

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

----- X

February 27, 2024
Start: 10:23 a.m.
Recess: 11:56 a.m.

HELD AT: 250 BROADWAY - COMMITTEE ROOM, 16TH
FLOOR

B E F O R E: Jennifer Gutiérrez, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Erik D. Bottcher
Robert F. Holden
Vickie Paladino

A P P E A R A N C E S

Martha Norrick, Chief Analytics Officer and
Deputy Commissioner for Data and Analytics at the
Mayor's Office of Data Analytics

Zachary Feder, Open Data Program Manager at the
Mayor's Office of Data Analytics

Rachael Fauss, Senior Policy Advisor for Reinvent
Albany

Noel Hidalgo, Executive Director of BetaNYC

Christopher Leon Johnson, Self

2 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Check one, two. This is
3 a prerecorded sound test for the Committee on
4 Technology. It's being recorded by Michael Leonardo
5 and Walter Lewis in the 16th Floor Hearing Room.
6 Today's date is February 27, 2024.

7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and
8 welcome to today's New York City Council for the
9 Committee on Technology.

10 At this time, we ask that you please
11 silence all cell phones and electronic devices to
12 minimize disruption throughout the hearing.

13 At any time throughout the hearing,
14 please do not approach the dais.

15 If you have testimony you wish to submit
16 for the record, you may do so via email at
17 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is
18 testimony@council.nyc.gov.

19 Thank you for your cooperation.

20 Chair, we are ready to begin.

21 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: [GAVEL] Thank you.
22 Good morning. Thank you, everyone, for your patience
23 and welcome to our hearing on Open Data Compliance.

24 I am Council Member Jennifer Gutiérrez.
25 I'm the Chair for the Council's Committee on

2 Technology. I want to thank all of you, anyone who is
3 online, and of course, Speaker Adams for trusting me
4 to lead this Committee for another term. Open Data is
5 the lifeblood of effective governance, especially as
6 we witness the increasing integration of automated
7 decision-making into every part of our lives.

8 Ensuring the quality of the data feeding into these
9 tools is paramount. It directly influences the
10 accuracy and reliability of the decisions produced by
11 those tools. Municipal data is one of the most
12 fundamentally important resources for a functional
13 city government. Without clean, efficient, accurate
14 data, the allocation of emergency resources and
15 decision-making in critical moments can result in
16 life changing outcomes. Decisions made based on bad
17 data could mean a family loses their home, their
18 children, or their benefits that keep the lights on
19 and food on the table. Issues of inequity that were
20 only known anecdotally in communities for decades can
21 now be verified by accurate data. The Open Data
22 Portal is a beacon of information, and we have a
23 legally mandated and ethical responsibility to ensure
24 its quality and accessibility in the evolving
25 landscape of data and its uses.

2 New York City's Open Data Law was one of
3 the first of its kind in the nation when it was
4 enacted in 2012, and is a leading example in
5 municipal Open Data operations. Council Member Gale
6 Brewer was the sponsor of Local Law 11 in 2012, which
7 became the Open Data Law. The strides made in Open
8 Data operations as highlighted in the annual Open
9 Data progress reports showcase the tangible impacts
10 of public data accessibility in our city's
11 advancement. However, despite MODA's efforts in
12 improving data availability, there are still data
13 sets which are either overdue, unavailable, or
14 instances in which the content of some data sets does
15 not seem to align with their descriptions on the
16 Portal. The Committee is also concerned about the
17 staffing structure and mainly resources that are
18 allocated to this invaluable part of the City's
19 infrastructure. Shout out to all the Open Data
20 Coordinators. Understanding the intricacies of data
21 maintenance and operational processes is vital to
22 addressing these challenges effectively. Moreover, as
23 AI continues to evolve and NYC Open Data is
24 increasingly used to train AI models, the Open Data
25 Portal becomes an even more valuable resource.

2 Therefore, in addition to availability, ensuring the
3 quality of data is more important than ever before.
4 As such, the Committee is eager to hear from the
5 Admin, advocates, and the public to understand how we
6 can collectively elevate New York City's Open Data
7 operations and continue to lead in data transparency.
8 Whether in the realm of AI or governmental services,
9 the integrity of our data infrastructure is non-
10 negotiable.

11 This Committee looks forward to learning
12 about opportunities to collaborate with
13 Administration and support Open Data as well as
14 hearing from advocates about best practices in
15 promoting governmental transparency and
16 accountability.

17 I'd like to thank the Technology
18 Committee Staff, Policy Analyst Charles Kim,
19 Legislative Counsel Irene Byhovsky, and my Chief-of-
20 Staff Anna Bessendorf, and Senior Advisor Anya Lehr
21 for putting together this hearing.

22 At this point, we do not have any
23 Committee Members, but we will shout them out as they
24 trickle in.

2 Now, I will turn it over to Committee
3 Counsel for administrative proceedings.

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BYHOVSKY: Good morning,
5 everyone, and thank you, Chair, for your excellent
6 statement.

7 We will start with testimony from the
8 Mayor's Office of Data Analytics, and I want to
9 welcome Martha Norrick, the Chief Analytics Officer
10 and Deputy Commissioner for Data and Analytics and
11 Zach Feder, Open Data Program Manager who will be
12 available for questions.

13 Before you begin your testimony, I kindly
14 ask you to raise your right hands.

15 Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth
16 and answer honestly to Council Member questions?

17 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yes.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Yes.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BYHOVSKY: Thank you so
20 much. You can begin your testimony.

21 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Okay.

22 Yep, that is different. I have done one before, but
23 it was on Zoom, and I muted and unmuted myself
24 successfully. Yes, this is my first time with a live
25 mic. Very exciting. Okay, I'll try it again.

2 Good morning, everyone. Good morning,
3 Chair. Good morning, soon-to-be Members of the
4 Technology Committee.

5 My name is Martha Norick, and I am the
6 New York City's Chief Analytics Officer and the
7 Deputy Commissioner for Data and Analytics at the
8 Office of Technology and Innovation, or OTI for
9 short. I'm joined today by Zachary Feder, the City's
10 Open Data Program Manager, and I'm excited to be here
11 today to discuss our important ongoing work to
12 fulfill the requirements of New York City's Open Data
13 Law and our progress connecting New Yorkers with the
14 data that runs their city, and I'd like to thank this
15 Committee for its interest in and support of the Open
16 Data Program. New York City Open Data is the City's
17 most important public data resource with billions of
18 rows of data viewed by more than one million people
19 each year. Prior to this administration, New York
20 City Open Data was jointly managed by the legacy
21 Mayor's Office of Data Analytics, or MODA, and the
22 legacy Department of Information Technology and
23 Telecommunications, or DoITT. Staff from each of
24 these offices worked in tandem as the New York City
25 Open Data team. Technical work, like building the

2 automated processes that move data from agencies to
3 the Open Data platform was led by the DOIT staff,
4 while agency and public facing engagement work was
5 led by the MODA staff.

6 When Mayor Adams' Executive Order 3
7 consolidated the City's technology agencies under OTI
8 in January of 2022, the Open Data Team was also
9 united within a single office. This new arrangement
10 strengthened the virtuous cycle of rigorous data
11 analysis and high-quality data. The same necessary
12 work to make data sets accessible to the City's data
13 analysts and scientists, ensuring that they're
14 structured properly and documented thoroughly is also
15 vital for making that same data accessible to the New
16 Yorkers who use Open Data.

17 New York City Open Data functions as a
18 collaboration between our team and every City agency
19 and office. Shout out to any Open Data Coordinators
20 in the room. Agencies share their data and their
21 subject matter expertise. We provide governance, help
22 with data and technical knowledge, and lead broader
23 public engagement.

24 The Open Data team has three main
25 functions. We support Open Data Coordinators and

2 agencies, we manage the technical platform and
3 pipelines that underpin New York City Open Data, and
4 we work on making public data more accessible for New
5 Yorkers. Each agency and office has its own ODC,
6 approximately 100 in total, who are responsible for
7 identifying, structuring, documenting, managing, and
8 communicating about their agency's public data set.
9 Nearly all ODCs have other responsibilities in
10 addition to their work on Open Data and regularly
11 work with agency colleagues across information
12 technology, data analytics, legal, and communications
13 roles to fulfill their duties. It is also important
14 to note that given the breadth of information that
15 most agencies share on Open Data, ODCs serve
16 primarily as facilitators between their agencies and
17 the Open Data team. They rely on experts across
18 different divisions and teams to contextualize the
19 data their agency publishes. They then use that same
20 context to create data documentation and respond to
21 public inquiries about this data. Supporting agencies
22 and ODCs is critical given the number of agencies
23 contributing to Open Data and the variety of forms
24 the data can take.

2 To start, we create and promote Open Data
3 standards and best practices derived from our own
4 experience, conversations with City colleagues, and
5 learning from other municipalities. For example, in
6 2022, we released a simplified data dictionary
7 template for more comprehensive and easier to use
8 data documentation, we updated the technical
9 standards manual to refocus the document on Open Data
10 Coordinators and the data set life cycle, and
11 published a data quality standards checklist used to
12 vet data sets before publication.

13 Our technical work is focused on keeping
14 data sets up to date. In recent years, our team has
15 employed new tools to build automations more quickly.
16 These automations transfer data from its source City
17 database to the Open Data portal at a specified
18 frequency. We have also piloted an initiative to
19 empower some agencies to create and manage their own
20 updates and automations. Accessibility is a hallmark
21 of our Open Data initiatives. Our thinking around
22 accessibility is directly informed by what we've
23 learned from New Yorkers, best practices across the
24 country and around the world, and New York City's
25 Open Data law. We remain focused on helping more New

2 Yorkers understand and make meaningful use of this
3 data through public programs such as the Open Data
4 Week Festival, which we're celebrating this year from
5 March 16th to March 24th, and Open Data Ambassadors,
6 which has brought introductory classes to academic
7 institutions, library branches, local elected
8 officials, including members of this Committee. These
9 initiatives are products of our longstanding
10 partnerships with the civic technology non-profit
11 BetaNYC and the Art Collective Data by Design as well
12 as the enthusiasm of many New Yorkers who have
13 volunteered to share their skills and knowledge.

14 I thank the Committee on Technology for
15 the opportunity to testify today and will now take
16 Council Members' questions.

17 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. I'd
18 like to recognize Council Member Bob Holden who's
19 just joined us.

20 Great. Thank you so much for your
21 testimony.

22 The first couple questions might be a
23 little bit, just asking for you to expand a little
24 bit about what's in your testimony. In the last two
25 years since the creation of OTI, the folding in of

2 all these relevant agencies, you mentioned in your
3 testimony that this has been helpful to improving
4 data analysis and high-quality data. Can you expand a
5 little bit on how that's happened?

6 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yes,
7 absolutely. The legacy Mayor's Office of Data
8 Analytics, we have three main teams. We have a team
9 of data scientists that are actually huge users of
10 Open Data themselves so we get asked frequently to
11 answer questions about New York City government using
12 Open Data. We also have an Engineering and Governance
13 practice and then also the Open Data team. Bringing
14 together the technical team that manages the
15 pipelines that move data from one place to another
16 and having more direct connection between our
17 analysts and the technical team that builds those
18 pipelines has really helped us better understand and
19 better document and better make use of Open Data, and
20 I think the best data sets are data sets that are
21 being used frequently by people because that way
22 people notice when there's issues or if they have
23 questions about the data set that leads to better
24 documentation if those questions are then being
25 answered and memorialized in the documentation

2 themselves, and that's what I was referring to with
3 sort of that rigorous cycle is that as users of Open
4 Data being more closely connected to all members of
5 the Open Data team and the formerly distributed
6 across two agencies Open Data team, I think has
7 really improved the that cycle of documentation and
8 publishing.

9 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Great. How many
10 employees does your office have?

11 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: On Open
12 Data or all together?

13 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: All together and
14 then my subsequent question is on Open Data.

15 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Okay.
16 Our office, the Office of Data Analytics has, I think
17 we have about 18 people now total. We recently
18 welcomed some members from the Mayor's Office for
19 Economic Opportunity who have joined the Engineering
20 and Governance Program. Before that sort of merger,
21 we had I think nine folks, and now we have more than
22 that. Now we have like 20. I will get you an exact
23 answer after this.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Please, yeah, you
3 can send it over. Do you have a sense of how many you
4 have working on Open Data?

5 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Open
6 Data has on the Office of Data Analytics side, a
7 full-time staff of four. We also have a full-time
8 data engineering resource in the Applications
9 division at OTI and a part-time business analyst
10 resource at the Applications division of OTI so five
11 and a half total.

12 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, and then you
13 just said in your previous answer that you went from
14 nine to potentially 20, we're not sure. Can you
15 describe a little bit how the staffing has changed
16 maybe from the last admin to this admin?

17 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Sure, I
18 think like many offices and across the City had some
19 staff attrition and given the budgetary situation of
20 the City have not yet had the opportunity to replace
21 to replace those staff.

22 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Sorry to
23 interrupt, but do you have a sense of how large the
24 staff was then?

1 COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY 16

2 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yes. Our
3 previous full-time staff was nine.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Nine. Okay.

5 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: On Open
6 Data.

7 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Sure. Do you have
8 any employees working on Open Data that are also
9 working at OTI or are they full-time?

10 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: We're
11 all at OTI.

12 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay.

13 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah, so
14 everybody's at OTI. The Office of Data Analytics is
15 one of the divisions in OTI. The Applications
16 Division is another division, and that is where sort
17 of OTI's main data engineering resources sit so the
18 data engineer that works on Open Data is in the
19 Applications division, but we're all part of OTI.

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. I guess
21 there's overlap. Do the data scientists or other
22 employees assist other units within OTI or do other
23 agency staff assist MODA or?

24 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah,
25 both ways. Our data scientists primarily work on

2 scoped analytics projects with other agencies. We
3 sometimes do scoped analytics projects within OTI
4 itself. Also, the data science team works on priority
5 projects from City Hall and sometimes also gets
6 called in the event of an emergency situation to do
7 kind of like SWAT team style analytics, I don't know,
8 maybe that's not the right phrase, and then the Open
9 Data team works primarily with Open Data Coordinators
10 at every different agency and also works on public
11 engagement and runs the opens the Open Data helpdesk
12 as well.

13 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Great. Are
14 there internships?

15 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah.
16 Yes. We've had a variety of really lovely and
17 wonderful interns over the years, both Urban Fellows,
18 folks from the AmeriCorps VISTA program, and also
19 just regular agency interns as well.

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Great. You guys
21 now are in the Metro Tech space (INAUDIBLE)

22 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: We are
23 (INAUDIBLE)

24 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Great. Is there
25 any other staff remaining at the Gold Street office?

2 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: No.

3 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: No. Okay. No one
4 from MODA specifically is at the Gold Street address.

5 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: All of
6 MODA is part of OTI now.

7 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay.

8 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah.

9 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: So all of OTI is
10 at?

11 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Most of
12 OTI is at the Metro Tech campus across a couple
13 different Metro Tech buildings, 3-1-1 is at Maiden
14 Lane, and I think there's some other additional OTI
15 employees at (INAUDIBLE) Finland as well.

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I've been there.
17 Okay. In the 2018 Local Law that codified The Mayor's
18 Office of Data Analytics, there was a piece about
19 training for agency staff, community board members,
20 and the public. Do you know if there's a difference
21 between the trainings held for agency staff versus
22 community members and the public on Open Data?

23 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: The
24 support we give to Open Data Coordinators and
25 onboarding them into the Open Data program,

2 understanding sort of their responsibilities under
3 the Open Data law, helping them sort of navigate
4 their own agencies and getting data published, all of
5 the materials, though, that we use to train ODCs are
6 available on the Open Data Portal. On the very bottom
7 of the Open Data site, there's a little section that
8 says For Open Data Coordinators. Anybody can go there
9 to see all of the different training materials and
10 materials that we've created over the years to
11 support Open Data Coordinators so the public is
12 certainly welcome to look at that. It's aimed a
13 little bit more towards City employees who are
14 working on the Open Data Program in the context of
15 being the named Open Data Coordinator.

16 Then on the public engagement side we
17 have in collaboration with BetaNYC, the Open Data
18 Ambassadors Program, which I know you're very
19 familiar with, Chair. We also have programming, Open
20 Data Week is coming up soon, a huge week of amazing
21 public offerings. We also encourage agencies to do
22 public engagement around their Open Data sets
23 throughout the year, whether that's including that in
24 agency communications like newsletters or tweets or
25 other sorts of ways that agencies feature their own

2 work, and we look to Open Data Coordinators to lead
3 the charge there.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: How often are
5 there trainings for the Open Data Coordinators at
6 these agencies, like how often do they need to do
7 trainings?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: We regularly
9 have office hours with agency Open Data Coordinators.
10 Depending on the agency, for larger agencies where
11 they're processing a ton of data and generating a ton
12 of data, we'll have a monthly recurring meeting and
13 then broadly we have at least once a year a training
14 for all of the Open Data Coordinators, but we're
15 talking to Open Data Coordinators and, as Martha was
16 describing, troubleshooting specific problems all the
17 time.

18 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: For some of those
19 bigger agencies, what are some of those larger
20 agencies where you're checking in on them more
21 frequently and maybe that are utilizing this like
22 office hours more often?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Yeah, and to
24 be clear, the office hours are available to everyone,
25 and we have office hour meetings with a lot of

2 agencies, but we do have these regular check-ins with
3 what comes to mind are like the Health Department,
4 the Transportation Department, Department of
5 Education, the Police Department. Some of it depends
6 on current data sets in the pipeline so as we have a
7 larger queue of things that are getting ready to be
8 published, we will frequently have regular meetings
9 with agencies that are about to have their data
10 rollout.

11 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I'm glad you
12 mentioned both PD and DOE, because on this side, I
13 feel like a lot of the bills that were forced to
14 Intro are reporting bills, and so I'm glad that you
15 mentioned both of those agencies.

16 I'd also like to acknowledge Council
17 Member Erik Bottcher, who's joined us, and he's new
18 to the Committee. Welcome, Erik.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: This is a hot
21 topic right here.

22 How do you see MODA's role in New York
23 City Artificial Intelligence Action Plan announced by
24 Mayor Adams?
25

2 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: The way
3 I think about our role is that all of the advances in
4 artificial intelligence and large language models and
5 these sort of both new and not-new applications of
6 machine learning and artificial intelligence really
7 depend on good data and also understanding how data
8 are generated. The example that I like to talk about
9 is 3-1-1, right? How many people in this room have
10 seen a rat and not called 3-1-1? Great. Okay.

11 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Every day.

12 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Every
13 day. Sometimes people sometimes use 3-1-1 calls about
14 rats as a proxy for understanding where rats are in
15 the city, but really that data are generated by a
16 process of New Yorkers calling in about something,
17 and we know that New Yorkers do not call in about
18 everything they see, and we know that they don't call
19 in about things that they see at equal rates across
20 the city so if you're using the 3-1-1 data set, which
21 is a huge, people think it's so big, so it must be
22 perfect for everything, the bigger the data, the
23 better, and don't really understand how that data is
24 generated and how to understand some of the biases or
25 some of the gaps that data set contains. Not because

2 the data is bad, but because the way that it's made
3 is that people call 3-1-1 and not everybody does that
4 and not everybody does that for every rat they see in
5 the city so our data scientists are navigating these
6 same questions every day about what is a data set,
7 what type of questions is a data set appropriate to
8 answer. If we're using this data set to answer this
9 question, what would be missing? I think that
10 knowledge and that understanding and documentation
11 around the data and what it means and what it doesn't
12 mean and what you can use it for and what you should
13 be careful about are really going to be fundamental
14 to the advancement of using these new tools
15 throughout government.

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Do you know if
17 there's any companies using Open Data as a training
18 for their AI tools or utilizing them for their AI
19 tools?

20 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: I don't
21 know. I know that there are companies that use Open
22 Data to check licensing, for example, like the for-
23 hire vehicle companies use the Taxi and Limousine
24 Commission's list of drivers who have a TLC license

2 to validate their drivers, but I don't know off the
3 top of my head of anybody using it for AI.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Who maintains the
5 Open Data portal? Do you work with vendors?

6 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: We do
7 work with a vendor. The vendor we work with is
8 Socrata, which was acquired a little while ago by a
9 company called Tyler Technologies. Socrata is a
10 platform that's used by many different municipal and
11 federal agencies for Open Data, and one of the things
12 we're really excited about working on is organizing
13 other municipalities and fellow users of the Socrata
14 platform to try to drive the development agenda and
15 user experience of that platform a little more
16 directly.

17 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Do you use Socrata
18 servers to store data uploaded to all NYC Open Data
19 portal or is the data hosted on your own servers?
20 What is their role? What are they doing? What are
21 they directly responsible for and how long is the
22 contract?

23 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Do you
24 want to talk about the contract?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: It's an annual
3 contract.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: But we have
6 been contracting with them since I think 2012 so it's
7 a long-standing relationship. As far as, you could
8 talk more about like where the data is, but when the
9 data is available to the public, so when you're
10 accessing the data through NYC Open Data, the data
11 gets uploaded to the internet and Tyler, Socrata,
12 whatever you want to call them, is the company that's
13 responsible for hosting it at that point.

14 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: They have like a
15 server that is hosting the data?

16 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: The data
17 sort of moves from New York City to that cloud
18 platform. Only the public data is on that cloud
19 platform and Socrata maintains the platform so all of
20 the sort of user experience tools and things where
21 you can interact with Open Data on the platform,
22 those are Socrata tools and, similarly, also maintain
23 and document the API which is a way that many people
24 interact with Open Data is using the Socrata API.

2 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Do you know how
3 much the contract with Socrata is for annually? You
4 can get that to us.

5 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Okay,
6 we'll get back to you. It's 300,000 dollars.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Close to
8 400,000.

9 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Oh, okay.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Somewhere in
11 that 300,000-dollar range.

12 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: And they're
13 responsible for maintaining the portal essentially?

14 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay.

16 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: We are
17 responsible for the content so when you land on the
18 Open Data portal and it says welcome to Open Data,
19 and it's blue, and there's like nice little...

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Collecting all the
21 data and all that...

22 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yes,
23 that's all us, but in terms of the actual, like I'm
24 clicking on this button and something is happening,
25 they're designing and maintaining the website.

2 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Great. In that
3 same Local Law 22 of 2018, it also listed one of the
4 duties as collaborating with other agencies to
5 facilitate data sharing. What tools exist to
6 facilitate data sharing between agencies or what
7 protocols exist?

8 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: It very
9 much depends on the type of data that is being
10 shared. Our office is working very closely with the
11 Office of Information Privacy, which is also part of
12 the Office of Technology and Innovation, and we've
13 been working very closely with them prior to the
14 merger into OTI as well. The City has all sorts of
15 type of data. Those data are all subject to various
16 different regulatory regimes, whether that's HIPAA or
17 FERPA or the state's General Welfare Law or the
18 City's Personally Identified Information Act. Each of
19 those laws has their own sort of set of stipulations
20 about why data can be shared, what purposes it can be
21 shared for, who it can be shared with, and what our
22 office does is help agencies navigate that regulatory
23 environment and through templating of data
24 sharing agreements, memorandums of understanding,
25 work on the citywide data integration agreement, and

2 then also on the technical side, helping agencies be
3 able to unite data together, whether that's through
4 record linkage techniques so trying to look to see
5 that two people across two different data sets are
6 probably the same person or whether that's uniting
7 data sets on geography so geocoding data sets and
8 understanding which rows are in a particular
9 administrative boundary. I think we provide agencies
10 with sort of the playbook, I would say, more on the
11 data sharing side, like here's how to do it, here's
12 what you need to do, here's who you need to talk to,
13 and then finally, when they are ready to knit those
14 data sets together, here are the technical tools to
15 support you doing that.

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: In the last
17 hearing that the Council, Chaired by Council Member
18 Holden at the time, had on Open Data there was
19 conversation about a service called DataBridge to
20 utilize this data sharing between agencies? Is
21 DataBridge still functioning today?

22 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yes, the
23 the Office of Technology and Innovation and the
24 legacy DoITT agency has various different sort of
25 database resources for agencies. DataBridge is one of

2 those tools where agencies can send data to be hosted
3 in a database. Agencies still do use it, but I would
4 defer to my colleagues at the Applications Division
5 in the Office of Technology and Innovation for more
6 details about that.

7 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Great. I want to
8 move to the data sets piece. I think the fact that
9 you have a helpdesk that can help, kind of just work
10 with anyone who's got ideas and data sets, I think is
11 really cool, and so something that was flagged was if
12 there is unavailability of a data set, the prompt is
13 other data sets have been prioritized ahead of this
14 one. Can you share a little bit of who is in charge
15 of this process and how you determine your
16 prioritization process? Does the public have access
17 to how data sets are prioritized?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Sure. The
19 first way the public has access to how data sets are
20 prioritized is we have actually a data set that tells
21 everyone what is going to get released. Yeah, data
22 sets all the way down. If anything changes, so let's
23 say there's a shift where more work is needed than
24 was expected, that rationale gets shared alongside

2 the date when that change happened and what the new
3 date is so that is all transparent for anyone to see.

4 As far as the prioritization, there's a
5 couple of factors at play. One is based on demand.
6 One of the things I think is enshrined in the law. We
7 have in our technical standards manual and very much
8 encourage agencies to do is where there is a topic
9 that they're getting more requests for that they have
10 maintained data about, sometimes there is a topic
11 where there is not that data set in existence, that
12 data set is something that will encourage them to
13 prioritize for release. Oftentimes for agencies,
14 that's also a practical and like just logistically
15 easier because they are otherwise releasing that data
16 set to the public via FOIL so instead of fielding
17 dozens and dozens of FOIL requests for a data set,
18 they could put it up on Open Data and anyone could
19 grab it whenever they want much more easily.

20 Ultimately, the prioritization and just the
21 publication of data, we work with agencies, but it's
22 not our data, it's theirs, they know it far better
23 than we do and so we turn to them for that
24 prioritization just based on the other things they're

2 working on and the internal knowledge of those
3 systems and what that data entails.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Why are some data
5 sets removed from the portal? Can you expand a little
6 bit about when that happens, do you announce it, and
7 do you believe that data sets that are removed should
8 still be available?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: To the
10 question if we announce the data sets, you'll be
11 surprised..

12 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Yeah, why do you
13 remove them? Why do you remove the data sets?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Yeah.

15 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Oh, I'm sorry, I
16 thought you were asking me to clarify.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: No, no, no.
18 You'll be surprised to hear there's actually a data
19 set of data sets that have been removed. There really
20 is a data set for everything.

21 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: That makes sense.
22 That's totally on brand.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: With that,
24 actually, is an explanation of why the data set was
25 removed.

2 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Oh, okay.

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: We have
4 recently been focusing actually on removing a lot
5 more data sets. We used to talk a lot about the
6 number of data sets we have, and when you're first
7 starting a public data program, it's important to add
8 more and more data sets. After a while, the number of
9 data sets, I think we're currently sitting somewhere
10 around 3,500, it becomes difficult for someone to
11 confirm that they have the right data set or to find
12 the data set they're looking for so one of the things
13 we're doing with agencies right now, when we get a
14 new data set, we are looking at what they've
15 published already, we're looking at the totality of
16 what they are planning to share and encouraging them
17 as much as possible to take that data and basically
18 share it together. Let's say if there's a data set
19 from one year and we get new data from a different
20 year, we're not going to publish it as a new data set
21 anymore. We'll take that and just have an ongoing
22 data set across different years, or if we have
23 related programs that follow a similar structure
24 those would also be combined. Other reasons that data
25 sets get removed sometimes it's because the program

2 no longer exists anymore in the same way that it did
3 so there were some, let's say, City efforts during
4 the height of the COVID pandemic, let's say around
5 like social distancing that there was data that was
6 being collected on and some of that data is no longer
7 active. In almost every case, we will preserve these
8 data sets as historical data so changing the title to
9 indicate this is not something that's ongoing.
10 There's an element for each data set, that metadata
11 element, that tells you like what to expect for how
12 often it's updated, and that will also be marked as
13 historical. Again, just really what we're focusing on
14 is like communicating clearly of what's active and
15 what's not and trying as much as possible to have
16 what's available actually meet those expectations.

17 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Is that historical
18 data still living?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Yeah.

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Yeah, you can
22 still see it, but it just is not...

23 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Yeah, totally.

24 Okay, great.

25

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Not actively
3 updated.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: That's great.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Those are the
6 majority of reasons why we're removing data sets.

7 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Wonderful. Are
8 there any data quality standards that agencies are
9 required to follow?

10 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: We have
11 a data quality checklist that is also available on
12 the Open Data site in the section of resources for
13 Open Data Coordinators that I referenced earlier.
14 That is the checklist that we give to agencies to say
15 work through this when you're working on creating the
16 data set for public release, and then we go over that
17 same checklist once we receive the data. Hopefully
18 agencies have already worked through it, but if
19 there's anything that slips through the cracks, our
20 team also reviews against that same checklist and
21 then anybody can take a look at that checklist and
22 see the things we're looking for. We're looking for
23 completeness, for there not to be randomly missing
24 data, we're looking for good documentation, we also
25 do a privacy review. Data that is released on the

2 Open Data portal, generally we're not releasing
3 personally identifying information unless there's a
4 compelling public interest reason, for example,
5 licensing or DOB applications sometimes contain the
6 name of the engineer that is on the application, for
7 example, but we've reviewed data sets to make sure
8 that there's not the possibility for identification
9 or re-identification of...

10 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: The same folks are
11 cleaning that data as well?

12 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: We don't
13 do additional cleaning after we receive the data from
14 the agency, but we will look at the data set and go
15 back to the agency and say hey, here's what we
16 noticed, please address this, and resubmit the data
17 set.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Sometimes like
19 the data that's on Open Data reflects the data that
20 agencies have internally generally so it's not as if
21 we're taking what agencies have and are using and
22 coming up with this pristine version otherwise, but
23 the really important thing, as Martha was describing,
24 is we want to make sure that if there is something
25 that's not clear about the data, if there's some

2 error in it or some process that's not intuitive,
3 that is clearly explained that anyone could
4 understand what that is and use that in their
5 analysis.

6 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Do you ever get
7 feedback once the data is published from folks that
8 have concerns about, okay, what does some of that
9 feedback sound like because I have heard from folks
10 as well and so just trying to think through what is
11 an effective way so that there's not like a poor
12 intern somewhere dedicating their life to it for
13 months.

14 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: I have
15 been that intern, and we would like to spare that
16 person...

17 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Which like that
18 could be fun but not consistently. We should be more
19 efficient.

20 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK:
21 Absolutely. One, I'd definitely encourage that intern
22 to attend an Open Data Ambassadors class so that they
23 can learn everything there is to know about the Open
24 Data Portal. Second, I think this is kind of like the
25 real reason the Open Data helpdesk exists is that we

2 welcome and actively look for people to, in that
3 virtuous cycle of using the data and discovering
4 things about the data, to then come to us if they
5 have questions about something, if they spot
6 something that seems wrong, or that they are
7 interested in understanding more. If it's a question
8 about the portal itself or something about kind of
9 the implementation of the program, we can field it
10 ourselves. If it's a question about an agency's data,
11 then we'll connect that person with the Open Data
12 Coordinator from that agency who can help run down
13 whatever additional detail or knowledge that that
14 person is looking for. We actually recently had our
15 10,000th helpdesk inquiry..

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: All right.

17 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Which
18 unfortunately was someone looking to delete their
19 account. I wish it were a cooler one, but it was not.
20 I know. Maybe we'll count the 10,001th instead.

21 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Yeah. I just want
22 to shift gears a little bit. Thank you so much for
23 all of this background.

24 Can I pass it to Council Member Holden,
25 you have a question?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you both for
3 your testimony. I have a question on how many data
4 sets that should be available are not currently
5 accessible on the Open Data portal.

6 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: I can
7 talk a little bit about the process that we use to
8 identify data sets that should be on the portal and
9 then also where you can look to see data sets that
10 have been identified for release but have not yet
11 been released.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So is that coming
13 soon?

14 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah,
15 exactly. It's a teaser trailer for Open Data in a
16 world where this data set is released. Yes, coming
17 soon to an Open Data portal near you.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, it doesn't
19 give you actual target dates though.

20 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: It does
21 have the target dates on there.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Oh, it does?

23 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yes.
24 Every data set has a data set release date if it's
25 going to be released in the future, but it hasn't yet

2 been released. We don't allow for just like nebulous
3 someday data set release. It has to have a date.
4 Every year in the yearly compliance process for
5 agencies, agencies fill out a workbook where they
6 identify any data set that should be released on the
7 Open Data portal. Those data sets include data sets
8 that have been released on the agency's website, and
9 we review agencies periodically to check for data
10 sets that they've released on their websites but that
11 are not available in Open Data. Also, agencies that
12 release data via FOIL, that data, as Zachary
13 mentioned, has to go on the Open Data portal. It also
14 helps agencies because then, if that data is being
15 FOILED repeatedly, they can just point people towards
16 the Open Data portal, and people can self-serve.
17 Those compliance workbooks, so all the agency's
18 review of the data sets that they have and or maybe
19 new data sets that's all released, that's all
20 available publicly and that, as I mentioned those,
21 workbooks include every data set that an agency has
22 identified that has not yet been released but will be
23 released and a publication schedule associated with
24 that data set. If there are data sets that are not
25 included in that sort of plan for release or are not

2 on the Open Data portal but that people think should
3 be, we also have a way to ask for an Open Data data
4 set through that helpdesk, and agencies have to
5 respond to that inquiry by either releasing the data
6 or publicly saying why they can't release that data,
7 and the reasons that agencies sometimes can't release
8 a data set is if it contains personally identifying
9 information or otherwise sensitive information, and
10 we work with agencies to try to think about
11 aggregation methods or other ways to be responsive to
12 that request without compromising individual level
13 information if there's an ability to aggregate data
14 up by geography or something like that.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You mentioned 3-1-
16 1 before. Do you get a lot of complaints about the
17 data sets on 3-1-1.

18 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: It's
19 very big and I think it is difficult to work with
20 sometimes because of the size. It doesn't respond
21 super fast on the website. We use the 3-1-1 data set
22 as an example for the Open Data Ambassadors training
23 for that reason because it's definitely one of the
24 most popular data sets to work with and also has
25 there's some, 32, what is it, 32?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: 35.

3 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: 35.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Yeah. It's
5 continually growing.

6 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Million
7 row data set, we are constantly looking for ways to
8 improve the performance of that data set on the
9 website because we know it is frustrating for people
10 to interact with.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You make
12 suggestions to the agencies, especially 3-1-1? I have
13 a lot of complaints on that. Just the information
14 that we, even like NYPD, if you use the app, there's
15 pulldown menus, but they're very general sometimes
16 and it's not very specific, and the responding
17 officers can't even input what the real solution is
18 so it's flawed data already. We're seeing that a lot.
19 I get a lot of complaints from my constituents on
20 that.

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Continue with
22 my theme of there's a data set for that. We actually
23 just published a data set of suggestions for 3-1-1.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Good.

25

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: I know this
3 because I was involved in the publication.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: That was just
5 launched?

6 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Just recently,
7 yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: All right, then
9 I'm going to really that's an important, because I
10 get a ton of complaints already, but people will
11 actually feel maybe we're getting somewhere now.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Yeah, my
13 recollection is it's structured like what the
14 complaint is, what is the agency that's responsible
15 for that issue, and then what is the status of that
16 complaint.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: All right. Could I
18 ask one more?

19 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Yeah.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay. Alright, I
21 want to bring up automation of data sets, and I think
22 it's lagging at this point. I think it's been 874
23 data sets currently on the New York City Open Data
24 portal have been flagged for automation. Yet,

2 however, 425 of them, nearly 50 percent, have not
3 been automated. Can you tell us what the holdup?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: There's a flag
5 that every agency when they submit a data set to us
6 and they indicate whether that data set could
7 potentially be automated. It's important that, within
8 that potential, there's some assessment between their
9 team and ours as to what actually makes sense. We
10 have some data sets, for example, that are updated
11 once every couple of years, and they absolutely can
12 be automated if we wanted them to, but given the
13 amount of work it would take to make that automation
14 versus the work to send that file for once every
15 couple of years, that would be something that we
16 would not prioritize. There are certainly other data
17 sets that can potentially be automated.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Can you give an
19 example of one?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: A lot of the
21 data, let's say that City Planning is responsible for
22 that's updated like when the census comes out. We
23 could have automations for that, but it is so
24 infrequent that the amount of work that would go into
25 it. We prioritize things...

2 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: It's not worth it,
3 yeah.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: Exactly, where
5 the data is actually coming in frequently every day,
6 multiple times a day.

7 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Our
8 ideal is that as many data sets that can be automated
9 will be automated, and, as Zachary said, we're
10 prioritizing and we have limited resources to build
11 these automations. It's not always push button, move
12 data. It requires some engineering work, but we know
13 that's the best user experience for people who are
14 interacting with Open Data is that for those
15 automations to just be there and having that data be
16 refreshed without the drama of who's on vacation. It
17 is our goal to get there, and we are working as
18 quickly as we can with the resources that we have and
19 it's something we hope to be constantly improving on.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Great. All right.
21 Thank you, Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you, Council
23 Member Holden.

24 Next, we have questions from Council
25 Member Bottcher.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Your unit, the
3 Mayor's Office of Data Analytics, you're housed
4 within the Office of Technology and Innovation?

5 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: And it's the
7 same office under which the 3-1-1 team operates?

8 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: 3-1-1 is
9 also a unit of OTI, yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: And what's the
11 name of that unit? The 3-1-1?

12 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah,
13 it's just 3-1-1.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Got it.

15 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: To my
16 knowledge. I don't know if they have another cool
17 name.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Got it. What's
19 your opinion of 3-1-1 data writ large? Do you think
20 that 3-1-1 data is an accurate snapshot of what's
21 actually going on in the city? Do you think, as folks
22 who work in data professionally, do you think the
23 data is really reflective of what's going on there,
24 or are there issues with it, people fatigue about 3-
25 1-1, some neighborhoods?

2 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah,
3 it's a great question. We work with the 3-1-1 data
4 set ourselves all the time. The Mayor's Office of
5 Data Analytics has a data science team within it as
6 well so we're both publishing this data and using
7 this data for analysis around New York City. I think
8 it is important to always remember how that data
9 comes to be, which is that people call or text or use
10 the 3-1-1 mobile app to report something that they
11 see, and not everybody does that at equal rates.
12 Reasons could include discomfort with the idea of
13 interacting with government generally, distrust of
14 government, could be as you're right general
15 reporting fatigue, like how can I actually call New
16 York City about every rat I see, that's a lot of
17 calls to 3-1-1 or just generally, I think there's a
18 lot of reasons why people do or do not call 3-1-1,
19 and I wouldn't necessarily describe that as an issue
20 with the data so much as that is an issue about the
21 data generation process, right? Ideally, we all trust
22 3-1-1, we all trust government to deliver on
23 resolving a complaint, and it can be hit or miss
24 sometimes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Most of the
3 time.

4 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: So I do
5 think it's important when you're using the 3-1-1 data
6 set to keep that in mind. There are also situations
7 where people who use 3-1-1 are like very enthusiastic
8 users of 3-1-1, and there are lots of complaints
9 about a particular thing that in another neighborhood
10 or with another person they wouldn't call 3-1-1 as
11 frequently. Yeah, I think it is a very valuable data
12 set, and some of the cool things that you could do
13 with the 3-1-1 data and if you have another data set
14 that has another view of that same issue. The
15 Department of Health, for example, does rat indexing
16 inspections where in a particular neighborhood, they
17 are going to every single house, regardless of
18 whether or not there was a complaint about a rat
19 there, so we can actually look to see who's
20 complaining in that neighborhood about rats versus
21 where are those health inspectors actually finding
22 rats when they're just going to every single address.
23 Opportunities for sort of ground truthing 3-1-1,
24 they're rare, but when they happen, they're really
25 exciting because you can really see like how the data

2 generation process influences what you see when you
3 look and analyze the data. This is like my favorite
4 topic in the whole world so I can nerd out about it
5 forever.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: One of the data
7 sets I'm interested in is the resolution of 3-1-1
8 complaints. As my Colleagues and I can attest, we get
9 complaints from constituents whose 3-1-1 complaints
10 are marked resolved or a condition not observed when
11 they're standing there on the phone looking at it and
12 it's clearly there. What are your opinions of that
13 data set and how do you interact with the 3-1-1 team
14 on improving that?

15 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: I would
16 say generally from the Open Data perspective, we work
17 very closely with agencies, 3-1-1 being no exception,
18 to make sure that the data that is on the Open Data
19 portal reflects accurately the data as it's being
20 collected, and I would encourage you to address these
21 questions around the data generation process and also
22 the agency's responsibility for fulfilling their SLA
23 for 3-1-1 directly with those agencies. Our sort of
24 purview is making sure that data is publicly
25 available and that it accurately reflects the 3-1-1

2 system as it stands. In terms of changing that system
3 or changing the ways that agencies are responding to
4 3-1-1 requests, I would say that that's outside of
5 our purview.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: This is
7 something that, at a previous hearing with the OTI
8 Commissioner, that we discussed, and the dynamics
9 here is that you process the data that you get from
10 3-1-1, 3-1-1 basically relies on the agencies to
11 resolve the complaints, and if the agencies aren't
12 processing the 3-1-1 request accurately, if they're
13 closing the ticket when it's not resolved, or if
14 they're not observing the condition, the 3-1-1 team,
15 they rely on the agency to accurately process the
16 complaint so one thing I'd love to dig more into at a
17 future hearing, perhaps, is what is 3-1-1 doing to
18 really lean on the agencies to make sure that they're
19 not closing 3-1-1 complaints and that they're not
20 resolved, that they're not marking them down as not
21 observed, who's really taking ownership of that
22 because that will really help increase usership of 3-
23 1-1 if people have better and better experiences with
24 it, if they see it having real-time results. Thank
25 you.

2 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: I think
3 also that's a real testament to the power of public
4 data, right? We know this is happening, you know this
5 is happening, you can look to see what the outcome of
6 a given service request is because that data is on
7 the Open Data portal and people can use it to
8 understand how service delivery is happening and then
9 raise those questions so I'm thrilled to hear that
10 people are using the 3-1-1 Open Data set for that
11 exact purpose.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: One more
13 question. There are customer satisfaction surveys
14 that go out following 3-1-1 experiences. Is that a
15 data set that you work with?

16 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yes, we
17 have worked with that data set to some extent, and I
18 know that 3-1-1 has plans to publish that data in a
19 future release.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Is that not
21 currently on the Open Data portal?

22 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: The
23 individual level information is not currently on the
24 Open Data Portal. I would have to consult with the 3-
25 1-1 team about what their plans are in terms of

2 releasing that information, but the release plan will
3 be available just like any new data set release is
4 published with a timeline for release and I think
5 it's an exciting data set and definitely one that I
6 think will be in heavy usage on the Open Data Portal.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: That's going to
8 be one of the most important data sets that we have,
9 a data set that reflects New Yorkers' satisfaction
10 with their 3-1-1 outcomes, tracking that over time,
11 looking for where there's room for improvement. I
12 would love to be notified of when that information
13 comes out because that's something we could really
14 work with as Council Members.

15 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Sure.

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thanks, Council
17 Member Bottcher. Council Member Holden?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I just want to
19 just follow up on that one because the survey that
20 the app gives you on 3-1-1, that should be automated
21 where we get the data right away, we can know
22 satisfaction from different districts, from different
23 boroughs because I keep filling that out and I don't
24 know if it goes anywhere so why isn't that automated?
25 Like that data is going, it's uploaded right there

2 into the data sets. Because right now, I don't know
3 if it works for every agency, if they're all doing
4 the survey, I guess they are, but most of my
5 complaints on 3-1-1 are NYPD-related, parking and
6 other issues, but I've been filling out that survey
7 for, I think, well over a year, mostly negative.

8 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: The 3-1-1 survey?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yes. The 3-1-1
10 survey, again, it's been a long time so that should
11 be, but we're relying on the agency to give us the
12 data or, that should be your...

13 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: It's a
14 data set that I think would be included on the Open
15 Data Portal, I'm not sure exactly when those surveys
16 started. I know it was fairly recent. So again, like
17 we will work with the 3-1-1 Open Data Coordinator to
18 make sure that data set is released and updated.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: That's how we
20 correct the situations, and if we don't get that,
21 because my constituents say I always fill out that
22 survey, and they come up to me, do you know about the
23 results, at least for our district, And I say, no, I
24 don't, and so that's what...

2 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: We'd be
3 happy to follow up with you after the hearing,
4 Council Member, with the release date for that.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: We do hear from
6 the complaints on 3-1-1 that nothing was resolved and
7 they're telling us it was. Again, the only way the
8 level of playing field is the survey. Otherwise, it
9 goes into thin air and we never, it's allowed to
10 stand so that's our recourse. It's important to get
11 that survey if you can do anything about that.

12 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah, I,
13 we're happy to follow up after the hearing with the
14 release date for that data set.

15 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Yeah, good point.
16 Thank you, Council Member Holden. Thank you.

17 I'd also like to acknowledge Council
18 Member Vickie Paladino who has joined us. Welcome. I
19 have a couple more questions, and then I'll see if
20 Members have any other questions before advocates and
21 folks that are testifying.

22 I just want to expand a little bit more
23 on the questions regarding data sets and the
24 responsibility that agencies have to provide that
25 data, right? I'm just going to paint the picture that

2 you've painted for me. Let me know if it's accurate.

3 Your team works with Open Data Coordinators at those

4 agencies to figure out what are the appropriate data

5 sets that they can ultimately provide data for that

6 then you are able to publish on the site. Are there

7 instances where agencies are not, and they're

8 essentially setting up their own goals, right, their

9 own deadlines is my understanding. That's correct?

10 What happens, and does it happen often that agencies

11 are not meeting their own goals, that agencies are

12 unable to provide that data, and what happens? What

13 does accountability look like in those instances? I'm

14 particularly interested in the two agencies that

15 we've highlighted, PD and DOE.

16 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah. We

17 have a few methods that we use to make sure that

18 agencies are being held publicly accountable for

19 their delivery of Open Data data sets. We publish on

20 the Open Data portal an Open Data dashboard that has

21 all of the agency's performance towards their own

22 goals in terms of releasing data at the frequency

23 that they said that they would release it, whether or

24 not data sets are late to be released, again, against

25 the agency's own benchmark of when that data should

2 be available publicly, and all of those sort of
3 performance measures that we use to, when we work
4 with agencies to say hey, where are you on having
5 this data set be released are also..

6 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Whose
7 responsibility is that from the team to approach
8 those Open Data Coordinators to say, you're late.

9 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: It's
10 part of our regular communications with Open Data
11 Coordinators is that we're tracking data sets that
12 are scheduled for release for our own purposes as
13 well to make sure that if there's engineering
14 resources or other sort of resources that are
15 required for the publication of that data set that
16 we're allocating our time towards those appropriately
17 as well. I think we're using these regular check-ins,
18 we're using these sort of relationships to have these
19 conversations with agencies about how well they're
20 doing towards their own goals. If they're missing, if
21 they're late, we definitely encourage them to provide
22 a reason why that data set is going to be late.
23 Frequently, it's around resources within the agency.
24 Agencies are also working in a constrained budget
25 environment, and so the IT staff and the data staff

2 to produce data sets on the agency side, if they're
3 short-staffed, then that can affect the timelines for
4 agencies as well. Apart from making sure that
5 everything that we're doing is publicly available and
6 that everybody is working towards those same goals
7 that are being released publicly. That's our main
8 sort of tool for helping agencies deliver on their
9 obligations for their responsibilities for Open Data.

10 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: The frequency of
11 which agencies provide that data, that is also
12 determined by that agency?

13 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: It's
14 determined by the agency, but it's also really
15 determined by the data set. If a data set is only
16 updated once a year, high school graduation rates
17 come to mind, there's not a lot of utility in
18 updating that data at other points in time so it's
19 both sort of what makes natural sense for that data
20 set, how often is that data set updated, Zachary
21 mentioned the census, there's data sets that have
22 different sort of natural cadences, and then it's
23 also a resources question on the part of the agency
24 and then also on the part of sort of our team to

2 build automations to be able to release data
3 frequently.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: In the last, I'll
5 say, two years roughly, what is the percentage of
6 data sets that are updated on time or whatever
7 timeframe that you can give to me.

8 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Data
9 sets that are currently published that get updated on
10 a published cadence...

11 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Based on their own
12 timelines, right?

13 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Are you
14 talking about data sets that haven't been released
15 yet or data sets that are already released?

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: That are already
17 released.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: So updating
19 existing data sets, not publishing brand new ones.

20 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: How
21 frequently do the daily data sets get updated daily?
22 We're looking at the dashboard.

23 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Sure. I'm looking
24 for opportunities to improve. Obviously, a big
25 benefit to having this law and this tool is a lot of

2 what my Colleagues here said. It is about
3 transparency. It's 100 percent about accountability,
4 but it's also about promoting trust that New Yorkers
5 have in government, and so if I'm getting complaints
6 where folks feel that certain agencies are behind on
7 providing that data that that they themselves have
8 determined are able to provide by a certain timeline
9 There has to be accountability, so that's why I asked
10 that question, but I'm also looking for opportunities
11 to improve so if you have a sense of the percentage
12 of agencies that are on time, that are doing well,
13 that are doing their thing responsibly.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: So right now
15 if you exclude all of the historical data sets or the
16 data sets that are updated on some irregular or less
17 predictable basis, we currently have around 63
18 percent of the data sets that we can track to be on
19 time are on time.

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Yeah, and is the
21 reason primarily what Martha said I guess when you're
22 checking in with these agencies, what is the reason
23 that agencies are saying they're unable to provide
24 it?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: I think there
3 is in some cases it's really a matter, again, of how
4 do we define on time, and we're continuing to improve
5 that definition. Right now, we have, let's say, an
6 automatic check every day for a data set, and what we
7 say publicly is this data set is updated daily,
8 because we check for new data each day. If we check
9 for new data and nothing changed for a day, for a
10 week, that data set doesn't change, and our records
11 would say this data set is not updated on time when
12 in reality it's just reflecting that no data has come
13 in for a day or for a week so it's on time. Our
14 automation is working, it's running, all the data's
15 there, so there's a question of like definitions that
16 we're getting at, and one thing we've started to do
17 with that is differentiate between how often do we
18 check for new data versus how often do we expect new
19 data. So that number, the 63 percent, will be
20 increasing as that continues to propagate and we get
21 a better understanding of that distinction.

22 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. Thank
23 you. I have a couple more questions, and then I'm
24 going to pass it off to my Colleague, Council Member
25 Paladino, for questions.

2
3 Is there a data set that you think Open
4 Data should have that they don't have right now? A
5 data set, excuse me.

6 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Good
7 question. I definitely think that there are new
8 initiatives and new programs happening in New York
9 City all the time, and we always look forward to the
10 release of data related to new initiatives.
11 Certainly, there are lots of things going on all the
12 time. Specific examples, we have a newly designated
13 Open Data Coordinator for the Office of Asylum Seeker
14 Operations that was created by executive order
15 recently so we're looking forward to working with him
16 on the release of data related to the Asylum Seeker
17 Operations. Yeah, there's always new things happening
18 in New York City and that generate new data sets and
19 we're pretty confident that our compliance process is
20 pretty thorough about picking up those new things. We
21 review the list of newly created offices so whenever
22 there's a new office that's created by executive
23 order, we contact them to make sure that they have an
24 Open Data coordinator as required by the law. Always
25 new things to look forward to in Open Data.

2 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. My last
3 couple of questions.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: (INAUDIBLE)

5 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: That's fine. Okay.
6 No worries.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: (INAUDIBLE)

8 There's a lot of questions.

9 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. Council
10 Member Paladino is really active in this Committee,
11 and I appreciate you being here. Don't worry about it
12 though. It's okay.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I feel terrible
14 because I'm late coming to the party and I want to
15 hear everything that you have already said.

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: No worries.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: So it's more
18 about the accuracy and how many people participate,
19 what makes your agency effective.

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Turn your mic on.
21 Are you asking them?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I guess so, yes,
23 I guess I am. I'm very sorry that I missed this. I
24 had another hearing and I had a press conference, so
25 I apologize to everybody, and excuse my ignorance if

2 this has already been asked. I'm very interested and
3 open-minded to this is a newly formed agency that
4 you're putting together to collaborate with other
5 agencies in the City. I just want to make sure I
6 understand the baseline.

7 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah.
8 The Open Data Program is actually a pretty mature
9 program. It's been around since 2012.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Okay.

11 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Council
12 Member Brewer authored the local law that created the
13 Open Data Program so the program has been around for
14 quite some time. The administration of the program
15 has shifted slightly with the Mayor's Executive Order
16 3 that brought the Mayor's Office of Data Analytics
17 into the new Office of Technology and Innovation,
18 which has a few different legacy technology related
19 offices and agencies now together in one happy
20 family, and I represent the Office of Data Analytics
21 which has existed also since about the same time that
22 they started.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Which leads me
24 to the next question. How many people make up your
25 data analytics? I want to know.

2 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: The
3 Office of Data Analytics is approximately 20 people.
4 We recently had some...

5 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: 20 people?

6 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yes. We
7 recently had some new staff join so I'm going to get
8 you an exact number after this hearing, but the Open
9 Data Program is staffed by five full-time employees
10 and then some additional resources.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: To cover the
12 entire city of New York?

13 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: And 100
14 Open Data Coordinators, one at every single agency
15 and office.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Okay, and what
17 are some of the agencies that you have?

18 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Every
19 single one.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: So we run the
21 gamut?

22 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Soup to
23 nuts.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Just right up
25 until most recently, the migrant crisis. Any agency

2 or office in the City, including newly created
3 offices, like the Office of Asylum Seeker Operations,
4 needs to have an Open Data Coordinator, yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: And how do you
6 acquire your information? Daily?

7 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: It
8 depends on the data set. Some data sets are updated
9 daily so 3-1-1, for example, we have an automated
10 process that updates every day that data set with all
11 of the service requests that 3-1-1 has and then also
12 updates service requests if the resolution changes,
13 but we also have some data sets that get updated once
14 a year or census...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Because I love
16 the principle and I love the idea.

17 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: It's just that I
19 have to just keep reminding myself, and I think
20 everybody does too, is that we don't live in Omaha,
21 Nebraska. We live in New York City. This is a huge
22 undertaking, and the account for accuracy. We're
23 talking about DDC, we're talking about DEP, we all
24 know what's going on, we're talking about DOT, we're
25 talking about those are just three major. Now we tack

2 on to that. That's not even touching anything else.
3 How do you keep track of every single thing that's
4 going on in this City with an ounce or two of real
5 accuracy because I've always found out though I'm
6 only doing this now in my third year, I will say
7 this, that when everything is broken down to a
8 borough level, we are able to keep much better track
9 of what's going on. Let's say in my District in
10 particular, District 19, we have our contacts in
11 District 19, and we're able to go to them right away.
12 You're dealing with this on a five-borough level,
13 with 20 people, is that correct? To manage everything
14 that's going on in this city, every major operation
15 that's going on in this city. That's a lot of work.

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: There's 20 people,
17 but they also have the support. That's what she
18 mentioned, the support from the Open Data
19 Coordinators.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Right.

21 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: But it's not
22 enough.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: No, it's not. I
24 don't know how you do it.

2 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Lots of
3 spreadsheets.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I find myself
5 saying that a lot. I really don't, and I just find
6 that when we break this very large pie that we live
7 in New York City into smaller pieces, it's much
8 easier to eat the whole pie one slice at a time. I
9 hope that's how you run the agency because that's the
10 best way to help everybody all the way around.

11 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: I make a
12 lot of references to how to eat an elephant, which is
13 just one bite at a time.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: One bite at a
15 time.

16 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Just
17 have to keep biting.

18 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Look at that.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: And that's why I
20 like things broken up at the borough level.

21 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: That's
22 right.

23 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you, Council
24 Member Paladino.

25 Maybe she should do another training.

2 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Oh,
3 yeah.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Actually, the
5 whole Committee. We'll follow up just to make sure.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: That would
7 interesting.

8 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I have two more
9 questions. Do we have a data set on how many FOIL
10 requests the City receives by agencies?

11 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: We do.
12 Yes.

13 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: We do? Oh,
14 wonderful.

15 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: And we
16 also recently in the last few years collaborated with
17 DORIS to update the FOIL request form to have a
18 checkbox to indicate whether or not that FOIL request
19 also includes data which helps us review FOIL
20 requests even more efficiently to look for data that
21 has been released via FOIL that should also be on the
22 Open Data portal.

23 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Martha, you
24 mentioned this before, but what, some agencies

25

2 respond, provide their data based on like their FOIL
3 request?

4 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: It's one
5 of the things we review.

6 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Or they respond
7 with their FOIL, I'm sorry.

8 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Yeah. If
9 an agency does release data via FOIL, that data also
10 needs to be released on the Open Data portal so we
11 ask the agencies as a part of their compliance
12 process to tell us what data sets they've released
13 via FOIL so we can then work with them to make sure
14 that there's a publication schedule for those data
15 sets on Open Data.

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Is that more
17 tedious? Is there more effort there?

18 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: No. I
19 don't know exactly.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: More effort
21 compared to?

22 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: To just having
23 them respond directly to the data sets as opposed to
24 providing it with like their FOIL response. Is that
25 what happens?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER FEDER: I think that
3 one of the key differences between FOIL and Open Data
4 is that Open Data is continuous and forever
5 essentially. FOIL requests will frequently ask for a
6 certain subset of information for a month where, for
7 Open Data, what we're working with agencies on is
8 setting up a structure to get that data in
9 perpetuity, and then document every possible case of
10 it so it's not just one individual's request for a
11 certain borough, but how do you get all that
12 information available for the entire city?
13 Oftentimes, the work that's required to go into Open
14 Data, yes, there's a lot of additional things that we
15 take pride in doing with agencies to make that
16 information accessible.

17 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: But it
18 is actually easier for agencies, for data sets that
19 agencies respond to FOIL requests about frequently,
20 it's much easier for the agency to have that data
21 released and updated on Open Data because then when a
22 person who requests it via FOIL can be directed to
23 that data set and help themselves to whatever data
24 that they were looking for in the first place.

2 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. My last
3 question is just related to the future. What do you
4 want to see? What does it look like in 5, 10 years?
5 Are there any opportunities for collaborations or
6 partnerships? What are you most looking forward to?
7 And what do you need to make that happen? I know we
8 are constantly talking about the budget and
9 resources. You said it yourself multiple times that
10 agencies use that as a reason for why they can't make
11 their own deadlines, which is understandable, but how
12 do you want to see the office expand? What do you
13 need? How many more people do you need? How much more
14 money do you need? Yeah, thank you.

15 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: All of
16 it. All of the people and all of the money.

17 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Gimme a number.

18 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: Gimme
19 all that stuff. We're really excited about this
20 program. There's not a lot of programs that I think
21 still maintain this level of excitement and
22 enthusiasm after 10 years of, I don't know maybe I
23 shouldn't say that, maybe there's lots of things
24 people are very excited about. I'm very excited about
25 Open Data after 10 years still. Things that I feel

2 really passionately about include data literacy,
3 again, like with this new frontier of new tools and
4 new applications of large language models or AI or
5 machine learning and in government contacts, or even
6 in just people everyday lives, I think having the
7 skills and knowledge to understand how to interpret a
8 data set, how to how to know like how your personal
9 data looks in data sets. These are all going to be
10 really foundational pieces of being a citizen in this
11 new era, and I think Open Data is an amazing tool to
12 help build that sort of knowledge among the citizenry
13 of the city and of the world. We love collaborating
14 with Open Data programs from around the country, from
15 around the world. One of the coolest things we get to
16 do is meet Open Data programs from other countries.
17 We've met with cities in South Korea, with lots of
18 different cities in Europe, we collaborate with the
19 London Office of Technology and Innovation pretty
20 frequently. Many of them will participate in our Open
21 Data Week events coming up in March. I think I also
22 referenced that we are also excited to collaborate
23 with other users of the Socrata platform to help
24 drive improvements there and make the user interface
25 easier for everyone. Yeah, I think we can always do

2 more with more. I would love to see the Open Data
3 team, to build it as large as we possibly can, but
4 I'm really proud of this team and the work that
5 they've done and the way they've been able to keep
6 this program really alive and evolving and serving
7 millions of people with the resources that we have.

8 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: So you don't need
9 any more resources?

10 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: I need
11 all the resources.

12 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I need you to be
13 very clear on that you need more.

14 CHIEF ANALYTICS OFFICER NORRICK: We
15 appreciate your advocacy on behalf of the Open Data
16 Program.

17 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Oh, all these
18 agencies. Okay. Thank you so much. You have done
19 tremendous and look forward to any of the remaining
20 followups.

21 I'm going to pass it off to Irene so we
22 can move into public testimony.

23 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BYHOVSKY: Thank you
24 again for your testimony, and now we will start with
25 public testimony.

2 I would like to welcome Noel Hidalgo,
3 Rachael Fauss, and Christopher Leon Johnson to
4 testify.

5 Any order is fine.

6 NOEL HIDALGO: Great. Hi, my name is Noel
7 Hidalgo, Executive Director of BetaNYC. Thank you for
8 inviting us, Chair Gutiérrez and fellow Council
9 Members, and great to have the Council Staff here.

10 Now, more than ever, the City's Data
11 Analytics Team and the Open Data Program need
12 resources to ensure that other agencies can do more
13 with less. Since its inception, the Data Analytics
14 Team has streamlined internal and external data
15 sharing practices, and their work has fundamentally
16 improved people's lives. We are a quarter way through
17 the 21st century on the verge of a climate
18 catastrophe and need to ensure that the human
19 investments that we make at this moment carry us
20 through the middle part of the century. Consumer
21 technology systems will morph rapidly and the climate
22 will dictate swift responses to people's needs. In
23 sum, we need adaptable people who will be able to be
24 around for quite a bit. Additionally, artificial
25 technology and machine learning tools require clean

2 metadata. We cannot build a 21st century government
3 on the back of systems that contain poor data.

4 I am going to hurry through the
5 opportunities and insights that I have that I've
6 emailed to the Committee. So first and foremost, if
7 we're talking about a 21st century Open Data team for
8 the City, we need the Open Data team that is
9 currently down five people from pre-pandemic levels
10 to reestablish those five roles. While the Mayor has
11 lifted elements of the hiring freeze, we asked that
12 the Open Data team completely be restored to pre-
13 pandemic capacity and add three more people, one
14 that's focused on civic engagement, another one
15 that's focused on data literacy and another person in
16 engineering. We need to cultivate a new generation of
17 leadership. Agencies, and this is broadly across
18 agencies, must modernize their data systems and
19 update civil service system to ensure that we have a
20 system that works for this decade, not the last one.
21 We need government technical talent ready to
22 understand new technologies and ensure that agencies
23 are not being sold snake oil. We need a new
24 generation of technical leadership that understands
25 the value of service design, data portability, and

2 open technologies. We need to cultivate a new
3 generation of technology leaders that can do more
4 with less. The Analytics Exchange, the Service Design
5 Forum, and the Open Data Ambassadors programs are
6 three current examples of demonstrating this type of
7 leadership. It needs to be combined with an
8 apprenticeship program that prepares various college
9 students to foster a career in public interest
10 technology. BetaNYC's Civic Innovation Apprenticeship
11 Program is an example of that, and we would love to
12 see institutional resources added to ensure that
13 these programs grow. Institutionalizing in regards to
14 making sure that ODCs and ODAs, the Open Data
15 Ambassadors, are really have the resources, we would
16 like to see those positions become full-time inside
17 of agencies so we were asking for Open Data
18 Coordinators and Open Data Ambassadors to become
19 actually agency positions.

20 Can I go for a little bit longer? Thank
21 you. In regards to...

22 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: One more minute.

23 NOEL HIDALGO: One more minute. Thank you.

24 In regards to accountability, it's appalling to hear
25 Council Members ask the Open Data team about 3-1-1

2 data when we all know that there are agencies that
3 are essentially juking the stats. Those agencies need
4 to be held accountable. We're asking that agencies
5 are held accountable in budget hearings, and so we
6 want to ensure that every single agency, when they
7 come asking for the justification of money, that they
8 describe their data infrastructure, their technology
9 infrastructure, their data management practices. They
10 need to be held directly accountable around their
11 FOIL requests and the responses. It should not be up
12 to the responsibility of the Open Data team to bear
13 the burden for the rest of the City when Council has
14 the responsibility and the opportunity to be asking
15 agencies directly. When it comes to data publishing,
16 there are two particular agencies that do not have
17 their crap together. The first is the Department of
18 Education. They continue to be an outlier with non-
19 standard data publishing practices, and I cannot
20 understand why NYPD continues to publish monthly
21 CompStat data in Excel spreadsheets at the police
22 precinct level while it doesn't publish that
23 information to the Open Data Portal and they have
24 their own fancy CompStat 2.0 website where you can't
25 really cleanly extract historical data. When it comes

2 down to digital and data literacy, we're on the verge
3 of a transformative shift on how people interact with
4 and incorporate information. If we are not teaching
5 New Yorkers how to look at data and to review source
6 data, there will be prey to misinformation. Open Data
7 Week, School of Data, Data through Design, the Open
8 Data Ambassadors Program, and the Mapping for Equity
9 are just a few fundamental tools that this government
10 should adequately resource to increase data literacy
11 while battling fake news and misinformation. Thank
12 you very much for this time.

13 RACHAEL FAUSS: Good morning. Chair
14 Gutiérrez and Council Member Paladino. My name is
15 Rachael Fauss, and I'm the Senior Policy Advisor for
16 Reinvent Albany. Reinvent Albany advocates for
17 transparent, accountable government in New York
18 State, and we were instrumental in drafting and
19 passing New York City's 2012 Open Data law. I
20 testified about it more than 10 years ago with a
21 different hat so it's nice to be back today, and when
22 we thank you for holding this oversight hearing.
23 Thanks to the leadership of the Council, New York
24 City passed the world's first Open Data law, and our

2 successes and failures are closely watched by
3 government everywhere.

4 Before getting into some of the analysis
5 of the 2023 Open Data Report published by OTI, I
6 wanted to highlight two principles we think are
7 really important that will make Open Data successful.
8 This hearing today is very important, and it's
9 important for two reasons. One is the public pressure
10 and showing that there is public interest and a need
11 for this, and the other, I think, is that looking at
12 ways to continuously improve the program. Second, we
13 really want to highlight automating Open Data as a
14 very high priority. I'll say it this way, I think
15 it's important for automation to happen because of
16 the limited resources. We noted in our testimony,
17 there are 435 that have not yet been automated.

18 That's about half of the total list of data sets that
19 are able to be automated. Appreciated OTI explaining
20 a little bit about the process there, but I would
21 love to see a data set for that specifically in terms
22 of the schedule, how quickly can we get these things
23 automated and highlighting some of the issues around
24 is this something that's only updated every 10 years?
25 Having that information would be helpful so we can

2 get a better sense of the progress in that area and
3 the challenges, right? We appreciate a lot of the
4 continuous improvement efforts, the policy documents,
5 the creation of that dashboard, the continuation of
6 Open Data Week with BetaNYC. We are big fans of
7 School of Data and a lot of the events around Open
8 Data Week, and it gives some good visibility to the
9 program. We also appreciate the technical standards
10 and policy docs. These will help the program succeed.

11 On the budget front, I second the notion
12 to get back at least where we used to be. I'd like to
13 give a comparison. We work a lot with the MTA Open
14 Data team, and they have three full-time staff just
15 on Open Data, and they have 46 agency staffers within
16 the MTA that are those data stewards. They're about a
17 fifth the size of New York City. That would say 15
18 staff if you were to be at the MTA levels. At the
19 same time, the MTA staff have told me repeatedly that
20 they don't have enough, three people is way, way too
21 small for the amount of work they have to do. I
22 think, if you scale it up, it really shows you that
23 you there needs to be a lot more resources. My
24 testimony goes into a few things that I'd just
25 encourage you to look at later. We looked at three of

2 the metrics documents. Metrics, data sets, the FOIL
3 metrics, the automation metrics, and then the what
4 else did I look at, data set removal. We've got some
5 interesting stats on there on where agencies are
6 doing well and where they're not doing well, and I
7 just encourage you to look at that if you want to
8 look at individual agency compliance issues. Thank
9 you so much.

10 Thank you so much, Rachael, yeah.

11 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Ready? Okay.

12 Hello, my name is Christopher Leon Johnson. Thank
13 you, Chair Gutiérrez, for having this hearing. Now I
14 wasn't here for earlier. I was busy covering this
15 rally about being against congestive pricing. I know
16 this had nothing to do with the hearing, but
17 Jennifer, I think you should be against congestive
18 pricing, but we can talk off the record about that.
19 Now, sorry about that. We can talk off the record
20 about that.

21 But I want to talk about Open Data. Now,
22 where is our Public Advocate? Where is our so-called
23 Public Advocate Jumaane Williams about this stuff? He
24 should be at every public hearing, every hearing
25 about Open Data. You know why? Because Jumaane

2 Williams is the Chair of COPIC, and everybody in the
3 city has to know about COPIC. COPIC oversees all the
4 data in New York City. Now this Public Advocate, he
5 makes sure that this is not mentioned about his
6 office. All he cares about is being woke and
7 defunding the cops and crippling the NYPD instead of
8 being more transparent to the people, saying I'm the
9 Chair of COPIC and I keep all the data so this is my
10 advice, Miss Gutiérrez, you're the Chair of the
11 Technology Committee. You need to introduce a bill
12 into the City Council with the help of the Ethics
13 Committee with Sandra Ung to remove Jumaane Williams
14 as a Chair of COPIC and make COPIC a separate agency
15 that the Mayor's Office and the City Council could
16 appoint someone that's independent, that is not an
17 elected official because Jumaane Williams is not
18 doing his job as a Chair of COPIC. He's a horrible
19 Chair for COPIC. He does not care about Open Data in
20 New York City. You the people here that actually
21 represents OTI care more about data than the Public
22 Advocate. Where's our Public Advocate about this?
23 Where's our so-called Public Advocate. I bet if the
24 COPIC was allowed to defund the cops with OTI, he'll
25 make a big deal, but because it's only about data,

2 data, data, and meta stuff, he doesn't give a damn so
3 we have to get rid of Jumaane Williams as the Chair
4 of COPIC. We have to get rid of this position. Hey,
5 abolish the whole position and merge it with the
6 department of OTI. Please. Because Jumaane is not
7 here. Where's Jumaane? Anybody in this office right
8 here that's a representative of NYCPA, the New York
9 City Public Advocate, please raise your hand. I don't
10 see no one raising their hand here. You know why?
11 Because they don't give a damn. All they care about
12 is defunding the cops, (INAUDIBLE) the cops, and
13 protecting liars like Yusuf Salaam who relies on cops
14 all the time. That's all he cares about. He doesn't
15 give a damn about no Open Data. He doesn't give a
16 damn about anything. It's all about defunding the
17 cops and protecting WFP, protecting the woke agenda,
18 and that's all he cares about. So where's our Public
19 Advocate? We got to get rid of the Public Advocate
20 position because the Public Advocate position isn't
21 doing nothing. People in the Open Data movement need
22 to start calling this stuff out, and I know you just
23 (INAUDIBLE) Albany, that's funded by Mark Gorton,
24 they need to start calling this stuff out too, but we
25 all know why, because Mark Gorton funds

2 Transportation Alternatives, he funds Open Plans, he
3 funds ARISE Alliance, and he funds Reinvent Albany
4 and Jumaane Williams is for congestion pricing. He's
5 for a bike (INAUDIBLE) lobby so he's not going to say
6 anything about this stuff. So get rid of Jumaane
7 Williams. (INAUDIBLE) I'm not trying to be rude. Get
8 rid of Jumaane Williams. He's kept of the Trans Alt,
9 he's kept to all these non-profits. He doesn't give a
10 damn about no Open Data so that's all I gotta say.
11 Thank you so much.

12 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you.

13 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Appreciate it.

14 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you.

15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BYHOVSKY: I want to
16 thank everyone. Chair, do you have any questions or
17 Council Member Palladino for the advocates?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: No.

19 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: No.

20 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BYHOVSKY: I want to
21 thank everyone for incredible testimonies today, and
22 this will conclude our hearing.

23 NOEL HIDALGO: Can I add one thing about
24 COPIC though?

25 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BYHOVSKY: Absolutely.

2 NOEL HIDALGO: Okay, great. Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: You got one
4 minute.

5 NOEL HIDALGO: Oh, one minute. COPIC is a
6 fundamental part of the Charter in regards to holding
7 the administration accountable. COPIC was very
8 pioneering when it was first put into the City
9 Charter. When we talk about what are the things that
10 we want to be adding resources to, COPIC is something
11 that should have more resources, and the Public
12 Advocate is actively talking about bringing COPIC
13 back again.

14 RACHAEL FAUSS: Yeah, and having done a
15 run at COPIC with Public Advocate Tish James, it
16 requires the Administration to send people so it's
17 not just on the Public Advocate, but I was part of a
18 prior reinvigorating COPIC effort, and it requires
19 the Administration participating fundamentally.

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you for
21 that.

22 COMMITTEE COUNSEL BYHOVSKY: Thank you. I
23 also checked the Zoom. There is no one in our Zoom
24 room right now, and if you wish to testify and you
25 haven't been called, please let us know.

2

3 I don't see any hands right now, so this
4 will conclude our hearing, and I want to turn to
5 Chair Gutiérrez to adjourn the hearing.

6 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. This
7 meeting is adjourned. [GAVEL]

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date March 2, 2024