

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

----- X

September 18, 2014
Start: 11:19 a.m.
Recess: 12:05 p.m.

HELD AT: Committee Room-City Hall

B E F O R E:
DAVID G. GREENFIELD
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:
Maria del Carmen Arroyo
Vincent J. Gentile
Inez E. Dickens
Rosie Mendez
Peter A. Koo
Mark S. Weprin
Jumaane D. Williams
Donovan J. Richards
Inez D. Barron
Andrew Cohen
Ritchie J. Torres
Mark Treyger
Daniel R. Garodnick
Stephen T. Levin
Ben Kallos
Antonio Reynoso
Ydanis A. Rodriguez
Jumaane D. Williams

1
2 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. Good
3 morning. My name is David Greenfield. I'm the
4 councilman from the 44th Council Community District
5 in Brooklyn. I'm privileged to serve as the chair to
6 the Land Use Committee. I want to welcome my
7 esteemed colleagues, who are the members of the
8 committee and are here with us today, and the gold
9 star goes to Council Member Arroyo for coming early.
10 Thank you very much, Council Member, and so far I
11 think you might actually be edging into the lead over
12 here, so that's exciting. We're going to do the
13 final tallies at the end of the year and we're going
14 to post it on the board and we'll give out some sort
15 of prize. Also, I want to recognize Council Member
16 Gentile, Council Member Dickens, Council Member
17 Mendez, Council Member Koo, Council Member Weprin,
18 Council Member Richards, Council Member Barron,
19 Council Member Cohen, Council Member Torres and
20 Council Member Treyger.

21 You'll see on the table before you one
22 item relating to the committee and first there's the
23 agenda prepared by the committee staff pertaining to
24 those matters which have had a hearing and were
25 viewed and fully vetted by the subcommittee. Those

1 are the matters on which we will be acting today.
2 I'd also like to take the opportunity to thank our
3 subcommittee chairs, Chair Weprin, Chair Koo and
4 Chair Dickens. Also before you are the joint reports
5 of the Land Use Committee and the applicable
6 subcommittee for each item we're voting on today with
7 the proposed resolution for each item. What the
8 committee is voting on today is to approve each of
9 the resolutions before you for presentation and vote
10 by the full council. The resolutions reflect the
11 recommendation of the applicable subcommittee. In
12 addition today, you will also find a briefing sheet,
13 which gives you additional information about those
14 matters and other matters which have been scheduled
15 to be heard by the subcommittee.
16

17 Today, we only have one application on
18 our calendar for our consideration, Land Use Number
19 110, 24 Fifth Avenue, an application for a sidewalk
20 café located at 24 Fifth Avenue to operate an
21 unenclosed sidewalk café with 10 tables and 20 chairs
22 in Community Board 2 in Council Member Johnson's
23 district. This café is across the street from
24 Council Mendez's district. Council Member Johnson is
25 very much in favor of this; Council Member Mendez is

1
2 very much opposed to it. The Zoning Committee has
3 recommended an approval of this item. I recommend
4 approval of this item as well.

5 Just so you have some of the basic
6 background of this, this originally started off as a
7 project that had 25 tables and 52 chairs. The
8 current reduction is to 10 tables and 20 chairs; also
9 a reduction in hours of operation. There is a
10 commitment by the applicant that the sidewalk café
11 will close at 10:00 p.m. Sunday through Wednesday, at
12 11:00 p.m. Thursday through Saturday, which is
13 significantly earlier than the required time.

14 Council Member Johnson, who is not a member of the
15 committee, has asked me to express that he's very
16 strongly in favor of this and he believes that this
17 agreement, in fact, will be the best agreement for
18 his community. As by coming to an agreement today,
19 this is, in fact, enforceable and if the committee
20 were to vote this down, this will inevitably likely
21 lead to litigation, which, could in fact, lead to a
22 much larger sidewalk café, which he would not be
23 happy with.

24 I also want to acknowledge that we are in
25 receipt of a letter from Neil P. Ritter of 25 Fifth

1
2 Avenue Condominium 25 Fifth Avenue, New York, New
3 York and that letter has been added to the record.

4 With that, I would like to...

5 [Pause]

6 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: With that, I
7 would like to hand it over to Council Member Mendez
8 to speak on this particular item.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you, Mr.
10 Chair, my colleagues. This issue that comes before
11 us is a very complicated issue. It has many layers.
12 My colleague and my dear friend, Corey Johnson, is
13 being a very practical individual and I, on the other
14 hand, am taking a position about preservation in
15 trying to preserve our community and the character
16 and the natures of our community.

17 So the ultimate issue here is whether
18 this sidewalk café is a legal or illegal non-
19 conforming use. Corey believes it is a legal non-
20 conforming use and should be grandfathered as the law
21 would allow for legal non-conforming uses to be
22 grandfathered. In terms of that, I think it's a
23 close call whether this a legal non-conforming use.
24 They would have to show that the use existed for two
25 years and the proof of burden is on the applicant.

1
2 They've provided some documentation, which, to me
3 is... for me is just shy of the two years, but at the
4 end of the day, this issue fails on procedural
5 grounds. There are laws in this city which requires
6 that certain filings happen at a certain time, and if
7 we need more time that you have to request in writing
8 to have that additional time to modify or to submit
9 the application, modify the application and here, the
10 Department of Consumer Affairs did not... my
11 colleagues, I'm speaking. Mr. Chair?

12 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Folks, if you're
13 having a conversation, we ask that you please take it
14 outside. Thank you.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Here, the
16 Department of Consumer Affairs did not abide by the
17 30-day requirement and in fact, submitted to the
18 Council this application 17 days after the deadline.
19 Moreover, the applicant, Claudette's Café, requested
20 an extension to modify the application nine days
21 after the deadline, so this fails on procedural
22 grounds 'cause they did not meet the 30-day
23 requirement. My colleague, Corey Johnson, thinks
24 this is a legal non-conforming use. He also would
25 want to see less tables and chairs as recommended as

1
2 an alternative by the community board. The community
3 board voted for 10 tables and 20 chairs only if the
4 zoning allowed this. They do not want sidewalk cafes
5 and on Fifth Avenue the zoning prohibits sidewalk
6 cafes for decades. For this reason, I'm asking my
7 colleagues to vote against this, making clear that
8 the actual location of the café is in Council Member
9 Johnson's district on the West Side of Fifth Avenue
10 and I am on the East Side of Fifth Avenue. This, of
11 course, affects residents on both sides of Fifth
12 Avenue and with that, Mr. Chair, thank you for giving
13 me this opportunity to speak.

14 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you very
15 much, Council Member. I just was texting actually
16 with Council Member Johnson. He's in a meeting with
17 the administration. He did ask me to point out,
18 which I will just for the record, that we, the
19 Council has studied this issue, as have several city
20 agencies and you pointed out, it's a debatable point,
21 but all of the city agencies, including ourselves,
22 actually believe that it is a legal non-conforming
23 use. That is our opinion and he asked me to point
24 out again that the... it is a very significant
25 reduction of to 10 tables and 20 chairs, including

1
2 the reduction of the hours of operation and if, in
3 fact, we were to vote against the council member's
4 preferences that we very well could end up with a
5 situation where most likely this would be litigated
6 and in fact, the neighborhood would end up with 25
7 tables and 52 chairs 'til 1:00 a.m. or later, which
8 is a concern of his and therefore, the council member
9 had asked...

10 [crosstalk]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Mm...

12 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Uh...

13 [crosstalk]

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Mr. Chair? Just
15 a point of clarification...

16 [crosstalk]

17 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Yes, yes.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: It would not end
19 up with whatever tables and chairs. There was a
20 modification because of a tree pit, so it would
21 actually be 40 chairs and I don't know how many
22 tables now because...

23 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: [interposing] I
24 guess it'd be twice as much, 20 chairs...

25 [crosstalk]

1 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Yes, it's 15...

2 [crosstalk]

3 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: 40 chairs and 20
4 tables.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Which is
6 significant.

7 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Yes.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Yeah.

9 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Okay, fair
10 enough, but it would be at least twice as much and
11 the hours would be lengthier and therefore, Council
12 Member Johnson is asking his colleagues to go with
13 his recommendation. Despite the fact that it's
14 across the street from your district, it is still in
15 his district technically and he is very strongly
16 asking his colleagues to support his recommendation
17 and to, in fact, pass this Land Use Item. Of course,
18 this is always an uncomfortable position for us, just
19 to be clear, that we have two colleagues and friends
20 who disagree. My general feeling, just to be
21 perfectly honest, is that we certainly do provide a
22 preference to the council member whose project the
23 district is located in and considering all the facts,
24 I certainly acknowledge your position, but as the
25

1
2 chair, I'm going to follow the recommendation of the
3 subcommittee chair and the subcommittee that we vote
4 aye on this project. Thank you. And with that, I
5 will ask the clerk to call the roll.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: William Martin,
7 Committee Clerk. Roll call vote Committee on Land
8 Use, Land Use Item 110. Council Member Greenfield.

9 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Yes.

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gentile.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: May I explain my
12 vote, Mr. Chair?

13 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Yes, sir.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GENTILE: As I said at the
15 subcommittee meeting, as the Dean of the Delegation,
16 I always consider the desire of the council member
17 whose district this is located as something very,
18 very important and something that we really need to
19 abide by. However, as Council Member Mendez has
20 indicated, there are significant legal and procedural
21 problems with this application and I think either way
22 it goes it will be litigated in some fashion or form
23 on either side. So that being the case, there's also
24 I think an ethical issue here with the applicant and
25 I think, although I don't know the applicant, I think

1
2 we may be dealing with a bad actor here because six
3 months before they came before the community board
4 asking for this sidewalk café permit, they six months
5 earlier had testified before that same community
6 board and said to them when they were applying for a
7 liquor license that they would never ever apply for a
8 sidewalk café; that that wasn't in their plans and
9 they wouldn't do that. That was six months before
10 they were before the board again asking for a
11 sidewalk café. So I don't think we, as a Council,
12 should be rewarding bad actors. However, I
13 understand Councilman Johnson's position on this and
14 so given that, I will abstain.

15 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Chair also
16 recognizes that we've been joined by Council Member
17 Garodnick and Council Member Levin.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.

19 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: And Council
20 Member Kallos.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: I'm not sure I'm
22 going to vote, so I'm not going to ask for permission
23 to explain, but I think given the conversation that's
24 going on here between Council Member Mendez and the
25 Chair, and the points that Council Member Gentile has

1
2 raised, I need more information. I'm not ready to
3 vote on this item.

4 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Okay and we'll
5 take that as a pass for now and then we'll come back
6 around if you decide to vote. We... the... our
7 committee staff would be happy to chat with you in
8 the meanwhile and Pete is standing right behind you.
9 Thank you. And I just also reiterate for the record
10 that these items are fully vetted at the
11 subcommittee. We've had extensive hearings at the
12 subcommittee reviewing these items and the essence of
13 the arguments are, in fact, correct that we are
14 succinctly putting, which is that there has been a
15 debate raised as to the legal non-conforming use.
16 Every government agency that has looked at it,
17 including this agency, the New York City Council, has
18 agree that it is indeed a non-conforming use. The
19 importance of giving the council member I believe it
20 is non... it is, in fact, not illegal conforming use
21 and that was an item that was fully vetted at the
22 subcommittee, which, one of three subcommittees and I
23 think we met probably for close to two hours to
24 discuss this matter, but Pete here certainly give you

1
2 that explanation and we'll take it as a pass for now
3 and we'll...

4 [cross-talk]

5 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: I'm... I'm...

6 [crosstalk]

7 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Come back again.

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: I'm compelled to
9 respond to the statement fully vetted in the
10 subcommittee does not mean the rest of us are fully
11 informed, so if we...

12 [crosstalk]

13 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: I understand.

14 [crosstalk]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Can understand
16 that fully vetted in the subcommittee does not
17 necessarily yield fully informed members of this
18 overall committee.

19 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: So we'll
20 recognize that. Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens. Council
22 Member Dickens.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Chair, I really
24 do not have a full understanding and comprehension.
25 I'm trying to ask now the Land Use staff to provide

1
2 me with the additional information because generally,
3 I support a council member's decision in whose
4 district a Land Use item is in. However, this time
5 because of what Council Member Mendez has brought up
6 as far as procedural and the legal aspects that
7 impact upon the additional tables and chairs and
8 Council Member Gentile's issues that he raised, I
9 want to pass for now and see if I can get the
10 additional information that I would need in order to
11 support the position of Council Member Johnson.

12 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. What
13 we are going to do is our members would like to vote
14 and leave and what we're going to do is we're going
15 to continue to vote. We're going to then hold the
16 vote opened for an additional 15 minutes so that for
17 those members who would like to confer with staff can
18 do so and then we will come back for those members
19 who want to vote, but to our members who would like
20 to do so I want to give them that opportunity, if
21 that's okay.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you,
23 Chair. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: You got it.
25 Let's keep calling the roll, please.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Mendez.

COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: I vote no.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Koo.

COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Lander.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Levin.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Weprin.

COUNCIL MEMBER WEPRIN: [off mic] Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Richards.

COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: [off mic]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: May I be excused
to explain my vote?

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Of course.

COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: I expressed... I
have a position that's similar to what has been
expressed by colleagues Dickens and Arroyo. Based on
what has been said here, I did not attend the
subcommittee meeting and it's only today that I'm
understanding that there is some question as to

1
2 whether or not it's legal or not legal. However,
3 understanding that the matter will perhaps be most
4 certainly litigated, I will cast my vote as aye,
5 understanding that hopefully the courts will make the
6 correct decision and we may have to come back and
7 look at this again.

8 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

9 [crosstalk]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Cohen.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: [off mic] Aye.

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Pass.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Reynoso.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER REYNOSO: [off mic] Aye.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Torres.

18 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: [off mic] I vote

19 aye.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Treyger.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Yes, sir.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: So there are
25 obviously legal implications that have been raised

1
2 here and raised at prior hearings, and we all I think
3 take them very serious, but I also take very serious
4 recommendations of both the Chair of Land Use and the
5 Subcommittee on Zoning, Chair Weprin; that their
6 staffs and people have been working on this issue for
7 a long time and I believe that you know, we are a
8 lawmaking body. We are not judges and I do respect
9 the fact that this issue will be followed up on and I
10 will cast my vote aye, but making sure that those
11 legal issues do get resolved and that we do respect
12 the letter of the law. So I will be voting aye,
13 Chair.

14 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Kallos.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: [Response not
17 heard]

18 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Would you like
19 to spend... we're going to do this. We're going to
20 take a 15 minute recess. I think we're done with our
21 first call of the roll. Are we missing anybody else
22 at this point?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Chair?

24 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Yes?

25

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: The... my opening
3 that I read at the subcommittee I think provides more
4 information than... 'cause it provides states and
5 stuff, and I don't know maybe if I should walk
6 through that and that might provide some of the
7 additional information that my colleagues might need
8 in order to make this decision or should I step with
9 them outside and talk them through what I believe is
10 the procedural issues here?

11 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Yes, if you
12 don't mind, we're going ask the clerk to call the
13 roll, if it's okay with you, just so we know you
14 know, what the vote is. Then we're going to have a
15 break so that we can all confer with our colleagues.
16 Is that alright with you, Council Member?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Whatever you say.

18 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: No, no, we'll
19 stay in here. We're not going outside. We're going
20 to stay in here and chat about it. No, no, no. Does
21 that work?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: You're the Chair,
23 so.

24 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.
25 Clerk, where are we at?

1
2 COMMITTEE CLERK: By a vote of 12 in the
3 affirmative and 1 in the negative and 1 abstention,
4 the item has been adopted. Members, please sign the
5 committee reports.

6 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: We're going to
7 take a 15 minute recess and then we're going to
8 reopen the vote for those members who have not voted
9 yet. Thank you.

10 [background voices]

11 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.
12 After our recess and having had the opportunity to
13 discuss the matter further, we are going to continue
14 the roll. Committee Clerk, call the roll.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Dickens.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Permission to
17 explain my vote.

18 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Of course,
19 Chair. [laughter] She is a chair of the
20 subcommittee. We defer to our subcommittee chairs.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you,
22 Chair. I take seriously the issues that were raised
23 by Council Member Mendez, whose district is just
24 adjacent across the street from the café in question.
25 I have spoken with my Land Use staff in order to get

1
2 a full comprehension of the legality. Recognizing
3 that zoning on Fifth Avenue does not permit sidewalk
4 cafes, my understanding is that the Claudette, this
5 café, is grandfathered in because it's been in
6 existence. The fact that there was... there's
7 question about the time, it's still grandfathered in
8 as far as I'm recognizing. I also recognize and I
9 support the fact that Council Member Johnson was able
10 to negotiate to bring the number of tables from 20 to
11 10; from 40 to 20 chairs, as requested and voted on
12 by Community Board 2. In light of what was
13 negotiated by Council Member Johnson, the fact that I
14 do feel that it's grandfathered in and the fact that
15 there will be litigation, giving both sides an
16 opportunity to argue in court and bring their
17 documentation I am going to vote aye.

18 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you, Madam
19 Chair.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Arroyo.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Permission to
22 explain my vote.

23 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Of course.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ARROYO: Which I rarely
25 do, but Mr. Chairman, I thank you and the staff for

1
2 the indulgence in trying to get my hands around the
3 details of this Land Use item. I am comfortable
4 that, as always, our staff have gone through the
5 process and you, as the Chair, to ensure that what
6 we're doing here is the right thing, and with my
7 apologies to Council Member Mendez; I don't think
8 we've ever disagreed on anything; I will vote aye on
9 this item.

10 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Kallos.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Permission to
13 explain my vote.

14 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Sure.

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I'd like to hat
16 tip to our Chair for encouraging a deliberative
17 process and for allowing us to recess so that we
18 could learn more and have a discussion. It's part of
19 what makes this a deliberative body where everything
20 doesn't just get rubber stamped, so I really
21 appreciate this. This specific case is a border. It
22 is down Fifth Avenue with one member representing the
23 West Side and the other member representing the East
24 Side, where each represents a constituency involved.
25 I think collegiality is important, but I also am

1
2 disappointed. I share borders with multiple council
3 members and I always make sure to work together and
4 in unison and in this I am disappointed that both of
5 the council members are not here and unable to do
6 that and that they were not able to achieve the
7 collegiality. I have had a chance to confer with
8 Land Use staff and I want to thank them for their
9 diligence. They have assured me that this is, in
10 fact, legal. I am relying on their legal opinions
11 into this matter. It is irrespective of pending or
12 threatened litigation. I do not believe that as a
13 body we should be passing anything that is illegal.
14 I think we have to rely on our Land Use counsel to
15 help inform our judgments on what is legal and isn't
16 legal and therefore, with respect to Council Member
17 Mendez, for which I considered this, and respect to
18 Council Member Johnson, I vote aye.

19 [Pause]

20 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Council Member
21 Mendez.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENDEZ: Thank you, Mr.
23 Chair. I want to thank all my colleagues for taking
24 the issues that I've raised into consideration and
25 Council Member Kallos, I just want to put on the

1
2 record Corey Johnson and I are collegiately and
3 amicably disagreeing and for me, this is a close call
4 and like has been stated, this is going to be decided
5 in the courts, so I still have not gotten to the
6 point 'cause I haven't seen all the proof that I feel
7 it is a legal non-conforming use and so that's why
8 I'm going to be more dogmatic about what the zoning
9 says where this is residential street as opposed to
10 what is the exception, and if this is the exception
11 we will see a café there, but this is not something
12 that Corey and I are coming to blows. A judge is
13 going to decide that later and I want to thank you,
14 Chair Greenfield, for giving me this opportunity to
15 speak. Council Member Johnson didn't know I was
16 going to speak on the record today and I appreciate
17 the opportunity afforded to me by all of my
18 colleagues. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you,
20 Council member Mendez. I want to thank you for your
21 advocacy. Your constituents are fortunate to have
22 such a passionate council member fighting on their
23 behalf at City Hall. With that, I'll ask the clerk
24 to call the roll.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMITTEE ON LAND USE

24

COMMITTEE CLERK: Revisement Land Use
vote is now 15 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative
and 1 abstention.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: Thank you. I'm
going to keep the vote open for the next 10 minutes
'til 12:05. Thank you very much.

[Pause]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Vote now stands at 16
in the affirmative, 1 in the negative and 1
abstention.

[Pause]

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council member
Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: For the reasons
I stated earlier in the subcommittee, I vote aye.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Final vote on the
Committee on Land Use is now 17 in the affirmative, 1
in the negative and 1 abstention. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON GREENFIELD: This item is
adopted by the Land Use Committee. So the meeting of
September 18th, 2014 is hereby adjourned.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 09/21/2014