

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

-----X

April 22, 2010  
Start: 10:00 am approx.  
Recess: 10:30 pm approx.

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
City Hall

B E F O R E:  
LEROY G. COMRIE, JR.  
Acting Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
Council Member Daniel R. Garodnick  
Council Member Sara M. Gonzalez  
Council Member Daniel J. Halloran,  
III  
Council Member Vincent M. Ignizio  
Council Member Peter A. Koo  
Council Member Brad S. Lander  
Council Member Stephen T. Levin  
Council Member Rosie Mendez  
Council Member Diana Reyna  
Council Member James Sanders, Jr.  
Council Member Larry B. Seabrook  
Council Member James Vacca  
Council Member Albert Vann  
Council Member Mark S. Weprin  
Council Member Jumaane D. Williams

## A P P E A R A N C E S [CONTINUED]

Leroy G. Comrie, Jr.  
Opening Statement  
Committee on Land Use

Samara Karasyk  
Director  
Intergovernmental Affairs  
New York City Department of Transportation

Anne Koenig  
Executive Director  
Franchises, Concessions and Consents  
New York City Department of Transportation

William Martin  
Committee Clerk  
Committee on Land Use

1

[Pause]

2

[Gavel banging]

3

4

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: I've got a working mic now. We can start the meeting. Today is Thursday, April 22<sup>nd</sup>, to a lot of people around the planet it's Earth Day. So I should make the sign of the E--the new sign of the E on the papers the other day, it's like E for Earth.

10

[Laughter]

11

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: I don't know-- yeah I wasn't--okay. Thank you Council Member Reyna, I won't use that again.

13

14

[Off mic]

15

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: That's the--oh okay. All right.

16

17

[Off mic]

18

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: This is the, huh, full Land Use Committee meeting. We are joined by Council Member Jimmy Vacca, Council Member Rosie Mendez, Council Member Sara Gonzalez, Council Member Diana Reyna, James Sanders, Jumaane Williams, Peter Koo... Vinnie Ignizio. [Chuckling] Mark Weprin. Brad Lander and Al Vann. And we have a quorum, we can move forward.

25

1  
2 The first thing we need to do is  
3 have a brief hearing on Intro 99, item number  
4 20105557LLY which is a Local Law to amend the City  
5 Charter in relation to authorizing the Department  
6 of Transportation to extend the expiration date of  
7 the Operating Authority of certain un-private,  
8 unsubsidized private bus lines. There are two  
9 private bus lines and they will be giving you a  
10 background on that. We have Samara and Anne from  
11 DOT. So. I won't mangle their last names by  
12 trying to pronounce them.

13 Good morning.

14 MS. SAMARA KARASYK: Good morning  
15 Chairman Comrie and members of the Land Use  
16 Committee. My name is Samara Karasyk, Director  
17 for Intergovernmental Affairs at the New York City  
18 Department of Transportation. I am joined today  
19 by Anne Koenig, Executive Director of Franchises,  
20 Concessions and Consents at DOT.

21 Thank you for the opportunity to  
22 discuss Intro 99, a Charter amendment authorizing  
23 DOT to extend the date of the operating authority  
24 for two unsubsidized private bus services. In  
25 2007 the Committee approved Authorizing Resolution

1  
2 838-A which allows DOT to award competitive  
3 franchises for two unsubsidized bus services. One  
4 that transports approximately 880,000 passengers  
5 annually from Manhattan to LaGuardia and Kennedy  
6 Airports and between these airports. And one that  
7 transports approximately 570,000 passengers  
8 annually between Williamsburg and Borough Park in  
9 Brooklyn.

10 Competitive solicitation will offer  
11 the opportunity for companies with the best  
12 overall proposal to operate these services. As  
13 you know, last year the Committee approved and the  
14 Council enabled Local Law 34 of 2009 which allowed  
15 DOT, subject to the approval of the Franchise and  
16 Concession Review Committee to extend the  
17 operating authority of the current unsubsidized  
18 bus service providers until June 30<sup>th</sup>, 2010 in  
19 order to ensure that we were able to solicit new  
20 proposals through an RFP process without  
21 interrupting services.

22 DOT released RFPs for the  
23 Williamsburg to Borough Park bus service on  
24 February 22<sup>nd</sup> and for the Manhattan to LaGuardia  
25 and JFK Airport bus service on March 22<sup>nd</sup> of this

1  
2 year. We issued addenda to the Brooklyn RFP in  
3 March. Responses to these solicitations are due  
4 in May of this year. There has been a lot of  
5 interest in these two bus franchises and we look  
6 forward to receiving proposals and awarding new  
7 franchise agreements.

8           Given the time period needed to  
9 evaluate proposals and negotiate final contracts,  
10 we are seeking an extension to the existing  
11 franchises to ensure that the New Yorkers who  
12 depend on these bus lines will not interrupt a  
13 disruption in service.

14           In accordance with Local Law 34 of  
15 2009, the operating authority of these  
16 unsubsidized bus franchises cannot be extended  
17 beyond the end of June 30<sup>th</sup> and therefore we urge  
18 the Council to support Intro 99 which will allow  
19 DOT to proceed to the Franchising and Concession  
20 Review Committee to extend the expiration date of  
21 these franchises until June 30<sup>th</sup>, 2011.

22           We expect to have the franchises in  
23 place by this date and hope to have them finalized  
24 sooner. Thank you for your consideration of this  
25 bill. We would be happy to answer any questions

1

2

that you may have at this time.

3

4

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Council Member Williams and Council Member Lander have questions.

5

[Off mic] Oh. Council Member Lander, sorry.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you Council Member Williams. Much to my great dismay the B-23 bus which is a route from Kensington to Borough Park and sort of in the path of the Williamsburg to Borough Park route but not exactly was eliminated as a result of MTA service cuts.

And there's been some discussion about the possibility of extending the franchise to include some type of replacement of the B-23 route as part of the franchise for the Borough Park to Williamsburg route. Is there a way that that could be included in this RFP?

MS. KARASYK: I mean the RFP is already out and released and the routes are specified there. I would encourage you maybe to submit that question as part of the RFP process and we could then respond to it at that point.

Also the authorizing resolution specifies the routes so that's the other part of that--

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER:

(Interposing) Could we have a follow-up conversation--

MS. KARASYK: (Interposing) Sure.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: --to do this at some point whether or not it could be included--

MS. KARASYK: (Interposing) Sure. We'll follow up with your office.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very much. Thank you Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay. I'm unclear. So does that--the RFP is due back when?

MS. KARASYK: In May. There are two different times in May.

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Two different times in May. And so can there be an addendum to the RFP before it's let? Is that what you're saying or are you saying that the follow-up meeting is to consider doing an addendum down the line?

MS. KARASYK: Well the RFP is already done and the routes are specified in the authorizing resolutions. So to change the routes



1  
2 would actually, from what I understand, would--  
3 we'd need a change in the authorizing resolution  
4 itself from 2007. So that's something that maybe  
5 we could consider at a later date. But from this  
6 RFP, we can't put it in there now.

7 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: So we--okay.  
8 From 2007 the authorizing resolution from 2007.  
9 Okay.

10 MS. KARASYK: Yeah.

11 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay. Do you  
12 understand what that means Council Member?

13 MS. KARASYK: Well we'll have a  
14 follow-up meeting to discuss what possibilities  
15 may exist--

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER:

17 (Interposing) Well perhaps the contract could be  
18 written in a way so that if we're able to change  
19 the routes, the same contractor would be able to  
20 pick up that route without having to go through a  
21 new RFP. Anyway, I look forward to it. There's a  
22 lot to learn here that the B-23 route just was  
23 cut. So I appreciate the opportunity to ask about  
24 it and the opportunity to follow up and see what  
25 we can do.

1

MS. KARASYK: Okay.

2

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you.

3

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay. Thank

4

you. Council Member Reyna has a question. We've  
been joined by Council Member Steve Levin, Council  
Member Larry Seabrook and I thought I saw Dan  
Garodnick. [Off mic] Oh okay. Council Member  
Dan Garodnick.

5

6

7

8

9

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Thank you

10

Mr. Chair. I just wanted to understand, you know,  
it's the first time I see this type of RFP. So  
the unsubsidized franchise is an RFP calling for  
any interested parties.

11

12

13

14

MS. KARASYK: Right.

15

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And the

16

purpose of asking the City is what? If it's a  
private?

17

18

MS. KARASYK: So in 2007, City

19

Council gave DOT the authority to grant these

20

franchises through a competitive process via the

21

RFP. And because last year you extended, you gave

22

us an extra year on the current contract so really

23

what we're just looking for is to extend the

24

contracts of the current franchisees so that we

25

1

2

can complete the RFP process and finish that competitive process.

3

4

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And the RFP has been in draft formation for how long now?

5

6

MS. KARASYK: Well it was released. It's out on the street. People are looking at it, asking questions. We had pre-proposal conferences. So that process has begun.

7

8

9

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And the extension is for how long?

10

11

MS. KARASYK: The extension is for an additional year.

12

13

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: One year.

14

15

MS. KARASYK: Yeah.

16

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: But I guess what I'm trying to understand is why would this particular franchise need any permission from the City.

17

18

19

MS. KARASYK: Because the City has to give them the authority to operate along these routes. They're the only two franchisees that operate bus routes in New York City. And DOT has to give them the authority to do that. So we have to have a formal contract with them to let them do

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2 that.

3

4

5

6

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And what is the cost of using these busses, like I live at, you know, growing up in Williamsburg I never knew that this existed.

7

8

9

10

11

12

MS. KARASYK: It goes from Williamsburg to Borough Park. We actually set the maximum fares that they can charge in the Request for Proposal. I know that right now the average fare that they're charging for the current franchisee is around \$1.20.

13

14

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: So it's less expensive to travel in this?

15

16

17

MS. KARASYK: For some passengers. I know that it varies but that's the average fare that I have.

18

19

20

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And as far as... as far as the use of the bus how is this publicized?

21

22

23

24

25

MS. KARASYK: We allow them to do their own advertising because they're unsubsidized and they give a portion of their revenues that they make to the City. We have specifications on how they're allowed to advertise but they take

1

2 care of that.

3

4

5

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And is the RFP that's out going to extend other routes like this?

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

MS. KARASYK: The routes are specified in the authority that Council gave us in 2007 to grant these franchises. That's specified in the Request for Proposal which, you know, I can get you a copy or, you know, you may want to download it so that you get all the updates that come with it. You just have to put in your email address and download it from our website. And the routes are actually specified. We have maps in the RFP and everything that show where it goes.

16

17

18

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And so, you know, as far as the set price is concerned, why is it not competitive with transit fares?

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. KARASYK: We don't set the price because we don't operate these busses. What the Request for Proposal does and what these franchisees have done in the past is we say this is the maximum amount you can charge which is also mandated through that authorizing resolution from 2007. And then they figure out what they're going

1  
2 to charge. They're just not allowed to charge  
3 more than we tell them.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And the  
5 maximum price is \$1.20 you said?

6 MS. KARASYK: No. That's what  
7 they're charging on average right now. The  
8 maximum is... it's \$2.50 for the Brooklyn routes  
9 and...

10 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Um-hum.

11 MS. KARASYK: Yeah. It's more for  
12 the New York to the airport routes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And what is-  
14 -I'm sorry.

15 MS. KARASYK: It's more. I think  
16 it's somewhere around--it's in here. The airport  
17 route is...

18 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: \$1.20 for  
19 the Brooklyn route on average is what they're  
20 charging but they can't go above \$2.50.

21 MS. KARASYK: Right. Well.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Right.

23 MS. KARASYK: And so part of the  
24 RFP process will be, you know, they'll come back  
25 with their proposals for what they're planning to

1

2 charge.

3

4

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: And as far as the percentage to the City, the payment?

5

6

7

MS. KARASYK: We don't specify how much they have to give us. That's part of the proposal they'll give back to us.

8

9

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: But what is it currently?

10

11

MS. KARASYK: Currently it is... 3% for the Brooklyn route that we're talking about.

12

13

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Which is how much?

14

15

MS. KARASYK: Last year it was about \$20,000.

16

17

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay. And that's a pilot or is that...?

18

19

MS. KARASYK: These are franchisees.

20

21

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: A franchisee, I see.

22

MS. KARASYK: Yeah.

23

24

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Okay. Thank you.

25

MS. KARASYK: Okay.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Council Member  
3 Garodnick then Council Member Williams.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Thank  
5 you very much Mr. Chairman. I just wanted to very  
6 quickly jump in and say that I support this. I  
7 have one end of the bus routes for the airports  
8 originating in my District in the area just south  
9 of 42<sup>nd</sup> Street by Grand Central Station. And it is  
10 an area which is screaming for help.

11 We've encouraged the DOT for a  
12 couple of years now to do this RFP because I think  
13 that when you're talking about visitors to New  
14 York who are using this bus service which by the  
15 way is very popular and is important for New York  
16 to be able to provide alternative routes to the  
17 airport, it is not a perfectly seamless process  
18 over there and it's a little disorderly.

19 And we hope that in response to the  
20 RFP that there will be some proposals that will  
21 truly facilitate the use of the service, allow for  
22 online ticketing to allow for pedestrian control  
23 and order and make this what it really should be  
24 which is a gateway to our airports in a great City  
25 that actually is consistent with the great City.



1  
2 So we want to thank the DOT for  
3 finally getting the RFP out. And we hope that  
4 this is the last extension. We know it will be.  
5 And we'll look forward to following up with you  
6 and coming to the right conclusion here. So thank  
7 you.

8 MS. KARASYK: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Council Member  
10 Williams.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I think  
12 actually Council Member Garodnick may have just  
13 answered my question. I was confused as to why we  
14 keep extending it. It's because an RFP wasn't  
15 out?

16 MS. KARASYK: Yeah I mean since  
17 2007 it's been extended until the time where we  
18 released the RFP. So now this is the--the RFP is  
19 out. So this is the last extension. We just need  
20 to finish the RFP process which takes a while to  
21 get the proposals back and evaluate them and  
22 finalized the contract.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And so  
24 once it's finalized that route exists in  
25 perpetuity? Or do busses come back? How does

1

2 that work?

3

4

5

6

MS. KARASYK: We can grant the contract for up to 25 years and then after that time period we would have to go through this process again.

7

8

9

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. I'm also in favor of Dollar Vans so I'd love to talk to DOE one day about that.

10

MS. KARASYK: Okay.

11

12

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Council Member Gonzalez.

13

14

15

16

17

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: I'm just a little bit interested on the route in Borough Park if I could get that, then that would be great because that's one of my areas a little bit and Brad, right, as well.

18

19

MS. KARASYK: Okay. We can send that to you.

20

21

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Okay, Gonzalez, thank you.

22

23

24

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay. Can you tell the Committee the website that they can go to; you mentioned a website where we can look at--

25

MS. KARASYK: (Interposing) It's on

1  
2 our website which is NYC.GOV/DOT and you can  
3 download both of the RFPs from our website. You  
4 just need to put in some information so that we  
5 can update you as we make--as we issue any  
6 amendments or, you know, answer people's  
7 questions, etcetera.

8 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay. Council  
9 Member Gardo--

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:  
11 (Interposing) I just wanted to--

12 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: --well I'll  
13 come back to you. We've been joined by Council  
14 Member Daniel Halloran.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I just  
16 wanted to clarify a couple of things. I just  
17 wanted to clarify a couple of things. Did you say  
18 before that only two companies are eligible to  
19 fulfill the RFP? Only?

20 MS. KARASYK: No--

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:  
22 (Interposing) No?

23 MS. KARASYK: --right now there are  
24 two companies providing the services as  
25 franchisees--

1

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:

2

(Interposing) Yes.

3

4

MS. KARASYK: But we're doing the RFPs and any, you know, anyone that meets the requirements, you know, experience, can provide this service, can apply for it. We'll--

5

6

7

8

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK:

9

(Interposing) The RFP--

10

MS. KARASYK: --evaluate all those proposals.

11

12

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: The RFP has been out since when?

13

14

MS. KARASYK: One of them went out in February and the other one went out in March.

15

16

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: When are they due back?

17

18

MS. KARASYK: In May.

19

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: In May.

20

MS. KARASYK: Yes.

21

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And this will be the last extension. What took the RFP process so long? I think you mentioned that these routes have been operating since 2006? So--

22

23

24

25

MS. KARASYK: (Interposing) The

1 routes have been operating for a while. We got  
2 the authority to grant these in 2007. And it took  
3 us a while to get the RFPs through. We also  
4 coordinate with the Port Authority on these, you  
5 know, so it's just--the coordination process of  
6 getting them out. But they're out now. So this  
7 is different than last year. We didn't have them  
8 out last year. This year we have them out.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Does the  
11 same organization or a company now have both  
12 routes?

13 MS. KARASYK: No they're different  
14 companies.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And they  
16 were chosen how? How were they chosen?

17 MS. KARASYK: They've been  
18 operating since the mid-80s through an agreement  
19 with the Board of Estimates. So we didn't--we  
20 weren't involved at that point.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: So you  
22 continued the Board of Estimates--but the Board of  
23 Estimates has been gone since 1987.

24 MS. KARASYK: Right.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: So how

1

2

were the two companies chosen in 2006--?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

MS. KARASYK: (Interposing) I don't know how they were originally chosen. Their contracts were for, how many--they were into the 90s, right? [Off mic]. [Pause] Okay. So their original contracts went through the mid-90s and then until the authorizing resolution happened in 2007 we were not able to do the RFP because we didn't have the authority to do so. So it's really since 2007 that DOT has needed to get this done.

13

14

15

16

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I understand what you meant to say and Gale is explaining it to me, they were operating under Board of Estimate authority.

17

18

19

20

MS. KARASYK: Yes.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: And the authority continued but these may not be the same companies that had the Board of Estimate--

21

22

MS. KARASYK: (Interposing) These are the same--

23

24

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: --the old Board of Estimate contracts.

25

MS. KARASYK: --these are the same

1

2 companies.

3

4

5

6

7

8

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: These are the same companies that the Board of Estimate gave authority to in 1987, is that--that's my question. I think the Board of Estimate gave authority to what, to the service or to the contractor, that's my question.

9

10

11

12

13

14

MS. KARASYK: They're basically the same companies. One of the companies got bought out. But the contract was for--that's how they had the contract. So this will be the first time since the mid-80s that we have released a Request for Proposal--

15

16

17

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: (Interposing) So you're now going to have an open process where before it was not an open process.

18

19

20

MS. KARASYK: Exactly.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I think I understand.

21

22

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Council Member Koo.

23

24

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Can you tell me how many companies participated in the RFP?

25

MS. KARASYK: Well the RFP process

1  
2 is still ongoing because the deadline for  
3 submitting the proposals is not until May. But we  
4 did have a number of people come to our pre-  
5 proposal conferences. I think it was around 30  
6 came--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: (Interposing)

8 Oh that many.

9 MS. KARASYK: --but that, you know,  
10 doesn't necessarily mean that all of them are  
11 going to apply but we've definitely seen interest.  
12 A number of people have downloaded the RFP from  
13 our website as well.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And then on  
15 the passenger side, now, what's the percentage of  
16 them tourists and what's the percentage of them  
17 that are workers going to the airport to work?

18 MS. KARASYK: I don't actually have  
19 those numbers. Anecdotally for the airport one  
20 and I think Council Member Garodnick and I spoke  
21 about this a little bit, it seems like it's a lot  
22 of tourists but I could probably try and find more  
23 information on that for you if you'd like us to  
24 follow up.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: So from the



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

airport to the final stop is only \$2.50 or what?

MS. KARASYK: No. The \$2.50 maximum that we were discussing was for the Brooklyn route that goes from Williamsburg to Borough Park and back. For the airport fares now, it's \$12 to LaGuardia from Grand Central and \$15 to JFK.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Oh I see. Okay.

MS. KARASYK: That's what they're charging now.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Okay. So what did the City get for the franchise, from the franchisee?

MS. KARASYK: Right now we get a percentage of the revenues. And we have requested in the Request for Proposal that they propose to us what percentage of the revenues they're going to give us.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And you say it's about \$20,000, right?

MS. KARASYK: That was for the Brooklyn route. It's \$20,000. And last year the airport routes give us 2% of their revenues and

1

2 last year that was \$220,000 for the airports.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And do they  
4 publicize the schedule online?

5 MS. KARASYK: Definitely I know the  
6 airport one does--

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: (Interposing)

8 MS. KARASYK: --one of the things  
9 that we have requested in the RFP is that they  
10 post it all online and within five years they need  
11 to have electronic ticketing as well.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: And do we have  
13 anyone to monitor whether they run on a schedule  
14 because there's a lot of busses. They don't run  
15 on schedule. They run late or where? Where, do  
16 you evaluate their performance?

17 MS. KARASYK: If we get--they all  
18 have to have a complaint process and if we get  
19 complaints we do follow up to see what's going on.  
20 This competitive process will enable us to have  
21 better control over what's happening because it  
22 will all be in the contract in the new agreement.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Thank you very  
24 much.

25 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay. Any

1

2 further--oh Council Member Williams. Okay.

3

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I just  
5 wanted to clarify. Are they allowed to pick up  
6 within the routes, all along the route or is this  
7 specific one--

8

9 MS. KARASYK: (Interposing) No  
10 they're not. There are specific stops that  
11 they're allowed to pick up at which is, for  
12 example, on the Brooklyn route, it's in  
13 Williamsburg and in Borough Park. They're not  
14 allowed to pick up in between.

15

16 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay.  
17 And so the same thing for the bus--for the airport  
18 run.

19

20 MS. KARASYK: Yes.

21

22 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay. And  
23 seeing no other questions, we can close the  
24 hearing on this. I have one general question  
25 though before we close out the hearing, not  
specifically on this topic but since you brought  
up an idea in my head, if a community or an entity  
wants to design a for-profit route, how would they  
go about that?

26

[Pause]

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: She could  
3 speak you know, she doesn't have to tell you  
4 everything.

5 [Chuckling]

6 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Okay. I'm  
7 just giving her the option.

8 MS. KARASYK: That's--it's not, you  
9 know, it's not something we've done a long time.  
10 The way that it worked the last time and would  
11 probably work in the future is for the Mayor's  
12 Office to submit the request for the authorizing  
13 resolution like we did a few years ago and then  
14 City Council, you know, would grant us the rights  
15 to do that.

16 CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Hum. I think  
17 that's something we need to look into 'cause I  
18 think we have the ability as a Council to also  
19 request an authorizing resolution if we feel that  
20 there's an opportunity for a route to be  
21 developed. So I just want to throw that out. All  
22 right. And with that we'll close [off mic] No I'm  
23 closing the hearing 'cause members have got to go.  
24 We'll tell you later. Members are after me to go  
25 to their other hearings. So I'm sorry.

1  
2 But we'll close the hearing on that  
3 item, Land Use Item number 99. We need to vote so  
4 members can go to other hearings 'cause I know  
5 which way you were heading, you weren't coming  
6 back any time soon. So, [chuckling].

7 We have Land Use Item number 64 an  
8 unenclosed sidewalk café in Speaker Quinn's  
9 District. But I'm going to talk to you about that  
10 because it's about the vans, I know where you're  
11 headed. And I support you on it. It's Item  
12 number 20095372 TCM. It's a sidewalk café known  
13 as Sombrero.

14 Land Use Item number 65 in Council  
15 Member Vallone's District. It's also a sidewalk  
16 café, Community Board 1. Item number 20105281  
17 TCQ, a restaurant known as El Greco in Council  
18 Member Dilan's District.

19 We have a UDAAP for low income  
20 housing, Land Use Item number 67, Community Board  
21 4 in Brooklyn known as Knickerbocker Commons.  
22 Item number C 100162 HAK.

23 We have--and Land Use Item number  
24 68 in Council Member Mendez' District. A UDAAP on  
25 a mixed-use building known as Houston D [phonetic]

1  
2 in Manhattan Community Board 3. Item number  
3 C100173 HAM.

4 We have a motion to file pursuant  
5 to withdrawal of the application for a Land Use  
6 Item for an unenclosed sidewalk café known as  
7 Hell's Kitchen in Speaker Quinn's District,  
8 Community Board 4, 20105340 TCM in Speaker Quinn's  
9 District I think I said that.

10 We have an HHC lease for Camber  
11 Incorporated in the J & N Buildings as part of the  
12 Kings County Hospital Center site to lease the  
13 land to Camber in Council Member Eugene's  
14 District, Brooklyn Community Board 9, Item Number  
15 20105481 HHK.

16 And then we have the Land Use Item  
17 82 in Council Member Koslowitz' District, Item  
18 number C 060550 ZMQ, Queens Community Board 6,  
19 it's an amendment to the Zoning Map to facilitate  
20 the proposed construction of a mixed-use building.

21 And finally Item number 99 the  
22 Citywide item that we just heard the hearing on,  
23 20105557LLY to authorize the Department of  
24 Transportation to extend the expiration date of  
25 the operating authority of certain unsubsidized

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

private bus services.

Any questions on any of the items?  
You should know that the members in the Districts  
that are affected for all these items approved the  
vote of affirmative vote on all of these items.  
Seeing no questions, I'll ask the Clerk to call  
the roll.

MR. WILLIAM MARTIN: William  
Martin, Committee Clerk, roll call on the  
Committee on Land Use. Council Member Comrie.

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Aye on all.

MR. MARTIN: Reyna.

COUNCIL MEMBER REYNA: Aye on all.

MR. MARTIN: Sanders.

COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Aye on  
all.

MR. MARTIN: Seabrook.

COUNCIL MEMBER SEABROOK: Aye on  
all.

MR. MARTIN: Vann.

COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Aye.

MR. MARTIN: Gonzalez.

COUNCIL MEMBER GONZALEZ: Aye on  
all.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

MR. MARTIN: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: Aye.

MR. MARTIN: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye.

MR. MARTIN: Vacca.

COUNCIL MEMBER VACCA: Aye.

MR. MARTIN: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Yes please.

MR. MARTIN: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [No audible  
response].

MR. MARTIN: Weprin.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: Aye.

MR. MARTIN: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye.

MR. MARTIN: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: Aye.

MR. MARTIN: Halloran.

COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Aye.

MR. MARTIN: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

MR. MARTIN: By a vote of 16 in the  
affirmative, 0 in the negative, no abstentions,  
all items have been adopted. Council Members



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

please sign the Committee reports. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Please sign the Committee reports. The next subcommittee hearings are held on May 4<sup>th</sup>. Okay. And we're going to hold this meeting for 10 minutes for anyone else who's due to arrive.

I just want to thank the members and I want to also support Jumaane Williams, I think an opportunity actually came out of this hearing for those of us that support the van drivers to see what we can do to help them get some franchises. So I know that's where you were headed but members had to leave. So with that I will declare the hearing closed and the roll... we will hold the meeting for 10 minutes.

[Background conversation]

CHAIRPERSON COMRIE: Thank you very much. It gets a little rowdy at the end around here.

MR. MARTIN: Final vote on the Committee on Land Use is 16 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions. Thank you.

[END 1004.MP3]

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Laura L. Springate certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Laura L. Springate". The signature is written in black ink on a light-colored background.

Signature \_\_\_\_\_Laura L. Springate\_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_April 2, 2010\_\_\_\_\_