

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

December 19, 2018  
Start: 1:37 p.m.  
Recess: 1:57 p.m.

HELD AT: 250 Broadway-Committee Rm, 16<sup>th</sup> Fl.

B E F O R E: I. DANEEK MILLER  
Chairperson

- COUNCIL MEMBERS:
- ADRIENNE E. ADAMS
  - DANIEL DROMM
  - ANDY L. KING
  - ALAN N. MAISEL
  - VANESSA L. GIBSON
  - ERIC A. ULRICH
  - JUMAANE D. WILLIAMS

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR  
A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

[gavel]

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Good afternoon

everyone, thank you for waiting, thank you everyone for... that is here today. I'd like to recognize those members that are here; Council Member Maisel, thank you so very much, Council Member Williams and Council Member Dromm and certainly our bill sponsor, Council... Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo. I'm Council Member I. Daneek Million, the Chair of the Committee on Civil Service and Labor and today we will, will be voting on two very important pieces of legislation. Intro 633 and Resolutions 566 both of which have full support. I first want to talk about Resolution 566, which was introduced this would... will call on the state and the state assembly bill 10935 and state senate bill 8844 which would automatically enroll optimal employees... optional employees in the New York City Board of Education retirement system, BURS after 90 days of employment. These optional employees are approximately 37,000 part time and or temporary city government employees that... to the state Department of Education. these employees are eligible for optional enrollment in our... in the pension system however, only 73 percent of them ever join this means that the

1 simple lack of awareness can mean that a commitment  
2 to city employees can be lost and they can lose  
3 access to years of pension benefits to which he or  
4 she is entitled and has worked very hard to earn over  
5 the years. This Resolution would essential encourage  
6 the state to adopt legislation that would ensure part  
7 time and temporary employees automatically be  
8 enrolled to the pension system while providing opt  
9 out mechanisms for those who truly wish not to join.  
10 I believe this is a vital step to ensuring that city  
11 employees regardless if they are part time or  
12 temporary receive the pension benefits that they so  
13 rightly deserve. I'd like to turn attention and... turn  
14 my attention and... to now Intro 633 sponsored by  
15 Majority Leader Cumbo and Public Advocate and myself,  
16 has truly been a labor of love over this past three  
17 years. This piece of legislation would have been...  
18 which we've been dealing with since 2016 is critical  
19 to the fight against wage disparity and  
20 discrimination within the city's workforce. This  
21 piece of legislation that will set the standard for  
22 other local governments around the country... around  
23 the city and around the country as well as private  
24 sector, it shows the commitment of this Council to  
25

1 the eradication of pay disparities within its  
2 workforce and how we have accomplished this. Unlike  
3 reporting bills of the past, Introduction 633 takes a  
4 whole new approach. Introduction 633 represents the  
5 Council's truly exercising its policy legislative  
6 oversight over the city government by not simply  
7 relying on public report put forth by the  
8 administration, the legislation gives Council direct  
9 access to underlying data and allowing... and allows  
10 Council to perform its own analysis of such data.  
11 Passing legislation... passing this will... legislation  
12 will allow Council to directly validate or invalidate  
13 what gets reported by the administration. There is a  
14 powerful tool, no longer do we have to take the face...  
15 take on face value what the city agencies want to  
16 report to this legislative body. As numerous lawsuits  
17 have shown like the one filed by CWA Local 11, 1180  
18 back in 2016 237 and others... Teamsters 237 and others  
19 which has now settled... been settled by the city, pay  
20 disparity exists. You cannot tell me otherwise; this  
21 body can no longer rely on public report by the same  
22 administration which argues these disparities do not  
23 exist or that they exist only in the fringes as a co-  
24 equal branch of government. This legislation will  
25

1  
2 allow us to flex our legislative oversight over the  
3 city agencies that cannot seem to get it right. This  
4 legislation represents the first step in the City  
5 Council helping these agencies get it right. Council  
6 Member Cumbo, Majority Leader Cumbo, Public Advocate  
7 and myself and numerous advocates we have waited a  
8 long and hard to see this legislation come to  
9 fruition. The fact that we have finally arrived here  
10 at this Committee vote shows that. A vote yes and we  
11 can start to take the first step of finding.. finally  
12 eradicating pay discrimination within the city's  
13 workforce whether the discrimination is based on  
14 gender, race, age or other protected categories. But  
15 before I pass it over.. and, and let me just it would  
16 also eradicate what we see quite often is.. which is  
17 often a nexus of, of this problem which is privilege  
18 and nepotism which has been a problem within the  
19 municipal workforce which is supposed to merit based  
20 and, and, and I think bill will go a really long way  
21 to eradicating that so I ask the Committee for their  
22 vote yes on this certainly. But before we turn it  
23 over for the vote I would be honored to hear from my  
24 colleague, the Majority Leader Miss Laurie Cumbo.

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you Chair  
3 Miller and as pop sensation star Rhianna said, pay me  
4 what you owe me. Today is a huge day for women all  
5 across the city of New York and people of all races,  
6 nationalities, age, religion who have felt  
7 discrimination as a result of pay inequity. I am  
8 Majority Leader Cumbo and over the past term I have  
9 been proud to work alongside so many incredible  
10 advocates, activists and true champions in the  
11 pursuit of equity, equality and economic, gender,  
12 racial and social justice reforms. Today is a very  
13 proud day, we are set to pass Intro 633, a Local Law  
14 to amend the administrative code of the city of New  
15 York in relation to reporting of pay and employment  
16 equity data. We are on the brink of changing the way  
17 the municipal workforce does business and changing  
18 history as we know it. Together we will close gender  
19 pay gap, an opportunity gap for women and all people  
20 all across New York. We know that women employed in  
21 New York City's municipal government face a gender  
22 wage gap that is three times larger than the gap  
23 experienced by women working in the private sector.  
24 When I look back at my time in the City Council, I  
25 will think about the countless hours working with the

1  
2 incredible pay equity advocates and the outstanding  
3 women that make our city run each and every day. Many  
4 of those who represent one of our finest unions,  
5 primarily made up of black and brown women of CWA  
6 Local 1180, they are responsible for this  
7 groundbreaking legislation that is going to open up  
8 the doors for so many women. Leave it to a group of  
9 dynamic women to change the course of history for all  
10 New Yorkers. I dedicate this moment and this work to  
11 the women soldiers that pushed us, told us and  
12 demanded more from the City Council, the Mayor and  
13 every city agency across the city of New York. It is  
14 an honor to stand with so many incredible women  
15 warriors and men who get it like the ones that are  
16 here today to champion this piece of legislation that  
17 will pass under the incredible leadership of my dear  
18 friend and colleagues Council Member Daneek Miller,  
19 who serves as the Chair of the Committee on Civil  
20 Service and Labor. Changing the status quo takes work  
21 and we as women have never been ones to shy away from  
22 challenges, piece by piece we will dismantle this  
23 gender pay gap and we will use legislation and policy  
24 discourse to bring the issues to the forefront. We  
25 will no longer stand idle by and permit an antiquated



1 human resource construct to perpetuate institutional  
2 discrimination in the workforce. There are many  
3 people that worked with us to make today possible. I  
4 want to thank Speaker Corey Johnson for standing by  
5 me and always standing up for the people. I want to  
6 thank Jason Goldman, Laura Popa, Jeff Baker, Rachel  
7 Credera and Terzah Nasser and to the incredible work  
8 of my former women's Counsel Aminta Kilawan and the  
9 Legislative Drafting Attorney and Leadership of  
10 Malcolm Butehorn on the Council Committee on Civil  
11 Service and Labor. I also again want to thank CWA  
12 Local 1180 and former President Arthur Cheliotis and  
13 President Gloria Middleton. Thank you, Beverly  
14 Neufeld, President of PowHer NY and the countless  
15 advocates. And I really want to thank Public Advocate  
16 Letitia James who is now our next New York State  
17 Attorney General Elect and the incredible Council  
18 Member sponsors on this bill for their incredible  
19 work to advance women's equity within the city and  
20 state of New York. We demand economic fairness, pure  
21 and simple. When we lift women up we lift everyone up  
22 and I would say from my time in the Council, women  
23 are so incredibly dynamic especially the women's  
24 caucus, we have tackled issues that impact women from  
25

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

2 wage disparities to health outcomes, from sex  
3 trafficking to domestic violence, to sexual assault  
4 to a lack of child care and most recently the tragic  
5 situation that was unfolding last week that Jasmine  
6 Headley was subjected to in HRA. There are so many  
7 ways in which women are under attack but we are  
8 dismantling all of those inequities throughout the  
9 city each and every day and I just want to close as  
10 we think about pay inequities, this has been going on  
11 systemically for so long and in 1980, if you listen  
12 to the lyrics to this song, working nine to five,  
13 what a way to make a living, barely getting by, its  
14 all taken and no given, they just use your mind and  
15 they never give you credit, its enough to drive you  
16 crazy if you let it. Nine to five for service and  
17 devotion, you would think that I would deserve a fat  
18 promotion, want to move ahead but the boss won't seem  
19 to let me, I swear sometimes that man is out to get  
20 me. These are... the lyrics of Dolly Pardon written in  
21 1980 talking about the same issues almost 40 years  
22 later that we are addressing today. So many dynamic  
23 women all across this nation have stood strong to  
24 bring greater attention to the inequities that women  
25 face and I'm proud to be here in the New York City

1 COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

2 Council, one of 11 women who are doing extraordinary  
3 work to end the disparities that women all across the  
4 nation are facing. I strongly encourage all of my  
5 colleagues to vote aye and I thank you for your  
6 support and for continuing to be the champions of  
7 great and strong legislation just like this one.  
8 Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: We've been joined by  
10 Council Member Eric Ulrich. With that William.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: William Martin,  
12 Committee Clerk, roll call vote, Committee on Civil  
13 Service and Labor, Introduction 633-A and Resolution  
14 566, Chair Miller?

15 CHAIRPERSON MILLER: I proudly vote aye.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Dromm?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: I vote aye.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Maisel?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: [off mic] Yes.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Williams?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I proudly vote  
22 aye on both, congratulations to the Chair and Council  
23 Member Cumbo and please add my name to both pieces of  
24 legislation, thank you.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: Ulrich?

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

COMMITTEE ON CIVIL SERVICE AND LABOR

COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I vote aye and ask my name to be added as a co-sponsor as well, thank you. Yes, on both please.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: By a vote of five in the affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions both items have been adopted by the Committee.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay, we're going to keep this open for about 15 minutes.

COMMITTEE CLERK MARTIN: The final vote, Committee on Civil Service and Labor, Introduction 633-A and Resolution 566 are both adopted by the Committee five in the affirmative, zero in the negative and no abstentions. Thank you.

[gavel]

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date

January 15, 2019