

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND
WORKER PROTECTIONS

----- X

May 6, 2025
Start: 10:18 a.m.
Recess: 5:01 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Julie Menin,
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Public Advocate Jumaane Williams
Shaun Abreu
Gale A. Brewer
Carmen De La Rosa
Amanda Farias
Shekar Krishnan
Sandy Nurse
Chi A. Ossè
Pierina Sanchez
Julie Won

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Joshua Goodman
Deputy Commissioner, Public Affairs & Customer
Experience, DSNY

Haris Khan
Chief of Staff, SBS

Carlos Ortiz
Deputy Commissioner for External Affairs, DCWP

Corinne Schiff: Deputy Commissioner for
Environmental Health, DOHMH

Eric Mosher
IBO

Alaina Turnquist
IBO

Matt Shapiro
SVP

Carina Kaufman-Gutierrez
SVP

Mohamed Attia
SVP

Calvin Baker
SVP

Cleotilde Juarez

Erin Piscopink
Co-Chair, NYC BID Association

Barbara Blair
Garment District

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Evan Sweet
Meatpacking

Nelson Eusebio
National Supermarket Assoc.

Scott Foletta
NDS

James Gonzalez
La Fonda

Adrian Cepeda
Worlds Borough Bookstore

Juan Nunez
NWBCCC

Shamier Settle
IRI

Noah Sheroff
Bayside - QNS

Brian McGinn
Bryant Park/34th Street

Dan Scorse
Hudson Yards/Hells Kitchen

Eliana Jaramillo
Make the Road

Angel Flores
Make the Road

Jose Sanchez

Luz Uruchima

Lisa Soren

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Bronx Chamber

Jessica Walker
Manhattan Chamber

Betsy Mark
Queens Community Board

Pedro Goico
National Supermarket Association

Nick Aquino
VOLS

Dylan Dellisanti
Institute for Justice

Balanda Joachim
ANHD

Nishat Tabassum
Make the Road

Elsa Saraceni
Voces

Salvador Quintana
Voces

Juliana Salas
Voces

Jimmy Hernandez
Voces

Leidys Bueno
Voces

Lilia Gomez

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Brenda Irizarry
NWBX Community and Clergy

Maryam Shuaib

Pamela Franco Larg
Chinese American Planning Council

Joshua Boom
JFREJ

Calvin Harrison
SVP

Kele Nkhereanye

Magdy Elobky

Waleed Salama

Xhang Jie

Yun Lin

Helen Fang

Ni Jin Fang

MD Rahman

Julie Torres Moskovitz

Nick Gulotta

Abram Moritz

Evelia Cayotzi

Xiomara Reges

Vicente Veintimilla

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Guadalupe Sosa

Shuai Hui Zhen

Shuang

Ngai Kwan Lian

Yu Chaohang

Roselia Alvarez

Margarita Armenta

Jessica Quintero

Teresa Carpio

Andrew Gustafson

Flor Caballero

Lola Siguencia

Ana

Tiffany Hervas

Marlene Ensaldo

Lucia Maldonado

Jennifer Salgado

Mohamed Awad

Ana Villa

Mahmoud Zaed

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Leeane G-Bowley

Jackson Chabot

Mouhel Ahmed

Christopher Leon Johnson

Sandra Jaquez
NYS Latino Group

Bill Bruno
Mind Spring

Justin Pollack

Rob Martinez

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Sound check for the Committee
3 on Consumer and Worker Protections. Today's date is
4 May 6, 2025 being reported by Danny Huang at the
5 Council Chambers.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Quiet down please. Good
7 morning and welcome to today's New York City Council
8 hearing for the Committee on Consumer and Worker
9 Protection. At this time that I ask that you please
10 silence all electronic devices and at no time are you
11 to approach the dais.

12 If you would like to sign up for in person
13 testimony or have any other questions throughout the
14 hearing, please see one of the Sergeant at Arms.

15 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE
16 [00:00:40]- [00:01:23].

17 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE
18 [00:01:26]- [00:02:09].

19 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE
20 [00:02:14]- [00:02:56].

21 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE
22 [00:03:01]- [00:04:22].

23 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE
24 [00:04:26]- [00:05:13].
25

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Chair Menin, we're ready to
3 begin.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: [GAVEL] Good morning
5 everyone. My name is Julie Menin and I'm Chair on
6 the City Council Committee on Consumer and Worker
7 Protection and I just want to welcome all of you
8 today on this rainy day to our hearing that's focused
9 on street vending enforcements and the issuances of
10 licenses pursuant to Local Law 18 of 2021.

11 I first of all want to recognize a number of my
12 colleagues who are present, Council Member De La
13 Rosa, Council Member Sanchez. I will recognize
14 additional colleagues who are here and we've also
15 been joined by our Public Advocate Jumaane Williams.

16 Street vendors have long contributed to the
17 vibrancy of New York City streets and to this city's
18 food and retail landscape. Since the late 1800's,
19 street vending has been an important entry level
20 entrepreneurial opportunity for new immigrants and
21 has often been one of the most, really the most and
22 only viable employment options that are available to
23 them.

24 For as long as there have been vendors that have
25 been selling goods on city streets, there have

2 however been complaints and concerns about vendors,
3 that they create sidewalk congestion, sanitation
4 problems and unfairly compete with brick and mortar
5 small businesses. Compounding these issues, street
6 vending is regulated through a patchwork of state and
7 local laws and rules that have created a tremendous
8 amount of confusion for vendors, for residents, for
9 businesses and enforcement officials alike.

10 In 2021, the City Council passed landmark
11 legislation to increase opportunities to legally vend
12 in New York City, as well as to bridge the gaps
13 around enforcement. Local Law 18 of 2021,
14 established a new licensing and permitting scheme for
15 mobile food vending and enabled the city to issue 445
16 new mobile food vending permits each year for ten
17 years, increasing the number of permits available for
18 the first time since 1983.

19 Local Law 18 of 2021 established the Office of
20 Street Vendor Enforcement, creating a specialized
21 unit with expertise in the city's myriad and complex
22 vending regulations as well as cultural competence to
23 work with the diverse vending population to be the
24 primary agency responsible for enforcement of vending
25 regulations.

2 The Office of Street Vendor Enforcement was first
3 established within the Department of Consumer and
4 Worker Protection and then was moved to the
5 Department of Sanitation in April of 2023. Despite
6 this major effort to improve both vending licensing
7 and enforcement, issues still remain. Both vendors
8 and brick and mortar businesses feel that enforcement
9 is inconsistent and arbitrary and that there is not
10 coordination between the multiple agencies
11 responsible for enforcing vending laws. The waitlist
12 for vending licenses are extremely long and the total
13 number of new mobile food vending licenses authorized
14 by Local Law 18 of 2021 has not been issued as
15 individuals who receive applications decide not to
16 follow through with them and vendors do not feel that
17 there is sufficient education and outreach from the
18 city to help them thrive as businesses and maintain
19 compliance with the complex vending requirements.

20 Today, we are hearing a number of bills on this
21 topic. Introduction 408, sponsored by the Public
22 Advocate would create a division within the
23 Department of Small Business Services to assist
24 street vendors and require SBS to update SBS programs
25

2 to permit access to mobile food vendors and general
3 vendors.

4 Introduction 431, sponsored by Council Member
5 Sanchez would amend Local Law 18 by increasing the
6 number of mobile food vending licenses made available
7 annually from 445 to 1,590 through 2029. It would
8 also make 1,500 additional general vending licenses
9 available during the same period. And finally, after
10 2029, the bill would lift the cap on the number of
11 vending licenses available for both food general
12 merchandise.

13 Introduction 1164, sponsored by Minority Leader
14 Ariola would create an interagency portal to share
15 enforcement history across all agencies that enforce
16 street vending laws.

17 Introduction 1251, sponsored by Majority Leader
18 Farias would clarify the DOHMH shall ensure the
19 maximum number of mobile food vending licenses
20 authorized by Local Law 18 are issued each year.
21 DOHMH could continue to move down the priority list
22 and send out enough license applications each year to
23 meet the requisite 4,445 licenses to be made
24 available before 2032.

2 I look forward to examining the Administrations
3 approach to street vending enforcement and hearing
4 from a variety of stakeholders regarding the
5 legislation on today's agenda.

6 Before I pass it over to a number of bill
7 sponsors to make their statements, I just want to
8 recognize we've been joined by Council Member Nurse,
9 by Majority Leader Farias, Council Member Abreu on
10 Zoom. And I will now turn it over to Public Advocate
11 Williams to read his statement.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you very much
13 Madam Chair. Good morning everybody. First of all,
14 let's go Knicks. Great game. I said Knicks, I said
15 what I said.

16 Good morning. My name is Jumaane Williams,
17 Public Advocate for the City of New York. Thank you
18 again Chair Menin and Committee Members for holding
19 this hearing. This day has been fought for a long
20 time. The hearing is essential at a moment when the
21 federal government is actively seeking to criminalize
22 many communities and prosecute our small businesses.
23 New York Street Vendors are our smallest business,
24 many of which are a minority and women owned
25 business. They are frequently the targets of

2 excessive enforcement by law enforcement and city
3 agencies. Today, we are one step, one important step
4 closer to changing the dangers dynamics of
5 criminalization.

6 In 2024, excuse me, the NYPD and Department of
7 Sanitation issued nearly doubled the amount of
8 vending related tickets issued in 2023. Five times
9 higher than the number of tickets issued in 2019.
10 The enforcement costs related to issuing these
11 tickets vastly out way the revenue generated by
12 penalties. In addition, the Independent Budget
13 Office found that license proposal made by Intro. 431
14 would boost the city's GDP by \$17 million. Frankly,
15 this legislation is common sense, long overdue. As
16 of October 2023, there were almost 11,000 individuals
17 on the waitlist for general vendor license. Another
18 10,000 individuals waiting to receive a food vendor
19 permit. As a part of the street vendor reform
20 package, I introduced Intro. 408, which would create
21 a division within the Department of Small Business
22 Services or SBS to assist street vendors. This
23 division would provide much needed services and
24 resources for street vendors alongside important
25 educational and training programs on save vending.

2 These bills are part of a package for a reason.
3 Each piece is essential. There is a budget proposal
4 this year that would allocate an additional \$7.7
5 million to Department of Sanitation for vendor
6 enforcement. Notably, there is still nothing to
7 support vendor compliance and education. We have to
8 try our best to end the criminalization of street
9 vendors, many of whom have been vending for years,
10 must include more licenses, more services and more
11 training, not simply more enforcement.

12 I said this before and we'll say it again; you
13 can't rain down enforcement on an unfair system. The
14 goals of Intro. 431 and for vendors and consumers.
15 And as I close, I cannot overstate how crucial these
16 bills are at this current moment. The President in
17 particular and unfortunately too often with the
18 support of our Mayor, are quickly leading our
19 communities and economy into extreme hardship and
20 undo criminalization. We must provide our
21 communities with ways to help support themselves and
22 their loved ones. This is common sense legislation
23 being heard today. It's a major step in direction
24 that chooses opportunity over criminalization and
25 level of fear for our smallest businesses.

2 This is an amazing intersection of immigration of
3 economic empowerment and small businesses. We have
4 to find a way to help the folks that our fabric is
5 based on. I don't think any New Yorker could think
6 of a New York City without our street vendors who
7 were out there in the rain today providing the
8 services they always do. We can find a way to
9 regulate this in a way that is actually fair and make
10 sure everybody has what they need. So, I look
11 forward to hearing what the Department and agencies
12 have to say today. Thank you Madam Chair.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much and now,
14 I'm going to call on Council Member Sanchez to read
15 her opening statement.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you so much Chair
17 Menin. I'd also like to thank the Speaker, my
18 partner in crime Majority Leader Farias on co-priming
19 and the 25 cosponsors that Intro. 431 has.

20 I'd also like to thank all of the members of the
21 Administration who are here and those who have taken
22 time off work to testify before the Council. Our
23 city is home to over 23,000 street vendors. They are
24 our smallest businesses. A mainstay of the vibrant
25 street life that makes New York City great and for

2 generations, they have served as a foothold for
3 immigrant New Yorkers trying to find a way in the
4 city. I know first-hand. I am the daughter and
5 granddaughter of street vendors but I also know that
6 today and I think that many of us agree, our street
7 vending system is broken. Access to licenses is
8 incredibly scarce thanks to an outdated cap created
9 in the 80's with more than 10,000 individuals sitting
10 on a now closed waiting list. Many vendors with
11 years and in some cases even decades to finally win
12 their golden ticket.

13 Today, nearly 70 percent of street vendors
14 citywide and in my district, 80 or 90 percent even on
15 some beautiful days operate without a license. Not
16 because they do not want to follow the rules but
17 because we've created a system that locks them out.
18 And instead of supporting them, we've increased
19 enforcement, NYPD enforcement putting immigrant
20 vendors at risk of immigration enforcement exposure.
21 No one should fear deportation for trying to feed
22 their family the right way. This lack of access is
23 partly responsible for an enforcement regime that has
24 failed everyone.

2 Enforcement is uneven, arbitrary, unfair where
3 agencies lead to large confiscation of vendor goods
4 but fail to deter the bad actors who are back again
5 the next week. Sometimes the same afternoon.

6 Enforcement has also been ineffective precisely
7 because licenses are so unavailable. Without access,
8 unlicensed spending has proliferated and without a
9 license that they could lose, vendors have no real
10 incentive to follow the rules designed to bring order
11 to our streets. My bill 431, part of the larger
12 street vending reform package attempts to address
13 these fundamental issues by increasing access to
14 licenses over time for both mobile and general
15 vendors, mobile food and general vendors.

16 A phased approach that eventually lifts the
17 arbitrary cap and posed more than 40 years ago. This
18 legislation will bring more vendors into the formal
19 economy and incentivize compliance with the rules New
20 Yorkers actually care about. Food that is sanitary,
21 streets that are clean and safe, and neighborhoods
22 where prosperity is shared. And talking brass tacks,
23 the Independent Budget Office estimates that
24 legalizing vendors could bring in \$59 million in tax
25 revenues. More than triple what the city currently

2 collects. I've also proposed amendments to our
3 legislation that would strengthen enforcement into
4 respects. First by increasing the number of
5 sanitation officers as the availability of licenses
6 increases and second, by creating clear standards for
7 how a vendors license can be suspended and revoked
8 after persistent violations. These amendments emerge
9 from ongoing conversations that we have held with
10 just about every side of this issue, vendors
11 themselves, supermarkets, business improvement
12 districts, brick and mortar restaurants, city
13 agencies, my colleagues on the Council and November
14 2024 we went a step further organizing street vendor
15 convenings in partnership with the speakers community
16 engagement division, shout out to you all. These
17 conversations were designed to bring a wide range of
18 stakeholders, more than 50 together with the goal of
19 listening to our shared challenges and developing
20 shared solutions.

21 Thank you all for participating. And in closing,
22 I'm thrilled that we have this public forum to
23 discuss these issues to hash out differences and to
24 work toward a collective solution. I do believe
25 sincerely that there is a collective solution here.

2 That the gap between positions is bridgeable. We
3 can't let the momentum end today. My pledge to you
4 is that together, we will find a path forward for
5 vending in New York City. Thank you so much Chair
6 and thank you to all stakeholders who are here today.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you and I'll now call
8 on Majority Leader Farias for a statement.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thank you Chair Menin.
10 I'd like to highlight and be associated to the words
11 of my counterpart, partner in crime, Council Member
12 Sanchez. This hearing is a long time coming,
13 specifically on the bills we have in front of us
14 today. Myself and Council Member Sanchez have worked
15 diligently to lift up the voices of vendors in the
16 peoples house. Street vendors are a vital part of
17 New York City's economy. They're entrepreneurs,
18 cultural ambassadors and community anchors but our
19 city's regulatory framework continues to fail them,
20 keeping vendors trapped in an outdated, unfair system
21 that limits opportunity and invites criminalization.
22 I'm proud to sponsor Intro. 1251. It addresses a
23 major flaw in the city's implementation of Local Law
24 18. That law mandates the Department of Health to
25 make 445 supervisory license applications each year

2 through 2032. But application available is not the
3 same as licenses issued. As a result, we are falling
4 short of a goal this loss they failed to achieve each
5 and every year, which is continually keeping licenses
6 out of the hands of our vendors.

7 Intro. 1251 fixes this by authorizing the
8 Department to issue more than 445 applications per
9 year. Actually as many as necessary to ensure that
10 445 licenses are issued each year. That's the only
11 way we'll reach 4,450 licenses by 2032, as the law
12 intended to do from the beginning. This is a simple
13 and essential correction that would help get more
14 vendors out of the underground economy and into safe,
15 legal employment.

16 I'm also proud to be the coprime sponsor of
17 Introduction 431 alongside Council Member Pierina
18 Sanchez. This legislation lifts the arbitrary caps
19 on food and general vendor licenses, increases the
20 number of licenses issued each year for the next five
21 years and strengthens local training rules and
22 restrictions.

23 If we're serious about equity and opportunity
24 than lifting those caps is long overdue. Together
25 with Intro. 408, these bills form a package rooted in

2 fairness, economic justice, and common sense. They
3 move us away from over policing and toward a system
4 that respects the value of street vendors and what
5 they bring to our city every day. Let's get this
6 done and give vendors the dignity recognition and
7 protection they have long deserved. Thank you for
8 the time.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: We will now call on
10 representatives of the Administration to testify.
11 We'll be hearing testimony today from Joshua Goodman
12 who is from DSNY, Deputy Commissioner Public Affairs
13 and Customer Experience. From Haris Khan from SBS,
14 Chief of Staff, from Carlos Ortiz from DCWP, Deputy
15 Commissioner for External Affairs and lastly, from
16 Corinne Schiff from DOHMH, Deputy Commissioner for
17 Environmental Health. I'll turn it over now to
18 Committee Counsel to administer the affirmation.

19 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Do you affirm to tell the
20 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
21 before this Committee and to respond honestly to
22 Council Member questions?

23 PANEL: I do.

24 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Good morning Chair Menin and
25 members of the Committee on Consumer and Worker

2 Protection and the wide array of New Yorkers who have
3 joined us today. I am Joshua Goodman, Deputy
4 Commissioner of Public Affairs and Customer
5 Experience at the New York City Department of
6 Sanitation.

7 In April of 2023, Mayor Adams designated DSNY as
8 the agency with primary responsibility for
9 coordinating enforcement of the city's rules around
10 street vending, particularly around cleanliness,
11 street pass ability, and quality of life. The Mayor
12 designated DSNY for this role because we are uniquely
13 positioned to enforce these kinds of rules. We have
14 a uniformed police force of trained and licensed
15 peace officers but we also have substantial
16 experience protecting and enforcing access to our
17 streets and sidewalks. Over the last two years, we
18 have leveraged this experience successfully and
19 having the Department of Sanitation serve as the lead
20 agency on this incredibly complex issue means that
21 this work is done thoughtfully with a focus on
22 balancing the needs of vendors, brick and mortar
23 businesses, and communities at large. Our
24 enforcement work is rooted in the belief that all New
25

2 Yorkers across every neighborhood in every borough
3 deserve clean, safe sidewalks.

4 We take a warnings first approach. Often posting
5 dozens of warning signs throughout an area before
6 taking any enforcement actions. But we also engage
7 in robust enforcement to protect cleanliness and
8 quality of life. This enforcement is civil in nature
9 and sanitation police as a general rule do not make
10 arrests. In fiscal year 2025 so far, the 35
11 sanitation police assigned to street vending
12 enforcement have conducted more than 8,000
13 inspections, issued approximately 5,000 summonses and
14 donated or composted about one and a quarter million
15 pounds of food that was either abandoned or being
16 vended illegally.

17 Generally about one quarter of summonses issued
18 by DSNY are for unlicensed vending. The overwhelming
19 passage of proposition two in November of 2024 shows
20 that this work is resonating with the public. This
21 measures gives DSNY the ability to enforce street
22 vendor rules in public areas that are not streets.
23 However, at this time, we have not yet used this
24 authority and are developing a plan for
25 implementation. In any case, the passage of

2 proposition two is that if New Yorkers support
3 ongoing enforcement of these laws. As is the
4 continued volume of requests for enforcement that we
5 receive via 311 from community groups and in
6 particular from members of this Council.

7 While DSNY does not set the laws or penalties, we
8 are responsible for fair and consistent enforcement,
9 particularly in cases where public safety or
10 sanitation is compromised. We enforce these laws
11 with a focus on situations where vending has created
12 dirty conditions, safety issues, items being left out
13 overnight, set ups to block curbs, subway entrances,
14 bus stops, sidewalks or store entrances.

15 Several of the bills on the agenda today deal
16 with issues of licensure and we will yield to our
17 agency partners to speak about them. One bill,
18 Intro. 1164, sponsored by Council Member Ariola does
19 deal with enforcement requiring the development of an
20 interagency portal for sharing street vending
21 enforcement information.

22 The bill duplicates much of the work of the
23 Office of Street Vendor enforcement, legislating a
24 text solution to a problem that we have not
25 encountered in a systemic way. DSNY does of course

2 share data with relevant agencies and they with us
3 but as the lead agency on vending enforcement, this
4 is done at a staff level. Given the fiscal and time
5 impact of this bill and the fact that significant
6 data is already on open data, we feel that it is
7 unnecessary at this time.

8 Thank you for the opportunity to testify and look
9 forward to taking your and now I will pass it over to
10 my colleges from New York City Small Business
11 Services for their testimony.

12 HARIS KHAN: Thank you. Good morning Chair Menin
13 and good morning to members of the City Council on
14 the Committee of Consumer and Worker Protection. My
15 name is Haris Khan; I serve as Chief of Staff at the
16 Department of Small Business Services. Thank you for
17 the opportunity to testify today.

18 At SBS, we're committed to supporting
19 entrepreneurship including startups, micro-
20 enterprises, storefronts and street vendors. Our no
21 cost services include business courses, legal
22 consultation, help navigating concessionary
23 opportunities and more. Our programs are accessible
24 to New Yorkers through SBS's seven neighborhood based
25 business solution centers, our hotline, 888-SBS-4NYC

2 and our My City business site at nyc.gov/business.

3 Our work is grounded in an education first approach

4 that seeks to equip small business with clearer

5 understanding of current regulations and connects

6 them to resources that can help them grow and thrive.

7 Street vendors play a vital role in the city's

8 economy as they are in many ways the smallest of

9 small businesses. Recognizing this, the

10 Administration has included leadership from the

11 Street Vendor project and the Small Business Advisory

12 Commission from Vendor Executive Order 15 in 2022.

13 This ensures that the voices of street vendors are

14 included in conversations by the regulatory landscape

15 facing small businesses.

16 SBS also partners with sister agencies to conduct

17 outreach to vendors when new licensing opportunities

18 arise. Over the past three years, we've mailed over

19 22,000 pamphlets to street vendors, making them aware

20 of available SBS services in a host of language

21 including Spanish, Haitian Creole and Wolof. In

22 coordination with DOHMH's supervisory license

23 rollout, we also provided DOHMH over 15,000

24 pamphlets.

2 Additionally, we translated DOHMH's technical
3 assistance presentation into multiple languages and
4 cohosted physical and virtual workshops to help
5 vendors better understand the opportunity.

6 Our services are broadly accessible to all
7 whether a business operates from a storefront or from
8 a cart and in FY24, over 24,000 New Yorkers benefited
9 from our services. We are proud of that reach and
10 impact.

11 I'd now like to turn to Intro. 408, which would
12 create a division of street vendor assistance within
13 SBS and require the Department to tailor programs
14 specifically for street vendors. While we support
15 the goal of ensuring vendors take advantage of our
16 services, SBS's existing programs are already
17 inclusive and designed to meet the diverse needs of
18 small businesses. Creating a separate division could
19 divert limited time and resources away from service
20 delivery and into new layers of reporting and program
21 design. Moreover, the bills reporting requirements,
22 especially tracking vendor participation, can deter
23 engagement from a community that includes many
24 immigrants. We welcome continued dialogue with the
25 bill sponsors and the Council to find effective ways

2 to ensure street vendors are supported and look
3 forward to answering any of your questions. And I'll
4 pass it our colleague from Department of Consumer and
5 Worker Protection.

6 CARLOS ORTIZ: Good morning Chair Menin and
7 members of the Committee and Public Advocate
8 Williams. I am Carlos Ortiz, Deputy Commissioner of
9 External Affairs at the Department of Consumer and
10 Worker Protection. Thank you for the opportunity to
11 testify today on issues related to street vending.

12 The Department of Consumer and Worker Protection
13 issues general vendor licenses to those who sell
14 goods or services in a public place such as the
15 street or sidewalk. There are currently
16 approximately 1,900 license general vendors. The
17 number of licenses issued to nonveteran general
18 vendors is capped at 853 licenses and the waiting
19 list for nonveteran applicants is currently closed.

20 The license applications for general vendors are
21 available to veterans or the surviving spouses or
22 domestic partners of a veteran.

23 Introduction 431 would increase the number of
24 food vendor supervisory licenses and general vendor
25 license available each year for five years and

2 thereafter would remove the cap on food vendor
3 supervisory licenses and general vendor licenses.
4 The Administration supports reducing regulatory
5 barriers on businesses, including expanding the total
6 number of street vending licenses to bring more
7 street vendors into regulation and compliance.
8 However, the Administration is opposed to the cap
9 entirely on street vendor licenses, due to concerns
10 about the impact on the quality of life for everyday
11 New Yorkers. We look forward to engaging in a
12 legislative process with the Council and stakeholders
13 here today to join this conversation on examining
14 license caps and understanding how the city can
15 better support street vendors or small business,
16 while balancing the needs of brick and mortar
17 establishments. Thank you for the opportunity to
18 testify before the Committee on these issues. I
19 would now like to pass it over to my colleagues at
20 the New York City Department of Health and Mental
21 Hygiene for their testimony.

22 CORINNE SCHIFF: Good morning Chair Menin and
23 members of the Committee on Consumer and Worker
24 Protection and the Public Advocate. I'm Corinne
25 Schiff, Deputy Commissioner for Environmental Health

2 at the New York City Department of Health and Mental
3 Hygiene. On behalf of Acting Commissioner, Dr.
4 Michelle Morris, thank you for the opportunity to
5 testify today on the Health Department's enforcements
6 of street food vending and on the legislation before
7 the Committee.

8 The Departments mission is to protect and promote
9 the health of all New Yorkers, including by promoting
10 the safety of food sold from food carts and trucks.
11 We do that by issuing permits to operate a food cart
12 or truck issuing licenses to the people who vend
13 food, providing mandated training for food vendors on
14 food protection and conducting food safety
15 inspections.

16 I want to start by providing an update on the
17 Departments implementation of Local Law 18 of 2021,
18 which expanded opportunities for street food vending.
19 Local Law 18 established a new mobile food vending
20 license called a supervisory license and a new kind
21 of permit, a supervisory license permit. The mobile
22 food vending license authorizes a person to vend and
23 a permit authorizes a food truck or food cart or
24 truck to be used for vending. A food cart or truck
25

2 will a supervisory license permit must be operated by
3 a person with a supervisory license.

4 The Department is charged with issuing 445
5 applications for a supervisory licensee each year for
6 ten years as of July 2022. Supervisory license
7 applications are issued to people on waiting lists in
8 accordance with the Local Laws detailed criteria and
9 prioritization. Vendors on the waiting list can
10 track their progress on the Departments lookup tool
11 available on our website.

12 Once a person has a supervisory license, they are
13 entitled to apply for a supervisory license permit
14 for a food cart or truck at any time. There is no
15 deadline or waiting list to apply. The Local Law
16 requires that as of July 1, 2032, all full term food
17 carts and trucks, other than green carts operate
18 under a supervisory license permit. The Department
19 has issued almost twice as many supervisory license
20 applications that the Local Law requires offering not
21 only the 444 supervisory license applications per
22 year for the last three years but also reissuing
23 applications that didn't turn into supervisory
24 licenses and offering applications that became
25 available for legacy permits no longer in use.

2 As of late April, 823 vendors applied for the
3 supervisory license and after approving the
4 applications, the Department issued all 823
5 supervisory licenses. So far, 382 of the 823
6 licensees have obtained their supervisory license
7 permits. Other vendors are in the permitting process
8 and because the local law has no deadline to apply
9 for the supervisory license permit, others may be
10 preparing to apply some time in the future.

11 I will now turn to the legislation under
12 consideration today. Introduction 431 would
13 accelerate the transition to supervisory license
14 permits by moving the deadline from 2032 to 2029,
15 increasing the number of supervisory license
16 applications required to be issued each year and
17 would remove the cap on licenses as of 2029.

18 The New York City Health Department has no
19 concerns about issuing more supervisory license
20 applications annually than Local Law currently
21 requires and would like to work with the City Council
22 on some of the details to ease implementation. The
23 Administration is opposed to lifting the cap entirely
24 and looks forward to further conversations. If the
25 Council changes the cap on food vending carts and

2 trucks, this will expand the Health Departments
3 current workload to monitor food safety, including
4 the issue of license and permits, provision of
5 mandatory food safety training and inspections,
6 leading to increased costs for the Department. We
7 have no concerns with Introduction 1251, which would
8 allow the Department to issue additional supervisory
9 license applications if needed to meet licensing
10 targets. We want to note that New York State and New
11 York City law require food carts and trucks to have a
12 commissary. Commissaries provide cleaning, storage
13 and facilities for food preparation. Any vending
14 expansion must ensure sufficient commissary space to
15 meet food safety requirements.

16 Thank you for the opportunity to testify. I,
17 along with my colleagues from DSNY, DCWP and SBS are
18 happy to take your questions.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you so much.
20 So, I'm going to start, I have a number of questions
21 focused first on licensing, then on enforcement. So,
22 some of the data you said in your testimony but I
23 want to get it out again in a clear fashion. So
24 first of all, please provide an update on the number
25 of approved supervisory licenses and improved

2 supervisory permits but that are broken down by
3 citywide, non-Manhattan and then lastly, those
4 designed for veterans and disabled veterans.

5 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes, so as you heard in my
6 testimony, we have issued 823 supervisory licenses.
7 510 of those are citywide, 232 of those are for the
8 boroughs other than Manhattan and 81 are for veterans
9 or people with disabilities.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Now in your testimony and I'm
11 just going to read from it. You said, so far 382 of
12 the 823 licenses have obtained their supervisory
13 license permits. Why is there this discrepancy?

14 CORINNE SCHIFF: There's no discrepancy. There
15 are two pieces. There's a license that allows-

16 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Right, I don't mean
17 discrepancy. I mean why the differential?

18 CORINNE SCHIFF: So if I understand your
19 question, your question is why if there are 823
20 people with a license, why have 382 need permits?

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, correct.

22 CORINNE SCHIFF: So that's an important question.
23 We don't know the answer to that. As I noted, the
24 Local Law doesn't have a deadline to apply for the

2 permit. And so, they may eventually turn into
3 permits. We don't know.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: What is the communication
5 between the agency and those that are applying for
6 the permits?

7 CORINNE SCHIFF: So, we have done extensive
8 outreach and education to make sure that people who
9 are eligible to apply for the permit understand that
10 opportunity. First, who are eligible to apply for
11 the supervisory license understand that opportunity
12 and then understand the opportunity to apply for the
13 permit. You've heard from my colleague at SBS, we've
14 worked closely together to make sure that those who
15 are on the waiting list who are then offered the
16 license are aware of the opportunity and we've got
17 materials in many languages on our website. We've
18 held forums, we talk to vendors on the phone, so we
19 are really working hard to get the word out about
20 this vending opportunity.

21 But is there a cut off period if you don't hear
22 back from an applicant?

23 CORINNE SCHIFF: There is a deadline to apply for
24 the license. So, when we issue the supervisory
25 license application, there's 90 days to submit that

2 application. That's why we've been able to issue
3 more. After that deadline passes, we see what came
4 in, what did not, what was not returned and then we
5 put those back into the hopper and send them out
6 again.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I see, okay. How does the
8 number of supervisory permits issue compare to the
9 number of supervisory license issues and what do you
10 believe that you know? We talked about the reason
11 for the discrepancy but what do you believe could be
12 the fix for it? Like, how can solve this issue in
13 your recommendation?

14 CORINNE SCHIFF: So, I don't know. I think
15 there's an important question about why people become
16 supervisory license holders and do not immediately
17 become permit holders. I think it's an area for
18 investigation and I think it's - you know the local
19 law was set up in a way to allow people to have time
20 before they apply for a permit.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, does that aspect of the
22 law in your recommendation need to be changed?

23 CORINNE SCHIFF: I don't have a recommendation
24 for that. You know it depends on what the objectives
25 are. What we have done at the Health Department is

2 taken the law that the Council enacted, under Local
3 Law 18 and we have implemented it.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Moving to enforcement. Can
5 you tell us about the enforcement strategy that the
6 agency has?

7 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Of course. Thank you Madam
8 Chair. The enforcement strategy is very straight
9 forward. New Yorkers deserve clean streets, clear
10 sidewalks. The city has never historically had a
11 meaningful strategy for dealing with how vending that
12 does not follow the city's rules impacts cleanliness
13 and quality of life.

14 Ultimately vending enforcement is a cleanliness
15 issue. It's an issue of pedestrian accessibility and
16 it should be treated as such. We've toured many
17 communities over the two years that DSNY has been the
18 lead agency on coordinating street vending
19 enforcement with elected officials who have asked
20 DSNY to help solve the vending problems that both
21 compete with rule following vendors, right? Because
22 a vendor who is trying to follow the rules may be
23 facing unfair competition from a vendor who isn't,
24 brick and mortar businesses and residents.

2 So, we take a warnings first approach at most
3 times in which were either post written warnings in
4 locations ahead of time or issue individualized
5 written or verbal warnings but of course, if DSNY
6 encounters a particularly egregious situation when
7 conducting inspections, a vending regardless of
8 whether a warning was issued, we will take corrective
9 action and that can include summonsing, confiscation
10 or just an on the spot correction of an unallowed
11 behavior.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Before we go on, I want to
13 mention we've been joined by Council Member Krishnan.
14 So, how do you determine where you're sending
15 enforcement agents? Is it solely complaint driven or
16 is the agency - like what - talk about a little bit.

17 JOSHUA GOODMAN: It's largely complaint driven
18 but those complaints may come informally through 311
19 or informally from civic associations, community
20 groups, other agencies or members of the City Council
21 who frequently bring areas that they are concerned
22 about to our attention.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I know a lot of our
24 colleagues from speaking to them really across the
25 board are concerned about this enforcement piece, so

2 that's why I want to drill down on some of the
3 specifics. So, an analysis of Oath hearings related
4 to vending violations shows that the total number of
5 vending related cases across enforcement agencies at
6 Oath was much lower in 2024 than it was a decade ago,
7 specifically with 10,578 cases in 2014 compared to
8 6,688 in 2024. So, what caused this substantial
9 decrease?

10 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Well, the law that sets the
11 current sort of standards around licensing and
12 enforcement is very different than it was at 2014,
13 right? So, it's a completely different legal regime
14 today than it was at that time.

15 As often as possible, DSNY is seeking to resolve
16 concerns about unlicensed, unpermitted or time and
17 place vending violations in the moment if we can.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And how many complaints in
19 the past year about street vendors have you received
20 and what are the most common complaints? And explain
21 how the city is responding to those complaints.

22 JOSHUA GOODMAN: So, if we were to say speak
23 about fiscal year 2025, there were about - that this
24 is going through the end of April. There were just
25 over 22,000 311 complaints about street vending.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Can you break them down by
3 borough?

4 JOSHUA GOODMAN: I have them by Community Board.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay.

6 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Or I could provide a borough
7 breakdown at a later date if you'd like.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay.

9 JOSHUA GOODMAN: But I have them by Community
10 Board, by zip code and by Council District. Those
11 complaints are, they run the gamut. It may be this
12 is a no vending area and there is vending occurring.
13 It may be I'm a brick and mortar business and there's
14 someone vending right in front of my entrance, which
15 is not allowed. This may be the narrow sidewalk
16 issue and there's you know no clearance. It may be
17 material left behind. So, these basically lead to
18 inspections. DSNY Sanitation Police Officers inspect
19 these locations, particularly focusing on areas of
20 the highest amount of 311 complaint or addition info
21 from members of this Council community groups and if
22 the issues can be resolved with inspections, with
23 verbal communication, they are and if they cannot be,
24 they are resolved through summons issuance or
25 confiscation when warranted.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And before issuing a
3 violation, how is the agency working to correct
4 noncompliant activity and also, what are you doing on
5 education?

6 JOSHUA GOODMAN: So, we are doing work on sharing
7 outreach and education materials prepared by the
8 agencies that are here beside me today. DSNY is not
9 primarily an outreach and education agency on this.
10 We are the lead enforcement agency. However, the
11 warnings are created - in our written warning notices
12 are created in coordination with the outreach and
13 education agencies. We also have done tremendous
14 work including with a lot of guidance from the
15 Majority Leader on increasing the cultural competence
16 and language access of our enforcement teams. We
17 obviously use language line as so many other city
18 agencies do but we also have sanitation police
19 officers who are either Native speakers or fluent in
20 seven languages, so that's right there in the moment
21 and then of course we utilize additional resources
22 whenever needed.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And can you talk a little bit
24 - I guess this is more directed to SBS than about the
25 outreach that your agency is doing.

2 HARIS KHAN: Thank you Chair Menin. So, we help
3 partner with city agencies whenever licensing
4 opportunities arise and an example of that was the
5 close partnership with the Department of Health over
6 the supervisory licenses. We mailed out 22,000
7 mailers and then we did another 15,000 pamphlets, and
8 in the general course of our work, we also promote
9 concessionary opportunities that may exist throughout
10 city agencies, such as the Parks Department or other
11 agencies. And so, whenever opportunities arise under
12 the current regulations, we make sure that vendors
13 can take advantage of those resources and our
14 services generally are broadly accessible to all, so
15 when they do access our services, they can benefit
16 from business courses, business planning, digital
17 marketing. There is no arbitrary barrier that is set
18 by our agency to serve as street vendors. We're
19 proud of that partnership.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Going back to DSNY. At a
21 previous hearing on this topic, you testified that
22 the agency exclusively issues civil penalties for
23 violations of vending laws and I know you touched on
24 this a little bit in your testimony, I just want to
25 get it out for the record.

2 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Yes.

3 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Has the agency changed their
4 enforcement policy and has the agency ever issued
5 criminal penalties for vending violations?

6 JOSHUA GOODMAN: No. No.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Going to
8 DOHMH. How does DOHMH engage vendors to correct
9 noncompliant activity prior to issuing a violation?
10 It's the same question that I asked before.

11 CORINNE SCHIFF: So, the Health Department uses a
12 risk based inspection program and every inspection is
13 really a teachable moment to help the vendor learn
14 any of the food safety conditions that they're not
15 meeting at the time of inspection.

16 In 2018, the Council had us launch a grading
17 program for mobile food vendors. That provides a
18 great incentive to meet food safety standards. A
19 vendor that gets an A at the time of the initial
20 inspection doesn't get any summons at all but we
21 nonetheless provide information and an inspection
22 report about our observations.

23 So, that's really how we are promoting food
24 safety compliance.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And what - this is really
3 open to all of you. What role would an interagency
4 portal play? I mean you each have your own
5 regulatory jurisdiction. How would an interagency
6 portal improve the landscape?

7 JOSHUA GOODMAN: We don't feel that it would
8 improve the landscape. It would create a sort of
9 tech hall for communication that already takes place
10 between these agencies. There's a lot of interagency
11 work where you know kind of work where an additional
12 tech based solution might be warranted for this kind
13 of work, which happens in the public realm in real
14 time. We don't feel that it's necessary or
15 appropriate.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay I have many more
17 questions but I want to be respectful of my
18 colleagues who I know have a lot of questions, so I'm
19 going to come back on round two and open it up to my
20 colleagues for questions. Thank you. I'm just going
21 in order of who said they wanted to speak first, so
22 Council Member De La Rosa, you are up.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you. I just
24 have a quick question. Uhm, once of the bills are
25 made into law, what is going to be the training

2 specifically with the agencies on the enforcement and
3 regulations around these bills. One of the things we
4 see in districts like mine for example, is if DSNY,
5 just to give the example of that agency, comes in and
6 does enforcement, they often tell our vendors, "well
7 you can go apply for a license." And then the vendor
8 goes down to apply for a license, there's no license
9 to be applied for. There is a waitlist forever and
10 ever and so, it's kind of like a false hope that I
11 being created but also a false standard where they're
12 not able at this moment to regulate their status as
13 vendors.

14 And so, wants these laws that my Council
15 colleagues are hoping to get done. We're all hoping
16 to get done, what is going to be the process across
17 the agencies for training and ensuring that the
18 information filters down to the vendors on the
19 street?

20 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Well, I can just start by saying
21 Council Member that as I mentioned in my testimony,
22 about a quarter of summonses issued by DSNY for
23 street vending violations are for unlicensed vending.
24 The number of interactions with unlicensed vendors is
25 likely higher than a quarter because one of the first

2 things that an unlicensed vendor will do when they
3 see enforcement personnel from any agency is to leave
4 the area. In general, we do typically find
5 interactions with licensed vendors about the rules
6 and regulations around vending to be more productive
7 than interactions with unlicensed vendors. But look
8 our staff are trained and licensed peace officers.
9 They obviously are required to always be up to date
10 on the law. If the law changes, they will be up to
11 date on that. I will say that there's a lot of
12 implementation work that would be required but I can
13 tell you something about what our interactions are
14 like with licensed versus unlicensed vendors.

15 HARIS KHAN: Council Member, thank you for the
16 question. Once if there is a decision to lift the
17 cap by the Council and if that is the policy decision
18 that takes place and when we are in the development
19 of implementation across the agencies that would be
20 involved, SBS would certainly play a role in
21 coordinating with those sister agencies and making
22 sure our material, our resources and our team that
23 provides compliance and regulatory assistance is
24 trained in the new pathways available to street
25 vendors as they take advantage of those

2 opportunities. And that has happened consistently
3 whenever there are new opportunities that arise in
4 the regulatory scheme. One example could be the
5 cannabis entrepreneurs that we've helped at the
6 agency as the state rolled out new license
7 opportunities for those particular businesses across
8 the city.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Council
11 Member Nurse.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Thank you. I just - I
13 only had a question about kind of protocol for
14 sanitation because sometimes I'm confused about who
15 is doing enforcement. We have a couple hot spots and
16 you all have come out as well as other agencies and
17 done pre-inspections and done a ton of communication
18 but unfortunately sometimes enforcement ends up being
19 the case.

20 Often times, we'll get photos or videos of police
21 officers there and you all are not there and when we
22 call down to Sanitation, they say well, we didn't ask
23 them to be there. So, can you walk through kind of
24 the protocol for your interactions with local
25 precincts in terms of when you communicate the need

2 for police presence or PD presence and just like how
3 you're in communication with them on a regular basis
4 on these things.

5 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Be happy to of course Council
6 Member. DSNY partners with the NYPD in specific
7 designated circumstances. As I mentioned, our
8 enforcement work on vending is civil in nature all
9 the time but we work with the NYPD on events where
10 counter fit goods are present because that's a
11 criminal matter. On complaints about vending that
12 includes the sale of drugs. Right, again a criminal
13 matter and sometimes as part of interagency NYPD
14 operations where they request DSNY assistance.

15 So, we do work closely with the NYPD,
16 coordinating particularly around you know some of the
17 sort of persistent areas of concern in the city but
18 generally the partnership is where DSNY is providing
19 the civil enforcement and NYPD is present because of
20 criminal matters believed to be taking place.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: So, would - are you all
22 being called down from PD doing enforcement in areas.

23 JOSHUA GOODMAN: PD does often request DSNY
24 assistance.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: For street vendor
3 enforcement?

4 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Yes.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: When they're down there
6 doing street vendor enforcement, they're calling you
7 all down?

8 JOSHUA GOODMAN: I couldn't speak to every
9 situation but there are situations like the one you
10 describe, yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: But is that not what the
12 current protocol is? I mean isn't that you all have
13 the enforcement portfolio for street vending?

14 JOSHUA GOODMAN: DSNY is the lead agency on
15 coordinating street vending operations but there may
16 be situations where NYPD is engaged in a different
17 quality of life operation. You know part of this is
18 street vending. We should get the Sanitation police
19 here to assist with the street vending concerns.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: So, when it comes to
21 street vending and both are on the scene, who is the
22 lead?

23 JOSHUA GOODMAN: DSNY is the lead agency on
24 street vending operations citywide.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Okay and have you asked PD
3 in situations to stand down?

4 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Not to my knowledge, we work
5 closely with the NYPD.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Okay, those are my
7 questions. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay thank you. Majority
9 Leader Farias.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thank you. I just wanted
11 to go back if possible to the supervisory license
12 applications. I see in the testimony you are open to
13 Introduction 1251. You don't see any initial
14 problems or you know concerns around it. Do you
15 think it would help address the gap between the
16 license applications released and the license issued
17 every year?

18 CORINNE SCHIFF: I don't know because we are
19 essentially all ready. We had the same idea that you
20 did so we are already really doing that. We will
21 issue the license application. If it's not submitted
22 for a license, a supervisory license, then we will
23 reissue it to the next person on the waiting list.
24 So, we're already creating those opportunities. So,
25 I don't know whether it would result -

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Except not at a necessary
3 accelerated rate, right? Or at the very least, maybe
4 putting in some sort of timelines other than the 90
5 days for reissue to communicate with the folks that
6 have maybe are only the holders and not moving
7 towards getting the license?

8 CORINNE SCHIFF: So, I think that there are - the
9 bills compliment each other and 431 would have us in
10 the first instance issue more supervisory license
11 applications. So, if we put them together, more
12 supervisory license applications would be issued. I
13 think it's a good hypothesis that more would become
14 licenses, supervisory licenses.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, thank you for that.
16 Then just, I have a couple questions. One for DCWP
17 and uh, so in New York City we have rules that I
18 wanted - you spoke in your testimony about the
19 competition or the business competition I believe or
20 one of the agencies mentioned competition on the
21 corridor. Regardless, do we have any rules
22 regulating competition for DCWP or for any of the
23 agencies testifying in terms of like, we have x-
24 amount of businesses on this corridor selling produce
25 or selling a burger, so someone else it not allowed

2 to open up or to sell closest to that store that
3 sells the same product?

4 CARLOS ORTIZ: I didn't - I don't believe I
5 mentioned it in my testimony. I'm not aware myself
6 of any rules as such but I think I would defer to the
7 Law Department if they had any guidance.

8 JOSHUA GOODMAN: There is uhm, I'm sorry if you
9 don't mind, I'll just jump in. There is a
10 restriction on street vending within five feet of the
11 entrance of a store front. It's not restricted based
12 on like oh, it's a cellphone store, so you can't sell
13 cellphones, it's not like that but just, you can't be
14 within five feet of a storefront entrance.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Yeah, that we know.
16 Thank you for that. And I just wanted to highlight
17 Deputy Commissioner from DSNY, thank you for
18 highlighting our language access work from our
19 corridor tours. It's super appreciated. And then I
20 wanted to ask some questions surrounding the
21 enforcement piece. I know you folks are the lead
22 agency on enforcement. I guess for me, my question
23 is around the piece on outreach and education, right?
24 As you folks are the people that are supposed to be
25 going out, enforcing, whether there's - what type of

2 vending is happening and if rules and restrictions
3 are being followed. Why do you think the agency
4 hasn't quite incorporated much of the education or
5 outreach components?

6 JOSHUA GOODMAN: I would frame it slightly
7 differently and I think that our discussion about
8 language access is a good example of how we do a
9 tremendous amount of outreach and education. It's
10 just that outreach and education has to take place in
11 a wide variety of venues, right?

12 You brought up these issues about a few languages
13 that you believed were underserved among our term and
14 you were totally right and we were so happy to be
15 able to take that feedback and make the change based
16 on that. And so, our - there are low triple digits
17 of sanitation police overall but 35 of them are
18 focused on street vending, right? And that's by
19 design, having a specific team that knows the issues
20 of these laws. That knows the issues of these
21 communities and that is working on this every day.
22 So, these are people who know what resources are
23 available and can connect vendors to those resources.
24 They're just not the ones actually providing the
25 resources. So, they can say, "hey you know, here's

2 the website where you can get more info from SBS."

3 "Here's the website where you can get more info from

4 DCWP." "Here's the website or the you know info

5 about info sessions by the Health Department." It's

6 just that a Sanitation Police Officer in the field is

7 not the appropriate one to be conducting that

8 counseling. Although they do make it a point to

9 always connect people to that counseling.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Last question Chair.

11 Okay, can we talk a little bit about and I want to

12 kind of pull out a little bit of what I think Council

13 Member Nurse was speaking about with the police

14 intervention or when they respond versus when you

15 folks respond. When you are responding to

16 complaints, or your enforcement agents are going out

17 and responding to complaints, is that solely coming

18 from a 311 call? And are we seeing that the NYPD

19 response calls are coming from 911 calls?

20 JOSHUA GOODMAN: You know it's an interesting

21 thought that there is you know these two separate

22 call centers are what's causing differentiated

23 enforcement. All complaints about street vending

24 would go to 311. If you called 911 and said there's

25 somebody vending outside my store, they would say

2 this is misuse of 911. Hang up and call 311. But it
3 is possible that 911 calls about things like drug
4 dealing right, would lead to NYPD intervention and I
5 couldn't speak to it specifically, although I could
6 reach out to them. 311 calls are one of the largest
7 drivers of our enforcement but they're not the only
8 one. And another huge piece of it is what we hear
9 from Council Member directly. Can you please come to
10 this location in my district? You know I'm hearing a
11 lot from this business that they need support, and
12 also other you know sort of local community groups.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: So, I guess we're trying
14 to figure out when - how does the NYPD end up on
15 site?

16 JOSHUA GOODMAN: I can speak to operations where
17 NYPD is there at the request of DSNY and those are
18 times like counterfeit goods, drugs, where we think
19 there's a criminal matter involved. Where we've gone
20 out and investigated it and said this is not peer
21 time place manner street vending, right? There's
22 something else happening here. And that's where NYPD
23 would be involved.

24

25

2 As far as other NYPD operations, I don't know
3 what triggers those but DSNY coordinates the street
4 vending operations that take place around the city.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: And I know you can't
6 answer this because you're not the NYPD but have you
7 heard or at least in your like interagency
8 communications, that sometimes we're having whether
9 that's business improvement districts or corridor
10 organizations calling directly to the local precinct
11 because maybe they work with CAU or they work with
12 their community affairs and they're negating telling
13 their businesses or telling patrons to call 311
14 first?

15 JOSHUA GOODMAN: You know I'll say if that's
16 happening, which I don't know that it is. It would
17 mean that those groups are making a lot of calls
18 because they certainly call us and ask for DSNY
19 enforcement. We hear from BIDs and you know from
20 merchant associations, all kinds of groups all the
21 time. If they're also calling precincts, that would
22 be a duplicative effort and I would say on the record
23 now that they should not be doing that and they
24 should reach out to us directly.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, thank you so much
3 for responding to my questions.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you. I've got a
5 number of questions for SBS. So, how many street
6 vendors have received support from SBS since Local
7 Law 18 went into effect?

8 HARIS KHAN: Thank you Chair Menin. So, our
9 services are broadly accessible to all New Yorkers,
10 that includes microenterprises, store front
11 businesses and street vendors. We not disaggregate
12 the data of the folks that we serve throughout our
13 business solutions.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yeah, but you must have data
15 on how many street vendors the agency has provided
16 services to.

17 HARIS KHAN: So, we've conducted outreach and
18 coordination with our sister agency partners that we
19 referenced at this hearing but we do not disaggregate
20 the data of folks that are consuming our services,
21 particularly with the concern that that might
22 actually disincentivize participation from a
23 community that includes many immigrants.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Just providing informational
3 outreach about how to work with various government
4 agencies?

5 HARIS KHAN: To ask them to disclose whether
6 they're a street vendor or not would lead to
7 disincentivize participation.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, what work are you doing
9 to support the street vendor community?

10 HARIS KHAN: Chair Menin, all of our work is in
11 service to the city's small business, which include
12 street vendors and we're proud of the partnership we
13 have with Mohammed Attia from the Street Vendor
14 Project who serves on the Small Business Advisory
15 Commission. We're always looking for feedback. In
16 fact, it was feedback from SVP that lead to the
17 decision of translating our pamphlet's for street
18 vendors into understanding that there is a community
19 of street vendors that has that language need. And
20 so, we're constantly in conversation with our
21 community stakeholders, and through the Advisory
22 Commission, making sure that our services are
23 accessible and remain accessible to New Yorkers
24 across business types.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And what about outreach? Are
3 you doing outreach to BIDs, to the community boards
4 to let people know about Local Law 18?

5 HARIS KHAN: So, Chair Menin, we do outreach in
6 general on all of our services that are available and
7 whenever there are licensing opportunities or other
8 opportunities that are made available, we'll partner
9 with those sister agencies to conduct outreach and
10 make sure businesses are aware and can benefit.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I want to go back to a
12 series of questions that I started to ask on
13 licensing, so I'm just going to go back to that. So,
14 what are the conditions that make a general vendor
15 license available to the issue to the next person in
16 the waitlist?

17 CARLOS ORTIZ: Thank you Chair Menin. In general
18 for nonveteran general vendors, there's a cap of 853.
19 So, what typically would allow somebody to apply for
20 an available license is if a license under that cap
21 became available by somebody deciding not to vend
22 anymore, moving away from the city, passing away,
23 likewise if their spouse or domestic partner did not
24 want to use the license anymore. That would result

2 in us now calling on the waitlist and asking for an
3 additional person who want to take up that license.

4 On the veteran side, there is no cap on those
5 folks taking those licenses, so anybody who is a
6 veteran or a spouse or domestic partner of a veteran
7 could come in and apply for a license, they just have
8 to - they would have to demonstrate a proof of
9 eligibility.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And so how long is it taking
11 the agency - well, how long is it taking for a
12 license to be issued then to the next person on the
13 waitlist once it is available?

14 CARLOS ORTIZ: Uhm, well typically, I think it's
15 a process that involves - yeah, I think it really
16 depends on the next person that's on the waitlist.
17 It is a process that involves sending letters,
18 emails, we also follow up with phone calls as well.
19 We like to give them an amount of time before we move
20 on to the next person. Whether that's a yes or a no
21 or a nonresponse. Generally, I would say if I could
22 pull these numbers up, since 2016, we've issued 996
23 general vendor licenses. Let's say that became
24 available since that point and time and we were able
25

2 to call another vendor off the waitlist or a veteran
3 decided to apply.

4 In general, 95 percent of our license
5 applications are processed within ten days and then
6 the rest are usually processed within 30 days on a
7 typical basis. That's in for all of our categories
8 really.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, DCWP previously shared
10 that 161 new general vending licenses were issued
11 from July 2022 through April 2023. How many general
12 vending licenses have been issued since May 2023?

13 CARLOS ORTIZ: I have yearly breakdowns here, so
14 118 general vendor licenses issued in 2023, 110 in
15 2024 and 15 so far in 2025.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And then just to clarify how
17 many people are on the waitlist for the general
18 vending licenses?

19 CARLOS ORTIZ: Currently there are about 10,500
20 people on the general vending waitlist.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So what can be done about
22 that?

23 CARLOS ORTIZ: Sorry, at this point and time,
24 there's a cap in place for nonveterans, which is I
25 guess why we're having the conversation today about

2 Introduction 431. You know the Administration
3 supports reducing regulatory burdens on street
4 vendors, including expanding the number of licenses
5 that are available. Albeit, I think we have concerns
6 about lifting the cap entirely but I think that's a
7 conversation we're open to engaging in. That
8 involves all the stakeholders here today, both the
9 street vendors, brick and mortar businesses, my
10 partner agencies here. I certainly appreciate the
11 need for balance and for collaboration. I think it
12 is an issue that is complicated but one that I think
13 all of us are committed to, to working through to
14 always find better solutions for New Yorkers.

15 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay and I guess, I want to
16 go back to SBS because I still, I'm troubled by your
17 answer that you don't have any data on help for
18 street vendors. I mean, I just - as someone who
19 previously served as Commissioner of DCWP, we
20 aggregated data. We always tried to make sure that
21 we were being responsive and I'm concerned that and
22 just saying, you don't keep any data, it just - it
23 seems like a nonresponse to me.

24 HARIS KHAN: Chairman, we did not say we don't
25 keep any data. I think what we're sharing here to

2 the Council is, we're concerned about adding the
3 kinds of questions that might deter engagement and
4 participation from vulnerable communities, including
5 the street vending community that includes many
6 immigrant entrepreneurs. Our services are
7 accessible. We do serve street vendors. I think a
8 difference with my colleague from DCWP and other
9 agencies is we don't issue licenses for street
10 vending; therefore we don't have you know categories
11 of data associated with that particular license type.

12 What we do provide is services that are broadly
13 accessible and so, when a New Yorker accesses our
14 service, we have general questions that we need to
15 track participation but we will not create, we do not
16 create additional barriers that may make them think
17 twice, especially in the moment that we're living in
18 about whether they should engage with a city agency
19 and benefit from -

20 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: But are you going out to
21 visit with them? So, like for DCWP, I can say with
22 firsthand knowledge that DCWP does an excellent job
23 in terms of going out to businesses, letting them
24 know how to cure fines before receiving any kind of
25 violation. What kind of work are you doing for

1 street vendors? Are you going out to street vendors?
2 Are you meeting with them? Are you explaining about
3 sort of the regulatory environment and all of that?
4 You need to meet them where they are.
5

6 HARIS KHAN: And we're really proud of the work
7 of meeting them where they are and that's why when
8 the Council, when the administration decided to issue
9 supervisory licenses, we were out there with DOHMH,
10 partnered with the Street Vendor Project, make sure
11 the materials were in language and not only organized
12 a virtual webinar but made sure it was physical and
13 virtual to accommodate the needs of the vending
14 community, and that work continues. I think one of
15 the things that we're looking forward to is as
16 there's more clarity on the licensing landscape here,
17 we would be involved in that partnership across the
18 city agencies. If there are licenses that are
19 increased in any category, we will be a partner to
20 those agencies in getting the word out.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, can you quantify in the
22 past year, how many times has SBS gone out into the
23 field to meet with street vendors?
24
25

2 HARIS KHAN: I can't off the top of my head share
3 because we don't the data of whether the business
4 we're interacting with -

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: This is a very frustrating
6 nonanswer. I mean, again, one of the things that
7 we're trying to do, this is like uh, we have so many
8 complaints on a number of different issues regarding
9 the vending situation. Some in terms of enforcement
10 and some in terms of outreach and making sure the
11 vendors understand what resources exist at the city
12 level.

13 Also making sure that there are opportunities to
14 cure before going right to a violation. So, I'll
15 leave it at that and I'll turn it over to my
16 colleague Council Member Sanchez for her questioning.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you
18 Chair and I just want to start by thanking the
19 members of the Administration for your coordination
20 to get here today. I know that that is a lot of
21 work. There's a lot of different agencies involved
22 here and I just want to appreciate that it is very
23 heartening to hear this position. The Administration
24 supports reducing regulatory barriers on businesses,
25 such as expanding the total number of licenses to

2 bring more street vendors into regulation and
3 compliance. I'm very heartened to hear that and look
4 forward to further dialogue. My first question is
5 for the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene.
6 Based on some conversations that I've had with
7 supermarkets and brick and mortar businesses, just
8 point of clarity, do all current licenses and permits
9 - will they all eventually be replaced into the
10 supervisory system?

11 CORINNE SCHIFF: So, the way that Local Law 18
12 works is by 2032, July 2032, all full term, so that's
13 year around permits other than green carts will
14 become supervisory license permits.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Great. Thank you. I
16 hope you all heard that. Okay, and regarding
17 commissaries, I understood from your testimony a
18 number of concerns around commissary space, the
19 availability. Can you just share a little bit about
20 what the landscape looks like and the role of
21 commissaries and helping to keep food that is vended
22 on our streets safe?

23 CORINNE SCHIFF: Yes and thank you for
24 highlighting this point because it's important as the
25 Council considers expansion of food vending and to

2 consider the role of commissary. So, as I said in my
3 testimony, both state and city law require that a
4 food vendor be associated with a commissary. And
5 that is because it's a very important part of food
6 protection.

7 Our food carts and trucks need to be stored in a
8 commissary. They need to be cleaned in a commissary.
9 There are some FDNY rules about storage at a
10 commissary that I will leave the FDNY to address and
11 many food vendors rely on commissaries for food
12 preparation. There are other places where you can
13 prepare food if it's at a commercial permitted
14 kitchen but many food vendors do use the permitted
15 commissary kitchen for that food preparation.

16 All of that is very important. Cleaning, we
17 don't want carts left out on the street, that's a
18 pest control risk. There's a food contamination
19 risk. We don't want people hosing down food carts on
20 the street. So, the expansion of commissaries is
21 really a key part of considering any expansion of
22 food vending.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you and so, I just
24 want to state for the record, Department of Health is
25 not taking a position on the number of licenses that

2 are - licenses and permits that are issued but merely
3 the safety of the food that is being sold on our
4 streets.

5 CORINNE SCHIFF: So, as I testified, the
6 Administration is opposed to the lifting of the cap.
7 We are looking forward to speaking with you but from
8 the Health Departments perspective, the focus that we
9 bring to the conversation is on food safety.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Turning to
11 Department of Sanitation. So, am I understanding
12 correctly? You have 35 agents dedicated to
13 enforcement. You received 22,000 complaints in the
14 last year and issued 5,000 violations?

15 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Yes, that's correct it's 35
16 sanitation police officers. In calendar year 2024,
17 it was about 25,000 complaints. We want to do fiscal
18 year 2025 to date is 22,000. So, that's about how
19 many we're looking at in an average year and thus far
20 in fiscal 2025 we've issued just shy of 5,000
21 summonses.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. If every
23 eligible street vendor had access to a license, every
24 vendor that is out in the street today, how would
25 this effect your work as an enforcement agency?

2 JOSHUA GOODMAN: So, the question is, just to
3 make sure I understand that question. You're talking
4 about no net increase in vendors. Just making sure
5 that everyone who is there today is licensed.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Exactly.

7 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Generally speaking our
8 interactions with licensed vendors are far more
9 productive than our interactions with unlicensed
10 vendors. We're able to work with them on corrective
11 action around hey, you know, you can't leave this
12 here. This is a little too big. You know you're
13 allowed to vend on that side of the street but not
14 this side. Can you head back over? We're able to
15 connect them to resources like from the Health
16 Department to make sure that all food safety
17 regulations are followed.

18 Whereas with an unlicensed vendor, the
19 conversations are often extremely limited. The only
20 think I'll just flag is that we don't know whether
21 any change to the cap does lead to change in the
22 number of vendors on the street.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, thank you. May I
24 Chair ask just one more follow up of sanitation?

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Ask as many as you want.

3 That's fine, not a problem.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so
5 much Chair and I appreciate that response. So, if we
6 were to increase the number of licenses available
7 over time, would it be important from your
8 perspective to have a proportional increase in the
9 number of sanitation enforcement personnel and if so,
10 how would you go about thinking about that
11 calculation? How many more personnel would you need
12 to be fully staffed today and in the future from an
13 enforcement perspective.

14 JOSHUA GOODMAN: So much of it is dependent on
15 specific numbers but I can certainly say that the 35
16 sanitation police officers are at their capacity for
17 enforcement today.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: And how did 35
19 sanitation police respond to 22,000 complaints?

20 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Well, often the complaints and
21 you know aggregated, okay we're getting a lot in this
22 area. We're going to go; we're getting a lot in this
23 area. Worked very hard to provide equitable levels
24 of service but there is certainly no capacity to do
25 more enforcement with our current staff involved.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. And then for
3 DCWP, do you believe that lifting the current cap on
4 the number of available licenses would lead to
5 congested and disorderly streets as was stated in the
6 press today by members of the Administration?

7 CARLOS ORTIZ: I'm not to be honest, I'm not
8 necessarily certain if it would lead to more
9 congestion or less congestion. I think - you know I
10 think that's something that as my colleagues
11 mentioned remains to be seen if there will be a net
12 increase in vendors. But I also think that's why we
13 want to make sure that we're taking an approach that
14 avoids any unintended consequences. I think that's
15 why we have concerns with lifting the cap entirely,
16 albeit still open to expanding the number of
17 licenses.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: And for DCWP and for
19 Department of Health, how do you think the number of
20 licenses should be determined or will you leave that
21 to us?

22 CARLOS ORTIZ: I think for me it's important to
23 consider that this hearing is being kind of one of
24 the first steps in the legislative process and really
25 hearing from stakeholders, street vendors themselves,

2 also brick and mortar establishment representatives.

3 I think they also have concerns. I think there are

4 two sides to that issue that would need to be

5 married. Certainly, you know taking as perhaps a

6 metric, the waitlist of general vendors of 10,500

7 that is a number that would certainly quire us over a

8 period of time to need new resources to develop that.

9 I know we submitted an FIS to the Council for 23

10 lines. And on the flip side, there would be

11 potential revenue for the city too in terms of just

12 basic license fees. But again, to answer your

13 original question, I think it's really - we're in

14 this process now determining what the right number is

15 for the city.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Can you help us

17 understand both from each agencies perspective how

18 your staffing needs would be to - how the staffing

19 needs would change if we were to raise the cap on the

20 number of licenses available? What costs would be

21 associated? What revenue would the agency see? And

22 if you could talk about the different roles, the

23 professionals within your agencies that are involved

24 in the enforcement system?

2 CORRINE SCHIFF: I can start for the Health
3 Department perspective. As my colleagues have
4 testified, I think we don't know what the additional
5 numbers of license - really for the Health Department
6 for permitted vending units. There is, as you know
7 there's no cap on licenses. If a person is licensed,
8 they are able to vend and we have no cap on those and
9 there would be, as I testified, there would
10 additional cost for us to manage food safety among
11 the additional permitted units. We have staff who do
12 issue licenses and permits. We have health
13 inspectors who conduct inspections both to check that
14 the vending unit meets food safety requirements and
15 then conducts inspections out on the streets and
16 sidewalks to make sure that those are operating in a
17 way that meets food safety standards. We have a
18 training staff at our health academy who provide food
19 safety training, which is required for anyone with a
20 food vending license. So, there would certainly be a
21 proportional need to increase our staff proportionate
22 to the number of increased vending units.

23 CARLOS ORTIZ: I think likewise I mean on the
24 general vendor side of things, we're certainly
25 talking about moving from a cap of 853 that was

2 established many decades ago. Whatever number we're
3 able to land on based on conversation today and
4 throughout the legislative process, there would be
5 new resources particularly on license intake,
6 attorney's as well. Yeah, I think that would be for
7 DCWP.

8 HARIS KHAN: For the Department of Small
9 Business, this would change and the cap would impact
10 - could impact our outreach staff and our regulatory
11 assistance staff. That team currently supports all
12 of these sister agencies and other agencies informing
13 them by the regulations that currently exist. An
14 increase in what's possible for businesses and the
15 opportunities that are possible could be to increase
16 volume and those would be the teams that would be
17 impacted by such as change.

18 JOSHUA GOODMAN: And I think I spoke to it.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, last question and
20 thank you so much Chair for the time is for Small
21 Business Services. So one major issue with street
22 vending is that vendors are not in compliance with
23 may of the existing regulations from siting rules to
24 public health hazards and we know that that is one
25 piece and not the only piece of the puzzle is robust

2 education and outreach so vendors who especially
3 those who do not speak English are aware of the
4 rules. Are there existing SBS programs that are
5 particularly good at doing education and outreach and
6 how might those programs be adapted to serve more
7 directly to the Chairs line of questions, our
8 smallest business owners for the street vendors?

9 HARIK KHAN: Thank you Council Member for this
10 important question. There's several business
11 industries; there's several licensing types where
12 there are opportunities for entrepreneurs in New York
13 City to take advantage of those resources and join
14 the fabric of our small business community. In those
15 cases, we are ready and able to serve those
16 businesses. Businesses can reach out to our New York
17 City business express service team. That team under
18 this Administration was formed and has already saved
19 businesses over \$40 million in fines and fees by
20 educating them about fines and fees that they could
21 avoid as a licensed business operator. As more
22 licensing opportunities open up, we would train that
23 team with new license opportunities. Make sure
24 they're cross trained across the sister agencies and
25

2 are able to meet the needs as they arise throughout
3 the city.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Great, thank you. Thank
5 you so much Chair and to the Department of
6 Sanitation. I just thank you for sharing that
7 reflection that interactions with licensed vendors
8 are so much more productive. That's exactly what
9 we're trying to accomplish with Intro. 431. Thank
10 you Chair and thank you to the members of the
11 Administration.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you and Majority Leader
13 Farias.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thank you. Just two
15 quick questions and one for SBS. Can you - I'm
16 trying to pull out I think a little bit of the data
17 aggregation thought process or question. I know you
18 folks don't necessarily tag people that you're
19 serving as a street vendor, and so, they get lumped
20 into the larger small business tag line.

21 Can you explain maybe through the data
22 aggregation process, if there's any points where you
23 can help to find when you are serving a vendor? Are
24 you tagging people that have one or two owners or
25 maybe not within a storefront or a mobile business?

2 Are there other ways to showcase data points that you
3 folks are maybe serving directly to our vending
4 community?

5 HARIK KHAN: So I think just - I want to make it
6 very clear, we serve street vendors. We serve
7 storefront businesses.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Yeah.

9 HARIK KHAN: When we're out in our neighborhood,
10 we've already done 100 plus events in this fiscal
11 year and when we're in those communities and there's
12 a street vendor and we're doing outreach across that
13 corridor, we will share our street vendor resources
14 with them. I think on the particular question of if
15 there are proxies that could help us get to what the
16 universe of street vendors are, that consumer
17 services, I think it's very difficult. I'm not sure
18 it would be the most accurate but just for general
19 awareness on how data gets entered, when we speak to
20 a customer, one of the businesses that we serve, we
21 enter into our database the industry that they're in.
22 So, for street vendors, if we're talking about food
23 vendors, that would fall under the accommodation, the
24 food and accommodation kind of category as defined by
25 the NAICS codes, which are national codes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay so in this food
3 category, I mean that's also restaurant tours?

4 HARIS KHAN: Yeah.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: So, I guess for our data
6 point where we're trying to better understand is when
7 SBS - how do you define the difference in services
8 you're getting to a vendor versus a restaurant owner?

9 HARIS KHAN: So, I think businesses themselves
10 define the type of service that they'd like to
11 consume. So, when they approach us and particularly
12 the ones that we promote for street vendors, they are
13 business courses, legal consultations where we can
14 help a vendor whether they should be a sole
15 proprietor or they should be in a partnership or form
16 an LLC. We can connect them to capital access
17 resources that are available and so our services
18 overwhelmingly are broadly accessible to the vending
19 population and we are proud of the partnership we
20 have.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Yeah, I think that we
22 know, right? We understand that component but I
23 guess when we are looking to you to tell us I serve
24 ten people a year or 10,000 people a year or 10,000
25 inquiries came in versus ten inquiries came in

2 specifically from x-community. Like, that is what
3 we're trying to better understand how our agencies
4 are working to provide the supportive services.

5 So, just food for thought for us to continue
6 about how we're going to disseminate information
7 while also disaggregating data to make sure we're
8 serving the people at the right pace.

9 HARIS KHAN: Right, certainly if there's
10 particular zip codes or corridors where there's an
11 interest of understanding whether we have served or
12 not, we'd be happy to do some analysis to understand
13 that trends there and we'd be happy to serve if
14 there's any business owner, anyone, any New Yorker
15 that reaches out to your office and says, I'm not
16 sure if SBS could be the right option for us. Please
17 connect them to us. We are the right option for
18 overwhelming majority of New Yorkers that are either
19 entrepreneurs that are doing businesses from their
20 homes and apartments as a result of the historic -

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Yeah, I mean it would
22 probably be interesting for us as a Council to also
23 see if there is an analysis from your agency on what
24 looks like vendor services, specifically in our
25

2 corridors but I'm happy to continue talking offline
3 about that.

4 HARIS KHAN: Yeah, absolutely.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: And then just the last
6 question that came to thought and all or any can
7 answer. Would you all agree that regulating and
8 setting a standard for the unpermitted vending
9 whether that's on cart setup, food safety, street
10 enforcement, like many of the good actors that are
11 currently vending without a permit are doing now
12 would help us get all the bad actors on more targeted
13 outreach or more targeted enforcement?

14 HARIS KHAN: I mean I think the situation that
15 you describe relies on a compromise that also
16 includes increased enforcement but certainly, we
17 agree that reducing regulatory burdens and providing
18 ways for people to come into compliance leads to more
19 productive interactions between enforcement personnel
20 and vendors and between vendors and the communities
21 around them.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Great, thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay great. So, I just want
24 to switch gears and talk about confiscations because
25 we haven't really spoken that much about that.

2 So, when the Office of Street Vending Enforcement
3 was situated at DCWP, the agency authorized just 37
4 confiscations out of over 25,000 inspections
5 conducted between June 2021 and March 2023. How many
6 inspections has OSVE conducted since moving to the
7 Department of Sanitation April 2023 and how many
8 confiscations have been authorized?

9 JOSHUA GOODMAN: I apologize Madam Chair. I have
10 very good data on that question for Fiscal Year 2025
11 to date.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay.

13 JOSHUA GOODMAN: So, I can do just off the top of
14 my head, I can do July to April 30th. So in that
15 time, there were 8,390 inspections and 3,374
16 confiscations. And confiscations happen in a few
17 situations. They occur when DSNY issues a summons
18 for operating a mobile food vehicle with no permit,
19 operating a mobile food vehicle with no license,
20 unlicensed general vending or abandoned property and
21 that abandoned property one is one where the issue
22 of unlicensed vending becomes significant because
23 many of those situations are when a vendor sees
24 sanitation police and leaves without packing up. And
25 then the summons is issued after the vendor claims

2 the abandoned property as part of the retrieval
3 process.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: So, how do you determine if
5 the property is abandoned for confiscation?

6 JOSHUA GOODMAN: If there is no one present and
7 no one will identify themselves and say, yes, that is
8 mine, it is abandoned property.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: What's the percentage of
10 confiscations that are conducted on mobile food
11 vendors versus general merchandise vendors?

12 JOSHUA GOODMAN: I want to say that I have that.
13 Give me one minute, I apologize. If not, we'll have
14 to get it to you.

15 Uhm, you know I think I just have information on
16 total confiscations; I apologize.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, if you can get that
18 over to the Committee. Thank you.

19 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Yes, we can work on that.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And can you just -

21 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Oh, no, I'm sorry I do have it
22 here.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, great.
24
25

2 JOSHUA GOODMAN: The uhm, confiscations - oh no,
3 this is breakdown on how much of it was picked up.
4 I'm sorry, which is not your question. I apologize.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, okay yeah if you can
6 get that to Committee. And can you describe the
7 process for property retrieval?

8 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Yes, I actually have right here
9 in front of me the information that is given to
10 vendors in those situations. So, I can tell you
11 exactly what they are told.

12 So, vendors are given a property redemption
13 notice that explains how they can retrieve their
14 property. When abandoned items are confiscated and
15 they are then given a notice that says, if you are
16 redeeming your property within two business days of
17 the date of the summons, please contact - and then
18 there's contact information. Experienced staff will
19 guide you through the redemption process, answer your
20 questions and tell you what documents are required to
21 redeem your property and then the business hours.
22 Please be advised that after the first two days of
23 storage, storage fees are charged at a rate of \$16
24 per day. Upon payment of storage fees, you will be
25 issued a redemption order to retrieve your property

2 and then there's the address of our storage facility.
3 Property that is not claimed and redeemed after 90
4 days after it was taken, even if storage fees have
5 been paid, will be donated to a 501C3 organization.

6 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And what percentage of goods
7 have been retrieved?

8 JOSHUA GOODMAN: Okay that was that number that I
9 have here. 6Y 2025 through April 30th, about 16
10 percent have been picked up, 38 percent are still in
11 the storage. Like meaning, it hasn't been the 90
12 days. We have it and they can come back and get it,
13 and 46 percent were composted, donated, or discarded
14 as appropriate.

15 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And where is the agency
16 donating to?

17 JOSHUA GOODMAN: If it's nonperishable food, it's
18 food pantries. Other items are donated to C3's that
19 we identify in coordination with other agencies.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, uhm, that concludes my
21 questioning. Does any other colleague have any other
22 questions? Council Member Sanchez.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you
24 Chair. Just one point of clarification. Deputy
25 Commissioner, I think you said vendors are required

2 to be at least five feet away from entrances but
3 isn't it twenty feet?

4 JOSHUA GOODMAN: I apologize, I think there might
5 be a distinction between food and general vending.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Oh is there?

7 JOSHUA GOODMAN: We'll double check on it because
8 Carlos said the same thing, so I think we have to
9 double check on that but yes.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, alright, thank
11 you. Thank you. Look forward to that. Uhm, and
12 just one last simple question on the Chair - just
13 following up on the Chairs line of questions on
14 confiscations. From your estimation, have
15 confiscations been successful in deterring unlawful
16 vending?

17 JOSHUA GOODMAN: They are successful in
18 maintaining many of the goals of these regulations
19 around clear and passable streets. You know
20 obviously in an abandoned set up, is a street
21 obstruction and that you know, harms quality of life
22 in a community. Whether they deter repeat offenders,
23 I couldn't speak to other than to say that there are
24 certain areas where it happens again and again.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Yeah, that
3 is my experiences as well but thank you Chair, really
4 appreciate the time.

5 JOSHUA GOODMAN: And you're right about the 20
6 feet, I'm sorry I was looking at some old data. I
7 apologize.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: No problem, thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. We
10 appreciate the testimony from the Administration, so
11 thank you that concludes that portion. Before we
12 move to the public comment period, I'm now going to
13 call on the New York City Independent Budget Office,
14 who is going to be testifying and specifically we'll
15 hear testimony from Eric Mosher and Alaina Turnquist.
16 If you could please come up. Thank you and then
17 after that we will move right into the public
18 comment. [01:34:06] - [01:34:46]. Okay thank you, we
19 are ready to begin.

20 ALAINA TURNQUIST: Hello, okay, it's on. Good
21 morning Chair Menin and members of the Committee on
22 Consumer and Worker Protection. My name is Alaina
23 Turnquist. I am a lead budget and policy analyst at
24 the New York City Independent Budget Office, also
25 known as IBO. I am joined here today by my

2 colleague, Eric Mosher. He is a lead economist at
3 IBO. IBO is an independent, nonpartisan City agency
4 that conducts fiscal and policy research for the
5 City. Thank you for the invitation to testify today.
6 I will be speaking about the fiscal impact to the
7 City's budget, were the cap on street vending permits
8 and licenses to be eliminated.

9 At the request of 14 Council Members, IBO
10 analyzed the fiscal impact on the City's budget that
11 could result from lifting the cap on street vending
12 in New York City. In January of 2024, IBO published
13 a report outlining potential impacts to the City's
14 tax revenue and agency spending. The report also
15 detailed the current regulatory environment for
16 various types of vending in New York City.

17 We found that lifting the caps on the number of
18 vending permits and licenses would have a net
19 positive fiscal impact on the city's budget. The
20 scale of the fiscal impact, however, would depend on
21 the number of vendors that become permitted. If ten
22 percent of people on the current vendor permit
23 waitlists, which is around 2,000 people were to
24 become permitted, the net revenue gained to the city
25 would be around \$5.9 million annually. If 100

2 percent of those on the waitlists were to become
3 permitted or licensed, which is around 20,000 people,
4 the net impact would increase to about \$59 million.

5 IBO expects that new sales tax revenue from
6 permitted vendors would be the largest source of new
7 revenue for the city.

8 In preparing for this testimony, IBO identified
9 an error in our original analysis that caused an
10 underestimate of forecasted tax revenues. The
11 January 2024 report misstated the \$59 million upper
12 estimate as \$17 million. We have since updated the
13 report on IBO's website but this really does not
14 change our overall methodology or the key findings
15 and conclusions of the report.

16 IBO expects the overall macroeconomic impact of
17 eliminating the cap on street vendor permits would be
18 minimal. However, the microeconomic impact to
19 individual vendors to become permit or licensed could
20 likely be substantial. For example, holding a legal
21 permit or license would prevent some street vendors
22 from receiving costly tickets or having their
23 materials confiscated by Law Enforcement assuming
24 that other city regulations and rules are followed
25 while vending.

2 Vendor revenues and profits overall we found were
3 modest according to the survey data for both
4 permitted and unpermitted vending. According to IBO
5 analysis of vendor survey data, the average annual
6 profit for all vendors in the city was roughly
7 \$41,000 in 2019.

8 General vendors would sell merchandise had lower
9 average annual profits compared to mobile food
10 vendors. On average, general vendors had an
11 estimated annual profit of around \$35,000 compared to
12 \$46,000 for mobile food vendors.

13 In terms of additional administrative costs, IBO
14 expects additional costs would be born by the
15 Department of Consumer Worker Protection, as well as
16 the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene.

17 Additional mobile food vending permits have higher
18 administrative costs than additional general vending
19 licenses, primarily due to Health Department
20 resources required to inspect mobile food vending
21 units as to ensure food safety.

22 IBO assumed no additional uniformed agency
23 enforcement costs would automatically result from
24 removing the permit cap for street vending. Any
25 change would be at the city's discretion. Law

2 Enforcement for vending has shifted away from
3 criminal summons and towards civil enforcement over
4 the past decade. Importantly, even without a cap on
5 the number of permits and licenses, vendors would
6 need to comply with other regulations. For example,
7 strict siting rules make many streets off limits for
8 vending, even with a permit and food vendors are
9 required to store their vending units in city
10 permitted commissary facilities which have a limited
11 capacity.

12 Therefore, while lifting the cap on permits and
13 licenses would likely benefit many vendors and
14 provide fiscal impact, positive fiscal impact to the
15 city overall, it is unlikely to immediately bring all
16 street vendors into the permitted vending economy.

17 Finally, vendors must pay any outstanding fines
18 to the city before being eligible to receive a
19 license or permit. For unpermitted vendors seeking
20 to legalize paying outstanding fines may present a
21 barrier and could effect the number of individuals
22 who would ultimately be able to convert from informal
23 to formal market vending.

24 In conclusion, lifting the cap on vending permits
25 and licenses would likely have a positive fiscal

2 impact on the city's budget. The overall scale of
3 the impact is highly dependent on the number of
4 vendors who are able to enter the formal permitted
5 market as well as the type of vendors who become
6 licensed and permitted. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions.
8 Okay.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you Chair. I just
10 want to follow up. You said the macroeconomic
11 impacts of lifting the cap would be minimal while the
12 microeconomic impacts would be substantial. One
13 concern that we often hear about Intro. 431 is
14 whether uh, the question about whether lifting the
15 caps would cause a massive influx of new vendors that
16 aren't on the streets today. How did you handle
17 assumptions about that aspect of the number of
18 vendors on the streets and does IBO have a
19 perspective of what might happen?

20 ALAINA TURNQUIST: Sure, I'll let my colleague
21 Eric take that one.

22 ERIC MOSHER: Thanks. Hi. Thank you for the
23 question Council Member. So, we in our research and
24 analysis, the basic assumption that we made is that
25 the decision whether or not to be a street vendor or

2 to you know, to do that work is not - is more
3 dependent on individual you know socioeconomic
4 conditions rather than the policy landscape that's in
5 place.

6 So, one of the kind of you know, central
7 assumptions underlying our analysis is that lifting
8 the cap or eliminating the cap alone would not lead
9 to an influx in the street vendor population.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so
11 much. Thank you Chair.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you very much
13 for your testimony.

14 ALAINA TURNQUIST: Thank you.

15 ERIC MOSHER: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Alright, I'm now going to
17 move on to the public comment period. So, I now open
18 the hearing for public testimony. I want to remind
19 members of the public that this is a formal
20 government proceeding and that decorum shall be
21 observed at all times. As such, members of the
22 public shall remain silent at all times. The witness
23 table is reserved for people who wish to testify. No
24 video recording or photography is allowed from the
25 witness table. Further, members of the public may

2 not present audio or video recordings as testimony
3 but they may submit transcripts of such recording to
4 the Sergeant at Arms for inclusion in the hearing
5 record. If you wish to speak at today's hearing,
6 please fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant
7 at Arms and wait to be recognized. When recognized,
8 you will have two minutes to speak on today's hearing
9 topic.

10 If you require translation services, you will
11 have a total of four minutes for you to speak on
12 today's hearing topic and for the interpreter to
13 interpret your testimony. We ask that you pause
14 frequently to give the interpreter enough time to
15 interpret your testimony as you go.

16 Today's hearing topic is of course street vending
17 enforcement and the issuance of licenses pursuant to
18 Local Law 18 of 2021 along with related Introductions
19 408, 431, 1164, and 1251. If you have a written
20 statement or additional written testimony that you
21 wish to submit for the record, please provide a copy
22 of that testimony to the Sergeant at Arms. You may
23 also email written testimony to
24 testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72 hours of this
25 hearing. Audio and video recordings will not be

2 accepted and let me just conclude before I call the
3 first panel, every speaker as I said is going to get
4 two minutes. I run a very tight hearing because I
5 respect everyone's time and so, if you go over two
6 minutes, it's simply not fair to the other speakers
7 who are waiting here. So, to be clear at two
8 minutes, I'm going to ask every person to wrap it up
9 and we will move on to the next speaker. You can of
10 course submit your written testimony. So, with that
11 said, I'm going to call the first panel and just so
12 everyone understands, generally we do those that are
13 in favor, those that are against, we try to alternate
14 so we can incorporate everyone's perspective into
15 this hearing.

16 So, the first panel is going to be comprised of
17 Matthew Shapiro, Carina Kaufman-Gutierrez, Mohamed
18 Attia, Calvin Baker, and Cleo. If you could please
19 come forward. Thank you.

20 And I understand we need an interpreter for Cleo.
21 Do we have an interpreter here? Okay, do we have an
22 interpreter? Do we have an interpreter? Okay, we're
23 getting the interpreter. The interpreter is here.
24 Okay, please begin. Thank you.

25 MATTHEW SHAPIRO: Hello, we ready?

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, we're ready. Thank you.

3 MATTHEW SHAPIRO: Hello, my name is Matthew
4 Shapiro and I'm the Legal Director of the Street
5 Vendor Project at the Urban Justice Center. We are a
6 membership based organization of over 3,000 vendors
7 who work in New York City's public spaces. These
8 include a large community of immigrant vendors as
9 well as the Native born and veteran street vendors.
10 The organized vendors that have their voices heard
11 when it comes to policies that affect them as well as
12 provide legal and small business services to main and
13 grow their businesses. We are here today to talk
14 about economic justice and relief for the 23,000
15 vendor small business owners who are currently
16 selling food and merchandise in our public spaces,
17 serving New Yorkers and visitors alike.

18 81 percent of all vendors use vending as their
19 primary source of income. The problem as you well
20 know is that there is currently almost no legal
21 pathway for vendors to formalize their business and
22 obtain the required license and permits to operate.

23 In 1979 and 1983, the number of food vendor
24 permits and general vendor licenses were capped with
25 a modest additional amount of only food vendor

2 permits being released every year due to the passage
3 of Local Law 18 in 2021. However, every week vendors
4 come into our office either asking how they can get a
5 license and permit to sell food or merchandize or
6 they come with multiple thousand dollar tickets
7 because they took a risk selling tacos, ice cream or
8 cut mango's to support their family. These high
9 fines are in addition to having their food seized and
10 disposed of by the NYPD or Department of Sanitation.
11 800,000 pounds of food from vendors was seized by
12 DSNY in 2024 alone. Vendors cannot even get on a
13 waiting list for a license, which has thousands of
14 names and is currently closed. Intro. 431 is the
15 solution gradually increasing the number of licenses
16 available for a multiyear period will allow those
17 vendors who are currently working to formalize their
18 business and work legally. Some will pose this
19 legislation may say that this will open the flood
20 gates with vendors everywhere. Quite the opposite.
21 By giving vendors a license and permit, compliance
22 with the sidewalk rules will increase since vendors
23 have skin in the game and incentive to have a legal
24 business.

2 There simply cannot be unlimited vending in New
3 York City. Since 80 percent of New York City
4 sidewalks are less than 12 feet wide and are
5 therefore restricted for vending. There are numerous
6 restricted streets and sidewalk placement rules that
7 when fairly enforced will ensure that vendors keep
8 adequate clearance from crosswalks, bus stops, taxi
9 stands and brick and mortar entrances.

10 Street vending has been an economic pathway for
11 small businesses since New York City was founded.
12 For far too long the city has placed insurmountable
13 barriers for vending. Instead, prioritizing strict
14 enforcement and criminalization.

15 It is time for the city to allow vendors to
16 formalize vendors, brick and mortars and all New
17 Yorkers will be better off. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

19 CARINA KAUFMAN-GUTIERREZ: Good afternoon, my
20 name is Carina Kaufman-Gutierrez and I'm the Deputy
21 Director at the Street Vendor Project. Thank you
22 Chair Menin for the opportunity to testify today in
23 support of Intro. 431, 408, and 1251. Perhaps no
24 industry in New York City faces enforcement from as
25 many agencies and departments as street vending.

2 There are at least seven city agencies that play a
3 role in enforcement. The amount of summonses issued
4 both civil and criminal just keeps climbing.

5 NYPD was in fact the agency that issued the
6 highest number of summonses in 2024. 9,376 total, 18
7 percent of which were criminal and this was five
8 times higher than in 2019 when the agency was
9 actually the one in charge of vendor enforcement.

10 In 2024, DSNY conducted more confiscations than
11 tickets, 4,323 confiscations versus 4,144. This
12 ticketing is costly and ineffective. Researches
13 with Cornell University found DSNY operates at nearly
14 a \$21 loss per summons. And as you heard today,
15 there's not a single city agency that conducts
16 outreach, education, or compliance with street vendor
17 small businesses. Having equal institutional support
18 for small businesses is not only fair, it's better
19 for the city. We've seen incredible success in
20 community education and outreach. When we can equip
21 vendors with information, tools, and a clear path to
22 follow, they know how to operate and can focus on
23 what they love to do, making their food and serving
24 the community.

2 Now, should the Council not act, what is the
3 impact of this costly and ineffective enforcement?

4 Number one, immigration risks. Increased NYPD
5 policing equals increased risk of ICE policing. As
6 long as the current outdated vending system is in
7 place, this Council is putting street vendors at risk
8 of interactions with law enforcement. When
9 immigrants who are at risk of deportation have
10 encounters with the police for any reason, their risk
11 of getting funneled into detention and deportation
12 increases regardless of the outcome of the case. How
13 does this play out in real life?

14 One of our members received a criminal court
15 ticket for vending without a permit. If I may? The
16 day of her court appointment her daughter was -

17 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask
18 you if you could please wrap up and then submit the
19 testimony. Thank you.

20 CARINA KAUFMAN-GUTIERREZ: Her daughter was sick
21 at school. She had the impossible choice to make
22 between taking her daughter to the hospital or
23 showing up in criminal because if she didn't show up,
24 a warrant would be automatically issued for her
25 arrest.

2 Lastly, this is a loss to the cultural fabric of
3 New York City. We're thankful for the Council's
4 listening to this to pass the street vendor reform
5 package. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you.

7 CLEOTILDE JUAREZ: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE
8 [01:50:54]- [01:51:30].

9 INTERPRETER: Good morning. My name is Cleotilde
10 Juarez. I am a street vendor. I live and work at
11 Queens Borough. I'm here to ask you to ask the
12 Council that I need you to approve the reform package
13 for street vendors and they are proposals 431, 408,
14 47 and 24.

15 As a single mother because I'm a single mother
16 and a lot of us are single mothers and we are also
17 grandma's. And a lot of us have to take care of our
18 grandchildren and even a lot of us are survivors of
19 domestic violence.

20 CLEOTILDE JUAREZ: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE
21 [01:52:32]- [01:53:07].

22 INTERPRETER: Okay, we support and we make sure
23 to take food to the table to our households. We have
24 to pay rent. So, I have to ask you in the name of
25 all of us, to approve the reforms but I also think

2 that it's been hypocrite because in the New York
3 Times has recognized our food and our sales but we
4 don't have the opportunities that we deserve to be
5 able to sell them. So, that's why I say it's been
6 hypocritical so far at this point.

7 CLEOTILDE JUAREZ: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE

8 [01:53:47]- [01:54:03].

9 INTERPRETER: Behind every street vendor there's
10 a person who has a business. We are entrepreneurs
11 and we want to help the economy. We actually help
12 the economy already and make it thrive but we want to
13 help even more. We want to contribute even more.

14 CLEOTILDE JUAREZ: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE

15 [01:54:30].

16 INTERPRETER: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

18 CALVIN BAKER: Good afternoon Council Members.

19 Thank you for the opportunity to speak today. I come
20 before you not as a street vendor but as a father, a
21 deacon in my faith community and a proud New Yorker.
22 There were a series of actions that have led to this
23 day. I've marched these streets with thousands of
24 vendors in the lines demanding for vendors rights and
25 stood on the corners, not just selling but to serve

2 with propose with pride and with a call rooted in
3 faith and family. I've given testimony before this
4 very body sharing the struggles of street vendors and
5 I've gathered hundreds of petitions and post cards
6 from my neighbors and customers who stand with me,
7 who believe that this reform is long overdue.

8 As a father, I know that it means to work long
9 hours to ensure my children have a roof over their
10 heads, food on their tables and the opportunities to
11 dream. As a deacon, I have dedicated my life to
12 serving others, advocating for the poor and standing
13 in the gap for those who live in fear. Therefore
14 their voices are often unheard and as a street
15 vendor, I experienced first hand the struggles that
16 come from trying to make an honest living while
17 navigating the system that too often leads us
18 vulnerable, paralyzed or ignored.

19 Today, I am here to support two critical pieces
20 of legislation, Intro. 431 and Intro. 408 part of the
21 street vendor reform package. Intro. 431 is about a
22 firmness a about giving me and my family and my
23 fellow vendors a chance, a real chance to operate
24 legally by expanding access to the vendors license.
25

2 Right now, thousands of hard working men and women,
3 many of them immigrants -

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask
5 you please to wrap up.

6 CALVIN BAKER: Families like me, and our focus to
7 work.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, if you want to submit
9 the rest of your testimony, we would welcome that.

10 CALVIN BAKER: No problem.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you so much.

12 CALVIN BAKER: You're welcome.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

14 MOHAMED ATTIA: Good afternoon. My name is
15 Mohamed Attia, I'm the managing director of the
16 Street Vendor Project. I want to thank Chair Menin
17 and the Council Members for the opportunity to
18 testify. Street vending in New York City has a long
19 rich history. In the 1600's people were selling
20 oysters. In the 1800's, the first push cart market
21 was created by Jewish immigrants on the lower east
22 side. Thousands of immigrants and minorities to make
23 a living and live the American dream here in our
24 city.

2 When we think of street vendors, we think of our
3 daughters, Macy's, the Hallal guys, so many names.
4 We think of families moving up the economic ladders,
5 sending their kids to college so they can have a
6 better future. Becoming community leaders and
7 elected officials while serving their communities and
8 providing affordable product and services. For
9 decades now, the street vending system has been set
10 up to fail everyone. Some people like to blame the
11 vendors for that, for the city's failure. They blame
12 the vendors for not having a business license. We
13 heard it and saw it over and over again.

14 Here's a crazy fact for you. Vendors want to
15 follow the law but the city is not allowing them to
16 do so. Thanks to the limits on the number of
17 licenses. Intro. 431 is a huge step forward to
18 address this dilemma the vendors and New Yorkers are
19 dealing with. For decades, the city has been trying
20 to target vendors with heavy enforcement and it has
21 not worked. Constant enforcement of inequitable laws
22 mean keeping the vendors community in a vicious
23 circle of poverty. This bill offers a different
24 approach. It offers a solution for the system to
25 finally work hopefully for everyone. Some folks are

2 under the illusion that this bill will add more
3 vendors to our city streets. However, the fact is
4 our city - the fact is in our city, 75 percent of
5 vendors operate without a proper permit, 37 of the
6 merchandise vendors operate without a license.

7 This bill will not add more vendors to our city.
8 It will only formalize the existing vending
9 businesses. After passage of Local Law 18 and after
10 three years of implementation, were seeing the scene
11 is not really changing. The rollout is very slow.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask
13 you to wrap up. I know you'll submit the testimony.

14 MOHAMED ATTIA: I will and we know that the roll
15 out we heard today from Health Department, there is a
16 huge bottleneck called the waiting list. They are
17 doing their part as an agency but nothing is really
18 moving the way it should be. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you so much to
20 this panel. Any questions for the panel? Okay,
21 Council Member Sanchez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Yeah, thank you Chair.
23 Uhm, in your view and specifically for SVP, why has
24 there been a rollout - actually, let me just skip to
25 this one. We have a number of vendors who are

2 licensed but still actually, let me - sorry, sorry.

3 Let me clarify this one. There are vendors across
4 the city who do follow the rules and don't follow the
5 rules. What is your position on how Intro. 431 can
6 address the situation? And finally, in this era of
7 heightened federal immigration enforcement, what have
8 you seen on the ground and what are you hearing from
9 vendors?

10 MOHAMED ATTIA: Sure, so now, we know that the
11 city is not creating any incentive for vendors to be
12 in compliance with the law. As we said over and over
13 again, the vendors are not allowed to obtain the
14 proper business license. There is no one doing
15 street outreach to educate the vendors of the law.
16 And as a result, vendors are out there breaking the
17 law, trying to be in compliance with the law but
18 they're not allowed to. We heard from the
19 sanitation; they go out and give the 24 hour warning.
20 That notice is not education. It says you are in
21 violation of some of the rules. Here are three
22 bullet points that you might be breaking. Some of
23 them do not apply to most vendors who sell food;
24 however, that's the only education that the city is
25 doing. So what we believe this bill will do is it

2 will create a mechanism where vendors are obtaining
3 the proper business license, getting the training
4 after the passage of 408 and making sure that they
5 understand the laws, they are in compliance and they
6 are following them. After that, any enforcement
7 action will only be fair.

8 Right now what we're seeing is that the whole
9 enforcement mechanism is not working. The whole
10 enforcement system is so unfair. It's going after
11 vendors including the good apples. Including those
12 who are in compliance with 99 percent of the law but
13 they don't have that piece of document from the city
14 that says a license on it. We heard also from DCWP,
15 the issue on average 110 licenses every year. It's
16 going to take us 95 years to go over the exiting
17 waiting list. 10,500 names, 95 years. Meet me next
18 century. Brother Calvin here is not on the waiting
19 list. He doesn't have a chance to get a license.
20 Yet he's been a vendor for more than 20 years. Where
21 is Calvin in the equation? Where is Calvin in the
22 thinking of the city? The system is failing
23 everyone. It's not only failing vendors. It's
24 failing the entire economy of the city.

25 I hope that answers your question Council Member.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. It does,
3 thank you and have you heard concerns around the new
4 federal immigration enforcement with respect to
5 vendors on our streets?

6 CARINA KAUFMAN-GUTIERREZ: Yes, I can answer
7 that. In our current political climate, there has
8 absolutely and frankly at the city level as well,
9 there being the heightened criminalization and
10 intimidation of street vendors has become all the
11 more alarming. I want to show a few photos. This is
12 what immigration enforcement looks like. You could
13 see it says police, police, police. Department of
14 Sanitation uniforms say police, police, police.
15 You're a street vendor and you're outside operating
16 and you don't know which agency, one of the seven
17 that do street vendor enforcement could be
18 approaching you, meanwhile you're also potentially
19 fearful of an ICE approaching - an ICE agent
20 approaching you as well. There's extreme concern and
21 fear that just stepping outside could result in
22 something more dangerous. And as long as the current
23 outdated vending system is in place, this Council is
24 putting street vendors at risk of interactions with
25 local law enforcement.

2 Because when immigrants who are at risk for
3 deportation have encounters with the police for any
4 reason, their risk of getting funneled into detention
5 and deportation increases regardless of the outcome
6 of this case. And the reason why is because any
7 encounter with NYPD can result in fingerprint
8 sharing, even if that person is not actually charged.

9 In particular, any case where fingerprints are
10 taken, they're sent via to FBI to ICE to determine
11 whether the person is a target. Additionally, there
12 is an impact in the discretionary element. Many
13 applications for immigration relief and defense to
14 deportation include a discretionary element. So, any
15 arrests or tickets, even just a summons right, a
16 civil summons, where even when a case is dismissed
17 does have the potential to be used as a negative
18 factor.

19 So again, there is a lot of concerns within the
20 community, 96 percent of street vendors are
21 immigrants.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you and I just
23 want to thank SVP for all the work that you've done
24 to get us here. For all the conversations you've had
25 with additional stakeholders. You've gone far beyond

2 your own role and even helped us. So, thank you for
3 all the work.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, just a couple questions
5 that I have. So, do you think there is enough legal
6 space for vending if the number of license each year
7 increased substantially?

8 MATT SHAPIRO: Yes, uhm one thing that I always
9 think about if right now food vendors are paying on
10 the underground market \$15,000, \$20,000 to use
11 another person's permit. They're stressed about
12 that, so they're trying to recover as much money as
13 possible, so maybe they think they need to be in the
14 most prime location. If vendors have the opportunity
15 to have their own permit, not pay that \$15,000, you
16 know pay a more reasonable amount, directly to the
17 city I might add, they will probably not need - you
18 know they probably wont stress as much to have that
19 prime location where every other vendor wants to be
20 and perhaps spread out a bit and go to those areas
21 where there is not as much vending, because they
22 won't be in the whole \$15,000 or \$20,000 and be
23 constantly thinking about recouping that money.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: What impact would this have
25 to the brick and mortar small businesses?

2 MATT SHAPIRO: Increasing?

3 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Increasing the cap. So, if
4 the brick and mortar, small businesses that are
5 paying rent and sometimes business interruption
6 insurance and myriad different costs, what impact
7 would it have on them?

8 MATT SHAPIRO: Well vendors also pay costs. They
9 have to pay for their carts. They have to pay
10 licensing and permitting fees. They have to pay
11 commissary storage fees. They don't pay nearly as
12 much as brick and mortar's do that's correct but they
13 also get a lot less. For a brick and mortar, they
14 have a few thousand feet, a big store, 10,000 feet.
15 They pay a lot more but they get a lot more. A
16 vendor gets at most 10 feet of space on the sidewalk
17 and they pay a lot less. So, they should get a lot
18 less. So we believe that it's a fair you know, what
19 they're paying is proportionate to what they're
20 getting in return. There's all different types of
21 business in New York City. There's big grocery
22 stores, there's small produce stores, there's farmers
23 markets, there's street vendors. All of these
24 different types of business have always existed and
25 they'll continue to exist side by side.

2 MOHAMED ATTIA: And if I may add Council Member,
3 just one little thing here with the competition back
4 in 2008, the Bloomberg Administration created the
5 Green Card program and there was a huge opposition
6 from the grocery stores and the bodega owners, saying
7 that creating this program would pretty much kill
8 their business selling fresh produce. However, years
9 later, a study showed that the sale of fresh produce
10 in these bodegas increased by 20 percent. So if
11 we're looking at the economic impact, having more
12 vendors in neighborhoods bring more foot traffic,
13 bring more economic mobility into these neighborhoods
14 and into these sidewalks, that benefits everyone. At
15 the end of the day, if there are some small
16 businesses who are concerned about competition, we
17 heard earlier from DCWP that it's not the city to
18 regulate based on competition. You cannot say sorry
19 bodegas; you cannot be within 1,000 feet from super
20 markets. You can not say sorry, you know brick and
21 mortar restaurants, you cannot be within 500 feet
22 from McDonalds. This is not the city's job but
23 sadly, this is the main drive of the conversation
24 because the city is taking sides and this is illegal.
25 If were to take this to court, if the caps are placed

2 on the licenses and permits based on competition to
3 curb the competition, we should be taking the city to
4 court but the city never said that. The city never
5 put on the record that they are keeping the caps only
6 for the competition reasons. They are saying it's a
7 public safety issue. However, years later after they
8 place the caps, in 1995, a group of military veterans
9 sued the city and they want access to all limited
10 general vendor licenses. The public safety is still
11 doing pretty well. The sky hasn't fallen. The
12 vendors are not packed on every sidewalk. The system
13 is still working and there is no limit. As of now
14 there are about 1,200 veterans who own a merchandise
15 vendor licenses. If 10,000 veterans walked tomorrow
16 to DCWP office, they are entitled to receive the
17 license immediately and hopefully public safety will
18 not be an issue.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Have you met with the BIDs
20 who are raising objections to this? Because I have
21 obviously heard from many BIDs and other groups that
22 have concerns about impact to small business. Many
23 immigrant owned small businesses who are saying
24 they're struggling to survive. What impact will this
25

2 have on them? So, have you sat with them to address
3 their concerns that they're raising?

4 MOHAMED ATTIA: We have Chair Menin and we have
5 over and over again over the last ten years met with
6 a lot of BIDs and a lot of other groups who are
7 concerned and some of them are in the position that
8 we should limit the vendors or create specific places
9 for vendors and get them away from our storefronts to
10 eliminate the competition.

11 We shared over and over again that this is
12 illegal. This is not something we will ever support.
13 We believe that this city should work for everyone.
14 If you have \$500 to start a business on a table, you
15 should be able to have the opportunity. If you have
16 half a million dollars to start a supermarket, good
17 for you but you can not really come down on the
18 little person.

19 In the conversation, their main concern is the
20 enforcement. We're not against enforcement. We are
21 against enforcement of a system that doesn't make any
22 sense to anyone. We are against enforcement that a
23 DSNY agent is going to a vendor yelling at them,
24 telling them go get a license, it's cheap and then
25 the vendor goes to DCWP and they are turned away,

2 saying sorry, we don't have a license. This is the
3 kind of enforcement we are against. If there is some
4 middle ground where we can have a functioning system
5 that protects everyone's rights, we're 100 percent
6 for it but I'm not going to sign off on something on
7 a road that says oh, the vendors are second class
8 businesses. They don't deserve the same opportunity
9 that storefronts. We're going to keep them 1,000
10 feet away from every storefront. This is something
11 we cannot support. Because before there were
12 supermarkets, there was vendors. Because there was
13 bodegas there was vendors, because there was
14 supermarkets and restaurants and any other brick and
15 mortar, people were selling on the streets. So, if
16 someone is reasonably discussing the topic with us,
17 we're more than happy to discuss with them, find the
18 middle ground, find how we can work together.

19 The only problem that they have and some of them
20 mentioned off the record, that they don't have any
21 problem with increasing the number of permits or
22 licenses. Their main issue is enforcing the laws,
23 which is again, we're not against enforcing the laws,
24 if the laws make sense. If they don't make sense,

2 we're against every single ticket that's straight to
3 the vendor that the vendor cannot comply with.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And last question that I have
5 is related to the testimony we heard earlier from SBS
6 because I was very troubled by SBS's apparent
7 inability to give me a simple data point of how many
8 small - how many street vendors they've helped with
9 SBS services, so any comment on that?

10 MOHAMED ATTIA: Yes ma'am. Real quick and I can
11 pass it to my colleagues as well. I happen to be a
12 former food vendor. I was a vendor for ten years. I
13 still keep my food vendor license active and a good
14 status and I do get the letters from the city. This
15 is a flyer that I received from SBS. The first
16 sentence of the flyer it says, we have the resources.
17 Street vendors need to operate or expand. Let's put
18 expansion aside. Let's just talk about operating.
19 If I need a permit, how would they help me get a
20 permit? If brother Calvin here needs a license to
21 operate the business; this is one, if you want to
22 start business, one is to get the paperwork ready.
23 So, the flyer they are sending to the vendors is
24 misleading. If a vendor walks into their office and
25 say hi, I'm selling merchandise, I need the proper

2 license and proper paperwork, they cannot help them
3 cut the line.

4 On the other hand, mailing 22,000 of these
5 doesn't really get you a lot of results. We as a
6 small nonprofit, we hit the ground every single day.
7 We are ten or maybe eleven staff members, we do
8 street outreach. This is where we meet the vendors.
9 The vendors don't google small business support.
10 They don't google Street Vendor Project. That might
11 happen once or twice a year but you have to meet
12 people where they're at.

13 On the other side, with all due respect, all my
14 lovely Council Members here, more than half of them
15 send us email requests every single week requesting
16 outreach in their districts and we get that much
17 support from the Council, less than 20 percent of our
18 budget. So, how can I be in 51 districts all at once
19 educating the vendors. This is not the nonprofit
20 job. This is the city job and if we are calling for
21 \$7.7 million to the DSNY enforcement office of street
22 vendor, let's call for \$7.7 million to create the
23 resources for the vendors to educate them, right? We
24 are seeing the response from the City Council. Last
25

1 month calling for \$7.7 million for the enforcement
2 but zero dollars for education.

3
4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: And how many times has SBS
5 gone out with the Street Vendor Project to visit
6 street vendors?

7 MOHAMED ATTIA: As far as I know, zero times and
8 I've been involved with SVP for the 12 years.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay. Thank you very much to
10 this panel.

11 CARINA KAUFMAN-GUTIERREZ: May I just add briefly
12 on that?

13 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yeah.

14 CARINA KAUFMAN-GUTIERREZ: I just want to
15 highlight the Street Vendor Project is very grateful
16 for the support that we do receive from the Council
17 and SBS for the work that we do. We are required to
18 report on all of our grants that we receive. The
19 location, the zip code. We have to provide photos
20 for every meeting that we have, sign in sheets so it
21 seems a bit hypocritical to require organizations
22 that receive funding to do that if our city agencies
23 are not required to do the same. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Thank you
25 for your testimony, we appreciate it. Okay, I'm

2 going to call the next panel Erin Piscopink, Barbara
3 Blair, Evan Sweet, and Nelson Eusebio. I apologize
4 if I mispronounce, I can't read the writing. If you
5 could please come forward. Oh thank you. Okay,
6 thank you. Please begin. Oh, you need one minute,
7 no problem. Oh, no, yeah, that's fine so instead
8 uhm, do you want to go first? Yeah, great.

9 EVAN SWEET: Good day Chair Menin and Council
10 Members. My name is Evan Sweet. I am the Director
11 of Neighborhood Operations for the Meat Packing
12 Business Improvement District. The BID is
13 responsible for managing and maintaining one of New
14 York City's premier live, work and play cultural
15 districts on Manhattan's west side.

16 The Meat Packing BID provides comprehensive range
17 of supplemental services, including sanitation,
18 landscaping, public space management. All of which
19 collectively ensure our neighborhood remains clean,
20 safe, and welcoming to residents, businesses and
21 visitors alike. These services are undermined by
22 proliferation of mobile food and goods vendors which
23 seriously infringe on pedestrians rights of way
24 frequently block access to storefronts, fire
25 hydrants, pollute catch basins from cooking grease

2 and undermine the investments in the public realm.

3 Things that have made the made the meat packing
4 districts public spaces so successful.

5 While some believe the existing vending rules are
6 enough to deal with limited bad actors, our daily
7 experience managing New Yorks public realm tells a
8 different story. Each day, vending creates a list of
9 issues that are unaddressed by the city and outside
10 of the Bid's ability to change. If it were any other
11 industry, the matter would be swiftly addressed and
12 legislation proposed to fix and not fumble this
13 matter. We understand that properly regulated
14 vendors are an important component of our city's
15 diverse economy and cultural fabric and for many, a
16 mobile street vending permit is a path to economic
17 opportunity. However, we believe that simply
18 expanding the number of permits without substantive
19 structural changes to the city's vending policy will
20 further complicate street vending and lead to worse
21 outcomes across the five boroughs.

22 Any legislation must directly address the city's
23 inability to enforce existing vending rules and to
24 provide a comprehensive framework for integrating
25 street vendors into the urban landscape and to not be

2 a detriment to brick and mortar businesses, public
3 realm stores and the pedestrian experience.

4 Today's legislation falls short and thus only
5 exacerbates the range of challenges directly caused
6 by poorly regulated street vending which BIDs and
7 communities across the city struggle to manage.

8 Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Yes, do
10 you want to next?

11 Good morning Chair Menin and members of the
12 Committee. I'm Barbara Blair, I'm the President of
13 the Garment District Alliance, a BID in Midtown
14 Manhattan and I'm here to testify against 431. The
15 time has come for well-grounded legislation which
16 addresses the city's wild, wild west vending policy.
17 Despite repeated calls from the community for
18 regulation of this pervasive public realm disorder,
19 the Council persists in introducing legislation that
20 allows for more vendors but lacks fundamental
21 guardrails to regulate their activities. To be
22 clear, we are not against vendors. In fact, the
23 issue of how many licenses you want to give is
24 irrelevant to the Garment district. What is relevant
25 is regulating time, place, and manner that are

2 enforceable, rules that are enforceable and are in
3 fact vigorously enforced. The bill, which adds
4 vendors to the streets but does not specify
5 regulations with ample funding and staffing to
6 enforce them will only complicate the chaos in our
7 neighborhoods and make rule enforcement more
8 challenging. It's time to reimagine our communal
9 spaces. Consider that neighborhoods are different
10 and the midtown vending rules because of pedestrian,
11 bike, vehicular congestion should be different for
12 public safety and quality of life reasons.

13 Vending should be planned in the context of other
14 public realm users such as pedestrians, cafés,
15 emergency vehicles, brick and mortar retail
16 entrances, bike docking, delivery vehicles, easy
17 charging stations, to name a few. For our part, we
18 request that any vendors be located in the curblane,
19 not on the sidewalk. The argument the vendors would
20 need to step into traffic is ridiculous. All drivers
21 step out into traffic when they get out of a parked
22 car. The bill does not address enforcement, which
23 should be dramatically more rigorous.

24 As it currently is, vendors in our area act with
25 impunity and shrug off citations.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Who wants
3 to go next?

4 NELSON EUSEBIO: Can I go?

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, yes.

6 NELSON EUSEBIO: Thank you. My name is Nelson
7 Eusebio. Thank you Chairman and members of the
8 Committee for the opportunity to submit testimony
9 from the National Supermarket Association. NSA is a
10 trade organization representing the interest of
11 independently owned supermarkets in New York City and
12 beyond the five boroughs. NSA advocates for more
13 than 600 supermarkets and 15,000 employees. NSA
14 members are predominantly immigrant and minority
15 entrepreneurs who have built a business from the
16 ground up.

17 Our member stores are locally family owned
18 business, many passed down from one generation to the
19 next. That serves as an economy engine in the
20 community and anchors of health, affordable food in
21 our neighborhoods across our cities. Our member
22 employs thousands of workers, pay local taxes and
23 invest directly in the communities where they live.

24 We submit these comments today, not to oppose
25 street vendors. Many of whom share similar

2 backgrounds to our members but to call for a
3 functional, fair and enforceable vending system that
4 works for all New Yorkers. The current system of
5 street vending in New York City is deeply flawed.
6 Overcrowded sidewalks, unregulated vending,
7 inconsistent enforcement, have created an
8 unattainable situation for both permit vendors and
9 brick and mortar business.

10 For supermarkets in particular, the consequences
11 are serious. Vague city and rules setting rules
12 allow vendors to operate directly outside our store
13 renters, which not only affects visibility and access
14 but also creates real liability risk. Under law,
15 supermarkets are responsible for maintaining the
16 sidewalks in front of the stores and are legally
17 liable for incidents that occur there. If a
18 pedestrian should slip and fall on the crowded
19 sidewalk, crowded with unregulated vending activity,
20 the supermarket, the supermarket not the vendor is
21 held liable.

22 This unfairly shifts the financial and legal
23 responsibility onto supermarket owners. I know I
24 just got the whistle but I just want to say that the
25 brick and mortars are literally subsidizing

2 everything that goes on that sidewalk. We are
3 responsible for the sidewalk from insurance, from
4 fines from Department of Sanitation and if the city
5 chooses to replace that sidewalk, they send us the
6 bill.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay and lastly.

8 ERIN PISCOPIK: Apologies for my delay.
9 Chairman and members of the New York City Council, my
10 name is Erin Piscopink. I am the Executive Director
11 of the SoHo Broadway Initiative but I'm here today in
12 my capacity as Co-Chair of the New York City BID
13 Association.

14 The Association is comprised of the 76 business
15 improvement districts across New York that are as
16 diverse as the city itself. BIDs are on the
17 frontlines of economic development, neighborhood
18 vibrancy and public realm management. It's critical
19 that BIDs have a seat at the table when making public
20 policy decisions about our street scape including
21 vending. We understand that New York City has always
22 had street vendors. Entrepreneurs who are trying to
23 make a living and support their families. The same
24 motivation drives our storefront businesses including
25 the small shops and restaurants that make our

2 communities unique. As stewards of vibrant
3 neighborhoods, BIDs welcome licensed street vendors
4 who play by the rules in their districts. Some have
5 voluntarily added vendors to their boards. However,
6 BIDs are also deeply concerned about the lack of
7 enforcement when it comes to common sense, time,
8 place and manner restrictions on vending.

9 We welcome and have supported common sense
10 changes to laws that will make it easier for street
11 vendors to make a living but only in conjunction with
12 the enforcement of sight and criteria and other
13 regulations meant to ensure things like clear path
14 for pedestrians and distant from storefront
15 businesses. We're also not philosophically opposed
16 to issuing new vending licenses but don't believe the
17 city should double down on a broken system.

18 And I'll add here, you know we heard from DSNY
19 earlier today that only 25 percent of the violations
20 are regarding licensure, so we think a bigger part of
21 the problem is time, place, manner.

22 Specifically, Intro. 431 would require the city
23 to make available over 7,500 new vendor licenses over
24 the next five years and then an unlimited number
25 after that. The changes in Local Law 18 of 2021,

2 which require a gradual increase in the number of
3 licenses along with increased enforcement and impact
4 studies have yet to be fully realized. We
5 respectfully believe that the new supervisory license
6 system and Office of Street Vendor Enforcement should
7 be given more time and resources to roll out before
8 the number of licenses is increased. We also believe
9 that an unlimited number of vending licenses will
10 create many more problems than it will solve.

11 I'll end by saying we look forward to continuing
12 our work with the Council and the Administration on
13 this important policy discussion. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you very much for
15 your testimony. I do have a question. I know for
16 the and just in looking at the written testimony, the
17 meat packing district, the National Supermarket
18 Association, both of you are recommending particular
19 structural reforms. Could you talk for a minute
20 about what those reforms are that you urge the city
21 to implement?

22 NELSON EUSEBIO: Sure, from my experience
23 directing the operations in the Meat Packing
24 District, I can say that even working with city
25 agency partners to enforce issues that we see as it

2 relates to time, place and manner are very difficult
3 if not impossible to undertake. We think that there
4 needs to be some sort of changes to the way that
5 enforcement is done or in clarity from perhaps the
6 Council or from the city itself to direct different
7 agencies on how to undertake enforcement and what
8 actions are clearly enforceable or not enforceable to
9 undertake.

10 EVAN SWEET: Yes, uh we believe expand
11 enforcement resources allocate \$10 million to hire
12 additional 118 DSNY enforcement agents to Community
13 Board to ensure educated year around proactive
14 oversight, set clear and enforceable requirement. We
15 asked for a 55 foot buffer from the front of our
16 stores, decriminalize violations, we feel people
17 shouldn't be criminalized because they're out there
18 vending. Create a Mayor's Office of Street Vending.
19 We support the Intro. 408, but we advocate to
20 centralize and coordinate of many agencies involved
21 in street vending. With these measures, we believe
22 we can support this bill.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay thank you. Any
24 questions from colleagues?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Do you happen to have
3 uhm, the number of how many of your supermarket
4 members have vending directly in front of their
5 markets?

6 EVAN SWEET: Currently, about 20 percent.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: About 20 percent. How
8 many members do you have in the association?

9 EVAN SWEET: Over we represent over 600
10 supermarkets.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay.

12 EVAN SWEET: In the five boroughs.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Okay, great thank you so
14 much.

15 EVAN SWEET: Yeah.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you Chair. I just
17 want to thank you all for continued engagement. I
18 don't know that all of you but most of you attended
19 the conversations we had in November and I think
20 we've come a long way. I really tried; we really
21 tried to make sure that the hearing was on the
22 amended legislation but it just didn't work out but I
23 want to ask questions about the amended legislation.
24 The amendments that we are wanting to pursue which
25 are particularly first increasing the number of

2 sanitation officers as the availability of licenses
3 increases, so that we're increasing the capacity to
4 as you said, I'm sorry, I have a lot of papers in
5 front of me but as you said, make sure that we as a
6 city have the ability to go after the time, place and
7 manner you know restrictions that are currently on
8 the books and even as we consider others.

9 And second, the second amendment would create
10 clear standards for how a vendors license can be
11 suspended and revoked after persistent violations.
12 So, these items go hand and hand, right? It's all
13 about balance. This is not - I'm not here to be
14 dogmatic. I'm not here to do anything except try to
15 get as closer to something that makes sense. A
16 rational system in the City of New York. And so, I
17 ask you and you highlighted a few changes already but
18 beyond licenses and we can have many conversations
19 about how to change the number of licenses and I look
20 forward to those. On enforcement, is there anything
21 else that you would specifically want to see the city
22 do? You mentioned 50 feet, a change to 50 feet. Are
23 there any other specifics you would want to see
24 changed?

2 BARBARA BLAIR: Well, I think just having
3 listened to the panel that you had, the City
4 Administration panel about education and reaching out
5 to the vendors, you know the licensing, to receive a
6 license, maybe instead of relying on them maybe
7 getting an SBS brochure that maybe they do or don't
8 read. You know maybe there's some course that you
9 have to take like you have to take a course to get a
10 driver's license and then you have to pass the course
11 and then you're issued a license.

12 So, that's just one thing. The other thing that
13 we mentioned. My testimony is not two minutes; was
14 the idea that as you add licenses, you add
15 enforcement and so, that requires money in the budget
16 to hire those people because we heard that there's
17 not the capacity within these agencies because
18 they're already over capacity in terms of what they
19 have to do. There's just not enough staffing. And
20 then finally, at least from our perspective in the
21 Garment District in Midtown Manhattan, the streets
22 are very narrow. There very crowded. We have
23 illegal vending all over the place. NYPD, DSNY, we
24 are in touch with them all the time. They enforce to
25 the degree that they're able to. If you're a repeat

2 offender, your goods should be confiscated and
3 destroyed and you're never vending again, ever. And
4 this idea that you can get multiple summonses and use
5 them as wallpaper in your living room makes a mockery
6 of the Council and our justice system.

7 ERIN PISCOPIK: I want to just thank you for the
8 effort that you put in to those roundtables in the
9 fall. I'm really appreciative to have a seat at the
10 table like we discussed but uhm, what's clearly a
11 good faith effort on your part to continue in the
12 dialogue. I appreciate it very, very much.

13 I think with respect to DSNY, I worry that there
14 might be some kind of missing components around
15 enforcement education. As a brief example, we -
16 after literal years of asking for enforcement from
17 DSNY, we're able to get enforcement in SoHo about a
18 week ago and consistently 90 percent of the vendors
19 we have in the district are out of compliance in one
20 way or another with vending laws.

21 When DSNY came out, they issued only two
22 summonses which were kind of outside of the scope of
23 DSNY enforcement. More related to vending from
24 metered parking. Because the vendors they were
25 interacting with were licensed but that doesn't mean

2 that time, place, manner was correct. It just means
3 they were licensed and so, I think there's a real gap
4 in where we're seeing enforcement and where we need
5 enforcement in the community as it is. And I'll also
6 say I can completely understand an agency needing
7 increased resources but it's interesting to me that
8 in the first week where you know composting became
9 mandatory, the agency was able to issue I think 2,000
10 summonses in that opening week. So, the agency
11 clearly has the ability to do enforcement and issue
12 summonses. I think there's just a mismatch or some
13 problems that we could solve together.

14 EVAN SWEET: Just to add on a little of that, you
15 know I don't want to say too much about our agency
16 partner who we work very closely with to make sure
17 our streets are clean you know day in and day out but
18 I will say that with DSNY enforcement issues, we have
19 found a disconnect as Erin just mentioned about their
20 understanding of where vending law or vending
21 enforcement can take place or what they're able to
22 enforce. I think having better education on the
23 agency side on being clear and those guidelines would
24 be very important and supportive of the overall
25 ability to enforce.

2 The second thing I would say is that you know I
3 work in the operation side of our organization as
4 well as the public realm investment and improvement.
5 So, when I work with agencies like the DOT to install
6 new seating or new public space amenities, I have to
7 go through landmarks. I have to go through the DOT
8 review and a number of different places and while I'm
9 not here to suggest that we need to put a whole new
10 administrative burden on vending, I think the ability
11 for an entity to just set up on a street without any
12 kind of guidance, framework, or structure or what is
13 frankly in the city limited guidance framework
14 infrastructure versus what I have to do is very
15 difficult.

16 I know in some other cities, the city even in
17 fact designates parking spots as vending spaces and
18 sells those to street vendors, right? There's a
19 number of other ways to help codify and structure on
20 the locations for vending and kind of helped with
21 some of these time, place and manner issues in that
22 way and I also would agree with Barbara Blair here
23 about having the opportunity or the ability for
24 vending to take place in the curb lane versus on the
25 sidewalk, especially in very congested districts like

2 the Meat Packing District or the Garment District on
3 Broadway.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. I was taking
5 vigorous notes. I really want to appreciate that. I
6 guess I just want to just link from my heart, just
7 say this out loud right? You know because you
8 probably heard her crying. I have two babies. One
9 is five months old. She calls the shots. What she
10 wants, she gets right but the two year old, the two
11 and a half year old, there's only so much sternness
12 that I can do to get him to behave the way I want,
13 right? It's bed time, if I just tell him it's bed
14 time, it's not going to work, right? There has to be
15 a back and forth and not to infantilize this
16 situation but to bring it to the policy making realm,
17 we have to have carrots and sticks. We can't just
18 have the sticks. I agree the sticks are important
19 and we got to fix the way that we lay out the sticks,
20 right. Pick up sticks, seven, eight, lay them
21 straight.

22 Okay, we have to fix the way that we enforce
23 right but this aspect about the licensing, I really
24 want to continue conversation with you all because I
25 think it can go such a long way to changing behavior

2 the way that when I sit down and I reason with my two
3 year old or I try and I tell him mommy's really
4 tired, can you please help me and go to bed? Every
5 now and then, he's like alright mom, fine. So, I
6 just want to thank you for the ongoing engagement,
7 for the good ideas, and you know really just like ask
8 and you know implore; that's the word I'm looking
9 for, implore you to continue coming to the table and
10 helping us to get to a better place.

11 NELSON EUSEBIO: And we thank the City Council
12 for this opportunity. We'd just like to say from
13 behalf of the supermarkets that just remember in the
14 70's where New York was falling apart and a lot of
15 the change, most of the change left the City of New
16 York. It was the independent supermarkets that kept
17 these neighborhoods together. It was the independent
18 supermarkets that kept these neighborhoods away from
19 all the drugs and the unemployment and so forth, and
20 we are the first stepping stone for immigrants that
21 come to this country seeking a work place. They come
22 to us. Where in some cases, just like you said,
23 we're too big and in some cases, we're too small.
24 We're not against street vending's but we have fought
25 hard for the position that we have now and still like

2 I said before, we subsidize these sidewalks. We're
3 in charge of these sidewalks. Everything that
4 happens on the sidewalks comes to us. We're not
5 asking to eliminate street vendors but we're asking
6 please if they can just sit a little further away
7 from our front door.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Okay, thank you so much
9 for that response. I have Council Member that has
10 questions for this panel.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I have a question. I
12 have been listening online because I was at a
13 funeral, so I was at the funeral with my - listening
14 in my earbuds. My question is to the supermarkets
15 because I have had a situation where I am conscious
16 of a small bodega and a coffee person vending
17 outside. And so, I have actually moved them myself,
18 you know gotten them to go further away but if you
19 call to do that, do you get any response?

20 In other words, I do think it's unfair if you are
21 a small grocery store, bodega, having somebody send
22 coffee right outside. When you call, does that make
23 any difference as to the person moving?

24 NELSON EUSEBIO: It's such a sad situation
25 because right now when you call, they tell you that

2 they will get to it and they give you like a little
3 number, your number 321 or whatever the case may be.
4 90 percent of the time, they never show up and when
5 you check your number has been removed from the
6 waiting list, and when we do have them come and
7 remove the person, a week later, that person is back
8 in front of our stores all over again and then when
9 you try to call them back that they feel that the
10 issue hasn't already been settled or you don't get
11 nobody on the other end of the line. It's really
12 frustrating on that part.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you and for the
14 BIDs, my question is roadway, would that be a parking
15 issue as opposed to the sidewalk? But if it is
16 roadway, would that make a big difference in terms of
17 support for the vendors?

18 BARBARA BLAIR: I think these BIDs as you well
19 know Council Member all very, very different. So, in
20 Midtown Manhattan, in the Garment District, our
21 sidewalks are unusually narrow.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know.

23 BARBARA BLAIR: So, right? So, in our case, we
24 would much prefer that they were in a parking spot in
25 the curb line. Not all districts are equal so I do

2 think it has to be a little more nuanced and maybe
3 the guideline is the width of the sidewalk.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: SoHo?

5 ERIN PISCOPIK: Hi, I'll echo what Barbara just
6 said and with my BID Association hat on add to the
7 nuance that we're talking about 76 districts in 76
8 neighborhoods. Many of which are -

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know all the ones in
10 Manhattan.

11 ERIN PISCOPIK: Yeah, many of our you know
12 colleague BIDs are in the outer boroughs where
13 parking is a really, really, really important issue
14 for people and so, yeah, I'll just echo. I think
15 that this isn't a one size fits all solution but it
16 could help alleviate some of the sidewalk congestion
17 in particular districts.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Well, maybe with the
19 sidewalk and community board somewhere have an input
20 might be helpful. Okay, thank you.

21 NELSON EUSEBIO: Thank you.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Seeing no other
23 questions. This panel is now dismissed. I'd like to
24 call up for the next panel Scott Foletta, James

2 Gonzalez, Adrian Cepeda, Juan Nunez, and Shamier
3 Settle.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Sorry, please begin. Thank
5 you.

6 SCOTT FOLETTA: Thank you. My name is Scott
7 Foletta and I am the Managing Attorney for the
8 Immigration Defense Team at the Neighborhood Defender
9 Service of Harlem, the public defender office for
10 upper Manhattan and I just wanted to speak to you
11 today about the critical importance of street vendor
12 reform for immigrant New Yorkers.

13 New comers to New York City often face many
14 challenges finding employment from lack of work
15 authorization to limited English proficiency to
16 employment discrimination and street vendor
17 businesses offer a way around these challenges by
18 starting your own small business and become your own
19 employer. And in this way, street vending enables
20 many immigrants to provide for their families but
21 over policing risks placing these same individuals
22 into the deportation pipeline.

23 Newcomers are often unaware of the laws around
24 street vending and enforcement can be arbitrary and
25 punitive. When somebody is arrested or given a

2 criminal summons, they're fingerprinted and that
3 fingerprint automatically triggers ICE to become
4 aware of their case. If the person is arrested by
5 ICE, any conviction they get through this process can
6 result in them being denied benefits like asylum by
7 an immigration judge. So, Introduction 47 addresses
8 these risks by requiring civil as opposed to criminal
9 summonses and ensuring that these violations are no
10 longer treated as misdemeanors.

11 The Trump Administration is targeting all
12 immigrants in our city, not just those who are
13 undocumented and they aim to spread fear in immigrant
14 communities and use criminalization as a tool to
15 deport more of our neighbors and unfortunately, our
16 mayor has taken dangerous steps to collaborate with
17 this deportation agenda. New Yorkers should not have
18 to fear being placed into the deportation pipeline
19 simply to provide for their families.

20 So, while ICE is trying to tear communities down,
21 let us instead build them up. This Council should
22 decriminalize street vending and provide New Yorkers
23 increased access to this critical stepping stone to
24 stability. Thank you.

2 ADRIAN CEPEDA: Hi, good afternoon. My name is
3 Adrian Cepeda, I am the sole owner of the Worlds
4 Borough Bookshop that is located in the Worlds
5 Borough, which is Queens It is a bookstore that
6 amplifies BIPOC voices and really represents a
7 diversity of Jackson Heights.

8 Now, I had a different speech before I came here
9 today but as someone who represents brick and mortar,
10 this idea of competition and this idea of them taking
11 resources or businesses away is extremely interesting
12 to me because it doesn't make any sense personally.
13 When you see competition, I don't view competition as
14 something that's bad. Competition is important for
15 everyone. It is what leads to innovation. If I am
16 selling books, not serving my community and there's
17 another book store across the street from me, who is
18 offering events, authors internationally and from
19 across the United States, I'm going to assume that
20 book store is doing better than me.

21 If your store, given the amount of feet that I am
22 given, I cannot give enough to my community or offer
23 community events, know your rights workshops, bring
24 in these authors, offer a third space for them, then
25 I'm not doing what I was supposed to do.

2 So, I want to make you guys understand and make
3 everyone here know that Jackson Heights, I've lived
4 there for 30 years. I was a first immigrant here.
5 My mom was born here but my dad was not. He came
6 here. He did not go to college. They did not have
7 college education of the first in higher ed. A lot
8 of these families are just working to provide for
9 their children. I am working to provide for not only
10 my child but for the children of the neighborhood who
11 are now growing up with a book store where when I
12 grew up there for 30 years, I did not have a book
13 store. There was no book stores anywhere. But what
14 was there were food venders, street vendors. I grew
15 up all around there with street vendors and food
16 vendors and they are the ones who served me when I
17 was a borough college student. They are the ones who
18 served many families around there and they are the
19 ones who provided payments to the catholic school
20 that I went to for their children because they wanted
21 their kids to have good education.

22 So, these families are here to work hard.
23 They're here not to make one million dollars.
24 They're here just to provide food. I own a book
25 store. I will not be a millionaire. I know that but

2 I do it to provide for the community, just like these
3 street vendors are.

4 JAMES GONZALES: Thank you first and foremost for
5 taking the time to hear us out. So, my name is James
6 Gonzalez. I'm the Co-owner of La Fonda Boricua or
7 known as La Fonda now. The heart of the change in
8 New York City and I stand here not just a small
9 business owner but as a New Yorker who believes
10 deeply in the promise of opportunity. Equality and
11 dignity for all who labor to make this city live.

12 That's why I support the Street Vendor reform
13 package, especially Intro.'s 431 and 408. They
14 aren't just bills, they are recognition. A
15 recognition that the people selling food, T-shirts,
16 books or belts on our corners and sidewalks are
17 entrepreneurs just like me. They are the beating
18 heart of our neighborhoods, cultural bearers, and job
19 creators. They are not a nuisance; they are a
20 necessity. Right now we have a system that punishes
21 the very people it should be uplifting. It is
22 outdated, unjust and unsustainable but with these
23 reforms, we have the chance to create a system that
24 is fair, enforceable and rooted in reality. One
25 where street vendors can operate with clarity,

2 respect, and the same chance to growth that every
3 small business deserves. This isn't just about
4 economics, it's about the soul of the city when we
5 open doors for one another, we build a New York that
6 thrives not just in profit but in purpose.

7 If we allow these bills to live, we allow the
8 people to live. We begin to remember how to grow not
9 apart but together. Let's move forward not with fear
10 but with faith, the kind of faith that built this
11 city in the first place. Thank you.

12 JUAN NUNEZ: Good afternoon everybody. My name
13 is Juan Nunez. I am a community organizer with the
14 Northwest Bronx Community and Clergy Coalition. I
15 wanted to thank Chair Menin and the Committee for the
16 opportunity to testify today in support of Intro.'s
17 431 and 408. I'm currently organizing around the
18 redevelopment of the Kings Bridge Armory. This
19 massive building that is already having a massive
20 impact on the small businesses on the Kings Bridge
21 Corridor that includes brick and mortar and street
22 vendors.

23 The Northwest Bronx fights for racial justice and
24 economic justice to transform the Bronx and beyond so
25 that all of our people could thrive. We help form

2 tenant associations; merchant associations and we're
3 here as part of the Street Vendor Reform Coalition
4 with Street Vendor Project because we know that
5 communities thrive when we work and organize
6 together. Because you see the street vendor that was
7 ticketed is your neighbor whose kids attend the local
8 elementary school two blocks away from the church you
9 all go pray at on Sunday's. We are all going through
10 the same struggle. Everything is getting more
11 expensive. We have some of the highest eviction
12 rates in the city in the Bronx, residential and
13 commercial. So, if it's happening to you, it's
14 happening to your neighbor.

15 Over the past three years I've been working
16 closely with the brick and mortar businesses on the
17 corridor, hoping to reactivate the merchant
18 association, providing resources, training,
19 workshops, through SBS and other really good
20 partners.

21 And I've been meeting with the vendors at the
22 armory also providing resources, compliance training,
23 direct services, anything we can do to support them
24 which isn't much unless they have a permit or a
25 license.

2 Which is interesting because the same could be
3 said for brick and mortar businesses operating
4 without long term leases. So, I really don't
5 understand how any small business owner could be
6 opposed to these two pieces of legislation knowing
7 that the biggest threat to your business is real
8 estate speculation, not the lady selling taquitos
9 down the block. This is a human rights issue. There
10 is no need to send sanitation police in swat gear,
11 which I've seen myself to hand people a \$250 ticket.
12 We have NYC best teams that go to brick and mortar
13 businesses, we could do the same for street vendors
14 and provide permits and licenses.

15 So please, I'm in support of these two bills and
16 I thank you for your time.

17 SHAMIER SETTLE: Good afternoon members of the
18 New York City Council and Chair Menin. My name is
19 Shamier Settle and I'm a senior policy analyst at the
20 Immigration Research Initiative. I'm also a Native
21 New Yorker and a fourth generation resident of City
22 Council 9.

23 In September 2024, we published a report, Street
24 Vendors of New York. For an industry that's
25 characteristic of life in New York City, we have

2 until now known surprisingly little about the vendors
3 that provide economic activity that ignites so many
4 city streets. How many vendors work in New York
5 City? How much do they earn? What countries are
6 they from? What challenges are they facing? How old
7 are they?

8 This report for the first time gives a
9 comprehensive empirical answer to these questions.
10 The report was based on data collected from a
11 comprehensive survey that was administered to more
12 than 2,000 street vendors in 2021 by the Street
13 Vendor Project. The survey was analyzed by us at the
14 Immigration Research Initiative using statistical
15 weights that were provided by Professor Johnathan
16 Auerbach from George Masin University, so that the
17 findings and the report would represent the
18 approximately 23,000 vendors that operate throughout
19 the city.

20 So, Professor Auerbach's report said that there
21 were approximately 20,500 mobile food vendors and
22 2,400 general merchandise vendors. From that, our
23 key findings say that according to our survey
24 analysis, there are most vendors have licenses, so
25 that's 63 percent. Only one in four food vendors

2 have permits. There's a whole list of finding that
3 you can see in the report. 96 percent of vendors are
4 immigrants; 49 percent of vendors are women. Two out
5 of every three vendors lack access to a restroom
6 where they work. It was a really, really extensive
7 survey and I look forward to your questions.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Do you have
9 questions? Okay, we do not have questions but we
10 would appreciate if you could submit the written
11 testimony.

12 SHAMIER SETTLE: Yeah, will do.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you so much. Thank you
14 for your testimony today. I'm now going to call the
15 next panel. Angel Hart, Noah Sheroff, Brian McGinn,
16 and Dan Scorse. If you could please come down.
17 Thank you.

18 Wait just one second. I called four names. Uhm,
19 I just want to make sure. Okay, so Brian McGinn,
20 Noah Sheroff, Angel Hart, Dan Scorse. Okay, okay,
21 alright, please begin. Thanks.

22 DAN SCORSE: Everyone agrees that street vending
23 in New York City is broken. However, Intro. 431
24 simply doubles down on that brokenness. Street
25 vending is a private for profit business taking place

2 on public land. The city has the right to regulate
3 street vending. In fact, the city has the duty to
4 regulate it.

5 Lifting the vendor cap would be a disaster. All
6 areas with high foot traffic would be inundated with
7 vendors, choking sidewalks and local businesses. If
8 that happens, I will look forward to returning to
9 this room when just accessors propose reinstating
10 the current cap.

11 Why not test this limitless license idea in a
12 small part of the city? Perhaps in a business
13 commercial area represented by one of the bill
14 supporters. Unfortunately I doubt any City Council
15 member would sacrifice their district to test a plan
16 that's destined to fail.

17 I have 30 more seconds and your attention, so
18 please allow me to make one more point. Under city
19 law, any truck driver caught idling for over three
20 minutes is subject to a hefty fine and yet we allow
21 thousands of food vendors to run gas power generators
22 all day every day within inches of pedestrians.
23 These generators are loud, polluting and stay in the
24 sidewalks. Please fix this hypocritical loophole and
25

2 expressly prohibit street vendors from using gas
3 powered generators. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Can you just identify
5 yourself for the record because we didn't get that.

6 DAN SCORSE: Sorry, Dan Scorse, the Hudson Yards
7 Hells Kitchen Alliance.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay great, thank you.

9 NOAH SHEROFF: Good afternoon Council Members.
10 Thank you for this opportunity. My name is Noah
11 Sheroff and I represent a small business improvement
12 district in Northeast Queens, the Bayside Village
13 BID. We are located in what is often referred to as
14 a transportation desert. Two bus lines run through
15 the districts, as does the Long Island Railroad.
16 Still commercial rents are high. Some examples
17 include 13,000, 14,000 and 23,000 per month with an
18 additional 4,000 to 8,000 per month in utilities.
19 Costs that street vendors and mobile vendors do not
20 face. Currently, three food trucks operate in the
21 district. Two of them on a daily basis and one
22 weekly. An additional periodic street vendors sell
23 flowers and gifts. The BID has little ability to
24 help businesses impacted by these vendors. For food
25 trucks, the main violation is either you're parked in

2 a metered space during certain hours. A few months
3 ago, a business closed its doors after years of
4 battling the food truck selling cuisine several yards
5 from its entrance for a fraction of the cost.

6 While I understand and certainly empathize with
7 the street vendors, times are indeed tough and
8 getting tougher. I recognize that there are small
9 business owners from diverse backgrounds, including a
10 substantial Chinese and Korean business community
11 within the district already struggling to survive.

12 As one business owner stated, additional street
13 vendors would adversely impact our business at a time
14 it's already difficult to survive. This would likely
15 result in a substantial loss of jobs. I ask that you
16 please reconsider this proposal and help our brick
17 and mortar stores thrive. Thank you.

18 BRIAN MCGINN: Good afternoon ladies and
19 gentleman of the Council. My name is Brian McGinn
20 and I sit before you today on behalf of the 34th
21 Street Partnership and the Bryant Park Corporation.
22 Two business improvement districts in Midtown to
23 testify against Intro.'s 431 and 1251.

24 In the 34th Street District, which spans from 29th
25 Street to 35th Street and from Park Avenue to Tant

2 Avenue, we regularly observe license vendors
3 operating in prohibited areas and unlicensed vendors
4 working illegally.

5 Together, they pose a serious threat to
6 pedestrian safety and quality of life in public
7 spaces. These are the same vendors that operate
8 every day and they know the rules. The most common
9 complaint we hear from the property owners is that
10 the vendors throughout the storefronts and obstruct
11 the pedestrian right of way on already crowded
12 sidewalks. Even license vendors frequently ignore
13 these restrictions on when and where they're allowed
14 to operate.

15 Our security staff works hard to protect
16 pedestrians when vendors behave dangerously. In an
17 alarming incident last year, a licensed vendor
18 illegally operating in our district threatened one of
19 our security guards with a knife. We are deeply
20 concerned that expanding the number of vending
21 licenses or eliminating the cap entirely would have
22 an immediate harmful effect on pedestrian safety and
23 the quality of life in Midtown and across the city.
24 Thank you for your time.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much for your
3 testimony. Any questions? Oh yes and we've been
4 joined by Council Member Brewer.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I was here earlier.
6 Thank you. Brian, the question. I know how uhm,
7 your boss feels about this issue.

8 BRIAN MCGINN: Yeah.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: My question is, when you
10 call for 311, 911, in any case, what happens? Is it
11 no response? Because I know that you -

12 BRIAN MCGINN: So, it depends on the situation.
13 Like I said in my testimony, a lot of the vendors
14 that we have in the 34th Street Partnership, we
15 manage Harold Square. We manage Greely Square.
16 These are public parks that the partnership manages
17 and we'll get the same vendors everyday that when we
18 ask them to leave they out and out refuse to leave.
19 So, then of course, we have to call the police
20 department to take some kind of enforcement action.
21 Also, the Sanitation Department. So, we call over
22 and over 311. We have a decent relationship with
23 both agencies and this is when it gets you know
24 enforcement action is taken but it's the same vendors
25 that know the rules over and over and they refuse to

1 do it. I invite any one of you to walk 34th Street
2 with me on a nice day. There's no vending on 34th
3 Street and you'll see food cart after food cart with
4 smoke into Macy's over by the Empire State Building,
5 Madison - by Madison Square Garden. You see vendors
6 in front of the souvenir shops that call us
7 constantly every day and they're losing a fortune
8 when people have their items spread out.
9

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: But there are some legal
11 vendors in legal places that are doing the right
12 thing. Is that a correct statement?

13 BRIAN MCGINN: There are some. The ones that we
14 deal with on 34th Street are licensed vendors at an
15 illegal spot.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: In the wrong place.

17 BRIAN MCGINN: And when we ask them to move,
18 sometimes it gets a little testy and they know that
19 they're wrong and they continue to do it and you know
20 Barbara Blair in her testimony, you could give them a
21 million summonses. They could use it as wallpaper.
22 She's 100 percent right. Something needs to be done.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Alright thank you.

24 BRIAN MCGINN: Yeah.

25 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay Majority Leader Farias.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Have you folks ever
3 considered looking at concession, legal concession
4 areas versus street vending? For example, in 34th
5 Street. I mean I was there last night and I think
6 many of us that are born and raised in this city know
7 what 34th Street is like, just like 42nd and all of
8 the other major hubs where there's an arena or a
9 major institution and there will always be some level
10 of vending.

11 Have you considered looking at mandating
12 concession areas with the City of New York in those
13 zones?

14 BRIAN MCGINN: I think that would be a great
15 idea. I think if there was a spot that we could work
16 together with to say okay, this is a concession zone
17 and as long as the businesses also agree with it and
18 it's not effecting somebody's business or a
19 pedestrian right of way, I think it's a great idea.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Because I know we've
21 attempted some pilot like that in Queens right, where
22 we have an entire space designated with kiosks that
23 have concession stands and I have had conversations
24 with the Administration in our side in the Council.
25 There might be hubs in areas where even the folks

2 that are unlicensed, even though it sounds like
3 you're having problems with some of the licensed
4 people as well could purchase you know their spot and
5 their time with the concession area and it's there's
6 and it's mandated and that's where it's regulated.
7 I'd love to continue the conversation offline to see
8 how I can be helpful in that.

9 BRIAN MCGINN: Absolutely, I think it's worth
10 looking into yeah.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Thanks.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, please.

13 DAN SCORSE: Just one of the things I want to
14 mention in response to that. I think even though we
15 may have fewer vendors that would be a great idea if
16 we had the space in Queens. Unfortunately, we just
17 don't have the availability to do that. Parking is a
18 major concern for both BID visitors and merchants
19 alike. So, it's quite difficult and that tends to be
20 part of the battle unfortunately.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER FARIAS: Yeah, no, I think that's
22 totally understandable. I think the reason why I
23 bring up the example of concessions in this one space
24 versus you know attracting vending is I agree and I
25 think we all agree there isn't a one size fit all in

2 all of New York City and there are some folks that
3 are here today asking for vending to move to a
4 parking spot. My district does not want the outside
5 dining regulations and they don't want vending in the
6 parking spot either right.

7 And not every sidewalk can take it. That doesn't
8 necessarily mean that we don't look at every angle
9 that we can that fits the best community. This will
10 take an all hands approach from our side of the
11 Council but also from the Administration who might
12 just only see that we want to expand. We want to
13 look at every measure that's possible to make New
14 York City and its entrepreneurs and business owners
15 work well together and thrive and like that's the
16 goal here. And that might mean that we're looking at
17 multiple approaches.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Council Member Sanchez.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you Chair. I'm
20 now present with my Co-Chair my - I know, with
21 [INAUDIBLE 03:01:56]. First, I just want to address
22 I would sacrifice my district to have limitless
23 licenses because there already there, right and if I
24 can just get them to behave the right way that you
25 know, I think that would make a big difference.

2 With that said, I just want to you know go back
3 to my earlier point, understanding where you folks
4 stand in terms of you know lifting the caps entirely.
5 I described the amendments that we are proposing to
6 Intro. 431 regarding increasing - you're being
7 distracted Majority Leader. Regarding increasing
8 enforcement. Is there anything that you would add?
9 Same question that we asked to the last panel. Is
10 there anything beyond increasing enforcement
11 resources and then you know to your point about the
12 paper on the wall, adding escalating enforcement and
13 suspension and revocation. Is there anything else
14 you would add?

15 BRIAN MCGINN: Yeah, again, I would just say uhm,
16 continued violations - we'd have to have continued -
17 worse consequences. Uhm, like I said, the vendors
18 that we have that we have the problems with did the
19 same ones over and over and over and that would be my
20 only comment.

21 DAN SCORSE: I'm going to say that if there was a
22 way to directly speak with food truck operators, that
23 would be helpful. Just to give an example, one of
24 the issues we're facing is uhm every weekend there's
25 a food truck operator that comes and because of the

1 smoke, it's a [INAUDIBLE 03:03:36] food truck. The
2 food is fantastic admittedly but it does interfere
3 with one of the second floor tenants has really bad
4 asthma and he's been impacted by the smoke going into
5 his window and that's something that we've been going
6 back and forth with bouncing from say DSNY to NYPD to
7 Department of Health to DEP will start to get
8 involved since it's related to smoke and it's just a
9 matter of at this point, I'm not even sure where to
10 turn. It sometimes feels like we're pounding the
11 pavement and even though the agencies have been very
12 receptive and very helpful, sometimes it just feels
13 sort of like a whirlwind. Thank you.

15 NOAH SHEROFF: I think I said it in my testimony
16 but gas powered generators I think are ridiculous for
17 street vendors. I understand why they want to use
18 them. Some of them do use batteries and have backup
19 batteries. It is an option but I don't think gas
20 powered generators should be allowed and similar to
21 the smoke in the second floor window comment.

22 But I wanted to also say that the revocation of
23 permits for repeat offenders would obviously be a
24 great thing.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay thank you very much to
3 this panel. The next panel is Eliana Jaramillo,
4 Angel Flores, Jose Sanchez, and Luz Uruchima. If you
5 could please come down. Thank you.

6 Okay, please begin.

7 JOSE SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE:

8 [03:06:50]- [03:08:06].

9 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Jose
10 Sanchez. I have been a street vendor in the City of
11 New York for 12 years. I live in the Bronx and I
12 work in Westchester Avenue. I am a father of family
13 and I need to provide for my children, my business as
14 a street vendor generate employment for my community
15 and my friends and then he was - SPEAKING IN SPANISH
16 [03:08:33]- [03:08:35].

17 JOSE SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:08:37]-
18 [03:08:41].

19 INTERPRETER: And I put in God's hands and his
20 authority the decision that you will make.

21 JOSE SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:08:48]-
22 [03:08:52].

23 INTERPRETER: It's an outcry from the people that
24 we have every day so that's what we have behind.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Please silence your cell
3 phones guys, please.

4 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:12]-
5 [03:09:14].

6 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Luz
7 Uruchima.

8 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:18]-
9 [03:09:23].

10 INTERPRETER: And I've been a street vendor all
11 my life since my parents taught me how to work.

12 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:28]-
13 [03:09:32].

14 INTERPRETER: I live in Brooklyn. I work in
15 Sunset Park.

16 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:35]-
17 [03:09:37].

18 INTERPRETER: I sell general things.

19 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:39]-
20 [03:09:43].

21 INTERPRETER: And you have talked today about a
22 lot of things but the main issue here -

23 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:47].

24 INTERPRETER: Is the customer.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 164

2 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:49]-
3 [03:09:50].

4 INTERPRETER: What does the customer want?

5 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:52]-
6 [03:09:55].

7 INTERPRETER: What does the customer ask when
8 they come into a store?

9 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:09:58]-
10 [03:10:01].

11 INTERPRETER: They discriminate us as street
12 vendors on the street.

13 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:06]-
14 [03:10:10].

15 INTERPRETER: But have you asked them, the
16 customer, how they are treated by the owners of
17 businesses?

18 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:15]-
19 [03:10:17].

20 INTERPRETER: They are discriminated when they go
21 inside stores, they get discriminated.

22 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:20]-
23 [03:10:22].

24 INTERPRETER: They don't let them touch their
25 merchandise.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 165

2 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:26].

3 INTERPRETER: Not all of them, some.

4 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:28]-
5 [03:10:30].

6 INTERPRETER: But they have done this and I have
7 witnessed this.

8 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:34]-
9 [03:10:37].

10 INTERPRETER: Owners that mistreat people who
11 come in to their store to buy.

12 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:42]-
13 [03:10:48].

14 INTERPRETER: Knowing that they live from us and
15 they mistreat them, nonetheless.

16 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:53].

17 INTERPRETER: And they don't care.

18 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:10:55] -
19 [03:10:58].

20 INTERPRETER: In less than a week, the police
21 issued three tickets to me.

22 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:03] -
23 [03:11:04].

24 INTERPRETER: In less than a week.

25

2 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:06]-
3 [03:11:07].

4 INTERPRETER: Each ticket is \$1,000.

5 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:09]-
6 [03:11:15].

7 INTERPRETER: It's not even what we earn or
8 someone like you earn \$1,000.

9 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:20]-
10 [03:11:21].

11 INTERPRETER: And nobody cares.

12 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:22]-
13 [03:11:24].

14 INTERPRETER: Nobody cares but we are good
15 people.

16 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:26]-
17 [03:11:30].

18 INTERPRETER: We are honorable, responsible
19 people. We pay our taxes every year.

20 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:35]-
21 [03:11:39].

22 INTERPRETER: And all that we do is provide the
23 community a service.

24 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:42]-
25 [03:11:47].

2 INTERPRETER: Just like a doctor does, a
3 president does, a cab driver does.

4 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:50]-
5 [03:11:56].

6 INTERPRETER: We provide a service and we give to
7 the community.

8 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:11:58]-
9 [03:12:00].

10 INTERPRETER: God says make an effort, be
11 courageous.

12 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:04]-
13 [03:12:08].

14 INTERPRETER: Here, we have courageous women and
15 men representing. We are parents, mothers.

16 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:15]-
17 [03:12:18].

18 INTERPRETER: Single moms who don't have a
19 husband to support them.

20 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:21]-
21 [03:12:25].

22 INTERPRETER: We have to pay bills. We have to
23 pay rent. We have to support ourselves.

24 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:29]-
25 [03:12:30].

2 INTERPRETER: And we go to the street to provide
3 a service.

4 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:33].

5 INTERPRETER: And what does the government do?

6 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:37]-
7 [03:12:40].

8 INTERPRETER: They want to cancel us as if we
9 were criminals, which we are not.

10 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:43]-
11 [03:12:47]

12 INTERPRETER: What we do, what we serve, what we
13 manufacture.

14 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:12:51]-
15 [03:12:54].

16 INTERPRETER: We do food, we provide, we create
17 gifts and all that we do is with our heart.

18 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:13:00]-
19 [03:13:04].

20 INTERPRETER: In order to pay our bills and to
21 move our families forward with honor.

22 LUZ URUCHIMA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:13:08]-
23 [03:13:09].

24 INTERPRETER: Thank you for listening to me.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 169

2 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

3 [03:13:21]- [03:13:24].

4 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon and your excellency
5 in the audience.

6 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

7 [03:13:27] - [03:13:34].

8 INTERPRETER: My name is Eliana. I am very proud
9 to be a member and leader of [INAUDIBLE 03:13:37].

10 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

11 [03:13:39]- [03:13:42].

12 INTERPRETER: And I am a founding member of
13 Street Vendor Project.

14 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

15 [03:13:46]- [03:13:49].

16 INTERPRETER: I have lived in the city of New
17 York for 43 years.

18 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

19 [03:13:52]- [03:13:57].

20 INTERPRETER: And I have worked as a street
21 vendor for 39 years.

22 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

23 [03:14:01]- [03:14:08].

24 INTERPRETER: So, I work legally with a license
25 but I have never been able to obtain a permit.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 170

2 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

3 [03:14:13]- [03:14:16].

4 INTERPRETER: I live alone and this is how I
5 survive.

6 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

7 [03:14:19]- [03:14:23].

8 INTERPRETER: I do not have a big business or a
9 boss to protect me.

10 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

11 [03:14:26]- [03:14:30].

12 INTERPRETER: I just have my own hands and my
13 efforts.

14 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

15 [03:14:32]- [03:14:39].

16 INTERPRETER: In fact, after all these years, I
17 continue receiving summonses because I don't have a
18 permit.

19 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

20 [03:14:45]- [03:14:48].

21 INTERPRETER: The truth is that we cannot obtain
22 one.

23 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

24 [03:14:53]- [03:15:04].

25

2 INTERPRETER: So the truth is that when we go to
3 request a permit, the city tells us we have no
4 licenses for you and then they punish for not having
5 one.

6 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

7 [03:15:13]- [03:15:21].

8 INTERPRETER: This is why we are demanding that
9 the City Council approve the projects, the bills, the
10 reform bills for street vendors.

11 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

12 [03:15:30]- [03:15:38].

13 INTERPRETER: Number 431, 408, 47 and 24.

14 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

15 [03:15:42]- [03:15:50].

16 INTERPRETER: These bills would finally provide
17 street vendors a pathway to work legally and without
18 fear.

19 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

20 [03:15:56]- [03:16:02].

21 INTERPRETER: Street vending is not a job for me.

22 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

23 [03:16:04]- [03:16:06].

24 INTERPRETER: It's my independence.

2 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

3 [03:16:07]- [03:16:08].

4 INTERPRETER: It's my survival.

5 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

6 [03:16:10]- [03:16:13].

7 INTERPRETER: It gives me the power to survive on
8 my own.

9 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

10 [03:16:16]- [03:16:22].

11 INTERPRETER: With dignity after decades
12 contributing to this great city.

13 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

14 [03:16:27]- [03:16:29].

15 INTERPRETER: We do not depend on government
16 help.

17 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

18 [03:16:34]- [03:16:36].

19 INTERPRETER: We pay our taxes.

20 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

21 [03:16:37]- [03:16:40].

22 INTERPRETER: We contribute to the economy.

23 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

24 [03:16:42]- [03:16:46].

2 INTERPRETER: We want to follow the law but the
3 city will not allow us.

4 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
5 [03:16:49]- [03:16:56].

6 INTERPRETER: Every day that I go to work, I
7 carry this fear of being ticketed.

8 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
9 [03:17:00]- [03:17:02].

10 INTERPRETER: Harassed or something worse.

11 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
12 [03:17:04]- [03:17:07].

13 INTERPRETER: As an immigrant woman who works
14 alone.

15 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
16 [03:17:10]- [03:17:11].

17 INTERPRETER: This is a huge fear.

18 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
19 [03:17:13]- [03:17:15].

20 INTERPRETER: But I continue going.

21 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
22 [03:17:16]- [03:17:22].

23 INTERPRETER: While we fight for permits to
24 formalize our work.

2 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

3 [03:17:25]- [03:17:28].

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask
5 you to wrap up and you can submit the written
6 testimony.

7 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

8 [03:17:32]- [03:17:34]

9 INTERPRETER: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:17:35]-
10 [03:17:37].

11 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

12 [03:17:36]- [03:17:41].

13 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you very much.

14 INTERPRETER: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:17:44]-
15 [03:17:46].

16 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

17 ELIANA JARAMILLO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

18 [03:17:47].

19 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:17:54]-
20 [03:19:30].

21 INTERPRETER: Hello, my name is Angel and I'm an
22 active member of [INAUDIBLE 03:19:34]. Thank you for
23 the opportunity to present my testimony. I have
24 worked as a street vendor in the City of New York
25 during five years of the pandemic forced me to do it.

2 I live in the Bronx and I work in different areas of
3 the city trying to support myself in an honest way.

4 I am here to ask the Council to please approve
5 the reform package for street vendors projects 431,
6 408, 47, and 24. We need these to be approved in
7 order to work without fear and with dignity. Street
8 vendors contribute to New York City's economy paying
9 taxes and business and personal taxes. We work hard
10 but even though we don't receive any type of
11 reimbursement.

12 An example of this is this check of \$0.01 that I
13 got sent. It's a reminder of the little that we
14 received in exchange for our contributions. Street
15 vending is the only source of income for me and my
16 family. It's not just a job, it's how we survive.
17 It's my survival. It's how I put food on the table
18 for my family and I'm not asking for charity. I am
19 asking for the right to work legally.

20 These reforms are very important for me because
21 they would give us a security to do our job without a
22 constant fear. Every day I have fear of being
23 ticketed or arrested, just because I'm trying to
24 support myself.

2 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:20:50]-
3 [03:22:11].

4 INTERPRETER: The Health Department tells us to
5 get a license and when we apply, they tell us they
6 can't give us one. This is the cruel cycle and they
7 make us jump through hoops and then they close the
8 door on us. We live in fear, especially during the
9 Trump Administration. At any moment we could be
10 arrested for a violation we can't avoid and that
11 charge has the potential to impact our immigration
12 status. The fear is heavy on our hearts every single
13 day. We want to comply with the regulations but the
14 city won't allow us to obtain the permits and
15 licenses that we need. We're trying to do the right
16 thing but we're trapped by a system that refuses to
17 help us.

18 Street vendors don't qualify for government
19 programs. We are self-sufficient. We're not asking
20 for handouts, we just want the ability to work
21 without fear to support our families and to
22 contribute to the city that we so much love. The
23 passage of these laws would bring order to our
24 streets, our neighborhoods and our communities but
25

2 most importantly, it would allow us to work with
3 dignity as we have always tried to.

4 I'm asking the City Council to pass these street
5 vendor reform bills now, so that we can finally work
6 with a permit and without fear. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions?
8 No, oh yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
10 [03:23:26]- [03:23:37].

11 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:23:40].

12 INTERPRETER: \$1,000.

13 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:23:41]-
14 [03:23:49].

15 INTERPRETER: And if you go the next day then
16 it's \$1,000 every day.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: [03:23:54]- [03:23:58].

18 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:23:59]-
19 [03:24:09].

20 INTERPRETER: So just like the panel before
21 earlier today said there's organizations that work
22 for small businesses.

23 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:24:16]-
24 [03:24:24].

2 INTERPRETER: So these small businesses have a
3 representative and they call the police every time
4 you show up.

5 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:24:29]-
6 [03:24:37].

7 INTERPRETER: So, I feel a lot of anger because
8 personally they harass me a lot.

9 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:24:41]-
10 [03:24:48].

11 INTERPRETER: So, I've been arrested and in the
12 last year, they've called the police on me every
13 single day and I've gotten so many tickets.

14 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:24:56]-
15 [03:24:57].

16 INTERPRETER: So what should I do stay home?-

17 ANGEL FLORES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:24:59]-
18 [03:25:02].

19 INTERPRETER: Or steal? We don't know how to
20 steal. We keep working honorably or with honesty
21 every day.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Gracias. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you to the
24 panel. Thank you very much. I'm now going to call
25 the next panel.

2 INTERPRETER: SPEAKING IN OTHER LANGUAGE

3 [03:25:22]- [03:25:33].

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Thank you
5 very much. Thank you. Lisa Soren, Jessica Walker,
6 Betsy Mark, and Pedro Goico if you could please come
7 down. Thank you.

8 Okay please begin. Thank you.

9 PEDRO GOICO: Good afternoon SPEAKING IN SPANISH
10 [03:26:11]. My name is Pedro Goico. I'm currently
11 the National Supermarket Association Treasurer but at
12 the same time, I'm an immigrant from the Dominican
13 Republic that came here 14 years old with my mom
14 looking for a better future like everybody else that
15 has spoken here.

16 In that time, my first job coming out of high
17 school was in a supermarket. I was bagging bags and
18 then I made my way over to the supermarket and I can
19 be so thankful of the owners of the supermarket. But
20 thanks to them, 25 years ago given the location of
21 the supermarket, today, I can say I proudly own three
22 supermarkets.

23 So, what I want to say today here is and I've
24 spoken Pierina about this. I have met - impression
25 with the street vending and Mohamed. I think we have

2 all the same solutions. We know the solutions. It
3 is give them licenses in a very responsible matter,
4 right? Because we just can't lift the ban and that's
5 it. We have to see how things go for at least a year
6 or two. Once that happen right, we have to also
7 understand the enforcement have to be done. Just
8 like Pierina said, my mom told me many times, if you
9 open that door, your going to hit. If I opened it, I
10 got hit and I learned. I learned that to open that
11 door is not the right thing to do but there's are
12 rules and regulations that your cancel here passed
13 and not to be respected.

14 In reference to a gentleman I'll say it in
15 Spanish SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:27:28]- [03:27:32].
16 I think he's very lucky to receive that penny check
17 because as a business of brick and mortar, I haven't
18 received one of those in a long time. SPEAKING IN
19 SPANISH [03:27:39]- [03:27:56], right? So, I'm
20 [INAUDIBLE 03:27:58] for getting those \$1,000 tickets
21 that she's getting because me as an owner, I just got
22 a ticket for \$6,500 because my temperature was under
23 36 degrees in one of my refrigerators.

24 So, I understand what's getting a ticket as well.
25 What I'm telling you here is go ahead and I'm sorry

2 if you give me a few minutes, as you give them
3 because of the translation just like 30 seconds more
4 but if you can please you know do this. This is a
5 time that whatever you guys do, it will be like for
6 the history. There will be people here sitting here
7 15, 20 years from now in your desk talking about what
8 happened here today. So, let's be responsible about
9 that and let everybody understand give them the
10 license but let's do it fair. This is not about
11 being petty about somebody. It's about being fair
12 for everybody.

13 Thank you and I hope that you guys make the right
14 decision and that's on the lease. That report from
15 the Independent Business from the city, that's a very
16 bias report. The same way they're going to make \$70
17 million for the city. The same way we're going to
18 lose 50 million brick and mortar. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Okay, thank you.
20 Just put the red button on. Just press the button
21 until it's red.

22 BETSY MAK: I'm Betsy Mak, I'm the Vice Chair of
23 Community Board 7 in Queens. CB7 is strongly opposed
24 to this new proposal. Our board received numerous
25 complaints about illegal vending in downtown

2 Flushing. The complaints include not only block
3 sidewalk, pedestrian congestion and huge amount of
4 garbage left behind but most dangerously the
5 unsanitary food from unknown sources.

6 According to our NYPD Sergeant Hodge, who leads a
7 six officer enforcement team from the 109 Precinct,
8 he coordinates with the Department of Sanitation for
9 a once a week operation, enforcement operation. No
10 matter how many merchandise or food is confiscated,
11 the vendors return shortly after every enforcement.

12 Six officers assigned seems like a sufficient
13 number, however his team has to cover elsewhere when
14 any 109 Precinct Officers are on vacation and when
15 there are parades.

16 The once a week enforcement often get canceled.
17 Just in April 2025, only one enforcement operation
18 actually took place. An additional following
19 operation Restore Roosevelt, which lasted for three
20 months with continuous enforcement effort in
21 neighboring Corona and Jackson Heights. Many vendors
22 from there moved the operation to downtown flushing.

23 In the meantime, the city tested this bill as a
24 pilot by issuing more of the license at Corona Plaza.
25 When I passed by, there were no illegal vendors on

2 the plaza and only few legal food trucks, because
3 there were continuous police presence and a police
4 mobile commence center truck at the plaza. So, the
5 cost of the illegal vending problems is the lack of
6 enforcement. Increasing vendor licenses would -

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask
8 you to wrap up and then submit the written testimony.

9 BETSY MAK: Increasing vendor licenses will
10 require even more resources for enforcement. The
11 solution is not to issue more licenses. The solution
12 is to have constant enforcement. We need to see the
13 illegal vendor situation under control now before
14 even talking about more licenses.

15 CB7 is strongly opposed to this proposal.

16 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you.

17 LISA SOREN: Sorry about that. Good afternoon
18 Chair Menin and esteemed members of City Council. My
19 name is Lisa Soren, President of the Bronx Chamber of
20 Commerce representing thousands of small businesses
21 across the borough and the city. We support licensed
22 permitted street vending as part of New York City's
23 vibrant, small, business ecosystem. However, Intro.
24 431 seeks to expand street vendor licenses and
25 permits while failing to address a deeply rooted

2 issue, the unchecked proliferation of illegal street
3 vending.

4 Today, more than 23,000 unlicensed street vendors
5 operate citywide, many without health inspections,
6 safety oversight or adherence to location
7 restrictions. This undermines licensed vendors and
8 puts our brick and mortar business who pay high rents
9 and taxes, employ residents and follow strict rules
10 and regulations at a competitive disadvantage.

11 If not handled appropriately, this will result in
12 a continuation of shuttered storefronts, declining
13 retail corridors and diminish community investment.
14 We strongly oppose any consideration of uncapping the
15 number of street license vendors as this would
16 negatively impact the retail and restaurant
17 businesses in New York City. We have grave concern
18 as it stands now, city agencies do not have the
19 capacity or resources to enforce its existing laws.
20 Without a real enforcement plan, increasing street
21 vendor licenses now risk further weakening compliance
22 and worsening street level conditions. Especially in
23 underserved areas like the Bronx where sidewalks are
24 already overcrowded and quality of life concerns are
25 mounting.

2 City agencies have already demonstrated that they
3 have been unable to implement the components of Local
4 Law 18 passed in 2021. Therefore the Bronx Chamber
5 respectfully urges the Council to pause legislation
6 that further expands street vendor licenses until
7 there is a comprehensive and fully resourced
8 enforcement strategy in place.

9 Let's get enforcement right first so all
10 businesses, vendors, and residents can thrive in a
11 fair and safe commercial environment. Thank you for
12 your leadership and opportunity to testify today.

13 JESSICA WALKER: I'm Jessica Walker. I'm the
14 President and CEO of the Manhattan Chamber of
15 Commerce. We represent the 125,000 businesses across
16 Manhattan, both large and small. New York absolutely
17 needs a vibrant food truck and street vendor scene
18 and we support them.

19 The citywide small business resource network that
20 we operate with the other four borough wide chambers
21 of commerce with funding from the City Council can
22 provide free help to any business in the city with
23 fewer than 100 employees, including street vendors
24 and food trucks and we are here to help.

2 We support the decriminalization of street
3 vending but completely lifting the permit cap before
4 solving the problems with the current system makes no
5 sense. Let's solve the problem. The problem is
6 about where and how. Vendors have to be in a proper
7 location and operating safely. So, let's solve the
8 problem. Start by working with BIDs and community
9 boards to identify the places where vendors can
10 operate legally without being disruptive. Create an
11 inventory of available spaces and then designate the
12 proper times and uses for each space so there is
13 never unfair competition with the brick and mortar.

14 The number of spaces would be linked to the
15 number of permits issued by the city, which makes
16 sense. Then each vending slot operates like a
17 parking space that individual permitted vendors can
18 reserve through an online portal on a daily, weekly,
19 monthly, or annual basis and you know whatever the
20 city deems is best and fairest.

21 Then the vendor can use that space freely. Such
22 a system would be largely self-enforcing because if
23 you show up someone is taking the space you reserved,
24 you can usually shoo them away without incident.

2 This is only one possibility. My main point here
3 is that there is a compromise here that supports all
4 businesses, all businesses. We don't need to fight
5 over crumbs. Simply lifting the cap does not get us
6 there. So, let's get there. I think we're all
7 committed to working with you to do that. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Just thank you. Thank
10 you for the good suggestions, I really appreciate it.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Alright,
12 I'm going call the next panel Vladimir Choli(SP?),
13 Nick Aquino, Dylan Dellisanti, Balanda Joachim, and
14 Nishat Tabassum.

15 Okay, please begin.

16 NICK AQUINO: Good afternoon. My name is
17 Nick Aquino, and I am a Staff Attorney with the
18 Microenterprise Project at Volunteers of Legal
19 Service. We help small business owners access free
20 legal services in New York City. Providing street
21 vendors the path to legal compliance it often
22 impossible, not because they refuse to comply but
23 because the current permitting system is broken.
24 When clients come to us for help, in nearly every
25

2 case, we must tell clients that they simply cannot
3 legally vend.

4 One of our clients, a disabled veteran in his
5 60's has been on the waiting list for years.
6 Although veterans are supposed to have some
7 preference, the reality is that even with this
8 benefit he has been unable to secure a permit to run
9 his food cart and unfortunately his story is not
10 unique. We urge the Council to pass Intro. 431,
11 which addresses this inequity by expanding access to
12 permits and ending arbitrary caps that keep thousands
13 of vendors in legal limbo.

14 This bill would bring much needed order and
15 fairness to the system but access alone is not
16 enough. Even when rare opportunities to apply for
17 licenses arise, vendors frequently lack the support
18 to successfully complete the process. One of my
19 clients after years on the waitlist was finally given
20 the chance to apply but due to a minor
21 misunderstanding in the application process, he was
22 denied and pushed back to the line again. That is
23 why Intro. 408 is equally critical. It would create
24 an office of street vendor services within SBS to
25 provide vital education, outreach and compliance

2 support with proper training and resources, vendors
3 can be fully integrated into the city's small
4 business ecosystem.

5 Thank you for the opportunity to submit this
6 testimony on behalf of myself and Volunteers of Legal
7 Service. We urge the Council to pass Intro. 408, and
8 431 to create a fair, supportive and inclusive system
9 for street vendors across New York City. Thank you.

10 BALANDA JOACHIM: Thank you Committee Chair Julie
11 Menin and members of the Committee on Consumer and
12 Worker Protection for the opportunity to testify
13 today in support of Intro. 408 and Intro. 431. My
14 name is Balanda Joachim; I'm a campaign organizer at
15 the Association for Neighborhood and Housing
16 Development. I am here today on behalf of the United
17 for Small Businesses of New York City Coalition. A
18 community organization across New York City committed
19 to protecting small businesses and nonresidential
20 tenants from the threat of displacement.
21 Particularly owner operated, low income and BIPOC run
22 businesses that serve our city's low income
23 neighborhoods and communities of color.

24 Small businesses are cornerstones of our city and
25 neighborhoods. They provide jobs, culturally

2 relevant goods and services and community keeping our
3 neighborhood thriving and vibrant places to live.

4 Our coalition supports some of the most iconic BIPOC
5 and immigrant business corridors in the city. From
6 Jackson Heights to the lower east side and the Bronx.
7 And our coalition members work directly with both
8 brick and mortar businesses and street vendors.

9 The passage of Intro. 408 would be crucial too
10 for organizers conducting outreach and supporting
11 vendors with their merchant associations. Creating a
12 dedicated street vendor division within SBS would
13 ensure the street vendors who are often integral
14 parts of local commercial ecosystems receive the
15 resources education support they need to operate
16 safety and in compliance with regulations.

17 However, the effectiveness of this division
18 depends on street vendors having proper access to
19 permits and licenses. Currently the cap on permits
20 continues to push vendors into informal markets and
21 exposes them to punitive enforcement and
22 displacement. This not only harms vendors but also
23 negatively impacts foot traffic and economic vitality
24 of nearby brick and mortar businesses. The passage
25 of Intro. 431, which would lift the caps on vendor

2 permits, is essential. By ensuring proper legal
3 access to permits, we empower vendors and allow USV
4 NYC and its partners to more effectively support them
5 as vital members of our city's commercial and
6 cultural entity.

7 DYLAN DELLISANTI: Hi there, my name is Dylan
8 Dellisanti. I am an economist at the Institute for
9 Justice. We're a public interest law firm that
10 defends the rights of Americans everywhere to earn an
11 honest living.

12 Over the last 10, 15 years, we've done a great
13 deal of research looking into the safety of street
14 vending food and the contribution that street vendors
15 makes to the local economy. And I wanted to call
16 attention to a study that was published about three
17 years ago that looked into this question of whether
18 or not street vendors took away stole business from
19 brick and mortar counterparts. And what we found is
20 that as there is an increase in mobile food vendors,
21 there was no subsequent decrease in brick and mortar
22 establishments.

23 This might seem a little counter intuitive but if
24 you think about it, street vendors, brick and mortar
25 businesses are selling two different types of goods,

2 right? If you want a Michelin dining experience, you
3 probably want to go to somewhere with an air
4 conditioning. If you want something more affordable,
5 a street vendor might make more sense for you.

6 It's also more important to recognize that street
7 vendors themselves if they are empowered
8 economically, they have money to spend that goes back
9 into local economy and street vendors are of course,
10 are going to choose to locate in places that are more
11 complimentary to their business. The book seller who
12 spoke earlier mentioned that he didn't feel like the
13 street vendor is distracted from their business, they
14 probably added to the vitality of the neighborhood by
15 offering a complimentary product.

16 And I'd like to call attention to another way in
17 which street vendors and brick and mortars have a
18 symbiotic relationship. Street vending is selling of
19 a pipeline into greater economic opportunity. I
20 think everybody in New York is probably familiar with
21 Nathan's Hot Dogs, which started in Coney Island
22 selling you know hot dogs from a push cart.
23 Basically every person in this room wearing the
24 yellow cap, every street vendor here who came in
25 today has this sort of unbounded economic potential

2 that we will not be able to recognize unless we lift
3 the caps. So, for that reason, we support Intro.
4 431. Thank you.

5 NISHAT TABASSUM: Hi, good afternoon. My name is
6 Nishat Tabassum and I'm sharing this testimony on
7 behalf of Make the Road and Daniel Coates who is the
8 Director of Public Affairs.

9 On behalf of 28,000 members, I thank the
10 Committee for the opportunity to testify. Make the
11 Road works to build the power of immigrant and
12 working class New Yorkers who reaches thousands of
13 New Yorkers per year with our legal and survival
14 service including legal services and outreach for low
15 wage workers.

16 Thank you for the opportunity to testify. I
17 wanted to thank Council Member Sanchez for her
18 leadership on these bills, as well as Majority Leader
19 Farias, Council Member Krishnan, Council Member Menin
20 and Speaker Adams for moving this issue forward.

21 The issues that plague street vendors today are
22 not new and much has been done over the years to
23 attempt to address the problem of licenses and
24 compliance but there are some common sense solutions
25

2 that are within our grasp if we can take advantage of
3 the progress that has been made.

4 Like immigration reform at the federal level, we
5 live in a situation where all sides agree that the
6 system we have is broken and like immigration reform,
7 there is a consensus in the middle about steps that
8 can be taken to recognize the reality that there will
9 always be street vendors and basic dignity that
10 vendors deserve, respect and support as entrepreneurs
11 trying to support their families.

12 The trick is always - as can be is the
13 legislative needle that needs to be threaded to find
14 a compromise that everyone can live with. In this
15 case, it seems that we have arrived at one. I want
16 recognize the Street Vendor Project for their amazing
17 leadership on this bill and also commend that brick
18 and mortar's and business associations who are the
19 table working through the thorny details.

20 The status quo does not work. It is chaotic and
21 vendors, despite being one of the city's more
22 vulnerable populations are heavily overpoliced in a
23 moment when immigrant communities are under
24 relentless attacks.

2 Many of Make the Roads members are vendors and
3 you heard from some of them today and we agree with
4 the Street Vendor Project when we say that a
5 predictable well-regulated system that prioritizes
6 education over punitive action is one that everyone
7 can support. These are the kinds of problems that we
8 need legislative bodies to address. Legislators are
9 meant to take clear problems, understand them and
10 develop policies and solutions.

11 We understand that after meeting with a range of
12 stakeholders, Council Member Sanchez has proposed a
13 thoughtful set of amendments to the bill that would
14 add common sense enforcement provisions. We urge
15 Speaker Adams to include these amendments as the bill
16 moves forward after this hearing. The nature of
17 legislating is compromised and I think we have that
18 here. Under this Speaker, there have been many
19 conversations and we have bills here that while
20 certainly not perfect for either side, get the core
21 components done. We can still tackle hard things in
22 New York. It might seem like we're far from the end
23 but we are close. Vendors are apart of New York
24 City's lifeblood and the truth is that they will be
25 whether we pass this legislation or not.

2 So, let's do it. Let's update our rules, create
3 a system that fits the current moment and show the
4 rest of the country that New York City supports
5 immigrant entrepreneurs in a moment when so much is
6 stacked against them. Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions?
8 No, okay thank you to this panel. I'm now going to
9 call the next panel Leidys Bueno, Lilia Gomez,
10 Salvador Quintuna, Juliana Salas, and Jimmy Hernandez.
11 If you could please come down.

12 Leidys Bueno here? Yes, okay, great thank you.

13 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:47:40]-
14 [03:48:01].

15 INTERPRETER: Okay one moment. Good afternoon.
16 My name is Lilia Gomez.

17 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:12]-
18 [03:48:17].

19 INTERPRETER: Before street vendors would
20 obstruct sidewalk.

21 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:20]-
22 [03:48:22].

23 INTERPRETER: It used to be restaurants that
24 obstructed the sidewalks.

2 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:26]-
3 [03:48:28].

4 INTERPRETER: When the pandemic started -

5 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:29]-
6 [03:48:31].

7 INTERPRETER: They built a sheds

8 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:32]

9 INTERPRETER: Outside on the sidewalks.

10 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:35]-
11 [03:48:47]

12 INTERPRETER: So, after those sheds, after that
13 was denied, they continued working on the sheds and
14 no tickets were issued.

15 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:48:57]-
16 [03:49:02].

17 INTERPRETER: It's not true that when the police
18 ask us to leave, we don't leave.

19 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:13]-
20 [03:49:18].

21 INTERPRETER: The majority are immigrants and
22 we're all under terror because of the police.

23 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:24]-
24 [03:49:26].

25 INTERPRETER: So, immediately we leave.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 198

2 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:27]-
3 [03:49:32].

4 INTERPRETER: Because besides being terrified and
5 harassed by the police -

6 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:38]-
7 [03:49:43].

8 INTERPRETER: Nowadays we're also in terrible
9 fear because of ICE.

10 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:48]-
11 [03:49:54].

12 INTERPRETER: I've been a street vendor in New
13 York for two years.

14 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:49:56]-
15 [03:49:58].

16 INTERPRETER: In Brooklyn and Sunset Park.

17 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:00]-
18 [03:50:03].

19 INTERPRETER: So, selling on the streets is my
20 only job.

21 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:06]-
22 [03:50:09].

23 INTERPRETER: I'm a single mom to a 16 year old
24 boy.

25

2 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:12]-
3 [03:50:14].

4 INTERPRETER: And a 15 year old daughter.

5 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:16]-
6 [03:50:20].

7 INTERPRETER: I ask that they let me work so that
8 I can buy my food.

9 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:24]-
10 [03:50:26].

11 INTERPRETER: Pay the rent, which is very high.

12 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:28]-
13 [03:50:33].

14 INTERPRETER: Okay, I don't have a license to be
15 street vendor because they're not available and if
16 they were available, I would have already requested
17 one.

18 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:47]-
19 [03:50:49].

20 INTERPRETER: I felt so harassed by police.

21 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:50:52]-
22 [03:50:59].

23 INTERPRETER: One time when I was working, they
24 approached me in a very aggressive way.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 200

2 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:03]-
3 [03:51:06].

4 INTERPRETER: They asked for my license and when
5 they saw that I didn't have one -

6 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:10]-
7 [03:51:14].

8 INTERPRETER: They said if you don't leave in an
9 hour, we are going to issue a ticket. Sorry, if you
10 don't leave in a half hour - we will issue you a
11 ticket.

12 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:23]-
13 [03:51:27].

14 INTERPRETER: So, I want you to leave now.

15 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:29]-
16 [03:51:32].

17 INTERPRETER: And when they left, I started
18 crying.

19 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:34]-
20 [03:51:37].

21 INTERPRETER: Because I was thinking, how am I
22 going to pay my rent now?

23 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:40]-
24 [03:51:45].

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 201

2 INTERPRETER: And so that month, I was unable to
3 pay my rent because I couldn't continue working.

4 LILIA GOMEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:50].

5 INTERPRETER: Thank you.

6 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:51:58]-
7 [03:52:01].

8 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Juliana
9 Salas.

10 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:05]-
11 [03:52:09].

12 INTERPRETER: I've been a street vendor in New
13 York City for three years.

14 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:15]-
15 [03:52:18].

16 INTERPRETER: My county is Brooklyn and Sunset
17 Park.

18 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:21]-
19 [03:52:28].

20 INTERPRETER: And I'm here to ask the Council to
21 please approve the reform packet for street vendors.

22 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:33]-
23 [03:52:40].

24 INTERPRETER: So to please pass 431, 408, 47 and
25 24.

2 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:46]-
3 [03:52:49].

4 INTERPRETER: These reforms are so important for
5 me.

6 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:52:52]-
7 [03:52:57].

8 INTERPRETER: Because then I could be a vendor
9 without being intimidated by the police and being
10 under terror.

11 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:53:02]-
12 [03:53:07].

13 INTERPRETER: Just like my colleagues said, we
14 have been continuously intimidated.

15 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:53:11]-
16 [03:53:18].

17 INTERPRETER: And if we had these permits, we
18 wouldn't have to undergo these harassments by the
19 police.

20 JULIANA SALAS: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:53:23]-
21 [03:53:25].

22 INTERPRETER: Thank you for listening to me.

23 SALVADOR QUINTANA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
24 [03:53:35]- [03:53:43].
25

2 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is
3 Salvador Quintuna and I've been a street vendor in
4 the City of New York for three years.

5 SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
6 [03:53:49]- [03:53:56].

7 INTERPRETER: I live in Brooklyn and I work in
8 Sunset Park on 51st Street and 5th Avenue.

9 SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
10 [03:54:02]- [03:54:09].

11 INTERPRETER: I am here to ask the City Council
12 to please approve the reform packages for street
13 vendors.

14 SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
15 [03:54:16]- [03:54:22].

16 INTERPRETER: Proposals 431, 408, 47 and 24.

17 SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
18 [03:54:26]- [03:54:33].

19 INTERPRETER: These reforms are very important
20 for us because we want to be supported by these laws.

21 SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
22 [03:54:39]- [03:54:41].

23 INTERPRETER: We need to work legally.

24 SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
25 [03:54:43]- [03:54:46].

2 INTERPRETER: In order to be able to bring food
3 to our families.

4 SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
5 [03:54:48]- [03:54:49].

6 INTERPRETER: And also be able to pay rent.

7 SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
8 [03:54:52]- [03:54:54].

9 INTERPRETER: Thank you for receiving us in this
10 hearing.

11 SALVADOR QUINTUNA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
12 [03:54:57]- [03:54:59].

13 INTERPRETER: May God enlighten you and thank you
14 very much.

15 LEIDY BUENO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:55:08]-
16 [03:55:11].

17 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon, my name is Leidy
18 Bueno.

19 LEIDY BUENO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [03:55:13]-
20 [03:55:29].

21 INTERPRETER: Okay, I support Laws 431, 408, 47
22 and 24 for all the street vendors. We deserve
23 permits and licenses. Thank you very much and have a
24 blessed day.

2 JIMMY HERNANDEZ: Good afternoon. My name is
3 Jimmy Hernandez. I am a 26 year old young adult and
4 I currently do not have a job and I do not have the
5 money or the income to put a store and to sell the
6 products I buy online or to rent a retail location to
7 sell the products I buy online and I love to vend, I
8 really do. The reason I like to vend is because I do
9 not want to spend the rest of my life working for
10 someone else.

11 I'd rather work for my dreams and work for
12 myself. In Bryant Beach, I want the street vendor
13 packets reform Intro. 431, 408, 47, 24. The problem
14 is there are no more licenses available. I am not a
15 veteran. I am not a spouse of a surviving veteran,
16 so I do not qualify for a veterans general vendors
17 license but I really need it so I can sell my
18 merchandise, such as toothpaste, mouthwash,
19 toothbrushes, deodorants, or fabric bleach, laundry
20 detergent, household stuff, that good stuff.

21 I ask you Chair to pass the Street Vendors
22 Package Reform. I cannot continue to pay tickets for
23 just setting up a small table with essential
24 household goods and hygiene goods. I want to thank
25

2 everyone for their time. Please, that's all I'm
3 asking for.

4 I recently gotten like tickets, so \$250 last
5 week, last Monday so I'm scared to go out into the
6 street and try to promote, sell, offer my products
7 because I cannot be constantly getting these tickets.

8 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm sorry, your time is
9 up so if you want to submit any written testimony,
10 please feel free to do so. Thank you so much.

11 JIMMY HERNANDEZ: Okay, alright.

12 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay thank you.

13 JIMMY HERNANDEZ: It's done?

14 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, thank you very much.

15 JIMMY HERNANDEZ: Already?

16 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes, yes, thank you.

17 JIMMY HERNANDEZ: Okay.

18 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

19 [03:58:05]- [03:58:23].

20 INTERPRETER: Okay, good afternoon. My name is
21 Elsa Saraceniago and I've lived in the State of New
22 York for 20 years.

23 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

24 [03:58:36]- [03:58:41].

2 INTERPRETER: I live in the county of Brooklyn in
3 Sunset Park, I'm a street vendor.

4 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
5 [03:58:45]- [03:58:51].

6 INTERPRETER: So, I've been a vendor for 18 years
7 and at the same time, I became an alternative
8 therapist.

9 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
10 [03:58:56]- [03:59:00].

11 INTERPRETER: I live - I sell [INAUDIBLE
12 [03:59:02]- [03:59:06].

13 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
14 [03:59:06]- [03:59:09].

15 INTERPRETER: That are used during therapy.

16 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
17 [03:59:12]- [03:59:15].

18 INTERPRETER: In order to be able to take care of
19 a lot of street vendors.

20 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
21 [03:59:19]- [03:59:26].

22 INTERPRETER: In the spaces that bosses you and
23 has provided for us.

24 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
25 [03:59:32]- [03:59:35].

2 INTERPRETER: And we use this in order to calm
3 their ails, their pain.

4 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
5 [03:59:40]- [03:59:47].

6 INTERPRETER: And also to be able to reduce the
7 stress, the depression and the anxiety.

8 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
9 [03:59:51]- [03:59:53].

10 INTERPRETER: That has been caused by the
11 mistreatment.

12 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
13 [03:59:55]- [04:00:02].

14 INTERPRETER: To calm down the anxiety, the
15 depression, and the stress caused by all the arrests
16 performed by the police, the New York Police.

17 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
18 [04:00:09]- [04:00:21].

19 INTERPRETER: I am here to ask the City Council
20 to please approve 408, 431, 47, and 24.

21 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
22 [04:00:28]- [04:00:34].

23 INTERPRETER: So that these laws can be approved
24 and defend the rights of street vendors.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 209

2 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

3 [04:00:38]- [04:00:41].

4 INTERPRETER: Because we've all been paying our
5 taxes to this country.

6 ELSA SARACENIEGO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

7 [04:00:44].

8 INTERPRETER: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions?
10 Yes.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: I just want to say thank
12 you to everyone including this panel for sharing your
13 stories, it's so important. So, SPEAKING IN SPANISH
14 [04:00:59]- [04:01:05].

15 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you to the panel.
16 Thank you. Okay, I'm going to call the next panel.
17 Maryam Shuaib, Brenda Irizarry, Pamela Franco Larg,
18 Joshua Boom, Calvin Harrison.

19 Okay, uhm, oh okay so just give a minute to the
20 last person is here. Okay. Yeah, just one second.
21 Okay sorry, some of the handwriting was difficult to
22 read so I apologize if I mispronounced someone's
23 name. I did call Brenda Irizarry. You're Brenda?
24 Okay, wonderful. Okay please begin.

25

2 MARYAM SHUAIB: Hello everyone. Thank you so
3 much for your time and for hearing my testimony. My
4 name is Maryam; I'm a representative of the Council
5 on American Islamic Relations of New York and our
6 work extends to protecting Muslims everywhere.

7 Street vendors are a cornerstone of New York City
8 emblematic of their rich culture and diversity that
9 is the foundation of the city that we love. In fact,
10 the iconic chicken over rice meal originated from
11 Halal food vendors just like the ones down the street
12 who wanted to give cab drivers an accessible halal
13 food option.

14 The number of available permits is way too low
15 which subjects people to over policing and risking
16 their economic security. The current cap on permits
17 for street vendors is unrealistic and currently does
18 not justify the over policing of street vendors.
19 Over 10,000 street vendors await their turn in a
20 dysfunctional system that is impractical and
21 inaccessible at best. As a result, New York City has
22 issued over 10,000 tickets to street vendors,
23 confiscated over 800,000 pounds of food with DSNY
24 issuing over 400 summonses in Corona, East Elmhurst
25 and Jackson Heights in the last year alone. Most of

2 these tickets confiscations and summonses were issued
3 because of the absence of a permit.

4 In the words Mohammed Ali, who has the right to
5 have rights? Is it the Muslim street vendor who was
6 issued a \$250 ticket for not having a permit? Or is
7 it the officer who raided his table in Jackson
8 Heights just mere days before the start of [INAUDIBLE
9 04:03:55] as they sold prayer mats and copies of the
10 [INAUDIBLE 04:03:57]. What about the 14 year old
11 girl standing by her mother on a hot summers day? No
12 permit was all it took for an NYC Parks Patrol
13 Officer to handcuff a street vendor before wrestling
14 her 14 year old daughter to the ground. The current
15 permit system excludes those who need it most. Your
16 support of Intro. 408 and 431 can change this
17 unsustainable dynamic. Intro. 431 would ensure
18 regulatory compliance of all mobile food and
19 merchandize, which would create sustainable, economic
20 opportunity for the city's smallest and mightiest
21 businesses.

22 Intro. 408 would create an in office of street
23 vendor services within SBS ensuring that street
24 vendors -

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask
3 you to wrap up and then you can submit your written
4 testimony.

5 MARYAM SHUAIB: Right and outreach to support
6 businesses and thank you so much and I hope that you
7 all vote in support of both resolutions. Thank you.

8 PAMELA FRANCO LARG: Good afternoon. Thank you
9 Chair Menin and members of the Consumer and Worker
10 Protection Committee for the opportunity to testify
11 in supports of Intro. 431 and 408. My name is Pamela
12 Franco Larg and I'm a Learn and Earn Student from
13 Franklin Delano Roosevelt High School as part of the
14 Chinese American Planning Council. Both my mother
15 and father are street vendors and I carry this truth
16 not with same but with unwavering pride. My father
17 who cannot read or write and my mother whose English
18 is limited and their daily acts of quite cruelty over
19 discrimination as they try to make a living and
20 support my family.

21 I stand here today, not just as a first
22 generation child of Mexican parents but as an
23 embodiment of their sacrifices as they made in order
24 to provide me with a better future. Intro.'s 431 and
25 408 do not merely represent policy changes, they

2 bring recognition to the lives that have long existed
3 within these margins.

4 If enacted fully these reforms would lift a veil
5 of anxiety that shadows every work day for my parents
6 and many others.

7 Intro.'s 431 expand access to vending permits,
8 offering legitimacy as well as adjusted or belonging
9 to those who have felt alienated due to harmful
10 stereotypes. In addition, Intro. 408 focuses on
11 shifting oversight away from law enforcement.

12 Transferring responsibility to a dedicated agency
13 that understands the complexities of street vending.
14 This replaces intimidation with understanding and
15 punishment with guidance. These actions acknowledge
16 the struggles of those who work tirelessly to
17 survive. Treated not as criminals but as workers
18 with their own stories deserving respect and
19 protection. An actual right many take for granted.

20 Thank you for accepting my testimony today. I
21 urge the City Council to take crucial steps of
22 passing Intro.'s 431 and 408 as part of the Street
23 Vendor Reform package. I speak not only for myself
24 but for my parents, whose strength is a reminder that
25

2 dignity, respect and projection should never be
3 privileges but rights.

4 BRENDA IRIZARRY: Good afternoon City Council
5 Committee Members and the audience. My name is
6 Brenda Irizarry. I live in the Norwood section of
7 the Bronx. I am a member of the Northwest Bronx
8 Community and Clergy Coalition.

9 As a coalition and community member, I urge the
10 Committee to support Intro. 431 and Intro. 408, which
11 is part of the street vendors reform package. Street
12 vendors play a vital role in our economy. They
13 provide goods and services to our neighborhoods.
14 They contribute to our city's tax base. Most of all,
15 street vending is a gateway for immigrants, people of
16 color and veterans to operate their own businesses.

17 The need for reform is imperative. Vendors that
18 aren't licensed or don't have permits face fines and
19 harassment. The process to obtain a license or
20 permit takes too long and is capped. Intro. 431
21 would solve this problem by increasing licenses and
22 permits over time. Thus, more vendors would become
23 regulated without fear of being shut down or fined.
24 Intro. 408 would benefit all vendors with much needed
25 support towards success with their businesses. By

2 creating a special office that provides services and
3 resources vendors would feel they are valued
4 stakeholders in our economy.

5 In closing, the street vendor reform package
6 would bring about a fairer system that force the
7 support for all vendors by appeal to this Committee
8 to support all the bills contained in the reform
9 package. Thank you for giving me this opportunity to
10 testify.

11 JOSHUA BLOOM: Good afternoon. My name is Josh
12 Boom and I am Liaison from JFREJ, Jews for Racial and
13 Economic Justice to the Street Vendor Project. I'd
14 like to thank Chair Menin and the Committee for the
15 opportunity to testify today in support of Intro.'s
16 431 and 408. JFREJ is the home for Jewish New
17 Yorkers to organize with our neighbors and allies in
18 New York, for New York where everyone has the freedom
19 and opportunity to thrive.

20 We always draw on our Jewish values and history
21 to inform our work but street vending itself has its
22 own Jewish history as Mohamed mentioned earlier
23 today. The modern street vending system in New York
24 started around the turn of the 20th Century with
25

2 immigrant Jewish push cart vendors in the lower east
3 side.

4 So, it is near and dear to our hearts that
5 vending and vendors get the respect they deserve.
6 Vending is long appealed to recent arrivals for the
7 flexibility it provides. When you are your own
8 employer, you do not need to fear discrimination,
9 harassment or exploitation. You can work on a
10 schedule that allows you to observe religious or
11 cultural customs, attend school and/or care for your
12 family. But then as now vendors were subjected to
13 explicit encoded xenophobia and classism mask
14 curating as concerns around sanitation, congestion,
15 business competition and fraud and then as now all
16 the data suggested that actually vendors were
17 generally very much in compliance, especially ones
18 educated and in economic and cultural boon to the
19 city.

20 We've heard testimony outlining the positive
21 economic impact on the city. Utility is a career
22 incubator for immigrants and veterans, especially
23 women. You've heard testimony on the diversity
24 vendors bring. I'd like to add also their
25 contributions to public safety. We've heard a lot,

2 this assertion that vendors cause congestion on
3 sidewalks and they risk two pedestrians with no
4 evidence or data to actually back that up. Where as
5 we do have evidence of vendors -

6 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask
7 you to wrap it up and you can submit your testimony.

8 JOSHUA BLOOM: Fostering public safety. Thank
9 you. We hope you support these packages.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Next.

11 CALVIN HARRISON: Good afternoon Chairman and the
12 Committee. Thank you for this opportunity to speak.
13 My name is Calvin Harrison. I'm an organizer at the
14 Street Vendor Project and a JFREJ member. I'm
15 honored every day to be able to support and work with
16 the city's hardworking vendors. I'm so proud of all
17 the vendors who joined us today to advocate for
18 themselves and speak about their struggles. Their
19 testimony is more than enough to explain why these
20 small businesses need access to licenses and permits.
21 Therefore I'm speaking not in my professional
22 capacity but in my perspective as a New Yorker. So,
23 much of the conversation around vending centers
24 around this idea of quality of life and I really want
25 to urge the Committee to reflect on that phrase.

2 When I think of what makes my life in New York
3 better, I think of stopping on my way home at the
4 produce stand. I think of grabbing a coffee and a
5 donut from a vendor on a dreary Monday. I think of
6 finding a merch vendor with umbrellas when I know
7 it's about to rain. I think of a plate of chicken
8 over rice, extra white sauce, in the late afternoon
9 after I had to skip lunch. Vendors improve my
10 quality of life not just because of what they sell
11 but because of the role they play as eyes on the
12 street as Jane Jacobs would say.

13 I feel safer in neighborhood when I pass the same
14 friendly faces of vendors every day. I feel safer at
15 night when I see the bright LED lights of a Halal
16 cart lighting up the sidewalk. I certainly feel much
17 safer seeing a vendor serving their customers than I
18 do watching armed NYPD officers harassing and
19 forcibly removing my working class neighbors from my
20 community. New Yorkers quality of life doesn't come
21 from empty sidewalks lined by chain stores and
22 restaurants with \$20 burgers. Street vending fills
23 our streets with vibrant culture and delicious,
24 interesting food.

2 We should be uplifting rather than shutting out
3 these vendors. Our quality of life can easily be
4 improved by providing access to the licensing vendors
5 need and supporting them with small business
6 services. Therefore, I urge you to please pass
7 Intro. 431 and 408 as well as the rest of the street
8 vendor reform package. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Any questions for this panel?
10 Okay, thank you to this panel. I'm now going to call
11 the next panel. Ibra, Kele Nkhereanye, and then Ibra
12 Sia(SP?). I don't know if that's the same and Karim
13 Ala(SP?) if you could please come down.

14 I'm just going to read the names again and just
15 make sure Karim Ala, Ibra Sia, Kele Nkhereanye and
16 then Ibra again. We're getting an Interpreter? Oh
17 they left? Okay, okay, great if you could please
18 begin. Thank you.

19 KELE NKHEREANYE: Good afternoon Council Members.
20 My name is Kele Nkhereanye. I'm a street vendor, a
21 community chef, a community gardener, and I'm here to
22 share that street vendors need your support. I wrote
23 something but it has been difficult listening to
24 people that oppose street vendors. We're not
25 thieves. We're not trying to take jobs away. We

2 want to comply with the laws that the city has. We
3 are smallest of the smallest business owners in New
4 York City. We contribute our taxes. We love the
5 city and we need your support. Department of Health
6 is aware of the failed system that has caused harm to
7 vendors. They are aware of how many permits their
8 given, how many vendors are on the streets, how many
9 licenses they have, and the BIDs and small business
10 owners, they know we are partners. We are trying to
11 make the city a well loved city that everyone loves.
12 Nobody wants to stop the Garment Industry BID from
13 making money. We just want to work aside with them.
14 I feel very insulted by some of the people who are
15 not telling the truth because as a vendor, I respect
16 myself. I respect other business owners and there's
17 no reason why people want people to support their
18 cause without understanding that we are a team that
19 want to support New York City to thrive.

20 I hope that the Council Members will take all
21 sides and understand that vendors are here to stay.
22 We are part of history of New Yorkers. We are part
23 of the immigrant communities that make this city
24 thrive. Everyone come from a culture that value
25 family, that value hard work, workers' rights, human

2 rights, women's rights or workers rights and we are
3 here to get your support. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Questions? Okay,
5 thank you. Our next panel is Ibrahim Shehata(SP?),
6 Waleed Salama, and Magdy Elobky and Ahmed Marad(SP?).
7 If you could please come down.

8 Okay, I'm just told we need the Arabic
9 Interpreter. Are they here? If not could we - oh
10 great, okay just give us a minute then. Okay, please
11 begin. Thank you.

12 MAGDY ELOBKY: Hello, my name is Magdy Elobky. I
13 come today to request support for the law 431 and 408
14 and the law 431. I work in Time Square just for 12
15 years and I have a family here. I have child
16 support. I do not have to pay because I don't work
17 like two years. I don't have a payment and I can and
18 a ticket for the SB Loan, for the small business. I
19 take a big loan and I don't have money for pay
20 because I doesn't work. Okay, thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you.

22 WALEED SALAMA: SPEAKING IN ARABIC [04:19:57]-
23 [04:21:47].

24 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Waleed
25 Salama. I have been working as a street vendor for

2 the past 25 years. I live in the Borough of Brooklyn
3 and I work in Manhattan. I came here today to
4 support the pass of the bill to support the street
5 vendors for the bill of 431 and 408. I have been
6 working since the year of 2000 until now. I don't
7 have a permit until today. I have been working and I
8 have been hoping to have the opportunity to get like
9 a permit. It apparently costs us about \$15,000 to
10 \$20,000 a year every two years, which is like an
11 average of \$10,000. This money caused us to also add
12 the cost of the food and when customers look at us we
13 think that we collect all of this money into our
14 pockets. However, that effects everything else
15 including the merchandise and the renting of the
16 permit.

17 The second thing I wanted to add is the violation
18 that we get, we have been getting in the past two
19 years. I've been working as a street vendor for the
20 past 25 years. In the past two years, only I got
21 violations that would equal to 23 years of work.
22 Thank you so much.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Any questions?
24 No, okay thank you very much to this panel, and our
25 next panel is Ni Jin Fang, Helen Fang, Yun Lin, and

2 Xhang Jie. If you could please come down and I
3 understand we need a Mandarin translator please.

4 Sorry, Xhang Jie, Yun Lin, Helen Fang, Ni Jin
5 Fang. Okay, yeah, okay great, thank you.

6 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:24:51]-
7 [04:25:02].

8 INTERPRETER: So, my name is Ni Jin Fang. How
9 are you? Mostly, I work out of Flushing. Mostly I
10 sell plants, various different plants.

11 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [04:25:11]-
12 [04:25:15].

13 INTERPRETER: So, I have a child, two of us in
14 the United States.

15 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:25:19]-
16 [04:25:23].

17 INTERPRETER: So, my main income is relying on
18 the vending on the street to make some money.

19 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:25:31]-
20 [04:25:34].

21 INTERPRETER: Unfortunately the police are acting
22 very frequently. They're acting on us frequently,
23 much more.

24 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:25:48]-
25 [04:25:56].

2 INTERPRETER: So, the police told us to go to the
3 city and get permits but when we get there it was an
4 impossible task. We couldn't do it. I couldn't do
5 it.

6 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:26:07]-
7 [04:26:16].

8 INTERPRETER: So, I felt that uh vending in
9 Flushing actually brings up the uhm, help push the
10 commercial activities in the area.

11 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:26:33]-
12 [04:26:40].

13 INTERPRETER: So as a vendor, mostly uhm other
14 than working very hard, there's nothing beyond
15 working very hard generally speaking as a vendor.

16 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:26:53]-
17 [04:27:05].

18 INTERPRETER: So, I hope the government agencies
19 will take our condition into consideration and
20 consider the reality of what's going on and allow us
21 to at least work a few days out of the week, three
22 days maybe out of the week.

23 NI JIN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:27:29].

24 INTERPRETER: Thank you.

2 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:27:40]-
3 [04:27:52].

4 INTERPRETER: So, Helen Fang is a name. I'm from
5 Flushing. So, how are you? There are two main points
6 I want to talk to you about.

7 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:02]-
8 [04:28:09].

9 INTERPRETER: So, vending needs control just like
10 a driver needs a license.

11 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:14]-
12 [04:28:15].

13 INTERPRETER: So, that's only natural.

14 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:19]-
15 [04:28:21].

16 INTERPRETER: So if you violate with your
17 license, then you get a deduction, you get a fine if
18 you have a license.

19 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:27]-
20 [04:28:32].

21 INTERPRETER: And if you violate enough and
22 gotten enough points, your license might be
23 suspended.

24 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:40]-
25 [04:28:42].

2 INTERPRETER: So, I feel that's very effective.

3 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:45]-
4 [04:28:48].

5 INTERPRETER: Just like vendors like us needs a
6 license permits as well.

7 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:28:54]-
8 [04:29:05].

9 INTERPRETER: And if someone violates just like
10 the situation that was brought up before, if they
11 have enough violation, they should be suspended just
12 like the example I gave before.

13 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:29:23]-
14 [04:29:27].

15 INTERPRETER: So this way, it would make more
16 rooms for the people behind. Speed up the people
17 that's behind in the line.

18 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:29:37]-
19 [04:29:43].

20 INTERPRETER: And it does not conflict with
21 giving out commercial licenses. Both can be done at
22 the same time.

23 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:29:51]-
24 [04:29:54].

2 INTERPRETER: And the reason that recently
3 there's more and more vendor rather than less -

4 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:30:03]-
5 [04:30:06].

6 INTERPRETER: Is actually a reflection of the
7 needs of the actual needs in the community in the
8 society.

9 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:30:16] -
10 [04:30:17].

11 INTERPRETER: So, that's just a natural pathway
12 of the economic development.

13 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:30:24]-
14 [04:30:27].

15 INTERPRETER: Vendor did not decrease in number
16 only because just because there's more uhm execution
17 of the - by the police.

18 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:30:40]-
19 [04:30:44].

20 INTERPRETER: Why is the government uhm, uh, stay
21 in place in the middle of this contradiction?

22 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:30:56]-
23 [04:31:02].

24 INTERPRETER: So, I think it's just very normal
25 to give our licenses, permits and if they violate it,

2 then they should be fined and given points. To me,
3 it's just very normal, natural.

4 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:31:16]-
5 [04:31:19].

6 INTERPRETER: The other point I want to make is
7 about license for veterans.

8 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:31:23]-
9 [04:31:31].

10 INTERPRETER: So, this is a benefit for people
11 who contributed as veterans after they retire to make
12 a living for themselves.

13 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:31:41]-
14 [04:31:47].

15 INTERPRETER: And uh however, not for them to use
16 it as an opportunity to rent out the license that
17 they have an exorbitant price.

18 HELEN FANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:31:59]-
19 [04:32:06].

20 INTERPRETER: They don't really care how much
21 people who rent a license from them -

22 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I need to ask you to
23 wrap up please and you can submit a written
24 testimony.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 229

2 INTERPRETER: Okay, SPEAKING IN MANDARIN

3 [04:32:15]- [04:32:21]

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Okay.

5 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:32:30]-

6 [04:32:34]

7 INTERPRETER: So, my name is Yun Lin. I'm from
8 Flushing.

9 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:32:38] -

10 [04:32:40].

11 INTERPRETER: And I've been a vendor in Flushing
12 for two years.

13 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:32:44]-

14 [04:32:48].

15 INTERPRETER: So, so far I have had over \$10,000
16 worth of merchandise that was confiscated.

17 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:32:57]-

18 [04:33:02].

19 INTERPRETER: So combining with my friends, we've
20 been given over 20 violations, tickets.

21 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:33:11]-

22 [04:33:17].

23 INTERPRETER: And I believe they are mainly
24 caused by complaints of local shop owners.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 230

2 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:33:27]-
3 [04:33:33].

4 INTERPRETER: So someone earlier mentioned that
5 there were within a year over 100,000 phone
6 complaints from -

7 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:33:45]-
8 [04:33:49].

9 INTERPRETER: So I believe the majority of these
10 phone complaints from local business owners, shop
11 owners.

12 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:34:02]-
13 [04:34:06].

14 INTERPRETER: So I believe overall the society,
15 the community needs us small vendors.

16 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:34:14]-
17 [04:34:19].

18 INTERPRETER: So a free market, free society,
19 should have free and open competition.

20 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:34:25]-
21 [04:34:30].

22 INTERPRETER: So if you provide superior service
23 then someone with an issue. If not, you will be
24 eliminated.

25

2 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:34:41]-
3 [04:34:56].

4 INTERPRETER: So to allow us under normal
5 circumstances, reasonable circumstances, within the
6 law to fairly compete and that should be a normal
7 government agency should do, to allow us to do.

8 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:35:11]-
9 [04:35:16].

10 INTERPRETER: It shouldn't be a situation where
11 there's a big tree with no grass at the root.

12 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:35:24]-
13 [04:35:36]

14 INTERPRETER: So a more perfect society would
15 allow everyone to survive big ones, big guys, small
16 guys, and that should be the normal, the norm.

17 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:35:47]-
18 [04:35:56].

19 INTERPRETER: And uh you probably notice that a
20 lot of the items that the vendors sell on the streets
21 of every popular people support the items that we
22 sell on the street.

23 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:36:09]-
24 [04:36:14].

2 INTERPRETER: So it's a society for everyone big
3 or small.

4 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:36:23]-
5 [04:36:34].

6 INTERPRETER: So I urge that we, the public
7 people would be allowed to get a license of vendors
8 so then we can do our work.

9 YUN LIN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:36:45].

10 INTERPRETER: Thank you. Thank you. Thank you
11 everyone.

12 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:05].

13 INTERPRETER: Dear friends.

14 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:09]- [04:37:11].

15 INTERPRETER: Government -

16 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:13]-

17 INTERPRETER: And guests.

18 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:16]- [04:37:21].

19 INTERPRETER: Thank you for the platform you're
20 providing me right now.

21 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:24]- [04:37:26].

22 INTERPRETER: I'm also from Flushing.

23 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:27]- [04:37:29].

24 INTERPRETER: Engaged in small business.

25 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:32]- [04:37:38].

2 INTERPRETER: So of course I'm hoping that my
3 small business would be legalized as well.

4 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:37:46]- [04:37:57]

5 INTERPRETER: So since the beginning of history,
6 people have been freely selling.

7 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:06]

8 INTERPRETER: And support their family that way.

9 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:11]- [04:38:12].

10 INTERPRETER: It's the same all over the world.

11 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:16]- [04:38:18].

12 INTERPRETER: So generally I think we are a weak
13 community.

14 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:24]- [04:38:28].

15 INTERPRETER: I hope the US government can help
16 and help us, the weaker community.

17 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:33]- [04:38:35].

18 INTERPRETER: That we can supply.

19 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:37]- [04:38:40].

20 INTERPRETER: To have a space to improve our
21 lives.

22 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:45]- [04:38:49].

23 INTERPRETER: Since we are a weak community to
24 begin with -

25 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:38:53]- [04:39:00]

2 INTERPRETER: So not powerful at all.

3 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:02]- [04:39:05].

4 INTERPRETER: We don't have any -

5 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:08]- [04:39:11].

6 INTERPRETER: So I hope that we won't be locked
7 up for an honest way of trying to live.

8 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:21]- [04:39:23].

9 INTERPRETER: There's a 60, 70 year old lady-

10 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:28]- [04:39:35].

11 INTERPRETER: So uh I don't think it's fair to
12 treat a 60, 70 year old vendor, female vendor and
13 locking her up is fair.

14 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:50]- [04:39:52].

15 INTERPRETER: It's not fair.

16 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:39:56]- [04:40:03].

17 INTERPRETER: So I agree this new legislation if
18 passed would advantageous to the small vendors.

19 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:40:10]- [04:40:13].

20 INTERPRETER: On behalf of the other vendors in
21 my area, I support this.

22 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:40:19]- [04:40:25].

23 INTERPRETER: I hope this legislation if passed
24 will be a life for all of us, a hope for all of us.

25 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:40:33]- [04:40:35].

2 INTERPRETER: So, that's the end. Thank you.

3 SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [04:40:37].

4 INTERPRETER: Thank you. Thank you government.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great. Thank you very much.

6 Thank you for your testimony today. Okay, thank you.

7 I'm going to now read the next panel MD Rahman, Julie

8 Torres Moskovitz, Illa Hagy Dein(SP?), Nick Gulotta,

9 Abram Moritz. If you could all please come down.

10 Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: You may begin when

12 ready.

13 MD RAHMAN: Good afternoon City Council and all

14 of them here, everyone. My name is MD Rahman. I am

15 a food vendor, mobile food vendor [INAUDIBLE

16 04:42:38] and ten and I am the only food vendor who

17 work from 2011 to 2021 on the New York City Brooklyn

18 Bridge with license and legal permit but

19 unfortunately city last 2021 city target the Brooklyn

20 Bridge all illegal vendor. And I was the - with

21 license me selling hot dog and water, soda but city

22 this time don't respect me and my license. Two of my

23 jobs was terrible for my working for my working life

24 and very problem.

2 So, now I am working same food cart on the New
3 York City Manhattan 5th Avenue and 22nd Street. I am
4 selling same stuff and I take living with my family
5 and take care of my kids and whatever they need every
6 day food and my bill. I want to thank to City
7 Council for bringing me here today speak about Street
8 Vendor Reform Package. I need to thank my favorite
9 organizer street vendor project for supporting me
10 always and giving me always update for street vendor,
11 bad news and street vendor something and problem,
12 that's why a lot of the street vendor project and I
13 still hanging with them from 2009 to now.

14 So now I want to explain about small sentences
15 about my 15 years of street vending. The thing,
16 every New Yorker alone, we are the hardworking
17 people. We work outside at least ten hours every day
18 and the effects, winter, summer, we stay outside at
19 least ten hour. And every day, thousands and
20 thousands of people pass by in front of us. We don't
21 know who is the good people, who is the bad people.
22 We have security concern also but sometimes law
23 enforcement people, NYPD, Sanitation, come to all of
24 us our vendor and give us summons for unreason
25 sometimes. We have the legal also, so some of them

2 maybe they don't have license but they try to live
3 with family, pay bill and the food their kids need.
4 But if this time a vendor [INAUDIBLE 04:45:14] then
5 why you guys do that with me? The Sanitation and
6 NYPD say where your license and permit?

7 Ask them again, can you give me permit and
8 license? They say, we don't give you permit, go ask
9 the city. So, this is a game. So, my concern is now
10 if the law enforcement people say go to city, apply
11 for the permit and we hear that this morning, all
12 them look like the laptop vendor people. They keep
13 normal being never. They're still waiting, my
14 friends Mohamed [INAUDIBLE 04:45:51], we need to
15 maybe work for every vendor get the license from the
16 waiting list. So my concern is now we not need to
17 hope anything from the city. We need to hear the
18 city what about we need and take action and give our
19 license department, we need to live, we need to pay
20 our bill, our family look like another New Yorker.
21 Thank you very much again for bringing me here today.
22 Thank you.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

24 JULIE TORRES MOSKOVITZ: Thank you. The city
25 fabric depends on vendors for food, for convenience,

2 for safety and for livelihood. It's about small
3 business. I am a small business person here too and
4 an architect and urban designer. My name is Julie
5 Torres Moskovitz and I live and work in Brooklyn.

6 Vendors make the city unique and special but the
7 system is so dysfunctional, inefficient, plagued with
8 underground market and discrimination of vendors. As
9 a citizen, as someone who loves democracy and our
10 government here, this is a challenge for us. We the
11 people that take on and resolve because underground
12 markets, agency enforcement switch Aroos, disorganize
13 leadership that hurts vendors and the public has gone
14 on way too long. City Council and the Mayor, I
15 implore you to fix this and thank you for having this
16 hearing. When you put your collective mind to it,
17 you can do it. I'm here to be an enthusiastic
18 supporter for you. That you are my representatives
19 and there's only three of you sitting there now but
20 I'm hoping the rest of the City Council hears this.

21 The answers are in the air here today. The
22 summonses and enforcement is at farce when the system
23 is so broken. Lift the caps entirely. Make it fair,
24 just, and efficient. Let small business thrive.
25 Support all of us in the city by supporting Intro.

2 431 and Intro. 408 and the reform package. Intro.
3 408 for SBS to help small business is critical.
4 Vendors are small businesses making permits available
5 for a small business needs to be a given. A
6 government for the people, by the people, and of the
7 people as Lincoln says up there on the ceiling.
8 There should not be a lack of will here. You are
9 serving us, the people and that should be an exciting
10 policy and operational challenge to solve and make
11 success. Vibrancy and thriving happen that all of us
12 appreciate and that marks you in history as great at
13 doing your job. Dysfunction is not something we the
14 people appreciate. You can do this and in fact you
15 must. Anything short of that is failure.

16 I wish more City Council were here today and I'm
17 happy to hear that 25 cosigned but it should be every
18 City Council person.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Please conclude.

20 JULIE TORRES MOSKOVITZ: Thank you so much.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

22 JULIE TORRES MOSKOVITZ: And I really have faith
23 in you. You can solve this for us.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

2 NICK GULOTTA: Thank you so much Chair Menin,
3 Majority Leader Farias and Council Member Sanchez for
4 your incredible leadership on this issue. I live off
5 of Roosevelt Avenue in Jackson Heights and I took
6 today off to testify along with several vendors who
7 are my neighbors and friends to support Intro. 408
8 and 431.

9 Prior to today's hearing, I reviewed transcripts
10 from the last ten years of Council hearings on
11 vending. At each hearing, opponents of increasing
12 the number of permits and from the Administration
13 have asked the Council to go back to the drawing
14 board. To conduct a comprehensive study, a census
15 before doubling down on a broken system. At each
16 hearing, they've described legislation to expand
17 permits as premature and hasty. But the Mayor's
18 Office actually did a comprehensive census and study
19 on vending over 100 years ago, in 1905, the report on
20 the Mayor's Push Cart Commission, which showed that
21 New York City actually issued 7,463 vendor licenses
22 and estimated that there were approximately 9,000
23 vendors.

24 Today, our population has doubled and the number
25 of vendors has more than doubled, yet New York City

2 issues actually 600 fewer permits than we did 120
3 years ago.

4 This Council has the opportunity to finally
5 address this issue through the Street Vendor Reform
6 Package. A comprehensive rational approach to
7 vending that will expand education. Establish clear
8 and fair enforcement system in every Council district
9 and create a thriving well-regulated street scape.

10 Every day that goes by is another day where vendors,
11 96 percent of whom are immigrants, risk being given
12 criminal summons or related charges that escalate
13 from police enforcement. The NYPD issued 9,376
14 tickets to vendors just last year. New York City is
15 the only major city in the country with a cap on
16 vendor permits. As a result, over 70 percent of
17 vendors take the risk to operate without one.

18 Immigration legal service providers have raised the
19 alarm about multiple cases where vendors were
20 targeted by ICE because of criminal summonses they
21 received. No one should be criminalized, arrested or
22 subjected to deportation for feeding New Yorkers. I
23 ask that the Council move these bills to negotiations
24 and pass them. Thank you.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you.

2 ABRAM MORITZ: I'd like to thank Chair Menin for
3 the opportunity to testify today. Street vendors are
4 an integral part of our communities. We must help
5 them succeed. Not neglect them and criminalize them.

6 My name is Abram Moritz and I'm a constituent of
7 Council Member Menin of District 5. On 81st Street
8 between 1st and 2nd in Manhattan, we depend on the
9 fruit stand at the end of the block. Growing up, the
10 produce my family got from that stand made up a good
11 portion of my diet growing up and the man who runs
12 the stand stays out day and night, cold and warm, and
13 rain or shine to deliver your fresh food.

14 Street vendors provide New Yorkers with
15 convenient food and products. They're vital to the
16 city economy and their presence brings vibrancy to
17 our streets. As a city, we must stop pushing them to
18 the sidelines. The city and state punish street
19 vendors for trying to make ends meet while they
20 reward large companies with security details. As the
21 cost of living has become top of mind to New Yorkers,
22 criminalizing vulnerable entrepreneurs makes life
23 harder for all of us.

24 I put forth my support for the street vendor
25 reform package, including Intro. 431 and 408. Our

2 street vendors make our streets fun places to be and
3 they make our streets safer with their eyes on the
4 street.

5 Demonizing and criminalizing people destroys our
6 streets and breaks down our communities. Do we want
7 a sterile city with silent streets? If we do nothing
8 to support our vendors, that's what we're going to
9 get. We need these laws to create a bold and
10 transformative relationship between the city and our
11 street vendors. Intro. 431 will expand the
12 opportunities for vendors to do their work within the
13 law, rather than pushing them to the fringes. We
14 need to integrate our vendors into our economy, not
15 force them out and Intro. 408 will help our vendors
16 to interface with the city and create buy in with
17 these regulations. Vendors and patrons alike will
18 benefit from the added resources.

19 I ask that you move these bills out of Committee
20 and they be voted on as soon as possible. Thank you.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you so much.
22 Chair Menin had to step away for just a few minutes
23 but I just sent her a picture of you testifying so.
24 Thank you. Thank you all for your testimony.

2 I will now call the next panel, Guadalupe
3 Sosa(SP?), Vicente Veintimilla, my neighbor, Xiomara
4 Reges, and Evelia Cayotzi.

5 SPEAKING IN SPANISH: Can I go first?

6 INTERPRETER: She's asking if she can go first?

7 EVELIA CAYOTZI: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:55:18]-
8 [04:55:28].

9 INTERPRETER: Good morning. My name is Evelia
10 Cayotzi, I've been a street vendor in the City of New
11 York for 25 years. I live in the Corona Queens
12 neighborhood and I work in the Corona Queens
13 neighborhood as well.

14 EVELIA CAYOTZI: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:55:51]-
15 [04:56:02].

16 INTERPRETER: I'm here to ask the Council to
17 approve the package, the reform package for the
18 following Intro.'s that are for the street vendors
19 and they are number 431, 408, and 47 and 24.

20 EVELIA CAYOTZI: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:56:24]-
21 [04:56:44].

22 INTERPRETER: These reforms are very important
23 for us and for me because we as a business, we do
24 business for families, for the community, for friends
25 and we pay taxes as well.

2 EVELIA CAYOTZI: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:57:01]-
3 [04:57:10].

4 INTERPRETER: We are the same as any other
5 business of the New York City but in return, we
6 receive the harassment from police.

7 EVELIA CAYOTZI: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:57:18]-
8 [04:57:22].

9 INTERPRETER: And for us it is important, the
10 reforms are important. Thank you very much.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
12 [04:57:28].

13 GUADALUPE SOSA: Hi, my name is Guadalupe Sosa,
14 I've been vending since the day I was born right next
15 to my mother. I am a second generation street vendor
16 who have been actively advocating for our street
17 vendors and I feel like it's tiring that we have to
18 come here all the time, waste a day of our work, lose
19 our income to stay here and always get the response
20 that nothing is being done. So, now that we have
21 this specific hearing specifically for the licenses
22 and permits that we've been waiting for that there's
23 been a cap for so many years, uhm, it's very
24 meaningful that like one of the persons that was here
25

2 said, that we make history today. That these bills
3 are passed into laws.

4 It's also New York City Small Business Month and
5 yet again, nothing is included for us street vendors.
6 There's really nearly no resources for our street
7 vendors. Intro. 408 needs to pass in order to
8 benefit from the Department resources that the city
9 budgets.

10 It's important that we get regulated if that's
11 what New York City residents call to complain on 311.
12 Then it's crucial that bill Intro. 431 passes into
13 law, so we could be regulated and we could be
14 organized as street vendors.

15 Also, uhm now that social media became a thing,
16 the viral videos that people often record when we're
17 being harassed by law enforcements makes us
18 vulnerable and targets of the public. Just last
19 week, one of the street vendors in Time Square got
20 shot just because he refused to get robbed. So, this
21 is where it's crucial that we need to be regulated
22 and organized so stuff like this doesn't happen and
23 thank you.

24 XIOMARA REGES: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [04:59:50]-
25 [05:01:14].

2 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon Chair and
3 distinguished members of the Council and the
4 honorable members of the Council who are here from
5 our beloved city. My name is Xiomara Reges and I'm a
6 street vendor. I sell shirts and additional goods in
7 the city. Thank you for allowing me the opportunity
8 to address you and I do all of this in the Bronx.
9 I'm also a leader of the Bronx Street Vendors. I
10 have made an appointment today to fulfill our
11 obligations as essential workers in New York.

12 Being a vendor in this city demands courage and
13 resignation. Resignation to suffering and just
14 persecution by authorities who you've seen an
15 outdated law by affecting justice by [INAUDIBLE
16 05:02:17]. I'm sorry to say that they're using that
17 type of law and that's it's outdated.

18 Every day is a challenge. Thank God we live
19 safely however, we don't know if we return home from
20 merchandise and be able to hug our loved ones. As
21 long as this current law [INAUDIBLE 05:02:37],
22 justify the [INAUDIBLE 05:02:41] we face, they will
23 continue to be a tool that serves to promote
24 discrimination and segregation in our community.
25 Therefore, I urge you as several representatives to

2 inform and update the laws that could turn the page
3 on the dark past and to change for the just hope or
4 the fair hope that thousands of families demand and
5 which now, rest in the hands of God and in your
6 hands. Thank you.

7 VICENTE VEINTIMILLA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH:

8 [05:03:20]- [05:04:45].

9 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon Madam President of
10 this prestigious Council. Good afternoon Council
11 Members and anything which public. I would like to
12 thank you for the opportunity to attend this hearing.
13 My name is Vicente Veintimilla and I am a leader of
14 the Bronx Street Vendors group. I have been selling
15 general merchandise on Fordham Road in the Bronx for
16 several years. I have come to this hearing to
17 support the bills, reform the informal retail
18 legislation.

19 Decades have passed since general merchandise
20 licenses were frozen and in the case of food vendor
21 permits, the ones issued today are insufficient. The
22 failure to update this legislation has only benefited
23 the Black market and harming vendors who in their
24 eagerness to be able to operate with a permit or
25 license "have fallen victim to their crutches of

2 [INAUDIBLE 05:05:45] procreators." Who promise to
3 arrange it by using their influence causing
4 irreparable damage to a meager economy.

5 You have the challenge of setting a mementos
6 present. Deciding fair, equitable and inclusive
7 legislation for the wellbeing of our entire
8 community. Thank you.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you
10 for your testimony. SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:06:17].

11 UNIDENTIFIED: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:06:19]-
12 [05:06:20].

13 INTERPRETER: He's asking you if you have any
14 questions with respect to what we said, is his
15 question.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: [05:06:27]- [05:06:39].

17 And the question is for tickets that they have
18 received, do they know what the cause is?

19 VICENTE VEINTIMILLA: [05:06:47]- [05:07:06].

20 INTERPRETER: Thank you. We believe that there's
21 no justification for the tickets and the amount that
22 have to be paid for them. For example, the ticket
23 prices go from one of our colleagues that had to pay
24 \$4,000 for selling tamales without a license for a
25

2 whole month to another colleague that was \$2,000 just
3 for selling water.

4 VICENTE VEINTIMILLA: [05:07:52]- [05:08:23].

5 INTERPRETER: And also I want to say that some of
6 our colleagues that are selling vitamins that they're
7 supposed to be classified as food. They think that's
8 \$2,000 for that and also for toothpaste. I don't
9 really know where this came from but they're actually
10 labeled as food and I want to say that SPEAKING IN
11 SPANISH [05:08:48]- [05:08:51].

12 Okay, so I want to bring your attention to this
13 because we do not deserve this as vendors.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Thank you so much.

15 SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:09:05].

16 [5:09:07]- [05:11:30] Sorry, we're just
17 confirming something. SPEAKING IN SPANISH
18 [05:11:31]- [05:11:34]. We'll resume in a few
19 moments.

20 [05:11:36]- [05:13:27] I will now call the next
21 panel Yu Chaohang, Ngai Kwan Lian, Shuang, Shuai Hui
22 Zhen.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, please begin, thank
24 you.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 251

2 YU CHAOHANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:14:19]-
3 [05:14:24]

4 INTERPRETER: Hi, how is everybody? My name is
5 Yu Chaohang. I'm from Flushing.

6 YU CHAOHANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:14:33]-
7 [05:14:44].

8 INTERPRETER: I have some disability so I cannot
9 do anything else and I rely on vending on the street
10 to make a living.

11 YU CHAOHANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:15:02]-
12 [05:15:16].

13 INTERPRETER: So my father has lung cancer and
14 cannot walk out of the family only myself and my mom
15 is working.

16 YU CHAOHANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:15:26].

17 INTERPRETER: I appreciate it.

18 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN:
19 [05:15:39].

20 INTERPRETER: Can I speak?

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Yes please.

22 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN:
23 [05:15:46].

24 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 252

2 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN

3 [05:15:51]- [05:15:57].

4 INTERPRETER: So, Ngai Kwan Lian is my name. I'm
5 from Flushing so I sell, I'm a vendor of electronic
6 parts.

7 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:16:03]-
8 [05:16:12]

9 INTERPRETER: So of course, I totally support the
10 two proposed laws and I want to tell you some of my
11 stories that I have.

12 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:16:23]-
13 [05:16:31].

14 INTERPRETER: Such as the young man that just
15 spoke who has some disability. He needed these uhm a
16 proper channel. This licenses to make a living in
17 order to make a living.

18 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:16:46]-
19 [05:16:51].

20 INTERPRETER: And there are secondly, there are
21 some other successful business men who started out as
22 vendors.

23 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:16:59]-
24 [05:17:15].

25

2 INTERPRETER: So, as new immigrants in a new
3 environment, we needed more space, more time for us
4 to become a more productive society and contribute to
5 society.

6 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:17:30]-
7 [05:17:47].

8 INTERPRETER: So, I do not need as many permits
9 as a food vendor. All I need is just a safe, stable
10 environment where I can just provide and sell.

11 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:18:00]-
12 [05:18:22].

13 INTERPRETER: So, I hope to avoid this pressure
14 that I feel the need to survive and to make a living.
15 I hope to avoid these pressures checking and
16 verifying and all the requirements that's excessive.

17 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:18:45]-
18 [05:18:57].

19 INTERPRETER: And I feel that actually I provide
20 a service for people after work, let's say 8:00, 9:00
21 and I'm still able to provide items that they are
22 able to buy at that hour. I believe I provide a good
23 service.

24 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:19:17]-
25 [05:19:24].

2 INTERPRETER: So, I think that satisfy both sides
3 that the items I sell is not expensive but is what
4 they need and I can make a living from what I sell.
5 I feel it's beneficial for both sides.

6 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:19:38]-
7 [05:19:49].

8 INTERPRETER: So not only are we bringing
9 convenience but harmony to everyday life, especially
10 with the tariffs going up these days out there.

11 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:20:02]-
12 [05:20:10].

13 INTERPRETER: So, I hope that we've been given
14 this opportunity to get the license and do what we
15 want to do to help and provide benefit.

16 NGAI KWAN LIAN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:20:22]-
17 [05:20:39].

18 INTERPRETER: So, I hope to rely on our own two
19 hands and not just lay there, do nothing to use our
20 own hands to help ourselves and help to relieve the
21 pressure on ourselves.

22 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm going to have to
23 ask you to wrap up and please submit the written
24 testimony. Thank you so much. Okay, thank you.

25 Next please, thank you.

2 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:21:13]-
3 [05:21:23].

4 INTERPRETER: So, I was an employee previously,
5 I'm also a street vendor recently from flushing.

6 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:21:29]-
7 [05:21:33].

8 INTERPRETER: Lost my job so I chose to be a
9 vendor to maintain my daily living.

10 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:21:41]-
11 [05:21:52].

12 INTERPRETER: So, I realize that this work is
13 very important to me, while I was doing this vending
14 job.

15 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:21:59]-
16 [05:22:11].

17 INTERPRETER: It brought impressions to the
18 customer. They like my product. Everybody
19 satisfied, everybody's happy.

20 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:22:19]-
21 [05:22:28].

22 INTERPRETER: But in th process I realize or find
23 out that the police keep arresting me while I'm doing
24 this work.

2 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:22:38]-
3 [05:22:48].

4 INTERPRETER: So, over an eight month period that
5 I've been vending, I received over ten violation
6 tickets.

7 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:22:57]-
8 [05:23:15].

9 INTERPRETER: So I remember one particular day, I
10 received four violations in one day. Before I was
11 even able to wrap up after the first two tickets were
12 given, I was then given another two tickets. I had
13 four for that day.

14 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:23:34]-
15 [05:23:46].

16 INTERPRETER: And the merchandize that's left
17 there were stolen also by thieves.

18 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:23:57]-
19 [05:24:12].

20 INTERPRETER: And I was oppressed by people with
21 the license claiming I don't have a license. Several
22 days ago, someone complained about me again.

23 SHUANG: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN: [05:24:25]-
24 [05:24:37].

2 INTERPRETER: So, I'm hoping that this process be
3 open of giving a license for vending. That I would
4 receive a license for vending. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Thank
6 you. Okay.

7 SHUAI HUI ZHEN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN
8 [05:25:08]- [05:25:15].

9 INTERPRETER: So, Shuai Hui Zhen is my name. How
10 is everybody? I'm from Flushing.

11 SHUAI HUI ZHEN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:25:20]-
12 [05:25:26].

13 INTERPRETER: So I sell fashion clothes items in
14 Flushing.

15 SHUAI HUI ZHEN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:25:32]-
16 [05:25:44].

17 INTERPRETER: So, I'm already 70 plus years old
18 already. I really have no wish at this moment other
19 than to just get a legal license or permit that I'll
20 be able to legal vend on the street.

21 SHUAI HUI ZHEN: SPEAKING IN MANDARIN [05:25:59]-
22 [05:26:01].

23 INTERPRETER: So nothing else really beyond that.
24 Thank you very much. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Okay, thank you
3 very much and we'll now call the next panel. Roselia
4 Alvarez, Margarita Armenta, Jessica Quintero, Teresa
5 Carpio.

6 Okay, thank you. Please begin. Okay ready?
7 Great thank you.

8 ROSELIA ALVAREZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:27:03]-
9 [05:28:23].

10 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Roselia
11 Alvarez. I come from the Bronx. I am 35 years old.
12 Sorry, I've been here for 35 years correction from
13 Interpreter and I've been a vender for more than 20
14 years. For me, I is an opportunity to work as a
15 street vendor because I'm a single mother and I have
16 the opportunity to work and to spend time with my
17 kids especially because it's just us and to take them
18 to school. Thanks to this, I can pay my rent and I
19 can support them on my own.

20 This is where we get our economic support. I do
21 pay my taxes but I don't want to say that - I don't
22 have the sticker that you're required to put on our
23 carts. I just have the ID because they are not
24 permits for the trucks or the carts. I do have my
25 license but the stickers are no because they're

2 frozen. So, when Sanitation picked me up, told me
3 that I had to get a license for the rent but
4 everything is frozen so everything has to be denied.
5 So, it will be good to pay a rent of cart or of truck
6 that you give us the license so we are not afraid
7 that police and legal enforcement would pick us up
8 from our places or spots or sanitation and take
9 everything from us when they come to us with police.
10 I'm going to know what's going to happen.

11 So, I just want to tell you that we need the help
12 with the licenses and we just want the opportunity
13 for support. We just want to work honestly. We are
14 upstanding members of the society and we just want to
15 have the opportunity to work and to get the licenses.

16 JESSICA QUINTERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

17 [05:31:17]- [05:31:51].

18 INTERPRETER: Hello Chair Members of the
19 Committee. My name is Margarita. I've been a street
20 vendor for more than 25 years. I work in the Bronx
21 neighborhood. I work on my own and this is an
22 opportunity that has let me support my family and
23 work for my family.

24 JESSICA QUINTERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

25 [05:32:31]- [05:32:45].

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 260

2 INTERPRETER: But everything they started to take
3 the merchandize and they have confiscated our goods.
4 It's been very difficult because we lack our income
5 and SPEAKING IN SPANISH. [05:33:01]- [05:33:05]

6 JESSICA QUINTERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
7 [05:33:08]- [05:33:20].

8 INTERPRETER: If you have the license it's
9 \$1,000. If you don't have that, then - if you don't
10 have any ID then if you don't have that then they
11 take your ID and then it is \$2025 to pay for the
12 tickets.

13 JESSICA QUINTERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
14 [05:33:38]-[05:33:44].

15 INTERPRETER: And then Sanitation, the Sanitation
16 Department, the first thing that they say is that you
17 have to go and get a permit. When they perfectly
18 know that there are no permits.

19 JESSICA QUINTERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
20 [05:33:57]-[05:33:59].

21 INTERPRETER: That's everything. Thank you very
22 much.

23 TERESA CARPIO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:34:12]-
24 [05:36:06].

25

2 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Jessica
3 Quintero, an Ecuadorian and I represent the
4 Association for Street Vendors in Corona, in Corona
5 Plaza in Queens and I've been a street vendor in New
6 York City for 20 years. I live at Corona Queens and
7 I work in the neighborhood of Corona Queens as well.

8 I'm here to ask you - to ask the Council that you
9 have to approve the reform package for the street
10 vendors for the proposals or Intro.'s Number 431,
11 408, 47, and 24. These reforms are very important
12 because street vending is unique and I cannot - oh I
13 can only rely on being a street vendor. I can't rely
14 on any other type of jobs but I can rely on street
15 vending. I control my own schedule on my own time,
16 especially I can spend time with my kids and the time
17 and I can provide them the time that they need. From
18 selling, from vending, I'm also I've been able to pay
19 my taxes because I do pay my taxes every year and I
20 pay the sales taxes every three months as well.

21 I do contribute to the economy of this country.
22 Really, at this moment, with Trumps Administration, I
23 am really afraid. I'm scared. I'm scared of
24 immigration police, the NYPD, or the police from the
25 Sanitation Department. They harass me or get uhm a

2 violation against me or that I have to answer to any
3 charges pressed against me or to be detained or
4 deported.

5 The same as any other business, we deserve the
6 support of authorities within this city. It is my
7 dream to obtain a license, a general merchandise
8 license to be able to sell that. Street vendors are
9 self-sufficient. We do not rely on the government.
10 Since - ever since the past year 2024, we've been
11 harassed by police, by New York Police and we've been
12 arrested just as criminals. When in reality, we are
13 working to be able to provide for our kids and give
14 them food.

15 New York Police is giving us criminal tickets.
16 Thank you very much for listening to me and to
17 support the Street Vendors and I also want to say
18 thank you for your support to all the street vendors.
19 God may bless you.

20 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

21 MARGARITA ARMENTA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH

22 [05:40:05]- [05:42:08].

23 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon Chair of the
24 Committee, Council Members and good afternoon to the
25 public. My name is Margarita Armenta. I am a leader

2 of Bronx Street Vendors and a seller of Amway
3 [INAUDIBLE 05:42:28]on Fordham Road in the Bronx. I
4 have been practicing this noble activity for several
5 years and through it, I have been able to educate and
6 support my three children without having to be a
7 burden on the state.

8 I'm here to promote the reform package to
9 informal trade legislation, which will allow all the
10 street vendors to operate in an orderly manner and
11 without the unnecessary pressure from the sanitary or
12 health that deteriorates or Health or the Sanitation
13 Department.

14 I've been the big thing of discrimination by
15 health inspectors who have fined me more than \$2,000,
16 arguing that vitamins are considered food just like
17 toothpaste. Some colleagues have also been victims
18 of these unjustified atrocities. The new legislation
19 will bring hope to thousands of families who depend
20 on our work. It will also create an orderly city
21 with qualified law abiding merchants. Since the
22 courageous and determined Council Members like you,
23 who are committed to serving your community. Thank
24 you.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Great, thank you
3 very much. Okay, I'm going to call the next panel
4 Lou Jang Yung(SP?), Ju Jing Low(SP?), Aio Gu
5 Quin(SP?), Chen Yang Yun, Jou Ku(SP?). If you could
6 please come forward. Anyone? They all left? Oh
7 they all left, okay thank you very much. Thank you,
8 we're going to call the next panel thank you. Okay,
9 and we also need a Mandarin translator for this next
10 panel please. Thank you.

11 Lin Yun Mu(SP?), oh okay, Chun Me Gee(SP?), Jou
12 Ya Wang(SP?), A Long(SP?), Yu Yan Lin(SP?). Oh they
13 all left, okay thank you very much. Okay next panel
14 Robert Martinez, Andrew Gustafson, Arial Mince(SP?),
15 Duane Jackson9SP?), Stefanie Bonen(SP?). Ah you're
16 solo, just you okay, no one else on that panel?
17 Okay, please begin.

18 ANDREW GUSTAFSON: Good afternoon. My name is
19 Andrew Gustafson, I'm here to testify today in
20 support of Intro.'s 431 and 408. I'm the Vice
21 President Turn Style Tours, a social enterprise that
22 works with nonprofit organizations that develop and
23 operate tour programs across New York City.

24 Over the past 15 years, our team has had the
25 honor to work with hundreds of vendors, while leading

2 tours about the city's street food industry. We've
3 hosted tens of thousands of visitors from around the
4 world and on our tours, we try to make visitors
5 understand the experience of street vendors
6 navigating the regulatory maze in New York City. Not
7 just the chapter and verse of the regulations but how
8 they play out in the real life vendors.

9 The virtual impossibility of receiving a legal
10 permit. The constantly shifting rules and arbitrary
11 decisions of enforcement officers. The endless
12 tickets and summons issued by a half dozen different
13 agencies. The constant fear of having your
14 livelihood and perhaps even your freedom taken away.

15 For many street vending is not a chosen
16 profession but one born of necessity. We're in the
17 midst of an unprecedented global migration crisis
18 with more people now displaced from their homes than
19 in any other point in human history. New York City
20 has been a refuge for so many people and street
21 vending is how they have survived as so many people
22 have attested to today.

23 We should be creating pathways for people to make
24 better lives for themselves in this city and in this
25 country. Instead, the current regulatory regime

2 makes it harder for people to make a living and it
3 places vendors at greater risk for arrest and
4 deportation. That street vending policy is bad
5 immigration policy and it makes the New York City
6 government and the City Council complicit in the
7 cruel, racist and destructive mass deportation agenda
8 of the Trump Administration.

9 What street vendors want and what all New Yorkers
10 want is a clear, fair and well regulated system where
11 small businesses can be successful and contribute to
12 their communities. Vendors want to operate legally.
13 These bills offer them a much more viable pathway to
14 do that. Vendors want to follow the rules. These
15 bills will provide them with the education and
16 support services they need to do that. These bills
17 will not lead to more street vendors. The vendors
18 are already there but instead they'll be legal and
19 regulated, thus better protecting the vendors
20 themselves and the public.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I'm just going to ask you to
22 wrap up please and then submit your testimony.

23 ANDREW GUSTAFSON: Yup, so thank you so much for
24 listening to my testimony. I hope you will support
25 moving these bills forward. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 267

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. I'm now
3 going to call our next panel, Lily Gonzalez(SP?),
4 Isabelle Rosario(SP?), Marybelle Padraza(SP?) and
5 then Antonio. Are any of them-anyone that I called
6 here?

7 Okay, they're gone, alright. Okay now we have;
8 we will need the Spanish Translator please for the
9 next panel Lucia Maldonado, Flor Caballero, Marlene
10 Ensaldo, Lola Siguencia, Tiffany Hervas. Are any one
11 that I called here? Okay.

12 Please begin, thank you.

13 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:49:33]-
14 [05:49:41].

15 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. Thank you for
16 having us here. I can see all of you're women.

17 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:49:45]-
18 [05:49:49].

19 INTERPRETER: And I'm very pleased to see that
20 because we know we're empowered women fighters.

21 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:49:54]-
22 [05:49:57].

23 INTERPRETER: And we fight for our children.

24 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:50:03]-
25 [05:50:09].

2 INTERPRETER: What I ask of you with all my heart

3 -

4 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:50:12]-
5 [05:50:23].

6 INTERPRETER: So, please make this reform pass
7 because we are women and we want to do the best for
8 our children, have them study.

9 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:50:33]-
10 [05:50:38]-

11 INTERPRETER: And I also want to a little
12 personally.

13 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:50:41]-
14 [05:50:44].

15 INTERPRETER: I've worked in the streets for 15
16 years.

17 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:50:46]-
18 [05:50:51].

19 INTERPRETER: But fortunately I want to work
20 under the law.

21 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:00]-
22 [05:51:08].

23 INTERPRETER: Three years ago with a lot of
24 effort, I bought my food truck.

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 269

2 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:12]-
3 [05:51:18].

4 INTERPRETER: And I'm renting a black market
5 permit.

6 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:20]-
7 [05:51:27].

8 INTERPRETER: And I thought I would be okay but
9 unfortunately it's not like that.

10 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:30]-
11 [05:51:34].

12 INTERPRETER: Because the money that thought I
13 would be able to save for my children's future -

14 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:37]-
15 [05:51:42].

16 INTERPRETER: Is being spent in other peoples
17 hands, passing to other people.

18 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:51:46]-
19 [05:51:56].

20 INTERPRETER: And I know that I cannot continue
21 giving \$20,000 away instead of for the city.

22 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:03]-
23 [05:52:08].

24

25

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 270

2 INTERPRETER: Because I want a better future for
3 my children, allowing them to have studies with my
4 own work and my efforts.

5 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:14]-
6 [05:52:19].

7 INTERPRETER: Because I already did it with one
8 of my daughters. She studied general nursing.

9 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:23]-
10 [05:52:30].

11 INTERPRETER: But I'm not being able to -

12 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:31]-
13 [05:52:33].

14 INTERPRETER: But I'm not being able to do it
15 right now with my other three children because all
16 the money that I'm earning is going away in the Black
17 market.

18 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:41]-
19 [05:52:48].

20 INTERPRETER: That's what I'm asking you, please
21 on behalf and all these women with their children
22 that we can move ahead.

23 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:52:59]-
24 [05:53:09].

25

2 INTERPRETER: So that's what we want you to
3 understand and we ask you from the bottom of our
4 hearts.

5 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:53:15]-
6 [05:53:26] -

7 INTERPRETER: So that we don't have to be running
8 and if Sanitation comes and they don't see my name on
9 the permit, then we have to run and we live with this
10 fear every day.

11 LUCIA MALDONADO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:53:36].

12 INTERPRETER: Thank you very much for your
13 attention.

14 LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:53:50]-
15 [05:53:58].

16 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Lola
17 Siguencia and I come from Ecuador.

18 LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:54:06]-
19 [05:54:10].

20 INTERPRETER: And I work as a street vendor in
21 Johnson and 37th.

22 LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:54:14]-
23 [05:54:23].

24 INTERPRETER: And I say that the situation for me
25 has become very needy.

2 LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:54:26]-
3 [05:54:31].

4 INTERPRETER: So the police have taken my things
5 three times. I paid my tickets.

6 LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:54:36]-
7 [05:54:40].

8 INTERPRETER: And what I'm afraid of -

9 LOLA SIGUENCIA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:54:42]-
10 [05:54:44].

11 INTERPRETER: The nerves are killing me because
12 I'm always afraid that ICE or the police are going to
13 come for me and that's it, thank you.

14 MARLENE ENSALDO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [05:55:06]-
15 [05:57:29].

16 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon Madam Chair of the
17 Council. Oh okay, my name is Marlene Ensaldo and I
18 am the leader of the Bronx Street Vendors and I have
19 been selling street fruit for several years in the
20 Bronx.

21 At our last membership meeting on April 30th, we
22 honored our children and as they introduced
23 themselves, the children, we were able to see what we
24 were building. Five of the kids aspired to police
25 officers. Two others want to be doctors and

2 veterinarians but one child in particular told the
3 audience that he wanted to be a lawyer to defend
4 merchants and prevent them from taking their wages.
5 Every child in our homes represents a professional
6 for the development of BIDs, your city and your
7 country. We street vendors sacrifice our youth and
8 we sacrificed our youth and invested our time to
9 leave for you a different legacy. Because my work on
10 the streets offers no guarantee other than survival.
11 That is why we ask you to make wise decisions based
12 on the commitment of our community and the justice
13 that a vulnerable community demands.

14 On behalf of us and our children, thank you for
15 the opportunity.

16 ANA: SPEAKING IN SPANISH: [05:58:52]-
17 [06:00:33].

18 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon Madam Council
19 Speaker and good morning everyone esteemed Council
20 Members and to the public. My name is Ana. I am the
21 leader of Bronx Street Vendor and I sell general
22 merchandise in the Bronx. I have met today to ask
23 you to approve this package of laws believing that it
24 will necessarily have to follow process that in
25

2 practice demonstrate real changes and complicate
3 different and inclusive legislation.

4 Sanitation was given the legal authority to
5 regulate in formal commerce since April of 2023. Two
6 long years have passed and there is no evidence of
7 significant improvements in street vending. The only
8 thing that has been evident is how they leave entire
9 families fragmented, in dept and bewildered. This
10 shows that as long as persecution, arrogance,
11 discrimination and racism are used as tools to impose
12 on just laws, dialogue, agreements and coherence will
13 be unnecessary.

14 On behalf of all the vendors in New York City,
15 thank you.

16 TIFFANY HERVAS: Good afternoon honorable Chair,
17 esteemed Council Members and fellow New Yorkers. I
18 am Tiffany Hervas, the President of the National
19 Association of Puerto Rican Hispanic Social Workers
20 and the Cofounder of Algundia.

21 I stand before you today to support Intro.'s,
22 particularly 408 and Intro. 431 and shed light on the
23 pressing challenges faced by immigrant families,
24 particularly in children engaged in street vending.

2 Algundia, which means someday, is a grass roots
3 volunteer led project born out of the resilience and
4 commitment of formerly undocumented immigrants,
5 dreamers and first generation New Yorkers. Our
6 mission is simple but urgent. To support migrant
7 families, especially children who have become
8 vendors, street vendors selling candy in the New York
9 City Subway systems just to survive. We're doing
10 this work, just because we know that street vending
11 is not just an act of survival, it's a form of
12 entrepreneurship in a system that too often fails to
13 provide pathways for newly arrived immigrants, via
14 our project and by testifying here, our goal is to
15 shift that narrative. These families are not a
16 public safety issue. They are our neighbors full of
17 hope and potential, vendor rights, dignity and
18 solutions.

19 Into Intro. 408 and 431 represent a critical step
20 toward regulatory reform that our city urgently
21 needs. These bills would finally give street vendors
22 a fair and transparent system to operate within,
23 allowing them to provide services New Yorkers rely on
24 in a regulated, predictable and safe framework. For
25 too long our city has treated street vending as a

2 criminal act rather than recognizing that the vendors
3 are just people trying to survive. Via our project,
4 we conducted a survey where we identified 88 percent
5 of vendors began doing so out of necessity to keep
6 their families afloat. This outdated approach has
7 only deepened economic hardship and fear in
8 vulnerable communities. Instead of punishing vendors
9 for trying to support their families, the city must
10 remove unnecessary barriers. Intro. 408 represents a
11 transformative opportunity for street vendors across
12 New York City, especially migrants. We can attest
13 that it will make difference, as in our survey we
14 found that 93 percent of candy selling vendors in the
15 subway had not received any assistance from
16 organizations, agencies and 60 percent indicated fear
17 of incurring fines and police interaction while
18 vending.

19 Many cited a lack of childcare, case on point and
20 awareness of city services as key barriers to finding
21 safer, more sustainable work. Intro. 408 would help
22 prevent families from being pushed into unsafe and
23 unlicensed vending by giving them the tools and
24 information they need up front before fines, before
25 fear or enforcement come into play.

2 With that, thank you for your time and
3 consideration. It is Algundia's hope that the City
4 Council takes the critical step of passing Intro.
5 431.

6 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm going to ask you to
7 wrap up please.

8 TIFFANY HERVAS: And the street vendor reform
9 package.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Great, thank you very much.
11 Thank you so much to this panel. Oh no sorry,
12 there's one more person. Sorry about that. Okay,
13 right is there one more person who didn't? Yes, I
14 believe you didn't, yes. Thank you.

15 FLOR CABALLERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:05:07]-
16 [06:05:12]

17 INTERPRETER: Good afternoon. My name is Flor
18 Cabellero. I come from Corona Plaza.

19 FLOR CABALLERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:05:21]-
20 [06:05:36].

21 INTERPRETER: I am here to ask you please to
22 allow us to have permits to work freely in the
23 streets because we work to support our children and
24 we don't depend on the city. Thank you.

2 FLOR CABALLERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:05:55]-
3 [06:05:58].

4 INTERPRETER: And I ask you to please help us and
5 support us.

6 FLOR CABALLERO: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:06:00].

7 INTERPRETER: And thank you.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: I just want to take this
9 moment. I know I stepped away from the dais but I
10 just want to take this moment to say how powerful it
11 is to see you and I'll say it in Spanish, to see you
12 testifying with your child as I listen with my child.
13 You know we're doing this for the next generation.
14 Everything that we do, they see and I hope that you
15 know this Council will be able to make them all
16 proud. So, SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:06:36]-
17 [06:07:11].

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much for that
19 panel. Thank you.

20 Okay, great we're going to keep on going. Uhm,
21 okay the next panel, we need an Arabic translator
22 please. Mohamed Awad, Victor Cha Cha(SP?), Jiamfony
23 Corseni(SP?), Jimmy Joel Hernandez, Jennifer Salgado.
24 Okay, please begin. Thank you.

2 MOHAMED AWAD: My name is Mohamed Awad. I
3 attended here to support the Street Vendor Project
4 Package that include its Law 431, 408, 47 and 24.
5 Actually I changed my whole testimony after I hear a
6 lot of stuff coming from some organizations that make
7 testimony today. One of them is blame. Street
8 vendors are not paying tickets; we just get tickets
9 and we're not paying the tickets. So, I just paid
10 yesterday almost \$2,000 and if you guys, Madam Chair
11 if you want to see that receipt, I can show you the
12 receipt right now.

13 Yesterday, I just paid \$2,000 fines, so who claim
14 the street vendors doesn't pay tickets, it's totally
15 lies. So, Madam Chair if you want to see the
16 receipt, I can show you the receipt.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: You're welcome to submit
18 anything in writing that you want. Thank you so
19 much.

20 MOHAMED AWAD: Thank you. Okay, so the other
21 one, one organization that testified earlier, you had
22 this on your BID. They say they don't want more
23 permit for vendors and they don't think vendors
24 should use generators. The problem is, a vendor who
25 works with them and pays in the park, they use

2 generators every single day. They show you the lies
3 and stuff. We're dealing with this; a statement came
4 in about the street vendors. I'm sorry. So, as they
5 don't like street vendors. You want to eliminate the
6 vendors when we are [INAUDIBLE 06:09:51].

7 So, is he talking about we're not supposed to use
8 generators and the guy from the Haddison Yard BID,
9 zero in for street vendors and they let him use
10 generators. Okay and that's it, thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much.

12 JENNIFER SALGADO: Hello everyone, my name is
13 Jennifer Salgado. I'm the daughter of a former
14 street vendor and a life long resident of the Bronx.
15 I'm here today to express my full support for bills
16 431, 408, and the rest of the Street Vendor Reform
17 Package.

18 When I sat down to write this testimony, I
19 thought about telling my mother's vending story but
20 the truth is, her story isn't unique. It mirrors
21 what so many vendors have already shared today. The
22 only difference is that her struggle happened over 20
23 years ago. And yet, here we are nothing has changed,
24 so instead, I want to speak to what I see now in the
25 neighborhoods of Kings Bridge and Fordham. Both of

2 which are areas I've worked and lived in. These are
3 communities built on hustle. Commercial corridors
4 that are full of life because of both storefronts and
5 vendors, yet somehow, vendors are treated as threats
6 to those storefronts. But let's be honest, the
7 biggest threats of brick and mortar small businesses
8 isn't a vendor, it's skyrocketing rents. It's the
9 city's own neglect, real estate speculation further
10 facilitated by BIDs, often lead by individuals who
11 live outside of the neighborhood or even out of
12 state. Making them disconnected from the needs of
13 their own members.

14 We heard business representatives here today say
15 that we need regulation and I agree, we all agree.
16 We are living under a broken unregulated system that
17 picks neighbors against each other. Bill 431 is a
18 step toward fixing that. It offers real regulation,
19 accountability and protection for vendors and brick
20 and mortar businesses.

21 Finally, I ask you to think about the city's
22 youngest New Yorkers. I was just a child when I had
23 to deal with my parents getting ticketed, arrested
24 and pushed out. How many more children does the city
25 want to traumatize under the current system? You

2 have a chance to change the course of thousands of
3 lives and I ask you to vote in favor of this reform
4 package. Thank you very much.

5 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you for your testimony
6 and we're now going to move on to the next panel, Ana
7 Villa, Magnum Navarate(SP?). I apologize, it's hard
8 to read the handwriting on this one, Leeane G-Bowley,
9 Mahmoud Zaed, Jackson Chabot. If you could please
10 come down. Thank you.

11 LEEANE G-BOWLEY: Good afternoon my name is
12 Leeane G-Bowley. I am a home owner in Elmhurst
13 Queens, a voter, educator and director of public
14 programs and partnerships at a Corona cultural
15 institution. I've served multiple terms on the
16 Queens Community Board 4, including on the executive
17 and zoning Committees and I thank you for your time
18 as I testify to support Intro.'s 431 and 408.

19 I walk daily to the institution where I work from
20 Elmhurst to Corona and it reveals the power of our
21 community and the role street vendors play in our
22 lives. Families gather for meals before school. Our
23 streets feel safer at night when I walk home because
24 the vendors are there and their customers light up
25 our neighborhood. Our committee - yet our city

2 disincentivizes these small businesses that bring
3 economic security and public safety to our streets.
4 The lack of available permits is weaponized against
5 my community and I'm going to actually go for my
6 testimony to respond to the DSNY testimony earlier.
7 For example, on October 21, 2024, I was walking home
8 from Roosevelt Avenue and saw a large NYPD truck with
9 a number of street vendor products and carts on it.
10 I asked why the DSNY wasn't doing enforcement and the
11 NYPD told me they're gone for the day so we have to
12 do it. That is not what was testified to earlier
13 today and it quite frankly disturbs me.

14 When I speak to the leadership at my local
15 precinct, they said I know I think you think it's
16 cute to get authentic food on the street but they're
17 breaking the law. Let's talk about breaking the law.
18 We see our Mayor who threatens compliance with the
19 legal tactics of mass deportation in collaboration
20 with the federal government. A federal government
21 that continues to break the law and defy court
22 mandates. Passing these Intro.'s directly addresses
23 the sphere mongering and potential legal actions from
24 our government by getting rid of an arbitrary cap
25

2 that puts local small businesses at risk of police
3 engagement.

4 Now, you can take that weapon out of the hands of
5 those who want to harm these entrepreneurs, these
6 small business owners and my neighbors in Elmhurst
7 and Corona. Another indication that the City Council
8 should pass Intro.'s 431 and 408 - I'll wrap up, is
9 our local youth know that it's the right thing to do.
10 Last year, I coproduced a local production where
11 students showed their immigration stories through a
12 play. Central to that play was the characters
13 struggle to support her family.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask
15 you to wrap up because we have to give everyone the
16 exact same amount of time.

17 LEEANE G-BOWLEY: As a street vendor project, the
18 students enacted seeking a permit combating fraud due
19 to lack of appropriate government regulations and
20 support.

21 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay just please submit your
22 written testimony. We'll take that. Thank you so
23 much.

24 LEEANE G-BOWLEY: Thank you so much for your
25 time.

2 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Okay, next thank
3 you.

4 MAHMOUD ZAED: Hello everyone. My name Mahmoud
5 Zaed. Before I give my testimony, I have a comment
6 to one of the testimonies that was given earlier
7 today. One of the testimonies says that we are food
8 vendors. We keep getting tickets that we never pay.
9 Maybe we hang it on the wall. I, myself, have paid
10 this month, not this month, last month \$4,975 and I
11 still have more tickets to come that I'm still
12 fighting. Last year, I paid almost \$12,000 for
13 violation. So, we pay tickets. They're trying to
14 get us out of business and we struggle to continue
15 with that business.

16 I've been a food vendor since 2008 and I started
17 my own business in 2009 and had to rent a permit
18 through the Black market as I have never been able to
19 obtain one in my own name. My business has grown
20 over the years and we now have cars and trucks in
21 Midtown, the upper east side and Long Island City.
22 For years, I have been forced to pay thousands of
23 dollars every two years to people who were able to
24 get permits directly from the city. While they only
25

2 pay a small fee force it be a huge expense that
3 ultimately is passed onto my customers.

4 The system is unfair and sustainable to small
5 business owners like me. We need the city to issue
6 more permits and Intro. 431 is a clear answer to
7 speed up the permitting processes. I am a number
8 myself, I'm a number 1,259 on the waiting list and so
9 far, the city has only reached 865, the number.

10 Intro. 431, we will get more permits, vendor
11 faster -

12 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask
13 you to wrap up please.

14 MAHMOUD ZAED: If all vendors can get permits
15 under their own name with the reduced cost
16 significantly, this would allow us to lower our cost
17 on the price that we use.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay and if you could just
19 submit your written testimony please. Thank you very
20 much.

21 MAHMOUD ZAED: Thank you. You're welcome, thank
22 you.

23 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay next.

24 EMILIA SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:18:03]-
25 [06:18:12].

1 COMMITTEE ON CONSUMER AND WORKER PROTECTION 287

2 INTERPRETER: My name is Emilia Legavon(SP?) and
3 I sell Amway products by the -

4 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:18:22]-
5 [06:18:29].

6 INTERPRETER: Sanitation issued two tickets to me
7 of \$1,250.

8 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:18:34].

9 INTERPRETER: I paid them.

10 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:18:37]-
11 [06:18:48].

12 INTERPRETER: So I asked Sanitation what I needed
13 to do in order to sell legally as they were asking me
14 to.

15 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:18:54]-
16 [06:19:01].

17 INTERPRETER: They asked me to go to 42nd and
18 Broadway to get a permit that they had permits to
19 sell.

20 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:07]-
21 [06:19:13].

22 INTERPRETER: I went, I took the class and they
23 did not give me the permit to sell.

24 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:17]-
25 [06:19:20].

2 INTERPRETER: They gave me a temporary permit.

3 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:22]-
4 [06:19:28].

5 INTERPRETER: And they told me that was allowed
6 as food but it is not allowed as food.

7 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:34]-
8 [06:19:41].

9 INTERPRETER: Later on, I rented a space out of a
10 store.

11 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:45]-
12 [06:19:51].

13 INTERPRETER: And again, they came, they took all
14 my things saying that that permit was not valid.

15 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:19:56]-
16 [06:20:10].

17 INTERPRETER: I want to ask you to please pass
18 those permits because we don't want to work
19 illegally.

20 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:20:14]-
21 [06:20:16].

22 INTERPRETER: And we don't want to be persecuted
23 as if we were thieves.

24 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:20:20]-
25 [06:20:32].

2 INTERPRETER: We need to be heard because we are
3 contributing to the country, to the state, we pay our
4 taxes.

5 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:20:37]-
6 [06:20:42].

7 INTERPRETER: We pay a sales tax. We pay
8 personal taxes as well.

9 EMILIA LAGAVON: SPEAKING IN SPANISH [06:20:48]-
10 [06:21:02].

11 INTERPRETER: And it's all that I'm asking,
12 please pass those reforms so that we can permits to
13 work. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you.

15 JACKSON CHABOT: Good afternoon. My name is
16 Jackson Chabot. I'm the Director of Advocacy and
17 Organizing at Open Plans. Where we advocate for New
18 York City streets, sidewalks and plaza's. I'm here
19 today to express Open Plans strong support for
20 Council bills Intro. 431 and 408, which proposed by
21 the reforms to New York City street vending laws.
22 These bills will not only provide thousands of
23 vendors the opportunity to operate legally but also
24 ensure the continued vibrancy of our public spaces.

2 Street vendors are a cornerstone of New York
3 City's culture, economy, offering diverse, affordable
4 foods and goods. They enrich our public spaces,
5 contributing to the city's unique energy and
6 fostering social interaction.

7 Vendors also support the local economies,
8 particularly in underserved neighborhoods and provide
9 valuable services to both residents and tourists.

10 Personally, they come into the rally, someone tried
11 to order a hot dog about 9:45 this morning and the
12 vendor did not have one by City Hall, so not a choice
13 I would make but it was something I overheard this
14 morning.

15 I'd like focus on the current siting regulations.
16 The current siting guidelines for street vendors are
17 rigorous and they're very specifically designed and
18 many of them date back many, many years ago before
19 many of us were born.

20 They were put in place allegedly to balance
21 economic activity with public safety but what they do
22 right now is our over prescriptive and offer many
23 places where vendors cannot vend. So, I've heard
24 today from some folks that if the caps were lifted,
25 vendors could vend anywhere and we know based on the

2 current regulations, this is simply not the case.

3 There are specific 12 foot pedestrian path clearances
4 for example.

5 And so, when we see this there is also these
6 restricted zones that I mentioned in specific areas
7 such as bus stops, taxi stands, near subway entrances
8 as well as specific parts of the city including
9 Midtown among other places. These rules were put in
10 place and they offer very specific parameters. So,
11 again, when we say that we're potentially lifting the
12 caps or the permits here, there are still places -

13 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay I'm just going to ask
14 you to wrap up.

15 JACKSON CHABOT: Where vendors would not be able
16 to vend. I'm asking you to take these bills into the
17 phase and please pass them expeditiously. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you to that
19 panel. I'm now going to call the last in person
20 panel and if you are here and you want to speak and
21 you haven't heard your name called, please just go
22 see a Sergeant at Arms and fill out a card and then
23 I'll be going to the Zoom panel because we had some
24 speakers on Zoom. Mouhel Ahmed, Christopher Leon
25 Johnson, Sharon Brown. Okay great.

2 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Hello, Chairs my name
3 - oh sorry, sorry.

4 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Oh sorry, hold on one second.
5 Oh, oh yes, yes, give us one second, we're just going
6 to do a quick translation in Spanish.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: SPEAKING IN SPANISH
8 [06:24:19]- [06:24:33].

9 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you very much. Okay,
10 please begin.

11 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Yeah, yeah, hello
12 Chairs Menin and Chair Sanchez. My name is
13 Christopher Leon Johnson. I'm speaking on behalf of
14 myself. I'm wearing this hat to show my support to
15 the Street Vendor Project and the Worker Justice
16 Project. I want all the bills to go through. Thank
17 you for finally having this hearing Ms. Menin. I
18 don't know - I know that you don't understand how
19 appreciated you are for having this hearing. I
20 appreciate you having this hearing. We've been
21 waiting for almost well, three years now for this
22 hearing, so thank you for that.

23 Alright, so the reason I'm supporting these two
24 bills is because we need to lift all the caps. We
25 need to eradicate all caps for these vendors and they

2 need to be able to sell this stuff anywhere they want
3 without harassment of the NYPD. Not only these
4 license, these guys and gals are here, they deserve
5 to make money here without no worrying about being
6 harassed by the NYPD and even to these days under the
7 Trump Administration ICE or DHS.

8 At the same time, the City Council needs to
9 condemn Franciso Moya, our Council Member because he
10 is against these guys and gals because there's a
11 stadium called, the New York City [INAUDIBLE
12 06:25:42] stadium that that team suck anyway. He
13 don't want these guys around Corona is because he
14 don't want the tourists and the people that's going
15 to try and watch those games see those people sell
16 mixed stuff there.

17 Now, there's a lot of economic racism that's
18 going on with this Council Member, with Francisco
19 Moya. I think he's an economic racist because if you
20 say you care about immigrants, why you against these
21 vendors selling stuff on the street. Everybody know
22 he's weaponized by Mazi Lugo, Ramis Freeas(SP?), and
23 his hidden homeboy Hira Mossaratt(SP?). So this City
24 Council like I said, not only do these bills need to
25 pass in the City Council, all these bills, they need

2 a public accommodation of Council Member Francisco
3 Moya for his economic racism towards these street
4 vendors, these guys and gals.

5 So, at the end of the day -

6 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm going to ask you to
7 wrap it up.

8 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: I know, I'm going to
9 wrap it up. I'm wrapping up. I'm going to wrap it
10 up. Uhm, cops city is happening in 2026. I am
11 calling on you the next Speaker of the City Council
12 to block all funding.

13 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay.

14 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: Block all funding -

15 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: I'm going to ask you to wrap
16 up. Thank you.

17 CHRISTOPHER LEON JOHNSON: I know \$20 million.
18 Thank you. No cop city, thank you. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay and next speaker.

20 MOUHEL AHMED: SPEAKING IN ARABIC [06:27:01]-
21 [06:29:54].

22 INTERPRETER: Thank you so much for giving me the
23 opportunity and your patience and listening to voices
24 that often go unheard. Voices from sidewalks, from
25 those who power the city, the city and formal economy

2 and fight every day just to survive. My name is
3 Mouhel Ahmed, I'm a journalist of Brooklyn and proud
4 member of the Street Vendor Project.

5 What bring me today is not for a report or
6 personal lease. It comes from feel from an earlier
7 story I have documented over the years. Stories that
8 out of elected, the harsh and often unjust reality
9 faced by thousands of street vendors in New York
10 City, especially immigrants and working class
11 families.

12 Number one, when help is needed, silence follow
13 us and again I have seen law enforcement.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, I'm just going to ask
15 you to wrap that up please.

16 INTERPRETER: Alright sure.

17 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: You can submit it in writing.
18 Yeah, you can submit it in writing. Great, thank you
19 very much. Thank you. Okay that concludes our in
20 person testimony. I'm now going to go to Zoom. We
21 have three speakers on Zoom and then I'm going to
22 call everyone who signed up on Zoom who we just want
23 to make sure that we did not leave anyone out. Bill
24 Bruno, Sandra Jaquez and Justin Pollack on Zoom.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

2 BILL BRUNO: Thank you so much Chairman Menin and
3 Council Members. My name is Bill Bruno. I'm from
4 Jackson Heights, the Center of West Street Vendor
5 activity and I'm here to testify for Intro.'s 408 and
6 431. Street vending provides both an important
7 business income and clearly a service to the
8 community because people are shopping there and
9 buying them. So, they meet a demand.

10 Since the sidewalk space many use, you need to
11 have a system to balance the needs of the
12 stakeholders. The current approach of doubling down
13 enforcement doesn't do that. City limits pointed out
14 NYPD tickets in 2024 is five times what they were in
15 2019 and twice as many in 2023.

16 So, clearly the peer enforcement approach did the
17 trick. This would have solved the problem and also
18 clearer enforcement is not being tried. So, instead
19 not only do we have a needlessly punitive treatment
20 in the street vendors, we don't have an organized
21 system and be legalized, educated and everything will
22 be better balanced.

23 431 removes and 408 is an important part of
24 educating them and that will integrate them into the
25 system and reduce the burden on enforcement. 431

2 removes an arbitrary cap. Arbitrary because it's
3 uneasy to organize the street spaces doesn't get rid
4 of the other sidewalk requirements like leading
5 sidewalk space and not crowding doorways.
6 Furthermore, enforcement efforts didn't constitute
7 permits could then regulate that.

8 I checked the OATH data base for my neighborhood.
9 The two precincts that cover Roosevelt Avenue, in
10 2024, the first three quarters, over three quarters
11 of the police OATH stuff, the summonses were for
12 permit violations. They're simply not being able to
13 get a permit only about a quarter of the things you'd
14 want our enforcement to regulate. You know sidewalk
15 space, uh proximity to doors and so on. So, in other
16 words, you have a blunt instrument that focuses on
17 that, so by risking the permit cap, integrating the
18 system, providing education resources, you can not
19 only regulate in a way that -

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

21 BILL BRUNO: Alright, thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay next.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

24 SANDRA JAQUEZ: Hi, this is Sandra Jaquez. Chair
25 Menin and members of the Committee on Consumer Worker

2 Protection. Thank you for the opportunity to share
3 comments today on the issue of street vending in New
4 York City. My name is Sandra Jaquez and I serve as
5 the President of the New York State Latino Bar and
6 Association.

7 We represent Hispanic and minority owned
8 restaurants bars and nightlife establishments
9 throughout the five boroughs. Our members are small
10 business owners, many of whom are immigrants who have
11 invested their time and energy into building
12 neighborhood establishments that serve as cultural
13 anchors, economic drivers and community gathering
14 spaces. These businesses operate in compliance with
15 city laws and regulations and continue to persevere
16 despite the significant challenges facing the
17 hospitality industry including inflation, rising
18 commercial rents and neighbor shortages.

19 We've heard testimonies that expressed concern
20 about the state of New York City street vending
21 system. The current lack of effectiveness
22 enforcement has led to widespread disorder. This
23 system is failing and in its current form, it is
24 increasingly disadvantaged to brick and mortar
25 establishments. What we are seeing today is that a

2 balance or well-regulated system, a coalition of
3 vending activities with minimal oversight and
4 inconsistent consequences.

5 Before the city considers any expansion of street
6 vending permits, it must first demonstrate that a
7 functional, effective, enforcement structure isn't
8 safe. That means consistent, coordinated and well-
9 resourced enforcement. It also means acknowledgement
10 that weak enforcement is not mutual. It has a direct
11 and damaging impact on small business owners who are
12 playing by the rules and paying the price. Raising
13 the vendor cap without first fixing enforcement will
14 not only - it will not resolve the underlying
15 problem; it would only deepen them.

16 Restaurants and nightlife establishments deserve
17 a level playing field in the public realm where rules
18 are applied fairly and enforced evenly. Our members
19 are subject to vigorous inspection and must comply
20 with strict health and safety standards, particularly
21 regarding time and preparation.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

23 SANDRA JAQUEZ: Thank you.

24 JUSTIN POLLACK: Good afternoon. My name is
25 Justin Pollack. I live on the upper west side and I

2 wanted to address something that I haven't heard yet
3 during this really interesting hearing, which is the
4 impact of street vendors on office workers like
5 myself because I work in Manhattan at an investment
6 firm that manages over \$150 billion, and over the
7 past five years really since COVID, we've literalized
8 our office policy to allow lot more work from home.
9 Because rather than enforce everyone back to the
10 office, we're looking for reasons to have them want
11 to come into Midtown and I wish that was working with
12 me but the reality is that's not quite enough reason
13 for them to get on trains and buses and have long
14 commutes. In the same way, they also don't go to
15 Broadway shows every night. They don't go to lunch
16 for hours at fancy restaurants but what they told me
17 is they will come to the office because they get
18 access to street food that they simply can't get
19 where they live. In a lot of suburban neighborhoods
20 where they are all around the city, they can get
21 salads and hamburgers from the same chain restaurants
22 that exists right off Park Avenue but what they can't
23 get is access to Jam Rock Jerk Chicken on Park Avenue
24 or Uncle Gussies Greek Food or the King of Falafel
25 Middle Eastern Menu, Kal Kang on wheels has really

2 great Tai food or even you know a staple, Giannottos
3 Pizza Truck. All those things are critical to
4 getting our stock traders, our bond traders, our
5 sales people, all of them back to the firm working
6 and supporting the broader ecosystem and money that
7 they spend in this city because the alternative is to
8 give them an experience in New York that's just like
9 the one that they have at home and they're going to
10 stay there. So, I just want to encourage you to pass
11 this series of reform bills for street vendors
12 because it's going to contribute to the rebuilding of
13 office life here in New York City. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Alright, we also have on I'm
15 going to call the next three panelists on Zoom Ariel
16 Mintz(SP?), Rob Martinez and Samna Escondar(SP?).

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

18 UNIDENTIFIED: Hi everyone. I just wanted to say
19 a big thank you to the Chair and the Council for the
20 truly yeomen's effort involved in listening to all
21 these testimonies today. I just have one 30 second
22 thing to add into the mix a little bit. I'm looking
23 to start an independent coding label in New York City
24 and I think that one really powerful way to connect
25 with customers and people who would be interested in

2 the brand would be by selling on the street and
3 really meeting people face to face, and I was
4 disappointed, surprised to find out that it's
5 literally impossible for me to do that right now.
6 I'd love to see these Resolutions pass and be able to
7 get an opportunity to sell my wares in the street and
8 start making those connections with fellow New
9 Yorkers.

10 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Okay, thank you. Next
11 speaker. Next speaker please.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: You may begin.

13 ROB MARTINEZ: Good afternoon. My name is Rob
14 Martinez. I am a film maker and content creator. I
15 make videos about people in food. I would like to
16 thank Chair Menin and the Committee for the
17 opportunity to testify today in support of Intro.'s
18 431 and 408. There are few videos that I've made in
19 my life that have been more beloved than the videos I
20 have made about New York City street vendors, whether
21 it was [INAUDIBLE 06:39:47] who is amazing. It was
22 made the New York Time top dishes of 2024 or with
23 Fidel Cortes, when New York Magazine dubbed the Lemon
24 Ice King of Bushwick Brooklyn or with the less but
25 equally important [INAUDIBLE 06:40:01] who have

2 opened their commissary kitchens to me at 2 in the
3 morning where they prep until 6 a.m. to be ready to
4 feed hungry New Yorkers on their commute. These
5 folks don't take up much space on the street but
6 they've earned a massive space in the culture of New
7 York City.

8 I was recently asked to contribute to a popular
9 You Tube food channel with over 10 million
10 subscribers and they were producing a street food
11 competition between the cities of Austin, Portland,
12 Los Angeles and New York City. In Austin and
13 Portland, the street food scene is a vibrant pop up
14 scene, an incubator for entrepreneurs who can't
15 afford a brick and mortar.

16 In Los Angeles, street vending has been
17 decriminalized and one of its most famous food trucks
18 inspired the movie Chef, but in New York we have a
19 broken system where vendors allocates for food but
20 aren't given the opportunity to sell it legally. I
21 wasn't able to recommend some of the vendors that I
22 love most because increasing visibility on their
23 business might actually harm their business, which is
24 insane.

2 New York lost that street food competition. We
3 came in last and the video currently sits at 3.4
4 million views on You Tube. I wish street vendors in
5 New York were given the same opportunity to thrive as
6 they are in these other major cities. This package
7 of bills will let vendors provide the services New
8 Yorkers want in a regulated, predictable and
9 enforceable system and given a real chance to build
10 wealth in their neighborhoods.

11 The city must not criminalize street vendors for
12 trying to provide for their families but instead cut
13 the red tape and facilitate a healthy regulatory
14 environment for our small businesses to thrive.
15 Street vendors deserve a shot at success like all New
16 Yorkers. This includes a fair opportunity to make a
17 living free from harassment. Thank you for accepting
18 my testimony today. It is my hope that the City
19 Council takes this critical step of passing Intro.'s
20 431 and 408 as part of the Street Vender Reform.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time is expired.

22 CHAIRPERSON MENIN: Thank you. Uhm, okay and
23 Sandia Escondar has dropped off. So, now what I'm
24 going to do is I'm going to read everyone who signed
25 up on Zoom to make sure we have not overlooked

2 anyone. So, I'm going to read these names and if
3 you're on, please do the raise hand function on Zoom.
4 Dillan Hatch(SP?), Ryan Pucos(SP?), Debbie Pria
5 Trategy(SP?), Fy Tashay(SP?), Kevin M. Dell
6 Casale(SP?), Elizabeth Murray(SP?), Francisco
7 Gonzales(SP?), Eiden Gebre(SP?), Deana Elos(SP?),
8 Calvin Ang(SP?), Johnathan Perez, Sam Yu(SP?),
9 Monalla Lopez(SP?), Jennifer Salgado, Krishendu
10 Ray(SP?), Pedro Suarez.

11 No, okay seeing no names, I really want to thank
12 everyone for testifying today. It was unbelievable
13 to see the turnout that the hearing got and just to
14 hear the diverse views on these bills and so, I want
15 to thank everyone for being here. I want to thank my
16 colleague Council Member Sanchez and baby, who made
17 it all the way to the end. And thank you once again
18 for your testimony today and that concludes our
19 hearing. [GAVEL] Oh and Council Sanchez's mom,
20 babysitter extraordinaire. [GAVEL]

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date June 15, 2025