CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

------------------------ X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

            Of the

COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

------------------------ X

                    April 25, 2024
                    Start: 10:12 a.m.
                    Recess: 12:12 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS – CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Jennifer Gutiérrez, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
                Erik D. Bottcher
                Robert F. Holden
                Vickie Paladino

OTHER COUNCIL MEMBERS ATTENDING:
                Carmen N. De La Rosa
                Eric Dinowitz
                Gale A. Brewer

A P P E A R A N C E S

Joe Morrisroe, New York City Office of Technology and Innovation Deputy Commissioner, 3-1-1

Melissa Guillaume, New York City Office of Technology and Innovation General Counsel, Legal Matters

2   SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Testing one, two.

3 Today's date is April 25, 2024. Today's hearing is

4 Committee on Technology being recorded in the

5 Chambers by Keith Polite.

6   SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning, everyone,

7 and welcome to today's New York City Council hearing

8 for the Committee on Technology.

9   At this time, we ask that you silence all

10 cell phones and electronic devices to minimize

11 disruptions throughout the hearing.

12   If you have testimony you wish to submit

13 for the record, you may do so via email at

14 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Once again, that is

15 testimony@council.nyc.gov.

16   At any time throughout the hearing, do

17 not approach the dais.

18   We thank you for your cooperation.

19   Chair, we are ready to begin.

20   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. Good

21 morning, everyone. Good morning. Good to see you

22 both.

23   Welcome to our oversight hearing on 3-1-

24 1. I'm Council Member Jennifer Gutiérrez, Chair of

25

2 the Committee on Technology. Today, we will be

3 discussing New York City's 3-1-1 service.

4   NYC311 is the City's 24/7 non-emergency

5 helpline, connecting residents with government

6 services and handling millions of calls, texts, and

7 online interactions yearly. It offers support in over

8 175 languages and assists people with disabilities.

9 Accessible via calls, text, app, and online, it's the

10 nation's largest 3-1-1 service, ensuring the City's

11 government serves everyone. Importantly, it provides

12 critical data sets for City agencies, elected

13 officials, and everyday New Yorkers, and this

14 information is used to make decisions about resource

15 allocation, City needs, and opportunities for

16 improvement. For many New Yorkers, 3-1-1 is the

17 primary direct interaction that they have with

18 government agencies. Given the importance of NYC311

19 in our City's functioning, it's paramount that we are

20 constantly seeking to improve it, including through

21 technological advancements. For example, the NYC311

22 mobile app is only in English. Submitting complaints

23 can be complicated, and some complaint types listed

24 in the app lack features like attaching images,

25 videos, or pinpointing locations accurately.

2 Similarly, the system offers limited categories for

3 logging complaints, and not every type of complaint

4 is available for submission. Furthermore, after

5 progressing through several steps to file a

6 complaint, users may ultimately encounter an

7 inability to submit it at all. The Committee is aware

8 that 3-1-1 acts as a conduit to other agencies and

9 relies on the complaint types that the responding

10 agency allows. However, as the architects of one of

11 the most important public-facing systems, we must be

12 responsive to consistent requests for updates to the

13 system to be more user-friendly and work

14 collaboratively with the responding agencies to

15 improve the 3-1-1 program.

16 To improve the services of NYC311, we

17 will be considering the following bills in the

18 Technology Committee today. Brace yourself, it's a

19 lot of bills, I'm just going to read through it.

20 Intro. No. 131 by Council Member Brewer in relation

21 to adding a 3-1-1 complaint category for noise from

22 sirens, Intro. No. 422 by Council Member Rivera in

23 relation to requiring the Commissioner of DoITT to

24 create a separate 3-1-1 category for rooftop activity

25 complaints and to report annually regarding such

2 complaints and to require the Commissioner of

3 Buildings to report annually regarding certain

4 rooftop spaces, Intro. No. 461 by Council Member

5 Sandra Ung in relation to requiring human translation

6 of the 3-1-1 app, Intro No. 485 by Council Member

7 Julie Won in relation to requiring the 3-1-1 Customer

8 Service Center to provide assistance relating to

9 affordable internet programs, Intro No. 582 by

10 Council Member Dinowitz in relation to creating a

11 mobile application to support the efficient handling

12 of 3-1-1 service requests by City employees, Intro.

13 No. 583 by Council Member Dinowitz in relation to

14 requiring the 3-1-1 Customer Service Center to

15 provide live chat functionality, Intro. No. 584 by

16 Council Member Dinowitz in relation to providing an

17 estimated wait time to 3-1-1 call center customers,

18 the following two by Council Member Dinowitz, No. 588

19 in relation to 3-1-1 transmitting image and video

20 data for service requests or complaints and Intro.

21 589 in relation to requiring that 3-1-1 allow persons

22 to request snow and ice removal on pedestrian bridges

23 and that those reports be routed to the appropriate

24 agency, the following bill by Council Member Holden,

25 No. 602 in relation to reports of illegal towing to

2   3-1-1, Intro. 626 by Council Member Powers in

3   relation to the use of global positioning system

4   coordinates for 3-1-1 complaints and service

5   requests, Intro No. 634 by Public Advocate Williams

6   in relation to 3-1-1 transmitting image and video

7   data for housing service requests or complaints,

8   Intro. No. 640 by the Public Advocate Williams in

9   relation to requiring the 3-1-1 Customer Service

10   Center to accept requests for service and complaints

11   using video call functionality, Intro. No. 673 by

12   Council Member Carmen De La Rosa in relation to

13   adding a 3-1-1 complaint category for dog runs,

14   Intro. No. 820 by Council Member Holden in relation

15   to the number of steps to submit service requests or

16   complaints on the 3-1-1 website and mobile

17   application and, finally, Intro. No. 822 by Council

18   Member Holden in relation to requiring the 3-1-1

19   Customer Service Center to indicate that an agency is

20   unable to respond to a service request or complaint

21   and implement protocols providing proof of action.

22   Some of these bills were heard last

23   session and address issues that have since been

24   handled by the NYC311 team. However, we want to make

25   sure that we do not overlook the opportunities for

2   improvement that inspired these bills and do our part

3   to ensure the people of New York City receive proper

4   service.

5   I look forward to hearing testimony from

6   the Administration, experts, and community advocates

7   about NYC311 and learning about current efforts to

8   improve this crucial service as well as exploring

9   further possibilities for increased access and

10   enhancement.

11   I'd like to thank the Technology

12   Committee Staff, Policy Analyst Charles Kim,

13   Legislative Counsel Irene Byhovsky as well as Senior

14   Data Scientists Nicholas Montalbano and James Wu, and

15   my Chief-of-Staff Anna Bessendorf and Senior Advisor

16   Anya Lehr for their work in putting this hearing

17   together.

18   I'd also like to recognize Technology

19   Committee Members that are here with us. I believe

20   it's Council Member Holden. Thank you for being here,

21   and I'd also like to recognize we're also joined by

22   Council Member De La Rosa. I'm going to turn it over

23   to Council Member De La Rosa to deliver her opening

24   remarks followed by Council Member Holden.

25

2   COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so

3   much, Chair, and thank you to the agencies for being

4   here.

5   Obviously, we are all interested in 3-1-1

6   and how it functions and the efficiency. My bill,

7   Intro. 673, is a bill that would require the

8   Department of Information and Technology and

9   Telecommunications to add a category through which

10   the public may file complaints, service requests, and

11   requests for information in relation to dog runs. The

12   category would be available on all relevant 3-1-1

13   customer service platforms, including websites and

14   mobile platforms. It may seem like a small category,

15   dog runs, but it is an example of legislation that is

16   requested and created by our community. During our

17   participatory budgeting process as our constituents

18   participated in civic engagement, we discovered a gap

19   in reporting and tracking of maintenance issues in

20   our public spaces, mainly in dog runs. Many of our

21   constituents are dog owners and often take their

22   strolls with their pets in our beautiful parks and

23   sometimes discover structural issues, benches, and

24   grounds in needs of repair. With a lack of tracking

25   and reporting mechanism, we failed to provide

2 oversight into each corner of our open-air spaces. We

3 believe in shared governance. Intro. 673 is a product

4 of District 10 constituents and is dedicated to their

5 commitment to improving the living conditions of our

6 neighborhood. Intro. 673 adds a reporting mechanism

7 and information center for dog runs across our city.

8 By using our current 3-1-1 system, a citizen hotline

9 that New Yorkers are familiar with, we can add

10 another layer of oversight and followup on important

11 issues that impact the quality of life of all New

12 Yorkers and our pets. Thank you so much for moving

13 this bill forward and I'm looking forward to the

14 conversation. Thank you.

15   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Up next, Council

16 Member Holden.

17   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair,

18 and my fellow Council Members. Today, I come before

19 you not only as a Council Member but also as a

20 regular user of our 3-1-1 service. I use it every

21 day, multiple times, I've been using it for years and

22 I know what it needs to really work much better, and

23 I have some suggestions and you'll hear some bills.

24 This system serves as a critical link between the

25 city's residents and the services that our government

2   offers. It is essential that we continue to refine

3   and improve this vital service to ensure it meets the

4   needs of all New Yorkers effectively and efficiently.

5   The package of bills we are discussing today,

6   including my bills, Intro. 602, 820, and 822,

7   represents a significant step toward achieving some

8   of these goals that are going to be mentioned today.

9   Intro. 602 addresses a very specific yet impactful

10   issue, illegal towing, and the City of New York

11   created the DARP program, D-A-R-P, and ROTOW to

12   really stop chasing by these tow trucks. They run red

13   lights, they go down one-way streets, and they

14   jeopardize the public. They're still going on,

15   they're still chasing. There's a lot of towing

16   companies that are really rogue companies. That means

17   they're not participating in these programs, so they

18   chase so we have to start enabling New Yorkers to

19   report illegal towing activities directly through the

20   3-1-1 system and it's not being done and submit

21   photographic or video evidence. We are enhancing

22   accountability and providing our citizens with the

23   tools they need to protect their property and, of

24   course, their rights.

25

2   Intro. 820 simplifies the process of

3   submitting service requests and complaints to just

4   four steps. This is crucial to making a 3-1-1 system

5   more accessible and user-friendly and encouraging

6   more people to utilize it confidently.

7   Lastly, 822 ensures transparency and

8   accountability when an agency cannot respond to the

9   requests. Right now, especially with the Police

10   Department, if they don't handle it within eight

11   hours, they say no action was taken and it doesn't

12   give a specific reason why they didn't fix the

13   problem, and that essentially upsets more New

14   Yorkers, especially me. When I report a car parked at

15   a hydrant and the cops tell us it's not there or they

16   took action to fix the problem, that's not being

17   honest, and that's why 822 is so important so by

18   requiring agencies to provide proof of action and

19   making these responses visible to the 3-1-1 system,

20   we are building trust and ensuring no request is

21   ignored.

22   Together, these bills make our 3-1-1

23   system more responsive, transparent, and easier to

24   use. As someone who regularly uses 3-1-1, I

25   understand the frustrations that can arise and, by

2 the way, I encourage all my constituents to use the

3 app. The app is great. It's been enhanced. It's been

4 fixed up. It's a little bit more complicated, but it

5 works, but there's things that when I use it,

6 certainly, and we talked about it many times, about

7 pinpointing your exact location, it still doesn't do

8 that very well so we need to work on it. Thank you,

9 Chair. Thank you for this hearing. This is really

10 very, very important hearing. Thank you.

11   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you, both

12 Council Members.

13   Next, I'd like to read opening remarks on

14 behalf of Council Member Rivera regarding her bill

15 hearing rooftop party complaints.

16   Good morning and thank you for calling

17 this important hearing and for bringing my bill

18 before the Committee that would create a 3-1-1

19 category for rooftop activity complaints. While we

20 understand why people choose to gather on rooftops,

21 it is essential that they do so safely and

22 respectfully. Rooftop gatherings can generate

23 excessive noise due to the way sound carries, which

24 is disruptive to neighbors in the community.

25 Additionally, rooftop activity can create dangerous

2 situations and has led to fatal accidents in our

3 District. Currently, residents do not have a

4 convenient way to report disrupting and potentially

5 dangerous rooftop activity, and this reporting option

6 will improve quality of life, public safety, and our

7 understanding of where unsafe rooftop activity is

8 happening.

9   That concludes her statement.

10   Today, we will hear testimonies from the

11 Office of Technology and Innovation followed by

12 testimonies from the public.

13   Now, I want to welcome Joe Morrisroe, OTI

14 Deputy Commissioner 3-1-1, and Melissa Guillaume, OTI

15 General Counsel, Legal Matters.

16   COMMITTEE COUNSEL BYHOVSKY: Before we

17 begin, I kindly request everyone to raise their right

18 hands. Thank you.

19   Do you affirm to tell the truth and to

20 respond honestly to Council Member questions?

21   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I do.

22   GENERAL COUNSEL GUILLAUME: I do.

23   COMMITTEE COUNSEL BYHOVSKY: Thank you.

24 You may begin your testimony.

25

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Good

3 morning, Chair Gutiérrez, and also Council Member De

4 La Rosa, Council Member Holden, and Members of the

5 City Council Committee on Technology.

6   My name is Joe Morrisroe, and I am the

7 Deputy Commissioner of New York City 3-1-1, known as

8 NYC311, under the Office of Technology and

9 Innovation. Thank you for the opportunity to testify

10 today on NYC311 operations, and with me today is

11 Melissa Guillaume, OTI General Counsel.

12   As New York City 3-1-1's Deputy

13 Commissioner since 2008, I oversee all aspects of 3-

14 1-1, from the operation of the most familiar

15 component, the call center, to the creation and

16 implementation of multiple customer-facing channels,

17 performance results and quality control measures,

18 interaction with City agencies, and data collection.

19 When Mayor Adams' Executive Order 3 consolidated the

20 City's technology agencies under OTI in January 2022,

21 the NYC311 team was also united within this single

22 office. The new organizational structure strengthens

23 and supports continual evolution and enhancements to

24 service delivery and customer experience.

25

2   As you all know, New York City 3-1-1

3 delivers fast and easy access to government services

4 and information to all New Yorkers. NYC311 is

5 available 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, 365 days a

6 year, and through multiple channels, including the

7 call center, and online portal, text, mobile

8 application, and social media. Originally launched as

9 a call center, New York City 3-1-1 has evolved into

10 the most comprehensive municipal government service

11 platform in the nation. NYC311 received 37 million

12 customer contacts in 2023 and, on an annual basis,

13 receives more calls than all other U.S. City 3-1-1

14 call centers combined.

15   I'm also pleased to share with the

16 Council a recent report by an independent third party

17 on the public satisfaction with New York City 3-1-1.

18 Call center representatives received a customer

19 satisfaction rating of 94 percent, positioning NYC311

20 in the top 10 percent outperforming even private

21 sector companies. This level of public satisfaction

22 is a testament to the dedication and commitment of

23 the NYC311 team that serves their fellow New Yorkers

24 each and every day.

25

2   It is important to note that NYC311

3 serves as the platform to provide information and

4 services to the public. With few exceptions, public

5 interactions with NYC311 result in one of the

6 following outcomes, an information request, which is

7 the most popular, such as when is my trash pickup

8 day, a referral to an external entity, such as a

9 transfer to the New York State Department of Labor or

10 a referral to the FCC, and a service request, such as

11 submitting a ticket. We rely on our collaborative

12 relationships with each agency to build out the

13 service request forms and information pages, which

14 are also known as knowledge articles, that properly

15 reflect the mission and services for each agency or

16 office.

17   With respect to service requests

18 specifically, NYC311 does not create them in a

19 vacuum. There must be an agency that will accept the

20 request, investigate, and, if applicable, enforce.

21 When an agency decides that adding a new service

22 request is necessary, it contacts NYC311 to create,

23 test, and deploy a complaint form. There are various

24 bills we will discuss today that propose the creation

25 of a new or modified service request, some of which

2 are in production today. I would like to invite any

3 Council Member to reach out to OTI with gaps in

4 service requests so NYC311 can loop in the potential

5 responding agencies to see if a service request can

6 be implemented without the need for legislation.

7   I will now turn to the pieces of

8 legislation associated with this hearing. Intro. 131

9 relates to creating a New York City 3-1-1 service

10 request category from noise from sirens. As the

11 Committee is aware, noise complaints are among the

12 top service request types NYC311 intakes year after

13 year. The NYC311 service request has a closed loop

14 process where NYC311 is responsible for the triage

15 and intake of the service request information, and

16 the agency is responsible for investigating,

17 responding, and updating the status of the service

18 request once the agencies have investigated. This is

19 the closed loop process customers expect when filing

20 a service request with NYC311. Intro. 131 asks that

21 a service request be taken for siren noise, but we

22 are unaware of any City agency that would accept such

23 a request, making the closed loop process that

24 customers come to expect from NYC311 impossible. At

25

2 this time, implementation of this legislation would

3 not be possible.

4   Intro. 422 relates to creating a separate

5 NYC311 category for rooftop activity service request

6 and to produce an annual report. NYC311 agrees with

7 the intent of the legislation, however, cannot meet

8 the requirements as written because they currently do

9 not align with the City's service request structure

10 and process. The bill would require that rooftop

11 activity be the complaint, such as the problem name,

12 and the type of issue, such as noise or exceeding

13 authorized rooftop occupancy, be a subcategory and

14 then route to the appropriate agency for response.

15 The 3-1-1 service request model cannot support this

16 data hierarchy structure. There is also a requirement

17 to create a subcategory for public safety complaints.

18 This subcategory is too vague and any public safety

19 issue call has to be triaged for potential emergency

20 response. However, NYC311 is already in conversations

21 with agencies that would receive these complaints to

22 figure out how we can create or code rooftop activity

23 complaints within the existing service request

24 framework. This approach will also allow the data to

25 be available in NYC Open Data.

2   Intro. 461 relates to creating human

3   translations for the NYC311 app. Local Law 30

4   requires covered agencies to appoint language access

5   coordinators, translate commonly distributed

6   documents into the 10 designated languages, provide

7   telephonic interpretation in at least 100 languages,

8   and develop a language access implementation plan,

9   among other requirements. NYC311 is in compliance

10   with this law. NYC311 provides telephonic

11   interpretation and translation services for up to 175

12   languages through a third-party vendor, LanguageLine.

13   LanguageLine is available for free to customers 24

14   hours a day, seven days a week. NYC311 provides

15   options for customers who speak a language other than

16   English or may be limited English proficient. For the

17   phone channel, a customer can access announcements

18   and messages in the integrated voice response system

19   in the 10 designated citywide languages. Spanish

20   language customers can be assisted by an NYC311

21   customer service representative who speaks Spanish.

22   Annually, NYC311 services approximately 1 million

23   calls in languages other than English and has

24   provided service in 133 non-English languages over

25   the years. The NYC311 mobile app allows customers to

2 connect with an agent and our vendor partner,

3 LanguageLine, for human translation. NYC311 has over

4 2,000 discrete content items called knowledge

5 articles, and it performs thousands of edits annually

6 as well as revising content for readability on a

7 consistent basis. Certain content changes require in-

8 the-moment creation and modification, such as during

9 emergencies. Intro. 461 would require a human-

10 translated version of the NYC311 mobile application.

11 To do so would require significant additional support

12 resources so that OTI's ability to create and

13 maintain the up-to-date content meet NYC311 standards

14 for customer satisfaction and service delivery.

15   Intro. 485 relates to the NYC311 customer

16 service center providing assistance related to

17 affordable Internet programs. We are aware that the

18 FCC announced the winding down of the federally

19 funded Affordable Connectivity Program, ACP. NYC311

20 is monitoring the program and will update the content

21 as appropriate should Congress act to restore

22 funding. As the ACP winds down, OTI continues to

23 provide opportunities for all New Yorkers,

24 particularly those who are historically vulnerable to

25 being on the wrong side of the digital divide, to

2 access the Internet and digital and education

3 resources. The Mayor's Big Apple Connect program is

4 now deployed at all eligible NYCHA developments and

5 provides NYCHA residents with free, reliable, and

6 safe broadband Internet and basic cable TV. Since the

7 initiative launched in September 2022, 121,702

8 households have been enrolled in the program and 80

9 percent enrollment across the city. We also provide

10 information on additional access points in the city.

11 If the Council is aware of programs not part of the

12 current NYC311 content, we would be happy to discuss

13 further and update where appropriate.

14   Intro. 582 relates to creating a mobile

15 application to support the efficient handling of

16 NYC311 service requests by City employees. As we

17 understand Intro. 582, we do not believe there is a

18 need for an application for agencies to receive

19 service request data. NYC311 coordinates with service

20 request agencies to ensure they receive the service

21 request information in real time in a way that best

22 suits their business need workflow. Many agencies

23 have their own applications they use for handling

24 service requests. The NYC311 application already

25 allows service requests to be viewed by a mobile

2 device if an agency opts in for that specific

3 functionality.

4   Intro. 583 relates to requiring the

5 NYC311 Customer Service Center to provide live chat

6 functionality. NYC311 already offers real-time text

7 capability through the 3-1-1 692 SMS code and through

8 the Text 3-1-1 option on the mobile app in addition

9 to the call center representatives that are available

10 24/7. Text agents engage in synchronous written

11 communication with customers to respond to questions

12 and submit service requests using the existing

13 enterprise service request format to submit to

14 agencies. The content on the NYC311 website and

15 available through the mobile app already provides

16 customers with access to information comparable to

17 what they would receive through a live chat

18 interaction. It incorporates user-friendly features

19 such as the prompts like, need something else, and

20 what do you need, in addition to curated sections and

21 links. Intro. 583 requires an increase in resources

22 beyond current levels to provide services that NYC311

23 already offers to the public through its phone, text,

24 mobile, and social media channels. At this time,

25 NYC311 opposes adding incremental resources and will

2   continue to monitor customer feedback and industry

3   enhancements in this area.

4   Intro. 584 relates to providing an

5   estimated wait time to NYC311 call center customers.

6   NYC311 will review queuing system options that

7   provide estimated wait time to customers as a

8   potential enhancement to the high call volume

9   protocol.

10   Intro. 588 relates to NYC311 transmitting

11 image and video data for service requests. All NYC311

12 service requests already accept image or video except

13 for Housing Preservation and Development and the

14 Department of Homeless Services per their request due

15 to privacy concerns.

16   Intro. 598 relates to creating an NYC311

17 service request category for snow or ice on

18 pedestrian bridges. It is possible to file a service

19 request today for snow on a pedestrian bridge, but it

20 is limited to the call center. NYC311 is in

21 discussions with the Department of Transportation to

22 streamline the process and make filing a service

23 request for snow or ice on a pedestrian bridge

24 available across all channels for the next snow

25 season.

2   Intro. 602 relates to creating a NYC311

3 service request for illegal towing by a tow truck

4 company. NYC311 already accepts these requests which

5 are routed to the Department of Consumer and Worker

6 Protection.

7   Intro. 626 relates to the use of global

8 positioning system coordinates for NYC311 service

9 requests. NYC311 service requests collect GPS

10 coordinates, such as latitude and longitude, based on

11 the customer enabling location services in the mobile

12 app or on the website and by the customer confirming

13 the address identified. If location services

14 functionality is disabled, NYC311 collects latitude

15 and longitude based on the address entered by the

16 customer. NYC311 is exploring a new geolocator

17 service that will take it a step further and collect

18 latitude and longitude based on the pin drop then

19 identify the address in the format required by the

20 agency based on the service request such as address

21 intersection or block face. Funding for the enhanced

22 mapping is being pursued.

23   Intro. 634 relates to NYC311 transmitting

24 of images or video data for housing service requests.

25 As mentioned in my comments for Intro. 588, all 3-1-1

2 service requests already accept image or video except

3 for Housing Preservation and Development and the

4 Department of Homeless Services per their request due

5 to privacy reasons.

6   Intro. 640 relates to the NYC311 customer

7 service center to accept requests for services and

8 complaints using video call functionality. NYC311

9 supports enhancements in service delivery and

10 leveraging technology to improve customer experience

11 when feasible. NYC311 is opposed to elements of this

12 bill that impose additional requirements for

13 functionality and currently exist, specifically the

14 minimum call taker requirement and providing

15 recordings or transcripts to relevant agencies. The

16 additional element of the proposed legislation

17 enabling video call functionality requires commercial

18 grade technology beyond the capabilities of our

19 current platform. This includes enhancements in

20 security measures, user authentication, network

21 access and carrier considerations, bandwidth and

22 integration elements. In addition, an agnostic video

23 calling platform is necessary to ensure equal access

24 for all potential users. At present, we believe it is

25 premature to impose this requirement through

2 legislation, but we'll keep this under review and add

3 this to the NYC311 service delivery roadmap when

4 implementation is possible.

5   Intro. 673 relates to creating an NYC311

6 service request category for dog runs in public

7 parks. It is already possible to file a service

8 request for a New York City Department of Parks

9 facility. NYC311 is in conversations with the

10 Department to see if we can make the process of

11 filing a service request for a dog run more

12 streamlined.

13   Intro. 820 relates to the number of steps

14 to submit a service request. We understand the desire

15 to streamline the process for submitting complaints

16 and, where possible, NYC311 encourages agencies to

17 collect information in an efficient way to reduce the

18 burden on the customer. Whenever the service request

19 form is driven by NYC311, it always takes four steps

20 or less to submit the service request. For many

21 complaints via the website, NYC311 presents the four-

22 step process as a what, where, who, and review cycle.

23 This allows for a consistent customer experience

24 across most service requests. On mobile, there may be

25 even fewer steps. There are circumstances under which

2   an agency's form is used for intake that may not

3   follow the same four-step pattern. If there are

4   specific complaints that require more than four

5   steps, we can take them under review with the agency.

6   Intro. 822 relates to requiring the

7   NYC311 Customer Service Center to indicate that an

8   agency is unable to respond to a service request and

9   provide proof of any action taken. The NYC311 service

10 request has a closed-loop process where NYC311 is

11 responsible for the triage and intake of the service

12 request information, and the agency is responsible

13 for responding and updating the status of the service

14 request to communicate the outcome directly to the

15 customer. There are thousands of different service

16 requests with different service level agreements,

17 some measured in hours and some measured in days.

18 NYC311 is not an oversight agency and does not have

19 the ability to know each status for the millions of

20 service requests filed each year until the agency

21 closes them with a description of the outcome as

22 presented to the customer. NYC311 can work with any

23 agency that wishes to update and improve their

24 messaging of service request outcomes for a better

25 customer experience.

2   Finally, on behalf of my colleagues and

3   on behalf of the hardworking and dedicated 3-1-1

4   team, I thank Chair Gutiérrez and Committee Members

5   for your time and for this opportunity to testify.

6   I'm happy to take questions.

7   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you so much.

8   Before we go on, I'd like to recognize we

9   have some very special guests from the City Workers

10   Bring Your Child to Work Day. We've got some visitors

11   today. Welcome, everybody. I hope you enjoy.

12   I'd like to recognize that we've been

13   joined by Council Members Gale Brewer, Eric Dinowitz,

14   and Council Member Vickie Paladino.

15   I'd like to pass it to my Colleague,

16   Council Member Dinowitz, for a statement.

17   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I'm a little

18   nervous about all the people in the balcony now. It's

19   Take Your City Worker Child to Work Day? I should

20   have brought my kids. I failed as a father. All

21   right. Don't make a 3-1-1 complaint against me,

22   please.

23   Well, good morning, everyone. Good

24   morning. Thank you. I want to thank Chair Gutiérrez

25   for the opportunity to speak about a number of bills

2 that I think will improve the 3-1-1 system here in

3 New York City. I mean if you could just imagine what

4 a lot of my constituents go through. They're in the

5 middle of a park, and they see a homeless encampment

6 or even just a homeless person, and we have big

7 hearts here in New York City, we want to help that

8 person, and we are told by DSS, we're told by our

9 agencies, the thing to do is to call 3-1-1 to get the

10 outreach person, but I have the third biggest park in

11 New York City. There's no address in the middle of

12 the park, and there's no real efficient way to help

13 that person who's in need of help. I'm on the app

14 right now. There's no way to geolocate where you are

15 in the app and to transmit that information so that

16 the person can get help. We have a lot of older

17 adults in my district who have to go across a

18 footbridge that goes over a highway, but there is no

19 way on the app to request that there is snow removal

20 on the bridge. There are people who see with their

21 own eyes what's going on in their community, and they

22 want to send video but, on the app that I'm on right

23 now, there isn't a way to send video, at least not

24 for every complaint, to 3-1-1 and then subsequently

25 to the respective agencies to help alleviate the

2 problem. Now, there are a lot of improvements that

3 can be made to 3-1-1, and that's what we're looking

4 to do today. 3-1-1 is the way that New Yorkers access

5 City government. In fact, when people call our office

6 and we call the agency, the first thing that the

7 agency asks for is the 3-1-1 complaint number but, if

8 there's no way for someone to meaningfully or

9 efficiently get that information, we therefore are

10 restricted in the way we are able to help our

11 constituents so there are a number of bills you

12 addressed. I just want to read them again. 640 would

13 allow constituents to video call 3-1-1 directly, and

14 this is important to increase accessibility. Perhaps

15 someone has hearing or verbal impairment. This would

16 allow two-way communication with running print at the

17 bottom of the screen in real time and live chat. 583

18 allows a broader number of requests to be made even

19 when lines are busy and employees are unavailable.

20 This is, of course, distinct from texting or a

21 texting system. You have 589, it deals with snow on

22 pedestrian bridges. It allows a far more encompassing

23 range of request types to be made that creates an

24 inherent accessibility for district-specific issues.

25 Ice on pedestrian bridges such as the Henry Hudson

2   Pedestrian Bridge in my District is a safety hazard,

3   especially, as I mentioned, for older constituents.

4   They need to be able to report this, and my co-prime

5   sponsor on the bill, Council Member Nantasha

6   Williams, has the same concerns in her District. The

7   geotagging, as I mentioned, is 626 with myself and

8   Keith Powers, and this, by the way, happened to me

9   where there was a homeless person, a person in need

10   of help on the street, and there was no address

11   nearby for me to type in, and it was a real struggle

12   to try to provide this person with the help they need

13   and that's for everything and, again, on the app, I

14   think the only way you can geotag something is with

15   rats, which we all hate, but there are other things,

16   a fallen tree, broken sidewalks, abandoned cars,

17   which don't necessarily have an address. We need to

18   be able to transmit location data. It's 2024. There

19   are two bills I know aren't part of this Committee,

20   but they do deal with 3-1-1 so I do want to mention

21   them. They're part of Governmental Operations. An

22   agency report card, Bill 587, would create

23   transparency on both ends. I think many of us know

24   that you make a 3-1-1 complaint, you find that the

25   complaint is listed as closed by the agency, even

2   though the problem persists, and this would allow a

3   feedback mechanism for users to actually say whether

4   their complaint was closed or not, and a customer

5   satisfaction, and would allow us to better address

6   with you the efficiency and responsiveness of 3-1-1.

7   Intro 744 deals with duplicate prompts, would

8   preserve multiple requests for the same issue, rather

9   than deleting them, thereby conveying the sense of

10 urgency and need for assistance.

11   Again, I wish to thank Chair Gutiérrez

12 for the opportunity to speak about my legislation,

13 which is laser-focused on finding ways this Body can

14 improve our City agency's ability to respond to the

15 needs of our constituents. Thank you, Chair. Thank

16 you.

17   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. I am

18 going to move on to some questions before handing it

19 off to my Colleagues, who I know are eager to explore

20 a little bit more about their legislation.

21   My first question, Deputy Commissioner,

22 is what is the present headcount for NYC311? Oh, can

23 you turn on your mic?

24

25

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: For the

3 call center representatives, title CCR, the budgeted

4 headcount is 248.

5   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: And that's how

6 many you have?

7   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Currently

8 we have that many, yes.

9   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, and those

10 are for the call center operators, and what is the

11 other remaining employees?

12   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: For the

13 organization in total, then the total headcount is

14 394.

15   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Did the

16 number of call center operators change in the last

17 two years?

18   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: No, it's

19 remained steady.

20   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Are any of

21 the call operators outsourced?

22   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: We have an

23 overflow vendor contract that handles overflow calls

24 that does provide call center agent resources so that

25 is an outsourced contract.

2   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, and when is

3 it determined, I guess, what is the benchmark for

4 determining overflow calls and then using the

5 outsource?

6   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The

7 ability to do overflow is when volume is managed,

8 peak volume will increase, we'll have an emergency

9 situation, you'll have an increase in call volume. We

10 consider that an overflow situation so a vendor is

11 there.

12   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay.

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: We can

14 rely on the vendor resources to handle any increase

15 in call volumes, best way to say that.

16   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: And what is the

17 name of that vendor?

18   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The vendor

19 is King TeleServices, and they're located in

20 Brooklyn, New York.

21   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Can you

22 share if you're utilizing this outsource vendor

23 daily, weekly, monthly, how many times monthly?

24   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: We do

25 utilize them daily. In order to have an effective

2 overflow environment, you need to have a steady state

3 so when the increase does occur, you have a base that

4 exists that you can build off of.

5   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: So daily? Okay.

6   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Daily.

7   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Is there specific

8 training done with this particular outsource vendor

9 to interface with members of the public?

10   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Yes, there

11 is. The vendor resources go through the same training

12 program. They're subject to the same quality

13 assurance and evaluation steps that City employees

14 are. The systems are governed by OTI, the system that

15 the vendor uses, and the practices and the policies

16 that they follow are the same that the 3-1-1 City

17 staff follow.

18   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. The current

19 contract that you have, when is that current until?

20   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: It was

21 registered two days ago.

22   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Oh.

23   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: And will

24 continue through February of 2026.

25

2   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Is there an

3 RFP that goes out for this or?

4   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Yes. The

5 current contract is the second of two-year renewals

6 following a five-year term so the RFP went out nine

7 years ago.

8   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Oh, okay. Nine

9 years ago. For these particular operators, do they

10 speak any other languages? Can you share a little bit

11 more about kind of what the breakdown is?

12   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Yeah,

13 sure. So yes, they all speak English, and there's a

14 portion that are bilingual in English and Spanish.

15   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, so those are

16 the only languages. Okay.

17   Is there any intention to create a system

18 for these overflow operators, I don't know what the

19 proper term is, sorry, to recruit members that speak

20 other languages or for now is it primarily because

21 that is the amount of calls that you get in English

22 and Spanish?

23   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Right now,

24 for the overflow vendor but also for the City staff,

25 the focus is for English and Spanish bilingual. We've

2   learned and determined that the most expedient and

3   efficient way to handle languages other than English

4   and Spanish is to rely on our third-party

5   LanguageLine.

6   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: LanguageLine.

7   Okay.

8   I want to move to the app a little bit

9   before passing it on to my Colleagues. Can you share

10   how many employees are working on developing or

11   maintaining the mobile app?

12   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I can give

13   some basic information. The current group working on

14   the mobile app is less than 10 resources in total.

15   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Less than 10?

16   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Less than

17   10 resources in total.

18   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Less than 10

19   resources, that less than 10 people?

20   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: 10 people.

21   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. No, no. I

22   never heard that before. Okay, and, every time you

23   need to update the app in particular, is that

24   happening in-house or is that one of the 10 staff

25   members or is that a vendor being used?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: OTI owns

3 the mobile app and provides product management,

4 setting priorities, and the leadership. A joint team

5 of OTI and contracted vendor are responsible for the

6 development and maintenance. Recent release that we

7 just had in March, that was an example of development

8 and then ongoing maintenance so this joint team of

9 City staff and contracted vendor, totaling less than

10 10, is what's responsible.

11 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, so it's OTI

12 and then a vendor that they choose. Do you know what

13 the name of that vendor is?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The vendor

15 that we use in this particular case right now is IBM.

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: IBM. Okay. Are you

17 or anyone at 3-1-1 responsible, or not responsible,

18 but do you all get to weigh in on the selection of

19 the vendor or is that a separate unit within OTI?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I would

21 say there's a standard process to follow if any time

22 a vendor is being used, and that's what we would

23 follow within OTI or with any other group.

24 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. IBM has been

25 the vendor for the mobile app since when, you said?

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I didn't

3 say since when, I'm trying to think of the answer to

4 that.

5   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Oh, I thought you

6 said it was recently.

7   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: They are

8 current. They have been, I don't know the start date

9 though. I'd have to check on that.

10   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Maybe this

11 year or?

12   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Oh, no,

13 longer than this year.

14   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. What can you

15 share about this most recent update? What are some of

16 the features that you can tell us?

17   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I

18 appreciate that question because I'm very excited

19 about the new look and the new features in the 3-1-1.

20   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I noticed on the

21 mobile app. Yeah, yeah, yeah. The mobile app, you can

22 tell it looks different for sure.

23   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: It was

24 released in March. I'll take a quick moment to

25 commend the mobile app team. They did a lot of hard

2 work and their approach was really focused on the

3 customer so I appreciate the feedback we've received

4 from Council over the years that actually fed into

5 some of that. There's a new look and a feel. There's

6 a streamlined navigation and there's new features and

7 content at a very high level. My favorite is there's

8 a new next scheduled change section on the homepage.

9 It takes the standard daily status for parking,

10 schools, and collection, which typically is presented

11 in the current day, and millions of New Yorkers are

12 interested in that information, but it adds a section

13 that flags the next scheduled change so you see today

14 and then you see what any of those three, the next

15 scheduled change date is going to be. It's a really

16 cool feature. I think it's actually a pretty elegant

17 step that customers really like.

18   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Yes.

19   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Real-time

20 user feedback.

21   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Absolutely. I'm

22 sorry. Anything else? Any other update? Okay. Thank

23 you.

24   Are there any plans for any other

25 features or updates to the mobile app?

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: We're

3 always looking at how do we enhance, how do we evolve

4 technology changes and updates, so we're looking at

5 that, and we're always looking for feedback, customer

6 feedback through surveys, feedback from Council

7 Members so part of that will go into our process. I

8 don't have anything specific to share at the point,

9 but we're open to feedback.

10   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I'd like to

11 acknowledge Council Member Erik Bottcher, who's just

12 joined us.

13   I have just two more questions before I

14 pass it off to Council Member Holden. I'm curious

15 about this feedback piece. Is there some kind of

16 like, what is the survey process? Is it on the

17 website? Are people only prompted after filing a

18 service request? What is like the general prompt for

19 New Yorkers to submit a survey?

20   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: In

21 general, we have a couple of ways you can provide

22 feedback on any experience with 3-1-1. Structured

23 surveys where you're able to send communication out

24 to a customer so they can fill a survey out. There is

25 the like, dislike, thumbs up, thumbs down on our web

2   pages, for example, and then there's opportunity to

3   get a prompt for a survey, which you can then take

4   and then that goes into the process for survey.

5   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, and then

6   whatever my Colleagues share today, I guess, is

7   feedback.

8   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Well,

9   that's the customer side, correct. Feedback that we

10   would get from Council Members, for example, is more

11   direct, more specific, and we can intake that

12   directly. Don't go necessarily through a survey

13   process. But we also have a customer experience team

14   at 3-1-1 who plays the role of the customer. They do

15   what we call customer journey mapping. They'll

16   evaluate all of our tools, not just the mobile app

17   and, as experts with a customer ear and a customer

18   focus, they come up with suggestions and

19   recommendations that can incorporate it as well.

20   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Great. Thank you.

21   I'm going to pass it off to my Colleague, Council

22   Member Holden, for questions and then Council Member

23   Brewer and then Council Member Dinowitz.

24   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you. Thank

25   you, Chair. Thank you, Commissioner.

2   On Intro. 822, you say you're not an

3 oversight agency. However, I use the app because it's

4 faster because I do a lot of complaints on 3-1-1,

5 especially parking, and commercial vehicles, for

6 instance, are a big problem in my neighborhood and

7 many neighborhoods in the District. They're parked on

8 residential streets. What happens when we put it in,

9 the police don't respond sometimes within the time

10 limit, where a truck can be legally parked in New

11 York City residential streets, a commercial vehicle,

12 after 5 a.m. so let's say the police respond at 5:15

13 a.m., what they write is, no police action was

14 necessary, yet I put the complaint in at 9:01 p.m.

15 They're not responding so essentially your app does

16 not allow, I mean, I'm asking a question here. Does

17 your app allow the police to answer honestly or the

18 agency to answer honestly to the specific question of

19 a vehicle parked illegally?

20   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Right. I

21 appreciate the question, and I understand the intent

22 of the question. What I would focus on is the 3-1-1

23 piece of that. What we work on is making sure the

24 intake and the referral process works so, at the

25 moment, in your example at 9 p.m., when you put it in

2   place, it's available and it's there. The process

3   then goes to the responsible agency for response. We

4   don't have the ability to govern or control the

5   handling of that response. Our focus is making sure

6   it's accurate and complete, basically by doing the

7   correct setup.

8   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: So the app doesn't

9   allow, after it leaves us, and let's say for me on

10   the phone, it doesn't allow the agency to type in

11   something that they, you know, a sentence or two to

12   explain the situation?

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: What it

14   does do is the process allows for that. The app

15   itself is not the vehicle to do that. The process is

16   you submit the service request. It electronically

17   goes to the responding agency in the same system. The

18   agency then will take action on that. Their update is

19   not to the app itself. It's to the process. They will

20   update the service request. That information is then

21   available in the service request. If you do a service

22   request look up, service request status, that their

23   most current information from an agency will be

24   populated there. That varies depending on the service

25   level agreement, depending on agency, depending on

2 the service request type, but the process allows for

3 that. It's not the app, the physical app, itself

4 that's doing that.

5   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I feel I just went

6 around in circles. I would like honesty, and that's

7 what this bill is about. If somebody takes the time,

8 and here we are trying to protect our neighborhoods'

9 quality of life, we're trying to get a car ticketed

10 at a hydrant, and then what comes back from the

11 agency is not true because the police will tell me,

12 well, we couldn't see the photo, or we couldn't see

13 this, we couldn't see that. They have excuses, but

14 they're not giving us honesty, and that's all I'm

15 after. If you can come up with a solution to that, if

16 you have some suggestions, whether it's a pull-down

17 menu on whatever the police see, but I've put in

18 Sanitation complaints also on property that was

19 littered. I mean, literally all over the place there

20 was debris and litter, and I know the agency didn't

21 respond, and I know you're not in oversight, we are,

22 but if there's no accountability, that means that

23 there's something on the agency's response to our

24 complaint that could tell us they were there, that

25 they responded because this gets to be a situation

2   where it's frustrating for everyone. When I put in

3   five complaints on commercial vehicles, and all five

4   come in with bogus information, because the cars, the

5   trucks are still there. That goes on to the system.

6   That means I lose faith in the system. I lose faith

7   in the police, maybe. I lose faith in the 3-1-1 app,

8   and just go back to the towing vehicles, like the

9   illegal tows. You say, well, we already have a

10 mechanism. Try doing that on the app. You can't do

11 it. You can't report it on the app, and you know why

12 I don't call the operators? Because I have streets in

13 my neighborhood, Juniper Boulevard South, Juniper

14 Boulevard North, Juniper Valley Road. Try to report

15 that on a 3-1-1 operator. You have to spell out

16 everything. It's tough. I understand that, but it

17 takes a lot more time. I'd rather use the app. The

18 app is good, but the app is still not, there's still

19 gaps in the app, and that's where I think we have to

20 try to fix. Where somebody, I have chasing, I have

21 trucks, tow trucks, going through my neighborhood

22 every day, chasing to accident scenes. I'm trying to

23 correct it. I can't report that on the app. It's hard

24 to even report it to an operator, and then on the

25 pinpoint, by the way, that's a bigger thing, where I

2   still can't put an address in. I have a lot of

3   railroads, highways. There's no address. There's no

4   residential, and when I try to pinpoint where I am, I

5   have to make up an address and try to figure it out

6   where exactly it is. That needs to be corrected. I

7   know you corrected it slightly. It works in certain

8   areas, but it doesn't work in City Hall, by the way.

9   I can't get the address where I'm sitting right now.

10   Why not? Why can't I get it?

11   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Yeah. So I

12   can answer that question, and you had several others.

13   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I know. I had

14   other questions, but answer (INAUDIBLE)

15   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Right now,

16   we need to upgrade the mapping capability, and it's

17   something that is being pursued so that you can do

18   the equivalent of a pin drop.

19   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: How far are we

20   along because I got this two years ago when I came up

21   with Local Law 66.

22   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I'm not

23   familiar offhand with Local Law 66, but it is…

24

25

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Well, it was a law of 2021 which mandates you guys to do some research on pinpointing map locations.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: What I can share is I know it is something that is being pursued and being pursued for funding and then, once funding is available, to be able to build it out, but I don't have a specific time.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: You don't have a specific time. Can you get back to us on where you are with this?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Sure. I can check with my colleagues.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I know there's been some improvement. I noticed a difference in the new…

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Since March, right? Since March.

COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: It's better. Still not working on many of my streets, and especially here. It doesn't recognize City Hall, which is weird.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: (INUDIBLE) being pursued.

2   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay. All right.

3 If you want to answer, do you have some of the other?

4   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Yeah, I

5 can address some of the others you mentioned there

6 so, first off, I want to say I do appreciate the

7 frustration that you expressed with respect to some

8 of the handling. With regard to the intent, you had

9 asked if we could take a look at the scenarios you

10 described. Happy to do that. We go back to our

11 agencies. I will go back to the process, just to

12 reiterate it, because I feel like I left you in a

13 loop there, as you said, and I'll just reiterate. The

14 steps are you submit it through the app, that's

15 instantaneous. That service request goes to the

16 agency. Any subsequent updates, the agency initiates,

17 and once they update that, that is available by

18 checking the status so that can be on the app, that

19 can be mobile, I'm sorry, a website, or you could

20 call so that process does exist. I think the other?

21   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I just don't know,

22 because I get conflicting messages. I'll get messages

23 from the police that they can't see what I sent from

24 some officers. I don't know if that's true, but I'd

25 like to actually see on their devices when I put

2 something in, what actually do they see, because I'll

3 get information from certain agencies, they didn't

4 see a photograph when I sent two or three.

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Right.

6 Yeah. I can say from the front-end side, where 3-1-1

7 is responsible for the intake and the transmission of

8 that, if you think about what's on the app and what

9 you filled out, that's the information that's

10 available to the agency.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Okay. All right.

12 Thank you. Thank you, Chair. Sorry for the extra

13 time.

14 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: No, no worries.

15 Thank you.

16 There may be some follow-ups, Council

17 Member Holden. Okay, so I'll come back to you. Okay.

18 Next, we have Council Member Gale Brewer,

19 followed by Council Member Dinowitz and then Council

20 Member Bottcher.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very

22 much. Thank you, Deputy Commissioners. Always nice to

23 see you, and congratulations to the Chair for going

24 through such a long list. I heard it when I was

25 coming in.

2   My question also, I just want to let you

3   know, some years ago, not recently, I had a friend

4   who was crossing the Triborough Bridge, and they

5   watched somebody jump, but they couldn't get 3-1-1 to

6   give them the right information so the person jumped,

7   and that was the end of that, but it was impossible

8   to give an address. I'm just pointing that out.

9   My issue is first the mentioning of

10   sirens and the hope that 131, I know you indicated

11   that it wasn't possible, but I didn't really

12   understand your loop issue, because my understanding

13   is that there are 20 noise categories, even some from

14   the streets, you know, loud music apparently is one,

15   and loud talking, I didn't know that was against the

16   law, but the issue is why not also include sirens,

17   because my understanding is it would go to Department

18   of Environmental Protection. That would be the right

19   agency, I would think. And I have to say, if you want

20   to keep quality of life on the list of how to address

21   some of these concerns, sirens is right up there.

22   People complain constantly and, of course, that's a

23   different topic. We need to try to address the siren

24   noise, but I would like to understand more as to why

25

2 you feel that it is not possible to include that as

3 one of the 20 categories.

4   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Council

5 Member, thank you for the question and, if I may also

6 say, thank you for the support of 3-1-1 over the

7 years.

8   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Since the

9 beginning. Since day one.

10   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Since day

11 one.

12   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: With Sal.

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Indeed.

14 21-plus years now.

15   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: And I was there.

16 Thank you.

17   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: In short

18 order, on the siren, there's not an agency that

19 currently accepts that complaint so the 3-1-1 process

20 is dependent on an agency being responsible and

21 responding to the complaint so, without that, we

22 don't have the ability to take the complaint.

23   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: What's with

24 Department of Environmental Protection that's

25

2 supposed to handle noise? Why would they not take

3 that? Why shouldn't they be mandated to take that?

4   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Fair

5 question. I can't speak on behalf of the Department

6 of Environmental Protection or another agency that

7 may or may not be able to take that, but that is our

8 current…

9   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: So I'd have to

10 mandate that the Department of Environmental

11 Protection take the complaint and then 3-1-1 could do

12 it. Is that what you're saying?

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I would

14 say we need an agency that would take the complaint

15 in order for us to build a front-end intake process.

16   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Because I

17 have to say, I do think, with all due respect, that

18 when you hear, what do people do now when they

19 complain, it just gets lost? In other words, you

20 complain that the ambulance is making a lot of noise,

21 which I get tons and tons of complaints about, and I

22 guess people call 3-1-1 and nothing happens. How

23 would that get responded to? Dear constituent, I'm

24 sorry we can't help you.

25

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: What we

3 have is, if it's not something we can take a

4 complaint for, we will let the customer know that

5 that's not something we can take a complaint for. We

6 will also likely check to see if there's an emergency

7 or a dangerous situation associated with it.

8   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: There's no

9 dangerous situation. They hate the noise.

10   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Yeah.

11 Understood.

12   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. So that's a

13 really, I must admit, if you get those kind of

14 complaints, it would seem to me, because we're one

15 City and one Administration, I would then say, we

16 need to fix this. We need to find an agency who would

17 take it. And I will work on that, I got it, but I'm

18 just saying, that's the kind of thing that makes me

19 crazy when there's a problem and it doesn't get

20 fixed, even though the public is quite adamant that

21 it's a problem so I will tell Rick that he needs to

22 take this as his complaint, as the Commissioner.

23   The other thing I just want to ask just

24 quickly is, you have, I know you have King, because I

25 can tell when I call, whether it's CUNY, King, or a

2   New York City employee, and I can tell them exactly

3   who they are. How many CUNY, and how many King, and

4   how many New York City in that division that you just

5   gave in terms of employees?

6   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Sure. I'm

7   happy to…

8   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I actually can

9   tell them what they are when they talk.

10   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I

11   appreciate that. I can give an update on all three of

12   those. The headcount for call center representatives,

13   the City staff 3-1-1 employees, known as CCRs, is

14   248.

15   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay.

16   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The King

17   universe is not done by headcount. We actually

18   purchase production hours as part of the contract so

19   we need one hour worth of work. They could cover that

20   with one qualified person or split the hour between

21   two qualified people so we look at that as budgeted

22   production hours on a monthly basis. There's no

23   headcount specific. CUNY, and I appreciate you

24   recognizing the CUNY program, also goes back to the

25

2 beginning of 3-1-1 as one of our best programs and

3 our best partnerships.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Yes, it does.

5   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: As you can

6 imagine, a lot of CUNY students have taken the

7 opportunity to start at 3-1-1 and gone on at 3-1-1

8 and other City agencies. Currently, our headcount for

9 CUNY students is approximately 40. I would say in

10 that ballpark, I wouldn't give you an exact.

11   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay. Then the

12 other question I have finally is, what is the number

13 one complaint that you can, is there such a thing

14 other than sirens? Is there a number one complaint

15 that you can't answer because of some either

16 bureaucratic or there's no answer to be able to give

17 to people, etc. because that makes people really

18 frustrated so do you have such a listing or diagnosis

19 to be dealt with, etc., and trying to figure out

20 where there might be some challenges that maybe we

21 can help address?

22   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Well, I

23 appreciate that question. Give me a chance to give

24 you a little bit of a piece of the process with that.

25 If there is something we don't have an answer to or

2 an outcome for, we'll call it an unmet need. We have

3 a process working with every City agency, whether

4 it's an agent who gets that information, whether our

5 team gets it, whether we get input, and we have a

6 dedicated group on the 3-1-1 side and dedicated

7 resources at each City agency to address just that.

8 If it's new from the agency, they let us know. If

9 it's an unmet need, we contact the agency and we work

10 through that. I will say that, again, citing kind of

11 the history of 3-1-1, in the early days, as you can

12 imagine, there were far more unmet needs and they

13 were built out over time. We used to have about a

14 couple of hundred pieces of content in our system,

15 and now we have over 2,000 pieces of content so it's

16 very rare we get something that's within City

17 jurisdiction that is not responded to but, if we do,

18 there is a process for it.

19   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, so why

20 wasn't sirens dealt with in that context?

21   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: In this

22 case, we would have passed that information on to

23 agencies that may be the likely place for that but,

24 until an agency is set up to handle those or to

25

2 accept those for 3-1-1, we don't have the ability to

3 take it.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: All right. Thank

5 you, Madam Chair. I will fix that problem.

6   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you, Council

7 Member Brewer.

8   Next, we have Council Member Dinowitz.

9   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you. Good

10 morning. You never know what time it is. You always

11 have to look at your watch. Good morning, Deputy

12 Commissioner. How are you? That's a working clock,

13 huh? That's a not working clock. Can we fix that,

14 Technology Committee Chair?

15   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I'll get right on

16 that.

17   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I thank you for

18 your testimony.

19   I want to talk about just a few of the

20 bills. I want to start with 583, which deals with

21 live chat. In your testimony, you said that they

22 offer real-time text capability. I have a few

23 questions about that and then a few comments. The

24 chats, I assume, are logged and kept on file?

25

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: We

3 currently don't do chat. Sorry.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: You said that

5 you do text.

6   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Text, we

7 do, yes.

8   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: That's what I

9 meant. Yeah, are the texts, chats, I'm using

10 colloquially. The text chats.

11   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: We share

12 that. I just wanted to be clear.

13   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Thank you.

14   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The text

15 process does allow for capture and transcription of

16 the interaction.

17   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: And those are

18 logged and kept for how long?

19   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I don't

20 know. I don't want to quote the retention period.

21 There is a retention period. I don't want to quote

22 that mistakenly, so it's something I could check and

23 get back to you on that, but they are logged and they

24 are kept.

25

2   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: And the chats

3   are transmitted to the relevant agencies?

4   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: No. The

5   content that's in the chat is free text, back and

6   forth between the customer and the agent. If a

7   customer is looking for information, the text agent

8   can satisfy that just by answering the question via

9   text back and forth. If it's a service request where

10   we've got to collect the what, the where, the who,

11   then that's done by the agent, entered into the same

12   CRM system we use in the call center and that you

13   would use online, and that's what's transmitted to

14   the agency.

15   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: It's funny. I

16   know this is not what you meant by free text, but you

17   know that text messages are not free.

18   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Correct,

19   and carrier charges may apply.

20   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: That's the

21   phrase, right.

22   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: That's the

23   phrase we use, but I meant free text, let me say…

24   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I know what you

25   meant.

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE:

3 Unstructured text.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: But understand

5 that for many people who may want to use this text

6 functionality, they are now paying where other people

7 may not, if they're just using the app or calling,

8 they're now paying for a service that is otherwise

9 free, and you just redid the app. I do want to

10 acknowledge it's much better looking. It's much more

11 user friendly, and a better feature to add to that, I

12 assume you have a contract with a vendor who's doing

13 the app?

14   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: It's led

15 by OTI.

16   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: It's internal.

17   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: It's led

18 by OTI. OTI…

19   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: It's internal,

20 so you can make changes to it very easily.

21   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Changes

22 can be made, but every change requires resources,

23 requires funding to do those resources but, yes, OTI

24 is the owner of the app and relies on in-house City

25

2 staff as well as some resources from a contracted

3 vendor to make changes and to maintain the app.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: So you see one

5 of the issues, I mean, one of the issues is

6 technologically a user interface, such as the

7 beautiful app you just updated, is much more

8 inviting, and this is something that most companies

9 do. Most companies, I don't think, send you to a

10 separate text messaging system. Think about the big

11 companies like Amazon. It's right on the app, right

12 there for a user, but there's also the issue of cost

13 because by not including texting right in the app or

14 live chat functionality in the app, you are sort of

15 outsourcing that cost to New Yorkers who are already

16 paying for the service with our tax dollars. You are

17 levying an additional charge on many people who would

18 like to be able to that live chat functionality.

19   I want to move on to the geolocating.

20 That's an easy one. That's why I'm co-sponsoring with

21 Council Member Keith Powers. You said that is being

22 worked on?

23   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Yeah.

24 There's a project that is looking at how do we

25 upgrade it and, specifically, I'll describe it as the

2   end result being that you can have an accurate pin

3   drop location.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Right, and

5   what's the timeline on that?

6   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I don't

7   have the timeline. I know it's an ongoing plan. I

8   don't have the timeline at this point. Something we

9   can get back to you on.

10   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Yeah. I mean,

11   have you, as Deputy Commissioner, has Commissioner

12   set goals for it, whether they're met or not, have

13   you set a goal for when you want users to be able to

14   drop that pin?

15   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: We have

16   projects, and each project has a goal and a timeline.

17   I would be risking giving you a wrong answer if I

18   tried to answer that right now. Something I would get

19   back to you on.

20   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: And they were

21   sworn in, right, so that would be like perjury. We

22   don't want that.

23   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Thank you.

24   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: So yes, please

25   get back to me. I mean, this is one of the bigger

2 ones. Again, anyone who has a park in their District

3 or a stretch of road where there is no address is

4 unable to meaningfully engage with the very service

5 we are told to engage with.

6   The estimated wait time, Bill 584, talk

7 to me about roadblocks to providing estimated wait

8 times for people who call.

9   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Appreciate

10 that one. Give an opportunity to talk a little bit on

11 that. It's something that we have looked at. You

12 mentioned it as part of the high call volume

13 protocol, which we have a very robust high call

14 volume protocol. In the interest of time, I didn't

15 spell it all out. I'd be happy to at some point.

16 We've looked at estimated wait time a number of ways.

17 As you may know, from an industry perspective,

18 there's mixed reaction to that. The proponents see

19 the value of it, practitioners often see that it can

20 create more complications than it can solutions, so

21 we look at it closely and try to monitor that, but

22 what we will do from this particular bill is look at

23 it, continue to review it, continue to revisit it,

24 and see if it's something we can add to the high call

25 volume protocol.

2   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Well, from the

3 perspective of my constituents who are on these calls

4 and don't know how long they have to wait, I am a

5 proponent, let's put it that way, and I think it's an

6 important feature to include from the user interface.

7 Transparency and information is only a good thing for

8 users.

9   The snow and ice removal. Can you talk a

10 little bit about what prevents specific items from

11 being listed on the app or from being accessible on

12 the app?

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The snow

14 and ice removal, two parts to that. Specific to your

15 question about what's on the app, in large part, it's

16 to some degree real estate, real estate on the app

17 itself so, if you're familiar with the new one, the

18 upgraded app, I appreciate the feedback on that,

19 there are a number of service requests that are

20 grouped by topics and then, within those topics, you

21 can click on each of those. We call those native to

22 the app. More broadly though, through the app, you

23 can access the 3-1-1 online website in a mobile

24 optimized way so every service request that is

25 available on the 3-1-1 website is available through

2 the 3-1-1 mobile app. There are hundreds and hundreds

3 of service requests. To list each one in a grouping

4 or a chronological, or I'm sorry, an alphabetical

5 order would take up so much real estate and further

6 frustrate customers so what's on the mobile app tend

7 to be the high volume and/or the ones that are

8 considered mobile on the go type of needs.

9   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Right. I see

10 that. I mean, in this particular category, there are

11 seven, which include home or business, park, school,

12 bus shelter, police station, post office, subway

13 station. I mean, if it's hard to find, it's hard to

14 even ask the question, how many requests do you get

15 for snow removal on pedestrian bridges if it's the

16 case that people can't find it on the app and they

17 have trouble finding it on the website, but do you

18 know how many requests you get for that?

19   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: We would

20 have the information on how many requests we get, and

21 you can take that through, as those come in beyond

22 just the app, we would know the count on that. Don't

23 have it handy. Obviously, it's only during snow

24 season, but it is something we could look at

25 historically to see what we've received.

2   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Right. Well, all

3   of these are only during snow season. I mean,

4   although with our weather now, who knows it may snow

5   next week.

6   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: It's not going to

7   snow next week.

8   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Says Gale

9   Brewer, it's not going to snow next week. You never

10   know. But, if I'm looking at snow or ice on the

11   street, I mean, this is something I've gotten

12   numerous complaints about and, taking it to the

13   website, I mean, I think kind of the point is I think

14   Council Member Holden made reference to this. I mean,

15   this is 2024. Apps are the way most people, I think,

16   engage with a lot of services, private and public,

17   that they come to use. You know, the MTA you get on

18   the train, it doesn't direct you to a website to

19   purchase your railroad ticket. If they get an Uber,

20   I'm not directed to a website to order my cab. In the

21   same token, people in my District who are requesting

22   service for snow and ice removal on pedestrian

23   bridges shouldn't be directed to another place. It

24   should be easy on the app and, given the number of

25   snow or ice on the sidewalk categories, it's only

2 seven, adding another one would not be arduous or

3 difficult, I think, for the app to do.

4   I don't want to take too much time. I

5 just want to do one more, and that is audio and

6 video, whether you're listening to one right now or

7 you're, just kidding, submitting it. I'm on the app

8 right now again, and I see that there's a way to

9 submit up to three photos, which is, I think, a

10 change from what the old app did, where in many cases

11 you had to compress it, but there's no option for

12 video.

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: It takes

14 media, photo or video.

15   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Let's talk about

16 it at another time because I want to show you. I want

17 to be respectful of everyone's time, but I just tried

18 three phones and there is not the ability to upload

19 or to take video in the app. Images, yes. Video, no.

20 So if there was an intent to do that, I am here to

21 tell you it is not done, but the bill would ensure

22 that that you are able to upload the video and the

23 photos, and then I just want to confirm that you said

24 those photos and videos are subsequently sent to the

25 relevant agency.

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: That part

3 I can confirm. Yes, they are.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Okay. Great.

5 Thank you. That is all. Thank you, Chair.

6   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you, Council

7 Member.

8   Next, we'll have questions from Council

9 Member Erik Bottcher.

10   COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Hi. 3-1-1

11 service requests for homeless assistance or regarding

12 homeless encampments, my understanding was that those

13 are supposed to be routed to the Department of

14 Homeless Services and contracted homeless outreach

15 workers. What we're finding in our district office is

16 that in almost every case they're being referred to

17 the NYPD. Are service requests for homeless

18 assistance, should they be routed to DHS service

19 contracted outreach workers or should they be routed

20 to the NYPD?

21   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Thank you

22 for the question, Council Member, and I appreciate

23 the distinction. I can speak to the 3-1-1 process

24 with respect to that, which is the intake piece, and

25 I'll split them the way you did. For a homeless

2 person assistance that is routed to DSS, Department

3 of Social Services, Department of Homeless Services.

4 If the filing is for an encampment, I believe, I want

5 to make sure I get the sequence straight, the

6 information is sent to NYPD to identify as an

7 encampment and then, from there, they notify

8 Department of Social Services.

9   COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: I'd love to talk

10 to you more about how that's playing out because what

11 we're finding is that in almost every case the

12 response that we get back rather promptly is this

13 service request has been closed by the NYPD, and I

14 would suggest that we rework the way that that takes

15 place. I think the Department of Homeless Services

16 should be the primary responder to that, and I think

17 we should talk to you about what kind of feedback

18 we're getting to make sure that that process works

19 better.

20   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I

21 appreciate that and, yes, we look forward to that.

22   COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: In your

23 testimony, you talked about the 94 percent

24 satisfaction rating for the call center

25 representatives, and I agree that they're great but,

2   arguably, the more important customer service rating

3   would be the satisfaction with the service that

4   people are getting as a result of 3-1-1. Can you

5   speak to the satisfaction ratings that you're getting

6   in your surveys for the level of satisfaction that

7   people are getting at the end of the 3-1-1 process?

8   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Again,

9   thank you for the question. It gives an opportunity

10 to talk a little bit more, and I'll first say thank

11 you for recognizing the satisfaction with the agents

12 and your feedback on the agents. It goes a long way.

13 It's a challenging position, and any sort of

14 recognition is a morale boost for the team so thank

15 you for that.

16   With respect to the satisfaction a

17 customer would have with the agency's fulfillment of

18 the process, CTO Fraser, had mentioned this at a

19 previous hearing last month. It is something we're

20 looking at. It's something we're looking to be able

21 to say, okay, let's get the customer feedback once an

22 agency has completed the service request and then

23 show what that is. That's work in progress, something

24 that we are looking to move forward on. I don't have

25

2 a specific date for it, but it is something in the

3 works.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: In our last

5 hearing, I did ask Mr. Fraser about that, and he said

6 that he thought by the end of the second quarter

7 you'd be able to post some kind of resolution

8 satisfaction dashboard that we could look at to get

9 an idea of the customer satisfaction with the

10 outcomes of 3-1-1. Is that a process that you're

11 familiar with?

12   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Yes, I'm

13 familiar with the process. I'm familiar with the

14 timeline. I believe he said the end of the second

15 quarter, possibly third quarter, but I am familiar

16 with the process, and that's what I referred to a

17 moment ago. That's what we're working on.

18   COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: Thank you.

19   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: All right. Thank

20 you, Council Members.

21   I'm going to ask a few more questions. I

22 want to dig in a little bit into privacy and data and

23 would love for you to share if there are any specific

24 security measures in place to protect user data and

25 security, both on the site or on the app.

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Thank you.

3 I appreciate that question because it gives us an

4 opportunity to talk about a very important topic.

5 I'll speak at a high level and a general level first,

6 but I'll also say I have very good colleagues that

7 work within OTI, including the City's Chief Privacy

8 Officer and our CISO, our Chief Information Security

9 Officer, who would both oversee the areas that drive

10 our policies and our adherence to those policies so,

11 ultimately, I would defer to them on anything that's

12 specific or related to the policy but, from a 3-1-1

13 perspective writ large, we have privacy measures. We

14 have privacy policy. It's available to customers. It

15 applies no matter which process you're using, which

16 channel you're using, phone, online, social, etc.,

17 and it is something that is very important to us. The

18 ability for 3-1-1 to work for New Yorkers is largely

19 based on a compact between customers and 3-1-1, and

20 we really make sure we are looking out for the

21 customer's interest, for the customer's need. Privacy

22 goes a long way with that. It builds trust. It gives

23 the customer confidence. It allows the customer to

24 call. It removes, potentially, a barrier to call. The

25 customer's afraid of their status, of their

2 situation, of anything. We really have stressed over

3 the years and engaged with City Council on a number

4 of times on the things that we offer to do that. For

5 example, 3-1-1 is largely anonymous for the public.

6 We don't need your name. We don't need your contact

7 information for general information. We often don't

8 need your name for a service request and don't

9 necessarily need to take your name for a service

10 request. That's something we've really pushed and

11 promoted over the years, and it gets to the broader

12 issue of privacy, but also the broader issue of this

13 compact and this trust with the public.

14   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I'm sorry to

15 interrupt you, but I just want to push back a little

16 bit. If you could just make the distinction between

17 what 3-1-1 is asking for and the agency in that

18 service request. I know for a fact DOH asks for

19 information, and they actually, in many ways, need it

20 to be able to access, so if you could just make that

21 distinction.

22   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Certainly,

23 yes. For general information, what we call

24 information provided, which is about 70 percent of

25 all the contacts to 3-1-1, there's no service

2 request, there's no complaint, and there's no need,

3 maybe one or two exceptions, whether it's an

4 application or a form, but there's generally no need

5 for customer information.

6   For a service request, 3-1-1, again, does

7 the intake. If an agency needs contact information in

8 order to fulfill on the request, such as a specific

9 location like an apartment, then that would be

10 something we would do in the intake process, and

11 that's what gets sent.

12   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Does 3-1-1 keep

13 that information?

14   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: No, that

15 information is transmitted through the service

16 request, and then it goes to the agency.

17   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: To the agency,

18 okay.

19   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: And then

20 for other ones, customers can choose to give their

21 contact information, but the majority of service

22 request types do not require the who in order for it

23 to be fulfilled.

24   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: And how often does

25 the privacy policy get updated?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I'm going

3 to be nonspecific, but I'll say on a very regular

4 basis. I think we've updated it fairly recently.

5 Various levels of changes, sometimes could be minor

6 changes, sometimes can be substantive updates, but

7 it's something that's a living document.

8 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, and are

9 there any factors that lead to a change in terms of

10 use of agreement?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I think a

12 lot of it comes from the learning and the growth in

13 the area of privacy. As I mentioned, OTI has a

14 privacy officer within OTI but also serves for the

15 City capacity, a good colleague, and we consult with

16 him and his team to make sure we have the most

17 current information.

18 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Thank you. I

19 just want to still dig into privacy and data. We've

20 learned that according to Apple and Google app

21 stores, policies revealing an app's data practices,

22 the NYC311 mobile app sends user data to third

23 parties. The data is not encrypted in transit and the

24 data cannot be requested to be deleted. What third

25 parties are receiving user data?

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Thank you

3 for the question and for the information. I'm not

4 sure. I don't know what the answer to that would be.

5 I would have to check and get back to you.

6   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. All right.

7 That cancels out the next question, but let me ask

8 you and you might have to give back to me on this as

9 well. Can OTI ensure that mobile app data is

10 encrypted in transit or is that up to another party?

11   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I

12 understand, and I'll put that in the same category.

13 I'll look into it. I'll talk to colleagues and we'll

14 get back to you on that.

15   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, and,

16 similarly, user's data being deleted or not, the

17 option for that data, a user cannot at this point

18 request that the data be deleted. Is that something

19 that OTI can allow for?

20   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I

21 appreciate it. If you'll allow me the opportunity to

22 look into that and get you an accurate and current

23 answer.

24   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Hopefully,

25 you got the answer to the next one. According to the

2 existing privacy policy, 3-1-1 does not sell, rent,

3 or otherwise use information for commercial or

4 marketing purposes. I know from the Play Store, it

5 says that data may be shared. It's right when you go

6 to download the app. What purposes is 3-1-1 sharing

7 user information for?

8   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I do

9 understand the question. I will need to get back and

10 consult with colleagues in order to give you an

11 appropriate answer for that.

12   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. This seems

13 really important so, yes, we'd love to follow up.

14   On phone calls, 3-1-1, are those phone

15 calls recorded?

16   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Calls are

17 recorded.

18   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, and what is

19 the purpose?

20   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: What is

21 the message?

22   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: The purpose, I'm

23 sorry.

24   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Oh, I'm

25 sorry. For quality control and training purposes.

CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: There is an announcement on the messaging when you call that for that very reason, calls are recorded for quality purposes. We use them as developmental opportunities so we can coach and develop agents.

CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Oh, okay, and how long do you keep those recordings for?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The retention period, I believe, is 14 days.

CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Oh, okay, 14 days. I'm going to ask a little bit more about the website experience. It's my understanding that the NYC311 appears to collect URLs of websites that users visit prior to visiting NYC311 website. Are you aware of that?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I am aware. I understand what you're saying, and I am aware. I'm not sure I would be able to answer the question.

CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Do you know, my question is just why.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Oh.

2   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Why, and I know

3 that they collect the websites and, yeah, and what?

4 And the domain names.

5   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Domain

6 names. Okay.

7   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Associated with

8 that device.

9   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Again, I

10 would appreciate the opportunity to pull together an

11 answer for that based on talking with my colleagues

12 instead of trying to answer off the top of my head.

13   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. I appreciate

14 that. The website uses many cookies. However, it does

15 not have the banner to provide the option for users

16 to opt out. Do you plan to provide that option for

17 New Yorkers?

18   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: If I may,

19 I would like to get back to you on that.

20   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: All right. Okay.

21 Let's skip. We'll send you these following questions,

22 because I think we're going to get the same

23 responses, respectfully.

24   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Appreciate

25 that.

2 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Now, I have a

3 couple more questions, and then I'm going to pass it

4 to Council Member Holden and then Council Member

5 Brewer. So, in the last hearing that we had, which

6 was in June of 2022, I think we were still virtual,

7 so dig deep, there was testimony that 3-1-1 would

8 extend services to WhatsApp messaging platforms. What

9 can you speak about that? Did this happen? Where are

10 we? Is this still going to happen?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Gotcha.

12 Yep. Again, thank you for that, and good recall on

13 that particular item. So it is still part of our

14 roadmap. We've not gone live with WhatsApp. We've

15 looked at it. There's a sequence of events we're

16 doing to upgrade our technology platform that will

17 then allow us to insert WhatsApp into that so we've

18 moved forward with something called omni-channel,

19 kind of a generic term but, once you have that, that

20 will allow agents to then be in a situation where

21 they could do a text, they could handle a WhatsApp,

22 they could handle a phone call so we need to build

23 that out to then be able to insert WhatsApp into that

24 so it's on our roadmap, it's on our radar. We don't

25 have a particular timeframe for it at this point.

2   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: And, just curious,

3   what is the reasoning for WhatsApp specifically?

4   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The reason

5   for WhatsApp?

6   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: For wanting to

7   utilize or integrate WhatsApp.

8   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: To expand

9   access to New Yorkers.

10   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. But there

11   are other apps. Is there something specific to

12   WhatsApp?

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Research

14   that we've looked at and the feedback that we've

15   gotten, it's the app that is most used that we're

16   currently not supporting. It's the place where people

17   go.

18   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: And how do you

19   think, because WhatsApp, and I'm familiar with it, I

20   have it, my family uses it, they have a very explicit

21   privacy policy that they're constantly updating. How

22   do you think their privacy policy and NYC311's

23   privacy policy are aligned and are you in talks?

24   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I can't

25   say we're in talks. I will say they would have to be

2 aligned in order for us to be able to bring WhatsApp

3 on board. Again, we see it as an opportunity to

4 expand access, particularly to some customers who may

5 not be familiar with or use 3-1-1 and maybe that

6 WhatsApp becomes the way they do that but, like every

7 other channel we do, any other customer interaction

8 we have, it would have to adhere to the privacy

9 standards.

10   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Are there any

11 plans to integrate 3-1-1 into the MyCity Portal in

12 the future?

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The MyCity

14 Portal is up and running in a number of categories.

15 We have a very complementary relationship at this

16 point in terms of what a customer can do and what

17 MyCity is specific for and what 3-1-1 online, as we

18 call it, is so I would say we run in parallel but not

19 necessarily plans to integrate anything at this point

20 in time.

21   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, and are

22 there any plans to incorporate generative AI into any

23 of the services?

24   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Generative

25 AI, as I think we all know, is something that has

2 emerged and advanced rapidly in the last couple of

3 years. Like any technology, we are looking at

4 anything that may enhance service delivery, anything

5 that may be better for New Yorkers so we are doing,

6 I'll say, due diligence in that area and trying to

7 understand the AI offerings and then how they could

8 and would fit into either the current channels that

9 3-1-1 has or potentially new channels.

10   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: So, I'm sorry, OTI

11 is currently looking at generative AI as a tool or

12 ways to integrate to the 3-1-1 service?

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Yeah, OTI

14 is doing a number of things. As you probably know,

15 OTI has issued the Mayor's AI Action Plan in October

16 of last year, recently updated in March, which

17 provides governance and guidance so that's our

18 umbrella but, from a technology standpoint and also

19 from a customer service delivery standpoint, we are

20 looking at AI, all aspects of AI, and looking towards

21 what could that do for New Yorkers, what could that

22 do for 3-1-1.

23   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, that's

24 exciting.

25

2   I'm going to pass it off to Council

3 Members Holden, Brewer, and then Paladino for

4 questions.

5   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you for the

6 second round, Chair. Thank you, Deputy Commissioner.

7   Just a couple of questions. During COVID

8 and we would call 3-1-1 to get an operator, it took

9 five minutes because you had to listen to tons of

10 messages. I understood that, but one of my

11 suggestions at the hearing back then, I said, what

12 about pressing zero to get a live operator? You know,

13 because I don't need to sit through five minutes of

14 this stuff. Now, it's two minutes and 35 seconds of

15 messages, which I don't want to, I'm not interested,

16 I just want to report something in my neighborhood.

17 Can you press zero, because I made a suggestion, can

18 you press zero to get a live operator?

19   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: At the

20 current time, I do not believe our system allows

21 that.

22   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Problem. There it

23 is. That's why, again, people want to make reports,

24 but they got to listen to stuff that they're not

25 interested in. You shouldn't force anybody to listen

2 to messages that they don't want to hear. User-

3 friendly, zero, press zero, get a live operator.

4 That's a normal operating procedure for most

5 messages. Please work on that.

6   The second thing, according to your

7 report pursuant to Local Law 66, I'm back to this, of

8 2021, due to the legacy systems used by some

9 agencies, which you had mentioned, even if the device

10 shows the exact location, the service request must be

11 identified by street address, intersection, or

12 landmark place. One of the proposed improvements

13 stated in the report was to allow users to submit

14 service requests by leveraging their mobile device

15 location or by picking a point on the map. It was

16 also stated that this project was in progress, you

17 had mentioned it's still in progress, but it was

18 expected to be completed by the first quarter of

19 2023, your agency said that, all right? We're now a

20 year later, it still hasn't been completed so what's

21 the holdup?

22   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The work

23 itself, as I said, we have a project to enhance the

24 mobile app and enhance the, I'll call it, the

25

2 location capabilities. I don't have specifics so I

3 could give you…

4   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Maybe you could

5 call Uber or Lyft because they could figure it out,

6 but you guys can't. This is unacceptable. You have

7 people that want to help their neighborhoods and fix

8 the quality of life or keep it, and we're not getting

9 service from that. That's a very, very important

10 feature. If I call 9-1-1, they should know where I am

11 with my phone, if my location services is on, right?

12 They should know where I am. I shouldn't have to

13 spell out the name of my street address. Same thing

14 should 3-1-1. Come on. And you said a year ago it was

15 going to be implemented, and we still haven't. We're

16 still waiting so that's why we're oversight. You guys

17 are not doing what you should be doing. If you can

18 get back to us, this Committee, as to when this will

19 be rolled out, because it's a very, very important

20 feature, and that's why, again, I don't use the live

21 operators because it takes too long, and I call in so

22 many times, and I shouldn't have to listen to 2

23 minutes and 35 seconds of information that I'm not

24 interested in, and you should do that, too, so

25 there's two major things that I'm concerned with,

2   location and also in listening to messages I don't

3   want to hear. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

4   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Council

5   Member, thank you for the feedback.

6   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you, Council

7   Member.

8   Next, we have Council Member Brewer

9   followed by Council Member Paladino.

10   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you very

11   much. Obviously, a lot of people are listening to

12   this hearing. Thank you, Madam Chair. The whole world

13   is listening, I swear, and one of the complaints that

14   they're getting on noise. Noise is such a quality-of-

15   life, as you know, and they say that when they call

16   about jackhammering, which only takes place for a

17   certain period, it takes 10 days, they're told it'll

18   get back to them in 10 days. That's not going to work

19   so how do you address things that are more time

20   sensitive on 3-1-1? Apparently, this consumer, and

21   they're on watching now, indicates that they called

22   about jackhammering, and they were told in 10 days 3-

23   1-1 will get back to them so does that mean that

24   somebody's investigating it, that's why it takes that

25   long, but it sounds like we're going to listen for

2   the jackhammering in 10 days and, of course, the

3   jackhammering could be over so how do you address

4   those really pesky noise issues like that?

5   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Council

6   Member, thank you for the question, and thank you for

7   relaying the real-time consumer question. What you

8   described sounds like something that 3-1-1 handles

9   the intake on and would go to the Department of

10   Environmental Protection, as in what I put in the

11   broader category noise complaint. I'd have to check

12   on what the service level agreement is and what the

13   steps are, but it could very well be what you

14   described, that the report goes in and that triggers

15   something for the agency to be able to pursue, but

16   I'd be a little bit beyond my headlights trying to

17   get at what the agency actually does without being

18   able to look it up.

19   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, well I can

20   follow up also, but I'm just saying things like that

21   are what bother people. Obviously, wait time is

22   another one. So those are the kinds of issues that I

23   think in order to get more people even to use 3-1-1,

24   they have to be addressed.

25

2   Second quick question, I'm obviously very

3   partial to the Open Data platform so is based on 3-1-

4   1 data so do you work with Open Data platform staff?

5   Is it completely separate? How does the data go from

6   3-1-1 to the open data? And, of course, there are

7   issues there, real-time, updating, so on and so

8   forth, so how does the coordination take place?

9   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I do

10   appreciate that question, give a chance to kind of

11   share how we're working in that. In the beginning I

12   mentioned the Mayor's Executive Order that created

13   OTI. That brought 3-1-1 and what was the Mayor's

14   Office of Data Analytics, now OTI's Data Analytics,

15   headed up by my colleague Martha Norick. We work

16   hand-in-hand with that team. On the Open Data site,

17   two of the biggest data sets, the most popular data

18   sets, there's many popular ones as you know, are

19   service request data from 3-1-1 and then call center

20   data. The service request one is the most interesting

21   for people because it's got location information and

22   other factors so that is something we do work with

23   OTI. It's a closed loop. The process gets updated on

24   a regular basis, on a daily basis. If there's any

25

2   enhancements, if there's any issues, we have a direct

3   connection with the team that supports that.

4   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, so you work

5   with the team because there is a box, so to speak,

6   that you can make complaints and this is what needs

7   to be improved so you and the other team work on

8   trying to respond to those complaints. Is that a

9   correct statement?

10   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The

11   process is to do that. We do have access to that. We

12   also would have other access to get feedback from the

13   public, as you know and I think you've participated

14   in the past, a number of Open Data events is also

15   kind of a hotbed to get feedback and get information

16   so that's something we do as well but, from a process

17   perspective, yes, we work with the Open Data team.

18   COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Okay, thank you.

19   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you, Council

20   Member.

21   Next, we have questions from Council

22   Member Paladino.

23   COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Thank you very

24   much, Chair.

25

2   I'm going to take you back to page one of

3   our list of questions here. I, too, I'm in an aging

4   community and I'm hearing a lot of talk about all the

5   new technology so I want to take you back a decade to

6   when people call, because they do call in my District

7   3-1-1, so going back to page one of the questioning,

8   how many employees and what's the present headcount

9   for calling 3-1-1?

10   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Great.

11 Thank you for the question and thank you for the time

12 period. I appreciate that. One of the things we're

13 proud about at 3-1-1 is we have multiple channels to

14 serve multiple customer needs because everyone, many

15 people, have different preferences.

16   To answer your specific question, the

17 headcount for 3-1-1 City staff, the call center

18 representatives, the frontline agents who are

19 handling the calls, is 248.

20   COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: That's what I

21 have. Okay, I just want to double check because I

22 wrote down the numbers. But when we have 9 million

23 people in the City and in my District over 300,000,

24 248 people to answer a phone is not really that

25 great. Now, you also said you outsource so how many

2 operators additional to that do you have at your

3 outsourcing facility?

4   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Great.

5 Appreciate that question as well. There's two pieces

6 that augment the resources that we have, the City

7 resources. What we have is an overflow vendor

8 contract and we have an arrangement where we bucket

9 it as production hours so I don't have a headcount

10 number for you, but what we do is we purchase hours

11 from the vendors.

12   COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: So how many

13 hours do you purchase?

14   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Per month,

15 we can purchase anywhere from 15,000 or more hours

16 per month, which then equates, if you do the math,

17 equates to the amount of coverage that you need.

18   COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Okay.

19   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: We also

20 have a program with CUNY, CUNY Research Foundation,

21 where college students can work at 3-1-1 as call

22 takers on a part-time basis. They basically work

23 three shifts a week and that allows us to augment the

24 full-time staff.

25

2   COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: So far I'm not

3 real happy.

4   Okay, next is with everything that's

5 going on and we see it's going on in our City right

6 now, what is the protocol that 3-1-1 has in, god

7 forbid, of an emergency?

8   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Great.

9 Thank you for that question. I do appreciate it. We

10 had referenced a little earlier what we call the high

11 call volume protocol. It's something that 3-1-1 has

12 really evolved and honed over the last several years,

13 going back at least 10 years. From the beginning of

14 3-1-1, Council Member Brewer referenced that earlier,

15 it was met with a transit strike and a blackout

16 within its first couple of years. Over the years,

17 we've dealt with Hurricane Irene, Hurricane Sandy,

18 we've dealt with the pandemic so we have a high call

19 volume protocol that factors first all channels, but

20 I'll speak specifically to the phone channel first.

21 First and foremost, it's information. We found that

22 most people need real-time information on the topic

23 at hand. Our telephone system allows us to provide

24 automated announcements, messaging, on that

25 particular topic, and the majority of customers get

2   that information, consume it, understand it within 30

3   seconds to one minute of calling. That's our number

4   one act for high call volume situations. What's the

5   issue? What's the City's status? What's the

6   information the public needs to know? We have a

7   number of other steps that go into high call volume,

8   everything from staffing to how…

9   COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: But there's no

10 separate number that, in case of an emergency, please

11 call. Okay, now in, god forbid, of an emergency,

12 you're going to have out, of 9 million people living

13 here, you're going to have about 3 to 4 million calls

14 in probably two-hours' time, an hour's time. I know

15 my office will probably get about 1,000, and that's

16 no joke. I just want to know, it doesn't sound like

17 you guys are really set up at all for an emergency.

18 You're having trouble enough just keeping up with our

19 everyday issues, dealing with our everyday agencies.

20   I just want to veer off a second to what

21 my Colleague mentioned about the 2 minute and 35

22 second wait time. Now you could call Walgreens and

23 everybody knows this, right? Call Walgreens and we

24 could just press zero to get to the necessary

25 operator. I want DEP, press this. We shouldn't be

2 listening to 2 minutes and 35 seconds of nonsense. We

3 should be able to, and what that does in essence is

4 that deters people from making the call. People don't

5 want to call and listen to music or listen to

6 nonsense. They just want their questions handled.

7 They want to know simple questions and it's just

8 ridiculous so there's a lot of things that 3-1-1

9 could really knuckle down to. I appreciate the fact

10 that you have a website, though I don't know anybody

11 who uses it. I appreciate the fact that you have this

12 text messaging that people could use. Again, nobody I

13 know is using it. What are you doing to tell people

14 other than this Technology hearing right now and me

15 taking this information back to my District and

16 people listening to this, what are you doing to

17 promote other alternatives to just picking up the

18 phone as we tell so many people and call 3-1-1 and

19 get the help because it always comes back to my

20 office and we call the agencies, but what are you

21 doing?

22   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Thank you

23 for that question. Specifically talking about the

24 phone channel, one of the things we do is target the

25 exact universe of folks who are looking to understand

2   other options so we play messaging, encouraging

3   customers to use the 3-1-1 online or use the 3-1-1

4   mobile app and market it as faster and easier access.

5   What we're trying to do there is make customers aware

6   there is a self-service option in addition to the

7   phone channel. At the end of the day, we want the

8   customer to go through the channel of their choice

9   and what they're most comfortable with, but we do

10   receive over 55,000 calls a day on average…

11   COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Sure.

12   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: And

13   through that process, some of that messaging is

14   designed to educate and inform the public.

15   COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: The problem is

16   the public has got about a 30-second, really, you

17   speak to a school teacher, the attention span is 30

18   seconds now so what we've done is it just reduces the

19   people. It's all right. You answered my question, but

20   I just want you to know the attention rate is down to

21   30 seconds so thank you very much. I appreciate it.

22   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Thank you,

23   Council Member.

24   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you, Council

25   Member.

2   I just want to ask a couple questions

3 about language access, and then I know Council Member

4 Holden has a followup.

5   I'm particularly interested in Council

6 Member Ung's bill. I'll give you the number, Intro

7 461. I'm aware, the 175 languages or so, but my

8 understanding is this particular bill wants to focus

9 on the app and, if I'm not mistaken, the app is not

10 in multiple languages. Is that correct?

11   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The app is

12 not in multiple languages. That is correct.

13   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Right. It's just

14 in English.

15   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Correct.

16   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: This bill is

17 really saying we would love it in multiple languages.

18 What is the barrier to transitioning this app to

19 allow for multiple languages?

20   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Thank you

21 for the question and the broader context. For the app

22 itself, it's similar to the path that we've taken

23 with the website. In order to be able to provide

24 translation services, currently we rely on automated

25 translation services so, if you use the 3-1-1 online

2 website, if you use NYC.gov, if you use the City

3 Council website, we're using automated translation. I

4 won't name the products, but there's a couple of big

5 ones that do that translation. We need to figure out

6 how to do that on the mobile app in order to make it

7 available in languages. It ultimately would be an

8 automated language translation tool.

9   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Are you

10 aware of any City app where the app is in multiple

11 languages, where it has this automated translation

12 feature?

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I

14 understand your question. I'm not aware, but that

15 doesn't mean there's not any, but I'm not.

16   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Is this something

17 that you are all looking to do?

18   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Under the

19 broader context of language access, we look at the

20 call center option, calling 3-1-1, as well as the

21 website as the primary ways to meet the requirements

22 of Local Law 30, but also to increase access to the

23 public.

24

25

2   For the mobile app, it's something we

3 know we need, something we're looking at, something

4 that will be part of our plan.

5   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Intro. 461 also

6 requires DoITT or OTI to make a translated version of

7 the app available for download on the website in

8 addition to Apple or Google Play. Are you aware of

9 any risks associated with downloading an app outside

10 of official app stores?

11   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I am not.

12   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay. Does 3-1-1

13 have any plans to expand languages supported on its

14 app or text message or social media channels?

15   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I do

16 appreciate that question. It'll give me an

17 opportunity to talk about some of the enhancements

18 we've made since we've last talked about this topic.

19 So, we actually have expanded. As I've referenced and

20 we've shared before, we have on the call side, when

21 you call 3-1-1, there's an automated process. It is

22 greeting in English, but it has provided up to six

23 languages, recorded announcements for the topics that

24 most people call for, to get quick information, for

25 example, parking. Last year, we expanded that from

2 six languages to the 10 designated citywide languages

3 so customers calling in those languages can hear that

4 information. Another item we expanded, and ties back

5 to a discussion we had when you came to visit last

6 time, was to create, I'll call it landing pages on 3-

7 1-1 online, on the website. They're language access

8 pages where a customer can go, and they'll see on

9 that page links in their languages, the 10 designated

10 citywide languages. Click on one of those links in

11 your language, and it takes you to a page that's

12 curated and manually transmitted, translated in that

13 language, and we call it How To 3-1-1. There's two

14 sections on it. One, it describes, again, in

15 language, how you would call 3-1-1, what procedure to

16 follow, gives you kind of a tip, and then the second

17 one is how to navigate the 3-1-1 website, including

18 how to use the automated translation tool. We think

19 it's something that customers will be very

20 comfortable with, and have an opportunity to say,

21 okay, great, I can use this, now I know how to take

22 the next step with 3-1-1, and again, relying on the

23 call center and the website.

24   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. That's

25 exciting. I don't want to skip that.

2   How many languages are supported by 3-1-

3 1's text messaging service? Is it the same amount?

4   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: The text

5 messaging service, we currently are going through a

6 program where we can do a translation for a text

7 that, if it comes in a language other than English,

8 we can convert it and respond back to the customer.

9   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: In that same

10 language, right?

11   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: In that

12 same language.

13   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: But do you have a

14 sense of, is that the 10 languages in text?

15   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: It's

16 currently nine out of the 10, and the 10th one, we

17 believe we've solved the barrier.

18   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I tried it in

19 Spanish but, obviously, I was hoping that it would

20 work, but okay so nine out of the 10.

21   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Nine out

22 of the 10 right now, and we're probably close to

23 having a solution on the 10th.

24   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, great. My

25 last question is how do you all monitor the quality

2   of language translations, both on the site, text

3   messaging, and even using LanguageLine? We've had

4   joint hearings specifically on LanguageLine and some

5   of the disconnect for users, just because languages

6   also have dialects, different intonations, different

7   meanings. How does 3-1-1 solve for or perform quality

8   control in this instance?

9   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Very

10   important question, and something we do spend focus

11   and time on. It does start with LanguageLine itself

12   so one of the best advantages that we have in

13   contracting with LanguageLine is their size and scope

14   and, more importantly, their business model, which

15   works with commercial and life safety resources

16   across the country so LanguageLine's own best

17   interest is to make sure that they're delivering

18   quality service. Once we work with them, we're able

19   to get an understanding of some of the best

20   practices, some of the tips, and some of the ways to

21   handle an interpreter call. We also have the ability

22   to do two things. We have a contract with

23   LanguageLine. We can also use another vendor to

24   basically do interpretation and written translations

25   so we will rely on a LanguageLine interpretation at

2   times to validate a call if we need to because we can

3   use a recorded call, for example so heavy partnership

4   with LanguageLine, leveraging the fact that they have

5   a vested interest in being good at what they do

6   beyond New York City's involvement. Within that, we

7   also use our own quality control structure so we're

8   able to go through calls if they're in a language

9   other than English or Spanish, and we need a

10   resource, we can bring a LanguageLine resource on to

11   listen to that call and interpret for us.

12   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. That

13   seems thorough.

14   I will pass it now to Council Member

15   Holden who has follow-up questions.

16   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair.

17   This is the third round. This is great. Thank you so

18   much.

19   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Of course.

20   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: One other thing,

21   you know, again, I'm going back to the app.

22   Previously, years ago, this Committee had made

23   suggestions about making complaints on the app for

24   filming, TV and motion picture filming on our

25   streets, and it's done a lot. We had suggested that

2 there's no way to make a complaint on the app about,

3 and here's what happens when they film on the

4 streets. Many times they take over the entire block

5 of a commercial district, and they put cones in the

6 street, and they take over the area 24 hours in

7 advance, sometimes even more. They take up more spots

8 than they need, and they continue that, and they

9 abuse the whole street, and they close it out to any

10 commercial work or any people shopping and so forth

11 so this Committee made a suggestion that you put a

12 category on filming since we do a lot of it here, and

13 it does lack oversight from the Mayor's Office,

14 because they're not, I've checked many times, and

15 they're not even aware, the Mayor's Office is not

16 even aware of the abuses so we've asked that that be

17 added to the list of, and it's not that hard, one

18 more category or at least, if you try to do that on

19 this app, you get nowhere. If I try to say filming,

20 taking up spots, blocking sidewalks, blocking

21 crosswalks, blocking hydrants, I can't get that from

22 the film industry. Can you include that? Will you

23 consider it? Because you guys told me that a few

24 years ago, and we're still nowhere.

25

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Thank you

3   for the context around that. My colleagues sitting

4   there are probably ready to remind me what the

5   process is for handling those complaints, but I

6   believe it is something that we do not take a

7   structured service request for, but instead we

8   connect the customer to the Mayor's Office of Media

9   and Entertainment who oversee that so the absence of

10   a service request wouldn't enable it to be available

11   on the website.

12   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No, but on the

13   app.

14   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Sorry, on

15   the app, website or the app.

16   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: No, but you won't

17   consider it?

18   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: We always

19   consider.

20   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: All right, but I

21   heard that a few years ago, so if you could, if you

22   know the amount of filming on our streets and if you

23   know the complaints, because it is an invasion

24   essentially to many neighborhoods. If it's in

25   residential, it could have trailers all over the

2   place and blocking crosswalks and sidewalks and all

3   that, but I think we need something in that area

4   because there's so many abuses.

5   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I

6   appreciate it and what I'll do is go back to the

7   agency that's responsible for addressing that and

8   revisit what our situation is.

9   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And just a general

10 app request, if I could type in my complaint and it

11 would actually give me a category, a subcategory,

12 that seems workable, although it doesn't exist.

13   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Appreciate

14 that one. I'll ask you a question back if that's

15 okay. Have you tried the new search on the request

16 site?

17   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Yes.

18   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: And you

19 can type in.

20   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: It doesn't work.

21   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Okay.

22   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I'll show you if

23 you want. After the hearing, I could show you. I

24 tried to do filming. I do everything first and see if

25 it works.

2   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I figured

3 you had, but it is an enhancement where you can type

4 in in that search and it'll pull up options based on.

5   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: It does, but it

6 doesn't take me to a complaint. It takes me somewhere

7 else.

8   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I see.

9 Okay.

10   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: And I just want to

11 stay in that app to file a complaint and I don't want

12 to go to another agency, look up a phone number and

13 have to call.

14   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: I

15 understand.

16   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you. Thank

17 you, Deputy Commissioner. Thank you.

18   DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MORRISROE: Thank you,

19 Council Member.

20   CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, thank you

21 both so much, Deputy Commissioner and General

22 Counsel. That concludes questioning from the Members.

23   Now, we're going to open the hearing for

24 public testimony.

25

2   I want to remind members of the public

3   that this is a formal government proceeding and that

4   decorum shall be observed at all times. As such,

5   members of the public shall remain silent at all

6   times.

7   The witness table is reserved for people

8   who wish to testify. No video recording or

9   photography is allowed from the witness table.

10   Further, members of the public may not present audio

11   or video recordings as testimony but may submit

12   transcripts of such recordings to the Sergeant-at-

13   Arms for inclusion in the hearing record.

14   If you wish to speak at today's hearing,

15   please fill out an appearance card with the Sergeant-

16   at-Arms and wait to be recognized. When recognized,

17   you will have two minutes to speak on today's hearing

18   topics on 3-1-1, Intros 131, 422, 461, 485, 582, 583,

19   584, 589, 602, 626, 634, 640, 673, 820, and 822.

20   If you have a written statement or

21   additional written testimony you wish to submit for

22   the record, please provide a copy of the testimony to

23   Sergeant-at-Arms. You may also email written

24   testimony to testimony@council.nyc.gov within 72

25

2   hours of this hearing. Audio and video recordings

3   will not be accepted.

4   Our first panel is Christopher Leon

5   Johnson. He was here. No? Okay. I'll wait a minute.

6   I'm going to call him up one more time.

7   Christopher Leon Johnson.

8   Okay. If we have inadvertently missed

9   anyone who has registered to testify today and has

10   yet to have been called, please use the Zoom hand

11   function and you will be called in the order that

12   your hand has been raised.

13   COMMITTEE COUNSEL BYHOVSKY: There is no

14   one on Zoom.

15   No one on Zoom? All right.

16   Thank you, everyone, for your testimonies

17   today. The hearing is adjourned. [GAVEL]

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the
foregoing transcript is a true and accurate
record of the proceedings. We further certify that
there is no relation to any of the parties to
this action by blood or marriage, and that there
is interest in the outcome of this matter.

Date _____ May 24, 2024 _____