

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

1

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

----- X

Thursday, June 8, 2023

Start: 11:23 A. M.

Recess: 11:37 A. M.

HELD AT: Committee Room - City Hall

B E F O R E: Hon. Justin L. Brannan, Chair

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Diana Ayala
Charles Barron
Gale A. Brewer,
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
David M. Carr
Amanda Farias,
Kamillah Hanks
Crystal Hudson
Farah N. Louis
Francisco P. Moya,
Chi A. Ossé
Keith Powers
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Althea V. Stevens,
Marjorie Velázquez
Nantasha M. Williams
Julie Won

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

A P P E A R A N C E S

Emily Edwards
Executive Director at New York City Department
of Small Business Services

Leslie Velazquez
Director of Bid Development and Legislation at
New York City Department of Small Business
Services

1
2 SERGEANT WONG: This is a sound check for The
3 Committee on Finance. Today's date is June 8, 2023,
4 this recording is being made by Danny Wong in the
5 Committee Room.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning, welcome to the
7 New York City Council vote for The Committee on
8 Finance.

9 At this time, please place all electronic devices
10 to vibrate or silent mode. Thank you for your
11 cooperation. Chair, we are ready to begin.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Sergeant.

13 [GAVELING IN] [GAVEL SOUND]

14 Okay, good morning, and welcome to today's
15 Finance Committee Meeting. I am Council Member
16 Justin Brannan; I have the privilege of chairing The
17 Committee on Finance.

18 We have been joined this morning by Council
19 Member Louis, Council Member Powers, Council Member
20 Carr, Council Member Hanks, Council Member Brewer,
21 Council Member Williams, Council Member Althea
22 Stevens, Council Member Crystal Hudson, Council
23 Amanda Member Fariás, Council Member Diana Ayala,
24 Council Member Selvena Brooks-Powers. Do we have
25 people on Zoom? On Zoom we have been joined by

1
2 Council Member Sanchez, Council Member Velázquez, and
3 Council Member Ossé.

4 And today the Committee will be voting on the
5 following items:

6 A Property Tax Preconsidered Resolution, 18
7 Article XI Resolutions, and Introduction 958-A.

8 First, the Preconsidered Resolution would set a
9 discount percentage rate for early property tax
10 payment, pursuant to both The Charter and The
11 Administrative Code every year. The New York City
12 Banking Commission recommends to the City Council
13 interest rates for early payment and for nonpayment
14 of property taxes. For FY24, the Banking Commission
15 recommends for early payment of real estate taxes a
16 0.50% discount. This resolution would adopt the
17 Banking Commissions recommended rate.

18 Next, the first Article XI would amend a
19 previously approved exemption in Council Member
20 Nurse's district. The amendment would make a
21 technical correction in relation to the exemption
22 level to reflect rents as of April 1, 2023 and avoid
23 increases added to the Contract Rent Differential
24 Tax.

1
2 The next Article XI would amend a previously
3 approved exemption on Council Member Richardson
4 Jordan's district. The amendment would extend the
5 term of the approved exemption from 35 to 40 years.

6 The next Article XI is a package of exemptions
7 for 12 building clusters in Council Member Richardson
8 Jordan, Council Member Abreu, Council Member Feliz,
9 Council Member Stevens, Council Member Rafael
10 Salamanca, and Deputy Speaker Ayala's districts. For
11 each cluster, the packages would authorize a partial
12 40-year exemption and require new HPD regulatory
13 agreements, a 10 percent unit set-aside for people
14 experiencing homelessness, enrollment in HPD's Aging
15 in Place Initiative, work on identified critical and
16 short term needs with the buildings, and stabilize
17 rents ranging from 40 percent to 110 percent AMI
18 depending on the cluster.

19 The next Article XI would authorize a full 40-
20 year exemption for one new building in Council Member
21 Rafael Salamanca's district, creating a 163
22 affordable housing units, 48 of which will be marked
23 as affordable senior housing, and 25 for formally
24 homeless households.

1
2 The next Article XI would authorize a partial 40-
3 year exemption for one building in Council Member
4 Velázquez's district. The exemption would impose a
5 regulatory agreement regulating rents to 60 percent
6 and 70 percent AMI, along with a 10 percent
7 homelessness set-aside, as well as HPD's Aging in
8 Place Initiative.

9 The next Article XI would authorize a full 40-
10 year exemption for ten buildings in Council Member
11 Feliz's district. The exemption would regulate rents
12 at 55 percent and 65 percent AMI, with 70 units set
13 aside for homeless households and HPD's Aging in
14 Place Initiative.

15 The final Article XI would authorize and full 40-
16 year exemption for six buildings in Council Member
17 Abreu's district. And the exemption would impose a
18 regulatory agreement and a 20 percent homelessness
19 set-aside, along with project based vouchers to
20 assist with rent burdens and low income households.

21 Finally, Intro 958-A, would merge the Church
22 Avenue and Flatbush Avenue bids. It would dissolve
23 the Church Avenue bid, expand the borders of the
24 Flatbush Avenue bid to incorporate the service area
25 presently covered by the Church Avenue bid, and

1
2 rename the Flatbush Avenue bid to the Church Avenue/
3 Flatbush Avenue Business Improvement District. The
4 bill would set the authorized annual expenditure
5 amount of the combined bid at \$589,000, which is the
6 total amount the current annual expenditures of the
7 two separate bids, and would amend the assessment
8 method accordingly. This bill was first heard back
9 on April 27th, after which we laid it aside for the
10 required 30-day period to allow for any property
11 owner in the proposed extended areas to object to the
12 bill with the City Clerk. We have been joined by
13 Representatives from The Department of Small Business
14 Services who will testify on the objection period.

15 And I will now turn it to my committee counsel to
16 swear them in for testimony.

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Good morning, SBS, are you
18 ready?

19 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR EDWARDS: Yes, ready.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, Do you affirm your
21 testimony will be truthful to the best of your
22 knowledge, information, and belief, and to respond
23 honestly to council member questions?

24 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR EDWARDS: I do

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Emily Edwards?

1
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: SBS, are you ready?

3 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR EDWARDS: Thank you. Good
4 morning, Chair Brannan, and members of the Finance
5 Committee. I am Emily Edwards, Executive Director of
6 the BID Program, and [BACKGROUND NOISE]
7 Organizational Development at the New York City
8 Department of Small Business Services (SBS).

9 I am joined by our Director of Bid Development
10 and Legislation, Leslie Velazquez. And today I would
11 like to report on the result of any objections filed
12 with the City Clerk against the extension of the
13 Flatbush Avenue Business Improvement District or BID
14 to form a consolidated Church Avenue/Flatbush Avenue
15 BID. As required by law, a [BACKGROUND
16 NOISE][INAUDIBLE] of the City Council Resolution was
17 mailed to the following parties:

18 To each owner of real property within the
19 proposed district at the address shown on the latest
20 bidding assessment [BACKGROUND NOISE] [INAUDIBLE] to
21 such other persons as are registered with the City to
22 receive tax bills concerning real property within the
23 district (BACKGROUND NOISE)...

24 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Emily hang... Emily, hang on
25 a second, we are getting some weird feedback.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

9

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR EDWARDS: [BACKGROUND NOISE]

[INAUDIBLE]

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Are you listening... (CROSS-TALK)

UNKNOWN: Can you... Can you mute your livestream that you have on your side of your computer?

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I think she...

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR EDWARDS: [BACKGROUND NOISE]

[INAUDIBLE] Okay, sorry about that.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Okay, go ahead?

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR EDWARDS: All right, uhm... (CROSS-TALK)

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: [BACKGROUND NOISE] Thank you to the various tech support... (CROSS-TALK)

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR EDWARDS: All right, as required by law, a summary of The City Council Resolution was mailed to the following parties: To each owner of real property within the proposed district at the address shown on the latest City Assessment roll; to such other persons as are registered with the City to receive tax bills concerning real property within the district; and to tenants of each building within the proposed district.

1
2 Furthermore, SBS arranged for the publication of
3 a copy of the summary of the resolution at least once
4 in the City record.

5 At the conclusion of the objection period at 5:00
6 p.m. on May 27, 2023, and taking into consideration
7 any objections postmarked by that date, no objections
8 were filed with the City Clerk for properties within
9 the district.

10 This level of objection is within our acceptable
11 threshold needed to advance the bill for a favorable
12 consideration by the full City Council. The New York
13 City Department of Small Business Services supports
14 the extension of the Flatbush Avenue Bid to create a
15 single, unified district that will service the
16 community. In our judgment, the proposed merger of
17 two separate, but adjacent bids, into a singular
18 unified bid will improve the quality and efficiency
19 of business and public [INAUDIBLE] services in the
20 Flatbush district, and represents the conclusion of
21 years of dedicated work by numerous stakeholders in
22 service to this vibrant community.

23 At this time, we are happy to take any questions,
24 thank you. And let me know if I need to repeat any
25 of the beginning of the testimony.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

11

1
2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Emily. Does
3 anyone have any questions for Emily?

4 Okay, any other comments or questions from my
5 colleagues on any of these items today?

6 Okay, seeing none, I will now ask Billy Martin,
7 the Committee Clerk, to call a roll.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Good morning, William Martin,
9 Committee Clerk; roll call vote Committee on Finance,
10 all items are coupled.

11 Chair Brannan?

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I vote aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Moya?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: (NO RESPONSE)

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Barron?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: (NO RESPONSE)

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Ossé?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: I vote aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you

20 Council Member Sanchez?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: (NO RESPONSE)

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Velázquez?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: Aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

25 Council Member Ayala?

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

12

1

COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: I vote aye.

2

3

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Powers?

4

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [BACKGROUND NOISE]

5

[INAUDIBLE] call it again.

6

COMMITTEE CLERK: I'm sorry?

7

Oh, Council Member Barron?

8

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: [INAUDIBLE]

9

COMMITTEE CLERK: Yes, sir?

10

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: You got it?

11

COMMITTEE CLERK: Uh, no, I didn't hear your vote,

12

sir.

13

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Okay, hold on, let me...

14

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Barron, are you
aye or nay?

15

16

UNKNOWN: Can you hear him now?

17

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Did you hear me?

18

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yes, go ahead, how do you
vote?

19

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Aye on all.

20

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, Council Member.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: All right.

22

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Powers?

23

COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye on all.

24

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Louis?

25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

13

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Farías?

COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: I vote... I vote aye on
all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Council Member Carr?

COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Moya?

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, sir.

COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Thank you.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Sanchez?

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: (NO RESPONSE)

1 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Won?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: (NO RESPONSE)

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of 16 in the
4 affirmative, zero in the negative, and no
5 abstentions, all items have been adopted by the
6 Committee.
7

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Pierina are you there?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: (NO RESPONSE)

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Is she on?

11 Council Member Won, are you on Zoom? Amanda
12 Farías is looking for you.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: (NO RESPONSE)

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: All right, Billy, we are
15 just going to close it. We are going to close it
16 out.

17 Okay, this meeting is adjourned, thank you.

18 [GAVELING OUT] [GAVEL SOUND]

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Hey, sorry! I have my
20 hands full with the baby. Aye, I vote aye! I'm so
21 sorry!

22 [LAUGHTER IN CHAMBERS]

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: We're still good...

24 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: All Right, okay, Council
25 Member Sanchez, how do vote?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: I vote aye, sorry.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

Final vote is now 17 in the affirmative, zero in the negative, and no abstentions.

CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, that's it.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, Council Member Sanchez, we got you.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 13, 2023