled on general orders and at this time I would  
17 ask for a roll call vote on all of the items on  
18 today's general order calendar.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Vallone.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: I'd like to vote  
21 aye on all and wish everyone a happy Easter and  
22 Passover, and blessings to everyone. Thank you.

23 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Moya.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye on all.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Rosenthal.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: With  
4 permission I'd like to vote on all land use callups  
5 and coupled items on the general order calendar and  
6 all resolutions, and congratulate Council Member  
7 Constantinides on this historic legislation. Thank  
8 you.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Rodriguez.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [inaudible]  
12 permission to vote on all on general orders and land  
13 use, especially those that are a environmental  
14 friendly bill, and congratulations Costa and the  
15 speaker and all the advocates. With these bills we  
16 will be doing what we can to save our planet. So  
17 with that I vote aye.

18 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Adams.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye.

21 UNIDENTIFIED: Ampry-Samuel.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Permission  
23 to explain my vote?

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
25 granted.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: I just want  
3 to congratulate all my colleagues on this package of  
4 bills. But I jus want to just speak briefly on, um,  
5 1527. This was a very, a real struggle for me  
6 because I remember when this conversation about  
7 charging five cents per bag came up in my community  
8 and a lot of seniors felt some kind of way about it  
9 and did talk about the stress that this will cause on  
10 them and, um, I will say that I do appreciate the  
11 fact that we will be able to have a robust initiative  
12 of being able to provide reusable bags throughout  
13 community and to those who will need it so that there  
14 won't be this five-cent fee. But I just wanted to  
15 say on the record that I did struggle with 1527 just  
16 up until a few minutes ago, honestly, but I do vote  
17 aye on all and appreciate everyone's efforts on the  
18 bills, and I do vote aye on all. Thank you.

19 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

20 UNIDENTIFIED: Ayala.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye on all.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to  
24 explain my vote?  
25

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
3 granted.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I  
5 just want to echo the comments made by my colleague,  
6 Alicka Samuels, and I also want to say I vote aye on  
7 all with the exception of Land Use 374, no, I'm  
8 sorry, 379, and 380, and the accompanying  
9 resolutions. I believe that until this body takes a  
10 strong look at what we're saying is affordable and  
11 until we move away from the 25% so-called affordable  
12 and 75% market we're doing a disservice to the people  
13 who live here. Thank you.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Borrelli.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all  
16 except Intro 276, 1032, 1253, 1527. Thank you.

17 UNIDENTIFIED: Brannan.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Cabrera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to  
21 explain my vote?

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I want to say a  
25 special thanks to Council Member Margaret Chin for

1  
2 her leadership and alongside Brad Lander, Council  
3 Member Lander as well. We have literally hundreds of  
4 thousands of bags the Department of Sanitation has  
5 available for those who are in need of them. I was  
6 one of those who was against this bill a couple of  
7 years ago, but when I started seeing bags flying all  
8 over my districts, in trees and causing all kinds of,  
9 ah, clogging in the drainage system, etc., etc.,  
10 etc., I am seeing what was happening in other states  
11 where some of my brothers live and there is life  
12 after this bill, and its going to be good for the  
13 environment. I also want to congratulate my  
14 colleague Constantinides, ah, and thank you for your  
15 consideration with the houses of worship. They do  
16 have a responsibility for the environment as well,  
17 but it was just right. It was just right, all the  
18 adjustments that were made in their consideration,  
19 and with that I vote aye on all.

20 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and  
21 happy belated birthday, Council Member Cabrera.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you, thank  
23 you so much.

24 UNIDENTIFIED: Chin.  
25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye on all,  
3 and I wanted to tell my colleague I look forward to  
4 coming to your district to help the Department of  
5 Sanitation to give out reusable bags, to seniors, to  
6 low-income families, I think it's going to be  
7 exciting. It might be difficult in it beginning, but  
8 I think people will get used to it and I also really  
9 wanted to congratulate Chair Constantinides again  
10 because New York, New York City is taking the lead.  
11 It's time for, ah, environmental justice, um, and  
12 we're taking a big step, and I want to wish everyone  
13 a happy Passover and happy Easter, and I vote aye on  
14 all. Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Cohen.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I vote aye.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Constantinides.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Madam  
20 Majority Leader, may I be excused to explain my vote?

21 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
22 granted.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I'll be  
24 very brief. I just want to congratulate all of my  
25 colleagues today who are passing legislation, Council



1  
2 Member Espinal and his Green Roofs bills, Council  
3 Member Donovan Richards, who has been a great  
4 environmental advocate in his own right and doing so  
5 many amazing things, so thank you, Council Member  
6 Richards, and to Brad Lander and Council Member Chin  
7 as well. Congratulations on your legislation. I  
8 know it's been a long time, and thank you again to  
9 Speaker Johnson. I vote proudly aye on all.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Cornegy.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to  
13 explain my vote?

14 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
15 granted.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I want to first  
17 say that for the first year since I've been in the  
18 council I got a hundred on my environmental, so I'll  
19 be keeping with that. I knew you'd clap, Donovan.  
20 So I want to keep with that. I want to say  
21 congratulations to Council Members Espinal, Richards,  
22 Constantinides, Chin, and Lander. Many people know  
23 that in the last session I did vote no on the bags,  
24 but due to, um, commitment from the chairs to do a  
25 very robust round of not only education but

1  
2 disbursement of bags I changed to a yes. I'm proud  
3 to be a part of a body that is relentless in its  
4 pursuit to have a clean NYC. I want to thank the  
5 speaker for his commitment to making sure that those  
6 people who have opposing views are protected and have  
7 an opportunity to have those opinions heard, and on  
8 that I vote aye on all.

9 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Diaz.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Permission to  
12 explain my vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
14 granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you, Madam  
16 Chairlady. I'm here to vote no on Resolution 1513,  
17 1514, 1522, 1527, 1580, 1532, 1540. And by the way,  
18 ladies and gentleman, 1527 would put a burden on  
19 senior citizens. I'm here to fight and protect  
20 senior citizens. I understand supporting the  
21 environment. But senior citizens would be burdened.  
22 It's a burden on senior citizens and the City of New  
23 York and we're here to protect and I want senior  
24 citizens, the senior citizens of New York City to  
25 know, especially in the Bronx, that they have someone

1  
2 here that will stand for them, that will fight for  
3 them, and this is wrong on senior citizens. I'm also  
4 voting no on Resolution 847 and 849. God bless you  
5 all. Thank you very much. Happy holiday.

6 UNIDENTIFIED: Dromm.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

8 UNIDENTIFIED: Espinal.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Permission to  
10 explain my vote?

11 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
12 granted.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Thank you,  
14 Majority Leader Cumbo. Well, I'm excited to be  
15 voting on these bills, bills that would make New York  
16 City greener, cleaner, and more livable for all New  
17 Yorkers. As we all know, we're living in a time  
18 where a federal government continues to push back and  
19 roll back all the progress we've made in the  
20 conversation of fighting climate change. It's  
21 important for cities like New York to step up with  
22 bolder and more aggressive policies. Together with  
23 my colleagues, Council Member Donovan Richards and  
24 Steve Levin, we are passing a package of legislation  
25 that would require pretty much a lot of New York City

1  
2 buildings in the five boroughs to have a sustainable  
3 roof. I believe that these bills will deliver the  
4 type of action our country and the globe needs to  
5 fight climate change. Whether it's a green roof as  
6 beautiful as one we see on top of the Barclay Center  
7 or solar panels or both, in the 21st century  
8 sustainable buildings must be a part of our building  
9 design. Before I go any further, I just want to give  
10 a few quick shout-outs to a few folks who have been  
11 working with me on these bills for many years, the  
12 founders of Brooklyn Grange, the People's Climate  
13 March, Aziz Decan, Steve Peck, the founder of Green  
14 Roofs for Healthy Cities in Toronto, which has set  
15 the model for green roof legislation, Lisa Bloodgood  
16 from the Newtown Creek Alliance, Costa, my colleague,  
17 for getting this through the committee and getting it  
18 [inaudible] for us to vote, and the speaker, of  
19 course. Green roofs are pleasing to the eye, but  
20 they offer so much more than just a view. We can use  
21 green roofs to advance the cause of environmental  
22 justice, especially in neighborhoods like the ones I  
23 represent, where there is a disparity in air quality  
24 and green spaces. Green roofs reduce air pollution  
25 by absorbing pollutants. For example, in my district

1  
2 we have some of the worst asthma rates, while we also  
3 have some of the worst air quality, issues that green  
4 roofs can help alleviate. Green roofs have been  
5 proven to mitigate urban island effect by cooling  
6 down buildings and bringing much-needed economic and  
7 physical relief for residents and businesses alike.  
8 A cooler building means more comfort and less energy  
9 costs. Not only do sustainable roofs reduce car  
10 emissions, they are also a boon to local economy,  
11 creating good-paying jobs and encouraging the growth  
12 of a green sector economy. There are many other  
13 environmental benefits, like cleaner water, and I  
14 would go on and on and on, but I just really want to  
15 say thank you to all my colleagues who voted on this  
16 bill, and it's a great day for New York. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you for  
18 your leadership.

19 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Madam Majority Leader,  
20 I just want to remind the council members that are  
21 hear that we are voting on two resolutions, which  
22 you'll bring up later in the agenda, and so we do  
23 need to maintain a quorum, so we need members to  
24 remain for the remainder of the meeting until we get  
25 to general discussion.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

3 UNIDENTIFIED: Eugene.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

5 UNIDENTIFIED: Gibson.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to  
7 explain my vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
9 granted.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam  
11 Majority Leader, and good afternoon colleagues. It's  
12 really a great honor to join with all of you in  
13 voting in the affirmative on this incredible package  
14 related to environmental justice and addressing  
15 climate change and really making sure that the City  
16 of New York is leading on this very important issue  
17 to save our planet. I am grateful for our  
18 environmental protection chair, Council Member Costa  
19 Constantinides, and I want to also thank Council  
20 Member Donovan J. Richards, Council Member Steve  
21 Levin, and Council Member Rafael Espinal for their  
22 leadership, and really making sure that the City of  
23 New York is not only leading the way, but we're  
24 looking at both short- and long-term goals,  
25 recognizing that a lot of these efforts are going to

1  
2 take several years to implement. I am also speaking  
3 on behalf of preconsidered Intro 1527. I want to  
4 thank Council Member Margaret Chin and Council Member  
5 Brad Lander for their leadership and also  
6 acknowledging and going on the record, two years ago  
7 when this body voted to impose a fee on plastic bags  
8 I was one of those council members that was opposed  
9 to the idea of posing a fee, for many of the  
10 sentiments that have already been expressed in terms  
11 of low-income and vulnerable communities feeling that  
12 burden at a greater advantage, and during that time  
13 as an elected official we are always in the business  
14 of learning and growing, and certainly this is an  
15 effort we are undertaking that is going to change the  
16 behavior and the practice that New Yorkers have and  
17 so while this legislation is really codifying what  
18 the state legislature has done and really making sure  
19 that the City of New York is going to now buy into  
20 this effort, I'm grateful and calling all of my  
21 colleagues, particularly my Bronx delegation, to make  
22 sure that we can aggressively get all of our Bronx  
23 residents, our supermarkets and small businesses on  
24 board so we can help educate our residents so that we  
25 can all be a part of saving our community and living

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

in a cleaner environment for the sake of our children. So with that, congratulations colleagues. I wish you all happy holidays, happy Passover, happy Easter, and happy Resurrection Sunday. I vote aye on all. Thank you.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Grodenchik.

COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Just briefly, Madam Majority Leader, if you'll indulge me. I want to thank Chair Constantinides for listening to and acting upon the concerns that I had that would have affected over 10,000 families in my district. With that I vote aye on all, except for 1527, which is a no, and I wish everybody a joyous holiday weekend regarding Passover and Easter. Thank you.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Holden.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I vote aye on all, except Intro 1527, which I see as just another tax, especially on seniors.

UNIDENTIFIED: Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Congratulate, congratulations to Costa, Brad, and Margaret. I vote aye on all.



2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

UNIDENTIFIED: King.

COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Congratulations to all who got legislation passed today. Constantinides, job well done. I vote aye on all, and happy Resurrection Season to all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Congratulations to Council Member Constantinides and Council Members Chin and Lander, and also Council Member Espinal for passing important bills today. I vote aye on all.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Koslowitz.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I want to congratulate my colleague, Costas, and my friend on his magnificent legislation. I won't be around in 2050, but my grandchildren will [laughter], so thank you. And also to Margaret and Brad, thank you. I'm already collecting my bags, you know, to go shopping, and I want to wish everybody happy holidays.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and you're going to live forever, Karen. And Karen, how do you vote on all?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye.

[laughter]

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I hope my hair looks  
3 that good in 2050.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: [laughs]

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Because you look  
6 amazing.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Lancman.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: No on 1527, but  
9 aye on the rest.

10 UNIDENTIFIED: Lander.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Permission to  
12 explain my vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
14 granted.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, Madam  
16 Majority Leader. I've said this before, but it  
17 really is true. Every night when I get home my  
18 daughter, Rosa, who is 15, says to me, Dad, what did  
19 you do today about climate change? This planet that  
20 you're handing off to us needs urgent action. What  
21 did you do about it today? And I'll be honest, most  
22 days I don't have anything that good to tell her, but  
23 today there's a lot to say, and I want to give big  
24 props to Costa on all the legislation there to be  
25 able to say we're passing the most aggressive action

1  
2 to reduce emissions and energy consumption in our  
3 largest buildings is extraordinary. Ah, to Council  
4 Member Espinal, the bill requiring solar and green  
5 roofs on top of new construction is going to make a  
6 huge difference in Gowanus and all throughout the  
7 city and obviously I am thrilled that we are finally  
8 taking action to get rid of the scourge of plastic  
9 and single-use bags. Three years ago this council in  
10 a close vote, and I'm really encouraged by the fact  
11 that today's vote I think will be a stronger one,  
12 voted 28-20 to take action on bags, but as you know  
13 the state overturned us and in that time we have  
14 sent, spent, sent over 25 billion single-use bags to  
15 our landfills, 25 billion bags, hundreds of thousands  
16 of pounds of solid waste, costing the city something  
17 like 50 million dollars, and finally we are going to  
18 take real action, not just to get them out of the  
19 trees and the storm drains, but to get them out of  
20 our landfills as well. Here's the beautiful thing.  
21 That little fee, as much as it annoys people, it acts  
22 incredibly to get people to bring reusable bags  
23 instead of take a new one, and all across the world,  
24 all across the country, in all kinds of cities,  
25 regardless of people's income, their race, their age,

1  
2 their family size, whether they think of themselves  
3 as environmentalists, that small fee helps all of us  
4 bring reusable bags and stop having waste that we  
5 just don't need. Big props to the advocates, to  
6 NRDC, New York League of Conservation Voters, Plastic  
7 Bag [inaudible] dot organization, Nilpeas, Citizens'  
8 Campaign for the Environment, and so many more who  
9 got us here today. I vote aye on all.

10 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you and  
11 thank you for your leadership.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Levin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to  
14 explain my vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
16 granted.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam  
18 Majority Leader. I just want to thank and  
19 congratulate all of my colleagues on their  
20 legislation passing today, Council Members Lander and  
21 Chin, on this amazing and long-fought and hard-fought  
22 victory here on this legislation. Congratulations  
23 Council Member Espinal for his amazing work on  
24 advancing green roofs in our city, Council Member  
25 Richards for his work as well, to the speaker and to

1  
2 the entire staff here at the council. It's  
3 unquantifiable how many hours went into this package  
4 of legislation, um, staff hours, really considered  
5 thought in making sure that we are doing the best  
6 that we can do and being responsible to future  
7 generations. I want to obviously acknowledge all the  
8 advocates that worked hard on these issues, the  
9 environmental advocates, the social justice advocates  
10 who have made climate change and combating climate  
11 change a priority for our city in realizing the  
12 economic impact and the social impact that this is  
13 going to have for many years to come in making sure  
14 that we are doing everything we can. And last and  
15 most importantly I want to acknowledge Costa  
16 Constantinides, who was so considerate and thorough  
17 and thoughtful in negotiating this legislation and  
18 was a total professional and made sure that she bill  
19 was the best that it could be, that it wasn't rushed.  
20 He toiled on this for over two years and as a result  
21 we have a bill that we can all be proud of, that the  
22 entire city can be proud of, and we are handing off a  
23 better city to future generations and with that I  
24 vote aye on all. Thank you, Madam Majority Leader.

25 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

UNIDENTIFIED: Matteo.

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: No on 1527. No on 1253. No on 1032 and 276. Aye on the rest.

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam Majority Leader, with profound heartfelt gratitude and congratulations to Council Member Constantinides and of course the other sponsors of the great bills today, Council Members Chin, Lander, Espinal, and with best wishes to New Yorkers celebrating and observing Pesach and Easter in the coming days I proudly vote aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Maisel.

COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: No on 1527, yes on everything else.

UNIDENTIFIED: Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

UNIDENTIFIED: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to explain?

MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission granted.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: First of all, I'd  
3 like to congratulate my colleagues on this incredibly  
4 courage legislation that is being passed today,  
5 particularly Costa, for your hard work, Former Chair  
6 Richards, and Margaret. This has been a long time  
7 coming. Congratulations. Before I vote aye on all,  
8 but I also want to say that I did some investigation  
9 and there is absolutely no truth to the rumor that  
10 our colleague, Robert Cornegy, will be leaving to  
11 coach St. John's University. [laughter] And happy  
12 holidays to all. Aye on all.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Powers.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: I vote aye and a  
15 very big congratulations to my colleagues, including  
16 Costa, for his bill today. Thank you for all your  
17 hard work.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thanks.

19 UNIDENTIFIED: Reynoso.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to  
21 explain my vote?

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
23 granted.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I want to  
25 congratulate Margaret Chin and Brad Lander for the

1  
2 work that they did with single-use bags and this  
3 council for being thoughtful about a comprehensive  
4 approach to dealing with single-use plastic and  
5 single-use paper bags. I also want to let the  
6 council know you can call me the reusable bag man.  
7 If you need bags, give me a call and I will make sure  
8 the Department of Sanitation gets you your bags. You  
9 can text me or you can shoot me a call. I'll make  
10 sure it happens. Yes, I'll get a beeper, there you  
11 go. And for Costa, I'm giving out names, the New  
12 York City Council's Captain Planet for the work that  
13 he did today. I really want to give him a shout  
14 because this was not easy to do and again the City  
15 Council has been comprehensive about what, how  
16 they're thinking about the environment. So thank  
17 you, Costa, for the work you did and to my colleague,  
18 Donovan J. Richards, Steve Levin, and Rafael Espinal,  
19 also being a part of the team and making sure that  
20 this city will look much better and will be left in a  
21 better place because of the work you did and my 15-  
22 month-old baby, Alejandro, is going to be very  
23 grateful for the work that we did here today. So  
24 thank you and I vote aye on all.

25 UNIDENTIFIED: Richards.



2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to  
3 explain my vote?

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
5 granted.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Happy to follow  
7 Bag Man, I guess we can call you, Reynoso, right?  
8 [laughter] Bag Man. Ah, what an honor to be here  
9 today. First off, let me start by thanking the  
10 speaker, ah, and both Chair Costa Constantinides and  
11 my other colleagues on this outstanding package of  
12 bills. You know, these bills are really bold. They  
13 are a bold response to the effects of climate change  
14 and I know Debbie Rose sits to my left, I know Carlos  
15 Menchaca represents Red Hook, Carlina represents the  
16 Lower East Side, and our communities were impacted by  
17 Hurricane Sandy and we need a bold response to  
18 really, to scourge, to stop the scourge of climate  
19 change for our communities. On a day like this when  
20 it rains, Daneek Miller and I know there will be  
21 homeowners in our districts whose basements are under  
22 water. When we have these storms that seem to be  
23 coming more ferociously and frequently, ah, over a  
24 few months of the year, communities like the  
25 Rockaways are impacted horribly, flooding, you can't

1  
2 even drive through roads. So when people talk about  
3 the impacts later, we are living with the impacts  
4 now, and this is why these bills are good. I'm happy  
5 to sponsor Intro 276, which will requiring buildings  
6 five stories or smaller to install green roofs, solar  
7 panels, or small wind turbines as we move forward. I  
8 know I've got a few seconds left, but I'm just  
9 thinking back to those senior citizens who could not  
10 walk downstairs in their buildings because their  
11 common areas weren't lit, they couldn't get access to  
12 their drugs if they needed it. I know when I got  
13 elected there were still people without electricity,  
14 I mean, you're talking over a year after Hurricane  
15 Sandy had already occurred. So having solar panels  
16 and a renewable future will ensure that our  
17 communities could survive in the future. So once  
18 again I want to thank Costa for thinking out of the  
19 box and really being courageous in moving this  
20 package of bills, and all my other colleagues, and  
21 with that being said I vote aye.

22 UNIDENTIFIED: Rivera.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Congratulations  
24 everyone, it's really exciting that we're taking  
25

2 action now for the future and I proudly vote aye on  
3 all.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Rose.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I want to  
6 congratulate my colleagues on this historic  
7 environmentally responsible bills and I vote aye on  
8 all.

9 UNIDENTIFIED: Salamanca.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

11 UNIDENTIFIED: Torres.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

13 UNIDENTIFIED: Treyger.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to  
15 explain my vote, please?

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Permission  
17 granted.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you. I'd  
19 like to speak about Intro 1527. In the previous  
20 council I did not support the bill that created a fee  
21 on plastic bags because I felt the bill did not go  
22 far enough. I wanted a ban. I wanted also back in  
23 2007 when I worked for a state lawmaker part time, I  
24 worked on a bill in Albany to ban plastic bags in New  
25 York State and we were told it would never happen.

1  
2 Take a good look today. California has banned  
3 plastic bags and imposed a fee on paper bags back in  
4 2014, and I'm glad that we are now taking bolder  
5 steps with this current measure. As someone who has  
6 argued that the city has not done enough to reduce,  
7 reuse, and recycle and as someone who has joined  
8 Southern Brooklyn Residents in Opposition to a waste  
9 transfer station that now stands facing my district,  
10 I think it would be hypocritical for us to block  
11 measures that reduce the amount of waste we are  
12 producing. So I am glad that we are taking steps to  
13 do away with plastic bags in New York and I support  
14 this legislation because this fee can help us reduce  
15 reliance on paper bags while helping cover the cost  
16 of reusable bags for New Yorkers. And with that also  
17 I want to commend all of my colleagues on their great  
18 bills and a big shout out, he deserves a lot of kudos  
19 today, Costa, because he really listened to  
20 everyone's concerns, he made adjustments where he  
21 felt where necessary but never compromised the  
22 integrity of his bills. He is a true lawmaker in  
23 every sense of the word, a true public servant, and  
24 with that I vote aye on all.

25

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you and  
3 happy belated birthday, Council Member Treyger.

4 UNIDENTIFIED: Ulrich.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye on all  
6 with the exception of preconsidered Intro 1527.

7 UNIDENTIFIED: Yeger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I vote aye on all  
9 with the exception of 1527, and my best wishes to all  
10 for a wonderful Easter and a wonderful Pesach. Thank  
11 you.

12 UNIDENTIFIED: Cumbo.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I vote aye.

14 UNIDENTIFIED: Speaker Johnson.

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All items on  
17 today's general order calendar are adopted by a vote  
18 of 47 in the affirmative, 0 negative, and 0  
19 abstentions, with the exception of Intro 1527, which  
20 was adopted by a vote of 38 in the affirmative, 9  
21 negative, and 0 abstentions. Intro 276A, which was  
22 adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 2  
23 negative, and 0 abstentions. Introduce 1032A, which  
24 was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 2  
25 negative, and 0 abstentions. And Intro 1253C, which

1  
2 was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 2  
3 negative, and 0 abstentions. [applause]

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you. Quiet  
5 in the chamber. We are now going to go to  
6 introduction and reading of bills.

7 SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills are referred  
8 to committee as indicated on the agenda, and Madam  
9 Majority Leader I was remiss. On all of the very  
10 complicated bills that we voted on today the amazing  
11 guy who runs this body every single day did an  
12 incredible job and I really, really want to thank my  
13 chief of staff, who is an incredible resource to all  
14 the members and staff here, Jason Goldman, for his  
15 hard work on that. [applause]

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We will now move  
17 into the discussion of resolutions. Are there any  
18 members who wish to speak on any of today's current  
19 resolutions that we will be addressing shortly?  
20 Today's resolutions. If no members have signed up  
21 today to discuss today's resolutions, I will now read  
22 them into the record below.

23 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible] please, sit  
24 down.

2 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: I'll now read  
3 today's resolutions into the records. Members who  
4 wish to vote against or abstain on any of these  
5 resolutions should register your vote with the clerk  
6 at the dais. Resolution 66, a resolution calling  
7 upon the state legislature to pass and the governor  
8 to sign legislation that would increase the real  
9 property tax abatement for the installation of a  
10 green roof to \$15 per square foot. All in favor say  
11 aye.

12 COUNCIL RESPONSE: Aye.

13 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All opposed?  
14 Abstentions? The ayes have it. Preconsidered  
15 resolution 845, resolution calling upon New York  
16 State Department of Environmental Conservation to  
17 deny the Water Quality Certification Permit for the  
18 construction of the Northeast Supply Enhancement  
19 Pipeline through the New York Harbor. All in favor  
20 say aye.

21 COUNCIL RESPONSE: Aye.

22 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: All opposed?  
23 Abstentions? The ayes have it. All right.

24 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We will now move  
25 into general discussion.

2 UNIDENTIFIED: Sit down, please  
3 [inaudible].

4 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: We have two  
5 members that have asked to speak on today's general  
6 discussion, beginning with Council Member Barron,  
7 followed by Council Member Kallos.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Ah, thank you. I  
9 just want to call attention to the fact that today  
10 we're celebrating the 50th anniversary of the student  
11 strike and takeover at City College, and I was there  
12 earlier today. They had a commemoration service and  
13 they wanted to highlight the fact that it was 50  
14 years ago that the community residents, community  
15 activists and students decided that...

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Quiet in the  
17 chamber.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: [inaudible]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you....  
20 decided that City College in particular was not doing  
21 enough, and it was their fight and their sacrifice  
22 that brought about open admissions, that instituted  
23 the opportunity for students who graduated and need  
24 some remedial assistance to be able to get that and  
25 to have black studies instituted in CUNY, ethnic



1  
2 studies, Spanish, ah, ethnic studies as well, Puerto  
3 Rican studies as well. And it was a battle that was  
4 long time coming. Of course, it was 1969. It was an  
5 era when all of that was happening. And we've lost  
6 much of that. We no longer have the child  
7 development center that had a focus for people who  
8 lived in the community, the president is talking  
9 about bringing in another agency to operate that and  
10 we're going to look to see how we can combat that.  
11 But I just wanted to highlight the fact that it 50  
12 years ago that we did have the open admissions policy  
13 and with pushback we no longer have 40% black  
14 students at City College, we only have 18% black  
15 students at City College and that's a problem and  
16 that's an issue that we have to address. And finally  
17 I just want to call attention to the passing of a  
18 dear friend of ours, Stanley Connard passed. He was  
19 a great activist. He was a political person, a  
20 product of the New York City schools. He attended  
21 Amherst University and while he was there he was  
22 responsible for the founding of the W.E.B. Dubois  
23 Department of African American Studies, which is one  
24 of the first departments to grant a degree in black  
25 studies. He was responsible for the founding of the

1  
2 Carter Woodson Culture Literacy Project, as well as  
3 Heritage House, which is in my colleague's district  
4 in Brownsville, and he was a great fighter for Boys  
5 and Girls High School. He battled so that it would  
6 not be closed. He served on the school leadership  
7 team. He was a part of the Care Center and he was a  
8 community associate. And he's going to be sorely  
9 missed. We extend our condolences to his family. He  
10 was a loving, selfless person. He talked about  
11 community all the time and the reason that he did  
12 that was he was involved in making sure that we  
13 advance as a person. He's going to be sorely missed.  
14 Thank you.

15 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you, and I  
16 share your sentiments. Thank you so much. Council  
17 Member Kallos, followed by Council Member Treyger.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Parks should be  
19 for playing, not pesticides. All families should be  
20 able to enjoy our city parks without having to worry  
21 that they're being exposed to toxic pesticides that  
22 could give them and their families cancer. My  
23 daughter isn't allowed to play on the grass,  
24 especially because as a baby she puts everything in  
25 her mouth. I look forward to working with all of you

1  
2 and our city agencies to ban toxic pesticides and  
3 keep our children safe. That's why today I'm joining  
4 with Council Member Carlina Rivera and we are proud  
5 to introduce a bill, 1524, that bans the use of toxic  
6 pesticides, including glyphosate, commonly known as  
7 Roundup, from city parks and lands. The evidence  
8 that Roundup poses a serious health threat is  
9 mounting, despite Monsanto's efforts to defend its  
10 product. Recently two courts have awarded 78 million  
11 and 80 million dollars, respectively, to two  
12 groundskeepers when juries deemed that they developed  
13 cancer in part from prolonged use of Roundup. New  
14 York City has relied on Roundup far too much. In  
15 2016 Roundup was applied over 1000 times by the  
16 city's Department of Parks and Recreation.  
17 Introduction 1524 moves city agencies to biological  
18 pesticides which are derived from naturally occurring  
19 substances as opposed to synthetic substances. There  
20 is the general acceptance that biological pesticides  
21 are usually inherently less toxic than their  
22 conventional counterparts and are often much more  
23 effective at targeting a specific pest. Biological  
24 pesticides can also be used in smaller quantities and  
25 break down in the environment more rapidly. Further,

1  
2 the bill adds measures to prevent harmful pesticides  
3 from contaminating water systems by preventing  
4 synthetic pesticides from being sprayed within 75  
5 feet of a body of water. I would like to thank all  
6 the parents, advocates, actually I introduced this  
7 bill on behalf of kindergarteners and expect experts  
8 who helped us draft a bill that will put New York  
9 City at the forefront of banning toxic pesticides.  
10 You may have just heard from them now. I want to  
11 thank a kindergarten teacher, Paula Rogovan, whose  
12 kindergarten class as PS-290 first brought this issue  
13 to my attention and actually came to City Council to  
14 advocate for this reform, and took over City Hall  
15 with the cutest protest you'll ever see in your life.

16 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you so  
17 much, Council Member Kallos. And now we will have  
18 Council Member Treyger, followed by Council Member  
19 Levin.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you. I  
21 would like to speak about my new resolution, 850,  
22 which calls on the New York State government to pass  
23 and Governor Cuomo to sign into law legislation  
24 introduced earlier this year in the state senate and  
25 the state assembly by State Senator Roxanne Persaud

1  
2 and Assembly Member Michealle Solages. That bill  
3 would help put an end to the unacceptable, antiquated  
4 practice of non-consensual pelvic examinations  
5 conducted by medical students on unconscious  
6 patients. No patient should ever have to enter a  
7 medical for care and leave the victim of such an  
8 egregious violation of their body and their human  
9 rights. Medical students under the supervision of  
10 training physicians enter operating rooms and perform  
11 pelvic examinations on anesthetized patients prior to  
12 surgery. Although patients at teaching hospitals are  
13 provided with consent forms indicating the  
14 involvement of medical students, the forms do not  
15 always explicitly disclose the nature of this  
16 investment. Horrifically, this is a practice that is  
17 legal in 45 US states, including New York. The  
18 American Medical Association, the Association of  
19 American Medical Colleges, and the American College  
20 of Obstetricians and Gynecologists have all denounced  
21 the practice and recommended that patients must be  
22 specifically informed and provide consent before any  
23 such procedure can take place. The senate and  
24 assembly bill would prohibit performing or  
25 supervising a pelvic examination on an anesthetized

1  
2 or unconscious female patient without first obtaining  
3 the patient's icon to the pelvic examination unless  
4 the examination is within the scope of the patient's  
5 surgical process or diagnostic examination, for which  
6 informed consent has been obtained. Thank you, and I  
7 urge my colleagues to sign on.

8 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.  
9 Council Member Levin, followed by Council Member  
10 Menchaca.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
12 much Madam Majority Leader. Today I am proud to  
13 introduce Intro 1528, a bill that will increase  
14 opportunities for jail diversions citywide and  
15 improve access to health care treatment in the  
16 criminal justice system. This bill will establish a  
17 two-tiered healthcare screening for people who are  
18 arrested and awaiting arraignment, enabling defense  
19 attorneys and judges to assess healthcare needs and  
20 identify appropriate treatment before a person enters  
21 jail. According to the Vera Institute, more than 40%  
22 of people in the city's jail system receive some  
23 behavioral health services. These numbers are  
24 significant and we know that for a vast majority of  
25 people with serious behavioral or mental health needs

1  
2 jail is not the appropriate solution. We have an  
3 opportunity to improve our protocols before a person  
4 even enters the criminal justice system and divert  
5 them to the care and treatment that is right for  
6 them. As New York City works to close Riker's Island  
7 we need to do everything that we can to decarcerate  
8 and effectively divert people out of jail and connect  
9 people to treatment and community supports that work.  
10 This program was first modeled in the Manhattan  
11 Detention Center in 2016 with great success. It is  
12 time that we take citywide. I want to thank my  
13 colleagues, Council Member Carlos Menchaca and Diana  
14 Ayala and Margaret Chin for introducing this  
15 legislation with me and I urge all of my colleagues  
16 to sign on as well. That's Intro 1528. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you.

18 Council Member Menchaca.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Thank you. I  
20 want to point to something I mentioned earlier when  
21 we were passing an incredible Green New Deal for New  
22 York City, ah, and incredible jobs that we're going  
23 to be creating, our work sites, our construction  
24 sites are not safe. And the people who are dying are  
25 immigrants in our city who have yet to get access to

1  
2 construction safety classes, OSHA, the standards that  
3 this council voted on a few years ago. Preconsidered  
4 Intro 1533, what I'm hoping everybody signs on to, is  
5 co-primed by me and the Public Advocate, Jumaane  
6 Williams, and this really points to the very  
7 dangerous industry of the construction work and the  
8 tragic deaths of the three workers that we spoke  
9 about and we honored this morning, or earlier today,  
10 underscores the extreme danger facing construction  
11 workers. Even despite the passage of Local Law 196,  
12 which mandates safety training for workers, the law's  
13 implementation has not met its original intent. To  
14 this day many of the estimated almost 200,000 workers  
15 in the city still await this mandated training and as  
16 the administration has failed to release funding to  
17 develop curriculum in a timely way, this is  
18 especially the case for day laborers who make up a  
19 significant portion of the construction workers and  
20 are amongst the most vulnerable workers. They're  
21 being told to go and get training, workers are being  
22 told by private contractors to go get training and it  
23 is our responsibility to ensure that everyone has  
24 access. This bill will extend the deadline and with  
25 a couple other pieces and policy changes we're going



1  
2 to be able to unleash a real robust opportunity for  
3 everyone to get educated. We are in a crisis and  
4 extending the deadline is the one immediate step that  
5 we can take and we will be doing this at the next  
6 Stated, so I hope that you can all joint us. We want  
7 to pull a briefing together to ensure that everyone  
8 understands this very intricate and nuanced  
9 situation, but I'm committed with the Public Advocate  
10 and the Speaker to make this happen. Thank you so  
11 much.

12 MAJORITY LEADER CUMBO: Thank you Council  
13 Member Menchaca. And with no other members signed up  
14 to speak, we will now call on the speaker to close  
15 today's meeting.

16 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Today's Stated Meeting  
17 of April 18, 2019, is hereby adjourned. Everyone  
18 have happy Pesach and Easter. Thank you, Madam  
19 Majority Leader.

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date May 28, 2019