COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK ----- Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING -----Х March 10, 2025 Start: 10:39 a.m. Recess: 2:10 p.m. HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL B E F O R E: Chris Banks, Chairperson COUNCIL MEMBERS: Alexa Avilés Erik D. Bottcher Justin L. Brannan Darlene Mealy Rafael Salamanca, Jr. OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING: Yusef Salaam Gale A. Brewer Kristy Marmorato World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502

A P P E A R A N C E S

Lisa Bova-Hiatt, Chief Executive Officer of New York City Housing Authority

Eva Trimble, Chief Operating Officer of New York City Housing Authority

Annika Lescott-Martinez, Executive Vice President of Finance and Chief Financial Officer of New York City Housing Authority

Shaan Mavani, Chief Asset and Capital Management Officer at New York City Housing Authority

Brian Honan, Executive Vice President of Intergovernmental Affairs at New York City Housing Authority

James Alcivar, Tenant Association President for Cypress Hills Houses

Trenton Price, Executive Director of the Salvadori Center

Daren Sealey, Associate Director of the Housing Resource Center at the Red Hook Community Justice Center

Manuel Martinez, President of South Jamaica Houses Resident Association

Noah Cohen, VOCAL-NY

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Richard Soohoo, Tenant Services Coordinator at 64 Norfolk HDFC at the Chinese American Planning Council

Laura Lazarus, Co-Founder and Chief Executive Officer of Anthos Home

Elizabet Rodriguez, tenant at Jacob Riis Houses

Jesse Maldonado Koklas, New York City Regional Director for Citizen Action of New York

Arlene Geter, tenant at Stapleton Houses

Christopher Leon Johnson, self

Sharon Brown, Rose of Sharon Ministries

Jeremy Bunyaner, Executive Board of the Association of Legal Advocates and Attorneys, United Auto Workers Local 2325

Imane Cherif El Farissy, delegate from Camden Legal Services Workers United at the Association of Legal Advocates and Attorneys

Tanesha Grant, Executive Director of Parent Supporting Parents New York and Moms United for Black Lives New York City

Dana Elden, St. Mary's and Residents for the Preservation of Public Housing

We the People, tenant at Jacob Riis Houses

2	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Testing, testing. This
3	is a sound check for the New York City Committee on
4	Public Housing. Recorded in the City Hall Committee
5	Room by Sergeant Ben Levy on March 10, 2025.
6	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning, and
7	welcome to the New York City Council hearing of the
8	Committee on Public Housing.
9	At this time, can everybody please
10	silence your cell phones.
11	If you wish to testify, please go to the
12	back of the room to fill out a testimony slip.
13	At this time and going forward, no one is
14	to approach the dais. I repeat, no one is to approach
15	the dais.
16	Chair, we are ready to begin.
17	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: [GAVEL] Good morning,
18	and thank you for attending today's hearing on the
19	City's Fiscal Year 2026 Preliminary Budget and the
20	New York City Housing Authority's Five-Year Operating
21	and Capital Plans for 2025 to 2029. I am Council
22	Member Chris Banks, and the Chair of the Public
23	Housing Committee, and I'm joined by my fellow
24	Colleagues, Councilman Brannan.
25	

2 NYCHA has operated the largest public 3 housing program in the nation for over 75 years, 4 providing affordable housing to over half of a 5 million working class and low-income New Yorkers throughout both Section 9, public housing, and 6 7 Section 8, voucher programs. There is no doubt that 8 NYCHA is a precious and critical resource in an 9 increasingly unaffordable city. However, longstanding disinvestment from successive federal, state, and 10 11 city administrations alongside a deep organizational mismanagement and, at times, outright fraud have 12 13 resulted in an ongoing deterioration of public 14 housing. On top of this legacy of federal 15 disinvestment, NYCHA, together with New York City, faces profound uncertainty from Washington when it 16 17 comes to federal funding. And despite the turn away 18 from federal support for public housing over the past 19 70 years, federal funding today is a critical 20 resource for the Authority. In New York, we are proud 21 of our public housing and its resilient and dedicated 2.2 tenants. 23 Today, the Committee is interested in hearing about how NYCHA will respond to the 24

uncertainty from Washington regarding federal funding

25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 6 and what contingencies it has put in place both today 2 3 and for future plans. We are also interested in 4 hearing about how NYCHA is working with City and State partners to address any funding needs due to 5 the City's budget process. 6 7 After NYCHA, we will hear from members of 8 the public, and I would like to remind everyone who 9 would like to testify today to please fill out the witness slips with the Sergeant-at-Arms so we can put 10 11 you on the speaker's list. I will now pass it to our Committee 12 13 Counsel to swear in NYCHA leadership before turning 14 it over to testimony. 15 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: If you could all raise 16 your right hand, please. 17 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the 18 whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this 19 Committee and to respond honestly to Council Member 20 questions? CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I do. 21 2.2 CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: I do. 23 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: I do. 24 25 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I do.

2	Thanks. You may proceed. And before you
3	speak, if you could say your name and your title for
4	the record, that would be great. Thank you.
5	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Chair
6	Chris Banks, Members of the Committee on Public
7	Housing, and other distinguished Members of the City
8	Council, NYCHA residents, community advocates, and
9	members of the public, good morning. I'm Lisa Bova-
10	Hiatt, NYCHA's Chief Executive Officer. I am pleased
11	to be joined by Chief Operating Officer Eva Trimble;
12	Executive Vice President of Finance and Chief
13	Financial Officer Annika Lescott-Martinez; Chief
14	Asset and Capital Management Officer Shaan Mavani,
15	and other members of NYCHA's leadership team.
16	Thank you for this opportunity to present
17	the Authority's adopted budget, which was approved by
18	NYCHA's Board of Directors in November. I would also
19	like to discuss our efforts to transform NYCHA as an
20	organization and improve residents' quality of life.
21	My colleagues and I are laser-focused on the work
22	required to keep NYCHA on the stronger, sustainable
23	path that we are currently on so we can better serve
24	the residents now and in the future. We have overcome
25	significant challenges and continue to make progress

in critical areas that most impact residents, 2 3 including mold and lead abatement, and comprehensive 4 renovations through innovative housing preservation programs. At the same time, substantial challenges 5 persist. On top of the escalating impacts of decades 6 7 of federal disinvestment, our rent arrears remain enormous. Rent arrears have increased four-fold since 8 9 the year before the pandemic. They currently stand at over half a billion dollars across approximately 10 11 67,000 families, which is nearly half of all households. NYCHA is collecting only 63 percent of 12 13 the rent owed, including arrears, over a 12-month period, and HUD expects housing authorities to 14 15 collect 100 percent of the rent. Our top priority is 16 to keep residents housed, and so we continue to 17 inform residents about the various ways they can get 18 assistance with rent payments, and we continue to 19 work with residents experiencing economic hardship. 20 We are implementing two new and critical rental 21 assistance programs, the State's CRA program and the federal HOME-ARP program, which will provide up to 2.2 23 185 million dollars to cover arrears that resulted from the pandemic. And thanks to our tireless 24 25 advocacy, in collaboration with our partners,

1	COMMITTEE	ON	PUBLIC	HOUSING

including residents and elected officials, NYCHA has 2 3 received 161 million dollars in ERAP funding from the 4 State. We have applied 150 million dollars to over 5 25,000 households to date. Together, these muchneeded programs are helping to stabilize rent 6 7 arrears. Rent payments constitute one-third of NYCHA's operating budget, and this revenue is 8 9 essential for maintaining our developments and providing residents with the quality of life they 10 11 deserve.

12 We are also grappling with the fact that 13 our rapidly aging developments need about 80 billion 14 dollars in major repair work. To address these 15 challenges, and considering the limited federal 16 funding available, we are pursuing innovative 17 programs that are bringing top-to-bottom renovations 18 and repairs to a significant portion of our 19 portfolio.

I would now like to discuss a few details related to NYCHA's budget. Please keep in mind that NYCHA's budget runs on a Calendar Year rather than the City's Fiscal Year. Thanks to the hard work of every department, especially our finance department, we adopted a balanced budget for 2025. This is a

2 significant achievement, and it follows a balanced 3 budget in 2024 despite an initial forecast of a 35-4 million-dollar deficit. However, with the increased 5 needs and continued rent arrears, an annual deficit 6 is expected in the coming years.

7 Federal funding comprises two-thirds of 8 NYCHA's operating revenue. This year, we expect to 9 receive about 1.29 billion dollars in federal operating subsidy. As I mentioned, rent revenue 10 11 accounts for one-third of our operating revenue, and we expect to collect about 1.05 billion dollars in 12 13 rent revenue this year, including approximately 125 14 million in HOME-ARP funding. Rent revenue is 15 approximately 110 million dollars less than we should 16 be collecting. Our 2025 budget assumes a proration 17 factor of 97.5 percent for the operating subsidy, 32 18 million dollars less than what NYCHA is eligible to 19 receive. We anticipate 287 million dollars in City 20 operating funds for Calendar Year 2025. We expect to receive about 2.29 billion dollars this year for 21 Section 8 vouchers and the associated administrative 2.2 23 fees. It's anticipated that HUD will announce the funding renewal rate by May of 2025. Current 24 proposals range from 88.6 to 97.5 percent of our 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 11
2	Calendar Year 2024 expenditures. This falls short of
3	the current funding level of 99.5 percent and could
4	impact the number of households served by the
5	program. The projected expenses for 2025 are
6	approximately 2.1 billion dollars in Section 8
7	payments to landlords, 1.86 billion in salaries,
8	fringe benefits, and overtime, 410 million in
9	contracts, 585 million in utility payments, and 426
10	million dollars for expenses such as leases,
11	supplies, vehicles, and equipment.
12	Chief Financial Officer Annika Lescott-
13	Martinez will now provide some additional information
14	about NYCHA's 2025 budget and financial outlook.
15	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
16	Good morning. My name is Annika Lescott-Martinez. I'm
17	the EVP and Chief Financial Officer of NYCHA.
18	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Make sure the red
19	light is on, please.
20	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
21	I'm sorry?
22	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Make sure the red
23	light is on so we can hear you. Thank you.
24	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
25	Can you hear me now? Now? Thank you.

Good morning. Just going to give you a few short updates on the NYCHA 2025 to 2029 Financial Plan. Next slide, please.

Our rent arrears through February 28, 5 2025, stands at 545 million dollars. That means that 6 7 approximately 67,000 households, or around 46 percent of all NYCHA households, owe some portion of arrears. 8 9 This is after we successfully advocated for and received 161 million dollars in ERAP funds through 10 11 the State with 150 million already being applied to 12 tenant accounts. This data does not yet reflect the 13 COVID Rental Arrears Program or the HOME-ARP Program. Data indicates that our cumulative 12-month rent 14 15 collection rate is relatively steady at 63 percent. 16 This includes new charges as well as arrears. This 17 may mean that while some households have not yet been 18 able to completely catch up on their arrears, more 19 households are back to making regular rent payments 20 each month, which demonstrates an important step in 21 the right direction. Next slide, please.

I won't spend too much time here. This is our 2025 sources and uses. Lisa went through it in her testimony. The key pieces here to note is that NYCHA's budget is 5.4 billion dollars. It assumes 1

2 billion dollars in rent revenue, including 125 3 million in HOME-ARP funding to support our tenant 4 arrears, and that is a program that we are actively working through. In terms of our uses, 1.86 billion 5 dollars of personal expenditures provides for salary 6 7 and fringe for 12,051 full-time employees as well as 8 a 182-million-dollar overtime budget. In great news, 9 we do expect a balanced budget at the end of Calendar Year 2025. Next slide, please. 10

11 While we have been able to balance our 12 budget in 2025, significant deficits loom in the 13 outyears so NYCHA will implement additional cost-14 saving measures through the years to mitigate our 15 deficits in 2026 and beyond. We do go through an 16 annual budget process where we adjust all of our estimates for sources and uses, and so we do expect 17 18 to be able to make meaningful progress towards 19 closing our deficits in the outyears. And lastly, on 20 our capital budget, our five-year capital plan includes 7.8 billion dollars in sources. 6 billion 21 will be invested in minor and major capital repairs 2.2 23 at NYCHA properties. In 2025 alone, that means 3.4 billion dollars in funds will become available, of 24 which 3 billion will be invested in major and minor 25

2 capital repairs at NYCHA properties. We are really 3 grateful for our City support. The City is providing 4 1.7 billion specifically for the HUD-SDNY agreement 5 so we can continue to make meaningful progress 6 towards our compliance goals. Thank you.

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Thank 7 8 you, Annika. I will now discuss a few details 9 regarding NYCHA's capital investment program. In 2025, about 3 billion dollars is available for 10 11 capital investments in our properties, including approximately 731 million in expected 2025 federal 12 capital funding, 1.3 billion in City capital funding 13 14 available for the 2025 City Fiscal Year, and other 15 federal, state, and city funds allocated from prior 16 year awards. We greatly appreciate the City's 17 support, which is helping us transform residents' 18 homes and quality of life. We are also grateful for 19 the State's commitments of over 1 billion for 20 boilers, elevators, and façade improvements.

Although this capital funding is only a fraction of the 80 billion dollars needed to fully restore our properties, we are making a difference for residents with the funding we receive. Last year, we expended 1.03 billion dollars, about 86 million

2 dollars per month, on major physical renovations, 3 completing 135 capital projects. More than 650 4 capital projects are currently underway across the 5 city, and we are targeting 1.1 billion dollars in expenditure and completion of 135 projects this year. 6 7 We have spent almost 3.2 billion dollars on Sandy recovery work, providing thousands of residents with 8 9 new roofs, flood-proofed electrical equipment, boilers, backup power generators, and flood 10 11 protection, along with exterior lights, CTV cameras, and security systems. In support of our HUD agreement 12 13 targets, we have replaced 138 boilers and 192 14 elevators through capital investments. In 2025, 15 construction work is underway at scores of 16 developments to replace an additional 100 boilers and 17 83 elevators. We have renovated 405 interior trash 18 compactor rooms with new equipment, and 21 waste 19 yards with new interior compactors. Thirty waste 20 yards are currently in construction. We have replaced 545 roofs through our roof replacement program since 21 2.2 2018, and an additional 275 roof replacements are in 23 progress.

24 We have also completed or advanced a 25 range of smaller projects, from CCTV and lighting to

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 16
2	playgrounds and community and senior centers, funded
3	through Mayoral, discretionary City Council, or
4	Borough President allocations. This includes 38 of
5	the City Council-funded projects that we had to pause
6	two years ago due to staffing constraints. Overall,
7	we more than doubled our City capital funds
8	commitments in City Fiscal Year 2024 to 862 million
9	dollars, or 89 percent committed. Over the next five
10	years, we plan to invest an additional approximately
11	1.3 billion to update heating systems, 1.1 billion
12	for comprehensive modernization projects, 700 million
13	to repair roofs, 400 million to repair façades, 409
14	million to replace elevators, 150 million for
15	plumbing upgrades, and 400 million in waste
16	management systems, along with many other critical
17	capital improvements.
18	Our mandate is not only to strategically

18 Our mandate is not only to strategically 19 invest limited funding in residents' homes to improve 20 their quality of life, but also to transform our organization, improving how we operate. Our 21 transformation plan guides our efforts to better 22 23 serve residents in various ways. For instance, it has enabled us to create smaller property management 24 portfolios that are easier to manage and offer 25

2 increased accountability and resources. We have also applied the neighborhood model to operations like 3 4 heat and pest management, enhancing oversight and fostering better coordination with property 5 management. Through our work order reform initiative, 6 7 work orders are being scheduled more efficiently, and we are making progress in closing them, including 8 9 skilled trades repairs. Last year, HUD inspection scores regarding our properties improved in every 10 11 borough. We achieved another important milestone last year, abating lead in more than 10,000 apartments, 12 13 providing families with the peace of mind they 14 deserve. To date, we have tested more than 100,000 15 apartments for lead using the City's stricter 16 standard. We completed over 32,000 mold inspections 17 since the beginning of 2023, and mold complaints are 18 down by 23 percent since then, due to our work to 19 replace roof fans, clean vents in apartments, and 20 install fire dampers. And we continue to 21 significantly reduce both the number and duration of 2.2 heat and elevator outages.

23 We are not only addressing the issues of 24 the past, but are also strategizing for the future. 25 For instance, our sustainability team is helping to

address the climate crisis while enhancing residents' 2 3 quality of life. The Clean Heat for All Challenge is 4 spurring the production of new energy-efficient 5 heating and cooling systems for apartments. Two manufacturers completed pilots in NYCHA apartments 6 7 and are currently scaling the initiative for full 8 building installations. The Induction Stove Challenge 9 is similarly catalyzing production of energyefficient electric induction stoves to explore the 10 11 possibility of replacing gas stoves in NYCHA 12 apartments. At Polo Grounds Towers, we are in the final stages of construction of the first-ever 13 14 pneumatic waste collection system in a public housing 15 development. Once fully complete, the system will 16 reduce the time staff spends transporting trash, 17 enabling them to focus their efforts elsewhere. 18 We are forging new frameworks for 19 bringing our aging developments the funding they 20 desperately need. Last year, PACT closed on the financing for eight developments, representing 1.7 21 billion dollars in comprehensive renovation for 2.2 23 nearly 7,600 residents. In October, we announced that the next phase of work is beginning at one especially 24

notable PACT project at Fulton and Elliott Chelsea

25

2 Houses, following years of community engagement 3 there. A total of nearly 7 billion dollars has been 4 invested in NYCHA properties to date, thanks to the 5 PACT program. Overall, 146 NYCHA developments, representing nearly 39,000 apartments, are in pre-6 development, are under construction, or have 7 8 completed construction through the program. We are on 9 track to bring comprehensive repairs and upgrades, along with enhanced property management and social 10 11 services, to a total of more than 142,000 residents through PACT. 12

13 The New York City Public Housing 14 Preservation Trust will also dramatically improve the 15 quality of life for residents. The Trust and NYCHA recently released RFPs for major capital renovations 16 17 and repairs at Bronx River Addition and Nostrand 18 Houses, the first two developments whose residents 19 voted to join the Trust. Resident votes have also 20 been held, or soon will be held, at Throgs Neck 21 Addition, Randall Avenue-Balcom, Highland Houses, 2.2 Coney Island Houses, and Coney Island 1, Site 1B. 23 Developed in collaboration with residents, both the Trust and PACT bring developments 24 the more stable Section 8 federal funding, which is 25

worth nearly double what Section 9 apartments receive. These initiatives also ensure that NYCHA developments remain public and that residents maintain their rights and protections, including permanently affordable rent.

7 Our Comprehensive Modernization Program 8 will complete holistic capital improvements instead 9 of simply repairing individual building components. Launched at four developments so far, the program is 10 11 supported by 678 million dollars in our City Capital Action Plan and 212 million dollars from the Gowanus 12 13 Neighborhood Rezoning. Design-build teams are on-14 site, initiating renovations at St. Nicholas and Todt 15 Hill Houses, and teams have been selected for Gowanus Houses and Wyckoff Gardens. 16

17 NYCHA is confronting serious challenges. 18 Rental arrears are at record levels, while federal 19 funding is not keeping pace with the ever-increasing 20 costs of repairing and maintaining decades-old 21 buildings. Yet we know that NYCHA is a venerable institution serving a vital role in our city, 2.2 23 providing decent and affordable homes to hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers, and so it must be 24 25 strengthened and preserved. That is why we are hard

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 21
2	at work to make the best use of limited funding,
3	while also implementing creative strategies for
4	generating desperately needed new revenue, such as
5	PACT and the Trust. Thank you for your partnership as
6	we continue to make progress in addressing the
7	challenges and ensuring NYCHA is here to serve the
8	coming generations of New Yorkers. We're happy to
9	answer any questions you may have. Thank you.
10	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
11	opening statement. We've been joined by Council
12	Member Brewer, Salaam, Bottcher, Brooks-Powers by
13	Zoom, and Kristy Marmorato.
14	Okay, we're going to get straight into
15	this. First of all, thank you again. Good to see you
16	again and, to the executives, it's always a pleasure.
17	We see that the Preliminary Plan includes
18	very minimal changes with NYCHA's Fiscal 2026 budget,
19	and that leads me to my first question. What have
20	been some of your conversations with OMB and the
21	Administration about City funding in Fiscal Year
22	2026?
23	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
24	Thank you for that question, Council Member Banks. We
25	are always in conversation.

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 22
2	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Can you move the mic
3	closer so I can hear you? Thank you. Thank you.
4	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
5	Thank you. We are always in conversation with OMB and
6	our City Hall partners regarding our programming. The
7	City supports NYCHA quite generously, and this
8	funding relationship is not seen in other PHAs across
9	the country. The actual preliminary budget provides
10	an additional 846 million dollars over 10 years for
11	NYCHA, and we're very grateful for that support.
12	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Were there any new
13	needs that you requested from the Administration that
14	were not included in this particular plan?
15	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
16	We continuously speak to them about our programming
17	and our new needs. We actually received 175 million
18	dollars via City of Yes alone, and so, again, we
19	found that the City has been very grateful and
20	responsive to us.
21	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And what new needs are
22	you requesting from the City to be included in the
23	Executive Plan?
24	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:

We're still under negotiations with the City, so we

1COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING232don't have specific proposals for the Executive Plan3as yet.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. When it comes to 5 the City capital funding increases, the City of Yes and the Fiscal Year 2025 Adopted Budget, as part of 6 7 the City's Fiscal 2025 Adopted Budget, the Council negotiated for an additional 2 billion in capital 8 9 funding for affordable housing across Fiscal Years 2025 and 2026. Included in this package was 700 10 million for NYCHA, 350 million in each Fiscal Year. 11 12 Can you give the Committee an update on how the 13 funding will be used in the up-and-coming Fiscal 14 Years?

15 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: So with regard to the City of Yes funding, we 16 17 received 175 million in additional capital funds for 18 various projects through Fiscal Year '26 through '28. 19 It includes repairs for vacant units, critical 20 infrastructure, and environmental hazard mitigation. 21 OMB, NYCHA, and City Hall are all currently in discussions about the exact allocation of these 2.2 23 funds, and all parties will have to agree to the allocation before work proceeds. We're happy to 24

2 provide an update to the Council when those 3 allocations have been decided on.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We definitely 5 appreciate that. The Council also negotiated for more funding flow to NYCHA as part of the City of Yes/City 6 7 for All. As a result of the Council's advocacy, the Administration committed to an additional 200 million 8 9 in capital funds to support vacant unit readiness and Section 8 repairs. Specifically, the Administration 10 11 committed 175 million to ready vacant units. 75 12 million of this was committed to Fiscal Year 2025 and Fiscal Year 2026. However, the Preliminary Capital 13 Commitment Plan shows no variances in vacant unit 14 15 readiness in those years. Can you explain when the 16 Council can see these funds added?

17 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 18 Sure. I can't speak to the process of OMB adding the 19 funds, but I can tell you that for the Vacant Unit 20 Readiness Program, we have 111 million in City Fiscal 21 Year 2025 and 2026. Through the five-year horizon, we have 193 million dollars. We're working pretty 2.2 23 diligently on that program, and Eva can speak more to that if you'd like. 24

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes.

2	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Thank
3	you, Council Member. I know we've had many
4	conversations here about our vacant unit production,
5	and I'm very happy today to share that in 2024, our
6	production was 24 percent higher than the previous
7	year. We had just over 4,000 vacant unit move-ins in
8	Calendar Year 2024, and again, that's 52 percent
9	higher. So, as we've stated in these hearings, we've
10	been laser-focused on this program and turning that
11	around. We are doing now approximately 430 turnovers
12	a month.
13	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The State also
14	committed to including 25 million to support these
15	efforts. Was this included in the Governor's
16	Executive Budget, and how confident are you it will
17	be included in the enacted budget?
18	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
19	Yes. We can confirm that there is 25 million in the
20	Governor's Executive Budget.
21	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And was this included
22	in the Governor's Executive Budget?
23	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
24	Yes, sir.
25	

2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, how confident 3 are you that this will be included in the enacted 4 budget?

5 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:6 We're very confident and hopeful.

7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. When it comes to 8 rent arrears, the rent obviously is a critical 9 resource of revenue for NYCHA, and the disruption in the rental payments as a result of the COVID pandemic 10 11 has been a challenge for the Authority. Can you 12 update the Committee on the progress you're making 13 with rental arrears, what trends are you seeing and 14 what concerns you may have, and is NYCHA's financial 15 plan reflects the rental revenue of over 1 billion in 2025, but approximately only 920 million in 2026. Can 16 17 you explain the drop, and does it have anything to do 18 with the ERAP funding?

19 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 20 Sure. Thank you so much for that question, Council 21 Member Banks. So as of February 28, 2025, our rent 22 arrears stood at 545 million. This is after we 23 applied 150 million dollars of the State ERAP funds. 24 On average, the households that are in arrears owe 25 around 8,116 dollars, which is a considerable sum for

low-income residents. Our rent collection rate is 2 3 around 63 percent through February 28, 2025. The 4 percentage is more or less the same or slightly lower 5 than what we've seen in 2024 and 2023, but what's really important is that we're actually collecting 6 7 more dollars. So, for example, in 2024, at a 65 8 percent rate, we collected 993 million dollars. In 9 2023, at a 65 percent rate, we collected 962 million dollars. So, there is some progress that's being 10 11 made. What's drowning out the collection rate is the 12 arrears balance. It is large. It is difficult for 13 residents to manage. The good news is we do have two 14 programs we'll be implementing this year. The first 15 is the COVID Rental Arrears Program through the State. That's around 35 million dollars. We are 16 17 already submitting a payment file to the State. We've 18 started to receive some funds, and we'll be applying 19 those to tenant accounts. We also have a HOME-ARP 20 program of, it's a total of 150. We conservatively 21 estimate 125 million dollars, and we're working with 2.2 our HPD, City Hall, and OMB partners on that program. 23 So, we expect that after those two programs, our rent arrears should drop to around 360 million dollars. 24

27

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 28
2	Again, large, some certainly, but much progress as to
3	where we are today.
4	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What do you think is
5	the reason why our tenants are not paying rent?
6	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
7	Well, I don't think it's fair to say they're not
8	paying.
9	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I mean, there are some
10	situations where tenants are not paying rent because
11	of the services.
12	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
13	I think what we've seen at least is that when we look
14	at the monthly collection, our tenants are trying to
15	keep up with the new charges every month, and where
16	they're struggling is on the rent arrears. So, if you
17	are a low-income family, you make 30,000 dollars,
18	owing 8,000 dollars is difficult. In our payment
19	plans, you can only pay up to 40 percent of your
20	income, as opposed to 30 percent normally so it will
21	take a family a considerable number of years to pay
22	down an 8,000 balance. That's why HOME-ARP is
23	important. That's why ERAP is important. That's why
24	COVID Rent Arrears is important. If we apply those
25	large programs, we hope that it will bring the

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 29 2 arrears down for our tenants, and those monthly payments that they make, they'll be able to catch up 3 4 again. CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Would you agree that 5 there are some residents who are withholding rent 6 7 because of lack of service? CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 8 9 I do not know of that circumstance, but it could be possible. 10 11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. We are going to 12 move on to my Colleagues who have questions, and 13 we're going to start with Council Member Brewer. 14 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very 15 much, and thank you, NYCHA, because I think we write 16 you about 500 letters a week, so we appreciate the 17 answers, and we also appreciate Brian Honan, of 18 course. 19 The vacancies, there's two kinds of 20 vacancies. There's the apartment vacancies, and then I think there's also commercial vacancies. I know in 21 2.2 one development I got 40 vacancies. I know you have a 23 capital budget challenge, but how are you addressing the vacancies? Because it's hard for the public to 24 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 30
2	understand we have a housing crisis and there are
3	vacant apartments.
4	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yes,
5	thank you, Council Member Brewer. As I just
6	mentioned, we have been very focused on our turnover.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I saw your number,
8	but there's a lot more to go. Go ahead.
9	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yeah,
10	there's definitely more to go. One of our biggest
11	challenges is that 60 percent of the vacancies go to
12	transfers so we also have a significant number of
13	emergency transfers and other transfer needs, so
14	every time we move someone in, another vacant unit
15	opens up, and so that's really why it's hard to see
16	the overall number of vacancies go down because of
17	the level of transfers that we're doing.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know, but
19	there's still a number of vacancies, fire, mold,
20	etc., ones that need to be restored, renovated.
21	What's that number?
22	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Our
23	total number of vacant units is just over 8,000.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.
25	

2	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: That
3	includes about 1,600, almost 1,700 that are off the
4	rent roll temporarily awaiting some form of
5	modernization or rehab, about 600 that are vacant but
6	already matched to a resident to prepare for move-in,
7	and then about 5,700 is what we call vacant and
8	available so that's our turnover universe. And that
9	5,700, we're working on about 430 turnovers a month,
10	but again, with 60 percent of those going to
11	transfers, it's hard to make headway on the overall
12	number.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. How long
14	does it take when fixed up, renovated, how long does
15	it take to get somebody into an apartment?
16	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: It
17	varies, and we're doing a lot of data work around
18	that turnover time.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I get complaints
20	about that, just so you know.
21	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yeah.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: It depends from
23	what to what?
24	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: It
25	depends on residents having, again, for transfers or

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 32
2	new admissions, they still right now have to come up
3	with rental fees, particularly for new admissions,
4	the security deposit first month, and many times they
5	work with HRA to get some of that assistance, and
6	then, of course, moving costs. And so we match to a
7	unit after the turnover is complete so they see a
8	renovated apartment, but then they still have to come
9	with the funding available to sign the lease and get
10	their keys and then do their move-in, and so
11	sometimes there are delays in that side of the
12	process.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Then how about
14	commercial vacancies? How many do you have?
15	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I'm glad
16	that you asked about it. I don't have the commercial
17	vacancy number on me right now.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I've been
19	complaining about this for a long time.
20	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I'm
21	happy to say that we have just started a new working
22	group to focus on some of our commercial spaces. We
23	are looking at both commercial and community spaces
24	to understand what the capital needs are of those
25	spaces, what the potential opportunities are for

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 33
2	rental. It's just starting now, so I can't say any
3	further, but we're happy to follow up with you more
4	about that work.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: You don't know how
6	many you have?
7	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: We do
8	know. I just don't have that number with me today.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. And then the
10	other thing is I want to thank your staff because we
11	just had a meeting on the west side with all of the
12	developmental leaders, NYCHA agencies. It was
13	excellent. In fact, I would recommend it for every
14	neighborhood. And the doors, D-O-O-R-S, you break
15	them, you fix them, you break them. So it's about
16	70,000 per door. So what are we going to do about
17	that? It needs a different approach. What do you
18	suggest?
19	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Two
20	things that we're focusing on with doors right now.
21	The first is to ensure that property management is
22	made aware as soon as a door is broken because we do
23	have significant CCTV cameras across the portfolio,
24	and we have had some success in actually catching
25	vandalism of the doors so working with our partners

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 34
2	at NYPD and our CCTV team in order to identify who's
3	breaking the door. So that's one thing. So as soon as
4	we have that notice, the better so that we can deal
5	with it. The second is we are working to improve our
6	training of maintenance workers to be able to fix the
7	doors so we're hoping to work with just in-house
8	rather than having to rely on vendors more, but that
9	does require retraining our maintenance workers on
10	some of the door technology, and that's something
11	we're hoping to start soon.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: My understanding
13	is a lot of the cameras are not focused on the door,
14	though. So in other words, you need a camera that's
15	focused on the door. Is that something that you're
16	looking at?
17	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yes, we
18	do have significant cameras focused on the lobby
19	doors.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: My understanding
21	is not in the developments that I'm talking about. So
22	that could be looked at?
23	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE:
24	Absolutely. We're happy to follow up and get the list
25	of developments.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: All right. Thank3 you very much.

35

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Next, we'll have5 Council Member Marmorato.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Thank you, 6 7 Chair. So, I have to tell you, I have about five 8 NYCHA developments in my District in the Northeast 9 Bronx, and you guys are not doing enough. It says it's going to take about 1.8 billion dollars just to 10 11 repair and bring them up to speed for the capital 12 projects. And, you know, it's devastating to have to 13 go into these NYCHAs, and I go twice a month with my 14 family, we do food pantries, we do events constantly, 15 and just to see what these people are dealing with 16 and how they're suffering is unacceptable, okay? I 17 think that you guys got to do better on that stuff.

As far as your Fiscal 2026 Preliminary Budget includes 374 million in City tax levy support, but residents continue to experience slow response times for repair, security concerns, and deteriorating building conditions. Where is this money going?

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: That's the question.

25

2 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
3 So, I'm sorry, can you just repeat the question?
4 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Where is the
5 money going that you're getting from the City tax
6 levy?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 7 8 Oh, sure. So, in terms of the funding for City tax 9 levy, a large portion of that funding goes to collective bargaining payments for union workers, 10 11 Vacant Unit Readiness Program as well as some smaller 12 programs in support of things like Woodside Senior 13 Center, organics expansion, food and nutrition 14 services. We have a long list that we're happy to 15 share if you'd like specifics on programs.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Absolutely, 17 definitely. I'd like to see that. And as far as like 18 the doors, the issue with the doors, I know you had 19 said that you have CCTV video and usually they are 20 told to fix it immediately. That's not true. It 21 takes, I have to start calling, I have to go to these 2.2 developments myself, and I have to take pictures and 23 start sending it to the higher ups just to put it on their radar, because whoever's there to fix it is not 24 doing their job. They're not coming through and 25

2	helping these people, and it's constant. At one
3	building, the door was broken three times in one
4	week, and this is from a resident who doesn't even
5	live and not on the lease of the building, and this
6	person is still in the building. What are you doing
7	to remove? And then another one, we had a shooting.
8	We have somebody subleasing an apartment in another
9	building, okay, who then subleased it to somebody
10	else, and there was a shootout. There are families
11	that live here with children. What are you doing to
12	remove these individuals who are violating all of
13	your agreements to get rid of them? What are we doing
14	here?
15	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Thank
16	you, Council Member. I understand how frustrating
17	some of these situations are to our families. So
18	first let me start with the doors. Unfortunately,
19	right now with the doors, there can be delays in
20	fixing them because we do require vendors to fix many
21	of the magnetic technologies and layered access
22	components.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: But this is
24	people's safety.

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I
3 understand.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: You have to 5 have fast track.

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: We are 6 7 doing our best to make sure that the vendors are responsive and coming in there, but as you said, too, 8 9 we bring them in to repair the doors, and they often get broken again, which is why we're very focused on 10 11 coordinating our efforts with NYPD, with our CCTV 12 cameras, in order to try to prevent that vandalism so that the investment we make with our vendors in 13 14 repairing the doors actually holds, and that's 15 something I'm happy to come to the site with you and walk with you and identify the specific areas that 16 17 you're talking about so that we can make sure that we have the right focus on it. 18 19 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: We're going to

21 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I'd be

be put together a whole day for that.

22 happy to. I'd be happy to.

20

Regarding the unauthorized occupants,
that is something we are also working very closely
with NYPD on. They have a task force that we've been

1	
1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 39
2	successfully working with to remove we've removed I
3	think over 200 unauthorized occupants, and we've
4	reclaimed those apartments, and so that is also
5	something I'm happy to work with your team on. It's
6	been a very successful partnership. It is a very
7	difficult process. Obviously, we have to make sure
8	we've followed up within the timeframe that we can
9	before we have to go through kind of a housing court
10	type process.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Okay. All
12	right.
13	Now, we have routine complaints about
14	leaks, mold, rodent infestations, and it takes months
15	to be addressed, months. What's the oversight to hold
16	on the contractors and the maintenance and the staff?
17	What's the accountability here for these delays?
18	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yes, and
19	again, I definitely want to get more details from you
20	after this hearing of the specific situations that
21	you're referring to.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: But this is
23	like hundreds of apartments that this is constantly
24	happening for. It's not like, oh, I can give you one
25	instance or I could give you one address. We're

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

inundated with complaints to my office, and even when J go there, I have to have women showing me that she has mold growing on the incinerator wall, which is on the other wall of her bedroom. These are things that even though they put a ticket in through NYCHA, they're still calling my office because nothing is getting done about it.

9 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: And that's why any examples you can give me, I know that 10 11 it's widespread, but those examples are helpful for us. Overall, we have increased our productivity 12 13 across every single trade in the portfolio. Seventy-14 five percent of our work orders are getting done with 15 work performed at that time, so there's no more high 16 instances of sequencing. We're really trying to focus on getting the work done when we show up. We've also 17 18 been able now to stay on top of our annual demand. 19 We're closing 96 percent of the work orders that we 20 are getting on a year-over-year basis, so our 21 productivity changes that we've put in place over the 2.2 last few years are starting to show improvement in 23 every single trade. We are working very hard to ensure that we are getting everything scheduled that 24 25 we can, so we encourage residents to work with their

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 41 neighborhood planner to get on the schedule. We know 2 3 that our schedules are far out, and that has to do 4 with our limited staffing. But once you're on the 5 schedule... COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Didn't you just 6 7 cut your staff? CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Did I 8 9 what? 10 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: The staff 11 headcount is being cut. 12 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: We have not cut our headcount on skilled trades. We are 13 14 focused on having the skilled trades there to do it, 15 but we are unable to grow that headcount because of 16 our funding limitations. 17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You can have another minute if you need? 18 19 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: I'll go for the 20 second round. Thank you. CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We'll come back for 21 the second round. Thank you. 2.2 23 We have been joined by Council Member Avilés, and we'll go to Council Member Brannan with 24 questions. 25

2	COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you, Chair.
3	I wanted to ask about the capital needs. I see
4	there's a little over 78 billion in capital needs. Is
5	that right? Okay. But the five-year capital plan is
6	around 7.8 billion. So I guess two questions. If the
7	capital need is 78 billion, five-year capital plan is
8	barely 8 billion, how are we going to prioritize and
9	triage those needs?
10	CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Sure. Thank
11	you, Council Member Brannan. So with the current
12	capital plan and since the HUD agreement in 2019, we
13	focus the capital investments on core compliance
14	areas that relate to resident health and life safety.
15	So under the HUD agreement, we have our focus
16	pillars, the heating, elevators, waste and pest
17	management, leaks and mold abatement, and then a few
18	other areas. That's where most of our capital funding
19	is allocated. So of our portfolio today, which is
20	about 6 billion active investment, 2 billion is in
21	heating, over half a billion is in elevators and some
22	of those statistics that were in the testimony. But
23	basically, we focus most of our investment in the
24	pillar areas. Obviously, in addition to that, we have
25	a number of programs that have been funded by the
1	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 43
2	City that are very critical. So we have a 1.5-
3	billion-dollars roofing program. We have over half a
4	billion dollars in façade work and brick work that's
5	critical as well. And then we obviously have generous
6	contributions from City Council Members that
7	typically are focused on things like community
8	centers, playgrounds, and other amenities on the
9	campus. It's only about 1 percent of our budget, but
10	it is a significant number of projects. And so
11	largely, our funding goes directly to specific areas
12	we're required to invest in for compliance and for
13	resident health and safety.
14	COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I mean, that
15	sounds great, but the pillars, it sounds like it
16	covers just about everything. So how do you triage
17	within that bucket?
18	CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Sure. So
19	maybe I'll just make two comments. Out of our 78
20	billion dollars of need, about a third of it is
21	within apartments so everything from windows to
22	flooring to fixtures, and that's where we're not able
23	to invest because it doesn't directly relate to those
24	compliance areas so there's a significant portion of
25	need that we're not able to meet today that relate to
I	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 44
2	kind of day-to-day apartment quality of life. Within
3	each area, we have prioritization that's based on
4	that type of asset. So, as you would imagine, for
5	something like heating, our prioritization is based
6	on things like the rate of heating outages, work
7	orders that are put in, and then what we typically
8	call the remaining useful life of the asset. So, in a
9	heating system, whether it's the boilers or the
10	piping or other types of components, they have a
11	typical life, anywhere from five years up to 80
12	years. And as those assets get to the end of their
13	life, they start to have a lot more problems, they
14	fail more frequently, we have to continually repair
15	them, and so when we're prioritizing funding in any
16	area, we look at the key factors that should drive
17	where the systems are in most need of investment, and
18	then we invest on that basis.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: And how much of
20	that would be covered by PACT?
21	CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: When we put
22	out the 2023 Physical Needs Assessment, which is
23	where that 78-billion-dollar number comes from, at
24	the time we were able to project that about half of
25	that need, 40 billion, would be addressed through our

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 45
2	PACT program as well as the Public Housing
3	Preservation Trust, so those tools allow us to
4	address about half of that need as we go, and
5	otherwise we're looking for either extending those
6	strategies or looking for additional capital
7	investment for the remaining need.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Okay. Thank you
9	very much. Thank you, Chair.
10	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. We have
11	Council Member Bottcher.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Thank you so
13	much. You said a short while ago that 200
14	unauthorized occupants had been removed from NYCHA
15	apartments. By unauthorized occupants, are you
16	referring to individuals who are squatting in empty
17	apartments?
18	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yeah, so
19	we can clarify the terminology for you between
20	squatter versus unauthorized. Obviously, squatters
21	have rights after 30 days, and so these are
22	apartments where there are unauthorized occupants
23	that have not yet reached 30 days and squatting so
24	it's slightly technical. We can certainly send you
25	the breakdown of the work that we're doing with NYPD.
1	

2	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: So, an
3	unauthorized occupant is someone who is living in a
4	vacant apartment for less than 30 days.
5	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Thank
6	you for the question. I want to just make sure that
7	we're using the terminology carefully. So, I think
8	it's best for us to speak to the NYPD and get back to
9	you because I think there are terminology that's used
10	differently by the NYPD than we do, and so I just
11	don't want to misstate anything.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Putting the
13	terminology aside, there are people who have occupied
14	empty NYCHA apartments, and they are now there.
15	They're not leaseholders. How many of those exist
16	throughout the NYCHA portfolio? How many units are
17	occupied from folks who just moved in without
18	permission?
19	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I don't
20	have the total number of squatters across the
21	portfolio. I don't know if that's something we are
22	tracking comprehensively, so I don't think we have
23	that full number.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: 200, though,
25	have been removed to date. Over what period of time?

CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I'd say
over the past year or so with our work with the NYPD
Task Force on this.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: And though you 6 might not have the exact number handy, are we talking 7 about thousands of units? Are we talking about 8 hundreds? Because 200 were removed.

9 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I really 10 couldn't say.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: So it could be a 12 lot more than 200 that are occupied by... and you 13 talked about a concerted effort. What was the name of 14 that effort to remove the unauthorized occupants?

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: The NYPD 16 has a task force. It's the Violence Prevention Task 17 Force, which is a strange name. I think it's really Anti-Violence Prevention, but it's called the 18 19 Violence Prevention Coordinator. It was Detective 20 Barron. He just recently retired. We were working closely with his team to coordinate reclamation of 21 2.2 our apartments.

COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: And once someone is there for over 30 days, it's no longer dealt with in that way. They now have rights to remain there.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 48 2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I can 3 tell you that currently our active holdover licensee cases, which is, I believe, what you're referring to, 4 we currently have 1,448 active cases in Landlord-5 Tenant Court. 6 7 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Got it. So there's 1,448 instances of when someone has moved 8 9 into an empty unit. CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Yeah, 10 11 they're holdover licensees. COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: And those are in 12 13 Landlord-Tenant Court to figure it out that way. CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: 14 15 Correct. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: In 2019, NYCHA 17 collected 88 percent of the rent; 2020, it was 81; 18 2021, it was 71 percent of the rent; '22, 64; and 19 then it was 64 again, and then last year, it was 65 20 percent. NYCHA is anticipating around 185 million dollars in additional funding to help address this 21 2.2 rent arrears problem, which is a big problem because 23 it's a third of your operating budget comes from rent. After that 185 million dollars is spent to 24 address rent arrears, what do you anticipate the rent 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 49
2	arrears rate to be? What percentage of the rent will
3	NYCHA be collecting in 2026?
4	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
5	I could not give a percentage of the rent that we
6	anticipate to be collected. I would say that at that
7	point, we would have a balance of 360 million dollars
8	in rent arrears still owed, and so we expect that the
9	rent arrears rate would increase, but I could not
10	tell you by what figure. It really does depend on
11	tenant behavior.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: One more
13	question, Chair. I apologize.
14	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You may.
15	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: So once that 185
16	million is spent to address the rent arrears, what's
17	the plan beyond that? What additional funding is
18	coming? Where do we go from there?
19	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
20	Sure. So we don't know of, at this point, any
21	additional rental assistance programs beyond that
22	funding, and so we would continue to do our normal
23	tenant workouts and enforcement. So, we would
24	certainly work with our tenants to get them on
25	payment plans, encourage folks to pay the rent, do

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 50
2	one-shot deals with HRA, and do the sort of
3	enforcement and collection work hand-in-hand with our
4	tenants at the property level. So there are no other
5	to answer the question very clearly, there are no
6	other rent assistance programs beyond those that we
7	are aware of at this time.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: And what size
9	check would you need right now to cover all the rent
10	arrears out there?
11	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
12	545 million.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: So we've got to
14	get you that delta there between the 185 million and
15	the 545, you said?
16	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
17	So you'd have to get us 360 million.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Okay. This is
19	critical that we do this because it's the… when
20	people have these rent arrears on their backs, it's
21	hard to get them up-to-date on their month-to-month
22	payments.
23	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
24	Council Member, yeah, that's exactly right. When you
25	think about a family, and our CFO mentioned this

1	
1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 51
2	earlier, to owe 6,000 dollars when your rent is 350
3	dollars, although we are so incredibly grateful that
4	we were able to provide rental assistance to our
5	tenants, it came two years into the pandemic. So, we
6	have residents, really through no fault of their own,
7	so many of them want to pay rent, but it's very, very
8	difficult for them to catch up. And some sign payment
9	agreements, but as we mentioned, we can only go up to
10	40 percent of a tenant's income, and so that pushes
11	out their ability to become non-delinquent years and
12	so it's really a struggle, and I think you're
13	absolutely right that there are so many residents
14	that want to pay their rent and are staying current,
15	but the significant amount of arrears, it's going to
16	take them five to 10 years to catch up.
17	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
18	And I just want to correct one thing on Lisa's
19	behalf. The average rent arrears owed per household
20	is 8,116 dollars.
21	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Thank
22	you.
23	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council
24	Member Bottcher. We have Council Member Avilés.
25	

2	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you so much,
3	Chair. Thank you to the NYCHA folks. I'm so sorry if
4	I ask a question that you've been through already. I
5	came in a little late, but I'm looking at the adopted
6	capital plan chart in your testimony on page five,
7	and I'm really struck by the 2026 column that says
8	State capital sources and a big zero. Why is that,
9	and what are we asking the State? What level of
10	funding are we asking the State to commit to NYCHA?
11	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
12	Sure. Thank you for the question, Council Member
13	Avilés. We are asking the State for 500 million
14	dollars of capital funding in support of our
15	rehabilitation of our properties. We would welcome
16	any advocacy from our City Council Members in support
17	of that ask.
18	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: And I guess that
19	is a slightly decreased ask from what the prior 2025
20	column shows.
21	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
22	So, the prior year includes a rollover of any funding
23	that wasn't spent previously.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Is there a
25	potential for rollover from 2025 into 2026?

2	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
3	It's certainly possible. We continue to work to spend
4	on all of our capital funds. As you know, capital
5	projects take a number of years to complete so it's
6	certainly possible that some of that money could roll
7	over, but we really do believe that an additional 500
8	million dollars from the State could help us to make
9	meaningful progress.
10	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Yes. The State 100
11	percent should be actually contributing a significant
12	amount to their Authority.
13	In terms of vacant units, my
14	understanding is that we are now hovering around an
15	8,000 number of vacant units across, which gives me a
16	heart attack, because the numbers are increasing when
17	it should be decreasing, given the thrust and the
18	funding to get them online so what is happening?
19	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Thank
20	you, Council Member. So yes, your numbers are
21	correct. We are happy to report that in 2024, we
22	turned over just over 4,000 units, which is a 52
23	percent increase from the previous year so as we've
24	said in our multiple conversations here, this is a
25	high priority for us and something we've been very
I	

2 focused on improving our production of. We turn over about 430 units a month. However, 60 percent of the 3 4 move-ins are transfers due to emergency transfers, other needs, reasonable accommodations. So when 60 5 percent of the move-ins every month are a transfer, 6 7 it just creates another vacant unit so it's very hard 8 to make progress on the overall number. But I 9 actually think the overall number is less important than our actual productivity here so the fact that 10 11 we've increased production by 52 percent, it's something we're continuing to look at and hoping to 12 increase further. But 430 units a month is the 13 14 highest number we've had in the past few years. And I 15 want to reiterate that these are lead-free and 16 asbestos-safe apartments so this is a tremendous 17 change for us and I think a really important change 18 for public housing, that these are units every month 19 coming online free of environmental hazards. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: And could you, you 21 don't have to do this right now, but I'd like to 2.2 request the office provide me with information on Red 23 Hook houses, the number of vacant units, and kind of

the situation with the houses there.

54

25

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: 3 Absolutely. I will say Red Hook is still recovering. 4 We had quite a number of vacant units that we were holding in anticipation of the comprehensive 5 modernization at Gowanus and Wyckoff, and so in order 6 7 to facilitate relocations and keep families in their 8 neighborhoods, we were holding units at Red Hook in 9 anticipation of that. We since released a lot of units because the relocation plans have changed for 10 11 Gowanus and Wyckoff, and so we're now working on 12 turning those over.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Yeah. And Red Hook 13 14 residents were being sent to East New York, which is 15 obscene, right? When we have vacant units in Red 16 Hook, we're holding them for another development, Gowanus, which is our neighbor, but then when you got 17 18 Red Hook residents being sent to East New York, it 19 doesn't make any sense at all so I'm glad to hear 20 that those units are going to be turned over. We can 21 follow up more specifically around that.

In terms of, I hear you on the one-to-one shift, so the overall numbers don't match. But even 8,000 units in a housing crisis, we want you to continue that productivity. That's what we're

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 56
2	investing in so we're glad to hear that there is
3	progress, even though the numbers don't feel that
4	way. We'll continue to certainly push on that. In
5	terms of, we've been… Chair, I'm sorry, just one more
6	question.
7	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You're permitted,
8	Council Member.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: In terms of, we
10	understand that, or can you tell me more about how
11	long it is taking for folks to process vouchers to
12	get a unit in NYCHA? We understand that there is a
13	very slow slog around getting folks who are having
14	vouchers to get units.
15	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Thank
16	you for that question. I think it's less of an issue
17	with them getting vouchers but finding apartments. As
18	you know, we have an incredibly low vacancy rate, and
19	we have vendors working with our voucher holders to
20	try to help them find apartments, but I think that's
21	really where the rub is.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Okay. So how do
23	you manage? I know you have transfers and emergency
24	transfers, obviously, that should be getting priority
25	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 57
2	and new folks. How do you triage amongst those
3	competing populations?
4	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: That
5	is a great question that I do not have the answer to,
6	and I don't want to misspeak so that's something that
7	we can get back to you on.
8	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Okay. Happy to
9	follow up.
10	And then, I guess, lastly, thank you for,
11	I think, Shaan, you sent information around capital
12	updates, and I would like to have a sidebar
13	conversation with you to get more clarity. It's very
14	generic, and I don't understand what it means
15	practically in terms of the development so I'll be in
16	touch with you around that.
17	CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Of course.
18	Thank you.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you. Thank
20	you, Chair.
21	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes. We've also been
22	joined by Council Member Mealy. And Council Member
23	Mealy, you have some questions?
24	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you, Chair. I
25	have one question. With your five-year plan, how can

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 58
2	you justify having no property emergencies? Could
3	someone explain that to me? Because a senior fell
4	out, and the Fire Department came and broke down her
5	door, got inside, and do you know how long her door
6	just was fixed after I found out? So, you're saying
7	now any NYCHA development will not have emergency
8	services?
9	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
10	No, ma'am. That number is just an estimate. We do it
11	year-over-year to figure out.
12	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: But it's going down
13	to zero.
14	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
15	Yes, but any of the funding, so I'll take a step back
16	and say that any of the funding that we have for our
17	capital plan could be reallocated at any moment to
18	address a property emergency so we address all
19	property emergencies in a timely manner. For example
20	COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, why would you
21	put this on your capital plan? That's giving us to
22	say that you're just not going to have it or you're
23	now going to find money whenever it arrives, but that
24	may be too late.
25	

2 CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Yeah, Council3 Member Mealy.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I already see how 5 long it takes you just to fix a door. Do you know 6 people was coming into her house stealing her food, 7 her chair? So, tell me.

CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Sure. So 8 9 maybe I can help clarify. There are allocations and 10 budgets for each property, which can be used for 11 emergencies. There's also allocations on the operating budget side. And then there are allocations 12 on the capital budget side in multiple places. And so 13 14 that line you're seeing in the budget was one of 15 those contingency budgets we hold to deal with larger 16 emergencies.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: What kind of 18 emergencies?

CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Or larger
 emergencies.

COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Larger like what? CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: What's a good example? Yeah, like a water main break. If we find a gas outage and it requires a riser replacement. If we find a major unusual roof issue that's structural and

2 is putting residents on the top floor at risk. Those 3 type of things will require a larger one-time allocation in the millions of dollars rather than a 4 smaller emergency situation so it's important, I 5 think, for us to clarify that our emergency services 6 7 team and all the work that they do and the emergency we respond to are fully funded on the operating side 8 9 to the extent we can keep them funded, just like previous years. And even on the capital budget side, 10 11 this is not the only line item that we hold to deal 12 with those type of emergencies. For example, in my 13 area, we maintain a façade emergency team when 14 there's any brickwork issues and we have to mobilize. 15 That is a separate budget line item, which is budgeted. And so I just want to clarify that line 16 17 being zero does not mean that we're not holding 18 various funds to ensure we can deal with any 19 contingencies that come up at the properties. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: So, it's like a 21 miscellaneous budget item? 2.2 CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: It's an 23 additional contingency item that we hold explicitly in the capital budget, but there's a number of places 24 we have that on capital and operating. 25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Thank you. 3 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council 4 Member Mealy. We will now proceed with some more 5 questions, and this is actually from Council Member Selvena Brooks, and this is pertaining to the Far 6 7 Rockaway Trauma Center. Last year, the Mayor and his 8 Administration agreed to support the efforts to build 9 a trauma center on Rockaway Peninsula. As part of this agreement, the Administration allocated 25 10 11 million dollars in the previous Fiscal Year and 12 agreed to transfer over the NYCHA property to the 13 City as a site of the trauma center. We are currently 14 working to secure 300,000 dollars in discretionary 15 funding to pay for the NYCHA fees associated with the land transfer process. Does NYCHA remain committed to 16 17 the land transfer process the Mayor committed to? 18 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Yes. 19 And as we've spoken about, we need a plan that 20 includes both funding and a provider before we can 21 start the Section 18 process because we do need 2.2 authorization from HUD to transfer the property. 23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Given the Mayor's commitment to this transfer, what further steps are 24 25 needed to move this process forward?

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 62 2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: 3 Funding and a provider. 4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The provider was not part of the plan? 5 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: 6 7 Pardon? 8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Was the provider not 9 part of the plan? CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: It's 10 11 my understanding that they haven't ... there's no provider at the moment, but that might have changed, 12 but we need both funding and a provider in order to 13 14 start the process with HUD. 15 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So there was no 16 provider that was part of the plan? 17 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: It's 18 my understanding that there was not. No. 19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. What is the 20 expected timeline, and by when does NYCHA expect to have this land transferred to the City? 21 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: So 2.2 23 that really is dependent upon making sure that the funding is in place and that there is a provider for 24 the trauma center. 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 63
2	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: But that was never a
3	stipulation.
4	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: That
5	is the requirement for HUD, the Section 18 process.
6	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Do we have that in
7	writing?
8	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: We
9	have spoken at length with the Council Member about
10	it. We are also very excited about this program.
11	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Can you get that to us
12	in writing?
13	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Sure.
14	We've already provided it in writing. We can provide
15	it again. But there are certain steps that are
16	required by HUD, not by NYCHA, in order to facilitate
17	this. We've provided it, but we will provide it
18	again.
19	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I don't believe
20	that's a requirement but, if you can get that to us
21	in writing, it would be greatly appreciated. They've
22	been very unresponsive.
23	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Who
24	is they?
25	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The Authority.

2	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Who?		
3	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: The Authority has been		
4	very unresponsive as far as the information that is		
5	given, and we are still waiting to find out if this		
6	is a requirement or not. Again, we just want to put		
7	pressure on the Authority to get us the information		
8	that's needed to make sure that this is a requirement		
9	and, again, we just want to stress the fact that		
10	early on this was not a stipulation in the land		
11	transfer.		
12	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Council		
13	Member, I can speak to this. I've met with Council		
14	Member Brooks-Powers several times and her staff,		
15	including increased staff at HHC.		
16	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Sorry, can I call on		
17	you to administer the oath? If you could raise your		
18	right hand.		
19	Do you affirm to tell the truth, the		
20	whole truth, and nothing but the truth before this		
21	Committee and to respond honestly to Council Member		
22	questions?		
23	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I do.		
24	COMMITTEE COUNSEL: And if you could state		
25	your name and title, please. Thank you.		

2	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: My name
3	is Brian Honan. I'm the Executive Vice President of
4	NYCHA's Intergovernmental Department.
5	So, Council Member, I've met with Council
6	Member Brooks-Powers, her staff, and HHC several
7	times on this matter. After the first time we met
8	with CEO Bova-Hiatt, I did send them the rules on
9	Section 18 dispositions. In this case, we'd be giving
10	the land at well below market rate, in fact, zero.
11	We'd have to justify that to HUD. The justification
12	would be that it would serve a community benefit.
13	Now, all of us believe that a trauma center,
14	especially on the Rockaway Peninsula, would certainly
15	serve a community benefit. However, HUD will ask us,
16	okay, what is the plan in place, where is the
17	funding, and who is the provider? Right now, we have
18	an idea, but not a plan. We need more of a solid plan
19	in order to move forward. I'm confident that with the
20	Council Member's leadership that she could put
21	together a plan that will get us there, but we're not
22	there now.
23	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, during one of

23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, during one of 24 the first meetings that was held with the DM, it was

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 66 2 confirmed that the provider could come later. Is that 3 still? EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: That is 4 not the case, no. So, HUD would not approve, and I've 5 never seen HUD approve any Section 18 disposition 6 7 without a partner in place and without funding in 8 place. 9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, is that a stipulation? Is that part of the stipulation? 10 11 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: It is a 12 requirement, yes. 13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Well, Brian, it's amazing that now we're getting this information 14 15 when there was multiple emails that were sent to you 16 and you were unresponsive to it. 17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I was not 18 unresponsive. Council Member, if you want, I can 19 forward them to you. I sent the rules. In fact, 20 probably hours after we met with the CEO and the 21 Council Member, I literally took them from HUD's website, copied and pasted them, and forwarded them 2.2 23 to you and, Council Member, I can forward them to you as well. 24

2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: All right. We're going3 to move on.

67

When it comes down to the vacancy rate unit turnover, can NYCHA provide the current vacancy rate for Carleton Manor, Hammel Houses, Ocean Bay Apartments, and Beach 41 Street Houses and Redfern Houses, and explain how NYCHA plans to reduce these vacancies under the current budget.

10 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yes, 11 Council Member, we can send you the vacancies for the 12 developments that you mentioned in your District. 13 And, as I mentioned, we are doing 430 turnovers a 14 month and working very hard to increase our 15 production.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. How much funding 17 has NYCHA allocated to speed up the turnover times for the vacant units in each of these five 18 19 developments, and what specific actions are being 20 funded to address lengthy turnover delays? 21 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: So, the vacancy budget is not broken down by development. 2.2 23 It's funding we receive to support all of our efforts

so we receive capital funding from the City.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 68 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Wait a minute. It's 2 3 not broken down per development? It's just ... CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: It's not 4 broken down per development. It's for all of our 5 turnovers. The Vacant Unit Readiness Program includes 6 7 capital funding for the asbestos removal component. 8 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: But there's no plan 9 for each development? I mean, each development has its own vacancies. Am I correct? 10 11 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: (CROSS-12 TALK) ask our developments to turn over. We're 13 getting 430 a month. It's about, on average, 100 14 units per borough per month. Queen and Staten Island 15 are combined into a borough. So, we're trying to push 16 that further every month, and so most of that work is 17 done through overtime by our skilled trade staff so 18 as not to compete with repairs and occupied 19 apartments, and it's supported as well by the Vacant 20 Unit Readiness Program capital funding, which supports the asbestos removal in our apartments. 21 2.2 CHAMBERS: (NOISE) 23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We need to establish order. Thank you. Yes, you may continue. Did you 24 finish answering the question? 25

1	COMMITTEE	ON	PUBLIC	HOUSING

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yes. CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Are there 3 4 specific targets and performance metrics outlined in 5 the budget cycle aimed at reducing vacancy durations across these five developments? And if so, what are 6 7 these targets? CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: It's not 8 9 set forth in the budget, and I think it's also 10 important to remember that NYCHA is supporting the 11 funding of this turnover within our own operating budget so the City's contribution is just a portion 12 of the overall cost for these turnovers. 13 14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And we're going to 15 switch over to repairs and maintenance backlog. What 16 steps are included in the current budget to address 17 the backlog of maintenance requests at the 18 developments within the 31st District? 19 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Thank 20 you, Council Member. So right now, our budget

21 supports our existing staff of skilled trades that we
22 are working with. As I mentioned, we have greatly
23 improved our productivity across all of our areas. I
24 understand that there's still very many repairs
25 waiting to be done, but we've been focused on...

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Lots of repairs stillneed to be done.

4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yes, we understand that it's, you know, still a long time to 5 get to repairs, but we have been working very hard to 6 align our productivity and create improvements so 7 8 that we are getting to things faster and that we are 9 getting to repairs done with work performed so that the job is getting done guicker. So, as I said, we 10 11 have 75 percent of our work orders are done with work 12 done, which means they're not getting sequenced 13 further to other repairs and other trades, and we're able to finish the job there. For skilled trades, we 14 15 are trying to stay on top of annual demand. We're 16 closing 96 percent of the work orders that are open 17 within a given year, which means we are ... 18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Is that quality work 19 or just patchwork?

20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yes, we 21 have our quality assurance team, which was set up as 22 part of the HUD agreement, one of three oversight 23 teams, does sample and review all of our work areas, 24 and so they go out, they review work performed. If 25 anyone has an issue with work quality...

2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I don't mean to cut 3 you off, but it's amazing. We hear and we see it on 4 paper as to what NYCHA is doing, and we talk about quality insurance, but it doesn't trickle down to the 5 developments. One particular development, Cypress 6 7 Houses, just had a meeting with the tenant 8 association where the manager and the superintendent 9 basically said there's not enough resources to fix the repairs in the development. Not only that, but 10 then you have a high staff turnover rate where you 11 12 have a superintendent that comes in and when you ask 13 him about past tickets that were put in, he has no 14 clue. He comes in and he starts just from where he 15 starts. How is that providing a quality service to 16 the residents of NYCHA? CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I think 17 18 it's important to understand that a lot of the 19 repairs that our residents are facing are really a 20 reflection of the capital need that we've been discussing here. 78 billion dollars of capital need 21 2.2 means that ... 23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: These are maintenance issues, ma'am. These are maintenance issues. Let's be 24

clear. These are maintenance issues.

2	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE:
3	Repetitive nature of the capital need. We'll come and
4	we'll fix a leak, but because these are the original
5	pipes, we will be back again most likely to fix that
6	leak. That is something we are trying to stay on top
7	of.
8	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What about a paint
9	job? I know a resident, she's been waiting seven
10	years for tiles. These are things that shouldn't be.
11	I know some developments, we get caught up in
12	obviously a grander scheme of things of the budget,
13	but we have a lot of developments that are falling
14	behind. This is completely because of the
15	incompetence of NYCHA. There has not been a serious
16	commitment to deal with the repair issues. So when
17	you talk about quality insurance and the fact that
18	you have all these things in place, come and speak to
19	the residents. And I've invited you out, CEO Bova, to
20	come and do a walkthrough to Cypress Houses and tour
21	the developments in my District, and we have yet to
22	see you come.
23	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Brian
24	Honan will gladly set it up. I go to many
25	developments, but respectfully this has absolutely

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 73 nothing to do with what you said, your words, not 2 3 mine, incompetence of NYCHA staff. We have 12,000 4 very... 5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We can agree to disagree on that one. 6 7 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Dedicated staff members. What we don't have is 8 9 funding, and what we haven't had for the past 90 years is sufficient funding, and this is a federal 10 11 issue, sufficient funding for public housing. 12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We agree that there 13 are issues with funding. There are major maintenance 14 issues, things that could have been dealt with that 15 has nothing to do with funding. 16 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: They 17 have everything to do with funding. 18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And it's just the lack 19 of NYCHA's commitment to really deal with the repair 20 issues. CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I'm 21 2.2 sorry, but that's not ... 23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Someone getting a paint job, listen ... 24 25

2 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Not 3 true. I'm sorry. But all of these things lead back to 4 a lack of funding. And you know what? To COO 5 Trimble's...

6 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How long have you been7 the CEO of NYCHA?

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I was 8 9 appointed interim in 2022. I've been at NYCHA for five years. I was a general counsel before I became 10 11 the CEO. And I will tell you, you will never meet a 12 more dedicated group of people who are interested in 13 making sure that all residents have decent, safe, and 14 sanitary housing. But when you are trying to balance 15 a budget, and you saw the budget in the outyears, we have a 200-million-dollar deficit. Maintenance is 16 17 tied to capital repairs.

18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, CEO Bova, would 19 you agree that when a ticket is closed out, and the 20 resident is home waiting for the repair person to 21 come, and the person never comes, and the ticket is 2.2 closed out, that has something to do with funding? 23 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Okay. Well, as Ms. Trimble spoke to about earlier, we're 24 25 going to talk about ...

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 75 2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Could you answer that 3 question? 4 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Repeat the question. I'm sorry. 5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: If a resident has a 6 ticket for repair, and the resident is home waiting 7 for that repair person to come and take care of the 8 9 repair, and the repair person doesn't come, and then the ticket ends up being closed out, does it have to 10 11 deal with a funding issue? CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: You 12 13 know what? It could actually deal with a funding 14 issue, because that maintenance worker could be stuck 15 at a different apartment finishing a repair there. No 16 work ticket should ever, ever be closed if the work 17 hasn't been done. And as our COO stated earlier, the 18 percentage of work tickets that are closed without 19 work being done has dropped absolutely dramatically. 20 I think it's 8 percent. 21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Lisa, I disagree with you. You're not dealing with reality. You throw these 2.2 23 numbers out and this data, and it doesn't match what's going on on the ground and the developments. 24

And that, to me, is the scary part, because you

2 defend this. It's a frustration that's here, and I 3 think we need a real commitment to the residents of 4 NYCHA, and we're not getting that.

5 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: We 6 share your frustration, but I can assure you that a 7 lot of the frustration that tenants are feeling, that 8 our own workers are feeling, is that there is not 9 enough money for us to handle all of the needs of our 10 173,000 apartments across five boroughs.

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I mean, listen, 12 had NYCHA done the proper maintenance over the years, 13 we wouldn't be in this situation, and that's what you 14 fail to accept and understand. I get that the ship is 15 burning now, but we could have been doing things, 16 putting things in place to avoid this, and that's 17 where we're at right now.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 18 So, Council Member Banks, I think it's important just 19 20 to add a little bit of color to what Lisa's saying in 21 terms of the numbers. So, in terms of federal 2.2 underfunding, NYCHA's been underfunded by over half a 23 billion dollars over the last 10 years in operating. So that means that over the last 10 years, we were 24 missing half a billion dollars in addition to the 25

1	COMMITTEE	ON	PUBLIC	HOUSING
_	0011111100	011	1000110	110001110

2	rent arrears. I think it's also important to note
3	that in some years, it could have been in the 50 to
4	100-million-dollar range. So I think certainly what
5	we are trying to do is more with less. There's a lot
6	more work to be done. We are all very much committed
7	to this work, and we need support from our various
8	levels of government, particularly the federal
9	government, and so forth, in order to get the
10	resources that we need for our tenants, and that's
11	the key.

77

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Listen, I hear you. I 13 think there is a commitment from all my Colleagues to 14 advocate for more funding for NYCHA, but we do have 15 to accept the fact that the ship is burning now, and 16 there are things that NYCHA can do to deal with some of these issues on the maintenance side and the 17 repair side, and it seems like NYCHA is constantly 18 19 laying on you we don't have the funding, but there is a budget that exists right now that NYCHA operates 20 with. Am I correct? 21 2.2

22 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 23 That's correct.

25

25

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Right. But some of
these issues are going back years and years of just
NYCHA not dealing with them.

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 5 And NYCHA not being historically funded. So, it has 6 7 happened over years. And it's no fault of the City, no fault of the State. But historically, we have been 8 9 underfunded by our federal government partners. And so we have tried to do the best we can with the 10 11 funding that we have, but 555 million dollars of 12 underfunding just in 10 years alone is significant 13 for us so we are doing the best we can with that 5.4-14 billion-dollar budget. We commit to you and to our 15 residents to continue to work as hard as we can and, 16 if you have specific concerns, in certain 17 developments, we are happy to (CROSS-TALK) 18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We hear that all the 19 time. If you have specific concerns, yeah. We've 20 heard that multiple times. Sometimes it's systemic. 21 It's robust. And that's the reason why we're 2.2 addressing it from that standpoint. When it comes to RAD-PACT, which is also 23 a program implemented by NYCHA, the core component of 24

NYCHA's transformation plan is the RAD-PACT. Through

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSI

RAD-PACT, NYCHA will utilize federally funded 2 3 project-based Section 8 vouchers to convert 62,000 4 apartments to private management. RAD-PACT is 5 important because NYCHA can unlock federal funding for its housing that has been systematically 6 7 dismantled by the federal government for decades. How do you think the changes with the federal 8 9 administration will impact federal funding for RAD-10 PACT?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 11 Sure. I'll certainly have Brian add. I think it's 12 important to note that NYCHA continues to monitor our 13 14 proposed federal funding and regulations, and we work 15 closely with our partners. As many people know, there 16 was a federal funding freeze which has created a lot 17 of uncertainty in the process. We are advocating. 18 We're actually going to D.C. next week to talk to our 19 partners on the Hill to make sure that we continue to 20 get the funding we deserve for our NYCHA residents to 21 improve the conditions that you're mentioning. I'll 2.2 ask Brian to provide some more details specifically 23 on RAD-PACT. EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Sure. 24

25 Council Member, I think that one of the few things

that this current Administration is committed to and 2 3 the Administration before is RAD as a tool to find 4 investment for public housing. And all things that we're hearing from Washington is that Section 8 5 funding remains much more secure than Section 9 6 7 funding, and that has been true for quite some time 8 now. And right now, RAD is the only tool that HUD 9 offers in order to bring real investment into developments. 10

80

11 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: With the 62,000 units 12 that have been converted to RAD, is there any savings 13 for NYCHA, the Authority, because obviously we've had 14 multiple units converted, multiple developments 15 converted. What does that look like as far as repairs 16 now or the budget for repairs for the other 17 developments?

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Sure. So, yep, I'll let Shaan talk about it. But can I just say, short term, there is some savings, but long term, so our funding on the Section 9 side is based on the number of units we have. When we convert, we have fewer units, and that does reflect our funding. So short term, yes, some savings. Long term, we

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 81
2	actually lose some funding from Washington for the
3	Section 9 portfolio, but we have a smaller portfolio.
4	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, with the 62,000
5	units that have been converted, can you give us a
6	dollar amount as to savings for NYCHA over the last
7	four or five years?
8	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
9	So, just to add some color to what Brian was
10	mentioning, when you convert a unit, you step down
11	the subsidy and you actually lose public housing
12	operating subsidy because that unit now belongs in
13	the Section 8 portfolio. What we've done over the
14	past five years is reinvest in the HUD agreement and
15	pillars so you've seen an increase in NYCHA staff,
16	you've seen an increase in skilled trades and so
17	forth, so what we've done actually is add more
18	resources so you have that, let's say, 50 people that
19	worked at that development. Those 50 people
20	reallocated to other properties in the portfolio to
21	fill vacancies and provide that support, and so there
22	are no sort of large, big picture savings. As Brian
23	mentioned, the budget over time is actually
24	decreasing because you no longer get the funding for
25	those units.
ļ	I

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, you've had a
decrease in your budget because of those units
converted.
CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
Over time, it steps down and you lose money for those
units because you're funded based on the units that
you have. When a property converts, HUD steps down
the funding over two years. They give you a small
sort of temporary increment, and that is what we use
to sort of reallocate staff and provide additional
resources to the developments that remain.
CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Maybe I can
add. So, the operating revenue decreases because the
units have moved out of the Section 9 portfolio. The
operating expense also disappears along with that,
right, because NYCHA doesn't have to maintain the
property anymore, and then there's a significant
benefit on the capital side. So, 62,000 units is the
overall goal for the PACT program. For the units that
have converted to date, it's an equivalent to about a
6.5-billion-dollar capital investment, right, that's
come off of our physical needs by those properties
converting so there's both the operating budget
impacts and the budget and the cost side and then

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 83
2	there's also a significant amount of liability that's
3	moved off of our books and have been funded and
4	renovated through the PACT program.
5	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, it's just an asset
6	that tends to be removed off of the books of NYCHA
7	basically. Well, that particular development is then
8	just removed off.
9	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: It's
10	the capital repair cost.
11	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: So, the capital repair
12	cost goes away.
13	CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: The capital
14	repair cost zeroes out. The operating budget revenue
15	and cost zero out. And then from a number of the PACT
16	deals, we do continue to get revenue from the
17	property over time through the partnership with the
18	PACT partner.
19	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. How do you think
20	that the changes with the federal administration will
21	impact federal funding for RAD-PACT, and what kind of
22	indicators are you seeing?
23	CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: I think that
24	might be the question that Mr. Honan just answered
25	around the federal impact.
I	

2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What indicators are 3 you seeing?

4 CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Indicators. CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 5 So we don't have a federal budget yet. As you know, 6 7 the federal government is still trying to avoid a 8 shutdown on March 14th so we are continuing to 9 monitor. But as Brian mentioned, we do and have heard that there is an increased sort of emphasis on the 10 11 Section 8 portfolio and that they are generally supportive of RAD-PACT and losing Section 9 units and 12 13 putting more units in Section 8, but there is no 14 budget yet and so we are happy to give the Council an 15 update once that happens.

16 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Prior to the 17 Trump Administration, NYCHA's ability to use PACT 18 more broadly was limited by a cap set by Congress. In 19 addition, NYCHA would need approval from HUD. How 20 realistic do you think an expansion of the RAD-PACT 21 program is under this Congress?

22 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 23 We think it is possible. They seem to be supportive 24 of the RAD-PACT program and so we will continue to 25 advocate, but we think it is possible.

2	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. We are going to
3	move to our second round of questions, and we are
4	going to start… actually, we are joined by Council
5	Member Salamanca, and our first round of questions
6	will actually start with Council Member Salamanca.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, Mr.
8	Chair. Good afternoon.
9	Just to get going here, senior centers. I
10	have a few senior centers that are in NYCHA
11	buildings, one of them being Melrose Mott Haven
12	Senior Center. I've seen at the senior center, they
13	have issues with their ceiling. A few years back
14	during COVID, there was repairs that were done to the
15	senior center. I know that the building itself is a
16	senior building. Repairs were done. Now we are back
17	to the same thing. The ceiling is gone. We are
18	flooding. Can you explain to me what repairs were
19	actually done four years ago that now we are back to
20	the ceiling being flooded over again?
21	CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: I don't have
22	the details of the repairs from that point in time
23	with me today as well as the driver of the flooding
24	that may be happening more recently with the rain. We
25	

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING
 can maybe follow up with you offline in detail on
 that.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I made nine years in office this weekend and, for nine years, 5 I've had the same issue with NYCHA with this senior 6 7 center. Repairs were made. The senior center for some 8 time was closed to make repairs in the building. Now 9 these seniors, they are congregating in a place which I feel is unsafe. Every time I bring it up, that's 10 11 the same response I get, you're going to follow up.

12 The leasing of property, I was recently 13 talking to a supermarket owner in Brooklyn. He had 14 concerns because apparently, I didn't know that NYCHA 15 has property that you lease, and he's on a month-tomonth lease which is affecting his business because 16 17 he cannot ... the distributors where he gets his 18 supplies do not want to give him anything on credit 19 knowing he's on a month-to-month lease. How much 20 property does NYCHA lease?

21 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: And I'll 22 share my answer. Good morning, Council Member. We are 23 starting to review all of our commercial spaces. Many 24 of them face the same physical needs that our 25 residential spaces face. We've been limited in our

ability to lease them out, but we're looking to be 2 3 more strategic in that area so we're taking stock of 4 all of our commercial spaces. Happy to share that 5 with you, and I definitely would like to get the information about this Brooklyn supermarket. We do 6 7 have some supermarkets and other leases on our 8 properties. I'm not familiar with a month-to-month 9 set up so we definitely want to find out more about that specific case. 10

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I appreciate that. It's not in my District. We have a mutual 12 13 friend, and he asked me to reach out and I just 14 wanted to see how we can be of help to him. It's 15 difficult to run a supermarket business knowing you're a month-to-month and your vendors know that 16 17 you're a month-to-month and they do not want to give 18 him credit so he can supply his store. It's an issue 19 and it's affecting his livelihood. 20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: 21 Absolutely. We're happy to follow up on that. 2.2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: All right. 23 Thank you. I just want to highlight, again, I made 24 25 nine years, in 2016 when I came into office, I

2	remember there was a total cost to fix all of NYCHA
3	was 35 to 40 billion dollars, and I see how it has
4	ballooned to 78 billion dollars, which is extremely
5	sad. I'm not going to ask a question. I just want to
6	highlight it's difficult for Council Members, and
7	I've said this in the past, to allocate funding and,
8	when we do give you the funding, it takes years and
9	years and years to actually implement the funding we
10	allocated so it's just frustrating.
11	Finally, I want to talk about the RAD and
12	PACT. I know that it's not a one-size-fits-all, but I
13	believe in it for smaller NYCHA developments. And
14	Stebbins Hewitt, I know it's almost completed. Do you
15	have a timeline when the Stebbins Hewitt RAD-PACT
16	program will be completed?
17	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I
18	don't have that with me, but we can follow up with
19	you.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I can tell you
21	it's been a life changer for the tenants that are
22	there. I lived on that block for 20 years. When I
23	became a Council Member or when I was a District
24	Manager, the constant complaints about having a
25	horrible winter, the boilers not working, the leaky

1	COMMITTEE	ON	PUBLIC	HOUSING

2	roofs, the entrance to the doors always broken. Now
3	this was the first winter they had hot water, they
4	had a boiler, did not need to complain. They feel
5	more secure because there's surveillance cameras in
6	the building, there's better lighting, and the
7	outside of the building does not look like a NYCHA
8	development. It looks more like a privately owned,
9	brand-new, 100 percent affordable housing building
10	that we built. And they're confident. What they feel
11	good about is they know they still have their NYCHA
12	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap up.
13	COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: I got it. Thank
14	you. They still have their NYCHA privileges. With
15	that, I just wanted to say thank you for that.
16	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: No.
17	You're so welcome. It sounds like it probably closed,
18	but they're in the middle of getting their repairs
19	done. We hear that so much. What RAD-PACT does is
20	provide the so-very-needed capital repairs that these
21	buildings and these residents so desperately need,
22	and the before and after. You can go from building to
23	building, whether it's a small one or a large

24 development, and pictures say it all.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 90 2 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Thank you, Mr. 3 Chair. 4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. We'll now move to Council Member Avilés. 5 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you, Chair, 6 7 again. I guess I wanted to follow up on a couple 8 things. Can you walk me through the process related 9 to the voucher holders? I understand that obviously there are many types of tenants that you're trying to 10 11 fill but, in terms of voucher holders, how long does it take to schedule appointments for those units that 12 13 you are engaged with? CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Council 14 15 Member, are you asking about appointments between the Section 8 voucher holder and the private landlord? 16 17 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Yes, NYCHA as a 18 landlord. So, inspections that need to be done with 19 some of these voucher holders, apartments need to get 20 inspected. Does NYCHA engage in that and how long 21 does that process take? 2.2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: (CROSS-23 TALK) I don't think we have that information with us today, but we can certainly follow up. 24

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 91 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Brian has all the 2 3 information. (SPEAKING SPANISH) 4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Once a tenant is called, they then have to fill out a rental 5 packet. Once their rental packet is completed and 6 7 accepted, it usually takes between two and three weeks in order to get an apartment inspected. If it's 8 9 a VAWA case, somebody with domestic violence issue, we can expedite it, but generally that's the time 10 11 period for an inspection. 12 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: So, from the 13 rental packet to the final determination of 14 inspection, a month? 15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yeah, about a month. 16 17 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Okay. And then if 18 there are challenges with that process or it doesn't 19 quite shake out that way, where does one call to move 20 that process forward? 21 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Sure. 2.2 They can call the call center or they can make an 23 appointment in one of our walk-in centers if they want to speak to somebody in person in Brooklyn, 24 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 92
2	close to your District, it's on Atlantic Avenue, and
3	that's what they would follow through.
4	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Okay. And then in
5	terms of just quick segue, you can probably stay
6	there, you're going to answer all of those
7	Specifically, as it relates to Red Hook, when can we
8	expect the emergency boilers to be taken offline,
9	related to the Sand and Sea Resiliency Repair?
10	(SPEAKING SPANISH) Just pull up a chair.
11	CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Sure, thank
12	you for the question, Council Member Avilés. So the
13	new boilers, the high pressure investment in the new
14	boilers is already online and running for some time.
15	Because that's a new technology for NYCHA, we don't
16	use those type of high pressure boilers in any other
17	properties, we're doing a little bit of an extended
18	commissioning to train our staff and to make sure
19	we're fully comfortable operating those, and for that
20	reason the temporary boilers have been kept on, but
21	the system is already running on the new boilers.
22	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: But how long are
23	we going to keep them on for training purposes and
24	public nuisance of residents?
25	

2	CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Sure, I feel
3	like I know the answer, but I don't want to get it
4	wrong, so let me just follow up with you with the
5	exact timeline that we've agreed.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Okay. And in terms
7	of Red Hook in particular, could you provide my
8	office with the numbers of folks that you have in
9	eviction proceedings. Also would like to know
10	specifically about the backlog of repairs across the
11	development. We can follow up after. I just want to
12	get the questions on the record.
13	And then to this notion of property
14	emergency allocation, obviously you stated it's
15	portfolio-wide to give you flexibility to respond.
16	How you respond to all manner of very important
17	emergencies for every development, I do not know. But
18	is there an allocation, let's say, for Red Hook in
19	terms of capital repairs on how they can manage the
20	property? And there might be tiers of this, there
21	might be utter emergency, cataclysmic, and it might
22	be slightly smaller emergency, but does the
23	development have a pool of resources that it is able
24	to be somewhat responsive to in a quick timeframe?

2 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 3 Sure. So, to start, each development has an operating 4 budget. What we have found though is when there are emergencies of that kind, the property manager 5 doesn't have sufficient resources to respond. 6 7 Otherwise, that would sort of decimate the entire 8 annual budget. So that's where we go to the property 9 emergency bank, which we use across the entire portfolio. We add additional funding where we can, so 10 11 if we get a new grant and we find we have additional 12 money from the federal government, we'll put more in 13 that line. For example, that's also where we'd work with Shaan to say hey, Shaan, what do you have in 14 15 ANCM for that property, do you have money in your 16 contingency, so because frankly we have so many 17 emergencies, we have sort of pools of contingency 18 funding. The funding that you see there is actually 19 what Finance manages for things like a gas outage, a 20 water main break, so that we can be responsive. If I 21 get a budget modification requesting additional 2.2 funding for that kind of emergency from a property, 23 we respond within 24 to 48 hours. If it's sort of a larger scale emergency that requires planning and 24 months of work, that's where we would, you know, talk 25

2 to Shaan and his team on the ANCM contingency. So 3 that money is really just there so that a property 4 manager isn't waiting for weeks because they feel like if they were to use the funding in their budget, 5 they wouldn't have anything left for the rest of the 6 year. So it's really just a way for us to be 7 8 responsive quickly. We also have emergency funding 9 and an emergency services department, which is funded on the operating budget and managed centrally by 10 11 Eva's team. So because there are so many emergencies, 12 we find that we need to be really nimble and flexible 13 and sort of provide the resources as quickly as we 14 can through any manner. So, if it's really quick, it 15 would come from that emergency pot. If it's something 16 that requires more planning, that's where we talk to 17 the ANCM team run by Mr. Mavani.

COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you. I'll follow up more specifically, but in terms of Councilfunded projects, in the testimony it said those projects are moving forward after kind of longawaited delays. Can you speak to me more specifically about that?

24 CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Sure. Thank25 you for the question. So yes, back about a year and a

1	COMMITTEE	ON	PUBLIC	HOUSING

half ago for capacity kind of constraints, we put 2 about 50, 55 projects that were Council-funded mainly 3 4 and some Mayorally funded projects on pause formally 5 to rather than just not be able to move them forward, but not communicate that we wanted to be more 6 7 explicit, and that allowed us to focus our resources 8 on some of our major compliance commitments and 9 larger projects, you know, the boilers, the elevators, things like that. We had committed to 10 11 restart any paused projects by this July. We have 12 restarted 75 percent already, and in fact a number of 13 them have completed construction. We have about 25 14 percent more to restart between now and June, and 15 that should not be a challenge for us. The benefit 16 we've had from this process is that our project teams 17 now are not overloaded and they're able to focus on 18 quality and other components on each of their 19 projects, you know, much more in line with what other 20 capital project teams typically are managing, and so 21 that one year or one and a half year pause process 2.2 really benefited us to be able to right-size the work 23 so that our teams are giving the due attention to any project no matter how big or small. 24

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you. Thank
3 you, Chair.

4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council
5 Member Avilés. We'll now move to Council Member
6 Marmorato.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Thank you. So you guys keep looking at statistics and numbers, and 8 9 I just want to gently remind you guys that these are people's lives who are impacted by these statistics 10 11 and these numbers, and as we start going through 12 things, I see that you're spending 182 million 13 dollars on overtime. Wouldn't it be cheaper to, like, 14 hire more employees, and do you have a problem with 15 recruitment? 16 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:

So 182 million dollars in overtime is actually adecrease from prior years.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: It's still a
20 lot of money.

21 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 22 Trust me. I agree with you. Last year, we spent 234 23 million dollars in overtime, and that has helped us 24 to meaningfully address the work order backlog, but 25 to your point, that is unsustainable, and so we've

decreased the budget to 182 million dollars, and we are providing, you know, additional support for our staff through full-time staff as well as contracts to support the work order backlog.

COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Is there an 6 7 issue with recruitment? I mean, are you just not 8 hiring more employees? And, you know, you talk about, 9 like, funding and this and that. Like, these are simple little asks, like sweeping a floor with two 10 11 inches of dust, food all over an elevator floor. 12 Like, these are simple maintenance issues that are 13 not getting done, and I don't think it's because 14 there's backup. These are things that should be done 15 every single day.

16 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 17 So, there is certainly a tradeoff that we constantly 18 face between overtime funding and hiring additional 19 staff. We have a pretty high fringe and benefits 20 rate, and at the same time, we are trying to manage 21 getting all of the work done that you mentioned. And some of that work has to be done in overtime because 2.2 23 we are trying to be responsive perhaps after hours. We also have scheduled versus unscheduled overtime. 24 So, for example, 30 percent of our overtime budget is 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 99
2	for schedule shift coverage on weekends to have
3	caretakers and maintenance workers at the
4	developments to pick up trash, sweep floors, mop
5	stairwells, etc., as you mentioned, on the weekends.
6	So that, while it seems like it would be a normal
7	cost because of our union contracts, that is
8	considered overtime as well on Saturday.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: That's a big
10	number.
11	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: And I
12	just want to add, sorry to answer your question, we
13	actually don't have an issue with recruitment. We've
14	improved our frontline hiring tremendously over the
15	last year so it's only taking us about 30 days to
16	replace frontline staff so we've worked hard with our
17	HR department. They've made tremendous strides to
18	make sure that we have bodies in all of our headcount
19	and so we're able to do that. But as we've said,
20	overtime is a standard part of our business practice.
21	It doesn't mean that we can transfer it easily to
22	hiring new staff.
23	COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Do these
24	maintenance workers have an accountability, like
25	
ļ	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 100
2	something that they have to report what they actually
3	do every single day?
4	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE:
5	Absolutely. And we're monitoring that on every single
6	day. So, all maintenance workers, skilled trades,
7	they work off of a handheld device. They have to
8	clock in for their work orders. We're actually able
9	to monitor their labor in real time in order to see
10	what their time is per work order.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Okay. Because I
12	think that needs to be investigated a little bit
13	more, only because of the fact that I get the text
14	messages to my phone, they said they came and
15	cleaned, and it's not the right location that they
16	cleaned, or it's just an old picture of some sort.
17	And I want to just touch on squatting,
18	because my time is limited. This is public housing.
19	Wouldn't you want to address squatting before the 30
20	days are up, where they actually have rights to stay
21	in the apartment? I mean, don't you want to find a
22	pathway to success for these people to be in these
23	apartments legally and the right way?
24	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
25	Absolutely. But there are many different types of
	l

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING

squatters. There are people who go into vacant 2 apartments. There are people who find out that a 3 4 tenant is deceased and get in. The sheer volume is 5 something that is very difficult to manage. Additionally, so 30 days is not a tremendous amount 6 7 of time, but as Mrs. Trimble said earlier, we've been 8 working very closely with the Police Department to 9 get people out. And one other thing that we should mention is sometimes we need to make sure that the 10 11 person in there... we get calls all the time saying 12 there's a squatter living next door to me, but we 13 have to do the research to make sure that they're 14 actually a squatter. They could be somebody with 15 rights, because they're a remaining family member. 16 COUNCIL MEMBER MARMORATO: Yeah. I mean, I 17 have two specific incidents that I could have given 18 you the information and these people could have been 19 thrown out almost immediately that they are squatting 20 in these apartments, and it doesn't take much to 21 investigate, and I think you need to really put that 2.2 on the forefront of what you guys are doing because 23 that will free up a lot of apartments. And I think it really poses a big public safety issue for the other 24 families that want to live there peacefully and 25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 102 2 safely. So, all right. Thank you, Chair. I'm done. 3 Thank you. 4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you, Council Member Marmorato. 5 There was a recent report that came out 6 7 that basically blamed NYCHA for delaying the rental assistance payments. Can you clarify the report? 8 9 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: Sure. Thank you for that question, Council Member. 10 11 It's important to note that we had a federal funding freeze. So, on January 28th, we were locked out of 12 13 our federal grant disbursement system and were unable 14 to receive funding so that meant that our pending 15 payments from the day prior were not released and we 16 could not request any additional reimbursements. That 17 also happened to coincide with the end of the month 18 and the beginning of February. So, on February 1st, 19 which was a Saturday, we were unsure whether we would 20 actually start to receive our payments from the 21 federal government. As you know, NYCHA is an 2.2 administrator of the Section 8 program, so we receive 23 the funding from the federal government and then we pay it to the landlords. On the 1st, we were actively 24 monitoring our bank accounts to ensure whether that 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 103
2	funding would actually come through, given the
3	uncertainty in Washington. The funding was released
4	on the 1st, which was a Saturday. It was not actually
5	available to NYCHA until Monday the 3rd. And on the
6	3rd, we made the payments. So going forward, we will
7	wait until we receive the funding from the federal
8	government and make the payments. The same is true of
9	this past month. Saturday was the 1st again. We
10	waited for the money to be received. The money was
11	made available on the 3rd, and we issued the payments
12	in time.
13	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. So no longer?
14	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
15	I'm sorry?
16	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: That impasse is no
17	longer?
18	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
19	Well, for now, it's still very uncertain, it's
20	chaotic, and we are just managing the best that we
21	can, but I think it's important for folks to know
22	that we wait on the funding for the federal
23	government and then make the payment.
24	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for the
25	clarification on that.

2	When it comes to a vacant unit readiness,
3	NYCHA's Vacant Unit Readiness Program helps prepare
4	and rehabilitate NYCHA units for new tenants. The
5	Administration has moved successive rounds of funding
6	for the program to the capital budget to generate
7	expense savings. As of February, there were 5,577
8	NYCHA apartments. NYCHA had previously shared it
9	wants to target 3,000 units for renovations annually.
10	Where are you against that target year-to-date in the
11	Fiscal Year 2025?
12	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Thank
13	you, Council Member. I'm happy to report that we
14	exceeded that target by turning over over 4,000 units
15	in the last Fiscal Year, 52 percent increase from the
16	previous year.
17	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And how many
18	will still be needed to be unrenovated at the end of
19	the Fiscal Year?
20	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I can't
21	give an exact estimate because, as I said, about 60
22	percent of our move-ins are transfers, so it creates
23	another vacant upon move-in, and so we are working to
24	increase our production as best as possible.
25	

2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And are you 3 working with the Office of Management and Budget on 4 any additional certificates to proceed with the CPS 5 for capital projects?

6 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 7 Yes. We continue to work with our colleagues at OMB. 8 We actually updated our CP for this program recently 9 to be able to unlock the additional capital funds, 10 and we will do that going forward as well as they 11 increase our funding.

12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. The total 13 funding in NYCHA's adapted financial plan for vacant 14 unit readiness is 67.9 million in Fiscal Year 2025. 15 However, the funding drops to 43.3 million in Fiscal 16 Year 2026. What's the reason for this drop?

17 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 18 So, what you're actually seeing there is a bit of a 19 rollover in Fiscal Year 2025, so any unspent funds 20 for 2024 get added to the 2025 budget. We of course endeavor, as Eva mentioned, to increase our 21 2.2 productivity and continue to turn over units, but 23 every unit that you turn over because of the transfers creates another vacant unit. So we will 24 just continue to work diligently to expedite our 25

2 productivity and our processing, and if we need 3 additional funds, we will work with our City 4 partners, and they've been very generous and 5 receptive.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. I know last 6 7 year, obviously, part of the budget, well, not the 8 adapted budget, the preliminary budget was cuts to 9 the NYCHA security guards. NYCHA considered reducing funding for the guards at 55 senior developments 10 11 across the city. Does the 2025 budget include funding for these positions, or will the City need to address 12 the funding shortfall through its budget process? 13 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Thank 14 15 you, Council Member. We have included full funding for the security guard program as it currently exists 16 17 across the 52 senior buildings in the city in our 18 2025 budget. 19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: What's that figure? 20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: It's 21 just about 7 million. 2.2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Are there plans 23 for an increase? 24 25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 107 2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: There's 3 no plans for increase at this time. We're maintaining 4 the current program as is. CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. And I know there 5 were some of the developments that didn't have 6 7 cameras, those senior developments that didn't have cameras. I know that's part of the ... is that capital? 8 9 Would that be a capital request? CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: That 10 11 would require capital funding. 12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Is there any 13 support for capital to improve the security apparatus 14 in these senior buildings? 15 CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Thank you, 16 Chair Banks. Yeah. We have a large number of ongoing 17 CCTV projects that are funded either by Mayoral 18 funds, City Council funds, or even State Assembly 19 Member funds so there are ongoing projects to either 20 install CCTV or expand it at a number of sites. If 21 there are specific sites that you're interested in, 2.2 we can follow up on those. 23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. We know throughout NYCHA that most of the time, well, all the 24 25 time, I believe, that the cameras are located in the

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 108
2	lobby area or next to any of the exits of the
3	development. Is there any plan to put cameras on the
4	grounds?
5	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Council
6	Member, we have over 20,000 cameras across our
7	portfolio, including lobbies, public space areas, and
8	around the grounds.
9	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: In Cypress Houses,
10	where are the cameras located exactly, or to your
11	knowledge?
12	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I'm not
13	going to disclose that here in the hearing. We don't
14	want everyone to know where all the cameras are.
15	That's what makes them so useful to us, but I'm happy
16	to follow up with you separately as to cameras at
17	Cypress.
18	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Are the cameras
19	located in the lobby area?
20	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I can't
21	speak to that here.
22	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Are the cameras
23	located near the exits?
24	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: I will
25	not speak to that here. Again, the usefulness of the
l	

2 cameras sometimes is that they are not completely 3 obvious so that they're better at catching conditions 4 and situations.

109

5 CHIEF ASSET OFFICER MAVANI: Maybe I can just add, like at Cypress Hills, we have an active 6 7 CCTV project in construction. When we determine 8 camera locations, we work with the property 9 management and the resident leadership on where they think the optimal locations are, as well as our own 10 11 Office of Security and Safety so resident input 12 around the location and the priority of the cameras 13 is always taken. In fact, our resident leaders will sign off the location plan before we move ahead with 14 15 the project. We do take into account what we're 16 hearing from the residents at the site around what 17 are the priority needs. 18 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: To access those 19 cameras, how is that process done? 20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Our CCTV 21 unit has remote access to those cameras, and so they

22 can review footage for any of the cameras they have 23 access to.

25

2	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. A couple more
З	questions? Just give me one minute, Gale. Thank you.
4	Gale, you can ask your questions.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Just back to
6	trying to get the apartments renovated and dealing
7	with repairs. We get a lot of, the neighbor upstairs
8	is a problem, won't give us access, blah, blah, blah,
9	and the problem has to be fixed in their apartment in
10	order to have the apartment below fixed. Who is
11	supposed to be working on those kinds of issues?
12	That's not an easy one. I'm not going to say it is,
13	but I'm sure it happens often.
14	CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yes.
15	Property management uses their right to enter when
16	there are emergency repairs. We start with a 48-hour
17	notice to the resident upstairs saying that we need
18	to get in in order to make a repair, to trace a leak,
19	to see what's going on that's affecting their
20	neighbors. We usually coordinate with NYPD before we
21	do any type of drill out because we want to make sure
22	that our staff are safe and that we avoid any type of
23	conflict or situation, but we are using our right to
24	enter in order to complete repairs.
0.5	

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Then, can 3 you get back to us? You're going to get back to us, back to the Chair, about the commercial? 4 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER TRIMBLE: Yes. 5 6 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. 7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We have a couple more 8 questions. This is around the RAD-PACT. Does NYCHA 9 have any initiatives to maintain the cohesion of the Authority even as it splits into two or three 10 11 different funding models across many different 12 private property management agencies? How many are 13 anticipated to be part of the PACT by the end of 2025 and 2026? 14 15 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Council 16 Member, we are on pace to convert slightly over 17 30,000 units, but ultimately, since we started our 18 plan, we ultimately have the authority to convert 19 62,000 units. 20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Can you repeat 21 that? 2.2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We are on 23 pace to convert slightly over 30,000 units, and ultimately, we have authority to do 62,000 units 24 25 throughout the whole portfolio.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 112 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Can you cite those 2 3 conversions by development? 4 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I'm 5 sorry? CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Can you cite them by 6 7 development? EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I can get 8 9 this Committee a list, yes, of where they are, ones that have already been converted, and also where they 10 11 are in the pipeline. 12 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: In the pipeline, okay. 13 And those developments that are in the pipeline to be 14 converted, I mean, I have to get this on the record 15 again, is there a commitment to allow those NYCHA 16 developments to have a formal voting process? 17 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: No, not at this time. 18 19 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: And, again, since you 20 won't be allowing those residents to weigh in on 21 whether or not they want to go RAD, are you comfortable with moving forward with those 2.2 23 conversions without having support from the residents? 24 25

2	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: NYCHA
3	does more in the way of engagement than any other
4	housing authority and more than what's required by
5	HUD. HUD requires public housing authorities to have
6	two meetings before making the decision to convert
7	through the RAD and PACT program.
8	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: How many meetings have
9	you increased it by since we're only required to have
10	two?
11	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: We
12	have years of engagement, and an incredible amount of
13	time and effort is spent by our RAD unit. We also
14	have the Tenant Association involved in choosing the
15	PACT developer so the engagement is deep, the
16	engagement is real and, of course, Chair Banks, if
17	you have any suggestions on how you think we should,
18	leaving voting aside
19	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, that's my number
20	one suggestion, allow the residents to make that
21	decision.
22	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: We're
23	happy to talk to you about that.
24	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, I want to
25	continue this conversation because we obviously it's

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 114 clear that NYCHA and the Administration is hell-bent 2 3 on converting more developments, and we just want to make sure that the residents, obviously, are able to 4 weigh in on that. Not after the fact, but before the 5 process begins. 6 7 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I can tell you what we are hell-bent on is providing 8 9 capital investments in our properties. CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, that should be 10 11 provided regardless. I mean, we can't play this game 12 of holding up repairs or needed capital investments. We can't hold that over the resident's head, 13 14 especially when it comes to them being a part of that 15 process. And the constant ... because I've heard that many a times. I heard it even in the last hearing, to 16 17 lay out the capital needs and so forth and so forth. 18 But at the end of the day, the residents, regardless 19 of whatever condition the development is in, the 20 tenants need to have a say on if they want to be 21 converted. 2.2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: So, 23 Council Member... CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Would you agree? Or 24 25 would you ...

2 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I'll let 3 the CEO answer that question, and then I'll let you... 4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I think you gave your... 5 you opined on that at the last hearing. I would like 6 to hear the CEO.

7 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I 8 think resident engagement is important. However, we 9 have buildings that we've had to empty and board up because the capital need was just so great, and I 10 11 think everyone is fooling themselves if they think that these issues are going to resolve themselves. 12 PACT is a model that works, and we see hundreds of 13 14 buildings that have converted where tenants are 15 living in the conditions that they deserve to be 16 living in. In contrast, we have an 80-billion-dollar 17 capital need, and there's no money coming from D.C. 18 to provide that support. Maintenance is tied to 19 capital repairs, which is tied to the conditions of 20 our apartments.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, listen, we... and I've heard that in the previous hearing, and we do understand there's a major need for capital investment in public housing. We're just saying give the tenants the right to weigh in on that. I just

1	COMMITTEE	ON	PUBLIC	HOUSING
	001111111	U - ·		11000110

2	want to be clear that it's not night and day and a
3	need for capital investments. And if the residents
4	choose to go RAD or PACT, that should be a choice
5	they should make. And that's what I'm hoping the
6	Administration, I'm hoping the Authority understands,
7	that the residents just want to have a say. And to
8	say that we do years and years of engagement, again,
9	it just comes off as you're just throwing this
10	program at the residents, and they really don't have
11	a true say in the future of the development.

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Sure. So, Council Member, so in your District, there's two developments, Linden Houses and Boulevard Houses, two of probably some of the largest developments in your District, not the largest. The Cypress Hills that...

17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: (CROSS-TALK) EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: We talked 18 19 about is huge, and Brinken (phonetic) is huge as well. Linden and Boulevard were both State-funded 20 projects. They were built by the State of New York, 21 and the State abandoned both of those developments in 2.2 23 1998. So those developments were left with no capital, no operating funds. They were run solely on 24 25 rent, and money that we took, federal money that we

took from other developments like Cypress, like
Brinken, which we know need a lot of funding as it
is, and we funneled it into Linden and Boulevard.
Only through conversion were we able to find the
funding that they needed in order to bring investment
into those properties.

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Brian, I get it. I get 8 9 that part, and I think you do that so eloquently in laying out the need for capital investment. I get 10 11 that. We get that. We're just saying that we want to 12 formal voting process for the residents. That's it. I 13 think we're not going to back away from that, or I'm 14 not backing away from it. We want you to understand 15 the need, the importance of real community engagement 16 is to allow residents to have a say, and that's what 17 it boils down to. I don't know what the fight is or 18 the resistance is from the Authority to just say, 19 well, let's explore that when it comes to RAD-PACT-20 converted developments Doing a survey, those things 21 are important as well. Having the community 2.2 engagement meetings are important, but first and 23 foremost, there needs to be a formal voting process for these developments, and I don't see how could it 24 hurt. How could it hurt? Part of the conversion is 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 118
2	getting the residents to sign over to a Section 8
3	lease. You want folks to be able to do that
4	willingly, and you want a decent percentage of the
5	development to be in support of it. You mentioned
6	Boulevard and Linden Houses. I mean, Linden Houses
7	and Pembroke and Linden Houses, we welcome the
8	investments that were done through the program. But
9	if you ask those residents today if they had a choice
10	or a decision on being converted, they'll say no.
11	This program was shoved down our throats, and we had
12	no say. Yes, there was some degree of community
13	engagement that was done, and I sat through some of
14	those meetings, but if you speak to the residents,
15	they would say they didn't have a say over it, and
16	the way in that you purport, it didn't give the
17	residents the final say.
18	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I
19	attended many of those meetings myself. In fact, I
20	led some of them myself, and I will say that it was
21	something that had to be done. The risk of those two
22	developments being habitable was real, and anybody
23	who was at Boulevard or Linden before versus now,
24	there is no way you could say it was better before. I
25	think what is really important is to make sure that

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 119
2	residents have decision-making when it comes to what
3	the repairs are going to look like, who they're going
4	to be the new partners, be engaged as much as they
5	possibly want, but we don't decide on the BQE, are we
6	going to have a vote of people who live in downtown
7	Brooklyn, whether we're going to have a new highway.
8	We don't decide in a community, are we going to have
9	a vote if we're going to invest in the school. These
10	investments need to be done. We have an obligation as
11	the Housing Authority to be stewards of a property,
12	and we need to make sure that these properties are
13	there for this generation, for the generation
14	afterwards, and the generation following that.
15	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I respect that, and
16	again, we just agree to disagree on how we go about
17	informing and bringing the residents, and I hope that
18	the Authority comes around to really a real, true
19	engagement with the residents of NYCHA when it comes
20	to the RAD-PACT converted developments, and I hope we
21	can get to a point where the residents are really,
22	truly a part of that process, and it's not something
23	that's just being forced down their throats to have
24	to accept. We look forward to continued engagement on
25	this, and hopefully we can get to that point.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 120 2 Council Member Bottcher, did you have any 3 questions? 4 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: I had a question. I wanted to follow up on my line of 5 question earlier regarding rent arrears. NYCHA is 6 7 collecting 63 percent of the rent owed, including arrears across its portfolio. In a previous hearing, 8 9 we went into detail contrasting that with the RAD-PACT. What percentage are the RAD-PACT partners, what 10 11 percentage of rent are they collecting? 12 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I 13 want to make sure I have that number, but I want to 14 say that it's in the high 90s. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: The high? 16 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: 90. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Okay, so the 18 high 90s. One factor to which that can be attributed 19 is the fact that RAD-PACT partners are allowed to do 20 rent amnesty when they take over a development. They 21 can give amnesty to everyone there. I think one of 2.2 the other concerns is that RAD-PACT partners can 23 proceed with eviction for non-payment. How much of a factor is that in the high collection rate that RAD-24 25 PACT has versus the 63 percent?

CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 2 3 Sure. Thank you, Council Member Bottcher, for that 4 question. I think certainly the ability for residents 5 to start fresh with a zero balance has a lot to do with the high percentage of rent collection that you 6 7 see at the RAD-PACT properties. The ability of the 8 RAD-PACT partners to start their tenants off at zero 9 has a lot to do with the high percentage of rent collection. They do not have arrears most times. The 10 11 policies certainly differ. Some partners will give 12 them partial forgiveness, full forgiveness. NYCHA 13 does not have the authority to forgive rent. That is 14 not contemplated in the United States Housing Act, 15 and HUD has reiterated that to PHAs multiple times. 16 We cannot forgive rent so we are on the hook to 17 collect 100 percent of the rent owed to us, be it new 18 charges as well as arrears but, again, I think that 19 the ability to forgive rent is why you see a 90 20 percent rent collection rate at a PACT property. CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: And 21 just going to your question about evictions, both 2.2 23 NYCHA and the PACT partners have an incentive to keep people housed so evictions are really a last resort. 24 But I will say that in 2025, NYCHA has executed 15 25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 122 evictions so far as of the end of January. Our PACT 2 3 partners have executed 10 evictions, nine non-payment and one holdover. 4 5 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: In what time period? 6 7 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: That was just for the month of January. 8 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: For the month of 9 10 January, across the 30 ... how many units have been converted so far? 11 12 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Hold 13 on. Over 24,000. COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: 24,000. There 14 15 were 10 citywide, and nine of the 10 were for non-16 payments. 17 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Correct. 18 19 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: And why would 20 those nine be evicted for non-payment versus, ostensibly, there's quite a few others that are 21 behind as well? 2.2 23 CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Well, 24 so we... 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 123
2	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: The number's low
3	to me.
4	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: The
5	number is incredibly low.
6	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: But I'm just
7	curious, what are the circumstances there?
8	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Well,
9	I think when you look and I also have the numbers if
10	you're interested for 2024, 2023, and 2022. We are
11	all beholden to the court system. There is an
12	incredible backlog in Landlord-Tenant Court. I will
13	say that in January 2025, the average amount owed for
14	the 67 non-payment cases that NYCHA filed, that NYCHA
15	filed, the amount owed was 60,875 dollars. That's in
16	stark contrast to the number that we were talking
17	about for people who, for the most part, were not
18	rent-delinquent prior to COVID, and then incurred
19	substantial arrears because of the pandemic.
20	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: How does NYCHA
21	work with the RAD-PACT partners on a case-by-case
22	basis for tenants in RAD-PACT developments that are
23	in arrears?
24	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: We
25	have guidelines that our PACT partners must follow,
	I

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 124
2	which basically mirror our guidelines. There is a
3	tremendous amount of outreach that they must do
4	before proceeding through an eviction process. And in
5	2024, for example, there were 6,817 pre-eviction
6	outreach cases were initiated in 2024 for PACT.
7	However, the total number of people who were evicted
8	in 2024 was 98.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: 98 out of the
10	20
11	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT:
12	6 , 700
13	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Right, and the
14	24,000 RAD-PACT units.
15	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: So,
16	there's a tremendous amount of work that's done. The
17	goal is to get people to start paying their rent, not
18	to evict people, whether it's in PACT or at NYCHA.
19	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Who makes the
20	decision whether or not rent amnesty will be given
21	upon a RAD-PACT conversion?
22	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
23	The developers.
24	COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: I just wanted to
25	say now that the conversion being contemplated in our

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 125
2	District, we're going to want amnesty for all our
3	tenants in arrears.
4	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: We'll
5	pass that message along. Thank you.
6	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Just before we
7	conclude the testimony from the Administration or
8	from the Authority, I just want to piggyback off of
9	some of the comments that my Colleague made, Council
10	Member Bottcher, and just get some clarification and
11	stuff.
12	I know this happened in Linden Houses,
13	there was a rent amnesty given to the residents. To
14	pry a little deeper, has it been done in some of the
15	other developments where there has been no rent
16	amnesty, and what percentage of the rent is collected
17	that goes to NYCHA and the management company keeps
18	or the new developers keep?
19	CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ:
20	Once the development is converted, NYCHA does not
21	receive any of the rent. The rent payments going
22	forward all go to the developer. To your point, yes,
23	the strategy with regard to how they treat rent
24	arrears is determined by the developer and that
25	particular transaction. There are cases where they
l	

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 126 2 might offer no partial or full amnesty, as you call 3 it. 4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You gave testimony in the past that said there was agreements that were 5 made between the Authority and somebody's RAD-PACT 6 7 where NYCHA will get a portion of the rent ... CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 8 9 Arrears. CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Arrears. 10 CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 11 12 (CROSS-TALK) Yes, we don't get the rent going 13 forward. 14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Whatever is in 15 arrears. What developments has that type of agreement 16 been agreed to and can you provide us with any 17 numbers as far as how much rent has been collected? CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER LESCOTT-MARTINEZ: 18 19 Sure. We can certainly provide statistics for the 20 converted developments and how the arrears were treated. 21 2.2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. The amnesty, is 23 that also part of the conversation? When the conversions are taking place, is that a 24 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 127
2	recommendation that is made by NYCHA to give a rent
3	amnesty to the residents?
4	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: With
5	respect to amnesty for rent arrears, it's not a
6	partner-only decision, but it's made in collaboration
7	with NYCHA.
8	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. When the
9	community engagement process is taking place, is that
10	also included in the conversation to the residents,
11	that it possibly can be an amnesty given for rent or
12	those scenarios set up where we may
13	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I'm
14	not sure whether or not that is something that's
15	discussed because the decision about rental arrears
16	is based on project financing. I think that's a
17	decision that's made between our PACT partner and our
18	REDD team, our real estate team.
19	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: When a PACT developer
20	makes a decision to give an amnesty, I was told that
21	by one particular developer that they did it just to
22	clean the slate. That doesn't seem to be something
23	that's taking consideration as far as the financing
24	piece.
25	

CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Well,
I would think that they could only clean the slate if
the numbers add up.

128

5 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, obviously, some 6 of those developments, there have been high rent 7 delinquencies in some of those developments, right? 8 To your knowledge, Brian, are there any particular 9 developments that you know where there's been a high 10 rent delinquency that has been converted over where 11 there's been a complete amnesty given?

12 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I mean, 13 there are several. We can get to the developments 14 where they have bought back the debt. There is a 15 financial ... it does weigh into the finances of the 16 final deal because they're not just forgiving, they 17 are buying back the debt owed. In our engagement, we 18 don't usually like to mention this because we don't 19 want to promise something that may not happen, right? 20 We do the same thing, too, when people ask for the 21 final scope. People often think that we're 2.2 withholding information. We're certainly not, but we 23 know that it's a long process, and I don't want to be there and say we're going to promise everybody new X, 24

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 129 2 or we're going to promise everybody a rent amnesty, 3 and then we can't deliver. 4 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: But you promise 5 everybody new refrigerators, and new stoves, and new floors, and painting. 6 7 EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Okay. But there are some things that we know for sure, like 8 9 people are going to get new kitchens and bathrooms. We know that's going to be part of the scope. We know 10 11 that security is going to ... there are some minimums, 12 but when there are some extra things, we can't 13 promise them. 14 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: All right. 15 Understandable. And the last thing I just want to 16 have a little conversation about is the materials. I 17 know it was pointed out that by the Administration, 18 by the Authority, that when RAD-PACT developments, 19 when they're converted over to RAD, it's because 20 obviously they needed capital investment, you know, 21 from the obviously the disrepair and the 2.2 dilapidation. Are you aware that there are NYCHA 23 developments that have been converted over to RAD-PACT that are dealing with some of the same 24

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 130
2	deterioration conditions that they were dealing with
3	prior to, you know, before the conversion?
4	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: I've
5	heard you mention it before, and I've heard some
6	other people mention this before.
7	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Not people, residents.
8	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN:
9	Residents. Excuse me. I'm sorry. I'm sorry. So
10	residents and advocates as well before. The thing I
11	would say about that is number one, they should be
12	brought to us, and we do work very closely with all
13	the partners to make sure that they're doing what
14	they supposed to. It also just doesn't make sense to
15	me, though, because there is a financial incentive
16	for them to make sure that they're passing
17	inspections, because Section 8 requires an annual
18	inspection. It used to be… so now it's called
19	Inspire. They have to pass Inspire inspections in
20	order to keep their funding going so, if what they
21	have put in place is not holding up, that's going to
22	put their funding in jeopardy.
23	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Okay. Well, again, I
24	would love to invite the CEO and whoever would like
25	to come with her to do a tour through Linden Houses,

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 131
2	which you held up, and we would also like to take you
3	to Boulevard Houses as well to speak to some of the
4	residents that have been converted over, and you can
5	hear directly as to how they feel about the inferior
6	materials that are being used to be put in their
7	apartments, and after a three-week rehab that they're
8	dealing with some of the same conditions that they
9	dealt with under your administration.
10	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I'm
11	happy to come back out there. I think we were there
12	about eight months ago.
13	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You were at Florentino
14	Houses, but Florentino…
15	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: No,
16	no, no. I was also…
17	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I know you were at
18	Florentino Houses.
19	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: I've
20	been to all of them.
21	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: I was well aware you
22	were at Florentino Houses. Florentino Houses is a
23	little different. That was a
24	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Very
25	different. But I've been to Linden
Į	

2	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: A gut rehab where you
3	removed everybody out the development. That, to me,
4	made sense, but when it comes to Boulevard and Linden
5	Houses, I would love for you to come, and then after
6	we leave Boulevard and Linden, we can go straight
7	down the block to a NYCHA development that is still
8	run by NYCHA, Cypress Houses, and we could also see
9	some of the things that you claim that doesn't happen
10	there, doesn't exist there.
11	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Happy
12	to do it. Actually, I was there with Council Member
13	Barron. Right?
14	EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT HONAN: Yes.
15	Yeah. So, we were there with Ms. Barnes and the
16	former Council Member.
17	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, listen, I'm the
18	new Councilperson, so I look forward to… and it's new
19	issues, so we look forward to hopefully to address
20	those, and we invite you out to the 42nd Council
21	District. Thank you so much for your testimony.
22	And if possible, could the Authority stay
23	behind to hear some of the testimony?
24	CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER BOVA-HIATT: Yeah,
25	we're here.

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 133 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Okay. Now, 2 3 I'll open the hearing for public testimony. I remind members of the public that this 4 is a government proceeding and that decorum shall be 5 observed at all times. As such, members of the public 6 7 shall remain silent at all times. 8 The witness table is reserved for people 9 who wish to testify. No video recording or photography is allowed from the witness table. 10 11 Further, members of the public may not present audio or video recordings as testimony, but may submit 12 transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant-at-13 Arms for inclusion into the hearing record. 14 15 If you wish to speak at today's hearing, please fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant-16 17 at-Arms and wait to be recognized. When recognized, 18 you will have two minutes to speak on today's hearing 19 topic. 20 If you have written statement or 21 additional written testimony and you wish to submit for the record, please provide a copy of the 2.2 23 testimony to the Sergeant-at-Arms. You may also email written testimony to testimony@councilnyc.gov within 24 25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 134 72 hours of this hearing. Audio and video recordings 2 3 will not be accepted. 4 We will now turn the opportunity for testimony to the panel. We will call up Manuel 5 Martinez, James Alcivar, Daren Sealey, and Trenton 6 7 Price. Please approach. Thank you. We will start with James Alcivar. 8 9 JAMES ALCIVAR: Hello. I want to start off by saying thank you, Councilman Chris Banks, for 10 11 noticing my development, Cypress Hills development, 12 which needs a walkthrough. Public safety is one of 13 the issues that we have right now. They were talking 14 about the CCT cameras, right? In my development, all 15 the cameras are spray painted and taped up. That one right there is a public safety issue because none of 16 17 the cameras are working. If a problem were to happen 18 in the building or where the cameras are located, you 19 won't be able to see anything because they are all 20 spray painted and taped. This has been going on 21 since, I believe, December 10th. It's now March. Lighting is bad in the development. We have no 2.2 23 playgrounds for the kids to come outside and play. We have a city park, but it's a city park. It's on 24 NYCHA's ground, but it's owned by the City. If we 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 135
2	come outside of our buildings, we don't have
3	playgrounds for the kids to come. There's not one
4	playground in there for the kids to play. There's
5	really nothing available for the kids to grow up to.
6	There's nothing there. With me being the new TA
7	President, I'm just fighting for what's right. We
8	also have a lot of complaints with tenants and
9	apartments. The maintenance work is property manager,
10	if you ask me. I'll just leave that there. There's a
11	lot of work that needs to be done in my development.
12	I will appreciate it if they do come and walk to see
13	for themselves what we go through on a daily basis.
14	Thank you.
15	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Before you conclude,
16	you're the TA President for Cypress Houses, am I
17	correct?
18	JAMES ALCIVAR: Correct. I'm the new TA
19	President for Cypress Hills Projects, yes.
20	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You may proceed. Thank
21	you.
22	TRENTON PRICE: Thank you, Chair Banks and
23	Members of the Committee on Public Housing. My name
24	is Trenton Price. I'm the Executive Director of the
25	Salvadori Center. I'm a former middle school teacher,

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 136
2	an assistant principal, and a district administrator
3	for arts education before I joined Salvadori two
4	years ago. I'm really passionate about education and
5	facilitating experiences for young people to work
6	together and empower their voices. At Salvadori, we
7	provide STEAM education, that's STEM plus the A for
8	Arts and Architecture, to schools and after-school
9	sites and NYCHA communities across the city. For
10	context, last year, Salvadori worked with over 12,000
11	students in 145 schools and NYCHA community centers.
12	We are grateful to have the support of the Council
13	through multiple CASA and digital inclusion and
14	literacy grants as well as the after-school
15	enrichment and Speakers Initiative at numerous NYCHA
16	sites across the city, and it's this work that brings
17	me here to speak today.
18	As a longtime partner of NYCHA for over
19	15 years, we see firsthand the need for robust, out-
20	of-school time programming for children and youth in
21	public housing communities. In our programs, young
22	people clamor for the opportunity to work together
23	and build solutions to design challenges that impact
24	their communities. These real-life challenges engage

25 their brains, foster collaboration, and make

2 connections to career pathways they may not have 3 considered. For example, last summer, Salvadori 4 worked with middle school youth in East New York and Astoria to learn about the built environment and to 5 propose designs for their own community center in 6 7 their NYCHA communities, which we then brought to 8 life. With so many pressing priorities for residents 9 of public housing, we know programming for children and youth can sometimes feel like not a priority. But 10 11 to the contrary, investing in pathways for children 12 and youth is one of the most critical things we can 13 do to support the success of future generations. I want to thank this Committee, Chair Banks, and the 14 15 Council for your investment in the futures of our 16 youth and encourage you to deepen that support for 17 out-of-school time partnerships. (TIMER CHIME) I ask 18 that you consider an increase to CASA and digital 19 inclusion and literacy to provide these opportunities 20 for young people in public housing communities. We're 21 grateful to be of service in New York City's youth 2.2 and stand ready to do more. Thank you for your 23 dedication in this hearing. CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. You may 24

25 proceed.

2 DAREN SEALEY: Good afternoon, Chair Banks 3 and esteemed Members of the Public Housing Committee. My name is Daren Sealey, and I serve as the Associate 4 Director of the Housing Resource Center at the Red 5 Hook Community Justice Center, an initiative of the 6 7 Center for Innovation. Access to safe, stable, and affordable housing is the foundation of economic and 8 9 community well-being. Yet NYCHA residents continue to face hazardous living conditions, chronic repair 10 11 delays, and ongoing threats of eviction. Our work at the Housing Resource Centers in Harlem and Red Hook 12 13 directly address these challenges. These centers provide court navigation, one-on-one tenant 14 15 assistance, and direct connections to legal and 16 financial resources. Last year we supported over 17 2,600 NYCHA residents, helping them document repair 18 needs, advocate for lease protections, and navigate 19 the court system. Recognizing the increasing housing 20 instability across public housing, the Center 21 launched a citywide housing navigator initiative 2.2 embedding housing navigators in East Harlem, the 23 South Bronx, Far Rockaway, and Red Hook. These navigators work directly with NYCHA developments to 24 assist tenants in resolving rental arrears, 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 139
2	addressing habitability concerns, and preventing
3	evictions, ensuring that residents receive the report
4	they need before reaching a crisis point. In
5	addition, through our Virtual Court Access Network,
6	also known as VCAN, we help tenants respond to
7	eviction notices, file housing court actions for
8	needed repairs, and connect with court services
9	remotely. VCAN ensures that NYCHA residents who often
10	face barriers to in-person court access can still
11	exercise their legal right without unnecessary delays
12	or procedural roadblocks. We urge the Council to
13	continue funding these essential programs. Supporting
14	NYCHA residents means supporting housing justice,
15	equity, and the well-being of our communities. Thank
16	you for your time and commitment to this issue.
17	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. You may
18	proceed.
19	MANUEL MARTINEZ: Good afternoon. Manny
20	Martinez, South Jamaica Houses, citywide resident
21	empowerment. For over a decade, the New York City
22	Housing Authority has received tens of billions of
23	dollars in federal funds, money meant to rebuild
24	communities, create jobs, and secure the economic
25	mobility of public housing residents. Instead, NYCHA
l	I

has weaponized these funds to expand executive 2 3 salaries while denying residents their legal economic 4 rights. NYCHA doesn't have a funding problem. It has 5 a corruption problem. It refuses to invest in the economic rights of the communities it serves, 6 7 blocking pathways that would make public housing 8 residents financially stable. A simple, measurable 9 goal, helping just 30 percent of NYCHA households reach the flat rent, would eliminate NYCHA's deficit 10 11 in three to five years. But that would mean thousands 12 of Black and Hispanic families transitioning from out 13 of poverty, gaining power, and demanding 14 accountability, and that is what NYCHA fears most. 15 Instead, NYCHA is spending millions to expand 16 executive salaries while public housing remains in 17 crisis. It refuses to provide jobs and contracts to 18 residents, even though over 7,000 vacant apartments 19 sit unleased. Units that could be used as training 20 grounds for resident employment in move-outs, 21 maintenance, and repairs. NYCHA's operational budget, 2.2 the largest share of its funding, is completely 23 shielded from economic rights of the residents who keep this system running. Our communities feel the 24 neglect every single day. Trespassers overrun our 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 141
2	spaces while NYCHA refuses to enforce basic housing
3	policies. There are over 19,000 security cameras, but
4	not a single one is used to protect residents or
5	maintain order. Elevators reek of urine. Stairwells
6	are used as toilets. Strangers sleep in front of our
7	apartment doors. Meanwhile, intercoms remain broken,
8	entrance doors stay unsecured, and residents are
9	obstructed from getting access to keys. NYCHA has
10	turned public housing into a free-for-all for
11	criminals while locking its own residents out of
12	economic opportunity. (TIMER CHIME) May I have 30
13	seconds?
14	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yeah, you have a
15	minute to go.
16	MANUEL MARTINEZ: And it's not just NYCHA
17	leadership. From 2010 to 2020, billions were spent
18	and no one was held accountable. The New York City
19	Comptrollers, past and present, acknowledge NYCHA's
20	legal obligation to enforce residents' economic
21	rights, yet they have never scrutinized contractors
22	who openly violate these mandates. Instead, they
23	blame the Mayor while running for mayor themselves.
24	Two State Representatives played a direct role in the
25	economic sabotage of public housing residents. They
I	I

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 142
2	either supported or ratified New York State ERAP
3	legislation that made it illegal for public housing
4	residents to access emergency rental assistance,
5	despite a warning from the U.S. Treasury that
6	blocking ERAP for public housing may violate the Fair
7	Housing Act. New York State was the only state in the
8	country to do this, despite having the largest public
9	housing population in the nation. One of these
10	representatives was once the HUD Secretary, and maybe
11	that was the point. Then there's NYCHA's pet
12	organization, the Citywide Council of Presidents.
13	This is not an independent resident organization.
14	NYCHA created it. NYCHA owns it. And yesterday, CCOP
15	itself admitted as much when it stated, despite our
16	legal status, a clear acknowledgment that it does not
17	have the legal status to exist as a resident
18	organization. NYCHA isn't just failing. It is rigging
19	the system against its own residents. The solution is
20	clear. A mass resignation of NYCHA executives, the
21	full enforcement of economic rights promised to our
22	public housing residents. And this is what we're
23	asking for the Public Housing Committee and the New
24	York City Council to help us achieve. Thank you, sir.
25	

2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your3 advocacy. Thank you, guys.

Now we'll have Sharon Brown. Sorry about
that. We will have Noah Cohen, Richard Soohoo, Laura
Lazarus, and Elizabet Rodriguez. Noah Cohen, Richard
Soohoo, Laura Lazarus, Elizabet Rodriguez.

8 You can take your seat. Thank you. I9 guess we'll begin with Noah Cohen.

NOAH COHEN: Thank you, Chair Banks and 10 11 Members of the Committee. I'm here to really talk about how NYCHA's false promises have directly 12 affected folks like me. I live in a homeless shelter 13 14 right now in Brooklyn, and a lot of our residents 15 applied through NYCHA for Section 8 vouchers back in 16 June. The waitlist was open for six days, and they 17 had a record amount of applications. Over 600,000 18 people applied for Section 8 through NYCHA. 200,000 19 were approved for the waitlist. NYCHA promised that 20 they were going to give out over 1,000 vouchers per 21 month. Guess how many eight months later, eight months after these applications were received, what 2.2 23 do we have now? They have doled out 2,400 vouchers. They promised 1,000 a month. That is unacceptable. 24 Right now, we have folks languishing in shelters like 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 144
2	my own with rats, with rodents, with gnats flying all
3	over, with them not making basic repairs. You know
4	what? Folks languishing in NYCHA housing are
5	experiencing a lot of the same conditions. My name is
6	Noah Cohen. I am a member of a grassroots
7	organization, for those who don't know, called VOCAL-
8	NY, and we advocate for folks that are directly
9	experiencing issues like homelessness. When it comes
10	to NYCHA residents, we have NYCHA residents who are
11	members of our organization. The conditions were so
12	awful in NYCHA housing. They were dealing with mold
13	on the ceiling, with basic repairs not being made,
14	all the stuff that we've been talking about during
15	this hearing. I actually know a member personally who
16	ended up moving into a homeless shelter because they
17	figured that the conditions would, one, not be as
18	awful as NYCHA housing, and two, they'd at least have
19	a shot at (TIMER CHIME) getting a voucher.
20	Unfortunately, that's not the case. We have people
21	waiting for very long
22	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap it
23	up.
24	NOAH COHEN: Understood. We have people
25	waiting for very long periods of time just to get a

2 voucher, just to get housing. We are basically 3 prolonging people's stay in the shelter system by 4 doing what we're doing now. We really need robust 5 oversight of NYCHA. I would really like somebody to introduce a bill that would allow Council Members the 6 7 authority to walk into a NYCHA facility at any time, 8 24/7, to inspect the conditions, to talk directly to 9 residents. Same thing with the shelter system. I would like them to have that kind of authority as 10 11 well. I would encourage the Council to use their 12 oversight authority and to expand their oversight authority to inspect the conditions in the shelter 13 14 system, to inspect the conditions in NYCHA housing, 15 and stand up for our residents who are really hurting 16 right now. People should not have to live like this. 17 People should not have to live in a place that is 18 unsafe. They should not have to live in a place where 19 there are rats and rodents... 20 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your 21 testimony. 2.2 NOAH COHEN: And gnats all over. They 23 shouldn't have to live in a place that isn't

providing basic repairs and continues to increase

145

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 146
2	their executive salaries, their CEO salaries, their
3	board member salaries. It's unacceptable.
4	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
5	advocacy and your testimony. Thank you.
6	NOAH COHEN: Thank you, Chair Banks.
7	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Now we'll move to
8	Richard Soohoo.
9	RICHARD SOOHOO: Good afternoon. Thank
10	you, Chair Banks and Members of the Public Housing
11	Committee.
12	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You want to speak into
13	the mic or turn it on?
14	RICHARD SOOHOO: I'm sorry.
15	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you.
16	RICHARD SOOHOO: Thank you, Chair Banks
17	and Members of the Public Housing Committee for the
18	opportunity to testify. My name is Richard Soohoo,
19	and I am the Tenant Services Coordinator at 64
20	Norfolk HDFC at the Chinese American Planning
21	Council, CPC, the nation's largest Asian American
22	social service organization.
23	In one square block of New York City in
24	the Lower East Side, CPC has 350 units of affordable
25	housing, with 265 of those units being earmarked for
ļ	

seniors, with 58 of those units set aside for the 2 3 formerly unhoused. I want to share a story of one of our residents. KJ, incarcerated in 1973 and released 4 in 2001, has struggled with unstable housing and 5 relies on a loose support system of friends and 6 7 family, though they have been in and out of shelters themselves. He resides in a housing unit for the 8 9 formerly unhoused at 64 Norfolk, but has faced several health setbacks, including hospitalizations 10 11 for high blood pressure and diabetes. KJ has an 12 expired State ID, which led to the expiration of his 13 housing subsidy during a CityFHEPS recertification. 14 Additionally, he was unaware of over 800 dollars in 15 late fees and legal charges, which had been sent to 16 collections, and had also fallen behind in a Con Edison bill. With assistance from his case manager at 17 18 CPC, his subsidy has been renewed, a payment plan for 19 the utility set up, and the arrears are being 20 addressed through an HRA one-shot deal. Our 21 communities heavily rely on housing assistance 2.2 services, the ones that we provide. However, our 23 communities deserve a city where housing is afforded to every New Yorker. We urge the City to invest in 24 more affordable housing, which includes expanding 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 148
2	CityFHEPS eligibility. We must have housing that is
3	inclusive of seniors, with social services and health
4	care provided, that is local and accessible to our
5	communities. Thank you for your time.
6	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
7	testimony. Laura Lazarus.
8	LAURA LAZARUS: Thank you. Good afternoon,
9	Chair Banks. My name is Laura Lazarus, and I'm the
10	Co-Founder and Chief Executive Officer of Anthos
11	Home. Thank you for the opportunity to testify about
12	using housing vouchers and a better way to use them
13	and expand their use.
14	Anthos Home is committed to helping New
15	Yorkers with housing vouchers find and move into
16	permanent housing as quickly as possible. We know
17	that housing vouchers are one of the most effective
18	tools to address homelessness and housing
19	instability, but too often they are difficult to use.
20	In New York City, it takes families an average of at
21	least a year to secure housing after receiving a
22	voucher. This delay prolongs shelter stays and forces
23	families to remain in unstable and challenging
24	conditions. This isn't a problem unique to New York.
25	Nationally, nearly 40 percent of federally issued

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 149 housing vouchers are not used. New York City has made 2 3 tremendous progress in addressing homelessness, 4 particularly through the CityFHEPS program. In the past year alone, DSS has helped more than 14,000 5 households into permanent housing, a 45 percent 6 7 increase over the previous year. This achievement is a testament to the City's commitment to tackling 8 9 homelessness at scale and ensuring that a housing voucher is a pathway to a home. Despite this 10 11 progress, persistent barriers prevent voucher holders 12 from accessing stable housing, both at NYCHA and 13 throughout the city. These challenges include finding landlords willing to accept vouchers, delays in 14 15 processing approvals and payments, and the need for more robust support services to help tenants maintain 16 17 their homes. Tackling homelessness cannot be the 18 responsibility of one program or agency. A crisis of 19 this magnitude requires strong partnerships between 20 government, non-profits and the private sector, 21 particularly the real estate community. That's where 2.2 we come in. Anthos Homes' model is designed to help 23 tenants and landlords overcome these obstacles so that vouchers can be utilized quickly and 24 effectively. Our approach includes proactively 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 150
2	securing apartments through a network of landlords
3	and brokers, ensuring that families with vouchers
4	have immediate access to housing options.
5	Additionally, our flexible funding model allows us to
6	cover necessary repairs for inspection approvals,
7	moving costs, application fees and (TIMER CHIME)
8	other expenses.
9	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap it
10	up if you need it.
11	LAURA LAZARUS: We also provide critical
12	support for both tenants and landlords throughout the
13	process, from assisting with paperwork to ensuring
14	units and tenants are move-in ready. We help
15	streamline what can otherwise be a slow and
16	disjointed system. Once families are housed, we
17	provide ongoing support for at least a year,
18	including monthly check-ins, help with repairs and
19	intervention if payment issues arise. It's this
20	wraparound approach that has reduced the burden on
21	landlords while ensuring tenants have their
22	resources. And our model has proved effective over
23	the last 18 months. To date, we have helped more than
24	270 families and individuals move into housing and
25	every single one of them remains stably housed. And I

2 just wanted to add a note, based on the testimony 3 today from NYCHA, that in our experience, in terms of 4 working with NYCHA, we do think that there can be 5 improvements in terms of the timeframe in which inspections are scheduled. We know that, in our 6 7 experience, it has been taking four to six weeks to just schedule an inspection, and then another two 8 9 weeks to actually have the inspection happen, and then it's very difficult to actually follow up with 10 11 an actual person at NYCHA to figure out when there are problems, what's going on. 12 13 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Ditto. I agree. Thank 14 you for your testimony. 15 We will now move to Elizabet Rodriguez. 16 ELIZABET RODRIGUEZ: Thank you, Chris 17 Banks. How are you doing? Good afternoon. I'm happy 18 to be here. And I'm here to say about RAD-PACT and 19 NYCHA. I live in Jacob Riis, and they're over here. 20 By trying to get the votes, they go and they actually knock on certain doors where there's seniors, and 21 they're threatening, harassing them if they don't 2.2 23 sign for PACT, that they will be getting off, they'll lose their apartment. And I can have that. I mean, I 24 25 go around, people tell me. I know them for years.

1	COMMITTEE	ON	PUBLIC	HOUSING
---	-----------	----	--------	---------

Okay, I've been in housing for years. My son is 41 2 3 years old. Well, he's going to be 41, and he was 4 raised in housing. You can imagine that. I'm going to 5 be 68, and I can't stand when people come and harass them for their votes. They're scared to open the 6 doors. They say, I'm going to lose my apartment. We 7 8 don't want PACT. We the people don't want PACT. We're 9 going around making petitions. We're going to make it heard. We don't want them. We never asked for them. 10 11 So why are they here? Trying to take over us? It's 12 going to be worse than what housing is doing right 13 now. Housing ain't repairing. They ain't going to 14 repair nothing. All they're going to do is take out 15 people, and that's not right. And I'm not just 16 fighting for me, but I'm fighting for my community 17 where I live, for the mama, papas, grandpas that are 18 there that raised their kids, their grandchildren. 19 And they're intimidated. They're scared. So Chris 20 Banks, I will invite you down, and you talk to 21 tenants, and they'll let you know. You'll see some of 2.2 them that come out, the seniors will come out when 23 it's a nice, hot, warm day to chill out there and see their neighbors (TIMER CHIME) and we don't want PACT. 24

152

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 153 2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap it 3 up. 4 ELIZABET RODRIGUEZ: Thank you. We just don't want them. Get them out. Thank you very much. I 5 appreciate it. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your advocacy. Thank you for your testimony, panel. Thank 8 9 you. Now we'll have Jesse Koklas, and we'll 10 11 have Arlene Geter, and we'll have Christopher Leon 12 Johnson. 13 Okay. You may begin your testimony. 14 JESSE MALDONADO KOKLAS: Okay. Good 15 afternoon, Chair Banks and the Committee. So, I want to start by introducing myself. My name is Jesse 16 17 Maldonado Koklas, New York City Regional Director for 18 Citizen Action of New York that organizes communities 19 across the city around various issues, and one of our 20 bases is public housing residents. We're here to advocate for at least 1.5 21 billion in capital funding for NYCHA. We know that 2.2 23 the federal government has consistently given less than NYCHA needs, and we really can't count on them, 24 especially in the current administration, which means 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 154
2	that the City has to step up their budget. There's a
3	45-billion-dollar backlog in repairs some estimates
4	have, so it's really needed. Last year there was 779
5	million in the budget, yet 98 percent of that went to
6	Section 8, so the Preservation Trust or PACT
7	programs, and only 2 percent went to Section 9, which
8	is not nearly enough. And so, yeah, we just really
9	want to, I know that you've heard the stories of the
10	lack of repairs and upgrades that are needed
11	desperately on developments, and so that money could
12	go towards that, and we want to make sure that it
13	doesn't, again, that it doesn't just go towards the
14	Section 8 programs. And I know that NYCHA mentioned
15	that there's historic resident involvement in these
16	programs and these conversions. We are witnessing a
17	historic moment in resident democracy on NYCHA
18	campuses. Only four developments were given the
19	opportunity to vote on their future. None selected
20	the PACT program. One chose to remain Section 9, and
21	three developments opted for the Trust, and the City
22	must respect these choices and share fair and
23	equitable funding for all NYCHA communities,
24	regardless of their chosen management structure. And
25	the New York City Council should ensure that a vote
ļ	

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 155 2 against PACT does not mean no repairs and no 3 improvements come. And we know (TIMER CHIME) that 4 many of the developments ... CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap up. 5 JESSE MALDONADO KOKLAS: Yeah. Many of the 6 7 developments haven't gotten a vote, and I know the NYCHA officials said that there's resident 8 9 involvement, but often it just goes to the TA president who makes the decisions on behalf of the 10 11 development, and the resident involvement in the TA structure is varied and so, if that's actually going 12 13 to be the process, there needs to be investment to 14 make sure that there's actually resident outreach, 15 there's door knocking, there's calls. That requires a 16 lot of work that the tenant associations aren't set 17 up with or have the training to do themselves. So in 18 conclusion, it's really important that we preserve 19 the current public and affordable housing through 20 serious investment. Thank you. 21 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your 2.2 testimony. Arlene Geter. ARLENE GETER: Greetings, Chair Banks and 23 Members of the Council Committee on Public Housing. 24 My name is Arlene Geter. I am a resident of Stapleton 25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 156 2 Houses in Staten Island. Thank you for the 3 opportunity to submit my testimony today. I urge the Council to prioritize public 4 housing investment in this year's budget, putting 1.5 5 billion towards NYCHA's capital funding. I've lived 6 7 in Stapleton Houses since 1992, raised my children 8 there. It is the largest NYCHA development in Staten 9 Island with 700 apartments and thousands of residents and is often listed as the worst development. People 10 11 who do not live there in the development break the locks in the buildings and the doors and smoke in the 12 13 hallways, urinate, poop in the stair hall, and they 14 threaten residents, making them feel unsafe. We had a 15 blackout where the electricity was out for three 16 days, and for a couple of months we had the 17 generators going on and off. They said the reason was 18 because the electrical went out and the wires were 19 old. They needed upgrades years ago. This was 20 especially hard on the disabled and elderly residents who could not keep their medicines cold or their 21 2.2 (TIMER CHIME) elevators working. 23 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap it 24 up.

2	ARLENE GETER: Working to go to their
3	appointments or even breathe with their respirators.
4	I was the Vice President of the Tenant Association
5	when the gas was out. It was out almost for a year.
6	This funding is important so our issues do not
7	escalate further. Thank you for your time.
8	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
9	testimony and your advocacy.
10	Mr. Johnson.
11	CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Hello, Chair
12	Banks. My name is Christopher Leon Johnson. First, I
13	am calling for the eradication, I'm calling for the
14	City Council to introduce a bill into the City
15	Council, starting with you, Mr. Chair Banks, to
16	introduce a bill to eradicate the CCOP, the Council
17	of Presidents. Please eradicate CCOP. I just found
18	out that CCOP is ran full of people that are
19	opportunistic, people that used to work for City
20	Council that couldn't even get 5 percent of the vote
21	in their primary like Reginald Bowman and Lilithe
22	Lozano. This committee needs to be eradicated because
23	they're a big part of the reason why these people in
24	NYCHA are getting sold out down the river. I just
25	found out this about the past meeting. I'm surprised
I	

that nobody in the City Council really started calling this stuff out. What's going on here? I'm calling for the eradication of CCOP. Nothing but opportunistic people that are hell-bent on selling out NYCHA to developers, to related and all these organizations.

Mr. Banks, I know you're down with 8 9 Mercedes Narcisse. You need to start supporting her for City Council because one of the people that is on 10 11 CCOP is supporting her opponent. You need to call that out. You need to support Mercedes Narcisse. 12 13 Mercedes, I hope you watch this right now. Mercedes, 14 your opponent is supported by Barbara McFadden, who's 15 part of CCOP. You need to start calling this stuff 16 out, Mercedes Narcisse. This is the truth.

17 Another thing I need to ask from you is I 18 hope, if they did apply, that the City Club of New 19 York that's run by Layla Law-Gisiko gets funding from 20 the City Council for programming when it comes to 21 educating clients, educating the members of NYCHA, people that live in NYCHA, about Section 9 and 2.2 23 Section 8 and the RAD and PACT and the Blueprint and CCOP. Like I said, I'm calling for the eradication of 24 CCOP right now. People need to start bringing this 25

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 2 stuff up more at these hearings. I feel bad for the 3 people that was out there two weeks ago. He was out 4 there. Thanks for supporting RPPH and Layla at the rally at the morning time. 5

CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap up. 6 7 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: I'm calling for the eradication of CCOP. Chris Banks, please support 8 9 Mercedes. You need to support her. You need to have her call out her opponent about Barbara McFadden, 10 who's the First Vice Chair of CCOP that is down for 11 the eradication of NYCHA through RAD-PACT, and the 12 13 Blueprint. You need to call her out, bro. You need to help out Mercedes, man. As man-to-man, you need to 14 15 help Mercedes call out her opponent about that. Thank 16 you. 17 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your 18 testimony. Thank you for your advocacy. 19 We'll now have Sharon Brown come on up. 20 Thank you. 21 SHARON BROWN: Hello, I'm Sharon Brown. Before I get started, remember Israel, defend Israel, 2.2 23 release the hostages, let Yahweh's people go.

Okay, so NYCHA, when they come to the 24 hearing, they are completely unprepared, unaware of 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 160
2	what's happening in the building with the money spent
3	and everything. Every question that was asked, they
4	don't know, and this seems to be a way to throw it
5	off for another time so they don't have to deal with
6	it. So, they know there's a meeting coming up and no
7	one has any kind of figures or any kind of data or
8	information, and this is ongoing and it's just a
9	cycle. They keep doing the same thing over and over.
10	The way they're dealing with the Council is the same
11	way they deal with the tenants. They tell them
12	they're going to make the repairs or whatever. They
13	go into a cycle and nothing ever gets done. So, all
14	they have to do to you is keep coming here
15	unprepared, and you yell at them, you tell them what
16	they need to do, and nothing ever gets done. So, the
17	things that they want to talk about, that they made
18	the repairs, but they say they've made certain
19	repairs, a hundred here, a thousand there since this
20	time, but they don't have anything, any data to show
21	you. I wonder if they actually handed in anything to
22	show the repairs that they've made thus far. When
23	they make repairs for the leaks in the apartments,
24	what they're doing is improper. If the leak is coming
25	back, that means that they have to change the pipes.

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 161
2	So, what they're doing now is patching up the wall.
3	They're probably putting a little sealant on the pipe
4	and then the pipe is re-bursting again. They have to
5	purchase new pipes or at least a portion of pipe.
6	Maybe they screw out or something, they could put
7	them in. They are in a cycle of causing rent arrears
8	by failing to make the repairs then (TIMER CHIME)
9	they save money.
10	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap it
11	up.
12	SHARON BROWN: They make the tenants pay
13	for an apartment that has not been repaired for many
14	years, and then the tenant winds up either getting
15	evicted or having to pay for living in squalor that
16	the NYCHA is responsible for. It's not fair to the
17	tenants to have to pay the arrears as if they lived
18	in a completely repaired apartment.
19	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you so much for
20	your advocacy and your testimony.
21	SHARON BROWN: You're welcome. God bless.
22	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Now we will end in-
23	person testimony, and we will now go to Zoom
24	testimony.
25	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 162
2	We will now turn to the remote testimony.
3	Once your name is called, a Member of our Staff will
4	unmute you, and the Sergeant-at-Arms will give you
5	the go-ahead to begin. Please wait for the Sergeant-
6	at-Arms to announce that you may begin before
7	delivering your testimony.
8	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: You may begin.
9	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Gwendolyn Primus.
10	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: You may begin.
11	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Gwendolyn Primus.
12	Gwendolyn Primus.
13	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: You may begin.
14	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Now we'll move to
15	Jeremy Bunyaner.
16	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: The time has started.
17	JEREMY BUNYANER: Thank you for the
18	opportunity to speak. My name is Jeremy Bunyaner. I
19	am an elected constitutional officer sitting on the
20	Executive Board of the Association of Legal Advocates
21	and Attorneys, United Auto Workers Local 2325. UAW
22	2325 represents over 3,400 active and retired legal
23	services workers at over 30 non-profit organizations
24	in the New York City metro area, including the
25	majority of providers participating in the Right to
<u>.</u>	

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 163
2	Counsel Universal Access Program. 2325 members are
3	the workers who keep people in their homes, fight for
4	repairs, and keep NYCHA and private landlords
5	accountable to the law by making sure New Yorkers
6	have access to justice in our courts and vital social
7	services in our city. Our members are an essential
8	labor force, but like with NYCHA itself, decades of
9	underfunding has led to untenable conditions. We are
10	facing an attrition and workload crisis. Our salaries
11	and retirement benefits have failed to keep pace with
12	our counterparts in the district attorney's offices
13	and corporation counsel. When our wages stagnate, the
14	services poor and working-class New Yorkers receive
15	are degraded. Positions requiring experience go
16	unfilled, leaving those who remain overburdened with
17	rising caseloads. We lose talent and institutional
18	knowledge. It takes experienced advocates to ensure
19	tenants are not evicted over unpaid NYCHA Section 8
20	portions of the rent that are not their burden to
21	pay. It takes a depth of knowledge with NYCHA
22	regulations to navigate succession in NYCHA units so
23	that family homes can remain family homes after the
24	death of a loved one. Not every licensee holdover is
25	actually that. A lot of these people, or at least
l	

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 164 some, are entitled to these units. Attempts to 2 3 meaningfully fill senior positions in the organizations we work for have failed. Our salaries 4 5 are just too low and the cost (TIMER CHIME) of living in the city is too high. 6 7 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Thank you. Time's expired. 8 9 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your testimony. 10 11 Now we'll have Imane Cherif El Farissy. 12 SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: You may begin. IMANE CHERIF EL FARISSY: Hi. Good 13 14 afternoon. Thank you for the opportunity to speak. My 15 name is Imane Cherif El Farissy, and I am a delegate 16 from Camden Legal Services Workers United at the 17 Association of Legal Advocates and Attorneys. I would 18 like to speak on the crucial role that case-handling 19 paralegals play in assisting NYCHA tenants and 20 Section 8 recipients. When NYCHA tenants are informed of an administrative proceeding and served with 21 charges, many mistakenly believe that a housing court 2.2 23 case has been commenced, failing to recognize an administrative proceeding as a possible preventative 24 measure to housing court action. It takes an 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 165
2	experienced paralegal to understand the charges,
3	interview tenants, review their files, and
4	effectively advocate on their behalf to settle the
5	proceeding. Paralegals play a key role in preventing
6	these cases from advancing to housing court and
7	preventing eviction from public housing. Furthermore,
8	paralegals may also assist NYCHA tenants and Section
9	8 recipients to resolve accrued rental arrears
10	balances that threaten their permanent housing.
11	Paralegals knowledgeable of the processes required to
12	secure financial assistance from the Human Resources
13	Administration, through a one-shot deal or from a
14	charitable organization, are crucial to assist
15	tenants to resolve their balances. In 2025, ALAA has
16	fundamentally changed the terrain of legal services
17	throughout organizing. Now over 95 percent of legal
18	services workers in New York City are UAW 2325
19	members. In Fiscal Year 2026, we are asking the
20	Council to fully fund legal services so our employers
21	can meet our core bargaining demands. My written
22	testimony will detail these demands. Our members are
23	not immune from the affordability crisis that has hit
24	our city hard. Austerity budgets and legal services
25	hurt our union, and they hurt New Yorkers. Settling

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 166
2	fair contracts that are centered on these demands
3	will provide stability to our members and ensure
4	working-class New Yorkers get the absolute best legal
5	representation. They deserve nothing less.
6	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
7	testimony. We're going to take a three-minute recess.
8	Thank you.
9	Let me just recognize Council Member
10	Sanchez, who was on via Zoom. Thank you, Council
11	Member.
12	Now we will proceed with our next virtual
13	testimony, and that's going to be Renee Keith. Renee
14	Keith.
15	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: You may begin.
16	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Renee Keith. All
17	right. So now we'll move on to Tanesha Grant.
18	TANESHA GRANT: Good afternoon.
19	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Good afternoon, Ms.
20	Grant.
21	TANESHA GRANT: Thank you, Chair. Thanks
22	for this very important meeting on public housing. My
23	name is Tanesha Grant. I am the Executive Director of
24	Parent Supporting Parents New York and Moms United
25	for Black Lives New York City. Also in my personal
I	

2 capacity, I am the Second Vice Chair of my community 3 board, Community Board 12 in Manhattan, but I am here 4 as the Executive Director of Parent Supporting 5 Parents New York.

We have a lot of parents, Chair, that 6 7 live in public housing, generations of Black people 8 and Brown people who have brought up their families 9 and, you know, others in public housing. This is about upkeep and budget. So, we are partners of 10 11 Residents to Preserve Public Housing, and we stand with them on their demands. We need 3.4 billion 12 13 dollars in capital funds in NYCHA budgets every year. We need 2.9 billion in operation funds for this 14 15 fiscal year and fiscal years going forward. This is about mismanagement. I am truly, truly disturbed on 16 17 how these people at the top of NYCHA came here today 18 and were so disrespectful to you and to the Committee 19 and to our residents in public housing. This is about 20 people's homes. Public housing has been mismanaged 21 for generations. There is no one other to blame 2.2 except the people who lead on NYCHA upkeep and on 23 NYCHA management. We do not want RAD, and we do not want PACT. We want to keep our Section 9. It is the 24 only deeply affordable housing that low-income people 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 168
2	and working-class people and working-poor people
3	have. We want you to stand on this, Chair. We really
4	appreciate your efforts, but we must do more. We
5	would like to see the (TIMER CHIME) whole City
6	Council get behind the Public Housing Committee
7	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Your time is expired.
8	Thank you.
9	TANESHA GRANT: And make sure that we
10	have
11	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap up.
12	TANESHA GRANT: Fully funded public
13	housing. Thank you.
14	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Thank you
15	for your testimony.
16	Now we will move to Beverly McFarland.
17	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.
18	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Beverly McFarland.
19	Beverly McFarland. All right. Now we will move on to
20	Dana Elden.
21	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Starting time.
22	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Dana Elden.
23	DANA ELDEN: Good afternoon, Chairman
24	Banks. This is Dana Elden from St. Mary's, also from
25	RPPH. And I'm here again to comment on some of the

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 169 2 many issues that residents suffer from at the hands 3 of NYCHA. Today, many spoke about the financial atrocities that follow NYCHA and their endeavors. And 4 5 as a Resident Council President and community activist, I have observed some of the spending 6 7 practices within my own NYCHA development. The spending of thousands of dollars, which could have 8 9 been spent on purchasing what was needed to fix items within the development. It is deplorable that they 10 11 spend money as they do, and you have no idea what 12 vendors they are using or the money exactly, the 13 figures that they are spending. This must stop. And 14 they keep saying, well, the resident leaders can and 15 are knowledgeable. That's a lie. If I want anything, 16 I have to beg for it. Just recently, there was an 17 issue in regards to me asking for the vacancies in my 18 development, the difference between Section 8 and 19 Section 9. I observed three new residents moving in 20 under Section 8. However, out of the 87 vacancies 21 that we have, I haven't seen one, not one Section 9 2.2 tenant moved in. What are they doing? What are they 23 doing? Why is no one jumping at them? And why is it that we only get two minutes? They sit, NYCHA comes 24 in there and they sit, and they give you crap. They 25

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 170
2	lie to you. And then they can say as much as they
3	want to say, and we get two minutes? That's not fair.
4	That's not fair at all. And it should be changed.
5	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Do you want an extra
6	minute? I'm going to give you an extra minute.
7	DANA ELDEN: Yes, I do.
8	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Yes.
9	DANA ELDEN: Thank you, sir.
10	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Not a problem.
11	DANA ELDEN: There's just too much that is
12	not being spoken of. And NYCHA tends to get away with
13	it, and so I'm not trying to run after them. I just
14	want the truth, and I want it to be known. There's no
15	way that we can do this without you and those that
16	support these efforts to find out what NYCHA is doing
17	and make them accountable. They need to be
18	accountable. Look how gray I've gotten since I've
19	been dealing with NYCHA. I didn't have this gray
20	before. But thank you, Chairman, for this
21	opportunity. God bless you always.
22	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you for your
23	strong voice and your advocacy. Thank you for your
24	testimony. We will now move to Douglas Covington.
25	Douglas Covington.

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 171
2	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: You may begin.
3	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: We would now like to
4	call up to the testimony table, We the People, and
5	that will conclude the… you may approach. Thank you.
6	You can have a seat. Yes, thank you. Yep. Move a
7	little closer so we can thank you. You can pull the
8	mic a little closer. Yeah.
9	WE THE PEOPLE: Okay.
10	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: You may begin.
11	WE THE PEOPLE: Hi. I'm here because I'm
12	from Jacob Riis Houses in Manhattan, and they're
13	trying to bring the PACT program to us as well. We,
14	the people, do not want it. We never asked for it.
15	The tenant association that claim they work for us,
16	we never agreed to these people. We don't even know
17	who are these people so we don't even know how they
18	get there into office when we never asked for them.
19	You understand? So a lot of these things that's going
20	on is going on underhandedly. You understand? A lot
21	of my, I'm going to say my tenants because I'm for
22	the people, so a lot of them be scared, you know, to
23	open their door. They send me videos where the PACT
24	people knock on their door. They don't want to open
25	it. And as far as when I was listening about the

2 maintenance, it takes actually, when you call, it depends what you're calling for for maintenance. You 3 4 could be waiting two weeks to another whole month to 5 actually get some type of repair. You understand? So now not only that the tenants pay money, they get 6 7 federal funded housing. So where's the money? Every tenant have a right to know where their money is 8 9 going and what account. Is it going into the housing account or is it going into their personal account? 10 11 Where's the money? Where's the money? You got tenants 12 that pay their rent, whether it's getting from public 13 assistance or whether it's coming out of their pocket. So with that and federal funding, they could 14 15 have fixed them building up 16 million times. Again, 16 it's like they want money. They're asking y'all for 17 money. I'm sitting here listening about all the money 18 they're asking for, but yet they're not doing that. 19 And as far as PACT, PACT abandoned plenty of their 20 buildings in Brooklyn. I'm from Brooklyn, you know, 21 and I moved to Manhattan. There's plenty of buildings 2.2 in PACT that's abandoned so how you coming over here 23 and want to take over here when you abandoned your own? That don't make sense. We don't want PACT. We 24

172

1	COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 173
2	never asked for PACT, and we have our own (TIMER
3	CHIME) I'm sorry.
4	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: 30 seconds to wrap it
5	up.
6	WE THE PEOPLE: Sorry, can I get five more
7	minutes?
8	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: No, 30 seconds.
9	WE THE PEOPLE: Oh, 30 seconds.
10	CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Go ahead, ma'am.
11	WE THE PEOPLE: Listen, we don't want
12	that. You understand? We, the people, don't want
13	that. We have our own signatures from every building
14	in Jacob Riis, and they saying they don't want it. So
15	I think it's underhanded that they trying to have a
16	vote without the tenants. It's a lie. They don't ask
17	the tenants to be on board. It's a lie. You
18	understand? So please, I mean, when I went to the
19	meeting, they tried to put me out because I told them
20	the truth. Like, we didn't ask for this. How y'all
21	just come in to decide this is what y'all want? And
22	here, take it, take it, take it. No. It's no contract
23	between us housing, which is we, the people, housing
24	or PACT stating that we wanted PACT.
25	

1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING 174 2 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Well, thank you for 3 your testimony and your advocacy. Thank you very 4 much. WE THE PEOPLE: Thank you, Chairman. Mr. 5 Banks, I appreciate your time. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON BANKS: Thank you. Thank you 8 for your time. Thank you. 9 WE THE PEOPLE: And you too, everybody. CHAIRPERSON BANKS: If we have 10 11 inadvertently missed anyone that has registered to 12 testify today and has yet to have been heard or 13 called, please use the Zoom to raise your hand 14 function. If you have testified remotely, you will be 15 called in the order that your hand has been raised. 16 If you're testifying in person, please come to the 17 dais. 18 If no one, okay. So, we see none. 19 I will close this hearing. Thank you to all the Members and Administration and the members of 20 the public who have joined us today to discuss this 21 very important topic. This hearing is [GAVEL] 22 23 adjourned. 24 25

CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date _____ March 25, 2025