

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON SANITATION  
AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT

----- X

Wednesday, November 16, 2022  
Start: 10:03 a.m.  
Recess: 11:37 a.m.

HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM, CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Sandy Nurse, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
Erik D. Bottcher  
Chi A. Ossé  
Nantasha M. Williams

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jessica Tisch  
Commissioner  
NYC Department of Sanitation

Greg Anderson  
Deputy Commissioner for Policy and  
Strategic Initiatives  
NYC Department of Sanitation

Javier Lojan  
Director of Operations Management  
Division  
NYC Department of Sanitation

John Chengus[sp?]  
Chief of Operations  
NYC Department of Sanitation

Christopher Schuyler  
Senior Staff Attorney  
New York Lawyers for the Public Interest  
and the Disability Justice Program

Diego Barbarena  
Residential Small Business Owner  
Upper East Side

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 3

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Please start the recordings.

3 Good morning, everyone. Welcome to the committee  
4 on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management. Anybody  
5 that desires to testify, whether you're here in  
6 person or on Zoom, you're welcome to sign up to  
7 testify. If you're on Zoom, you can go to our  
8 website and sign up there. If you're here, you can  
9 just see the Sergeant At Arms, and you can sign up to  
10 testify in the back at the Sergeant At Arms desk. If  
11 you have any copies of any written testimony that you  
12 would like to submit, you can submit it at  
13 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Again, that is  
14 testimony@council.nyc.gov. If you have any  
15 electronic devices that are going to make noise  
16 during the hearing, please set them to vibration.  
17 Thank you so much for your cooperation. Madam Chair,  
18 we're ready to begin.

19 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you, Sergeant Perez.  
20 Good morning, everyone. Thank you Sanitation  
21 Committee members, Commissioner Jessica Tisch, Deputy  
22 Commissioner for Policy and Strategic Initiatives,  
23 Greg Anderson, Director of Operations Management  
24 Division, Javier Lojan, it's nice to meet you, Chief  
25 of Operations for the department, John

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 4

2 Chengus[sp?]. . . I'm sorry, I don't want to butcher  
3 your name. What's that? Okay. And others for  
4 joining us today.

5 Welcome to the ninth Committee on Sanitation and  
6 Solid Waste Management hearing of 2022. Today we'll  
7 be focusing on DSNY's 2020 to 2023 snow plan, as well  
8 as the future of the city sanitation fleet. We will  
9 also be hearing two related bills. The Department of  
10 Sanitation is vital not just for daily waste  
11 collections but also plays an important role in  
12 providing emergency response and operations to New  
13 Yorkers, including annual snow removal operations  
14 across 19,000 lane miles of city roads, with 1500  
15 snowplowing routes. I want to thank DSNY workers for  
16 their critical work and adapting sanitation  
17 operations during these emergency snow events, as  
18 well as other emergency responses such as debris  
19 removal during coastal flooding and flash flooding  
20 events.

21 Last year, New York City had just under 18 inches  
22 of snow during the winter season, making it the  
23 second least snowy winter in a decade. That's about  
24 10 inches less than the city's average snowfall in a  
25 season. Climate change continues to bring more

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 5

2 extreme variability to weather patterns in the city,  
3 from record breaking heat waves in the summer months,  
4 unseasonably warm autumn weather, to unexpected cold  
5 snaps and blizzards in the winter months.

6 As I read through the department's 2022-2023  
7 drafts snow plan submitted to the city council,  
8 community boards, and borough presidents for review,  
9 I was struck by the scale of the undertaking, and the  
10 comprehensive planning that goes into being prepared  
11 for whatever comes our way this winter, and I'm eager  
12 to hear from you all on the preparedness for the next  
13 snowstorm.

14 DSNY's fleet includes 1000s of collection trucks,  
15 mechanical brooms, salt spreaders, and more. A  
16 strong, reliable and sustainable fleet is key for  
17 effective sanitation operations across the city, and  
18 I look forward to learning more about the future of  
19 DSMs fleet in terms of what is needed to  
20 operationalize strong zero waste policies and what  
21 innovative technologies can help DSNY achieve  
22 electrification goals.

23 Today, we will also be hearing two sanitation  
24 bills introduced by councilmember Brannon. We have  
25 Intro Number 20 in relation to increasing penalties

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 6

2 on chain businesses for failure to remove snow, ice  
3 and dirt from snow from sidewalks, and Intro Number  
4 100 in relation to exempting or partially exempting  
5 seniors and certain persons with disabilities from  
6 penalties for failing to remove snow or ice from  
7 sidewalks, crosswalks, curbs, and other locations.

8 I want to thank my team, Anelle Hernandez, who's  
9 here. She's my director of climate environmental  
10 policy. And thank you to the sanitation committee  
11 Task Force, Jessica Alben, and Ricky Chowla, Andrew  
12 Lane Lawless. Thank you Task Force. And of course,  
13 to anyone who's providing public testimony today. So  
14 now I will turn it over to our moderator to get us  
15 started.

16 COUNSEL: Administration do you affirm to tell  
17 the truth in your testimony today and to answer  
18 honestly to council member questions?

19 ALL: I do.

20 COUNSEL: Thank you. You may begin when you're  
21 ready.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Thank you, Jessica. Good  
23 morning, Chair Nurse, and members of the City Council  
24 Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management.  
25 My name is Jessica Tisch and I am the Commissioner of

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 7

2 the New York City Department of Sanitation. I am  
3 joined today by Gregory Anderson, our Deputy  
4 Commissioner for Policy and Strategic Initiatives,  
5 Javier Lojan, who's the Director of the Operations  
6 Management Division, and John Chengus[sp?], the Chief  
7 of Operations for the department. Thank you for the  
8 opportunity to testify today on the future of DSNY's  
9 fleet and our preparedness for the upcoming winter  
10 season.

11 Winter more than any other time of year is when  
12 the sanitation department shines. Every day, our  
13 department works tirelessly to make our city cleaner,  
14 to collect 24 million pounds of trash organics and  
15 recyclables from the curb every day. They are  
16 essential to the functioning of New York City. But  
17 for a few months out of the year, and even for just a  
18 few dozen days within those months, the employees of  
19 this department rise to a new level. They keep our  
20 city moving in the face of tremendous adversity, and  
21 they work tirelessly to dig out our streets, bike  
22 lanes, bus stops, crosswalks, and public spaces from  
23 millions of tons of snow. I am very confident that  
24 this department will rise to the occasion yet again  
25 this winter.

2 Before I talk about our preparedness for the  
3 upcoming winter season, let me address the first  
4 topic, the future of New York City's sanitation  
5 fleet: Our work at DSNY relies on a fleet of nearly  
6 6000 units, from large collection trucks and front  
7 end loaders, to small forklifts that move parts and  
8 supplies in our garages. Without this critical  
9 equipment our workforce of nearly 10,000 employees  
10 could not deliver our essential services to nearly  
11 8.8 million New Yorkers each and every day. Over the  
12 last two years during the fiscal crisis brought on by  
13 the COVID pandemic, the previous administration froze  
14 orders for new equipment. That means that we had two  
15 years with basically no new collection trucks or  
16 mechanical brooms, the core parts of our cleaning and  
17 collection fleet. Collection trucks have a lifespan  
18 of around eight years, where adequate day to day  
19 maintenance can keep them going before you have to  
20 start making costly replacements of transmissions,  
21 engines, and other major components. That means that  
22 our fleet of collection trucks on average should be  
23 about four years old, some newer, some older. Today,  
24 the average age of our rear loader collection trucks  
25 is nearly six years old, two years more than the



2 target. All this because we put the brakes on the  
3 cycle of new equipment purchases. Once that process  
4 stops, it takes a long time to start up again.  
5 production lines for trucks are booked several months  
6 in advance. And unlike standard cars and SUVs, our  
7 trucks are customized from top to bottom to meet the  
8 needs of New York City streets and DSNY sanitation  
9 workers. Once we place an order, it can take up to  
10 eight months for the first trucks to roll into the  
11 city.

12 Earlier this year, the Adams administration  
13 wisely began to restart purchases of new collection  
14 trucks. We advanced funding from future fiscal years  
15 to increase the number of purchased and locked in  
16 lower pricing on an older contract ahead of looming  
17 inflation. We now have 296 new collection trucks  
18 scheduled for delivery, 36 of which have already been  
19 delivered.

20 What does this mean for day to day operations?  
21 In general we are able to adapt mechanics work  
22 through the night to fix equipment before it is  
23 needed on the day shift. Operations moves equipment  
24 from district to district and borough to borough  
25 almost daily to meet the operational need. We are

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 10

2 working to minimize the impacts on day to day  
3 operations and have been impressed by the get-stuff-  
4 done mentality our dedicated staff have embraced. We  
5 are working to turn the tide on these challenges.

6 As I mentioned we have 296 rear loader trucks on  
7 order from last fiscal year and deliveries have begun  
8 arriving. We plan to order 167 mechanical brooms in  
9 the current fiscal year and another 174 in fiscal  
10 year 2024. And we will order 50 dual bin collection  
11 trucks this year to replace units that are more than  
12 a decade old.

13 We are working with the mayor's office and OMB to  
14 evaluate the department's capital budget and staffing  
15 to put us on track to right the ship in the coming  
16 months and years.

17 Looking forward we are also working hand in hand  
18 with DCAS in the mayor's office to achieve the city's  
19 ambitious climate and emissions goals. Already, DSNY  
20 has been a leader in reducing air pollutant emissions  
21 from our heavy duty fleet. We were early adopters of  
22 advanced technologies to reduce particulate matter,  
23 NOX and SOX emissions, and today we operate the  
24 cleanest heavy duty diesel fleet in the country. We  
25 have tested hybrid and compressed natural gas trucks.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 11

2 We've worked with industry to develop new innovations  
3 to reduce idling and capture braking energy, and we  
4 have developed an industry leading emissions testing  
5 laboratory.

6 Today based on positive results of early tests  
7 DSNY is working to increase investments in electric  
8 vehicles. We have ordered another seven fully  
9 electric mechanical brooms, building on a successful  
10 test of the first ever electric full size street  
11 sweeper. On the collection truck side, we've ordered  
12 seven fully electric rear loader collection trucks,  
13 one for each DSNY borough. These trucks have  
14 performed well on collection operations, although  
15 they have not had the range of power necessary to  
16 meet the demands of snowplowing. We are working  
17 closely with DCAS to plan for expanded electric  
18 fleets in the future, including adding new charging  
19 infrastructure and associated facility upgrades. A  
20 large scale adoption of electric fleet will require  
21 substantial changes to our facilities, new or  
22 upgraded utility service, and additional space for  
23 charging trucks and equipment. We are working now on  
24 assessing these needs for the future.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 12

2 DSNY is fully committed to the city's fleet  
3 sustainability goals. And we will continue to work  
4 with our partners to move toward a zero carbon fleet.

5 Pursuant to local law 28 of 2011, DSNY submitted  
6 draft borough-based snow plans to the City Council at  
7 the end of September and issued final plans for each  
8 borough this week. I'll take a moment to highlight  
9 the core components of these plans. The department  
10 begins preparing for winter as soon as the previous  
11 winter ends. We evaluate performance, we revise  
12 routes, and overhaul equipment beginning in April to  
13 ensure we are ready for the following November. Each  
14 fall we conduct snow training for uniformed staff to  
15 prepare for the coming winter. This full-day snow  
16 training program combines a classroom module on  
17 proper techniques and procedures with real world  
18 driving training, with workers operating plows and  
19 spreaders on sector routes in the fall months. This  
20 training includes refreshers on how to attach plows  
21 and chains, how to operate in-cab navigation  
22 technology, and proper communication protocols over  
23 the radio.

24 This year, we trained more than 6700 employees  
25 over the last two months and we will continue to

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 13

2 train new employees as they come out of the academy.

3 For this season, we have the highest sanitation

4 worker headcount in years, giving us a deeper bench

5 to be able to continue core collection and cleaning

6 services, while responding to snow events. And in

7 the case of a large storm that merits a full-force

8 response. We will have more plows out than in any

9 point in the last three years.

10 On the equipment side we have a fleet of 705

11 large and small salt spreaders that are our first

12 line of defense against winter weather. We also have

13 34 new large spreaders coming into service beginning

14 in January that will replace the oldest units in the

15 fleet.

16 Salt serves three purposes in snow removal: It

17 melts snow and ice that is accumulated on the

18 roadway, suppresses accumulations and helping to

19 improve the plowability of the snow. We have more

20 than 350,000 tons of salt on hand at 42 sites across

21 the five boroughs, and we have contracts in place for

22 the delivery of up to 600,000 tons this season if

23 necessary. We also have 350,000 gallons of calcium

24 chloride, which improves the effectiveness of road

25 salt at lower temperatures. Since 2019, we have also

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 14

2 pretreated roadways with a salt brine solution that  
3 inhibits snow and ice accumulation, keeping roadways  
4 passable longer until additional treatment can be  
5 applied. Brine is only used in certain situations  
6 and is less useful when storms are forecast to start  
7 as rain and transition into snow. Brine is applied  
8 to roadways starting 48 hours before a storm, with an  
9 emphasis on hilly roadways, overpasses, and protected  
10 bike lanes.

11 In storms with accumulations of greater than two  
12 inches, we deploy our collection truck fleet as plows  
13 to physically remove snow from the roadway. We  
14 currently have more than 2200 pliable vehicles and  
15 more than 4000 plow blades in stock. Even with the  
16 concerning out-of-service rates I mentioned earlier  
17 in my testimony, we are very well suited to be able  
18 to run even our largest plow plans this winter.

19 This year, we're expanding our fleet of smaller  
20 equipment for treating protected bike lanes. In  
21 April, we announced the purchase of 47 new utility  
22 tractors to treat, plow, and clean bike lanes, and  
23 the first 12 of these units will be delivered next  
24 month. We expect a full contingent to be delivered  
25 by the spring, and we have leased 30 units in the

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 15

2 meantime until those arrive. We also now, for the  
3 first time ever, have dedicated personnel for bike  
4 lanes, meaning we can operate more bike lane  
5 equipment during active snowfall.

6 Each storm is different, and we respond  
7 differently based on the forecast, the expected  
8 conditions, and the timing. For example, a storm  
9 expected to have heavy snowfall during morning rush  
10 hour or school pickup may merit a more aggressive  
11 response than one that comes in early Saturday  
12 morning. DSNY also takes into account factors like  
13 snowfall intensity, a storm's total moisture content,  
14 clusters of back-to-back storms, and exceptionally  
15 cold temperatures in developing and executing  
16 response plans for each storm. We work closely with  
17 partner agencies like NYPD, DOT, and the MTA to  
18 prepare for the season and each individual storm.  
19 For example, NYPD sends escorts for some critical  
20 highway equipment.

21 Earlier this fall we met with the head of New  
22 York City Transit to reiterate the importance of  
23 chaining buses, to keep them from getting stuck  
24 during heavy snowfall.

25

2 We also maintain situational awareness throughout  
3 each storm, using our fleet tracking systems, DOT,  
4 and NYPD traffic cameras, social media, and 311  
5 complaints, and on the ground observations from DSNY  
6 personnel. During a storm, New Yorkers can track our  
7 progress at [nyc.gov/PlowNYC](http://nyc.gov/PlowNYC). Following a storm, DSNY  
8 assigns workers to clear bus stops, crosswalks, and  
9 other pedestrian areas. We have a fleet of 102 small  
10 skid steers that help us mechanize this work, but  
11 much of it involves manual shoveling. To assist us  
12 in these efforts, DSNY hires temporary snow laborers  
13 following major storms. These snow laborers work  
14 under the direction of DSNY staff to clear walkways  
15 for pedestrians. Recruitment for individuals  
16 interested in becoming snow laborers is underway, and  
17 we appreciate the assistance of the City Council in  
18 spreading the word about these efforts.

19 Trash and recycling collections may be delayed  
20 during and after a snowstorm as the Department  
21 continues to address roadway conditions and keep  
22 streets passable for emergency responders. This  
23 year, we will be focused on limiting those  
24 disruptions and pivoting back to collections sooner  
25 in keeping with our efforts to get trash bags off the



2 curb sooner. The additional sanitation worker  
3 headcount that I mentioned before will contribute to  
4 this effort. We appreciate New Yorkers' patience as  
5 we carry out these critical services throughout the  
6 winter.

7 As I mentioned before, I am quite confident in  
8 the ability of this department to once again rise to  
9 the occasion this winter. We are prepared and we've  
10 got this.

11 Before I address the council bills being heard  
12 today, I do want to address one piece of state  
13 legislation that passed the legislature earlier this  
14 year: The Buy American Salt Act would require all  
15 government agencies in New York State to purchase  
16 salt mined or hand-harvested in the United States.  
17 New York City on average buys more than 300,000 tons  
18 of salt each year. That's 600 million pounds. We  
19 use two vendors, each of which has a large salt  
20 stockpile and the New York City metropolitan area,  
21 one on Staten Island and the other in the port of  
22 Newark. They receive shipments in large ocean-going  
23 barges that hold 50,000 tons of salt per delivery for  
24 a total of six deliveries in the average year. Much  
25 of the salt is mined in Chile. Delivering the same

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 18

2 amount of salt in trucks from mines in upstate New  
3 York and the Midwest would require 10,000 long-haul  
4 truckloads per year. That is a substantial increase  
5 in the heavy duty truck trips into the city and  
6 surrounding metropolitan region.

7 As I described, road salt is a core component of  
8 our winter operation. It melts the snow and ice  
9 inhibits accumulations, and helps keep roads passable  
10 for emergency vehicles. Make no mistake: Imposing  
11 this requirement would have a very real impact on our  
12 snow operations as early as next year. While the  
13 bill has exclusions if this requirement is not in the  
14 public interest or would result in unreasonable  
15 costs. These exclusions are too vague. Simply put,  
16 potentially disrupting our longstanding supply chain  
17 for road salt is too big a risk. I encourage the  
18 Governor to veto this bill.

19 I will now turn to the council bills under  
20 consideration today. Intro 20 sponsored by  
21 Councilmember Brannon would increase penalties for  
22 chain stores, including franchises that fail to clear  
23 snow from the sidewalk following a storm. DSNY will  
24 always support any action that will have the ability  
25 to increase compliance, to improve cleanliness and

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 19

2 safety, but I do not support this particular bill.

3 All property owners have a responsibility to clear

4 their sidewalks just as they all have the

5 responsibility to keep their sidewalks clean year

6 round. I would support increased penalties for

7 everyone, including businesses, apartment buildings

8 and other properties. This is a very basic

9 responsibility that affects the safety and livability

10 of every neighborhood in this city.

11 Penalties for failing to clear snow and ice and

12 failure to clean sidewalks are simply far too low,

13 just \$100 and \$50 respectively. I understand the

14 council's inclination to focus on chain stores and I

15 don't want to overly penalize small businesses.

16 However, every business must keep their sidewalk

17 clean, and when it snows shovel the snow. If there

18 are particular locations where you have had problems

19 in the past, we can make sure to conduct proactive

20 inspections following a snowstorm. However, I think

21 this is too small a step and we should be focused on

22 increasing penalties for all violators.

23 Intro 100, also sponsored by Councilmember

24 Brannan, would require the Department of Sanitation

25 to establish a program to assist seniors and persons

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 20

2 with disabilities with snow removal from sidewalks  
3 abutting buildings such individuals own lease or  
4 occupy. It would also reduce the fines by at least  
5 50% for seniors and persons with disabilities who  
6 failed to remove snow from the sidewalks.

7 NYC service and DFTA provide capacity-building  
8 tools and resources to local not-for-profit  
9 organizations and other community groups to establish  
10 registries of volunteers willing to help remove snow  
11 on behalf of persons who are unable to do so due to  
12 infirmity, illness or disability. These local  
13 networks have proven most effective for connecting  
14 volunteers to those who need assistance, and we are  
15 happy to discuss with council how to bolster this  
16 effort. We encourage New Yorkers to help their  
17 neighbors when they can, particularly their older  
18 neighbors or those with disabilities. However, I do  
19 not support this bill.

20 Every property owner, regardless of their age or  
21 ability has a responsibility to maintain their  
22 property. This means cleaning your sidewalks and  
23 curb line and shoveling the sidewalk after it snows.  
24 This is a longstanding requirement and one that is a  
25 core part of the social contract in New York City.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 21

2 Allowing some property owners to avoid these  
3 responsibilities will only threaten those it aims to  
4 help: Older New Yorkers and people with disabilities  
5 who may struggle most to navigate and unshoveled  
6 sidewalk. Anyone unable to maintain their sidewalks  
7 on their own should make arrangements for it, either  
8 with family neighbors, by hiring someone or by  
9 leveraging the programs that I mentioned earlier.

10 Thank you for the opportunity to testify on these  
11 important topics. I am now happy to answer your  
12 questions.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you, Commissioner.

14 I want to acknowledge councilmember Julie Menon  
15 who's joining us remotely. At least that is what she  
16 texted me. And yes, and Councilmember Ossé.

17 Okay, thank you. I will just start with the snow  
18 plan. But thank you for the testimony. It answered  
19 quite a bit of the questions already in here.

20 So we'll just start off, can you just provide a  
21 short overview of last year's snow plan results, any  
22 particular challenges or improvements you saw?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. The basics of our  
24 snow-fighting strategy have not changed for this  
25 year. We have spent the last six months reviewing

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 22

2 routes, overhauling equipment, and ensuring that

3 every aspect of our operation is ready to go this

4 winter. This year, as I mentioned, we have the

5 highest number of sanitation worker headcount in

6 years, giving us a much deeper bench to be able to

7 continue core collection and cleaning services.

8 While responding to snow events. I would say that's

9 the biggest change. And in the case of a large storm

10 that merits a full-force response, we will have more

11 plows out than at any point in the last three years.

12 As we announced in April, we are purchasing dedicated

13 equipment for protected bike lanes for the very first

14 time, and we'll have a total of 47 pieces of

15 equipment.

16 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you. I also just want

17 to acknowledge Councilmember Marjorie Velazquez, who

18 has also joined us virtually.

19 Thank you, Commissioner. How many 311 complaints

20 did DSNY receive in fiscal year 2022 for missed

21 streets for snow plowing.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: In fiscal year 2022, DSNY

23 received 2516 service requests through 311 related to

24 snow or icy street conditions, and 3097 service

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 23  
2 requests or complaints for enforcement due to failure  
3 to clear snow and ice from the sidewalk.

4 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, and then since the  
5 snowplow tracker has launched, how has the number of  
6 311 complaints changed?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: For fiscal years 2011  
8 through 21, the number of DSNY snow related 311  
9 complaints has ranged from under 550 to over 15,000.  
10 And it does appear correlated to the annual snowfall  
11 accumulations throughout the city. The National  
12 Weather Service has tabulated annual snowfall  
13 accumulations for Central Park by fiscal year, which  
14 can be used as a proxy of measure of snow season  
15 severity.

16 For example, in 2011 to 2012, there were only 7.4  
17 inches of snow in Central Park and only 539 snow-  
18 related service requests citywide. Compare that to  
19 2013-2014 snow season, there were 57.4 inches of  
20 snowfall in Central Park, and 15,573 Snow related  
21 service requests city wide. The snowfall and the  
22 service request trends appear highly correlated, and  
23 can display high year-to-year variability. And I'm  
24 happy to provide the council a chart that maps  
25 service requests for snow-related conditions against

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 24

2 inches of snowfall, and you'll see the very clear  
3 correlation.

4 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah. I'd love to see that  
5 when you all have a chance.

6 And then in terms of doing the 1500 snow routes,  
7 which is an incredible amount of routes to have to  
8 cover: Can you share a little bit more about which  
9 ones present the most challenges? Maybe there's  
10 specific neighborhoods or boroughs that are more  
11 challenging than others?

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Absolutely. So there is no  
13 single neighborhood that is most challenging, but  
14 every part of the city presents its own unique  
15 challenges. So in Manhattan, for example, the  
16 orderly street grids make routing much easier, but  
17 the concentration of high-priority locations like  
18 hospitals, schools, bus routes, and other locations,  
19 and the congestion can pose challenges particularly  
20 when a storm hits at rush hour.

21 In Eastern queens, the vast geography and the  
22 various intersecting grids means that you have more  
23 equipment to get out the door, and to keep track of  
24 over the course of a shift, and we have seen a lot of  
25 benefits there for the GPS tracking on our plows.



1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 25

2 In Staten Island and in the Bronx, there are  
3 hillier areas that require advanced pretreatment and  
4 regular clearing to avoid having dangerous and  
5 slippery conditions. Our routing takes all of these  
6 challenges into account, and over the years we've  
7 tailored and optimized our routes and our equipment  
8 allocations to meet the needs of each individual  
9 borough and district.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Got it. You already talked a  
11 little bit about the equipment... the additional  
12 equipment that you have ordered, and additional  
13 training... or the training that you've already  
14 started. Can you talk a little bit about the budget,  
15 in terms of how much the city spent on... is planning  
16 to spend on salt and salt spreading this year?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: The majority of the snow  
18 budget that we have is used to support overtime labor  
19 by uniform and trades employees, mechanics for  
20 example, auto service workers, who often work 12-hour  
21 shifts for several days straight when responding to a  
22 snowstorm. In FY 2022 budget, spending was broken  
23 down by \$60.6 million on personnel services \$31.5  
24 million for salt, calcium chloride, and other  
25 supplies and then \$13.2 million for vehicle parts.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 26

2 The current FY 23 snow budget is \$96.2 million. We  
3 do not anticipate additional budget needs for the  
4 2022-2023 snow season at this time. The actual spend  
5 is driven by the number and the severity of the  
6 storms in a season. So if we have a more active  
7 season, we may have to look at increasing the snow  
8 budget in the January or the executive budget plans.  
9 However, we certainly do not anticipate any resource  
10 constraints that would impact our response.

11 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. That was my follow up  
12 question. Thank you, Councilmember Williams for  
13 joining us. For the night plow shift, can you share  
14 how many sanitation workers on average were scheduled  
15 for night shifts in FY 22? And how many on average  
16 would you schedule for FY 23?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: DSNY employs sanitation  
18 workers, as you know, on all three shifts during  
19 winter operations to ensure a constant state of  
20 readiness to deploy a snow response. These minimum  
21 staffing levels are determined based on staffing  
22 levels needed for a spreader storm response -- that  
23 means a big storm response.

24 Minimum staffing... minimum sanitation worker  
25 staffing levels for the previous and current years

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 27

2 are as follows: For the 12 to 8 a.m. shift, the  
3 2021-22 season, we had 342. For the 2022-2023  
4 season, we are planning 606. The 6 a.m. to 2 p.m.  
5 shift would be the... Well, the 4 p.m. to 12 a.m.  
6 shift would be 606 for both years, it's the same  
7 number, and on the 6 a.m. to 2 p.m. shift, we would  
8 have the balance of available personnel grieve.

9 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. For streets where the  
10 outdoor dining sheds haven't come down is a hot topic  
11 right now. Can you share more about how that impacts  
12 your operations?

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. DSNY has made route  
14 adjustments over the past year till to accommodate  
15 changes in roadway conditions due to the city's open  
16 restaurants program, which includes dining and  
17 protected roadway seating areas. Where necessary,  
18 DSNY uses smaller equipment to salt and plow streets.  
19 In particular, those streets that have very narrow  
20 roadway width due to roadway dining. So just to be  
21 clear, that would be like a naturally narrower street  
22 that also has dining. So by no means the majority of  
23 city streets. During a DSNY issued snow alert,  
24 businesses are prohibited from seating diners in the  
25 roadway area, and they should remove or secure any

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 28

2 tables or chairs, and entirely remove any heaters.

3 Restaurant operators should sign up for NotifyNYC to  
4 receive snow alerts and all snow-related updates.

5 When there is a forecast of snow accumulations of  
6 a foot or more, DSNY may require that restaurants  
7 remove or consolidate their roadway setups to have  
8 smaller footprint along the curb, to facilitate safe  
9 and effective snow removal. In the event of a  
10 significant snowfall, restaurant operators on the  
11 right-hand side of the driving lane may experience a  
12 ridge of snow alongside the roadway barriers as plows  
13 push snow to the right.

14 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. You mentioned about  
15 the training you're doing, but just... could you just  
16 restate how many refreshers or new trainings have  
17 been carried out for sanitation workers so far this  
18 year?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, we... we conducted  
20 snow trainings this year on Sundays for 5965  
21 sanitation workers and 749 officers. That's 629  
22 supervisors, and 120 superintendents, and the  
23 training program concluded on Sunday, November 6. In  
24 addition, all new sanitation workers graduating now

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 29

2 receive... will receive... receive snow training as  
3 part of their four-week academy course.

4 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. And for how many  
5 seasonal workers is DSNY planning on hiring for this  
6 season? And just related, did you have enough last  
7 snow season, including the flame throwers, and the  
8 seasonal snow workers. I don't know... I love the  
9 graphic and the flame throwers. It's my favorite job  
10 to advertise. But just to get a sense of how many  
11 folks will be on and how that changed?

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. DSNY begins  
13 recruitment efforts in October each year and New  
14 Yorkers interested in signing up can register at any  
15 local district garage, after making an appointment  
16 online through 311. The rate of pay begins at \$17  
17 per hour, and increases to \$25.50 per hour after  
18 completing the first 40 hours in a given week. Last  
19 year DSNY hired 893 Snow laborers and activated them  
20 for a total of seven days. Ideally, we would like to  
21 increase snow labor recruitment compared to last year  
22 so that we have additional support available in the  
23 case of a large snowstorm. We do have the capacity  
24 to manage and transport up to 1500 snow laborers at a

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 30  
2 time. The last time that we employed that number was  
3 during the record-setting 2016 blizzard.

4 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, just a couple more  
5 questions, and I'll open it up to council members on  
6 the snow plan. So it's hard to kind of articulate  
7 this question, but how... when from the time DSNY  
8 issues a snow alert to, kind of, the... the first  
9 loading of the salt and like the... before the trucks  
10 start coming back to the garage to like put on the  
11 plows and get going, what is that average timeframe  
12 like? And is there enough time to do partial  
13 collections of trash in neighborhoods where there's  
14 high volumes of trash per block? This is something  
15 that we've had some... a lot of folks suggesting if  
16 DSNY... if there was a solution for that in between  
17 the period of an impending storm to get some of the  
18 stuff off of there because we know it takes so long  
19 between the snowstorm or the storm happening before  
20 collections resume, and then it's just kind of a  
21 mess. So I was just wondering about that.

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: DSNY begins preparing for a  
23 snowstorm as much as three to four days in advance  
24 with the first forecast of snow accumulations. These  
25 preparations include loading salt spreaders,

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 31

2 attaching plows and chains to collection trucks, and  
3 applying brine pretreatment to roadways. I should  
4 note that we loaded all of our salt spreaders this  
5 week, because we saw the temperatures begin to drop  
6 significantly.

7 While storm prep is going on, DSNY continues to  
8 collect trash and recycling. Our goal is always to  
9 clear as much of the material out for collection as  
10 possible ahead of a snowstorm. But this year to get  
11 at your question, with more sanitation workers  
12 available. I believe that we will be able to leave  
13 more staff on collection functions ahead of a storm  
14 or during a smaller spreader storm event to keep  
15 trash and recycling collections on or closer to  
16 schedule.

17 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. Can you tell us more  
18 about how the snowplow GPS tracker functions in terms  
19 of costs. How long does it take to create a tool  
20 like that? And how many folks management?

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: PlowNYC is DSNY's snow  
22 plowing tracking tool. It was first built in 2011.  
23 It originally used GPS-enabled flip-mounted phones in  
24 plow trucks to track which streets had been plowed  
25 and when. We have obviously refined this technology

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 32

2 substantially over the past 11 years, including  
3 upgrading to CalAmp tracking devices, and a more  
4 robust back-end processing technology. These  
5 advancements have improved the accuracy and the  
6 reliability of the PlowNYC tool.

7 Previously, issues with GPS signal would cause  
8 some pings like to... look like they're happening on  
9 adjacent streets, or in the case of high-rise parts  
10 of Manhattan to land in entirely different areas.  
11 Today, more advanced software and hardware have  
12 largely resolved these issues, and PlowNYC is an  
13 effective tool to provide both transparency to the  
14 public on our snow operations, but also a more useful  
15 management tool to manage snow operations. I think  
16 that answered your full question.

17 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, that does. Well, just  
18 how many people need to maintain it?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I don't have on me the  
20 number of people in our VIT unit, which is our tech  
21 unit, but I can get that for you right after this.

22 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And then how does that  
23 compare... would it compare to GPS tracking on street  
24 sweeping?

25



1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 33

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well that's something that I  
3 am very interested in, as we've discussed in in the  
4 past. For that we would use similar underlying  
5 technology, with some important changes. First, on  
6 the street sweeping... street sweeping the side of  
7 the street that is serviced matters. So it's not  
8 like I could just copy and paste PlowNYC, and do the  
9 exact same thing for street sweeping. We would need  
10 to take that into account. And it matters even on  
11 one-way streets as there are two curb lines on every  
12 street.

13 For plowing, our initial goal is often to create  
14 one passable travel lane. And we will return  
15 afterward to widen out the travel lanes. The second  
16 difference, I think, is noncompliant cars and other  
17 obstacles can impede the passage of the broom. We  
18 don't want to mark a street as clean if the  
19 mechanical broom is not able to access the majority  
20 of the curb line. So we're working through and  
21 thinking through those important differences between  
22 what a street trans... mechanical broom transparency  
23 tool, and snow trans... plowing transparency tool  
24 would look like.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 34

2 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: That's really interesting.

3 Yeah. Okay. And then can you just tell us, I think,  
4 finally for this question, can you... Oh, sorry, let  
5 me back up: Did you mention how much it costs for  
6 creating a platform like this?

7 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I don't think I have the  
8 cost on me. But we can also get that to you very  
9 quickly.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Can you tell us more about  
11 snow plowing plans for bike lanes and how do you  
12 prioritize, you know, which... which areas having the  
13 most bike lanes or different types of bike lanes for  
14 cleaning?

15 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. We are continuing to  
16 test types of smaller equipment to pretreat and  
17 clear, protected and non-protected bike lanes on the  
18 roadways. We currently lease, as I mentioned before,  
19 30 smaller tractor units of various sizes for brining  
20 and plowing protected bike... bike lanes. We have  
21 purchased 47 new ones for snow clearing and cleaning  
22 going forward, and we expect to receive those through  
23 the first half of 2023. We deploy brining equipment  
24 ahead of a major snowstorm to prevent accumulations  
25 on bike lanes. We are also now assigning our bike

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 35

2 lane equipment during active snowstorms to stay ahead  
3 of accumulations and keep the bike lanes passable,  
4 particularly for working bicyclists. However,  
5 bicyclists, like other road users, should exercise  
6 extreme caution during winter weather. As with other  
7 roadway surfaces, bike lanes will not be  
8 immediately... immediately cleared to blacktop. And  
9 the slushy residue may exist even after plowing.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: So for protected bike lanes,  
11 those are the smaller ones that will come in. And is  
12 there a prioritization, or hierarchy of, kind of,  
13 which major lanes are...

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Chief Chengus[sp?], do you  
15 want to take that question on prioritization of bike  
16 lanes?

17 CHIEF CHENGUS[SP?]: Sure. So we prioritize  
18 according to manpower available, and we will dispatch  
19 the equipment as needed, and if we have available  
20 personnel to jump on a bike lanes, we will. Just  
21 keep in mind, they also have to be trained. We have  
22 a lot of people who are trained on these smaller  
23 pieces, and we have to look at their certificates to  
24 make sure that they're on the right shift, and they  
25 can use that piece of equipment.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 36

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And I would just add, that  
3 the prioritization will obviously be... priority will  
4 go to the most heavily used bike lanes in the city.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah. That was... I was  
6 going to ask if there was DOT data that was you all  
7 were working with on that.

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: That's what we are looking  
9 at as part of our snow planning for bike lanes.

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Great. I'm going to open up  
11 for questions before turning back to the status of  
12 the fleet and the future of the fleet.

13 Councilmember Julie Menin has a question, joining  
14 virtually.

15 Sorry, Councilmember Menin. We've got to have a  
16 quorum before we take questions virtually.

17 Councilmember Ossé?

18 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Good morning. Thank you,  
19 Chair, good morning Commissioner, and the entire  
20 Department of Sanitation... not the entire Department  
21 of Sanitation. You know what I mean. Whatever.

22 The first question that I have is when a  
23 snowstorm hits, conditions around someone's property  
24 can present as obstacles for older adults or seniors,  
25 as well as those with disabilities.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 37

2       How will DSNY tackle and prioritize customer  
3 service complaints from older adults and disabled New  
4 Yorkers? I know that you opened up in terms of how,  
5 no matter the age and disability that someone has, if  
6 they own the property they do have the obligation,  
7 you know, of fixing or shoveling the snow and salting  
8 the ice. But I do receive calls from seniors during  
9 our snowy season, about their streets being iced  
10 over, and is there a priority that DSNY takes in  
11 terms of alleviating those problems?

12       COMMISSIONER TISCH: So the first thing to know  
13 is I am a very data-driven person. And there's...  
14 there's two things going on here. The first is  
15 enforcement, right? So after a snowstorm if property  
16 owners have not cleared the snow and ice conditions  
17 in front of their property, we have to send  
18 enforcement around to unfortunately give out fines to  
19 people who don't clear snow and icy conditions. It  
20 makes it... It creates unsafe conditions for all New  
21 Yorkers. It... In particular, disabled New Yorkers  
22 and older New Yorkers. So enforcement is key. The  
23 other piece of this -- and I think this is what  
24 you're getting at -- is our snow laborers and our  
25 operation to clean parts of the streetscape that the

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 38

2 sanitation department is responsible for clearing,  
3 and there obviously, we will look at the 311 data and  
4 see where there are lots of service requests about  
5 it, and deploy our resources accordingly.

6 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you. And on our  
7 blocks we tend to see huge snow pile ups and the  
8 flooding from snow on corners. And these make it  
9 difficult for residents to travel around, again  
10 especially our senior population and our disabled  
11 population. How can we ensure that snow plows and  
12 other DSNY snow removal fleets fully remove snow from  
13 our sidewalks and bus stops?

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So our snow removal really  
15 focuses on the streets, like plowing the snow from  
16 the streets. And for the sidewalks, again it is  
17 largely the responsibility of the property owners to  
18 clear snow and ice conditions from them. And we will  
19 have our enforcement teams out there. We also will  
20 have our snow laborers out there to clean snow and  
21 ice. But there is no way for a department of 10,000  
22 people to clear all snow and... shovel all snow and  
23 ice conditions from New York City streets. That is  
24 why it's a shared responsibility, and property owners  
25 are required to shovel in front of their property.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 39

2 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: And what's the fine that one  
3 receives if they don't shovel their property?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: \$100... Right? \$100?  
5 Yeah.

6 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: I'm just thinking about some  
7 vacant lots that exists in my district where, you  
8 know, it's probably these developers that are  
9 millionaires to own a plot of land like that, that  
10 \$100 probably doesn't hurt their wallet to not shovel  
11 or hire someone to.

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: That's why I testified...  
13 That's why I testified earlier that I think that the  
14 fine structures around failure to remove snow and ice  
15 conditions in front of property, and just as much so  
16 cleanliness... failure to sweep... or clean 18 inches  
17 into the curb are just too low. The cleanliness  
18 violations in the last council were reduced from \$100  
19 for a first violation to \$50. And then, you know,  
20 people wonder, like, why we have the same property  
21 owners, you know, having this... like the same dirty  
22 conditions in front of their... their stores. Like  
23 that's why. There's no real consequence for not  
24 maintaining that important part of the social  
25 contract.

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 40

2 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: And you know I have a bill  
3 that I'm pushing to increase that, especially for  
4 large complexes. Um, hopefully, we can throw snow in  
5 there.

6 I guess the last question I have is: What is the  
7 plan for DSNY after a snowstorm to remove the extra  
8 snow?

9 You know what? Scratch that question.

10 Is it possible for the council to work alongside  
11 DSNY on... working on a mechanism that identifies  
12 frequent bad actors that every single year they're  
13 not doing anything about their snow? And work on a  
14 system of you know, either fining them more because  
15 they are consistently not, you know, shoveling and  
16 salting their... their sidewalks, or even, you know,  
17 working with maybe some district attorneys or other  
18 agencies or officials in holding them accountable on  
19 their frequent bad behavior?

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah, I... I... Obviously,  
21 I'm open to working with you and your colleagues on  
22 anything that will improve the quality of life and  
23 safety for New Yorkers, especially in the context of  
24 like, repeat bad offenders. But I do think it all  
25 starts with the fine structure. And I think... Like



1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 41

2 it is very clear to me that both for cleanliness  
3 functions and snow and ice removal, that the fine  
4 structures are out of... out of whack. And I'm very  
5 interested in working with you on correcting that,  
6 not because I believe in enforcement for the sake of  
7 enforcement, but I do believe in enforcement for the  
8 sake of asking New Yorkers to adhere to the very  
9 basic requirements around cleanliness and snow  
10 removal.

11 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Thank you. I have one more  
12 question. And we could do this later... But you are  
13 famous in my friend group chat for your quote on  
14 rats. I would love to, you know, meet up with you  
15 sometime after this and get a video so that they  
16 could see you in the flesh doing it too. But thank  
17 you.

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I was worried that you were  
19 going to ask me to deliver my line. Taylor Swift  
20 doesn't sing her songs for free. We'll talk after.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thanks, Councilmember. I do  
22 want to ask a question on behalf of our virtually  
23 participating, Councilmember who's not able to ask  
24 the question because of our weird laws right now,  
25 with this. But in the adopted fiscal year 2023

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 42  
2 budget, \$96 million was allocated, which is lower  
3 than the \$109 for FY 2022. Can the administration  
4 confirm the budget for snow removal? And are they  
5 looking at additional PEGs for this year? And in the  
6 mayor's management report, the removal cost per inch  
7 of snow is \$5.5 million in fiscal year 2022, up from  
8 \$3.2 million in FY 2021. Why has it increased? And  
9 how does this compare to other large cities? And I  
10 can repeat any part of that.

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Okay, let me... I'll start  
12 with the first... the first part. I can confirm that  
13 the budgeted number for the snow operation is  
14 correct. And that is actually not set by us or by  
15 the administration. It's set through the city  
16 charter, which says that the snow budget for a given  
17 year is the average of what was spent in the previous  
18 fives snow years... uh... snow seasons. And so  
19 that's how we got to the budget for this year. I  
20 also can confirm that we do not anticipate needing an  
21 additional budget for snow season. But this  
22 administration has been very clear that should this  
23 be an outrageously snowy year, or if we require more  
24 money for snow operations, that this is not going to

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 43

2 be an area where we're going to look to penny-pinch  
3 or save.

4 COUNSEL: Oh, sorry.

5 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Oh, your mic wasn't on.  
6 I was like, what's happening? Okay. Hi. Where was  
7 the question on this? Oh, here.

8 We have heard that the Queens curbside organics  
9 program that we're so excited about the borough of  
10 Queens is already utilizing all the available dual  
11 bin collection trucks to implement... to implement  
12 citywide curbside organics, how many new dual bin  
13 collection trucks will DSNY need to procure?

14 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, we, we don't need to  
15 procure any more for Queens curbside composting. But  
16 we will need to procure new dual bin trucks for...  
17 for two purposes: One to just natural lifecycle  
18 refreshes, to keep the fleet younger and healthier.  
19 And two: If and when we contemplate an expansion of  
20 curbside organics service.

21 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: And I missed part of your  
22 testimony, but I read it quickly, specifically your  
23 comments on the bills. And I agree. I think you  
24 know, DFTA, NYC Service... is it ACES? Is ACES the  
25 cleanup crew?

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 44

2 (background voice) Yes.

3 ACE... They help. I know we fund them, and so I  
4 do think you know, maybe as a council, there's  
5 different apparatuses we can use to support seniors  
6 and individuals with disabilities. But I am  
7 disappointed that you don't agree with the penalty  
8 reduction for seniors and people with disabilities.  
9 I think that the structure should be changed, and for  
10 folks who can afford to pay a fine, they should pay a  
11 fine, but I have a community of a lot of seniors.  
12 Some seniors are living in like single-family houses  
13 on the corner with like very huge sidewalks to shovel  
14 and it's very difficult for them... if like a young  
15 person doesn't come in, stop by and ask to shovel or  
16 whatever. It's hard for them to get people to shovel  
17 their snow. We even... In my office, we have a list  
18 of seniors that we know about, and we try to deploy  
19 people there when there is a snow event. But I do  
20 hope that we can consider a fair structure to support  
21 individuals who need it financially. Because some  
22 seniors have money, maybe a senior that has money  
23 doesn't need it, but for a senior that's on a fixed  
24 income or a person with a disability that's on a  
25 fixed income, I do hope that we can get your support,

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 45

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I understand and appreciate  
3 the spirit and the intent of what you're saying. I  
4 am incredibly practical person. And I like to, like,  
5 find practical solutions to practical problems. But  
6 I also see very practical challenges, just  
7 administering something like what you're proposing.

8 Like, how would we even know when we go to a  
9 proper... property like, oh, this person should get  
10 that level of a fine because they're this age and  
11 they have this income, and this person should get  
12 another type of fine. Like, that's the first thing:  
13 Like, practical implementation of that type of  
14 program.

15 The second thing I would say is that when we give  
16 people... if we gave people a pass on shoveling in  
17 front of their property. It actually creates a  
18 bigger problem for those that we are trying to help,  
19 because seniors and people with disabilities, they  
20 will suffer the most from property owners not  
21 cleaning or not shoveling there... there in front of  
22 their property. So I hesitate to support the bill as  
23 written for those two big reasons.

24 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: No, I appreciate that.  
25 And I'm rather practical in terms of government

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 46

2 implementation, because we have really smart ideas as  
3 council members. But when it goes to the agency,  
4 sometimes it doesn't make practical sense in the  
5 implementation phase. And so maybe this is something  
6 that could happen on the back end. So you know, you  
7 have a guy out there who's an enforcement agent. He  
8 sees someone didn't shovel their snow. He issues a  
9 ticket, fine, no problem. But maybe on the back end,  
10 if there's a process, maybe something can be written  
11 on the ticket that says, "If you fit this criteria,  
12 you can call... or you can..." I don't know, if it  
13 also deals with your tickets as well on the back end.  
14 I'm happy to talk through how we can make it  
15 practical because I do hear what you're saying, like,  
16 how would a random enforcement agent know who to give  
17 a ticket to or who to give a pass to, and I don't  
18 want to give people passes, I just want to provide a  
19 resource for them if they need it, to be able to have  
20 some type of relief.

21 And I do agree that when people do not shovel, it  
22 causes problems for those who are pedestrians and  
23 walking the streets, which is why I do think as a  
24 council, maybe we should look at other resources for  
25 people that cannot shovel their snow, because it is a

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 47

2 challenge for quite... I mean, we have on our list,  
3 we have over 200 people that we know of. I'm sure  
4 there are more people that don't even know we keep a  
5 list of seniors and folks with disabilities that need  
6 help during snow season. But to me, that's a lot of  
7 people, randomly to have, that don't have any ability  
8 to shovel snow, they don't have family members that  
9 there's no resources for them.

10 And then the last quick question. Also in my  
11 district, as you know, we have a lot of side streets.  
12 Some streets, I believe should be one ways. It's a  
13 DOT problem, not your problem. And so I know  
14 sometimes it's really hard for the vehicles to get  
15 down the street. So we have had instances during a  
16 snow event where certain side streets are not  
17 shoveled. So I just wanted to make sure that all of  
18 the streets are prioritized in reference to usage. I  
19 know you have to clear the main streets for where  
20 buses and things go, and I understand that, but I'm  
21 making sure that we don't leave some of the very side  
22 annoying streets.

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, I agree with you. I  
24 think this year, we are in a better position than we  
25 have been in years past to deal with those narrower

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 48

2 streets because of our investments... the investments  
3 we've made in the smaller equipment specifically for  
4 the narrower streets and bike lanes. And that's only  
5 going to improve, like, every year as we continue to  
6 grow out that fleet. I mentioned that we purchased  
7 47 of the smaller, like, bike lane type vehicles that  
8 can... can plow snow. Last year was the first year  
9 that we used those types of smaller vehicles. And  
10 we're hoping to improve this year on the level of  
11 service over what we did last year, particularly on  
12 the narrow streets.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you, Councilmember  
14 Williams. I do agree that maybe we need to look at  
15 how other agencies that work with seniors can support  
16 that. And I know Councilmember Farias is really  
17 interested in this issue as well. So maybe we can  
18 work together on something.

19 I'm going to turn now to the current status of  
20 the sanitation fleet. You've answered a handful of  
21 things in here. So I'm trying to jump down to get  
22 out some new questions.

23 Can you tell us why many of the collection trucks  
24 and dual bin collection trucks are not currently in  
25 actual service?



1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 49

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sure. The current out-of-  
3 service rate for rear loaders and dual bins is 26%  
4 and 27%, respectively. As I mentioned, Chair Nurse,  
5 in my testimony, the department was not allowed to  
6 buy any new trucks for... basically no new trucks for  
7 the two years during COVID, leading to an increase in  
8 the average age of our heavy duty fleet. Older  
9 trucks go down more frequently and are more labor  
10 intensive and time consuming to maintain. That  
11 coupled with reductions in automotive trade staff,  
12 this has increased our out-of-service rates.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you for that. And just  
14 to clarify, I'm sure if you've said it multiple  
15 times. But how many dual bin collection trucks is  
16 DSNY currently utilizing for the Queen's program?

17 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Uh, 110 Dual bin collection  
18 trucks for the Queen's curbside composting.

19 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you.

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And they're great, I should  
21 also say. They allow us to do this so much more  
22 efficiently in particular... particularly in areas  
23 where the volume is... is lower.

24 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And just as it relates to the  
25 fleet, how have the FY 23 budget cuts of garage and

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 50

2 utility workers impacted the maintenance and  
3 operations of the sanitation fleet?

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: They actually haven't...  
5 They will not impact us for this snow season. And  
6 that is because we have a higher sanitation worker  
7 headcount than usual. So for the purposes of snow  
8 season, when the garage utility workers are most  
9 needed, we will have two garage utility workers.  
10 Like, we will not have the cuts during... during snow  
11 season. And that's a decision that I made early on.  
12 Like, I think, it was part of our initial snow  
13 planning conversations.

14 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And this is kind of off the  
15 cuff, but when I read when I read your testimony...  
16 heard your testimony about the average life of a  
17 vehicle being about four years, that kind of was a  
18 little bit mind blowing, because it seems like...

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Well, it should be four  
20 years.

21 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Should be. Right. That's  
22 the target. It was just a little bit mind blowing.  
23 Because they're, I imagine, incredibly expensive  
24 vehicles. And as you mentioned, they're customized.  
25 Is there something that the Department could be doing

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 51

2 to prolong the life of these vehicles? I mean, I  
3 know that there's wear and tear and...

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: There's tremendous,  
5 /tremendous/ wear and tear on these vehicles.

6 Remember, like some of these... some of the vehicles  
7 can be out like on a snow day, like 24 hours a day.  
8 And like on a normal collection day, they could be  
9 used on like two different shifts. So they're used  
10 all the time, there's unusual wear and tear, given  
11 the purpose. The useful life is eight years. We'd  
12 like to see... Which is more than four. Four is what  
13 we would like our average... the average age of our  
14 truck on our fleet to be.

15 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: So the wear and tear is... is  
16 it... is it tied to the engine? Is it... I mean,  
17 What... Are there like a particular type of wear and  
18 tear that's more damaging than others? I know I'm  
19 getting really granular, but it's just... I'm just  
20 wrapping my mind around it.

21 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Greg, would you like this  
22 one? Greg loves talking about this. I want to hear.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah. So we've  
24 done... We've done a lot of analysis over the years.  
25 We actually, I think probably around six years ago

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 52

2 increased our sort of target lifespan for a  
3 collection truck from seven years to eight based on  
4 some analysis we did of when those major system  
5 components start to break down. Things like  
6 transmissions, things like major hydraulics  
7 components, parts of the diesel emissions control  
8 systems. So it's really looking at when... how...  
9 how long are trucks down? How often are they down?  
10 And how does that trade off with the amount of work  
11 and parts that you're putting into them? So we think  
12 eight years is the right number. We continue to work  
13 with the administration, with OMB, with DCAS fleet to  
14 look at our maintenance cycles, look at our  
15 preventative maintenance, to try to refine that. But  
16 that's... that's where we think we need to be, and  
17 right now we're way over that number.

18 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: It's just mind blowing  
19 information.

20 Okay, so we're going to turn to the future of the  
21 fleet.

22 Councilmember Williams touched on the Queens  
23 organics program. But some of the follow up  
24 questions were related to the cost of these trucks,  
25 the procurement timeline, and how much funding you

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 53

2 would need in the following fiscal years to start to  
3 phase into a full city-wide program.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So you... Are you asking  
5 specifically about...

6 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Yeah, about the curbside  
7 organics.

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: But are you asking  
9 specifically about the dual bins?

10 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: The dual bin trucks, yes,  
11 sorry.

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So, right now, in Queens, as  
13 I mentioned, we have 100... we're using 110 dual bins  
14 per day. To expand the program and the ways that  
15 you're contemplating, we would need an additional 112  
16 dual bin trucks on top of the... the current fleet  
17 count. We would use the dual bin... those dual bin  
18 trucks particularly in lower density parts of  
19 Brooklyn, Staten Island in the Bronx, where the  
20 hybrid collection model really works. Each new dual  
21 bin truck costs approximately \$450,000. And so we  
22 believe that the new need for the additional dual bin  
23 trucks would be between \$50 and \$75 million in  
24 capital funding.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 54

2 But I want to be clear that we wouldn't just need  
3 new dual bin trucks. We would also need additional  
4 rear loaders because not every neighborhood, not  
5 every route would require, or could... could  
6 accommodate a dual bin truck. And so the number of  
7 like single bin rear loaders that we would need, we  
8 estimate to be approximately half the number of dual  
9 bins. So if we need 112 dual bins, we need like 50  
10 plus new rear loaders. And then I think you also  
11 asked about how long it takes to order them?

12 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: About... yeah.

13 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So yeah. From the time that  
14 we place an order, it takes about eight months to  
15 deliver the vehicle.

16 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And you don't have to... You  
17 have a contract already in place? You don't have to  
18 bid these out, right? You have a supplier that...?

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Um, I was not thrilled to  
20 learn that the old... one of the old important  
21 contracts had expired. However, we do expect to have  
22 a new contract in place in January.

23 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: So once that's in place, it's  
24 not like every time you want to do another...

25 (crosstalk)

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 55

2 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Correct. You just buy off  
3 of that. We're doing it that way. So you can just  
4 buy off of the contract.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: So just to confirm, to kind  
6 of... to achieve the full city-wide program, as you  
7 are envisioning it, with a combination of dual bin  
8 and single... or rear loader trucks, you're looking  
9 at \$50 to \$75 million, which would be \$112.  
10 Additional dual bin on top of the current fleet, and  
11 also 60... 50 to 60-ish rear loaders.

12 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Correct. Dual... Dual bins  
13 plus rear loaders. So if the total cost for dual  
14 bins is \$50 million, we would need an additional \$25  
15 million for the rear loaders, because it's about half  
16 the number.

17 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. Very helpful.

18 Okay.

19 COMMISSIONER TISCH: (speaking to  
20 others) (inaudible) A quoting total would be around  
21 \$75.

22 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. So according to the  
23 DCAS NYC fleet, we understand that there are no  
24 current viable electric options in the marketplace  
25 that can fulfill the operational requirements of plow

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 56

2 trucks and salt spreaders for DSNY. However, there  
3 is a goal to... a goal date for electrifying these  
4 units by 2040. Do you believe you will be able to  
5 fully electrify this fleet by 2040?

6 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No, but I think we can make  
7 a lot of progress in a lot of key areas, and I would  
8 be happy to outline for you where I see concerns.

9 So first, we are moving aggressively to  
10 transition to a non-fossil-fuel fleet by 2040. We  
11 have made substantial progress on the light duty side  
12 of our fleet where we are working to build out our  
13 network of level two EV chargers at various garages  
14 city-wide, with a total of 201 level two charging  
15 ports.

16 Our light-duty fleet includes 289 plug-in  
17 vehicles, either plug in hybrid or fully battery  
18 electric vehicles. And we will continue to work with  
19 DCAS to expand the use of EV light duty vehicles and  
20 charging infrastructure in all 59 districts.

21 So our light duty fleet: I have a lot of  
22 confidence in that, and in being able to meet the  
23 city's goals.

24 The majority of our fleet is comprised, as you  
25 know, of heavy duty vehicles with larger batteries



2 that require DC fast chargers to effectively charge.

3 We currently have 13 of those chargers and we are

4 working to expand that network. However, this

5 charging infrastructure requires additional space,

6 and often new electrical utility connections that

7 require... that can require substantial capital

8 investments. We are working with DCAS and with OMB

9 to assess our future needs in these areas to support

10 a growing heavy duty EV fleet.

11 It is very important to mention that we have

12 tested both fully electric collection trucks and

13 fully electric mechanical brooms. We did great on

14 the mechanical brooms. The tests went really well.

15 And we have placed an order for seven additional

16 mechanical brooms. And I am hoping that we can push

17 forward on the charging front to like make a lot of

18 progress on shifting our mechanical brooms to non-

19 fossil fuels.

20 I have serious concerns, as we've discussed in

21 the past on the rear loader side. Because in our

22 test of the non-diesel, rear loaders, we found that

23 they could not plow the snow effectively. They

24 basically conked out after four hours. We need them

25 to go 12 hours. And so I do not see today -- given

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 58  
2 the current state of the technology -- I don't see  
3 today, a path forward to fully electrifying the rear  
4 loader portion of the fleet by 2040. Now things  
5 could change. Like the technology could develop and  
6 advance. But I don't want to sit here and say to you  
7 that I see it in my crystal ball today.

8 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And for the super-fast  
9 charging -- I'm sorry, I didn't know the terminology,  
10 you call them fast batteries?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Fast chargers.

12 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Fast chargers. Yeah. Yeah,  
13 you have 13 of those. Are those concentrated in a  
14 certain area? Or a certain set of garages? Or they  
15 kind of spread out?

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Greg is going to take that  
17 one.

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah, so those are  
19 DC fast chargers. DC stands for direct current. So  
20 there's... there's a inverter involved as well. It's  
21 much more complicated technologically. We are, as  
22 the Commissioner mentioned, ordering seven fully  
23 electric mechanical brooms and seven fully electric  
24 collection trucks. And those will be spread across  
25 the seven DSNY boroughs, two boroughs in Brooklyn and

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 59

2 two boroughs in Queens. So we are trying to have  
3 that that geographic spread there. As the  
4 Commissioner also mentioned, there are some  
5 constraints on space and on the utility connections  
6 that sort of drive where it makes the most sense to  
7 put those in. We want to put them in where we have  
8 particularly newer garages that have utility setup to  
9 have that extra load. So that's where we're focusing  
10 our efforts. But we're... we're working very closely  
11 with DCAS to try to put those in as many places as we  
12 can.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And just a couple follow up  
14 questions: Is sanitation or the administration  
15 working at this with the state to pull some of that  
16 money for EV infrastructure upgrades for garages  
17 potentially?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We obviously look at any  
19 state and federal grant opportunities, and have  
20 leveraged those in the past, and will continue to do  
21 so. Do you have anything to add to that, Greg?

22 COMMISSIONER TISCH: And then just related...  
23 I... Maybe we've talked about this before in a  
24 previous hearing, but I know when we visited a garage  
25 earlier this year and we spoke about the challenges

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 60

2 with electrification, some of the workers mentioned  
3 they just need new training. There's a whole  
4 different type of maintenance for those vehicles  
5 versus others. How are you all kind of planning for  
6 some of that? Challenges within staffing?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah, that's...  
8 that's a great question. I think one of the  
9 potential benefits of electric vehicles is actually  
10 lower maintenance. You have fewer moving parts in an  
11 engine. You have an electric motor instead of a gas  
12 or diesel engine. So I think there are some benefits  
13 there. As we are in the transition process, we have  
14 to make sure we have the capacity to maintain both  
15 the... the fossil-fuel-powered fleet as well as the  
16 new electric vehicles. So with you know, the  
17 mechanical broom, and the collection truck, obviously  
18 only having one of each. There's not a lot of  
19 experience maintaining those. As we get more, we  
20 think will develop that experience, we will bring the  
21 vendors in to provide the proper training to our  
22 automotive trades workers and make sure that they  
23 have everything they need to do that.

24 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Awesome. I just want to  
25 recognize Councilmember Bottcher. I don't know if

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 61

2 Councilmember Farias was able to join us as well yet,  
3 but we'll keep working on that one.

4 Okay. And in 2020 DSNY began piloting a fully  
5 electric garage truck in Brooklyn. Is the electric  
6 truck still operating as expected? And what, if any,  
7 complications have arisen during the pilot period?

8 COMMISSIONER TISCH: So the testing of that truck  
9 concluded in May of 2022. I think we just discussed  
10 some of the real challenges with that testing,  
11 particularly around snow. But given our commitment  
12 to keep pushing in this area, we have purchased seven  
13 electric rear loader trucks, understanding that they  
14 will not be used for plowing purposes. We can't  
15 really make significant process in converting our  
16 rear loader fleet until the snow challenges are  
17 addressed.

18 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay. You've answered a  
19 couple of my additional questions. Just to  
20 reiterate, if you've already specifically mentioned:  
21 Has DSNY added any additional fully electric street  
22 sweepers to its fleet since 2021?

23 COMMISSIONER TISCH: We are in the process of  
24 ordering seven additional electric mechanical brooms.  
25 The anticipated delivery for those is Q4 of... it's

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 62  
2 2023, right? (background voices) Yeah, that's what I  
3 thought. Fiscal year 2023. That's this spring. And  
4 just to pick up on your last question, we're using  
5 federal EV grant funding to purchase... to support  
6 this purchase.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: And so those were fully  
8 electric. But are those... is that inclusive of  
9 hybrid electric for the street sweepers? Or are  
10 they... would they be fully electric?

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: I have it back here. Do you  
12 know that off the top of your head? I have it right  
13 here.

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah, we do. So  
15 for the current fiscal year, we do have seven of the  
16 fully electric, and then we have some on order that  
17 are hybrid?

18 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Yeah. I can I can pull that  
19 for you.

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANDERSON: Yeah, we'll...  
21 we'll look that up and get into in a few minutes.

22 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Those are my questions.  
23 Councilmember Bottcher, do you have any questions?  
24 You're good? Okay.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 63

2 Just wait for them. And then we can do  
3 testimony.

4 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Oh, sorry. And the trucks  
5 are part of the... Yeah, we have 30 hybrids. Okay,  
6 30, on top of the seven, and those start arriving in  
7 June of this year, June through January.

8 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Got it. And you have... And  
9 just to confirm, you have no additional budgetary  
10 needs for regular...

11 COMMISSIONER TISCH: No. Those have been ordered  
12 and purchased.

13 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Okay, so you have no  
14 additional budget needs for regular collection trucks  
15 or other parts of the DSNY fleet.

16 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Of the what?

17 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Do you have any additional  
18 budget needs for the regular collection trucks or  
19 other parts of the fleet?

20 COMMISSIONER TISCH: Sorry. I was still on  
21 hybrid. We are working with OMB to assess the  
22 current capital funding in the context of the  
23 significant fleet age issues that I mentioned in my  
24 testimony. It also highlights the importance of  
25 maintaining a level, by cycle, as part of a long term

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 64  
2 capital budget, because I can tell you that those two  
3 years of buying virtually no new rear loader is  
4 really... is like hurting us.

5 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Right. Well, those are our  
6 questions. Thank you so much for coming with such  
7 detailed answers. I really, really appreciate the  
8 continued additional information you bring in the  
9 hearings. We're looking forward to snow season...  
10 maybe not a heavy one, but a fully prepared  
11 sanitation snow season. So thank you so much. And  
12 I'm going to turn it over to our counsel to moderate  
13 testimony. Thank you.

14 COUNSEL: Thank you. If there's anybody in  
15 person who has not registered to testify from the  
16 public, if you could please see a Sergeant At Arms.  
17 And we will continue now with those who are on the  
18 Zoom. First to testify will be Christopher Schuyler.  
19 You may begin when the Sergeant calls time.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

21 MR. SCHUYLER: Thank you. Good morning Chair and  
22 Committee members, thank you for giving me the  
23 opportunity to testify today. My name is Christopher  
24 Schuyler. I'm a Senior Staff Attorney with the New  
25 York Lawyers for the Public Interest and the



1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 65

2 Disability Justice Program. I'm also a person who  
3 stutters. So please bear that in mind while you  
4 listen to my testimony today. So, as a big overview,  
5 we, at New York Lawyers for Public Interest are in  
6 support of the two proposed bills. We think that  
7 they that they work off each other very nicely. As  
8 others have kind of noted, during the hearing today,  
9 increased penalties for the chain stores just make  
10 sense. They have the means to clear the sidewalks  
11 and no excuses to not pay to have to have them  
12 cleared.

13 And similarly for people with disabilities, and  
14 for people that are over 65 that often have limited  
15 mobility, and also with limited means, they often  
16 cannot clear in time, so to have their fines reduced  
17 makes a lot of sense. And we think that the  
18 council's idea of the assistance program for these  
19 folks is a brilliant way of kind of offsetting any  
20 unintended consequences that I think the DSNY sort of  
21 discussed today about possibly people creating kind  
22 of more blocks on the sidewalks than what we're  
23 hoping to have. Well, if there's assistance  
24 programs, then that then that shouldn't be a problem.  
25 So we love that. You know, with the registration

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 66

2 part of it, you know, I think that there's some  
3 kinks that can be worked out, and hopefully that  
4 registration process for people that are people with  
5 disabilities and those 65-plus, that registration is  
6 very simple. And I think another council member  
7 mentioned that perhaps when... when a fine is given,  
8 you know, perhaps there's something on the citation  
9 saying, you know, if this is if you're a person with  
10 disability or 65, you can opt into this program and  
11 we will reduce this fine for you. So I think the  
12 logistics of it can be can be sorted out a little bit  
13 more to cut down on unintended consequences.

14 So I think overall, we really kind of are very  
15 supportive of these bills, and we welcome... we  
16 welcome the council kind of reach out to New York  
17 Lawyers for Public Interest. If there's any,  
18 anything further that we can do. We've had some  
19 experience in this area, with kind of pushing for the  
20 rights to people with disabilities in snow removal.  
21 Formerly, we've worked with the... with the then-  
22 borough-president Brewer's office in sending out kind  
23 of letters to major property owners about their  
24 right, their responsibilities and snow removal. And  
25 so we just, we do have a history here, and maybe some

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 67

2 we can trade notes in terms of improving the  
3 programs. So that's... I think that's about it, but  
4 we were just really welcome kind of future  
5 collaboration and are hugely supportive of these two  
6 bills. So thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you, Christopher. I  
8 think the next step we have...

9 COUNSEL: Next is Diego Barbarena. You may begin  
10 when the Sergeant calls time.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

12 MR. BARBARENA: Hello, my name is . I founded a  
13 business with the intent to clean up New York City  
14 through the manifestation of smart technologies. Our  
15 mission is to help reduce the impact of human waste  
16 in environments with smart and efficient technology.  
17 So our goals is to review... [image freezes]

18 COUNSEL: Diego, you're frozen and we can't hear  
19 you.

20 MR. BARBARENA:... March of this year, we have  
21 been working with NYCHA to implement some of these  
22 technologies, automation to improve the residents'  
23 quality of life, as well to help to increase the  
24 recycling rates.

25

2       During the summer we met with NYCHA, DSNY support  
3 service teams, including Deputy Director Giovanni  
4 Ianniello, and the (inaudible) director, Marco[sp?]  
5 Marovich[sp?]. Our (inaudible) came from Europe and  
6 answered all the questions.

7       I moved to this city 26 years ago, and in that  
8 time, I see that the sanitation trucks haven't  
9 improved at all. I think that New York is still in  
10 the fax machine era, and cities with less resources  
11 like (inaudible), in Mexico, has already moved on the  
12 (inaudible) outside of the sidewalks. Cities like  
13 Buenos Aires, Argentina, has a collection system that  
14 makes waste collection parcels fly twice as fast  
15 while keeping fresh, and (inaudible) high capacity  
16 containers at all times. In another system that  
17 trash is collected by hand. They are collected by  
18 mechanical lifters, that made the collection faster  
19 as well as safer for the workers.

20       The only smart collection system that the city  
21 has, other than the last interior pneumatic  
22 collection system on Roosevelt Island was the self  
23 compacting bins that we see in some parts of high-  
24 traffic areas around the city. But I just learned  
25 from a DSNY member in my community we're meeting that

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 69

2 the sanitation department refuses to service that.

3 Someone else is in charge to empty them, and put the  
4 plastic bag inside them. Also the weight of the bag  
5 is limited to a 40 pound law, rendering the  
6 compaction obsolete.

7 Not investing in this technology has such a high  
8 price for the city. It comes at a great monetary  
9 cost with a high negative impact of quality of life.  
10 The bad services will reflect directly in our rat  
11 problem. If the services were to improve, the rat  
12 problem will diminish. This level of service is not  
13 acceptable for the US government. (inaudible) has  
14 requested from NYCHA that plastic garbage bags cannot  
15 be on the sidewalk for more than 24 hours. NYCHA has  
16 determined that with the current level of service  
17 provided by DSNY, that this is not possible. To  
18 solve this fall in NYCHA has decided to start a pilot  
19 program and lease their own on trucks with the latest  
20 in waste collection technology. All the waste will  
21 always be in a rightful (inaudible) container, easily  
22 accessible to the residents. There will be a  
23 container side by side, for every waste stream, which  
24 will make recycling easier and more effective. With  
25 smart sensors, our trucks will be able to pick up the

1 COMMITTEE ON SANITATION AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT 70  
2 containers at the right time -- not too full, not too  
3 empty. This will result in better service and less  
4 truck traffic.

5 The budget for this final product is \$4 million  
6 for five years, which is the budget of one day at  
7 DSNY. City Council has allocated \$1 million for  
8 containerization, but almost a year later there's  
9 very little to show. Mailboxes similar to this has  
10 certainly existed outside.

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

12 COUNSEL: Diego. Your... your camera keeps  
13 freezing, so if you could submit your testimony via  
14 the [testimony@council.nyc.gov](mailto:testimony@council.nyc.gov), that would be  
15 extremely helpful. Thank you very much for your  
16 testimony.

17 At this time if we have not called on anyone who  
18 is in the Zoom and would like to testify please use  
19 your zoom raise hand function and we will call on  
20 you.

21 Seeing none I will turn it back to the chair to  
22 close the hearing.

23 CHAIRPERSON NURSE: Thank you Jessica This  
24 concludes our hearing for today.

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 11/23/2022