

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON CONTRACTS

----- X

October 25, 2021  
Start: 1:11 p.m.  
Recess: 2:02 p.m.

HELD AT: Remote Hearing, Virtual Room 3

B E F O R E: Ben Kallos  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Ben Kallos  
Inez D. Barron  
James F. Gennaro  
Mark Gjonaj  
Bill Perkins  
Helen K. Rosenthal

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Victor Olds  
Director  
Mayor's Office of Contract Services

Ryan Murray  
First Deputy Director  
Mayor's Office of Contract Services

Douglas Lipari  
Deputy General Counsel  
Mayor's Office of Contract Services

Roger Wareham

Reilly Martin

@

1

2

SERGEANT AT ARMS: PC recording good.

3

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Recording to the cloud

4

all set.

5

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Backup is rolling.

6

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you, and good

7

afternoon, and welcome to today's remote New York

8

City Council hearing of the Committee on Contracts.

9

At this time would all council members and council

10

staff please turn on their video. To minimize

11

disruption, please place electronic devices on

12

vibrate or silent mode. If you wish to submit

13

testimony you may do so at [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov).

14

Once again, that is [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov). Thank

15

you, Chair Kallos. We are ready to begin.

16

CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you for

17

joining this virtual hearing today. I'd like to,

18

acknowledge that we've been joined by Council Member,

19

ah, Jim Gennaro, Council Member Mark Gjonaj, Council

20

Member Helen Rosenthal, and, ah, we've been joined by

21

Council Member Inez Barron. We worked with her to

22

bring a bill, ah, that she has authored, Introduction

23

1686, of which I am a proud sponsor, from one

24

committee to this committee, so we could get it

25

heard. Ah, I just want to say that, um, we serve

1  
2 together on the Landmarks Committee where, ah,  
3 Council Member Barron, ah, was an incredibly strong  
4 advocate and proponent, ah, making sure that as we  
5 consider our city's history, um, that that history  
6 included, ah, our history that involved slavery and,  
7 ah, treatment of, ah, black New Yorkers at different  
8 times throughout history. So more than happy to turn  
9 it over to Council Member Barron, and thank you for  
10 her leadership.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very  
12 much, ah, Chair Kallos, and thank you to the  
13 administration and the panelists and the other folks  
14 who are going to be giving testimony today. The bill  
15 that I'm introducing talks about

16 UNIDENTIFIED: Council Member Barron.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Yes?

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Please hold, we lost the  
19 live. Just give me one second.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, OK.

21 UNIDENTIFIED: We're live. You can  
22 continue, Council Member Barron.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Ah, thank you.

24 Thank you, Council Member, Chair Kallos, for allowing  
25 me this opportunity to talk about the bill which I'm

1  
2 introducing, of which you're one of the main  
3 cosponsors, ah, Intro 1686, and what Intro 1686 calls  
4 for is a declaration of legislative intent and  
5 findings. We know that in recent years there are  
6 many companies that have disclosed the fact that they  
7 engaged and/or profited from the commerce that was  
8 generated and in fact a great economic, ah,  
9 foundation that this country is built upon by  
10 engaging in, in slavery, enslaving many thousands of  
11 Africans, millions of Africans, during what is called  
12 the transatlantic crossings, sometimes also known as  
13 the Maafa. Ah, Aetna, ah, insured slaveholders'  
14 interests in slaves in the case of their death or  
15 damage and was found to have directly profited from  
16 such communicate. JP Morgan issued a letter of  
17 apology for its participation in the slave trade, and  
18 other, ah, organizations and institutions have also  
19 done similarly. So I want to be clear. It is not  
20 the intent of this legislation, ah, that puts the  
21 questions of past links to slavery as a litmus test  
22 for whether or not the city will do business with any  
23 such entity. But just as we're coming to the point  
24 where we are acknowledging that history has only been  
25 partially told or told from a distorted point of

1 view, and just as we're celebrating the fact that the  
2 Thomas Jefferson statue will now be removed from the  
3 legislative chambers, we need to make sure that the  
4 whole story is told. And some of my colleagues that  
5 are here have from the outset expressed support for  
6 the removal of the Thomas Jefferson statue, and I'm  
7 talking about Council Member, ah, Kallos as well as  
8 Council Member Rosenthal, among others who have  
9 understood that this was an inappropriate, ah,  
10 gesture, honor, or whatever else you want to call it.  
11 So this is in keeping with that and what the law  
12 would require is that companies that are wanting to  
13 enter into or renew contracts with the city would  
14 have to search their past and reveal whether or not  
15 they engaged in or profited from slavery. And just  
16 to note that this is not something that's far afield  
17 from what's happening in other cities. Chicago, Los  
18 Angeles, Milwaukee, San Francisco, and Oakland all  
19 have legislative requirements for potential  
20 contractors to submit displayed redisclosure  
21 certifications as a prerequisite for being awarded a  
22 contract. Again, not that there are, ah, um, other,  
23 ah, obligations attached to that, but the information  
24 must be told. We must put the full story on the  
25

1 record. So I want to, ah, thank you for allowing me  
2 to introduce this legislation, 1687. Thank you for  
3 your support in signing on, and look forward to the  
4 testimony.

6 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you, Council  
7 Member, ah, Barron. Ah, in addition to hearing this  
8 important legislation, we're also hearing  
9 Introduction 2401, which I sponsored, authored, which  
10 would require the establishment and maintenance of a  
11 searchable public procurement database and would  
12 contain information from all stages of the  
13 contracting process. This bill would require  
14 specific information to be made publicly available at  
15 each stage of procurement, from pre-solicitation  
16 phase all the way to the last city expenditure  
17 pursuant to a particular contract. This information  
18 would be made freely available to the public on the  
19 city's website. Introduction 2401 would build upon  
20 prior transparency measures that we've passed over  
21 the last several council sessions and would expand  
22 beyond the only public access point currently  
23 available, which is the terminal of the Office of the  
24 Mayor's Office of Contract Services on the ninth  
25 floor of 253 Broadway. In recent conversations with

1  
2 MOCS we were glad to hear that our interests are  
3 aligned on much of this [inaudible] material in the  
4 bill and we look forward to working with the team at  
5 MOCS and the administration to develop a version of  
6 the bill that we can pass before the end of the  
7 session. I'd like to thank my committee staff,  
8 Counsel Alex Polinoff, policy analyst Leah Skripiak,  
9 and finance unit head, John Russell, for all their  
10 hard work putting this hearing together. With that  
11 said, I will now turn it over to our moderator,  
12 committee counsel Alex Polinoff, to go over some  
13 procedural items and spread the administration to the  
14 record.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair  
16 Kallos. Ah, my name is Alex Polinoff, counsel to the  
17 Contracts Committee of the New York City Council.  
18 Before we begin testimony I just want to remind  
19 everyone that you will be on mute until you are  
20 called upon to testify, at which point you will be  
21 unmuted by the host. I will be calling on panelists  
22 to testify in order, so please listen for your name  
23 to be called. The first panelist to give testimony  
24 today will be the director of the Mayor's Office of  
25 Contract Services, Victor Olds. Both First Deputy



1  
2 Director Ryan Murray, and Deputy General Counsel  
3 Douglas Lipari from the Mayor's Office of Contract  
4 Services will also be available for questioning. I  
5 will call upon you shortly when it is time to begin  
6 testimony. During the hearing if council members  
7 everyday like to ask a question of the administration  
8 or of a special panelist, please use the Zoom hand  
9 raise function and we will call on you in order. We  
10 will be limiting council member questions to five  
11 minutes, which includes the times it takes to answer  
12 those questions. Please note that for the ease of  
13 this virtual hearing we will not be allowing a second  
14 round of questions for each panelist outside of the  
15 committee chair or the bill sponsor. All hearing  
16 participants should submit their written testimony to  
17 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Before we begin I will  
18 administer the oath. To all members of the  
19 administration who will be offering testimony or will  
20 be available for questions, please raise your right  
21 hands. I will call on each of you individually for a  
22 response. Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole  
23 truth, and nothing but the truth before this  
24 committee and to respond honestly to council member  
25 questions? Director Olds?

2 DIRECTOR OLDS: I do.

3 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: First Deputy Director  
4 Murray?

5 FIRST DEPUTY DIRECTOR MURRAY: I do.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Deputy General  
7 Counsel Lipari?

8 DEPUTY GENERAL COUNSEL LIPARI: I do.

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you. Ah,  
10 Director Olds, you may begin your testimony.

11 DIRECTOR OLDS: Thank you. Hello, Chair  
12 Kallos, Council Member Barron, members of the  
13 Contracts Committee, I thank you for inviting us to  
14 attend this hearing today on establishing a public  
15 procurement database. Council Member Kallos, I'd  
16 like to take a moment to you especially for being a  
17 valued partner on the City Council over the past  
18 several years. MOCS's over the past few years has  
19 demonstrated our commitment to centralizing the  
20 procurement process and simplifying contracting for  
21 city vendors. As we have testified before this  
22 committee previously, the primary work at MOCS  
23 continues to be the design, build, and deployment of  
24 a digital platform that centralizes procurement  
25 activity for agencies and vendors. The Procurement

1 and Sourcing Solutions Portal, PASSPort, has been a  
2 multiyear effort aimed at digitally transforming New  
3 York City contracting in a manner that streamlines  
4 and standardizes the procurement process. We  
5 developed this system through a phased roll-out and  
6 carefully considered user needs and the appropriate  
7 schedule for bringing functionality online. The  
8 first two releases focused on bringing vendors into  
9 the platform, providing a central repository for  
10 filing required disclosures, and performing document  
11 management, and subsequently piloting, ordering, and  
12 payment functionality on goods, catalog contracts.  
13 The biggest component yet, Release 3, brought full  
14 end-to-end functionality for the contracting process,  
15 enabling agencies to source vendors once they have  
16 identified a need, release solicitations through the  
17 public portal, evaluate responses, draft a contract,  
18 and ultimately submit contract packings to the  
19 comptroller for registration. The ability to conduct  
20 all of these activities in one shared platform brings  
21 a new degree of efficiency to New York City  
22 procurement. It alleviates bureaucratic confusion  
23 and it drives better performance. Over a year out  
24 from Release 3 we can now report that PASSPort is the  
25

1 central hub for doing business with the city. The  
2 past few years have seen a tremendous increase in  
3 vendor adoption of the system, with over 30,000  
4 organizations having an account and 15,000 responses  
5 submitted to elicit solicitations. This has been  
6 accompanied by discrete process efficiencies gained,  
7 such as seeing the length of vendor filings drop from  
8 weeks to days and the average length for background  
9 checks similarly reduced to a fraction of their  
10 previous timeline. Meanwhile, agency users have  
11 completed over one million work flow steps during  
12 this time and released nearly 2000 solicitations.  
13 Our team continues to center its main focus on  
14 driving adoption, supporting agency capacity  
15 building, and constantly iterating on the system to  
16 make sure it is flexible and user-friendly. Looking  
17 forward, we expect to continue iterating on  
18 functionally to match the needs of users, even as  
19 user familiarity and adoption continue to grow.  
20 These process will also involve decommissioning older  
21 systems and constantly looking for disparate systems  
22 that can be consolidated into this one shared  
23 platform. We will also continue to leverage the data  
24 that is now available from this system to share  
25

1 procurement activity with the public. As we recently  
2 discussed, we are in agreement with the primary  
3 purpose of Intro 2401, which is to centralize  
4 information on New York City procurement and make it  
5 easier for vendors and nonprofits to do business with  
6 the city. We welcome further conversations with the  
7 council to ensure that this legislation is tailored  
8 to the city's procurement laws and would like to see  
9 if there is a way to address the overlappings set of  
10 regulations we already face, already-existing  
11 publicly available information, and the need for an  
12 iterative, agile approach to software development.  
13 We are currently focused on centralizing information  
14 on the pre-solicitation solicitation stages of the  
15 procurement process through PASSPort. These made the  
16 most sense to prioritize early so vendors could find  
17 and respond to solicitations in one place and have a  
18 view of future city needs. We designed PASSPort to  
19 channel the information in the post-selection and  
20 post-award selections of the bill to *The City Record*  
21 online, which is legally required. Over time we  
22 would like to post this information on PASSPort as  
23 well. In general, we agree with the need to further  
24 centralize information on city procurement and make  
25

1  
2 it as easy as possible for vendors and members of the  
3 public to find what they are looking for. This is  
4 the work we have already led for years with PASSPort  
5 and it has resulted in a single place for doing the  
6 vast majority of business with the city. As we make  
7 further progress in adding functionally and  
8 increasing public accessibility, we will be happy to  
9 continue this dialogue with the council. Thank you  
10 for inviting us to testify today. I'm joined by Ryan  
11 Murray, First Deputy Director, and Douglas Lipari,  
12 Deputy General Counsel. We can take any questions  
13 that you may have.

14 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Director  
15 Olds. I will now turn it over to questions from the  
16 chair. Panelists from the administration, please  
17 stay unmuted, if possible, during this question and  
18 answer period. A reminder to Chair Kallos that you  
19 be in control of muting and unmuting yourself during  
20 this period. Chair Kallos, ah, please begin.

21 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, thank you for,  
22 ah, your testimony on, ah, on legislation. Ah, is  
23 the administration prepared to testify on Council  
24 Member Inez Barron's, ah, important legislation?  
25

1  
2 DIRECTOR OLDS: Ah, thank you for the  
3 question, Council Member. As you know, we were just  
4 informed of the legislation on Friday. We were, we  
5 understand the importance of it, the weight of it,  
6 and we're happy to take it back to the administration  
7 to see if there are any comments that we have to  
8 offer on that proposed legislation.

9 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: OK. Ah, as a  
10 courtesy I'd like to turn it over to Council Member  
11 Barron to ask any questions that you, she feels, she  
12 would like to ask and you feel comfortable answering  
13 at this point, and then I will get into the, ah,  
14 nitty gritty of the, ah, transparency legislation.

15 DIRECTOR OLDS: Absolutely.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Ah, thank you,  
17 Chair Kallos, and thank you, ah, for your testimony.  
18 I just wanted to ask are you familiar with the fact  
19 that there are five other major cities that already  
20 have this type of legislative requirement for their,  
21 ah, legislation?

22 DIRECTOR OLDS: I was not actually aware  
23 of that.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Chicago, Chicago  
25 was the first city and it was followed in 2003 by Los

1 Angeles, in 2005 by Milwaukee, and 2006 by San  
2 Francisco, and I think Oakland back in 2005. So  
3 we're about, ah, 16 years behind the lead in this.  
4 So are you familiar with these, with the requirement  
5 of these cities?  
6

7 DIRECTOR OLDS: Well, thank you for the  
8 question, Council Member. I was not aware of the  
9 other cities who, ah, have imposed these  
10 requirements, although I understand the rationale for  
11 doing so, and as we said, ah, we, we view this as  
12 weighty legislation. We, we definitely see the  
13 impetus for, for legislation like this, and, and are  
14 happy to take it back to the administration to see if  
15 there are comments we can offer.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Has the  
17 administration, to your knowledge, ah, thought to  
18 include this broad look at the impact of slavery in  
19 all of the manifestations in all of the agencies that  
20 it is responsible for? Have they decided to have an  
21 overview, a broad kind of look at how they can, ah,  
22 make this assessment for the agencies that exist in  
23 terms of the historic impact?

24 DIRECTOR OLDS: To my knowledge there,  
25 there are no decisions that have been made yet as to



1  
2 how to incorporate, ah, legislation, the legislation  
3 that you're proposing today, but, but I'm sure that  
4 there will be conversations about, ah, what that  
5 might look like.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: OK, but I just  
7 again want to highlight the fact that this is not a  
8 litmus test, I want to be clear, ah, for awarding the  
9 contract. But this is in fact a measure to bring  
10 full disclosure as to the contracts that might be,  
11 and we're only talking about, just to be clear, we're  
12 only talking about contracts of \$100,000 or more, so  
13 we're not asking small contractors to try to be  
14 burdened with this kind of responsibility, so I did  
15 want to highlight that as well. Thank you, Chair  
16 Kallos.

17 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, thank you, Chair  
18 Barron. I'm going to ask if, ah, any of the council  
19 members have questions before I start jumping into  
20 the, ah, more, ah, transparency questions.

21 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: It does not look like  
22 they do, Chair.

23 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: That's great. Ah, I  
24 really enjoyed, ah, your testimony. Ah, in your  
25 testimony you actually referred to City Record online

1  
2 and as, as you may or may not know, ah, I, I wrote  
3 that law and so, ah, compliments will get you  
4 everywhere. One of the issues we've run into on *The*  
5 *City Record* is that, hold on, I have a copy of it,  
6 I'll be right back. So I, I keep copies of *The City*  
7 *Record* and I think on my like last day in office, um,  
8 I'm probably gonna like have, have a fun bonfire, so  
9 like in, in a safe, meaningful way with FDNY  
10 supervision, of course. But, so, like this is *The*  
11 *City Record* and, um, it's got just like walls and  
12 walls of text and a lot of that text is, ah, is in,  
13 ah, basically it's inputted, if, if you're a software  
14 developer, in something called a, a blob. Ah, that  
15 is the technical term for when you drop a bunch of  
16 text into a field in a database, ah, versus, ah,  
17 something that has more structured data. Ah, is  
18 there an opportunity, whether it's through PASSPort  
19 or through your current passing of information to *The*  
20 *City Record* online to pass structured data that is  
21 wrapped with information, whether it's XML or  
22 another, an XML schema or something else?

23 DIRECTOR OLDS: Sorry, Council Member, I  
24 was trying to unmute myself. Ah, I appreciate the  
25 question. Ah, I, we'd love to take a look at that.

1  
2 As, as I said before, I think that our conversations  
3 over the years have, have been fruitful and you've  
4 often provided us with, ah, suggestions for things to  
5 implement into the system, and so happy to take a  
6 look at that and, and figure out if it's a  
7 possibility for us to do that.

8                   CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Absolutely. Ah, can  
9 you share a little bit about how the coding system  
10 currently works, so if I am a vendor, ah, whether I'm  
11 an M/WBE or a regular vendor and I make widgets, and  
12 not only do I make widgets but I make widgets here in  
13 New York City and my widgets are best damn widgets on  
14 the planet. Ah, how, how does that work? How do I  
15 find out about contracts and, and being a  
16 subcontractor or provider, or even prime contracts  
17 for, ah, the widgets that, that are just so important  
18 in this world?

19                   DIRECTOR OLDS: Sure. So I'm...

20                   CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: [inaudible] for a  
21 random technical item.

22                   DIRECTOR OLDS: I'll provide some, some  
23 basic information and then, ah, Ryan, feel free to  
24 jump in if there's any, ah, additional substance you  
25 would like to add. So vendors are invited to sign up

1  
2 to do business with the city. At that point in time  
3 they enter their commodity information, which will  
4 help to segment them towards the type of  
5 solicitations that are, are most geared towards the  
6 work that they do. All solicitations are put out,  
7 ah, through PASSPort and in *The City Record* so there  
8 are two points of contact for where you can go to see  
9 what those, ah, solicitations are, and then vendors  
10 are invited to respond to them. Beyond that, Ryan,  
11 if there's something that you'd like to add you can  
12 jump in here as well.

13           FIRST DEPUTY DIRECTOR MURRAY: No, I  
14 think that covers it for the most part. Um, you  
15 know, the commodity codes are pretty important, ah,  
16 here in making sure that folks sign themselves up and  
17 they can add to or change those, ah, at any point in  
18 time. And then, ah, there are weekly, there are  
19 notices that go out, um, and also a digest that goes  
20 out from PASSPort so folks can get a sense of what  
21 all the things that are coming down the pipeline.

22           CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, we've, we've  
23 been working together for a while. We operated up  
24 the, ah, public inspection portal. Ah, part of our  
25 conversation has been, ah, just in terms of the City

1 Council Local Law 5 of 2012, Local Law 76 of 2017, in  
2 terms of providing more online access to contracts.

3 Ah, apart from what's currently available to the  
4 public, we have PASSPort and the public access  
5 terminal. What steps is MOCS taking to, ah, open up  
6 more access to the public and comply with those  
7 specific laws?

8  
9 DIRECTOR OLDS: It's, it's a great  
10 question, Council Member, so thank you for it. Ah, I  
11 do remember the ribbon cutting ceremony that we had  
12 here in our office prior to the pandemic, but we were  
13 able to display some of the information that's  
14 available on our website, including, ah, the names of  
15 vendors who do business with the city, performance  
16 evaluations about those vendors, and other  
17 information as well. Today in PASSPort we, we push  
18 out through the system information about solicitation  
19 so that vendors can be made aware of what contracts  
20 they might be interested in getting on. We're also  
21 planning for the future to, ah, put out information,  
22 ah, about actions prior to solicitation, so that  
23 folks can prepare for them. As you know, there are  
24 other places where we're legally required to provide  
25 that information by law on the MOCS website. There

1  
2 are Local Law 1 plans, which are housed within the  
3 M/WBE program, Local Law 63 plans, which cover  
4 standard and professional services contracts and so  
5 we're looking at ways to intelligently, ah, provide  
6 additional road map information. And then, and then  
7 we'll look ultimately to provide additional  
8 information as well in the future.

9           CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you. In  
10 discussion with some prominent international  
11 procurement advocates, such as Open Contracting  
12 Purposes Partnership, the committee has advised that  
13 the potential impact of legislating additional  
14 transparency measures, some of these measures such as  
15 public access to the pre-solicitation backed phase of  
16 the contractor I included in this bill, ah, what are  
17 your thoughts on that piece and these additional  
18 measures, ah, and are an agency's procurement needs  
19 something that can be presented to the public at the  
20 pre-solicitation phase?

21           DIRECTOR OLDS: I think that the  
22 information, as we both know, is important so vendors  
23 can be aware of upcoming opportunities. There's a  
24 bit of difficulty, I think, on the agency side  
25 because there is already existing legislation about,

1  
2 ah, information that needs to be released prior to  
3 solicitation. Some of the plans that I previously  
4 mentioned, ah, regarding Charter Section 312, which  
5 is Local Law 63, also, ah, 6-129 of the  
6 Administrative Code, which is the M/WBE provision we  
7 call colloquially Local Law 1, um, so I think that it  
8 would, it would take some, ah, some thought and, and  
9 we invite the council, we invite you to engage with  
10 us on that in ways that we can figure out to  
11 telegraph upcoming procurements in a way that it  
12 isn't, ah, burdensome for agencies where there is yet  
13 another road map that they would be required to do.  
14 I think that there is maybe an opportunity to  
15 streamline some of these other, ah, road maps and,  
16 and we can arrive at something that is, is helpful  
17 for everyone.

18 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, thank you. I  
19 have no further questions. Ah, I do want to thank  
20 you for doing your best to comply with the, the  
21 numerous contracts that we are pulling on a regular  
22 basis, ah, and, ah, I see that Council Member Helen  
23 Rosenthal has raised her hand, so welcome the  
24 additional questions.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you so  
3 much. Thank you, Chair Kallos. Um, and, and thank  
4 you, Director Olds and, and your entire team. Um, I  
5 do just want to say that, ah, as nonprofits have  
6 reached out to me, as I'm sure they have other  
7 council members, um, your team has been incredibly  
8 helpful in getting information to, um, both the  
9 nonprofit groups and the, um, agency [inaudible] in  
10 order to connect them to make sure that, um,  
11 contracts can be, ah, you know, vouchers can be  
12 submitted and, ah, nonprofits can be paid on time.  
13 Thank you for that. Um, this is a little off topic,  
14 but I'm curious to know if you think, given the  
15 delays in, um, in, in, um, nonprofits being able to  
16 access funds that they're, for work they're  
17 contracted to do, um, whether or not you think the  
18 Returnable Grant Fund is large enough and is doing  
19 the job it's meant to do.

20 DIRECTOR OLDS: Thank you for the  
21 question, Council Member Rosenthal. We always enjoy  
22 working with you and, ah, a special thank-you, while  
23 I have the opportunity, to Ryan Murray, Jennifer  
24 Geiling, Erin Villari, ah, Jenny Russo, for the work  
25 that they do with your in ensuring that nonprofits',



1  
2 ah, needs are, are addressed in a timely manner. We  
3 had some similarly questions on the administration,  
4 on the side of the administration, and, and we  
5 decided recently to increase the size of the loan  
6 fund by 15 million dollars. So that was done, ah,  
7 about two months ago or so to ensure that we had  
8 enough money to, ah, meet some of the needs as, as  
9 agencies are making their way through the process  
10 and, and to ensure that nonprofits are, are  
11 sufficiently addressed.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh, wow,  
13 that's great news. Um, so what's the total value  
14 now?

15 DIRECTOR OLDS: The total value of the  
16 fund I, I believe, don't, I should have this number  
17 handy, sorry, wasn't anticipating this question, but  
18 I, I...

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: No, I  
20 apologize, and I'm guessing, I couldn't quite hear if  
21 you said the increase was 1-5 or 5-0 [inaudible].

22 DIRECTOR OLDS: Oh, it was, it was 1-5,  
23 it was 1-5, sorry for it.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Oh, OK.

25 DIRECTOR OLDS: Right.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And I think  
3 the base is 25, so that would bring it to 40, but  
4 I'm, you know, you can confirm after.

5 DIRECTOR OLDS: Sure. That, that sounds  
6 about right to me. I know that it's, it's, ah, I'm  
7 always thinking about how much is currently in the  
8 fund...

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Got it.

10 DIRECTOR OLDS: ...and I, I, ah, but we're  
11 happy to come back to you with the new total amount  
12 of the fund.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:  
14 Congratulations on that. That's, that's super  
15 impressive, and I'm gonna assume the payback is as it  
16 was before, which is 100%, um.

17 DIRECTOR OLDS: Absolutely. Upon  
18 registration, ah, the fund will be repaid.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yep, yep.  
20 Great, great, great, great. Um, um, I wanted to ask  
21 you about Council Member Kallos's bill, which just  
22 seems terrific. Um, would it be, um, in what way  
23 would it be different than what, um, people who are  
24 contracting with the city, who are already in  
25 PASSPort, in what way would it be different from that

1 reality, and, again, I, I'm, I'm not going after  
2 anything. I think the answer is it would be  
3 transparent to the public, not just contractors, but  
4 is that accurate to say or no?

6 DIRECTOR OLDS: No, that, that is  
7 accurate. The idea is to provide as much  
8 transparency as possible to the public and so right  
9 now we've been focusing on the solicitation phase of  
10 the contracting process, where you can go into the  
11 public portal, you can see information about  
12 solicitations that are, that are upcoming and, and we  
13 plan to now focus really on pre-solicitation so that  
14 folks can have as much advance notices as possible,  
15 and then we'll shift our attention to post-award  
16 information, but we're taking it in phases and trying  
17 to be intelligent about that, but the idea is to have  
18 a central place for, for, ah, the public and for  
19 vendors to have information about the contracting  
20 process.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Got it, got  
22 it. Thank you so much for that. Um, that's super  
23 helpful. Um, and my last question is about, um, on  
24 the side of, and, and I swear to you, this is, I'm,  
25 I'm really just, this is just a question, it's not

1  
2 meant to be anything more. Um, one of the issues  
3 that's so important is that in New York City agencies  
4 the people who work there who are the contract people  
5 the [inaudible], that they be trained and retrained  
6 'cause PASSPort is a lot and really different than  
7 what they're used to, and I was just wondering how...

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: ...coming  
10 along, and that's my last question. Thank you.

11 DIRECTOR OLDS: Absolutely. We, we thank  
12 you for the question and, and I agree with you, it is  
13 a, a brand new way of doing business. Ah, for those  
14 who are not familiar who may be watching today, prior  
15 to PASSPort the city had a paper-based contracting  
16 process and so we have fully digitized that process  
17 and long with that we have been training the vendor  
18 community and the agency community. I'll let, ah,  
19 Ryan speak a little bit to what that training looks  
20 like.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.

22 FIRST DEPUTY DIRECTOR MURRAY: So,  
23 Council Member, we often, ah, respond to this  
24 question, um, over the years what, what you've  
25 acknowledged with us and we've seen is that obviously

1 efficiencies happen over time, so there's an  
2 incredible amount of training up front. Um, we  
3 launched the most recent phase during the middle of  
4 the pandemic in June last year, so we're a year out  
5 from that, um, and what we've done it was timely,  
6 obviously, because, ah, we wanted to make sure that  
7 folks were doing in that digital space. Um, our team  
8 did initial trainings, as always. We created videos  
9 and guides, we put them online so that they're self-  
10 paced learning. Um, but as always I think the team  
11 rolled up its sleeves and did a lot of technical  
12 assistance and frankly that continues today. So, um,  
13 where an agency or a vendor or together they need to  
14 brought onto the same platform so that we can watch  
15 them, ah, now move tasks from one side of the house  
16 to the other. Ah, we've been doing screen shares for  
17 that and we're deploying, ah, to agencies who need  
18 the extra support. So the usual that you expect from  
19 training, lots of, ah, digital workshops and so, and,  
20 um, and then we also get out to the agencies with  
21 dedicated sessions. Um, primarily that's been  
22 digital, given [inaudible], um, but sometimes that's  
23 even better because we're looking at the computer  
24 screen together.  
25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Yeah, yeah,  
3 that makes sense. That makes good sense. Um, ah,  
4 ah, Chair, may I ask one or two more questions? I  
5 know my time's up, and whatever.

6 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, sure, ah, would  
7 you like one minute or two minutes?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: One is fine.

9 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: What, what, so set  
10 the clock on [inaudible].

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Um, ah, First  
12 Deputy Director, um, I'm wondering if you feel that  
13 both your agency, MOCS, has enough staff and then at  
14 the specific agencies like DYCD, um, Department of  
15 Aging, whatever it is, if they have enough staff to,  
16 to do this work well, um, given how critical it is.

17 FIRST DEPUTY DIRECTOR MURRAY: Ah, so  
18 thank you for the question, Council Member.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And I don't  
20 mean to get in trouble. Oh my goodness.

21 FIRST DEPUTY DIRECTOR MURRAY: No, no,  
22 we're, we're not concerned about the question. Yeah,  
23 so, yes, we feel that the agencies have, ah, the  
24 staff that they need. So I'm not up to date on any,  
25 you know, more recent attrition that, that may have

1  
2 occurred, but, but we really do think that as, ah, we  
3 continue to roll out our training as we bring  
4 agencies online as they become more familiar with the  
5 system and as we continue to, you know, build out  
6 some of the technical expertise that we'll be able to  
7 see, ah, progress and improvement, ah, at the agency  
8 level, and so I think it's more a matter of  
9 familiarity and us continuing to provide technical  
10 assistance and support, ah, as opposed to, you know,  
11 actual bodies, not withstanding any, you know, ah,  
12 recent changes with the, the administration.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Great. OK.  
14 Thank you very much. Thanks, Chair, for the  
15 additional time.

16 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, do we have any  
17 other questions for the administration?

18 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: It does not appear  
19 that we do, Chair.

20 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Seeing none, we will  
21 move on to, ah, testimony from advocates, ah,  
22 starting with, ah, starting with, ah, ah, people who  
23 would like testify on Council Member Inez Barron's  
24 bill, 1686.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONTRACTS 32  
2 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: I will, ah, just read  
3 a bit of administrative information and then we'll  
4 come to the panelists, if that's OK with you, Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Sure.

6 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Great. Ah, thank  
7 you, Chair Kallos. Ah, we will now turn to public  
8 testimony. I'd like to remind everyone that unlike  
9 our typical council hearings we will be calling  
10 individuals one by one to testify. Due to the large  
11 number of witnesses, excuse me, there are not a large  
12 number of witnesses. Due to the witnesses who have  
13 testified today we will be limiting each panelist's  
14 speaking time to five minutes. Please begin once the  
15 sergeant has started the time. Council members who  
16 have questions for a particular panelist should use  
17 the Zoom raise hand function and we will call on you  
18 after the panelist has completed their testimony.  
19 Ah, for panelists, once your name has been called a  
20 member of our staff will unmute you and Sergeant at  
21 Arms will set the time and give you the go ahead to  
22 begin. Please wait for the sergeant to announce that  
23 you may begin before delivering your testimony. Ah,  
24 at this time I would now like to welcome Roger  
25 Wareham to testify, followed by Reilly Martin. Ah,



1 COMMITTEE ON CONTRACTS 33  
2 Mr. Wareham, you may begin as soon as the sergeant  
3 has called time.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

5 ROGER WAREHAM: Ah, good morning to the  
6 City Council Committee on Contracts, Chairman Kallos,  
7 Council Member Barron. Good afternoon. My name is  
8 Roger Wareham. I am a human rights attorney and  
9 member of the December 12 Movement. I support Intro  
10 1686. Ah, the December, for background purposes the  
11 December 12 Movement is a black human rights  
12 organization which defends the interest of African  
13 people locally, nationally, and internationally.  
14 We've been an active participant in the United  
15 Nations human rights mechanisms since 1989. Intro  
16 1686, ah, 2019 has in one form or another been before  
17 this body since 2006, originally introduced by then  
18 Councilman Bill Perkins, continued by former  
19 Councilman Charles Barron, and now sponsored by  
20 Council Member Inez Barron and, ah, Chairman Kallos.  
21 Even then, as Council Member, ah, Barron has said, it  
22 was not a unique phenomenon in this country. In 2001  
23 the State of California passed a slavery disclosure  
24 law which applied to all insurance companies. By  
25 2006 Chicago, Oakland, Milwaukee, Detroit,

1 Philadelphia, Berkeley, and San Francisco had passed  
2 broader slavery disclosure laws. A catalyst for  
3 these demands was the national debate sparked by a  
4 lawsuit filed in federal court in March 2002, seeking  
5 reparations from 17 major US corporations which had  
6 historically profited from transatlantic slave trade  
7 and slavery. Ah, this is mentioned in your committee  
8 report. I was one of the lead counsel on that case.  
9 I refer to this history to emphasize that New York  
10 City, which regards itself as a beacon of forward and  
11 democratic thinking, has been seriously out of step  
12 with the national trend requiring transparency from  
13 entities which have contracts with the government on  
14 their connections with slavery. As I said before, I  
15 support Intro 1686. The protest in New York, across  
16 the US, and around the world condemning racism and  
17 demonstrating reparations since the murder of George  
18 Floyd has simply reinforced my conviction that the  
19 problems of 2021 cannot be resolved until this  
20 society is willing to examine the historical origins  
21 and continuing manifestations. Intro 1686, which  
22 simply requires disclosure by current and/or  
23 prospective contractors, is a good faith and  
24 necessary first step in demonstrating New York City's  
25

1  
2 commitment to address and repair the damage caused by  
3 the human rights violations which have taken place in  
4 the city. Thank you.

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thank you, Mr.  
6 Wareham.

7 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you. Ah,  
8 Council Member Barron, do you have any questions for  
9 this witness? It appears we do. Please, ah,  
10 recognize Council Member Barron.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. Thank  
12 you very much, Chair Kallos. I don't have any  
13 questions. I just want to thank Attorney Wareham for  
14 coming, taking time out of his busy schedule. I know  
15 he's very much involved in what's going on at the  
16 United Nations, particularly this week. So I wanted  
17 to thank him for laying out the historical  
18 perspective of this legislation, the, ah, ability of  
19 other cities, which we considered themselves to be  
20 that, ah, progressive as we are, to have already  
21 enacted this type of legislation and to just commend  
22 for the work that he has been doing for the last 40  
23 years in this regard. Thank you very much.

24 ROGER WAREHAM: Thank you.  
25

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, if, if I just  
3 may ask a question for counselor, ah, and this is  
4 more for anyone watching at home who, who may be  
5 curious. Ah, what prevents the city from outright  
6 banning and refusing to do business with anyone, ah,  
7 a corporation which, unlike human beings, have a  
8 lifespan, corporations don't, ah, what, what stops us  
9 from doing business with companies that have profited  
10 from, ah, the slave trade or other forms and, and,  
11 and systemic racism that followed, ah, are we able to  
12 do an outright ban? If so, why, ah, if not, why not?  
13 Ah, and if the best we can do is just transparency,  
14 ah, what, what can we, we as elected officials, as,  
15 ah, allies and, and within the communities of color  
16 do with that information when we have it?

17 ROGER WAREHAM: That's a very good  
18 question and I don't know if I have all the answers  
19 to all of that. Um, I'm sure there are legal  
20 obstacles to an outright ban and I think that the  
21 precedent that has been set by some of the other  
22 cities with their disclosure has been that, ah, they,  
23 once they have the information they can then look at  
24 legally what they can do and whether they can also  
25 build in or require, I know in some cities they have,

1  
2 they have asked the companies that have admitted to  
3 having profited from the slave trade to make  
4 voluntary contributions to programs that begin to  
5 redress the, the damages that have been caused, that  
6 have been caused by, ah, what their companies had  
7 done. Um, I think it's really, ah, what, what can be  
8 done I think is really tied to, um, the, the tenor of  
9 the time and the, the sense of what, what's people  
10 real or government's real commitment to repair the  
11 damage that has been caused. You know, New York  
12 City, um, I know former Council Member Charles Barron  
13 has a whole catalog of, ah, the, the, the, the New  
14 York City's relationship to the slave trade and  
15 slavery and what the, the, the, um, effect has been  
16 down through, through the ages. So I think that, um,  
17 if we can get this passed I think it will require  
18 some real, I think, creativity and commitment, but I  
19 think we can't get to the, the stage you're talking  
20 about if we can at least, can't even at least get  
21 this, um, disclosure bill passed and, ah, as Council  
22 Member Inez Barron has said we're like 15 years  
23 behind the, the cart in terms of other cities around  
24 the country. So I think this, this is a real  
25 important first step. I don't want to project too

1  
2 far down the line 'cause when people say, well, I'm  
3 not sure if I'm, I'm committed to that, but at least  
4 on the issue of transparency I think, that's, that's  
5 the importance of this step, and then we can see how  
6 we move forward from that.

7 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Thank you very much  
8 for your advocacy. Thank you to Council Member  
9 Barron for her leadership on these issues, ah, and to  
10 her husband's leadership as well. I, I, I've had a  
11 chance to serve with Council Member Inez Barron,  
12 think incredibly highly of her, and the work she's  
13 been able to do over the past eight years. Let's  
14 just add this feather to the cap. Ah, do we have any  
15 other council members with questions for this  
16 witness?

17 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: [inaudible], Chair.

18 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Counselor, you are  
19 excused. If you can call the next panelist.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Thanks, Chair Kallos.  
21 Ah, next we will hear from Reilly Martin from the  
22 Open Contracting Partnership. Ms. Martin, you may  
23 begin when the sergeant is called on.

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.  
25

1                   REILLY MARTIN: Hello. I am Reilly  
2  
3 Martin, senior program manager at the Open  
4 Contracting Partnership, leading all of our  
5 organizations [inaudible]. Thank you for the  
6 opportunity to testify today on 2401 in relationship  
7 to a public procurement database. Open Contracting  
8 Partnership is an independent nonprofit based in  
9 Washington, D.C., working in more than 50 countries,  
10 Mexico and the UK, to name a few, but with a growing  
11 presence in the United States. Our mission is to  
12 make public procurement more open, inclusive, and  
13 fair. We work with governments, legislators,  
14 academia, simple society, and more, who value open  
15 contracting just as much as we do. We believe that  
16 both folks working for and elected by New York City  
17 share this dedication, as is evident in this hearing  
18 and was already public today. We are supportive of  
19 having open, accessible, user-friendly data in one  
20 holistic place and we are happy to help all players  
21 get there. We know New York City and specifically  
22 the Mayor's Office of Contracting Services is already  
23 actively working on some of this. I want to lift up  
24 three pieces of their work, which are inclusion of  
25 forecasting information, [inaudible] and tracking,

1 and online payment management. They also have an  
2 ongoing commitment to continue to make enhancements  
3 to online systems and accessible data. To build on  
4 some of this work and do it well, it is our  
5 understanding that other city agencies would need to  
6 be involved, such as the comptroller. We are  
7 proponents of cross-functional teams focused on  
8 contractor [inaudible] and open contracting and are  
9 happy to help ourselves in any way we can. This  
10 legislation does include some helpful additions for  
11 open contracting, two in particular. It's focused on  
12 detailed award information and funding  
13 justifications. The value of open information on  
14 funding justifications has been important when  
15 reviewing emergency spending, particularly related to  
16 COVID-19. There are resources available on our  
17 website to learn how countries around the globe have  
18 managed to buy fast, smart, and open, as well as  
19 guidance to consider for future emergency spending.  
20 There's also ways it could be better. Specifically,  
21 two ways of note - clarification on the timeline and  
22 what's expected in 120 days, and how it relates to  
23 and/or complements or contradicts current  
24 legislation. Open Contracting Partnership recently  
25



1 released an open contracting legislative guide, which  
2 we hope can continue to be a resource as you all  
3 think collectively about open contracting legislation  
4 in New York City. We look forward to watching what  
5 we hope is increased collaboration around contracting  
6 data and continue to offer our technical assistance  
7 to continue to open up as much as possible and the  
8 best way possible. I will also submit this as  
9 written testimony for future reference and quick  
10 access to our online resources I've mentioned today.  
11 Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: When we say  
14 transparency, other people often hear bureaucracy and  
15 red tape. Hearing your testimony, you mentioned, ah,  
16 being able to contract openly and quickly during the  
17 pandemic. Ah, can you share any examples of  
18 jurisdictions that have been able to do so, ah, and,  
19 and how can you do transparency at the same time as  
20 moving quickly?

21 REILLY MARTIN: Sure, yeah. Um, if I  
22 can, I'll, again, I'll drop resources that folks can  
23 reference in the future. But if you go to  
24 [opencontracting.org](https://opencontracting.org) you'll see specific examples  
25 throughout COVID. Um, one of the, one of the best

1  
2 examples that we always say is the Ukraine, um, which  
3 seems like an unlikely example, um, [inaudible] to  
4 the US, but it's definitely a place where simple  
5 society is fighting for and looking for transparency  
6 in this space. Um, they're, it, it, I'll go back to  
7 it's definitely a partnership, right, of like who's  
8 involved at what stage, um, but I think if you work  
9 together to make sure all the information is, is  
10 open, um, you're able to do that quickly. Again,  
11 I'll, I'll cite the, the funding justifications. If  
12 you know from the very beginning where the money is  
13 going it's fairly easy to, to cite back where it was  
14 spent, um, given that there is a connection piece to  
15 take all the way through. So one, one point of note,  
16 um, that I think is well to remember, um, someone can  
17 correct me if I'm wrong, but one single contracting  
18 ID to follow, um, a piece of contracting from a  
19 [inaudible] all the way through to spend.

20 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Um, with regards to  
21 the, the contracting processes, ah, our legislation  
22 speaks to the different phases. We're adding  
23 increased solicitation, we're adding, ah, post award,  
24 we're adding a lot of the pieces along the  
25 [inaudible] lines. Where, where do schemas and XML

1 and, and making the information intelligent versus,  
2 ah, dumb, ah, as it were, and, and how can  
3 information be dumb versus intelligent?  
4

5 REILLY MARTIN: Sure. Um, so we  
6 definitely, as you mentioned, like to sort, um, open  
7 standards. So, um, open data as a concept, as you  
8 know and are familiar with, definitely means schemas  
9 that are machine readable, um, so that looks like a  
10 few different things, but essentially someone should  
11 be able to go through and scan with a computer system  
12 all, all system fields. Um, and so they definitely  
13 need to be separated. If it's behind, it's always  
14 valuable and we always fight for like whatever is  
15 open, um, should be open, it's great if it's open  
16 'cause that way someone can find and could find it  
17 faster than waiting for someone to respond, say, an  
18 email or a FOIA request, for example. Um, but, with  
19 that being said, if it's hidden behind a PDF  
20 oftentimes different softwares cannot access it  
21 particularly when you think about, um, screeners for  
22 folks that are, are unable to access information any  
23 other way.

24 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: The, the odd  
25 transparency for transparency's sake, ah, are there

1  
2 any flow-on benefits to the open contracting  
3 approach?

4 REILLY MARTIN: Sure. That was a great  
5 question. Um, so one of, one of the reasons we've  
6 put it in a standard that's a globally recognized  
7 standard, is so that you can do analysis, so we've  
8 done, ah, there are five case, uses cases that,  
9 again, I'm happy to point to, um, where folks can  
10 read more on this, but essentially those five use  
11 cases allow different constituencies, ah, and the  
12 public to examine where the money went, if it was  
13 spent well, if corruption was involved. Um, so  
14 there's definitely benefits to analyze that data if  
15 it is open and structured in a way you can analyze  
16 it.

17 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, the City Council  
18 will leave the record open for, I believe, 48 hours.  
19 Is that correct, Counsel?

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Ah, 72 hours, Chair.

21 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: 72 hours and where  
22 can people submit testimony in writing?

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: They should submit  
24 their written testimony to [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov).

2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: And, ah, I guess for  
3 open contracting what kind of, ah, engagement process  
4 can, can you do or can we also do to expand  
5 engagement over the next 72 hours for anyone who's  
6 interested in seeing how the city spends 20 billion  
7 dollars?

8 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Are you asking me,  
9 Chair?

10 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Well, I'm asking,  
11 ah, [inaudible] contracting.

12 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: OK. Can we please  
13 unmute Reilly?

14 REILLY MARTIN: Sure, hi. Um, so I'm  
15 happy to be a resource, um, and I can send somebody  
16 my email address, but it's just mmartin@open-  
17 contracting.org. Feel free to contact us, um, or by  
18 my email on our website at open-contracting.org. Um,  
19 we're happy to be a resource, answer questions,  
20 direct people to more information, um, either  
21 different legislation that exists around the globe,  
22 um, or different things that we have written based  
23 on, on research ourselves.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, thank you very  
3 much. Ah, do we have any council members with  
4 questions for this panel?

5 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: It does not appear  
6 that we do, Chair.

7 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, seeing none, do  
8 we have any additional panelists?

9 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: We do not.

10 CHAIRPERSON KALLOS: Ah, OK. I'd like to  
11 now conclude this, ah, hearing of the Contracts Comm.  
12 I want to thank, ah, all the committee staff and  
13 everyone who worked hard to get us here. I hope we  
14 can move quickly on both Introduction 1686 as well as  
15 Introduction 2401. Ah, with the remaining, ah, 65  
16 days that we have in this term. Ah, thank you to  
17 everyone and have a wonderful day.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date October 31, 2021