

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

----- X

May 8, 2019
Start: 11:43 a.m.
Recess: 12:11 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: KAREN KOSLOWITZ
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne E. Adams
Margaret S. Chin
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
Vanessa L. Gibson
Corey D. Johnson
Rory I. Lancman
Steven Matteo
Deborah L. Rose
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

3

2 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: [gavel] The
3 Meeting on Rules is now called to order. Good
4 morning and welcome to the Committee on Rules,
5 Privileges and Elections. My name is Karen
6 Koslowitz, and I am Chair of this committee. Before
7 we begin this hearing, I would like to introduce the
8 Council Members of this committee who have joined us
9 today. First, we are honored that our Speaker will
10 be joining us. The other members of this committee
11 who—who are present are Minority Leader Steven
12 Matteo, Council Member Adrienne Adams, Council Member
13 Margaret Chin, Council Member Rafael Espinal, Council
14 Member Vanessa Gibson, Council Member Rory Lancman,
15 and Council Member Debi Rose. I would also like to
16 acknowledge Rules Committee Counsel Elizabeth Guzman
17 and the staff of the Council's Investigative Unit
18 Chuck Davis, Director of Investigations and Andre
19 Johnson Brown, Investigator. Today, the Rules
20 Committee will consider two candidates for re-
21 designation by the Council to the Civilian Complaint
22 Review Board, Mr. Joseph Puma and Mr. Nathan Joseph.
23 If re-designated and subsequently reappointed by the
24 Mayor, Mr. Puma a resident of Manhattan will serve
25 for the remainder of a three-year term that expires

1 COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

4

2 July 4, 2021. If re-designated and subsequently
3 reappointed by the Mayor, Mr. Nathan Joseph, a
4 resident of Staten Island will serve for a three-year
5 term beginning July 5, 2019 and expiring July, 4,
6 2022. Pursuant to the New York City Charter, the New
7 York Civil-City Civilian Complaint Review Board has
8 13 members. Of these, five are designated by the
9 Council, one from each of the boroughs. Five are
10 designated by the Mayor, one of whom is appointed
11 Review Board Chair, and three are designated by the
12 Police Commissioner. The three designated by the
13 Police Commissioner must have law enforcement
14 experience. All appointees the Review Board serve
15 three-year terms. Review Board mandates may not hold
16 any other public office including public employment.
17 Board members are compensated per diem at a rate of
18 \$315. The Review Board is authorized to receive and
19 investigate here, make findings and recommend action
20 concerning Civilian Complaints of misconduct
21 committed by members of the New York City Police
22 Department. Complaints within the Review Board's
23 jurisdiction-jurisdiction include those that allege
24 excessive force, abuse of authority, discourtesy or
25 use of offensive language including, but not limited

2 to slurs relating to race, ethnicity, religion,
3 gender, sexual orientation and disability. Welcome
4 Mr. Puma. Would you please raise your right hand to
5 be sworn in.

6 LEGAL COUNSEL: Do you swear or affirm to
7 tell the truth, the whole truth in this testimony
8 you're about to give?

9 JOSEPH PUMA: Yes.

10 LEGAL COUNSEL: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Well, Mr. Joseph.
12 Would you please raise your right hand to be sworn
13 in.

14 LEGAL COUNSEL: Hello. Do you swear or
15 affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth in this
16 testimony you're about to give?

17 NATHAN JOSEPH: I do.

18 LEGAL COUNSEL: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Mr. Puma, do you
20 wish to make an opening statement?

21 JOSEPH PUMA: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Alright.

23 JOSEPH PUMA: Good morning, Chair
24 Koslowitz, Speaker Johnson and members of the
25 Committee on Rules, Privileges and Elections. The

1 last time I appeared before this committee in April
2 2016, the CCRB was in the midst of significant
3 leadership transition. Despite the immense
4 uncertainty of that period, I retained hope that the
5 agency including its very dedicated and capable staff
6 would rebound and even prosper once the new the issue
7 took the helm. I am happy to report and to bear
8 witness that reality that three years later the CCRB
9 despite its undeniable constraints and continued
10 opportunities for improvement is more equipped to
11 fulfill and indeed has been fulfilling its Charter
12 mandate more faithfully than at any time I can recall
13 over the past five years of my CCRB service. During
14 the past five years, I've had the unique opportunity
15 to excise fair minded hands-on principles and
16 collaborative leadership during a time when vast
17 swabs of the public and numerous leaders in
18 government and law enforcement have looked to repair
19 and improve police community relations. During this
20 time I have seen the agency through five changes in
21 in the Board's chair, an ad hoc Executive Committee
22 that temporarily performs the duties of Chair when
23 the agency had no one named, and three changes in
24 Executive Director. At pivotal times I've been able
25

2 to help shape the face of upper management by serving
3 on committees to vet and advise selection on
4 Executive Director, General Counsel, Senior Advisor
5 candidates and by offering incoming chairs or acting
6 chairs, perspectives and recent institutional memory
7 as they transitioned into their roles. Seeds that
8 were sewn in recent years such as the creation of the
9 Administration-Administrative Prosecution Unit and
10 the funding of Outreach, Training and Policy Units
11 have borne and continue to bear fruit. The agency
12 continues to be blessed with a highly capable staff
13 that is dedicated to the agency's mission, and in my
14 experience earnestly receives, solicits, considers
15 and yes even voluntarily implements suggestions for
16 improvement from internal and external stakeholders.
17 One recent example of the latter is the Board's
18 Resolution to receive and investigate complaints of
19 certain types of sexual misconduct, which the agency
20 has begun in a first stage for cases they have deemed
21 can be appropriately handled within our existing
22 resources and capacity. For years the agency had
23 been referring all sexual misconduct allegations to
24 the NYPD's Internal Affairs Bureau. Although there
25 were strong cases being made that sexual misconduct

1 falls under the CCRB's fatal jurisdiction, it was
2 through community engagement particularly with
3 organizations that serve female victims of sexual
4 violence, and the LGBTQ community that the agency
5 began to consider this reform. It was a sense of the
6 Board that such allegations fall under the agency's
7 fatal jurisdiction, and I was a proud supporter of
8 this long overdue reform. I firmly believe the CCRB
9 should be an option for civilians to suggest this in
10 these cases. I also strongly believe the agency
11 would need more resources to adequately and
12 responsibly investigate the more complex and
13 sensitive so-called Phase 2 cases of sexual
14 misconduct that it currently does not investigate.
15 This is just one, but certainly a significant example
16 of some of the sweeping reforms that have resulted in
17 sweeping gains for the agency in terms of its
18 efficiency and effectiveness, and that has
19 incrementally improved the perception of an agency
20 for—for which much of its existence has not lived up
21 to its full potential as an important and uniquely
22 situated player in the city's police oversight
23 landscape with potential to foster improved police-
24 community relations in the city. This unrealized
25

1 potential has been notwithstanding various earnest
2 efforts, scores of the agency's forebears, staff and
3 board included and also exacerbated by real setbacks
4 and challenges of the years. Although rights Stop,
5 Question and Frisk has been abandoned as official
6 practice is to its unconstitutionality and racial-
7 racially discriminatory impacts. Although there have
8 been moves to relax penalties for certain low-level
9 offenses, and in spite of initiatives like the NTO
10 Committee Policing approach, and the recent enactment
11 of the Right to Know Act, it seems the public
12 discussion has rightly turned to reforming the laws,
13 the mechanisms and even the internal processes that
14 could yield greater transparency and meaningful
15 accountability regarding alleged police misconduct.
16 This includes Charter reforms to the CCRB as one
17 option. All these efforts exist in a milieu of
18 discourse and debate focused on questions and
19 collective values such as how best to promote and
20 maintain public safety impacts on the day-to-day
21 practice of law enforcement creating better and more
22 equitable outcomes for individuals and groups
23 upholding Constitutional and civil rights and
24 understanding and initiating positive reforms to law
25

2 enforcement and the Criminal Justice System

3 holistically. If reappointed, I intend to help shape

4 constructive policy informed by stakeholder input and

5 CCRB staff regarding developments such as the NYPD's

6 Blue Ribbon Panel's recommendations on the Police

7 Disciplinary system, proposals and preparation for

8 any Charter revisions affecting the agency, possible

9 Civil Rights Law 50-A reform or repeal in Albany

10 regarding the confidentiality of police personnel

11 records, and efforts to reduce truncations (sic) and

12 ensure more Police Department concordance with CCRB

13 recommendations. Since I began serving on the Board,

14 I estimate I have reviewed over 2,500 cases. I bring

15 an engaged fair minded, hands-on and collegial

16 approach to working with my fellow board members and

17 staff. I bring an open mind, sensitivity, and

18 compassion to my review of cases, which bear real

19 world consequences to police officers and civilians

20 alike. My perspective and my experience as a

21 community advocate, life-long public housing resident

22 of Manhattan and as an Ivy educated openly gay bi-

23 cultural Latino identified cisgender man has aided

24 the agency in its outreach efforts for example to

25 NYCHA communities, Manhattan communities, LGBTQ

1 serving organizations of other community-based
2 organizations. My previous experience as a civil
3 rights paralegal, logic and policy analyst and
4 intergovernmental liaison has enriched internal
5 conversations about topics such as the budget and
6 legislative process, and has helped the CCRB forge
7 new contacts with partisan government, my long-time
8 involvement with Good Old Lower Eastside, also known
9 as GOLES, sensitizes me to the social forces that can
10 lead to displacement of the most vulnerable, low and
11 moderate income mostly of color residents of
12 neighborhoods all over New York City, I'm seeking
13 professional opportunities currently in the non-not-
14 not-for-profit and private sectors or for self-
15 employment after having earned a Masters Degree from
16 Union Theological Seminary in 2017. The Masters
17 Thesis explored issues of the stigmatization and
18 criminalization of public housing and its residents.
19 I have lived the experience and struggled with these
20 pressures myself and still do. I care deeply about
21 forging spaces for healing, understanding justice and
22 reconstruction of the fracture itself. As frontline
23 public servants in their communities, Council Members
24 have been vital partners in spreading the message of
25

1 the CCRB, inviting the agency to events in their
2 districts and distributing our informational
3 literature in multiple languages. I'm pleased that
4 under Speaker Johnson's leadership the Council has
5 continued its partnership with the CCRB in its
6 Community Partners Initiative, which began during the
7 tenure of former Council Speaker Melissa Mark-
8 Viverito. The Community Partners Initiative allows
9 members of the public to access CCRB services during
10 special evening office hours in five participation
11 Council Members district offices throughout the city
12 where community members can file complaints, give
13 sworn statements and obtain information about the
14 CCRB without needing to travel to the CCRB's Lower
15 Manhattan Office during normal-during normal business
16 hours. I'm grateful for the participation Council
17 Members in this expanded Initiative, Council Members
18 Ayala, Gibson, Richards, Rose, and Cornegy. My
19 gratitude also goes out to several other Council
20 Members not listed here who participated in earlier
21 phases of that Initiative, and who-and those who
22 would like to explore further future participation.
23 You are well aware that the Council only recently
24 achieved its full complement of CCRB members with the
25

1 appointment Staten Island representative after a
2 four-year vacancy. I'm pleased to sit alongside Mr.
3 Nathan Joseph as you consider our reappointments
4 today. I might add that in addition to being a
5 thoughtful and engaged member who quickly embraced
6 the roles and responsibilities of a CCRB board
7 members, Mr. Joseph has probably one of the best last
8 names that a person could ever have besides Puma.
9 [laughter] Joking aside, I was deeply honored to
10 receive news in December 2018 of the Manhattan
11 Delegation of the City Council's wish to reappoint me
12 as their designee on the CCRB. My last reappointment
13 in May 2016 left me with a little over two years in
14 my term, which expired on July 4, 2018. In the
15 Current City Charter, CCRB Board members serve terms
16 of three years, and the Public Officers Law commits
17 certain appointed officials to serve in their
18 official roles beyond their stated terms until a
19 replacement is named. Seeking reappointment has
20 afforded me the opportunity to review and validate my
21 unique contribution to and commitment to helping the
22 CCRB fulfill its Charter mandate. Again, I was quite
23 humbled to receive the renewal-renewed support of the
24 Manhattan Delegation as their potential designee and
25

2 would be most grateful for the support of this
3 committee and the full Council in recommending me to
4 the Mayor for re-appointment. Thank you very much
5 for the opportunity to speak with you today. I look
6 forward to answering any questions you may have.

7 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. Mr.
8 Joseph, do you have an opening statement?

9 NATHAN JOSEPH: [laughter] He does. That
10 was—thank you. I didn't expect that. It caught me
11 off guard. Good morning, Chair Koslowitz and,
12 Speaker Johnson and Council Members. I come before
13 you today to be considered for re-appointment to the
14 Board of the New York City CCRB. I have served on
15 the CCRB for only seven months. I'm the newest
16 member of it, and this is oldest member. That's
17 fascinating. It has been an enlightening and very
18 rewarding experience. There are no easy solutions to
19 the issues of community police relations. It will
20 take time and dedication to not only maintain the
21 gains, but to move forward with initiatives to
22 improve that relationship. An aspect of improving
23 that relationship is educating communities about the
24 role of the CCRB. I say this because the majority of
25 the people I speak with do not know that the CCRB

1 exists or if they have heard of it, they believe it
2 for filing general complaints like no heat, trash in
3 the streets, potholes, tolls, all kinds of things
4 except police/community relations. Then there are
5 those who know something about us but feel we are an
6 extension of the Police Department, and we will not
7 really help them, and then there are those who know
8 about us, but won't deal with us because they feel we
9 are totally ineffective since the Police Commissioner
10 has final say on discipline for substantiated
11 misconduct allegation. More people need to know that
12 we exist, and that we are here to serve them by
13 addressing their concerns related to interactions
14 with the police. This requires increased outreach
15 events as well as greatly increased advertising, and
16 this requires a close collaborative relationship with
17 the City Council. I hope you will allow me to
18 continue to be a part of this effort by reappointing
19 me to the CCRB. I thank you for your consideration,
20 and I'm ready for your questions.

22 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. Mr.
23 Puma, as a long-term member of the Civilian Complaint
24 Review Board, can you tell us how your work has

1 contributed to improving the way the NYPD handles
2 policemen's conduct?

3
4 JOSEPH PUMA: Yes, I mean, I-I think
5 those efforts are ongoing but what I've seen during
6 my time has been a--an effort to increase
7 communication between the agencies. It is a bit of a
8 David and Goliath relationship. I don't think that's
9 a secret, and though--and--and we are certainly
10 integrated into the--we are part of the disciplinary
11 system, a much larger disciplinary system that
12 resides with the department. There has been efforts
13 such as introducing the reconsideration process to
14 begin to, which have helped I guess facilitate
15 dialogue about specific cases and specific penalties
16 that have been recommend--that have been recommended
17 by the Board. The Board has also even unilaterally
18 created things like memoranda--I think you call them
19 variance memoranda where if a board panel departs
20 from example it substantiates a case that the CCRB
21 investigator did not originally recommend for
22 substantiation, the Board panel with the help of--of
23 staff drafts a memo explaining that, and because
24 that's a case that's eventually going to get brought
25 to the department. So, if it arrives there, they

2 have no idea previously. They have no idea why the
3 Board panel departed from the original
4 recommendation. So that's just some example.

5 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Okay, thank you.

6 We have to speed it up because we have a lot of
7 things going on today including the Council metering.
8 Mr. Joseph, [coughs] your appointment the CCRB was
9 fairly recent. Can you tell us how you're experience
10 thus far has compared to your expectations about what
11 this work would be. Has your experience been
12 positive?

13 NATHAN JOSEPH: My experience has been
14 positive. It was also surprising. I did not expect
15 it to be as much work as it actually turned out to
16 be. [laughter] Initially, I was told well, you'll
17 meet once a month in the Board meeting and that's it,
18 and I was wondering how can we review cases at one
19 meeting. So, the reality is-

20 COUNCIL MEMBER: Was it Council Member
21 Rose who told you that? [laughter]

22 NATHAN JOSEPH: What?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER: Was it Council Member
24 Rose who told you that? [laughter]

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: They sit there.

2 NATHAN JOSEPH: I'll take the two, and it
3 was—it was more than one person. I'll put it that
4 way okay [laughter] and so with 40 or 50 cases it can
5 take you three weeks 4, 5, 6 hours a day just to go
6 through those cases. I'm also very much involved in
7 outreach. I feel I must go out to community, see
8 what's actually happening on the ground, what people
9 think, what they feel about the police/community
10 relationship and that takes time and that takes
11 effort, but I don't mind. I—I love it. It's been
12 really, really great.

13 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you, thank
14 you, and any-any of my colleagues have questions or
15 statements? Council Member Rose.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Mr.
17 Joseph, in your opening statement you talked a lot
18 about the need for outreach and increased outreach.
19 Is there—do you have some way in mind that you would
20 like to see this happen, and what—what do you see
21 that needs extended outreach that need to be—?

22 NATHAN JOSEPH: Yeah. Fortunately, the
23 CCRB, which I didn't know when I joined has an
24 Outreach Unit, and I would like—and the Outreach Unit
25 goes out in the community, speaks at schools,

1
2 community events, and—and other things like that,
3 sets up its own outreach events. That needs to be
4 expanded because there aren't enough outreach unit
5 members to cover all five boroughs, all of the
6 schools, all of the things that we want to do. One of
7 the things we want to do is have a—a barber shop
8 tour. We want to go to all the barber shops on
9 Staten Island--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: That's where I'm
11 at. [laughter]

12 NATHAN JOSEPH: --and speak with the men
13 and some women that hang out at the barber shops,
14 find out what they feel about police/community
15 relationships. The reason we want to do that is
16 because when you go to events that are hosted by
17 organizations that are involved in politics, they
18 pretty much know about us. Okay, they know what we
19 do and how we do it, but we don't get to those people
20 who are involved in that, who are having, you know,
21 the most direct contact with—with—with the police.
22 So, we're trying to do more of those grassroots
23 talking directly to the people's efforts. We also
24 want to do more advertising I think on the subways.
25 Buses, ferries so that everyone knows about the CCRB.

2 I mean I want to see signs in the bodegas. This is
3 just CCRB. This is what we're here for. This is
4 what we can do, and I know we're running out of time
5 so, I'll hand it.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: And are you talking
7 about increasing the staff—the staffing in terms of
8 your outreach?

9 NATHAN JOSEPH: Yes, I think we need to
10 increase the staff. We need to pay for advertising.
11 We need to pay for media. Cable TV perhaps might be
12 one of the things that we can do, and as I said,
13 putting all those ads up on the public conveyances--

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

15 NATHAN JOSEPH: --would really help.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you.

18 NATHAN JOSEPH: Uh-hm.

19 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Any of my other
20 colleagues have any questions? Okay, with that, we
21 will not vote on the on the nomination of Mr. Puma to
22 the New York City Civilian Complaint Review Board.

23 CLERK: William Martin, Committee Clerk,
24 roll call vote in the Committee on Rules. Chair
25 Koslowitz.

1 COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

21

2 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye and
3 good luck.

4 JOSEPH PUMA: Thank you.

5 CLERK: Matteo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye.

7 CLERK: Gibson.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Aye.

9 CLERK: Chin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye and
11 thank you for all your hard work.

12 JOSEPH PUMA: Thank you.

13 CLERK: Espinal.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye.

15 CLERK: Lancman.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

17 CLERK: Rose.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
19 explain my vote, Madam Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: [off mic] It's
24 not addressing that. (sic)

25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Well, I just—I
3 wanted to explain my vote but--

4 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: We're very, very
5 late.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: We're late. Okay.

7 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Deborah Rose has
8 joined the Rules Committee.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [laughter]

10 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: We can't forget
11 about Deborah Rose.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I just wanted to—to
13 say that I think we're really lucky to have Mr. Puma
14 and Mr. Joseph. Their resumes speak volumes in terms
15 of their ability to get the job done, the fact that
16 Mr. Puma has been on there a long time, and has a
17 distinguished record, and I've spoken with Mr. Joseph
18 and in—and in the short seven months he's reviewed
19 over 500 cases, and he's been to many outreach events
20 that he's been ranked as an exemplary board member by
21 the CCRB. So, I—I happy vote aye for Mr. Puma and
22 Mr. Joseph's re-appointment.

23 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Thank you. We
24 will hold off for a few minutes.

2 CLERK: Council Member Adams,
3 Preconsidered and in regards to Mr. Puma.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I must say that I
5 am also partial to the name Joseph. That's my
6 husband's name just for the record. [laughter] I am
7 so enthused and impressed by the both of you. The
8 CCRB is indeed very, very privileged to have you
9 both. I enthusiastically vote aye and thank you for
10 your service.

11 CLERK: By a vote of 7 in the
12 affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions,
13 the Preconsidered M in relation to Mr. Puma has been
14 adopted by the Committee. [background
15 comments/pause]

16 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Nobody leave.
17 [background comments/pause]

18 CLERK: Continuation roll call,
19 Preconsidered M in relation to Mr. Puma. The
20 Speaker-Speaker Johnson.

21 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all.

22 CLERK: The vote now currently stands at
23 8 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and no
24 abstentions. Preconsidered in relation to Mr.
25 Joseph, roll call. Chair Koslowitz.

2 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: I vote aye and
3 welcome.

4 CLERK: Matteo.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: I'm voting no on
6 Mr. Joseph not on anything about Mr. Joseph. I
7 appreciate your efforts but the Staten Island
8 Delegation wasn't all in sync and two-thirds of the
9 Staten Island Delegation were supportive of the
10 nomination back seven months ago, so I'm continuing
11 that and voting no.

12 CLERK: Chin.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I vote aye and
14 thank you for your service.

15 CLERK: Espinal.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote aye.

17 CLERK: Lancman.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

19 CLERK: Rose.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye.

21 CLERK: Speaker Johnson

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

23 CLERK: Adams.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye and
25 once again, thank you very much for your service.

2 CLERK: By a vote of 7 in the
3 affirmative, 1 in the negative and no abstentions,
4 the item has been adopted by the committee.

5 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Congratulations.
6 This meeting is adjourned. [background comments]

7 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Council Member
8 Gibson.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.

10 CLERK: Continuation roll call, Committee
11 on rules, Preconsidered M in relation to Mr. Puma.
12 Council Member Gibson.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] I vote
14 aye.

15 CLERK: The vote now stands at 9 in the
16 affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions,
17 and on Preconsidered M in relation to Mr. Joseph,
18 Council Member Gibson.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: [off mic] I vote
20 aye.

21 CLERK: This vote is now 8 in the
22 affirmative, 1 in the negative and no abstentions.

23 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: The meeting is
24 adjourned.

25 CLERK: Now it is.

1 COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES AND ELECTIONS

26

2 CHAIRPERSON KOSLOWITZ: Oh.
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 6, 2019