

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

DECEMBER 7, 2015
Start: 1:34 P.M.
Recess: 2:49 P.M.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: LATISHA JAMES
PUBLIC ADVOCATE

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
SPEAKER FOR THE COUNCIL

COUNCIL MEMBERS: INEZ BARRON
JOSEPH BORELLI
FERNANDO CABRERA
MARGARET CHIN
ANDREW COHEN
COSTA CONSTANTINIDES
ROBERT CORNEGY JR.
ELIZABETH CROWLEY
LAURIE CUMBO
CHAIM DEUTSCH
DANIEL DROMM
RAFAEL ESPINAL
MATHIEU EUGENE
JULISSA FERRERAS-COPELAND
DANIEL GARODNICK
VINCENT GENTILE
VANESSA GIBSON
DAVID GREENFIELD

BARRY GRODENCHIK
COREY JOHNSON
BEN KALLOS
ANDY KING
PETER KOO
KAREN KOSLOWITZ
RORY LANCMAN
BRAD LANDER
STEPHEN LEVIN
MARK LEVINE
ALAN MAISEL
STEVEN MATTEO
CARLOS MENCHACA
ROSIE MENDEZ
I. DANEEK MILLER
ANNABEL PALMA
ANTONIO REYNOSO
DONOVAN RICHARDS
YDANIS RODRIGUEZ
DEBORAH ROSE
HELEN ROSENTHAL
RITCHIE TORRES
MARK TREYGER
ERIC ULRICH
JAMES VACCA
PAUL VALLONE
JAMES VAN BRAMER
RUBEN WILLS

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

1 STATED MEETING

4

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise for the
3 Pledge of Allegiance.

4 CLERK: All rise.

5 [Pledge of Allegiance]

6 PUBLICA ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be
7 seated, roll call.

8 CLERK: Arroyo. Barron. Borelli. Cabrera.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

10 CLERK: CHIN.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

12 CLERK: Cohen.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

14 CLERK: Constantinides.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

16 CLERK: Cornegy. Crowley. Cumbo.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

18 CLERK: Deutsch. Dickens. Dromm. Espinal.

19 Eugene. Ferraras-Copeland. Garodnick.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Here

21 CLERK: Gentile. Gibson.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Present

23 CLERK: Greenfield.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Here.

25 CLERK: Grodenchik. Johnson.

1 STATED MEETING

5

2 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Here.

3 CLERK: Kallos.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

5 CLERK: King. Koo.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Present.

7 CLERK: Koslowitz.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

9 CLERK: Lancman.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Here.

11 CLERK: Lander.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Here.

13 CLERK: Levin. Levine.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Here.

15 CLERK: Maisel. Mealy. Menchaca.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Present

17 CLERK: Mendez.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here.

19 CLERK: Miller.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

21 CLERK: Palma. Reynoso

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNSO: Present.

23 CLERK: Richards.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Present.

25 CLERK: Rodriguez. Rose.

1 STATED MEETING

6

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Here.

3 CLERK: Rosenthal.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

5 CLERK: Torres. Treyger.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

7 CLERK: Ulrich. Vacca

8 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Here.

9 CLERK: Vallone.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

11 CLERK: Williams. Wills.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: Present.

13 CLERK: Matteo.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

15 CLERK: Van Brammer.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMMER: Here.

17 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

18 SPEAKER MARK VIVERITO: Here.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All rise. All
20 rise. Please move your capsule gentlemen. All rise
21 for the invocation delivered by the Department
22 Chaplin for NYPD, The Reverend Barbara Williams-
23 Harris, Pastor Onward Ministries in Brooklyn New
24 York. Quiet in the Chamber.

25

1 STATED MEETING

7

2 REVERAND WILLIAMS-HARRIS: God we thank
3 you for this time of coming together. We thank you
4 that in this season of giving and receiving that not
5 only do we remember one another but we remember those
6 who have lost loved ones, those that are grieving
7 during this period. We remember those on Pearl
8 Harbor Day today December 7th and all that they've
9 done and all that they've been through for us and I
10 ask you to bless every Council Member, every person
11 under the sound of our voice and that you will bless
12 us in this season and we pray for peace on earth,
13 goodwill towards men and that we will share the love,
14 show the love, give the love and receive the love one
15 to another. In your name we pray and by special
16 request.

17 [singing]

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen.

19 [clapping]

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please be seated.

21 And now a motion to spread the invocation, quiet in
22 the chambers, Council Member Reynoso.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I make a motion
24 to spread the invocation in full upon the record. I
25 want to thank Reverend, the Reverend Pastor Dr.

1 STATED MEETING

8

2 Barbara Williams-Harris of Onward Ministries on
3 Broadway and Winnisburg (sp). Reverend Pastor,
4 Reverend Pastor Dr. Williams-Harris is the first, is
5 the very first career police officer to serve as an
6 officer and then enter the NYPD Chaplin Service. She
7 retired from the department after 20 years of service
8 in 2003. She was appointed Chaplin of the NYPD last
9 year. She has been in Ministries since she 14 and
10 distinguish herself by serving in the Brooklyn North
11 Community Affairs Office and creating programs such
12 as; The Community Affair Talent Show, The CCAP Youth
13 Dialogue Program and the Brooklyn North Basketball
14 League and for that we thank you.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16 Adoption of minutes, Council Member Miller.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Make a motion
18 that we adopt the minutes as printed for the month of
19 November.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 Messages and papers from the Mayor.

22 CLERK: None.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication
24 from City, County and Borough Offices.

25 CLERK: None.

1 STATED MEETING

9

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and
3 communications.

4 CLERK: M353, Designation of Minority
5 Whip.

6 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Received order,
7 printed and filed.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use call
9 ups.

10 CLERK: None.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now quiet in
12 the Chambers, quiet in the Chambers. Everyone please
13 be seated. As we now hear from the Speaker, Melissa
14 Mark-Viverito.

15 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam
16 Public Advocate and if I could ask my colleagues to
17 please stand.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Please rise.

19 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Unfortunately
20 this is becoming too much of an occurrence but last
21 week the Country experienced another tragedy as 14
22 people lost their lives in a horrific shooting in San
23 Bernardino, California. This violence is senseless;
24 it's heartbreaking and devastating that we continue
25 to hear more and more stories like this. So as we

1 STATED MEETING

10

2 continue these conversations about what to do, what
3 steps to take, our thoughts and prayers are with all
4 the victims and their loved ones and ask that we join
5 in a moment of silence.

6 [moment of silence]

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you my
8 colleagues. Today will be voting on legislation
9 requiring copies of annual reports from the City's
10 Economic Development Corporation to be distributed to
11 Community Boards. While these reports are currently
12 distributed to the Mayor, the Council, the
13 Controller, the Public Advocate and to all the
14 Borough Presidents. Extending this information to
15 Community Boards will help increase communication
16 between the City and all of the neighborhoods across
17 the 5 Borough's. On staff I would like to thank Alex
18 Polonoff (sp), Rachel Harris, Kendal Stephson (sp),
19 Jeffery Baker and Ed Adkin. This is a piece of
20 legislation that is sponsored by Council Member
21 Cabrera and ask him to say a few words.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
23 much Madam Speaker, thank you for your support on
24 this bill. Currently a job creation and retention
25 report is provided to the Mayor, the Council, the

1 STATED MEETING

11

2 City Controller, the Public Advocate and the Borough
3 President. I hope that the Council will vote to pass
4 Intr. 128 so that our Community Boards will... will
5 also receive this report as they are critical players
6 in proving the unemployment rate in our communities.
7 Specifically the report must provide through
8 information on projected and actual jobs created and
9 retaining connections with any project undertaking
10 buyout contracted entity. These entities include
11 local development corporations other not for profit
12 corporations and all other entities involved in
13 economic development in our City. This bill will not
14 only apply to projects that involve expenditures or
15 City Capital for creations but also those who were
16 provided with assistance in the form of a loan, grant
17 or tax benefit of over \$150,000. It would also apply
18 to projects involving the sale or lease of City
19 involved land where at least 25 jobs are created,
20 expected to be created or retained. In addition, the
21 report must include terms of restriction on the use
22 of lease property including the rent received in the
23 prior fiscal year for sales, the price for which the
24 property was sold and any terms of restriction on the
25 resale of the property must be included. I believe

1 STATED MEETING

12

2 this bill will increase transparency, allow us to get
3 a better sense of the role that City funds are
4 playing in the creation of retention of job. Access
5 to a job is truly a lifeline and all of our residents
6 deserve to make a decent living if they are willing
7 to work. I hope that all my colleagues will
8 recognize the importance of Intro 128 and vote in
9 support of it this afternoon. Thank you so much.

10 SPEAKER MARK-VIVIERITO: Thank you
11 Council Member. Additional were going to be voting
12 on legislation to promote the use of Geothermal
13 energy in City facilities across New York.
14 Geothermal power use heat from the earth to provide
15 heat to buildings. As a clean renewable source of
16 power it's exactly the type of innovation that will
17 help New York become a greener more sustainable City.
18 This bill will require the City to create a screening
19 tool to determine why the Geothermal energy is cost
20 effective for public buildings. Any building that is
21 determined to be a good candidate for Geothermal
22 energy and heat must have a Geothermal system
23 installed. Through this process were taking another
24 step toward our goal of reducing New York City carbon
25 admission by 80% before the year 2050. On staff end

1 STATED MEETING

13

2 I'd like to again thank Alex Polonof (sp), Rachel
3 Harris, Kendal Stephenson, Jeffery Baker and Ed Adkin
4 and this is a bill sponsored by Council Costa
5 Constantinides and ask him to say a few words.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Thank you
7 Madam Speaker and thank you for your strong
8 environmental leadership under this Council we become
9 more green and more sustainable and that's due to
10 your leadership, so thank you. You know recently we
11 marked the anniversary of the passage of local law
12 66. The law that mandate that New York City reduce
13 it greenhouse gas admission 80% by 2050. In that
14 time our City has made real progress in
15 sustainability. In September for instance the City
16 open PS62 on Staten Island, the first net zero
17 building in New York City. We also using our roll a
18 market participate to spur further developments in
19 (inaudible) by requesting proposals on how the City's
20 energy consumption can be sourced from 100%
21 renewables. Finally we passed legislation to
22 discourage frizzles energy usages that strain the
23 inaudible grad and necessitate the use of peaker
24 plants that burn dirty and harmful fossil fuels. As
25 important as these first steps are, it is far more

2 necessary that we move even further. Greenhouse gas
3 emissions in buildings are the number one culprit at
4 over 70%. Much of this comes from our heating,
5 ventilating, air conditioning or HVAC systems. These
6 systems are generally relied on fossil fuels such as
7 heating oil or natural gas to run and are often
8 economically burdensome not only on the property
9 owner as many older inefficient models but also on
10 countless New Yorkers must deal with pollen the
11 unleash. That's why I'm proud to sponsor Intro 609-
12 A, which encourage the adoption of Geothermal
13 exchange system. I want ask my colleagues for their
14 support on this bill. For many Geothermal can
15 replace additional HVAC systems. These systems work
16 by utilizing stored heat from the earth's crust in
17 the winter for heating and the sun earth conversely
18 the process can be reversed by channeling the heat
19 back into the ground, eliminating the need for
20 separate air conditioning or central air
21 installations. Geothermal systems are currently used
22 at St. Patrick Cathedral, the Queens Botanical Garden
23 and the Brooklyn Children Museum, so we know that
24 they work in New York City's diverse topography.
25 Geothermal systems are also easy and cheap to

2 maintain and do not require large roof units. They
3 will not be problematic for landmark buildings or
4 other structures where roof space is a premium.
5 Intro (inaudible) call the City to develop to make
6 publically available online a screening tool that can
7 be used to determine when an installation for a
8 Geothermal system will be cost effective. Starting
9 in 2017 the City will be required to use this
10 screening tool whenever it construct or retrofits a
11 City owned building. The tool determines a
12 Geothermal system maybe cost effective that a more
13 through engineering analyst must be done to balance
14 the real cost versus other alternatives taking in
15 account not only the cost of installation but the
16 utility bill savings and the social cost of carbon
17 which is the first time were doing that in New York
18 City. Such as the benefits of reduced greenhouse gas
19 emissions. Last it would require that the
20 administration sent to the account the
21 recommendations for standards for installation for
22 Geothermal systems, qualifications for system
23 installers, informing property owners and Geothermal
24 systems installers of the benefits of coupling with
25 solar which would make buildings energy neutral.

1 STATED MEETING

16

2 President Obama has said that we are the first
3 generation to fill the effect of climate change and
4 the last generation that will be able to do anything
5 about it. This legislation marks the progressive
6 step of making our City more sustainable and does not
7 create greenhouse gas emission and will take us in a
8 more green sustainable future. I want to thank staff
9 attorney Samara Swanston (sp), Policy Analyst Bill
10 Murray for their tireless efforts. Jonathan Seltzer
11 (sp), Jeff Baker, Laura Popa (sp), the Mayor's
12 office, Nelda Masa(sp) from the Office of
13 Sustainability, Anthony Peori (sp) as well and my
14 staff Nick Widzowski, Nick Roloson and Shachar
15 Sharon. Thank you.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
17 Member and finally today (inaudible) to vote on
18 legislation that will authorize the City to reimburse
19 non-public schools for cost related to higher and
20 paying security guards for school facilities. This
21 bill will allow schools from across the 5 Boroughs to
22 make sure there facilities are a safer and more
23 secure place for their students. This is a first of
24 its kind measure to keep students in non-public
25 schools safe and were proud to lead on this landmark

1 STATED MEETING

17

2 safety measure. Students across our City deserve a
3 safe learning environment no matter what community
4 they come from or where they attend school. With
5 this bill were reaffirming that message and showing
6 our commitment to all students in New York City. I
7 want to thank Rob Newman, Iesha Shumberg (sp), Deepa
8 Ambicar (sp), Beth Gottleib (sp) Rachel Codero, Seria
9 Ansher and Laurie Wen and would ask Council Member
10 Greenfield the lead sponsor on this bill and who has
11 been a tireless advocate for this, to say a few
12 words.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you
14 Madam Speaker, I'm extremely proud that New York City
15 today is leading the way in protecting our most
16 vulnerable or nearly 1 ½ million school children in
17 public and non-public schools. Intro 65-A,
18 legislation that I have sponsored and is being voted
19 on today is a truly landmark measure extending the
20 promise of school security on the basic notion that
21 every single child deserve to be safe regardless of
22 where go to school. First I want to thank you
23 Speaker for your setfast support. I want to
24 acknowledge that you made an immense contribution to
25 the development to this legislation. You meet with

1 STATED MEETING

18

2 me and several of our other colleagues over a half a
3 dozen times in the last 21 months. You provided
4 feedback and guidance as we worked toward the passage
5 of this vital bill and I'm really grateful for that.
6 I want to thank my colleagues the unarmed prevailing
7 wage security officers will soon provide an
8 incredible protection to nearly 200,000 non-public
9 school children, that's over 70% of the non-public
10 school children in New York City. Thanks to you
11 colleagues the program authorized by Intro 65-A offer
12 security officers to schools of 300 or more students
13 in grades preK-12 and give larger schools an
14 additional guard for every 500 students. These
15 officers will be extensively trained to protect the
16 unique student bodies of these schools and be
17 sensitive to the profound threats they face including
18 unfortunate arise and bias attacks. Intro 65-A
19 security officers will be state licensed and employed
20 by state licensed security companies. The companies
21 will be screened and prequalified by the
22 administrating agency. Today we are both voting to
23 give hundreds of thousands of New York City parent's
24 peace of mind and create up to 500 new living wage
25 jobs. I want to thank all of you for that. I also

1 STATED MEETING

19

2 want to thank the historic coalition that joined
3 together to support this legislation. Foremost I
4 want to thank the Chair of the Public Safety
5 Committee Vanessa Gibson and my colleagues on that
6 Committee who voted unanimously to pass this
7 legislation this past Friday. I want to thank the 44
8 Council co-sponsors plus our esteemed Public Advocate
9 Latisha James, all of who co-sponsored this
10 legislation; in fact we have more sponsors on this
11 bill than any other bill. I also want to thank the
12 advocates, without of whom it never would have
13 happened. The Muslim Community Network, The Islamic
14 School Association, Rafic Muhammand (sp) is with us
15 today, The Catholic Community Relations Council, Joe
16 Rosenberg is with us today, The Archdiocese of New
17 York, The Archdiocese of Brooklyn, The UJA
18 Federation, Jeff Letts (sp) is with us today, The
19 Good of Israel of America, (inaudible), The Orthodox
20 Union, where Jake Adler is with us today as well.
21 They turned out with students, they had their diverse
22 voices heard loudly and clearly and finally I want to
23 thank the labor advocate especially building service
24 workers local 32BJ of Service Employee International
25 Union, I'm proud to call them supporters and

2 advocates for this bill. We know that we will not
3 just be receiving protection from properly trained
4 security officer but they will also be earning a
5 prevailing wage and excellent benefits. I want to
6 thank as well Mayor Bill de Blasio for recognizing
7 the safety needs of all children whether they attend
8 public or non-public schools. The Mayor personally
9 negotiated this bill and every public school has
10 security guards regardless of its size, location or
11 risk and were simply extending that to non-public
12 schools and finally I really want to my thanks to all
13 the co-sponsors of this legislation. I want to give
14 a special shout to a half a dozen or so members
15 including the Public Safety Chair Vanessa Gibson, she
16 gave me non-stop feedback and advice, the Jewish
17 Caucus Chair Mark Levine was a
18 (inaudible) supporter, Finance Committee Chair Julissa
19 Ferreras-Copeland really help me with invaluable
20 advice to crunch the numbers as well, the Majority
21 Leader Jimmy Van Brammer who kept pushing along with
22 me, Council Member Ritche Torres who pushed me every
23 day to work harder on this legislation and Minority
24 Leader Steven Matteo and his predecessor Vincent
25 Ignizio for the bi-partisan support, we're very

1 STATED MEETING

21

2 grateful for that. All of you gave me support, most
3 of you co-sponsored this bill, you'll gave me advice
4 and encouragement over the last 21 months. I
5 couldn't have done it without you and finally I want
6 to give a shout out to our wonderful staff, you're
7 incredible especially Romon Martinez (sp) who kept
8 the faith in this bill, our amazing Counsel Rob
9 Newman, who stayed with me until 1:30 a.m. on the eve
10 of Thanksgiving to negotiate this bill with the
11 administration. I want thank Gary for his behind the
12 scenes wisdom as well and I want to thank Emma Wolf
13 and John Palupa (sp) who took the lead negotiating
14 this bill on behalf of this administration and to my
15 fabulous Chief of Staff, my current Chief of Staff
16 Danny Pearlstin (sp) and my former Chief of Staff
17 Jane Carrie for spending 100s of hours working on
18 this and to my other staffer who worked on this
19 Becky, Alex, Helania, Juliani and Danny and Finally
20 on your desk today you will see that you have gold
21 coins with chocolate inside. It's a tradition for
22 100s of years known as Hanukkah Gelt or Hanukkah
23 money. Today's bill will create as many as 500
24 prevailing wage jobs in New York City, these will be
25 real good high paying jobs on behalf of those who

1 STATED MEETING

22

2 will be employed as a result today, I give you a
3 little gelt, a token of their appreciation. Thank
4 you all.

5 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Council
6 Member. Now I want to point, I'd like to point
7 everyone's attention to the monitors in the front.
8 We're displaying Council labs, some of you that were
9 Democratic Conference would remember. It is a
10 website for testing new ways of sharing information.
11 So we are in the process now we want to engage and
12 get peoples feedback on how this website our website
13 can better serve our constitutes. The first phase of
14 this new site demystifies the work of the Council.
15 It's written in clear language and much of it is
16 available in Spanish, we are looking at other
17 languages. Council labs grew out of Council 2.0
18 which is the public tech plan we announced in the
19 spring. We want to build on this great effort and
20 your feedback is critical in involving all of the
21 digital work we do to share information and engage
22 New Yorkers. So I'm looking forward to hearing from
23 my colleagues, ask that your staff get on the site as
24 well and provide feedback. Counsel staff, the public,
25 anyone that wants to be part of this process we

1 STATED MEETING

23

2 actually we really encourage you so please visit
3 labs.council.nyc and provide us your feedback. So
4 additionally on this front I want to recognize a
5 digital strategy team, the working group on public
6 tech and the other staff that have been involved in
7 making council labs a reality, so please also
8 available on your, on your smartphones, so check it
9 out. We also have some additional exiting news
10 Council Member Donovan Richards and his wife Tameka
11 became, he became a father and she a mother
12 obviously.

13 [clapping]

14 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: We congratulate
15 him and Tameka on the birth of their son Donovan III,
16 definitely, definitely really great news. He's not
17 looking up, come on Donovan. He's too tired, he said
18 he's tired, he's tired, he needs some sleep. So
19 congratulations. You know as has been allotted to
20 earlier by Chaplin, today is the 74th Anniversary of
21 the attack on Pearl Harbor. Over 2,400 people lost
22 their lives on that December 7th, 1941 ultimately
23 leading to major American involvement in World War
24 II, so today let us reflect on that. We remember
25 their lives, their sacrifice, their commitment,

1 STATED MEETING

24

2 theirs and those that serve us each and every day,
3 and so thank you for that commitment and remember
4 them on this day. Finally I want to wish all my
5 colleagues a joyous and festive Hanukkah this week.
6 For anyone who wishes to join, I'll be in City Hall
7 Park with Council Member Levine and the Jewish
8 Caucasus at 4:15 to light our Menorah and will be
9 serving soupcanua (sp) did I pronounce it right? I
10 hope not, maybe? Jelly donuts I think they were
11 being served in the members lounge earlier, some
12 people had powdered sugar on them when they came up
13 here into the members lounge so I caught you. So
14 please come out and join us and Happy Hanukkah to
15 everyone across the City and with that I end
16 communication from the Speaker.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. The
18 donuts are downstairs? Congratulation Daddy Donovan
19 on DJ. Discussion of general orders. Seeing none.
20 Report or special Committees.

21 CLERK: None.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of
23 standing Committees.

24 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
25 Economic Development Intro. 128. Job creation report.

1 STATED MEETING

25

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
3 general order.

4 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
5 Environmental Protection Intro. 609-A, Geothermal
6 Systems.

7 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
8 coupled on general orders.

9 CLERK: Report of the Committee on
10 Finance pre-considered LU 308 and Reso. 924 and LU
11 309 and Reso. 925.

12 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
13 general orders.

14 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Public
15 Safety Intro. 65-A, security and school facilities.

16 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Amended and
17 coupled on general orders.

18 CLERK: Report of the Committee on Rules,
19 Privileges and Election pre-considered Reso. 926
20 approving Committee changes.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Coupled on
22 general orders.

23 CLERK: On the general orders calendar
24 resolution appointing various persons Commissioner of
25 deeds.

1 STATED MEETING

26

2 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: At the, at this
3 coupled on general orders and at this time we ask, I
4 ask for a roll call on all items on the coupled
5 general order calendar.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the
7 Chambers please.

8 CLERK: Cohen.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I.

10 CLERK: Gibson

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to
12 explain my vote.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I'd like to
15 congratulate my colleagues on very important pieces
16 of legislation, thank you and congratulations to
17 Council Member Cabrera, Constantinides and certainly
18 Council Member Greefield for your consistency and
19 remaining persistent in recognizing Intro. 65-A is
20 really about the safety of all children in our City.
21 On behalf of many of my residence, my students who
22 are in non-public schools I know that this will
23 provide a significate benefit for their safety moving
24 forward. I'm very proud to have been a part of this
25 process as Chair of Public Safety and thank you for

1 STATED MEETING

27

2 hearing the concerns that many of raised throughout
3 this long journey. It was worthwhile and it is
4 making an investment and it will make a difference so
5 congratulations and certainly to all of my colleagues
6 thank you for all of your work and happy holidays.
7 Thank you very much.

8 CLERK: Garodnick.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I.

10 CLERK: Gentile.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: I on all.

12 CLERK: Wills.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: May I have
14 permission to vote.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLS: I vote I.

17 CLERK BARRON:

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to
19 explain my vote.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: The City has an
22 obligation to provide essential services to all it's
23 residence. Education being one of the most critical.
24 For that reason, New York City's education system was
25 first founded to provide elementary education through

2 grade 8. Subsequently, secondary education levels
3 were added and that in fact lead to the formation of
4 the free academy which evolved to become CUNY the
5 City University of New York. The CUNY system of
6 higher education provided tuition free education for
7 high school graduate with 75 or better average. We
8 are fighting to see a return to that condition. I
9 believe that for those private, for profit, religious
10 as well as profit, hedge fund operated and other
11 entities that choose to establish private education
12 institutions must bare the cost associated with the
13 operation of such schools. I believe that we have an
14 obligation to provide safety and public places which
15 is why I introduce legislation requiring one way stop
16 signs at every intersection of a block where a school
17 exists be it public or private. Certainly such a
18 measure would help to provide safer traffic condition
19 for all children on their way to and from school.
20 But the responsibility for what transpires in a
21 private school building should be the obligation of
22 the operators of that school. Public dollars should
23 not be used to provide for conditions within private
24 schools. The money be required to bare the cost of
25 these school safety agents in private schools will

1 STATED MEETING

29

2 further constrict the already struggling City budget
3 that is not providing funds for construction of new
4 schools, not providing funds to reduction of class
5 size, not providing funds for much needed long and
6 overdue school repairs and forcing co-locations.

7 With that, I vote no on Intro. 65, I on the others.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 CLERK: Borelli.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: I on all.

11 CLERK: Cabrera.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Permission to
13 explain my vote.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I just want to
16 give a special thanks to Chair Garodnick for his
17 support on this bill, as the Chair of Economic
18 Development and also to all the legislative staff and
19 also to my Director of Legislation Brittney Mongonga
20 (sp) and also to my colleagues, congratulations on
21 their bills. Thank you so much.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: I on all.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

25 CLERK: Chin.

1 STATED MEETING

30

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: I just want to
3 congratulate my colleague and thank you to Council
4 Member Greenfield on Intro. 65, I vote I on all.
5 Thank you.

6 CLERK: Constantinides.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: Well
8 congratulations to my colleagues, Council Member
9 Cabrera and Greenfield on their bills today and
10 congratulations to Donovan Richards on addition to
11 his family, congratulations Donovan. I vote I on
12 all.

13 CLERK: Cornegy.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: I vote I.

15 CLERK: Crowley.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CROWLEY: I on all.

17 CLERK: Cumbo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Permission to
19 explain my vote.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: I just want to
22 congratulate my colleagues Cabrera, Constantinides,
23 Greenfield and I also too want to celebrate Donovan's
24 new addition to his life and may your new addition

25

1 STATED MEETING

31

2 bring you and your wife great happiness for many
3 years to come and I vote I on all.

4 CLERK: Deutsch.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Can I explain my
6 vote.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: I believe all
9 our school children, all our school children need to
10 be protected so I thank Council Member David
11 Greenfield for his persistence, dedication and
12 introduction of this bill. I am also grateful to
13 Mayor de Blasio and Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for
14 their commitment and supports on Intro. 65-A.
15 Finally I'd also like to thank my Chair, the Public
16 Safety Committee and my esteemed colleague Vanessa
17 Gibson for your unwavering leadership was a great
18 honor for me to Chair Intro. 65 hearing with you and
19 be a part of this extremely important safety measure
20 for all our children and I vote I on all.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22 CLERK: Dromm.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Permission to
24 explain my vote.

25 PULBIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: As Chair of the
3 Council Education Committee I am deeply disappointed
4 that the Council has decided to give yeshivas private
5 and parochial schools millions of dollars of taxpayer
6 money that could and should have been used for our
7 public schools. This is an unprecedented step in the
8 direction of subsidizing private education. Security
9 guards in these schools will still be required to
10 call the NYPD if there's any threat to student
11 safety. This measure will come at a great cost to
12 our public schools that are still owed \$2.3 billion
13 in campaign for fiscal equity funding from the State.
14 These types of budget decision should be part of the
15 established City budget process and not rammed
16 through legislatively. The Council should not be in
17 the business of circumventing its own procedures.
18 Furthermore many of these non-public schools and
19 religious construction classes teach homophobia and
20 transphobia to young people each and every day. They
21 are not subject to Council oversight and mostly
22 exempt from New York City Union Right law. We cannot
23 allow these private interest to teach hate to our
24 children. If they receive millions of dollars from
25 the City they must be required to sign a non-

1 STATED MEETING

33

2 discrimination clause. This is the least we can do
3 to ensure the safety and wellbeing of our students.
4 Once again I want to voice my deep disappointment on
5 the passage of this regressive bill. I know the same
6 lobbyist for these private and parochial schools and
7 yeshivas will be back again to rob the public school
8 budget of additional funding at some point in the
9 future. This is a sad day for public education and
10 for our public school students. I vote no on Intro.
11 65 and yes on all other matters. Thank you.

12 CLERK: Espinal

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I vote I.

14 CLERK: Eugene.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I vote I on all.

16 CLERK: Ferreras-Copeland.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER FERRERAS-COPELAND: I vote

18 I.

19 CLERK: Greenfield.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: May I explain

21 my vote.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER GREENFIELD: Thank you I

24 want to congratulate Council Member Cabrera and

25 Constantinides for their important legislation. I

2 just want to respond to some factual inaccuracies
3 that have been stated so far because I think that
4 it's important the record reflects that. First
5 inaccuracy is that these schools are predominately
6 nonprofit schools. I don't know someone refers to
7 them as Charter schools those aren't covered today,
8 if they're referring to them as hedge fund schools
9 they're not recovered today. These are nonprofit
10 schools that are struggling to pay their bills. The
11 second thing which I think is important to note is
12 that this follows 50 years of legal precedent. Right
13 now the City already pays for busing to get a child
14 to and from school to make sure their safe. We pay
15 for nursing to make sure that their safe. We pay for
16 crossing guards to make sure that their safe. Were
17 simply extending this one final point which is for
18 school safety officers. The final statement that is
19 factually inaccurate is well is, this doesn't take
20 away any money from any other program. The reality
21 is that in the City of New York quite frankly were
22 flushed with cash, we have a \$78 ½ billion budget.
23 Just a couple weeks ago we announced the new
24 initiative that's important for HIV funding before
25 that we announced another new initiative that's

1 STATED MEETING

35

2 important for mental health funding, before that we
3 announced another new initiative that's important for
4 supportive housing, no one claimed then, nor should
5 we claim now that this takes away money from any
6 other process, sorry to bother you I just can't see
7 the clock there and so the reality is that this is a
8 funding decision that is simply made based on good
9 government and based on a public priority which is to
10 keep every single child safe. If that's not a good
11 use of government funding, making sure that every
12 parent has the peace of mind knowing that their child
13 goes to school and is safe, quite frankly I'm not
14 really sure what is a good use of public funding. I
15 thank all my colleagues, I wish you all a very Happy
16 Holiday, a Happy Hanukkah and I proudly vote I on
17 all.

18 CLERK: Grodenchik.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I on all.

20 CLERK: Johnson.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: I want to say
22 congratulations to my colleague Donovan Richards on
23 his new son. I vote no on Intro. 65-A and I vote yes
24 on all others. Thank you.

25 CLERK: Kallos.

1 STATED MEETING

36

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I on all.

3 CLERK: Koo.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I vote I and I want
5 to wish everyone a Happy Holiday.

6 CLERK: Koslowitz.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: May I be
8 excused to explain my vote.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Certainly.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: I want to
11 congratulate David Greenfield on this legislation. I
12 also want to congratulate the children that are going
13 to be protected with this law. So thank you very
14 much David Greenfield for all the people that are
15 going to benefit from this protection. I vote I on
16 all.

17 CLERK: Lancman.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: I.

19 CLERK: Lander.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I on all.

21 CLERK: Levin.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to
23 explain my vote.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

25

1 STATED MEETING

37

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Madam Public
3 Advocate I want to first vote I on all and I want to
4 congratulate the sponsors; Fernando Cabrera, Costa
5 Constantinides and David Greenfield, I also want to
6 congratulate Donovan Richards on the birth of his
7 son, he and his wife. With regards to Intro. 65-A, I
8 want to congratulate Council Member Greenfield for
9 this bill and... and express my support. I... I agree
10 with Council Member Greenfield that this is an
11 appropriate use of public fund and an important use
12 of public funds to ensure the safety of our children
13 is an obligation that we all have in New York City.
14 All children, not just children that attend our
15 public schools and this in no way takes away our
16 obligation to fully fund our public schools, to
17 continue to fight for CEF funding, to make sure that
18 our kids in public school continue to be safe and
19 that they receive an all of the education dollars
20 that they need and we as elected officials have every
21 responsibility to continue to fight for that. The
22 fact of the matter is that in the schools that I
23 represent in my district that will benefit from this
24 legislation, those schools struggle to get by each
25 and every day. They provide a deeply discounted

2 tuition for children in need and for children that
3 otherwise don't receive a lot of public education
4 dollars. The fact of the matter is that the
5 community that would see some relief from this
6 legislation and this funding, do not receive, receive
7 a very small percentage of the public education
8 dollars that... that other communities throughout New
9 York City receive. Small things like nurses and
10 transportation and this public safety is important to
11 keep those communities afloat and with that I proudly
12 vote I on all items before us today.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

14 CLERK: Levine.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Madam Public
16 Advocate permission to explain my vote.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you. New
19 York City is always prided itself on the principle
20 that everyone here be treated equality regardless of
21 their background, regardless of their religion or
22 lack thereof and this is a City where we have a
23 change to make that statement now. At a time where
24 were experiencing such religious strife here and
25 globally. I'm proud of the Council standing up and

1 STATED MEETING

39

2 saying we don't care about the background of a child,
3 we care about their safety. The truth is that we
4 have Muslim communities, Catholic communities, Jewish
5 communities that have some of the lowest income
6 residents among them. This is our chance to say that
7 they matter. We as grownups can and should continue
8 to debate robustly questions about public versus non-
9 public schools. Including questions of curriculum
10 and content on social issues. But we should agree
11 that the kids need to be kept safe. That's what this
12 bill accomplishes and I am, and I will remain a
13 passionate advocate for increase to our public
14 schools budget. If I thought that this money was
15 coming directly out of the DOE budget I would be the
16 first to oppose Intro. 65 but the truth is no more
17 than any other initiative in our \$78 billion budget
18 is this money directly coming out public schools. So
19 I look forward to continue to advocate for our public
20 school budget while embracing the principle that
21 every child no matter their background deserve to be
22 kept safe and that's why I'll be voting I on all
23 including Intro. 65, thank you.

24 CLERK: Maisel.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

1 STATED MEETING

40

2 CLERK: Mealy. Menchaca

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: I on all.

4 CLERK: Mendez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Permission to
6 explain my vote.

7 PULBIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I'm voting I on
9 all expect Intro. 65. I believe that we should not
10 be spending our public dollars in private schools.
11 These schools charge tuition and all too often many
12 of them discriminate against the LGBT community,
13 against women and so I have a real problem moving
14 forward in providing City funds in this case. Thank
15 you very much.

16 CLERK: Miller.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: I vote I.

18 CLERK: Reynoso.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: I vote I.

20 CLERK: Richards.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: I vote I and

22 congratulations to Council Member Costa

23 Constantinides on his landmark Geothermal bill

24 legislation and I also want to wish Samara Swanston

25 who I know worked on this a long time, happy belated

1 STATED MEETING 41

2 birthday and also Bill Murrary, congratulation. I
3 vote I on all.

4 CLERK: Rodriguez.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Congratulations
6 Council Member Richards and his wife. I vote I and I
7 would like ask permission to vote I on all general
8 orders.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: I.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 CLERK: Rose.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Happy Hanukkah to
14 my colleagues and congratulations to Donovan Richards
15 on the birth of his son D III and I vote I on all.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: His name is DJ.

19 CLERK: Rosenthal.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: I.

21 CLERK: Torres.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: I on all.

23 CLERK: Treyger.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
25 explain my vote.

1 STATED MEETING

42

2 PULBIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: If a church, if
4 a temple or if a mosque caught fire, do we ask the
5 fire department or the fire fighters if they are
6 diverting resources away from protecting the public?
7 I represent one of the hardest hit districts from
8 super storm Sandy. And if it was not for our houses
9 of worship and our schools of worship more people
10 would have died. Before FEMA came in they were there.
11 So we have to understand that if we're going to
12 preach a City of tolerance that message has to be
13 universal to religious organizations and to us as
14 well. We live in a democracy, parents choose,
15 families choose their schools. Regardless of where
16 kids go, their safety is non-negotiable. So I want to
17 commend Councilman Greenfield, I want to commend the
18 Speaker, commend this Council for saying the safety
19 of all of our kids, regardless of what school they go
20 to is non-negotiable and with that I vote I on all,
21 thank you.

22 CLERK: Ulrich.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Permission to
24 explain my vote.

25 PULBIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I first want to
3 wish all of my colleagues who are celebrating
4 Hanukkah a very Happy Hanukkah. When we light the
5 candles of the Menorah we are making the world a
6 better place and we pray for the peace and the
7 security of the Jewish people not only in New York
8 and Israel but all around the world. I want to also
9 congratulate all the sponsors of today's bill,
10 particularly Council Member Greenfield who has worked
11 so hard, tirelessly to pass this important piece of
12 legislation. You know one point that I don't think
13 has been made today is that parents who choose to
14 send their children to yeshivas or Catholics schools
15 or other parochial schools, they pay twice, their
16 taxes pay for an education that they don't use
17 because they don't put their child in the public
18 school system and on top of that they pay 10
19 sometimes 20 thousand dollars per student, per seat
20 inside one of those parochial religious schools. So
21 they vote, they pay taxes, they are deserving of
22 every right and privilege that we should afford every
23 citizen of this great City and I don't think that we
24 should be discriminating against children or making
25 children less safe whose parent decide to send them

1 STATED MEETING

44

2 to those schools. At the end of the day, all
3 children and all taxpayers and all people of this
4 great City should be treated fairly and the same. We
5 should not be treating them differently. This money
6 is not coming away from public schools, quite the
7 contrary. Council Member Greenfield is correct, I
8 don't know how flush we are with money but because
9 I'll be looking for more of it for my veterans stuff
10 later on in a few months, exactly not that the
11 Finance Chair just remind me not that flush but
12 anyway but the point is that we do have the money to
13 do this, it's an essential service we should provide
14 and I'm very proud to vote for this bill today and
15 finally to my good friend and colleague and neighbor
16 in the Rockaways Councilman Donovan Richards. I want
17 to congratulate him on becoming a father. I hope you
18 got plenty of sleep over the past 9 months. I speak
19 from experience very recently and I have to say it's
20 the most important job we have. Being a member of
21 the Council, elected officials the second most
22 important, the first is being.. being good parents.
23 So congratulations and god bless you and your wife.
24 Thank you.

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen.

1 STATED MEETING

45

2 CLERK: Vacca.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Can I explain my
4 vote.

5 PULBIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: I want to vote in
7 favor of all. I want to thank Councilman Greenfield
8 for sponsoring Intro. 65-A. I represent many schools
9 in my district, public and parochial and each child
10 represent the hope that we have for the future. Each
11 child is equal. Each child has a right to go to a
12 school where they feel safe and where we take a
13 position that were going to make sure there as safe
14 as possible. This bill does that. I understand that
15 were flushed with money this year, but I have to tell
16 you something whether we were flushed with money or
17 not this is the right thing to do. This has been
18 something that has been long overdue. Parents who
19 put their children in private or parochial schools
20 pay taxes and as my colleague just said they truly
21 pay twice. Their entitled to safety at all times.
22 We as the Council of the City of New York are taking
23 an important step today to make sure that they are
24 treated equally and that they go to school always in
25 a safe environment. So I vote I on all.

1 STATED MEETING

46

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 CLERK: Vallone.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Permission to
5 explain my vote Madam Advocate.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: So Happy
8 Hanukkah to all and from one proud father to another,
9 Donovan I wish you all the blessing and happiness
10 that fatherhood brings and I think as a father I take
11 Council hat off and I just want to say thank you to
12 Council Member Greenfield and I think what the parent
13 want to know when your father or mother, the love of
14 your child exceeds all and the unprecedented times we
15 live in and the greatest City in the world we will
16 always be a target and when you get the call that
17 something happening, I don't care if there's a
18 Tsunami in front of you, you are going to get to your
19 child and to know that every school has the ability
20 to have a security agent, not money for their budget,
21 not discretionary, not capital, not anything a
22 security guard. We're not furthering anyone's lost
23 hopes or their budgets. To have the face of a man or
24 a women in a uniform greet you at the door as
25 something those in our private schools have never

1 STATED MEETING

47

2 been able to have. And it's always a father or mom,
3 the super mom's, the dad who take their extra time or
4 volunteer to keep those schools safe will now have
5 that ability. But I can't tell you how thankful I am
6 that thousands of phones calls I've received to just
7 know that there, were going to be able to give that
8 and go beyond politics and anyone else's issues to
9 say that yes our children safety is paramount and
10 first and your love of child should always be able to
11 see that everything were doing as a City starts with
12 the safety of our children. The future of our
13 children, everything we do is for, everything we do
14 is for the future of our children and if it's not
15 were doing something wrong. So I thank you and god
16 bless you during these holidays to do that for those
17 who don't have the ability to stand up and speak,
18 thank you Council Members and god bless and happy
19 holidays everyone.

20 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21 CLERK: Matteo.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: May I be excused
23 to explain my vote.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

25

1 STATED MEETING

48

2 COUNCIL MEMBBER MATTEO: I want to start
3 off by wishing my colleagues and everyone a happy
4 Hanukkah. Congratulations to my good friend Donovan.
5 I want to congratulate Joe Borelli who was just
6 become minority whip and you have a big shoes to fill
7 in the last minority whip Joe. Big, big, big shoes,
8 big shoes and I want to, I want to congratulate my
9 good friend David Greenfield. David your... your
10 leadership and persistent throughout this process was
11 just inspirational for everyone and as my colleagues
12 have already said when our kids go to school the most
13 important thing that us as parents want to make sure
14 is that they are safe. And it is our responsibility
15 in the Council, it is our job in the Council to do
16 everything that we can to make sure that our students
17 are safe. We have you know in terms of our budget we
18 spent \$27 plus billion on our public education, we
19 should be providing safety agents at a non-public
20 school and David and I had discussion on how we
21 should include more non-public school and I look
22 forward to having that discussion, so you know this
23 is a bill that... that we all should support because of
24 our kids. The paramount of our safety of our kids is
25 priority and as you can see it a bipartisan sport.

1 STATED MEETING

49

2 I'm proud that my conference has joined you in
3 passing and supporting this bill and I proudly vote I
4 and I on all.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 CLERK: Van Brammer.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMMER: I on all.

8 CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito:

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: I vote I.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Since were
11 flushed with money, there's an office that I know
12 that could use some, just saying. All items on
13 today's general order calendar were adopted by a vote
14 of 45 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and 0
15 abstentions with the exception of Intro. 65-A which
16 was adopted by a vote of 41 in the affirmative, 4
17 negative and 0 abstentions and that is the tally.
18 Introduction and reading of bills.

19 SPEAKER MARK VIVERITO: All bills are
20 referred to Committee as indicated on the agenda.

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: There are no
22 discussions, there is no resolutions and now were
23 going to resolute general discussion beginning with
24 Council Member Kallos.

25

1 STATED MEETING

50

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Happy Hanukkah to
3 those who are observing and to all who have lit many,
4 many menorahs over the past day or so I want to just
5 start by thanking Speaker Mark-Viverito, Erica
6 Gonzalez and the entire team behind labs.council.nyc,
7 it's pretty amazing you can check it out on your
8 phone. You can find out who your Council Member is
9 right there on your phone it's absolutely amazing. I
10 want to welcome our Republican whip, Council Member
11 Borelli to the Committee on Governmental Operations.
12 I also want to thank Council Member Richards on the
13 birth of his child and along those lines I want to
14 just say to my wife that Happy Anniversary we will be
15 celebrating our 2nd Anniversary tomorrow night and in
16 terms of flush for money I think one of the offices
17 the Public Advocate may have been referring to is
18 COPIC (sp) which a commission but it's actually not
19 funded so we would love to see that funding but today
20 I'm actually here to speak about Intro. 1015 which
21 requires building owners to registrar each and every
22 unit of affordable housing with the City. New York
23 City is in desperate need of affordable housing but
24 as we all suspected and recent investigation have
25 confirmed from the Attorney General on.

1 STATED MEETING

51

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Excuse me Council
3 Member were still in session please, may we have some
4 quiet in the house, quiet in the house. Thank you,
5 we apologize Council Member Kallos.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: No worries as the
7 Attorney General and the Governor and the Mayor have
8 found owners of affordable housing have routinely
9 hidden the units from the public in order to rent
10 them at market rates. There is not fine for not
11 filing to the State but we would not have a fine for
12 the City and I just want to thank everyone who was
13 involved in making it happen. Ed Adkins, Brad Reid
14 and the whole team and for central staff, hopefully
15 you can join on so that we can make sure that every
16 single unit of affordable housing is in a place where
17 people can find it. Thank you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, we
19 apologize Council Member Kallos and now Council
20 Member Palma for a vote.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: I vote I.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.
23 Continuing with general discussion before we update
24 the tally. Council Member Rosenthal.

25

1 STATED MEETING

52

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you
3 Madam Public Advocate and Speaker Mark-Viverito. I'm
4 delighted to be part of a body, part of this body
5 that works tirelessly to reduce any quality and
6 support New York City's workers. We all know how
7 important it is for us as legislators and
8 representatives of our continuities to support
9 minority and women owned businesses, MWBEs in New
10 York City. The City's MWB program is meant to create
11 more opportunities for minority and women owned
12 business enterprises to compete for City contracts
13 and to better inform City agencies of these
14 businesses and Chair of the Contract Committee I want
15 to make sure that more New Yorkers.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Apologize to
17 Council Member.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Thank you.
19 That's ok I was mumbling. So although I'm
20 introducing package of bills today related to MWBs
21 what I'd really like to do is invite everyone to a
22 joint hearing with the Committee on Small Business
23 and on Women's Issues and the Committee on Contracts,
24 and Oversight Committee on how the City is doing with
25 it's MWBs and to hear this legislation, it will be

1 STATED MEETING

53

2 held a week today, December 14 at 1:00 p.m. Thank you
3 very much colleagues for your time.

4 PULBIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
5 Council Member Levine. We're still in session, quiet
6 in the Chambers.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you Madam
8 Public Advocate and (inaudible) I want to wish
9 everyone a Happy Hanukkah and invite all of you to
10 join us at 4:15 as the Speaker said in City Hall
11 Park, we will be lighting a menorah together. People
12 of all backgrounds and all faiths or no faith at all
13 are welcomed to participate. And I also want to
14 remind my colleagues in the Jewish Caucus that will
15 be meeting downstairs immediately following Stated.
16 And I'd like to call my colleagues attention to a
17 piece of legislation I'm introducing today, that
18 Intro. 1018, now colleagues many of you know that for
19 years really disgracefully, members of the NYD have
20 often had to dig into their own pockets to pay to
21 replace their bullet proof vest when they've become
22 worn out, damaged or passed there warranty date.
23 Thankfully recently the Mayor and the police
24 commissioner have amended the policy so that officers
25 are guaranteed new vest when all vest go out of

2 warranty. But we want to go further and we want to
3 enshrine this guarantee into law and this bill would
4 mandate that vest be replaced after 5 years and
5 importantly they'd be replaced if any significant
6 damage is sustained from a bullet or other projectile
7 or if the vest no longer fits due to changes in body
8 weight or other reasons why the device might be
9 damaged or unusable. And I invite all of my
10 colleagues to join me again in supporting this
11 important bill, Intro. 1018. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, Happy
13 Hanukkah to you as well. Council Member Lander.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Madam
15 Public Advocate I also want wish a Happy Hanukkah to
16 everyone these in many ways around the world are dark
17 and anxious times and sometimes lighting a candle can
18 help nudge miracles along, so I hope everyone will
19 join us and in the miracles vein I also want to
20 welcome prince Donovan III very cute pictures and I'm
21 so thrilled for he and his family. I would like to
22 call my colleagues attention to 2 Intros. Intro.
23 1016 and 1017, providing additional protection for
24 freelance and independent workers. Intro. 1017,
25 which some of you joined us to intro a few minutes

1 STATED MEETING

55

2 ago is the freelance is in free act, right now when
3 freelancers are victims of payment theft or late
4 payment and 7 and 10 of them have been, they have no
5 way to recover the payments that their due or to deal
6 with the fact that their stiffed by employers
7 sometimes 5,6,7 months even though the rent is due in
8 30 days. This would establish protections like W2
9 wage workers have. Giving them the opportunity to
10 collect the wages the payments that are due them and
11 creating a system where they make sure they collect
12 them. Intro. 1016 would also support independent
13 freelance contingent workers by making more clear
14 that they are covered by the protections the New York
15 City Human Rights Law gives to workers because that
16 was drafted when we had more traditional
17 understanding of employee updating this law to make
18 clear that the human right law protection due to
19 workers also belongs to workers regardless of whether
20 they get a W2 or a 1099, whether there construction
21 day laborers or Uber drivers, or freelance graphic
22 designers, we all outta have the protection of the
23 human rights law. So I hope people will sign on to
24 vote Intros 1016 and 1017 and finally just want to
25 encourage people Council Member Gibson and I have

1 STATED MEETING

56

2 bills regarding schools crossing guards and are doing
3 a hearing next week in her Committee on School
4 Crossing Guards initiative, I know it's near and dear
5 to many of my colleagues and I hope you will join us
6 there, now I can't find the calendar, but it's on the
7 calendar, will see you there.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member
9 Miller. Council Member Chin.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you Madam
11 Public Advocate. First I wanted to wish all of my
12 colleagues a Happy Hanukkah, Happy Holidays and of
13 course congratulations to the new dad on the City
14 Council. And I also wanted to share that my husband
15 Allen and I are celebrating our 38th Anniversary this
16 week on December 9th and I thank my husband for his
17 love and support. I want to draw my colleagues
18 attention to Reso. 920, a resolution introduced by
19 Council Member Cumbo, Crowley and myself. Resolution
20 920 urges the US congress and the State of New York
21 to support a woman right to choose and to oppose sex
22 selective abortion band that perpetuate racial
23 stereotype that undermine access to care. At a
24 glance such band might sound like laws meant to
25 further women's right but they do just the opposite.

2 These bands exploit and promote an ugly stereotype
3 about the Asian American community. Mainly that we
4 do not value the lives of our girls. Between high
5 rates of limited English proficiency and a complexed
6 healthcare system, these bands will only heighten the
7 barriers to accessing care and family planning
8 services for the Asian American community. New York
9 City is home to one of the largest Asian American
10 population in the country. We must take a stand and
11 demand that our colleagues on the State and federal
12 level work to ensure that our communities have more
13 opportunities and better choices for healthcare and
14 not more restrictions. I want to thank Joan Provoli
15 (sp) for her work in drafting this resolution and I
16 urge my colleagues to sign on to Reso. 920. Thank
17 you.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you,
19 Council Member Cabrera.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so
21 much Madam Speaker, Madam Public Advocate. Good
22 afternoon and thank you for the opportunity to
23 briefly speak about the resolution I'm introducing
24 today is Reso. 919, with Council Member King to
25 officially recognize November as the Hip Hop month in

2 New York. Hip hop is not just a style of music but
3 also a cultural art form that was born in the Bronx.
4 The birth and growth of hip hop is rooted deeply in
5 the social and economic disparities that plague
6 residence in the South Bronx during the 1970s.
7 Several individuals in particular are remembered for
8 their contribution to creating hip hop culture; Clive
9 Campbell, perhaps better known as DJ Kool Herc is
10 considered the father of hip hop. A Jamaican
11 immigrant to New York he was the first DJ to
12 experiment with innovative rhythmic drum beats of
13 funk, soul and r&b. He made the practice of dubbing
14 famous and coined the term break dancer which by the
15 way I was one of them some years ago. African
16 Bombada, founder of the universal, I know that
17 shocking, but founder of the Universal Zulu Nation is
18 credited with coining the term hip hop which envision
19 as unifying force that will draw people away from
20 negativity. Since the release of the Sugar Hills
21 Gang first commercially successful hip hop hit
22 Rappers Delight over 40 years ago, hip hop has grown
23 to become a multi-billion dollar industry that
24 imparts the fields of fashion, television and film,
25 design, sports, advertising among others. In 2001 a

1 STATED MEETING

59

2 group of people gathered at the United Nations here
3 in New York to sign the Hip Hop Declaration of Peace,
4 recognizing hip hop as an international cultural of
5 peace and prosperity as the Universal Zulu Nations,
6 as the Universal Zulu Nation recognizes the official
7 birth date of hip hop as November 12, 1974, I am
8 proud to be introducing this resolution calling on
9 the State of New York legislator and Governor Cuomo
10 to recognized November as hip hop month in New York.
11 Thank you so much for your support.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you and we
13 look forward to seeing you breakdance at the holiday
14 party. Council Member Mendez.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you Madam
16 Public Advocate, my colleagues today I rise because
17 yesterday Dan Garodnick and I said farewell to a
18 friend of ours, Democratic district leader Charles
19 Buckwald (sp), he was not just a district leader, he
20 serviced on the community board, he was my dear
21 friend for nearly 2 decades and it is a big loss for
22 us as it is a loss for the lower east side. A few
23 things you should know about Charles. He was born
24 and raised in Brooklyn, moved to Manhattan later in
25 life, he loved politics and baseball and those are

1 STATED MEETING

60

2 things that we shared and often talked together. I
3 even use to go to Met games with him cause he was a
4 big Met fan, so Charles you will be missed and from
5 this Yankees fan to you I say let's go Mets.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you, may he
7 rest in peace and Council Member Cornegy.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Thank you Madam
9 Public Advocate, I'd like to say on behalf of myself
10 and my wife I'd like to make our announcement which
11 is we will not be having any more children but I did,
12 I wanted to take a moment to recognize Angelica
13 Morris, a student a Baruch College studying with
14 former Council Member Steve DeVenezia. Angelica is a
15 full-time student in her last semester who also works
16 long hours at JetBlue, a job that requires a very
17 long commute from Central Brooklyn to JFK. Sometimes
18 she comes straight to my office from her airport in
19 her uniform displaying the determination and
20 characteristics so many working students across the
21 City have. She's been enthusiastic, steadfast and
22 contributed a great deal to the subject, to special
23 projects and subject matter, such as getting the word
24 out about the gifted and talented test and connecting
25 our (inaudible) communities to the Museum of Natural

1 STATED MEETING

61

2 History. Angelica I hope you've learned as much as
3 you contributed during your time at City Council,
4 please stay in touch and best of luck.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. You
6 have six beautiful and talented and smart children,
7 god bless you. Council Member King for a vote.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote I.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you and
10 back to general discussion which will end with the
11 beautiful Council Member Debbie Rose.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you so much
13 Public Advocate. My colleagues I want to thank today
14 publically my intern Michael Posca (sp) who's a
15 student at the college of Staten Island and who's
16 here today to observe our Stated Meeting and to get a
17 taste of democracy and action and this is his very
18 last week with my office and we will sorely miss him.
19 Michael has been working in my district office and
20 has proved to be a valuable member of my team doing
21 constitutes service intake work, performing Council
22 staff data entry, answering phones and basically
23 helping out wherever he was needed and you know in
24 district offices that's a lot. So Michael I want to
25 thank you in front of all of my colleagues for all of

1 STATED MEETING

62

2 your help and I hope that you won't be a stranger,
3 keep in touch, thank you Madam Public Advocate.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And now the very
5 last, Council Member Miller.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Thank you Madam
7 Public Advocate. First I'd like to as the Speaker
8 said that today is December 7th the infamous Pearl
9 Harbor Day and I'd like to acknowledge the works of
10 Dorie Miller (sp). Dorie Miller was a cook on a
11 naval ship that was attached in Pearl Harbor after
12 coming from the load deck and saving some of his
13 fellow shipmates. He maned the gun which he was not
14 trained on and shot down Japanese air fighters which
15 saved the rest of the ship, so certainly we want to
16 remember that and then I want to congratulate Council
17 Member Reynoso and his Grand Avenue Campus defeated
18 my alma mater Erasmus Halls yesterday in the PSAL
19 Football Championship. Yes at Yankee Stadium, it was
20 really exciting and if there was any consolation
21 Grand Avenue had the first African American head
22 coach to ever win a championship at the PSAL and we
23 will see you again next year, thank you.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you and may
25 Jacqueline Berrien the former Chair of EEOC, may she

2 rest in peace. All items on today general order
3 calendar were adopted by a vote of 47 in the
4 affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions
5 with the exception of Intro. 65-A, which was adopted
6 by a vote of 43 in the affirmative, and 4 negatives
7 and no abstentions and now to close, the Speaker
8 Melissa Mark-Viverito.

9 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you Madam
10 Public Advocate and again I want to thank my
11 colleagues I really do respect and am really proud of
12 how this body conduct itself, particularly when we're
13 engaging in conversations that may get heated at
14 times so I just want to commend everyone for that an
15 again next Stated Meeting is Wednesday, December
16 16th. We have our holiday celebration on that day,
17 the City Council, I would encourage all of my
18 colleagues to attend and to bring your staff if you
19 have not RSVP'd, to please do so, it should be a
20 great evening. So thank you all very much and again
21 that ends this Stated Meeting, at about 2:50. Meeting
22 adjourned.

23 [gavel]

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 23, 2015