

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

November 30, 2017  
Start: 2:09 p.m.  
Recess: 4:15 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE  
  
MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO  
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne Adams  
Inez D. Barron  
Joe Borelli  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
Andrew Cohen  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Robert E. Cornegy, Jr.  
Elizabeth S. Crowley  
Laurie A. Cumbo  
Chaim M. Deutsch  
Daniel Dromm  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Mathieu Eugene  
Julissa Ferreras-Copeland  
Daniel R. Garodnick  
Vincent J. Gentile

Vanessa L. Gibson  
David G. Greenfield  
Barry Grodenchik  
Corey D. Johnson  
Ben Kallos  
Andy L. King  
Peter A. Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Rory I. Lancman  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Alan N. Maisel  
Steven Matteo  
Darlene Mealy  
Carlos Menchaca  
Rosie Mendez  
I. Daneek Miller  
Annabel Palma  
Bill Perkins  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Deborah L. Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Rafael Salamanca  
Mark Treyger  
Eric A. Ulrich  
James Vacca  
Paul A. Vallone  
James G. Van Bramer  
Jumaane D. Williams

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Degenimos Charconia[phonetic]  
Executive Director  
Latino Commission on AIDS

Diana Wright and husband, Xavier Wright

Dr. Brown from P.S.109 and Students

Paul Egan and Bridgett Raines from UFT

Reverend Doctor Joshua Hollmann  
Pastor of Christ Lutheran Church  
3357 58<sup>th</sup> Street in Woodside Queens

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE SPEAKER: Assembly woman

MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: All right, I think we're gonna get started. We have two ceremonials today, if my colleagues want to come up and join us. We're gonna be first presenting to Latino Commission on AIDS. If we could have the representatives from the Latino Commission here, join us up here and the colleagues that are present that can join us to celebrate. So we have the executive director, Degenimos Charconia[phonetic] with us and some other representatives, all right. If Jalisa and other colleagues, can we get Dan come on up here. We don't want us to stand up here alone. [Laughter]

So obviously we're celebrating the Latino Commission on AIDS has been serving our city for many years and we want to celebrate them for their outstanding commitment to fight against HIV AIDS and for raising awareness about the disproportionate impacts that HIV and AIDS has on the Latino communities in particular, most recently they even built a strong partnership. They helped bring some representatives from the trans community in Cuba here to New York to do an exchange with members of the LGB

1 STATED MEETING

5

2 community here in New York and share experiences and  
3 the work that they do in Cuba and important the work  
4 that is done here and having a great exchange.  
5 They've been a great partner on so many different  
6 issues. I really appreciate them for that and for  
7 this reason we're honoring them this year and will  
8 honor them every year but they've been a strong  
9 partner with us in a lot of the initiatives that we  
10 do here in the City Council so would like to take a  
11 moment to really highlight that and share this  
12 proclamation with them so I'm gonna ask the Clerk to  
13 read the proclamation so we can all get an  
14 understanding of the extent of the work that they do  
15 each and every day.

16 CLERK: Council City of New York  
17 Proclamation. In observance of World AIDS Day, the  
18 Council of the City of New York is proud to honor the  
19 Latino Commission on AIDS for their outstanding  
20 commitment to the fight against HIV AIDS and for  
21 raising awareness about the disproportionate impact  
22 of the HIV AIDS public health crisis on Latino  
23 communities everywhere and whereas tragically more  
24 than 200,000 Latinos in the U. S. and Puerto Rico are  
25 living with HIV AIDS. Latinos are the fastest

1 STATED MEETING

6

2 growing ethnic group in America, now representing 17%  
3 of the U. S. population yet they account for nearly  
4 20% of AIDS cases. For Latinos living with HIV or  
5 AIDS and their loved ones, the challenges are often  
6 exacerbated not only by social stigma and poverty but  
7 compounded by language barriers, immigration  
8 statispheres and access to care, testing and  
9 increased infection rates. In 1990, Latino leaders  
10 came together to address the critical unmet need for  
11 HIV prevention and care in their community and to  
12 address its unique challenges by forming a coalition  
13 for collective action, the Latino Commission on AIDS;  
14 and

15 WHEREAS for the last three decades the  
16 Latino Commission on AIDS has spearheaded health  
17 advocacy promoting HIV education, developing model  
18 prevention programs for high-risk communities and  
19 building capacity and community service organization.  
20 In addition to these endeavors, the Latino Commission  
21 on AIDS has made tremendous progress by employing a  
22 very effective intersectional approach. Addressing  
23 the urgent need for better health care, education,  
24 employment, opportunities and housing while  
25 mitigating other disparities and advocating for LGBT

1 STATED MEETING

7

2 and immigrant rights, they recognized that winning  
3 the fight for true social and economic justice is  
4 essential to eliminating HIV and reaching an AIDS  
5 free generation at last; and

6 WHEREAS in this era when the President of  
7 our United States aspires to build walls, the Latino  
8 Commission on AIDS continues to strengthen the  
9 inextricable bond between our nation and others. In  
10 September 2017 in partnership with Council Speaker  
11 Michelle Mark-Viverito and the LGBT caucus, the  
12 members of the Latino Commission on Aids were crucial  
13 to bringing a delegation of Cuban LGBTQ leaders to  
14 New York City and helped facilitate a meaningful  
15 learning experience between us and our Cuban  
16 visitors; and

17 WHEREAS during the seven day program, the  
18 Latino Commission on AIDS helped guide the delegation  
19 of thirteen community based organizations and  
20 cultural institutions where they discussed how to  
21 work together to strengthen and protect the LGBTQ  
22 community. The delegation's visit culminated in a  
23 community summit at City Hall with two illuminating  
24 panels and in-depth conversations on building better  
25 bridges between the LGBTQ communities in New York and

1 STATED MEETING

8

2 Cuba between diligently fundraising to cover the  
3 expenses for the trip, to tirelessly [Inaudible] and  
4 translating for the delegation, this historic  
5 opportunity would not have been possible without the  
6 leadership of the Latino Commission on AIDS.

7 NOW THEREFORE BE IT KNOWN that as we  
8 observe World AIDS Day and reflect upon the thousands  
9 of men, women and children who lost their lives to  
10 AIDS, the New York City Council is forever grateful  
11 to the Latino Commission on AIDS for its  
12 extraordinarily heroic commitment and contributions  
13 to changing the trajectory of the epidemic. Melissa  
14 Mark-Viverito speaking for the entire Council; Rosie  
15 Mendez, Chair, LGBT Caucus, Council Member 2<sup>nd</sup>  
16 District, Manhattan; James Vacca, Council Member 13<sup>th</sup>  
17 District, the Bronx; Corey Johnson, Council Member,  
18 3<sup>rd</sup> District, Manhattan; Carlos Menchaca, Council  
19 Member, 38<sup>th</sup> District, Brooklyn; Jimmy Van Bramer,  
20 Majority Leader, 26<sup>th</sup> District, Queens; Ritchie  
21 Torres, Council Member, 15<sup>th</sup> District, the Bronx;  
22 Daniel Dromm, Council Member, 25<sup>th</sup> District, Queens.

23 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: All right. Thank  
24 you.

25 [Applause]



1 STATED MEETING

9

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Haviermo [phonetic]  
3 say a few words.

4 HAVIERMO: Thank you so much. On the  
5 eve of [Inaudible] that is going to be observed  
6 tomorrow, I ask all of us to also recognize the  
7 leadership of this City Council, the former mayor of  
8 our governor because we working to end the epidemic  
9 by 2020. We're right on track. Yesterday was  
10 released very promising data concerning about women  
11 but young, black and Latino gay men, but we gonna  
12 continue working together. We're extremely concerned  
13 about what is going on in Puerto Rico, the  
14 immigration. Don't forget that over 18,000 people  
15 are living with HIV in Puerto Rico and we need to  
16 respond and address their needs and we know that we  
17 have a strong partners in City Council. We love you  
18 forever and we will never give up until we reach our  
19 goals. It reach now three generations with stigma  
20 and phobia and transforming our communities. Mucha  
21 gracias.

22 [Applause and crosstalk]

23 [Pause]

24

25

1 STATED MEETING

10

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Wonderful. All  
3 right. We have an additional proclamation. Council  
4 Member Williams is honoring Diana Wright an educator  
5 for the last ten years and Teacher of the Year in  
6 2014 whose life story became the focus of a short  
7 file about her triumph after a near fatal car  
8 accident. I'm gonna hand it off to Council Member  
9 Williams.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you so  
11 much Madam Speaker. Very often people talk about  
12 what they might do if tragedy strikes them. You  
13 don't know until it happens and I think, I don't know  
14 if anybody can show the amount of grace and courage  
15 that Ms. Diana Wright has shown. As mentioned, she  
16 was awarded Teacher of the Year P.S. 109 in 2014 in  
17 my district. On June 30 of 2015, she lost a leg  
18 after a horrific car accident. She's battled back.  
19 She shows a role model to her students, many of which  
20 are here, her peers, her community. She wears her  
21 new leg not with shame, with a source of pride and  
22 inspiration for the kids. She uses it to give them  
23 inspiration. She was noticed by Dove and she has a  
24 video called "Me Diana" which was directed by Shonda  
25 Rhimes and it spreads a message to millions. This is

1 STATED MEETING

11

2 the least that we can do for Ms. Wright, someone of  
3 her importance. She is joined by her husband Xavier.  
4 We have Dr. Brown from P.S.109 with some students.  
5 Also Paul Egan and Bridgett Raines from UFT. Her  
6 story truly, and her sister as well as others, her  
7 story truly, truly is an inspiration and  
8 many of us can only hope to provide that source of  
9 pride in continuance with our lives if something  
10 happens so God bless you and thank you for giving us  
11 the opportunity to honor you.

12 [Applause]

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Will you please  
14 read the proclamation.

15 UNKNOWN WOMAN SPEAKER: Council, City of  
16 New York proclamation.

17 WHEREAS the Council of the City of New  
18 York is proud to honor Diana Wright for sharing her  
19 story of strength, confidence and resilience to  
20 inspire students and people of all ages; and

21 WHEREAS when Mathine[phonetic] and Ida  
22 Rodriguez welcomed their daughter into the world,  
23 they named her Diana after Wonder Woman. Diana  
24 Wright has been accustomed to living up to her  
25 namesake ever since. After attending New York City

1 STATED MEETING

12

2 public schools, she earned her bachelor's degree from  
3 Suneo [Inaudible] and her master's degree from The  
4 College of Mt. Saint Vincent, then return to Gotham  
5 to be one of our true contemporary super heroes, a  
6 New York City public school teacher; and

7 WHEREAS in addition to being a wife, a  
8 devoted mother of two little girls and an athlete,  
9 Diana Wright has excelled as an educator for the last  
10 ten years. In 2014 she was named Teacher of the Year  
11 at P.S./I.S. 109 in East Flatbush. Before long,  
12 however, she would be tested physically, mentally and  
13 spiritually; and

14 WHEREAS just days after school let out  
15 for summer vacation, Ms. Wright was involved in a  
16 horrific accident that left her unconscious in Kings  
17 County Intensive Care Unit. When she awoke she  
18 learned that she had lost her left leg above the  
19 knee. With the love and support of family and  
20 friends, clergy and colleagues, she persisted.  
21 Slowly but surely she regained enough strength and  
22 balance to allow her to return to work ahead of  
23 schedule by December 2014. Drawing on her faith and  
24 her commitment to her family she wanted more; and

25

1 STATED MEETING

13

2 WHEREAS Ms. Wright resolved to reclaim  
3 her independence and recover the physical strength  
4 and endurance she needed to keep up with her eight  
5 and seven year old daughters, remembering the  
6 resilience of her students and the relentless work  
7 ethic of her father who supported a family of seven,  
8 she was determined to balance on her new prosthetic  
9 leg and regain the ability to walk, lift weights and  
10 juggle the very demanding responsibilities of wife,  
11 mother and full-time employee of the New York City  
12 Department of Education; and

13 WHEREAS Ms. Wright's unwavering  
14 confidence and commitment soon garnered the attention  
15 of T.V. titan Shonda Rhimes who produced a short film  
16 about her triumph over the near fatal accident. The  
17 short film called "Meet Diana" was distributed on-  
18 line for Dove's Real Beauty campaign and it continues  
19 to be widely shared today. On YouTube alone,  
20 Ms. Wright's story has already inspired more than two  
21 million people; and

22 WHEREAS Ms. Wright has constantly told  
23 her students, strength and growth come only through  
24 continuous effort in spite of the struggle. Today as

25

1 STATED MEETING

14

2 she imbibes that message, she is teaching people of  
3 all ages around the world.

4 NOW THEREFORE BE IT KNOWN that the City  
5 of New York, sorry, that the New York City Council  
6 gratefully honors Diana Wright for sharing her  
7 extraordinary story inspiring millions to persevere.  
8 Melissa Mark-Viverito speaker for the entire Council,  
9 Jumaane D. Williams, council member 45<sup>th</sup> District,  
10 Brooklyn, Matthew Eugene, council member 40<sup>th</sup>  
11 District, Brooklyn.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, please  
13 give her another round of applause.

14 [Applause]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And we're gonna  
16 allow her, allow her the opportunity to speak and I  
17 hope everyone takes pride and particularly the young  
18 ladies. We don't have enough women in this council  
19 and so I hope some of the inspiration that she brings  
20 allows you to do further, better things, maybe join  
21 us here on the council one day.

22 DIANA WRIGHT: Hi, good afternoon  
23 everyone. I just want to say thank you to Councilman  
24 Jumaane Williams for this recognition, this honor. I  
25 am so appreciative for this. I just want to thank so

1 STATED MEETING

15

2 many more people that have been with me throughout  
3 this entire journey, my immediate family, my husband,  
4 my daughters, my students, my administrators,  
5 supervisors, a very supportive group of people and my  
6 church family. I mean, the list goes on. I'm here  
7 today because of their encouraging words because of  
8 their support and their understanding. I set goals  
9 and they support me on my vision and I accomplish  
10 them one step at a time. Thank you.

11 [Applause]

12 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Well thank you so  
13 much for joining us here and all these students. You  
14 have a lot of love around you but thank you for your  
15 inspiration and your strength. That really is  
16 serving as a guiding light to all the young people  
17 and I'm sure anyone who interacts with you so thank  
18 you so much for your courage. All right.

19 [Applause][Crosstalk]

20 [Pause]

21 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Well, once  
22 again ladies and gentlemen, we ask everyone to find a  
23 seat. Non-council staff please make your way up to  
24 the balcony. Once again, Non-council staff make your

25

1 STATED MEETING

16

2 way up to the balcony. We ask you to please silence  
3 all cell phones or electronic devices at this time.

4 [Pause][Crosstalk]

5 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Can I have  
6 your attention please? Can I please have your  
7 attention? Quiet in the chambers please. At this  
8 time, quiet in the chambers please. Can we take  
9 those cameras outside please? Can we please take  
10 those cameras in the back outside please? Thank you.  
11 At this time please place all electronic devices, all  
12 electronic devices to vibrate. Will all non-council  
13 employees, non-council employees please leave the  
14 main floor of the chambers. If you do not work for  
15 the council, you have to leave the main floor of the  
16 chambers. There is additional seating upstairs in  
17 the balcony. Thank you.

18 [Pause] [Crosstalk]

19 [gavel]

20 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Everyone please  
21 take a seat. Please close the doors. All rise for  
22 the pledge of allegiance.

23 ALL: I pledge allegiance to the flag of  
24 the United States of America and to the Republic for

25



1 STATED MEETING 17

2 which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible,  
3 with liberty and justice for all.

4 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Please be seated.  
5 Roll call. Quiet in the chambers.

6 CLERK: Barron?

7 BARRON: Present.

8 CLERK: Borreli?, Cabrera?

9 CABRERA: Here.

10 CLERK: Chin?

11 CHIN: Here.

12 CLERK: Cohen? Thank you.

13 Constantinides? Cornegy? Crowley?

14 CROWLEY: Here.

15 CLERK: Cumbo?

16 CUMBO: Present.

17 [Boos]

18 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Sh-hhh -

19 None of that.

20 CLERK: Deutsch?

21 [Crosstalk]

22 CLERK: Deutsch?

23 DEUTSCH: Right here.

24 CLERK: Dromm?

25 DROMM: Present.

1 STATED MEETING

18

2 CLERK: Espinal?

3 ESPINAL: Here.

4 CLERK: Eugene?

5 EUGENE: Here.

6 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland? Garodnick?

7 GARODNICK: Here.

8 CLERK: Gentile?

9 GENTILE: Here.

10 CLERK: Constantinides?

11 CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

12 CLERK: Gibson?

13 GIBSON: Here.

14 CLERK: Greenfield?

15 GREENFIELD: Here.

16 CLERK: Grodenchik?

17 GRODENCHIK: Here.

18 CLERK: Johnson? Kallos?

19 KALLOS: Here.

20 CLERK: King?

21 KING: Present.

22 CLERK: Koo? Kosolowitz?

23 KOSOLOWITZ: Here.

24 CLERK: Lancman?

25 LANCMAN: Here.

1 STATED MEETING

19

2 CLERK: Lander?

3 LANDER: Here.

4 CLERK: Levin? Levine?

5 LEVINE: Here.

6 CLERK: Maisel? Mealy? Menchaca?

7 MENCHACA: Presente.

8 CLERK: Mendez? Miller?

9 MILLER: Here.

10 CLERK: Thank you. Palma? Perkins?

11 Reynoso?

12 REYNOSO: Here.

13 CLERK: Richards? Rodriguez? Rose?

14 ROSE: Here.

15 CLERK: Rosenthal?

16 ROSENTHAL: Here.

17 CLERK: Salamanca?

18 SALAMANCA: Present.

19 CLERK: Torres?

20 TOREES: Aye.

21 CLERK: Treyger?

22 TREYGER: Here.

23 CLERK: Ulrich? Vacca?

24 VACCA: Here.

25 CLERK: Vallone?

1 STATED MEETING

20

2 VALLONE: Here.

3 CLERK: Williams?

4 WILLIAMS: Here.

5 CLERK: Matteo?

6 MATTEO: Here.

7 CLERK: Van Bramer?

8 VAN BRAMER: Here.

9 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito?

10 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Here. All  
11 quiet in the chambers. Please close the doors. All  
12 rise for the invocation. The invocation will be  
13 delivered by Reverend Doctor Joshua Hollmann, the  
14 pastor of Christ Lutheran Church at 3357 58<sup>th</sup> Street  
15 in Woodside Queens. All quiet in the chambers.

16 REVEREND HOLLMANN: A word of prayer and  
17 a word of peace for our City and for our Council.  
18 All might and merciful God, yesterday, tomorrow and  
19 even today your steadfast love remains. This  
20 afternoon we ask you to continue to bless our City  
21 and inspire those who govern and serve New Yorkers,  
22 especially our City Council to do what is right,  
23 honorable, just and compassionate. We thank you  
24 limitless God for the ability to imagine what could  
25 be better and for opportunities to put into practice

1 STATED MEETING

21

2 the realities of your mercy and your justice for all.  
3 During this season of hope and the giving of  
4 happiness in Jesus, let us not grow weary in doing  
5 good or neglect the ease of gratitude and the  
6 authenticity of charity. Enlighten us with your  
7 grace that we may welcome others as you welcome us.  
8 In the name of the Father, and the Son and the Holy  
9 Spirit. Amen.

10 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Please be  
11 seated. A motion to spread the invocation in full  
12 upon the record. Council Member Jimmy Van Bramer.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JIMMY VAN BRAMER: Thank  
14 you very much Madam Speaker. A motion to spread the  
15 invocation

16 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Excuse me  
17 Council Member, may we have quiet in the chambers.  
18 [Crosstalk] Sh-hhh. Council Member Van Bramer has  
19 the floor.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
21 very much. I would like to offer a motion to spread  
22 the invocation in full upon the record and also take  
23 this moment and privilege to welcome our Pastor from  
24 Northern Woodside who does an amazing job at Christ  
25 Lutheran Church. I want to thank him for his

1 STATED MEETING

22

2 service, for his presence at so many community  
3 events, whether they be holiday lightings or rallies  
4 to keep our streets safe along Broadway and certainly  
5 his beloved 58<sup>th</sup> Street. I want to thank him and his  
6 family, his wife Amy and their son, Elijah, for their  
7 constant presence in our communities, lifting us up  
8 in so many ways, for taking care of the young people  
9 in Northern Woodside but also those of us who are a  
10 little bit more senior so with great love from the  
11 great neighborhood of Woodside, we say thank you to  
12 Reverend Joshua Hollmann for his great service.  
13 Thank you.

14 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
15 Council Member and thank you Pastor. Adoption of  
16 minutes, Council Member Vacca.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I make a motion  
18 that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of October 17,  
19 2017, be adopted as printed.

20 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Messages  
21 and papers from the mayor?

22 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: None.

23 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO:  
24 Communication from city, county and borough offices?

25

1 STATED MEETING

23

2 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: M561, the  
3 certification of Adrienne E. Adams, new Council  
4 Member, 28<sup>th</sup> District.

5 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received  
6 order, printed and filed.

7 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Thank you  
8 Madam Speaker.

9 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Yes.

10 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: At this time,  
11 the City Clerk and Clerk of the Council will perform  
12 the formal ceremony of Council Member Adrienne Adams  
13 taking her oath of office.

14 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Quiet in  
15 the chambers.

16 [Applause]

17 CLERK: Please raise your right hand and  
18 repeat after me. I Adrienne Adams

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I Adrienne Adams

20 CLERK: Do solemnly swear

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: do solemnly swear

22 CLERK: That I will support the

23 Constitution of the United States

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: That I will  
25 support the Constitution of the United States

1 STATED MEETING

24

2 CLERK: And the Constitution of the State  
3 of New York

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: And the  
5 Constitution of the State of New York

6 CLERK: And the Charter of the City of New  
7 York

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: And the Charter of  
9 the City of New York

10 CLERK: And that I will faithful discharge

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: And that I will  
12 faithful discharge

13 CLERK: The duties of the office of

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: The duties of the  
15 office of

16 CLERK: Council Member

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Council Member

18 CLERK: For the 28<sup>th</sup> District

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: For the 28<sup>th</sup>  
20 District

21 CLERK: In the Borough and County of  
22 Queens

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: In the Borough and  
24 County of Queens

25



1 STATED MEETING

25

2 CLERK: According to the best of my  
3 ability.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: According to the  
5 best of my ability.

6 CLERK: Council Member Adams,  
7 Congratulations.

8 [Applause]

9 [Pause]

10 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: [gavel] All  
11 right.

12 [Crosstalk]

13 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: May we resume  
14 order. May we resume order. Congratulations Council  
15 Members. Petitions and Communications?

16 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: None.

17 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Land use call  
18 ups?

19 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: None.

20 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: May we have quiet  
21 in the chambers. Quiet in the chambers as we now  
22 hear from the speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito.

23 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
24 Madam Public Advocate. Good afternoon, Buenas tardes  
25 to all my colleagues. I really hope everyone had a

2 wonderful, happy Thanksgiving with family and friends  
3 and first and foremost obviously as we just saw, we  
4 had the wonderful welcoming committee for our newest  
5 colleague, Council Member Adrienne Adams.  
6 Congratulations so much on your victory and being  
7 here with us today. Adrienne brings a lifetime of  
8 community service and experience to this council.  
9 It's also an honor obviously as have been talking a  
10 lot about the lack of women. It's great to welcome  
11 another woman of color to this legislative body and  
12 we look forward to working with our new colleague so  
13 again congratulations and welcome Council Member  
14 Adams. I also want to thank everyone who made our  
15 Puerto Rico resilient celebration on Monday night a  
16 huge success. I was especially honored to welcome my  
17 dear friend, San Juan mayor, Carmen Yulín Cruz, to  
18 celebrate our Puerto Rican heritage and the  
19 contributions that our people have given to our city  
20 and to this country and although we celebrated the  
21 beauty of our people and our culture, this event had  
22 even more significance as our island has been in the  
23 spotlight. Our continuous pleas for help  
24 commensurate with the level of devastation have been  
25 ignored by this President and here in New York we

2 continue to take action and provide assistance so  
3 from the bottom of my heart I want to thank each and  
4 every one of you for your continued and on-going  
5 support. On a more somber note, we mourn the victims  
6 of last week's attack at a mosque in Egypt where over  
7 300 people were killed. A house of worship is  
8 supposed to be a place of peace and we mourn all of  
9 those who lost their lives. It's truly tragic and it  
10 is a truly horrifying situation. I do hope that  
11 there is some comfort that could be found during this  
12 time so jumping into the docket of the day, the  
13 council's gonna begin by voting on the rezoning of El  
14 Barrio of East Harlem, the creation, creating  
15 affordable housing on the site of the Bedford Union  
16 Armory in Crown Heights, Brooklyn, the zoning text  
17 amendment for East River 50's and the construction of  
18 a new school in Majority Leader Van Bramer's  
19 district. For the past eighteen months, we have  
20 engaged in meaningful conversations with  
21 stakeholders, community leaders, business owners and  
22 local residents and today I am proud to announce the  
23 City will make commitments that adopt this community  
24 based vision on zoning and accompanying investments  
25 in El Barrio East Harlem. As the cost of living in

1 STATED MEETING

28

2 New York City continues rising, we recognize that the  
3 creation and preservation of affordable housing is  
4 imperative to insure New Yorkers can continue to live  
5 and thrive in our diverse neighborhoods. Advancing  
6 the East Harlem neighborhood plan is a major victory.  
7 From expanding affordable housing and providing  
8 substantial and unprecedented investments in our  
9 neighborhoods public housing stock to boosting  
10 employment in local businesses and revitalizing the  
11 La Marqueta, this rezoning plan presents a  
12 comprehensive vision for our community's future. As  
13 we create new affordable housing, we also recognize  
14 the importance of protecting the integrity of our  
15 neighborhood's character and cultural identity. That  
16 is why we came together to reduce the density and the  
17 height across the neighborhood to levels more in  
18 keeping with the character, beauty and vibrancy of El  
19 Barrio East Harlem. I want to thank the  
20 administration for working with us on this issue and  
21 our partners in the Steering Committee, particularly  
22 Council Member Bill Perkins, Community Board 11 and  
23 Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer for their  
24 collaboration and input to make El Barrio East Harlem  
25 a better place to live for our constituents. I also

1 STATED MEETING

29

2 want to thank, on the staff, George Sarkisen  
3 [phonetic], Roger Mann, Rebecca Crimons [phonetic],  
4 Chelsea Kelley, Jeff Uwin [phonetic], Dalen Casey and  
5 Joe Toronto.

6 Next the Council's gonna vote on three  
7 finance items. First off, Introduction 799B,  
8 sponsored by Council Member Dan Garodnick, would  
9 establish a small business tax credit against the  
10 commercial rent tax. The credit would provide  
11 complete tax relief for taxpayers who report incomes  
12 of \$5 million or less and who pay less than \$500,000  
13 a year in rent. Manhattan's small business owners  
14 have had to make too many sacrifices just to keep  
15 their livelihoods. Intro 799B would alleviate the  
16 financial burden of having to pay a rent tax on top  
17 of having to pay the rent itself for the borough's  
18 businesses. This legislation reflects a long over-  
19 due step to provide relief to those businesses who  
20 have been struggling for far too long. First off, I  
21 want to thank Rebecca Chasen, Eric Bernstein, Raymond  
22 Juskie [phonetic], Emra Edif [phonetic] and Davis  
23 Winslow.

24 Next introduction of 1376A, sponsored by  
25 Council Member Helen Rosenthal, would require the

1 STATED MEETING

30

2 Department of Finance to issue an annual report on  
3 the commercial rent tax. Again, Rebecca Chasen, Eric  
4 Bernstein, Raymond Juskie [phonetic], Emra Edif  
5 [phonetic] and Davis Winslow. Thank you for that.

6 And Intro 1750A, sponsored by Council  
7 Member Julissa Ferreras-Copeland, would provide  
8 critical property tax information to new homeowners  
9 throughout the city. Want to thank Rebecca Chasen,  
10 Eric Bernstein and John Seltzer for their help on  
11 this Bill.

12 Moving on the council will vote on a  
13 number of transportation bills. Intro 231A,  
14 sponsored by Council Member Jimmy Vacca, would  
15 require the Department of Transportation to notify  
16 applicants for sidewalk construction permits to  
17 consult the Department of Parks Recreation's website  
18 for information on scheduled tree planting. I want  
19 to thank Jeff Baker, Malik Nasaradine [phonetic],  
20 Johnathan Mazaradono [phonetic], Emily Rooney, Chem  
21 Obachar [phonetic], John Bazil, Susan Aser and Andrea  
22 Vasquez.

23 Intro 1251A, sponsored by Council Member  
24 Alan Maisel, would require the Department of  
25 Transportation to prioritize repairs of ponding

1 STATED MEETING

31

2 conditions on roadways. I want to thank Jeff Baker,  
3 Malik Nasaradine [phonetic], Johnathan Mazaradono  
4 [phonetic], Emily Rooney, Chem Obachar [phonetic],  
5 John Bazil, Susan Aser, Andrea Vasquez and Alex  
6 Wasenberg [phonetic].

7 Introduction 955A, sponsored by Council  
8 Member Dan Garodnick would increase the maximum civil  
9 penalty set out in the Administrative Code for Street  
10 Construction, maintenance, repair, obstruction and  
11 closure violations. I want to thank Jeff Baker,  
12 Malik Nasaradine [phonetic], Johnathan Mazaradono  
13 [phonetic], Emily Rooney, Chem Obachar [phonetic],  
14 John Bazil, Susan Aser, Andrea Vasquez and Kelly  
15 Taylor.

16 Intro 973B, sponsored by Council Member  
17 Corey Johnson, which would create a committee on City  
18 health services to review data and other information  
19 on the health of New Yorkers and the effectiveness of  
20 health services provided by City agencies. I want to  
21 thank Jeff Baker, David Sitzler, ZeManuel Hilu  
22 [phonetic], Crystal Pond and Susan Aser.

23 The council will also be voting on Intro  
24 1278A sponsored by Aging Committee Chair, Margaret  
25 Chin. It's a continuation of the council's efforts

1 STATED MEETING

32

2 to ensure that the rapidly growing number of social  
3 adult day cares operating in the City are providing  
4 proper services to vulnerable senior citizens such as  
5 those suffering from Alzheimer's or dementia. I want  
6 to thank Jeff Baker, Caitlyn Fahey, Emily Rooney,  
7 Susan Aser, Andrea Vasquez, Daniel Croop and Johini  
8 Sumpara [phonetic].

9           Next we're gonna vote on a package of  
10 bills to increase oversight training and feedback for  
11 ACS's Child Welfare and Preventive Services programs.  
12 Intro 1374A, sponsored by General Welfare Committee  
13 Chair, Steve Levin, will provide quarterly reports on  
14 the utilization of preventive services. Intro 1598A  
15 also sponsored by General Welfare Committee Chair,  
16 Steve Levin, would require ACS to ensure that all  
17 families receiving preventive services are provided  
18 with an annual survey regarding their experiences  
19 with preventive services. Intro 1590A, sponsored by  
20 Council Member Fernando Cabrera, would require ACS to  
21 require all individuals providing preventive services  
22 to attend trainings on an on-going basis and no less  
23 than once per year. Intro 1607A, sponsored by  
24 Council Member Debbie Rose would require ACS to  
25 complete a study on child protective caseloads and



1 STATED MEETING

33

2 workloads and Intro 1609A, sponsored by Council  
3 Member Rafael Salamanca, would require ACS to report  
4 annually on the aggregate findings and  
5 recommendations of this child fatality review. On  
6 the staff side, I want to thank Jeff Baker, Ameenta  
7 Kilawan [phonetic], Tanya Cyrus, Andrea Vasquez,  
8 Susan Aser, Johini Sumpara [phonetic], and Daniel  
9 Croop.

10 Next we're gonna vote on bills improving  
11 services for HRA public assistance clients, Intro  
12 1461A, sponsored by General Welfare Committee Chair,  
13 Steve Levin, would require the Human Rights  
14 Administration, Department of Social Services to  
15 conduct customer service and professionalism training  
16 for all employees that interact with members of the  
17 public and work in job centers or Snap centers where  
18 individuals may apply for public assistance benefits.

19 Intro 1635A, sponsored by Council Member  
20 Corey Johnson, would require the Department of Social  
21 Services to create and issue a job center appointment  
22 receipt for all individuals who visit job centers.

23 Staff I want to thank Jeff Baker, Ameeta Kilawan  
24 [phonetic], Tanya Cyrus, Andrea Vasquez, Susan Aser,

25

1 STATED MEETING

34

2 Johini Sumpara [phonetic], and Amera Nuzat  
3 [phonetic].

4 Moving on, the council will vote on Intro  
5 1210A, sponsored by Council Member Ritchie Torres,  
6 would require the Department of Housing, Preservation  
7 and Development to create a publicly available  
8 speculation watch list of regulated buildings who  
9 based on several factors tenants might be at risk of  
10 being displaced. Buildings on the watch list may be  
11 prioritized for HPD preservation programs or  
12 initiatives. I want to thank Jeff Baker, Megan Chin,  
13 Hose Conde and Sarah Gastelom [phonetic].

14 Next council will vote on Intro 1431A,  
15 sponsored by Council Member Barry Grodenchik which  
16 would require registration of Lift directors and sets  
17 forth the qualifications and duties of Lift  
18 directors. I want to thank Jeff Baker, Megan Chin,  
19 Hose Conde and Sarah Gastelom [phonetic].

20 Also vote on bills imposing crane  
21 modernizations, Intro 443A, sponsored by Council  
22 Member Ben Kallos, would impose age limitations on  
23 cranes used in New York City and Intro 1403A,  
24 sponsored by Housing and Buildings Chair, Jumaane  
25 Williams, which would require the installation of

2 anemometers on cranes. I want to thank Jeff Baker,  
3 Megan Chin, Hose Conde and Sarah Gastelom [phonetic].

4 In addition, the council will vote on  
5 Housing and Buildings Committee bills that would  
6 define harassment. Intro 1721A sponsored by Housing  
7 and Buildings Chair, Jumaane Williams, would amend  
8 the definition of harassment to include acts or  
9 omissions related to violations of the construction  
10 code.

11 Intro 152C, sponsored by Council Member  
12 Brad Lander would create a certificate of no  
13 harassment pilot program which would require certain  
14 buildings to apply for a certificate of no harassment  
15 before obtaining Department of Buildings' approval of  
16 permits of other construction documents for certain  
17 covered work. Jeff Baker, Megan Chin, Jose Conde and  
18 Sarah Gastelom [phonetic] I wasn't to thank you for  
19 the work on that.

20 Next the council will vote on Intro  
21 1300A, sponsored by Dan Garodnick which would require  
22 the Department of Environmental Protection to collect  
23 all noise mitigation plans from construction sites  
24 and make those plans publicly available on the DEP

2 website. I want to thank Jeff Baker, Semara Swanson,  
3 Nadia Johnson and John Steltzer.

4 Also, we're gonna vote on Intro 461A,  
5 sponsored by Council Member Vacca, which would  
6 require the Department of Education by June 1 of each  
7 year to post and distribute information about the  
8 availability of summer meals including where and when  
9 such meals are available and eligibility requirements  
10 for such meals. Jeff Baker, Elizabeth Hoffman, Kelly  
11 Taylor, Semeta Tesmook [phonetic], Andrea Vesquez and  
12 Susan Aser thank you.

13 Next Intro 1400, sponsored by Council  
14 Member Helen Rosenthal, would amend local law 67 of  
15 2008 governing participation of minority and women  
16 owned business enterprises in construction projects  
17 receiving benefits under the industrial and  
18 commercial abatement program ICAP, which provides  
19 abatements for property taxes for periods of up to 25  
20 years. I want to thank Jeff Baker, Alex Paulinoff  
21 [phonetic], Maria Johnson, and Alea Alee [phonetic].

22 We'll also vote on a package of bills on  
23 criminal justice reforms and transparency. Criminal  
24 justice reform is a hallmark of my tenure as speaker  
25 and the council will pass three bills that address

2 two crucial issues rectifying erroneous criminal  
3 records and addressing the roughly one million  
4 outstanding criminal warrants for low level offenses.  
5 Intro 1723A which I sponsored will require the  
6 Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice to make efforts to  
7 address outstanding criminal warrants and to issue an  
8 annual report related to these activities. It also  
9 requires the Department of Correction to respond to  
10 certain requests for records relative to erroneous  
11 warrants within three business day. Intro 1636A,  
12 sponsored by Council Member Corey Johnson would  
13 require the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice to  
14 take a variety of actions to address issues related  
15 to erroneous criminal and juvenile records. It would  
16 also require the New York City Police Department to  
17 quickly respond to records requests necessary to  
18 rectify erroneous records and Intro 1712A, sponsored  
19 by Council Member Rory Lancman, will require the  
20 Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice to issue a bi-  
21 annual report comprehensively addressing criminal  
22 summonses issued by all city agencies. I want to  
23 thank Jeff Baker, Brian Crodes [phonetic], Eva  
24 Ambacar [phonetic], Casey Adison, and Steve Rister.  
25 And finally the council will vote to prohibit

2 conversion therapy. Conversion therapy is barbaric  
3 and inhumane and right here in New York City we will  
4 insure that all individuals would be able to live  
5 without fear of coercion and to change into someone  
6 who they are not. Intro 1650A which I sponsored will  
7 prohibit any person from charging consumers for  
8 services intended to change a person's sexual  
9 orientation or gender identity. My partners in New  
10 York City government and I will continue to be the  
11 model for acceptance across the nation as we ban  
12 conversion therapy once and for all. I want to thank  
13 Jeff Baker, Zema Ohilu [phonetic], [Inaudible], Nuzat  
14 Chowdery [phonetic], Rachel Cordero and Jeff Baker  
15 and that completes the highlights of our docket. A  
16 lot on the docket and I look forward to proceeding  
17 with today's votes and with that I close  
18 communication from the speaker. Thank you Madam  
19 Public Advocate.

20 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Quiet  
21 in the chambers as we now turn to the discussion of  
22 general orders beginning with Council Member Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you Madam  
24 Public Advocate. I rise to talk about Land Use 808-  
25 812. Just as a background, we know that in New York

1 STATED MEETING

39

2 City we've got approximately 60,000 homeless people  
3 and a huge percentage of New Yorkers who are rent  
4 burdened. In Community Board 35, the median income  
5 for the neighborhood is about \$44,000. According to  
6 ANHD, 50% are rent burdened and more than 50% are in  
7 danger of displacement. The Bedford Armory  
8 [phonetic] Project, the city owned property have  
9 presented an opportunity as the community wanted to  
10 have a community land trust established or to have  
11 development by a not for profit organization and they  
12 wanted a multi-purpose community facility and they  
13 wanted a 100% affordability. This vote today that  
14 we're taking does not leave any of what the Community  
15 Board voted to have.

16 [Applause]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: In 2005, the  
18 Federal

19 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Sh-hhh. Quiet  
20 please.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: In 2005, the  
22 Federal government indicated that where rezonings  
23 take place in so-called transit zones, there is  
24 gentrification. That's what the federal government  
25 said in 2005. The City proposed that market rates

1 STATED MEETING

40

2 are needed in order to sustain rentals that are  
3 affordable supposedly to the people who live in that  
4 community. I don't accept that premise and I've not  
5 allowed that to happen in my community district.  
6 Affordability is a dangling partisan. Affordability  
7 is a dangling partisan. It needs to stay affordable  
8 to whom so ANHD has said that in New York City the  
9 households that meet income for market rates is  
10 approximately 29% of New Yorkers and if we look at  
11 the district where this proposal is being brought,  
12 there are about 20% of the people currently living  
13 there who can afford market rate rentals so this  
14 proposal, I think, deserves 40% for market rate and I  
15 think it's not affordable to the people who live  
16 there. I think the City is not fulfilling its  
17 obligation to address the issue of homelessness and  
18 people who are rent burdened and for that reason I  
19 cannot vote for this and I think that the long term  
20 lease that the City has agreed to does not benefit  
21 the community. Thank you so much.

22 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member  
23 thank you. Sh-hhh, Sh-hhh. Council Member  
24 Garodnick.

25



1 STATED MEETING

41

2 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you very  
3 much. I rise to speak on a few items very quickly,  
4 not that quickly.

5 [Laughter]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: that I had the  
7 opportunity to have been involved in and the first  
8 was Intro 799, a bill that will reform the commercial  
9 rent tax and reduce the tax burden on Manhattan's  
10 small businesses. Currently, the commercial rent tax  
11 imposes a 3.9% surcharge on rent paid by businesses  
12 starting at rents of \$250,000 per year. This bill  
13 would double the threshold at which businesses become  
14 subject to the tax bringing it to \$500,000. As our  
15 effort is targeted to helping small businesses in  
16 particular, this new threshold applies to businesses  
17 with less than five million dollars per year in total  
18 income, businesses that make between five and ten  
19 will receive a partial credit against their tax  
20 liability. This will be a big help for small  
21 businesses and I ask my colleagues for their support  
22 today. The second, Intro 1300 requires noise  
23 mitigation plans to be filed with the DEP and posted  
24 on the outside of construction sites. Noise is one  
25 of our City's top quality of life issues and

2 construction noise is a major contributor to the  
3 overall noise problem. Currently all construction  
4 sites must have a noise mitigation plan associated  
5 with their work and those plans must be kept on file  
6 but they need not be filed with the City or posted  
7 publicly. This bill would change that requiring  
8 noise mitigation plans to be filed with the DEP,  
9 published on line and posted on the outside of  
10 construction sites. It will add transparency and  
11 accountability for people affected by construction  
12 noise and will allow DEP to enforce plans more  
13 efficiently. The third bill is Intro 955 which  
14 raises the maximum fines for companies that fail to  
15 repave and repair streets properly after companies  
16 dig them up. Big entities like Verizon, ConEd, Time  
17 Warner often dig up our streets to lay wires, fix  
18 cables and check on pipes. That's important work but  
19 once it's done they have an obligation to the public  
20 to repair the streets according to standards and  
21 specifications set by the Department of  
22 Transportation. That's not always done or done well  
23 and that's why this bill doubles fines on certain  
24 violations and I ask my colleagues to support all  
25 three. Thank you.

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.  
3 Council Member Kallos.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: New Yorkers are  
5 tired of out of control, out of scale,  
6 overdevelopment destroying affordable housing and our  
7 neighborhoods. Today we have an opportunity to stop  
8 the march of super tall buildings from commercial  
9 districts on East 57<sup>th</sup> Street into residential  
10 districts where they would displace rent regulated  
11 residents to build the buildings for billionaires.  
12 In 2015, we formed the East River 50's Alliance which  
13 has grown to 45 buildings in the area, 2,600  
14 individual members from 500 buildings all over the  
15 City with support of friends of the upper East side,  
16 historic district Seville and City wide organizations  
17 like the Municipal Arts Society. Council Member Dan  
18 Garodnick, Senator Liz Krueger, Manhattan Borough  
19 President Gale Brewer joined me as co-advocates and  
20 Congress Member Carol Malone has joined in support.  
21 We worked with the Department of City Planning on  
22 several options for providing affordable housing as  
23 part of proposal. DCP ultimately advised that with  
24 the change to a tower on base to produce affordable  
25 housing with the existing inclusionary housing

1 STATED MEETING

44

2 framework which we agreed to improve and is what  
3 we've proposed. We removed the grandfathering  
4 provision that the City Planning Commission had added  
5 erroneously and City Planning has voted that removing  
6 this provision was in scope. This rezoning will  
7 protect oxygenarians like Hernd [phonetic] and Wurth  
8 and seniors like Charles Fernandez and his sister who  
9 face displacement from their affordable rent  
10 regulated units. Your vote today is in support of  
11 residents over real estate developers, putting  
12 affordable housing for real New Yorkers over  
13 buildings or billionaires. Thank you.

14 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.  
15 Council Member Lander.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam  
17 Public Advocate.

18 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Quiet please.  
19 Council Member Lander.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam  
21 Public Advocate. I arise today to ask my colleagues  
22 to support Intro 152C which would require a  
23 certificate of no harassment before landlords get  
24 permits for a demolition or a substantial alterations  
25 of their buildings. This council has taken

1 STATED MEETING

45

2 significant steps together to prevent tenant  
3 harassment by extending the right to council by  
4 putting the burden of proof on landlords, by  
5 expanding the definition, by focusing on  
6 constructionist harassment. Unfortunately in too  
7 many cases, unscrupulous landlords still persist  
8 because the bucket of gold at the end of their  
9 efforts of harassment by getting out low income and  
10 working class tenants and tripling or quadrupling the  
11 rent is just too big so the certificate of no  
12 harassment policy looks to block them from making  
13 that mint to profit from the harassment by denying  
14 them the building permits that they need to do so.  
15 Before landlords of covered buildings will be able to  
16 get those permits they would have to demonstrate they  
17 had not harassed tenants out of the building and if  
18 they're found to have harassed tenants out, they  
19 would not be able to get their building permits for  
20 five years unless they agree to make 20 or 25% of  
21 their building affordable to low income tenants  
22 beyond any MIA [Inaudible] 21A requirements with no  
23 public subsidy. A program like this has been in  
24 place in Hell's Kitchen since 1974 and it is the  
25 result of the work of some tremendous tenant

1 STATED MEETING

46

2 advocates that we are expanding it today so I want to  
3 give big props to the Coalition Against Tenant  
4 Harassment, ANHD, Make the Roll, America Justice  
5 Center, 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue Committee, to the St. Nick's  
6 Alliance and a whole bunch of other groups. When  
7 this council passed mandatory, inclusionary housing  
8 we want a commitment for the administration to work  
9 with us. We formed a task force that met for a year  
10 looking at what buildings should be covered and we've  
11 got a great, I won't go into all the details of what  
12 buildings and what neighborhoods are covered, but it  
13 covers 11 community districts, a wide range of  
14 buildings and in every single community district  
15 across the city, any building where there's been a  
16 finding of harassment in court or by HCR, any  
17 building in the Alternative Enforcement Program or  
18 any building with a vacate order will have to go  
19 through this program. This isn't gonna solve the  
20 problem but it is a big and significant step forward.  
21 Big thanks to Megan Chin, to Jeff Baker, to Ed Atkin

22 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member,  
23 can you bring your comments to your close?

24

25

1 STATED MEETING

47

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: to Danny Levers,  
3 to the Speaker and the Housing Chair on helping to  
4 get this done. Thank you.

5 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Thank  
6 you so much. Council Member Rose.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. One of  
8 the most sacred duties of government is the  
9 protection of the most vulnerable of our society. It  
10 is therefore critically important that the agency  
11 tasked with this responsibility of protecting the  
12 safety of our children which is the Administration of  
13 Children's Services, has the absolute best processes  
14 in place to safeguard and secure their wellbeing.  
15 For decades we have been looking at only at the sizes  
16 of the caseloads and that has not been enough. We  
17 must have a better understanding of the complexity of  
18 worker caseloads, digging deep to analyze this type  
19 of data is the heart of Intro 1607A which authorizes  
20 ACS to conduct the study and make best practices  
21 recommendations based on data gleaned from the study  
22 which will happen no later than September 30, 2019.  
23 In particular, this study will analyze the number of  
24 children per family caseload and their prior ACS  
25 involvement of the family, analyze the relationship

2 between the size of the family and prior ACS  
3 involvement to the complexity of the case and to  
4 access best practices and make recommendations based  
5 on this data to improve child safety and wellbeing  
6 outcomes. It is my hope that this study will help  
7 adjust caseworker's workload by taking into account  
8 the complexity of their cases and the corresponding  
9 additional work that complex cases require and will  
10 enable ACS workers to better carry out their mission  
11 of insuring the safety of our children and to prevent  
12 unneeded deaths. I want to thank Speaker Melissa  
13 Mark-Viverito and the General Welfare Committee  
14 Chair, Steve Levin for their support of this  
15 important legislation and all who worked to make this  
16 a great bill. Thank you.

17 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.  
18 Council Member Chin.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Today we are voting  
20 on Intro 1278A legislation that will dramatically  
21 increase information available, about, and  
22 transparency on social adult day cares. This bill  
23 continues this council's effort to address the need  
24 of millions of caregivers across the City. Yesterday  
25 during the council committee's hearing about unpaid



1 STATED MEETING

49

2 caregivers, I heard heart wrenching stories about a  
3 husband who forsake his own health to bring his wife  
4 to the doctors and adult children who take turns  
5 using they vacation days to ensure that their mother  
6 is never alone. Social adult day cares offer  
7 caregivers, a majority of whom are women, a break for  
8 a couple of days to take care of their own needs.  
9 However, as the state made it easier to access these  
10 services with little oversight, some unscrupulous  
11 providers open programs that endangers multiple  
12 seniors, threatened the funding of good senior  
13 centers and good social adult day cares and opened  
14 the door to Medicaid fraud. Intro 1278A require  
15 DIPTAS [phonetic] to create an on-line database of  
16 all social adult day cares in the City. The database  
17 would also indicate the number of violations issued  
18 at a given day care and the outcome of that  
19 violation. Most importantly, Intro 1278A would allow  
20 people to submit complaints about bad social adult  
21 day cares electronically and directly to DIPTAS  
22 [phonetic] social adult day care office person. By  
23 offering greater levels of transparency, 1278A can  
24 help identify bad actors in the system and allow  
25 families to make informed decisions for our senior

1 STATED MEETING

50

2 and caregivers. I want to thank our Speaker Melissa  
3 Mark-Viverito for her support throughout the process  
4 and I also want to thank our wonderful committee  
5 staff, Kathleen Fahey, Emily Mooney, Daniel Croop and  
6 Johini Sumpara [phonetic] and my Deputy Chief of  
7 Staff, Vincent Bank for all their work on this and  
8 all the advocates who helped push this forward.

9 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Thank  
10 you. Council Member Johnson.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I thank you  
12 Madam Public Advocate that an individual accused of a  
13 crime is innocent until proven guilty is one of the  
14 bedrocks of our Criminal Justice System. An  
15 erroneous criminal record completely undercuts that  
16 foundation in our society. Erroneous criminal  
17 records with basic bureaucratic errors burden over  
18 two million New Yorker with an assumption of guilt  
19 for crimes they were never convicted of or in some  
20 cases for which they were not even prosecuted. That  
21 no City agency is responsible for maintaining the  
22 accuracy of these records is possibly even more  
23 disheartening than the inaccuracies themselves. My  
24 bill Introduction 1636A would require the Mayor's  
25 Office of Criminal Justice to address erroneous

2 criminal records but it's not enough to merely  
3 correct the current errors because in many cases the  
4 professional or personal damage has already been  
5 done. This bill will also require that office to  
6 address the root causes of these inaccuracies to  
7 prevent this from happening in the future and to  
8 report on these actions. I also want to talk about  
9 another bill that I am passing today. New Yorkers  
10 who rely on our City's safety net of social programs  
11 are an incredibly vulnerable population. It includes  
12 people who are homeless or pending eviction or  
13 utility shutoff. These folks come to us to help keep  
14 their roof over their heads, putting food on the  
15 table, or paying their medical bills. We have to do  
16 everything in our power to make sure these New  
17 Yorkers receive the help that they need. My bill  
18 Introduction 1635A would require HRA, the Human  
19 Resource Administration, to issue a receipt to  
20 everyone who comes into a service center seeking  
21 assistance. This receipt will consolidate the  
22 confusing array of information individuals often  
23 receive. It would also require HRA to publicly  
24 report wait times at service centers and clarify the  
25 process for individuals to make a complaint. These

2 are common sense protections that should be provided.  
3 I ask my colleagues to vote in favor of this piece of  
4 legislation and also Introduction 973B on City health  
5 care services. Thank you very much.

6 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.  
7 Council Member Greenfield.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you  
9 Madam Public Advocate. I'd like to speak briefly on  
10 several land use proposals that we have up for a vote  
11 today and a lot of conversations that have been had  
12 about them and while I think it's important to  
13 remember that we have a lot of conversations (thank  
14 you), we have a lot of conversations that happen and  
15 the product of these final items are literally  
16 thousands of hours worth of work. The idea that  
17 somehow people expect for these applications to be  
18 completed and perfect, honestly I find bizarre. All  
19 of these applications are better as a result of the  
20 thousands of hours of work that have gone in. We  
21 have a firm philosophy in this council that we defer  
22 to members. It's a very good reason. Members know  
23 their districts better than anybody else and in my  
24 experience as a land use Chair, nine times out of ten  
25 you end up with a better result and specifically I

1 STATED MEETING

53

2 want to commend my colleague, Council Member Laurie  
3 Cumbo, for reaching a deal on the Bedford Union  
4 Armory that will

5 [Crosstalk]

6 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Sh-hhh. Sh-hhh.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: that will -  
8 that's okay. Folks this is, this is democracy.

9 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Quiet in the  
10 chambers. Quiet in the chambers. Quiet [Gavel]

11 [Crosstalk]

12 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member  
13 Greenfield has the floor. Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: The deal not  
15 only removes luxury condos but it keeps the land  
16 public through a 99 year lease and increases the  
17 affordable housing to 60% of the 400 units at 60% of  
18 AMI or below. For those people who say it's not  
19 affordable, I find that very curious.

20 [Crosstalk]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Fifty of  
22 those units, fifty of those units, fifty of those  
23 units are 30% AMI. That means that you can make \$10  
24 an hour and you can afford to move into a brand new  
25 affordable housing unit with a state of the art

1 STATED MEETING

54

2 recreational facility with space for community based  
3 organizations.

4 [Crosstalk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: The folks,  
6 the folks up there, I respect you but quite frankly  
7 in a democracy, we had an election. The voters were  
8 clear. The voters

9 [Crosstalk]

10 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: If this  
11 continues, we're gonna clear the room.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: And the  
13 voters support Council Member Laurie Cumbo as do we  
14 and that's what we're doing here today

15 [Crosstalk]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: and I think  
17 people need to appreciate, people need to appreciate  
18 that this ladies and gentlemen is democracy at its  
19 finest. There was an election. There were results  
20 and the result is that

21 [Crosstalk]

22 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Sh-hhh.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: there is an  
24 outstanding project that will not now go forward

25

1 STATED MEETING

55

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Thank  
3 you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: thanks to  
5 Council Member Cumbo so I thank you all for coming  
6 out and I thank you for your opinions but  
7 unfortunately, unfortunately

8 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: the people  
10 have spoken and that's exactly what we're doing  
11 today.

12 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member  
13 thank you. Thank you.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you  
15 very much.

16 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you.  
17 All right, so I think we're gonna

18 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Excuse me.

19 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We're gonna  
20 clear, we're gonna clear the room upstairs. We're  
21 gonna clear the balcony, all right.

22 [Crosstalk] [Crosstalk]

23 [Pause]

24 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: I think we're  
25 gonna get started again.

2 [Crosstalk]

3 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Let's resume.  
4 Sh-hhh. Is, Council Member Cornegy, you have the  
5 floor. We're still in general orders.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you, thank  
7 you Madam Public Advocate. Today in New York City,  
8 someone who has defrauded a homeowner to obtain the  
9 deed to their home can leverage the power of City  
10 agencies and utility provider to force rightful  
11 homeowners out of their homes. This bill 1770 will  
12 require the sheriff's department to notify the  
13 Department of Finance, the Department of  
14 Environmental Protection and certain utility  
15 providers of properties under investigation for deed  
16 fraud. This notification will help prevent  
17 fraudulent actors from taking advantage of City  
18 resources to force unassuming homeowners out of their  
19 homes and help stem the tide of deed scammers  
20 victimizing countless innocent New Yorkers. I'm  
21 asking my colleagues to sign on to Intro 1770 which  
22 will help protect unassuming homeowners from deed  
23 theft and deed fraud. Thank you.

24 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thanks and lastly  
25 Council Member Van Bramer.



2 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you  
3 very much Madam Public Advocate. Today is a day to  
4 celebrate for the families and children of Sunnyside  
5 and Woodside. Today the council is voting on LU822  
6 which will allow the School Construction Authority to  
7 move forward with a plan to build a new state of the  
8 art intermediate school in Sunnyside Queens. This  
9 project will turn a dilapidated car garage that has  
10 been abandoned for a number of years into a  
11 cornerstone of our community that will improve the  
12 lives of families and children for years to come.  
13 This will be a nearly 700 seat new intermediate  
14 school helping to alleviate overcrowding in school  
15 district 30 in every neighborhood in my district.  
16 School district 30 is one of the most overcrowded in  
17 the City of New York. Ensuring that our children are  
18 able to go to school, a school that's in their own  
19 neighborhood, as well as keeping children from having  
20 to cross dangerous thoroughfares like Queens  
21 Boulevard and Northern Boulevard is a win for our  
22 district and for all of the children and families in  
23 our neighborhood. The new school will reduce class  
24 sizes throughout the district and allow educators to  
25 better nurture and instruct our children improving

2 the outcomes for our students. Over the last eight  
3 years, I'm proud that we've been able to site, build  
4 and fund now 13 new schools in my district.

5 Investing in the future of our children is by far the  
6 most important work that I do as a council member. I  
7 want to thank everyone involved and I urge all of my  
8 colleagues to vote yes on this important school in  
9 our district which will change the face of our  
10 neighborhood and the future of our neighborhood for  
11 decades to come. Thank you.

12 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. I'm  
13 sorry, I overlooked one Council Member, Council  
14 Member Williams.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very  
16 much Madam Public Advocate. I just wanted to talk  
17 about two bills I am proud to be sponsoring today.  
18 First one is combined with Council Member Kallos on  
19 cranes. Crane accidents in New York City have led to  
20 five deaths and dozens of injuries in the last five  
21 years. Wind is a factor in many of these accidents.  
22 This, my bill, creates guidelines for uses of  
23 anemometers on cranes and derricks and having the  
24 information that we collect from these instruments  
25 will make it easier to keep equipment safe and

2 protect workers and pedestrians. Together with  
3 Council Member Kallos' bill that require the  
4 inspection of cranes as they age. They represent a  
5 significant effort toward addressing technology  
6 failures in construction and using technology to  
7 solve these problems. Just want to point out that  
8 there was a lot of focus on 1447. At that time, we  
9 said this body is doing much more when it comes to  
10 construction safety for workers and the public alike.  
11 We had a hearing with 21 bills. These are in  
12 addition to those and the council will not stop until  
13 we have put back the culture of safety that has been  
14 eroded. The last one, Intro 1721A, which is combined  
15 with Council Member Lander. Landlords have no  
16 shortage of imagination when it comes to finding ways  
17 to harass tenants and remove them from their homes.  
18 Our laws need to keep up with their actions. It's  
19 very hard to legislate the morality of unscrupulous  
20 people who will always find ways to be unscrupulous  
21 so this body will have to keep coming back time and  
22 time again to deal with the harassment issue because  
23 as we pass laws, landlords and unscrupulous landlords  
24 will very shortly thereafter try to find loopholes to  
25 slip in. My building in particular, adds to the

1 STATED MEETING

60

2 definition of harassment dealing with work without a  
3 permit and lying about permits and for both bills I'd  
4 like to thank the committee staff, the Speaker,  
5 Council Member Kallos, Council Member Lander, the  
6 Coalition Against Tenant Center Harassment, NAHD,  
7 Make the Roll, Legal Aid Society and Legal Service  
8 New York, Committee Staff and my [Inaudible] state  
9 director, Mike Toomey [phonetic]. Thank you.

10 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

11 Seeing none other report of special committees?

12 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: None

13 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Report of

14 standing committees?

15 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the

16 Committee on Aging, Intro 1278A, Database of adult

17 day cares.

18 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Um, coupled on

19 general orders.

20 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the

21 Committee on Civil Rights, Intro 1650A, Prohibiting

22 Conversion Therapy.

23 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on

24 general orders.

25

1 STATED MEETING 61

2 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
3 Committee on Economic Development, Intro 1400 MWBE  
4 Projects.

5 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
6 general orders.

7 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
8 Committee on Education, Intro 1461A, Summer Meals.

9 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
10 coupled on general orders.

11 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
12 Committee on Environmental Protection, Intro 1300A,  
13 Noise and Mitigation Plans.

14 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
15 coupled on general orders.

16 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 1465A,  
17 Residual Fuel Oil and City Power Plants.

18 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and laid  
19 over.

20 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
21 Committee on Finance, Intro 799B and Intro 1376A,  
22 Commercial Rent Tax.

23 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
24 coupled on general orders.

25

1 STATED MEETING 62

2 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 1750A,  
3 Real Property Taxes.

4 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
5 coupled on general orders.

6 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Preconsidered  
7 Reso. 1730, Organization Funding.

8 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
9 general orders.

10 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Preconsidered  
11 LU819 and Reso. 1732 and LU 820 and Reso. 1733,  
12 Various Applications.

13 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
14 general orders.

15 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
16 Committee on General Welfare, Intros 1374A, 1461A,  
17 1590A and 1598A, Preventive Services.

18 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
19 coupled on general orders.

20 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 1607A  
21 and 1609A, Child Protective Case Loads.

22 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
23 coupled on general orders.

24 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 1635A,  
25 AHRA Job Centers.

1 STATED MEETING

63

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
3 coupled on general orders.

4 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
5 Committee on Health, Intro 973B, Committee on City  
6 Health Care Services.

7 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
8 coupled on general orders.

9 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
10 Committee on Housing and Buildings, Intro 152C,  
11 Certificate of No Harassment.

12 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
13 coupled on general orders.

14 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 443A,  
15 Crane Modernization.

16 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
17 coupled on general orders.

18 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 1210A,  
19 Speculation List.

20 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
21 coupled on general orders.

22 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 1403A,  
23 Crane Anemometers.

24 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
25 coupled on general orders.

1 STATED MEETING

64

2 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 1431A,  
3 Registration of Lift Directors.

4 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
5 coupled on general orders.

6 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 1721A,  
7 Amending the Definition of Harassment.

8 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
9 coupled on general orders.

10 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
11 Committee on Land Use, LU746 and Reso. 1734, Property  
12 Tax Exemption.

13 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled to be  
14 filed pursuant to letter of withdrawal.

15 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU773-LU786  
16 on page 8, Various Applications.

17 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Approve the  
18 modifications and refer to the City Planning  
19 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of  
20 the Council and Section 197(d) of the New York City  
21 Charter.

22 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU790 and  
23 Reso. 1735, Property Tax Exemption.

24 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
25 general orders.



1 STATED MEETING

65

2 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU808-812,  
3 Bedford Union Armory.

4 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Approve the  
5 modifications and refer to the City Planning  
6 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of  
7 the Council and Section 197(d) of the New York City  
8 Charter.

9 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU818 and  
10 Reso. 1736, Property Tax Exemption.

11 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
12 general orders.

13 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Preconsidered  
14 LU822 and Reso. 1737, School Facility, Council  
15 District 26.

16 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
17 general orders.

18 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Preconsidered  
19 LU823 and Reso. 1738 and LU824 and Reso. 1739, Tax  
20 Exemptions.

21 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
22 general orders.

23 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Preconsidered  
24 LU821, Zoning Amendment.

25

1 STATED MEETING

66

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Approve the  
3 modifications and refer to the City Planning  
4 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70(b) of the Rules of  
5 the Council and Section 197(d) of the New York City  
6 Charter.

7 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
8 Committee on Public Safety, Intro 1636A, 1712A and  
9 1723A, Criminal Records, Summons and Warrants.

10 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
11 coupled on general orders.

12 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
13 Committee on Rules, Privileged and Elections,  
14 preconsidered Reso. 1740, Approving Changes to  
15 Certain Committees.

16 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
17 general orders.

18 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Report of the  
19 Committee on Transportation, Intro 231A, Tree  
20 Planting.

21 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
22 coupled on general orders.

23 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 955A,  
24 Penalties for Street Construction Violations.

25

1 STATED MEETING

67

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
3 coupled on general orders.

4 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Intro 1251A,  
5 Repairing and Ponding.

6 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Amended and  
7 coupled on general orders.

8 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: On the  
9 General Order Calendar, LU773 and Reso. 1741 and LU  
10 774 and Reso. 1742, Zoning Amendments.

11 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
12 general orders.

13 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU775 and  
14 Reso. 1743, Millbank, Frawley Circle East.

15 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
16 general orders.

17 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU776 and  
18 Reso. 1744 and LU777 and Reso. 1725, Zoning  
19 Amendments.

20 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
21 general orders.

22 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU778 and  
23 Reso. 1746 and LU779 and Reso. 1747, Disposition and  
24 Acquisition of City Owned Property.

25

1 STATED MEETING

68

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
3 general orders.

4 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU780 and  
5 Reso. 1748 through LU782 and Reso. 1750, East Harlem  
6 Rezoning.

7 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
8 general orders.

9 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU785 and  
10 786, Harlem Waterfront District.

11 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Re-referred to  
12 the Committee on Land Use.

13 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU787 and  
14 Reso. 1751 through LU 809 and Reso. 1754, Zoning  
15 Amendments.

16 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
17 general orders.

18 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU810 and  
19 Reso. 1755 and LU 811 and Reso. 1756, Special  
20 Permits.

21 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
22 general orders.

23 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: LU812 and  
24 Reso. 1757, Disposition of City Owned Property.

25

1 STATED MEETING

69

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
3 general orders.

4 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Preconsidered  
5 LU821 and Reso. 1758, Zoning Amendments.

6 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
7 general orders.

8 UNIDENTIFIED MALE SPEAKER: Resolution  
9 appointing various persons, Commission of Deeds.

10 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Coupled on  
11 general orders and I ask for roll call vote on all  
12 general order items beginning with Council Member  
13 Garodnick.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank you,  
15 aye.

16 CLERK: Levine.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye on all.

18 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

19 Council Member Chin.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Ah, congratulations  
21 all my colleagues on these important land use  
22 proposal and legislation. I vote aye on all.

23 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: And Council  
24 Member Rosenthal.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye.

1 STATED MEETING

70

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: And Council  
3 Member Copeland, Ferreras-Copeland, moving on.

4 CLERK: Adams.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye.

6 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.  
7 Council Member Vacca.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I vote aye on all  
9 except 1723. I vote no and I vote aye on all  
10 resolutions and I ask that we Tweet Resolution 1287.  
11 Maybe someone in Washington will be Tweeting as that  
12 person does. Thank you.

13 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

14 CLERK: Barron.

15 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Barron.

16 CLERK: Borreli

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BORRELI: 152, 1721 and  
18 1723.

19 CLERK: Cabrera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Aye on all.

21 CLERK: Cohen.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Aye.

23 CLERK: Constantinides.

24

25

1 STATED MEETING

71

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I'd like  
3 to congratulate and welcome Adrienne Adams to the  
4 City Council and with that I will vote aye on all.

5 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

6 CLERK: Cornegy.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

8 CLERK: Crowley.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I'd like to also  
10 welcome our newest council member from Queens,  
11 Adrienne Adams. I know she's gonna be terrific. I  
12 want to congratulate all of those who have important  
13 bills that we're voting on today and I vote aye on  
14 all. Thank you.

15 CLERK: Cumbo.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to  
17 explain my vote.

18 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes, quiet in the  
19 chambers please.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I want  
21 to thank all of my colleagues today that have stood  
22 with me and supported me negotiating one of the  
23 largest and most important land use deals in  
24 Brooklyn, New York on maternity leave has been quite  
25 a challenge and I thank all of you for your support

1 STATED MEETING

72

2 and for working with me to get to this particular  
3 point. I want to thank everyone because this has  
4 been a challenge and to all of the individuals that  
5 were here to voice their opinions and concerns, those  
6 concerns have been taken into account. They have  
7 been heard but there's a way to go about doing  
8 things. There is a democratic process and when I was  
9 standing to the side, people asked if I was scared,  
10 if I was concerned but when I think about that every  
11 time I come into this chamber I walk in with the  
12 knowledge and the understanding that my predecessor,  
13 the late James E. Davis, was shot and killed here in  
14 City Hall so this level of yelling, of screaming, of  
15 being inappropriate, of disrespecting one another  
16 creates a very dangerous environment for everybody  
17 involved and we have to as a City, as a City Council,  
18 as a nation, we have to bring respect back and  
19 listening to one another and conversation and  
20 meetings and discussions but to disrespect one  
21 another, to yell at, to shout out, to over talk, to  
22 threaten, this is not what democracy is and this is  
23 not what democracy looks like. We have a process  
24 that we go through to get to the solutions that are  
25 gonna make this City a better place. Crown Heights



2 in Brooklyn, New York is in crisis. We are in the  
3 largest affordable housing crisis that we've ever  
4 known. There are people that are languishing in our  
5 homeless shelters. We have over 30 known gangs and  
6 sets and crews surrounding the Bedford Union Armory.  
7 We have a lack of educational and athletic  
8 opportunities and outlets for our young people in the  
9 community. It is a community in crisis, a community  
10 that cannot wait five to ten, fifteen, twenty years  
11 for opportunity, opportunity that must happen right  
12 now. What we're talking about and what we're voting  
13 on right now is I fought with my colleagues to make  
14 sure that we ended luxury condominiums. There are no  
15 luxury condominiums for sale as part of the Bedford  
16 Union Armory. Sixty percent of the housing is going  
17 to be for individuals making between \$27,000 and  
18 \$57,000. We could not get to 100% because 40% had to  
19 be set aside in order to pay for the world class  
20 recreational facility. I wish that there was another  
21 way to pay for things other than to pay for things  
22 but right now we still have to pay for things. We  
23 also are going to have a world class recreational  
24 facility that our young people, so many of them who  
25 have become involved in gangs, teenage pregnancy, are

1 STATED MEETING

74

2 now going to have an outlet. We tell them to say no  
3 to so many things but give them so few options to say  
4 yes to. They will now have an opportunity to say yes  
5 to something. I negotiated to have a 25,000 square  
6 foot brand new medical facility for those who are  
7 uninsured. They will have an opportunity to have  
8 affordable healthcare right in their own backyards.  
9 I fought to have a 10% set aside for those  
10 transitioning out of our homeless shelters so that  
11 those that are languishing in our homeless shelters  
12 who need housing now and who cannot wait for the  
13 bureaucracy and cannot wait for all of the arguments  
14 and the rallies to end, who need a home right now,  
15 will have that. We're gonna create over 720  
16 construction jobs within this particular development,  
17 local hiring from the very communities in which  
18 people live. In addition to that, there will be over  
19 200 permanent jobs created after that. This is  
20 progress. This is an opportunity. This is getting  
21 something done in our term. Every council member  
22 runs on a premise of creating jobs, education, making  
23 sure that we have affordable housing and this project  
24 does just that.

25

1 STATED MEETING

75

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Council Member,  
3 could you bring them to your close.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I most certainly  
5 will.

6 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And I thank  
8 everyone for this opportunity to create the greatest  
9 level of affordable housing that the Crown Heights  
10 community has seen in decades. This is progress.  
11 This is getting something done. I thank all of my  
12 colleagues and I look forward to continuing to work  
13 with you in collaboration to make this, yes, the  
14 greatest City in the world. Thank you so much and I  
15 proudly vote aye.

16 [Applause]

17 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you. Thank  
18 you. Continuing with roll call.

19 CLERK: Deutsch.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I'll pass.

21 CLERK: Dromm.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye.

23 CLERK: Espinal.

24

25

1 STATED MEETING

76

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: With many, many  
3 congratulations to Laurie Cumbo in Brooklyn, I  
4 proudly vote aye.

5 CLERK: Eugene.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote aye.

7 CLERK: Gentile.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: Congratulations  
9 to Laurie Cumbo. I vote aye on all.

10 CLERK: Gibson.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to  
12 explain my vote.

13 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you Madam  
15 Public Advocate and Madam Speaker. I first want to  
16 congratulate Council Member Adams and welcome her to  
17 the Delegation of the Women's Caucus. We look  
18 forward to working with you. I want to congratulate  
19 all of our colleagues that are passing very important  
20 legislation today but certainly in particular, I want  
21 to highlight and thank the speaker and Council Member  
22 Lander for the Certificate of No Harassment. This is  
23 going to have a transformative impact on so many  
24 tenants and families throughout the City, in  
25 particular of my district, community districts 4 and

2 5 which fall within the Jerome Cromwell neighborhood  
3 zoning area. I am so proud of the work that has been  
4 done to make the Certificate of No Harassment a  
5 reality. I also want to congratulate our Speaker and  
6 Council Members Johnson and Lancman on the Public  
7 Safety Criminal Justice Reform Package that relates  
8 to outstanding criminal warrants and erroneous  
9 records. We know the disproportionate impact that  
10 erroneous records has on young men and women of  
11 color. It prohibits them from accessing jobs,  
12 financial aid and housing and if we can do anything  
13 in this term, we just allow them an opportunity to be  
14 a success and not a statistic. I also want to  
15 certainly thank and commend our Speaker on  
16 successfully putting forth a neighborhood plan for  
17 East Harlem and I also want to commend Council Member  
18 Laurie Cumbo not only for that amazing speech but for  
19 being able to successfully craft a neighborhood plan  
20 all while on maternity leave. You have truly been an  
21 incredible leader and certainly going through my own  
22 neighborhood rezoning, I know the challenges we face.  
23 We truly want to satisfy everyone's concern, every  
24 advocate and leader, labor leader, community  
25 organization, everyone that has a true interest in

1 STATED MEETING

78

2 the affordability of this City. We truly, truly want  
3 to satisfy everyone but I know at the end of the day,  
4 you both worked extremely hard to craft the best plan  
5 for your districts and with that I proudly vote aye  
6 on all and congratulations.

7 CLERK: Greenfield. Grodenchik.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Permission to  
9 briefly explain my vote, Madam Public Advocate.

10 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Thank you. I  
12 just want to thank all those involved in passing  
13 today. My Lift Director bill it's part of a package  
14 of construction safety legislation some of which has  
15 been passed by the council already and signed into  
16 law. I especially want to thank Chair Williams of  
17 Housing and Building and his staff, my counsel, Steve  
18 Behar[phonetic] who became an expert on crane  
19 operation and my chief of staff Ire Gurshman  
20 [phonetic] for all the great work they have done. I  
21 hope that this bill will bring a large measure of  
22 safety for our City. We've seen some spectacular  
23 accidents in the cranes killing both crane operators  
24 and pedestrians on our streets and I hope that this  
25 will go a long way to remedy that and lastly I just

1 STATED MEETING

79

2 want to congratulate everybody who's passing  
3 legislation today and I probably shouldn't say this  
4 but Ms. Adams, yo Adrienne.

5 [Laughter]

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK:

7 Congratulations to all and welcome to the council  
8 Ms. Adams.

9 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: You were holding  
10 that in for how long? [Laughter] Continuing with  
11 roll call.

12 CLERK: Johnson.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Permission Madam  
14 Public Advocate.

15 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: There's a lot of  
17 really impressive bills that we're passing today. I  
18 want to congratulate the Speaker and Council Member  
19 Dromm on passing the legislation related to banning  
20 conversion therapy which is so destructive and  
21 horrible in New York City. It's a big deal and I'm  
22 really glad we're doing it. Council Member Garodnick  
23 has fought for so long on the commercial rent tax.  
24 It affects literally every block in my district and  
25 it is something that people have been begging for.

1 STATED MEETING

80

2 It's not a cure all solution but it's something that  
3 is going to make a substantial difference in the  
4 lives of small business owners and how they pay their  
5 bills. I'm proud of the bills that I'm passing today  
6 and I also want to congratulate my dear friend,  
7 Laurie Cumbo, who did an incredible job negotiating  
8 this. The campaign that was run again over the  
9 summer was vicious, full of smears and lies. She  
10 handled it with grace and with dignity, her character  
11 shown through. She did it while pregnant. She did  
12 it after she had her beautiful baby Prince and she  
13 negotiated this in the midst of having a new born  
14 baby so I'm really proud of her and the speech that  
15 she gave today on this floor I think was very moving  
16 and so I am very proud to support here and vote in  
17 favor of this negotiated land use project and with  
18 that I congratulate all my colleagues and vote aye on  
19 all the bills.

20 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

21 CLERK: Kallos.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye on all.

23 CLERK: King.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Permission to  
25 explain my vote.



1 STATED MEETING

81

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: First I want to say  
4 congratulations to my sisters, Council Member  
5 Adrienne Adams welcome to the party, Council Woman  
6 Laurie Cumbo, thank you for showing us how to pay for  
7 something. You did a marvelous job and  
8 congratulations on the great work that you've done.  
9 To all my colleagues, all of us today, I want to say  
10 thank you all for passing legislation that improves  
11 the lives of all New Yorkers and especially want to  
12 give a shout out to the Land Use Division all  
13 everyone voted today for the Article 11 that was  
14 voted for Sidney House that's a major project that is  
15 being built in my district, the largest humanity for  
16 habitat, Habitat for Humanity that's being built in  
17 the United States of America which we've been able to  
18 invest over \$2.5 million so I want to thank everyone  
19 and I vote aye on all and I abstain from Intro 1658.

20 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

21 CLERK: Koslowitz.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Can I be  
23 excused to my vote.

24 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Always.

25

1 STATED MEETING

82

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: First I wanted  
3 to congratulate everybody on the bills that they are  
4 passing today but I especially want to thank Laurie  
5 Cumbo for her strength and her courage on today's  
6 land use issue. Congratulations Laurie. You did a  
7 great job and I vote aye on all.

8 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

9 CLERK: Lancman.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

11 CLERK: Lander.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Permission to  
13 explain.

14 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you, member  
16 Adams I want to say a big congratulations to Council  
17 Member Dromm and the Speaker, your leadership on  
18 conversion therapy which with all of us goes back  
19 many years to helping us even understand and see it  
20 as a problem and what it just means to the humanity  
21 of our City and especially for LGBTQ young people is  
22 a big deal so congratulations. Congratulations to  
23 the Speaker on East Harlem. It is brave in these  
24 days to do community planning that might try to lead  
25 toward redevelopment and rezoning and to led that

2 effort on the ground and then been able to work with  
3 the City and City Planning to bring it home is great  
4 and one thing I want to underline is it's the first  
5 rezoning that includes a commitment of contribution  
6 to NICHA to public housing, something the  
7 administration had not been willing to do before,  
8 obviously critical if we're promoting redevelopment  
9 of a neighborhood that the public housing in that  
10 neighborhood also see investment and so thank you for  
11 paving the way on that. I'm pleased also to vote yes  
12 with Council Member Cumbo on the Bedford Union Armory  
13 and I want to note that her advocacy here seems to  
14 have helped win some broader policy change, not only  
15 that there will not be condos at the Bedford Union  
16 Armory but we hear reported at least that perhaps  
17 there won't be proposals for condos in the future on  
18 publicly owned sites when they are disposed. I do  
19 think this is an area where collectively as a council  
20 and as a City we can do better to set standards.  
21 Mandatory inclusionary housing sets minimum standards  
22 for development in privately owned sites when they  
23 are rezoned and then Council Members and  
24 neighborhoods can advocate to go up from it. We  
25 should do more of that on publicly owned buildings as

2 well. Not only that there shouldn't be condos but  
3 that we seek to have them developed or owned by not-  
4 for-profits or community land trusts, that we  
5 maximize affordability to the extent possible when  
6 given other amenities like the recreation center that  
7 we ensure permanent affordability. There should be  
8 policies that we all do together. I want to thank  
9 you for helping push us in that direction and hope  
10 that we will keep walking forward in it. I vote aye.

11 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Barron.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to  
14 explain my vote.

15 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. I  
17 would say that I've heard my colleagues and I still  
18 say that as a body we're not taking full advantage of  
19 providing housing to the most needy. With 60,000  
20 people needing homes and being in the shelter system,  
21 we need to do more both as a City and with  
22 arrangements that we make with private developers  
23 whose bottom line is to make money and increase their  
24 profits. I think we could have looked at  
25 establishing land trusts and this could have been an

2 opportunity to see how we could make that a model for  
3 going forward in the City and I think we could have  
4 looked at having a not-for-profit developer bring  
5 their expertise into this development so for those  
6 reasons I'm voting no on Land Use 808 and 812 and the  
7 accompanying Resolutions and I had some concerns  
8 about Land Use 773 and 775 but with clarification, I  
9 understand it does not include Option 2 so I'm voting  
10 yes on that and all the rest. Thank you.

11 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Levine.

13 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Madam  
15 Public Advocate. I'd like to congratulate my  
16 colleagues, Council Member Dromm, Council Member  
17 Lander, the Speaker for their significant  
18 achievements today and legislation in land use. I  
19 want to say specifically about Council Member Cumbo.  
20 I have seen over the last year and a half Council  
21 Member Laurie Cumbo truly come into her own and rise  
22 to the occasion in looking at this particular land  
23 use development with a level of circumspect and  
24 consideration and honesty and decency, respect for  
25 those that disagree with her, just an overall

1 STATED MEETING

86

2 responsible way to conduct this office and I'm so  
3 proud of the way that she has approached this and  
4 navigated these very, very difficult questions with  
5 grace and dignity and respect for everybody involved  
6 and I am proud that she has been able to achieve this  
7 significant outcome for the neighborhood of Crown  
8 Heights and the surrounding neighborhood in bringing  
9 more affordable housing and deeper affordability in  
10 the community center that was promised all along  
11 making sure that luxury condos will not be part of  
12 this development but overall it was the manner in  
13 which she conducted herself that I think is going to  
14 be a really significant legacy here and I'm just so  
15 proud to call her a colleague and call her a friend  
16 and of the significant work that she has done.  
17 Laurie, [Inaudible].

18 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Maisel.

20 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: We love him.

21 CLERK: Mealy.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Pass.

23 CLERK: Menchaca.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye on all.

25 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

1 STATED MEETING

87

2 CLERK: Miller.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to  
4 explain.

5 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Madam  
7 Public Advocate. I would first like to thank my  
8 friend and neighbor and now colleague. I'd like to  
9 welcome Adrienne Adams to the body. Congratulations  
10 and look forward to working with, to continue to work  
11 with you. I'd also like to congratulate all of my  
12 colleagues on passage of the important and thoughtful  
13 legislation and some of this legislation on that  
14 addresses some homeowner issues and transportation  
15 issues that we take for granted but that's why we are  
16 here and there is some really thoughtful and  
17 intelligent legislation being passed here today and I  
18 want to congratulate my colleagues on that but I  
19 certainly want to congratulate my colleague Speaker  
20 Melissa Mark-Viverito and Laurie Cumbo on their land  
21 use those that are being passed today. They are very  
22 important. It was mentioned time and time again.  
23 The need for housing, affordable housing here in the  
24 City of New York, how do we do it, how it has been a  
25 challenge and I think that we have demonstrated today

1 STATED MEETING

88

2 that when folks come together and put the best foot  
3 forward that it is possible. Is it perfect?

4 Absolutely not, but it is a foundation and a template  
5 for us to get better in creating housing throughout  
6 the City and with that I vote aye on all. Thank you.

7 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

8 CLERK: Perkins.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

10 CLERK: Reynoso.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Permission to  
12 explain my vote.

13 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Just like  
15 Republicans to silence the majority. [Laughter] Just  
16 want to, just want to make mention to the fact that  
17 thanking folks like Laurie Cumbo and Rafael Salamanca  
18 and a lot of these members in majority/minority  
19 communities, I continue to bode the bulk of the  
20 affordable housing in this City that we have droves  
21 of people coming in from these communities fighting  
22 for more affordable housing for deeper affordability  
23 and in other districts we do the bare minimum of  
24 barely doing MIH and then building at Level 2 or  
25 Level 3 of workforce option that these minority



2 communities are crying out for help even in places  
3 like again, the Bronx, and in Laurie Cumbo's district  
4 where they do this much and that's the reception they  
5 get. In more white affluent districts we see people  
6 do the bare minimum and not get that response because  
7 they don't have the struggles or the amount of poor  
8 people or the needs that these other communities have  
9 and I think we, we have to talk about that as a  
10 council. I don't think we've done that. I think we  
11 run away from it and so long as that continues to  
12 happen, our communities are gonna continue to cry out  
13 and we can't build all the affordable housing on the  
14 backs of the council members that have poor districts  
15 so I want to say good job to Laurie Cumbo for  
16 continuing the work of being able to provide  
17 affordable housing for her community and just really  
18 want to get back to the fact that Rafael has built  
19 more affordable housing in his short amount of time  
20 here than possibly any other council member. We  
21 can't allow those people to be the only ones that  
22 built affordable housing and with that I vote aye on  
23 all. Thank you.

24 CLERK: Richards.

1 STATED MEETING

90

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Thank you and I  
3 want to start off congratulating my found new  
4 colleague, Council Member Adrienne Adams. I just  
5 also want to circle back and agree with my colleagues  
6 and congratulate both first off Speaker Melissa Mark-  
7 Viverito on East Harlem and Council Member Laurie  
8 Cumbo on her work on Bedford Armory and I want to  
9 point out that, you know, there are trade off  
10 sometimes that are critical to ensuring that both  
11 economic and social growth also happens in  
12 communities. It's not good enough to have a strategy  
13 where we're just building housing and not thinking of  
14 the other amenities that communities need so I think  
15 these two rezonings strike an important balance in  
16 reaching a medium that's gonna insure that even as we  
17 get affordable housing but that local communities  
18 receive the particular amenities that they long  
19 deserve and I think we do have a lot more work to do  
20 in the City in ensuring that we are addressing the  
21 affordable housing crises. These two projects  
22 certainly are hitting a mark and a target but there's  
23 more work we need to do and around community land  
24 trusts that was mentioned but also making sure more  
25 subsidy dollars are available as well to make sure we

1 STATED MEETING

91

2 can drive down the affordability levels even to a  
3 greater capability and dimension as well so with that  
4 congratulations. You've handled yourselves well.  
5 Council Member Cumbo, hats off to you on a good deal  
6 and to the Speaker, I of course expected nothing  
7 less. Melissa does well everywhere and with that I  
8 vote aye.

9 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

10 CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to  
12 explain my vote.

13 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I want to say  
15 welcome to Council Member Adams. We're glad to see  
16 you here. You made it girl and to Council Member  
17 Chin, I want to thank her for continuing to pass much  
18 needed legislation that supports our senior  
19 population and to Council Member Cumbo. I think with  
20 leadership comes great responsibility and  
21 responsibility to make the tough decisions and I  
22 truly believe that you are a profile in courage and I  
23 congratulate you on getting this legislation passed  
24 and with that I vote aye on all. Thank you.

25 CLERK: Salamanca.

1 STATED MEETING

92

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I would like  
3 to congratulate and welcome Council Member Adams and  
4 also congratulate Council Member Cumbo on a job well  
5 done. I vote aye on all. Thank you.

6 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

7 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to  
9 explain my vote.

10 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So I'd like to  
12 certainly congratulate all my colleagues on their  
13 pieces of legislation and all their achievements and  
14 kudos to the Speaker for her district and I'd like to  
15 just comment briefly on Council Member Cumbo's land  
16 use project. From my understanding it started with a  
17 proposal that had two few affordable housing  
18 opportunities with luxury condos and it ended up with  
19 a proposal due to her determination and her steadfast  
20 insistence that the project be majority affordable  
21 housing with zero luxury condos and as noted by some  
22 of my colleagues, people are not sardines. You don't  
23 just stuff them in a box and say here. Live here.  
24 They need to have services, schools, parks, a  
25 neighborhood so this project also includes affordable

1 STATED MEETING

93

2 space for non-profits in the community that serve the  
3 neighborhood. It also provides affordable  
4 recreational space where local residents pay \$10 a  
5 month, \$10 a month, so they can have wonderful  
6 programs, children, family, seniors so she is  
7 providing I believe the deepest level of  
8 affordability that the neighborhood has seen in quite  
9 some time and she's providing her neighborhood with a  
10 full sense of a neighborhood and let me just  
11 respectfully add to the advocates. I respect  
12 people's passion on this issue but killing the deal  
13 would have meant zero affordable housing on that  
14 site, zero, cause I don't know what non-profit  
15 developer can just go there and build with no  
16 resources so Council Member Cumbo I applaud you for  
17 your strength during fire and I vote aye on all.

18 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Rodriguez.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye all.

21 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Ulrich.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: A warm welcome to  
24 Council Member Adams, my neighbor in Queens. I vote  
25 aye on all with the exception of Intro 1721 and 1723.

1 STATED MEETING

94

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you.

4 CLERK: Vallone.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all  
6 except 1723 and welcome Council Member Adams. May  
7 you be comforted in knowing that you shall always be  
8 going first while the rest of us with alphabetically  
9 challenge council member names like myself are always  
10 last.

11 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: [Laughter]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Hopefully Madame  
13 Advocate, we can address that in January.

14 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: [Laughter]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: We can switch  
16 the roll call backwards and forwards but welcome  
17 Adrienne and well done Laurie.

18 CLERK: Williams.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I excuse my  
20 vote.

21 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: First I too  
23 want to congratulate Council Member Adams. I have  
24 some dreams I'd like to talk to you about when we get  
25 a chance but welcome.

1 STATED MEETING

95

2 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Run girl, run.

3 [Laughter]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: [Laughter] I  
5 just want to, while I am standing on the Armory  
6 project, I just want to make sure that I put on  
7 record a particular exception to people calling my  
8 colleague a liar and I just want to make sure that it  
9 was noted. I don't see anything that she lied about.  
10 I think one can argue whether or not they got what  
11 they thought they wanted in the project and when I  
12 stood with the Council Member I heard her  
13 specifically say she would not support the deal as it  
14 is and with comments about it being better and no one  
15 can argue that it is significantly better than it was  
16 originally when she said she would not support it.  
17 There were some questions that I still wanted  
18 answered that weren't so I'm gonna go aye on all with  
19 the exception of Land Use 808 to 812 and 821 and  
20 accompanying Resolutions in which I abstain. Thank  
21 you.

22 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

23 CLERK: Deutsch.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: No on 1650A, aye  
25 on the rest. I want to congratulate Laurie Cumbo and

1 STATED MEETING

96

2 also congratulate Council Member Adams to City  
3 Council. Thank you.

4 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Greenfield.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: May I sum it  
7 up?

8 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you  
10 very much. Abstaining on Finance Resolution 1730,  
11 voting no on 1650, voting aye on the rest and I want  
12 to congratulate once again Council Member Laurie  
13 Cumbo and I want to congratulate the Speaker on the  
14 [Inaudible] rezoning. Terrific accomplishments  
15 including \$15 million for NICHU [phonetic] public  
16 housing that's brand new. Precedent that's really  
17 fantastic and I also want to congratulate Council  
18 Member Ben Kallos for his determination in the ERFA  
19 rezoning and I want to wish everybody a very happy  
20 holidays.

21 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Mealy.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I want to  
24 congratulate Ms. Adams. Welcome to the council. I  
25 just, wanna just say that congratulations to Laurie



1 STATED MEETING

97

2 Cumbo. She fought a good fight and I'm glad that it  
3 was changed but I have promised that I would not vote  
4 for this with this development getting it for only a  
5 dollar and then having a 99 year lease. I believe it  
6 should have been much more affordable housing and  
7 more supportive. Talking about two tales of a City,  
8 Brownsville gets so many supportive housing and this  
9 one should have had a lot more. If we can get 60%, I  
10 believe this project since it's the City's and the  
11 taxpayer's money, they should have did much more and  
12 I vote aye on all and I vote no on 808-812. Thank  
13 you.

14 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Um-huh.

15 CLERK: Matteo.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I'm voting no on  
17 1723, 1721 and 152, aye on the rest.

18 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Thank you.

19 CLERK: Van Bramer.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to  
21 briefly explain my vote.

22 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: Yes sir.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: First of all  
24 welcome to Council Woman Adams. I want to  
25 congratulate Laurie Cumbo as well for working

1 STATED MEETING

98

2 tirelessly to get this right on behalf of her  
3 community. She doesn't deserve what happened and  
4 what people said as she is better than that and I'm  
5 proud to serve with you Laurie Cumbo so  
6 congratulations. I also have to take a moment as a  
7 gay man who struggled for a decade with my sexual  
8 orientation to thank the Speaker and Council Member  
9 Dromm. Banning conversion therapy will save lives  
10 but not only with it prevent tragic suicides but will  
11 also allow for LGBT folks to be who they are and  
12 embrace who they are sooner, living healthier and  
13 better lives so this is a really important step  
14 forward. Incredible important piece of legislation  
15 so I want to thank them and all those who support it.  
16 Thank you very much.

17 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

18 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: As we tally  
19 the votes, that was quick. [Laughter] I too want to  
20 welcome Council Member Adams and congratulate  
21 Prince's mom, Council Member Cumbo. All items on  
22 today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote  
23 of 46 in the affirmative, 0 negative and 0  
24 abstentions with the exception of Land Use 808-812  
25 and accompanying Resolutions which is adopted by a

1 STATED MEETING

99

2 vote of 43 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 1  
3 abstention and Intro 1721A which was adopted by a  
4 vote of 43 in the affirmative, 3 negative and 0  
5 abstentions and Intro 1723A which was adopted by a  
6 vote of 41 in the affirmative, 5 negative and 0  
7 abstentions and Intro 1650A which was adopted by a  
8 vote of 43 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 1  
9 abstention and Intro 152C which was adopted by a vote  
10 of 44 in the affirmative, 2 negative and 0  
11 abstentions and Land Use 821 and Resolution 1758  
12 which was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative,  
13 0 negative and 1 abstention and Resolution 1730 which  
14 was adopted by a vote of 45 in the affirmative, 0  
15 negative and 1 abstention. Introduction reading of  
16 bills.

17 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: All items are  
18 referred to committee as indicated on the agenda.

19 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Seeing no  
20 discussion on resolutions, let's vote on Resolution  
21 614 which reads as follows a Resolution calling upon  
22 the New York State legislature to pass and the  
23 Governor to sign into law A4558 and Senate 61 which  
24 would prohibit discrimination on the basis of gender  
25 expression and expand the state's hate crime statute

1 STATED MEETING 100

2 to include offenses committed against someone on the  
3 basis of his or her gender expression or identity.

4 All of those in favor, say aye.

5 ALL: Aye.

6 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All those  
7 opposed, any abstention. The ayes have it.

8 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Resolution  
9 1225, a Resolution calling upon the New York State  
10 legislature to significantly increase funding for the  
11 New York State long-term care ombudsman program. All  
12 those in favor say Aye.

13 ALL: Aye.

14 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All of those  
15 opposed, any abstentions. The ayes have it and  
16 Resolution 1226A, a Resolution calling upon the New  
17 York State legislature to pass and the Governor to  
18 sign A2743 in relation to violations of safety  
19 conditions in adult care facilities. All those in  
20 favor say Aye.

21 ALL: Aye.

22 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: All those  
23 opposed, any abstentions. The ayes have it and  
24 lastly Resolution 1287A, a Resolution calling upon  
25 the United States Congress to pass and the President

1 STATED MEETING

101

2 to sign HR3185 and Senate 1858 The Equality Act which  
3 would amend the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and 1968 to  
4 include sexual orientation and gender identity as  
5 prohibited categories of discrimination or  
6 segregation with respect to employment, public  
7 accommodation and housing. All those in favor say  
8 Aye.

9 ALL: Aye.

10 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: All those  
11 opposed, any abstention. The ayes have it. General  
12 discussion, Council Member Williams. Council Member  
13 Williams not being in the room, Council Member  
14 Treyger.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Thank you Public  
16 Advocate. When people hear about affordable housing,  
17 the first question is always who is it affordable  
18 for. My new bill will make sure our housing lottery  
19 process is much more transparent, we'll finally know  
20 exactly who qualifies for affordable housing and  
21 perhaps more importantly who doesn't and why. With  
22 my bill HPD will have to report on housing lottery  
23 outcomes broken down by AMI, eligibility for  
24 preference and demographics. The number of  
25 applicants who are accepted, rejected or put on a

2 waiting list will also be available and the data will  
3 be broken down by a variety of income levels  
4 including extremely low income applicants, very low  
5 income applicants, low income applicants and moderate  
6 income applicants. I'm also pleased to introduce  
7 another bill that will help many families here today.  
8 It's more expensive than ever to raise a family in  
9 our City and diapers are a call to necessity. Having  
10 clean diapers for your children is not a luxury but  
11 it is a need. Council Member Julissa Ferreras-  
12 Copeland made our City better, a more equal place,  
13 with her legislation that provided free feminine  
14 hygiene products for so many people in our City.  
15 Like feminine hygiene product, diapers are also a  
16 necessity that should be available at no cost.  
17 Diapers are a huge expense and my bill will provide  
18 for free diapers for our most vulnerable families and  
19 childcare centers and our family shelters and I thank  
20 you for your time and also I want to just welcome  
21 Council Member Adams to the coolest row in the City  
22 Council as well.

23 MADAM PUBLIC ADVOCATE: That's where I  
24 used to sit. Not seeing Council Member Williams,  
25 closing remarks to Speaker Mark-Viverito.

2 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you  
3 to all my colleagues and definitely as I think  
4 Council Member Cumbo said, you know, we need to  
5 be respectful to each other and unfortunately the  
6 situation today is one that has happened to other  
7 legislative items. I know mine was one of the  
8 ones that was being protested today. We do a lot  
9 of deliberations. I know in my case, we did  
10 extensive conversations and we made a lot of  
11 adjustments to accommodate community concerns but  
12 we know in this job we can't please everybody.  
13 We do the best that we can. We work our damndest  
14 and our hardest to ensure that community input is  
15 part of the decisions we make and I'm proud of  
16 the work that we've accomplished in this council  
17 so I congratulate Council Member Cumbo and I  
18 congratulate Ben Kallo and all of the other land  
19 use items that were on the agenda so thank you  
20 all for the support and congratulations again to  
21 Council Member Adams. A great interesting first  
22 day of your tenure. [Laughter]

23 [Laughter]

24 CHAIR SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: And with  
25 that we end the session and we are adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 21, 2017