

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

----- X

April 30, 2014  
Start: 10:06 a.m.  
Recess: 1:48 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
City Hall

B E F O R E: CARLOS MENCHACA  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Mathieu Eugene  
Daniel Dromm  
Peter A. Koo  
Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.  
Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito  
Fernando Cabrera  
Ydanis A. Rodriguez  
Antonio Reynoso  
Jumaane D. Williams  
Mark Levine  
Brad S. Lander  
Deborah L. Rose  
Public Advocate Letitia James

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Lucio Escamilla  
NYC Resident

Batya Miller  
Manhattan Together

Sue Dorn  
Member of Central Synagogue

Bryan Ellicott  
NYC Resident

Mindy Tarlow  
Director  
Mayor's Office of Operations

Nisha Agarwal  
Commissioner  
Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs

Steven Choi  
Executive Director  
New York Immigration Coalition

Johanna Miller  
Advocacy Director  
New York Civil Liberties Union

Emily Tucker  
Staff Attorney  
Center for Popular Democracy

Deyanira Del Rio  
Co-Director  
New Economy Project

Esther Sanchez  
Faith in New York

Jeong Min Yu  
MinKwon Center for Community Action

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jason Chang  
National Federation of Community  
Development Credit Unions

Linda Sarsour  
Executive Director  
Arab American Association of New York

John Lugo  
Unidad Latina en Accion  
New Haven, CT

Eric Mar  
District 1  
San Francisco Board of Supervisors

Arely Gonzalez

Juan Carlos Gomez  
Make the Road New York

Jesus Castellanos  
Make the Road New York

Carlos Vasquez

Jojo Annobil  
Attorney  
Legal Aid Society

Jeff Foreman  
Policy Director  
Care for the Homeless

Jessica Orozco  
Director  
Immigration and Civic Engagement  
Hispanic Federation

Diana Reyna  
Brooklyn Borough Deputy President

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Elana Redfield  
Representative  
Sylvia Rivera Law Project and  
Peter Cicchino Youth Project

Noah Lewis  
Staff Attorney  
Transgender Legal Defense and Education  
Fund

Lynly Egyes  
Attorney  
Sex Workers Project

Glenda Testone  
Executive Director  
New York City Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and  
Transgender Community Center

Mizue Aizeki  
Immigrant Defense Project

Mark Noferi  
Center for Migration Studies and  
New York City Bar Association

Annie Wang  
Co-Chair  
Comprehensive Immigration Reform Committee  
New York Chapter of the American  
Immigration Lawyers Association

Owen Rogers  
Picture the Homeless

Nancy Mageson [sp?]

Gabriela Sandoval Requena  
Policy Analyst  
Coalition for the Homeless

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Rev. Getulio Cruz  
Pastor  
Monte Sion Christian Church  
Manhattan Together and Metro IAF

Laurie Izutsu  
Senior Staff Attorney  
Brooklyn Legal Services

Yolanda Castro  
Mexican Consulate

Lauren Burke  
Executive Director  
Atlas: DIY

Unknown Speaker  
The Fortune Society

Diane Steinman  
Director  
New York State Interfaith Network

Jeff Weiss  
Counsel  
Assemblyman Felix Ortiz's Office

Joseph Rosenberg  
Executive Director  
Catholic Community Relations Council

Louis Quinones  
Representing  
President George Miranda  
Teamsters Joint Council 16

Dr. Paule Cruz-Takash  
Oakland City ID

Ethan Carr  
MasterCard Worldwide

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Hally Chu  
Representative  
Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer

Rev. Terry Troia  
Director  
Project Hospitality

Liam O'Doherty  
Pastor  
Our Lady of Good Counsel Parish

Bishop Orlando Findlayter  
Chairman  
Churches United to Save and Heal

Gene Judy  
First Nation Baptist Church

Prof. Raul Hinjosa  
UCLA

Daniel Rose  
MasterCard

Freddy Cruz Martinez  
Volunteer Leader  
Little Sisters of the Assumption Family  
Health Services, Manhattan Together and  
Metro IAF

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

[gavel]

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **00:00:17**

and welcome to our City Council Chambers. I am Carlos Menchaca, Chair of the New York City Council's Committee on Immigration. This morning our Committee will consider Int. No. 253, a Local Law to amend the Administrative Code of the City of New York in relation to the creation of a New York City identity card program. I am proud to have co-sponsored this bill with my colleague, Council Member Danny Dromm.

The Notion of the New York City identity card is not a recent idea; in fact for many years now the City Council and advocates have learned of the many communities who lack access to basic City services and the foundation of this bill has come out of the experiences of our immigrant community here in New York. We repeatedly heard stories of families not being able to see a doctor or pick up a prescription because they do not have an ID. We heard stories of parents who couldn't pick up their kids from school or attend PTA meetings in school because they didn't have an ID. We heard of people too scared to call the police for help or to report a

1  
2 crime simply because they didn't have identification.  
3 All of these stories made us realize that there is a  
4 serious problem and that we need to find a serious  
5 solution and that is what this bill is.

6           But immigrants are not the only New  
7 Yorkers who face these issues. In our years of  
8 researching we have learned that seniors, homeless;  
9 especially our homeless youth, the transgender  
10 community who struggle to obtain identification that  
11 affirms their gender expression, or making it more  
12 convenient, like people... or for people like me who  
13 ride a bike, or prefer to ride a bike, prefer to take  
14 public transportation; they could all benefit from a  
15 municipal ID program; this is what makes this concept  
16 so exciting. And our vision of impact doesn't stop  
17 there; whether you are born here or immigrated from  
18 another country or another state, we all know that a  
19 New Yorker is a special kind of person, and the truth  
20 is, when New York [background comments] acts, we have  
21 national and global impact; this card can go beyond  
22 giving people the right to identify themselves and  
23 access basic services, like bank accounts; this card  
24 has the ability to unite us as New Yorkers, giving us  
25 access to things that make New York New York; our

1 world-class cultural institutions in every borough,  
2 our libraries in every borough, our Bike Share  
3 program, or maybe even one day our subway system.

4  
5 Int. No. 253 presents us with a New York solution to  
6 a New York challenge. This creation of a municipal  
7 ID card is of importance not only to me, but to my  
8 colleagues, including our great Speaker, Melissa  
9 Mark-Viverito, as well as Mayor de Blasio. I am  
10 happy that this initiative has wide support, both in  
11 City Hall and with the City Council. I look forward  
12 to hearing from the Mayor's Office of Immigrant  
13 Affairs and Operations, immigrant advocates and legal  
14 practitioners on how we can make the municipal  
15 identification card program the largest of its kind;  
16 the most successful of its kind. Int. 253 calls on  
17 the Mayor's Office of Operations to create a  
18 municipal identification program for all New York  
19 City residents. The New York City identity card will  
20 help thousands of New Yorkers who lack acceptable  
21 identification to access City services, feel safer in  
22 their communities and foster a feeling of unity for  
23 all New Yorkers; additionally, protections,  
24 protections would be built into the program to  
25 protect against fraud.

1  
2 I would like to thank everyone for coming  
3 to this morning's hearing and I would like to thank  
4 everyone in advance for their testimony. And due to  
5 the large number of witnesses here today, we will be  
6 putting the timer on all our witnesses and also to my  
7 colleagues, I will also ask you to keep your  
8 questions and comments brief of two minutes, and  
9 lastly, I would like to mention that we will be  
10 reading people's tweets throughout today's hearing;  
11 if you have a comment or a question regarding  
12 municipal IDs, we urge you to tweet your comment to  
13 @NYCCouncil with the #nycID and before we move  
14 further, I want to present to you our incredible  
15 Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito, who will be making an  
16 opening statement, someone that has been [Spanish]  
17 **00:04:43** on this topic and so many other ones that  
18 are gonna bring more justice and more access and more  
19 safety to our New Yorkers, our great Speaker, Melissa  
20 Mark-Viverito.

21 SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Thank you, Chair  
22 Menchaca, [Spanish] **00:04:55**, good morning; I have to  
23 say that this is an extremely exciting day  
24 personally, something that I have been fighting for,  
25 along with my great colleague Danny Dromm here for

1  
2 some time and know that this hearing is the first  
3 step towards achieving that ultimate goal of the  
4 largest municipal ID program in this country; very  
5 excited that we're having this hearing today.

6           Before I make my comments, I understand  
7 also we do have translation equipment [Spanish]  
8 **00:05:24.** If people need translation equipment, it  
9 is in the back and you can feel free to get that, so  
10 it's great that we have that available.

11           So again I wanna thank our great Chair,  
12 Carlos Menchaca, and thank Council Member Danny Dromm  
13 for the introduction of this vitally important  
14 legislation.

15           Currently many New York residents have  
16 difficulty getting access to basic public services  
17 because they do not have a government-issued ID card;  
18 this includes some of the most vulnerable among us.  
19 This legislation will change that, it will give  
20 anyone who lives in the five boroughs the opportunity  
21 to obtain a municipal identification card. The  
22 legislation will require City agencies to accept this  
23 card as a form of valid ID, so those who make use of  
24 this program can rest assured that with this ID card  
25 they will be able to access essential City services.

1  
2 The bill requires that the card be  
3 designed in a way that deters fraud, much like a  
4 driver's license or passport does. The Council is  
5 very serious about safety and security; we will  
6 explore ways to ensure that the ID cards are  
7 protected from fraud in this hearing and in continued  
8 conversations with stakeholders and the  
9 Administration. We do not want these ID cards to end  
10 up in the wrong hands and we wanna make sure every  
11 step is taken to safeguard users' identities and  
12 their privacy.

13 Other municipalities have seen success  
14 with their municipal ID programs; it is time to  
15 replicate that success on a larger scale here in New  
16 York City. This Council also looks forward to  
17 continuing our productive conversations with the law  
18 enforcement community, along with others from the  
19 senior, immigrant, LGBT, youth, and other communities  
20 who stand to benefit from this legislation. For too  
21 long the Federal Government has lagged behind on  
22 immigration reform and it's fallen to municipalities  
23 like New York to take the lead and I think that we've  
24 done quite a stellar job over the years of making it  
25 clear that our immigrant communities are welcome and

1  
2 that we will make sure that we do everything to  
3 protect them.

4           While we would like to also see action in  
5 Washington, we know that when New York City has big,  
6 bold ideas, like muni IDs, that often the rest of the  
7 country follows. This hearing is the next step; I  
8 look forward to hearing some of the testimony and let  
9 it be known and let it be clear that this is a  
10 priority for this New York City Council and we will  
11 have municipal IDs in New York City. Thank you.

12           CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you,  
13 Speaker. And now we'd like to hear some opening  
14 statements from prime sponsor, Danny Dromm, Council  
15 Member.

16           COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you very  
17 much, Chair Menchaca; it's indeed a pleasure to be  
18 here today. I want to also start off by thanking  
19 Speaker Mark-Viverito for the translation equipment,  
20 because if I'm not mistaken, it's the first time  
21 we've had translation equipment and that is a great  
22 step forward; I am also going to be using that  
23 translation equipment for my hearing on Tuesday, my  
24 Education Committee hearing, so that is a great  
25 addition to the City Council and you are true to your

1  
2 word in terms of making these hearings more  
3 accessible to people, as you have done with many of  
4 the proposals put forth just last week, in terms of  
5 the budget and the transparency issues that we  
6 prioritize here in the Council.

7           You know, for many years Speaker Mark-  
8 Viverito and I have wanted to put forth this  
9 municipal ID program and now the time is right. We  
10 feel that in this Committee and in this Council we  
11 have great leadership; we have leadership from the  
12 Mayor's side of the fence as well, and we believe  
13 that we have come up with a very good proposal, one  
14 that will be a model for the rest of the country and  
15 one that will help to move all communities forward.  
16 The way that I look at this municipal ID is that it's  
17 a municipal ID for all, and we want to make sure that  
18 all New Yorkers avail themselves of this  
19 identification; that is crucial to the distribution  
20 of these IDs.

21           I wanna thank Chair Menchaca as well for  
22 his leadership on this issue and for fighting so hard  
23 from the moment he came in; I don't know that he was  
24 elected one day that he wasn't knocking at my door  
25 saying, where is that bill and we work very closely

1  
2 together to ensure that this piece of legislation has  
3 come out. When passed, this is going to be a major  
4 benefit for all New Yorkers, and Chair Menchaca, your  
5 fingerprints are all over this, so thank you for your  
6 leadership on this as well.

7 I do look forward to hearing from people  
8 today who will be giving testimony and we'll have a  
9 number of questions for the Administration, but this  
10 a very proud day for me and for us in the City  
11 Council, and thank you to everyone who has come to be  
12 a part of this historic day. Thank you very much.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Council  
14 Member Dromm and I wanna second that partnership that  
15 we've built in the Council and as someone who's just  
16 come into the City Council, there's no one better to  
17 work with than our good Council Member Danny Dromm,  
18 who has been, and was the Chair of Immigration  
19 before, so it's just been a great thing to kinda take  
20 that mantle and to continue it and you have two  
21 fighters here. We have also other fighters in this  
22 incredible Immigration Committee, Council Member Koo  
23 and Council Member Eugene, thank you so much for  
24 being here; this is a Committee that is really made  
25 up of people who are incredibly passionate about this

1  
2 topic, but really making sure that immigrants in the  
3 City continue to prosper and get access.

4           So without further ado I wanna call up  
5 the first panel, and we'd like to invite up Batya  
6 Miller, Sue Dorn, Bryan Ellicott, [background  
7 comment] and Lucio Escamilla [sp?]. Thank you. If  
8 you have statements, we'll take them as well. We're  
9 gonna put the clock at two minutes; we know you have  
10 written testimony, so if you don't get through the  
11 testimony, just hand it over and we'll take the rest  
12 into record, and we'll start with... well actually,  
13 we'll... we're gonna... let's start from the left over to  
14 the right, if that's okay. Go ahead, Mr. Escamilla.  
15 Thank you.

16           LUCIO ESCAMILLA: Hello, my name is Lucio  
17 Escamilla and I am member of Immaculate Conception  
18 church and a leader in South Bronx Churches and  
19 Metro-IAF. I know personally how important it is  
20 that all New Yorkers have access to an ID that is  
21 recognized everywhere in the City. In 2005 I was  
22 stopped by the police; they asked to see my ID. I  
23 showed them my Mexican Consulate ID card and a valid  
24 Michigan driver license and they claimed that both  
25 were fake; actually threw them on the ground; then

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

they took me to a holding cell for the night. The next day the judge dismissed the case immediately and I was free to go, but I should not have had to spend the night in jail, my family should not have had to worry. And I know many people in my community, in my church who have also spent the night in the jail only because they did not have a recognized ID. The City of New York has to start to producing its own ID so that this never happens again. People should not be taken to the jail unnecessarily and the police should be able to spend their time on the real criminals. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Mr. Escamilla.

BATYA MILLER: Do I have to press it again?

SUE DORN: No, it's on. [background comment]

BATYA MILLER: It's on. Okay. Hello, my name is Batya Miller and I am with Manhattan Together. I'm here today to talk about why it is useful and important for all of us to apply for a municipal ID. This City program would finally give countless New Yorkers an important benefit they now

1  
2 lack. While it will certainly help vulnerable New  
3 Yorkers like undocumented immigrants, the homeless  
4 and the formerly incarcerated, it would also improve  
5 my life and the lives of many others.

6 Like many other New Yorkers, I don't  
7 drive and I love living in a city where you don't  
8 need to. A driver's license has become the de facto  
9 photo ID all over the country, [background comment]  
10 I've somehow managed to squeak by all these years  
11 with... [interpose]

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Ma'am, can you  
13 speak closer to the mic so we can... we can hear you...  
14 [crosstalk]

15 BATYA MILLER: Oh, sorry. I've somehow  
16 managed to squeak by all these years with my  
17 university library card that has a photo on it and  
18 more recently my senior citizen MetroCard when I've  
19 been asked to show photo ID. Such situations have  
20 been stressful at times, as not everyone readily  
21 accepted them. I finally hit a brick wall several  
22 months ago when I went to return something at a major  
23 women's clothing chain; they would not refund the  
24 credit charge because they did not view either ID I  
25 showed them as official. I was not able to return

1  
2 the item and have never gone back to the store. As a  
3 non-driver I am really looking forward to receiving a  
4 New York City ID. The ID should be relatively easy  
5 to apply for at community-friendly places like  
6 libraries and congregations; it can then become a  
7 primary or the primary ID for the many non-drivers in  
8 this city, citizens and others. I know it will both  
9 simplify my life and link me in a small but  
10 significant [bell] way to other New Yorkers who  
11 contribute to the wonderful diversity of this great  
12 city.

13 [background comment]

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
15 for that.

16 SUE DORN: Good morning. My name is Sue  
17 Dorn and I am a member of Central Synagogue and a  
18 leader of Manhattan Together and Metro-IAF.

19 A hundred and ten years ago this summer a  
20 woman left the Ukraine with her three small children;  
21 she landed in Boston, made her way across the United  
22 States to Oregon where she met her husband who had  
23 gone there the year before. He eventually became a  
24 citizen, but between raising their 11 children and  
25 helping with their small grocery store, she never had

1  
2 the opportunity. Although life was so much better in  
3 the United States, she was never completely  
4 comfortable because she was not a citizen. As a  
5 result, for most of her life she always carried her  
6 alien registration card, this card, in the back of  
7 her mind she thought someone might pick her up and  
8 send her back to the Ukraine, separating her from her  
9 family and friends. This apprehension was so intense  
10 that she took the card with her to the hospital when  
11 she was on death's doorstep. I have this card  
12 because she was my grandmother. Even as a small  
13 child I understood her uneasiness and how much this  
14 card was a lifeline for her. No one should have to  
15 walk the streets without recognized identification,  
16 things happen, people get stopped, buses jump curbs,  
17 and in an era of increasing security, we all need ID  
18 to enter places where we have to go. The lack of an  
19 easy, accessible ID is a major problem for many,  
20 including immigrants, students whose permanent  
21 residents are elsewhere, the elderly, and those who  
22 do not drive. As an 80-year-old, I won't be driving  
23 much longer and would find it helpful to have an  
24 easy, attainable [bell] municipal ID than go through  
25 the hassle of dealing with New York State's DMV.

1  
2 Metro-IAF looks forward to working with the City to  
3 make sure this effort is implemented properly;  
4 outreach will be necessary to convince all New  
5 Yorkers why it's to their benefit to get the ID.  
6 I'll be among the first to be issued one; like my  
7 grandmother, I will always carry it.

8 [background comment]

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
10 for that.

11 BRYAN ELLICOTT: Good morning. My name  
12 is Bryan Ellicott and I fully support Int. 253 as an  
13 open and proud transgender man who is looking forward  
14 to the day when I feel appropriate, my appropriate  
15 gender marker is on my identification. I am pleased  
16 to see this legislation is co-sponsored by so many  
17 members of the City Council and this entire  
18 Committee.

19 The idea that New York City will allow me  
20 to decide that my true and proper gender identity is  
21 one displayed on this piece of identification is  
22 something I couldn't be more excited about. Think  
23 about the number of times a day you show your ID, any  
24 given day, looking at my New York State ID you know  
25 my name, my birth name, where I live and the gender I

1  
2 was born, and it doesn't look like I do now. As my  
3 transition has progressed, the idea of a female  
4 gender marker on my identification is something that  
5 brings a lot of distress and dysphoria to my life,  
6 especially going out with friends and coworkers, many  
7 who know I'm transgender and some that don't.

8           The protections of Title 8 in New York  
9 City define gender in the New York City Human Rights  
10 Law, as it was amended in 2002, as your actual or  
11 perceived gender identity; self-image; appearance and  
12 behavior or expression, or within the identity, self-  
13 image, behavior of the invil [sic] assigned at birth.  
14 New York State has very strict guidelines for  
15 changing your gender marker on pieces of  
16 identification, such as birth certificates and the  
17 Department of Motor Vehicles.

18           New York State [background comments]  
19 Administrative Code says a letter from a surgeon  
20 specifying date and place of your type of sexual  
21 reassignment, or gender reassignment surgery  
22 performed, an operative report and if additional  
23 medical information is needed to change your gender  
24 marker.

1  
2 New York City Administrative Code also  
3 states that in order to change your gender marker on  
4 your birth certificate you also need to have surgery.

5 Insurance companies do not cover these  
6 procedures and the State finds it unacceptable for  
7 you to change it without so. An estimated close to  
8 \$30,000 is needed to have these surgeries and then  
9 you get your gender markers changes; that's a lot of  
10 money, a lot of saving; a lot of fundraising on top  
11 of then having [bell] to spend money to have them  
12 changed. My suggestion to the Council is to ask for  
13 letters from either your health provider or the  
14 therapist that can provide your HRT; those are the  
15 letters that are needed by the New York State and New  
16 York City to change those identifications to prevent  
17 fraud.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Bryan.  
19 And thanks to this first panel; clearly you've now  
20 heard from New Yorkers who are engaged in many  
21 reasons why municipal IDs could be beneficial. And  
22 so I'm gonna open it up to questions that Council  
23 Members have, but really I wanna actually start with  
24 you, Bryan on the suggestion you just gave us. Can  
25 you tell us a little bit about how that suggestion is

1  
2 different from current IDs that you might want to be  
3 able to get and how this municipal ID has to be a  
4 little bit different?

5           BRYAN ELLICOTT: This... [background  
6 comment] What is I'm asking is a suggestion is that  
7 you get the letter... that the letters... we can get  
8 those letters easily; the letters come from our  
9 therapists, we have to see a therapist in order to  
10 get hormone replacement therapy or from the doctor  
11 who already provides a hormone replacement therapy.  
12 Those letters doctors write easily, they write them  
13 pretty much within the five minutes you ask about  
14 them. What I'm not asking is that we have to have  
15 surgery in order to prove that we have our genders  
16 changed, all I'm asking is that we're allowed to use  
17 the same letters we need to have surgery and to say  
18 that we're ready to have surgery in order to get  
19 those IDs without the surgery.

20           CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Great. Thank you  
21 for that. And I just wanna let everyone know that  
22 our Council Members Koo, Eugene, Dromm, Espinal, and  
23 our Speaker are here today, thank you. And any  
24 questions from our council members for the panel?  
25 [background comment] Council Member Eugene.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very  
3 much, Mr. Chair. And I want to commend your to come  
4 in and thank each one of you from the panel, and  
5 thank you also, especially to you gentleman, for your  
6 courage, you know for explaining, sharing with us,  
7 you know what you went through because of the ID,  
8 your ID that you provided to the police officer; you  
9 were stopped and arrested. And my question to you,  
10 very simple; how do you think that you know the  
11 municipal ID will prevent such thing to happen?

12 [background comment]

13 LUCIO ESCAMILLA: The municipal ID is  
14 gonna help me about... I'm gonna work in the City like  
15 free and I can prove I live in New York City and also  
16 many of my families and especially in my church, in  
17 my community, where I know thousands of the people,  
18 they need that kind of ID to identify anywhere,  
19 especially open accounts in the bank, especially to  
20 go to probably places where they can show they live  
21 in New York.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very  
23 much. In your testimony Miss, you mentioned that  
24 outreach would be necessary and we know that, but  
25 since we are dealing with immigrants and we know the

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

immigrant people are... they are facing so many challenges in everyday life, because of language, because of difficulty to navigate through the system; [background comments] what can you tell us, you know, what your organization can do in terms of reaching out to immigrant people, especially those who don't speak English, you know as a first language; what do you advise to do in term of outreach?

SUE DORN: I'm... I'm sorry; I...

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: In terms of outreach, you know... [interpose]

SUE DORN: In the outreach?

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: outreach...

SUE DORN: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: we know that immigrant people, all of us, especially I'm immigrant too...

SUE DORN: Right.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: and many of immigrant people, you know, they don't speak English proficiently, so whenever there is a service available in the City of New York, they'll face, you know, challenges in term of being able to navigate through the system and get the resources that are

1  
2 available to them. Do you have any idea, any  
3 thought, [bell] you know, any advice in terms of how  
4 to reach out [background comments] to immigrant  
5 people and especially those who don't speak English  
6 properly?

7 SUE DORN: Many are members of churches,  
8 synagogues, other congregations and through those  
9 organizations, through the social service agencies in  
10 their communities would be a great way to start with  
11 reaching out to people.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
13 and we're actually... [crosstalk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you so  
15 much; appreciate that. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: gonna be hearing  
17 from... from some faith leaders later today in  
18 testimony. I'm gonna hand it over to Council Member  
19 Dromm.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Thank you, Chair  
21 Menchaca. So my question is kind of related a little  
22 bit to what Council Member Eugene was getting at as  
23 well. Not only the outreach to the community, but I  
24 was wondering if you might have ideas about how we  
25 would set up offices to begin to do the intake for

1  
2 the documentation so that people can actually apply.  
3 Where would places... what types of places would be  
4 most convenience for people to go to [background  
5 comments] to apply for the municipal ID?

6           BATYA MILLER: Well I think it's really  
7 important if we can possibly set up... [interpose]

8           CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you speak into  
9 the mic a little bit closer?

10           BATYA MILLER: It's really important if  
11 we can possibly set up places of application that are  
12 known and friendly to the community, whether that be  
13 congregations or libraries; [background comment] I  
14 think that's a way that... a non-threatening way that  
15 you're going to get people to come. You know, I  
16 think that's as important, those kinds of decisions,  
17 as the... making the process as least cumbersome as  
18 possible, but to have places that are friendly  
19 [background comment] to the community and perceived  
20 that way; I think especially churches would be a  
21 wonderful way of doing that, if you can.

22           BRYAN ELLICOTT: A suggestion I have is  
23 that we use, for the trans community, the LGBT  
24 centers we have in Manhattan, Staten Island and  
25 Brooklyn, as those are places the transgender

1  
2 community and even the immigration community feel  
3 safe; that we should use those as open houses to  
4 apply for the IDs.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So one of the  
6 concerns that I have is ensuring that we have many..  
7 all New Yorkers, 8.5 million New Yorkers, applying  
8 for this card. I see an issue, moving forward, that  
9 if there is not some type of a benefit attached to  
10 it, that those who already have drivers licenses and  
11 other types of identification might not be as  
12 interested in this; [bell] do you have any  
13 suggestions in terms of what type of benefits we  
14 might attach to it that would bring other people in  
15 who already have some type or form of identification?

16 SUE DORN: One of the thoughts some of us  
17 had was if it could be in fact connected to a library  
18 card; that that would be good for families as well,  
19 and also help bringing children into the library so  
20 that there would be another benefit from that.

21 BATYA MILLER: I think another  
22 possibility is if you can get discounts, small  
23 discounts at major institutions, like museums; that  
24 could be very appealing to people, the fact that they  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

would save money with this card, you know, which you certainly don't do with your driver's license.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Right. Thank you for that. And we've been joined by Council Member Cabrera as well. Thank you so much. Thank you so much to this panel and we'll be looking forward to continuing our conversation.

We're gonna call up our next panel, Miss Mindy Tarlow from Operations and Commissioner Nisha Agarwal from MOIA, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs. And Council Members, you have their testimony in front of you. [background comments] Should we leg 'em know? [background comment] Just to clarify on the testimony that we have, there might be a page missing; can we double... [interpose]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: Miss Tarlow, on your testimony, I think there might be a page missing.

MINDY TARLOW: I think we can provide a new copy. [background comment]

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: It's okay; I mean we'll lis... yeah, we'll just... just to get this [background comments].

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Let's see if we  
3 can get the whole testimony, but we'll go ahead and  
4 start with your oral testimony. Thank you.

5 [background comments]

6 MINDY TARLOW: Good morning, Chairman  
7 Menchaca, members of the Committee, Speaker Mark-  
8 Viverito, colleagues in government, and members of  
9 the public. My name's Mindy Tarlow and I'm the  
10 Director of the Mayor's Office of Operations and on  
11 behalf of the Administration I would like to thank  
12 you, Chairman Menchaca and Council Member Dromm, for  
13 introducing this vital legislation and for inviting  
14 me to testify at this hearing. At the direction of  
15 Mayor de Blasio, who has made the creation of a  
16 municipal ID a signature priority of this  
17 administration, my office has been working closely  
18 with Commissioner Agarwal at the Mayor's Office of  
19 Immigrant Affairs (MOIA) and numerous City agencies  
20 to prepare for the timely and effective  
21 implementation of this initiative, should the Council  
22 approve it.

23 The municipal ID will be an ID for all,  
24 every single New Yorker benefits by having a  
25 government-issued photo identification card that can

1  
2 be broadly recognized by New York City government  
3 entities and private establishments. We support  
4 development of an identification card program that  
5 can be both widely utilized by New Yorkers of all  
6 backgrounds and easily accessed by marginalized  
7 populations.

8           For those of you who aren't familiar with  
9 the Mayor's Office of Operations, we are responsible  
10 for performance management and accountability across  
11 all City agencies and as you probably know, we're  
12 responsible for delivery of the Mayor's Management  
13 Report, and under the de Blasio administration we  
14 have additional functions that have been moved  
15 underneath Operations, including the Center for  
16 Economic Opportunity and the Mayor's Office of Data  
17 Analytics so that we can more fully support the  
18 Mayor's equality agenda. Finally, Operations  
19 undertakes a range of cross-agency initiatives to  
20 facilitate the effective implementation of citywide  
21 projects and we're particularly focused on helping to  
22 realize the Mayor's priority initiatives, such as  
23 this one, the Municipal ID Program.

24           But before I discuss our planning around  
25 the municipal ID I'd like to tell you a little bit

1  
2 about my own experience regarding the importance of  
3 expanding access to government identification for  
4 marginalized populations.

5           Prior to joining the de Blasio  
6 administration, I spent nearly two decades as the  
7 founding CEO and Executive Director of the Center for  
8 Employment Opportunities. The Center for Employment  
9 Opportunities is a New York City-based national  
10 organization that's exclusively dedicated to  
11 connecting recently incarcerated individuals to  
12 employment, and one of the often overlooked barriers  
13 to reintegration for people with criminal records is  
14 the lack of proper documentation, and my years at the  
15 Center for Employment Opportunities vividly  
16 demonstrated to me how important the securing of  
17 government-issued photo identification can be in  
18 helping people start down the pathway to legitimate  
19 employment and securing basic essential services; I  
20 saw it every day for two decades.

21           This Administration is committed to  
22 helping all New Yorkers, including marginalized  
23 populations, access the proposed municipal ID;  
24 populations such as disconnected young adults,  
25 seniors, homeless individuals, undocumented

1  
2 immigrants, and formerly incarcerated persons are  
3 some of the key demographic groups that have  
4 historically retained government-issued photo  
5 identification at lower rates than the population at  
6 large and the municipal ID can and will vastly  
7 improve this.

8           We support creating an enrollment model  
9 for the municipal ID that will readily facilitate  
10 access for all New Yorkers and incorporate fraud  
11 prevention and security protocols to ensure the  
12 integrity of the identification card. Should the  
13 Council approve this legislation, we support a  
14 municipal ID enrollment model that designates  
15 multiple sites in each borough where New Yorkers can  
16 apply for the municipal ID card.

17           As Council Members Menchaca and Dromm  
18 have laid out in this bill, the process for applying  
19 for a municipal ID card and demonstrating proof of  
20 identity and residency will be similar to the  
21 Department of Motor Vehicles' model -- individuals  
22 will be required to demonstrate evidence of their  
23 identity and residency by providing acceptable  
24 documents and we support a system of weighted values  
25 for documentation, similar to what is used by the

1  
2 DMV. The City would leverage existing facilities as  
3 intake centers, looking for sites and convenient  
4 locations across a range of agencies covering all  
5 five boroughs. We propose having two types of sites  
6 where people can sign up for the municipal ID, what  
7 we're calling "active sites" would be broadly  
8 promoted as places the general public can visit to  
9 sign up for the municipal ID. What we're calling  
10 "passive sites" would include agencies where many  
11 members of the public already go to receive services  
12 and are likely to already have brought necessary  
13 proof of identity and residency with them so they can  
14 access the municipal ID at that time.

15           Turning to fraud prevention, we are  
16 working closely with NYPD, other law enforcement  
17 entities, government agencies that issue  
18 identification cards and cities from around the  
19 country who have implemented similar programs to  
20 ensure we are incorporating all appropriate fraud  
21 prevention and security procedures. Design of the  
22 municipal ID card would be inspired by DMV-style  
23 government-issued photo identification cards, but  
24 with a distinct New York City branding. We would  
25 embed a full array of security features into the

1  
2 card, such as holographic laminates, special  
3 cardstock material and engraved text.

4           With respect to records retention, we are  
5 highly sensitive to the issue of document retention  
6 and the concerns that have been raised by Council  
7 Members and advocates alike. This administration is  
8 emphatically committed to protecting the privacy of  
9 the information gathered from this proposed  
10 initiative and particularly attuned to safeguarding  
11 any and all information that could potentially hint  
12 at the immigration status of a cardholder. We would  
13 employ every tool at our disposal to guarantee  
14 protection of information submitted by applicants.

15           I believe that there is generally broad  
16 consensus among the Administration, Council Members  
17 and advocates about the municipal ID initiative and I  
18 would like to commend the lead sponsors of the  
19 legislation, Council Members Menchaca and Dromm, as  
20 well as Speaker Mark-Viverito for crafting this bill.  
21 I would however like to suggest a few items be  
22 revisited. I would strongly encourage the Council to  
23 consider allowing for more flexibility in the  
24 administration of the municipal ID initiative by  
25 mayoral agencies. Under this model the Mayor's

1 office could capitalize on the back end  
2 infrastructure of the Human Resources Administration  
3 (HRA) to ensure the successful implementation of the  
4 municipal ID. My office, the Mayor's Office of  
5 Operations, conducted an analysis comparing all City  
6 agencies that could potentially perform this back end  
7 function, including our own, and determined that HRA  
8 is best positioned to undertake the back end  
9 responsibilities necessary to successfully implement  
10 and operate the municipal ID initiative. HRA has the  
11 most relevant expertise in issuing identification  
12 cards at scale, including reviewing and verifying the  
13 authenticity of the identification. Considering the  
14 aggressive timeline to make the municipal ID  
15 available to the public this calendar year, HRA's  
16 procurement infrastructure and administrative support  
17 will cost-efficiently and swiftly get this program up  
18 and running. HRA would support day to day  
19 administration of the budget, procurement and general  
20 back end office functionality regardless of HRA's  
21 heavy involvement in the back end; however, they  
22 would have no involvement and would not be associated  
23 with the public branding of this initiative.  
24

1  
2 I also wanna emphasize that Mayor de  
3 Blasio, Deputy Mayor Barrios-Paoli and HRA  
4 Commissioner Steve Banks have committed HRA to a  
5 mission of fighting inequality and poverty every  
6 single day and the municipal ID is a key initiative  
7 that will help HRA realize that essential mission.  
8 My team and MOIA have worked closely with HRA  
9 throughout the municipal ID planning process and we  
10 can say firsthand that the senior leadership at the  
11 agency is deeply committed to this initiative and  
12 supporting the communities who will benefit from it.  
13 I believe the Council and the Administration are  
14 equally committed to the successful implementation of  
15 the municipal ID and I hope you will consider  
16 permitting HRA to conduct the back end office  
17 functionality that can best position us to realize  
18 that shared objective.

19 I would also like to suggest removing  
20 Section 3-139 on penalties from the legislation. The  
21 conduct being regulated in this section is already  
22 captured by several provisions in the Penal Law.

23 One additional concern about Int. 253  
24 that I would like to raise relates to the  
25 availability of applications and intake of the

1 municipal ID. The legislation indicates the  
2 Administration would make "applications for such card  
3 available for pickup and submission at any agency or  
4 office where there is substantial contact with the  
5 public." This implies that any City facility that  
6 serves the public would be a site where New Yorkers  
7 could apply for the municipal ID; this would  
8 represent thousands of locations around New York City  
9 and could be logistically infeasible and cost-  
10 prohibitive if it were implemented or taken literally  
11 at its word, so we strongly suggest working with us  
12 so that we can identify the best sites to offer  
13 intake for the municipal ID that will navigate the  
14 security, the cost, the technology; the staffing so  
15 that we can address everything that we're trying to  
16 address at each and every municipal ID site.

18 The de Blasio Administration is  
19 enthusiastically committed to the swift, [bell]  
20 secure and successful implementation of the municipal  
21 ID initiative, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant  
22 Affairs and the Mayor's Office of Operations will be  
23 directly and intimately engaged in the planning and  
24 implementation of the municipal ID and we look  
25 forward to partnering with individual members of the

1  
2 City Council and the many advocates and supports  
3 across the City to generate robust public awareness  
4 and tremendous citywide take-up of the municipal ID.

5 Thank you again for this opportunity to  
6 testify on the municipal ID and it's now my privilege  
7 to turn things over to my new colleague and friend,  
8 Nisha Agarwal, Commissioner of the Mayor's Office of  
9 Immigrant Affairs and we'll of course both be  
10 available to answer any questions you'll have after  
11 our testimony.

12 NISHA AGARWAL: Good morning. Thank you,  
13 Mindy for the introduction and for so clearly laying  
14 out the groundwork on the municipal ID. Thank you  
15 again to Chairman Menchaca and Council Member Dromm,  
16 members of the Committee, Speaker Mark-Viverito and  
17 the Council as a whole for advancing such a critical  
18 issue, and thank you, actually, to the first panel of  
19 New Yorkers who spoke in support of this issue.

20 My name is Nisha Agarwal and I am the  
21 Commissioner of the Mayor's Office of Immigrant  
22 Affairs, or MOIA; I welcome the opportunity to speak  
23 further about municipal ID.

24 As the Commissioner of MOIA, my role is  
25 to advance our City-chartered mandate to work with

1  
2 the Mayor and the Council to create policies and  
3 programs that improve the lives of immigrant New  
4 Yorkers; this mandate clearly encompasses today's  
5 legislation for which we commend the Council's  
6 leadership, and Mayor de Blasio's charge to us of  
7 ensuring the creation and solid implementation of the  
8 municipal ID card.

9 My office's work also includes  
10 collaborating across the Administration to support  
11 programs that bolster access to services and well-  
12 being for all New Yorkers, whether their immigrant  
13 ancestry is recent or generations ago. In that light  
14 we are clear that the municipal ID is a  
15 groundbreaking program that will reach beyond  
16 immigrants to all of our communities.

17 Before I discuss the program in more  
18 detail I would like to speak briefly about my own  
19 professional experience which has centered on  
20 increasing access to services for marginalized  
21 populations, including but not limited to immigrants.  
22 Before I joined the de Blasio Administration I worked  
23 on increasing access to legal services for immigrant  
24 New Yorkers and improving language access in health  
25 care settings and government agencies. As a civil

1  
2 rights lawyer I worked on cases and campaigns to  
3 ensure that all New Yorkers, regardless of race,  
4 citizenship, language or disability are able to  
5 access all our city has to offer on equal terms.

6           Recently I was part of the Center for  
7 Popular Democracy's research effort to study the  
8 implementation of municipal identification cards  
9 across the country as a vehicle to understand how our  
10 city could learn and improve upon other cities'  
11 programs. As such, increasing access to our city's  
12 services, attractions and spaces to more New Yorkers  
13 who currently struggle to obtain a basic entryway, a  
14 form of government identification is a natural  
15 continuation of my work over the years and a key  
16 aspect of MOIA's leadership on the issues of equality  
17 and unity. It's our view that the proposed municipal  
18 identification card will serve as a unifying force  
19 across many communities, providing valid  
20 identification to many who have lacked access to  
21 identification while providing meaningful benefits to  
22 those who already have access to ID.

23           It is also our view that the municipal ID  
24 would allow more New Yorkers of all backgrounds to  
25 more easily access City services, public and private

1  
2 programming and increase participation in our local  
3 economy by accessing banking and financial  
4 empowerment services.

5           Of course, part of our commitment is a  
6 response to the very harsh realities faced by  
7 undocumented immigrants, estimated to number  
8 approximately half-a-million in New York City who  
9 face numerous obstacles as a result of not having  
10 government-issued identification. For example,  
11 undocumented immigrants and other communities without  
12 identification may fear law enforcement, are often  
13 afraid to report housing and labor violations, or  
14 have a harder time signing leases or opening bank  
15 accounts or even visiting their children's schools.

16           I wanna emphasize that these obstacles  
17 are not faced by our undocumented communities alone;  
18 it is a real issue for many marginalized communities,  
19 such as our elders, victims of domestic abuse,  
20 runaway and other disconnected youth, the disabled,  
21 transgendered individuals, and those who are  
22 re-entering our society after incarceration. In  
23 other words, it is clear that many communities beyond  
24 immigrants will benefit from a municipal ID and  
25 indeed, to avoid a reality in which the card is

1  
2 viewed merely as an immigrant card, it is crucial  
3 that the card have widespread appeal and we support a  
4 program that meets this goal.

5           One of the ways we will meet this goal is  
6 to build many benefits into the municipal ID so that  
7 the card is meaningful to all New Yorkers. We are  
8 still in the early stages of exploring for the  
9 municipal ID, but I can share with you some of the  
10 benefits that we support. To begin, the municipal ID  
11 should be broadly recognized and accepted by City  
12 agencies; we would like to ensure, for example, that  
13 parents would be able to use the municipal ID to gain  
14 entry into their child's school. Our goal is also  
15 that the municipal ID will enable New Yorkers who  
16 previously lacked government-issued identification to  
17 better access private-sector services. For example,  
18 our hope is that the municipal ID will serve as the  
19 government-issued photo documented needed to get a  
20 bank account so New Yorkers can avoid predatory  
21 financial services and check-cashers.

22           These benefits and others will assist  
23 communities that have been needlessly marginalized in  
24 their day to day interactions with the City. But  
25 again, I wanna emphasize that the municipal ID is an

1  
2 identification card that will benefit all New  
3 Yorkers, even those with government-issued photo ID.

4           If this legislation is enacted, we would  
5 work with City agencies and private-sector entities  
6 across the five boroughs to explore how we might  
7 embed the municipal ID with benefits and discounts at  
8 educational, arts and cultural institutions,  
9 restaurants and other small businesses,  
10 transportation, and an array of other services.

11           Importantly, even after the municipal ID  
12 program has launched, it would important to continue  
13 working to expand the suite of benefits available to  
14 cardholders to ensure that this is a program that  
15 grows over the years. We are open, of course, to  
16 hearing ideas from the Council and others on  
17 additional benefits and services that could be  
18 attached to the card.

19           Beyond the benefits of municipal ID, I'd  
20 like to share our ongoing efforts to engage  
21 communities and learn from other cities' experiences.  
22 To this end we've been hearing and learning from  
23 three layers of advisers -- (1) are community  
24 advocates representing the diverse communities in New  
25 York; (2) municipalities who have implemented similar

1  
2 programs across the country, and (3) our governmental  
3 partners to support the program.

4           On the community level we have been in  
5 active conversation with many groups -- the Arab  
6 American Association of New York, the New York Legal  
7 Assistance Group, Make the Road New York, The New  
8 Economy Project, Faith in New York, the Center for  
9 Popular Democracy, Picture the Homeless, Northern  
10 Manhattan Coalition for Immigrant Rights, the New  
11 York Civil Liberties Union, the New York Immigration  
12 Coalition, and truly, many other leaders from the  
13 advocacy, business and faith communities. These  
14 groups, along with many others, have been extremely  
15 helpful in informing our thinking.

16           In terms of other municipalities, we have  
17 learned from the experiences of Oakland, Los Angeles  
18 and San Francisco in California, as well as New Haven  
19 in Connecticut. While the scale in these cities is  
20 not comparable to New York, we have gleaned many  
21 important lessons that will inform our effort here.

22           On the governmental side, we have spoken  
23 to the New York City Department of Motor Vehicles at  
24 the State level, governmental partners, such as CUNY  
25 and all three of New York City's library systems, and

1  
2 many City agencies, including the Department of  
3 Homeless Services, the Department of Corrections,  
4 NYPD, the Mayor's Community Affairs Unit, the  
5 Department of Cultural Affairs, the Department of  
6 Finance, the Department of Environmental Protection,  
7 the Department of Consumer Affairs, the Taxi and  
8 Limousine Commission, the Small Business Services,  
9 the Department of Transportation, the Department of  
10 Parks and Recreation, and others. Our agencies have  
11 been incredibly committed to the success of this  
12 proposed program and I have no doubt that robust  
13 partnerships with our agencies will be at the heart  
14 of the municipal ID.

15           We are clear that the widespread adoption  
16 is critical for the card to be most meaningful and  
17 have preliminary ideas for an expansive outreach  
18 strategy to reach every neighborhood through a  
19 citywide campaign. For any outreach effort on  
20 municipal ID, MOIA would work closely with the  
21 Mayor's Community Affairs Unit and Operations,  
22 alongside our trusted community partners who have  
23 proposed working closely with us to accomplish our  
24 shared goals of seeing the municipal ID get into the  
25 hands of as many New Yorkers as possible. We would

1  
2 also look to partner with the Department of Education  
3 and other City agencies with strong and widespread  
4 touch points across all five boroughs. We would also  
5 plan to leverage the capacity of our agencies and the  
6 Mayor's Community Affairs Unit, who already have  
7 relationships in the community, to provide accurate  
8 information on the program and help steer residents  
9 to efficiently access the card. We would anticipate  
10 promoting the card through social media, community  
11 and educational institutions, notable New Yorkers,  
12 like yourselves, foreign consulates, faith-based  
13 institutions and beyond, and we look forward to the  
14 prospect of working with your local offices to help  
15 your constituents get the municipal ID and make the  
16 program a resounding success.

17 Thank you again for inviting us to  
18 provide testimony; I welcome any questions, along  
19 with Director Tarlow, now or at any time after the  
20 hearing.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you  
22 Commissioner and thank you Director, and what I wanna  
23 just underscore really is your testimony, both of  
24 your testimonies kinda show a real commitment on the  
25 Administration to understand this, your multiple

1  
2 conversations with really, probably all agencies kind  
3 of show a breath of understanding about how this  
4 piece of legislation as it's written is gonna impact  
5 the Administration and how to get this out quickly.  
6 Every agency adds on the table, so thank you so much  
7 for confirming that for us; this is something that  
8 we've been engaged in conversation. So I'm gonna  
9 start the questions off and then I'm gonna open it up  
10 to our council members. But really what I wanted to  
11 understand is, in your legislative recommendations,  
12 as we kind of continue to evolve this bill, you  
13 mentioned increasing agencies that can come in and  
14 help out the efficacy of this bill; can you talk a  
15 little bit about the procurement process and I think  
16 you give the dynamics of it, but what compels the  
17 Administration to understand procurement and its  
18 benefits [background comment] for HRA?

19 MINDY TARLOW: I think there is multiple  
20 things at work here -- (1) I think you pointed out is  
21 just the speed and efficacy with which we're trying  
22 to get this very important and complex initiative off  
23 the ground, [background comment] and the initiative  
24 itself has a lot of moving parts; it has to do with  
25 technology, it has to do with understanding of how ID

1  
2 cards are put together and used, it has to do with  
3 just knowledge and experience about procurement in  
4 general and the speed with which you can put those  
5 things together and having the underlying apparatus  
6 and experience to do that. I referenced in my  
7 testimony that Operations had done an evaluation of  
8 multiple agencies who could conceivably have one or  
9 more of those kinds of experience and HRA had all of  
10 them, and we felt that given the complexity of this  
11 initiative, the speed with which we're trying to get  
12 it to happen and the importance of it to both the  
13 Council and to the Administration, we felt in our due  
14 diligence in preparation for hoping that this will go  
15 forward, that was the conclusion that we drew, that  
16 HRA was the most well-positioned to play that role.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Does that affect  
18 cost as well? Is... [interpose]

19 MINDY TARLOW: Uhm...

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: is there a cost  
21 savings in moving to this multiple agency approach?

22 MINDY TARLOW: Yes, ultimately I think  
23 there will be; we're still of course working out the  
24 cost proposals; we're... we're... [interpose, crosstalk]

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you tell us  
3 about what the costs are... [crosstalk]

4 MINDY TARLOW: we're really working on  
5 budget process right now; as everyone knows, we're  
6 deeply engaged in that, so what we're trying to do is  
7 just develop a budget framework that matches and  
8 compliments the vision that I laid out in the  
9 testimony and we're working on that right now. But  
10 we do think this is the most cost-effective and...  
11 because time is money, as we all know, and  
12 [background comment] for something to happen quickly,  
13 that generally means it's more cost-efficient.

14 NISHA AGARWAL: And the one thing I would  
15 just add to what Director Tarlow said is that, you  
16 know one possibility, right, would be to create a  
17 separate apparatus for implementation of the  
18 municipal ID, but of course, that comes with all of  
19 its, for lack of a better word, overhead. If we  
20 leverage existing agencies that we have that already  
21 have the procurement functions, have all of those  
22 different administrative functions built in and have  
23 been doing it at volume, we save the program a  
24 considerable amount of money.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Gotcha. Okay. I  
3 have some other questions, but I wanna give Council  
4 Members the time and opportunity; we've been joined  
5 by Council Member Antonio Reynoso and I'm gonna give  
6 it up to Council Member Dromm.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So I just wanna go  
8 a little bit more to the cost as well. Have we  
9 thought about partnering with businesses or banks,  
10 MasterCard, anything like that; there are models in  
11 other cities that I've heard of that have done that,  
12 that have seen those types of businesses pick up the  
13 cost for it; what's your opinion on that; have you  
14 thought about that and can you give us a little bit  
15 more information about that?

16 NISHA AGARWAL: Sure. So, you know we  
17 have conducted research into the feasibility of  
18 adding a banking component to the municipal ID; at  
19 least at the initial stages we don't anticipate that  
20 we'll incorporate a debit component into the  
21 municipal ID card when it's issued this year, just  
22 because we don't have confidence we can offer a truly  
23 safe and affordable product that effectively meets  
24 the needs of low-income New Yorkers. If options  
25 available were to evolve, we would of course

1  
2 reconsider accordingly; that said, the Administration  
3 is working very closely with the Department of  
4 Consumer Affairs and the Office of Financial  
5 Empowerment to identify banks and credit unions  
6 across the City that are eager to accept the  
7 municipal ID as a form of identification for  
8 accessing bank accounts and non-predatory financial  
9 services. So we're confident that the municipality  
10 [sic] will provide financial access in that way, from  
11 the outset, or at least we're having those initial  
12 conversations and they're going well.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So my question, a  
14 little bit different, I think; has there been any  
15 consideration about having one of those businesses  
16 pick up the cost for that? So in other words, that  
17 they would cover the cost of production of the card.

18 NISHA AGARWAL: So, you know I can speak  
19 to... we have not spoken, at least for the financial  
20 institutions, about that issue, but we're exploring a  
21 variety of different models in terms of the costing  
22 and the budgeting at this point, but nothing specific  
23 to share.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So is there any  
25 timeline in terms of your mind what you would

1  
2 consider for the vendor to be selected as we move  
3 down the road?

4 [background comment]

5 MINDY TARLOW: We have set some  
6 timeframes for trying to get this grounded within the  
7 calendar year, so that sets the stage and that's one  
8 of the reasons we've tried to do a lot of due  
9 diligence now; you know, obviously this is a critical  
10 part of the process here today and we're not trying  
11 to -- what's the right phrase -- get over our skis,  
12 but we're trying to do the due diligence that's  
13 necessary so that we're ready to press go and you  
14 know we did set this calendar year timeframe in front  
15 of us and we're trying to make good on that, should  
16 this go forward.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So I believe that  
18 the Mayor originally spoke about allocating about  
19 \$400,000 for the initial startup of this.

20 MINDY TARLOW: That was in the February  
21 financial plan, yes, for the planning process.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: So how much money  
23 will be allocated moving forward for outreach and  
24 education?

25

1  
2 MINDY TARLOW: We are working on the  
3 budget right now and as I said earlier, it has a lot  
4 of moving parts, as does the budget as a whole and  
5 we're deeply engaged in that right now and trying to  
6 create a budget for this project that matches the  
7 vision that we laid out in the testimony around the  
8 hub and spoke model of having the intake centers and  
9 the back end functionality that we described, the  
10 kind of outreach that Nisha described; we're trying  
11 to put all that together right now and looking at  
12 different kinds of modeling and imbedding that within  
13 the budget discussions that are going on right now.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Okay. Thank you,  
15 Mr. Chair.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Council  
17 Member. Council Member Koo.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you Chair  
19 Menchaca and Council Member Dromm for this wonderful,  
20 very important initiative. Thank you, Commissioners.

21 My first question for you is; you know,  
22 we all know this municipal ID card is really good,  
23 really important to new immigrants or undocumented  
24 immigrants, but there is a stigma attached to it and  
25 people told me, why do I wanna apply a card that even

1  
2 though I'm documented? So my thought is, in order to  
3 solve that problem we... like you said, we encourage  
4 all citizens from New York City to apply, but why  
5 would a citizen or other immigrants that have already  
6 proper IDs to apply a municipal ID? So there must be  
7 an incentive there, so in order for us, and including  
8 our council members; the Mayor may be the first one  
9 to apply for one, you know [background comments,  
10 laughter] and in order for other people to do the  
11 same thing, we have to have some incentive or make it  
12 really usable. Now say we combine it with a MTA  
13 card, you know, everybody use a MTA card, there's no  
14 distinguish when use... this card... nobody know you're  
15 second-class or first-class or whatever, you know.  
16 [background comment] So my suggestion is... because on  
17 the MTA card there are a lot of space and like this  
18 one is Grand Central Station, do the advertisement  
19 there, no, 100 years and this would be one of the  
20 ideas you know because I don't know if MTA will agree  
21 to that because with this you can add money to the  
22 card and you can use every day, and the black one is  
23 a... this a municipal ID card too; just one of the  
24 thoughts. [background comments] And another thing I  
25 wanna ask you is, with this municipal ID, suppose one

1  
2 carried this and they go on interstate travel on a  
3 bus and the bus stop by immigration service, they  
4 check IDs, with this... [bell] is this okay for  
5 immigration purpose; would they... would the immigrant  
6 official detain the passenger because they carry this  
7 kind of municipal ID? [background comment]

8 NISHA AGARWAL: So I can respond about  
9 this question. So we could not... the Administration  
10 could not agree more, that this is a card that has to  
11 have benefits and incentives built into it that make  
12 it appealing to all New Yorkers, which is the reason  
13 why we've been having conversations both with other  
14 agencies within City government as well as with  
15 private-sector entities to figure out, are there ways  
16 to get, as was mentioned in the prior panel,  
17 discounts at cultural institutions so that parents  
18 and students can access all that New York City has to  
19 offer and really expand their education, right; make  
20 New York City the platform for their education, using  
21 the municipal ID card. So that is absolutely  
22 something that we are very focused on and working on  
23 and when the card is launched, it will have benefits  
24 not only for undocumented immigrants, but really that  
25 will make you and everyone else wanna sign up first

1  
2 to get the ID, so we are hard at work on that. On  
3 the issue of interstate travel and some other issues  
4 that cards may be used for, like drivers licenses,  
5 one of the things that we should look at is whether  
6 we should have warning language on the card about  
7 what purposes the card cannot be used for, 'cause we  
8 have... the City has limited authority about what cards  
9 can be accepted for state and federal purposes and  
10 we'll wanna properly inform and educate the users of  
11 the card about the limitations as well, so that's  
12 something we've been exploring preliminarily and  
13 would certainly continue if this bill were to pass  
14 and we were to implement.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Can I... [crosstalk]

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

17 Council Member Cabrera.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Can you... can you...  
19 one more... just real quick... [crosstalk]

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Quick follow up.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Can you use the card  
22 for like get on the airplanes?

23 NISHA AGARWAL: That's... the use of  
24 identification for that purpose is actually not  
25 within the City's authority, that's a federal issue

1  
2 and so we would need to inform people... the federal  
3 government about those limitations.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. We're  
6 gonna adhere to the strict two minutes per council  
7 member. Council Member Cabrera.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so  
9 much and I'll take 10 seconds of that. To Mr. Chair  
10 and Council Member Dromm, I really wanna take a  
11 moment to praise you for really putting a tremendous  
12 amount of time; I don't think people realize how much  
13 time you have dedicated to this cause and I know  
14 Council Member Dromm, for years you have, as the  
15 former Chair, have indeed given a tremendous amount  
16 of effort and now is gonna become a reality, so I  
17 compliment both of you. I'm gonna make a quick  
18 statement and then I'll follow up with a question,  
19 since I only have a minute-and-a-half. I wanna  
20 follow up with Council Member Dromm's question, that  
21 it would seem to me it will make sense to add the  
22 banking piece to it, and let me tell you why, for a  
23 couple of reasons -- (1) if we change our minds later  
24 on, it's gonna cost us a tremendous amount of money,  
25 and to say the least, headaches; (2) why not have a

1  
2 public-private kind of setup that really, it'll  
3 defray all the cost; this is gonna cost us millions  
4 of dollars; I could tell you, based on what I've seen  
5 in Oakland, minimum we're gonna be spending \$50  
6 million, minimum. I would encourage you to really do  
7 the research on this; I would rather use those \$50  
8 million for something else, and let the private  
9 sector pay for it; they have the money, they can  
10 afford it, and they wanna do it; that's the really  
11 interesting piece here; they really wanna do it and  
12 it will be a win-win situation and having said that,  
13 the banking piece I think is important; I think we're  
14 leaving it to kind of a luck, chance situation and  
15 based on the history, what we have seen in other  
16 municipalities, banks tend not to [bell] be amicable  
17 to the idea of using these IDs in order for them to  
18 get banking; I think this would empower our people  
19 and, respect to the Chair, I'll stop here. But  
20 please, if you could address that; at least stay  
21 open-minded as we go through this process.

22 NISHA AGARWAL: Sure. So thank you;  
23 that's a very legitimate point. One thing to be very  
24 clear on is that we are designing the system, or at  
25 least our initial plans would not foreclose the

1 possibility of adding banking features later on, so  
2 the concern about the cost escalating because we  
3 didn't think of it at the outset I think is  
4 somewhat alleviated, because we're... that's very much  
5 on our radar screen. We also, on the other side,  
6 wanna be sure that we are as thoughtful and as  
7 protective of the needs of low-income New Yorkers who  
8 we wanna be able to provide a safe, affordable,  
9 effective financial product to; that's a very serious  
10 consideration, and so while we're open-minded, we do  
11 wanna be very thoughtful about how we implement that  
12 and that's sort of our thinking at the moment.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.  
15 Next I wanna give it up to my brother from Brooklyn,  
16 Council Member Reynoso.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you,  
18 Chair, thank you so much; I'm really happy to be here  
19 at this moment with you Chairing this hearing and  
20 speaking on an issue that I think is extremely  
21 important. I'm gonna say one thing that I haven't  
22 thought out and one thing that I have. When it comes  
23 to our youth and being able to have them participate  
24 in this program, I think it's extremely important; it  
25 might be a little difficult, our incentivizing or the

1  
2 programs that we have to incentivize folks to join  
3 this program, it might not be attractive to people  
4 that have state IDs already; the resources or the  
5 gains that they get from having a City ID might not  
6 be attractive; I'm hoping that we could implement a  
7 very early age in which you can obtain this ID, even  
8 as low as 12 years old, because then once they're  
9 there, they're gonna cycle through and continue to  
10 maintain or have this ID, so maybe in 40, 50, even 60  
11 years every single person can have this ID and we  
12 would eliminate the stigma of only undocumented  
13 having it, [background comment] so just being mindful  
14 of that. [background comment] And well, what are  
15 you thoughts on it?

16 NISHA AGARWAL: Sure. So we... that's very  
17 much something the Administration is looking into and  
18 supports and access for young people to this  
19 identification is something that we're thinking  
20 about; of course, with appropriate protections for  
21 minors, you know, that may be necessary and so, I  
22 would say I agree and we will also be having  
23 conversations with the Department of Ed and other  
24 agencies that work with young people to be able to  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

leverage some of their resources as well to reach that population.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: And then the last part was -- I'm a biker, I bike, and this might not be popular and I haven't thought this one out, [background comment] but maybe there's an opportunity here for, you know, proper biking, riding in the City of New York and having to go through a course and maybe obtaining this [background comment] ID through that as well; just thought I'd bring it up; maybe it's an idea that could also work. [bell] But thank you for being here and good job, by the way.

NISHA AGARWAL: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Council Member Reynoso. And now we'll hand it over to Council Member Eugene.

COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very much, Mr. Chair and thank you to each one of you for your testimony. To Miss Mindy Tarlow, [background comment] in your testimony you mentioned that we propose; that's your nice pose [sic], we proposing having the two type of site where people can sign up for the municipal ID; you mentioned active site and passive site; where those sites would be located;

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

would they be located in government building, in government agencies, private institution or private organization, and what will be the process to choose them if they would be located in private institutions?

MINDY TARLOW: So we're looking at a wide range of sites right now and I... I... I did wanna reference the earlier panel and was encouraged to hear that they were thinking along similar lines; that made us feel that we're also on the right track. We're looking at sites that are government, but also community-based, where people would go for other kinds of services that cover a broad range of things, whether it's parks or whether it's libraries, things like that, where people would normally go; we consider those active sites and we're trying to make sure that they cover a wide range of topics so that it would draw a wide range of people and also make sure that they cover a wide range of geographies and that they cover all boroughs, and we're looking at a number of different options and we're trying to talk to as many people as possible so that we can get the broadest range of options available.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: In terms of the  
3 whole process, will you create an agency to oversee  
4 the process or to oversee all the sites?

5 MINDY TARLOW: What we're proposing to do  
6 is to have the Mayor's Office, sort of broadly  
7 speaking -- Operations, the Mayor's Office of  
8 Immigrant Affairs, the Community Assistance Unit, the  
9 groups that [bell] Commissioner Agarwal was  
10 describing earlier -- oversee the project at large  
11 and make sure that we have the right kind of  
12 communication and interaction with the active sites,  
13 but also, make sure that we're working closely with  
14 the back office operation to make sure that the IDs  
15 are properly administered, that the program is  
16 properly put on the ground; the technology and  
17 procurement process is adequately secured. So we  
18 would try to have the Mayor's Office, again, sort of  
19 generally speaking, oversee the whole process.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you very  
21 much. [background comment] Thank you, Mr. Chair.

22 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Council  
23 Member Eugene. And I'm gonna round it off with some...  
24 a series of questions, just to kind of really fill in  
25 the experience of New Yorkers, and the first one I

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

wanted to ask about was, maybe right after, kinda thinking about the mobility of this program and how it's gonna interact with New Yorkers; how are you gonna evaluate, (1), and do you have a plan to evaluate the current kind of front end workers, and how are you thinking that out? And on the flip side; how are you evaluating the experience of every New Yorker, and we've kind of talked a lot about seniors, LGBT community, our undocumented immigrants, and evaluating their experience as well and kinda share that?

NISHA AGARWAL: So I can start and then, you know, our goal would be, in terms of the front end staff, to have a very extensive and thorough training program for them to be able to, you know, look at and sort of identify the veracity of documents that are presented for identity and residency and to have a kind of cadre of people who are focused on municipal ID as the individuals who would be doing some of the front end work, and in addition, you know, I think part of what you're asking is, would they have the kind of cultural competency training, the sort of linguistic support, the other kinds of training that's needed to make the

1  
2 card truly accessible at the point of contact, and  
3 that's of course something that we would work to  
4 ensure is the case so the training is not just, are  
5 these documents real or not, but the training is, how  
6 do we make this a welcoming process for people who  
7 wanna get the card, so absolutely. And then in terms  
8 of about... oh, sorry.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Before you go to  
10 the second component, and just stay on the kind of  
11 worker experience, language access; can you really  
12 talk about that and really the commitment to language  
13 access for New Yorkers?

14 NISHA AGARWAL: Sure. So the commitment  
15 on language access, I will say personally is an  
16 issue, very near and dear to my heart; that's the  
17 work I started doing in my career as a lawyer and  
18 it's very important to the Mayor, and so in  
19 implementing this program, along with all of the  
20 other major initiatives that have been happening,  
21 like universal pre-K, etc., there will be, you know,  
22 translated materials available for people, the access  
23 to interpretation services, all of the basic language  
24 access services, as we have at this hearing, right,  
25 to make it possible for New Yorkers of all languages

1  
2 and all backgrounds to be able to access the program.  
3 So I'll just emphasize that commitment now.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And then the  
5 second part to the question about the kind of  
6 experience that New Yorkers are gonna have and how  
7 you plan to evaluate that; how are we gonna know and  
8 hopefully in real time that this is a highly  
9 accessible, but great experience?

10 MINDY TARLOW: I think that the Mayor's  
11 Office of Operations, along with MOIA, we actually  
12 have a very close-working relationship around  
13 language access and among other things; we do a lot  
14 of work around customer service and I think that we  
15 will come up with ways of using that experience to  
16 make sure that we can test and survey New Yorkers to  
17 make sure that their experience is a good experience  
18 and use the things at our disposal to make sure that  
19 we are finding out how the public is experiencing  
20 municipal ID and you know, try to come up with some  
21 creative ways to really understand that experience.

22 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Next question is,  
23 Director Tarlow, what kind of outreach to previously  
24 incarcerated people would be successful in getting  
25

1  
2 municipal IDs in... really into their hands and can you  
3 kinda drill down on that point for us?

4 MINDY TARLOW: Right and if I had another  
5 hat I would put it on right now. [laughter] I think  
6 that New York City has one of the strongest  
7 community-based apparatus in the country in terms of  
8 people who deal with formerly incarcerated people,  
9 especially those who are just coming home and  
10 reintegrating into their communities, so I would tap  
11 into that network; it's quite robust, and that would  
12 be my first stop, would be to engage that community,  
13 it's where people are going for services, it's where  
14 people feel... it's a place of trust and comfort and I  
15 think that would be my first thought, would be to  
16 engage that community.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And we're really  
18 looking forward to your expertise on this as we  
19 continue to develop... develop the program.  
20 [interpose, crosstalk]

21 MINDY TARLOW: And I would be delighted  
22 to share it.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: The next question  
24 is really for... for you again on... or actually, for  
25 both of you on understanding the consulate IDs and it

1  
2 kind of come into ecosystem in New York City, you've  
3 heard from the first panelists a little bit about  
4 that experience, and so, have you reached out to the  
5 consulates and what's your conversation in really  
6 understanding what they bring to the table in  
7 understanding identification [background comment]  
8 being part of the weighted point system to  
9 [background comment] get a municipal ID?

10 NISHA AGARWAL: Yes. So we are engaging..  
11 the Mayor's Office of Urban Affairs has historically  
12 worked with the consulate offices, as you can  
13 imagine, on a range of different issues and we are  
14 sitting down with them to learn both about their  
15 consular ID process as well as to understand how some  
16 of the IDs and the programs that they have may  
17 interface with the municipal ID, and so that's a  
18 conversation that's ongoing, and you know, I think  
19 the consulates will may be important partners in  
20 outreach and some of the consulates that have ID  
21 programs that have done outreach efforts, they have  
22 people coming at 6 in the morning to line up for this  
23 card and there's clearly a pent-up demand for  
24 identification cards of this sort, and one of things  
25 they've done well is actually doing some of that

1  
2 outreach in the community itself, not requiring  
3 people to come into Manhattan to obtain the consular  
4 ID, and so we'd like to learn from those experiences  
5 and we'd like to partner with the consulates very  
6 much on outreach in addition to understanding the  
7 kind of ID mechanics as well.

8 MINDY TARLOW: Just; not to pick up on  
9 that, which I think was beautifully stated, but back  
10 to your earlier question, one additional thought is  
11 about the Department Probation, which, as you know,  
12 is a sentence in and of itself where people are going  
13 for the first time; again, another really important  
14 agency in the community that might be a very, very  
15 important, as we were saying earlier, passive site  
16 that people can go to directly to get a municipal ID,  
17 because they're going to probation for other  
18 services, and I think they're a very important agency  
19 to engage and Commissioner Bermudez I'm sure would be  
20 a really great active partner in this effort.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And really, in  
22 kinda thinking about the kinda mechanics of this, for  
23 New Yorkers who are homeless, and really maybe can  
24 you describe just the process that you'd imagine;  
25 someone goes into a mobile passive active site, they

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

apply; what's the time... the lag time; [background comment] is it mailed; can you kinda describe a little bit about what you're thinking on that?

MINDY TARLOW: Yeah, I mean the idea would be that somebody comes into a site, passively or actively, they sign up for the ID, they give their paperwork, that then gets processed on-site, that gets sent to the back end site for final processing, and when the card is ready it does get mailed out to their official address and we will be working with experts in the field about how you get a card out to somebody who doesn't in fact have a permanent address and there, fortunately or unfortunately, is a lot of expertise out in the field about that, whether it's, you know finding folks who are in shelter or finding folks who are transient and moving from one place to another and we're very committed and have already started some of those conversations about how best to contact those folks who don't have a permanent address.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And last, any other questions... Council Member Reynoso.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hi again. When we talk about housing, especially lotteries in

1  
2 affordable housing, a lot of times; actually, all the  
3 time you need to input your social security number,  
4 you have to add your social security number and  
5 unfortunately many folks don't have social security  
6 numbers that in the City of New York are allowed to  
7 apply, but there's obstacles obviously in the way and  
8 that's one of them. I've put in legislation to allow  
9 for a tax identification number to be used in place  
10 of social security for an application, an affordable  
11 housing application; what I'm hoping is that that  
12 legislation is obsolete or is not needed, because  
13 these IDs will work as an opportunity to apply for  
14 affordable housing for anyone that's a resident of  
15 the City of New York. Do you think that that's gonna  
16 be something that, working alongside HPD we might be  
17 able to accomplish through this ID?

18 NISHA AGARWAL: So we are in conversation  
19 with many agencies, including HPD, to understand, you  
20 know, whether it's signing up for a lease where you  
21 have to show identification or accessing different  
22 programs, to ensure that the identification card is  
23 accepted broadly across City agencies, so that's  
24 certainly a commitment. One thing we won't be able  
25 to change with the ID card is what the rules and

1  
2 requirements might be that are made at the state or  
3 the federal level, so to the extent that there are  
4 limitations imposed on that, that's not entirely  
5 within our control, but whatever is within our  
6 control we will of course wanna increase access to  
7 the maximum extent possible.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Council  
9 Member Reynoso. And really, I just wanna clarify  
10 something -- I'm just kinda reading the Twitter feeds  
11 -- and that this card is not gonna be able to be used  
12 for interstate travel; this is a municipal ID that  
13 will work in New York City and really only in New  
14 York City and that this card essentially doesn't  
15 really... this card lives within the bounds of the  
16 state and federal laws, [background comment] and so  
17 do one of you wanna expand on that a little bit?

18 NISHA AGARWAL: Absolutely. There is  
19 nothing about this identification card that will  
20 break state or federal laws, it is a community-  
21 building, it's an access-creating card for New York  
22 City and that's some of what its power is, is that  
23 it's a New York City card for New Yorkers; well, you  
24 know, were we able to change the federal and state  
25 laws, I would have a lot of ideas on that, but we

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

are, for now, you know we have the power to do what we can at the city level. [interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish]  
[laughter] Okay. Well thank you so much; we're gonna get some other panelists up; [background comment] thank you so much for your time and we look forward to working with you.

MINDY TARLOW: Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And our next panel, we'd like to call up Johanna Miller from New York Civil Liberties Union, Emily Tucker from Center for Popular Democracy, Steven Choi from the New York Immigration Coalition, and Miss Deyanira Del Rio from the New Economy Project. Please come on up. And I do wanna say that we had a couple Twitter questions about language access and we asked it; this is from Christina S. Chang, from the MinKwon Center; thank you so much for saying that question, and really continue, if you wanna engage us, on #nycID. Thank you. And we're waiting for one more. Steven, can you start, please?

STEVEN CHOI: Sure.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

1  
2 STEVEN CHOI: Good morning; my name is  
3 Steve Choi and I'm the Executive Director of the New  
4 York Immigration Coalition, an umbrella organization  
5 with nearly 200 member organizations.

6 On behalf of New York City's vibrant and  
7 diverse immigrant communities, who continue to face  
8 barriers in accessing government-issued  
9 identification, we believe that the municipal ID  
10 envisioned by this legislation, an ID available to  
11 all New Yorkers, would go a long way to break down  
12 the stigmatizing barriers for immigrants. My  
13 testimony is informed by the New York Immigration  
14 Coalition's experiences and the crushing consequences  
15 of a lack of proper identification are a common theme  
16 in our work. Time and time we've heard stories of  
17 individuals who are not able to provide identity to  
18 hospitals, of parents who cannot enter their child's  
19 school and New Yorkers who cannot open bank accounts.  
20 But we've also seen how strong policy can break down  
21 these barriers. With the support of the City  
22 Council, the NYIC was able to begin the Key to the  
23 City Consular ID Initiative to work with the  
24 consulates to provide over 19,000 New Yorkers with  
25 services and nearly 13,000 people have stood in line

1  
2 for hours to receive these critical identify  
3 documents. These consular ID initiatives have not  
4 only shown the incredible need in immigrant  
5 communities, but have also provided a model structure  
6 for engaging partners in successfully reaching  
7 diverse communities.

8 I also wanna emphasize today that the  
9 best ID for immigrants will be an ID widely adopted  
10 by non-immigrants. The muni ID cannot be a proxy for  
11 undocumented status; it should be a badge of civic  
12 pride that unites all residents, but it will only be  
13 so if it is linked to a robust package of discounts,  
14 privileges and other benefits that will appeal to  
15 everyone. And to that end, we believe it will be  
16 critical to establish a joint task force of the  
17 Administration, City Council and community  
18 organizations to bring this package to life. We must  
19 also ensure that the application process is smooth  
20 and secure, that City agencies are properly trained  
21 and above all, the confidentiality of personal  
22 documents and information must be guaranteed. [bell]

23 In conclusion, we at the Coalition look  
24 forward to working closely with the Administration  
25 and the City Council to make municipal IDs a reality

1  
2 and I know I cannot wait to get my own New York City  
3 municipal card myself. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I'll be right  
5 there with you. Thank you. Johanna.

6 JOHANNA MILLER: Hi, good morning. My  
7 name is Johanna Miller; I'm the Advocacy Director at  
8 the New York Civil Liberties Union, speaking today on  
9 behalf of our 50,000 members statewide.

10 We are pleased to be here today to join  
11 our allies in supporting the access that the NYC ID  
12 promises to diverse New York communities, but in the  
13 interest of time I'm gonna focus my comments on one  
14 of our primary concerns, which is for the privacy of  
15 applicants for the ID card.

16 We commend the City Council for designing  
17 legislation that protects against the risks of  
18 disclosure of applicants' private information to the  
19 maximum extent possible. Closely linked with making  
20 the NYC ID appealing to broad communities is the  
21 City's promise that people's information will not be  
22 entered into a database or shared with third parties.  
23 The current language in the bill prohibiting  
24 retention is the best way to guarantee this promise;  
25 we applaud the Council for including that language.

1  
2           These foundational documents are some of  
3 the most sensitive pieces of information that people  
4 have -- passports, benefit cards, pay stubs, bank  
5 statements, information about their children's public  
6 school attendance -- these are things that people  
7 don't even want disclosed to family members; it is  
8 essential that the City takes the same care in  
9 preserving privacy.

10           Revelations about the NSA's domestic  
11 spying program and public outrage over New York State  
12 Education Department's contract with data servicer  
13 inBloom speak loudly to the public's wariness about  
14 government abuse of privacy rights. So retaining the  
15 documents we think creates an unnecessary risk of  
16 disclosure. The threat is not abstract; as you  
17 probably know, in New Haven the information about  
18 people who had the municipal ID was requested by  
19 anti-immigrant activists who said they were gonna  
20 turn it over to ICE; New Haven was able to defeat  
21 that request, but we think that the threat of  
22 something like that actually defeats some of the  
23 broad appeal of the ID and could scare away potential  
24 applicants [bell] that the City needs to make this  
25 program a success. So we fully support the work

1  
2 you've put in to protecting confidentiality and we're  
3 happy to continue providing our expertise in that  
4 area.

5           EMILY TUCKER: Good afternoon and thanks  
6 to Councilman Menchaca and the Immigration Committee  
7 for convening today's hearing and for inviting me to  
8 testify on this important issue. My name is Emily  
9 Tucker and I'm a Staff Attorney at the Center for  
10 Popular Democracy in Brooklyn, where I support state  
11 and local initiatives to promote immigrant rights and  
12 promote racial justice and economic justice.

13           One of the things I've seen over and over  
14 again in the communities I work with is how seemingly  
15 small changes in circumstances can lead to huge  
16 improvements in the well-being of individuals,  
17 families and whole cities. At CPD we look for  
18 initiatives like this which often simply by removing  
19 obstacles to basic goods, like health and security  
20 that most of us take for granted will enable people  
21 to live better, happier lives. Municipal ID is one  
22 such initiative and I'm here today to voice my full  
23 support and the support of my organization for this  
24 legislation that would bring IDs to New York City.

1  
2 Access to a widely-accepted form of ID is  
3 a right, but increasingly in this country we treat it  
4 as a privilege, a privilege that tends to go along  
5 with other privileges of race, of class and of  
6 citizenship. Many of us take IDs so much for granted  
7 that we don't even realize how much we rely on it.  
8 Over the last decade it's become increasingly crucial  
9 to have ID, increasingly difficult to get ID and  
10 increasingly risky to share personal information with  
11 the government agencies that issue ID; at the same  
12 time, ID continues to gate-keep every aspect of life.

13 In response to this problem, a wave of  
14 municipalities across the country have enacted local  
15 ID car programs, starting with New Haven, Connecticut  
16 and now including San Francisco, Oakland, Richmond,  
17 Los Angeles in California, Asbury Park and Mercer  
18 County in New Jersey, and Washington D.C. Campaigns  
19 are also currently underway in cities as diverse as  
20 Phoenix, Philadelphia and Chicago. The programs in  
21 these jurisdictions take a variety of forms and have  
22 a range of different features tailored to the  
23 particular localities they serve; my organization has  
24 researched all the existing programs and we've  
25 identified several key features that we believe will

1  
2 be important for municipal ID cards to be successful  
3 here in New York City.

4           The first of these is accessibility;  
5 [bell] in order for a city ID to actually serve the  
6 purpose for which it's designed, it has to be more  
7 accessible than existing forms of state and federal  
8 ID, and that means the application process has to be  
9 clear and simple and the methods of proving residency  
10 and identity in order to qualify for the card must be  
11 flexible. That doesn't mean verification of identity  
12 and residency can't be robust, it just means the  
13 program has to be designed to fit with the particular  
14 circumstances of those in this City that typically  
15 have trouble getting ID. The next piece is privacy;  
16 I'm not gonna go into that, 'cause I think Johanna's  
17 covered that very well, but we found that the cities  
18 that have the most robust privacy policies -- San  
19 Francisco being an example, and you'll hear from  
20 someone from San Francisco later today -- tend to  
21 have the highest rates of adoption. The last piece  
22 is broad appeal -- as other folks have mentioned, we  
23 don't want the card to become a scarlet letter where  
24 an individual is assumed to be a member of one or  
25 more vulnerable groups simply by virtue of being a

1  
2 cardholder and the best way to avoid this is to  
3 ensure the card appeals to and is adopted by as broad  
4 a cross section of the population as possible; many  
5 jurisdictions have done this -- Los Angeles and San  
6 Francisco -- and the cards there are viewed as  
7 legitimate and viewed as non-stigmatizing.

8           The last thing I wanna say is that it's  
9 crucial to all of the communities in New York City  
10 that support this card that the NYPD accept it, that  
11 they view it as a legitimate way of proving your  
12 identity and they accept it for the purpose of  
13 issuing summonses.

14           Though there are many variables that can  
15 impact the success of an ID card program, our  
16 research shows that these are especially fundamental  
17 and we're excited to see that the current draft bill  
18 addresses all of these points. We're lucky to be in  
19 a position to learn from the other jurisdictions that  
20 have already implemented municipal ID card programs  
21 and we have a chance to make New York [cough] card  
22 the best in the country.

23           CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, Miss  
24 Tucker. Miss Del Rio.

1  
2 DEYANIRA DEL RIO: Thanks. Hi, good  
3 morning...

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

5 DEYANIRA DEL RIO: thank you for the  
6 opportunity to testify. My name's Deyanira Del Rio;  
7 I'm the Co-Director of New Economy Project, formerly  
8 NEDAP; we're an organization that works with  
9 community groups around New York City to fight for  
10 economic justice and to build a new economy that  
11 works for all.

12 And I specifically want to address in the  
13 proposal, which we enthusiastically support, some of  
14 the issues around banking access; this is an area in  
15 which we've done work for many years, working to hold  
16 banks accountable to communities in New York City and  
17 also working to eliminate barriers that immigrants,  
18 young people and many others, including people in  
19 communities of color face to accessing fair and  
20 affordable financial services and you know, which  
21 leave people not only vulnerable to high-cost and  
22 predatory lenders and other institutions, but  
23 actually blocks people from all kinds of other  
24 economic opportunities by virtue of not having  
25 banking or credit histories. Unfortunately, the

1  
2 reality of that today without a banking and credit  
3 history, it's increasingly hard to get housing, jobs,  
4 insurance, cell phones, and the list is growing,  
5 thanks to aggressive marketing by the credit bureaus.  
6 The City Council is separately looking at a bill to  
7 ban employment credit checks and that would at least  
8 eliminate one of these unfair practices. But the  
9 implications for being financially excluded are  
10 really severe and expansive and that's the point I  
11 wanna make, it's not just about saving fees from  
12 check-cashing, it's really about economic access as a  
13 whole.

14           We are really excited about the potential  
15 for the municipal ID to be a tool that the City and  
16 New Yorkers and advocacy groups and organizers can  
17 use to press for accountable banking in the City and  
18 to really expand fair and affordable financial  
19 services for all New Yorkers.

20           There is in my testimony lengthy, sort of  
21 documentation that the City has put out regarding the  
22 numbers of people who right now do not have any  
23 credit union or bank account at all; it's somewhere  
24 upwards of 800,000 New Yorkers that have no account  
25 and that doesn't include many hundreds of thousands

1  
2 more that maybe have an account, but are still  
3 relying on high-cost, you know fringe services,  
4 [bell] predatory services to meet some of their  
5 needs. So literally expanding financial access in a  
6 meaningful way could literally put millions of  
7 dollars back in the pockets of low-income New Yorkers  
8 and their communities and so it's a really, you know  
9 critical issue for that reason.

10 I am going to, in the interest of time,  
11 just jump ahead a little bit into some of the  
12 recommendations that we have to make sure that the ID  
13 is an effective tool to promote banking access,  
14 because as everyone knows, I believe up here that  
15 lack of a government-issued ID is one of the major  
16 impediments that people face to getting access to an  
17 affordable, safe, regulated bank or credit union  
18 account, so not having a government-issued ID, it's  
19 not just immigrants; it's all the other communities  
20 that you've heard so far face these challenges. One  
21 is that we would recommend that the City take into  
22 account the federal banking requirements, including,  
23 for example, under the Patriot Act, and design the ID  
24 to meet those minimum requirements so that banks can  
25 accept that ID card as sufficient government ID to

1  
2 open an account, so the Patriot Act sets forth very  
3 basic minimum requirements -- name, address, a photo,  
4 for example; a birth date, and then, critically, an  
5 identification number that's unique. And so making  
6 sure there's a unique ID number on the cards will  
7 hopefully go far to making sure banks and credit  
8 unions accept that card. Second, we urge the City to  
9 use its leverage and its relationships with local  
10 banks and credit unions to press them to accept the  
11 ID not as a second or third ID, but as the primary ID  
12 which meets federal law, federal banking  
13 requirements, as a primary ID to allow people to open  
14 basic, affordable savings and checking accounts. And  
15 we think that the City has several leverage points,  
16 including the New York City Responsible Banking Act,  
17 which gives the City the ability to evaluate how  
18 banks are meeting community credit and banking need;  
19 when the City is deciding where to put its deposit.  
20 And so this, you know acceptance of the ID, service  
21 to people who have the ID could be one way that the  
22 City evaluates banks under that law. We also think  
23 that the City could go a step further and do what we  
24 understand San Francisco did, which is, in its  
25 statute, it requires all entities that do business

1  
2 with the City to accept the municipal ID card, and so  
3 that's yet another kind of hook or leverage with  
4 banks and others. And then finally, we would say  
5 that we have anecdotally heard from some financial  
6 institutions that they are already kind of viewing  
7 the ID a little bit skeptically, thinking it's not  
8 really a full... a true government-issued ID; it's  
9 gonna be a little too flexible or they're saying,  
10 well we'll accept it, but we're gonna develop a  
11 special product for those people, and you know  
12 unfortunately that... for those that do this work, the  
13 code there are, you know, inferior products, there  
14 are like fewer products and services and you know,  
15 things like pre-paid debit cards that aren't  
16 federally protected and insured in the same way as  
17 other banking services, for example and often have  
18 really high and hidden fees for people. So we wanna  
19 ask the City to make sure that institutions are  
20 viewing the City ID as a true and full government-  
21 issued ID; the ID is about unifying and really  
22 expanding access, equal access for all New Yorkers,  
23 it's not about creating separate and segregated  
24 systems and products, so we would want to make sure  
25 that the City has its radar up for that.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Great. I'm gonna  
3 pause you there; I just... [crosstalk]

4 DEYANIRA DEL RIO: Okay. Okay, thank  
5 you. That was it.

6 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I wanna... I wanna  
7 make sure that we can ask some questions, and I wanna  
8 recognize our great Public Advocate Tish James who's  
9 joined us; no stranger to this body and this room,  
10 but a fierce fighter for all New Yorkers, and I wanna  
11 give you an opportunity to say a few words and to ask  
12 a question.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Good morning. I  
14 wanna thank Immigration Chair, Council Member Carlos  
15 Menchaca for inviting me to speak on the topic of New  
16 York City Municipal ID Card Program.

17 Across the country a growing number of  
18 municipalities have begun to issue municipal ID cards  
19 to their residents; these municipal identification  
20 cards typically feature the photo and address of the  
21 cardholder. Although typically available to all  
22 residents, the cards are particularly valuable for  
23 the most vulnerable community residents, undocumented  
24 immigrants, homeless populations and others who may  
25 have difficulty obtaining and retaining other

1 government-issued ID. As know, governmental  
2 identification is needed to obtain access to service  
3 most New Yorkers take for granted, like opening bank  
4 accounts, access to financial services, leasing  
5 apartments, entrance into certain governmental  
6 buildings, and even simply getting a library card.  
7 Today over half-a-million undocumented New Yorkers  
8 unfairly live in the shadows; it's now time that they  
9 step out of the shadows, and I am pleased to hear  
10 that this Council is considering.. I am pleased to  
11 hear that this legislation is being considered within  
12 the Council and that the Administration has moved  
13 forward with the Mayor's Office of Contract Services  
14 to secure project management and quality assurance  
15 services for the municipal ID application system, as  
16 well as a company that would oversee the program. As  
17 in the Office of Public Advocate, we also look  
18 forward to making sure that that company, that there  
19 is some oversight over that program and that company.  
20 I would hope to further discuss specifics regarding  
21 the procurement process, specifically how  
22 registration data will be compiled and secured and  
23 accessed both by the contracting company and that  
24 individuals' information is safe. And I again thank  
25

1  
2 you for the opportunity to speak on the proposed New  
3 York City Municipal ID Card Program, but I want  
4 everyone to know that the Office of Public Advocate  
5 is a friend to all regardless of status and that we  
6 support this initiative going forward and whatever we  
7 can do in our capacity to ensure that there is equal  
8 opportunity for all, the Office of Public Advocate,  
9 the office of Letitia James, is here to serve. Thank  
10 you.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Public  
12 Advocate Tish James. And really with that note, I  
13 wanna hand it... or direct my question to Johanna from  
14 NYCLU and really understand how you envision  
15 protecting the privacy during the period in which the  
16 City has explained to us that they're gonna take  
17 information, the... well I guess I should just... I'll  
18 leave it there. How did you feel like that's gonna  
19 happen from your perspective?

20 JOHANNA MILLER: So as a threshold  
21 matter... my understanding is that the City has  
22 concerns about whether the people who are kind of the  
23 storefront recipients of these applicants in order to  
24 make it widespread may not have the correct training  
25 to be able to verify documents and so they need to

1  
2 either scan them or retain them in some way to have  
3 them -- like a two-step verification process. So as  
4 a threshold matter, we don't think that that's a  
5 legitimate reason to retain documents, we think that  
6 that indicates, quite frankly, a troubling lack of  
7 investment in proper training of those individuals;  
8 we think if there is a tension between widespread  
9 access and proper training, the City has to err on  
10 the side of training, and that's not just a safety  
11 concern with verifying the documents, but also, as  
12 you raised yourself, a customer service concern; a  
13 lot of the populations that are going to be best  
14 served by this identification card have had  
15 historically from interactions with many government  
16 agencies, including HRA, and so I think they're  
17 concerned that people won't be trained to verify a  
18 paper document, whether it's true or not, to me  
19 raises those secondary concerns about whether those  
20 people will actually be trained to handle the many  
21 different circumstances that people are going to  
22 present and make sure that they have a dignified  
23 experience. But as a secondary matter, we are not  
24 yet convinced that scanning and retaining the  
25 documents actually presents the right kind of

1 verification, the means of verification at all; in  
2 fact, many of the security features of these types of  
3 documents are security features that you can only  
4 verify when you have the document in your possession  
5 and so scanning them... so things like embossed seals,  
6 watermarks, things that even a high-quality scanner  
7 are not going to show, and so that two-step  
8 verification process, we haven't seen evidence yet  
9 from the City, we haven't had detailed conversations,  
10 but I have not seen evidence that actually would even  
11 work at all and in fact there are in-person  
12 mechanical verification methods that we would  
13 encourage the City to explore, like using UV lamps on  
14 some documents where the, you know, watermarks can  
15 show up on UV; we think that people can be trained to  
16 do this work and we think if that means that there  
17 are slightly fewer of them, that's probably the right  
18 path to go down.

19  
20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. And my  
21 next question is to Miss Tucker, you mentioned really  
22 the value of NYPD accepting this piece of  
23 identification; can you just frame for us the value  
24 and why it's so essential for the NYPD to accept  
25 this?

1  
2           EMILY TUCKER: Yeah, I mean I think there  
3 are a few communities that are represented in our  
4 advocacy coalition that could speak to this  
5 firsthand, but you know the... just to give a basic  
6 overview, undocumented immigrants are often afraid to  
7 take advantage of law enforcement in their  
8 communities because they worry that if they have to  
9 present identification, that identification might tip  
10 law enforcement off to their undocumented status and  
11 that that could trigger a pickup by ICE or their  
12 personal information being submitted to ICE and  
13 consequences not only for themselves and their family  
14 members and that has huge consequences we've seen in  
15 the domestic violence advocacy circle, many, many  
16 examples of individuals who are suffering from  
17 domestic violence and fear going to the police  
18 because they don't wanna bring to light their status  
19 or the status of their family members and there  
20 actually have been incidents where individuals have  
21 gone to the police in cases of domestic violence and  
22 have ended up in deportation proceedings. So that's  
23 one example and the other example would be the, for  
24 example, homeless individuals who often don't have  
25 current forms of identification and will be, you

1  
2 know, they'll be in the subway and have their feet on  
3 the seat and it's 3 a.m. and the cops are doing  
4 sweeps and aren't able to present a valid form of  
5 identification for the purposes of getting a summons  
6 and so they end up having to spend the night in jail.  
7 So those are some of the examples and it's really,  
8 really crucial for NYPD to accept the ID.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Miss  
10 Tucker. Next question from Council Member Reynoso.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you. This  
12 is to Mr. Choi. You specifically talked about  
13 incentives and discounts; are you saying that maybe  
14 we get 10 percent off at Macy's for getting this  
15 card; is that what you're implying... [crosstalk]

16 STEVEN CHOI: Think we rely upon you as  
17 Council Member to make that happen.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [laugh] Well, I  
19 do want to see if you've thought of any creative ways  
20 that you think... [interpose]

21 STEVEN CHOI: Sure.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: you can make  
23 this popular and make it attractive to folks and  
24 speak to the discounts or incentives that you were  
25 talking about.

1  
2 STEVEN CHOI: Absolutely. So as I stated  
3 before in my testimony and as you see in the written  
4 testimony, we think that this package of potential  
5 benefits is going to be the most critical thing. As  
6 I said before, the best thing for immigrants about  
7 this card is to make sure that non-immigrants are  
8 taking advantage of it, and that is gonna be  
9 absolutely critical to dealing with the issue of  
10 avoiding this being a scarlet letter. And so what I  
11 would say is, as I mentioned earlier, we should  
12 establish a joint task force, get the Mayor's folks  
13 to come together, get the City Council to come  
14 together, and this broad network of nonprofit  
15 organizations, this robust network that we have here  
16 in New York City, get our minds together and lets  
17 think together strategically and creatively. If we  
18 think about it, there is a whole range of benefits  
19 that could be... that we can make eligible through this  
20 card -- discounts to restaurants, discounts to  
21 Macy's, although I don't shop at Macy's, I don't have  
22 enough money to shop there, but really thinking  
23 through all the different ways in which we could  
24 connect it up. We could connect it up with... and this  
25 is just some brief brainstorming, but we could

1  
2 connect it up with a restaurant week, we could  
3 connect it up with the City Bike system, and this is  
4 all just sort of brainstorming that we're thinking  
5 about. Procedurally we should create a joint task  
6 force; I think we should actually build it into the  
7 bill, where we talk about brining these folks  
8 together so we're not doing this in a haphazard way,  
9 but in a thoughtful and careful and strategic way  
10 where we are identifying not only what's best for  
11 immigrants, but also what's gonna attract citizens  
12 and green card holders and students to all say, I  
13 want this bill as well. So ultimately, at the end of  
14 the day, there should be this robust package of  
15 benefits that every single person in this room should  
16 say, there's something in it for me.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Okay. Well with  
19 that I think... I wanna thank you for being on this  
20 panel; we're gonna hear from so many other New  
21 Yorkers and we're gonna continue our conversations.  
22 Thank you for being engaged in this process up until  
23 this point; we're gonna continue. So thank you so  
24 much. [background comment]

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Our next panel we call up Jason Chang from the National Federation of Community Development Credit Unions, Jeong Ming Yu [sp?] from the MinKwon Center, Linda Sarsour from the Arab American Association of New York, and Esther Sanchez from Faith in New York. Please make your way up to the table. [background comments] [Spanish] 01:46:16...

[interpose]

ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] 01:46:17

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] 01:46:21

Can we have a translator, please?

MALE VOICE: [Spanish] 01:46:28

[interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] 01:46:31

ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] 01:46:32

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

[background comment]

ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] 01:46:36

[background comment]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] 01:48:17

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: So I'm going to translate and it says, "My name is Esther Sanchez, I living in New York for more than 15 years, a mother of three autistic children and because of the

1  
2 diagnostic or the condition of my children I have to  
3 take them constantly to the hospital and on various  
4 occasions, because I didn't have an ID, my children  
5 were not attended at the hospital and I've had to  
6 come back to my house really worried that something  
7 bad could happen to my children because they didn't  
8 receive medical assistance that day. Also, when I go  
9 to my children's school they also ask me for an ID to  
10 be able to get in and in various occasions I showed  
11 them my consular ID, the ID from my country and I  
12 have been discriminated and rejected and I have to  
13 always, you know be going through very difficult  
14 times and I don't wanna go to my children's school  
15 because I don't feel accepted there. So for me this  
16 ID will change my life because as a mother I have  
17 experienced discrimination and having a municipal ID  
18 in New York is really important for me and for a lot  
19 of mothers that are in my same situation; it will  
20 take me out of the shadows and I would be able to  
21 live with tranquility and peace. You know, after so  
22 many years of living here I will finally feel that  
23 I'm a part of this city.

24 [background comment]  
25

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

[background comment] Mr. Yu.

PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Good morning Council Members Menchaca and other council members. Thank you for this hearing and the opportunity to share my experience and my thoughts on the municipal ID program.

My name is Jeong Min Yu and I am a member of the MinKwon Center for Community Action. I'm going to hold up my green passport and then just tell you about a recent exchange at a Home Depot while returning an item.

The Home Depot rep had said, "Can I see your ID?" And I said, "Yeah, here you go." And then he said, "I'm sorry, but we can't accept this." And then I said to him, "Why?" And he says, "We can only accept U.S. Government IDs here." And I was like, "It's a Korean Passport, it's from Korea." And he said, "Sorry," you know. And so as I walked away I heard another worker say, probably mockingly; sarcastically, "You know, if you're in America you should have your American ID." And than I shot back, "You know, not everybody can be an American citizen," sad but true. And so nonetheless, my passport is my

1  
2 only sole documentation of the journey from Korea 33  
3 years ago and I was born in Seoul and brought to the  
4 States at the age of 1 and my family moved to New  
5 York when I was 8; I went to Mark Twain and  
6 Stuyvesant High School and went to college and  
7 graduated magna cum laude. Even with all this, when  
8 it comes to being an actual person in the eyes of the  
9 law, I continue to live in the shadows. I've aged  
10 out of the Deferred Action Program by one year and  
11 have not been able to drive, work and travel like my  
12 younger stream of [sic] peers; they now have a valid  
13 U.S. ID while I still do not.

14 Experiences like the one at Home Depot  
15 leave me wondering, what can be done for the people  
16 like me, undocumented immigrants without other forms  
17 of ID or even international students who might be  
18 relying on foreign passports as their sole means of  
19 government-issued ID? Banks, post offices and even  
20 rental properties can and do ask for secondary forms  
21 of IDs, but our very limited options basically  
22 imprisons us and our existence in the real world.  
23 [bell] This municipal ID program would rectify some  
24 of the problems I face as I continue to live in this  
25 great city for another, 10, 20; 30 years. While so

1  
2 many of us wait for Congress to act, I hope you do  
3 pass Int. 253 now, and not just for me, but for the  
4 other immigrants who have just arrived or who have  
5 been listed as Deferred Action Program, not to  
6 mention for the entire immigrant community who every  
7 day and in every way wishes to contribute to this  
8 great city. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Next,  
10 please.

11 JASON CHANG: Good morning. My name is  
12 Jason Chang and I'm with the National Federation of  
13 Community Development Credit Unions. The Federation  
14 is an association of community development credit  
15 unions with more than 250 members across the country,  
16 serving over 2.5 million members in urban and rural  
17 settings. The Federation works to support member  
18 credit unions in their mission to serve under-served  
19 populations while complying with Know Your Customer  
20 rules and other existing regulations. Community  
21 Development Credit Unions, or CDCUs, are in a unique  
22 position in the financial sector because they work  
23 with immigrants, low- and moderate-income populations  
24 and historically under-served communities. As such,  
25 CDCUs have an extensive experience working with

1  
2 alternate forms of ID, such as the Matricula  
3 Consular. However, while some national consulates  
4 are proactive in helping their citizenry, immigrants  
5 may not always be able to obtain passports or IDs if  
6 they do not have immigration status and may be  
7 required to pay hundreds of dollars for services that  
8 they cannot necessarily afford. A municipal ID can  
9 help remove these barriers for immigrants and expand  
10 access by providing a government-issued ID that all  
11 New Yorkers can use and CDCUs and other financial  
12 institutions can accept to open accounts and provide  
13 other needed services. The Federation believes in  
14 equal access to financial products and services and  
15 therefore wholly supports the efforts to introduce  
16 municipal IDs that can help immigrants and all New  
17 Yorkers establish banking accounts. We look forward  
18 to working with the City Council and a membership to  
19 expand and maximize access to financial products and  
20 services and we thank you for the time and the  
21 opportunity to speak on this important issue.

22 LINDA SARSOUR: Okay. So thank you,  
23 Council Members for having us here today. My name is  
24 Linda Sarsour and I'm the Executive Director at the  
25 Arab American Association of New York and I'm here to

1 wholeheartedly support the creation of a New York  
2 City identification card for all New Yorkers. The  
3 key here is to ensure that this card has broad appeal  
4 to the pastor in Staten Island, the transgendered  
5 teen in Queens, successful business owner in the  
6 Bronx and the undocumented mom from Brooklyn. Any  
7 New Yorker should be proud to carry this new ID; we  
8 want to ensure and stress to the New York City  
9 Council and Mayor de Blasio that this does not become  
10 a scarlet letter. In order to avoid this we call on  
11 the New York City Council and the Mayor's Office to  
12 pool their resources to implement a robust outreach  
13 and marketing campaign that leverages the power and  
14 deep routes of ethnic and community-based  
15 organizations, chambers of commerce to reach the  
16 widest possible audience. A comprehensive media  
17 marketing campaign will also need to be a top  
18 priority and we hope the Council will commit those  
19 resources. We envision this card as the key to New  
20 York City, exploring opportunities with museums,  
21 other tourist sites, City Bike rental, libraries are  
22 just some examples of the potential of this card to  
23 appeal to every corner of New York City. We recommit  
24 to working with members of the New York City Council  
25

1  
2 and the Mayor's Office to foster the relationships  
3 needed to make this a multi-purpose ID. We believe  
4 that the aesthetics of the card are important and  
5 appealing to a broader base. Ideas around using the  
6 Statue of Liberty or other landmarks as part of  
7 making this a New York City centric functioning  
8 document that also acts as a memento of who we are  
9 and what we represent as New York City. This card is  
10 long overdue in a city like New York; I know we have  
11 a lot of support in the New York City Council and  
12 from our Speaker and Mayor; since we're gonna do it,  
13 let's do it big and let's do it right. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
15 Miss Sarsour for testifying, and thank you all for  
16 coming today to talk about your experiences of really  
17 all New Yorkers and particularly I wanna ask Mr. Yu  
18 to talk a little bit more about the relationship and  
19 something we talked earlier about, language access  
20 and how language access is such an important  
21 component and what that means to you on the ground,  
22 understanding it through different programs that  
23 you've already been engaged in?

24 JEONG MIN YU: My parents, they own a  
25 grocery store and even though they've been here like

1  
2 30 years, their English is, you know, somewhat basic...  
3 you know, my English is great 'cause I've been raised  
4 here and it's... I think the issue of language access,  
5 especially for Korean immigrants, is just so key,  
6 because some of these are international students and  
7 you know, it does take some time, especially when  
8 they come as teenagers, to learn the language  
9 basically to move about and stuff like that. I think  
10 for them and for all the Asian immigrants and, not  
11 just Asian immigrants; Latino immigrants and  
12 everybody else, that we have programs to actually  
13 benefit them and you know, even for this Deferred  
14 Action Program, which I am not a part of right now, I  
15 hope that they could actually take part in it and get  
16 their own program and even for this ID, I think that  
17 would be the right step and to just understand what  
18 it entails and to move forward. And especially for  
19 educational purposes, when going to college and  
20 getting jobs, I think that would be such a huge  
21 benefit for them and I think that's what we need to  
22 push for as well.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

24 JEONG MIN YU: Thank you.  
25

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And I have another  
3 question, [Spanish] **01:58:29**. And then, just to  
4 translate, I asked a little bit about the  
5 relationship, about her and... she talked a lot about  
6 in her testimony her relationship with her school and  
7 agencies, but really on the police side, how she  
8 could feel a little bit more secure and safe in  
9 talking to the Police Department, for example.

10 ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] **01:59:12**

11 SPANISH TRANSLATOR: So as an immigrant  
12 it's terrifying to go to a precinct and report  
13 anything because you're afraid that they're gonna  
14 arrest you or you're gonna get deported.

15 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **01:59:47**

16 ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] **01:59:49**

17 SPANISH TRANSLATOR: One time I was  
18 talking to my husband on the phone, he was a block  
19 away, and out of nowhere he stopped talking to me, I  
20 later found out that he was stopped by the police and  
21 he was questioned and he was taken in to the precinct  
22 because he did not have identification, so the next  
23 morning I had to go and look for him; it was a  
24 terrible experience because I had not... I did not know  
25 what had happened.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish]

**02:01:21.** Council Member Reynoso.

ESTHER SANCHEZ: [Spanish] **02:01:27**

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: My question is for Linda; how are you, first? Speaking of being in New York and going big, I think that's extremely important and it not being a scarlet letter; do you think... So originally in the beginning we keep speaking about who we think are gonna be the people most attracted to this card; what place do CBOs like yours have in ensuring that they can get broad support from their membership and even further than that; do you feel that you play a role outside of the City of New York's work in regards to what they need to do? What role do you think you could play in helping with the marketing?

LINDA SARSOUR: Thank you for that question and I think that's actually, for me personally, it's the critical point that we have to really clarify here. If we wanna make this broad appeal, I'm all about using existing resources, like the Human Resources Administration, but to be honest with you, let's be serious; the Human Resources Administration has a stigma behind it as an agency

1  
2 that provides services and support to low-income New  
3 Yorkers, so if we wanna appeal to the Upper West  
4 Side, if we wanna appeal to the people in, you know  
5 Greenpoint, Park Slope, you know this kind of... you  
6 know our allies and others in the community, we need  
7 to make sure that we're providing access points to  
8 people that don't wanna be part of that stigma. And  
9 the role of community-based organizations is multi-  
10 faceted. First of all, we represent organizations  
11 where many of us are multi-lingual, multi-cultural,  
12 we understand how to work with our people, and I  
13 think that that's why I'm talking about a very robust  
14 campaign, similar to that of UPK; I mean there was a  
15 lot of resources and marketing around universal pre-K  
16 and we think this is just as important if not even  
17 more important to ensure that while we're trying to  
18 get our kids into a pre-K program, that their parents  
19 are not barred from going and being part of their  
20 educational experience because of lack of documents.  
21 I think our role could be as... doing education, doing  
22 workshops, helping to be part of a committee to look  
23 at the translation materials around the marketing;  
24 there's a lot of roles for ethnic-based  
25 organizations, for the faith-based community, for the

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

financial institutions, for the credit unions, and I think the idea here is, how do we use this as a time in a new administration to build relationships with all the sectors -- government, private, nonprofit. If we can't do it on municipal IDs, then we're gonna be in trouble in the future on future initiatives. So I think that's a conversation to have about how we can ensure that this is not a scarlet letter, that it is not only attractive to the undocumented and to the homeless and to transgender and the LGBT community, but it's something that every single New Yorker -- basically, if you are a cool New Yorker and you're a real New Yorker, you're gonna have a municipal ID, and that's the kind of theme that we hope this initiative does.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Miss Sarsour and I think we can put a #coolfactor on that... on that piece of testimony. [laughter] But thank you for that, and really thank you for everyone who's testified. We're gonna move on to our next panel now, and we have [background comments] folks from other jurisdictions; I wanna call Mr. John Lugo from New Haven to the table, and we have two folks on the

1  
2 phone... [background comment] and we're gonna have John  
3 Lugo go first, or are we ready... [background comments]  
4 Great, thank you so much. We're gonna to with John  
5 Lugo first, who's here, and we'll be testifying from  
6 New Haven; this is a panel we've asked and we've  
7 compiled from other jurisdictions to give us their  
8 perspective. Thank you so much for being here, Mr.  
9 Lugo. And when you're ready you can begin.

10 JOHN LUGO: [background comment] Okay.

11 My name is John Jairo Lugo; I am the founding member  
12 of Unidad Latina en Accion, a grassroots organization  
13 created in 2002 in New Haven, Connecticut. At that  
14 time, immigrant workers came together to seek a  
15 driver license, but the bill was defeated in the  
16 Connecticut legislature. After that defeat, we  
17 decided to create a platform of policies to make New  
18 Haven a model city for the integration on new  
19 immigrants in the social fabric.

20 One of the most innovative ideas was the  
21 creation of the municipal ID card. The reasons were  
22 clear, we did not have a driver license, but we still  
23 need the ID. Many of our members were detained by  
24 the police for simple traffic violations or the  
25 police report refused to release them for several

1  
2 days because they could not produce an ID. Without  
3 an ID, many immigrants could not open bank accounts  
4 and they were targeted by criminals as walking ATMs  
5 because they carry cash. In 2006 one of our members,  
6 Manuel Santiago Vasquez was murdered during a robbery  
7 and we could no longer stay silent. We created  
8 alliances with other organizations in the city, we  
9 went to Junta for Progressive Action; the Director,  
10 Kica Matos agreed to work with us in this platform.  
11 We met with the Mayor, John DeStefano, and he was  
12 open to the idea; he recruited the Yale Law School  
13 for the legal research. They found the municipal ID  
14 could not contra... doesn't contradict the federal or  
15 state law. Mayor DeStefano convinced different  
16 sectors of the city to support this project. The  
17 Board of Aldermen held several public hearings and  
18 people from different neighborhoods came in support  
19 of the proposal, others questioned the idea [sic]  
20 anti-immigrant and neo-Nazi groups came from outside  
21 of New Haven to attack the city; they sent hate  
22 emails and death threats to the city officials.  
23 These groups tried to rally the African American  
24 community against the immigrant community, they  
25 passed out flyers saying that immigrants were the

1  
2 cause of African American inequality [bell]; however,  
3 African Americans saw the immigrants were suffering  
4 the same attacks as they have suffered in the past  
5 and they came out in support of the ID card; that's  
6 how the Board of Aldermen ended voting 25-1 in favor  
7 of the ID card, becoming the first city in the nation  
8 to create this initiative. Two days later, Federal  
9 Immigration agents came to the city of New Haven and  
10 raided the homes of immigrants and detained 29  
11 people. We later confirmed through a lawsuit that  
12 this ICE raid was an act of retaliation against the  
13 city. Days after the raid diverse sectors of the  
14 city marched to denounce the raids -- immigrants,  
15 African-Americans, Puerto Ricans, Jews, people of  
16 faith and city officials -- they also raised the  
17 money to free all these brothers and sisters who were  
18 detained. A few weeks later, when New Haven began to  
19 issue the ID card, thousands got online and get the  
20 document; they were not just Latinos, because people  
21 saw the ID card as a way to integrate a society that  
22 was segregated and divided. Since then, more than  
23 10,000 people have applied for the ID.

24 The advantages are clear, many people can  
25 now open bank accounts, so they are not targeted by

1  
2 criminals. The relationship with the police has  
3 improved because now we are citizens of the city of  
4 New Haven. People coming out from jail who had no  
5 documents can apply for the ID card and now they can  
6 integrate into the social fabric. High school  
7 students, now they have an ID. We're one city,  
8 united we stand, divided we fall. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Mr. Lugo  
10 for that testimony and so much of what you're talking  
11 about is alive and well in New York City and is at  
12 the base of what we're trying to do here, so thank  
13 you so much for your testimony. What we have...  
14 [background comment] And so, thank you so much.  
15 We're gonna go... you can stay here at the table; we're  
16 gonna... we might have some questions for you. We have  
17 Mr. Eric Mar?

18 ERIC MAR: Yes it is.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Mr. Mar, thank  
20 you. Can you please identify yourself; we're gonna  
21 give you a couple minutes for testimony; I know  
22 you're calling from San Francisco.

23 ERIC MAR: Yes; my name's Eric Mar; it's  
24 M A R; I'm a member of our Board of Supervisors in  
25 San Francisco; I represent District 1, which is Ocean

1 Beach and Golden Gate Park, for those New Yorkers  
2 that don't know where it is. [sirens] I've been on  
3 our Board of Supervisors since 2009, when we first  
4 implemented our San Francisco municipal ID card; I am  
5 one of 11 members of our Board of Supervisors. Way  
6 back in 2007, when many other parts of the country  
7 were facing immigration raids, ICE raids, San  
8 Francisco had a group of grassroots, mostly Latino,  
9 immigrant organizations that came together to discuss  
10 the need for bringing people out of the shadows,  
11 giving dignity and creating more public safety for  
12 the immigrant communities; they brought this issue to  
13 the Board of Supervisors; Supervisor Tom Ammiano, at  
14 the time, he's now a State Assemblyman, took the  
15 legislation with others on our Board; they strongly  
16 championed it; we planned it for quite a while, about  
17 a year-and-a-half. Part of the challenge was, our  
18 mayor at the time, Gavin Newsom, who's now our  
19 Lieutenant Governor, was more lukewarm on the issue,  
20 but our Board of Supervisors and a grassroots  
21 coalition from the immigrant community pushed hard  
22 and they really tried to frame it as, not just for  
23 immigrants or undocumented people, but for homeless  
24 people and low-income youth or seniors that needed a  
25

1 sense of legitimacy and also to be able to talk with  
2 the police to report crime, so it was about framing  
3 it for increasing civic engagement for vulnerable  
4 populations, not just for immigrants. We implemented  
5 it in January of 2009; it really took a strong push  
6 from our immigrant community organizations through a  
7 network called The San Francisco Immigrant Legal and  
8 Education Network, or SFILEN, and I think some of the  
9 challenges at the time also were broad public  
10 education, countering the media's framing in an  
11 environment in 2008 [bell] and 2007 of anti-immigrant  
12 sentiment, but to frame it as, it's about public  
13 safety for immigrant communities and for everyone,  
14 and it was about better access to service for  
15 vulnerable populations as well. We have about 40,000  
16 ID cards right now; I... or no, 20... 20,000 right now in  
17 our City of 800,000 people; it's been about 4,000 per  
18 year and they're heavily from the Latino community,  
19 though it's a diverse population of people that have  
20 ID cards. It cost us about \$828,000 to set it up in  
21 the first year and part of that was buying the  
22 expensive machines that were laser-etching that could  
23 create a document that could prevent fraud, and I  
24 think there have been no incidents of fraud reported  
25

1  
2 in San Francisco, so the fear of easy illegal  
3 activity are not true, there's no incidents of fraud  
4 within our city that we know of. The card...  
5 [interpose, crosstalk]

6 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Supervisor Mar...

7 ERIC MAR: also costs \$15 per person, but  
8 if you're low-income and you could verify that, it's  
9 \$5.00 per card and we do not... or, if used for many  
10 services like New Haven and other places, as a step  
11 towards opening up a checking account or a banking  
12 account with our Bank on San Francisco, which other  
13 cities use as well, there are 40-50 businesses that  
14 allow discounts or other benefits from using the card  
15 and I think there's still a broad community of  
16 support from the nonprofits and community-based  
17 organizations that support this in addition to our  
18 whole city government, so all departments are  
19 supposed to acknowledge this card. There were  
20 initial challenges with the police department that,  
21 [background comment] in speaking one of our police  
22 commissioners in San Francisco, Angela Chan, who  
23 served really with a focus on protecting the  
24 immigrant communities on the Police Commission, but  
25 she said that at different times police would

1  
2 confiscate the card from someone or they wouldn't  
3 know what it is, so we've had to do a lot of broad  
4 education with our police department, with our police  
5 chief and others to make sure that the law is  
6 followed in San Francisco and that the card is used  
7 as a key identification purpose whenever somebody  
8 wants to report crime or even if you get in a fender-  
9 bender. There are some challenges right now also  
10 when a car is impounded and somebody needs to get  
11 their car back as well. But I think overall, for  
12 increasing public safety, expanding access to low-  
13 income and immigrant people to services, from health  
14 care to other types of services in the city, that  
15 it's been a wonderful addition to our city and at a  
16 fairly low cost to our city, but really expanding  
17 civic engagement and bringing people out of the  
18 shadows so that they have legitimacy and a feeling of  
19 unity in being a San Franciscan.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
21 for that testimony. And we're gonna keep you on the  
22 phone for a couple minutes; we have a couple  
23 questions for you; do you have a couple more minutes?

24 ERIC MAR: Yes I do.  
25

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: So my first  
3 question is, in really understanding the issue of  
4 privacy, how has San Francisco ensured privacy for  
5 your residents throughout this program?

6 ERIC MAR: Yeah, I think that's a great  
7 question. I think for these municipal ID cards, the  
8 verification first of using of the documents to show  
9 that you are who you are and that you have resided in  
10 San Francisco for over 15 days has been a challenge;  
11 we've... actually, before I get to privacy, we've shown  
12 some flexibility in how to document that you live in  
13 San Francisco and you are who you are; we also allow  
14 nonprofit organizations, legitimate nonprofit  
15 organizations, to write a letter to verify that a  
16 person is who they are and has been living here for a  
17 period of time to show residency. So that's another  
18 flexibility, because often people weren't able to  
19 produce the documents that our County Clerk that  
20 verifies everything could use. But none of the  
21 information that you show for validity is kept by our  
22 County Clerk, so that's a key part of, I think  
23 protecting privacy. Also, even Supervisor Ammiano at  
24 the time went through the line to get his municipal  
25 ID, and he kinda jokes about it in some ways as well;

1  
2 again, he's a State Assemblyman now, but even he  
3 could not provide, when we first implemented it in  
4 January of 2009, enough evidence to show that he was  
5 a resident and who he was. So we've had to deal with  
6 the challenges of verification, but we've been  
7 flexible. And I think the challenges in setting this  
8 up were protecting people's privacy and I know our  
9 current Mayor Ed Lee, who was a city administrator at  
10 the time, and our police department and many  
11 departments really developed a system that is  
12 protecting the privacy of especially undocumented  
13 people so that no information is reported to the  
14 Department of Homeland Security or ICE and that  
15 people feel absolutely secure that they could provide  
16 the information to get the ID card.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.  
18 There's two quick questions and then... actually, three  
19 quick questions, if we can keep them brief; is the  
20 confirmation that the SFPD was not part of the  
21 creation and implementation of the card program; is  
22 that right?

23 ERIC MAR: Actually, I'm not sure. I  
24 know that our Police Chief, Heather Fong at the time,  
25 there were some challenges in the beginning, but

1  
2 there is a departmental memo from the police chief to  
3 the department after long meetings with the city  
4 leadership so that the police know that they're  
5 supposed to comply with and to accept the use of the  
6 card. I know there are some exceptions that the... if  
7 the police reasonably see that there might be fraud  
8 involved, but again, there's been on incidents of  
9 fraud; they don't have to accept the ID card. But I  
10 think in the early days there were some police  
11 officers that were confiscating ID cards, but I think  
12 with broader education from our Immigrant Legal  
13 Education Network and work with the police that we've  
14 cleared up a lot of that confusion about the use of  
15 the card. But we'll try to get a copy of the  
16 directive from the police chief to the department on  
17 how the card is supposed to be accepted by the police  
18 as a department.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. And  
20 the next question is about how San Francisco allows a  
21 designation of gender on the municipal IDs?

22 ERIC MAR: So San Francisco has a strong  
23 tradition of equal rights for everyone, including  
24 transgendered people; our card does not designate  
25 gender at all, and I think it was specific to be very

1  
2 inclusive to use the card so that transgender people  
3 didn't have to be in a situation of having the card  
4 questioned by people. So I think that was a key part  
5 of our promotion of dignity and civil rights for  
6 everyone.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. And we  
8 have one question from Council Member Cabrera.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you, Mr.  
10 Chair. My question is in reference -- I just wanna  
11 understand it right -- it is about \$50, the cost per  
12 card in the economy of scale; is it \$50 per person  
13 and how many people again do you have in San  
14 Francisco that are using the ID?

15 ERIC MAR: Thank you. It's not \$50; it's  
16 \$15, one, five... [interpose]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Okay.

18 ERIC MAR: \$15. San Francisco has about  
19 800,000 people, though our population doubles or  
20 triples during the workday, with many people coming  
21 into our city, and there are 20,000 cards issued,  
22 about 4,000 per year and the card is... it lasts for  
23 two years and then you have to renew the card.

24

25

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: So that's... just  
3 to be clear, the \$15 is what people pay or is \$15 the  
4 cost... is your cost as a city?

5 ERIC MAR: It costs the person \$15. And  
6 what... is there a cost to the city at all? How much  
7 you're spending [interpose] or did you RFP this out  
8 and there's a private entity involved in this? How  
9 is that working out?

10 ERIC MAR: No, it's our City Clerk's  
11 Office that administers it. I think it costs roughly  
12 the amount that it brings in, so it costs us about  
13 \$200,000 a year and I think the fees are roughly paid  
14 for by that \$15 fee. And again, there are \$5.00,  
15 low-income cards issued and then, there are many  
16 homeless people in the city that utilize the card and  
17 the fee is waived if you could verify that you are  
18 homeless as well. So my understanding is there are  
19 hundreds of cards that are for homeless people that  
20 provide dignity and bringing them out of the shadows  
21 as well.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Thank you so  
23 much.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Our next and final  
25 question is from Council Member Reynoso.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: Hi. I just  
3 wanted to ask if there's any advice you would give us  
4 to expand on participation? You said 20,000 folks  
5 have it out of 800,000; that seems like a low number;  
6 what would you have done different to allow for that  
7 number to be larger?

8 ERIC MAR: I think that's a great  
9 question. I think one of the challenges, when we  
10 first implemented, was an anti-immigrant sentiment  
11 and a budget crisis that was going on. I think  
12 funding, not only your city's immigrant commission;  
13 we have an Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant  
14 Affairs with a director and staff; we have an  
15 Immigrant Rights Commission; we have a network of  
16 immigrant rights organizations. I used to be the  
17 Director of our Immigrant Rights Coalition in the  
18 city in the 90s, but we have a SFILEN network that...  
19 our city does some funding for outreach for language  
20 access and lots of other needs and services, but I  
21 think cities' funding capacity in immigrant  
22 communities with the nonprofit organizations and  
23 raising awareness early on is important. I think a  
24 big blitz with media to frame it not just for  
25 immigrants but for everyone, to improve public safety

1  
2 and civic engagement is really critical. I think at  
3 the time we implemented ours there was an anti-  
4 immigrant hysteria; we had minutemen, right-wing,  
5 anti-immigrant minutemen coming to protest at city  
6 hall, but it was a climate that was different than  
7 what you have. We also had a mayor that was not that  
8 supportive, Gavin Newsom, and immigrant communities  
9 had to organize like crazy to push it forward with  
10 our support of city council I think the vote was  
11 10-1 at our city council to support it, so there was  
12 near unanimous support. But having Mayor de Blasio  
13 and your City Council Chairman and Councilman Dromm  
14 and Lander and Menchaca and so many others of you  
15 supporting it I think is a big, big plus for you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you  
17 Supervisor Mar, and thank you for your time and we  
18 look forward to continuing to work with you and  
19 follow up on some of the things we brought up during  
20 this testimony. Thank you and we'll talk to you  
21 soon.

22 ERIC MAR: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Okay.

24 ERIC MAR: Bye.  
25

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. And  
3 Mr. Lugo -- Does anyone have any questions for  
4 Mr. Lugo? I mean I don't know if there's anything  
5 that you've heard, but clearly there's [bell] a  
6 kinda... a over-arching theme to the way that all these  
7 programs have kind of been rooted and it's just great  
8 to hear from you and New Haven as the first; it was  
9 not easy and now we're here in New York, so just  
10 thank you so much for your testimony today.

11 JOHN LUGO: Thank you very much.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And so we're gonna  
13 call up our next panel, Jesus Castellanos, Make the  
14 Road, a youth member, Arely Gonzalez, Juan Carlos  
15 Gomez, and Carlos Elias Vasquez Zambrano [sp?]. If  
16 we can have you to the table, please. Thank you so  
17 much. [background comments] And the panel after  
18 that, just so you could be ready for this next panel,  
19 is Diana Reyna, Brooklyn Deputy Borough President,  
20 Jeff Foreman from the Care for the Homeless, Jessica  
21 Orozco, Hispanic Federation, and then Jojo Annobil  
22 from Legal Aid Society, [background comment] the  
23 panel after this. [background comment] [Spanish]

24 **02:25:25.**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

127

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:25:31...**

[background comments]

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: My name is Arely Gonzalez and I am from... [interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Could you get him a chair, please?

ARELY GONZALEZ: Make the Road.

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: Make the Road New York.

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:25:56**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: I know that the City entirely is emotional about the proposal from the Mayor...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:08**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: the other forces are pushing for this legislation...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:19**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: thanks to the leadership of Pechaco [sp?]?

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:30**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: thanks... thank god... I mean, thanks to the leadership of Mr. Pechaco, the leadership...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:40**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: for the community,  
the immigrant communities and the transgender  
communities...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:50**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: this initiative is  
very important.

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:26:54**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: We wanna count on a  
form of identification that show who we are...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:27:04**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: that we are  
residents of the State of New York.

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:27:11**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: Since we know it's  
difficult, like me, undocumented, having obtaining a  
piece of identification...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:27:23**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: and a lot of us,  
it's been difficult for us to obtain the ID and come  
out of the shadow.

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:27:38**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: We're scared that  
sometimes when we walk outside that we're gonna walk  
to... talk to police officers or other people...

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:27:53**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: a part of the  
community of EBT... [background comment] [Spanish]

**02:28:02**

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:28:05**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: us, like transgender  
women, we don't identify with the ID that... identify...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:28:21**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: like our  
corresponding gender and our names...

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:28:28**

[bell]

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: and it would also  
reduce the amount of arrests due to not having ID.

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:28:38**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: The implementation  
of... [Spanish] **02:28:44?**

ARELY GONZALEZ: [Spanish] **02:28:45**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: so we could have...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:28:48**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: our names and our  
preferred genders...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:28:52**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: will open the doors  
to our lives...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:28:57**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: like people who will  
form part of the community..

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:03**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: like members of the  
community of EBT, I mean [Spanish] **02:29:09..**

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:10**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: this initiative is  
very important for us.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:15**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: Like me, as a  
transgender woman...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:21**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: people make fun of  
us when the police stop us...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:29**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: to ask for ID.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:32**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: they tell us that we  
are not women...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:37**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: they make fun of us...

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:40**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: sometimes I don't carry an ID that has my gender and my date of birth...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:49**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: because I am ashamed that... I am embarrassed that maybe someone might see it.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:29:58**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: This ID, this form of ID will open our lives much easier...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:10**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: we would have something that we can show to the police officers who we are...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:20**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: and we could have confidence...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:23**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: we would feel like we are more a part of the city...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:28**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: and would do it strongly.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:32**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: The ID has to not involve our identity of our gender...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:43**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: if it's not on the ID, it wouldn't be useful for me or other individuals who are transgender.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:30:55**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: For other people...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:03**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: For all those reasons...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:06**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: I believe that the municipal ID...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:10**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: to have the people to sign...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:14**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: the gender that they have...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:18**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: would be a big help.

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:21**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

133

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: It would help us  
create a more security city...

ARELY GONZALEZ: **02:31:28**

SPANISH TRANSLATOR: and just with  
results. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: **02:31:34**

[background comments]

JESUS CASTELLANOS: [Spanish] **02:32:05**

[interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **02:34:40**

So can we... We're gonna go through the whole panel  
really quick... **02:34:48**. Okay. [background comments]  
Yeah, we're... let's just go through the whole panel,  
then we can go back and... and do a quick translation.  
Okay. [background comments]

JUAN CARLOS GOMEZ: Good afternoon...

[interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: **02:35:09**

JUAN CARLOS GOMEZ: Okay. Yeah. Good  
morning... or good afternoon... [interpose]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: **02:35:21**

JUAN CARLOS GOMEZ: Okay. Okay. Thank  
you. Good afternoon members of the Commission of the  
Immigration and everyone attending to this meeting.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

My name is Juan Carlos Gomez, member of the Make the Road New York and today I want to share with you only small part of my personal history. In this point I want to switch to Spanish for be more clear.

[Spanish] **02:35:51** [bell]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Gracias.

CARLOS VASQUEZ: [Spanish] **02:37:50**

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: [Spanish] **02:39:00**

we're not gonna translate for this panel. We have another public hearing in less than an hour, so we wanna make sure everyone that wants to talk about their experience gets to do that; we're gonna change the time to one minute per testimonial. [Spanish]

**02:39:21.**

Can we have the next panel that I called earlier, Jojo Annobil, Jessica Orozco, Jeff Foreman, and then our Brooklyn Deputy Borough President, Diana Reyna please? [laugh] Thank you. Okay. And the next panel after that is Miss Glennda Testone, Elana Redfield, Lynly Edgars... Egyes, from the Sex Workers Project, and Mr. Noah Lewis, from the Transgender Legal Defense and Education Fund; they'll be testifying next. We're gonna try to speed through this; I'm sorry for the speed-through, but we have

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

another really great, important public hearing on Vision Zero, so thanks so much for your appreciation and your consideration.

DIANA REYNA: Turn on...

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: The mic is on? Thank you so much. [background comment] I'll stop you at one minute.

JOJO ANNOBIL: Sure, no problem. [laugh] So my name is Jojo Annobil and I'm the attorney in charge of The Legal Aid Society's Immigration Law Unit. Thank you so much for giving us an opportunity to testify today.

We basically agree with a lot of the comments and suggestions made here today; one of the things that we just wanted to highlight is the fact that we all talk about having an identify document which would... this would make a lot of undocumented immigrants be able to get an identity document, but also improving public safety; it will encourage people to feel much more comfortable reporting crimes, but it's a two-way street. If the Police Department is not going to accept these municipal cards as identity documents, then we are going to run into the same whole problem of for simple, non-

1  
2 criminal offenses like riding a bike on the sidewalk,  
3 open container of alcohol, all these are non-criminal  
4 offenses; however, it allows the Police Department,  
5 [bell] if you don't have an ID, to run your  
6 fingerprint; once they run your fingerprint you are  
7 basically put into a pipeline. [interpose]

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

9 JOJO ANNOBIL: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. And  
11 that's been a consistent theme in conversation.

12 JOJO ANNOBIL: Okay.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Next. Thank you.

14 JEFF FOREMAN: Chair Menchaca and members  
15 of the Committee, thanks for the opportunity to  
16 testify; I'm Jeff Foreman, the Policy Director for  
17 Care for the Homeless.

18 If this legislation did nothing more than  
19 document undocumented people, it would be a visionary  
20 important piece of legislation that we would be very  
21 happy to enthusiastically support, but it actually  
22 does far more than that, it promises to help people  
23 who have lost documents, people who have misplaced  
24 documents and certainly help many people who are  
25 homeless, like our clients. For all the people that

1  
2 a municipal ID program offers relief, why wouldn't we  
3 support our neighbors in need? And this bill wisely  
4 also requires not just that IDs be appropriately  
5 issued, but that they be promoted to include things  
6 like public and private institutions and banking that  
7 many poor people desperately need and do not have  
8 access to... [bell] Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
10 for that support as well. How do you say your last  
11 name?

12 JESSICA OROZCO: Orozco.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Orozco. Okay,  
14 sorry; I... I couldn't read it. [crosstalk]

15 JESSICA OROZCO: Yes, right; my  
16 handwriting...

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: I'm sorry about  
18 that.

19 JESSICA OROZCO: It's okay.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Go  
21 ahead.

22 JESSICA OROZCO: So good afternoon; my  
23 name is Jessica Orozco and I'm the Director of  
24 Immigration and Civic Engagement at the Hispanic  
25

1  
2 Federation; thank you for this opportunity to  
3 testify.

4           Hispanic Federation is a premier Latino  
5 membership organization in the nation and was founded  
6 to address the many inequities confronting Latinos  
7 and the nonprofits that serve them. Our member  
8 agencies are located within the heart of Latino  
9 communities throughout the City and witness the  
10 difficulty New Yorkers encounter when attempting to  
11 obtain a widely-accepted photo ID. With member  
12 agencies like Spanish-speaking Elderly Council and  
13 Institute for the Puerto Rico Elderly, which provide  
14 access to essential senior services, we see how  
15 difficult it is for the City's elderly to acquire a  
16 photo ID. For example, in New York for a U.S.-born  
17 citizen to obtain a non-driver ID card, they must  
18 show their birth certificate, passport or military  
19 photo ID to prove date of birth. Seniors living in  
20 the City may have been born at home and never  
21 obtained a birth certificate or their certificate may  
22 have been lost or destroyed over the decades.  
23 Additionally, many elderly in New York City may have  
24 disabilities that prevent them from getting to the  
25

1  
2 DMV or a few agencies that may assist them in getting  
3 these documents reissued. [bell]

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you again.

5 JESSICA OROZCO: And I provided written  
6 testimony.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Yeah. Thank you  
8 so much for your written testimony. And our... someone  
9 that's not a stranger to this amazing body, our great  
10 Deputy Borough President from Brooklyn, Diana Reyna.

11 DIANA REYNA: Thank you so much. Good  
12 afternoon, Chairman Menchaca and Committee staff; I  
13 want to just, for the sake of time, introduce my  
14 Brooklyn Borough President, Eric Adams, who is not  
15 here today and on his behalf, as his Deputy, I am  
16 testifying in support of what would be Int. 253,  
17 Municipal IDs. I just wanted to thank the Speaker,  
18 Melissa Mark-Viverito for her staunch support on this  
19 proposal and Mayor de Blasio for his unwavering  
20 leadership to making this program a reality, along  
21 with the Council; your leadership here is avid and  
22 making sure that this continues to be at the  
23 forefront of our agenda in government.

24 Each day the gates of New York City civic  
25 life are open for those who can prove their identity

1  
2 and display a photo ID; lacking an ID affects the  
3 countless numbers of members of New York City's  
4 immigrant communities, the growing number of homeless  
5 people in our City, children in the foster care  
6 system, the elderly, formerly incarcerated  
7 individuals, and those who are disabled, mentally ill  
8 or from the LGBTQ communities. Our communities grow  
9 stronger and our city becomes one [bell] only when  
10 all our neighbors can enjoy the multitude of  
11 opportunities. I wanted to just express that an ID  
12 is not worth the plastic it is printed on unless we  
13 have the public's trust [background comment] and I  
14 believe that we in Borough Hall, along with what  
15 would be your leadership and the Mayor, to be able to  
16 work together to provide what would be IDs being  
17 processed at the center of our borough's civic  
18 universe in Brooklyn Borough Hall, [background  
19 comment] and so we want to welcome the opportunity to  
20 work with you, we agree with the merits behind this  
21 bill, but we also wanna make sure that the access to  
22 the processing is one that would garner a lot of  
23 synthesizing [background comment] between agencies  
24 and working together to making sure that the  
25 obstacles are reduced, that the distance is shorter

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

and that the economic barriers are removed. Thank you so much. [crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And that... that is... that is a priority of this City Council. So thank you so much for... [crosstalk]

DIANA REYNA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: echoing it, and I do have to say that on Twitter I did see that the Borough President would welcome Borough Hall to be a place where we could have application processes too, so I just wanna acknowledge that.

DIANA REYNA: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much for this panel. The next panel, if you can come up as I called your name last time, Elana Redfield, Miss Glenda Testone, Lynly Egyes -- please correct me in your pronunciation of your name -- and Noah Lewis. [background comments] Okay. We'll start on this end, please. Identify yourself; thank you so much. Stick to the one minute. Thank you. Actually, the red button. [crosstalk]

ELANA REDFIELD: the button. My name is Elana Redfield and I'm speaking today on behalf of the Sylvia Rivera Law Project and also the Peter

1  
2 Cicchino Youth Project. So in my short time today I  
3 want to emphasize how critical it is that the Council  
4 and the Mayor's Office make these IDs gender-  
5 affirming. It's an essential component of reducing  
6 discrimination; one study found 40 percent of  
7 respondents experienced harassment because their ID  
8 did not match their gender presentation. In order to  
9 make the ID accessible to the most vulnerable people,  
10 I must emphasize the critical importance of gender  
11 self-determination; no medical evidence should be  
12 required. Why is this important? First, every  
13 individual is the best expert on their own internal  
14 sense of gender, but secondly, many transgender  
15 people do not have access to the medical treatments,  
16 so providing a doctor's letter may be hard or  
17 impossible. Even finding a doctor or affording  
18 medical care can be a challenge for low-income trans  
19 people, especially considering that New York State  
20 Medicaid does not cover transgender health care. So  
21 this leave many people without the option of  
22 obtaining IDs. And by obtaining an ID that affirms  
23 their gender accurately, [bell] trans people can  
24 reduce and in some cases eliminate the shame and  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

humiliation and harassment of using an ID that doesn't match their gender.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

NOAH LEWIS: I'm Noah Lewis, Staff Attorney with Transgender Legal Defense and Education Fund and I echo Elana Redfield's comments wholeheartedly. Through our name change project we've helped hundreds of transgender New Yorkers change their name and we understand the problems that they do have accessing doctors letters to get their gender record changed and I would emphasize also that New York already recognizes self-designation with regards to access to homeless shelters, people can choose for themselves which shelter best fits them; they are the best determiners of whether they are male or female and the New York City Human Rights Law already makes it unlawful to ask for ID when accessing sex-specific facilities, like restrooms, so people are already able to use the facilities that match and having ID that matches will just help when they are unlawfully confronted for using those facilities. Thank you.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for  
3 that, and well aware of the name change project and  
4 thank you so much for that.

5 LYNLY EGYES: Hi, my name is Lynly Egyes;  
6 I'm an attorney at the Sex Workers Project...  
7 [interpose]

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you speak  
9 closer to the mic; pull it closer to you?

10 LYNLY EGYES: Sure.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: You can pull it  
12 closer to you. Yeah.

13 LYNLY EGYES: I'm an attorney at the Sex  
14 Workers Project at the Urban Justice Center; one of  
15 the groups that I wanna talk about today that will be  
16 impacted by this legislation is victims of  
17 trafficking. The best way to explain how this will  
18 impact victims of trafficking is to tell you about  
19 two of my clients. Rebecca was brought into the  
20 United States by a very powerful family, she worked  
21 as a nanny, but upon arrival her entire situation  
22 changed; she was forced to work up to 20 hours a day  
23 without any pay, she was deprived of food, sleep and  
24 subjected to sexual and physical abuse; immediately  
25 her trafficker took away her passport; when she was

1  
2 able to finally escape, she had to leave her passport  
3 behind. Luckily she found her way to my office with  
4 her birth certificate in hand, when I suggested that  
5 we go and get a new passport for her, she said her  
6 traffickers would find her, which they would have.  
7 And so she spent all of this time living without ID,  
8 which made her fearful to even walk on the street...  
9 [bell] I guess I'm out of time to tell you about my  
10 other clients, but this is really important for  
11 victims of trafficking to be able to report crimes.  
12 So many of my clients actually choose not to report  
13 crimes to law enforcement because they don't have  
14 proper identification, especially my clients who are  
15 transgender, walking into any type of law enforcement  
16 office [background comment] they basically choose not  
17 to because of the fact that they don't have  
18 identification that matches their gender.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.  
20 And again, all this testimony is gonna be brought in;  
21 we're gonna analyze every single piece of it. Miss  
22 Testone.

23 GLENNDA TESTONE: Good morning, my name  
24 is Glenda Testone; I'm the Executive Director of the  
25 New York City Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender

1  
2 Community Center; thank you for allowing me to  
3 testify today. The Center sees 6,000 unique  
4 individuals a week from all over the City and the  
5 number one thing that we see firsthand is the power  
6 that this proposed legislation has to impact numerous  
7 New Yorkers, including many of the LGBT community.

8           In particular I wanna talk today about  
9 LGBT youth, immigrants and transgender people.  
10 Transgender New Yorkers face unrelenting  
11 discrimination and harassment and are placed at the  
12 highest risk; they tell us every day about the  
13 challenges that they face trying to obtain the most  
14 basic but vital identification. This municipal ID  
15 will allow transgender people to accurately self-  
16 identify their gender; it's welcome, vital and  
17 overdue. LGBT youth are over-represented among the  
18 homeless population in New York City and many young  
19 people are forced to run away from their homes  
20 without any identification. [bell] LGBT immigrants  
21 also face increased barriers to employment, along  
22 with increased stigmatization and violence when they  
23 don't have accurate ID documents that record their  
24 legal status. The Center wholeheartedly supports  
25 this municipal identification card as a powerful tool

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

to help some of the most vulnerable New Yorkers step out of the shadows, take better care of themselves and help eliminate the two New York's that we do have, the ones with [background comment] ID and the ones without, and I for one wanna say I look forward to getting my municipal ID.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Great.

GLENNDA TESTONE: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much for that enthusiastic support. And thank you so much for this panel [background comment] and for... make sure that we have your testimony as well.

Next panel, Annie Wang, Mark Noferi, Annie... Annie Wang, from the American Immigration Lawyers Association New York Chapter, and Mizue [background comment] Aizeki, Mizue Aizeki. Thank you so much. And the panel after that, we're gonna have Tawney Mill, Samuel Palmer-Simon, Lucia Gomez, and Gabriela Sandoval Requena. I hope I said those names correctly. And if we can start [background comments] now, maybe with Mizue.

MIZUE AIZEKI: Sure. Thank you very much for your time; I know you've taken a lot of time to listen to all our concerns. My name is Mizue Aizeki;

1  
2 I'm with the Immigrant Defense Project and just to  
3 really quickly summarize, I think that we all  
4 understand that one of the primary ways someone can  
5 get deported nowadays is by interaction with the  
6 police and so to emphasize the importance, both of  
7 the NYPD accepting this ID but not sacrificing the  
8 very critical concerns about privacy, right, data-  
9 sharing of information, it's a very big concern for  
10 immigrant communities as well as the self-designated  
11 gender; we think that people need to feel like they  
12 own this idea and they're proud to have it. And the  
13 other piece I just wanna alert as well; you know,  
14 when we do our Know Your Rights trainings in the  
15 community, having an ID that the police accept is  
16 really critical; for many immigrants we also, in  
17 terms of, you know, maybe preventing arrests or  
18 deescalating, we wanna be clear to people that that's  
19 not gonna prevent your arrest and once you get  
20 brought into the precinct your risk of deportation is  
21 equally as strong until we have a very robust  
22 detainer policy in New York City. So thank you very  
23 much [bell] for your time.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you very  
25 much for that enthusiastic support again. And I

1  
2 wanted to remind everyone, if we can keep it quiet in  
3 the chambers please so we can hear the testimony;  
4 it's a real short testimony, but very powerful. Can  
5 we have the next person? Thank you.

6 MARK NOFERI: Thank you Council Member,  
7 I'm Mark Noferi of the Center for Migration Studies  
8 think tank and the New York City Bar Association.

9 Two clarifying points: (1) on implement..  
10 [interpose]

11 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you talk into  
12 the mic closer?

13 MARK NOFERI: Sure.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Pull it closer to  
15 you.

16 MARK NOFERI: (1) on implementation --  
17 the Council may want to amend this legislation to  
18 clarify the operational responsibilities here so that  
19 this program is ensconced beyond this  
20 administration's four years [background comments] --  
21 this is on Page 4 and 5 of my testimony and San  
22 Francisco may be a good example here. The San  
23 Francisco legislation explicitly directs  
24 administration by the Clerk in explicit consultation  
25 with the Immigrant Rights Office, under the explicit

1 supervision of the City Administrator. Similar here,  
2 New York could explicitly direct administration by  
3 the Clerk or HRA or the boroughs, but with an  
4 explicit role for MOIA and Commissioner Agarwal and  
5 an explicit role for the Office of Operations,  
6 although the Office of Operations does innovative  
7 work, they don't have the capacity to process  
8 potentially 200,000 applications, as they mentioned.  
9 Additionally, the San Francisco legislation also  
10 gives the Immigrant Affairs Office an explicit role  
11 in coordinating with city agencies to promote the  
12 card and develop multiple uses for it; (2) on  
13 confidentiality -- we support Section 3.136, but the  
14 Council could amend it to specifically direct  
15 regulations to clarify the outstanding issues, and  
16 there are several. For example, whether immigration  
17 courts could subpoena ID card records in deportation  
18 proceedings, whether these records are exempt under  
19 the Freedom of Information Act; whether the City has  
20 an obligation to disclose names, if not the records.  
21 The San Francisco legislation specifically exempts  
22 names as well as records; how long the city will keep  
23 these records. All of these might be addressed by  
24 regulations to clarify; other parts of the  
25

1  
2 legislation specifically provide for regulations and  
3 Section 3.136 could as well. Thank you very much.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Mark for  
5 that. And I think you hit some [bell] big points  
6 that are on the table right now in discussion, so  
7 we'll be in touch.

8 ANNIE WANG: Good afternoon... [interpose]

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you make sure  
10 that the button is pressed?

11 ANNIE WANG: How's that?

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: That's perfect.  
13 Thank you so much.

14 ANNIE WANG: Thank you. I'm Annie Wang,  
15 Co-Chair of the Comprehensive Immigration Reform  
16 Committee of the New York Chapter of the American  
17 Immigration Lawyers Association. I don't want to add  
18 to the eloquent testimony already given about the  
19 need for an accessible and attractive ID card; I do  
20 wanna mention that with regard to undocumented  
21 immigrants who would benefit from this card, that  
22 there is a unique challenge faced by undocumented  
23 youths who were brought to this country at a young  
24 age. Even though many of these youths would qualify  
25 for deferred action for childhood arrivals, many of

1  
2 these undocumented youths who should qualify for DACA  
3 have a very difficult time proving that they have  
4 been continuously present in the U.S. In addition,  
5 if Congress were to pass immigration reform, [bell]  
6 it's likely that any future legislation will require  
7 similar evidence of continuous presence in the U.S.  
8 Thank you for [background comment] allowing me to  
9 contribute to this discussion.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Well thank you for  
11 much for contributing and again, we all wait for that  
12 final federal moment of immigration reform that we've  
13 all been fighting for. Thank you so much.

14 [background comments]

15 Next panel please, Miss Gabriela Sandoval  
16 Requena from the Coalition for the Homeless -- please  
17 correct me there if I did not read it correctly --  
18 Lucia Gomez from La Fuente, Samuel Palmer-Simon and  
19 Tawney Mill. [background comments] Are the rest of  
20 you... anybody else here on this list? Okay, we're  
21 gonna move on... we're gonna add to this panel,  
22 [background comment] Nancy Magitzgar or Mogador from  
23 Brooklyn, Rev. Getulio Cruz, Rev. Cruz, Manhattan  
24 Together, Rogers from Picture the Homeless.

25 [background comments] Come on up. [background

1  
2 comment] Okay, great; thank you so much. And  
3 Rogers, can you begin and remember, one minute, if  
4 you can end promptly. And you can begin, thank you  
5 so much.

6 OWEN ROGERS: I am a member of Picture  
7 the Homeless, a local nonprofit group that works with  
8 thousands of homeless New Yorkers, many of whom are  
9 marginalized because we don't have acceptable  
10 identification to work a steady job or to have an  
11 apartment. We are many thousands of New Yorkers who  
12 need this proposed form of municipal identification.  
13 We come from many places in the U.S. and overseas, we  
14 come from prisons, we come from shelters, we come  
15 from municipalities that don't document births in  
16 records the way that New York City does. Some of us  
17 came up through the foster care maze, we come from  
18 the streets. What we have in common is that we all  
19 need to be recognized and affirmed by the City of New  
20 York and its agencies and to the businesses to whom  
21 we turn for support. We need to be respected as well  
22 by law enforcement, we are former felons, we are  
23 street homeless people; we're immigrants. All of us  
24 are New Yorkers who are running into governmental  
25 obstacles when we try to open a bank account, to rent

1  
2 a room, apartment; register for school. I used to  
3 work for the Police Department in the City of New  
4 York; they have my fingerprints and documents on  
5 file, [bell] but without documentation that they will  
6 not give to me, I am one of the people who needs  
7 municipal ID.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
9 for that. And I just wanna make a quick reminder,  
10 for anyone who has already given us your slips,  
11 everyone will be testifying today, so don't leave;  
12 everyone will have a chance to testify. Next.

13 NANCY MAGESON: My name is Nancy Mageson  
14 [sp?] and I would like to speak today about how  
15 municipal IDs can be utilized to make New York City  
16 transit more accessible to riders with invisible  
17 disabilities.

18 Currently the MTA complies with the ADA  
19 by asking able-bodied riders to give up their seats  
20 to those with disabilities; this works when a  
21 disability is plainly evident, but for those with  
22 invisible disabilities, this compliance strategy  
23 fails. When I haven't needed my seat I have tried to  
24 decide if other passengers did, but it is very hard  
25 to discern whether someone is chronically ill,

1  
2 suffers from a weakened immune system or cancer, is  
3 feeling ill from the first months of pregnancy or has  
4 an injury or disability that makes standing painful  
5 or difficult, nor should passengers be expected to  
6 intuit this information. The voluntary city ID for  
7 people with invisible disabilities would begin to  
8 address this gap in accessibility; the ID would  
9 require medical documentation, have a clearly printed  
10 expiration date and use a logo, perhaps the  
11 wheelchair icon; it could be work on a chain or  
12 strings or carried by hand. I believe that the  
13 majority of New Yorkers would, like me, willingly  
14 give up their seats if they knew that others truly  
15 needed one. Under the current system, riding public  
16 transit can be stressful, painful or simply  
17 impossible for those with invisible disabilities,  
18 never knowing if a seat will be available; [bell] is  
19 in no way compliant with the ADA; New Yorkers with  
20 injuries, illness or disabilities should not have to  
21 rely on their negotiating savvy or on good luck in  
22 order to be able to ride public transit. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much,  
24 and we... can we make sure we have a copy of that too?  
25 Great. Thank you.

1  
2 GABRIELA SANDOVAL REQUENA: Hi, my name  
3 is Gabriela Sandoval Requena, Policy Analyst for  
4 Coalition for the Homeless... [interpose]

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Requena.

6 GABRIELA SANDOVAL REQUENA: and the  
7 Coalition would like to, first of all, thank the City  
8 Council and the Committee on Immigration for this  
9 opportunity to testify in support of the municipal ID  
10 program. Many New Yorkers who are homeless are not  
11 able to obtain one, even if they're able to gather  
12 all the documentation and the money to cover the cost  
13 they're simply not able because of their lack of  
14 fixed residence. So needless to say, creating a  
15 municipal identification program that addresses the  
16 need of New Yorkers regardless of their housing  
17 status will improve the quality of life of homeless  
18 individuals and families [sic] tremendously. We  
19 strongly support this initiative and we look forward  
20 to working with the Administration and the Committee  
21 to ensure that the implementation includes rules  
22 around proof of residency and waiver of fees that  
23 would make new municipal ID cards accessible to all  
24 homeless New Yorkers who need it. Thanks.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
3 again. Can you reset the clock? Thank you.  
4 Reverend.

5 REV. CRUZ: I am Reverend... I am Rev.  
6 Getulio Cruz, pastor of [bell] Monte Sion Christian  
7 Church on the Lower East Side, I'm also a leader in  
8 Manhattan Together and Metro IAF. We are a network  
9 of 100 diverse member congregations and other  
10 organizations in New York City. My fellow clergy in  
11 Metro IAF and in other churches in my council, the  
12 Assembly of Christian Churches, have heard too many  
13 stories of people's lives being disrupted by the lack  
14 of recognized ID; this is why some Metro IAF member  
15 organizations started to produce their own IDs; we  
16 have worked with the police and other agencies in our  
17 communities to ensure they recognize these local IDs.  
18 We strongly support the City producing its own ID  
19 that all New Yorkers can get. We also know these IDs  
20 must be distributed in the right way. Metro IAF is  
21 ready to work with the Mayor, Council, the police and  
22 the rest of the City to ensure these IDs are designed  
23 in a professional manner that will be useful to a  
24 wide variety of New Yorkers. We want to encourage  
25 thousands of our members to sign up for IDs; if it

1  
2 can be done securely, we would love to have City  
3 officials come to our congregations and perhaps  
4 [bell] public libraries to sign people up.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And we will be  
6 there in your and everybody else's congregations, and  
7 you're absolutely right, that the word needs to get  
8 out in outreach. So thank you so much for each of  
9 your pieces of testimony and we'll be in touch with  
10 you and again, make sure that we have copies of what  
11 you used to testify.

12 Next we wanna call up Lauren Burke from  
13 Atlas, Sunset Park, Yolanda Castro, Dr. Kirk Anthony  
14 James, and Laurie Izutsu for this panel. And the  
15 panel after that we'll have Gene Judy [sp?) from the  
16 Premier Baptist Haitian, [background comments] Joseph  
17 Rosenberg, [background comments, laughter] Diane  
18 Steinman from the Interfaith Network, Jeffrey Weiss  
19 from Assemblyman Ortiz' office. [background  
20 comments] And I just wanna acknowledge our Council  
21 Member from Brooklyn, Jumaane Williams, is here as  
22 well... [background comment] okay -- who will say a few  
23 words; we're gonna clock you at one minute.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you for  
25 allowing me; I was chairing another hearing, so I

1  
2 couldn't be here early, but this issue is very  
3 important to me. I wanna thank you and Council  
4 Member Dromm for taking the leadership on this. A  
5 lot of people ask why I haven't signed on yet; it's  
6 not because... I'm fully supportive of the issue. I do  
7 have one concern that I know might've been mentioned  
8 here, which is just making sure... I think it was  
9 mentioned, that it doesn't become a scarlet letter,  
10 that really concerns me; I wanna make sure that the  
11 ID is something that all New Yorkers can use for  
12 something or the other; that's very important to me.  
13 Just anecdotally, my brother, I learned much later in  
14 life, was not a citizen, he was over 50 when I  
15 realized and that was because his mother died and he  
16 could not go to the funeral, so these issues are  
17 issues that really hit home to me.

18           And lastly, I wanna make a plug to  
19 anybody who's listening, the Caribbean community has  
20 been largely missing from this discussion and I think  
21 out Latino brothers and sisters for really taking the  
22 helm, but I'm pushing everyone who this will affect  
23 to really get their voice be heard, because it  
24 touches a lot more, even more than the thousands of  
25 people already who have been screaming and yelling,

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

so I wanna make sure that everybody who is an immigrant and have immigrant families get involved in this discussion. Thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you Council Member. And if we can begin here on the left-hand side, please. Thank you. Ma'am.

LAURIE IZUTSU: Oh, sorry... Okay, sorry.  
[laughter, crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Sorry; you're... you're... you're up. One minute.

LAURIE IZUTSU: Okay. Good afternoon, my name is Laurie Izutsu and I'm a Senior Staff Attorney with Brooklyn Legal Services. My office is a part of Legal Services NYC, the country's largest provider...  
[crosstalk]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Can you speak closer to the mic, so... so we can...

LAURIE IZUTSU: sure... for low-income individuals and families. Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony today. One population I would like to highlight that would be substantially impacted by the ID cards is survivors and victims of domestic violence. The creation of a municipal identify card program enhances the capacity

1  
2 for undocumented domestic violence victims to  
3 establish independence from their abusers by improved  
4 access to financial services and the ability to sign  
5 a lease. Additionally, the program would ease the  
6 ability of those without state-issued identification  
7 to interact with the police and the criminal justice  
8 system, an important measure where often survivors of  
9 domestic violence are retraumatized by the very  
10 agencies from which they seek help. It is clear  
11 based on these circumstances and the testimony you've  
12 heard already that the need for municipal ID cards is  
13 great; however, I would like to emphasize that it is  
14 not just a matter of language access with [bell]  
15 implantation of the ID program, but immigrants with  
16 limited English proficiency won't reap the full  
17 benefits if the City's language access policy isn't  
18 also consistently and effectively implemented along  
19 with that. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Thank  
21 you for that.

22 YOLANDA CASTRO: Hello, good afternoon.  
23 My name is Yolanda Castro; on behalf of the Mexican  
24 Consulate we thank you for allowing us to testify  
25 today; we are the agency that issues the consular ID

1  
2 cards that have been referred to here by other  
3 testimonies; I just wanna let you know that we are...  
4 for our government is paramount importance as our  
5 consular ID cards are regarded as a safeguard and  
6 secure document and form of identification. We issue  
7 them to our citizens; last year we issued 35,000 of  
8 these IDs, because we know how important and  
9 strategic it is for them to have a form of ID for any  
10 type of business and even for survivor matters, so we  
11 are very happy to have this new initiative being  
12 brought and we are happy to open up and discuss  
13 whatever the security characteristics of our consular  
14 security ID bears, because we wanna make them  
15 available for... we've [bell ] been working very hard  
16 to make them available and secure for everybody and  
17 we are open for discussion if you need it. 'Kay.

18 [crosstalk]

19 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you. Miss  
20 Castro, one question... [crosstalk]

21 YOLANDA CASTRO: Sure.

22 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: the 35,000 IDs  
23 that you've issued out; is that a New York number or  
24 is that a national number?

25

1  
2 YOLANDA CASTRO: No, it's just only in  
3 the New York area.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: New York City..  
5 incredible. [crosstalk]

6 YOLANDA CASTRO: Yeah, it's... the ID, the  
7 consular IDs are issued [coughing] to citizens that  
8 live in our jurisdiction...

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Right.

10 YOLANDA CASTRO: so in the whole United  
11 States it's around one million... [crosstalk]

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: That's amazing.

13 YOLANDA CASTRO: consular ID cards, and  
14 in some states are even used to get driver's license,  
15 because they have been officially admitted. So we  
16 continue to work towards... with agencies,  
17 organizations and we are, you know, welcome any  
18 inquiry and in the handouts you can see the very high  
19 security traits these... [crosstalk]

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And on the high  
21 security... sorry to interrupt... this is something that  
22 you've been in contact in coordination with our city  
23 agencies, including the NYPD; is that right?

24 YOLANDA CASTRO: That's correct, we... we...  
25 [crosstalk]

1 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Okay.

2 YOLANDA CASTRO: do seminars and we do a  
3 lot of workshops and presentations and we're always  
4 welcoming whoever wants to know about them, we will...  
5 we happily make a presentation and [interpose]

6 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Right.

7 YOLANDA CASTRO: answer any questions.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
9 for being here today.

10 YOLANDA CASTRO: Thank you.

11 LAUREN BURKE: Hi. Hello, thank you for  
12 having us. My name is Lauren Burke; I'm the  
13 Executive Director of Atlas: DIY (Developing  
14 Immigrant Youth), and both my office and my home are  
15 located in District 38, so raise the roof to District  
16 38. [laugh] Atlas: DIY represents transgender young  
17 people, homeless young people, undocumented young  
18 people; everybody who's brought up today who would  
19 benefit from the issuance of these ID cards. I also  
20 have a secret; I have been using my Massachusetts  
21 State ID card for the past eight years, due to the  
22 fact that I do not have the documents I need because  
23 of expiration, divorce, losing cards, etc. So if I  
24 myself, a very privileged attorney, 30-year-old  
25

1  
2 citizen of New York City could utilize these, so  
3 could everyone else. I also wanna offer that Atlas:  
4 DIY is ready and excited to be a site that these  
5 could be issued through; we have notaries and  
6 attorneys on staff, we speak Spanish, English,  
7 Mandarin, Urdu, and I know that so many other  
8 community-based organizations would be thrilled and  
9 love to be an organization that could be seen as a  
10 host site. Lastly, this is a away to make all New  
11 Yorkers feel like they belong to this great city,  
12 it's a place that I've wanted to belong since I was  
13 12, and so I'm very excited to finally have an ID  
14 that proves it. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Well said. Well  
16 said. [bell] Thank you so much for that.

17 MALE VOICE: Hi, I'm here on behalf of  
18 the Fortune Society, which serves over 4,000 citizens  
19 coming home from prisons and jails across New York  
20 City. Many folks leave prisons lacking ID, yet  
21 they're expected to obtain jobs, housing and health  
22 care without any ID. The municipal ID program must  
23 be available to them by way of their discharge  
24 papers, meaning that as they leave prison the  
25 discharge paper should be enough to obtain an ID and

1  
2 that the chances of these men and women, mothers,  
3 fathers, and sisters, their success and integration  
4 into the community would be greatly compromised.  
5 Many opponents of the municipal ID speak of the  
6 possibility of ID fraud, yet the New York State Penal  
7 Law already protects other IDs from those measures,  
8 and again, the municipal ID program will allow people  
9 leaving from prison to obtain the basic human rights  
10 guaranteed under the constitution; it will also  
11 continue to create a safer New York by allowing  
12 formerly incarcerated people to access the tools  
13 necessary to become contributing members of our city.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you again.

15 And our final panel member. [background comment]  
16 Panel two. Okay. [bell]

17 DIANE STEINMAN: Good afternoon, I'm  
18 Diane Steinman; I'm the Director of the New York  
19 State Interfaith Network for Immigration Reform,  
20 which is a religiously, racially and ethnically  
21 diverse network of faith leaders and organizations  
22 that advocates for just and humane comprehensive  
23 immigration reform and municipal laws that treat all  
24 immigrants, regardless of status, with fairness,  
25 justice and compassion and based on our values, we

1  
2 are proud to join the many testifiers who are  
3 supporting the creation of a municipal ID and the  
4 strategies to promote its widespread use by the  
5 diverse communities that need this ID in order to  
6 become part of the mainstream of city life. I do  
7 wanna amplify one point that the Speaker made this  
8 morning; at this watershed moment in the future of  
9 our democracy, when many elected officials in  
10 Washington and around the country are driven by  
11 political self-interest and negative attitudes toward  
12 undocumented immigrants, the poor and the  
13 marginalized, they're driven by those attitudes to  
14 pass laws that do them harm and prevent passage of  
15 laws that would do them good. Passing the New York  
16 City ID law at this moment would serve as a  
17 repudiation of their toxic attitudes and harmful  
18 actions and an affirmation that public policies must  
19 satisfy the moral requirements to treat all who live  
20 among us with dignity, justice and compassion, thus  
21 presenting an alternative model for federal, state  
22 and local lawmakers to emulate in the critical days  
23 ahead.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
25 for that. And if we can... [background comments] And

1  
2 the next panel's names, while you get ready, is Miss  
3 Hally Chu, who will be reading testimony on behalf of  
4 Gale Brewer, our Borough President, Louis Quinones,  
5 Dr. Paule Cruz Takash and Ethan Carr from MasterCard  
6 Worldwide. And you can begin. [interpose]

7 JEFF WEISS: I will try to finish up this  
8 panel with less than a New York minute. My name is  
9 Jeff Weiss; I'm counsel to Assemblyman Felix Ortiz  
10 from Sunset Park, Cobble Hill, Bay Ridge, Borough  
11 Park, Red Hook; the same district as the Chairman.  
12 I'll make two points; that Assemblyman Ortiz is in  
13 Albany today in session, but in his capacity in  
14 Albany chairs the Puerto Rican and Hispanic Caucus,  
15 has a bill in Albany to provide non-resident New  
16 Yorkers with a driver's license based on certain  
17 federal criteria; he's also a member of the National  
18 Conference of State Legislatures Immigration Task  
19 Force and has been working in Washington with other  
20 states on issues similar to this which he strongly  
21 supports and asked me to let you know that he stands  
22 ready to work with the Council in Albany and in  
23 Washington to achieve the same goals and to thank you  
24 very much.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
3 for that support and send our best.

4 JOSEPH ROSENBERG: Good afternoon, I'm  
5 Joseph Rosenberg; I'm the Executive Director of the  
6 Catholic Community Relations Council, a not-for-  
7 profit corporation established by the Archdiocese of  
8 New York and the Diocese of Brooklyn to represent the  
9 church on local legislative and policy matters. I'm  
10 pleased to be here to testify strongly in support of  
11 Int. 253. By providing the ability for immigrants to  
12 obtain identification cards to access government  
13 services, this bill will vastly improve the lives of  
14 so many residents of our city. We're a city of  
15 immigrants, many of us second and third generation;  
16 the tradition continues in the instance of the more  
17 recent arrivals to our city who will benefit from  
18 this bill. The Catholic Church has long been in the  
19 forefront of immigration reform and services to  
20 immigration communities regardless of one's place of  
21 origin or religious beliefs; this legislation will go  
22 far in embracing this population.

23 The mission of the Catholic migration  
24 services of the Diocese of Brooklyn is to empower  
25 underserved immigrant communities in Brooklyn and

1  
2 Queens regardless of religion or ethnicity, their  
3 immigrant tenancy advocacy program provides free in-  
4 person housing services to help low-income immigrant  
5 tenants in their fight for decent, affordable  
6 housing. The division of immigrant services for the  
7 archdiocese provides a similar comprehensive range of  
8 [bell] services, not just in Manhattan, Bronx, but in  
9 boroughs upstate, they assist more than 100,000  
10 individuals annually, they offer over 55 English as  
11 second language courses and [background comment] and  
12 provide free legal assistance on deportation  
13 proceedings along those lines. They also have a  
14 hotline that answers 25,000 calls annually  
15 [background comment] in 17 different languages; in  
16 short, we embrace this bill, we embrace your  
17 leadership for bringing it and we hope that it is  
18 soon enacted and signed by the Mayor. Thank you very  
19 much.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Well and thank you  
21 for that. And let's call the next panel; I'll make a  
22 comment, but we recently stood, I think in Corona,  
23 Queens with you and other advocates in making sure  
24 that immigrants always have a way to connect; this is  
25 just another way to do that with an identification

1  
2 card, but our faith leaders and organizations have  
3 always been an incredible connector and we need you  
4 all to be part of this team and this task force that  
5 will make this happen. So thank you so much for  
6 coming today.

7 I'm gonna call the next panel up, Ethan...  
8 Ethan Carr, MasterCard Worldwide, Dr. Paule Cruz-  
9 Takash from the Oakland ID Prepaid SF Global, Louis  
10 Quinones, Teamsters -- Teamster are in the house --  
11 and Hally Chu from Gale Brewer. [background comment]  
12 A reminder, we have one minute and I'll be asking you  
13 to keep it to one minute, thank you so much.  
14 [background comments] If we can begin at the left  
15 here, and make sure to speak into the mic. We have  
16 one minute; thank you so much.

17 LOUIS QUINONES: Hi, my name is Louis  
18 Quinones; I'm here on behalf of George Miranda,  
19 President of Teamsters Joint Council 16; I will read  
20 a statement of President Miranda.

21 "Teamsters Joint Council 16 represents  
22 120,000 members over the New York area. The New York  
23 City Teamsters support municipal identification cards  
24 for any New Yorker, regardless of immigration status.  
25 This proposal from Mayor de Blasio, Speaker Mark-

1  
2 Viverito, Council Member Dromm and Council Member  
3 Menchaca makes sense for a diverse city. Ours is a  
4 city of immigrants; with our immigrant community, not  
5 only would we lose the art, culture, food and values  
6 that make us New Yorkers, our city would literally  
7 cease to exist. Immigrants, many of them  
8 undocumented, do the jobs that run New York; they do  
9 them without the rights and recognition from the city  
10 they deserve. The reality for many of our  
11 undocumented neighbors is one of exclusion. They can  
12 send their children to the public schools, but cannot  
13 visit them. They can earn money, but cannot open a  
14 bank account to keep it safe. They can call the  
15 police, but cannot identify themselves to an officer.  
16 With municipal ID cards, undocumented and other New  
17 Yorkers will have access to banks, schools, other  
18 public and private buildings [bell] and essential  
19 services. You have the support of the New York City  
20 Teamsters in making the proposal law."

21 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

22 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: Thank you, uhm...

23 [interpose]

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Make sure that the  
25 red button's on.

1 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: Red button is on.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

3 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: Thank you. My

4 name is Dr. Paule Cruz-Takash; I am one of the two

5 intellectual architects of the Oakland City ID and

6 the Richmond City ID prepaid debit card, which is

7 also a MasterCard; we incubated this card in our

8 research center at UCLA, we are activist scholars and

9 we also created a company in order to carry the

10 platform that would allow us to offer low-cost

11 financial services to poor and low-income folks of

12 all nationalities and backgrounds and we are the

13 company that was contracted by the City of Oakland

14 and the City of Richmond; we're about to open up our

15 offices in the City of Richmond; we also are

16 contracted by Casa de Maryland, which is one of the

17 largest immigrant service organizations in the

18 country. Casa de Maryland understood that this issue

19 goes beyond a need for ID, that's a critical ID, but

20 they contracted with us because they said the banks

21 have not responded to the municipal ID cards that are

22 out there and that we need to be able to provide our

23 folks with a low-cost financial alternative [bell].

24 I wanted to bring attention to the costs; our company

25

1  
2 officers this service in the City of Oakland and  
3 Richmond at no cost to the City or to the taxpayers  
4 and... [interpose]

5 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

6 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: so I also wanted  
7 to say that the San Francisco supervisor estimated  
8 that it cost them about \$200,000, but their City  
9 Clerk that implements this program has estimated that  
10 the card costs about \$70 per card for that city  
11 [background comment] to implement. You all are  
12 talking about... [interpose]

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, do you  
14 have... uh just...

15 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: multiple sites  
16 and also city staff that would be required to  
17 implement that program, [background comment] so you  
18 are talking about a huge, huge budget, not only to  
19 implement this program, but to sustain it over time,  
20 [interpose]

21 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

22 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: so we would work...  
23 [crosstalk]

24 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And if you have...  
25 if you have...

1  
2 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: welcome the  
3 opportunity to work with you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Yeah, thank you,  
5 and especially, you have testimony that talks about  
6 those pricings, we'd love to see that analysis.

7 DR. PAULE CRUZ-TAKASH: Yes. Thank you.  
8 [crosstalk]

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

10 ETHAN CARR: Good afternoon everyone; I'm  
11 Ethan Carr with MasterCard Worldwide; it's a pleasure  
12 to be here with you today. [interpose]

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for  
14 being here.

15 ETHAN CARR: Okay. What I wanna talk  
16 about, basically I wanna ask the question -- we would  
17 like you to consider the financial option as you go  
18 forward with this program, [background comment]  
19 because we believe it will give greater access to not  
20 only city services, but also financial services to  
21 your residents. We see all over the country where  
22 the governments are at all levels adopting the pre-  
23 paid card solution and to look at reducing costs,  
24 save money, add convenience and make it more  
25 efficient for the organization. Since 1990

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

governments have increasingly migrated to direct deposit and pre-paid cards as a way to distribute over \$140 billion in payments; this include in the form of grants, unemployment, child support, all kinds of means of government disbursement. We think you'd do a great service to your residents if you give them the ability to be included in that financial service spectrum by allowing them to have that option to get disbursed benefits on the card.

[bell]

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for that and thank you for being here.

HALLY CHU: Hi, good afternoon; my name is Hally Chu and thank you for the opportunity to testify on behalf of Borough President Gale Brewer of Manhattan. I'm just gonna summarize some of her recommendations which already have been mentioned by a lot of other people. First is that municipal IDs must not become the de facto form of identification for just undocumented and just to provide being stigmatized and the Borough President recommends a host of different services attached to the card, which you've already heard. Second is, municipal IDs need to have NYPD support and that includes a lot of

1  
2 safety measures and security that is incorporated  
3 into the municipal ID card. And third and also  
4 fourth, the municipal IDs must first not be too  
5 costly for citizens to... for New Yorkers to obtain and  
6 also not too difficult. So the cost, as you can see  
7 some other cities have implemented a sliding scale,  
8 and also difficulty, in terms of language access,  
9 [bell] the Borough President strongly encourages uses  
10 community-based organizations to help with that. So  
11 thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for the  
13 voice of the Borough President and send her our best.  
14 Thank you so much to this panel. We're gonna call  
15 the next panel up and before I do that I wanna just  
16 recognize we've been joined by Council Member Rose  
17 and Council Member Rodriguez. Gene Judy, Bishop  
18 Findlayter from CUSH, Rev. Terry Troia, Project  
19 Hospitality, Rev. Liam O'Doherty from Our Lady of  
20 Good Counsel Parish. [background comments]

21 And our final panel is Daniel Rose, Dr.  
22 Raul Hinjosa and Freddy Martinez from LSA, Manhattan  
23 Together. [background comment] But let's have our  
24 first panel speak and we'll start over here from the  
25 left. Please introduce yourself; make sure that the

1 mic is on [background comments], red light.

2 [background comments] Thank you.

3  
4 REV. TERRY TROIA: Hi, uhm... [background  
5 comment] thank you for having me; I'm Rev. Terry  
6 Troia, Director of Project Hospitality and I sit on  
7 the Board of Directors of El Centro del Immigrante in  
8 Staten Island, and hello to our Councilperson, Debi  
9 Rose and all the other council people, thank you for  
10 having us here. I've worked for more than 30 years  
11 with homeless people on Staten Island; there is a  
12 group of chronic homeless people in the City of New  
13 York, mostly elderly with memory loss who cannot move  
14 out of shelters because of lack of appropriate  
15 documentation. Even in the aftermath of Hurricane  
16 Sandy on Staten Island we served non-immigrant  
17 families in the city's evacuation center and in FEMA  
18 hotels who did not have sufficient identification to  
19 apply for necessary services. A municipal ID card  
20 similar to programs set up in other cities would  
21 really help us move forward for getting chronic  
22 homeless people with severe impairments some level of  
23 service and housing. I can cite many examples of  
24 local Staten Island residents, mostly impoverished,  
25 who have been detained, arrested and held at the

1  
2 precinct because they did not have an ID for these  
3 reasons -- they were sleeping in an abandoned  
4 building or sleeping in a garage or riding a bicycle  
5 on the sidewalk or taking a used newspaper out of a  
6 garbage can on the Staten Island Ferry or calling the  
7 police to report an incident of domestic violence.

8 [bell] Poor people, disabled people, elderly  
9 persons, persons with profound memory loss and  
10 immigrants who are out of status are among those who  
11 bear the suffering of being hauled in, disappeared  
12 into our criminal justice system [interpose]

13 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

14 REV. TERRY TROIA: for not having an ID.  
15 Thank you for... I... we support Int. 253 with the  
16 support and cooperation of the NYPD to protect the  
17 civil rights of our neighbors.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And thanks again  
19 for coming in today; we'll make sure to take your  
20 testimony.

21 LIAM O'DOHERTY: 'Kay. Yes, I am Liam  
22 O'Doherty; I'm pastor of Our Lady of Good Counsel  
23 Church in Staten Island and also a member of Staten  
24 Island Clergy Leadership. Staten Island has the  
25 largest percentage increase in immigrant population

1  
2 in the City of New York and a large percentage of  
3 these law-abiding citizens of our borough and our  
4 city do not have acceptable means of documentation  
5 for police stops. For instance, Carlos, not his real  
6 name, an elderly man and insulin-dependent diabetic,  
7 who collects empty cans for money was arrested for  
8 collecting cans in a supermarket cart he had found in  
9 an abandoned lot; he was arrested for theft of the  
10 cart, he did not have ID; he spent a few days in  
11 jail; his family attempted repeatedly to give the  
12 police his insulin, but without his insulin he fell  
13 into a diabetic coma, ended up in ICU chained to a  
14 bed with police assigned to guard his room. After an  
15 outcry from the community, the Parish of St. Mary's  
16 of the Assumption, in backdoor meetings with the  
17 local precinct captain, who explained that he was  
18 being held because he did not have acceptable ID.  
19 The precinct had agreed to release Carlos from  
20 custody; Carlos almost died. It would have been an  
21 unbearably high price to pay for the right to feed  
22 his family. For the life of Carlos and for the lives  
23 of all immigrants like him, I urge you to make this  
24 program a reality. Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much.

BISHOP ORLANDO FINDLAYTER: Good

afternoon, my name is Bishop Orlando Findlayter; I'm the Chairman of Churches United to Save and Heal, a clergy organization primarily of Caribbean American and African American pastors. We are proud supporters of the rights of all citizens, including those who are undocumented. We applaud Council Member Carlos Menchaca for introducing the Municipal ID bill and we urge members of this body to support the bill, vote for it and let's make municipal ID a reality in New York City. Too many hard-working New Yorkers can't open a bank account, can't enter City buildings, have difficulty registering their children in schools and are fearful every day of being stopped without the ability to produce a valid, government-issued ID. Municipal ID is a step in the right direction for this City; it will restore dignity to hundreds of thousands of our neighbors who have been marginalized by the nation's broken immigration system. We represent the faith community who is overwhelmingly supporting this bill; it is our belief that this a moral issue; every citizen deserves the right to have an ID [bell] and so we urge to pass this bill. Thank you.

[laugh]

GENE JUDY: Thank you, Chairman and the members of the Committee. My name is Gene Judy from the First Nation Baptist Church; I want to thank the pastors and the secretary and the administration who accompany me today. The NYC needs a general ID to ensure that everybody in New York can be easily identified. Secondly, it will help all New Yorkers to have something in common, regardless of their immigration status. Third, ID card with a waiver component will reduce the stress level of the homeless population, which constantly needs to fight to identify themselves because they have lost their document after losing their bed. Last; not the least, NYC ID will help the undocumented residents to hold a legal document they can call theirs and by simulation they will feel 100 percent New Yorkers. Research shows that it takes seven years for an immigrant to accept their adoptive land; by issuing the ID card you will reduce the stress level on the immigration and help them to integrate the society less than seven years. [bell] Thank you for listening.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
3 to this panel again. And we'll be in touch with you  
4 and all faith leaders really that are coming to us  
5 with support. And our final panel, Daniel Rose from  
6 MasterCard, Dr. Raul... yes... Dr. Raul Hinjosa; Freddy  
7 Martinez from LSA. And we've been joined by Council  
8 Member Brad Lander, Council Member Mark Levine and I  
9 think I already mentioned, but Council Member Debi  
10 Rose [background comment] from Staten Island.  
11 [background comments]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Mr. Chairman,  
13 thank you so much for your leadership on this; it's  
14 wonderful to be a part of this historic hearing and I  
15 appreciate all the testimony; the leadership that you  
16 and Council Member Dromm and the Speaker are  
17 providing in making this move forward to reality.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you, thank  
19 you so much Council Member Lander. And we'll give an  
20 opportunity for Council Members to say... quick moment  
21 at the end, after this panel. Let's begin.

22 PROF. RAUL HINJOSA: How do you do,  
23 members of the Council? I am Professor Raul Hinjosa  
24 at UCLA; I'm also the CEO of Liberation Card  
25 Services, which is a company dedicated to exactly

1  
2 what we're talking about here, empowering the  
3 undocumented and empowering the unbanked throughout  
4 cities and we are now actively doing ID cards with  
5 banking services built in in California, which I flew  
6 out to talk with you for a minute for, but I  
7 appreciate the opportunity. We think that the  
8 solution that we have now spearheaded in California  
9 in the last year is the solution for New York,  
10 particularly for the type of issues that were raised  
11 here, the scarlet letter issue. While there's half-  
12 a-million undocumented in New York, there's almost a  
13 million under-banked and people that don't have  
14 access to proper identification; that's the way you  
15 do it, through a combination of an ID card with an  
16 advanced set of financial services at the same time.  
17 Second thing, the cost issue is extremely important;  
18 [bell] I don't think that it's been even given good,  
19 adequate information. What we're seeing in the case  
20 of the cities where they -- both New Haven and San  
21 Francisco -- they require huge government subsidy;  
22 what we have done is not only have extremely low...  
23 basically zero cost to the city [background comment]  
24 for the implementation of this, but also providing  
25

1  
2 financial services, which are the lowest in the  
3 country in terms of being able to access... [crosstalk]

4 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

5 PROF. RAUL HINJOSA: zero fee options for  
6 people that have this. [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you.

8 PROF. RAUL HINJOSA: Finally, the issue  
9 -- it's not just Macy's that you wanna get involved  
10 in this; we provide a mechanism whereby all local  
11 businesses can also participate in this program, all  
12 built through something that everybody also has in  
13 their pockets, which is [background comment] a mobile  
14 phone, which is the future, and so I suggest you look  
15 at that alternative at the same time that you look at  
16 the others. [interpose]

17 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: And we... and we  
18 definitely will. And if there's anything you wanna  
19 give us... I know you gave us a packet, thank you so  
20 much for that.

21 DANIEL ROSE: Good afternoon; I'm Daniel  
22 Rose; I'm from MasterCard, the payments network. I  
23 think that the idea, the concept of the ID card is a  
24 homerun, so I think... congratulate you on that; I  
25 think it's a winner. However, I think you're missing

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

an opportunity and I'm gonna, you know, piggyback off of what Dr. Raul Hingosa said, that I think financial inclusion is an important aspect that could be addressed with the same initiative. Here in the New York City area, in the New York City metropolitan area, the FDIC did an under-banked study; about 24 percent of the households in the metropolitan... in the New York City area are under-banked, so they don't have access to the financial mainstream. I believe by... and you coupling the payment functionality with the ID card that you'll hit a homerun and address a lot of issues that a lot of these under-banked families have today.

CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you for that.

FREDDY CRUZ MARTINEZ: So good afternoon everyone. My name is Freddy Cruz Martinez; I'm a volunteer leader with Little Sisters of the Assumption Family Health Services, Manhattan Together and Metro IAF, so finally I'm here to testify. Eight years ago, while coming home from late work, I was stopped by the police; they asked, "Do you hear the gunshot?" I said, "No." They asked to see my ID and I show my Mexican consular ID, [background comment]

1  
2 they said this is fake; [background comment] I was  
3 afraid because I thought that they would take me to  
4 the jail; fortunately, all they did was search me,  
5 asked me a few questions and let me go, but others  
6 haven't been so lucky. We've heard many story of  
7 people in our community that have been taken to the  
8 prisons for hours when they couldn't produce an ID  
9 that the police recognize. So like Metro IAF, member  
10 congregations, we at Little Sisters, we [bell]  
11 started produce our own IDs like the police  
12 recognize. A local credit union even lets people  
13 open up an account with them.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Right.

15 FREDDY CRUZ MARTINEZ: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: So thank you, and  
17 we wanna make sure to take that testimony and again,  
18 thank you for your own personal experience and really  
19 giving us a sense of what we've been hearing  
20 throughout the entire hearings. So thank you to this  
21 panel. [crosstalk]

22 FREDDY CRUZ MARTINEZ: Great.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much  
24 to this panel. And we're gonna... I'm gonna allow for  
25

1  
2 Council Member Rose to say a few words and then I'm  
3 gonna close up and say thank you to all.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you so much,  
5 Chair and I will be brief. I just want to thank you  
6 so much for pushing this legislation along; several  
7 years ago in my district we had a proliferation of  
8 bias crimes against undocumented Mexican residents in  
9 my district and we found that one of the major causes  
10 were, they were crimes of opportunity, because the  
11 day laborers were carrying all of their cash on them  
12 because they had no safe way of keeping their funds  
13 secure, and because they lacked identification they  
14 were not able to open up bank accounts, and so in  
15 conjunction with the Mexican Consulate, we, I  
16 believe, started the first precursor by getting them  
17 at least their Mexican ID so that they have  
18 identification and we brokered a deal with the banks  
19 to accept that ID so that they could then open up  
20 their accounts. And we have subsequently not had  
21 anymore of those type of bias crimes. And so we've  
22 seen the [background comments] benefit of ID, but ID  
23 is important to everyone because it will change the  
24 economic disparities in communities where people lack  
25 ID. And what happens is, people have to go to

1  
2 predatory services, they have to go to check cashing  
3 places, they have to go [bell] to rent-a-centers,  
4 they have to go to places where they get less for  
5 their dollar and it perpetuates the financial  
6 inequities. So I wanna thank you so much, Chairman  
7 Menchaca for, you know, pushing this legislation  
8 forward.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENCHACA: Thank you so much,  
10 Council Member Rose. And really, I think what that  
11 says is that so much of this work has really happened  
12 even before this session started with so many of our  
13 senior council members in the City Council and what I  
14 wanna do is just let you know for the record that the  
15 Central American Legal Assistance Group, the New York  
16 Legal Assistance Group, Safe Horizon, New York City  
17 Gay and Lesbian Antiviolence Project, the Coalition  
18 for Asian American Children and Families, SEIU 32BJ,  
19 NYS Interfaith Network also dropped off testimony for  
20 the record. I wanna thank the incredible staff that  
21 has put so much time; you heard earlier that day one  
22 I came in with the strength of horses really to push  
23 this forward, but this would not have happened if it  
24 wasn't for Julian Beckford, Jennifer Montalvo [sp?]  
25 on the Committee staff, Lee Wellington, my Chief of

1  
2 Staff, Mary Brooke from my office as well, Ivan  
3 Luevanos and Faisal Ali, who just joined us,  
4 Sebastian McGuire from Danny Dromm's office, and so  
5 many more of the Speaker's office that have put so  
6 many hours in analyzing this information and will  
7 continue to analyze everything we've heard today.  
8 And so really in closing, what I wanna say is that  
9 you've heard today no just from organizations and  
10 advocates, you've heard from New Yorkers at the  
11 beginning, you've heard from the Administration, the  
12 Operations and MOIA about the commitment that both  
13 the City Council and the Mayor have to making this  
14 happen; everyone is at the table under the pillars of  
15 this entire project that range from safety and fraud  
16 protection and making sure that people have access,  
17 not just at our immigrant New Yorkers' base, but  
18 really everybody that wants to be able to connect and  
19 unify around this card is understood and we're gonna  
20 keep on moving forward, this is our first hearing and  
21 we're gonna come back to you with more information  
22 and analysis as we move forward. So with that I'm  
23 gonna say thank you so much for staying; I know we  
24 over-stood our stay and I hope you stay for the next  
25 hearing, chaired by our Chairman of Transportation,

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON IMMIGRATION

191

Ydanis Rodriguez. Thank you so much and this concludes our hearing.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date            May 19, 2014