

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES  
  
Of the  
  
CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

November 16, 2016  
Start: 01:35 p.m.  
Recess: 03:11 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E:  
  
MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO  
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
  
ALAN N. MAISEL  
ANDREW COHEN  
ANDY L. KING  
ANNABEL PALMA  
ANTONIO REYNOSO  
BARRY S. GRODENCHIK  
BEN KALLOS  
BRAD S. LANDER  
CARLOS MENCHACA  
CHAIM M. DEUTSCH  
COREY D. JOHNSON  
COSTA G. CONSTANTINIDES  
DANIEL DROMM  
DANIEL R. GARODNICK  
DARLENE MEALY  
DAVID G. GREENFIELD

## COUNCIL MEMBERS: (CONTINUED)

DEBORAH L. ROSE  
DONOVAN J. RICHARDS  
ELIZABETH S. CROWLEY  
ERIC A. ULTICH  
FERNANDO CABRERA  
HELEN K. ROSENTHAL  
I. DANEEK MILLER  
INEZ D. BARRON  
INEZ E. DICKENS  
JAMES G. VAN BRAMER  
JAMES VACCA  
JOSEPH C. BORELLI  
JULISSA FERRERAS-COPELAND  
JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS  
KAREN KOSLOWITZ  
LAURIE A. CUMBO  
MARGARET S. CHIN  
MARK LEVINE  
MARK TREYGER  
MATHIEU EUGENE  
PAUL A. VALLONE  
PETER A. KOO  
RAFAEL L. ESPINAL, JR.  
RAFAEL SALAMNCA, JR.  
RITCHIE J. TORRES  
ROBERT E. CORNEGY, JR.  
RORY I. LANCMAN  
ROSIE MENDEZ  
RUBEN WILLS  
STEPHEN T. LEVIN  
STEVEN MATTEO  
VANESSA L. GIBSON  
VINCENT J. GENTILE  
YDANIS A. RODRIGUEZ

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1  
2 [gavel]

3 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Okay we're going  
4 to... we... hoping to get started shortly. Waiting for  
5 a couple more of our members and then we'll, we'll  
6 start. So, thank everybody for their patience.

7 [pause]

8 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: ...colleagues to  
9 join us. We have a ceremonial here that, that is  
10 one that we can say thank you to our first  
11 responders. So, those of that are in the chambers  
12 they would join us up here. I'll say a little  
13 background. We're honoring two police officers,  
14 Police Officers Felix Baez, and Giovanni Laguna.  
15 I'm going to read quickly from a, a local paper on,  
16 on what they did which is amazing. So, these two  
17 police officers saved an unconscious baby in the  
18 Mott Haven section of the Bronx. That's my  
19 district. Come on guys. Come on up.

20 [applause]

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Want to welcome...  
22 also Chief Secreto come on up. Yeah Chief Secreto  
23 is here to, to celebrate with us. But at around  
24 8:30 p.m. at night. This is in October. Plain  
25 clothes officers Felix Baez and Giovanni Laguna,

1  
2 both on the force for four years were on a routine  
3 patrol at the Mitchell houses in the south Bronx,  
4 138<sup>th</sup> Street Willis Avenue when they saw a woman  
5 running down the block calling for help in Spanish.  
6 Baez and Laguna stopped their car and identified  
7 themselves to the woman. That's when they noticed  
8 that the infant in her arms was turning blue.  
9 Laguna immediately placed the baby on the ground  
10 and began CPR while Baez called for an ambulance.  
11 Laguna continued CPR for about a minute and then  
12 noticed the baby's eyes opening and felt a faint  
13 pulse. I just got goosebumps. Baez and Laguna then  
14 decided to take the infant and her mother to a  
15 nearby hospital. Laguna continued chest  
16 compressions on the infant and Baez continued to  
17 communicate with the, with the radio dispatcher  
18 according to police. Various other officers helped  
19 expedite the trip by stopping traffic at several  
20 intersections. The baby named Ashley Dolores is in  
21 stable condition. Obviously, she's doing much  
22 better now. It was, it's the first time the NYPD  
23 officers had ever used their CPR training on the  
24 job. Wow! So this is just an example. I mean, first  
25 of all, thank you for your service and it's just an

1  
2 example of what our officers do each and every day.  
3 I mean they respond to all sorts of incidents but  
4 they have to step up to the plate and their  
5 training really kicked in here obviously. The  
6 importance of the, of the training they get in the  
7 academy. CPR I think is something that everybody  
8 should know how to do. Not everybody does. So it  
9 literally does save lives. So thank you so much for  
10 your service. It's my district so I'm, I'm really  
11 proud of you. I'm proud of all the officers that  
12 protect us each and every day. You know that. And  
13 on behalf of all my colleagues we're here to  
14 demonstrate this appreciation by giving you this,  
15 this proclamation. So, I'm going to ask the clerk  
16 to read the proclamation and then we would love to  
17 have you say a few words.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council City of New  
19 York Proclamation: The Council of the City of New  
20 York is proud to honor NYPD Officer Felix Baez and  
21 NYPD Officer Giovanni Laguna for saving the life on  
22 October 14<sup>th</sup>, 2016. And whereas around 8:30 p.m.  
23 Friday, October 14<sup>th</sup>, 2016 Officer Baez and Officer  
24 Laguna were patrolling in an unmarked car near  
25 138<sup>th</sup> Street and Willis Avenue in Mott Haven when a

1  
2 woman holding an infant ran down the street calling  
3 for help in Spanish when they saw that the one year  
4 old girl was unresponsive and her arms were turning  
5 blue Officer Laguna placed the baby on the ground  
6 and began administering CPR while Officer Baez  
7 called for an ambulance. This was the first time  
8 either officer had used CPR training on the job.  
9 And whereas Officer Laguna continued CPR for about  
10 a minute and then noticed the baby's eyes opening  
11 and felt a faint pulse. The officers decided to  
12 take the infant and her mother to Lincoln Hospital.  
13 Officer Laguna continued chest compressions while  
14 Officer Baez continued to communicate with the  
15 radio dispatcher. Soon their colleagues helped  
16 block intersections so that they could get to the  
17 hospital more quickly. Because of their quick  
18 thinking and teamwork the baby is alive today. And  
19 whereas while Officer Baez and Officer Laguna may  
20 continue to save lives throughout their career this  
21 experience serves as an important reminder that a  
22 police badge is not required to learn CPR. Anyone  
23 can learn CPR and everyone should. Sadly, 70  
24 percent of Americans may feel helpless to act  
25 during a cardiac emergency because they either did

1  
2 not know how to administer CPR or their training  
3 has significantly lapsed. Unlike this incident  
4 lives saved by CPR are likely to be someone at  
5 home; a child, a spouse, a parent, or a friend. All  
6 New Yorkers can find a CPR training center online  
7 at WWW dot Red Cross dot org. And whereas we  
8 commend Officer Laguna and Officer Baez for their  
9 heroic actions. They are truly two of New York's  
10 finest and have earned the gratitude of every New  
11 Yorker. Now therefore be it known that the council  
12 of the City of New York gratefully honors NYPD  
13 Officer Giovanni Laguna and NYPD Officer Felix Baez  
14 for saving an infant's life on October 14<sup>th</sup>, 2016.  
15 Melissa Mark-Viverito Speaker for the entire  
16 council.

17 OFFICER BAEZ: Good afternoon everybody.  
18 Thank you for having us. It's a pleasure being  
19 here.

20 [applause]

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Oh my  
22 god you got that radio voice.

23 [applause]

24 OFFICER BAEZ: For me and my partner  
25 just another day at work. And on that particular



1  
2 day we're very happy to have be vigilant enough to  
3 see what was going on with the baby and being able  
4 to respond the way we responded and being able to  
5 give her mother peace of mind... going to be okay if  
6 I get her to the hospital efficiently and as fast,  
7 as fast as we could. It is a honor being here but  
8 for us we just doing our job. Thank you.

9 [applause]

10 OFFICER LAGUNA: Thank you again for  
11 having us. You know we're, we're, we're happy to be  
12 here. You know I appreciate... you know that that day  
13 was... it's a, a memory that you know I'll never  
14 forget it. You know once, once, once we had Ashley  
15 in the, in the car and we got there you know... Once  
16 the doctors told us that she was going to be okay  
17 and she was breathing it was you know a huge weight  
18 off my shoulder. Like it, it was, it was  
19 remarkable. Thank you.

20 [applause]

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I'm going to  
22 have Chief Secreto say something too.

23 CHIEF SECRETO: I, I just want to say  
24 I'm so proud of these guys. I'm a product of public  
25 housing and as a young boy I was inspired by the

1  
2 men and women that, that wore this uniform. Kind of  
3 got me to where I am today. So, I am just so proud.  
4 At this is the same PSA where we had two officers  
5 shot back in February. We were involved in a  
6 shooting last week. This was, this is... these guys  
7 are out there and they did a great, great job and  
8 I'm just so proud. Thank you.

9 [applause]

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Alright again  
11 thank you so much.

12 [pause]

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Members please  
14 have your seats. Quiet in the chambers. All rise  
15 for the pledge of allegiance. I pledge allegiance  
16 to the flag of the United States of America and to  
17 the republic for which it stands. One nation under  
18 god, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.  
19 Please be seated. Roll call.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli, Cabrera,  
23 Chin.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CITY COUNCIL

11

COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic] I'm  
here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.  
COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.  
COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: [off mic] Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Crowley. Cumbo.  
Deutsch. Dickens. Dromm.  
COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.  
COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene. Ferreras-  
Copeland.  
COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: [off  
mic] here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.  
COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.  
COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson. Greenfield.  
Grodenchik. Johnson.  
COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos. King.  
COUNCIL MEMBER KING: [off mic] Present.

CITY COUNCIL

12

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.  
COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Koslowitz. Lancman.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LAN  
COUNCIL MEMBER AN:  
[off mic] I'm here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic] Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.  
COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel. Mealy.  
Menchaca.  
COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: [speaking  
Spanish]  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.  
COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: [off mic] Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.  
COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Present.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.  
COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.  
COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

CITY COUNCIL

13

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.  
COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic]  
Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.  
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.  
COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]  
Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.  
COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.  
COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres. Treyger.  
COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca.  
COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: [off mic] Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.  
COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.  
COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [off mic]  
Here.  
COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera.  
COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: [off mic] Here.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [off mic] Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo. Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Van Bramer.

COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the chambers. All rise for the invocation. The in... The invocation will be... Quiet in the chambers. The invocation will be delivered by Reverend Doctor T. Kenjitsu Nakagaki at the Buddhist Council of New York. Quiet in Chambers.

REVEREND DOCTOR NAKAGAKI: As many New Yorkers feel great anxiety towards the direction that our country is going we need to reconfirm our true value of love and compassion with wisdom and plant them into the deep... of our mind which should be, or should become the source of our actions. Now let us meditate with prayer.

[bell rings]

REVEREND DOCTOR NAKAGAKI: Relax your body tension and breathe deeply using your lower stomach instead of your lungs. And now you can

1  
2 close your eyes lightly and focus on breathing.  
3 Simply count your breath and be mindful of your  
4 breath.

5 [bell rings]

6 REVEREND DOCTOR NAKAGAKI: Instead of  
7 hate and anger maybe breathe out this way. Then we  
8 bring love and compassion as you breathe in.  
9 Instead of suffering we bring happiness and well  
10 beings. Breathe in. Breathe out. Instead of bias  
11 and discrimination breathe out. We bring equality,  
12 mutual respect, and understanding. Breathe in.  
13 Instead of distraction and violence. Breathe out.  
14 We bring peace with nonviolence in our mind and  
15 spread that out to the society. Instead of division  
16 we bring togetherness; mind and body together, you  
17 and your neighbors together, all city council  
18 members together, and all New Yorkers together.  
19 Instead illusion and delusion we bring  
20 enlightenment and freedom.

21 [bell ringing]

22 REVEREND DOCTOR NAKAGAKI:

23 [unintelligible]

24 [bell ringing four times]

1  
2 REVEREND DOCTOR NAKAGAKI: May all  
3 living beings be happy, well, and peaceful. May all  
4 beings be free from greed, anger, and ignorance.  
5 May our mindful action bring happiness and peace to  
6 all our family, our city, our nation, and our  
7 world. Peace to you all. [speaking foreign  
8 language] Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Now that we're  
10 all relaxed you may have your seats. Motion to  
11 spread the invocation. Council Member Garodnick.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you  
13 very much Madam Public Advocate. I would like to  
14 welcome and extend my deepest gratitude to Reverend  
15 T. Kenjitsu Nakagaki for joining us today. Reverend  
16 Nakagaki is President of the Buddhist Council of  
17 New York, a 31 year old organization whose mission  
18 is to foster dialogue, cooperation, and unity  
19 within the Buddhist community of our city. Reverend  
20 Nakagaki is not only a leader in his own community.  
21 He has reached out across religious lines and has  
22 been a remarkable civic leader on behalf of all New  
23 Yorkers. Reverend Nakagaki serves as the Clergy on  
24 call for Columbia University as well as the  
25 Community Clergy Liaison for the New York City



1  
2 Police Department. Since 1994 he has organized an  
3 interfaith peace event to commemorate the Baroshama  
4 [phonetic] Nagasaki atomic bombings and previously  
5 organized the World Trade Center Memorial floating  
6 lantern ceremony. As part of his research for his  
7 doctor of ministry program at the New York  
8 Theological Seminary he visited Poland touring the  
9 Auschwitz and Treblinka death camps. Reverend  
10 Nakagaki's actions from mentoring students to  
11 diving into interfaith work to strengthening his  
12 own spiritual community show New Yorkers concrete  
13 steps we can all take to make our city the best  
14 that it can be. With leaders like Reverend Nakagaki  
15 we have a shining example of what we can do to  
16 strengthen and in the current environment to heal  
17 our beautiful mosaic of a city which today and  
18 going forward will be more important than ever. In  
19 this spirit I would like to make a motion to spread  
20 his invocation in full upon the record.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet  
22 in the chambers please. Adoption of minutes.  
23 Council Member Garodnick.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you. I  
25 move the adoption of the minutes of the stated

1  
2 meeting of October 13, 2016 that they be adopted as  
3 printed.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now two  
5 members need to vote early. Council Member King.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Thank you for  
7 permission to vote on all votes today?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
11 Council Member Van Bramer.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: I vote aye  
13 on all.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. And  
15 now messages and papers from the mayor.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication  
18 from city, county, and borough offices?

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and  
21 communications?

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use call-  
24 ups?

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

1  
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
3 chambers now as we hear... Quiet, as we now hear from  
4 the Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam  
6 Public Advocate. If I could ask my colleagues to  
7 rise please.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I want to start  
10 today's session by noting the deaths of two New  
11 York City employees who were killed in the line of  
12 duty this past month. On November 4<sup>th</sup> Sergeant Paul  
13 Tuozzolo was tragically shot in an exchange of  
14 gunfire with an armed man in the South Bronx.  
15 Sergeant Tuozzolo was a 19-year veteran of the NYPD  
16 and leaves behind a wife and two sons. On November  
17 3<sup>rd</sup>, Lewis Grey, an employee for the Metropolitan  
18 Transportation Authority, was fatally struck by an  
19 oncoming train while performing maintenance work on  
20 the G-line. Lewis had been with the MTA for 15  
21 years and leaves behind a wife and three sons. I  
22 want to please ask that you join me in taking a  
23 moment of silence to honor these two individuals  
24 who committed their lives to serving our city and  
25 we thank them for that service.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

[pause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you my  
colleagues.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be  
seated.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I want to thank  
the reverend for today, for being with us today...

[cross-talk]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
chambers please. Quiet in the chambers.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I think it was a  
most appropriate opening to this session. So, I  
really appreciate you for, for being here with us.  
On a lighter note I want to please ask that you  
join me in a round of applause for our  
communications director Eric Cook.

[applause]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: He's getting  
ready. He's a little nervous I think. Look, you  
know, people have, have probably heard and read  
that this is Eric's last stated with us as he's  
going to be moving on to join Precision Strategies  
as a managing principal. And Eric has been working  
with me prior to me becoming speaker in that rough

1  
2 and tumble campaign and I really wanted to thank  
3 him for his years of work with us here at the  
4 council. And Eric you've done amazing things for  
5 this council, really getting our message out there,  
6 what our priorities are, really putting us on the  
7 map and getting the respect that we deserve. So,  
8 we're going to miss your insight, your wisdom. And  
9 if anybody knows or follows him he's an avid sports  
10 fan so he throws out those little tweets here and  
11 there on all the sports activity happening, all the  
12 games. So, we know we're going to be hearing a lot  
13 more from you. You have a bright future. Still very  
14 young relatively speaking. So, we know we're going  
15 to be hearing a lot from you. And thank him for  
16 that. It's, it's really been, personally been  
17 really fulfilling to work alongside you. And as  
18 many of you have maybe know or heard that Press  
19 Secretary Robin Levine is going to be promoted to  
20 Communications Director. So, congratulations to  
21 her. She's been working in the press office since  
22 2011 and know that she will be doing great work on  
23 behalf of this council in her new role. And  
24 obviously happy thanksgiving which is upcoming to  
25 all of you. I hope you have time to really spend

1  
2 time with your family and to appreciate the moments  
3 with family and friends. I think it's a real good  
4 moment to do that, do a lot of reflection. So,  
5 before we get started on the legislative agenda I  
6 want to just take a moment to address the obvious  
7 issue at the forefront of our news today which is  
8 the presidential race. Many, many people are scared  
9 and worried, justifiably so about what the future  
10 holds for them. And we've seen terrible acts of  
11 racism, xenophobia, antisemitism, islamophobia over  
12 the past week. This is not normal. And we cannot  
13 pretend that it is. It is on us to reject that. And  
14 it is on the President Elect to more strongly  
15 denounce it and to take this more seriously. If you  
16 can spend time tweeting insults at the New York  
17 Times and the press he can take time to speak to  
18 people committing horrible acts in his name.  
19 Locally now is a time to unite to protect our  
20 values, to protect our future, and to protect our  
21 city. Because the America and the United States  
22 that I know is diverse. We are LGBTQ. We are  
23 undocumented. We are survivors. And together we are  
24 the foundation of our great nation. It's made  
25 because of, not in spite of our differences. There

1  
2 can be no national registry of Muslims or mass  
3 round ups of immigrants or massive implementation  
4 of stop and frisk. This is not who our nation is.  
5 So, our message to New Yorkers is simple. We will  
6 never stop fighting for you whether you were born  
7 here or that you overcame insurmountable odds to  
8 find your way to our city or whether you have  
9 sought administrative relief from deportation. You  
10 are a New Yorker and you belong here. We will not  
11 allow Donald Trump's white house to tell us  
12 differently. We will not allow Steve Bannon to tell  
13 us differently. There's obviously much that we've  
14 built here that we will need to defend. In the  
15 absence of federal comprehensive immigration reform  
16 the New York City Council has done more to protect  
17 immigrants than any other municipality in our  
18 country. We have provided every single  
19 unaccompanied minor in our city with free legal  
20 services and have successfully granted over 100  
21 children with permanent legal status or asylum. We  
22 have ousted federal immigration officials from our  
23 city jails and ended the use of immigration  
24 detainers. We've invested in our day laborers,  
25 protected.. and helped keep families together. And

1  
2 now in the midst of the uncertainty and fear facing  
3 our immigrant communities we say this. New York is  
4 and always will be a sanctuary city. To our  
5 undocumented community we are with you. We will  
6 stand by you and we will protect you. You are New  
7 Yorkers and we will not abandon you. The months  
8 ahead will not be easy. But we must steel ourselves  
9 to the mission ahead. We will fight and we will  
10 persevere and we will do what New Yorkers have  
11 always done best in challenging times. We will  
12 stand united together. Because together we are New  
13 York and New York will never stop being New York.  
14 And together we are the United States of America.  
15 This council has the ability to push back in many  
16 ways and we will exert every tool available in  
17 defense of this city and its ideals. So, I want to  
18 thank my colleagues. I know there's been a lot of  
19 response. We're coming together as a council. I  
20 know that there has been a lot of events that  
21 people are doing in their districts and I think  
22 that that is important. So, I thank you all for  
23 that. So, moving on to the first item up for vote  
24 today. I'm going to... this is... we have quite a bit  
25 of a package, a lot of legislation. After in depth



1 negotiations between the Subcommittee on Zoning and  
2 Franchises, Council Member Steve Levin and the  
3 developing corporation the proposed rezoning at 141  
4 Willoughby Street in Downtown Brooklyn will be  
5 voted on by the full council today. This vote will  
6 establish a mandatory inclusionary housing area and  
7 amend the special downtown Brooklyn district to  
8 create a new zoning district with increased  
9 commercial and community facility uses. If approved  
10 the new building will stand at 44 stories and  
11 feature 310,000 square feet of space including  
12 124,000 square feet of commercial space and house  
13 203 dwelling units of which 61 will be designated  
14 as low to moderate income housing. I know Steve,  
15 Council Member Levin has been working really hard  
16 on this so if we could please say a few words about  
17 it.  
18

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you very  
20 much Madam Speaker. Today the Council will be  
21 voting on a proposed mixed use commercial and  
22 residential development as you said at 141  
23 Willoughby Street. This project sparked dynamic  
24 discussions in my district over 400 people  
25 contacting our office to share their opinion about,

1  
2 opinions about potential new precedents set for  
3 density in the downtown Brooklyn area and lack of  
4 adequate infrastructure such as an elementary  
5 school to support the large number of new units. I  
6 applaud and encourage this type of community  
7 engagement and look forward to continuing these  
8 important conversations about the future of the  
9 downtown area with residents and stakeholders. In  
10 particular, I'd like to thank the Co-op, the local  
11 co-op shareholders, Community Board 2, and Peter  
12 Bray of the Brooklyn Heights Association for their  
13 leadership. I also want to thank you Speaker  
14 Melissa Mark-Viverito and Chief of Staff Ramone  
15 Martinez, Borough President Eric Adams, our Land  
16 Use Chair David Greenfield and Subcommittee Chair  
17 Donovan Richards. Additionally, I'm grateful to the  
18 development team at Savannah including Ed Wallis  
19 [sp?] and Jay Seagull [sp?] and to the Economic  
20 Development Corporation for engaging in meaningful  
21 conversations about how to address the community  
22 needs here. Finally, I want to thank the incredible  
23 Land Use staff here at the council Raju Mann [sp?],  
24 Dillon Casey, and Bryan Paul, Amy Levitant as well  
25 as my staff Legislative Director Julie Barrow,

1  
2 Constituent Liaison Bravo Lopez, Chief of Staff  
3 John... Bushey [sp?], and Communications Director  
4 Edward Polino [sp?], all of whom spent many hours  
5 on this application. As you said this is going to  
6 be a... this is a compromise where we saw a reduction  
7 of FAR from the 18 that was proposed to 15 which  
8 would be a reduction of three residential FAR and  
9 additional six commercial FAR so you'll have a  
10 truly mixed development, mixed use development  
11 where we will encourage commercial development, or  
12 retaining mandatory inclusionary housing in  
13 affordable units in the residential space. So  
14 hopefully this will become a model for downtown  
15 Brooklyn and other downtowns in our city so that we  
16 can have truly a thriving downtown area where all  
17 communities can continue to thrive. So, I want to  
18 thank you Madam Speaker for the opportunity to  
19 speak and I encourage my colleagues to vote in  
20 support of this application.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
22 Council Member. Moving on to other items on the  
23 agenda. The City University of New York is the  
24 largest urban public's university system in the  
25 United States and one of our most important

1  
2 institutions. From its inception in 1847 until the  
3 financial crisis of 1976 CUNY was a tuition free  
4 institution for qualifying students. Although this  
5 is no longer the case the following legislation  
6 seeks to explore solutions to making CUNY more  
7 accessible to all New Yorkers. Introduction 1138A  
8 sponsored by Council Member Inez Barron would  
9 establish a temporary task force to examine ways to  
10 increase admission, affordability, and graduation  
11 rates in the CUNY system including the feasibility  
12 of returning to a tuition free educational model  
13 for New York City residents. For staff, I want to  
14 think... Tiquillawan, Kiro Guchurro [phonetic], Chloe  
15 Rivera, Jessica Ackerman, Iesha Shamburg, and Tersa  
16 Nasser [sp?]. And Council Member Inez Barron is  
17 sponsoring that bill and she'll say a few words.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam  
19 Speaker. I'm pleased to be having this bill come  
20 before this body today for a vote. Intro 11-38A  
21 will in fact bring CUNY to the position where it  
22 was that allowed me to be able to attend CUNY. I  
23 was able to attend CUNY because I had a B average  
24 and I was able to select Hunter as a school which I  
25 wanted to attend and I went at no cost. Both my

1  
2 parents working but we did not have money to pay  
3 tuition as well as all the other costs that go with  
4 attending college. I had to struggle with the car  
5 fare which at that time was the 15-cent token. I  
6 had to struggle with the textbooks fees and of the  
7 college. So, this bill will establish a temporary  
8 taskforce that is charged with examining how we can  
9 increase admission to CUNY, how we can keep  
10 students at CUNY and help them graduate including  
11 examination of instituting free tuition once again.  
12 We know that when the state took over in 1976 due  
13 to the economic crisis that they cut back on their  
14 funding and they continued that downward trend of  
15 investigating CUNY and we also know that they  
16 instituted tuition at that time. So, we're looking  
17 to see how this panel which will come together and  
18 be composed of a representative from the public  
19 advocate, representative from the speaker, seven  
20 mayoral appointees, four for the speaker, and have  
21 at least three meetings to come up with a proposal,  
22 recommendations for how we can once again restore  
23 free tuition at CUNY. I think it's important  
24 because we know that going forward in the  
25 technological age which we're advancing that we

1  
2 need to have an opportunity for all of our  
3 residents to be able to garner the skills that they  
4 need to be a part of that workforce. We know that  
5 CUNY over the last at least 10 years has only had a  
6 one percent increase in black faculty at CUNY. So,  
7 we need to expand the opportunities for all of our  
8 people who are living here to be able to attend  
9 college, get those degrees, get into that pipeline,  
10 become faculty, become instructors, and move up and  
11 be a part of the CUNY system. At this point tuition  
12 at the senior colleges is three, 6,033 dollars for  
13 senior colleges and 4,700... 4,000... 4,700... 4,700  
14 dollars at the community colleges. And although we  
15 may think that's a novel amount when your income is  
16 less than 15,000 dollars that's a challenge. So,  
17 looking forward to being able to have this  
18 taskforce established and produce a report. I want  
19 to thank the speaker. I want to thank Jeff Campana  
20 who was a former council to the committee. I want  
21 to thank Anita Killowan [sp?]. I want to thank Kiru  
22 T Keeru [phonetic], the present counsel to the  
23 committee, Indigo Washington, my Legislative  
24 Director, Chloe for her work on the revisions

25

1  
2 especially. And all of you who signed on for the  
3 bill thank you so much.

4           SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
5 Council Member. We have made it a point here in New  
6 York City to be a leader on sustainability issues.  
7 As electric vehicles become an increasingly popular  
8 method of transportation it is time for our  
9 infrastructure to meet the demand. Introduction  
10 1124A sponsored by Council Member Costa  
11 Constantinides would require the city to install at  
12 least 20 electric vehicle charging stations in  
13 publicly accessible locations by March 2018.  
14 Stations would be established in all five boroughs  
15 and the city would work with stakeholders including  
16 electric vehicle manufacturers to review the  
17 success of the program and the possibility of  
18 installing on street charging stations. I want to  
19 thank Kelly Taylor, Johnathan Motzorano [sp?],  
20 Gafar Zalof [sp?], Emily Rooney, and Chima Obichair  
21 [phonetic] for working on this bill. I would like  
22 to ask the sponsor Council Member Constantinides to  
23 say a few words followed by Council Member Ydanis  
24 Rodriguez.  
25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank  
3 you Madam Speaker. In our transportation sector we  
4 must reduce reliance in petroleum burning cars.  
5 Their exhaust accounts for an estimated 75 percent  
6 of carbon monoxide pollution, one-third of smog,  
7 and 27 percent of greenhouse gas emissions in the  
8 United States. As we seek to meet our mandate of  
9 reducing emissions 80 percent by 2050 here in New  
10 York we must act on this sector. While many New  
11 Yorkers do not drive to work one step for those  
12 that do is to purchase an electric vehicle. The  
13 more electric vehicles that can replace  
14 conventional cars the more our transportation can  
15 come from clean renewable energy instead of burning  
16 fossil fuels. But one of the biggest challenges  
17 facing consumers who want to purchase an electric  
18 car is the scarcity of places to charge them. Some  
19 wealthier citizens may have access to private  
20 garages with electric chargers but most do not. By  
21 providing charging stations for public use we can  
22 make it possible for New Yorkers who want to switch  
23 to electric cars to do so. We can make Electric  
24 cars more visible and encourage their use and move  
25 closer to building a reliable EV network. Intro



1  
2 1124 is an important step in reducing emissions  
3 here in New York City. By initiating its pilot  
4 program which would place 25 chargers in public  
5 accessible locations throughout the city including  
6 two in each borough we can incur the use of cleaner  
7 electric cars. The location appropriate fee of the  
8 usage of these charges will be set by DOT. Intro  
9 1124 also expands the scope of the EV advisory  
10 commission, committee established by Local Law 122  
11 of 2013 to explicitly consider how to expand to on  
12 street parking opportunities for electric vehicles  
13 as well. By implementing 1124 and by encouraging  
14 the use of electric vehicles we would take an  
15 important step in reducing the risks and improving  
16 the health of safety of New Yorkers protecting  
17 everyone from global crises like climate change and  
18 from harmful contamination that we breathe. On a  
19 final note let me just say that our environmental  
20 efforts have become vastly more critical in the  
21 past week. We have an incoming administration that  
22 as we speak is planning to abrogate our nation's  
23 commitment to the powers of climate accord. It is  
24 led in this field by a man who has no scientific  
25 training who none the less questions the

1  
2 credentials of millions of scientists who have done  
3 the research on climate change. Under this  
4 administration the EPA, if it even continues to  
5 exist will only serve as rubber stamp for those who  
6 seek to evade responsibility for polluting our air  
7 and water and for those who want to lodge their  
8 heads in the sand as the waves of climate change  
9 come even closer and closer year by year. Cities  
10 and states are now the last line of defense in  
11 fighting for cleaner and more sustainable planet  
12 and, and I'm proud to be part of this council which  
13 has been a world leader in sustainability and  
14 greening. And thank you Madam Speaker for that. I  
15 want to thank our, my, the chair of the  
16 transportation committee and my partner on this  
17 legislation Ydanis Rodriguez, the counsel Kelly  
18 Taylor who was amazing setting up so many meetings.  
19 Thank you, Kelly, Gafar, Akiru [phonetic], and of  
20 course my legislative director Nick Wazowski. Thank  
21 you, Madam Speaker.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Well my  
23 colleague say.. explain all the merits of this bill.  
24 This is about doing the right thing to reduce  
25 emission that we produce in our city.

1  
2                   SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
3 Council Member. So next the council will be voting  
4 on a legislation to establish an inspector general  
5 for the department of correction. First proposed in  
6 my February State of the City address this  
7 legislation will ensure that those incarcerated in  
8 city facilities are treated in a humane manner.  
9 Introduction 1228B which I have sponsored would  
10 establish a permanent entity to monitor, review,  
11 and report on the Department of Corrections on an  
12 ongoing basis. This entity would focus its  
13 attention on issues related to improving conditions  
14 in city jails protecting the safety of the  
15 departmental employees and protecting the rights of  
16 the incarcerated. The Department of Investigation  
17 will be overseeing this monitor and I look forward  
18 to seeing this crucial step toward improving  
19 conditions in our city jails take effect. Want to  
20 thank Bryan Crow, Will Huggett [sp?], and Steve  
21 Ryster [sp?] for working on that legislation. And  
22 finally, today we'll be voting on a majors  
23 legislative package to enhance safety standards for  
24 gas piping systems across the city. These bills  
25 come in the wake of several tragedies throughout

1  
2 New York including the east village explosion and  
3 the east Harlem explosion which occurred in my  
4 district that killed eight individuals while  
5 injuring dozens of others. This is a very  
6 promising, this is very promising legislation and  
7 I'm hopeful that the measures we take today will  
8 protect lives and property in the future. This was  
9 a lot of work that went into this. I want to thank  
10 Jeff Baker, Ed Atkin, Jen Wilcox, Megan Chin,  
11 Guillermo Patino, Jose Conde, and Sara Gastelum.  
12 There are a number of bills in this package so I'm  
13 going to let my colleagues get into the details of  
14 the items. But we're going to begin with Intro  
15 1079A which I have sponsored. And that would  
16 require final inspections of permanent work on gas  
17 piping systems to be performed by the Department of  
18 Buildings. This is a change from previous standards  
19 which allow for final inspections of permanent work  
20 to be completed through self certification. This  
21 amendment will go far to ensure that gas work in  
22 our city is performed in a safe and code compliant  
23 manner. Given the number of dangerous situations we  
24 have seen result from faulty gas piping work  
25 throughout the city in recent years it is

1  
2 imperative that we maintain the strictest standards  
3 to ensure the safety of an already inherently risky  
4 process. I thank my fellow council members for  
5 their leadership on these crucial improvements and  
6 invite them to give some remarks on their  
7 legislation. Starting off with Intro 738A Council  
8 Member Mark Levine.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Madam  
10 Speaker. We have seen in recent incidents including  
11 the explosion at Kennedy High School which was  
12 caused by a worker who lit a match to check to see  
13 whether gas was leaking from pipes they had  
14 installed. How dangerous this work is and how  
15 important it is that the workers be trained in this  
16 complicated, complicated work. Incredibly though  
17 today anyone can work on gas lines. There's no  
18 certification or testing or experience or on the  
19 job training. Anyone can walk off the street and  
20 work on gas lines as long as they're under the  
21 nominal supervision of a master plumber. Who... I say  
22 nominal because the master plumber doesn't have to  
23 be at the work site, doesn't have to be in the  
24 building, doesn't have to be in New York City when  
25 the work is being completed. And we think this is a

1  
2 dangerous, dangerous policy. And I'm thrilled that  
3 Intro 738 requires for the first time that people  
4 working on gas lines have received a certification  
5 through a combination of testing and experience or  
6 are working under the direct supervision of someone  
7 on site who has been qualified in such a manner.  
8 This would help bring a very large workforce  
9 estimated to be as many as 10,000 people who are  
10 doing this work up to safety standards and allows,  
11 allows a reasonable phase in period so that there  
12 will not be significant disruptions while we  
13 advance towards safer installation of this  
14 infrastructure. I want to thank the Council Speaker  
15 for support of this important measure. I want to  
16 thank the chair of the Housing and Building  
17 Committee, Chair Williams, for support of this. I  
18 also want to thank the great staff who worked out  
19 of the legislation, out of the legislative division  
20 Jen Wilcox, Ed Atkin, Jeff Baker, and of course my  
21 own Amy Slatery [sp?]. And I encourage my  
22 colleagues to vote yes on Intro 736. Thank you.

23 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
24 Council Member. Introduction 1094A Council Member  
25 Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Good

afternoon. I am proud to stand here today with my colleagues and speaker to be a part of this comprehensive package of bills that will improve our infrastructure and protect the lives of New Yorkers across the city. Over the last few years we've lost too many lives to gas explosions including one of our own police officers in the Bronx just last month. 98 percent of these types of accidents of course by reckless behaviors, creaky installations, or by a lack of maintenance of our infrastructure. Many of these risk factors are identifiable if the city works with gas corporations to find them before an actual explosion happens. We must have a more proactive approach before we lose more New Yorkers to these catastrophes. Intro 1094A requires the mayor to designate an office or an agency to identify these risk factors that indicate a violation or pose as a hazard to health and safety. These risk factors include unauthorized gas usage, unusual gas usage for a building based on its history of use or usage of similar building size, type, or occupancy as well as abandoned structures or condemned

1  
2 buildings. The agency office must work with gas  
3 corporations operating or managing in the city in  
4 organized labor associations to share this  
5 information. The city would then submit a report  
6 every three years on how these risk factors were  
7 used to target the enforcement of laws and rules  
8 and how efficient the targeted enforcement was.  
9 Today... actions will help us catch the bad actors  
10 with people cutting corners to save a few dollars.  
11 If we can identify a cracked pipe or illegal hookup  
12 early perhaps we may prevent more tragedies. I  
13 would like to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito,  
14 Mathew... our Housing and Buildings Chair Council  
15 Member Williams, Michelle Lee, and our Legislative  
16 Division for all of their hard work in crafting  
17 these package of bills. Thank you.

18 CHAIR: Thank you. Introduction 1088A,  
19 Council Member Espinal.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Good afternoon  
21 everyone. Thank you Madam Speaker for allowing me  
22 to say a few words on Intro number 1088, a bill I  
23 sponsored that would require building owners to  
24 perform periodic inspections of their gas piping  
25 systems. Quite frankly I found it troubling that



1  
2 city currently requires periodic inspections on  
3 various types of systems including boilers,  
4 elevators, water recycling systems, and sprinklers  
5 yet these periodic inspections are not required for  
6 gas piping systems. To me that doesn't make any  
7 sense. Especially since a malfunctioning gas pipe  
8 can result in a potentially dangerous and quite  
9 possibly deadly situation. In order to ensure that  
10 gas piping are safe beginning on January 1<sup>st</sup> 2019  
11 Intro 1088 would require that gas piping systems be  
12 periodically inspected by a licensed master plumber  
13 at least once every five years, require that the  
14 inspection entity to provide the owner with an  
15 inspection report require that the local utility  
16 company as well as Department of Buildings be  
17 notified that an inspection was completed and  
18 require the inspection entity to immediately notify  
19 the building owner, the local utility, and the  
20 Department of Buildings of a potentially hazardous  
21 situation is found and then requires the building  
22 owner to immediately take action to correct the  
23 problem. By enacting this legislation, we will  
24 ensure that gas piping systems throughout the city  
25 are functioning properly, not corroded, or damaged

1  
2 and performing on an optimal safety level to keep  
3 New Yorkers safe. I would like to thank the Housing  
4 and Buildings Committee Chair Jumaane Williams for  
5 all his work and his committee counsel for all the  
6 long hours and late nights she had to endure over  
7 the past couple of months or making provisions to  
8 these bills. I'd also like to thank all the  
9 stakeholders that gave input to improve this  
10 legislation and assure its passage. Finally, I  
11 would like to thank again Chair Williams and the  
12 speaker for helping move these bills along. Thank  
13 you.

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
15 Council Member. Intro 1098A, Council Member Ydanis  
16 Rodriguez.

17 [background comments]

18 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: ...say at the  
19 time of the East Harlem explosion which... kill eight  
20 of our working New Yorkers and injuring dozens more  
21 that we needed to take serious look at our aging  
22 infrastructure to prevent this tragedies. We are  
23 moving in that direction today with this package.  
24 Intro 1098-A will require our utility companies and  
25 relevant agency to report annually on the state of

1  
2 their assets. They will also be required to meet  
3 with the city on a annual basis to discuss this  
4 report and work through any outstanding and  
5 potentially life threatening issues. This  
6 legislation will give us as a city better ideas or  
7 where key infrastructure lies and what conditions  
8 it is in so that we can best prepare with  
9 replacement or repairs before the situation becomes  
10 dangerous. Thank you Speaker and, and all the staff  
11 who work in this bill.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [speaking  
13 Spanish] Introduction 1101 1102 are both sponsored  
14 by Council Member Williams.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: First I want  
16 to thank the Speaker for her leadership in getting  
17 this package of legislation through. It was  
18 introduced in April and of course the speaker had  
19 personally experienced with this type of tragedy.  
20 And I hope that the city actually sees what  
21 happened here, the time and the deliberation that  
22 was taken, not to rush through packages for  
23 political expediency or to work with people on the  
24 ground to actually make sure that the ideas that we  
25 have were practicable. So this packet of

1  
2 legislation I think represents the very best of  
3 what government does in times of tragedy. I have...  
4 so the bills are, are part of the package. The aim  
5 is of the 10 bills is to improve gas safety by  
6 requiring inspection of gas piping systems, annual  
7 reports on the state of gas... the city and the  
8 natural gas... housing units. The package also calls  
9 for building owners to notify tenants and  
10 procedures that should take place during a gas  
11 leak. My, the two bills that I have sponsored,  
12 Intro 1101 co-sponsored by Council Members Palma  
13 and Richards allow for a temporary waiver of fines  
14 for improper fueling gas piping, alterations,  
15 installations, establish a temporary fuel gas  
16 violation resolution program and Intro 1102 co-  
17 sponsored by myself Council Member Richards,  
18 Levine, Cabrera, and Palma designates violations of  
19 existing law regarding gas piping as immediately  
20 hazardous. Again, I want to thank the speaker. I  
21 want to thank Laura Popa [sp?], Matt Goab [sp?],  
22 Jeff Baker, Ed Atkin, Jen Wilcox, Megan Chin,  
23 Guillermo Patino, Jose Conde, and Nick Smith my  
24 Deputy Chief of Staff. Thank you.

1  
2                   SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
3 Council Member. Introduction 1090A, Council Member  
4 Gibson.

5                   COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you very  
6 much Madam Speaker and good afternoon to all of my  
7 colleagues. Truly we continue to mourn the lives of  
8 those New Yorkers that we lost in some of the  
9 recent gas explosions that we had in our city in  
10 the east village and in east Harlem and certainly  
11 the explosion in the Bronx. I am proud to join with  
12 our speaker and all of my colleagues in really  
13 putting forth this very comprehensive package of  
14 legislation. Truly every New Yorker should know how  
15 to report a gas leak. As we work to update our  
16 city's infrastructure it's very imperative that we  
17 work with all partners at every level of government  
18 and within our community to prevent future gas  
19 related explosions. I am proud to sponsor Intro  
20 1090A, a bill that will require landlords to  
21 clearly communicate the procedure for reporting gas  
22 leaks to their tenants both by clearly posting  
23 directions to call 9-1-1 and the relevant gas  
24 service provider in the building lobbies and  
25 including those instructions in every lease. Gas

1  
2 leaks are an infrastructure issue, a housing issue,  
3 a health issue, and a public safety issue. I truly  
4 want to recognize and urge all New Yorkers to stay  
5 vigilant for the signs of any gas leak or, and  
6 illegal gas hookup and to protect themselves and  
7 their fellow neighbors by taking potential gas  
8 leaks very seriously. If you smell something  
9 suspicious, take it seriously, leave your building,  
10 call 9-1-1 and your gas service provider. Intro  
11 1090A is part of a very comprehensive package of  
12 legislation that aggressively takes steps and  
13 measures to protect all New Yorkers against gas  
14 explosions. And I want to thank our speaker Melissa  
15 Mark-Viverito. Not only was this something deeply  
16 personal to our speaker but certainly personal to  
17 every New Yorker that was affected by this. I thank  
18 all of the legislative staff for their hard work  
19 during the last several months in preparing these  
20 bills. I want to thank Laura Popa, Matt Goual  
21 [phonetic], Rachel Coderro [sp?], Jennifer Wilcox,  
22 and Guillermo Patino. Thank you once again Madam  
23 Speaker. Certainly want to recognize our Housing  
24 and Buildings Chair Council Member Jumaane Williams  
25 for leading the council and leading the hearing on

1  
2 this very important issue and our collective  
3 efforts overall to protect the safety of every New  
4 Yorker across the city. I'm very proud of this bill  
5 and urge all of my colleagues to vote on these  
6 measures today. Thank you once again Madam Speaker.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

8 Introduction 1093A is sponsored by Council Member  
9 Mendez.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you Madam  
11 Speaker. I assure you and your community just like  
12 my community and I are still mourning the losses in  
13 East Harlem and the east village. And it's a stark  
14 reminder when I walk by there every day to see  
15 those empty buildings and to see the lives that we,  
16 that we lost. Intro 1093 would require gas service  
17 operators and business owners to notify the  
18 Department of Buildings within 24 hours when gas  
19 service to a building is shut off or not restored  
20 based on safety conditions. This bill coupled with  
21 all the other bills that my colleagues have  
22 introduced today will make New York City a safer  
23 city and it will ensure that agencies are receiving  
24 information in real time and that will go a long  
25

1  
2 way to preventing future disasters. Thank you very  
3 much Madam Speaker.

4 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
5 Council Member. And last but not least 1100A,  
6 Council Member Vacca.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: My legislation  
8 provides that upon the development of the needed  
9 technology that we're now awaiting that multiple  
10 dwellings would be required to have gas detectors.  
11 I think these smoke detectors and carbon monoxide  
12 detectors have served our city well, saved a lot of  
13 lives over the years. But now we know we have an  
14 issue with gas as well. We have a city  
15 infrastructure which is aging and in many parts of  
16 our city is very, very old. So how do we protect  
17 our citizenry best? Well having gas protectors is  
18 the answer. Well right now this very issue is being  
19 refined and it's being exacted and, and so much as  
20 what type of detector would be best but my  
21 legislation provides for this requirement in  
22 multiple dwellings once we do so. And I would urge  
23 the members to vote aye.

24 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
25 Council Member. Last but not least before I finish



1  
2 communication with the speaker one of the races  
3 that was happening last week, it was the assembly  
4 race of which Inez Dickens won in her district.

5 [applause]

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We'll be doing a  
7 proper send off but obviously that means at the end  
8 of this year she will be finishing early obviously  
9 her term as Council Member and moving on to the  
10 assembly so congratulations Inez. And we'll, we'll  
11 be talking more about that but I at least wanted to  
12 let everybody know. So congratulations for your  
13 victory. And that ends Communication with the  
14 Speaker.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations  
16 Council Member Dickens and congratulations Council  
17 Member Joe Morelli. Discussion of General Orders.  
18 Seeing none. Report of Special Committees?

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: None. No report of  
20 Special Committees ma'am. On the reports of...

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of  
22 Standing Committees?

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the  
24 Committee on Finance Preconsidered Reso 1275,  
25 organization of funding.

1  
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Hold on a  
3 second. I'm looking at Resolution. This one. Report  
4 of the Committee on Finance. Coupled on general  
5 orders.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Preconsidered LU520  
7 and Reso 1276 and LU521 and Reso 1277.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on  
9 general orders.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the  
11 Committee on Fire and Criminal Justice Services,  
12 Intro 1228B, Department of Correction report.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
14 coupled on general orders.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the  
16 Committee on Higher Education, Intro 1138A, CUNY  
17 taskforce.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
19 coupled on general orders.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the  
21 Committee on Housing and Buildings, Intro 738A  
22 qualification for gas work.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
24 coupled on general orders.

1  
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1079A, final  
3 inspections of the gas piping systems.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
5 coupled on general orders.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1088A, gas  
7 piping systems.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
9 coupled on general orders.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1090A, tenant  
11 procedures when a gas leak is suspected.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
13 coupled on general orders.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1093A, gas  
15 service, shut off notifications.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
17 coupled on general orders.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1094A, gas  
19 related violations.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
21 coupled on general orders.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1098A, gas  
23 infrastructure reports.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
25 coupled on general orders.

1  
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1100A, standard  
3 for natural gas detectors.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
5 coupled on general orders.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1101, gas piping  
7 penalties for...

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on  
9 general orders.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro 1102 gas piping  
11 violations.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on  
13 general orders.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the  
15 Committee on Land Use LU 472 to 474 Flatbush Avenue  
16 extension.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Approved with  
18 the modifications and referred to the city planning  
19 commission pursuant to rule 11.70B of the rules of  
20 the council and section 197D of the New York City  
21 Charter.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU495 and 496  
23 Concourse Village West.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Approved with  
25 modifications and referred to the city planning

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

commission pursuant to rule 11.70B of the rules of the council and section 197D of the New York City Charter.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU497 through LU500 Second Farms neighborhood.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Approved with modifications and referred to the city planning commission pursuant to rule 11.70B of the rules of the Council and Section 197D of the New York City Charter.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU501 and Reso 1278 UDAP Queens.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU505 and Reso 1279 Maritime Lease.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on general orders.

COMMITTEE CLERK: LU513 and Reso 1280 and LU514 and Reso 1281 property transfers.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on general orders.

1  
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Report of the  
3 Committee on Transportation. Intro 1124A, electric  
4 vehicle pilot program.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amended and  
6 coupled on general orders.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: On the general order  
8 calendar LU472 and Reso 1282 through LU474 and Reso  
9 1284, Flatbush Avenue extension.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on  
11 general orders.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: LU495 and Reso 1285  
13 and 496 and Reso 1286 Concourse Village West.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on  
15 general orders.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Resolution appointing  
17 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Coupled on  
19 general orders. And at this time I ask for a full  
20 roll call on all items on the coupled general order  
21 calendar.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
24 chambers.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I... I would  
3 like to ask permission to vote on all general  
4 order.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I vote aye with  
10 the exception 472 and 474.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Borelli.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cabrera.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Chin.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Aye on all.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic] Aye.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Constantinides.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Aye on  
21 all.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cornegy.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cumbo.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Deutsch.

COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Dromm.

COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: [off  
mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: With  
congratulations to my colleagues I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson.

COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Greenfield.

COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: I want to  
thank Council Member Constantinides for making it  
easier to drive my car. And I want to congratulate



1  
2 Council Member Levin on a outstanding job at 141  
3 Willoughby and with that I vote aye on all.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Grodenchik.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: [off mic]

6 Aye.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Johnson.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye on all.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lancman.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LAN  
COUNCIL MEMBER AN:

15 [off mic] Aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic] Aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye on all. And

20 thank you to all my colleagues.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Levine.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

23 COMMITTEE CLERK: Maisel.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Yes.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Menchaca.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Miller.

COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I'd like to congratulate all of my colleagues. In particular, Council Member Constantinides on Intro 1124 and which was, I had inadvertently voted in the negative in the committee hearing and I whole heartedly support it so I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Palma.

COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Congrats to Council Member Levin and Salamanca and with that I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rosenthal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Salamanca.

COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [off mic] Aye on  
all...

COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: With  
congratulations to Consta Constantinides and all my  
colleagues I vote aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Ulrich.

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vallone.

COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Happy  
Thanksgiving to everyone and to your families and  
aye on all.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Abstaining on  
Land Use items 472, 473, and 474. Aye on all the  
rest.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Wills.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Matteo.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] Aye.

Thank you. Okay. All items on today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote of 49 in the affirmative, zero negative and zero abstentions with the exception of Land Use 472 and Resolution 1282 which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, one negative, and one abstention. And Land Use 474 and Resolution 1284 which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, one negative, and one abstention and Land Use 473 and Resolution 1283 which was adopted by a vote of 48 in the affirmative, zero negative, and one abstention. Introduction and reading of bills.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All bills are referred to committees as indicated on the agenda.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Seeing no discussions, no resolutions, we're going to immediately go into general discussion leading off with Council Member Johnson. We are still in session.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you Madam Public Advocate. This week has been a very

1  
2 difficult week for many of us in New York and  
3 across the country. Many of us are devastated,  
4 reeling, heart broken, and scared but I know that I  
5 have never felt more certain about the need for all  
6 of us to lead. We cannot allow Trump-ism  
7 [phonetic], misogyny, racism, xenophobia, and the  
8 debasing of fundamental democratic institutions to  
9 be legitimized. Democrats and republicans of good  
10 conscience must not stand by and let the values  
11 that the President Elect stood for to be validated  
12 in any way. We can respect the election results  
13 while not respecting what is taking hold. We as New  
14 Yorkers must be united and stand in solidarity with  
15 congressional democrats as they try to block the  
16 worst of it. We must not fight with each other  
17 right now or be divided. And we as elected  
18 officials and New Yorkers must stand with  
19 vulnerable communities, Muslims, poor people,  
20 immigrants, women, people of color, LGBT people,  
21 and people of Jewish faith and let them know that  
22 we will fight together and work to protect each  
23 other during the rough storm that lies ahead. I  
24 want to tell all New Yorkers that may be listening.  
25 Remember how you feel right now. Do not forget this

1  
2 feeling. We have to immediately turn our anxiety  
3 into action. Complacency is not an option. Let all  
4 New Yorkers become activists, participants in our  
5 democracy. Let's roll up our sleeves, be strategic  
6 and methodical, inspire people to join the fight,  
7 change hearts and minds, organize like hell, and  
8 plan for the future. The one silver lining that I  
9 can find from this election is that maybe more  
10 people will get involved and stay involved. I'll  
11 finish with this Madam Public Advocate. This  
12 session I have been honored to work with my  
13 colleagues on the great economic and social  
14 challenges of our day. Now more than ever we need  
15 to continue on a path of fairness and decency. This  
16 is difficult work.

17 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Council Member.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: But for the  
19 sake of many of New Yorkers we must continue to  
20 lead. The fight goes on. Thank you.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.  
22 Council Member Cornegy.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you Madam  
24 Public Advocate. I'd like to speak on two intros I  
25 have today very quickly. The first one is far too

1  
2 long we've ignored a segment of our population that  
3 needs us the most. The average daily population at  
4 Ryker's Island is approximately 10,000 inmates many  
5 of whom will never be convicted of a crime or who  
6 are either awaiting trial or cannot afford bail.  
7 These are our fathers, sons, mothers, and daughters  
8 who are exposed to bodily harm and mental trauma  
9 while waiting for the system to respond. Intro 1398  
10 will require the Department of Correction to  
11 provide vocational and educational training to  
12 inmates incarcerated for more than 30 days. If we  
13 truly care about rehabilitation, reducing the rates  
14 of recidivism, and ending mass incarceration then  
15 we need to stop treating inmates as numbers and  
16 start treating them as citizens. If a mind truly is  
17 a terrible thing to waste then we must take a stand  
18 now and stop setting our citizens up for failure  
19 when they have not even been convicted of a crime.  
20 For this reason, I urge my colleagues to sign onto  
21 Intro 1348 and focus our attention on those  
22 citizens who have fallen through the cracks and  
23 require our advocacy and support. Truly right now  
24 if you are, if you only receive services on Ryker's  
25 Island if you are actually sentenced to a crime,

1  
2 not if you're a detainee. However, we have  
3 detainees who have been on Ryker's Island for two  
4 years and sometimes three years and services need  
5 to be provided within a 30-day window. So, that's  
6 what I'm asking. And then I just have another Intro  
7 asking that the gifted and talented registration  
8 for the exam be included in the Universal Pre-K  
9 package. I'm asking all of my colleagues to sign  
10 onto both of those as they will move the city  
11 forward in the direction that we'd like to see it  
12 go. The second, is Intro 1347. Thank you.

13 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.  
14 Reverend Council Member Cabrera.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so  
16 much Madam Public Advocate. Good afternoon. Today  
17 I'm introducing along with Council Member Palma,  
18 Reso 1273 calling up on the New York state  
19 legislature, later to pass and the governor to  
20 sign A5982 S6384 which will prohibit employers from  
21 seeking salary history from perspective employees  
22 for an interview or as a condition of employment.  
23 The 2014 American Community Survey known as the ACS  
24 reported that woman of color are disproportionately  
25 hurt by the gender pay gap. Hispanic, African



1  
2 American nation woman experience a 54, 45, and 37  
3 wage gap respectively compared to white men in New  
4 York City. The 2000, 2014 ACS also found that woman  
5 with college and post graduate degrees in New York  
6 City experience a gender gap, wage gap of 16 and 20  
7 percent respectively. And I commend our public  
8 advocate for introducing Intro 1253 to prohibit  
9 employers from seeking a job applicant salary  
10 history which was introduced in August of 2016.  
11 We're introducing this resolution because the need  
12 to prohibit salary history inquiries extend beyond  
13 New York City. We appreciate your support for this  
14 reso. Thank you so much.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you so  
16 much. Council Member Richards.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you  
18 Madam Public Advocate. Dear colleagues I would like  
19 to call your attention to a piece of legislation  
20 Council Member Rose and I are introducing today.  
21 Too many of our nursing homes across the city are  
22 in an unacceptable state. And far too often these  
23 operators who are caring for our vulnerable seniors  
24 allow health and safety violations to persist at  
25 the risk of their residents. We must do more to

1  
2 ensure that these operators are not allowed to  
3 expand their facilities without securing the safety  
4 of our seniors under their care first. This is why  
5 once again I'm introducing 1360 with Council Member  
6 Rose in relation to denying building permits where  
7 a nursing home has an excessive number of  
8 citations. This bill will ensure that nursing home  
9 operators are not allowed to expand their  
10 facilities and benefits when they are consistently  
11 receiving health and safety citations from the  
12 Department of Health. I urge our colleagues to  
13 please join us in support of this legislation.  
14 Thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
16 Mealy. Council Member Mealy.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I want to salute  
18 all my colleagues. And one thing I want everyone to  
19 note November 17<sup>th</sup> is March... awareness prematurity  
20 is live and direct. We have some... some people right  
21 here in this room who was a premature baby and now  
22 weighing 150 some, 300... just... No, just be aware... I  
23 hope everyone knows this is... wear, go purple this  
24 month for prematurity. Thank you. March...

25

1  
2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
3 Mendez.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you Madam  
5 Public Advocate. Today I rise because we lost a  
6 lower east side hero.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Today I rise to  
9 think about one of our lower east side (S)heroes  
10 was an activist and a gardener and she died at the  
11 age of 94 on Saturday surrounded by her family.  
12 Carmen migrated to New York City in 1946. She  
13 originally came to New York and lived in the Bronx  
14 and worked in a factory a few years later. She  
15 moved to Manhattan and in 19... 1955 she moved into  
16 NYCHA's Lillian Walt Houses where she lived until a  
17 few days prior to her death. She was a humanitarian  
18 and was finally referred to as the Madrinna of... She  
19 volunteered to many not-for-profit organizations,  
20 served on the Board of Housing Works. And she was  
21 one of many people who started the garden movement  
22 in our community. In 2000 as a result of then Mayor  
23 Julianne selling off all of our community gardens  
24 she lost her garden. We got it back through Council  
25 Member, then Council Member Margarita Lopez in a

1  
2 Land Use hearing. It's taken several decades and  
3 some legal hurdles but on October 26<sup>th</sup> we reopened  
4 the garden. We renamed it after her now known as  
5 Carmen Pabon el Amanecer Garden and she was there  
6 to cut the ribbon. So, thank you Carmen for  
7 everything you have done in our community. I will  
8 miss you. All of lower East Side I will miss you.  
9 [speaking foreign language] Thank you.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 Council Member Williams. Council Member Williams I  
12 know you're going to join us in the March of dimes  
13 march to protect premature babies. The clock is  
14 running.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: No it's not...  
16 oh... Alright, I got some serious stuff so hold on.  
17 While I want the country to succeed I do not want  
18 Donald Trump to succeed unless he changes his core  
19 themes. I hope he fails. You can't compare these  
20 words to words to our position of Obama or even  
21 protest to a possible Clinton Sanders presidency. I  
22 will not equalize the legitimacy of policy  
23 differences with government sanctioned xenophobia,  
24 misogyny, racism, and religion bias. The Klu Klux  
25 Klan endorsed this man. The American Nazi Party

1  
2 said it was a wonderful candidacy. The KKK is  
3 trying to have a parade in his honor as we speak.  
4 If you don't understand the angst amongst so many  
5 of us and I congrat, and you refuse you to even try  
6 I congratulate you on the privilege that allow you  
7 that option. History however thankfully is on our  
8 side. The people who... across this country have lost  
9 every single time. Every time that kind of speech  
10 was spoken they have lost. They have won some  
11 battles but the... the universe is long and bends  
12 toward justice. History shines brightest on those  
13 who swim amongst, who swim back against the  
14 strongest tide. Hopefully that will be us. And to  
15 all the protesters who are out there I stand with  
16 you from here. I know they want people speaking up  
17 for them. I'd like to do that at the risk of losing  
18 some votes possibly there is a song that has given  
19 me a lot of hope every single day when I press  
20 play.

21 [singing]  
22 And I rise up  
23 I rise like the day  
24 I rise up.  
25 I rise unafraid.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

I rise up.  
And I do it a thousand times again.  
And I rise up  
High like the waves.  
I rise up.  
In spite of the ache I rise up.  
And I do it a thousand times again.

[singing]

[applause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

as the days get dark the stars get brighter and you  
certainly are a star. Congratulations on your... on  
your award last night. Council Member Williams  
received the award for New Yorkers Against Gun  
Violence. Another round of applause.

[applause]

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member

Barron are you going to sing?

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

Before I say what I had intended to say Madam  
Public Advocate and to my colleagues I would ask  
that we not engage in any form of put down of  
colleagues as they offer their comments in this  
body. In terms of my comments first congratulations

1  
2 and best wishes to Assembly Member Elect Inez  
3 Dickens. I wish you all the best. Yes, Charles is  
4 getting an ally coming up. And I wish you all the  
5 best as you go there. And what I did want to do is  
6 just acknowledge the life and contributions of Gwen  
7 Ifill who was a pioneer who overcame numerous  
8 obstacles including racism and sexism in  
9 journalism. She was known for her intellect and  
10 keen questioning ability. She spent four decades  
11 maintaining an exemplary standard of rigorous  
12 journalism. She moderated presidential primary and  
13 vice presidential debates. She was a news anchor  
14 and the co-anchor of the PBS program, columnist,  
15 and a... columnist in newspapers. News, our co-anchor  
16 Judy Woodruff's Call Ms. Ifill a consummate  
17 communicator who exuded the rare combination of  
18 authority and warmth. She displayed the authority  
19 for people who believe you and have credibility.  
20 She didn't mind telling anyone when she thought  
21 they were wrong on camera. She kept it respectful  
22 and she was one of the most graceful interrupters I  
23 have ever seen. So, I just wanted us to call  
24 attention to the great contributions that we made,  
25

1  
2 that she made, she passed earlier this week. Thank  
3 you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: May she rest in  
5 peace. Council Member Crowley for a vote.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I vote aye.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And Council  
8 Member Cumbo I believe you wanted to change your  
9 vote.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I  
11 wanted to change my vote to abstaining on 472 as  
12 well as 474 and I want to continue with my  
13 comments. Throughout the Obama administration our  
14 Commander in Chief and First Lady had been met with  
15 unprecedented racism, acts of hatred, and other  
16 disrespect. Pamela Ramsey Taylor the Director of  
17 the Clay County Department Court posted on social  
18 media quote, unquote it will be so refreshing to  
19 have a classy, beautiful, dignified first lady back  
20 in the white house. I'm tired of seeing an ape in  
21 heels. Beverly Wailing the Mayor seemingly approved  
22 the Facebook post by saying you made my day. Though  
23 Taylor was placed on leave and the mayor ultimately  
24 resigned after an online petition was signed by  
25 more than 175,000 people we are constantly reminded



1  
2 that racism is alive and well in our nation.  
3 Despite the jeers and comparison to animals the  
4 first family had always risen above these acts  
5 meant to tarnish their incredible legacy. First  
6 Lady Michelle Obama has been the epitome of  
7 integrity, elegance, grace, and humility. As a  
8 devoted wife and mother she has been an inspiration  
9 to girls across the country and around the world.  
10 The first lady to hold two graduate degrees from  
11 world class institutions. When they go low we go  
12 high as our first lady has said. Today I salute  
13 Michelle Obama, our first lady for being a shining  
14 example to all of us each and every day. And this  
15 reminds all of us that when acts of hate that are  
16 going to continue to rear their ugly head we must  
17 speak up. We must organize. And we must continue  
18 condemn those who put forth such rhetoric and hate.  
19 Secondly, on Monday Stephen K Bannon was appointed  
20 a street, chief strategist and he has been accused  
21 President Obama of importing more hating Muslims.  
22 He has compared Planned Parenthood's work to the  
23 holocaust. He has advised female victims of online  
24 harassment to just quote unquote log off and stop  
25 screwing up the internet for men. Public concern

1  
2 that he will bring anti-Semitic nationalist and  
3 racist views to the west wing. In 2010, in closing,  
4 in an interview he said fear is a good thing. Fear  
5 is going to lead you to take action. I want to  
6 bring more attention to all of my colleagues to  
7 remain, continue to remain vigilant, continue to  
8 speak up, and continue to make sure that those that  
9 attack us as well as our community and our first  
10 lady and President Obama that we continue to raise  
11 our voices. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank  
13 you Council Member. All items on today's general  
14 order calendar were adopted by a vote of 50 in the  
15 affirmative and zero negative and zero abstentions  
16 with the exception of Land Use 472 and resolution  
17 1282 which has been revised which was adopted by a  
18 vote of 47 in the affirmative, one negative, and  
19 two abstentions and Land Use 474 and resolution  
20 1284 which was, which is an amended vote of 47 in  
21 the affirmative, one negative, and two abstentions  
22 and an amended vote of Land Use 473 and resolution  
23 1283 which was adopted by a vote of 49 in the  
24 affirmative, zero negative, and, and one  
25

1  
2 abstention. And now returning back to general  
3 discussion. Council Member Rose.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. My  
5 colleagues I rise to ask you the support. Intro  
6 1360 which I am co, co-sponsoring with COUNCIL  
7 MEMBER Richards and to reiterate this legislation  
8 when enacted will deny building permits when a  
9 nursing home has an excessive number of citations.  
10 While the state regulates nursing homes the city  
11 has the power with respect to issuing permits for  
12 expansions. It is important that we carefully and  
13 thoughtfully exercise that power in transactions  
14 that will impact vulnerable populations such as our  
15 seniors and nursing homes some of whom are living  
16 in deplorable conditions in buildings with multiple  
17 and repeated health and safety code violations. I  
18 hope that you will join me and Council Member  
19 Richards in protecting our seniors by supporting  
20 this bill. Thank you.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
22 Council Member Lander.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam  
24 Public Advocate. I stood back up for the pledge of  
25 allegiance at our council meeting today, at several

1  
2 meetings earlier this year I remained seated out of  
3 solidarity with our colleague Jumaane Williams in  
4 light of the racist hate mail that he received and  
5 with Black Lives Matter. At the time, I said I  
6 would stand back up after the election regardless  
7 of who won. At the time, of course, I imagined a  
8 different result but I am standing back up again  
9 because my love of our country is far greater than  
10 my contempt for our president elect. Remaining  
11 seated was an act of patriotism and boy is standing  
12 back up is as well. In the... in the days ahead and  
13 unfortunately the months and years as many of us  
14 engage in fierce resistance to actions by the Trump  
15 administration that harm the people and the values,  
16 the American values that we care about I hope we do  
17 it from a place of deep patriotism and commitment  
18 to those values that we are all created equal that  
19 are embedded in our flag and our pledge. I was  
20 reminded in thinking about the agitation that will  
21 be required of Fredrick Douglas; born a slave,  
22 tried to escape twice before making it. Faced  
23 problems harder than certainly we, and we do. He  
24 began his activism seeing the constitution as a  
25 vehicle of oppression and slavery but over time

1  
2 through struggle and action he came to view it  
3 differently and called it a glorious liberty  
4 document and that's what it is. So for those who've  
5 criticized our actions and who believe that one  
6 must always stand for the pledge I just hope that  
7 in the months and years to come you focus on its  
8 final words 'with liberty and justice for all'. Are  
9 we living up to those words for immigrants and  
10 refugees, for Muslims, for LGBTQ Americans and for  
11 so many others I sure hope so. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
13 Levin.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you Madam  
15 Public Advocate. Today I want to call my  
16 colleague's attention to two bills that I'm  
17 sponsoring with Council Member Jumaane Williams  
18 that would require HPD to audit properties where  
19 developers benefit from 421A tax credits to  
20 determine whether they have met the obligations to  
21 provide affordable housing or rent stabilized units  
22 and filed timely accurate qualifying paperwork.  
23 Properties found failing to be reporting the NYC  
24 council and Department of Finance will be, will be  
25 sending those for revocation of those tax benefits.

1  
2 The city must protect and preserve the affordable  
3 and rent stabilized apartments guaranteed under the  
4 existing 421A. Changing subjects I wanted to  
5 follow-up on what Council Member Barron said. I  
6 was... my heart sank when I heard on, on Monday the  
7 passing of Gwen Ifill because now more than ever we  
8 need strong journalists, the fourth estate to hold  
9 our elected officials to account now more than  
10 ever. And so I was very, very sad to hear of her  
11 passing because she did that so exemplary, in such  
12 an exemplarily fashion for her entire career. Also,  
13 I want to acknowledge that like many Americans  
14 across the country I have been appalled to hear of  
15 the news of recent rise of violence and hate in the  
16 wake of the presidential election. In the light of  
17 these troubling events it is clear the pursuit of a  
18 more perfect union is far from over. However, until  
19 this weekend I did not believe that such violence  
20 could find its way into our neighborhoods. On  
21 Saturday night in my district after an election  
22 related argument a male Donald Trump supporter  
23 punched a woman in the... at a Boerum Hill  
24 restaurant. This violent act condemnable no matter  
25 where it occurred is particularly troubling

1  
2 considering a sharp contrast with our community  
3 values. We do not tolerate violence and we do not  
4 tolerate hate. We have seen a rise in the last  
5 week. Over 300 incidents across the country  
6 according to Southern... Law Center that's, that's  
7 about what we, they normally see every five to six  
8 months. We must stand up to this hate. We must call  
9 the incoming president to account and, and demand  
10 that he forcibly condemn these incidents  
11 unequivocally condemn these incidents and  
12 repeatedly condemn these incidents. And I, you can  
13 count on me to stand up to any type of hate and any  
14 type of bigotry whether it comes from the President  
15 of the United States anywhere in our city. Thank  
16 you.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
18 Greenfield.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you  
20 very much. Thank you to all my colleagues. And I  
21 certainly would like to add my hope and  
22 encouragement in support for the remarks that were  
23 made today in relation to the fact that we have  
24 seen an increase in hate and bigotry and certainly  
25 we, all of us in New York are committed to be a

1  
2 beacon of light for those around the country. And I  
3 think the message has gone out, and should continue  
4 to go out, that we in New York will continue to  
5 welcome everyone regardless of their background. I  
6 do just want to speak of some business as well. I  
7 am either introducing or co-priming seven pieces of  
8 legislation that have to do with common sense, good  
9 government, campaign finance reform. I'm looking to  
10 working together with the speaker Chair Maisel, my  
11 colleagues in the council on these package of bills  
12 that we're going to have a hearing on next Monday  
13 November 21<sup>st</sup> in the Standards and Ethics  
14 Committee. The package of legislation will cut  
15 through the regulatory red tape and provide clarity  
16 to candidates running for office. For example, the  
17 document reform legislation Intro 1355 will make it  
18 easier for the first time candidates are running  
19 for office by once and for all clarifying what  
20 documentation is required to receiving matching  
21 funds. And other legislation like that that will  
22 make it easier for first time candidates and will  
23 provide more transparency and consistency. And I'm  
24 excited to be sponsoring and cosponsoring quite a  
25 few of these pieces of legislation. And I just



1  
2 wanted to inform my colleagues and invite them that  
3 the council is going to have a wonderful, wonderful  
4 symposium at Brooklyn law school in December 2<sup>nd</sup>.  
5 The next 100 years of Brooklyn zoning we're going  
6 to have several colleagues on a panel speaking  
7 about the future of Brooklyn zoning including  
8 Council Members Espinal, Lander, Levin, Reynoso as  
9 well as an address by the Deputy Mayor Alisha Glenn  
10 and I encourage my colleagues and those watching at  
11 home to sign up for this event on the next 100  
12 years of Brooklyn zoning Friday December 2<sup>nd</sup> from  
13 9:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. at Brooklyn Law School. And  
14 I wish all of my colleagues and all of New York and  
15 all of America a very happy Thanksgiving.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. And  
17 our last speaker is Council Member Mendez.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you Madam  
19 Public Advocate. I wanted to give a shutout to my  
20 MSW intern who was in the rafters and apparently  
21 went back to the office to do works. IBM Risoto is  
22 from the... School of Social Work. And I'd also like  
23 to give a shutout to Jaz Manascu [sp?] who was a  
24 MSW intern in my office and is now a full-time  
25 staff person and it was her birthday last week.

1  
2 Happy birthday ladies and thank you for all the  
3 work you do for me and my district.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Happy holidays  
5 to everyone. And to close our Speaker Melissa Mark-  
6 Viverito.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I just want to  
8 thank all my colleagues for their words today.  
9 Obviously, there's a lot of work ahead of us. Got  
10 to stand united, defend our values, and continue  
11 to, to uphold them. So, thank you all. I look  
12 forward to that. And have a great afternoon. Happy  
13 Thanksgiving, yes.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: We stand  
15 adjourned.

16 [gavel]

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 7, 2016