

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

October 30, 2013  
Start: 2:02 p.m.  
Recess: 6:11 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:

\_\_\_\_\_  
SPEAKER

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

MARIA DEL CARMEN ARROYO  
CHARLES BARRON  
GALE A. BREWER  
FERNANDO CABRERA  
MARGARET S. CHIN  
LEROY G. COMRIE, JR.  
ELIZABETH S. CROWLEY  
INEZ E. DICKENS  
ERIK MARTIN DILAN  
DANIEL DROMM  
MATHIEU EUGENE  
JULISSA FERRERAS  
LEWIS A. FIDLER  
DANIEL R. GARODNICK  
JAMES F. GENNARO  
VINCENT J. GENTILE

COUNCIL MEMBERS CONTINUED:

SARA M. GONZALEZ  
DAVID G. GREENFIELD  
DANIEL J. HALLORAN III  
VINCENT M. IGNIZIO  
ROBERT JACKSON  
LETITIA JAMES  
ANDY KING  
PETER A. KOO  
G. OLIVER KOPPELL  
KAREN KOSLOWITZ  
BRAD S. LANDER  
JESSICA S. LAPPIN  
STEPHEN T. LEVIN  
MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO  
DARLENE MEALY  
ROSIE MENDEZ  
MICHAEL C. NELSON  
JAMES S. ODDO  
ANNABEL PALMA  
CHRISTINE C. QUINN  
DOMENIC M. RECCHIA, JR.  
DIANA REYNA  
DONOVAN RICHARDS  
JOEL RIVERA  
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ  
DEBORAH L. ROSE  
ERIC A. ULRICH  
JAMES VACCA  
PETER F. VALLONE, JR.  
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER  
ALBERT VANN  
MARK S. WEPRIN  
JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS  
RUBEN WILLS



[gavel]

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: ...the meeting today if we can bring the chambers to order. I want to first introduce my colleague in the city council Danny John who is honoring someone who is a legend within the community, someone who is civil rights activist that has contributed so much to our society and I wanted to give Danny John my opportunity to introduce and to say a few words on the matter.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHN: Well thank you Mr. Majority Leader it's with deep pleasure and gratitude that I'm able to present this proclamation today to Bennett Singer who is here. We had originally expected and some people came today thing that Walter Naegel, Bayard Rustin's partner, life partner would be here with us. Unfortunately he was called to jury duty so civic duty always comes first but we're very proud to have Bennett Singer with us. So Bennett why don't you come up? You know I was a New York City public school teacher for 25 years before being elected to the city council. And we often taught black history, African American history in our schools,

1 but often times many people didn't know who was  
2 behind the march on Washington in 1963. And in  
3 fact, this year, marks the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of that  
4 march on Washington. And that was a changing point.  
5 That was a pivotal point in the struggle for  
6 African American civil rights. And the man behind  
7 that march, the man behind that march, the man  
8 whose idea that march was, and who was the co-  
9 organizer was Bayard Rustin. But what a lot of  
10 people also don't know is that Bayard Rustin was a  
11 gay man and he was proud of that and he never  
12 veered from that. And it was part of his history  
13 and it was part of who he was as a human being. And  
14 Bayard believed in the gay civil rights movement  
15 just as much as he did in the black civil rights  
16 movement. And Bayard was a believer in many other  
17 things that were important to both of those  
18 movements. Non-violent confrontation was his  
19 biggest contribution and he was a deep believer in  
20 non-violence. When other African American leaders  
21 were talking about having separate nations for  
22 example Bayard rejected that type of talk and said  
23 no, we need to work with everybody. So today we are  
24 very proud to be able to present this proclamation  
25

1  
2 and in recognition also of the fact that President  
3 Obama awarded Bayard a Presidential Medal of  
4 Freedom last August I believe it was in recognition  
5 of his contributions to the African American civil  
6 rights movement. And so I would like to present  
7 this now to Bennett Singer. And Bennett is the  
8 producer of the film which is called  
9 "Brother Outsider" which we showed downstairs  
10 yesterday in the members lounge. And he's a New  
11 York based filmmaker who directed "Brother  
12 Outsider" described as 'Brilliant.' by the Wall  
13 Street Journal and as 'A mesmerizing eye opener.'  
14 by the San Francisco Film Society. "Brother  
15 Outsider" premiered at the Sundance Film Festival,  
16 was broadcast nationally on PBS and Logo, and has  
17 been shown at the United Nations, the Library of  
18 Congress, and the Kennedy Center, as well as the  
19 New York City Council, and in hundreds of schools,  
20 and in dozens of countries across the globe.

21 The film has won more than 25 awards  
22 including the Glad Award for 'Outstanding  
23 Documentary'. Bennett recently completed work on  
24 electoral dysfunction; a feature length documentary  
25 about voting rights which maybe we could use here

1  
2 or maybe not use here in this council. And hosted  
3 by political humorist Mo Rocca, the film had a dual  
4 premier at the 2012 Democratic and Republican  
5 conventions, aired nationally on PBS, and won the  
6 American Bar Associations 2013 Silver Gavel Award.  
7 Bennett Singer. Congratulations.

8 [Applause]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHN: I'm going to ask  
10 the city clerk to read the proclamation first.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council City of New  
12 York Proclamation. Whereas in celebration of LGBT  
13 history month and the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the 1963  
14 march of Washington the council of the City of New  
15 York is proud to honor the late Bayard Rustin. And  
16 Whereas on August 28<sup>th</sup>, 1963, hundreds of thousands  
17 of people converged on the National Mall to join in  
18 what the Reverent Doctor Martin Luther King Junior  
19 called "The greatest demonstration for freedom in  
20 the history of our nation.". The 1963 march on  
21 Washington for freedom and jobs galvanized people  
22 of all ages and backgrounds who shared in the dream  
23 that our nation would one day make real the promise  
24 of liberty, equality, and justice for all making it  
25 a transformative even for the civil rights

1 movement. Bayard Rustin was the strategic  
2 organizing genius behind the entire event as well  
3 as many other groundbreaking protests, yet because  
4 he was openly gay decades before the stonewall  
5 rebellion only recently has he begun to receive the  
6 attention and credit he is due. And whereas  
7 standing before the Lincoln Memorial in 1963 Bayard  
8 Rustin was the first to sight the demands of the  
9 day including; effective civil rights legislation  
10 from public accommodations, to the right to vote,  
11 to an immediate end to school segregation, the  
12 enforcement of the 14<sup>th</sup> amendment, and more. And  
13 whereas born in 1912 in Westchester, Pennsylvania  
14 he grew up in a town without a restaurant or  
15 theater that would allow him to enter. Raised as a  
16 Quaker he was an unyielding activist for civil  
17 rights, dignity, and equality from the start. In  
18 1937 he moved to New York City and ten years later  
19 helped to plan the journey of reconciliation in  
20 which long before Rosa Parks, he and others  
21 intentionally violated segregated seating on busses  
22 and trains, faced terrible violence, and even time  
23 on chain gangs. None the less the journey's success  
24 became a prototype for the freedom rides of the  
25



1  
2 early 1960s. Long before the 1963 march on  
3 Washington Mr. Rustin guided a young Dr. King to  
4 adopt Mahatma Gandhi's revolutionary ideals of non-  
5 violent protest and civil disobedience. And whereas  
6 this year President Obama posthumously bestowed the  
7 Presidential Medal for Freedom; the highest  
8 civilian honor, upon him noting that "As an openly  
9 gay African American Mr. Rustin stood at the  
10 intersection of several of the fights for equal  
11 rights.". In fact, Mr. Rustin fought tirelessly for  
12 marginalized communities at home and abroad until  
13 the end of his life. In addition to the United  
14 States he had a profound impact in Israel, Haiti,  
15 Zimbabwe, El Salvador, Grenada, South Africa,  
16 Southeast Asia, and beyond. At his core he believed  
17 that we are all part of a global human family. "We  
18 are all one." He said. "And if we don't know it, we  
19 will learn it the hard way." Now therefore be it  
20 known that the council of the City of New York  
21 proudly celebrates the life and memory of Bayard  
22 Rustin for his truly extraordinary and enduring  
23 contributions for civil and human rights in the  
24 United States and around the world. Christine C.  
25 Quinn, Speaker for the entire council, Daniel

1  
2 Dromm, Councilmember 25<sup>th</sup> district Queens, and many  
3 other Councilmembers.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHN: Thank you very  
5 much. Thank you very much Mr. City Clerk and now,  
6 Bennett Singer.

7 BENNETT SINGER: Well thank you so much  
8 and this is an incredible honor and as you heard  
9 Walter Naegal, Bayard's life partner had hoped to  
10 be here but wasn't, though I think that he and  
11 Bayard Rustin are here in spirit. It's such a  
12 momentous honor and I think on November 20<sup>th</sup> when  
13 President Obama actually bestows the Medal of  
14 Freedom to Walter on behalf of Bayard Rustin. That  
15 will be an incredible turning point; not only in  
16 bringing Rustin from invisibility to visibility,  
17 but really more generally for the cause of social  
18 justice that Rustin worked tirelessly for decade  
19 after decade. And so thank you on behalf of the  
20 film team, on behalf of Walter and the Rustin  
21 family, and really for all of us who are continuing  
22 Rustin's work to make this a more equal and just  
23 and democratic country so thanks so much.

24 [Applause]

25 [Background comments]

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHN: Thank you. Thank  
3 you very much. Councilmember Cabrera you're on  
4 deck.

5 [pause]

6 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Ladies and  
7 gentlemen the next proclamation is going to be  
8 given out by Councilmember Fernando Cabrera  
9 recognizing the fine work and dedication from the  
10 City of New York from one of our finest and bravest  
11 in the NYPD. And at this point in time I want to  
12 turn the mic over to my colleague Fernando Cabrera.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so  
14 much Majority Leader and for your leadership and  
15 for this special moment. About a year ago, if I  
16 recall, it was about a year ago I was standing here  
17 with police officer Ivan Marcano who bravely took  
18 on three individuals right there in Burnside  
19 Avenue. Today I stand again with one of our heroes.  
20 I'm talking about police officer Henry Huot who  
21 after the perpetrator had gone... Listen to this.  
22 This is amazing. After perpetrator had shot dead a  
23 member of the LGBT community the man escaped still  
24 with his gun. Officer Huot noticed something that  
25 was wrong and called upon his attention that, that

1  
2 person took out a gun and pointed it towards him to  
3 shoot and the gun malfunctioned. He had a clear  
4 shot to shoot him, what a composure. I wonder what  
5 I would have done but he took control of the  
6 situation, the man eventually gave up, and he's was  
7 arrested and today our city is a safer city because  
8 of the unselfish work of a great police officer  
9 Henry Huot. And so I'm going to turn it over to a  
10 great clerk, city clerk for the reading of the  
11 proclamation.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council of City of New  
13 York Proclamation. Whereas the council of the City  
14 of New York is proud to publicly honor NYPD officer  
15 Henry Huot for making the key arrest following the  
16 most shocking hate crimes of the year; the murder  
17 of Mark Carson. And Whereas Mark Carson was a 32  
18 year old man beloved by his family and many  
19 friends. He had been open about his sexual  
20 orientation from an early age and when he was still  
21 a student at Legacy High School in Harlem, he  
22 discovered Greenwich Village. Sometimes he would go  
23 to Christopher Street or the after school program  
24 at the Harvey Milk High School on Astor Place, an  
25 inclusive public school which welcomes LGBT

1 students. Later, he attended Borough of Manhattan  
2 Community College, and earlier this year Mark  
3 Carson worked at a kiosk in Grand Central Terminal,  
4 had saved enough money to move to Brooklyn, and  
5 continued dreaming of a better life in the years  
6 ahead. And whereas in the early morning hours of  
7 May 18<sup>th</sup>, 2013 Mark Carson and a friend were walking  
8 in Greenwich village near West 8<sup>th</sup> Street and 6<sup>th</sup>  
9 Avenue only a short distance from the Stonewall  
10 Inn, the birthplace of the Contemporary Gay Rights  
11 Movement when they were allegedly trailed and  
12 taunted by a complete stranger. They had done  
13 nothing to provoke him and tried to ignore him, but  
14 the assailant suddenly released a barrage of anti-  
15 gay slurs then shot and killed Mark Carson at point  
16 blank, point blank range before fleeing the scene  
17 on foot.

18  
19 And whereas NYPD officer Henry Huot had  
20 heard the suspect's description on his police radio  
21 and spotted him on the edge of the NYU campus and  
22 ordered him to stop. Fortunately the homophobic  
23 gunman crouched down, threw his revolver to the  
24 ground, and officer Huot arrested him. The suspect  
25 even laughed and boasted about his actions but

1  
2 thanks to officer Huot's quick and courageous work  
3 he was soon arraigned on second degree murder as a  
4 hate crime, menacing, and criminal possession. And  
5 whereas officer Huot has earned the gratitude of  
6 all New Yorkers and he is truly one of New York  
7 City's finest. Now therefore be it known that the  
8 council of the City of New York gratefully honors  
9 NYPD officer Henry Huot for his outstanding work  
10 following the brutal murder of Mark Carson.

11 Christine C. Quinn, speaker for the entire council,  
12 Fernando Cabrera, Councilmember 14<sup>th</sup> district, the  
13 Bronx, Jimmy Van Bramer, Councilmember 26<sup>th</sup>  
14 district, Queens.

15 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you so  
16 much and now we're going to be hearing from a great  
17 police officer, Henry Huot.

18 HENRY HUOT: Thank you, thank you  
19 Councilmembers. I was just doing my duty as a  
20 police officer. Thank you Councilmember Fernando  
21 Cabrera and everyone else involved. Thank you.

22 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you so  
23 much.

24 [Applause]  
25

1  
2 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you very  
3 much. We have one more ceremonial. We're going to  
4 hold on 'till one of the Councilmembers can join us  
5 momentarily. So we're in a five minute recess.

6 [pause]

7 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: For today we  
8 have two schools who are here with us today; The  
9 Gateway School's Center for Educational Enrichment  
10 and Ps 39 Francis J. Murphy Jr. School who both  
11 contributed after hurricane Sandy and were part of  
12 the effort. And I'm wanting to hand the mic over to  
13 two of my colleagues; Council member Gale Brewer  
14 and Councilmember Jimmy Oddo, who both happen to be  
15 upcoming Borough Presidents. So at this point in  
16 time I want to hand the mic over to Gale Brewer.

17 GALE BREWER: Hi, I'm Gale Brewer and I  
18 represent the west side of Manhattan and I am  
19 honored to be here with my very favorite Colleague  
20 Councilmember Jimmy Oddo. And I want the two  
21 schools to know, Gateway and 39, that you actually  
22 have picked, not only are you great schools but you  
23 also have picked two Councilmembers who have great  
24 admiration for each other and both of whom  
25 hopefully will be your Borough presidents

1 respectfully, respectively. And I'm here because in  
2 terms of Gateway. First of all Gateway is a very  
3 special school. Not only do you collaborate and  
4 reach out in terms of post Sandy but Gateway is on  
5 a street, West 61<sup>st</sup> Street that has other schools  
6 on it and they have participated with the other  
7 schools on what we call border crossing. And what  
8 that means is not only did they go across the water  
9 to Staten Island but they went across the street to  
10 Ps 191 and Heschel and Beacon. So on a almost  
11 yearly basis they have collaborated right there in  
12 the neighborhood. So this is a school, both schools  
13 can understand the word collaboration and  
14 understand the meaning and how important it is for  
15 the future. So I am really really honored to be  
16 here today to have this special reach-out post  
17 Sandy and I want the public to know that the two  
18 schools have been sitting together here in City  
19 Hall. And I think in many situations this is the  
20 first time the young people, and even the teachers,  
21 and maybe even the principles have been to City  
22 Hall. So welcome to City Hall and I would like to  
23 introduce a really special person. He is in charge  
24 of the Republican delegation in the city council.  
25



1  
2 He will be the Borough President of Staten Island,  
3 but more importantly he is a really special human  
4 being, Councilmember James Oddo.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: [off mic] Thank  
6 you Gale.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I'll just stand  
8 back here. This is so funny because everyone in,  
9 that works in this building, works in the City  
10 Council knows that Council Brewer, Councilmember  
11 Brewer and I are, are very good friends and  
12 hopefully as she said we are going to be partners  
13 in each of us being the Borough President of our  
14 respective boroughs. So to see the two schools come  
15 together like this is absolutely wonderful and  
16 maybe it's a precursor of good things to come in  
17 the future of the two boroughs. I will just say  
18 this that yesterday I went back and I looked back  
19 at my Facebook page and my Twitter page from when  
20 the storm hit. And there were a couple of tweets  
21 expressing my appreciation for how many of my  
22 colleagues reached out to Staten Island and  
23 personally reached out to me and expressed their  
24 support and offered various help. And so many of  
25 the Councilmembers from across the city actually

1  
2 helped Staten Island. They sent food, and they sent  
3 clothing, and they sent donations. It was really  
4 overwhelming. So to see the kids step up and do  
5 their part and reach out to their counterparts in  
6 our home borough is a, is really a wonderful thing.  
7 And it was a challenge for principles, for council  
8 people, for the people of our borough. It is an  
9 ongoing challenge and lots of people have showed  
10 great resilience and courage, but we are a long,  
11 long way away from being back or where we want to  
12 be. So for the ongoing support and the emotional  
13 lift that you all gave us it is so very very much  
14 appreciated. So thank you to the parents, the  
15 teachers for sort of setting the tone for the kids  
16 and Gale and I will try really hard to live up to  
17 your wonderful standard. So thank you.

18 [Applause]

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council City of New  
20 York Proclamation. In observance, whereas in  
21 observance of the first anniversary of hurricane  
22 Sandy the Council of the City of New York is proud  
23 to honor the students, faculty, and families of the  
24 Gateway School's Center for Educational Enrichment  
25 and those at Ps 39 the Francis J. Murphy Jr. School

1 for their great citizenship and excellent teamwork.

2 And whereas after hurricane Sandy struck New York

3 City on October 29<sup>th</sup>, 2012 the middle school

4 students from the Gateway School Center for

5 Educational Enrichment on Manhattan's upper west

6 side extended their friendship to support a school

7 community struggling to recover from this

8 unprecedented storm. Ps 39 on Staten Island near

9 the Verrazano Bridge whose community sustained real

10 and terrible hardships because of Sandy accepted

11 the Gateway students' offer with an open heart and

12 a resilient spirit. And whereas led by Gateway

13 Service Learning Program 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> grade students

14 at Gateway joined students, I'm sorry, joined 4<sup>th</sup>

15 grade students at Ps 39 to create a narrative work

16 of art facilitated by renowned sidewalk artist Hani

17 Shihada. Together students painted on 14 two foot

18 by four foot plywood panels each depicting a

19 component of the storm including residents and

20 first responders as well as the fierce

21 determination to rebuild. Gateway students also

22 captured their new friends' stories of the storm by

23 recording peer to peer podcast interviews to share

24 with others, how families bravely struggled to

1  
2 recover. And whereas undeterred by the tremendous  
3 destruction caused by that hurricane Sandy these  
4 two schools worked together as a creative team to  
5 form new connections, to develop collaborative  
6 skills, and to find the means to make since of how  
7 communities rise above difficult circumstances. At  
8 the same time the artists or the artwork created  
9 serves to educate and move viewers through the  
10 unmatched insights of children. And whereas today  
11 the students' completed artwork appears in  
12 exhibitions at the Children's Museum of Staten  
13 Island as well as the General Society Library of  
14 Mechanics and Tradesmen of the City of New York  
15 where it continues to touch the hearts and minds of  
16 everyone. Now therefore be it known that the New  
17 York City Council gratefully honors the Gateway  
18 School's Center for Educational Enrichment and Ps  
19 39 Francis J. Murphy Jr. School for their  
20 outstanding teamwork following the devastation of  
21 hurricane Sandy. Christine C. Quinn, Speaker for  
22 the entire Council, Gale A. Brewer, 6<sup>th</sup> district  
23 Manhattan, James S. Oddo Minority Leader, 50<sup>th</sup>  
24 district, Staten Island.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very  
3 much. That's wonderful. We'll hear from Jerry  
4 Pavlon-Blum who's a teacher at Gateway and who put  
5 all this together. Jerry?

6 JERRY PAVLON-BLUM: Thank you  
7 Councilmembers Brewer, Oddo, and Oddo, Speaker  
8 Quinn, Councilmember Rivera, and all  
9 Councilmembers. You do us a great honor today and  
10 special thanks goes to Deputy Director Brie Elise  
11 [phonetic] for her great amount of help to us. I  
12 speak on behalf of the community of Gateway School  
13 and that of Ps 39 when I see how good it feels to  
14 stand together, especially here in these historic  
15 chambers, to celebrate new work, new friendships,  
16 new opportunities that lie ahead of us that have  
17 all blossomed as a consequence of hurricane Sandy,  
18 particularly on this, it's one year anniversary.  
19 We're grateful to you for offering our schools this  
20 proclamation. We will hang it proudly and it will  
21 stand as a promise and as an invitation to continue  
22 to do more together, to reach out to each other in  
23 hard times, and certainly to celebrate, like today,  
24 the good times that we create. Thank you all.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you all.

JERRY PAVLON-BLUM: [off mic] Iggy?

Where's Iggy?

STUDENT IGGY: Hi. Hi, my name is Iggy and I'm in 6<sup>th</sup> grade at the Gateway Middle School. I want to thank Councilmembers Brewer and Oddo for sponsoring this proclamation and to all of you on the City Council for this recognizing our school partnership with Ps 39 and all we have achieved together. I will be talking to you about how much our school and Ps 39 met. So I'm pretty sure it was about the middle of November 2012 when we had Service Learning days. We heard stories from an engineer, Sissy Nikolaou a GeoSeismic Specialist who's in charge of keeping our bridges and tunnels safe after the hurricane. We also talked with the Executive Director of Change for Kids and a teacher from Staten Island who showed us the pictures of destruction and flooding. I think that's what got our school thinking about helping a school that was affected by Sandy and our top target to help make things better was Staten Island. In a few weeks our school found Ps 39, the Francis J. Murphy School and we were very happy about that. That is my opinion of how our beautiful friendship started.

1  
2 It's a beautiful friendship because we helped them  
3 by taking them under our wing and offered to  
4 comfort them and they gave us thanks by inviting  
5 last year's entire 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> grades plus the 7-8  
6 leaders to our school. You never know what  
7 circumstances will bring someone into your life. In  
8 this case a terrible storm that hurt those people  
9 emotionally and physically is what brought our  
10 friends from Ps 39 into our lives. And I have mixed  
11 feelings because you could cry that they got hit by  
12 the storm but you could shout for joy because we  
13 met these wonderful people. Thank you again for  
14 this wonderful offer, honor.

15 [Applause]

16 [Background comments]

17 FEMALE STUDENT 1: Hi my name is Cree  
18 Markesan [phonetic]. From the bottom of our heart  
19 we would like to thank you for giving us this  
20 opportunity. We would like to thank Councilor Oddo  
21 and Councilwoman Brewer and thank you for your  
22 cooperation.

23 [Applause]

24 UNKNOWN FEMALE 2: Hi I'm Jenna Baresh  
25 [phonetic]. After Sandy so much happened and lots

1  
2 of people took the proper action to help. Curtis  
3 Anderson came with the Y and donated backpacks full  
4 of supplies. To help our school he gave out free  
5 clothes, food, and items for the school. At Ps 39  
6 we always say you have to retreat like a leader and  
7 do the right thing. After Sandy everyone in the  
8 community came together to help like leaders. Now  
9 one year later we look around and the community is  
10 fixed and most of it looks better than ever. Two of  
11 the 4<sup>th</sup> grade classes along with the students from  
12 Gateway, from the Gateway School created panels  
13 about before and after hurricane Sandy happened. We  
14 talked about our dreams for making the community  
15 look better and now our dreams are becoming a  
16 reality. The friendship between our two schools is  
17 everlasting and special to all of us. We will never  
18 forget this moment. Thank you.

19 [Applause]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARROW: Thank you all so  
21 much this is a special moment.

22 [Off mic comments]

23 [Off mic laughter]

24 [pause]

25



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Okay my  
colleagues please rise for The Pledge of  
Allegiance.

[Pledge of Allegiance]

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Roll call.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo? Barron?

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Brewer

COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera

COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin? Comrie? Crowley?

COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens? Dilan?

COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm?

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras? Fidler?

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick?

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gennaro?

COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here.

1 CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING 26  
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile? Gonzalez?  
3 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Here.  
4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield?  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.  
6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Halloran? Ignizio?  
7 Jackson?  
8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Jackson?  
9 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Here.  
10 COMMITTEE CLERK: James? King?  
11 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.  
12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo?  
13 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.  
14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koppell?  
15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Here.  
16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz?  
17 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.  
18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander?  
19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.  
20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lappin?  
21 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: Here.  
22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin? Mark Viverito?  
23 COUNCIL MEMBER VIVERITO: Here.  
24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy? Mendez?  
25 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING

27

COMMITTEE CLERK: Nelson? Palma?  
Recchia? Reyna? Richards?

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez?

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose? Ulrich?

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca? Vallone?

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vann?

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin?

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile?

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Halloran?

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens?

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Here.

CITY CLER: Ignizio?

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Here.

[Background comments]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: WILLS?

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Present.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Oddo?

COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rivera?

COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Quinn.

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Alright a quorum

is present. We're also joined by some council members some council members elect, council members elect Menchaca, Espinal, Gibson, Barron, and Cohen who are here with us in the audience. So we have a Super Majority President today. My colleagues please rise for the Invocation being delivered today by Imam Ki Date.

IMAM KI DATE: [speaking foreign

language] In the name of Allah almighty the most gracious, the most merciful. By the time man is in loss verily man is in loss except to those who believe in almighty. Then they do righteous. They commend one another to the truths. They commend one another with patience. Oh Almighty bless you, your

1  
2 bounty, your blessing on us and accept our service  
3 amen.

4 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you very  
5 much. Council member Dickens.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Imam Konate  
7 heads the Al-Aqsa Mosque on Fredric Douglas  
8 Boulevard near 116<sup>th</sup> street; a neighborhood that is  
9 considered a hub for the West African community in  
10 Harlem. Imam Konate is one of the 13 founders of  
11 this mosque which was established to address the  
12 cultural and language needs of African needs of  
13 African immigrants in Harlem in addition to being a  
14 place of warship. Imam Konate is also a very  
15 passionate supporter of HIV aids testing and  
16 awareness and he is the Secretary General of the  
17 council of African Imams.

18 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.  
19 Adoption of the minutes. [interpose]

20 SPEAKER QUINN: If I could actually ask  
21 my colleagues to please stand and in addition to  
22 welcoming the democratic nominees, soon to be  
23 council members elect, no offense Jimmy. To the  
24 council I also want to note that we've been joined  
25 by Patricia Lewsley and her family. Lewsley,

1 Patricia Lewsley is the commissioner for children  
2 and young people and past Grand Marshall of the St.  
3 Patrick's for Oil Parade. I want to thank Mrs.  
4 Lewsley and her family for being with us today so  
5 thank you very much. And thank council member Dromm  
6 for being their host as well as Brandon Fey for  
7 being their host. Let me, sadly though note that on  
8 October 21<sup>st</sup>, 2013 of this year obviously former  
9 Brooklyn Congress Member Major Owens at 77 passed  
10 away due to complications renal and heart failure  
11 first elected to succeed retiring Congresswoman  
12 Shirley choosen in 1982. Congress Member Owens  
13 served 12 terms before retiring at the end of 2006.  
14 He was born in Tennessee and moved to New York  
15 after obtaining his Master's degree. Congress  
16 Member Major worked as a librarian for a number of  
17 years and then became the executive director of the  
18 Brownsville Community Council an important anti-  
19 poverty organization. In 1968 Mayor Lindsay  
20 appointed him the commissioner of the Community  
21 Development Agency. He served until 1973 and was  
22 elected to the state senate in 1975 where he served  
23 until his election to congress. Congressman Owens  
24 believed education was the "kingpin issue" and was  
25

1  
2 a house floor manager for the passage of the  
3 American with Disabilities Act of 1990 as well as a  
4 contributor and author of many other important  
5 pieces of legislation. He was a strong supporter of  
6 the labor movement and fought for fair rights of  
7 immigrants documented and undocumented. He is  
8 survived by his wife, three brothers and sister,  
9 his children and grandchildren and let me call on  
10 one of his close Colleagues, council member Al  
11 Vann, to say a few words.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Thank you Madam  
13 Speaker. I think you've covered his bio  
14 exceptionally well. He was a rather extraordinary  
15 man. He was very very high intellect. He maintained  
16 a very high moral and ethical character. He  
17 remained an activist and he identified with the  
18 masses. As you indicated he was born of humble  
19 beginning but that was not a disadvantage it was a  
20 challenge that he overcame. He was a librarian and  
21 I understand that he is the only librarian that has  
22 been elected to the halls of Congress, very very  
23 unusual. I also believe that second only to Adam  
24 Clayton Powell, Jr. in terms of the amount of  
25 legislation that he has was able to pass in the

1  
2 legislature and that is an extraordinary high  
3 standard. As indicated I think was '82 when the  
4 Congressman, Senator was elected to congress. Prior  
5 to that he was part of a small group of us that  
6 founded the Coalition for the Community Empowerment  
7 and it was dedicated to expanding black political  
8 power in King's county. And if you look from late  
9 70s till now I think we're about to say we  
10 accomplished our goal and it could not have been  
11 done without his participation and leadership. He's  
12 respected, well respected by all that knew him and  
13 all that knew of him because of again who he was  
14 extraordinary talents that he had. Major has done  
15 his work, he's finished a course, and he's gone  
16 home to rest and may peace be upon him. Thank you.

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you council member  
18 Vann.

19 [pause]

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you Mr. Majority  
21 Leader.

22 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you Madam  
23 Speaker. Adoption of the minutes. council member  
24 Robert Jackson.

25



1  
2 COUNCILMEMBER JACKSON: I move that we  
3 spread the minutes upon the record.

4 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you. So  
5 ordered. Messages and papers from the Mayor?

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

7 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Communication  
8 from City, County and Borough Offices?

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

10 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Petitions and  
11 Communications?

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

13 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Land Use Call-  
14 Ups?

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: M 1303 and M 1304.

16 SPEAKER QUINN: I'll ask for a roll call  
17 on a coupled vote on the land use Call-Ups. And in  
18 case anybody is leaving after Landers I just want  
19 to make note and make sure everybody goes out and  
20 gets their copy of this month's '*Oil & Energy*'  
21 Magazine because it is not common to have an  
22 environmental advocate the cover boy of Oil and  
23 Engineer. But our Jim Gennaro, the first national  
24 magazine he is on the cover of is ironically '*Oil &*  
25 '*Energy*', '*Oil & Energy*'. So please I know many of

1  
2 you have a subscription but if you don't go out and  
3 get '*Oil & Energy*' so...

4 [Background comments]

5 SPEAKER QUINN: That, I'm not discussing  
6 the centerfold of '*Oil & Energy*' and I assume you  
7 have to buy it to see it. But we will now have a  
8 coupled Land Use Call-Up vote please.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron? Brewer?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Aye.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I vote aye in  
13 all Land Use Call-Ups and with permission I'd like  
14 to vote aye on all items in the Coupled General  
15 Order Calendar and Resolutions.

16 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Comrie? Crowley?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye on  
21 all Land Use items and with permission I vote aye  
22 on all calendar items.

23 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Comrie?

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: I'd like to vote  
3 aye on the Land Use Calendar and permission to vote  
4 on everything on today's calendar?

5 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER COMRIE: Aye on all.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: I vote aye on  
9 all Land Use Call-Ups and with permission I would  
10 like to vote aye on all items on the Coupled  
11 General Order Calendar and Resolutions.

12 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dilan?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: I'm going to  
16 take... [pause] I vote aye on all Land Use Call-Ups  
17 and request unanimous consent to vote on all the  
18 items before today's General Order Calendar.

19 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DILAN: I vote aye on  
21 all.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye on all  
24 Land Use items and with permission I would like to  
25

1  
2 vote aye on all other items before us today as  
3 well.

4 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I want to vote  
7 aye on all Land Use Call-Up and would like to ask  
8 permission to vote, to vote on all the items in the  
9 agenda.

10 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: And I vote aye.

12 Thank you.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I vote aye on  
15 the Land Use Call-Ups and with permission would  
16 like to vote aye on the General Order Calendar as  
17 well.

18 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gennaro?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Yeah.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I vote aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gonzalez?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: I vote aye on  
3 all land use Call-Ups and permission to vote on  
4 General Order items. Aye on all. Thank you.

5 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield? Halloran?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ignizio? Jackson?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Aye on all.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: James? King?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye on all  
12 Land Use Call-Ups and with permission I would like  
13 to vote aye on all items coupled with General  
14 Orders Coupled and Resolutions.

15 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Aye.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote aye on all  
19 Land Use Call-Ups and I would like to have  
20 permission to vote aye on all items on today's  
21 General Orders.

22 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koppell?  
25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Aye on the Land  
3 Use Call-Ups.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lappin?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LAPPIN: I vote aye on  
10 the Land Use Call-Ups and I request unanimous  
11 consent to vote aye on the General Order Calendar  
12 as well.

13 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: I vote aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mark-Viverito?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote  
18 aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy?

20 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Council member  
21 Mealy? How do you vote?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye and  
23 with permission to vote on all Land Use and  
24 Calendar orders.

25 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you  
3 Majority Leader. I vote aye.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Nelson?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: I vote aye on  
8 all Land Use Call-Ups with permission I would like  
9 to accept. And I'm going to vote aye on all except  
10 for intro number 250 A.

11 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NELSON: Aye on all  
13 others. Thank you?

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Recchia?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Yes.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reyna? Richards?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I vote aye on  
18 all Land Use Call-Ups and with permission vote aye  
19 on all General Calendar Items.

20 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Where's the other one?  
22 Where's the other one, the other one? Rodriguez?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye. And I  
24 would like to vote aye on all General order.

25 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

1 CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING 40  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.  
3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose?  
4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye on all.  
5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich?  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.  
7 COMMITTEE CLERK: James?  
8 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: [off mic]  
9 ...General Orders and all Land Use items and all  
10 Resolutions..  
11 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes.  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER JAMES: I vote aye.  
13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca?  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all  
15 Land Use Call-Ups and I ask permission to vote yes  
16 on all General Coupled items and Resolutions.  
17 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.  
18 SPEAKER QUINN: Can we get a little  
19 quiet please? Thank you.  
20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone?  
21 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye and with  
22 permission I would like to vote on Coupled General  
23 Land Use items.  
24 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.  
25



1 CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING 41  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Vote aye.  
3 Thanks.  
4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer?  
5 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I vote aye  
6 on all Land Use Call-Ups and with permission I  
7 would like to vote aye on all items on the Coupled  
8 General Order Calendar and Resolutions.  
9 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.  
10 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I vote aye.  
11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vann?  
12 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye on all.  
13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin?  
14 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.  
15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams?  
16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.  
17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills?  
18 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Aye on all.  
19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Oddo?  
20 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: Yes.  
21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rivera?  
22 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Yes.  
23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Quinn?  
24 SPEAKER QUINN: Aye.  
25

1  
2 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Today's Land Use  
3 Call-Ups were adopted by a vote of 43 in the  
4 affirmative, zero in the negative. Communication  
5 from the Speaker?

6 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you we are voting  
7 on a piece of legislation today out of the Economic  
8 Development Committee 1166 A. I want to thank  
9 Thomas Donaldson and Barbara Holme [phonetic] for  
10 their work on this piece of legislation that was  
11 sponsored by council member Koslowitz. This piece  
12 of legislation that deals with reporting by certain  
13 industries, entities, excuse me under contracting  
14 with the Department of Small Business Services and  
15 its important transparency initiative. And let me  
16 call on the sponsor and the chair council member  
17 Koslowitz.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Thank you  
19 Madam Speaker. The primary issue addressed by intro  
20 1166 A is the disclosure of indirect lobbying  
21 activities conducted for the benefit of the New  
22 York City Economic Development Corporation. In June  
23 2012 the New York State Attorney General found that  
24 the EDC as a local development corporation violated  
25 the state's special not for profit law while trying

1  
2 to influence legislation by engaging in lobbying  
3 activities. Specifically the Attorney General found  
4 that EDC in connection with two other LDCs sought  
5 to influence city council legislation concerning  
6 city development projects in Willard's Point and  
7 Coney Island. These LDCs forces the appearance of  
8 grassroots support from community members, prepared  
9 the testimony for community members, supposedly in  
10 support of the projects, organized transportation  
11 to city council hearings, retained an outside  
12 government relations firm, were ghostwriting up  
13 adds and were drafting letters to city council  
14 members. These activities violated the law because  
15 as a local development company EDC was violated  
16 from lobbying. What is perhaps most troubling is  
17 the lobbying activities for these EDC projects were  
18 conducted by and with third parties and were  
19 designed to deceive both the council and the  
20 public. Following the Attorney General's  
21 investigation EDC restructured its cooperate status  
22 and now although still a not for profit corporation  
23 is no longer classified as a local development  
24 corporation. This means EDC is now legally free to  
25 lobby the New York City Council, the City Planning

1  
2 Commission, and other public bodies regarding EDC  
3 projects where city land and city tax benefits are  
4 conveyed to private parties. Intro 1166 directly  
5 addresses this circumstance by requiring that all  
6 lobbying and lobbying activities, expenditures and  
7 expenses directed at the city council and other  
8 public bodies be disclosed in quarterly reports to  
9 the council as well as published on the city's  
10 website. The lobbying activities of EDC activities  
11 and employees need not be reported. I'm almost  
12 done.

13 [laughter]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Intro 1166  
15 also addresses two housekeeping measures by  
16 amending the charter and administrative code to  
17 recognize and capture EDC's change corporate status  
18 as a result and also to ensure that EDC is still  
19 required to provide the council an annual report on  
20 jobs and economic development benefits and assist  
21 in evaluating the mythology for such reports and  
22 that the council maintains our right to know their  
23 support and trades related contrasts and its right  
24 to prohibit such contrasts by local law. It's a  
25 good bill...

[laughter]

SPEAKER QUINN: There you go. Karen I didn't think you had anybody 'till then, now I think it's going to be unanimous because 'It's a good bill.' and I think that says it all. Thank you Karen.

We are also voting on a piece of legislation out of Gov. Ops. I want to thank Alex Pustilnik[phonetic] and David Seitzer's[phonetic] 951 A which requires that boards and commissions be given rules and pilot programs at least three days in advance so they kind of know what they're voting on. It was introduced by council member Vacca and shepherded through the Government Operations Committee so let me call on council member Vacca and then Chair Brewer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Thank you Madam Speaker. Basically as you know when we in the city council want a bill passed we have to let the bill age for seven days. I learned that there was no such requirement when it comes to city boards and commissions. And in fact we've had city boards and commissions vote on items that were given to them the very same day often under the guise of pilot

1  
2 programs. Members of commissions walked into  
3 meetings no knowing what they were voting on until  
4 they sat in their chairs. The public was not  
5 notified either that these items were on an agenda  
6 of a board or commission of the City of New York.  
7 So I propose this very progressive legislation  
8 which seeks to reform that process. We have to  
9 reform the process about how people are kept in the  
10 dark especially those who are on boards and  
11 commissions that we count on to make serious  
12 judgments about how our city operates  
13 administratively every day. So I hope that the  
14 council will pass this legislation. It's only fair  
15 that there be sunlight shine, that sunlight shine  
16 on this process and my legislation does that, just  
17 that. Thank you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very  
19 much. As council member Vacca and Ms. Speaker  
20 indicated 951 A has a simple goal although it's not  
21 a simplistic piece of legislation. And what it does  
22 is overall sets a precedent for future  
23 administrations and New Yorkers to build upon for  
24 boards and commissions and that's not all the  
25 agencies. It's just those with boards and

1  
2 commissions because currently commissions,  
3 commissioners are more destined and must have a  
4 much longer time frame in which to provide details  
5 for. That has not been true of boards and  
6 commissions and that's why council member Vacca is  
7 so correct in introducing this legislation. Because  
8 now places like TLC, Taxi Limousine Commission,  
9 those commissioners must know the full details of  
10 proposed rules or pilot programs before these  
11 commissioners vote on them. So I want to thank  
12 council member Vacca for proposing this adequate  
13 advance notice and I also want to thank David  
14 Seitzer for whose great leadership is council to  
15 the committee. Thank you very much.

16 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. We are also  
17 voting on two important pieces of legislation that  
18 come out of The Health Committee. I want to thank  
19 Crystal Prawn [phonetic], Dan Heifetz, Molly  
20 Murphy, Ters Benazir [phonetic], Margaret Nelson  
21 [phonetic], and Rob Newman for their work on this  
22 piece of legislation. I want to thank the chair of  
23 the health committee council member, Chair Arroyo  
24 excuse me for her work on this. 1021 A is a piece  
25 of legislation that sets a price for cigarettes, a

1 floor, you cannot for cigarettes go below \$10.50 in  
2 New York after this piece of legislation gets  
3 passed and we'll also ban the use of coupons as it  
4 relates to cigarettes and some other tobacco  
5 products. We're doing this because we've seen  
6 clearly every time that we've raised prices or  
7 taxes on tobaccos it reduces young people from  
8 smoking. In New York City we haven't seen a  
9 reduction in the number of young people smoking  
10 since 2007. We've made great progress up to that  
11 and we plateaued. We need to do more to stop young  
12 people smoking. I know I thank Chair Arroyo for her  
13 sponsorship of 1021 A. Intro 250 A which was  
14 sponsored by council member Gennaro is a historic  
15 piece of legislation. When we pass this law raising  
16 the age to purchase cigarettes, tobacco products,  
17 and e-cigarettes to 21 we will be the first major  
18 city or state in the country to have done this. And  
19 we know that doing this is going to have a  
20 important effect reducing young people from  
21 starting to smoke and we know that when young  
22 people start smoking they are much more likely to  
23 become addicted to nicotine and tobacco for the  
24 rest of their lives. This is literally a piece of  
25



1  
2 legislation that will save lives. And I want to  
3 thank Jim Gennaro for championing it. I don't think  
4 I said that word right and let me call on Jim  
5 Gennaro.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you Madam  
7 Speaker and, and thank you for your leadership and  
8 this I think is the most significant bill that I  
9 think I've ever had a hand in. I'm, I'm very  
10 honored you know that that it's finally coming to  
11 pass and, and, and, and we're doing it and we're  
12 doing it right. This was first proposed by me back  
13 in, back in 2005 we didn't have all the science. We  
14 didn't have all the data. It sounded like a very  
15 good thing to do but whenever we move forward with  
16 something this broad and this comprehensive we have  
17 to make sure we have all the science and all the  
18 data on our side. We have that now and like the  
19 Speaker said we've plateaued for the last six years  
20 in terms of being able to reduce teen smoking and  
21 we need the next big thing and this is the next big  
22 thing. And when we announced that we were doing  
23 this and we got the mayor on board we had people  
24 come across the river from Jersey so there's  
25 already a bill in their upper house and their lower

1 house that's ready to go. They're kind of waiting  
2 for us. We had Diane said that you know join us. I  
3 believe she's partnering with Linda Rosenthal to do  
4 this on the state level. We've got the state of  
5 California watching us. And my understanding that  
6 the state of Hawaii is about to go forward with  
7 this. And this is in no small measure from what  
8 we've done here. This will literally save many many  
9 lives. We really done a lot of work to make air  
10 quality better. The mayor made the announcement not  
11 long ago, last month whatever it was. We had the  
12 cleanest air in over 50 years, since the last 50  
13 years since we've been measuring it. But for young  
14 people who smoke we can clean the air all we want  
15 it's not going to make a difference. They're going  
16 to be polluting their lungs with tobacco and we  
17 can't afford to lose these precious lives. And  
18 just, you know it's kind of not a lot of people in  
19 the chamber so I may about just get a little down  
20 home or something. But you know for the last I  
21 guess 11 years seeing it like a succession of  
22 people in my family you know who like died slow  
23 deaths you know. And, and, and, and, I've, I've,  
24 I've, I've lived with it. I've seen it. My mother,

1  
2 my father, my father-in-law, someone in my family  
3 as everyone know has like the health challenge of  
4 her life and you know it kind of breaks you in a  
5 way. I'm in a broken, I'm a broken man like in a  
6 lot of ways but I feel good today. I feel good that  
7 we're going to do something really good to prevent  
8 you know this kind of disease from taking people  
9 away. There's no one in this room who hasn't lost  
10 someone to tobacco or has been close to someone  
11 who's had that and so we're doing a really good  
12 thing today. And like I said I'm a broken man like  
13 in a lot of ways from all I've seen over the last  
14 10 years but I feel good and we are doing a great  
15 thing in voting for this bill. Thank you very much  
16 Madam Speaker.

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very much Jim.  
18 We're also voting today on 983 A out of Housing and  
19 Buildings. I want to thank Bob Ahamed, Ed Atkins,  
20 Colin Hackage [phonetic] of legislation. Also 990 A  
21 in relation to preventing wind damage to certain  
22 buildings. And all of these bills are a response to  
23 Sandy and now the day after the year anniversary of  
24 Sandy these are more pieces of legislation before  
25 today. We've passed 16 bills on resiliency and

1  
2 emergency preparedness. We will pass more before  
3 the end of this term and all of this is to learn  
4 from the real life tragedy so many New Yorkers went  
5 through and to make sure we are prepared moving  
6 forward. So I want to thank everyone who has worked  
7 on these pieces of legislation. Let me call on a  
8 couple of council members who were sponsors of the  
9 different bills. I want to thank council member  
10 Ulrich who sponsored 1090 A and council member  
11 Gonzalez who introduced 1089, council member Oddo  
12 who introduced 1096 A, and let me call on council  
13 member Chin the sponsor of 1085 A, and then council  
14 member Richards the sponsor of 1099 A. And by that  
15 I mean just council member Chin. Go ahead, council  
16 member Richards' not here.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Madam  
18 Speaker. Good afternoon. I'm proud to sponsor intro  
19 1085 on increasing the disaster preparedness of  
20 residential and commercial building. One year ago  
21 when super storm Sandy struck our city, my district  
22 was blanket in darkness. We went for a week without  
23 power or heat but many other buildings were out for  
24 even longer. Some were out for weeks and months.  
25 One of the main issue that we saw was the private

1 buildings were not prepare. There were no  
2 information posted about whether they were in  
3 evacuation zone or where tenants should evacuate  
4 to. They had no battery operated lights in their  
5 hallways. They did not have emergency generators  
6 for their elevators. They did not have a mechanism  
7 for informing the resident before enduring the  
8 outage regarding the status of the building. What  
9 happened is that many of our constituents ended up  
10 reaching out to our office asking what was the  
11 status of the building. They were asking us through  
12 Twitter and email about information their building  
13 should have been providing them. This bill is aimed  
14 at increasing the information tenants receive from  
15 their building and also how private building  
16 prepare in the future for these disasters. I would  
17 like to thank the staff who help work on this  
18 legislation; Bob Ahamed [phonetic], Ed Atkins, and  
19 Guillermo Portillo [phonetic], and I urge my  
20 colleague to vote in favor of this important  
21 legislation. Thank you.

22  
23 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you council member  
24 Chin. And last but certainly not least we are  
25 voting on an important land use item; an item that

1  
2 is very important to Staten Island, to the north  
3 shore of Staten Island but to the whole city. I  
4 want to thank Ramone Martinez, and Ann McConnaughy  
5 [phonetic], Amy Levin, and Gale Benjamin for all of  
6 their work on this. I want to congratulate council  
7 member Rose for her tremendous, I hope Debbie's  
8 still here, tremendous leadership on this issue and  
9 bringing this project over the goal line. I want to  
10 thank chair Comrie and chair Weprin for all of  
11 their work. Let me call on yeah the chair of the  
12 subcommittee council member Weprin and then council  
13 member Debbie Rose. And again I want to again, on  
14 behalf of everyone congratulate Debbie Rose for her  
15 tremendous accomplishments in this project.

16 [Applause]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you. Thank  
18 you Madam Speaker. Thank you for that applause  
19 colleagues. [interpose]

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Thank you very  
22 much. [interpose]

23 SPEAKER QUINN: Council member Weprin  
24 and then council member Rose.

25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: I won't spoil  
3 Debbie's thunder so I won't get into too much of  
4 the details. I will say this about this particular  
5 project. It is an example of smart development. A  
6 development that helps bring in jobs, pays good  
7 wages in those jobs, helps bring in tourists and  
8 attraction for Staten Island. The commons, the  
9 retail outlets are going to be a great attraction  
10 to bring people into New York City to do their  
11 shopping. And the wheel is going to be a great  
12 tourist destination as well as being used by many  
13 local residents thanks in part to the great work of  
14 Debbie Rose. She will describe many of the other  
15 aspects of this that help make it, not only good  
16 jobs, not only a money maker but environmentally  
17 friendly and great for a community. So it really  
18 was a great smart development and I got to  
19 compliment Debbie Rose and all the staff for all  
20 the hard work they put in here and I'll let her  
21 describe all the great wins that she had. Thank you  
22 very much Madam Speaker.

23 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you. Council  
24 member Rose.

25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. I want  
3 to thank so many people because this is truly a  
4 transformative project the likes of which Staten  
5 Island has never seen and especially since the  
6 building of the Verrazano Bridge. And I would just  
7 like to say that this project will also contribute  
8 to Staten Island not being considered the forgotten  
9 borough again. I want to thank Speaker Quinn for  
10 her leadership and for loaning me your more than  
11 able staff. I just want to thank Ramone Martinez  
12 who with his...

13 [Applause]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: ...quiet, demure  
15 ways of negotiating helped... [interpose]

16 MAJORITY LEADER: Come on out Ramone.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [crosstalk]...get us  
18 to this point. Ramone I really would like to thank  
19 you. He's been there through the thick and thin.  
20 I'd like to also thank Gale Benjamin, Ann  
21 McConnaughy [phonetic], and Amy Levin from our Land  
22 Use division. They are stellar and they had a keen  
23 eye for catching some things that might have gotten  
24 overlooked. I'd like to thank my delegation Jimmy  
25 Oddo and Vinny Ignizio when the press and local



1  
2 folks started putting a lot of pressure on me they  
3 had my back and gave me the support I needed. I'd  
4 like to thank Land Use chair Leroy Comrie and the  
5 Zoning and Franchise subcommittee chair for their  
6 sage advice and reminded me to breathe that it's a  
7 long process. And again I have to say I never  
8 thought I'd be saying thank you to EDC but thank  
9 you EDC and the mayor to Don Capoccia and Mr.  
10 Marin, building trades 32 VJS, hotel trades, all  
11 of, all of the unions that participated in these  
12 negotiations and my staff who put in countless  
13 hours without complaining. I really think they  
14 liked the sport of it all. And for everyone who,  
15 all of my colleagues who were so supportive and  
16 helpful for their support and assistance during  
17 this unique and exhausting experience. So you've  
18 heard a lot. This is the biggest thing that's ever  
19 happen to the north shore of Staten Island and in  
20 fact it is the biggest observation wheel in the  
21 world at 625 feet. Its presence will be forever  
22 felt. So we started this process, I started this  
23 process wanting to find the win win benefitting  
24 Staten Island and our residents and there was doubt  
25 expressed that these goals could be reached. I am

1  
2 happy to stand here today and say the elusive win  
3 win has been achieved. This vote is a tremendous  
4 victory for the residents of the north shore of  
5 Staten Island for New York City because this will  
6 be a transformative project and a boom to our  
7 economic development. It is worth over 580 million  
8 dollars in private investment with an additional 52  
9 million in commitments from New York City and the  
10 developers. With the approval of this project and I  
11 thank all my colleagues for voting affirmatively  
12 the north shore of Staten Island will have the  
13 world's tallest observation wheel on its  
14 waterfront. At 625 feet tall we'll also have a  
15 front, our first high end outlet mall which is  
16 located in New York City with over 125 retailers,  
17 eating and drinking establishments, and a 200 room  
18 hotel with catering facility. The project will  
19 generate over 1150 construction jobs and 1350  
20 permanent jobs. It will generate over 101 million  
21 dollars in return to New York City. And as promised  
22 these projects hold my concerns were first and  
23 foremost for my district and Staten Island. I have  
24 consistently said in the past year that Staten  
25 Islanders get the best deal possible with this

1 project and in order to ensure this I needed  
2 certain key areas to be addressed. Among them were  
3 traffic congestion and ferry commuter concerns,  
4 good jobs for Staten Islanders pre, during, and  
5 post construction and economic development  
6 provisions. And I'm proud to announce that we have  
7 indeed gotten many benefits for Staten Islanders  
8 included. They include; one million dollars for a  
9 traffic mitigation fund, 700 thousand for a  
10 planning study for the replacement of Cromwell  
11 Center which was destroyed during Irene and  
12 finished off during Sandy, commuter parking levels  
13 that will be maintained throughout the construction  
14 of the project, parking rates that will be capped  
15 at close to the current rate, 100 percent union  
16 hiring for both the wheel and the outlet projects,  
17 500 thousand dollars for capacity building for MWBE  
18 contractors, the activation of the north shore  
19 right away, support for the activation of the north  
20 shore right away, support to ensure public access  
21 to Bay Street Landing promenade which was destroyed  
22 during Sandy, two million for repair of the  
23 Richmond Terrace Esplanade and aesthetic upgrades,  
24 750 thousand for the development of a Staten Island  
25

1  
2 Greenway Trail which goes from the Verrazano Bridge  
3 to the Goethals Bridge, plans for a private ferry  
4 service adjacent to the development area, 35  
5 million in city capitol funds for new ferries,  
6 plans for a ferry service to Snug Harbor, a  
7 comprehensive signage program in the ferry and on  
8 the ferry, improve signage programs for the 'Kiss &  
9 Ride' which is not a place where people just hang  
10 out and neck, it's actually the pick-up and drop-  
11 off for the Staten Island ferry and a welcome  
12 center and kiosk in the ferry terminal, Wi-Fi  
13 service in the ferry terminal and on the ferries, a  
14 complementary ridership for Staten Island school  
15 children on the wheel and also every student in New  
16 York City will have the opportunity to ride the  
17 wheel at least once, formation of the community  
18 association advisory board, 75 thousand dollars for  
19 the creation of a Jersey Street local development  
20 corporation, rezoning of the new Brighton community  
21 from manufacturing to commercial and residential,  
22 new pedestrian crossings with countdown clocks in  
23 St. George, siding of an eco-dock near Homeport and  
24 aesthetic improvements for St. George and Jersey  
25

1  
2 street corners. And Jumaane's yawning so I'm just  
3 going... [interpose]

4 [laughing]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I am going to say...  
6 [interpose]

7 [laughing]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'm going to say  
9 that I'm ecstatic and to quote Vinny Ignizio I'm  
10 wheel-y wheel-y wheel-y happy. [interpose]

11 [laughing]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I know. It's Vinny  
13 Ignizio. [interpose]

14 [laughing]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: So I want to thank  
16 all of you for voting for this project. It provides  
17 52 million dollars for improvements that were  
18 provided by New York City and EDC and 580 million  
19 in private investments and it is going to help in  
20 our economic development and it will allow Staten  
21 Island to say once more that we're not the  
22 forgotten borough and now people have a reason to  
23 get off the boat and contribute to our economic, to  
24 our economy. Thank you.

1  
2 SPEAKER QUINN: Thank you very much  
3 council member Rose.

4 [Applause]

5 SPEAKER QUINN: And that completes  
6 communication from the Speaker.

7 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you very  
8 much Madam Speaker. We now move on to discussion of  
9 General orders. We're going to first call on  
10 council member Mealy.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I would just like  
12 to amend my vote.

13 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Go ahead.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I would like to  
15 vote no on intro 1021 A. Thank you Majority Leader.

16 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you and  
17 now we have a couple of members who need to vote.  
18 Council member Mendez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you I'd  
20 like to vote aye on all the, on the General Order  
21 Calendar and all the Resolutions.

22 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you.

24 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Council member  
25 Gentile?

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Yes I vote aye  
3 on all General Orders except intro 250 A and intro  
4 1021 A I vote no. And yes on all the Resolutions.

5 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Council member  
6 Barron?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: My colleagues I  
8 rise to say I finally did it; I bagged Thomas  
9 Jefferson... [interpose]

10 [laughing]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: ...and his partner  
12 George Washington both of who owned and slaved  
13 Africans. I rise also to say that of the two  
14 smoking bills I'm voting no on the first one on 18  
15 to 21 for these reasons. One, I don't know that  
16 that's going to stop 18 year olds from smoking.  
17 Two, we don't need another interference with the  
18 police department. I can see the stop and frisk now  
19 finding young people with packs of cigarettes. Now  
20 that becomes an issue in our community. Now you  
21 purchase a pack of cigarettes and you're 18 that  
22 will be against the law. We don't need more of that  
23 in our community. And they say that 18 year olds  
24 don't know the real danger of smoking but they know  
25 enough to vote for you. [interpose]

[Applause]

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: And they know enough to die in the, in the wars and they know enough to ride and get license for cars. I just don't think this is the way to go about it. The second one I think I'm going to vote yes. And then finally I left this on your table, on your desk. This is the 100 percent affordable project of the Livonia Commons. 100 percent affordable. Too bad Inez Dickens is not here because I'm sure I captured the number one spot of all the city councilors in building affordable housing. You can get a 3 bedroom apartment making 28 to 39 thousand dollars and the rent would only be 754 dollars a month, unheard of in this city. So I thank you very much for your support. 16 percent will be for the homeless and they will get subsidized rent to go along with it. This is a 100 percent affordable project. Not bad for a black, radical, revolutionary, anti-capitalist, anti-imperialist, elected official. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Council member Jackson?



1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you my  
3 colleagues I rise in order to discuss intro 250 A  
4 and 1021 A. While I support raising the minimum age  
5 to purchase tobacco from 18 to 21 which is intro  
6 250 A, I cannot support intro 1021 A. This bill,  
7 the accompanying bill banning the use of discounts  
8 of coupons for the purchase of tobacco by  
9 responsible adults. The first legislation speaks  
10 directly to our youth who are coming into their own  
11 as responsible adults still highly susceptible to  
12 marketing tactics and developing lifelong addictive  
13 behaviors. However the second legislation 1021 A is  
14 misguided in appearing to avert black market  
15 behavior but only results in penalizing and hurting  
16 the pockets of responsible adults who exercise  
17 their choice to purchase legal tobacco products.  
18 When a city intervenes to stifle a law abiding  
19 adult from purchasing a legal product we start  
20 heading into a nanny state. With all due respect to  
21 my colleague council member Arroyo and the American  
22 Heart association this legislation should be  
23 amended or scrapped all together to develop  
24 measures that would truly address the black market  
25 industry with enforceable measures. If this

1  
2 legislation is passed, my dad, who is 87 years old,  
3 a smoker, and on fixed income would not only have  
4 to pay more to purchase cigarettes but we'd also be  
5 unable to use coupons or discounts to offset the  
6 cost. We are unnecessarily penalizing the same  
7 adults that our city public health adds aim to  
8 help. We're going from a supportive message of we  
9 know it's difficult, but we're here to help and  
10 less, and let us show you the way to dictating and  
11 controlling behavior as this, as if these same  
12 adults are irresponsible and need to get their  
13 privileges taken away. I say let's stay away from  
14 punishing adults and move toward educating the  
15 masses. Thank you very much.

16 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you.  
17 Council member Koppell?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Thank you Mr.  
19 Majority Leader. I have the greatest respect in  
20 regard for my colleague Jim Gennaro and I know he's  
21 well-meaning in the advancement of legislation.  
22 Unfortunately I think that there is some sort of  
23 inconsistency of how we view our young people in  
24 this legislation. And I agree here with council  
25 member Barron. We don't always agree but on this we

1 do. We say that those young people 18 and over can  
2 vote, you know, a very important responsibility. We  
3 say that, you know that they can drive a car. We  
4 say, in fact, that they can be drafted and fight  
5 for our country but we say now in this legislation  
6 that they can't buy a pack of cigarettes. First of  
7 all, first of all it's not going to work. Most kids  
8 who start smoking start before 18 even though it's  
9 now illegal. We are creating again a type of  
10 prohibition that it's not going to work and it's  
11 going to say to our young people that it's fine to  
12 violate the law because they're going to be  
13 violating the law all the time if they want to get  
14 cigarettes. We say now, you know, a woman should  
15 have control over her own body. Even a teenager can  
16 have an abortion without her parental consent and I  
17 support that. But that teenager can't buy a pack of  
18 cigarettes? Look I would vote to make smoking  
19 illegal if I thought it would work because I think  
20 it's a bad habit. But saying that we have to treat  
21 19 year olds, and 20 year olds, and, and, or and,  
22 18 year olds differently just in my opinion doesn't  
23 make sense. And it supports those who say we should  
24 interfere with a young woman's right to choose.  
25

1  
2 It's not going to work and it's going to make again  
3 in our society just like right now with the  
4 marijuana laws; people flout them freely and openly  
5 and it causes a contempt or lack of belief in the  
6 law and that's what's going to happen here. It's a  
7 mistake to do this even though it's done out of  
8 goodwill and I cannot support it.

9 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Council member  
10 Levin?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
12 much Mr. Majority Leader my colleagues I rise in  
13 support of intros 250 A and 1021 A. My colleagues I  
14 started smoking as a teenager and over the last 15  
15 years or so I have wrestled with nicotine addiction  
16 and everything that comes along with that. So the  
17 cost that's associated with that, the health  
18 impacts that are associated with that, and the  
19 concernation to my loved ones that's associated  
20 with that. And if we can do anything to dissuade or  
21 make more difficult... [crosstalk]

22 [background comments]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: ...smoking for our  
24 young people those under the age of 18 and also for  
25 those between the ages of 18 and 21, we ought to do

1  
2 it. The addiction only sets in more as you grow  
3 older and it becomes harder and harder to kick the  
4 habit. So I, I, there's no doubt in my mind that  
5 these two bills will save lives and improve the  
6 health of our city long term, and will have a  
7 measurable impact in reducing smoking rates among  
8 young people. Make no mistake, these two bills  
9 especially intro 250 A are a big deal. No other  
10 municipality of our size anywhere has done this but  
11 just like the ban on smoking in indoor  
12 establishments that this council did 10 years ago  
13 this bill will become a national and international  
14 bellwether action and will lead to other actions  
15 like this and other municipalities in the states so  
16 I urge my colleagues to vote in the affirmative.

17 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you very  
18 much. Council member Lander?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thanks Mr.  
20 Majority Leader and I apologize for interrupting  
21 the discussion but I'd like to request unanimous  
22 consent to vote aye on all orders.

23 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I vote aye and  
25 congratulations to council member rose.

1  
2 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Council member  
3 Williams?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.  
5 First congratulations to Debbie Rose. I would never  
6 yawn at your wonderful project...

7 [laughing]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: ...and you did a  
9 fantastic job. I calling to, I'm writing to explain  
10 my no votes on intro 250 and 1021. The first one I  
11 want to associate myself with all the people who  
12 suggested that it is a bit hypocritical to say that  
13 we can put a gun in a young person's arm and tell  
14 them to decide whether they should kill or be  
15 killed and then tell them that can't buy a pack of  
16 cigarettes. And I do want to say I know that this  
17 bill and its sponsor had the best of intentions in  
18 moving this forward but that bit of hypocrisy I  
19 have a problem with. Intro 1021 I also think it's  
20 very well intentioned. I might have voted for it. I  
21 have one concern with the coupon portion of it. I  
22 think the administration has done a good job with  
23 the ads but I actually support the taxing the mess  
24 out of tobacco but also sugar. But I'm a little  
25 concerned about delving into the commerce part when

1  
2 it comes to the coupons and telling manufacturers  
3 and retailers about coupons that they can use for  
4 products that are actually legal and I wish that  
5 part was not in there. And I think there's some  
6 other ways that we can get on with it. I do have  
7 the luxury of knowing that it's actually going to  
8 pass so I know that as well but I do have some  
9 concern with that and I'm going to be voting no on  
10 both of these. Thank you.

11 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you very  
12 much. Seeing no other... Oh council members Ignizio  
13 and Halloran next.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I just wanted  
15 to speak on 250 if I may. I too agree with my  
16 colleagues that I don't think it's something we  
17 bought increased but what I did offer and what I  
18 believe should be offered is if you do believe that  
19 we ought raise the age because you do believe it  
20 will save lives they ought be a caveat, they ought  
21 be an amendment to this bill which allowed for  
22 active military personnel who we will put a gun in  
23 their hands and tell them to kill the enemy on  
24 behalf of your family and mine that they can upon  
25 showing lawful active military documentation or

1  
2 licensing or, or, identification that they can in  
3 fact purchase at the age of 18. I think that is a  
4 worthy amendment that ought be, that ought be part  
5 of this bill and I, I think it's, I, I think it's  
6 wrong that it was not either discussed or put into  
7 this bill. I'm going to be voting no but I believe  
8 that's something we should revisit.

9 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Council member  
10 Halloran?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: I would like  
12 to join myself with the comments that have been  
13 made including those of council member Barron. Once  
14 again we find ourselves regrettably agreeing  
15 however let's be clear. Not only is it that we can  
16 put a gun in the hand of a service man or woman at  
17 18 and now ask them not to buy cigarettes and  
18 whatever. I think we should let the fleet week  
19 people know that that will be the case because  
20 thousands of our Naval crew men and women will be  
21 descending on New York each year and will not be  
22 aware of the fact that they're not going to be able  
23 to buy these products. But more importantly the  
24 hypocrisy that was pointed out very articulately by  
25 council member Koppell. The fact is that we say a



1  
2 woman has the right to choose, that she has the  
3 right to make a decision that involves probably the  
4 most controversial thing in Modern Society but she  
5 will not be able to buy a pack of cigarettes. This  
6 is the problem, the dilemma that we run into in the  
7 nanny state that we're living in right now. In  
8 regards to intro 1021 it's not simply the fact that  
9 we are now going to be setting a base price for a  
10 product. Remember the free market? Remember the in  
11 the 60s and 70s we talked about how communism was  
12 about the government setting market prices. Well  
13 guess what that's exactly what we're doing. But  
14 more than that we're also changing the number of  
15 cigarettes per person that will be determined to be  
16 presumptively a dealer. If you possess 200  
17 cigarettes, two cartons, you are presumptively a  
18 dealer of cigarettes. So if your mom or your dad  
19 goes to the Indian Reservation and buys two cartons  
20 of cigarettes, they are now presumptively a dealer  
21 for the penalties contained in this legislation. In  
22 addition you can't sell an individual cigar. So if  
23 we're talking about cutting down on smoking people  
24 can't buy individual cigars. And now we've added  
25 hookah and flavored cigarettes into the mix here.

1  
2 Once upon a time the founding fathers said that  
3 which is the proper province of government must be  
4 limited. Well guess what we just again expanded  
5 government exponentially, its ability to tell us  
6 what we can and can't do, what's right and wrong.  
7 This is a precedent that's the problem. And I'll  
8 ask unanimous consent to vote on all items.

9 [interpose]

10 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Council member.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: I vote aye on  
12 all with exception of intros 250 A and 1021 A for  
13 which I vote emphatically no!

14 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

15 Council member Ulrich?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you Mr.  
17 Majority leader and my colleagues. I would also  
18 like to voice my very serious concerns with intros  
19 250 A and 1021 A and I want to touch upon some  
20 points that I think have not been addressed or  
21 discussed today. Have we thought of what impact  
22 these laws, if enacted, would have on small  
23 businesses? What about the small businesses on the  
24 Nassau-Queens boarder? What about those students  
25 who attend college perhaps in St. John's university

1  
2 or Nassau community college and on their way home  
3 from school they want to buy a pack of cigarettes?  
4 When they're in that store they're also buying a  
5 bag of chips, they're also buying a, you know, a  
6 soda or other goods. They are not going to stop in  
7 the stores in Queens in the five boroughs if  
8 they're not going to buy their pack of cigarettes.  
9 So we are hurting the small businesses that are  
10 going to be impacted by this. We're empowering a  
11 black market that was mentioned. And for whatever  
12 reason we seem fixiated as a body on correcting  
13 peoples' bad habits rather than addressing some of  
14 the more serious and pressing issues that are  
15 facing our constituents and the people of this  
16 city. And with respect to the second bill this  
17 isn't a precedent. This is more than that, much  
18 worse than that. This is a slippery slope. Because  
19 what happens when we start banning the use of  
20 coupons on fatty foods because that's not good for  
21 you. What happens when we start banning the use of  
22 coupons for McDonald's or Burger King? And that's  
23 going to have an impact on peoples' ability to  
24 afford to eat and consume that food. We should not  
25 be dictating to people how they spend their money,

1  
2 how they eat, what they smoke, when they're not  
3 breaking the law. We are infringing upon the rights  
4 of taxpaying citizens of this city. Smokers whether  
5 you like it or not, they have rights and what we  
6 are doing is violating those rights of people who  
7 are not breaking the law. We are hurting small  
8 businesses, we are creating a black market, and we  
9 are setting a very dangerous precedent for other  
10 habits which we now seem the need to police.

11 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Thank you so  
12 much. Seeing no others we'll now move on to Reports  
13 of Special Committees.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

15 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Reports of  
16 Standing Committees?

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the  
18 Committee on Economic Development intro 1166 A;  
19 Small Business Services Reporting.

20 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on  
21 General Orders with a message of necessity.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the  
23 Committee on Finance pre-considered Resolution  
24 1993; Hudson Yards.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING 77  
2 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
3 Orders.  
4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 949  
5 in Resolution, 1996, and LU 950 in Resolution 1997.  
6 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
7 Orders.  
8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of Committee on  
9 Governmental operations introduction 951 A; Public  
10 Notice of Final Rules.  
11 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on  
12 General Orders.  
13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the  
14 Committee on Health; intro 250 A; Sales Age for  
15 Cigarettes.  
16 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on  
17 General Orders.  
18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Introduction 1021 A;  
19 Tobacco Advertisements.  
20 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on  
21 General Orders.  
22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the  
23 Committee on Housing and Buildings introduction 983  
24 A; Construction Requirements for Health Facilities.  
25

2 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on  
3 General Orders.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 990 A; Flood  
5 Maps.

6 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on  
7 General Orders.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1085 A;  
9 Emergency Preparedness.

10 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on  
11 General Orders.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Introduction 1089 A;  
13 Cabling for Building Systems.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on  
15 General Orders with a message of necessity.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1096 A.

17 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on  
18 General Orders with a message of necessity.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1099 A;  
20 Preventing Wind Damage to Buildings.

21 SPEAKER QUINN: Amended and coupled on  
22 General Orders.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Before the Committee  
24 on Land Use LU 918 and Reso 1998; Landmark  
25 Designation.

1 CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING 79

2 SPEAKER QUINN: Approved of the  
3 modifications and coupled in General Orders.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 922 and Reso 1999;  
5 New York City Waterfront Revitalization Program.

6 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
7 Orders.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 923 and Reso 2000  
9 through LU 928 and Reso 2005.

10 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
11 Orders.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 929 and Reso 2006  
13 through LU 933 and Resolution 2010.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
15 Orders.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 936 and Resolution  
17 2011; UDAAP Manhattan.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
19 Orders.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 937 and Resolution  
21 2012; Zoning Map Amendment.

22 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
23 Orders.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 938 and Resolution  
25 2013 and LU 939 and Resolution 2014.

1 CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING 80

2 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
3 Orders.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 940 and Resolution  
5 2015 through LU 19, excuse me, 942 and Resolution  
6 2017.

7 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
8 Orders.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 944 and Resolution  
10 2018; Unenclosed Sidewalk Café.

11 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled to be filed.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 947 and Resolution  
13 2019; Zoning Map Amendment.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
15 Orders.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 948 and Reso 2020;  
17 Tax Exemption.

18 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
19 Orders.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 959  
21 and Resolution 2021; School Facility Council  
22 District 19.

23 SPEAKER QUINN: Motion to file pursuant  
24 to a letter of withdrawal.

25



1 CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING 81

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU 960  
3 and Resolution 2022; Public School Facility Council  
4 District 3.

5 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
6 Orders.

7 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: General Order  
8 Calendar.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Resolution appointing  
10 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

11 SPEAKER QUINN: Coupled on General  
12 Orders and at this time I'd like to ask for a roll  
13 call on the items that are coupled on the General  
14 Order Calendar please.

15 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: So ordered.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote no on  
18 intro 250 A and aye on all the rest.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Brewer?

20 I vote aye but I want to talk  
21 particularly about Land Use 918, Reso 1998 which is  
22 the West End Collegiate Historic District  
23 Extension. And I want to thank the city council  
24 because a little over a year ago we preserved West  
25 End Avenue from 79<sup>th</sup> Street to 87<sup>th</sup> Street and now

1  
2 this second portion goes from West 70<sup>th</sup> Street to  
3 West 79<sup>th</sup> Street and it's approximately 220  
4 buildings. I did work to carve out a couple of very  
5 specific structures but in general the entire  
6 section is part of this historic district. And I  
7 want to thank the council for your past and future  
8 support. There will be one more portion that will  
9 be considered next year. I vote aye on all and I am  
10 very supportive of the legislation regarding  
11 smoking, or no smoking in specifics. And I don't  
12 like to go to a store to buy cigarettes, chips,  
13 candy, and soda. Thank you very much.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all and  
16 congratulations to council member Rose.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gennaro?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Mr. Leader I  
19 would like the opportunity to speak on my vote.

20 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Thank you.

22 First of all I, I, I, also like to join the chorus  
23 of people who are giving congrats to council member  
24 Rose. Job well done on that. And, and when I was  
25 speaking before I forgot to thank some good folks

1  
2 who were knew part of the smoking bills. Of course  
3 I, I, let me just say thanks one more time to the  
4 Speaker and her great team they've all been  
5 mentioned. I, I, I, like to thank the mayor and  
6 certainly the Bloomberg Foundation for all the work  
7 they're doing to fight smoking around the world.  
8 And I like to thank commissioner Farley, Sam  
9 Miller, and Anne Sperling from the city health  
10 department. And there was a lot of advocates  
11 mentioned but I want to give a special shout out to  
12 Global Advisor for Smoke Free Policy; imparticular  
13 Karen Blumefeld, Blumenfeld. And with that I wish  
14 to vote aye on all.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ignizio?

16 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Don't get too  
17 comfortable up there.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: [clears throat]  
19 [background comments]

20 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I happen, I  
21 happen to be standing here excuse me.

22 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: What is this?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I vote no on  
24 intro 280 A and no on 1021. Aye on all others.  
25 Feels good up here hold on one second.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: We need a shorter podium though. We need...

[background comments and laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Envy is the worst sin.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: [off mic] Stand up stand up. Let me see. Like he's so much taller.

[background comments and laughter]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz?

[background comments.]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Jackson?

[background comments]

COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: So I vote aye on all with the exception of 1021 A. I vote no.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz?

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Can I be excused to explain my vote? I just want to thank, congratulate Debbie Rose. I can't wait to take the ferry to go shopping. I'm not going to go on the wheel it's a little too high for me.

[background comments]

COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I also failed to mention Thomas Donaldson, my council for 1166.

1                                   CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING                                   85  
2       The a very good bill and Christina Prince  
3       [phonetic] of my staff. Thank you and I vote aye.

4                                   COMMITTEE CLERK: Koppell?

5                                   COUNCIL MEMBER KOPPELL: Briefly explain  
6       my vote. I've, I'm going to vote no on 250 A but I  
7       will support 1021 A. While I have some concerns I  
8       don't want to create incentives for people to smoke  
9       even though I don't want people who are 18, 19, and  
10      20 to be penalized for smoking. So I vote no on 250  
11     A and yes on all items, all other items on the  
12     General Order Calendar.

13                                  COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin?

14                                  COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: With  
15     congratulations to Debbie Rose on a valiant effort  
16     and a job well done and with congratulations to Jim  
17     Gennaro on two very, Jim Gennaro and Maria Del  
18     Carmen Arroyo on two very important bills. I vote  
19     aye on all.

20                                  COMMITTEE CLERK: Mark-Viverito?

21                                  COUNCIL MEMBER MARK-VIVERITO: You know  
22     I've been personally struggling with these smoking  
23     bills. I think that there are certain  
24     inconsistencies that have been raised which are of  
25     concern moving forward. I think these are things

1  
2 that we can continue to look at but I think at the  
3 end of the day the benefit outweighs the costs and  
4 I, we'll be voting on both. And I do very much want  
5 to congratulate Debbie Rose. I know it was a hard  
6 fought battle. She struggled heavily with it and  
7 the benefit of this project for her constituents is  
8 to be commended. She should be very proud today. So  
9 aye on all.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Recchia?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: Let me be  
12 excused to explain my vote?

13 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RECCHIA: I vote no on  
15 250 A. I vote no. I vote aye on everything else.  
16 I'll also like to congratulate my colleague Debbie  
17 Rose for doing an outstanding job. This is a  
18 project that she's worked extremely hard on with  
19 her staff. And she really did a great job for the  
20 people of Staten Island. They're going to have  
21 jobs, they're going to have new businesses, and  
22 it's going to be a new day for the forgotten  
23 borough of Staten Island because of the leadership.  
24 I also have to recognize the entire delegation of  
25 Staten Island Jimmy Oddo and Vincent Ignizio for

1  
2 working with Debbie Rose and making this happen. So  
3 Debbie it's your day, enjoy it. You did a great job  
4 and all your constituents should be proud of you.  
5 Aye on all.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you Domenic.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I'd like to  
9 explain my vote.

10 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE: Yes.

11 COUCIL MEMBER ROSE: I want to  
12 congratulate Debbie Rose.

13 [laughter and applause]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: No, I vote aye on  
15 all. Thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Mr. Majority  
18 leader I'd like to vote no, no, no, no, no, no, no.  
19 I'd like to vote no on intro 250 A and the  
20 accompanying it intro 1021 A, those are the smoking  
21 bills. I would like to congratulate Rose for a job  
22 well done and I vote aye on all others.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Vann?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Explaining my  
25 vote. Not a constituent but I'm proud of you

1  
2 anyway. Gennaro I'm not a constituent of yours but  
3 I'm proud of you as well. And I vote aye on all.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I excuse  
8 my vote?

9 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: Yes.

10 COUCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you. I  
11 want to congratulate council member Barron for that  
12 100 percent affordable project. And I want to say  
13 hip hip hooray for Debbie Rose which is the  
14 opposite of yawning. It was a fantastic project.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [laughing] Thanks.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And with the  
17 two smoking bills is my colleague Oliver Koppell  
18 pointed out we also have police officers 18, 19,  
19 and 20 years old and firefighters of that age and  
20 we're also telling them, with arms, to keep us safe  
21 and make the appropriate decisions. It just seems  
22 odd as a city that we believe that these young men  
23 and women have the ability to make life and death  
24 situations and then tell them they don't have the  
25 ability to decide whether to buy a pack of



1  
2 cigarettes. And with the other bill again I do  
3 think that cigarettes, smoking, is a terrible habit  
4 and it's costing lives particularly in poor and  
5 black Latino communities and I think the city's  
6 actually moved in a great direction. This is one  
7 place I think the mayor has done a good job in  
8 getting that reduced and I think the mayor has done  
9 a good job in getting that reduced. And I think  
10 those are some of the things we have to keep going.  
11 And like most of the things in this bill I am  
12 worried about the precedent being set with the  
13 coupon aspect of it. And I vote no into 250 A and  
14 intro 1021 A and aye on all the rest.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Mr. Majority  
17 leader may I be excused to explain my vote.

18 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: Yes.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: There are some  
20 concerns I have with these bills. One of them being  
21 I'm worried about young people, young minorities  
22 especially who may be targeted as they walk and  
23 smoke. But more than a bad habit this smoking is a  
24 killer addiction and I am against making anything  
25 that is negative or economic engine that we rely

1  
2 on. So with that being said we will be watching for  
3 the first part of my statement. I vote aye on all  
4 and I would like to make sure that Mr. Ramon  
5 Martinez who was absent from the Zoning and the  
6 Land Use meetings when Debbie Rose applauded his  
7 efforts during this as well as a full body we  
8 echoed that sentiment. You did a good job. And to  
9 Debbie Rose and Koslowitz these are more than just  
10 good bills and a good deal. These are great for our  
11 city. I vote aye on all.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Oddo.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: May I be  
14 temporarily excused to explain my vote?

15 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ODDO: I'm not going to  
17 repeat all the comments that I said at the  
18 Prestated Press about the land use item but I do  
19 want to repeat two thanks. And the first obviously  
20 is to council member rose who endured a  
21 particularly difficult process, last 60 days or  
22 last 90 days of an administration campaign season  
23 it always seems to heighten the rhetoric and Debbie  
24 endured it and navigated it. And to the outside  
25 world it might not be the prettiest of processes

1  
2 but it's where you end up and I think that she  
3 ensured that we at Staten Island ended up in a  
4 really good place. And right at her side throughout  
5 this, in addition to her staff, was the great Ramon  
6 Martinez who called me up at one point after I made  
7 a little bit of a boo-boo and yelled at me in a  
8 manor he hasn't done previously but he was  
9 defending the council member and defending the  
10 institution and that's his job and I respect, I  
11 respected that and I respect him and he's a good  
12 friend. So I want to congratulate them. I also just  
13 want to add one other comment on it and it was said  
14 by Lynn Kelly who's the head of Snug Harbor. She  
15 said that if she can capture, if Snug Harbor can  
16 capture just 10 percent of the folks visiting the  
17 wheel, she will increase the participation and her  
18 admissions at Sung Harbor by 83 percent. It's just  
19 one example of what these projects mean to this  
20 borough. So kudos to everyone involved. On the  
21 smoking bills I'm voting no on intro 250 A and  
22 1021. In the year 2001 if you asked anyone in and  
23 around this building who were the two biggest anti-  
24 smoking zealots; they were council members Quinn  
25 and Oddo and somewhere along the line the movement

1  
2 has lost me. And I think it was with the parks  
3 prohibition. And I've heard lots of arguments that  
4 I think are valid arguments and valid points made  
5 by those voting no but I'm particularly kind of  
6 confused by the, and amused to some degree that we  
7 place in these young men and women's hands the  
8 judgment to vote us in and out of office and we're  
9 telling they don't have the maturity to make a  
10 decision to smoke and while I'm talking about that  
11 bill let me just say I love and respect Jim  
12 Gennaro. He is one of my favorite people that I've  
13 dealt with for the last 20 years in this building.  
14 So I'll vote aye on all with the exception of those  
15 two bills. And just if I might let everyone know  
16 that our good friend Lew Fidler who had quintuple-,  
17 or whatever it was, bypass asked me to share with  
18 you; 'If my colleagues want to send well wishes  
19 tell them they could pass the Styrofoam ban, extend  
20 the hotel tax, and baseline the money in the  
21 November plan.' to which I responded; 'I thought  
22 you went in for a bypass not a lobotomy.' he  
23 laughed. So Lew we're thinking about you. We love  
24 you. Thank you.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rivera?

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: I vote aye on  
3 all.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Quinn?

5 SPEAKER QUINN: I vote aye on all and  
6 just want to convey that Lew Fidler then emailed me  
7 complaining that Jimmy Oddo was being unkind a few  
8 other choice words as it relates to his get well  
9 wish list, added a few items for me personally, so  
10 clearly the surgery went just fine. And then he  
11 reminded me that he was a sick sick man and that we  
12 should all remember that as we listened to his  
13 list. That said and with regards to Lew Fidler, and  
14 congratulations to Debbie and Jim, I vote aye on  
15 all.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you. I  
18 vote aye on all including the previous votes with  
19 the exception of 1021 A which I vote no. I also  
20 request permission to vote for all Land Use Call-  
21 Ups.

22 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I vote aye.

24 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you Debbie for  
25 6:00 stated.

1  
2 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: Okay. All items  
3 in today's General Order Calendar were adopted by a  
4 vote of 45 in the affirmative, zero in the  
5 negative, and zero abstentions with the exception  
6 of intro 250-A which was adopted by a vote of 35 in  
7 the affirmative, ten in the negative and zero  
8 abstentions and intro 1021-A which was adopted by a  
9 vote of 36 in the affirmative, nine in the  
10 negative, and zero abstentions. And the revised  
11 Land Use Call-Ups were adopted by a vote of 45 in  
12 the affirmative, with zero in the negative.  
13 Introduction in reading of the bills.

14 SPEAKER QUINN: All bills are referred  
15 to committees as indicated on the agenda.

16 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: Discussions and  
17 Resolutions. We only have one resolution on today's  
18 calendar. It is Reso 1768-A, an amended resolution.  
19 Calling upon the New York State legislature to pass  
20 and the governor to sign A6059-A and S5932,  
21 legislation that would protect student privacy by  
22 prohibiting the release of personally identifiable  
23 student information without consent. All in favor,  
24 anybody want to speak on these items.

25 SPEAKER QUINN: No.

1  
2 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: Council member  
3 Brewer.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I'll be very very  
5 quick. I want to thank council member Jackson who's  
6 a cosponsor with me of this resolution and while in  
7 bloom and the state department mitigation may have  
8 the best intentions in pursuing innovative ways to  
9 help our children learn. We cannot and should not  
10 give student's personal information to commercial  
11 entities without parental consent.

12 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: Thank you. I see  
13 no... Council member Jackson?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Sure. My  
15 colleagues I know that you're all very busy. I ask  
16 you to vote yes on this. Sharing student data is  
17 not one's business but their parents'. Yet again  
18 parents and students have to put energy to protect  
19 what is rightfully theirs. The right to decide with  
20 whom they are trying to share their private  
21 information with. Parents entrust... [interpose]

22 SPEAKER QUINN: Can we just get a little  
23 quiet while people are exiting for council member  
24 Jackson. Thank you.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER JACKSON: Parents entrust  
3 private information to their schools for their  
4 records not to be shared with corporations. As it  
5 stands in bloom an ill-conceived policy allows  
6 corporations to gain access to student's profiles  
7 to develop individual educational techniques in  
8 such a way that promotes labels and  
9 characterizations that can potentially follow them  
10 for the rest of their lives. I'm proud to be a co-  
11 lead sponsor with my colleague Gale Brewer of this  
12 resolution that will guard our students'  
13 information and help stop this wrongful breach of  
14 parents' trust. I ask all of you to vote aye in  
15 favor of this.

16 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: Okay seeing no  
17 others all in favor say 'aye'.

18 ALL CONGRESS MEMBERS: Aye.

19 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: All opposed say  
20 'nay'.

21 [silence]

22 PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: Any abstentions?

23 [silence]

24

25



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CITY COUNCIL ON STATED MEETING

PRESIDENT PRO TEMPOR: The aye's have  
it. We now move on to general discussion. Seeing  
none this meeting is now adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date           November 13, 2013