

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION

and

COMMITTEE ON CULTURAL AFFAIRS, LIBRARIES AND  
INTERNATIONAL INTERGROUP RELATIONS

-----X

November 23, 2009  
Start: 1:12 pm  
Recess: 4:59 pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
City Hall

B E F O R E:  
ROBERT JACKSON  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
Domenic M. Recchia, Jr., Co-Chair  
Maria del Carmen Arroyo  
Gale A. Brewer  
Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.  
Bill de Blasio  
Inez E. Dickens  
Simcha Felder  
Lewis A. Fidler  
Daniel Garodnick  
Letitia James

## A P P E A R A N C E S

## COUNCIL MEMBERS:

G. Oliver Koppell  
Jessica S. Lappin  
John C. Liu  
Domenic M. Recchia, Jr.  
Peter F. Vallone, Jr.  
Albert Vann  
David I. Weprin  
David Yassky

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Kate Levin  
Commissioner  
New York City Department of Cultural Affairs

Paul King  
Executive Director for the Office of Arts and Special  
Projects  
Department of Education, Division of Teaching and  
Learning

Gerald Ross  
Dean School of Education  
St. John's University

Karen Alford  
Vice President for Elementary Schools  
United Federation of Teachers

Tom Chaypin  
Singer/songwriter, Member New York Chapter  
Board of Governors of NARAS

Doug Israel  
Director of Research and Policy  
Center for Arts Education

Paul Katz  
Member New York Chapter  
Board of the Recording Academy

Steven Tenin  
Executive Director  
Arts Connection

Olivia Koppell  
Professional Musician, Member  
Systema New York City

Ella Weiss  
President  
Brooklyn Arts Council

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Michael Mao  
Michael Mao Dance Company

Kelly Kulabarra  
Director, Arts and Education Program  
Council on the Arts and Humanities for Staten Island

Steven Macintosh  
Director of Education  
Flushing Council on Cultural and the Arts

Carol Boyd  
Parent Fellow, Parent Leader  
Center for Arts Education in New York, New York City  
Coalition for Educational Justice

Janice Wright  
Public School Parent  
Queens

Francis McGarrett  
Director of Instruction  
Stevenson Aimes Young Playwrights, Inc.

Monica Harris,  
Member  
CPAC, District 1

Debra Greenberg  
Parent Volunteer

1  
2 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Good afternoon  
3 and welcome to today's joint oversight hearing of  
4 the Committees on Education and Cultural Affairs  
5 regarding arts education in New York City public  
6 schools. My name is Robert Jackson, I chair the  
7 Education Committee and we are joined by our  
8 colleagues. This is a joint committee--hold on a  
9 second, please.

10 This is a joint committee hearing.  
11 I'm co-chairing this committee hearing with  
12 Domenic Recchia, the Chair of the Cultural Affairs  
13 committee. And we've been joined by our  
14 colleagues, to my left Lou Fidler of Brooklyn,  
15 Peter Vallone, Jr. of Queens along with  
16 appropriate staff of the various committees. We  
17 will be joined by other members of both  
18 committees. Some of them are involved in  
19 committee hearings over at City Hall on the 14th  
20 floor. This is the 16th floor.

21 This hearing is a follow up to a  
22 2008 joint hearing on arts education by the same  
23 committees. Today's hearing will examine the  
24 impact of recent Department of Education reforms  
25 on the availability, content and sustainability of

1  
2 arts education programs in New York City public  
3 schools, particularly in light of the ongoing  
4 school budget cuts.

5           We all know how essential arts  
6 education is in providing a high quality  
7 education. Research has shown that students who  
8 participate in arts programs not only do better in  
9 other subjects but also less likely to drop out of  
10 school, especially those that come from low income  
11 families. However, we also know that in tough  
12 economic times arts education is usually the first  
13 area that is cut.

14           Many of us remember the mid-1970s  
15 fiscal crisis when more than 14,000 teachers were  
16 laid off, including practically all arts teachers,  
17 virtually eliminating arts programs from city  
18 schools for more than two decades. Arts education  
19 in city public schools have never fully recovered  
20 from those devastating cuts.

21           It wasn't until 1996, almost two  
22 decades later, that we saw the first major effort  
23 to restore arts in city schools with the  
24 announcement of a \$12 million arts education  
25 challenge grant by the Annenberg Foundation to be

1  
2 matched with equal amounts from the public and  
3 private sectors for a total investment of \$36  
4 million over five years. In response to the huge  
5 demand for these arts funds, the then Mayor  
6 Giuliani and the Board of Ed agreed in 1997 to  
7 provide \$75 million over three years to promote  
8 arts instruction through Project ARTS, which is  
9 the acronym for Arts Restoration Throughout the  
10 Schools.

11 Today Project ARTS no longer exists  
12 as a dedicated per capital funding stream for the  
13 arts. Instead, in order to give principals  
14 greater discretion over spending, in 2007 Project  
15 ARTS funding was folded into the Fair Student  
16 Funding formula, an act that prompted community  
17 outcry and fear that our already scarce arts  
18 programs would further shrink. These fears are  
19 not unjustified.

20 In 2001, Chancellor Levy reduced  
21 the allocation for Project ARTS from \$75 million  
22 to \$52 million and gave district superintendents  
23 permission to redirect Project ARTS funds to cover  
24 expenses other than art instruction, supplies and  
25 services of cultural organizations. The result

1  
2 was a 50% reduction in arts education spending.  
3 Arts organizations contend there is still a  
4 pervasive attitude that in a competitive for  
5 scarce resources, arts instruction is a frill that  
6 must take a back seat to core academic classes.

7           Since the discontinuation of  
8 dedicated Project ARTS funding, the Department of  
9 Education has taken a number of steps to encourage  
10 principals to maintain spending on arts education,  
11 increase student access to arts instruction and to  
12 improve accountability for meeting state  
13 requirements for arts education.

14           We will be hearing about all of  
15 these efforts from the Department of Education  
16 shortly. However, despite these efforts, the  
17 Department of Education's own annual Arts in  
18 Schools report shows that most schools do not meet  
19 state requirements nor provide high quality arts  
20 programming to all students. Today the committees  
21 expect to hear about how the DOE and the  
22 Department of Cultural Affairs plan to support  
23 schools, principals, as they work to comply with  
24 state arts education standards.

25           We are also interested in learning



1  
2 how the Department of Education plans to increase  
3 the number of certified art teachers and increase  
4 space for dedicated and well-equipped arts  
5 classrooms. Finally, we're looking forward to  
6 hearing from both the Department of Education and  
7 the Department of Cultural Affairs as to how they  
8 are supporting and cultivating relationships where  
9 arts and cultural institutions. And as we are  
10 entering another tough financial time, how we can  
11 work to protect arts in schools and ensure that  
12 every child has access to a quality arts education  
13 with certified art teaches and properly equipped  
14 spaces.

15 I have to tell you that I'm  
16 extremely skeptical that we will be able to meet  
17 state requirement and provide all students with a  
18 quality education unless we ensure a minimum level  
19 of funding so that arts programs are not reduced  
20 or eliminated in tough fiscal times, such as we  
21 are currently facing. That's why I introduced  
22 resolution 837, a resolution calling upon the New  
23 York City Department of Education to maintain a  
24 minimum level of arts funding in New York City  
25 public schools. I guess I'm not the only one

1  
2 that's skeptical since 32 of our colleagues in the  
3 City Council are also co-sponsoring this  
4 resolution.

5 Today we will also be considering  
6 and hearing testimony on resolution 837. I want  
7 to point out, however, that we will not be voting  
8 on the resolution today as this is just the first  
9 hearing. Everyone who wishes to testify must fill  
10 out a witness slip with our Sergeant of Arms at  
11 the back of the room. If you want to testify on  
12 Resolution 837 please check the appropriate box to  
13 indicate whether you support or oppose the  
14 resolution. To allow as many people as possible  
15 to testify, testimony will be limited to three  
16 minutes per person.

17 Now, let me turn to my co-chair of  
18 this joint committee hearing, Domenic Recchia the  
19 chair of the Cultural Affairs Committee, for his  
20 opening remarks.

21 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Thank you Chair  
22 Robert Jackson and I'd like to thank you and your  
23 entire committee for the work they have done in  
24 putting this together. Thank you everyone for  
25 joining us today to discuss arts in education in

1  
2 New York City public schools.

3 Our committees held a joint hearing  
4 in April of 2008 after the first Annual Arts  
5 Report was published. At that time we were  
6 disappointed to learn that only 4% of elementary  
7 schools were providing instruction in all four art  
8 disciplines, dance, theatre, visual arts and music  
9 and only 29% of middle schools.

10 The second annual report was  
11 released in October 2008 and it revealed that the  
12 elementary grades only 8% of elementary schools  
13 offer the four art forms each year to every child  
14 as required by law. In addition, we learned that  
15 less than half of our middle schools are ensuring  
16 that every child receives the state education  
17 department arts requirements for grades seven and  
18 eight.

19 Nearly 30% of schools have those  
20 certified arts teachers on staff, up from 20% the  
21 previous year. And last year, principals  
22 allocated a smaller percentage of their budgets to  
23 arts education than the previous year, shrinking  
24 to less than 2.9% on an average. The second  
25 report also revealed that high school students had

2 taken three or more credits in arts education, a  
3 decrease since the first report.

4 DOE was due to release the 2008-  
5 2009 report at the end of October 2009 but to date  
6 it has not been released. However, there was some  
7 positive movement towards improved arts education;  
8 the addition of study of moving image to the arts  
9 blueprint and incorporating arts education in  
10 school and principal reviews. Quality reviews  
11 have started including arts education in  
12 evaluating schools' success. Quality review  
13 scores factor into performance bonuses as well as  
14 principals' annual performance evaluation.

15 However, the progress reports  
16 better known as the report cards, are only  
17 minimally influenced by school performance and the  
18 report cards do not have a space on the report  
19 card for arts education and does not take into  
20 consideration the arts education in that school in  
21 evaluating the school as a whole report card.

22 So when parents go to the web site,  
23 they look at these wonderful report cards, they  
24 will not know what is being offered to the  
25 students in the field of the arts, if there's a

1  
2 drama, if there is a music program, if there's any  
3 type of arts program. And no longer would a  
4 parent be able to choose a school or say this  
5 school is good for my child. Because what the  
6 report cards are missing and what the DOE is  
7 missing is that many children wake up every day,  
8 day in and day out, to go to school for that art  
9 class, that drama class, that dance class, that  
10 theatre class, and I could go on and on.

11 It's time to stop. It's time for  
12 the Department of Ed to wake up and say, let's  
13 work together, let's work for the best interest of  
14 the children. And stop putting out all these  
15 reports and stop using data and statistics because  
16 it's not about data and statistics, it's about the  
17 children of New York City. So we have to rise to  
18 the top today to work together.

19 The benefits of arts education are  
20 well documented and studied but they are not  
21 enough. So today I call upon the DOE and  
22 Department of Cultural Affairs to say to the  
23 Council, we want to work with you and see how we  
24 could move forward from here. Thank you and Mr.  
25 Chairman.

2 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you, co-  
3 chair. We've been joined by additional colleagues  
4 that joined after my first round of introductions,  
5 Jessica Lappin down there on my left from  
6 Manhattan, Jimmy Vacca from the Bronx, Oliver  
7 Koppell from the Bronx, Dan Garodnick from  
8 Manhattan down there and to my right, to our right  
9 is Vincent Ignizio of Staten Island.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Mr.  
11 Chairman.

12 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Yes, sir.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: I wanted  
14 to come because I wanted to demonstrate my full  
15 support for a much greater commitment on the part  
16 of the Department to arts education. I heard  
17 Council Member Recchia. I can only say ditto but  
18 I have to leave because I'm Chair of the Committee  
19 on Mental Health, which includes disability  
20 services. We have a hearing that I'm chairing  
21 downstairs so I have to leave. But I appreciate  
22 you holding this hearing. You should know that  
23 I'm in full support.

24 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you  
25 Council Member Koppell. We know that and I

1 understand that you have a conflict right now. So  
 2 we appreciate any time that you're here in during  
 3 this hearing process.  
 4

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Thank you.

6 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: You're welcome.

7 With that, I'd like to introduce the first  
 8 witnesses, we have Santiago Tavares, the Deputy  
 9 Chancellor for the New York City Department of  
 10 Education, Kate Levin, the Commissioner for the  
 11 Department of Cultural Affairs and Paul King, the  
 12 Executive Director of Arts and Special Projects.  
 13 With that, good afternoon to all of you. And I  
 14 don't know who is scheduled to go first. I assume  
 15 that you discussed that but I make no assumptions  
 16 so please, whoever is going to go first, just  
 17 introduce yourself and your position with the  
 18 appropriate agency and you may begin your  
 19 testimony.

20 KATE LEVIN: Good afternoon. I'm  
 21 Kate Levin, Commissioner of the New York City  
 22 Department of Cultural Affairs. I'm here today to  
 23 testify with regards to arts education in New York  
 24 City schools. With me here today from the  
 25 Department of Education are Santiago Tavares and

1 Paul King.

2 Working to ensure that every New  
3 York City school child has access to high quality  
4 arts instruction is a priority for all of us. The  
5 Department of Cultural Affairs is the largest  
6 funder of New York City's cultural community which  
7 has done so much to support arts education in our  
8 public schools. Indeed, 42% of our cultural  
9 development fund grants and 60% of our CDF dollars  
10 fund organizations that applied for programs which  
11 directly serve New York City school children.  
12

13 In addition, the 33 city owned  
14 institutions or CIGs work with more than 800  
15 public schools across the five boroughs. In the  
16 first quarter of this fiscal year alone, CIGs  
17 welcomed 343,000 visits by school children.

18 Through my agency's Materials for  
19 the Arts program, the Department of Cultural  
20 Affairs is also the largest provider of art  
21 supplies in the city's public schools. Last year,  
22 631 public schools came to our Long Island City  
23 warehouse to get free supplies for arts programs.

24 In the first five months of this  
25 year alone, from July through November, we've



1 received 554 visits from 359 schools, that's an  
 2 increase of 13% in the number of visits over last  
 3 year. These numbers tell us that Materials for  
 4 the Arts is recognized as an even more valuable  
 5 partner in our public schools when budgets are  
 6 tight.  
 7

8                   And school leaders aren't coming to  
 9 MFTA for materials alone. The past few years have  
 10 seen a dramatic expansion in our education  
 11 offerings, which serve teachers and students at  
 12 all stages of learning. MFTA host professional  
 13 development P credit courses for teachers, art  
 14 making field trips and art classrooms for K  
 15 through 12 students, warehouse tours for future  
 16 educators working on their degrees, hands on arts  
 17 project for school based family activities and all  
 18 of our classes emphasize the creative value of  
 19 reuse and recycling in making art.

20                   Last month we cut the ribbon on  
 21 10,000 new square feet of warehouse space. This  
 22 city funded expansion brings total square footage  
 23 to 35,000, creating two dedicated classroom spaces  
 24 along with additional space for donations. Also  
 25 last month, we were please to join the Department

1  
2 of Education and the Department of Film, Theatre  
3 and Broadcasting in launching the new blueprint  
4 for teaching and learning in the moving image. My  
5 colleagues at the Department of Education will  
6 provide more detail but it's worth noting that in  
7 the absence of state certification in film,  
8 television or media, the city's efforts were  
9 inspired by the need of in school film programs  
10 for a curriculum with clear, quality measures.

11 The blueprint provides school  
12 leaders with concrete milestones for every grade  
13 level, the first of its kind in the United States.  
14 The moving image blueprint joins the blueprints in  
15 visual art, music, theatre and dance. Like them,  
16 it was created through a collaboration between the  
17 Department of Education and non profit cultural  
18 organizations.

19 We've also worked with the  
20 Department of Education and its arts education  
21 task force to create the arts education reflection  
22 tool, bringing together representatives of the  
23 cultural community to develop consensus around the  
24 indicators of quality in arts education. The  
25 reflection tool, which is rolled out this fall and

1  
2 is available on the Department of Education's web  
3 site provides a guide for principals, teachers,  
4 teaching artists, researchers and cultural  
5 partners to assess program quality by arts  
6 discipline and grade level.

7           Finally, I'm delighted to report  
8 that we're working with Council Member Recchia,  
9 City Council Member and the Department of Youth  
10 and Community Development to administer City  
11 Council funding for the Cultural After School  
12 Adventures program, fondly known as CASA. Now in  
13 its fourth year, CASA builds on and supports the  
14 administration's arts education initiatives by  
15 providing funding for dedicated cultural  
16 partnerships at 255 school sites across the five  
17 boroughs.

18           This year, each Council Member is  
19 making five designations to cultural groups  
20 partnering with schools in their districts. DCA  
21 and the City Council are currently evaluating  
22 partnership proposals and we're looking forward to  
23 site visits later this year.

24           I'd like to thank the Council for  
25 its leadership on arts education. Council Member

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Recchia has been a passionate advocate for extending arts education beyond the school day through the creation of CASA. And Council Member Jackson has proved an enthusiastic champion for arts education across the five boroughs. I'd also like to thank my colleagues at the Department of Education, they are tireless in working with teachers and school leadership throughout the system to ensure as quality arts education for every student and relentless in assessing current achievements and pressing for future progress. Paul King and Santiago Tavares will describe in detail some of the key strides that have been made as well as the challenges that remain.

In closing let me acknowledge how much work remains to be done. Your partnership is critical to advance arts education for every New York City school child. After my colleagues after testimony, I'll be delighted to join them in answering any questions you may have.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you, Commissioner. Next please.

PAUL MR. KING: Thank you Commissioner Levin. It's a pleasure to continue

2 our work with the Department of Cultural Affairs  
3 to benefit the students of New York City. Good  
4 afternoon Chair Jackson, Chair Recchia, members of  
5 the Education Committee and members of the  
6 Committee on Cultural Affairs. My name is Paul  
7 King, I'm Executive Director for the Office of  
8 Arts and Special Projects in the Division of  
9 Teaching and Learning at the Department of  
10 Education.

11 Thank you for the opportunity to  
12 provide you with an update on arts education in  
13 our schools. Under the leadership of Mayor  
14 Bloomberg New York City has made an unprecedented  
15 commitment to provide all students with an  
16 excellent education that prepares them to succeed  
17 in school and beyond. We firmly believe that arts  
18 learning is fundamental to an outstanding  
19 education.

20 Arts programs engage students while  
21 cultivating critical thinking and innovation,  
22 qualities that are in demand across a range of  
23 career paths. Our students deserve a world class  
24 arts education that takes full advantage of the  
25 incredible cultural resources that this city

1  
2 offers. And we've taken strong steps to ensure  
3 that they are getting just that.

4           When it comes to arts education,  
5 New York City has set the bar very high. Arts  
6 instruction must be aligned with the rigorous  
7 performance indicators established in our  
8 blueprints for teaching and learning in the arts.  
9 These blueprints define what students should know,  
10 understand and be able to do in the arts at each  
11 benchmark grade. They're widely recognized as a  
12 model for high quality arts instruction, adopted  
13 by school districts across the country and even  
14 internationally.

15           As Commissioner Levin mentioned,  
16 this year we introduced the new blueprint for the  
17 moving image. This document was developed in  
18 conjunction with DCA, the Mayor's Office of Film,  
19 Theatre and Broadcasting and the TriBeCa Film  
20 Institute and is supported by the JP Morgan Chase  
21 Foundation. We're confident that this latest  
22 blueprint, like the existing blueprints for dance,  
23 theatre and music and the visual arts will set the  
24 pace for teaching and learning in the increasingly  
25 influential field of media arts.

2 As you may recall the Mayor and the  
3 Chancellor launched Arts Count in July 2007.

4 Under that initiative, we introduced a series of  
5 measures to hold schools accountable for providing  
6 students with the arts education they deserve.

7 Beginning during the 2007-2008 school year, arts  
8 education was added as an evaluation criterion for  
9 school quality reviews and principals annual  
10 performance evaluation. Arts education also  
11 factors into schools annual progress report  
12 grades.

13 Perhaps most notably, we began  
14 producing the annual Arts in Schools report, which  
15 collects and synthesizes data on arts  
16 participation, spending, staffing and  
17 instructional programming in New York City  
18 schools. Every year we publish these reports for  
19 individual schools and for the city as a whole.

20 This level of information is not  
21 available for any other academic discipline in our  
22 schools. No other district in New York State  
23 monitors arts participation as comprehensively as  
24 we do and very few districts in the country  
25 approach this level of attention to arts

1  
2 education. Now in its third year, the annual Arts  
3 in Schools report demonstrates the Department's  
4 clear and steady progress in expanding arts  
5 education while also identifying areas where  
6 further development is needed.

7           It is worth mentioning that the New  
8 York State instructional guidelines and  
9 requirements for the arts provide the baseline for  
10 our Arts Count measurements. At the elementary  
11 school level, the state mandates that every  
12 student in every grade receive annual instruction  
13 in all four major art forms, dance, music, theater  
14 and visual arts. They also recommend that 20% of  
15 instructional time be devoted to the arts in  
16 grades 1 to 3 and 10% in grades 4 to 6.

17           While we fully support these  
18 recommendations we also recognize that they are  
19 exceptionally rigorous. It is not surprising that  
20 many elementary schools find these requirements to  
21 be challenging. So we have deepened our efforts  
22 to help more schools meet them. For example,  
23 since elementary students spend most of their day  
24 with a single teacher in their home classroom, we  
25 offer professional development to train those



1  
2 teachers to deliver blueprint aligned arts  
3 instruction as part of those daily lessons.

4 As I will discuss shortly, these  
5 efforts are bearing fruit but much more work is  
6 needed. We welcome the opportunity to work with  
7 City Council Members to help more elementary  
8 schools meet this high standard.

9 At the middle school level, the  
10 state requirements one semester each of music and  
11 visual arts instruction provided by a licensed  
12 arts teacher over the course of seventh and eighth  
13 grades combined. But the state does not currently  
14 recognize theatre and dance instruction as  
15 fulfilling those requirements. For high school  
16 students, the state requires completion of two  
17 semesters of study in any art form. This year,  
18 nearly one-third of graduating seniors exceeded  
19 that requirement.

20 Having outlined the state's  
21 requirements for arts education, I want preview  
22 some key findings that will be included in the  
23 forthcoming 2008-2009 annual Arts in Schools  
24 report that we expect to release in early  
25 December.

1  
2 Last year, 100% of elementary  
3 schools provided arts instruction in at least one  
4 discipline and 96% of schools provided instruction  
5 in at least two. Roughly 12% of elementary  
6 schools are now in compliance with the state arts  
7 requirement to provide elementary students with  
8 annual instruction in all four art forms. This  
9 last number is still far too low but demonstrates  
10 steady progress with compliance, up from 4% in  
11 2006-2007 and 8% in 2007-2008.

12 While that data illustrates a  
13 continued positive trend, it also tells only part  
14 of the story. This year for the first time, we  
15 also captured data about arts instruction provided  
16 by regular elementary classroom teachers, as the  
17 state requirements allow. When this additional  
18 instruction is accounted for, 39% of elementary  
19 schools comply with the state's requirement for  
20 delivering all four art forms in every elementary  
21 grade.

22 In 2008-2009, 63% of responding  
23 middle schools reported that all of their eighth  
24 grade graduates met the requirements to complete  
25 at least one half unit in two arts disciplines.

1  
2 In 2006-2007, only 29% of middle schools reported  
3 meeting that standard. In our high schools we  
4 continue to see increased access to arts programs  
5 as well. 82% of our high schools offer  
6 instruction in at least two disciplines, half  
7 offer instruction in three and nearly a quarter  
8 offer all four art forms, representing a steady  
9 increase in all those categories.

10 In June 2009 the first Chancellor's  
11 endorsed arts diplomas were awarded to 653 high  
12 school students who demonstrated a high degree of  
13 proficiency in the arts by completing a 10 credit  
14 sequence of study in dance, music, theater or  
15 visual arts as well as earning a passing grade on  
16 a rigorous exit exam in their discipline of study.

17 While the forthcoming citywide Arts  
18 in Schools report reveals gaps that we must  
19 continue to address, it also provides clear  
20 evidence that our approach to improving arts  
21 education in New York City is working. Whether  
22 you consider access to arts programs, the number  
23 of certified arts teachers working in our schools,  
24 per capita spending on the arts, or opportunities  
25 for students to pursue advanced learning in the

1  
2 arts, we're seeing positive trends even as overall  
3 school budgets have been shrinking.

4           When this year's aggregate report  
5 is released, we will have a three year profile of  
6 arts education data as a foundation for renewed  
7 collaboration with our partners, parents, the arts  
8 and higher education communities, school leaders,  
9 teachers and elected officials.

10           A key component of those efforts  
11 involves review and analysis of individual arts  
12 reports. Those reports provide critical  
13 information in allowing the Department to identify  
14 schools with an adequate arts access so that we  
15 can provide targeted assistance where it is needed  
16 most. They are also posted on each school's web  
17 site so families and community leaders can learn  
18 about the diverse offerings available in their  
19 local schools.

20           For your convenience, I have  
21 provided today each Council Member with a CD-ROM  
22 with a 2008-2009 arts reports for the schools  
23 cited in your districted. We hope that this  
24 information will be useful to you in your efforts  
25 tot support arts education. We welcome any

1  
2 feedback about the reports or recommendations  
3 about how we might jointly support your community  
4 schools.

5           While I've shared some key arts  
6 participation data from the forthcoming citywide  
7 arts report, I now want to share some additional  
8 finds and discussion specific strategies the  
9 Department has adopted to increase access to arts  
10 education. As you're obviously aware, the past  
11 several years have presented tremendous fiscal  
12 challenges for our city and our schools have not  
13 been immune to those challenges. Moreover, at the  
14 conclusion of the 2006 school year, the Department  
15 announced that it would un-restrict Project ARTS  
16 funding that had previously been earmarked for the  
17 sole purpose of funding arts programs.

18           Schools still receive a per capita  
19 allocation equivalent to past Project ARTS funding  
20 but they now have flexibility over how to spend  
21 those dollars. Both of these conditions prompted  
22 concern that schools would slash spending on arts  
23 instruction. I'm happy to report that those fears  
24 have proven unfounded. Over the past three years,  
25 schools have not significantly or

1  
2 disproportionately cut back spending on arts  
3 instruction. In fact, average per capita spending  
4 on the arts increased slightly from \$311 per  
5 student in 2007-2008 to \$316 in 2008-2009.

6 The amount of money schools spend  
7 on arts education today represents five times the  
8 value of Project ARTS allocation. Project ARTS  
9 funding was essential when the program was  
10 launched but it outlived its usefulness. Our  
11 principals and our teachers understand the value  
12 of arts education but they have continued to make  
13 robust arts programs available to their students,  
14 even in tough times. Moreover, our accountability  
15 measures have proven effective in spurring  
16 expanded access to arts education, even in this  
17 challenging economic climate.

18 As budgets have tightened, we have  
19 seen schools shift a greater portion of their arts  
20 spending toward the hiring of certified arts  
21 teachers, with a commensurate decrease in spending  
22 on materials, supplies and outside partnerships.  
23 We strongly believe that this focused investment  
24 on hiring certified arts teachers is a positive  
25 development. Full time, certified arts teachers

1  
2 possess tremendous expertise and serve as the  
3 anchor for the school's arts program. They  
4 coordinate partnerships with outside arts  
5 organizations and support their colleagues across  
6 a range of academic disciplines.

7           The total number of certified arts  
8 teachers increased by 14.5% from 2004-2005 to  
9 2007-2008 and grew by an additional 3.2% from  
10 2007-2008 to 2008-2009. We're particularly  
11 gratified to see a 36.6% increase in the number of  
12 certified arts teachers working in our elementary  
13 schools during that period because arts  
14 instruction is not required to be delivered by a  
15 certified arts specialist in those grades.  
16 However, we are concerned to see a decrease in the  
17 number of certified music teachers working at our  
18 middle schools. And we're in the process of  
19 identifying concrete strategies and resources to  
20 help our schools reverse that trend.

21           Over the past three years, we  
22 continued making strides in providing central  
23 support for arts education, including extensive  
24 professional development opportunities. Over  
25 1,200 school leaders have appointed arts education

2 liaisons as the point person to collaborate with  
3 my office and to lead in the administration of  
4 arts education programs at their schools.

5 My staff provided a 15 training  
6 workshops to these liaisons last year alone,  
7 helping them evaluate the strength and weaknesses  
8 of their existing arts offerings so they can  
9 continue to build and improve their programs. The  
10 Office of Arts and Special Projects also continued  
11 to provide rigorous blueprint aligned professional  
12 development workshops to both arts and non-arts  
13 teachers, with over 600 educators participating in  
14 training workshops during the 2008-2009 school  
15 year.

16 While my office provides support  
17 and training opportunities open to every New York  
18 City public school, we also analyze data for the  
19 individual Arts in Schools reports to identify  
20 schools where arts access is particularly limited.  
21 Using data from the 2007-2008 school year, we  
22 identified 57 arts needy schools. Each of the six  
23 arts directors from my office provided direct  
24 support to those schools, including site visits  
25 where they consulted with school leaders and



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

teachers to improve arts access.

Additionally, leaders from those 57 schools, along with principals from across the five boroughs were invited to participate in the Schubert arts leadership institute, a three day workshop series to help them envision, implement and support quality arts programs in their school. Going forward, we will continue to track low performing arts schools and provide them with direct support and opportunities for arts leadership training, including specific guidance in addressing budget and scheduling challenges.

We believe that the progress achieved over the last three years is a direct result of Arts Count and the accountability measures implemented under that initiative. School leaders are keenly aware that arts education is essential to a rich, well rounded education. The challenges that our schools face in providing arts access are related to resources, time during the school day and space constraints.

While much work remains ahead, we now have a wealth of information to prioritize our efforts, identify the particular needs of

1 individual schools and directly support our  
2 schools accordingly. We ask the City Council to  
3 partner with us in our continued efforts to ensure  
4 that all New York City students obtain the  
5 rigorous arts education they need and deserve. I  
6 would be happy to address any questions that you  
7 have at this time.  
8

9 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you.

10 We've been joined by additional colleagues, Leroy  
11 Comrie to my right, David Yassky, Bill de Blasio  
12 is here, Al Vann is here. What we are attempting  
13 to do, forgive us if you don't mind, this room is  
14 clearly too small for this particular committee.  
15 Due to logistics, as you know the committee room  
16 is not available to us so we're juggling between  
17 the hearing rooms here at 250 Broadway and our  
18 main chambers. As soon as we get the signal that  
19 the chambers are available, we're going to pause  
20 for ten minutes to relocate to the chambers so  
21 that everyone that wants to be heard and everyone  
22 wants to see and witness the testimony will have  
23 the opportunity to do that. So there is no  
24 indication yet, Jared? Good.

25 So until that time we're going to

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

continue. First colleague for questioning is--

SANTIAGO TAVARES: I'm sorry. I'm Santiago Tavares. I just want to add one thing before.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: I'm so sorry, go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: We thought you just came here just to supervise. My attorney Rachel goes, is he going to say anything? I go, I doubt it. He always loves to speak.

MR. TAVARES: I am Santiago Tavares, Deputy Chancellor for Teaching and Learning. I noticed that everyone was looking for the CDs. We have all of the CDs right here so if someone wants to...for every single city.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Deputy Chancellor is there anything else you want to comment on with respects to the testimony?

MR. TAVARES: I just want to make the comment that although there is a lot of work to do. Like both my colleagues have said, we're definitely on the right track. Together with the City Council and the State Department of Education, we're sure to continue making the

1  
2 strides that we've made so far to make sure that  
3 all of our children have the opportunity to  
4 participate in the arts in all of our schools.

5 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay. Let's  
6 turn to our colleagues, Peter Vallone, Jr. of  
7 Queens for some questions.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Let me  
9 just ask first.

10 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Sure.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Can  
12 someone get that box so we can start giving out  
13 the CDs for everyone so colleagues could...

14 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Lou Fidler, our  
15 colleague from Brooklyn.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Thank you  
17 Chairman Jackson. I want to start by thanking Mr.  
18 King and Commissioner Levin because I suspect that  
19 without all of these detailed efforts that I've  
20 heard from the two of you that there would be  
21 absolutely no arts education in the schools. I  
22 have to tell you that those of us who speak to  
23 principals and parents and even students in our  
24 public schools find a very, very, very different  
25 picture than the one you just painted for us.

1  
2 I know that I provide through  
3 member items but the newspapers like to call as  
4 pork programs for my schools, the Brooklyn  
5 Philharmonic, the Brooklyn Arts Council, the  
6 Brooklyn Ballet, Inside Broadway, Theatre  
7 Development Fund, programs like that. In more  
8 than one case, I would say perhaps in the majority  
9 of cases the principals have said to me thanks for  
10 that money because without that we'd have no  
11 cultural or arts programs in our school. So I  
12 have to say I'm skeptical.

13 You seem to take with great pride  
14 the fact that 96% of the city's elementary schools  
15 are almost 50% compliant with the law. I have to  
16 tell you that I'm a little amazed that you should  
17 be happy about that. That's not, to me, something  
18 that I would be happy about. I am also going to  
19 ask you how you can tell me now, I know this  
20 question sounds rhetorical, but it's not.

21 Given the fact that we're about to  
22 take another PEG, which this Council will not have  
23 any ability to vote on, that is going to impact on  
24 the Department of Education budget. Can you tell  
25 me now that the statistics that you gave me for

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

arts spending in the schools will not be altered in the negative?

MR. TAVARES: We can't make those guarantees being that principals are the ones that drive their budget and make decisions on their budget.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: What incentive does a principal have to maintain that funding when the school report cards and all these other mechanisms that you devised for transparency and accountability place so little emphasis on anything other than reading and math scores?

MR. TAVARES: The incentive comes in the outcomes of the students. I think one of the things we can look at is that schools that are doing well and how well they're doing with the arts as well in correlation to that. We don't know that one thing crosses the other. One of the things I've been doing this year is visiting schools with very rich arts programs.

One of the things we're looking to do is to use some of the schools' budgets, which are all available online, to use as models for schools that don't necessarily have all of their

1 art forms. I think it's very important for us to  
 2 share that information. Being that it is being  
 3 transparent and every school has the annual Arts  
 4 Report online as well, it's important for  
 5 principals to look at how they can also assure  
 6 that their kids get the opportunity to participate  
 7 in the arts.  
 8

9 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: We'll get  
 10 to the measuring and comparison in a moment. You  
 11 indicated that the very first thing that you do is  
 12 measure outcomes. I know how you measure reading  
 13 and math outcomes. How do you measure the arts  
 14 outcomes?

15 MR. KING: As we previously  
 16 referenced, the blueprints have very clear  
 17 indications of student learning, what students  
 18 should know, understand and be able to do in each  
 19 of the four art forms that benchmark grades. So  
 20 our teachers who are delivering the arts  
 21 instruction as well as our cultural partners have  
 22 received a lot of training in how to identify  
 23 quality arts education and student outcomes.

24 Secondly, as Commissioner Levin  
 25 referenced, we just completed an arts reflection

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

tool that allows school leaders to look specifically at the instruction offered in the arts studio, whether it's by a licensed arts teacher or a cultural partner. I think we've done a good and zealous job in really defining what the criteria for what quality arts education looks like.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Mr. King, I don't doubt your zeal because I can tell you're a true believer. I just doubt the system's zeal. I did not hear an answer to a question of how you measure outcomes. You just told me that you provide training but I didn't hear how you measure outcomes.

MR. KING: Well, let me--

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER:  
[interposing] How can you measure an outcome in an area that's not being offered in an elementary school? If 96% of our elementary schools are only providing two of the four areas, I guess the outcome in the other two areas is zero.

MR. KING: First of all, let me correct that statistic.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: I got it



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

from your testimony.

MR. KING: And that's dated from two years ago so let me just try to clarify here. What we saw, you're absolutely right, schools--

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: [interposing] Do you have any later statistics. I'm sorry.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Right, you're about to give out the 2008-2009 report.

MR. KING: Yes, sir. So what I pointed out in my testimony is your absolutely right. When you look at the arts instruction at the elementary school level provided only by arts and cultural partners and licensed arts teachers, that figure was 4% for the 2006-2007 school year. Then it increased to 8% in the following school year. In this year, when the report is released, you will see 12% of elementary schools meeting the state requirement in all four arts areas as provided by cultural partners and licensed arts teachers.

However it's important to note, and this is new information, that this year we captured the instruction delivered by classroom teachers at the elementary school level. This

1  
2 year we're showing 39% of elementary schools  
3 meeting the compliance metric of all four art  
4 forms. You're absolutely right, it is still far  
5 too low.

6 But let me address your question  
7 about quality. One of the most important things  
8 that we've done actually is at the high school  
9 commencement level to create arts assessments,  
10 which are in support of the Chancellor's arts  
11 endorsed diploma. Those are very rigorous exams  
12 that really do tell you what the quality of the  
13 arts instruction is and what the student outcomes  
14 are. This year my office is beginning to develop  
15 fifth grade assessments which will look at the  
16 elementary school level and what the arts  
17 instruction should be at that level. We think  
18 that these are largely diagnostic so it will tell  
19 schools where there are gaps, not only in the  
20 student achievement but in their own program.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Well, I  
22 would go back to the first part of your answer. I  
23 guess if you're not able to crack double digits in  
24 your success rate, we change the way we measure  
25 the formula. So now we'll capture the classroom

1  
2 teacher performance and say we're doing better,  
3 where we don't know if we're doing better.

4           And we also don't know whether or  
5 not in fact we're doing worse, if you've been  
6 capturing classroom teacher participation prior to  
7 this, you may have been finding that they felt  
8 freer to spend more time on arts education but now  
9 the pressure on them to perform on standardized  
10 tests is costing them time. So for all we know  
11 that number is actually down so let's bear in mind  
12 that it is an absolute apples to bananas  
13 comparison.

14           I'm interested in the sentence here  
15 that say schools still receive a per capita  
16 allocation equivalent to the past Project ARTS  
17 funding but they now have flexibility to spend it  
18 on anything. So of course, what you're saying is  
19 we folding the \$75 million or whatever it was, \$67  
20 million Project ARTS funding into the education  
21 budget and sent it to the schools. But then we  
22 cut \$329 million of school spending. How can you  
23 say with all candor that that money is still  
24 there. The fact of the matter is, is that we've  
25 reduced. We aren't happy about it.

1  
2 In fact, two years ago the Council  
3 very much drew a line in the sand and didn't  
4 permit it. But last year there was a cut of about  
5 five times the amount of Project ARTS funding that  
6 went to schools. So what's the significance of  
7 that statement?

8 MR. TAVARES: The school's budget  
9 continued to have an item line number for Project  
10 ARTS, meaning that the schools, the principal, the  
11 public, can see specifically how much money was  
12 allocated to the arts and according to the overall  
13 budgets. We are in very big financial crisis.  
14 Jackson said that quite a few times and we  
15 recognize that. Schools still have to be and are  
16 responsible for all of the different requirements  
17 from the state. Schools will look at their budget  
18 and make the best decisions for their students and  
19 their school. We're going to continue to  
20 encourage them to not make any of the cuts in the  
21 arts.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: So every  
23 school, principal gets a budget at the beginning  
24 of the year, with a Project ARTS item in it and  
25 they must spend that money on arts.

2 MR. TAVARES: No.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Oh.

4 MR. TAVARES: When you said that  
5 the school gets the money folded into it and that  
6 the reduction comes from the arts, you're partly  
7 correct and partly not correct. The fact is that  
8 yes, they have the ability to use that money for  
9 anything else they think is appropriate for the  
10 school. But the line item still shows that the  
11 money was allocated towards Project ARTS.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Mr. Deputy  
13 Chancellor, don't you realize that nobody is  
14 fooled by that. It's wonderful that you're  
15 putting the money in there. Why don't we just put  
16 another line in there that says guidance  
17 counselors and gym teachers and what not and then  
18 tell the principal they can spend it for whatever  
19 they want. The fact is that it's coming to them  
20 on the label and then you're cutting the rest of  
21 their budget so that they need to hire teachers so  
22 that they can have moderate sized classes. Don't  
23 you realize no--that's just utterly ridiculous.  
24 It's utterly ridiculous.

25 MR. TAVARES: I want to make the

1 point that when we get our pay checks, anybody  
 2 here that works gets a pay check, it doesn't give  
 3 you an item line number for rent, for car, for  
 4 this or that. It is your discretion to use that  
 5 money the way you think best fit for your family--  
 6

7 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER:

8 [interposing] Exactly, but there's no line in my  
 9 paycheck that...

10 MR. TAVARES: [interposing] Excuse  
 11 me. I listened to you, I would just ask...

12 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: ...Deputy  
 13 Chancellor that says.

14 MR. TAVARES: ...that you listen to  
 15 me until I'm done.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Fine, go  
 17 ahead.

18 MR. TAVARES: One thing that I do  
 19 have to say, we come here with all good gracious  
 20 and we're here to listen and to work together for  
 21 our kids. But when I speak I like to be listened  
 22 to, just like I listen to you. And we'll listen  
 23 to you until you're done.

24 Allocations come from different  
 25 funding sources. We don't control those. The

1 school gets an allocation for Title 1, gets an  
 2 allocation for Niso [phonetic], gets an allocation  
 3 for fitness gram, gets an allocation for different  
 4 things. As a whole, you put all that money  
 5 together and you figure out how many classrooms  
 6 you have in your building, how many teachers you  
 7 need to meet the state requirements for that kid  
 8 to go from one grade to the other and to learn all  
 9 of the pieces of the coursework. So that's what  
 10 I'm saying. Is the money there? Yes. Is every  
 11 single principal that using it appropriate? No  
 12 and that's what I go back to using the model  
 13 budgets to make sure that we can train principals  
 14 on how to best use that money.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Deputy  
 17 Chancellor, when I get my paycheck there is no  
 18 line in it that says rent, there is no line in it  
 19 that says car payment. But you're now giving  
 20 principals a budget with a line in it that says  
 21 Project ARTS. I have to say to you, in my first  
 22 year of law school we learned a term called legal  
 23 fiction. It sounds a little oxymoronic but that's  
 24 exactly what you're doing. This is a legal  
 25 fiction; you're saying there's arts money there,

1  
2 you're admitting that it's not necessarily used  
3 for arts. It's just kind of a legal fiction,  
4 let's tell people that we're giving money for  
5 arts.

6 Let me be more specific because Mr.  
7 King's testimony said that the amount per student  
8 went up from \$311 to \$316. How do you figure  
9 that? What goes into that number? Does that  
10 include CASA money, does that include Reso 8 money  
11 from Council Members?

12 MR. KING: It does not. These are  
13 only tax levy monies that are in the Department of  
14 Ed budgets, not for after school programs.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: But some of  
16 us give money to our schools for cultural arts  
17 programs in the school. During the day they do go  
18 through DOE, not necessarily DCA or DYCD.

19 MR. KING: We do--

20 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER:  
21 [interposing] So how do you figure, what goes into  
22 this? When you have the Shubert learning training  
23 institute or whatever it is, does that money...

24 MR. KING: That's privately funded  
25 by...



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: ...part of that?

MR. KING: ...the Shubert Foundation.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Okay. So what goes into this statistic? It is so counter intuitive to many of us sitting here to believe that spending on cultural and arts programs in school has gone up. But I'll point out that that \$5 is less than the rate of inflation. It's so counter intuitive how do you figure it? What goes into that number?

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: What goes into what number? The 300?

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: The \$11,316 number.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay. Why don't you hold up on that answer? Why don't you think about that answer and take a break and go over to the City Council chambers. I ask everyone when you're going through security...

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Stay tuned, same bat time, same bat channel.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: When you're

1  
 2 going through metal detector sensors, everyone  
 3 going at the same time, please remove all your  
 4 stuff so we can move through the metal detectors  
 5 as quickly as possible. We're resuming in ten  
 6 minutes. So you have ten minutes to get over  
 7 there or else you're not going to be able to  
 8 speak. Joking, of course.

9 [pause]

10 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Good afternoon.  
 11 We apologize for the transition from 16th floor  
 12 over here but clearly this is a better venue so  
 13 that everyone that wants the opportunity to see  
 14 the testimony in person will have the opportunity  
 15 to be in the same room at the same time. So  
 16 Council Member Fidler, I believe your last  
 17 question was...can you play back the video tape on  
 18 that?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: The fact  
 20 that no one is sitting next to me shouldn't  
 21 reflect the fact that they don't agree with what  
 22 I'm asking you so... I guess we all understand  
 23 that your statement that the amount per capita  
 24 represent five times the Project ARTS spending is  
 25 another thing I learned in law school called a

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

half truth, which is that the implication that that was all the money spent on arts education at the time of the Project ARTS program is obviously omitted from that statement.

So I'm interested in the numbers that you are providing, forgetting for a second that inflation would account for more than this difference to begin with, what goes into your calculation of \$311 per student in 2007-2008 and \$316 in 2008-2009? How do you get to that number? Where do those numbers come from?

MR. KING: Let me clarify, Project ARTS as a discreet budget allocation had typically been around \$67.5 million, somewhere in that neighborhood. In FY09 we spent \$326 million on the arts and in FY08 \$309. Those budget expenses are tracked through Galaxy using assigned expense codes, tracking tax levy money. So what we simply do is take the number of students on the audited student register and divide by the amount of arts spent that year.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: I can figure out the per capita part of it. I got a good score on my math test. I could figure that

1  
2 out. I'm trying to figure out what went into the  
3 number you're dividing in to? What codes--I got  
4 to tell you, the DOE budget is a bit unmanageable  
5 from a Finance Committee point of view. What  
6 codes are you using to determine the gross  
7 spending that you're dividing in to?

8 MR. KING: I can get back to you if  
9 you want the specific code numbers.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Yeah, I do.

11 MR. KING: We'll be happy to  
12 provide those but the general categories are  
13 personnel in terms of licensed, full time arts  
14 teachers, expenditures that schools code as direct  
15 support of arts including supplies and materials  
16 and codes that they allocate for outside  
17 partnerships.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Give me an  
19 example of an outside partnership.

20 MR. KING: So an organization that  
21 purchases the services of an arts organization to  
22 come in and provide direct student services so one  
23 of our great cultural organizations that may  
24 provide services in the schools.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Then that

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

might include CASA money, doesn't it?

MR. KING: That does not include  
CASA money because CASA monies are administered  
differently and not in the regular tax levy money.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Okay. I'd  
be very, very interested in seeing what those  
codes are. You're not capturing that classroom  
teacher time in there anywhere, right?

MR. KING: We are not, not in the  
expense.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Mr.  
Chairman, I know I've gone way over my allocated  
time but I think looking at what those codes are I  
think are very important. I'd like to see them  
and I wish I had them here so that I could  
question you about them. Because, as I said, to  
everyone sitting probably in this room and  
everyone sitting up here, the idea that we're  
spending more on arts programs in the schools is  
almost laughable and very sad. Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you  
Council Member. Before we moved across the street  
we were joined by our colleague John Liu of  
Queens, Simcha Felder of Brooklyn and Letitia

1  
2 James of Brooklyn. Over here we are joined to our  
3 left, Council Member Maria del Carmen Arroyo of  
4 the Bronx and Council Member Inez Dickens of  
5 Manhattan. You were across the street, too?  
6 Okay. So you get twofer, two for one. Domenic  
7 Recchia, my co-chair.

8 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Good afternoon.  
9 First picking up where my colleague, Lou Fidler,  
10 left off with the \$311 per student to \$316 per  
11 student. You're saying that is three times or  
12 four times Project ARTS money, is that correct?

13 MR. KING: It's actually five  
14 times.

15 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Five times. And  
16 how are you coming to that number? I'm not clear  
17 how you arrived at that number, \$316 per student?

18 MR. KING: We, again, tracked the  
19 expenses from each school site through Galaxy.  
20 The expense codes that they assign for personnel,  
21 supplies and materials and outside partnerships.  
22 We divide that by the audited register of students  
23 in the school system to arrive at that per capita  
24 figure.

25 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: So you are

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

including in that the expense that they pay for personnel?

MR. KING: For full time licensed arts teachers, yes, but not for classroom teachers.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. So then if a school had a full time licensed art teacher and they let that art teacher go, and then they hire and F status art teacher for two days or three days a week, that would bring up the number. Is that correct?

MR. KING: We don't track F status in the future, we only track full time certified arts teachers.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: So you're testimony is that you do not figure in F status teachers into this formula.

MR. KING: That is correct.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: So that means that if a school hires an F status art teacher or music teacher, no where is that expense counted or included in your number?

MR. KING: Not in our number, no.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. So then

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

what is even more disturbing is how is the number of music and art teachers going down and you're number going up?

MR. KING: It has not gone down. As I reported earlier, we actually saw an increase in the number of licensed certified arts teachers in our schools from 2004 to 2009. Where we do see cause for concern is at the middle school level in music where is the one area where we've seen a decrease. In every other arts area and in every other grade level, we've seen an increase in the number of licensed certified arts teachers.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: So you're saying that the number of arts teachers in elementary schools is going up?

MR. KING: That's correct. We act-

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: [interposing]  
And is--

MR. KING: Excuse me.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: And is that full time?

MR. KING: That is full time, yes.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: And you went



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

into every--so you're using Galaxy to figure this out?

MR. KING: That data is also cross referenced with the HR data.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. So let's say if you're a full time music or arts teacher is teaching another subject area, that number would be included for the arts.

MR. KING: That's correct under the licensed--

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: [interposing] So we're not really sure if that teacher is teaching art every day.

MR. KING: Correct but likewise you may have a teacher who is dually certified who's teaching under an English license but also licensed in an art form and providing the instruction. We can only track teachers under one certification.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: I understand that but if a principal hires a music teacher that can help them out with English or other subject matter areas then that expense according to its use, it could get counted either way.

1  
2 MR. KING: That's correct, it would  
3 only be counted under one personnel area.

4 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Therefore to  
5 say--it's not what you're just looking at what  
6 they're teaching but that music or arts teacher  
7 can be used for other subject areas. So  
8 therefore, even though the expense is going up,  
9 the number of art classes or art programs or  
10 teaching the children art can not increase, they  
11 could be staying the same or going down and we  
12 would never know about it.

13 MR. KING: That's also why issue  
14 the individual arts report. So if you look at an  
15 individual school site, you can see exactly how  
16 the kids are programmed, what arts they're  
17 offering--

18 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: [interposing] I-

19 -

20 MR. KING: [interposing] I'm sorry.  
21 Let me just finish.

22 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Go ahead.

23 MR. KING: What arts are offered at  
24 every grade level and the mean hours of  
25 instruction they receive.

1  
2 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: By looking, what  
3 you're saying is that every child, if they have an  
4 outside company that comes in. Let's say for  
5 first and third graders, to do a program for let's  
6 say a few months then that gets included, that  
7 goes on the web site. That doesn't mean it's for  
8 the whole year or every kid is getting that.  
9 Correct?

10 MR. KING: That's correct but those  
11 are among the instructional hours that New York  
12 State counts towards that recommendation.

13 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: So when people  
14 go on the web sites to see what kind of art  
15 programs are being offered, it's not clear exactly  
16 what types of programs are being offered.

17 MR. KING: Again, If you look at  
18 the individual reports at the elementary level, it  
19 tracks the instruction delivered by classroom  
20 teachers, licensed arts teachers or arts partners,  
21 at each grade and in each of the four disciplines,  
22 dance, music, visual arts and theater. We think  
23 it's a very comprehensive picture. What it also  
24 allows a person to do is to see where there are  
25 gaps. That's why we think it's a key tool for

1 principals in ascertaining where there are gaps in  
 2 the sequential instruction they're providing.

3  
 4 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: There are many  
 5 gaps, as we learned, in the elementary schools  
 6 since the majority of them don't have the four  
 7 disciplines. I just have to disagree with you on  
 8 the \$316 per student. That's why we would like to  
 9 see how we figure that out because our figure is  
 10 much lower. Not requiring principals to spend  
 11 certain funds, there's a lot of ways to make that  
 12 number go up, like I just told you about hiring  
 13 outside programs. Hiring an outside program to  
 14 come in the school and having a full time music or  
 15 art teacher is a lot different. Correct?

16 MR. KING: We're in absolute  
 17 agreement on that.

18 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: In addition  
 19 to...

20 MR. KING: May I interject one  
 21 other thing?

22 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Yeah.

23 MR. KING: I think it's important  
 24 as we noted earlier that in fact schools are  
 25 spending more on full time certified arts teachers

1  
2 and less on cultural partners. So while the  
3 increase per capita may not be huge, schools are  
4 really allocating resources differently. As you  
5 noted, it's extremely important to invest in those  
6 licensed, full time, certified arts teachers.

7 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: That's where I  
8 think I disagree with you on, about that. About  
9 hiring more full time licensed arts teachers. I  
10 think that is something that we could discuss but  
11 I disagree with you on that because my numbers are  
12 much lower. But what I'd like to talk about is  
13 your progress reports or your report cards. What  
14 attempts have you made to include arts on the  
15 report cards?

16 MR. TAVARES: Right now the  
17 progress report for our schools focus on three  
18 different areas. One is environment, which  
19 includes attendance and a learning environment  
20 survey, which students, parents and teachers fill  
21 out and progress that the students have made in  
22 gains from one year to the other in English and  
23 Math and the performance that they have in English  
24 and Math. You're absolutely correct that the  
25 progress report does not have a specific metric

2 for the arts.

3 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: So how do we get  
4 a number, the arts to be included in the report  
5 card?

6 MR. TAVARES: That's a good  
7 question that we could explore with the Division  
8 of Accountability and Assessment and research from  
9 our Department of Education.

10 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Because they  
11 don't have the art or what's happening in the arts  
12 on their progress reports, on their report cards,  
13 that's telling people that it's not important.  
14 And it's telling a principal, well, you better  
15 concentrate on your reading and math scores when  
16 that parent or people go to your web site or go to  
17 look at to see if you got an A or an B, forget  
18 about what programs you offer. It's all about  
19 reading and math.

20 MR. TAVARES: The progress report  
21 takes only into account those three areas that I  
22 mentioned, does not take into account science,  
23 social studies, phys ed. or any other measures  
24 because the progress report is a comparison to the  
25 No Child Left Behind and state mandates and the

1  
2 designation of Sydney Sir Corrective Action. So  
3 there are different reports that we have, the  
4 quality review which is another evaluation of  
5 schools does include the arts and--

6 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: [interposing]  
7 One question, one question. Don't even go there  
8 about the quality review. It's one question and  
9 it's a .0% so don't even go that route. You're  
10 right. But you know what about science? The  
11 fourth graders have to take a science test and  
12 when they see, parents can see how well that  
13 school is doing in the fourth grade science. And  
14 in social studies, they're given a social studies  
15 test in the fourth grade. Do you want to go on?  
16 What test do they give for music? I don't hear  
17 your answer. I can't hear you! What test do you  
18 give in the fourth grade for drama. I can't hear  
19 you! What test do you give for vocal music? What  
20 test do you give for musical instruments. I can't  
21 hear you!

22 So if you want to take me on, I'll  
23 take you on because you know what? You're dealing  
24 with people that know the business. We're not  
25 going to sit here any longer and deprive these

1  
2 children of the arts. And it's that child that  
3 wakes up every morning to go to school for the  
4 arts that achieve success. And if you look  
5 further, those children who had art and music and  
6 dance in their lives did better on the SATs. So  
7 that's where I'm headed, that's what means  
8 something to me. That's what I look at and I'm a  
9 parent in public school. But I'll move on. Now--

10 MR. TAVARES: [interposing] I just  
11 want to add, though, that the ARRA's parent link  
12 does have the ability for every single parent to  
13 look at how they did in any art courses that the  
14 students take. So we do have that piece as to the  
15 arts so we're not totally ignoring it as you have  
16 insinuated in your statement.

17 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: No. Now I'll  
18 ask my good commissioner, Kate Levin. We have  
19 a...in the past years the Department of Ed has  
20 given cultural institutions money and the cultural  
21 institutions took that money and they were able to  
22 raise money off of that. For example, if Carnegie  
23 Hall or Lincoln Center or other institutions were  
24 given let's say \$1 million, they were able to fund  
25 raise with that and triple that or quadruple that



1 money. That was used for music or arts programs.

2 Has that money been cut and are the  
3 cultural institutions still given that money so  
4 they could fund raise?  
5

6 MS. LEVIN: That's actually really  
7 a question for my Department of Education  
8 colleagues. But what the Arts Count findings  
9 suggest, again they're up to date as of last  
10 school year, is that the arts have not been cut  
11 disproportionately to any other service that DOE  
12 is providing where there have been cuts.

13 It's certainly the case that what  
14 we've seen in our most recent round of funding  
15 allocations that, again, arts ed. programs remain  
16 an enormously robust part of what it is that we're  
17 funding and that suggests to us that they're still  
18 absolutely out there, able to raise money to  
19 leverage against various kinds of city support  
20 from various city agencies.

21 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: I understand  
22 that but as far as the cultural institutions are  
23 concerned, is the DOE still giving them money to  
24 fund raise off of?

25 MS. LEVIN: Yes.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. And what institutions are getting that money?

MS. LEVIN: I can give you a list of that. I don't have it with me.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. We would ask for a list of those institutions that get money so they can go out. And has that money been cut? How much has that money been cut from let's say a number of years ago?

MS. LEVIN: I can get that to you also. I don't know.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. At this time Mr. Chairman, I'll let someone else ask some questions and I'll come back.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you Council Member. Let's turn to our colleagues--

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: [interposing] It's just I'd like to say. Kate, Commissioner Kate Levin has to go at 3:00 so if anyone has any questions for the Commissioner, Kate Levin she has to go.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: We've been joined by our colleague, Council Member David Weprin from Queens and we're going to turn to our

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

colleague Maria del Carmen Arroyo of the Bronx.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO:

Thank you Mr. Chair and co-Chair. Mr. Tavares, didn't expect to see you so soon.

MR. TAVARES: Nice to see you.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: We

were hanging out yesterday in Brooklyn at the South Bronx High School campus, on the Cup Bowl Championship. So we're going to be celebrating that victory here in the City Council chambers soon so it's nice to see you again so soon.

My question is for DOE. Is there a minimum requirement for school administrators or schools to maintain in their budget for the arts?

MR. TAVARES: No.

MR. KING: There is no minimum requirement.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: So there is no central office oversight to ensure that there is a minimum level of funding in schools for the arts?

MR. TAVARES: No. What there is, is that we are monitoring the schools to make sure they provide the necessary arts requirements by

1  
2 the state but there is no particular minimum of  
3 funding for schools in the arts.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: So  
5 how do you ensure that they meet those  
6 requirements if you don't expect them to keep a  
7 certain amount of funding in their budget?

8 MR. TAVARES: We have several ways.  
9 One is that students, specifically high schools,  
10 need to meet minimum requires in the arts and in  
11 order to provide those services they have to fund  
12 a teacher to be able to do that. In addition to  
13 that, we're able to look at the Arts Count and the  
14 annual arts survey where we get information on how  
15 they are doing so that allows us to track, to see  
16 what are the arts that are offered in any  
17 particular school. You wanted to add something to  
18 that?

19 MR. KING: No, I would just  
20 elaborate. So what it allows us to for example at  
21 the middle school level is say this middle school  
22 is only providing one art form when they're  
23 required to provide two. Those are the schools  
24 that we make direct outreach to and work with the  
25 school, faculty and the principal to make sure

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

that students are getting the minimum requirement.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: How often do you have to intervene?

MR. KING: Last year we looked, as I noted earlier, at 57 most needy schools. Certainly if you look at the figures we talked about earlier, there are many elementary schools and we have particular concerns at the middle school level at the amount of arts instruction.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: So needy as it relates to their ability to ensure that their students meet the minimum requirement?

MR. KING: Not their ability.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: In arts?

MR. KING: I'm sorry, not their ability necessarily but what they are actually providing. So we call them needy based on the fact that their students are at need because they're not getting the minimum requirement.

COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: How long does it take for you to get that corrected?

MR. KING: It's highly individual depending on the school. I can tell you there are

1 schools that we worked with last year that have  
 2 made significant improvement and if you like we  
 3 could provide you with a couple of those case  
 4 students. But again, because the decisions are  
 5 made at the local school level it's highly  
 6 individual, depending on how large the deficit is  
 7 and how far we have to move them.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: So  
 10 given that we are dealing in a reality that we  
 11 have to consider cuts across the board, what I'm  
 12 hearing is that the Department of Education does  
 13 not mandate any school administrator to preserve a  
 14 specific dollar amount to invest in the arts?

15 MR. KING: That is correct except  
 16 as Santiago Tavares said, at the middle and high  
 17 school level the instruction in order for it to be  
 18 credit bearing has to be provided by a licensed  
 19 arts teacher. So those positions are somewhat  
 20 guaranteed because the instruction has to be  
 21 provided in order to meet the promotional or the  
 22 graduation requirement.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: The  
 24 Department's in charge, right? And schools ought  
 25 to be, at least, trying to ensure that the arts

1  
2 are well preserved in the curriculum in the  
3 schools. You don't tell them what two art forms  
4 to invest their money in. But if you are not  
5 requiring principals to preserve a certain amount  
6 of funding for the arts, you're always going to  
7 have to go in and troubleshoot in those schools  
8 that you define as needy. It seems to me almost  
9 counter productive.

10 In the meantime the children that  
11 are in those schools lose the opportunity for the  
12 enrichment. So it seems like the cart is pulling  
13 the horse and that's just not something that we  
14 ought to be allowing to happen in our system.

15 MS. LEVIN: Can I offer a slightly  
16 different perspective, which is to say that the  
17 Department of Education has focused on tracking  
18 participation because ultimately it makes logical  
19 sense that the more money you have the more  
20 children you serve. However, what really matters  
21 is the children get served with a robust quality  
22 arts and education experience.

23 When there was a mandated spend  
24 under Project ARTS we had lower compliance than we  
25 currently have. So it's a multiple offensive

1  
2 going on here. Tracing spending, tracking  
3 participation, trying to figure out with  
4 individual schools because each non-compliant  
5 school has a slightly different story, as I'm sure  
6 you can appreciate. What are the different  
7 barriers to appropriate compliance?

8           Is it that a principal doesn't feel  
9 comfortable? Because unfortunately what happened  
10 with losing arts in the 1970s is that so many of  
11 our current school leaders themselves never  
12 experienced a robust arts education when they were  
13 students so some of our school leaders don't feel  
14 comfortable making the kind of selections that we  
15 would like to see them make to ensure that they  
16 have the appropriate faculty and/or outside  
17 cultural partners doing that providing.

18           In some cases there are issues with  
19 scheduling so there's a multiple approach that  
20 Deputy Chancellor and Mr. King are taking to try  
21 and figure out on the ground with each school,  
22 what is it that they need? But I would circle  
23 back to say that a mandated spending amount did  
24 not completely address the problem when we had  
25 one. It's about a series of incentives to try and



1  
2 make sure that all principals understand their  
3 obligation under state law and get as much support  
4 as possible in meeting that obligation.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: Do  
6 we have the participation when there was a  
7 mandated amount and what the participation is now.  
8 Is it better? How do we know that that's an  
9 issue--

10 MS. LEVIN: [interposing] It is  
11 better. It is nowhere where we need it to be but  
12 it is improved--

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO:  
14 [interposing] Have you seen a the report that  
15 states--

16 MS. LEVIN: [interposing] The Arts  
17 Count report that started, we now have three years  
18 of data. When we began this, which was at the  
19 same time that the mandated Projects ARTS spend  
20 was ending, on elementary schools which is the  
21 least compliant area, we had 4% compliance. At  
22 this point we're up to 12%. Is that acceptable?  
23 No but it's showing that in the most intractable  
24 area we are making improvements and that's 12%  
25 providing all four arts disciplines. The numbers

2 improve when you look at schools providing three  
3 or two or one.

4           Again, it's ultimately not where  
5 we're supposed to be but we have. In other words  
6 we watch very carefully because we took very  
7 serious the concerns that if mandated arts  
8 spending was removed, there would be a  
9 catastrophic decline in the amount of arts ed.  
10 provided. In fact, we've seen a increase, not  
11 nearly as dramatic as we'd like to see, in overall  
12 compliance and we've seen an increase in the  
13 number of certified teachers hired at the schools.  
14 Both of those are very positive indicators. Mr.  
15 King and his team have been working on, again,  
16 multiple strategies to try and address the varied  
17 reasons why schools don't get in compliance as we  
18 move towards getting them there.

19           COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO: How  
20 recent is this improvement?

21           MS. LEVIN: The most recent Arts  
22 Count data is from the end of the last--so June  
23 2009.

24           COUNCIL MEMBER CARMEN ARROYO:  
25 Thank you. Thank you Mr. Chair.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you Council Member. Commissioner, with respects to you had said that there's partnership with, I believe, 255 schools in your statement. And I believe those are the CASA partnerships. Is that correct?

MS. LEVIN: I believe it's 255 CASA partners.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay. Do we have a list of those partners broken down--

MS. LEVIN: [interposing] Sorry, 255 school sites.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: School sites so there may be more partners.

MS. LEVIN: Exactly, one partner may serve more than one site.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay. Can we have a list of those as far as elementary, intermediate, high schools, the various stuff like that, a one provided--

MS. LEVIN: [interposing] A list is eminent of all the contracts that we're prepared to go forward with. We're talking with Council Finance staff to finalize that but obviously will

1  
2 be shared with you.

3 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: That would be  
4 great. I'm looking at the Department of Education  
5 on page five, if I'm not mistaken, it says using  
6 data. And I'm reading from the next to the last  
7 paragraph. Using data from the 2007-2008 school  
8 year, we identified 57 "arts needy schools", can  
9 you talk about that for a minute? As Commissioner  
10 are you aware of that? Are there any of those  
11 schools that are CASA, part of those arts needy  
12 schools? I don't necessarily demand--

13 MS. LEVIN: [interposing] I don't  
14 believe there is an overlap with CASA but, again,  
15 we can certainly look at that.

16 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: And is there any  
17 collaboration with Department of Cultural Affairs  
18 with those arts needy schools or are you doing  
19 this on your own, the Department of Education?

20 MR. KING: One of the things that  
21 we did in the summer was actually provide the  
22 Council with the 2007-2008 reports for each of  
23 their schools. So as they were looking at CASA  
24 allocations, they could make a determination about  
25 how to best serve those schools. Similarly we

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

brought reports for the 2008-2009 school year for this year to assist in that process.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Data from 2007-2008 you said that you've supplied or sent every Council Member a list in their district so they can possibly partner with those arts needy schools. Is that correct?

MS. LEVIN: That's correct.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: What else have you done in order to help these arts needy schools to comply with state regulations?

MR. KING: Again, those are the 57 schools that we identified last year that we do direct outreach to each school leader. We provide training through the Shubert Arts Leadership Institute in terms of scheduling, budgeting and issuing the arts program at the school. And we do do direct site visits to assist the school leader in implementing their arts programs. And those services, as I should point out, are available not only to those 57 schools but to any school system wide.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Right. But considering that these are arts needy schools and

1  
2 I assume that those. If in fact the statistics  
3 that you state as far as those schools that are in  
4 compliance, I would assume that all of these are  
5 out of compliance. What are you doing to mandate  
6 anything towards those arts needy schools, if  
7 anything, rather than suggesting?

8 MR. KING: There is no mandate at  
9 the school providing the arts instruction.

10 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay. So  
11 they're not meeting state requirements and you're  
12 not mandating them to meet state requirements for  
13 arts, that's what I'm hearing. Please, no  
14 applause, please. That's what I'm hearing.  
15 They're not meeting state requirements and you're  
16 not mandating them to do it. You're encouraging  
17 them to do it but not mandating them. I assume  
18 that principals and whoever else involved that is  
19 being reflected in their evaluation. Am I correct  
20 in that assumption Deputy Chancellor?

21 MR. TAVARES: Yes.

22 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Yes?

23 MR. TAVARES: Part of their  
24 principal's performance review takes into account  
25 some of the compliance areas and although I

1  
2 believe co-Chair Recchia did say it's a small  
3 percentage but it does count in their compliance  
4 report which is then reflected in the principal's  
5 performance review, which is the evaluation that  
6 the superintendent gives each principal at the end  
7 of the school year.

8 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Were the  
9 superintendents last year evaluating the  
10 principals with respects to that or is it only  
11 going to be as a result of new law that went into  
12 effect?

13 MR. TAVARES: The principals  
14 performance review was revised last year. It was  
15 the first year that compliance, including the  
16 arts, was part of the principals' performance  
17 review. So this is the second year that the  
18 principals have been evaluated using not just the  
19 compliance but also the progress report, the  
20 quality review and the goals and objectives that  
21 they set with their superintendent.

22 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: What percentage  
23 of a principal's evaluation is an evaluation of  
24 what arts programs they're doing in school and  
25 what percentage of the students are in compliance,

1  
2 whether or not that school is in compliance with  
3 the state regulations?

4 MR. TAVARES: The principals'  
5 performance review is broken down into different  
6 parts. The part that has to do with compliance is  
7 10% of the overall and in that 10% it includes  
8 arts, child abuse, number of periods for ESL and  
9 all the other things. The other piece since we  
10 just rolled that out last year that we're moving  
11 towards is that if a principal is zero compliant  
12 in a particular area, then the superintendent is  
13 able to reprimand that principal by either writing  
14 a letter in the file or subsequently removal.

15 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Correct me if  
16 I'm wrong Deputy Superintendent, prior to the  
17 Mayoral control being revised superintendents were  
18 not in the district. They were only in the  
19 district for a small percentage of the time and  
20 they were out of the district the majority of the  
21 time. Is that correct or am I wrong?

22 MR. TAVARES: No. The role of the  
23 superintendent is and continues to be to make sure  
24 they uphold the 32 pieces of legislation that they  
25 are supposed to require from evaluating principals



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

to looking at the budget and so forth and so on.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay. Deputy Chancellor, last year the school year that began 2008-2009 my understanding was that superintendents were majority, most of the time, what percentage, out of the district and not really in the district to supervise principals. Am I wrong or am I right in that?

MR. TAVARES: It depends on each superintendent. The superintendents did supervise every single one of their principals. That principals performance review that I mentioned includes the compliance data that is provided to the superintendent. So regardless of the number of times that the superintendent visited a particular school, they're able to get that information from the compliance officer.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: The compliance officer is a community based organization, a compliance officer is within the school, who is that compliance officer?

MR. TAVARES: The compliance office is part of the Department of Education. What they do is they collect information from the principals

1  
2 in two different ways. One, in a self reported  
3 method or survey and the second way is to look at  
4 that data and compare it to the different systems  
5 that we have in the Department of Ed. Including  
6 the Arts Count, Galaxy, Famous and all of the  
7 other, ATS, HSST, all of the other computerized  
8 systems that we have in order to cross reference  
9 the numbers.

10 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay. So  
11 basically the data is basically self reported but  
12 cross referenced to the various fields within  
13 whatever the different variables that you have.  
14 Is that correct?

15 MR. TAVARES: Some of it is self  
16 reported, some of it we can look at. For example,  
17 if you say you have an art teacher, we could just  
18 simply look at Galaxy and see whether or not  
19 that's true or not.

20 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: You mean whether  
21 or not their line is being used for that  
22 particular purpose and what have you.

23 MR. TAVARES: Yes.

24 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: You said that of  
25 the principals evaluation, 10% is for ABCDEFG and

1  
2 it appears as though arts is part of that 10%.  
3 But based on the different factors that you  
4 mentioned. You mentioned about five or six of  
5 them and they're probably more than that. So I  
6 basically deducted that arts will probably be 1%  
7 of that 10% because there are other factors that  
8 are involved in that. Is that a true assessment  
9 that I'm assuming is the case?

10 MR. TAVARES: Correct. But I also  
11 want to mention that if a principal has a zero in  
12 that compliance area where there is arts or anyone  
13 else, the superintendent has the ability to  
14 reprimand the principal because they're totally  
15 out of compliance in any one of the areas in the  
16 compliance report.

17 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Now, overall who  
18 is responsible to coaching, mentoring, pushing,  
19 shoving, mandating that the arts curriculum in  
20 accordance with the state requirements are met?  
21 Whose job is that other than the principal,  
22 knowing that is their responsibility.  
23 Superintendent is the supervisors of the  
24 principals right now. Is that correct Deputy  
25 Chancellor?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. TAVARES: Yes, that's correct.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: So that's in the superintendents job to make sure that the job is being done, in essence.

MR. TAVARES: Correct and it's done through a series of different places. The school support organizations have a network leader who in turn have a number of people that work there to support the schools. The Council for Supervisors and Administrators offers mentoring for principals that are in their first and second year. There are also other leadership programs that support principals in trying to make sure they do all of the different pieces that are required as a principal.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Based on the statistics that Mr...

MR. KING: King.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: King had given earlier, are you satisfied with the progress of the Department of Education regarding requirements of the state Education Department's mandates for minimum requirements for arts education?

MR. TAVARES: Anything except for

1  
2 100% I would be satisfied. The fact of the matter  
3 is that we stated over and over again that there's  
4 a lot of work to be done. And you won't find a  
5 more dedicated team to try to get that done than  
6 some of the folks that are sitting over here from  
7 the Division of Arts in the Department of  
8 Education. We work tirelessly with schools to  
9 make sure that we provide them with the best  
10 possible support to get all the arts to our kids.

11 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: I truly believe  
12 that without a doubt. I have no question that  
13 your heart and soul and the heart and soul of the  
14 individuals involved are invested in it. That's  
15 one thing that whether or not your heart and soul  
16 are invested in it. Another thing is whether or  
17 not the state education department is meeting the  
18 requirements--the city Board of Education is  
19 meeting the requirements of the state education  
20 department, which my understanding, you're not.  
21 How come you're not meeting those requirements and  
22 when can we see you in compliance at least 65%  
23 because 65% when I grew up was a passing grade,  
24 not 50%.

25 Right now, I don't know whether or

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

not the Department of Education is receiving a passing grade. Based on the 65 being a passing grade, would you say the Department of Education is passing this particular grade with respects to meeting state requirements from K to 12 or the Department of Education is failing as far as in evaluating on a 65 being passing?

MR. TAVARES: As I mentioned before, we have made a lot of strides moving forward. Are we where we want to be? Absolutely not. Again, I just wanted to reiterate that it's a collective effort from the federal government, from the state government, from the city agency and the Department of Education to try to get us there. Working collaboratively is how we're going to get there. I believe we have the right people around the table to get that done.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: I believe you do also but still you didn't answer my question. Is it that you don't want to say that you're not being successful in that you're not passing the grade or you don't want to say because you are a Deputy Chancellor? If you say that we, the Department of Education, city of New York, is

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

failing that you may be reprimanded by the  
Chancellor or the Mayor for that? I'm asking a  
simple question on whether or not the Department  
or Ed is passing or failing right at this moment,  
at this point in time.

MR. TAVARES: Chairman Jackson, if  
you know me, asanti [phonetic], I always say  
what's on my mind. I know and I told you my first  
sentence was that for me, anything less than 100%  
is not satisfactory.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay, all right.  
I appreciate that. So clearly the work that the  
Department of Education is doing is  
unsatisfactory. Now I'm reading here on the  
second paragraph of the opening statement put  
forward by Paul King, who is sitting next to you,  
the Executive Director for Office of Arts and  
Special Projects, is under leadership of Mayor  
Bloomberg, New York City has made an unprecedented  
commitment to providing all students with an  
excellent education. Now you know that's not  
true.

Our kids are not receiving an  
excellent education. In fact, approximately 50%

1  
2 of our children are failing. So do you truly  
3 believe that the students of New York City are  
4 receiving an excellent education? I'm asking you  
5 Mr. King, this is your statement.

6 MR. KING: I believe that we're  
7 making significant progress.

8 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Towards an  
9 excellent education?

10 MR. KING: Absolutely, that's--

11 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: [interposing]  
12 Where only 50% are graduating from high school in  
13 four years?

14 MR. KING: Clearly Mr. Jackson,  
15 there's huge work to be done. We know that. But  
16 if you look at the statistics we have made  
17 significant progress in all areas, including the  
18 arts, over the last three years.

19 MR. TAVARES: I just want to  
20 clarify that as of August we have an approximately  
21 64% graduation rate.

22 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: What does that  
23 include? Is that a five years or four years?  
24 Does it include those that graduate in four years?  
25 Does it include summer school? Does it include



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

GEDs? Does it include children with special needs? What does that include Deputy Chancellor? I'm sorry, you opened the door for that. I just need clarification before I move forward.

MR. TAVARES: Not a problem, that's actually one of my passions is the lack of our young Black and Latino men, in particular, not meeting graduation requirements within a four year. But the number that I gave you is a four year, including the summer of their fourth year. It does not include the GED and it does not include, obviously, drop outs. I would have to check whether or not it includes the special education students.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: I'm almost sure that it doesn't include children with special needs because the graduation rate in New York City with children with special needs is only about 18% or 20%.

MR. TAVARES: The other thing I just want to mention is that the state just mentioned over this summer is that they're going to be looking at a five year graduation rate. Because there are a lot of students who come from

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

other countries and English is a second language so they want to be able to include those students as well. When we have a complicated system like we do, with one million children that come from all over the place, we have to look at every possibility to make them successful and afford them that opportunity without criticizing a student for not meeting a four year requirement.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: I totally agree with you. Only thing, as someone that has oversight responsibility, what I want to do is paint a picture that is true and transparent and that we can evaluate it not against ourselves. I could say that I'm the most handsomest man in the world and people are looking at me. But in reality, I have to compare myself to everyone else.

So I just want to be able to know the statistics of the New York City Department of Education comparative to all the other school systems in New York state so that I could get a realistic assessment. Evaluating ourselves against ourselves is not getting it. I think that that's where the problem is and I think that the

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Department of Education, I'm going to move on because it's not about graduation rates. But the Department of Education wants to try to put its best foot forward and not putting a realistic, transparent approach to evaluation with respects to all other school systems in New York state. If in fact, you use a criteria that the State Department of Education, the graduation rate would not be 64%. You would agree with that or disagree?

MR. TAVARES: We have a difference in how we measure our graduation rate, yes.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay, all right. Let me move on. Thank you. Let's see. Council Member Lou Fidler then we'll go to my colleague, co-Chair Domenic Recchia.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: I just wanted to thank you for giving this disk. You made the comment that part of the purpose of this disk is so that we can decide how to give out CASA money. I'm just curious whether the implication of that is if a principal is in fact spending money on cultural and arts programs that you're suggesting that the Council Member punish them by

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

not giving them a CASA grant and giving it to a more needy school.

MR. KING: No, sir. I'm just asking--

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER:  
[interposing] It sounds like a disincentive, doesn't it.

MR. KING: I'm only suggesting that where there are schools that are at need, I think we should both try to serve those schools.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: That was a really, very fancy way of saying, yes, Councilman. It was. Will this tell me what the per capita spending per student by school in my district is on arts programs?

MR. KING: It will not. Those figures are not on the individual arts reports but we can run that data for you if you like. We can run it for your individual--

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER:  
[interposing] Why aren't they on the individual reports?

MR. KING: Because the individual report does not track school by school the

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

expense. That's included in the aggregate report.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: And could you do that? In the sense that is all of this money coming from school budgets? That \$316 figure, is that all going to be found within school budgets?

MR. KING: Yes, sir.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: So for this to have real meaning to me, so I can see how my principals are doing, I need to know what the per capita is because I need to know whether or not we're above or below \$316. If I were to look at this disk and all my schools were \$270, that would say something to me. If they were all at \$400, it would say something else.

MR. KING: I think you'd need to look at not only the expense but what are the programs being delivered. It's not only, solely about the per capita allocation spent on the arts. There are many other factors that would factor into that, including how the school allocates other resources that may not be tracked in arts for example or what the arts faculty is delivering in terms of classroom teachers or arts partners.

1  
2 So it's not--I would not use, quite honestly, the  
3 per capita allocation as the only measurement of  
4 that school's success.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: I wouldn't  
6 either and that kind of gets me to the last  
7 question/point, which is Chairman Recchia was  
8 asking you about the use of licensed arts teachers  
9 in areas other than what their licensed in and  
10 vice versa. It would seem to me, given that  
11 there's a finite number of schools, that that  
12 wouldn't be a hard thing to ask a principal. Oh,  
13 I see that whatever that program is, Galaxy,  
14 whatever, says you have to have an arts teacher.  
15 Are you using them to teach arts or are you using  
16 them to teach English or vice versa? Why isn't  
17 that being done?

18 MR. KING: You're absolutely right.  
19 We would need to do an evaluation of all 1,600  
20 school, site by site, in order to pull the school  
21 assignments to make that ascertainment [phonetic].  
22 There's no central place where the data exists.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: But if we  
24 really wanted to know the answer to the question--

25 MR. KING: [interposing] Certainly

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

and--

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER:

[interposing] And we ask it wouldn't--

MR. KING: Certainly with the resources we could visit all 1,600 schools and make that determination.

COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: I'm not asking you to visit them. I would think you could do that with--the Chancellor is real good at blast emails. Lord knows the Intergovernmental Department sends me three a day. So to send an email to all principals or just to have each superintendent, now the law says they should be back in the district, check on. Well, P.S. 123, you have an arts teacher. Is that teacher teaching in license or out of license, in part license, out of license. Or do you have someone that's teaching in a English license or whatever, teaching arts classes? Can you tell us that? It shouldn't be a hard thing to do.

MR. TAVARES: I think you have a very good point. Right now in the high school division, the way that the school program the students, you can tell what class a teacher is

1 teaching, whether it's art or math or whatever.  
 2 That's not necessarily the case in the elementary  
 3 school ATS system. But that's definitely noted as  
 4 one of the recommendations that we could take back  
 5 to see how we can figure out how to do it so we  
 6 can capture that data from our systems.  
 7

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: You see  
 9 Deputy Chancellor, we found something we could  
 10 agree on. Next year's report, that should be  
 11 done.

12 MR. TAVARES: If it was that easy.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Thank you.  
 14 Too bad we don't agree on anything else.

15 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: My co-Chair  
 16 Council Member Recchia.

17 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Thank you. Mr.  
 18 King, I heard your testimony and you talked about  
 19 how proud you are of the blueprints that you've  
 20 been putting together. Correct?

21 MR. KING: Yes, sir.

22 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. And those  
 23 blueprints, a lot of work went into them. Is that  
 24 correct?

25 MR. KING: That's correct.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: And you formed committees--how did you come to these blueprints?

MR. KING: Well, it was essentially a year long process of engaging our teachers of the arts, arts and cultural partners, people from higher education, representatives from the industry, from guilds and unions who joined us in the creation of those arts blueprints.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Right and each blueprint has a different discipline. Correct?

MR. KING: That's correct. There are now five.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Five.

MR. KING: Mm-hmm.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: You have professional development in these areas?

MR. KING: We do. We're now in the fifth year in professional development in support of the blueprints.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: And how much-- you spend a lot of money training these teachers in this blueprint Is that correct?

MR. KING: The blueprints themselves were mostly developed and printed with

1  
2 not using tax levy money. For example the moving  
3 image blueprint was supported by JP Morgan Chase  
4 and they're also supporting the professional  
5 development associated with that blueprint. The  
6 professional development currently offered is  
7 provided by the Central Office and a small fee is  
8 paid by the participating schools.

9 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. With all  
10 that said, how come this blueprint is not a  
11 curriculum?

12 MR. KING: It is a curriculum  
13 framework in that it allows schools individually  
14 to address those indicators of student learning.  
15 We're very transparent about what student  
16 achievement looks like at each benchmark. But  
17 whether a student gets there by engaging in Afro  
18 Caribbean dance or ballet, we don't prescribe.

19 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: But you spent  
20 all this money, raised all this money and schools  
21 in a curriculum they have to use it; in a  
22 blueprint they don't have to use this. And this  
23 is, to me, if you're so proud of it and we spend  
24 thousands of dollars on this, then the schools  
25 should be using this, not recommended. Because in

1  
2 a curriculum they have to teach what's in the  
3 curriculum; in a blueprint, they don't have to  
4 teach what's in it.

5           What I'm saying here is if you  
6 spent thousands of dollars in putting this  
7 together and not required the schools to use it  
8 because it's not curriculum, then why are we doing  
9 this? There's much more better need in this time  
10 of hard monies that we could be using that money  
11 towards other projects.

12           MR. KING: First of all, those  
13 documents were not developed in the last two  
14 years. The document that was developed in the  
15 last two years was done exclusively with private  
16 money. But what I would like to reiterate is that  
17 the benchmarks for student achievement are very  
18 clear; the school expectation for those individual  
19 students is extremely clear. And if you look  
20 benchmark grade by benchmark grade you see very  
21 clear indications for what we expect the student  
22 outcomes to be. That's regardless of how the  
23 individual curriculum is delivered.

24           MR. TAVARES: May I just add?

25           MR. KING: Yes.

2 MR. TAVARES: Thank you. That's a  
3 good debate that we just had in our office not too  
4 long ago. We have what is called scope and  
5 sequence, which basically takes the state  
6 standards and says this is a suggested sequence to  
7 take on particular subject area. And some people  
8 wanted to call it curriculum map, some people  
9 wanted to call it a curriculum framework so you  
10 get into semantics. What we want to do is to  
11 allow schools to have the creativity of their  
12 curriculum based on the students' interest but at  
13 the same time whatever it is that they're doing  
14 has to be aligned with those standards and that  
15 framework that we put in the blueprint.

16 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: It sounds great.  
17 If you want schools to be creative, you should get  
18 rid of all the required curriculum that you're  
19 forcing schools to use so that will bring back the  
20 creativity. But anyway--

21 MR. TAVARES: [interposing] Sir, we  
22 don't have any required curriculum for any school.  
23 Schools are able to choose anywhere they want from  
24 core curriculums. They can choose--

25 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: [interposing]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Listen, no disres--

MR. TAVARES: --teachers, college. They can use America's Choice. They could use a whole bunch of different core curriculum--

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: [interposing] And there's a lot of pressure.

MR. TAVARES: --but what can not choose is the standards that they're measured on.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: And there's a lot of pressure on to use the new math, okay? There's a lot of pressure to use other reading programs. I'm not going to get into this whole issue but I'm just--we know how it works; just say that.

MR. TAVARES: For 20 years that's all I've been working on and I would love to continue that conversation whenever you would like because I think it's very interesting. Because it is something that we need to discuss and continue to discuss so that the kids are interested in what's happening in the classroom.

CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Right. We're here for arts today, not here to talk about reading and math. But we requested before today's

1 hearing, because you rely on the 2008-2009 annual  
2 Arts in Schools report. You cited in your  
3 testimony today. Prior to this hearing, we  
4 requested a copy of that report. We requested the  
5 information. We requested the numbers that you're  
6 relying on and your office refused to give it to  
7 us. Why?

8  
9 MR. KING: I honestly don't know  
10 that that's the case. This is the first that I've  
11 heard the Council directly requested a copy of the  
12 report.

13 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: The report was  
14 supposed to be submitted without us requesting it,  
15 that's number one. Because it's an annual report  
16 and it was supposed to be submitted by the end of  
17 when? We were originally told the end of October  
18 and then November 30th. So staff has requested  
19 it. Help me out here. You agree or disagree?

20 MR. KING: We're happy to preview  
21 some of the preliminary data. The report is not  
22 ready to go.

23 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Why isn't it  
24 ready?

25 MR. KING: We're having to crunch

1  
2 three years of data and make sure that there is  
3 alignment and that the report is clean.

4 MR. TAVARES: The last thing we  
5 want to do is give you a report with mistakes in  
6 it that doesn't reflect the accurate data for the  
7 last three years.

8 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Yeah, but you  
9 didn't even give us preliminary data. How do you  
10 expect us to--I was getting ready to say like my  
11 father would say, you think it's flee? He used to  
12 say flee as free? You think it's flee? God rest  
13 his soul. But you're coming here giving  
14 statistics of the 2008-2009 and we have nothing to  
15 verify whatsoever. We just supposed to take your  
16 word. Not that we don't trust you, but you've  
17 heard the saying, trust but verify. And right now  
18 I can not verify neither can Domenic Recchia or  
19 Lou Fidler or Gale Brewer behind me or Maria del  
20 Carmen Arroyo of the Bronx.

21 And in fact, I heard what you're  
22 saying as far as three years of statistics so that  
23 you can make sure that it's aligned so forth and  
24 so on. Domenic raised a question but I have a  
25 question as far as even the 2006-2007-2008

1  
2 information is not aligned. I raise that because  
3 I'm looking here, the second annual report does  
4 not include the average student teacher ratio for  
5 arts education, while this statistic was included  
6 in the first report. So my question is why wasn't  
7 it reported in 2007-2008 version when you included  
8 it in the first version. So we have some  
9 continuity for evaluation purposes, that's number  
10 one. So I'll give you the opportunity to think  
11 about that.

12 Let me ask the second. The second  
13 report notes that the number of art rooms went up  
14 49% from 27% the previous year. This conflicts  
15 with the information about the number of actual  
16 cluster rooms used as reported in the blue book.  
17 You know the blue book deals with enrollment  
18 capacity and utilization report. For 2006, the  
19 blue book reported 2,272 actual cluster rooms  
20 used. For 2008, that number decreased to 1,988.  
21 So I'm giving you statistics but you say the  
22 second report notes that the number of art rooms  
23 went up 49%. Something doesn't jive there.

24 MR. TAVARES: No, it doesn't and  
25 we'll get back to you on that.



2 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: I guess myself  
3 and my staff are curious as to if you report stuff  
4 in 2006-2007 and then you leave that stuff off in  
5 2007-2008, we want to see the two based on  
6 information you have in 2006-2007, roll that  
7 forward to 2007-2008 and 2008-2009. If you have  
8 new categories that you're coming in as of 2008-  
9 2009, that's fine too. That's new categories that  
10 we can statistically roll off over the next couple  
11 of years.

12 MR. TAVARES: I agree that that  
13 should be aligned. What we will do is we'll make  
14 sure when we're able to release the annual school  
15 report for this year, bring you a copy and then  
16 we're more than happy to come back and address the  
17 issues you may find in that report.

18 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay, we  
19 appreciate that. If you have any questions, your  
20 people can touch base with our people in order to  
21 think. But what about the blue book as far as do  
22 you have any information on that right now?

23 MR. TAVARES: We will get back to  
24 you on that.

25 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay. Domenic,

2 I'm sorry. That was just on that line of  
3 questioning.

4 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: That's all  
5 right.

6 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Council Member  
7 Gale Brewer has joined us, she's behind us.  
8 Forgive me, Gale, I didn't notice you in the back.  
9 I don't have eyes in the back of my head,  
10 sometimes I wish I did though because I see what  
11 people are talking about me. But no, I'm joking,  
12 of course.

13 But Council Member Gale Brewer has  
14 some questions.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you  
16 very much. First of all, thank you for inviting  
17 me to Governor's Island to see your students  
18 during the summer. I had a great time. It was  
19 just all the arts students in the eighth grade and  
20 it was wonderful.

21 MR. TAVARES: We were delighted to  
22 have you there. It was a wonderful event.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I didn't  
24 see Domenic or Robert there. Okay, I love them  
25 anyway. I love them anyway.

1  
2 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: I was away with  
3 my children.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know, he  
5 told me. I called him up and said where are you  
6 Domenic. I have a couple of questions. First of  
7 all, this is just minor but when you have a lot of  
8 arts groups, some of which already have funding.  
9 I think it's hard, this is just an operational  
10 question, I think it's hard because understanding  
11 if I was a principal and a group calls me up that  
12 I don't know, I'm a little suspicious. I don't  
13 know who they are. So it used to be in the old,  
14 old days that you would call Karen Abramowitz or  
15 something in District 3 because you knew she was  
16 the Project ARTS coordinator. So who are they  
17 supposed to call now because sometimes they  
18 actually have funding from other sources. They  
19 tell me they call all the schools. They're  
20 ignorant about public schools and the public  
21 schools are not familiar with them. So how is  
22 somebody supposed to break in to, if they have  
23 funding and they want to work with the schools. I  
24 always tell them, this is a sustainable project.  
25 Do not think you're going to come in once. I have

1  
2 the lingo down. But how do they break in to  
3 working with the schools if they have not  
4 familiarity?

5 MR. KING: Let me deal with your  
6 question from two sides. Where schools have  
7 questions about arts partners, we currently have  
8 on the arts education web site, our Arts and  
9 Cultural Services Guide. Any vendor or any non-  
10 vendor who is delivering services can register for  
11 that guide and it profiles programs that those  
12 individual organizations are offering. And that's  
13 updated quarterly for any organization that wants  
14 to be listed.

15 The easiest and most direct way for  
16 arts partners to service our schools is to make  
17 outreach through the arts education liaisons. We  
18 have over 1,200 arts liaisons appointed to our  
19 schools. That material is also available online  
20 in a database so arts organizations can go and  
21 access those direct emails and solicit schools  
22 through the arts education liaisons.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So they  
24 still have to get into the registration guideline  
25 and they have to call every school?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. KING: No, those have emails. They can do a blast to all of the arts liaisons if they choose to go that route.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. I'm just in the old days; 32 people is different than 1,200.

MR. KING: It is.

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: It's not great. The second question is I have great respect for Cool Culture because they take Headstart children and families and take them to the museums, etc. Is there anything like that for the school children who are older? In other words, I don't know if you--you know Cool Culture and make sure that kids in Headstart and low income communities can go to the museums, blah, blah, blah. Is there anything like that that happens for students who are older, anything like Cool Culture?

MR. KING: I think as you're aware many of the organizations do services not only in schools but take students to performances and galleries. But I also understand that later in this testimony, you'll be hearing from Arts

1  
2 Connection who works very deeply and is now  
3 incorporated a High Five so I would ask you  
4 discuss that with them as well.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.

6 Tracking individual students, is that something  
7 you do? In other words, I read your testimony.  
8 I'm sorry I wasn't here; I was in another meeting.  
9 But I understand that you have some statistics,  
10 Domenic may agree or disagree and so does Robert.  
11 But the issue is how do you track whether an  
12 individual student has enough or what you would  
13 consider whatever the benchmark is. Even in arts  
14 rich schools, there may be students who are not  
15 able or for whatever reason not taking advantage.  
16 How do you track individual students as opposed to  
17 a class, a teacher, a school?

18 MR. KING: That is really the gold  
19 standard and we are not there yet. What we are  
20 tracking is class by class; it was a major effort  
21 to get to that level. You are absolutely right.  
22 We would love to have individual student level  
23 data we can track.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: When do you  
25 think you might have that?

1  
2 MR. KING: I can't give you that  
3 answer right now. It's something we're working  
4 toward and I'd be happy to get back to you as we  
5 make progress on that.

6 MR. TAVARES: I just want to add  
7 that that's true what Paul said about K through 8.  
8 In the high schools, because of the way that the  
9 system works we can track specific courses the  
10 students are taking.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And  
12 individual students, too, not just courses, right?

13 MR. TAVARES: Individual students.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: The middle  
15 schools, I know you mentioned that you're doing  
16 much better than in the past in terms of  
17 participation in the arts. But my question is it  
18 does seem to be, from what I've heard, a drop in  
19 music teachers and music preparation maybe because  
20 as many critics say, more test prep. So I'm just  
21 wondering whether you think that's true and how  
22 are you measuring the actual music participation?

23 MR. KING: We do know that there's  
24 a decrease in the number of licensed, certified  
25 music teachers and certainly corresponding drop in

1 the number of students participating in music.  
2  
3 It's a problem area that we're hoping to address,  
4 particularly in terms--with limited resources  
5 we're not actively trying to identify  
6 private/public partnerships that will address  
7 that, particularly in music and at the middle  
8 school level.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Is their  
10 funding for these public/private partnerships?

11 MR. KING: We're working diligently  
12 to identify that funding.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. And  
14 then just finally, the issue of LaGuardia High  
15 School. That is, along with Frank Sinatra and  
16 others premiere, why do they get such a huge cut  
17 in their budget for the instruments and all the  
18 things that they need. LaGuardia got the biggest  
19 cut.

20 MR. KING: I honestly would have to  
21 look into that. I don't know as a percentage of  
22 the school budget if in fact LaGuardia was  
23 disproportionately cut.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Of course,  
25 we think it is. What I'm trying to say--we



1  
2 obviously think it is. What I'm trying to say is  
3 when you have an arts rich or any kind of other  
4 school, we're talking about the arts today that is  
5 rich in a particular topic, I don't think that it  
6 should be penalized for having that kind of  
7 opportunities. So I won't belabor the point but  
8 LaGuardia got hit and I would like to have it  
9 restored. Thank you very much, Chairs.

10 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Thank you Gale  
11 Brewer. And just picking up on that along with  
12 LaGuardia, Mark Twain School for the Gifted and  
13 Talented. They have also been cut. They have  
14 been cut much more than any other middle school in  
15 the whole city for their programs. So I think you  
16 should also put that on your list also.

17 Getting back to that \$316, is that  
18 tax levy or is that a combination of all monies.

19 MR. KING: It's only tax levy.

20 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. All right  
21 because I'm going to do some research on this.

22 MR. KING: We're happy to help you  
23 with that research.

24 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: You know what?  
25 We've been asking you for the information before

1  
2 today's hearing and we didn't get it but hopefully  
3 we'll get it. The arts liaison that you're  
4 talking about, the 1,200, that's a teacher from  
5 every school that you're calling an arts liaison.  
6 Is that correct?

7 MR. KING: It may not be a teacher,  
8 it may be an assistant principal. Sometimes a  
9 principal, him or herself, decides to opt in to  
10 that position

11 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: So one person  
12 from every school, one educator, someone who has a  
13 teaching degree, is an arts liaison, not the  
14 parent coordinator, not a para.

15 MR. KING: In very few cases the  
16 principal will appoint a parent coordinator but  
17 mostly those are the licensed teacher of the arts  
18 or an assistant principal.

19 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Could you give  
20 us a list of all those liaisons?

21 MR. KING: Certainly.

22 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Those 1,200  
23 because I think we should have that.

24 MR. KING: Certainly.

25 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Because I think

1  
2 we should know, to answer Gale Brewer's questions,  
3 when people have problems is that who should they  
4 go to in the school.

5 MR. KING: Okay. And again, that  
6 material is on our web site. It's easily  
7 available but we'll be happy to forward that to  
8 you.

9 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: What is the  
10 Chancellor's art endorsed diploma and how is that  
11 different from the arts Regents diploma?

12 MR. KING: The arts Regents diploma  
13 is really a misnomer in that New York state does  
14 not grant Regents diplomas in the arts. What New  
15 York State says is for a student taking nine or  
16 ten semesters of study at the high school level  
17 that they can waive the foreign language  
18 requirement and meet the Regents requirements  
19 through the arts. So what this does, this locally  
20 endorsed diploma is acknowledge that nine or ten  
21 credit sequence study in one arts discipline and  
22 the passing of a very rigorous arts commencement  
23 assessment.

24 So we believe that this is an  
25 additional seal of approval for student who have

1  
2 completed a rigorous course of study. We believe  
3 it will be advantageous as they're applying for  
4 colleges and universities and conservatories to  
5 note that they're on track for receiving an arts  
6 endorsed diploma.

7 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: So if someone  
8 wants to still get a Regents diploma, what you're  
9 saying is they don't have to do the foreign  
10 language part. They can do nine or ten.

11 MR. KING: That's correct. That's  
12 a New York State requirement is that students  
13 meeting the nine or ten credit requirement in the  
14 arts can waive the foreign language requirement  
15 but we don't recommend that. I can say having a  
16 student, a daughter at LaGuardia and I insisted  
17 that she also take the French requirement so we do  
18 not recommend that.

19 MR. TAVARES: I just want to  
20 clarify that right now the State Department of  
21 Education requires five Regents in order to get a  
22 Regents diploma and those are two in social  
23 studies, the English, the math and one science so  
24 foreign language is not one of those that are  
25 required for a kid to get a Regents diploma.

2 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. What are  
3 we doing in New York City as far as getting the  
4 Regents to count in the arts? Are we working on  
5 that?

6 MR. TAVARES: Yes, I just met with  
7 John King, not related to Paul King, the new  
8 Senior Deputy Commissioner for the State  
9 Department of Education. We had a wonderful  
10 conversation around the arts, among other things.  
11 But wanting to make sure that he understands what  
12 our needs are here at the city and to tell them  
13 about the Chancellor's endorsed diploma which we  
14 just introduced this past summer.

15 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: We would like to  
16 go up with you to Albany to get a Regents diploma  
17 in the arts.

18 MR. KING: We would welcome that  
19 opportunity.

20 MR. TAVARES: We would go there  
21 side by side with you.

22 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: That's very  
23 important. I don't have any further question.

24 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Well, let me  
25 thank you both for coming in. We look forward to

1  
2 working with you in the future with respects to  
3 arts funding in the New York City public schools.  
4 Staff will be following up with additional  
5 questions and comments. We look forward to that  
6 report. When can we expect to see the report?

7 MR. TAVARES: Early December.

8 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: December?

9 MR. TAVARES: Yeah, it's been a lot  
10 of work and a lot of things happening. As you  
11 know with these budget cuts we got to do all of  
12 that stuff so it's just a lot of work on our  
13 plate. But as soon as we have it, you'll get it.

14 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: I'd like to see  
15 the alignment with those questions that were in  
16 the first year's report and moved forward to the  
17 second and the third year so we can look at it  
18 from an evaluating point of view, okay?

19 MR. KING: Very good.

20 MR. TAVARES: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Say that again?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: And a list  
23 of the codes.

24 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: And a list of  
25 the codes.

1  
2 MR. KING: And we will certainly  
3 get you a list of the budget codes.

4 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you very  
5 much.

6 MR. KING: Thank you.

7 MR. TAVARES: Thank you.

8 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Our first  
9 witnesses, our first panel are Dean Gerald Ross  
10 from St. John's University School of Education,  
11 Karen Alford UFT, Doug Israel Center for Arts  
12 Education and Tom Chaypin the National Arts,  
13 representing himself, he's an artist with Local  
14 1000. Please come forward.

15 For the record, we received  
16 testimony from the Alliance for the Arts. For the  
17 record, we received testimony from Senator Hosea  
18 Serrano of the Bronx. For the record, we received  
19 testimony from Education and Dance. For the  
20 record, we received testimony from Steven Yaffy  
21 Arts and Education Consultants in support of  
22 Resolution 837. We received testimony for the  
23 record from the Council of Supervisors and  
24 Administrators, commonly known as CSA.

25 With that, Dean Ross would you

1  
2 please identify yourself and your position and you  
3 may begin your testimony. I'm going to ask, as  
4 earlier, please if you can not read your  
5 testimony, can summarize it. We're going to try  
6 to hold everyone to three minutes if possible.  
7 Dean Ross.

8 DEAN GERALD ROSS: Thank you Mr.  
9 Chair. As a matter of fact, I'm going to ask you  
10 not to pay any attention to the printed material  
11 you have in front of you because the conversation  
12 that has been held until now I think I have better  
13 things to say. I apologize for running after this  
14 but I teach a class called the Organization and  
15 Administration of Colleges and Universities. If  
16 you think you have trouble monitoring the  
17 Department of Education, just try herding those  
18 cats that inhabit our buildings. It lends  
19 credibility to the definition of a dean as someone  
20 who has lost his faculties.

21 [Laughter]

22 I am, myself, a product of the New  
23 York City schools and a graduate of LaGuardia High  
24 School. I think the comment of the Councilperson  
25 just a minute ago of a disproportionate cut at



1  
2 LaGuardia is true when you look at the class  
3 schedule, which has been cut from eleven periods a  
4 day to nine because of those cuts. I also am a  
5 member of the committee that advises the state  
6 Education Department on all of education,  
7 including the arts. There are developments in  
8 Albany about which I think we need to all be  
9 concerned but that we can reserve to another  
10 conversation. They will reflect not very well on  
11 the arts.

12 I think there are two factors that  
13 have not been mentioned yet and probably won't be.  
14 So I'd like to reinforce what everybody says about  
15 the importance of the arts leading our children to  
16 understanding of the world and global education.  
17 If we are to believe the statements of economists  
18 and world leaders, within the last part of this  
19 century, America will have lost the leadership  
20 among the democracies of the world. Largely  
21 because of what has been called and continuing to  
22 be called a loss of imagination.

23 That, in fact, is how 9-11 was  
24 described by the commission investigating it, it  
25 was a loss of imagination on the part of those who

1  
2 should have known what could and eventually did  
3 happen. When we deprive children of study in the  
4 arts, we are diminishing their capacity to imagine  
5 even further.

6           The second is that there is an  
7 urgent need for us to civilize ourselves and to be  
8 able to get along better with one another. Here,  
9 again, the arts play a very significant role. Not  
10 to be confused with other disciplines that indeed  
11 practice and teach other things. The power of the  
12 arts to create and sustain global awareness and  
13 the power of the arts to provide learning that is  
14 not technocratic and eliminates democracy from  
15 their understanding is something that is  
16 frequently written about, little talked about and  
17 very little implemented in the vision of the city  
18 blueprint as it now stands.

19           Someone once said that vision,  
20 which is what the papers are supposed to represent  
21 vision without implementation is hallucination.  
22 And we have a lot of hallucinogenic floating  
23 around in the city at this point. But I'm not  
24 convinced that arguing with one another is going  
25 to produce the best results. No one sitting in

1  
2 this room, I think, can fail to be impressed with  
3 the knowledge possessed by the members of the  
4 Council. It really is extraordinary, the depth of  
5 the questions and the understanding of the kinds  
6 of questions to ask.

7 But similarly, I go back long  
8 enough to remember that if you ask anyone at the  
9 old Board of Education, how many music teachers  
10 are there in the board system, you couldn't get an  
11 answer. How many social studies teachers? You  
12 couldn't get an answer? How many principals were  
13 not acting interim? You couldn't get an answer;  
14 you couldn't get data on anything.

15 I believe the Chancellor and the  
16 people in the arts education division of the  
17 school system ought to be complimented on at least  
18 placing the facts before us. That we don't like  
19 that facts is another issue. But we do have data  
20 now that proves once and for all that we are not  
21 in compliance. We don't have to guess, we don't  
22 have to look around and we don't have to try to  
23 pry out of city officials, what is really  
24 happening. So the transparency is good. The  
25 verbal directives that the Chancellor gives to his

1 principals are also good.

2  
3 The problem is, as indicated in my  
4 paper here, the one area I hope I can leave with  
5 you which reinforces what you said before. That  
6 no matter how you encourage principals to select  
7 the arts as a priority and to use the money that  
8 we've all heard many times over was transferred  
9 into their regular budget so that they make their  
10 decisions. The more you discover that they can't  
11 really respond because their job assessment is  
12 held largely to the successful completion of test  
13 scores in primary math and literacy.

14 Therefore the money that they have  
15 available to them is going to go to preserving  
16 their own jobs and more than one of them has said  
17 so. You can check with any member of the  
18 principal's staff in any school and they will live  
19 under the cloud of whether or not they will be  
20 continued in their jobs if test scores, other than  
21 those in the arts or anything else fall.

22 So what I'm asking us to try to do  
23 today is to for your committees to continue to  
24 monitor the efforts of the city schools to  
25 improve. There's a gigantic job but it's a

1  
2 gigantic job in the context of a school system  
3 that has not yet realized the significance of the  
4 arts in the 21st century. As if they weren't  
5 significant before but even more these days.

6 I would encourage you to try to  
7 partner with the Mayor and the Chancellor in  
8 raising funds and finding additional funds so that  
9 what happened under the Giuliani administration  
10 could reoccur again. And hand in hand, you would  
11 go to corporations and foundations, looking for  
12 the money not only to increase the services of the  
13 arts but other disciplines that are equally  
14 negatively affected. If I were from the sciences  
15 I would be saying the same thing, including the  
16 word science instead of arts.

17 If Mayor Giuliani could find \$75  
18 million, certainly Mayor Bloomberg can find \$75  
19 million. If you were there along with him and if  
20 he took that initiative--in fact he could write  
21 the check himself, he'd never miss it. I think a  
22 lot more doors would open so that we wouldn't be  
23 looking at and arguing with one another on the  
24 need for funding and what funding produces.

25 Finally, in those arts needy

1 schools, which are abundant in the city, which  
2 parallel the dismal graduation rates about which  
3 Chairman Jackson has spoken. There is such a  
4 tremendous need for funds that nowhere in the  
5 existing budget, even with the shifting of  
6 priorities, could they possibly meet state  
7 standards or for that matter what we consider to  
8 be the minimum that we would want our children to  
9 have.  
10

11 I think that the case, if we were  
12 to work together, including higher education where  
13 by the way there is an army of students being  
14 prepared to be arts teachers. The thought that I  
15 presented over and over again to chancellors and  
16 greeted by oh, that's a good idea and you never  
17 heard again were put into effect.

18 We could, as my school does from  
19 the freshman year until their senior year, place  
20 our students in the schools as tutors and as  
21 mentors and as role models. Overnight you would  
22 have hundreds of music students who would gain  
23 college credit by serving in those schools as  
24 tutors and mentors to the kids who really need  
25 them. No one has ever taken me up on that offer.

1  
2 If, in your capacity as overseers of the school  
3 system, you could push that a little bit, I think  
4 you'd find a very welcoming reception in the  
5 higher education community.

6 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Professor, we  
7 have to move on to other witnesses.

8 DEAN ROSS: Okay. I just want to  
9 quote one quote, four lines. It was John Adams,  
10 President John Adams, who said I must study  
11 politics and war that my sons may have liberty to  
12 study mathematics and philosophy. My sons ought  
13 to study mathematics and philosophy, geography,  
14 natural history, naval architecture, navigation,  
15 commerce and agriculture in order to give their  
16 children a right to study painting, poetry, music,  
17 architecture, statuary, tapestry and porcelain. I  
18 would ask us to remember that.

19 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you.  
20 Next, Doug Israel, Center for the Arts Education.

21 KAREN ALFORD: Excuse me, Chairman  
22 Jackson. We've had a change in the order.

23 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay, go ahead.

24 MS. ALFORD: Good afternoon. I'm  
25 Karen Alford and I'm the Vice President for

Elementary Schools for the United Federation of Teachers.

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Okay, go ahead, please.

MS. ALFORD: I'm just going to give you the highlights since you have the complete information with you. We know the arts are essential to a quality learning experience and that goes for all age groups, from pre K to high school. Whether we're talking about crayons, finger paints and museum trips to classrooms on photography, dance and band, the exposure to a participation in the arts is vital to a child's academic and personal growth.

For at risk students, the arts are entrée to getting them involved and interested in school because it's an area where the struggling reader or level one or two student can be successful. This focus, sense of self and positive reinforcement can carry over into other content areas.

The United Federation of Teachers has partnered with the Center for Arts Education to help develop teachers' skills and integrate the



1  
2 arts into their curriculum. The biggest obstacle  
3 that we see right now; budget cuts. We know that  
4 when a budget gets a cut, as they have this year,  
5 the arts are among the first programs to be  
6 downsized or eliminated. In a city such as ours  
7 where music, dance, visual arts and theater are  
8 part of its very core, that in itself is a shame.  
9 The thought of budget cuts forcing schools to  
10 further scale back their arts programs is tragic.

11 We know the Council has been among  
12 the city's strongest, consistent supporters of the  
13 arts in schools. And for that, we at the UFT  
14 commend you. In a survey we did in October, 15%  
15 of elementary and middle schools reported that  
16 they lost art programs. 14% had eliminated music  
17 programs and 11% had cut back on theatre or dance  
18 classes. In the elementary schools, 13% had lost  
19 cluster teacher positions, which are very often  
20 art teachers. In high schools, 10% reported that  
21 art classes were cut and 13% said music classes  
22 were eliminated. In addition, most schools  
23 reported cuts in supplies, after school program,  
24 enrichment activities and special events,  
25 virtually all of which are cuts to the arts.

1  
2 Besides budget cuts, there has been  
3 a system wide decline in arts spending in recent  
4 years, largely due to the fact that Project ARTS  
5 funding has been cut. Since this funding change,  
6 there's been a decline of more than 60% in the  
7 purchases of art and music materials. Two  
8 additional obstacles that we see are overcrowding  
9 and the physical space for arts programs. The  
10 high stakes testing movement have forced schools  
11 to push the arts out of their curriculums.

12 Moving forward we have our work cut  
13 out for us if we want to save the arts in our  
14 schools. First and foremost, we should all be  
15 looking at ways to stem the growing tide of budget  
16 cuts, classrooms and direct services including the  
17 arts must be protected. Secondly, we need to  
18 ensure that each and every school has a certified  
19 arts teacher as well as physical space and  
20 materials for arts instruction. Third, schools  
21 must be in compliance with state regulations and  
22 the DOE should properly support schools in this  
23 regard by restoring arts funding as a stand alone  
24 budget line. And giving schools their proper per  
25 pupil allocation for arts education.

1  
2 After all, the arts have the  
3 potential to enrich our lives in the most amazing  
4 ways. They provide kids with creative and  
5 emotional outlets and help enhance their  
6 confidence and interest in learning. We can't  
7 keep shortchanging our children. Thank you.

8 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you.

9 Next, please Doug Israel or Tom Chaypin.

10 TOM CHAYPIN: Chairman and  
11 committee members, nice to be here. My name is  
12 Tom Chaypin, I'm a singer/songwriter, New York  
13 City kid. Went to P.S. 41, P.S. 8 in Brooklyn,  
14 graduate of Brooklyn Technical High School and a  
15 parent of four kids that went for at least part of  
16 their time in New York City schools, including  
17 LaGuardia, graduate of LaGuardia. I'm also a  
18 member of the Board of Governors of the New York  
19 Chapter NARAS, the Recording Academy, which is the  
20 Grammy people. I guess that's part of why I'm  
21 here. The other is as a concerned citizen.

22 I'm not an expert in education but  
23 I am a songwriter so I thought that I would add a  
24 little arts to this event. [Playing guitar and  
25 singing]

1  
2 They sorted through the data and  
3 found as a rule that kids who have the arts do  
4 much better in school. And song and the dance, on  
5 the canvas, on the stage, art gives life to the  
6 lessons they read on a page. Oh, you can't spell  
7 smart without art. You can't spell smart without  
8 art. All the testing will tell you, it's there on  
9 the chart that you can't spell smart without art.  
10 That's your part. You can't spell smart without  
11 art. You can't spell smart without art. All the  
12 testing will tell you, it's there on the chart  
13 that you can't spell smart without art.

14 Imagination' needed in this  
15 challenging world. To nurture the mind of each  
16 and each girl. The arts are an answer to an old  
17 paradox, how to teach a whole class to think out  
18 of the box. You can't spell smart without art.  
19 You can't spell smart without art. Passing 837  
20 would be a good start because you can't spell  
21 smart without art.

22 So let's make kids more likely to  
23 start on the path to do better in schoolwork like  
24 science or math. And to help out our teachers,  
25 provide them with tools. Watch our kids grow and

1 blossom with the arts in our schools. You can't  
2 spell smart without art. You can't spell smart  
3 without art. Yes science and reading and math do  
4 their part you can't spell smart without art.  
5 Last chance, you can't spell smart without art.  
6 You can't spell smart without art. All the  
7 testing will tell you, it's there on the chart,  
8 yes passing 837 would be a good start, yes  
9 science, reading and math do their part but you  
10 can't spell smart without art.

12 [Applause]

13 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: That says it  
14 all.

15 [Laughter]

16 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you. Tom,  
17 I think your message is loud and clear. Let me  
18 just say, I enjoyed it so much, really.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Maybe if we  
20 could get a song for the five minute parking grace  
21 bill, the Mayor would...

22 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: We need that.  
23 Did you hear that? Our colleague, Lou Fidler,  
24 said we need a song for our five minute grace  
25 period for parking. That was really great. Give

1 him another round of applause.

2 [Applause]

3 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: And we needed  
4 that, too. Doug, they tell me you're going to  
5 read your testimony, too. Is that true?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Are you  
7 going to read it in haiku?

8 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Read it in what?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Haiku. I  
10 think he'll tap dance for us.

11 DOUG ISRAEL: We had the tap dance  
12 before when DOE was here.

13 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: All yours Doug?

14 MR. ISRAEL: A tough act to follow  
15 but I asked for it, so. I'm Doug Israel, Director  
16 of Research and Policy for the Center for Arts  
17 Education. I'm standing in for Richard Kessler,  
18 our Executive Director, who was not able to make  
19 it today. He was not feeling well.

20 I have submitted written testimony  
21 for the record but would just like to touch on two  
22 of the key points from that testimony. The first  
23 one being a report that the Center for Arts  
24 Education released on arts education and high  
25

1  
2 school graduation rates. And the second,  
3 supporting Resolution 837, introduced by Council  
4 Member Robert Jackson, which is part of the agenda  
5 today.

6 As you might be aware, this  
7 October, the Center for Arts Education released a  
8 report of which copies are available today on the  
9 side table. If they're not there, you can visit  
10 our web site or ask me for a copy. What we did is  
11 we took an independent look at the data provided  
12 by the Department of Education through their Arts  
13 in Schools reports for the previous two school  
14 years.

15 We looked at nine arts education  
16 indicators and correlated that to high school  
17 graduation rates. What we found was that for  
18 schools in the top third of graduation rates, they  
19 were offering the most access and most resources  
20 to support arts education. Conversely, those  
21 schools that were in the bottom third of  
22 graduation rates, those that are struggling the  
23 most to graduate their students on time, are  
24 offering the least opportunities for participation  
25 in the arts.

1  
2                   These findings were consistent  
3 across all nine of the arts education indicators  
4 that we looked at, from certified arts teachers to  
5 dedicated arts classrooms to partnerships with  
6 cultural arts organizations, all topics which were  
7 discussed today. Schools in the top third of  
8 graduation rates had almost 40% more certified  
9 arts teachers on staff than those in the bottom  
10 third of graduation rates. That, on average, is  
11 about one extra certified arts teacher per school.  
12 They also have 40% more physical spaces,  
13 classrooms dedicated to the arts, which also is  
14 about one extra arts classroom per schools, and  
15 also schools with the highest graduation rates.  
16 And schools with the highest graduation rates also  
17 fostered 25% more cultural arts partnerships than  
18 schools in the bottom third.

19                   This research does not stand alone.  
20 It is built upon the work in the field that show  
21 the benefits of arts education, not only on  
22 academic success but engaging students in school  
23 and keeping them in school and graduating on time.  
24 These findings are particularly relevant as New  
25 York City struggles with its graduation rates.



1  
2 The latest state data says about 56% of our  
3 students are graduating on time. We feel that the  
4 arts could play a key role in inspiring students  
5 to stay in school and graduate on time. That  
6 principals and the DOE should utilize the arts and  
7 tap into the benefits of the arts to improve our  
8 graduation rates and this is one of the many  
9 reasons that CAE is calling for, is pleased that  
10 Reso 837 is on the agenda today.

11 As many of you know, the City  
12 Council and the former Mayor created Project ARTS,  
13 which basically was a dedicated funding line for  
14 arts education. This type of funding and also  
15 this method of accountability, if you will, helped  
16 revive arts education in public schools after  
17 there near decimation in 1970s. And the funding  
18 provided through this initiative was the factor  
19 that moved the system from having one arts teacher  
20 in only one third of the schools in 1991 all the  
21 way up to having one arts teachers in two thirds  
22 of the school in 2007, the year Project ARTS was  
23 eliminated.

24 Unfortunately the forward progress  
25 has ended with the elimination of Project ARTS.

1  
2 There now exists no safety net to ensure that  
3 students are getting an arts education. While the  
4 numbers that they give you, \$311 or \$316--

5 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Go ahead.

6 MR. ISRAEL: This is relevant to  
7 some of the discussions. That \$316 is an average  
8 across all the schools; it does nothing to speak  
9 to equity and how much the schools at the bottom  
10 are getting. Some schools may be putting in \$50  
11 to \$100 per student and not that \$311 which  
12 figures in, factors in LaGuardia and all the other  
13 schools that specialize in the arts.

14 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: We're going to  
15 look into that number.

16 MR. ISRAEL: That wasn't discussed  
17 in--

18 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: [interposing]  
19 Listen, I know how to make the number go up but I  
20 definitely have issues with that number.

21 MR. ISRAEL: The other point about  
22 that number is the majority of that number is  
23 personnel. To the degree that teachers get  
24 mandated raises, that number of course is going to  
25 go up with nothing else changes. It's also

1 interesting to look at it in relation to how other  
2 areas have fared. For instance, what we know  
3 since the phasing out of Project ARTS is that  
4 while that number may have gone up according to  
5 their numbers, the percent of a school's budget  
6 has gone down. The percent of a school's budget  
7 spent on the arts has gone down and that's a  
8 significant factor.

10 What we also see is that principals  
11 are eliminating arts and special classrooms for  
12 the arts. In fact, according to a survey, 25% of  
13 principals reported losing their dedicated  
14 classroom for the arts to general classroom uses.  
15 Anyway today you heard from the UFT in their  
16 testimony calling for a restoration of dedicated  
17 funding, per pupil dedicated funding. In  
18 testimony submitted by the CSA, the principals'  
19 union, they have also called for the restoration  
20 of this dedicated funding line. I think that both  
21 of these points are very important. I think  
22 you'll hear, after my testimony, from parents and  
23 from other cultural organizations for the  
24 restoration of dedicated funding as well.

25 So to wrap up, we are very glad

1  
2 that Resolution 837 was on the agenda. Here  
3 today, we urgently call for the City Council to  
4 take a vote on Resolution 837 and pass this before  
5 the end of the calendar year as a symbolic but very  
6 important way to show support for a minimum level  
7 of funding in arts education for every child, at  
8 every school for arts education. Thank you.

9 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Thank you very  
10 much. Next panel.

11 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you, our  
12 next panel is Paul Katz, New York Chapter of  
13 Recording Academy and Steven Tenin, Arts  
14 Connection and Wendy Dupit, the Producers Project  
15 and Olivia Koppell, who is the sister of Oliver  
16 Koppell, our colleague.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: Mr.  
18 Chairman, while this panel is coming up, I have to  
19 leave for a doctor's appointment. I want to  
20 apologize to this panel, to the remaining  
21 witnesses and to both chairs. This is an  
22 extraordinarily important hearing as far as I'm  
23 concerned and I apologize for having to leave. If  
24 I could just take a brief moment to read one or  
25 two sentences from Ernie Logan's testimony, I

1 think we've submitted to the record, I really  
 2 think it sums it up.

3  
 4 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Sure, go right  
 5 ahead. Council Member Fidler.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER FIDLER: This is,  
 7 with budget decisions now made at the school  
 8 level, the mid year budget cuts and deeper cuts  
 9 planned for next year will back most school  
 10 leaders against the wall, once again. They are  
 11 likely to feel forced to scale back arts programs  
 12 even further in order to focus on mandated  
 13 subjects, particularly reading and math.  
 14 Considering the elimination of Project ARTS and  
 15 the additionally looming cuts to the school  
 16 budget, we may be looking at perfect storm brewing  
 17 for arts education.

18 God forbid but I'm afraid that he's  
 19 right. I think this committee, these committees  
 20 are going to have to be more vigilant than we ever  
 21 have been in making sure that we don't take three  
 22 big steps backwards on the subject of arts  
 23 education in the schools so thank you.

24 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you  
 25 Council Member Fidler. I hope you're wrong. Time

1  
2 will tell. For the record, before the first  
3 witness testimony, we received from the Ethan Find  
4 Local 802 of the American Federation of Musicians.  
5 For the record we received testimony from the  
6 David Sukoff, Director of Education at Manhattan  
7 Theatre Club and Chair of the New York City Arts  
8 in Education Roundtable. Okay? First witness,  
9 whoever name I called first, Paul?

10 PAUL KATZ: Hi, everybody. Thanks  
11 for hearing me. Like Tom I serve on the board of  
12 the Recording Academy in the New York chapter and  
13 also I'm a national trustee. We're the Grammy  
14 folk, that's the way we're best known. By way of  
15 a little bit of background, I previously for 20  
16 years had a record label called Jive Records,  
17 which was anyone from Billy Ocean to Usher to  
18 Britney Spears and Justin Timberlake. Now I tend  
19 to do some non-profit stuff and oversee music for  
20 different movies, one of which was New Moon in  
21 Twilight that opened over the weekend. I'm here  
22 as co-chair of the advocacy committee for the  
23 Recording Academy.

24 We just wanted to lend our support,  
25 and this is something we've been doing for several

1  
2 years now about the need for there to be a  
3 mandated line in the budget for arts and how  
4 important arts are. And just very briefly, we all  
5 know how academically it's important, how it  
6 improves your math. We know how it helps  
7 attendance of students. We know how it helps the  
8 community; it's good for the community. In this  
9 day and age we know how economically important it  
10 is to have jobs.

11 A number of our members, we have  
12 4,000 members in New York, we have 22,000 around  
13 the country plus their families. How many of them  
14 came through the New York school system to learn  
15 their craft? Tom, Suzanne Vega, Alicia Keys, but  
16 not just them, many, many working musicians who  
17 you don't know the names of who play in the clubs,  
18 who play in restaurants, who play Broadway also  
19 came through the public school system and they  
20 don't have that possibility now and it's a serious  
21 problem.

22 Further, I also want to reiterate  
23 the idea that we talked about earlier with the  
24 intellectual property, which is a big export for  
25 us and a big part of New York. You have the life

1  
2 blood of Broadway, concerts, the recordings that  
3 we do. It's a key part of the culture of the city  
4 but also the economy of the city. So I just  
5 wanted to mention how important we feel this is to  
6 continuing that.

7           Also as a parent who spent this  
8 morning filling in the high school public school  
9 record for their kid and have been to more high  
10 schools than I ever want to go to again, including  
11 LaGuardia, which seems to be the one mentioned.  
12 But also, anyone from Beacon, Eleanor Roosevelt,  
13 just loads. My decision as parent and my daughter  
14 tallying on this decision, which school that she  
15 wants to go to. It changed this morning. She  
16 went to see a school that has arts and music and  
17 she played bass. It changed because of that.

18           There's two decisions. One is the  
19 students which school you go to, you may be losing  
20 hopefully good students by not offering these  
21 programs. And me as a parent, I may go to the  
22 private sector versus the public sector. I come  
23 from the public sector and am a strong believer in  
24 it as a result of a lack of possibilities and I  
25 think that's what we need to offer our kids.



1 Thank you very much for hearing me.

2 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you.

3 Next, please.

4 STEVEN TENIN: Good afternoon. My  
5 name is Steven Tenin, I'm Executive Director of  
6 Arts Connection, a dedicated arts in education  
7 organization with provides instruction in the  
8 visual and performing arts, reaching over 30,000  
9 student every year at over 100 public schools  
10 throughout the five boroughs. We've been doing  
11 this for the past 30 years.

12 In January, High Five tickets to  
13 the arts will officially merge with Arts  
14 Connection. This merger with strengthen our work  
15 after school with middle and high school students  
16 and will allow us to provide those students with  
17 low cost tickets to museums and galleries and  
18 music, dance and theatre performances that will  
19 allow them to see professionals demonstrate the  
20 skills they learn in arts connection programs.

21 Before coming here today, I took a  
22 look at the testimony I delivered to this  
23 committee over the last few years and I thought a  
24 lot about how far the field has come during that  
25

1  
2 time. We've spoken in the past about how  
3 important the arts are to the development of  
4 social, personal and cognitive skills in children  
5 and the positive effects an arts rich school has  
6 on the entire arts community, the entire school  
7 community, children, parents, teachers and  
8 administrators.

9                   We've spoken in the past about how  
10 the many studies that have come out in the past  
11 several years that speaks specifically to the  
12 benefits of an arts education. Most notably is  
13 the Center for Arts Education study on the  
14 correlation of arts in the high schools and  
15 graduation rates that were just spoken about.  
16 We've spoken in the past about the real strides  
17 that have been made by the Department of Education  
18 over the past seven years; the blueprints, they  
19 full staffed arts office, the strong leadership  
20 provided by Paul King, the re-hiring of arts  
21 specialists, the gathering of important data.

22                   We've spoken in the past about the  
23 important contribution of the arts community to  
24 this work. The contribution that started during  
25 the fiscal crisis in the 70s and which continues

1  
2 to this day. The fact that arts organization more  
3 than match the monies schools pay for their work  
4 with funds raised from the private sector.

5           What we need to think about today  
6 is Project ARTS and dedicated arts funding.  
7 Sometimes it takes a special effort o get  
8 something done, even when everyone agrees on the  
9 importance of that thing. The arts are that  
10 thing. When Project ARTS was discontinued the  
11 argument was that the money was still in the  
12 school budget, that principals knew how important  
13 the arts are and with the encouragement of the  
14 arts office and the Tweed, they would continue to  
15 spend that money on the arts. They haven't.

16           There are reasons; the financial  
17 meltdown and budget cuts have contributed to this.  
18 The infusion of new principals into the system,  
19 many of whom are graduates of the leadership  
20 academy which does to include the arts in their  
21 list of things principals need to know about. And  
22 many of whom have no experience with the arts in  
23 their academic or personal lives, have contributed  
24 to this.

25           Just other priorities have

1  
2 contributed to this. But it is clear that in the  
3 years since Project ARTS was discontinued there  
4 has been a diminution of arts services in the  
5 public schools. I don't think that was the  
6 intention but it is the fact. I urge the Council  
7 to do something about this, to make dedicated  
8 funding for the arts in schools a reality again.  
9 We need to strengthen the gains of the past seven  
10 years and we need dedicated funding to do it.

11 We all agree that arts are  
12 important, that arts education enriches  
13 achievement in children and in schools. I was  
14 taught years ago that if something is important  
15 and worth doing, if you believe in it, you put it  
16 in your budget. Let's put dedicated funding for  
17 the arts back in the budget. Thank you.

18 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Hello? Thank  
19 you. Next Wendy Dupit.

20 WENDY DUPIT: Okay. I'm Wendy  
21 Dupit. I am the founder of the Producers Project.  
22 It's been a not for profit for seven years working  
23 in all five boroughs. But I really started it in  
24 third grade when school was failing me in suburban  
25 Maryland because it didn't seem alive and applied

1  
2 and relevant. So when our third grade teacher  
3 said we want everyone to do a science report, any  
4 questions. I said could we please do articles  
5 instead. She said why and I said because articles  
6 are what scientists and journalists write and  
7 people read them. Well, we're out of luck because  
8 there's no science magazines published in the  
9 articles of third graders. I asked could we start  
10 one and in third grade we did. We started a  
11 science magazine. We made movies about it.

12 I went on to a start up studied  
13 career in magazines, music, film and television  
14 for major Fortune 500 companies. But there's not  
15 been one year of my in school or adult life when  
16 we haven't brought it right back to K through 12  
17 classroom so that students can make music, film,  
18 television, comics and cartoons, performance and  
19 poetry that turns the lens right back on science,  
20 math, social studies.

21 We're going out on our first day  
22 seven years in Concord. We asked the bus driver,  
23 is this the bus to Concord. He said yes but why  
24 would you want to go there, it's a school for  
25 failures. It's a transfer school. The price of

1 admission is you failed out of two schools before  
2 you get there. We go into the school. I say to  
3 these kids, hey, we're going to write a song and  
4 they said, no, we can't write a song. I said if I  
5 could write a song, you could write a song. And  
6 they said you can't write a song. But I have with  
7 Kermit, Piggy, Mary Kate and Ashley, Annie Lenox  
8 and Peter Gabriel and I told them that. They said  
9 oh my gosh, well then what went wrong?  
10

11 I said what do you mean what went  
12 wrong. They said what went wrong that you had to  
13 come here and work with us. And no, what went  
14 right is that myself, our team of talented music  
15 and film producers, the team of companies that  
16 have been supported us, we did enough right that  
17 we want to take it back to the public schools to  
18 help the schools do things more right.

19 Some of the schools we're in are  
20 the schools on Ryker's Island where every young  
21 inmate sees an orientation video produced with us  
22 by and for them. Where one of the student says on  
23 the outside, all school got me was here. Big  
24 school, metal detectors at the door, can't even  
25 quote but it's too high the percentage of people

1  
2 going with weapons; here all I got is school. I  
3 want to get this message out. Go to school, stay  
4 in school.

5 Based on our success in that  
6 school, we've actually been asked by major players  
7 at the Department of Education to start a school  
8 for young adults coming out of Rikers Island with  
9 the arts based flavor. I probably don't have to  
10 describe the punching bag that that has gone  
11 through, through budget cuts and hopes that get  
12 ballooned and then busted but we're keeping the  
13 hope. We're coming to you, we're going into the  
14 schools, we're going out to Corporate America and  
15 we're bringing that home where it matters most.

16 Thank you for understanding how  
17 much this matters and thank you for knowing as  
18 much as you know. I am on your side to do the  
19 research and sing the song and get us where we  
20 deserve to be. Thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you.

22 Olivia Koppell.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Chairman,  
24 you might notice the similarity of names.

25 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: You weren't here

1  
2 when I introduced her.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Yeah, I  
4 know. I just learned that my sister had arrived  
5 and was testifying. So I'm pleased to see her  
6 here and I hope you will give her the attention  
7 you give everyone else.

8 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Undivided.  
9 Except for my Blackberry, no I'm joking.

10 OLIVIA KOPPELL: Thank you. My  
11 name's Olivia Koppell. I'm a professional  
12 musician. I freelance in New York City. I  
13 played, I like to say, from the sublime to the  
14 ridiculous and everything in between. I am a  
15 product of the public schools. I went to the High  
16 School of Music and Art and I would like to say  
17 ditto to everything that was said. I have no  
18 numbers here. I didn't write anything because I  
19 didn't hear about the hearing until last night.

20 I just want to make some points and  
21 Mr. Jackson, it's nice to see you again and I just  
22 want to remind you about the DVD that we screened  
23 about El Systema. Which is a music education  
24 system in Venezuela that's produced hundreds of  
25 thousands of young people playing instruments and



1  
2 save them from a life of poverty, a life of crime.  
3 It's really a social program through music. If  
4 you remember that.

5 I'm part of a group called El  
6 Systema New York City, we're all volunteer. We're  
7 not a 501(c)(3), we don't ask for any money, we  
8 don't want any money. There are enough groups all  
9 trying to get funding to do all the things we  
10 support. What we advocate is what you are doing  
11 with your resolution, which is we want to put  
12 music and art education back in the schools.

13 There are a lot of pilot programs.  
14 They are wonderful but the best pilot program was  
15 the one that I went through. I was in school  
16 before 1972 when there was music and art as part  
17 of the curriculum. There was an orchestra in  
18 every school or a band in every school, there was  
19 a chorus. There were arts programs. That was the  
20 best pilot program and it worked. Look at what it  
21 produced.

22 There's been a vacuum for the last  
23 30 or 40 years. You mentioned the leadership  
24 academy with principals. I don't know how someone  
25 could be a principal with no teaching experience,

1  
2 for starters. But the fact that the arts are not  
3 included in that curriculum is a great loss. It  
4 saddens me when I heard the testimony before that  
5 it just felt.

6 With all due respect, if felt like  
7 the DOE and I met with Mr. King's predecessor are  
8 more interested in defining what they're doing  
9 than listening to construction criticism and many  
10 suggestions that could improve what they're doing.  
11 As you said, their heart might be in the right  
12 place but they're always on the defensive. I  
13 would think that they would want to support this  
14 resolution rather than say they're doing fine  
15 without it.

16 I believe that the music education  
17 needs to be part of the curriculum. As you said,  
18 if you just suggest it, it's not going to happen.  
19 If it's in the curriculum, it will be there and it  
20 has to be there from pre-K through 12. The El  
21 Systema program shows that; they take these little  
22 kids. They're not learning instruments yet in  
23 pre-K. They're singing, they're clapping, they're  
24 singing Tom Chaypin songs. And that's the  
25 beginning. In second and third grade when they're

1  
2 larger and they can handle an instrument, they get  
3 a string instrument. When they're older and can  
4 handle a brass instrument, because their arms are  
5 longer, then it moves on to that.

6 If it's not in the curriculum, you  
7 have wonderful programs. There was one in the  
8 Bronx that colleagues of mine started a brass  
9 program in an elementary school. But then the  
10 kids go on to a middle school where there was  
11 nothing. So then what do they do? It has to be  
12 across the board, K through 12 and part of the  
13 curriculum. It worked, it was in the schools for  
14 years and that's what we need to go back to.

15 I support this resolution as a step  
16 in the right direction but I won't stop advocating  
17 until it's back in the curriculum. If this  
18 resolution does not pass, my group is prepared to  
19 take other measures that will somehow force the  
20 DOE to listen. I invite all of you to go to our  
21 web site to see what this is all about. There are  
22 links to hundreds of research papers that all  
23 support this.

24 I'd like to say, I coach amateur  
25 groups in the summer that get together to play

1 chamber music. These are all physics  
2 professionals, math professionals, math teachers.  
3 There is not one scientist who did not study  
4 music; music and science go hand in hand. There's  
5 a direct correlation between math and music.  
6 Today it's said in the New York times, Obama,  
7 President Obama, educate to innovate. He wants to  
8 improve our science education. The way to do that  
9 is through music and art because science is all  
10 about imagination. It's all about imagination and  
11 that's what music and art do. You can not have  
12 scientists without art. Albert Einstein said if  
13 he hadn't been a physicist, he would have been a  
14 musician. He was an amateur violinist and he  
15 loved playing string quartets.

17 There is so much evidence that this  
18 is so important that I don't understand anyone who  
19 sits back and says, well I don't know or we'll see  
20 or we need more pilot programs or we need more  
21 research. It's all there. So I support what  
22 you're doing and it should go further. I intend  
23 to help you take it further. Thank you very much.

24 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Well, thank you.  
25 Clearly in my opinion, Resolution 837 will pass.

1  
2 Because if you don't know, a resolution is an  
3 expression, the will of the body and the body in  
4 my opinion will say yes to this. But whether or  
5 not the Mayor and the Chancellor then accept the  
6 resolution and then implement it is another  
7 question. So whatever you're going to do, don't  
8 wait for the resolution to pass, start it now.

9 MS. KOPPELL: Okay. We will.  
10 We'll let you know what it is, too.

11 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you all  
12 for coming in. Our next panel is Gale Nathan,  
13 Bronx River Arts Center, Ella Weiss, Brooklyn Arts  
14 Council and Connie Baker Savo, Queens Theatre in  
15 the Park and Kelly Kulabarra, the Council as the  
16 Arts and Humanities for Staten Island. Please  
17 come forward. Are other people here? Can I call  
18 two more then, Steven Macintosh from the Flushing  
19 Council of Culture and the Arts. Is Steven here?  
20 And Brenda Reid, representing 15--Brenda Reid are  
21 you here? And Michael Oats, the Paper Bag  
22 Players. Michael are you here? Or Michael Mao,  
23 please come forward, Michael Mao Dance Company.  
24 Please, first panelist you may begin your  
25 testimony. Please identify yourself.

2 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Again, could you  
3 just summarize what's in your testimony. We can  
4 read what's here. Just summarize.

5 ELLA WEISS: Thank you, Domenic.  
6 Good afternoon and let me add my kudos to all of  
7 you for the work that you're doing on behalf of  
8 this resolution. I'm Ella Weiss, President of the  
9 Brooklyn Arts Council. And we're obviously  
10 pleased to add our support for Reso 837, which  
11 would restore this dedicated minimum level per  
12 capita arts funding.

13 As one of the largest providers of  
14 arts education services, our teaching artists do  
15 workshops and assembly programs and reach over  
16 22,000 students a year in almost 100 schools in  
17 the public school system in the city. We work in  
18 school hours and after school hours. Typically we  
19 work in schools in neighborhoods that have limited  
20 arts infrastructure and often where there are few  
21 or no certified arts teachers on staff.

22 Funding for Project ARTS was the  
23 one effective way of ensuring that all New York  
24 City public school students had arts in the  
25 schools. Since it was eliminated, we have seen a

1  
2 direct drop in the number of schools using our  
3 arts education services, showing the significant  
4 negative impact of this decision. In fact, our  
5 arts education programming funding through the  
6 Department of Education has declined almost 30%,  
7 notwithstanding what the DOE wants to contend.

8           One of the most gratifying parts of  
9 my work I to visit schools and see the benefits of  
10 this intellectually and aesthetically robust  
11 programming as students become more effective  
12 communicators, problem solvers and rigorous  
13 thinkers. See kids eyes light up when one of our  
14 teaching artists comes into the room.

15           We have also seen how our programs  
16 and those of other arts organizations that do this  
17 across the city are helping young people develop  
18 life skills and avoid the temptation of gangs and  
19 the streets. It's been an honor to serve as a  
20 trusted partner with the CASA program and that  
21 support has been incredibly important for arts in  
22 the schools but it isn't enough.

23           We indeed need to increase what we  
24 do. On behalf of the Brooklyn Arts Council I urge  
25 every member of the Council to support this Reso

1  
2 and ensure that tomorrow's New Yorkers have the  
3 opportunity to receive the benefits that arts  
4 education affords. As first lady, Michelle Obama  
5 recently noted, learning through the arts  
6 reinforces critical academic schools in reading,  
7 language arts and math and provides students with  
8 the skills to creatively solve problems. We  
9 believe that what she said is absolutely on the  
10 mark and that these programs are absolutely  
11 essential and the birthright of every child born  
12 in our great City of New York. Than you very  
13 much.

14 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Next, go ahead.

15 MS. WEISS: I did it fast.

16 MICHAEL MAO: My name is Michael  
17 Mao, I joined my colleagues in urging the Council  
18 to ensure funding at all schools for arts  
19 education. Although my dance company tours  
20 nationally and internationally, I choose in  
21 addition to serve our children in schools at a  
22 financial loss to my company because they are the  
23 future of our city. It is particularly important  
24 that in New York, a city which benefits  
25 financially from the arts, that such riches are



1  
2 available to our youths. When my diverse company  
3 excites the students with multi cultural fusion,  
4 they see in front of their eyes, multi culturalism  
5 in action.

6 ESL dance we use movement to assist  
7 teen immigrants learn English through dance. They  
8 learn physically and feel empowered to master the  
9 language of their new home, America. As I speak  
10 to you I can see in my mind's eye here in my inner  
11 ear the excitement, the appreciation and the spark  
12 of creativity that art and the performing arts  
13 bring to everyone of our schoolchildren.

14 I respectfully request that you  
15 invest in the future of our city and our country.  
16 As I listen to the discussion today, I want to  
17 also mention that I was the original team and  
18 continue to be a facilitator for the blueprint for  
19 dance. The reason that it was made a blueprint  
20 instead of curriculum was indeed not to limit only  
21 to mandated curriculum taught in schools but also  
22 to use what New York City specifically has at its  
23 disposal, the many, many arts organizations to  
24 compliment and augment what's being taught in  
25 schools.

1  
2 If you look at the dance blueprint,  
3 it will not be difficult to develop scores for  
4 testing. Certain things can not be taught;  
5 creativity can not be taught, it can be  
6 discovered. But the art of making dances or  
7 composing movement can be quantified and can be  
8 scored. This is something that I want to add  
9 today. I didn't quite realize there's a  
10 disagreement in the way funding should be. I  
11 think we should just invest in our kids. That's  
12 it. Thanks.

13 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Thank you, next.

14 KELLY KULABARRA: Hi, I'm Kelly  
15 Kulabarra, the Arts and Education Program Director  
16 for the Council on the Arts and Humanities for  
17 Staten Island. Thanks for having us here today.

18 I couldn't believe more strongly in  
19 Resolution 837. Without it bringing a high  
20 quality education to the city students and the  
21 equity it represents is an uphill battle, to say  
22 the least. As cited in the resolution,  
23 economically disadvantaged students and remedial  
24 students experience the most gains from arts  
25 education. So equity becomes an issue, especially

1 in a city as diverse as New York.

2  
3 Additionally, the arts play an  
4 irreplaceable role for immigrant students and  
5 others whose culture may not be represented in the  
6 main stream. I spoke with a woman just yesterday,  
7 a Liberian immigrant who teaches dance on Staten  
8 Island. She told me in no uncertain terms that  
9 when she arrived in this country it was dance that  
10 kept her in school - period. Her life in her  
11 country of origin had been steeped in dance and in  
12 fact the dance offered at her school was ballet,  
13 not Liberian dance. Yet it was still the most  
14 familiar thing at school and it become a life  
15 line. She now conducts dance residencies herself  
16 at I.S. 27, seeing similar increased motivation  
17 and better grades in her own students.

18 My colleague is hardly alone in her  
19 experience. It's stories like hers that underlie  
20 the reports we read correlating achievement with  
21 instruction in the arts. And this crucial  
22 instruction is not likely to be provided to all  
23 students without something like Project ARTS.  
24 There are schools throughout the city such as  
25 Staten Island, which utilize the arts to bring

1  
2 about dramatic improvements in school life and  
3 academic achievement. But to follow those  
4 examples other principals have to take a leap of  
5 faith and they have to make initial investments of  
6 their very limited time and money into the arts.  
7 Under extreme pressure to teach to test in only  
8 two subjects, they are de-incentivized to do so  
9 without this per student allocation.

10 In Staten Island, we're a small  
11 borough but our arts funding is even smaller. In  
12 2009 we had 2.1% of DCA's dollars as compared to  
13 nearly 6% of the city's population. Even our more  
14 established art organizations have capacity issues  
15 and are not well positioned to make up for a lack  
16 of funding for art instruction in the schools.

17 In Staten Island, as in the rest of  
18 the city, the proposed resolution is one essential  
19 step in bringing a good education to every child.  
20 With it the arts can gain a foothold to play their  
21 essential role in education and their special  
22 function in reaching many students who are not  
23 reached in other ways. Without this resolution,  
24 education in the city will continue to suffer. In  
25 Staten Island, as in the rest of the city, our

1 students deserve better.

2  
3 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Thank you. I  
4 would ask when you testify, if you have written  
5 testimony that not to read it, just to summarize  
6 it because we're getting the hour is getting late  
7 we've been here.

8 STEVEN MACINTOSH: Definitely. My  
9 name is Steven Macintosh. I'm the Director of  
10 Education at Flushing Council on Cultural and the  
11 Arts at Flushing Town Hall. This is my first  
12 Council meeting and just wanted to thank the co-  
13 chairs and the two committees for your commitment  
14 to this city and its schools.

15 I'm testifying today as an arts  
16 administrator, an arts educator and representative  
17 of one of the 33 cultural institutions in the  
18 city. I've provided my brochure so that outlines  
19 a lot of the programs we offer, both in school and  
20 after school programs. We do run one of the CASA  
21 programs and wonderful matinee performance series  
22 that exposes students to world class award winning  
23 artists. That we bring them in at reduced price  
24 ticketing and helping to support the New York  
25 State learning standards and New York City

1  
2 blueprint for the arts. We serve schools across  
3 the borough as well as Long Island, Brooklyn,  
4 Manhattan, Connecticut and even New Jersey.

5           Some of the challenges, I just  
6 wanted to point out that we experience in terms of  
7 bringing quality arts education programming to  
8 schools include the prohibitive cost of  
9 transporting students to cultural art centers.  
10 And lengthy test prep schedules that limit or shut  
11 out arts programming and the time and resources  
12 needed to address particular learning needs for  
13 ELL, ESL and special needs students in inclusive  
14 classrooms.

15           I just wanted to share a simple  
16 story just in terms of the effectiveness of arts  
17 education in the schools. We do wonderful arts  
18 education partnership with Junior High School 189  
19 and last year we were working on a math and  
20 theatre residency which may sound strange in terms  
21 of its pairing but came out with some really  
22 interesting results. The students were developing  
23 skills in voice projection, focused attention and  
24 script writing that incorporated fractions and  
25 percentages.

1  
2 In the evaluations, students noted  
3 they felt they could visualize better, especially  
4 during test taking time. One student noted that  
5 in particular while reticent before to raise her  
6 hand in classroom, she found herself participating  
7 and noticed students as well raising more hands,  
8 not only in their math class but beyond.

9 It's wonderful to come in this year  
10 and see this math teacher now with less support  
11 from - - because we've had to send them elsewhere  
12 to see monologues on the walls of students who  
13 have written about being a radius and a  
14 circumference. You see their creativity, their  
15 humor and the mathematical understanding  
16 altogether and it's a wonderful showcase of arts  
17 integration.

18 I would add as well that as a  
19 cultural institution we are struggling even beyond  
20 what's happening with the DOE through layoffs,  
21 cutting of public hours, staff pay cuts and  
22 impending furloughs. Our tiny organization, in  
23 particular, is struggling to provide the resources  
24 our partners deserve. We know that we're a key  
25 element to this city. We support the great work

1  
2 that the Council is doing as well as other  
3 partners, cultural institutions and arts ed.  
4 organizations and we're grateful for your support.  
5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Thank you. I  
7 want to thank you all for coming to testify. Next  
8 panel, please, Debra Greenberg, Janice Wright,  
9 Carol Boyd, Monica Harris, and Matt Shockey. Is  
10 there anybody else that wish to testify? This is  
11 the last panel. Come on up. Did you sign a piece  
12 of paper? What's your name? Francis McGarrett.  
13 All right, fill out another one and we'll give you  
14 a seat. This is the last call. No one else after  
15 this.

16 We just want to thank everyone for  
17 coming to testify. Your input is greatly  
18 appreciated. We will definitely follow up on  
19 this. You can keep in touch with my colleague,  
20 Robert Jackson the Chair of our wonderful  
21 Education Committee, who does a great job, and  
22 through my office. We're going to follow up on  
23 many issues that we discussed here today. So does  
24 everyone have a seat? It's all ladies so I'm just  
25 going to say ladies. We'll start, we'll go from



1 left to right. Unless you want to go right to  
2 left, I'm only kidding. The Sergeant at Arms will  
3 take it. Go ahead.

4  
5 CAROL BOYD: Good afternoon. I'm  
6 Carol Boyd and I'm a parent fellow with the Center  
7 for Arts Education in New York and also a parent  
8 leader with the New York City Coalition for  
9 Educational Justice. Everyone has pretty much  
10 summed up everything that I had in my testimony.

11 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: That's great.

12 MS. BOYD: However, the thing that  
13 is-- [Laughter] Ah, yes and no. You don't get  
14 off the hook that easily.

15 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Of course not.

16 MS. BOYD: However, what is rather  
17 disheartening is that 365 days have gone by and  
18 I'm back here for the same reason and not too much  
19 has changed for most of the 1.1 schoolchildren of  
20 New York City. Now I am fortunate in so far as  
21 both of my children are fortunate enough to have  
22 an arts rich program. One of them, I'm sorry that  
23 Councilman Jackson's not here.

24 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: He's here. He's  
25 right there.

1  
2 MS. BOYD: Oh, there he is. He  
3 attends the Lower Manhattan Arts Academy and he  
4 aspires to be a professional dancer and  
5 choreographer, much like your daughter.

6 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: You're telling  
7 me that my colleague, Rob Jackson, gets on that  
8 dance floor. Is that what you're saying?

9 MS. BOYD: No, his daughter gets on  
10 the dance floor.

11 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Of course.

12 MS. BOYD: As my son said, being a  
13 young man in tights, one, you know where I am.  
14 It's a quarter to five he's at the bar and not  
15 that bar. He also says that he has cultivated a  
16 mean, grand pertay [phonetic], which helps him  
17 also have a wicked jump shot. So there is a lot  
18 considering especially what's been going on in our  
19 papers lately with young men of color and all the  
20 unmitigated violence that dance, art and the other  
21 arts medias produce a child who is successful  
22 academically and also civically responsible.  
23 Thank you.

24 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Thank you very  
25 much. Next.

2 JANICE WRIGHT: My name is Janice  
3 Wright. I'm a public school parent in Queens.  
4 The only reason I stayed this long is to add the  
5 parents voice to this because that's the only  
6 thing I haven't heard today.

7 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: That's great.

8 MS. WRIGHT: So I'm definitely in  
9 support of 837. My son's school has a lot of arts  
10 programs. He's in second grade in Queens and he  
11 has high functioning autism, part of that means  
12 he's very verbal. So he tells a great story but  
13 he would not write them down. He could not keep  
14 up. I'm summarizing, you got the whole story  
15 here. But he only started to write them down this  
16 year after the art teacher showed him a better way  
17 to draw people. Because they draw their stories  
18 and then they write stories. Now, he's better at  
19 drawing them so he's willing to write them.

20 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: That's a  
21 beautiful story.

22 MS. WRIGHT: There's a similar one  
23 in my testimony about one of my friends who  
24 couldn't color until the art teacher showed him.  
25 He has no special ed. training; she's just years

1  
2 and years of experience with elementary school  
3 kids. She showed him how to break it down so he  
4 could color and now he's fine.

5 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: She's a  
6 certified art teacher?

7 MS. WRIGHT: Yes. I'm sure she  
8 was.

9 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: No, no, no.

10 MS. WRIGHT: She retired but yeah.

11 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: No, that's very  
12 important.

13 MS. WRIGHT: So that's my story and  
14 so--

15 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: [interposing]  
16 It's a beautiful.

17 MS. WRIGHT: The arts had a big  
18 impact on both of their academic success.

19 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: I'm glad your  
20 child is doing a great need for special needs  
21 children. That's very, very important. Too many  
22 times they get left out.

23 MS. WRIGHT: Exactly; this is an  
24 integrated class so all the kids have the whole  
25 mix in there.

2 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: That's  
3 beautiful. Next. State your name for the record.

4 FRANCIS MCGARRETT: My name is  
5 Francis McGarrett. I'm Director of Instruction  
6 for Stevenson Aimes Young Playwrights, Inc.  
7 What's so wonderful is that we work with students  
8 like that. What we do is to ensure the future of  
9 the American theater, what better way to do that  
10 than through the art of play writing. Just as you  
11 talked about being mother, I am teacher and I  
12 always apologize for being a teacher. I always  
13 felt like oh, I'm just a teacher. I was an  
14 English and theater teacher for 30 years and it  
15 wasn't until I worked with Young Playwrights Inc  
16 that I felt validated.

17 One of the things I want to bring  
18 out that's important that wasn't brought out at  
19 this point, which is why I stayed this late is  
20 that the DOE said that the funding is now going  
21 towards investing in hiring certified teachers.  
22 Well, I was a certified English and theatre  
23 teacher and I got my PhD and all of that but  
24 there's nothing that can compare to having a  
25 professional playwright come and work with me and

1  
2 my students. It had a tremendous impact on me and  
3 it's how I ended up being the Director of  
4 Instruction of an organization that I feel so  
5 passionately about.

6 So when they say, yes, it's good to  
7 have a certified teacher in the classroom all the  
8 time and it is about sustainability. But you've  
9 got to give the teacher the tools to continue that  
10 process. And who better to learn that from than a  
11 professional playwright.

12 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: That's one of  
13 the reasons why this City Council developed the  
14 CASA program to bring teaching artists into the  
15 schools. That's why when we put this program  
16 together, we made sure that the money went to the-  
17 -

18 MS. MCGARRETT: [interposing] We  
19 applied, we didn't get it.

20 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: We'll try to  
21 help you out for next year. That's why we fought  
22 hard for the money to go to the art or theater or  
23 drama group, not to the DOE because if DOE would  
24 get their hands on that money, they would never go  
25 after a teaching artist. Okay? So we addressed

1  
2 that properly, this City Council, we did exactly  
3 to address the issue because I'm glad you brought  
4 that up because it means a lot to us.

5 MS. MCGARRETT: Thank you.

6 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay, next.

7 MONICA HARRIS: Thank you for the  
8 opportunity to be here today and speak to this  
9 very, very, very important issue. A heroine or a  
10 hero is defined by those who know what the  
11 predicament is and are still willing to take  
12 action. I thank you--

13 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: [interposing]  
14 Please state your name for the record.

15 MS. HARRIS: Sorry, my name is  
16 Monica Harris. I am CPAC member and I'm from  
17 District 1. I thank you all for those who have  
18 testified and for you, the committee, being  
19 diligent enough to make sure that we hold people  
20 accountable to this.

21 Arts in education strongly develops  
22 critical thinking in children. Art is a language  
23 within any culture. It allows children, students,  
24 teachers to transcend boundaries beyond tolerance  
25 to a place of deep exploration, inspiration, and

1  
2 as a result there is an internal process of  
3 learning and understanding that takes place.

4 A picture paints 1,000 words, there  
5 are 1,000 words but except for a picture would  
6 remain unnoticed, unheard, unexpressed, unlearned.  
7 Music movement, signing and dancing are innate in  
8 many cultures in indigenous people and our rites  
9 to passage. In these artistic expressions,  
10 history and the movement of time is manifest.

11 How could we leave this out of  
12 education? How could we remove money that would  
13 otherwise not allow children to understand these  
14 things? I feel like I need to feed two birds with  
15 one seed rather than kill two bird with one stone.

16 What I mean by that is in our  
17 district recently the DOE has developed an  
18 internal committee to explore un-utilized space in  
19 schools that would provide an opportunity for  
20 charter schools to come into these schools. The  
21 un-utilized space is considered as art rooms,  
22 technology rooms, computer labs, science. It's  
23 the greatest hypocrisy exposed when you tell  
24 teachers teach, children learn, parents be  
25 involved and then you remove the resources that



1 allow these things to take place.

2 So again, I am fighting the good  
3 fight in District 1, not just for our children in  
4 District 1 but for all children. I hope to be a  
5 part of anything that speaks to this matter.  
6 Thank you.

7 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: That's an issue  
8 that we've been looking at because we get  
9 complaints about that all the time, about taking  
10 away the music room, the dance room or not  
11 counting it as utilization in the school. So if  
12 you need any help, our doors are open to help you.  
13 Go ahead, next. You're the last one.

14 DEBRA GREENBERG: Gosh, pressure.

15 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: State your name  
16 for the record. No pressure, go ahead.

17 MS. GREENBERG: My name is Debra  
18 Greenberg. I'm a-- you don't want me to read it,  
19 it was so good.

20 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Go ahead read  
21 it. We're listening.

22 ): I spent time on it.

23 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Go ahead. You  
24 spent time, go ahead.

1  
2 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Talk from your  
3 heart.

4 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Talk from your  
5 heart. Just go ahead.

6 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: And your mind,  
7 what your knowledge is. You're good.

8 ): And it's true. Okay, my name  
9 is Debra Shrier Greenberg. My daughter is a sixth  
10 grader at P.S. 344 at the Anderson School in the  
11 upper west side. I volunteer at her school. I  
12 work with the art teacher, Mr. Nahabedian  
13 [phonetic]. I organize parents to help him in and  
14 out of the classroom. I work with him in the  
15 classroom and I'm also working with him to plan a  
16 school wide art event. I also work with the  
17 Center for Arts Education to educate and inform  
18 parents about the role of arts education in their  
19 children's lives.

20 I'm also a graduate student at the  
21 Teacher's College at Columbia University in the  
22 Art and Art Education program. I'm working  
23 towards my Masters degree and initial  
24 certification and I will be looking for a job in  
25 three years. So if we could kind of figure this

1  
2 out, I would really appreciate it.

3 As a parent I want to see the  
4 Project ARTS line item restored to its full  
5 budget. I want to see principals required to  
6 spend a certain percentage of their budget on  
7 mandated arts education. I'm not asking for more  
8 money, I'm just asking that you restore a  
9 successful program.

10 Why is arts education important to  
11 me as a parent? Arts education is valuable and  
12 unique types of learning. It is a place where  
13 students learn to make something out of simple  
14 materials. For example, in the visual arts class  
15 students have the opportunity to transform  
16 materials. They can take a blank piece of paper  
17 and a pencil and tell a story with lines. Even  
18 the most basic materials, say recycling, students  
19 can experience re-appropriation, taking something  
20 creative for one purpose and changing it to serve  
21 another purpose. This creative act is exciting,  
22 invigorating and empowering.

23 I'm reminded of this while watching  
24 the film Apollo 13. In one scene the scientists  
25 need to figure out how to use existing material in

1  
2 the space caps to improvise an air filter system  
3 to keep the astronauts alive on their journey  
4 home. The scientists had to see all possible ways  
5 these materials could fit together to work for a  
6 new purpose. This kind of creative thinking  
7 happens in an art class. These skills are the  
8 kind of skills our children need to participate in  
9 the world. We need to give them a place to  
10 explore how ideas are found and developed. These  
11 skills are as important as reading and math. They  
12 need to be nurtured in equal proportion.

13 Arts education is also an important  
14 pathway to reach underperforming students. It is  
15 a way to expose students to the excitement of  
16 learning and discovery, especially if they are  
17 struggling in reading and math. New York City is  
18 filled with intellectually--and this actually  
19 speaks to you because I do think it's very  
20 important to have partnerships with teaching  
21 artists.

22 It's very enriching for everybody  
23 involved. Not only it gives children a way to see  
24 the world outside their small boundaries and to  
25 see there is a world outside their neighborhood

1  
2 that they might be able to participate in. It  
3 just opens up possibilities. And also that they  
4 can see there are jobs in art related fields, that  
5 there's a whole other place where perhaps they can  
6 spend the rest of their lives.

7 But we're also talking about job  
8 creation. Middle schools and high schools are not  
9 meeting their arts education requirements. They  
10 need certified arts specialists. These teachers  
11 exist and the need jobs. They do exist; I go to  
12 school with them, graduating them. And they're  
13 fabulous, fabulous, fabulous teachers.

14 So restore Project ARTS, get the  
15 line item back, get people to work filling our  
16 educational gaps. With the line item we can hold  
17 principals accountable to provide mandated arts  
18 education. Please pass Resolution 837 so we can  
19 we reach the school. I'm asking for myself and a  
20 thousand other New York City parents.

21 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: For us or are  
22 you holding on to that? Say that again. Okay,  
23 thank you.

24 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: I just want to  
25 thank you all for coming and before I say some

1  
2 closing remarks, we have two parents here, right,  
3 three parents. Three different school, correct?  
4 Okay, we have Queens, Manhattan. Do any of you  
5 know who your art liaison is?

6 ALL: No. Oh my god, and that's so  
7 irritating.

8 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay. Listen,  
9 listen. I have another question. Do you know who  
10 your network leaders are?

11 ALL: No.

12 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: All right.  
13 That's another problem. I know because the  
14 network leaders is supposed to deal with the  
15 education of our children, not superintendents.  
16 We don't know who the network leaders are and we  
17 don't know who the liaison is. But we're going to  
18 tell everybody because we're going to work on  
19 that.

20 ALL: Thank you. Although, I do  
21 know who Karen Abramowitz is and I wish she had a  
22 job.

23 CHAIRMAN RECCHIA: Okay, I just  
24 want to thank everyone who came here to testify  
25 today. It means a great deal to me and my

1  
2 colleagues here at the City Council, Speaker  
3 Christine Quinn. We will take all your comments,  
4 bring them together and move forward on this.  
5 We're going to hopefully pass the resolution soon  
6 but I really just want to thank everyone who took  
7 the time out, especially those who stayed this  
8 late hour.

9 We're going to work on moving  
10 forward. My door is always open if you ever need  
11 any help. I'm the Chairman of the Cultural  
12 Affairs Committee. I have Rachel here and Don  
13 here. They're my policy person from the committee  
14 and other staff, Bob and Felicia, all here to help  
15 you.

16 I also want to thank the entire  
17 staff of the Education Committee for doing an  
18 outstanding job. I thank everyone for help  
19 putting this together and we look forward to  
20 moving this and maybe someday we'll get a set  
21 amount of money for every child. And we're going  
22 to find out the \$316 per student.

23 [Applause]

24 CHAIRMAN JACKSON: Thank you  
25 Chairman Recchia. Let me say to you and to

1  
2 everyone that I appreciate your co-chairmanship on  
3 this extremely important matter. I need to  
4 testify that someone had said in given their  
5 testimony that science and arts go together. In  
6 fact, let me testify that my daughter, Sadia  
7 Jackson who is 34 was involved in TADA, the  
8 Theatre and Dance Alliance, every since she was 10  
9 until she graduated from high school. She is now  
10 an MD and that experience of eight years at TADA  
11 will be with her for the rest of her life, not  
12 only with her but my entire family.

13 Samia Jackson who is 23, she grew  
14 up in the Alvin Ailey School, got accepted to  
15 Julliard and her parents, which is myself and my  
16 wife, didn't want to send her there so she went to  
17 the Dwight School for academics. Upon graduation  
18 she received, I guess the baccalaureate diploma, a  
19 worldwide diploma where she focused in on art. So  
20 I have her artwork, both ceramic art and painting  
21 art, what have you in my office. But she applied  
22 to every major dance school in the country and  
23 several academic schools, including Barnard, Duke  
24 University and some other schools. She got  
25 accepted into all of them but obviously her love



1  
2 was dance. She got accepted into Julliard so she  
3 has a BFA in dance from Julliard in May of 2008.

4 And As Mahan, who is 29 is an  
5 educator in Virginia and some of her art work, her  
6 painting is in my office right now. So I say to  
7 all of you that art and music and dancing are my  
8 life and my kids life, their entire history.  
9 Obviously it has had a very, very positive effect  
10 on them and us.

11 Especially, as you know, if your  
12 family can afford to travel to various places, you  
13 go and you visit. My wife is from Tanzania so  
14 we've been to Tanzania with the music and dance  
15 and the drums and all kind of instruments. We've  
16 been to Paris and museums and so forth and so on.  
17 Let me just say that has such a positive impact.  
18 Obviously New York City is the cultural center of  
19 the world so you have museums and theatre and  
20 dance and everything else that you want here in  
21 New York City that we can take advantage of.

22 So Domenic, I say that 837 will be  
23 passed. But the question is on whether or not the  
24 Department of Education and Mayor Bloomberg is  
25 going to take our lead or partnership with us to

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7

set a minimum standard for arts education funding  
the New York City public schools. I hope so.  
Time will tell. Thank you all for coming.

[Applause]

CHAIRMAN JACKSON: This meeting is  
closed, adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Amber Gibson, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature Amber Gibson

Date December 3, 2009