

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

-----X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

SUB-COMMITTEE ON LANDMARKS, SITING AND MARITIME USES

-----X

October 25, 2010

Start: 11:20am

Recess: 12:15pm

HELD AT: Council Chambers  
City Hall

B E F O R E:  
BRAD LANDER  
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:  
Maria del Carmen Arroyo  
Daniel J. Halloran  
Letitia James  
Rosie Mendez  
Annabel Palma  
James Sanders, Jr.  
Jumaane D. Williams

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jenny Fernandez  
Director of Intergovernmental and Community Relations  
Landmarks Preservation Commission

Jeffrey Contradt  
Assistant Commissioner  
Department of Citywide Administrative Services

Lisa Fitzpatrick  
Deputy Commissioner, FIA Operations  
Human Resources Administration

Joseph Santino  
Deputy Commissioner  
Human Resources Administration

Tom DeBibbo  
Senior Executive Deputy Commissioner  
Human Resources Administration

Theresa Ward  
Deputy Mayor for Operations  
Human Resources Administration

John Dew  
Chairperson  
Community Board 2

Shelly Hagan  
Clinton Hill Neighbors

Ken Fisher  
Cozin O'Connor, representing GFI

1

2

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Good morning.

3

This meeting of the Land Use sub committee on

4

Landmarks, Public Siting and Maritime Uses is

5

called to order. I'm Council Member Brad Lander,

6

joined this morning by my colleagues, Council

7

Member Dan Halloran, Rosie Mendez, Jumaane

8

Williams, Annabel Palma and Maria del Carmen

9

Arroyo. Welcome.

10

We have three matters on the

11

calendar before us this morning, two landmarks

12

applications and one lease, one public siting.

13

We'll start with the landmarks applications and

14

get right to them. Let me find out where the

15

numbers are on these things here. Jenny, you can

16

come on up. Thank you. We will begin with Land

17

Use 235, the Look Building, 20115154HKM in

18

Community Board 5.

19

JENNY FERNANDEZ: Thank you Chair

20

Lander, members of the Committee. My name is

21

Jenny Fernandez, Director of Intergovernmental and

22

Community Relations for the Landmarks Preservation

23

Commission. I am here today to testify on the

24

Commission's designation of the middle--you

25

started with the Look Building?

1

2

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. FERNANDEZ: I gave you the wrong one. I'm sorry. Sorry about that. I'm still Jenny Fernandez, I'm here today to testify on the Commission's designation of the Look Building in Manhattan. On November 17, 2009 the Landmarks Preservation Commission held a hearing on the proposed designation of the Look Building. Three people spoke in favor of the designation including representatives of the New York State Assembly Member Richard N. Godfried, the Historic District Council, Docomomo [phonetic], New York Tri State.

On July 27, 2010 the Commission voted to designate the building in New York City an individual landmark. The 21 story Look Building dates to 1948, 1950 when the minimalist aesthetics of European modernism first began to transform the character of setback office buildings. Located on the west side of Madison Avenue between 51st and 52nd Streets, this handsome mid 20th century modern structure combines tiers of ribbon like windows and tightly wound corners and setbacks faced with the white brick to create a unique and memorable silhouette.

1  
2 Two second generation family run  
3 businesses were responsible for its construction.  
4 Euros Brothers Developers and Emily Roth and Sons  
5 Architects. The new structure was named for Look  
6 Magazine, which was part of the Kyles media empire  
7 with a strong emphasis on photography, Look became  
8 one of the most widely read magazines in the  
9 United States and it remained at this location  
10 until ceasing publication in 1971.

11 Other prominent tenants included  
12 Esquire magazine, Pocket Books, music publisher  
13 Witt Mark and Sons where singer/songwriter Bob  
14 Dillon made some of his earliest studio  
15 recordings, the industrial designer Raymond Lowing  
16 and the building's architects. The Commission  
17 urges you to affirm this designation.

18 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
19 much Ms. Fernandez. This building is in the  
20 Speaker's district and she supports the  
21 designation. Do any of my colleagues have any  
22 questions on this one? I will note the irony that  
23 the architect of this building did give us this  
24 quote in the report. "I happen to believe the  
25 interior of a building is more important than the

1  
2 exterior. None of the architectural people agree  
3 with me but you build for those who occupy it not  
4 for those who stand across the street and look at  
5 it. I won't say I'm not a perfectionist but I  
6 can't help it if people think every building  
7 should be the Taj Mahal." So we'll note the irony  
8 of designating the building despite those words by  
9 its architects.

10 Any other questions? We don't have  
11 anyone signed up to testify so unless anyone is  
12 here to testify, we'll close the public hearing on  
13 this matter and move on to Land Use 236, the  
14 Burrell House, 20115155HKM, also in the Speaker's  
15 District but in Manhattan Community Board 6.

16 MS. FERNANDEZ: Thank you, Chair  
17 Lander, members of the Committee. Again for the  
18 record my name is Jenny Fernandez, Director of  
19 Intergovernmental and Community Relations for  
20 Landmarks Preservation Commission. I'm here today  
21 to testify on the Commission's designation on the  
22 Middleton S and Emily Nielson Burrell House in  
23 Manhattan.

24 On March 24, 2009, the Landmarks  
25 Preservation Commission held a public hearing on

1  
2 the proposed designation of the Middleton S and  
3 Emily Nielson Burrell House. Four witnesses spoke  
4 in favor of designation, including representatives  
5 of the Historic District's Council, the Society  
6 for the Architecture of the City, the Municipal  
7 Arts Society and the Metropolitan Chapter of the  
8 Victorian Society of America. On July 27, 2010  
9 the Commission voted to designate the building in  
10 New York City an individual landmark.

11 In 1902 through 1903 the prominent  
12 architectural firm of Hoppin and Cohen remodeled a  
13 circa 1862 brownstone roadhouse to create this  
14 impressive bows art style mansion for Middleton S  
15 Burrell and his wife, Emily Nielsen Burrell.  
16 Burrell, a socially prominent attorney and  
17 businessman who was the first mentor of the famed  
18 Wall Street financier, Renard Baruke, purchased  
19 the house in 1901 and hired Hopping and Cohen to  
20 alter the house by adding the elegant bows arts  
21 type façade, which combines elements derived from  
22 French and English 17th and 18th century sources.  
23 Hoppin and Cohen designed several  
24 significant public installations but also were  
25 known for their design of elaborate country

1  
2 houses. The Burrells left the house in 1929 after  
3 which it was used as a rooming house until 1945  
4 when the property was sold by the trustees of the  
5 Burrell estate and converted into apartments and  
6 medical offices.

7 The Middleton S and Emily Nielson  
8 Burrell house remains an impressive example of a  
9 bows art style roadhouse in the Murray Hill  
10 section of Manhattan. The Commission urges you to  
11 affirm this designation.

12 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
13 much. On this building as well the loyal member  
14 who is the Speaker supports the designation. Any  
15 questions from the sub-committee? Seeing none, we  
16 also have no one signed up to testify from the  
17 public on this item so we will close the public  
18 hearing on this matter. Thank you very much.

19 MS. FERNANDEZ: Thank you, Chair.  
20 Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: All right,  
22 great. We'll move on to our third item which is a  
23 public siting. We received a notice of intent to  
24 acquire office space, submitted by the Department  
25 of Citywide Administrative Services to use the



1  
2 property located at 470 Vanderbilt Avenue. Many  
3 people know that building; that's the very large  
4 building at the intersection of Vanderbilt and  
5 Atlantic, for a lease by the Human Resources  
6 Administration. We'll ask Jerry Contradt from  
7 DCAS to come up and present testimony. This is  
8 application 20105756PXX.

9 JEFFREY CONTRADT: Hi.

10 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: I'll just note  
11 we've been joined by Council Member Letitia James  
12 whose district this is in.

13 MR. CONTRADT: Hi.

14 [off mic]

15 MR. CONTRADT: Perfect. Chair  
16 Lander, members of the committee, I'm Jeff  
17 Contradt. Sorry, my writing wasn't so good, I  
18 guess.

19 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Sorry.

20 MR. CONTRADT: That's okay. I'm  
21 the Assistant Commissioner for the Department of  
22 Citywide Administrative Services in charge of the  
23 acquisition of properties and leasing of space for  
24 city agencies. I'm here this morning to speak to  
25 you about our submission to the City Planning

1  
2 Commission of a notice of intent to acquire  
3 400,000 square feet of office space at 470  
4 Vanderbilt for the Human Resources Administration.

5 470 Vanderbilt, an approximately  
6 600,000 square foot building bordered by  
7 Vanderbilt, Atlantic and Claremont Avenues in  
8 Brooklyn. We intend to lease about 400,000 square  
9 feet on the first floor and the third through the  
10 seventh floors of the building for HRA's  
11 operations currently at 210 Livingston Street in  
12 Brooklyn, 330 West 34th Street in Manhattan and  
13 part of its operations from 35 Fourth Avenue in  
14 Brooklyn, a small piece.

15 This consolidation will provide HRA  
16 with greater operational efficiencies and as a  
17 result reduce the amount of space the city leases  
18 and its costs. It will also provide newly  
19 renovated space which will upgrade the condition  
20 to their current locations. It is an upgrade from  
21 their current locations' conditions.

22 HRA will have its own entrances to  
23 the building, one on the corner of Atlantic and  
24 Claremont and two others along Claremont Avenue.  
25 One of those entrances will be used exclusively

1  
2 for HRA employees and the other two will be used  
3 for HRA's clients.

4 As part of the Land Use review, the  
5 city assembled an interagency team that worked  
6 together and conducted extensive community  
7 outreach. The project received near unanimous  
8 approval from Community Board 2 in a vote of 27-1  
9 and the unanimous support of the City Planning  
10 Commission. In the process the city made certain  
11 commitments which were memorialized in a letter  
12 from Deputy Mayor Steven Goldsmith on October 19th  
13 to Community Board 2 and we have copies of the  
14 letter for you to review and we can hand them out  
15 now if you want.

16 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: That would be  
17 great.

18 MR. CONTRADT: Sure. And I can  
19 answer any questions you have or we have others  
20 here that can also answer questions if I don't  
21 have the answer.

22 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you and  
23 thanks for giving us this letter. Maybe just give  
24 us a minute to take a look through it. I  
25 understand, and then we'll recognize Council

1  
2 Member James to ask some specific questions, that  
3 on your first run through the Community Board was  
4 not in favor. You then worked with them to  
5 make...

6 MR. CONTRADT: Yes.

7 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: ...a series of  
8 sort of agreements and then came back to them with  
9 this letter and then had the overwhelming vote in  
10 favor so that's the kind of thing we like to hear  
11 here. So give us just a minute to take a look at  
12 this and then I'll recognize Council Member James  
13 to ask question.

14 MR. CONTRADT: Sure.

15 [Pause]

16 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Actually maybe  
17 while we're looking can you give me a little more  
18 detail than what's in the letter about what the  
19 activities are that are going to be taking place  
20 in the building, just what the types of services.  
21 If that's better to be done by HRA.

22 MR. CONTRADT: I'm thinking that  
23 the HRA people in attendance here know the  
24 programs that are going there better than I do so  
25 we should call someone up, if you like.

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Jeff, if you  
3 don't mind sticking around.

4 MR. CONTRADT: No, I don't mind.

5 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Why don't we  
6 ask HRA to come up and also tell us a little bit  
7 more about what's going to go on in the building  
8 and then we can ask you questions together.

9 MR. CONTRADT: Great.

10 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: I have three  
11 people signed up for HRA. I don't know if you're  
12 all coming to testify or one of you, Lisa  
13 Fitzpatrick, Thomas DeBibbo and Joseph Santino,  
14 all from HRA. Great so please go ahead. Do you  
15 have prepared testimony or are you here to answer  
16 questions.

17 ALL: We're here to answer  
18 questions.

19 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: All right.  
20 Why don't you introduce yourselves, just state  
21 your name for the record.

22 LISA FITZPATRICK: Hi, good  
23 morning. My name is Lisa Fitzpatrick and I am the  
24 Deputy Commissioner of FIA Operations. I'm  
25 responsible for the job centers and the food stamp

1

2

centers in the City of New York.

3

4

5

6

7

JOSEPH SANTINO: Good morning. My name is Joseph Santino. I am the Deputy Commissioner for General Support Services Facilities Operations and I'm here to answer any facilities questions.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Could you just start by giving us a sense of what the activities are that are going to--take what you're moving here, what activities are going to be taking place in the building and maybe some sense of sort of the volume of clients that would be coming in and out the doors.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CLERK: We're currently moving the Linden model job center at 210 Livingston Street. We'll be moving that into 404 Vanderbilt Avenue or 420 Vanderbilt Avenue, 470, I'm sorry, Vanderbilt Avenue. The job center is a place where individuals, New Yorkers can come to apply for cash assistance, food stamps and medical assistance. We currently service about a thousand people per day at this location. We will also use the facility as a training facility for HRA employees. I think Joe can speak to the Medicaid

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

component of the program.

MR. SANTINO: Mixa [phonetic] will be moving from 330 West 34th Street, approximately 500 clients a day. In total there will be approximately 1,880 full time HRA people there and 1,500 clients daily.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Great, thank you. I recognize Council Member James.

MS. JAMES: Thank you. First allow me to give my colleagues some background. As most of you know when this proposal was first released I opposed it and joined with my Community board and residents in my community in opposition.

As most of you know when 470 Vanderbilt was rezoned I fully supported it. At that time, the economy was in full swing. We had anticipated a number of community benefits, including but not limited to a supermarket, a bowling alley, some affordable housing and some other use. The economy, unfortunately, has been in free fall and now the owners of 470 Vanderbilt have now found fit to operate this as a city agency, to lease out to a number of city agencies.

There's an agency there now, NYCHA

1  
2 and now the landlords would like to extend a lease  
3 for HRA. I have had my serious concerns and there  
4 has been a 7% increase in crime in the 88th  
5 Precinct. There is a ongoing problem with the  
6 methadone clinic about three blocks away. We are  
7 having a community meeting with regards to that,  
8 those quality of life issues in the next two  
9 weeks.

10 But I also heard from a number of  
11 businesses on Fulton Street, which are having a  
12 difficult time keeping their doors open and  
13 anticipate that a number of employees will  
14 patronize the businesses on Fulton Street and keep  
15 them afloat.

16 The landlord and the city has made  
17 a number of commitments to Community Board 2. The  
18 chair of Community Board 2 will be testifying  
19 today but my question is timing. When will the  
20 security be in place and who do you plan on hiring  
21 and how many?

22 MR. SANTINO: Security will be in  
23 place when we open the facility. We currently  
24 have a contract with FJC. We also have our own  
25 HRA police department. We will adequately staff



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

both outside and inside the location.

MS. JAMES: When you say adequately staff I need numbers. How many security?

MR. SANTINO: I don't have those numbers right now. It would be based on the analysis that gets done by our HRA police department and its commissioner.

MS. JAMES: When will that analysis be complete3d?

MR. SANTINO: That analysis will probably get completed prior to the opening of the location.

MS. JAMES: When do you anticipate opening?

MR. CONTRADT: We anticipate opening anywhere between a year to two years from now.

MS. JAMES: From today's date?

MR. SANTINO: Jeff, maybe you can.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Please step up to the mic, please.

MR. CONTRADT: Being the process to move in will include doing the construction documents to submit to the Buildings Department,

1  
2 fitting out the construction costs and doing the  
3 work, we anticipate in the Spring, early summer of  
4 2012 to be the current project move in date.

5 MS. JAMES: What are the other uses  
6 for this building at this time?

7 MR. CONTRADT: You mentioned the  
8 NYCHA lease that they have, 30,000 feet give or  
9 take, I believe. Other than that, I'm not sure.  
10 The landlord is talking to several tenants and  
11 perhaps the landlord should answer that question.

12 MS. JAMES: Let me ask the  
13 landlord. Do you have--

14 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: [Interposing]  
15 He's going last.

16 MS. JAMES: Okay. I'll ask the  
17 landlord those questions. What is the name of the  
18 security is F, what did you say?

19 MR. SANTINO: It's currently FJC is  
20 our contractor guard service. I don't know if  
21 that will be the guard service at the time because  
22 that contract will probably be let between now and  
23 then, a new contract.

24 MS. JAMES: Is that the same guard  
25 that currently has the contract for Livingston

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Street?

MR. SANTINO: Yes.

MS. JAMES: I would hope that you would get another contractor. I've been to Livingston Street.

MR. SANTINO: We also have our own HRA police department, our own officers which supervise at each location.

MS. JAMES: My experience with your facility on Livingston Street is that individuals are not allowed in front of the building and/or within 100 feet of the perimeter. Is that true?

MR. SANTINO: I don't know if that's the case to be honest with you. We do try to discourage people milling about outside the location but I don't believe there's any steadfast rule that they have to be 100 feet away.

MS. JAMES: Upon completion of your analysis, can this committee get a copy of that analysis as well as my office?

MR. SANTINO: Absolutely.

MS. JAMES: In terms of the bus, how often will the bus run?

MR. SANTINO: Currently I believe

1  
2 there are two buses that we've anticipated. I  
3 don't know what the schedule would be but they  
4 would run pretty much from 7 to 9:30 I believe in  
5 the morning.

6 MR. CONTRADT: And in the evening.

7 MR. SANTINO: And in the evening as  
8 well.

9 MR. CONTRADT: It will be  
10 continuous. It will be circulating.

11 MR. SANTINO: Yes, continuous loop.

12 MR. CONTRADT: I don't think we've  
13 tested yet exactly the timing but they'll just  
14 continuously loop between this site and the  
15 Atlantic Avenue and Flatbush Avenue subway and  
16 train stations.

17 MS. JAMES: Are you aware that on  
18 Claremont Street there is a high school right  
19 across the street at 470 Vanderbilt? Have you  
20 spoken to the principal, Ms. Pier?

21 MR. SANTINO: I have not but I  
22 believe people in HRA have.

23 MS. JAMES: You haven't, okay.  
24 What is the position of the principal? Does she  
25 have a position?

1  
2 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thanks, please  
3 state your name and title for the record.

4 TOM DEBIBBO: I'm Tom DeBibbo, I'm  
5 the Senior Executive Deputy Commissioner at HRA.  
6 I did speak with the principal one day when I was  
7 sort of reviewing the area. We told him exactly  
8 what was happening and he didn't have any  
9 objections at all.

10 MS. JAMES: It's a woman.

11 MR. DEBIBBO: I'm sorry, then I  
12 must have been the Dean. It was a person who was  
13 in charge at that point during the summer.

14 MS. JAMES: On the street parking,  
15 how many parking spaces do you anticipate will be  
16 used by your employees of HRA?

17 MR. SANTINO: We only have five.  
18 If I'm not mistaken I think it's about five  
19 placards that folks at HRA who are moving from the  
20 two locations have. The rest of the folks don't  
21 have any specific parking authority.

22 MS. JAMES: Do you know whether or  
23 not the landlord is going to allow you to park in  
24 the parking lot that's available now?

25 MR. SANTINO: I don't think that's

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

the case.

MR. CONTRADT: There has been no preset parking [off mic] placards.

MS. JAMES: Apparently according to the memo that you provided to the committee, DOT has indicated that they're going to make 17 potential on street parking spaces available. Has that been confirmed?

[off mic]

[Laughter]

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: This is very exciting here. How many more questions to you have? People are going to keep showing up to answer them.

MS. JAMES: Everybody move to the front row.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Please state your name.

THERESA WARD: Theresa Ward, Deputy Mayor for Operations. The DOT identified 117 on street spaces where they could modify the signage to allow additional on street parking. They had a meeting with the committee, before the Transportation Committee to review them. The

1  
2 Transportation Committee is currently reviewing  
3 those street sign modifications to see if they  
4 agree with it. That would be 117 spaces.

5 MS. JAMES: 117?

6 MS. WARD: 117 spaces.

7 MS. JAMES: Not 17, I apologize.

8 Upon the completion of the analysis if I could get  
9 a copy of that as well as the Committee, I would  
10 appreciate that as well. Security cameras, when  
11 will they be, how many do you plan on installing?

12 MR. SANTINO: It will be part of  
13 the analysis done by HRA police department.  
14 Obviously we put in as many as necessary.

15 MS. JAMES: Tree planting, will  
16 that be done by the city or by the landlord or by,  
17 sorry.

18 MS. WARD: Theresa Ward again, that  
19 tree planting will be done by the Parks  
20 Department.

21 MS. JAMES: Do you happen to have  
22 any idea how many trees are anticipated to be?

23 MS. WARD: We do not, until they  
24 survey to know what's physically possible.

25 MS. JAMES: Lastly, employment

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

opportunities will be filed with the Community Board as well as my office and Workforce 1?

MS. WARD: That's a question for the landlord to respond to.

MS. JAMES: Okay.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Council Member, if I could just note the parking analysis is in this packet so the security one we'll still wait on and the trees but the parking is in here. We've been joined by Council Member Sanders from Queens. I don't know if anyone has any questions for this round robin panel. Council Member Williams.

MR. CONTRADT: Interagency team.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Interagency team, excuse me, they don't call it a round robin panel.

MR. WILLIAMS: Hello? Thank you Mr. Chair. I want to clarify. I was confused by six and seven, the parking. I know you spoke about it a little bit. Is there special permission to park on street?

MS. WARD: There's largely street cleaning regulations and there is a whole



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

analysis. It lays out the parking spots on there.

MR. WILLIAMS: Just break it down really quickly please so I can understand it.

MS. WARD: Break down the 117 parking spaces? Is that what you mean?

MR. WILLIAMS: Yeah, I guess so. Because it says placard parking and then it says 7 on street parking, those are two I'm talking about.

MS. WARD: Sorry, I thought you were talking about the--okay. On street parking was identifying additional on street spaces that could be made available through DOT analyzing the street cleaning regulations and other sort of rush hour regulations. That analysis is attached where they presented to the community board, here are 117 spaces that we could modify the regulations in order to free up those parking spaces. The five placards--

MR. WILLIAMS: [Interposing] For the agency?

MS. WARD: No, for the community.

MR. WILLIAMS: Oh, for the community.

1  
2 MS. WARD: For the community. The  
3 placard parking was about the five HRA vehicles  
4 that have placards for parking anywhere, not  
5 anywhere, anywhere legal

6 MR. WILLIAMS: So they change the  
7 regulations they're going to free up 117 parking  
8 spaces for the community and then you'll have five  
9 agency vehicles that have placards?

10 MS. WARD: Correct.

11 MR. WILLIAMS: The third was number  
12 ten, the employment opportunities.

13 MS. WARD: That's a question for  
14 the landlord to respond to. They'll be hiring  
15 contractors.

16 MS. JAMES: Before she leaves can I  
17 just ask you a question. At one time there was a  
18 proposal to do angle parking on Claremont. Do you  
19 know if that's on the table?

20 MS. WARD: That I don't know. I  
21 know that they've met with the Community Board to  
22 talk about actually eliminating some of the  
23 parking on--did you say Claremont?

24 MS. JAMES: On Claremont.

25 MS. WARD: Oh, I don't think that's

1  
2 been part of this conversation about these 117  
3 spaces.

4 MS. JAMES: At one time we did have  
5 a plan in for angle parking to accommodate one,  
6 the school as well as individuals who come  
7 Saturday to the field across the street on  
8 Claremont for game night.

9 MS. WARD: That may be something  
10 that the Community Board would be discussing with  
11 DOT but I wouldn't know about that.

12 MS. JAMES: Do you know whether or  
13 not the bus stop on Vanderbilt Avenue will be  
14 removed? There's a bus stop right in front of the  
15 building.

16 MS. WARD: I think what they  
17 proposed was a bus stop a little further away. I  
18 don't think that particular bus stop at Vanderbilt  
19 was discussed. I have not looked at the map.

20 MS. JAMES: I think you should  
21 discuss the bus stop right in front of 470  
22 Vanderbilt where people tend to congregate as it  
23 is now. There's also, just FYI to the  
24 administration, there's homeless people in front  
25 of 470 Vanderbilt as of this morning. So I know

1  
2 there's a number of analyses, surveys and other  
3 types of studies that have to be done before you  
4 can answer a lot of these questions but I do have  
5 my concerns.

6 Also, I'm somewhat disappointed  
7 because the 470 Vanderbilt was supposed to be the  
8 anchor for Clinton Hill and not it appears to be  
9 nothing more than a city agency, and that's very,  
10 very, very disappointing. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: I have just  
12 one more question on the HRA side. Will you be  
13 accepting cash assistance applications at this  
14 center?

15 MS. WARD: Yes, we will.

16 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: We did a  
17 hearing in this room a couple of weeks ago which  
18 we asked the Commissioner if he could provide some  
19 information to us on the volume of cash assistance  
20 applications that we've been seeing across the  
21 board. That's not only at this intake center,  
22 though I would be delighted to have them broken  
23 down by intake centers. If we're going to be  
24 asked to site, to do leases in which HRA are going  
25 to be taking, it would be very helpful if we could

1  
2 know the volume of them. Our sense is it's going  
3 up although the amount of cash assistance we're  
4 giving out is flat. It would be very helpful to  
5 us as we try to figure out how much space we need  
6 for things if we could have that information. If  
7 you could let the Commissioner know we would be  
8 most grateful. If he could get back to us, it  
9 would be appreciated.

10 I'm sure it's coming so thank you.  
11 All right, thanks very much for your time. We do  
12 have a couple of people signed up. Thanks very  
13 much. We have two other folks signed up to  
14 testify. I'll first call Shelly Hagan from  
15 Clinton Hill Neighbors. Actually you know what,  
16 I'm sorry. The Community board is here; let me  
17 ask them. We normally have the community board go  
18 first and then the folks that are signed up to  
19 testify. I apologize. So John Dew is here from  
20 Community Board 2.

21 JOHN DEW: Good morning Council,  
22 good morning Council Member James.

23 MS. JAMES: Good morning, how you  
24 doing Chair Member Dew.

25 MR. DEW: The Community Board did

1  
2 hear this application twice. The first time in  
3 June which we pretty much unanimously voted  
4 against it. We heard it again last month in  
5 September, as was reported earlier. It was almost  
6 unanimously approved except for one board member  
7 who lives in the vicinity and had some issues with  
8 traffic and the like.

9 I'm just going to briefly go over  
10 because I don't have any written submitted  
11 testimony, some of the issues that have been  
12 raised this morning. First as it relates to the  
13 parking, which was a very important for the  
14 community. This is a burgeoning community and  
15 parking is very much at a premium. In addition to  
16 the 117 spots that DOT has already agreed to add,  
17 we have requested about 30 additional spots that  
18 have been identified by the Fort Green Association  
19 as being potentially available. So we are  
20 awaiting the results of that analysis.

21 The Community Board did ask for, in  
22 addition to satisfactory security, we did ask for  
23 and were told that we would get security cameras  
24 that surround the facility. The community was  
25 concerned about loitering so we did also get

1  
2 agreement from HRA that the would indeed open the  
3 facility earlier such that patrons do not have to  
4 loiter outside the facility before it opens.

5           There were some issues with access.  
6 We did ask for and received a commitment that all  
7 entrances to the building would be on Claremont,  
8 not on Vanderbilt where we have residential  
9 development. As it relates to the bus shuttle, we  
10 did get agreement that there would be a bus  
11 shuttle but that it would not be able to entertain  
12 either client who might be getting off at Atlantic  
13 Avenue and would like to take the shuttle or the  
14 local community because of liability issues.  
15 That's it.

16           CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thanks very  
17 much. Are there any questions?

18           MS. JAMES: No.

19           CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
20 much for joining us this morning.

21           MR. MR. DEW: Thank you.

22           CHAIRPERSON LANDER: We appreciate  
23 your time. We'll now call up Shelly Hagan and  
24 then following that we'll have Ken Fisher from  
25 Cozin O'Connor who is the landlord. Good morning,

1

2

please state your name.

3

4

5

SHELLY HAGAN: I've been in your area. I always vote for Tish. I'm glad you won Mr. Lander.

6

7

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Go ahead and state your name.

8

9

10

11

MS. HAGAN: My name is Shelly Hagan and I live at 60 Downing Street in Clinton Hill and I am an early and fervent fan of my City Council person, Letitia James.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. JAMES: Thank you, Shelly.

MS. HAGAN: Good morning honorable City Council. Normally a two headed goat would make the news, not 470 Vanderbilt Avenue. It has been a secret for years. The City Council knows. You examined the second head last year. It came by ULURP. Who presented for the head? Who was there for the vote from Fort Green, Clinton Hill, Prospect Heights? We're way behind, trying to catch up. Only a few weeks ago word leaked the huge old Shrader Tire factory was being re-purposed as a huge HRA intake center.

HRA's weigh in beating this body's approval of a second residential structure on what



1  
2 is now a 50 car parking lot. Quite imaginatively  
3 the developers, GFI Corporation and PRAT Area  
4 Community Council made 470 a two-fer, arguing that  
5 the old factory couldn't get a tenant unless they  
6 could build something over tall and extraneous on  
7 the parking lot.

8 Our neighborhoods are full of empty  
9 new apartment buildings and we're certainly  
10 familiar with how lucrative affordable housing it.  
11 Bruce Ratner ring a bell? When you voted for the  
12 residential component, did you do so because  
13 without it GFI couldn't attract a tenant for the  
14 factory? We ask for a record of the vote so we  
15 can understand your reasons.

16 There is a mounting cry in the  
17 neighborhoods for a air clearing, fact filled  
18 meeting on 470. We were told the City Planning  
19 Commission was holding such a meeting a couple of  
20 weeks ago. That turned out to be for developers,  
21 supporters and their friends on the Commission.  
22 One could argue that Specter Hall is tiny on  
23 purpose. Unless you're connected with the  
24 project, you probably can't get in.

25 We're grateful for 470 as being

1  
2 discussed here but sorry we didn't know about  
3 today until last Thursday. Most people who would  
4 have liked to have attended can't because they  
5 couldn't change their schedules on such short  
6 notice. When was 470 put on this agenda? Who put  
7 it on?

8 Thank you for your time and for  
9 your answers to these several questions. We also  
10 thank you if you can join us in asking the Mayor  
11 to remove Angela Batallia from the City Planning  
12 Commission for obvious reasons. We have already  
13 asked Shirley McRae to recuse herself from the 470  
14 vote on the grounds of her having publicly  
15 advocated for it.

16 MS. JAMES: Thank you.

17 MS. HAGAN: Also, some of the  
18 people who couldn't come, there's not a three  
19 minute limit on me?

20 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Go ahead, you  
21 can finish your sentence.

22 MS. HAGAN: I'm used to being shut  
23 down in mid sentence.

24 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: If you want,  
25 we can put the clock on but I think you like to

1

2 finish. Please feel free to go ahead.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

MS. HAGAN: This is a kinder, fuzzier City Council. Some of the people who couldn't get here today are way more expert on the Atlantic Yards minutia. My understanding is that some of the parking places violate promises that were made about parking on Atlantic Avenue on the south side. I personally don't know this but I've been so informed.

11

MS. JAMES: Promises to who?

12

13

14

15

16

17

MS. HAGAN: I don't know but Denie Arotoski was trying to get here and she and Peter Chrashis brought up the issue about parking on Atlantic Avenue on the south side. We, of course, Bruce Ratner isn't necessarily held in the greatest credibility but...

18

MS. JAMES: [off mic]

19

MS. HAGAN: Yeah, yeah.

20

21

22

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Ms. Hagan, thank you very much for taking the time to come this morning.

23

MS. HAGAN: Thank you.

24

25

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: And giving us this testimony.

1

MS. JAMES: Thank you, Shelly.

2

3

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Are there any questions from members of the Committee?

4

5

MS. JAMES: See you in the neighborhood.

6

7

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much. Our last witness this morning is Ken Fisher from Cozin O'Connor, representing GFI the building owner.

10

11

KEN FISHER: Good morning Council Members. First of all, let me on behalf of GFI categorically reject the notion that they developer felt that they needed the apartment building that's going up on Fulton Street in order to attract tenants. I don't believe that that representation was made to the Council or the Planning Commission. On a personal level, I want to reject any attack on the integrity of Shirley McRae who is the former board chair of Community Board 2 and with whom we've had no conversations and who, in fact, was absent on the day of both the public hearings the vote. So it's something to align her because somebody doesn't like the fact that the Planning Commissioner acted in a

25

1

2

particular way is unfortunate.

3

The corollary, however, is true.

4

We share Council Member James' frustration that

5

the apartment building, which is going to have a

6

25% affordable component that was previously

7

approved by the Council hasn't been able to move

8

forward for financing reasons. Getting the office

9

building filled as quickly as possible is critical

10

for the owner's ability to finance the entire

11

project. We look forward to moving forward with

12

that as quickly as we possibly can.

13

In terms of the process here, as

14

Chairman Lander pointed out, what started out as a

15

bad situation. Actually I think turned out to be

16

a pretty model situation because under Council

17

Member James' leadership we did presentations to

18

the Fort Green Association, which then supported

19

the project, the PRAT Area Community Council,

20

which supported the project, the Fulton Emergence

21

Bid which supported the project. We also

22

presented it to one of the block associations

23

closest by and also to the Clinton Hill Society.

24

As far as I know, neither of them took an official

25

position but they didn't oppose the project. And

1  
2 most importantly, the Community Board as you've  
3 heard voted 27-1.

4           The reason they did that, I think,  
5 is two fold. Number one was that everyone  
6 recognizes this is a good place for an office  
7 building. It's an office building where  
8 challenges, the floor plates are 90,000 square  
9 feet. It's not the kind of small office space  
10 that's in high demand these days. Finding  
11 commercial users to take the big back office  
12 spaces are a real challenge in this environment.

13           But it does work out very  
14 efficiently for large organizations, that's why  
15 HRA will actually be able to do some  
16 consolidations. We're told the city is going to  
17 save \$6 to \$8 million a year for this so it's a  
18 significant amount of money in a difficult budget  
19 situation. The other thing that came out of it  
20 was that we asked working with City Hall, they  
21 surveyed the HRA employees who are going to be  
22 moving here. We found out, pretty much that most  
23 of them, almost all of them were going to be  
24 coming by mass transit. The area is well served.  
25 It's a few blocks from Atlantic Avenue. There are

1  
2 two bus lines that go right by the building as  
3 well as subway station for the C line next door.  
4 Then we'll be running the shuttle bus so it's well  
5 served by mass transit.

6           The other thing we found out was  
7 that the 1,880 city employees are going to be  
8 spending \$2 to \$4 million a year in local stores.  
9 We were pleasantly surprised at that number. It's  
10 a real shot in the arm for the part of Fulton  
11 Street that doesn't get as much attention as we  
12 would all like. So we think it's a good location.  
13 We're committed to working with the community.  
14 We're committed to working with Council Member  
15 James' office. I'm sure that the city agencies,  
16 they've made some strong public commitments about  
17 how they're going to proceed going forward. Even  
18 something like the parking, they're not doing it  
19 unilaterally. I suggested that they ask DOT to  
20 take a look at it. Quite frankly I was only  
21 expecting them to come up with a small number.  
22 They came into it with good faith but DOT publicly  
23 stated at the community board meeting that they  
24 weren't going to implement anything unless they  
25 discussed it and vetted it with the Community

1  
2 Board and that they're open to suggestions from  
3 the community as well. On balance, this is one  
4 where the process worked. It's a good deal for  
5 the city, it's a good deal for the neighborhood  
6 and it'll mean a good deal towards making 470 the  
7 kind of anchor for the community that the Council  
8 Member and the owners hoped it will be.

9 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
10 much. Council Member James you have questions?

11 MS. JAMES: Sure. It's my  
12 understanding that there were two schools that  
13 sought to get a lease at 470 Vanderbilt. The  
14 first school is Mattie McDowell which is in  
15 Brooklyn Heights now. And there's another school,  
16 it's an international high school. I'm blanking on  
17 the name and I was trying to find the email.  
18 They, too, came to me and both informed me that  
19 they attempted to seek leases at 470 Vanderbilt  
20 and unfortunately were rejected because of  
21 negotiations.

22 MR. FISHER: We've got space that  
23 we need to lease up. School use is a good use for  
24 the building. I can't speak to those two  
25 particular situations as to whether they were able



1  
2 to. It's an economic issue. It was not a use  
3 issue. In fact, again, I don't want to jeopardize  
4 negotiations that may be going on now but I know  
5 that there's another school use, not a public  
6 school. There's another school use that's in  
7 conversations with the owners. So the idea of the  
8 school is not an issue, the economics of it is  
9 something that hopefully will get worked out.

10 MS. JAMES: Mattie McDowell, which  
11 is a school for the disabled is a private school.  
12 The other school that the name is escaping me was  
13 a charter school. Are you in discussions with A  
14 Char Inter School?

15 MR. FISHER: No.

16 MS. JAMES: Obviously, I would  
17 imagine and the community would support me, 470  
18 Vanderbilt is ideal for a school and I would urge,  
19 seriously urge. No, I would strongly urge that  
20 the landlord of 470 Vanderbilt give it due  
21 consideration to any and all schools that come  
22 before you. What is GFI? Who are they? What are  
23 the names associated with GFI?

24 MR. FISHER: GFI is a large real  
25 estate company. I actually think they started in

1  
2 Brooklyn, I'm not sure. Their headquarters is in  
3 Manhattan now. They have properties around the  
4 country and the principal is Alan Gross.

5 MS. JAMES: Is there another  
6 organization that owns 470 Vanderbilt besides GFI?

7 MR. FISHER: There's an investment  
8 group that was organized by the Carlisle Group so  
9 they're investors in the property. The person  
10 that I've been dealing with who I don't know what  
11 his ownership position is. But the person who  
12 brought me into this situation after the Community  
13 Board initially rejected the application was  
14 Arthur Levitt, Jr. the former SEC Chairman. Many  
15 of you may not know this but he grew up down the  
16 street from me on Grand Army Plaza. In fact, was  
17 on the band board for I think nine or ten years.  
18 The lobby is named after his mother. He has told  
19 me both publicly and privately that this is not  
20 just important to him financially, which obviously  
21 it is but he thinks that this would be very good  
22 for a neighborhood that he knows very well.

23 MS. JAMES: Do you have the names  
24 that you can provide me? There's one name in  
25 particular that I'm looking for, which I will not

1  
2 say publicly but I'd like to know who is  
3 associated with GFI? From what I understand,  
4 there's one individual in particular who's  
5 associated with GFI who has a pattern and practice  
6 of renting out space to city agencies.

7 MR. FISHER: I'm not sure who  
8 you're referring to. My dealings on this, other  
9 than the direct leadership team, which is Andrew  
10 Zobler, Steven Horowitz and Cora Johnson has been  
11 helping with the community relations. The only  
12 person that I've dealt with from GFI on this has  
13 been Alan Gross.

14 MS. JAMES: How long with this  
15 lease be?

16 MR. FISHER: 20 years, I believe.

17 MS. JAMES: Why 20 years?

18 MR. FISHER: Because that's what  
19 the city asked to negotiate.

20 MS. JAMES: I guess the question is  
21 ether or not the lease could be for much less.

22 MR. FISHER: I think that would  
23 probably not be in the best interest of the city  
24 because part of what you do in a situation like  
25 this is that there's certain improvements, whether

1  
2 they're paid for by the landlord or they're paid  
3 for by the tenant. There's physical construction  
4 that's going to run a considerable amount of  
5 money. You need to be able to amortize that over  
6 a period of time and get the most useful life out  
7 of it. I think 20 years is probably the minimum  
8 that you could do without starting to eat up the  
9 savings to the city.

10 MS. JAMES: What happens if all of  
11 the commitments that you provided to me in writing  
12 as well as the administration are not followed  
13 through?

14 MR. FISHER: Well, I'm sure that  
15 the administration would pay a price for that. It  
16 certainly, when I was the Chair of this Committee  
17 and people made commitments to me...

18 MS. JAMES: What would be the  
19 price?

20 MR. FISHER: ...and the government  
21 didn't pay them, we held up other facilities for  
22 those agencies. We whacked them at budget time  
23 and generally speaking the Speaker made their life  
24 hell. I don't want to put any ideas into your  
25 head but if somebody broke a commitment to me and

1

2

I was sitting in that chair, that's what I did.

3

4

5

MS. JAMES: I don't know if any of those are possibilities. The question is what price do you pay and/or your clients?

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

MR. FISHER: I think the price that we pay is our reputation is very important to us. It's important to us not just in a formal legalistic sense but in terms of our ability to go to market to do business with other city agencies. And to get financing for our projects. We're going to have to come back, for example, when the residential building goes up there's going to be an affordable housing plan that's approved by HPD as part of that process. That's on notice to the community board. It puts you in a position to be able to weigh in with the Commissioner of HPD on the credibility of the organization.

19

20

MS. JAMES: When do you anticipate that the affordable housing will begin?

21

22

MR. FISHER: As soon as we can put together the financing.

23

MS. JAMES: And when can that be?

24

MR. FISHER: I wish I knew.

25

MS. JAMES: Any idea, within a

1

2

year?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. FISHER: Than answer is they're working on it. Obviously securing office building is going a big step toward to that. I can tell you Council Member that HPD doesn't have enough money to do its part on affordable housing deals for the next several years because of the demand that's been created as a result of the 421-A changes and other things and market conditions in general. HPD tells me that they are fully booked up for the next several years. So to the extent that we can all work to make more funding available for them and the banks will start to lend some money because the construction financing market is a little bit constipated right now. The faster we can solve that, the better off we'll all be. Equity on this, the developer's share of the money is not the problem. The problem is the financing for the construction financing and also the allocation of tax credits and other subordinated financing that the city typically provides.

MS. JAMES: So based upon the

answer to your question the affordable housing is

1

2 not going to happen for the next couple of years.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. FISHER: I don't know. If financing frees up, if the Council allocates more money, if the federal government allocates more money. I know all of these may sound like far fetched given the fiscal situation we're in now. But the offsetting side of it, and this is the positive, is that construction lending rates right now are very low, which is an offset to the need for subsidy to some extent. The problem is that the volume that the banks are willing to [Break in audio]

Which means that it does require more equity or more financing. But I can tell you, I'm involved with other projects having nothing to do with this where developers are stymied because they haven't been able to get the construction financing.

MS. JAMES: Last two questions Mr. Chair and I thank you for your indulgence.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you.

MS. JAMES: Community space, where there be any space available for the community to use free of charge?

1  
2 MR. FISHER: The answer to that is  
3 that we're not specifying designated space. In  
4 fact, that was a request of Chair Dew and  
5 something that he and I have discussed. It wasn't  
6 formally part of the Community Board  
7 recommendations and in fact may not have been  
8 appropriate. There is no plan to lease HRA space  
9 for consideration to be used by community  
10 organizations. We have not committed to setting  
11 aside a particular amount of space to be used for,  
12 say, a community organization. However, what the  
13 owners have committed to do and have done in the  
14 past and are continuing to do is on an ad hoc  
15 basis make space available for community  
16 organizations. For example, just to give you a  
17 recent example, green Fort Green Clinton Hill,  
18 which is an organizations that was organizing a  
19 program to widen tree pits and getting young  
20 people to do that work with funding I think that  
21 your office provided, approached us about making  
22 the parking lot available as a staging area for  
23 their equipment so that they can store their  
24 supplies there and have people come and pick up  
25 tools and whoever else they needed. We made that



1  
2 available at no cost to them. We were happy to do  
3 that. Other organizations have had fundraising  
4 events there. There's a proposal now to make  
5 5,000 square feet of space available for storage  
6 on a somewhat permanent basis. That has some  
7 problematic consequences to us so I don't think  
8 that we'll be able to accommodate that. But we  
9 definitely have done and will continue to do what  
10 we can.

11 MS. JAMES: Will you provide us  
12 with employment opportunities and are you  
13 dedicated to hiring residents who live within  
14 Community Board 2?

15 MR. FISHER: Yes and in fact I'm  
16 told that your office has previously recommended  
17 people for positions and they've been hired.

18 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Do we have  
19 those couple of commitments you just made and we  
20 have this letter from Deputy Mayor Goldsmith. Is  
21 there something in writing from GFI on the  
22 employment commitment and the space commitment you  
23 just made?

24 MR. FISHER: I don't believe so but  
25 these are commitments that we've made publicly at

1  
2 all the public hearings. In terms of notifying  
3 the Community Board Fort Green Association as  
4 employment opportunities come up, I'm publicly  
5 committed to, committing GFI to that now. If you  
6 want us to confirm that by later, we can do that  
7 later.

8 MS. JAMES: Yes, I'd like to have  
9 that in writing. In addition, would GFI also  
10 commit to purchasing some trees to be planted in  
11 the neighborhood?

12 MR. FISHER: We've discussed--I  
13 don't think that was part of our commitment. What  
14 we said was we would work with the Parks  
15 Department because they're going to be serving the  
16 area and accelerating the placement. And if there  
17 are some gaps that we can fill in on that--

18 MS. JAMES: [Interposing] There's  
19 some gaps.

20 MR. FISHER: I'm sure that we can  
21 discuss that.

22 MS. JAMES: If this Committee were  
23 to vote this lease down today, what would happen?

24 MR. FISHER: I think there's a very  
25 good chance that the building would be lost by the

1  
2 owners. They would have to negotiate a work out  
3 with their bank, which is eagerly monitoring this  
4 facility. One thing I can guarantee is if this  
5 lease goes down, that the likelihood of the  
6 affordable building getting built in the next  
7 decade will go with it. If there's a  
8 restructuring either by stretching out the debt or  
9 bringing in new investors or if the bank takes the  
10 property back, all consequences that I hope we can  
11 avoid. I think that that would substantially  
12 dampen any interest in moving forward with the  
13 affordable building. Not to mention the fact that  
14 it would deprive the city of \$6 to \$8 million a  
15 year in savings and deprive the local merchants of  
16 \$2 to \$4 million in investments.

17 MS. JAMES: What's the likelihood  
18 that the affordable housing is going to be built  
19 in the next decade if we vote it up?

20 MR. FISHER: I think as soon as the  
21 financing market recovers, they're sitting there  
22 with land that they own. There's an opportunity  
23 cost to them. Carrying the cost of the land,  
24 keeping it vacant doesn't do them any good so as  
25 soon as they can get the financing. Remember,

1  
2 they took this through ULURP. This wasn't a city  
3 as of right thing, they affirmatively asked for  
4 permission to be able to do this because that's  
5 what their intention is. They already spent a  
6 boatload of money getting it to this point.  
7 There's no benefit to them in keeping it vacant.

8 MS. JAMES: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very  
10 much. Council Member Williams I hear you have  
11 one, one question.

12 MR. WILLIAMS: Yes, thank you. I  
13 have two questions. One, the shuttle bus, if it's  
14 such a good transportation for the clients why do  
15 we have it for the employees?

16 MR. FISHER: it's for the employees  
17 not for the clients.

18 MR. WILLIAMS: I'm sorry?

19 MR. FISHER: It's for the HRA  
20 employees.

21 [off mic]

22 MR. WILLIAMS: So why--

23 MR. FISHER: [Interposing] We're  
24 not providing it for the clients for liability  
25 reasons. The cost of providing insurance against

1

2

something going wrong would be prohibitive.

3

4

5

6

7

MR. WILLIAMS: The employment opportunities, you're going to make sure that people from the community use it and as well as maybe some of the people who are getting services there?

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

MR. FISHER: In terms of GFI, to the extent that we do hiring or contracting, we're happy to promote those opportunities in the community. As far as the city employees are concerned, they're primarily civil service. It's the normal processes that go with that. Also, by the way, the \$2 to \$4 million in anticipated spending, we're told by the city economic development folks translates into 20 to 40 jobs in the local community in the stores that would be meeting that demand.

19

20

21

22

23

24

MS. JAMES: The commitment for the jobs, for the trees and the two other commitments, the community space and there was something else. If you could commit that to writing I would greatly appreciate it. Last question is, is the landlord behind on its mortgage payments now?

25

MR. FISHER: I don't believe so. I

1  
2 don't believe so but I don't know the specifics.  
3 I know that they're in discussions with their bank  
4 and that there are some milestones that are coming  
5 up at the end of the year.

6 MS. JAMES: Thank you. Thank you,  
7 Mr. Chair.

8 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: thank you very  
9 much, Mr. Fisher. Thanks for everyone who  
10 testified. That's all the people we have signed  
11 up to testify so we'll close the public hearing on  
12 this item. Thanks to everyone for being here. We  
13 will move forward to vote on the items before us  
14 today. We've got three items to vote out here.  
15 There are LU235 and 236 and application 20105756,  
16 the Chair recommends a vote of aye on all.

17 CLERK: Carol Shine, counsel to the  
18 sub committee. Chair Lander.

19 CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Aye.

20 CLERK: Council Member Saunders.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SANDERS: Sanders  
22 votes yes.

23 CLERK: Sorry. Council Member  
24 Palma.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER PALMA: Yes.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CLERK: Council Member Arroyo.

COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Yes.

CLERK: Council Member Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Aye on all.

CLERK: Council Member Williams.

MR. WILLIAMS: Aye on all.

CLERK: Council Member Halloran.


COUNCIL MEMBER HALLORAN: Looking  
to the Councilwoman for the district, Letitia  
James, I will vote aye.

CLERK: By a vote of seven in the  
affirmative, none in the negative and no  
abstentions, the aforementioned items are approved  
and referred to the full committee.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Committee  
meeting is adjourned.

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Amber Gibson, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

Signature  \_\_\_\_\_

Date November 12, 2010