

NEW CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

of the

STATED MEETING

[*INCLUDED: CONTINUATION OF THE
RECESSED MEETING OF JUNE 22, 2023
HELD ON JUNE 30, 2023]

----- X

Friday, June 30, 2023
Start: 12:55 P. M.
Recess: 2:13 P. M.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Adrienne E. Adams, Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Joann Ariola
Alexa Avilés
Diana I. Ayala
Charles Barron
Joseph C. Borelli
Erik D. Bottcher
Justin L. Brannan
Gale A. Brewer
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Tiffany Cabán
David M. Carr
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Eric Dinowitz
Amanda Farias
Oswald Feliz

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

COUNCIL MEMBERS (CONTINUED)

James F. Gennaro
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Shahana K. Hanif
Kamillah Hanks
Robert F. Holden
Crystal Hudson
Kristin Richardson Jordan
Rita C. Joseph
Ari Kagan
Shekar Krishnan
Linda Lee
Farah N. Louis
Christopher Marte
Darlene Mealy
Julie Menin
Francisco P. Moya
Mercedes Narcisse
Sandy Nurse
Chi A. Ossé
Vickie Paladino
Keith Powers
Lincoln Restler
Kevin C. Riley
Carlina Rivera
Rafael Salamanca, Jr
Pierina Ana Sanchez
Lynn C. Schulman
Althea V. Stevens
Sandra Ung
Marjorie Velázquez
Inna Vernikov
Nantasha M. Williams
Julie Won
Kalman Yeger

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING
A P P E A R A N C E S

Sensei Koshin Paley Ellison, MPA, LMSW, DMIN,
President & Guiding Teacher,
New York Zen Center for Contemplative Care
located at 119 West 23rd Street, Suite 401, New
York, NY 10011

2 SERGEANT POLITE: Today's Stated Meeting is being
3 recorded by Keith Polite. Today's date is June 30,
4 2023.

5 CITY CLERK: Council Member Powers to the Captain
6 America Chair.

7 Ladies and gentleman, at this time please place
8 all electronic devices -- all electronic devices to
9 vibrate or silent mode.

10 Quiet on the floor, please! Quiet on the floor,
11 please!

12 Mr. Majority Leader?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Before we start, I just
14 want to congratulate... I just want to congratulate
15 our Chief Economist, Ray Majewski, this is going to
16 be his last budget. He is retiring... Well, not
17 really, but he's retiring from the Council. So, we
18 made him a proclamation to honor his dedication to
19 this council.

20 [APPLAUSE]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Come up, Ray! This will
22 be Ray's 23rd budget!

23 [APPLAUSE]

24 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Do you want to say
25 something?

2 MR. RAY MAJEWSKI: Look, it's... It's been an
3 honor. It's all I can say, it has just been
4 wonderful working with the council members over the
5 years, and with the really, really great staff at
6 Finance. And, to the economists at Revenue and
7 Economics, man, you guys are mine, you guys are mine.
8 So, thank you all.

9 [APPLAUSE]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you, Ray!

11 [APPLAUSE]

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: I am going to read a
13 little bit from the proclamation: Ray was born in
14 Brooklyn, New York, of course, the best borough.

15 [APPLAUSE]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: He earned a PhD in
17 economics at the New School for Social Research.
18 Following the completion of his doctoral studies, he
19 embarked on an academic career teaching economics at
20 several esteemed universities, including Monmouth,
21 Seton Hall, and his alma mater, The New School.
22 Transitioning from academia to public service, Ray
23 joined the staff of the New York City Council 23
24 years ago, November 6, 2000. By January of 2002, he
25 had earned the distinction of becoming the council's

1 first Chief Economist -- we didn't have a Chief
2 Economist before we had Ray -- a role that has since
3 evolved to also include the title of Deputy Director.
4 During his tenure, Ray's contributions to the City
5 Council have been profound. He has played a critical
6 role in the formation of 23 budgets, providing
7 invaluable expertise in economic and tax forecasting.
8 Ray has truly distinguished himself in his commitment
9 to economics and to the city of New York. And, upon
10 his departure, we wish you the best, Ray. God bless,
11 thank you so much.

12 [APPLAUSE]

13 MR. RAY MAJEWSKI: Thank you.

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: It's a tough one, Ray. We are so
15 happy for you. The love that you had bestowed on
16 this institution during 23 budgets, is unimaginable,
17 incomparable. And for that, this council will always
18 be indebted to you for your genius in economics. I
19 have never seen anything like the genius of Ray
20 Majewski.

21 [APPLAUSE]

22 SPEAKER ADAMS: Ray, we are going to miss you.
23 And, I don't think we're going to find anybody to
24 take your place. But, we know that you have trained
25

2 up incredible individuals that will follow in your
3 legacy in greatness, that will sustain this
4 institution, just like you have, for generations to
5 come. Thank you so much, Ray.

6 [APPLAUSE]

7 MR. RAY MAJEWSKI: Thank you all. Thank you all.
8 Thank you, Speaker, it's been a pleasure

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: My pleasure, thank you.

10 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS:

11 [GAVELING IN] [GAVEL SOUND]

12 Good afternoon, and welcome to the recessed
13 Stated Meeting of June 22nd, 2023, being held on June
14 30, 2023.

15 I am Majority Leader Keith Powers. I would like
16 to thank everyone for joining us here today. If you
17 would like to follow along, the agenda for today's
18 meeting is posted on the website.

19 We are going to take a re-call vote call for this
20 recessed Stated Meeting now. Roll call.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Abreu?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Present.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ariola?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: [NO RESPONSE]

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Presente

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ayala?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Barron?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Here

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Bottcher?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: [NO RESPONSE]

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Present

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Cabán?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Present

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Carr?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: [NO RESPONSE]

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member De La Rosa?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Here

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Here

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Farías?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Present

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Presente

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Presente

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Hanif?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Here

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Present

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Holden?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [NO RESPONSE]

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Present

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Joseph?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Present

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Kagan?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Present

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Here

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Lee?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Here

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Louis?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Marte?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Here

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Mealy?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you.

6 Council Member Menin?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Here

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Moya?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: [NO RESPONSE]

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Narcisse?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Present

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Nurse?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Here

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ossé?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Present

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Paladino?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: [NO RESPONSE]

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Restler?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: [NO RESPONSE]

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Richardson Jordan?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Here

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Riley?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: [NO RESPONSE]

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Here

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Salamanca?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Sanchez?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Present

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Here

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Here.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ung?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Present

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Velázquez?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: [NO RESPONSE]

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Vernikov?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Here

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Williams?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Present

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Won?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Here

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: [NO RESPONSE]

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

25 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Here

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 12

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Moya?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present

4 COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Speaker Adams?

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Present

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. With that, the

7 recess Stated Meeting of June 22, 2023 is hereby

8 adjourned.

9 [GAVELING OUT] [GAVEL SOUND]

10

11 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS:

12 [GAVELING IN] [GAVEL SOUND]

13 We will now convene the Stated Meeting of June

14 30, 2023.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Please join us for the pledge of

16 allegiance.

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise!

18 CITY COUNCIL: [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE]

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. We once again

20 call a roll call.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Abreu?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Present.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ariola?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: [NO RESPONSE]

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Presente

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ayala?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Barron?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Bottcher?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHER: [NO RESPONSE]

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Here

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Here

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Present

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Cabán?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Present

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Carr?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: [NO RESPONSE]

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member De La Rosa?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Here

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: Here

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Farías?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: Still present

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Presente

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Here

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Presente

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Hanif?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Here

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Present

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Holden?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [NO RESPONSE]

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Present

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Joseph?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Present

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Kagan?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: [NO RESPONSE]

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Kagan?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Present, present.

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Yeah, thank you.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you, Council Member.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Krishnan?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Here

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Lee?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Here

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Louis?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Present

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Marte?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Present

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Mealy?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: Present

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Menin?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Present

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Moya?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Present

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Narcisse?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Present

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Nurse?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Here

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ossé?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Present

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Paladino?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: [NO RESPONSE]

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Restler?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: Present

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Richardson Jordan?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Here

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Riley?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: [NO RESPONSE]

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Salamanca?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Sanchez?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Still present

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Still here

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Stevens?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Here

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Riley?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: Present

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Ung?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: Present

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Velázquez?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: Present

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Vernikov?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: Here

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Williams?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Won?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Present

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeager?

COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here

COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: [NO RESPONSE]

COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Present

COMMITTEE COUNSEL: Speaker Adams?

SPEAKER ADAMS: Present

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you.

We will now have today's invocation which will be delivered by Sensei Koshin Paley Ellison, New York Zen Center for Contemplative Care located West 23rd Street in Manhattan.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: All rise!

SENSEI KOSHIN PALEY ELLISON: So, let's all just take a moment to appreciate this important day by remembering that we are human and breathe. So, I invite you to put both of your hands on your belly, and let's just take a one, long inhale. And exhale. And inhale, and exhale.

It is rare to remember to be compassionate when we are uncomfortable. It is rare to be compassionate when we are feeling awkward and hurt. Today is a day where decisions are made that will both be helpful and will hurt. And who we are is really forged in

1 these moments where things are uncomfortable. And we
2 can understand actually what compassion means. Can
3 we actually bring forth to realize that we are all
4 doing what we can do, and to treat each other with
5 dignity and respect across difference? Because
6 there is difference and there is oneness -- that we
7 all are actually literally breathing the same air
8 right now, and we are all different. So, to me, I am
9 just honored to be here, and appreciate that we have
10 this opportunity to be in this discomfort and learn
11 how to be courageous and compassionate in the
12 discomfort; to be able to feel sorry and participate.
13 And, so, how do we extend out remembering, our breath
14 and remembering to look into each other's eyes with
15 some kindness, with some compassion, in particular
16 with the people that you disagree with. And this is
17 how we create a more compassionate and courageous
18 world in these moments that are hard. This is when
19 we really see who we are. Thank you so much, and may
20 your lives go well, thank you.

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you.

22 Thank you, am now going to on Council Member Eric
23 Bottcher...

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Please sit down, quiet, please!
25

2 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: to spread the invocation
3 on the record.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Thank you so much, that
5 is exactly the invocation that I wanted to hear
6 today, and that I wanted to hear together with all of
7 you today.

8 I really want to thank Sensei Koshin Paley
9 Ellison for delivering today's invocation. He is an
10 author, a Zen teacher, a Jungian psychotherapist, and
11 he co-founded the New York Zen Center for
12 Contemplative Care right in Chelsea, which offers
13 education, personal caregiving, and Zen practice. I
14 thank you greatly for your words today.

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Council Member Bottcher,
16 would you like to make a motion?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: I would like to make a
18 motion to spread the Invocation in full upon the
19 Record.

20 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, and thank you
21 for being here today.

22 We will now move into the Adoption of Minutes.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Messages & Papers from
25 the Mayor?

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 20

2 COUNCIL CLERK: M 163 through M 166, Mayor's veto
3 and disapproval messages?

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: General Welfare.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: M 170, City debt and reserves?

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: Received, Ordered, Printed and
7 Filed.

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Communications from City,
9 County & Borough Offices?

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered M's 167 and 168,
11 budget modifications?

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Finance

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Petitions and
14 Communications?

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: None

16 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Land Use Call-Ups?

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: None

18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you.

19 We will now have communication from Speaker
20 Adrienne Adams.

21 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Mr. Majority
22 Leader. And, good afternoon, everyone.

23 UNKNOWN: [INAUDIBLE]

24 SPEAKER ADAMS: Oh, okay.

25 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Good afternoon.

1 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you!

2 Before we begin, I am going to acknowledge
3 someone who is very special who is here with us today
4 -- someone who was elected in 1999, and served
5 through 2005 as the Manhattan Borough President.
6 Colleagues, let's give a warm welcome to C. Virginia
7 Fields.
8

9 [APPLAUSE]

10 SPEAKER ADAMS: Before we begin, I would like to
11 address yesterday's Supreme Court decision to strike
12 down affirmative action in our institutions of higher
13 education. For decades, affirmative action has
14 empowered educational institutions to address a long
15 legacy of systemic inequities that have prevented
16 Black people, and people of color more broadly, from
17 accessing equitable opportunities. This decision is
18 a loss for civil rights and the longstanding struggle
19 for justice and equality, but certainly is another
20 example of an intentional and long term campaign to
21 rollback civil rights realizing success at the
22 Supreme Court. It will undermine racial diversity
23 and inclusivity in the classrooms of our institutions
24 of higher education which benefit all students.
25 Despite the implications made by conservative members

1
2 of the court, racial inequities persist and permeate
3 our society in deeply rooted ways. It is critical
4 for us as a city and country to advance policies that
5 ensure that everyone, especially those from
6 traditionally marginalized and underserved
7 communities, have equitable access to opportunity.

8 And today, on the last day of Pride Month, this
9 Supreme Court issued a ruling that undermines equal
10 protections for LGBTQIA+ individuals. It is a
11 terrifying setback in progress and protections for
12 the LGBTQIA+ community who continue to experience
13 existential and physical attacks on their identity,
14 safety, and well-being. This decision effectively
15 grants businesses the right to discriminate. It is
16 an alarming trend and a continuation of the rollback
17 of our collective rights, put in motion by far-right
18 extremists on the Supreme Court. We firmly denounce
19 the Supreme Court's decision today, and we will
20 continue the work of a Council to safeguard and
21 expand rights for all LGBTQIA+ New Yorkers.

22 Today, we are voting on several items related to
23 the adoption of the City Budget for Fiscal Year 2024.

24 And I want to start by thanking our Finance
25 Chair, Council Member Justin Brannan.

2 [APPLAUSE]

3 SPEAKER ADAMS: And our collective Leadership
4 team, Deputy Speaker Diana Ayala; Majority Leader
5 Keith Powers; Majority Whip Selvena Brooks-Powers;
6 Council Member Gale Brewer; and Council Member Rafael
7 Salamanca.

8 [APPLAUSE]

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you for your hard work
10 throughout this budget process.

11 I also want to thank all of the members of the
12 Budget Negotiating Team for your dedication in this
13 process as well.

14 I also want to extend our deepest gratitude to
15 the entire Finance Division, led by my Deputy Chief
16 of Staff and Chief Financial Officer, Tanisha
17 Edwards.

18 [APPLAUSE]

19 SPEAKER ADAMS: And the Director of the Finance
20 Division, Richard Lee.

21 [APPLAUSE]

22 SPEAKER ADAMS: None of the progress we have made
23 on this budget would have been possible without you
24 and your long days and nights of work. And, I thank
25 you for the bottom of my heart.

1 We are also thankful for the work of our
2
3 Legislative Documents Unit led by Jonathan Ettricks.

4 [APPLAUSE]

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: And we, of course, always thank
6 our legislative staff led by Jeff Baker and Andrea
7 Vazquez.

8 [APPLAUSE]

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: And, now, I want to take a moment
10 to recognize, one again, someone who has been
11 critical to the Council's operations for over two
12 decades. For 23 years Ray Majewski, the Council's
13 Chief Economist, has exemplified the best in public
14 service. His precise economic forecasts have allowed
15 the Council to maintain financial stability during
16 periods of economic uncertainty. Ray has played a
17 tremendous role in formulating and shaping the last
18 23 budgets in the city of New York. Ray's work has
19 improved the lives of millions of his fellow New
20 Yorkers, and has made it possible for so many to
21 build their lives in our city. His legacy will live
22 on for generations and generations to come as someone
23 who has brought heart, wisdom, and insight every day
24 to his profession to strengthen our communities. Dr.
25 Majewski, Ray, we thank you immensely for your service

1
2 to our city, and you wish you much success and
3 happiness in your most deserved retirement, my
4 friend.

5 [APPLAUSE]

6 SPEAKER ADAMS: Today we are voting on several
7 items related to the adoption of the City Budget for
8 Fiscal Year 2024. The Council's focus in this budget
9 has to been to protect the essential services that
10 the people of this city rely on. As the first women
11 majority and "the men who get it" council in our
12 city's history, we have a responsibility to shift the
13 deeply engrained dynamics of our city that have
14 historically left women and communities of color
15 behind. The inequalities that undermine our
16 communities and city must be addressed, and resolving
17 them was the focus of our budget vision and
18 priorities.

19 Since the start of this process, the Council held
20 a distinct vision for the budget even as we understood
21 approaching challenges. There are budget gaps in our
22 outyears that we must confront. Yet, as I said
23 yesterday, how we approach these challenges matters
24 to New Yorkers. As a result of the proposed budgets
25 presented to us that contain cuts in just about every

1 area, that only grew deeper throughout this process,
2 the Council was left with a responsibility and tasked
3 with fighting for restorations to the harmful cuts
4 across the entire budget.
5

6 Through what I would characterize as incredibly
7 difficult negotiations, we worked to bridge the
8 distance between us and the Administration fighting
9 to restore investments and essential services that
10 our families, communities, and city need. The budget
11 before us is the result of these labored efforts.

12 This council took seriously our task to negotiate
13 the best and most achievable outcomes that deliver
14 results for New Yorkers. It was our responsibility
15 to shape a negotiation, a negotiated budget, as
16 responsible stewards of our city. There are real
17 potential economic and financial implications of a
18 delayed budget that risks harming the very people we
19 seek to protect with our investments. We understand
20 that if we don't achieve a negotiated budget by the
21 legal deadline, it could negatively impact our bond
22 rating and capital budget.

23 Advancing a non-negotiated budget could also put
24 everything that we have gained in this fight at risk.
25 It could jeopardize the funding restorations we

1
2 fought so hard to attain, as well as the important
3 funding for critical programs that this council's
4 foresight helps to deliver.

5 We sought to avoid these outcomes by driving hard
6 negotiations that would meet the budget deadline
7 while preserving as many of the investments that New
8 Yorkers count on. These negotiations were uniquely
9 challenging because of how much they focused on
10 restoring cuts out their outset.

11 We left it all on the fields for New Yorkers,
12 because we know the immense need through the City and
13 the lives at stake. We approach these negotiations
14 aiming to claw back every proposed cut that this
15 council prioritized restoring. Everything we secured
16 was a hard fought victory and must not be overlooked.

17 Because of our efforts, there are many priorities
18 that we successfully advanced in this budget. This
19 council negotiated to restore \$36.2 million in
20 funding that our public libraries would have totally
21 lost, effecting weekend and other services that serve
22 New Yorkers of *all* ages. We avoided this outcome
23 thanks to you and all New Yorkers raising their
24 voices to protect this precious public resources.

1 And as a city that depends on the valuable labor
2 of nonprofit workers, it is imperative that we fairly
3 compensate the human services workforce, the majority
4 of whom are underpaid women of color, with a
5 multiyear pay increase. Securing pay increases for
6 these workers is a matter of gender, racial, and
7 economic justice. We are proud to have secured a new
8 baselined \$40 million, on top of \$60 million from
9 last year, for a total of \$100 million in this year's
10 budget for these workers. We also secured an
11 additional \$50 million starting next fiscal year for
12 a total of \$150 million in baselined funds for each
13 year moving forward. We know this is still far from
14 what is needed to truly provide these workers with
15 the wages they deserve. And we remain committed to
16 fighting to achieve true parity.

18 CUNY is one of the most effective pathways to
19 equitable economic opportunity for New Yorkers, and
20 they were a major funding priority for us as well.
21 The \$32.4 million restored to this budget for our
22 public institutions of higher education will help
23 avoid the bulk of programmatic cuts they faced.

24 We also secured \$46 million to support legal
25 service providers and their staff in helping low-

1
2 income New Yorkers avoid evictions and other
3 destabilizing outcomes. With rising economic
4 instability and evictions, the City's Right to
5 Counsel program and other legal services, championed
6 by the Council, must be sustained. The frontline
7 workers delivering these services need more dedicated
8 resources and the permanent baselined \$30 million is
9 an important start towards increasing support for
10 them. As a council, remain committed to pursuing
11 solutions that match the scale of this crisis.

12 Early childhood education is key to long term
13 cognitive development and gives working parents the
14 opportunity to advance in their careers. Yet, the
15 prohibitive costs of childcare put this out of reach
16 for so many New Yorkers. The Council worked hard to
17 secure \$16 million to support Promise NYC, providing
18 more childcare assistance to undocumented and low
19 income-families. The baselined \$15 million for our
20 shared vision with early childhood education
21 providers to repair 3-K by converting extended year
22 seats will help our city begin to effectively meet
23 extraordinary demands across the City. And because a
24 holistic education requires support inside and
25

1 outside of the classroom, we secured \$14 million for
2 community schools.
3

4 From restoring cuts to programs that provide
5 meals for our older adults, and NYCHA's ability to
6 make vacant apartments available for New Yorkers, to
7 increasing funding for affordable housing during a
8 housing crisis, and fair fares when fare hikes are
9 approaching there are so many investments that we
10 should be proud to have secured.

11 This council's contributions are responsible for
12 individual school budgets receiving additional
13 funding from added weights to the Fair Student
14 Funding Formula and continued federal funding to
15 protect against enrollment losses.

16 Transparency in our budget is critical, which is
17 why the Council prioritized improving the structure
18 of the budget to reflect actual agency programs and
19 functions. This year, through our negotiations, we
20 secured commitments from the administration to create
21 eleven new units of appropriation. Two new units of
22 appropriation in The Department of Correction Budget
23 will allows us to breakdown their spending on
24 transportation of people who are incarcerated. Over
25 the past two years, the units of appropriation for

1 the Department of Correction budget has gone up from
2 four to ten. We also secured new units of
3 appropriation in the Police Department for a total of
4 seven.

5
6 Finally, our budget includes a record sixty-two
7 terms and conditions, which will disclose spending on
8 issues critical to the Council, including migrant
9 funding, emergency contracting, DOE payments to early
10 childhood providers, and restorative justice
11 programing. And I thank Jim Caras for his tireless
12 work in securing...

13 [APPLAUSE]

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: units of appropriation for this
15 council.

16 We made significant progress on many priorities
17 for New Yorkers, but we also acknowledge that there
18 are unfulfilled goals that still remain *missing* from
19 this budget. These remain priorities for this
20 council, and we will fight to ensure they are
21 recognized by our city.

22 Let me be perfectly clear, the investments
23 secured in this budget do not, *do not*, represent the
24 completion of our work. Critical programs in our
25 communities require far more recourses, and we refuse

1
2 to turn our backs on the investments that were not
3 able to be secured in *this* budget. There is more
4 that must be done on every front, and we are fully
5 committed to the important work ahead. We will
6 continue to fight for these investments, because we
7 cannot afford to withhold what is proven to help New
8 Yorkers advance in health, safety, and opportunity.

9 Looking ahead, we are more than clear about
10 challenges that we must confront. The City faces the
11 loss of over \$10 billion in one-time COVID relief
12 funding. We also have significantly increased costs
13 from cost shifts of approximately \$500 million from
14 the state and other economic and fiscal realities
15 facing our city, state, and country that could
16 significantly affect the New Yorkers we represent.
17 The Council will continue to advocate for our city to
18 take a different approach to proactively address
19 these challenges. Our vision remains one where we
20 work together across all levels of government to
21 address the urgent needs of New Yorkers.

22 While the Council's focus there was to restore
23 cuts to essential services, our City must shift away
24 from this harmful budgeting approach. We must move
25 forward through the lens of expanding what New

1 Yorkers need, not on what they can do without.
2
3 Though we have come to a negotiated budget, we will
4 continue to push forward in our yearlong budgetary
5 legislative and oversight efforts to secure the
6 investments that New Yorkers deserve. None of this
7 was remotely possible without the unity this body
8 exhibited in our budget vision and the priorities we
9 shared in fighting for.

10 I encourage us to remain united as a body even
11 when we may have divergent views, because it is in
12 our unity that strengthens us and afforded the
13 ability to achieve these gains today. We won't always
14 succeed, but I believe this body can achieve anything
15 when we are in trenches together, working on behalf
16 of and with the people of this city.

17 Our focus now and in the years to come *must* be to
18 invest in what helps all New Yorkers succeed. And
19 that will be my priority, seeking to strengthen this
20 body and its ability to wield greater power to
21 achieve the outcomes we all want.

22 Colleagues, I appreciate you, and I appreciate
23 your hard work during this budget season. Let's move
24 on to do the work of the people of the city of New
25 York.

2 I thank you for your attention, I now turn it
3 back to over to our Majority Leader.

4 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Speaker Adams.
5 We are now going to move into the Discussion of
6 General Orders.

7 We are first going to call on the Finance chair,
8 Council Member Brannan, followed by Council Member
9 Barron.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you, Majority
11 Leader, and thank you, Speaker.

12 The Council entered into budget negotiations this
13 year with eyes wide opened to the challenges on the
14 horizon and at our doorstep. And we have never the
15 doubted the durability of our city's economy, but we
16 also recognized that resilience doesn't happen on its
17 own, it requires thoughtful, targeted investments.
18 And when money is tight, tough decisions must be
19 made. So, our negotiations were no different from
20 the often tough conversations working families have
21 around their dining room table every night as they
22 try to make ends meet for another month in the most
23 expensive city in the world. But even with an
24 uncertain fiscal future, and a migrant influx,
25 everyone agrees New York City cannot and should not

2 have to handle on our with the nearly \$107 billion
3 budget, we knew that there was still no reason for
4 cuts with scythe. Instead, we fought hard for
5 thoughtful and surgical investments, and we focused
6 our priorities where they mattered most.

7 I wanted to take a moment to thank everyone in
8 mission control across the street, uh, who have
9 worked so hard over the past six months to get this
10 budget to where it is today and the budget that we
11 are going to vote on today. Every question that was
12 asked over the past 24-48 hours, every last minute
13 change that had to be made, and all of the research
14 that goes into getting us to this point requires a
15 whole lot of work from folks across the street. And
16 I wanted to just take a second to acknowledge them.
17 Starting with the Legal Unit and the Finance
18 Division: Kathleen Ahn, Alan Lebowitz, and Michael
19 Twomey.

20 The Budget Unit: Chima Obichere, Eisha Wright,
21 Crilhien Francisco, Aliya Ali, Julia Haramis, Jack
22 Storey, Danielle Glants, Ross Goldstein, Sandra Gray,
23 Saiyemul Hamid, Nia Hyatt, Florentine Kabore, [TIMER
24 CHIMES] Owen Kotowski, Daniel Kroop, Casey Lajszky,
25 Andrew Lane-Lawless, Glenn Martelloni, Alicia

2 Miranda, Monica Saladi, Michael Sherman, Tanveer
3 Singh.

4 Revenue and Economics Unit: Of course, Raymond
5 Majewski, Emre Edev, Paul Sturm, Hector German,
6 William Kyeremateng, Nashia Roman, Andrew Wilber

7 Discretionary Funding and Data Support Unit: Paul
8 Scimone, James Reyes, Emmanuel Afuape, Savanna Chou,
9 Carolina Gil, Miguel Perez-Perez.

10 Administrative Support Unit: Vanessa Diaz-Lopez,
11 Nicole Anderson, Maria Pagan.

12 And of course, Richard Lee and Jonathan
13 Rosenberg, and Tanisha Edwards.

14 Thank you all so much for all of the hard work
15 that you did to get us to this place.

16 [APPLAUSE]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Thank you, Majority
18 Leader.

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, we will now
20 hear from Council Member Barron.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much.

22 My colleagues, you know that this budget should
23 be rejected. I have never seen a more reluctant
24 handshake by a speaker in all of my life. Matter of

25

2 fact, I only think she gave him three fingers. She
3 didn't even give him a whole hand.

4 This budget does not reflect what is needed in
5 this city! First of all, they gave us these
6 documents a few minutes before this meeting. They
7 should have given us a speed reading manual to go
8 with it.

9 This budget is during a time when there is an \$8
10 billion reserve fund. There's \$4.4 billion in
11 unexpected revenue. This is a surplus year. Last
12 year they said they needed... "this is going to be a
13 deficit year", that was a lie.

14 This budget still has major cuts to education;
15 healthcare; to our youth! This budget has cuts to
16 seniors, every major service is going to be cut. And
17 we should put in this budget the \$439 billion for our
18 retirees that this city has been paying for 57 years.
19 We are talking about lunchroom servers; we are
20 talking about traffic directors; we are talking about
21 EMS; and teachers. These retirees should be in this
22 budget! But, no, we decided to allow this mayor to
23 make these cuts. This is a conservative, I don't
24 even want to say closet republican, because he's out
25 of the closet. He's a conservative Republican mayor

2 who is engaging in austerity cuts that are not
3 necessary during a surplus year.

4 We should not have been talking about
5 enhancements not just cuts. So, I want to urge you
6 to vote no on this budget. This is not a fiscally
7 prudent budget [TIMER CHIMES]. This is a fiscally
8 oppressive budget for those in Black and Brown
9 communities in particular.

10 I will be voting no on this budget. And
11 encourage my colleagues my to do the same thing.
12 Don't make the same mistake... [CROSS-TALK]

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Council
14 Member...

15 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: that we made last year in
16 voting for a budget that cut money from vital
17 services, like education, and has a bloated police
18 budget... [CROSS-TALK]

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Council
20 Member.

21 [APPLAUSE]

22 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you. Please hold
23 your applause, folks. Please hold your applause,
24 thank you.

25 Do we have anyone else signed up?

2 Not seeing anyone, we will now move into the
3 Reports of Special Committees.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

5 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Reports of Standing
6 Committees?

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of The Committee on
8 Finance, Preconsidered Resolutions 703 and 704, base
9 percentage, current percentage and adjusted base
10 proportion?

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered Resolution 705,
13 transparency resolution.

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: M 141 and Preconsidered
16 Resolutions 706 and 707, Expense Revenue Contract
17 Budget, for Fiscal Year 2024?

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: M 142 and Preconsidered
20 Resolutions 708 and 709 Executive Capital Budget For
21 The Fiscal Year 2024?

22 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: M 143 and Preconsidered Resolution
24 710, Community Development Program Budget?

25 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered M 167 and Resolution
3 711 and Preconsidered M 168 and Resolution 712,
4 budget modifications?

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Preconsidered M 169 and Resolution
7 713, fixing the tax rate?

8 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled on General Orders.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: M 114 through M 157, various
10 budget documents?

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: Coupled to be filed.

12 I now ask that that clerk take a roll call vote
13 on all of the items coupled on today's General Orders
14 Calendar.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Abreu?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Permission to explain my
17 vote?

18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Permission granted.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ABREU: Thank you, Majority
20 Leader.

21 As we all know, this a very difficult budget for
22 a variety of reasons. However, I want to thank this
23 council for putting forward a bold and empathetic
24 vision in our initial budget response. And I want to
25 thank Speaker Adams, Chair Brannan, and the Budget

1
2 Negotiating Team for achieving as much of that vision
3 as possible.

4 Restoration rarely inspires any parades, but for
5 those affected by this restorations, they mean a
6 great deal. They are the difference between seeing
7 your favorite teacher instead of an empty classroom.
8 They are the difference between visiting your local
9 library to be welcomed by a librarian instead of
10 "closed" sign. They are the difference between
11 sending your child to a high quality 3-K program
12 instead of quitting your job, because childcare is
13 too costly.

14 Progress is never certain. It is up to us to
15 make hard choices and continue the fight to deliver
16 resources, services, and programs that help New
17 Yorkers live in peace and dignity. That fight will
18 not end today.

19 I am relieved that this budget will push the ball
20 forward on legal representation. The \$46 million,
21 and I'll say that again, *\$46 million* that this
22 council attained for criminal and legal services will
23 mean that New Yorkers will be able to stay in their
24 homes and have someone to stand by them in court.

2 If we want to protect our rights, we have to pay
3 the people who do the protecting. And that is what
4 this budget does.

5 I vote aye, thank you.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

7 Council Member Ariola?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Aye on all with the
9 exception of Resolutions M 169 and accompanying
10 Resolutions 713, 703, and 704.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you

12 Council Member Avilés?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Pass, I need to sort
14 something out, thank you.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Okay.

16 UNKNOWN: [INAUDIBLE] pass?

17 Council Member Ayala?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Okay, uhm, I need to
19 disclose on the record of the council proceedings
20 that one, AARC, the New York City Chapter of the New
21 York State Association for Retarded Children is
22 funded in the budget that we are adopting, and my
23 partner is an employee of that organization. And,
24 then, two, Positive Workforce is funded under this

1 budget that we are adopting, and my son and my
2 brother are associated with that organization.

3 And, with that, I vote aye.

4 Thank you to all of our colleagues for getting us
5 here today.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

7 Council Member Ariola for disclosure?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ARIOLA: Thank you for the
9 accommodation.

10 I am disclosing on the record of the Council
11 proceedings that the New York City Department of
12 Transportation is funded in the budget that we are
13 adopting, and my brother is an employee of that
14 entity; and that the New York City Department of
15 Sanitation is funded in the budgets that we are
16 adopting, and my son is an employee of that entity;
17 and the Howard Beach Lindenwood Civic is funded in
18 the budget that we are adopting, and my Chief of
19 Staff, Phyllis Inzerillo, is associated with that not
20 for profit.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

22 Council Member Barron?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: To explain my vote very
24 quickly, I just want you to know, uh, Malcolm X once
25

1 said, [* paraphrased] if a knife is in your back 9
2 inches and pull it out 6 inches, you're still fatally
3 wounded.
4

5 So, we need to understand that those
6 restorations, even the \$36 million to the libraries,
7 is on top of the cuts from last year. So, libraries
8 are struggling. And we can appreciate the
9 restorations, but we have the power. We have the
10 power to check this mayor. We have the power to tell
11 him, "No, this budget is unacceptable." So, he will
12 be lauded for having these restorations, there were
13 \$3 billion worth of cuts, and there are only, \$2 to
14 \$3 million worth of restorations.

15 So, on that I will vote no on M 141 and
16 accompanying Resolutions; I vote no on M 142 and the
17 accompanying Resolution; no on M 143 and the
18 accompanying Resolution, and one of those no votes
19 are against the Capital Budget, which they are not
20 even talking to you about -- \$169 billion for ten
21 years, and only \$2.5 billion for NYCHA. NYCHA needs
22 \$40 billion to be right.

23 And I also want to disclose that BRICK
24 [phonetic] is funded by the budget, and my son is an
25 employee of that entity.

2 But, this budget is wrong. The bible says [*
3 paraphrased] Where ones treasure is, so is their
4 heart. This is a heartless mayor.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Bottcher?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: Permission to explain my
7 vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER BOTTCHEER: No one is thrilled about
10 this budget. At the beginning of this process, we
11 were faced with draconian cuts across the board. And
12 this council has fought like hell to push back on
13 those cuts. And I am proud of Speaker Adams, the
14 Budget Negotiation Team, the Leader Team, and
15 everyone in this council who has been fighting the
16 past weeks and months. And we were able to beat back
17 significant cuts to this budget -- \$107 billion
18 budget, the biggest budget in the history of the
19 City. The budget was \$77 billion in 2014; \$92
20 billion in 2020. But, it still contains painful cuts
21 that none of us are celebrating. We restored funding
22 to the libraries, meals to seniors, Sanitation, and
23 we made historic investments in right to counsel,
24 expanding fair fares; there's a cost of living
25 adjustment; new money for early childhood education

1
2 so that working families can more easily enroll their
3 children in 3-K. And next year's budget is predicted
4 to be tough. There are significant budget gaps
5 predicted for next year. If the tax receipts break
6 our way, it might not be so bad. If they break the
7 other way, it could be very bad. But, I know that
8 this council will continue fighting to prioritize the
9 people in New York who are most vulnerable, who are
10 hurting the most right now. And that is what we have
11 done in this budget.

12 I vote aye. [TIMER CHIMES]

13 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Brannan?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER BRANNAN: Aye

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Brewer?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you. I particularly
17 want to thank the Speaker and Chair Brannan, and
18 certainly Richard Lee, Tanisha Edwards, Jonathan
19 Rosenberg, uh, Vanessa Diaz-Lopez, all the MDI staff
20 with Jimmy Reyes, Carolina Gil, and Owen Kotowski for
21 all of their amazing work, as well as colleagues. I
22 know that a whole lot of work went into these
23 discussions when you start with major, major cuts,
24 and a budget deficit.

2 So, I do want to particularly thank the work done
3 on COLAS, I know that this Human Services staff is
4 often the backbone of our city and I have great
5 respect for them. And will continue to fight for
6 even more increases in salaries.

7 I also want to thank the work that was done to
8 support the oversight agencies. If we don't have a
9 strong DOI and Board of Correction, and CCRB, then
10 agencies and will get away with things they should
11 not, as well individuals. And the public deserves
12 better.

13 Uhm, NYCHA obviously needs a lot more money, but
14 their vacancies need to be fixed. In one development,
15 in my district, as we sit here today, there are forty
16 vacancies. All apartments need to be fixed.

17 I want to thank the libraries, CUNY obviously
18 needs more funding, but it's a start.

19 Same thing meals for seniors. And Parks, we
20 still want to fight for 1%, but getting the small
21 amount for the staff is *always* important.

22 So, I vote aye. And look forward for the months
23 ahead to continuing to fight for the people who need
24 the support the most.

25 But, thank you to everybody who worked so hard.

COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Brooks-Powers?

COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Permission to explain my vote?

MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: From the moment the Preliminary Budget was released, we knew this would be a difficult cycle. We knew the City faced emergent fiscal challenges from the asylum seeker crisis to the reduction in available federal funding post pandemic. But, this council has always been clear about our approach to this budget. We are fiscally responsible when we invest in New Yorkers and essential programs and services we rely on every day. We create a virtuous cycle of equitable economic growth that supports and uplifts everyone, especially the most vulnerable in our city. That is why this council fought to restore the Mayor's cuts to critical services -- to our libraries, our schools, our seniors, and so much more -- to CUNY, and to NYCHA. We worked to expand funding for 3-K, and to secure a pay raise for nonprofit employees who work tirelessly and selflessly to fill gaps in services in each of our communities. And we negotiated an annual addition of \$20 million to the

1 Fair Fares program, a meaningful increase in the
2 level of funding to help hundreds of thousands more
3 low-income New Yorkers get where they need to go.

4 This budget is an imperfect result of
5 negotiation. And we understand there is still much
6 more work to be done. Fair Fares is an example. We
7 will continue to fight to expand eligibility
8 thresholds to include more residents in need who
9 benefit from this program. But, the budget reflects
10 the efforts of this council to *deliver* for the people
11 of New York.

12 I want to extend my thanks to Speaker Adrienne
13 Adams, for her steadfast leadership throughout this
14 budget cycle; our Finance Chair, Council Member
15 Brannan, for his tireless advocacy on and off the
16 dais; I want to thank the Speaker's Chief of Staff,
17 Jeremy John; First Deputy Chief of Staff, Faiza Ali;
18 and the entire Finance team, as well as Tanisha
19 Edwards; and, of course, Queens' own Richard Lee; as
20 well as all of the folks in the background that we
21 never hear about [TIMER CHIMES], but who are doing
22 the work.

23 I just want to make my disclosure as well. And,
24 so, I am disclosing on the record of the Council
25

2 proceedings that the Queens Alumnae Chapter of Delta
3 Sigma Theta Sorority, Inc. is funded in the budget
4 that we are adopting, and I am associated with that
5 organization. And that The Greater Allen A.M.E.
6 Cathedral of New York is funded in the budget we are
7 adopting, and I am associated with that entity. And
8 that Edge School of the Arts is funded in the budget
9 we are adopting, and my daughter is associated with
10 that organization.

11 With that, I vote aye.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Cabán?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Permission to explain my
14 vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.

17 I would like to begin with words of appreciation
18 for all of my colleagues who have spent the spring
19 pushing back against the mayor's cruel, dangerous
20 budget cuts, and putting forward a vision of a caring
21 New York City with safety and health for all of our
22 families, neighborhoods, and communities. And thank
23 you to Speaker Adams and her team, Finance Chair
24 Brannan and his team, all of Council Finance, the
25 Progressive Caucus, Women's Caucus, LGBTQIA+ Caucus,

2 and the Black, Latino, and Asian Caucus. Thank you
3 as well as to Comptroller Lander, Public Advocate
4 Williams, and the many, many, organizations who have
5 boldly fought for a budget based on care, not cuts.

6 Standing here today, I cannot help but recall the
7 confusion, the litigation, and the backlash that
8 followed last year's budget vote. In the midst of
9 that whirlwind, I joined several colleagues in
10 outlining a way to avoid the same result this year:
11 Release of the budget documents for consideration by
12 members of the public, press, and council at least
13 seventy-two hours before vote. And Mayor Adams has
14 not met that minimum standard this year. So, I have
15 not had nearly the time I'd need to adequately
16 scrutinize the budget I am called to vote on.

17 To the best of my understanding, in it the mayor
18 succeeded in defunding the Department of Health and
19 Mental Hygiene, in the midst of an urgent need
20 citywide mental health crisis, by about \$150 million;
21 defunding Small Business Services at a time when
22 shops are shutting down left and right because of
23 unaffordable rents by a stunning nearly thirty-five
24 percent; defunding the Department of Transportation,
25 after a year when traffic violence has claimed a

2 record number of District 22 lives by over \$30
3 million; defunding CUNY; housing and constructive
4 agencies, oversight agencies; labor protection
5 agencies, and the list goes on.

6 And all of this defunding to spite the fact that
7 the already bloated Police Budget is skyrocketing
8 this year by over a billion dollars.

9 This budget will inflict further hardships on
10 working class New Yorkers who are already suffering
11 from inflation and relentless bill hikes from Con
12 Edison, and the Mayor's handpicked Rent Guidelines
13 Board. [TIMER CHIMES]

14 I am going to wrap up...

15 But, not only that, but as he has shown over the
16 fiscal year, the mayor is happy to kick dirt in the
17 face of this entire process by ramming through
18 unpopular, harmful budget modifications that
19 undermine public safety and public health, for which
20 he doesn't even require council approval. So, any
21 restoration of funds we managed to win in these
22 budget negotiations, he might easily reverse later in
23 the year while continuing to abet the NYPD's
24 scandalous abuse of overtime.

25

2 And, so, in conclusion, for all of these reasons,
3 I am casting a no vote today as I did last year. No
4 on M 141, 142, and 143 and the accompanying
5 Resolutions.

6 Aye on the rest.

7 And, as I did last year, I affirm today that I am
8 ready and excited to vote aye on any budget that
9 reflects the priorities of District 22 constituents,
10 but reallocating funds from policing, prosecution,
11 and punishment to care, compassion, and community.
12 That's how we achieve true public safety, public
13 health, and a city that works for all us, not just
14 the wealthy few. Thank you.

15 [APPLAUSE]

16 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: All right, folks,
17 please... Please hold your applause. Please do
18 not... We have a lot of votes to get through. You
19 can snap instead of applause, but we need to make
20 sure we keep moving the meeting so people can vote,
21 thank you.

22 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Carr?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Permission to explain my
24 vote?

25 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

1 COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: Thank you, Majority Leader.

2 I just want to thank those who helped with local
3 initiatives and supported local initiatives for
4 Staten Island in particular, of course, our speaker
5 for showing herself to be a friend to our borough --
6 two budget cycles in a row --; my colleagues in the
7 Borough Delegation, our chair, Joe Borelli, and my
8 colleague, Kamillah Hanks for their partnership on
9 leadership across so many issues; and of course, the
10 many members of staff who listened to us and heard
11 our concerns and fought for things that were
12 important to our constituents; Jeremy John; Carlos
13 Beato; Tanisha Edwards, for all of her help and for
14 being a friend to me and my predecessors in my
15 district for the last several years; Richard Lee for
16 all of his work this year; as well as my own staff
17 Giuseppe Deserio; Lauren Centenario (phonetic); and
18 Peter Spencer from the Minority Leader's office.

19 And in particular, I just want to say good luck
20 and farewell to Ray Majewski. He was a wonderful
21 partner to everyone from my district, you know, Jim
22 Yadao (phonetic); Steve Matteo, I know they have
23 valued his partnership greatly, and I am no exception
24 to that. So, I wish you well, Ray, on your next
25

1 chapter, and we will miss you here when we have those
2 tough questions that we need to parse through. So,
3 thank you so much for everything you have done for
4 our city.
5

6 And, with that said, I am going to disclose on
7 the record of these council proceedings that the City
8 University of New York is funded in the budget that
9 we are adopting, and my spouse is a student at CUNY.
10 And the Italian Club of Staten Island and the Jewish
11 Community Center of Staten Island are being funded in
12 the budget that we are adopting, and I am a member of
13 both organizations.

14 With that said, I'll be voting no on M 169 and
15 accompanying Resolution 713, as well as Resolutions
16 703 and 704, and aye on the rest.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member De La Rosa?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Permission to explain
19 my vote?

20 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you.

22 I would first like to thank Speaker Adams who has
23 courageously led this body in budget negotiations
24 despite the many obstacles thrown her way. Speaker
25 Adams, your steadfast actions leading up to this vote

1 today have made me feel proud to be a member of this
2 body. I also want to thank our colleagues and
3 leadership and BMT, plus all of the Finance staff who
4 have worked arduously over the last few months to
5 secure wins in our budget that safeguard access to
6 critical services which this mayor attempted to cut.
7 The unfortunate reality we must face is that this was
8 an effort that should have never been needed in the
9 first place. Because cuts to critical services
10 should never have been on the table. This is a
11 council that in its efforts identified \$2.7 billion
12 in additional revenue. We have had to fight to
13 convince a mayor of a city coming out of a pandemic,
14 and facing compounding crises, that working people in
15 our city need our help. For a mayor who puts the
16 priority on public safety, words ring hollow when we
17 continue inflating an NYPD budget that is greater
18 than several agencies combined, yet there is not
19 enough investment on the true remedies to public
20 safety -- like permanent housing, health services,
21 stable employment, or adequate reentry services. This
22 budget does not fully remedy previous PEGS, forcing
23 city agencies to operate at lower levels when demand
24 for assistance is at an all-time high. Constituent
25

1 Services staffers across our city can attest to this
2 reality, when we are forced to scrape together
3 resources to feed constituents who have had their
4 public assistance shut off, or rescue tenants in
5 ever-dilapidated NYCHA elevators. While there are
6 wins in this budget, because of the efforts of this
7 council this is only the first step. We cannot
8 guarantee that this mayor will not attempt to impose
9 further cuts down the line.
10

11 I want to remind our colleagues that our power is
12 derived from the people we serve. And this council
13 has its work cut out for us. We must continue to
14 push back to ensure that working people across our
15 city can feel the fights we have fought on their
16 behalf. They deserve a budget that fully addresses
17 their needs and safeguard their ability to thrive in
18 our city -- I'm wrapping up -- a budget that centers
19 all New Yorkers, our children and families, our newly
20 arrived migrant neighbors, our city's workforce --
21 including our human service workers, those inflicted
22 by mental illness and substance abuse, those
23 returning home from incarceration. This budget falls
24 short of delivering for these vulnerable populations,
25 and it did not have to come to this.

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 58
2 For those reasons, I will be voting no on this
3 budget today. I vote no on M 141 and M 142 and the
4 accompanying resolutions.

5 I also want to disclose on the record that
6 Washington Heights Tenant Association is funded in
7 this budget, and my daughter is associated with this
8 nonprofit. And, also, the DOE is funded in this
9 budget, and my daughter is associated with this
10 nonprofit. Thank you.

11 [APPLAUSE]

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Folks, please hold your
13 applause, thank you. We've asked three times.

14 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Dinowitz?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER DINOWITZ: I am disclosing on the
16 record of the Council proceedings that New York
17 Presbyterian Columbia University Family Medical
18 Center is funded in the budget we are adopting, and
19 my mother is an employee and that entity.

20 I also want to thank ,you know, especially the
21 Finance staff who was up all hours of the night
22 working on this, especially, Ray. I am going to miss
23 all of his lectures on the economy and economics. I
24 learned a lot from you. Of course, our Speaker;
25 Finance Chair, Justin Brannan; and all of my

1
2 colleagues who pushed for ,you know, a lot of
3 important priorities in this budget. And I think a
4 lot about the work that we do as elected officials.
5 Even just today walking to my office, walking towards
6 my office, I have a library right down the block from
7 my district office, and there were people waiting
8 outside to get into the library. And because of the
9 fights we had, and because of this budget, the doors
10 to that library will stay open for our continents and
11 for my constituents.

12 I got a call even just this morning about a woman
13 who is facing eviction, and because of our fight, we
14 are investing money in legal services, so that women
15 like that, and their families, and everyone else have
16 a better chance of staying in their homes.

17 On the subway today I saw a great advertisement
18 for CUNY ASAP, and we fought very hard, not just to
19 beat back cuts to CUNY, but to specially name
20 advisor, ACE and ASAP, as programs that we are going
21 to fund in this council. Programs that help give our
22 students a better chance at success, help keep them
23 in school, double graduation rates, and make their
24 lives, and the lives of all New Yorkers, better.

2 We in this council did that. We didn't get
3 everything we wanted. There was a lot that we didn't
4 get. And there is a lot of work that needs to be
5 done. But, I know that my constituents and New
6 Yorkers all over the city are better off because of
7 how hard we fought for this budget, how much we
8 worked as a team, and I vote aye.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Farías?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER FARÍAS: I am disclosing on the
11 record of the council proceedings that NYU Langone is
12 funded in the budget we are adopting, and my mother
13 is an employee of that entity. And that the New York
14 City Department of Education is funded in the budget
15 we are adopting, and my sibling is a student at that
16 entity.

17 I also want to take a moment to thank the entire
18 Finance team, and I vote aye on all.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Feliz?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Permissive to explain my
21 vote?

22 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER FELIZ: Thank you, Majority Leader.

24 As we all know, this is not an easy budget. Not
25 an easy budget due to many reasons including the

1 unexpected costs we have had from the migrant crisis.
2 Funds that we were proud to take on, because these
3 migrants needed help, but costs and realities that
4 were not foreseen.
5

6 I vote aye on this budget. It includes many
7 victories that we should all be proud of, including
8 and especially victories of the issue and the topic
9 of 3-K and Pre-K early childbirth programs. These
10 programs make a tremendous difference in the lives of
11 our children, and I am talking about our youngest
12 children, our youngest students, as young as three
13 and four years old. These programs also make a big
14 difference in the lives of our parents, including and
15 especially, new parents. I am proud that we are
16 expanding 3-K and Pre-K programs, creating nearly
17 2,000 new seats for full day and year-round 3-K and
18 Pre-K programs. These programs are life changing,
19 and we need to make sure that they are truly, but
20 truly accessible for all, including and especially
21 low income families. We need to make sure that child
22 is left behind, and assure that every child,
23 regardless of the zip code they live in, has access
24 to these life changing programs. Expansion of 3-K
25 and Pre-K will help archive that, it is an investment

2 in our youngest students, an investment that we
3 should all be proud of.

4 So, I proudly vote aye on all, and thank you so
5 much. And congratulations to everyone, including our
6 speaker, and everyone fought so that we could achieve
7 everything that we achieved, thank you.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Gennaro?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER GENNARO: Aye

10 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Gutiérrez?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: Permission to explain
12 my vote?

13 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GUTIÉRREZ: In negotiating this
15 budget, Speaker Adams has had an impossible task.
16 Instead of starting from a place of opportunity, she
17 was forced to push back against cut after cut
18 proposed by this mayor. I want to thank her for
19 standing strong and for fighting like hell for our
20 centuries old institutions like our libraries, and
21 restoring cuts made to CUNY programs. These are
22 engines of opportunities that this mayor would have
23 crippled if given the chance. I am deeply proud of
24 the victories this council achieved. Meaningful
25 steps to rethink our childcare infrastructure,

1 including Promise NYC, capital funding for
2 desperately needed affordable housing, and expanding
3 Fair Fares. But, my community is drowning. We are
4 drowning in displacement, in evictions, in food
5 insecurity, and in childcare costs. And this budget
6 leaves the City gasping for air. Thousands of
7 nonprofit social service workers, predominantly women
8 of color, flooded our streets asking humbly to be
9 lifted up out of poverty wages. This budget denied
10 them the salary increases they are entitled to, while
11 somehow managing to provide six years of backpay for
12 the NYPD -- and windfall that no other essential City
13 employees will receive. This mayor's priorities are
14 clear, from budget cuts to social service agencies,
15 to giving less and expecting more. The mayor is
16 placing the burden of the City's success on the backs
17 of the people on the frontlines without providing
18 them the resources they deserve. These people are my
19 constituents and my neighbors, and I cannot sign my
20 name onto a budget that allows them to fail.

22 The mayor's budget fails our schools, our
23 parents, our tenants, our unhoused, our seniors, and
24 it frames our economy of care as a question up for
25 debate rather than a requirement for our success. As

1
2 the forces of gentrification intensity and the cost
3 of living continue to rise, the working class and the
4 working poor are increasingly being pushed out of the
5 neighborhoods they've built. As a community
6 organizer, I will use every tool at my disposal to
7 fight back against the forces that would erase my
8 communities. And that includes voting no on a budget
9 that does not go far enough to meet our needs.

10 [TIMER CHIMES]

11 I look forward to working with my colleagues on
12 real structural change that reimagines what it looks
13 like to serve New Yorkers.

14 I vote no on this budget and no on M 141 and M
15 142 with its accompanying resolutions.

16 And I am also disclosing on the record of the
17 council proceedings that the New York City
18 Department of Social Services is funded in the budget
19 we are adopting, and my husband is an employee of
20 that entity; and that Maimonides Hospital is funded
21 in the budget we are adopting, and my sister is an
22 employee of that entity, thank you.

23 [APPLAUSE]

24 SPEAKER ADAMS: Ladies and gentlemen... Ladies
25 and gentleman, we understand your enthusiasm, the

1
2 Majority Leader has asked twice... three times now,
3 to please hold your applause. We ask for your
4 respect in these chambers as the meeting continues.
5 If it happens one more time, I will ask the Sergeant
6 At Arms to please remove those who do not respect the
7 wishes to hold the applause, thank you very much.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Hanif?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Permission to explain my
10 vote?

11 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: I vote no, I do so with
13 deep appreciation for Speaker Adams and the entire
14 Budget Negotiation Team which secured significant
15 restorations to the Mayor's proposed cuts for
16 critical agencies and programs, including libraries
17 and Promise NYC. I proudly stood with them and many
18 of my colleagues as we fought back against austerity,
19 and united to deliver what working New Yorkers
20 deserve. However, the austerity that the mayor
21 forced through is too destructive for me to endorse.
22 From cradle to college the mayor has insisted on
23 slashing our educational system. The promise of
24 universal 3-K was scheduled to be fully realized this
25 year, but this budget caused many families in my

1 district to have their 3-K applications rejected.
2
3 Despite strong efforts to hold our public schools
4 harmless, this budget is requiring schools to excess
5 critical staff with deeper cuts still on the table
6 for the fall.

7 This budget also applies significant cuts to
8 CUNY, the economic driver that has allowed students,
9 especially students of color like me, to become our
10 city's next generation of leaders.

11 This austerity is also reflected in the mayor's
12 shortsighted refusal to allocate any new legal
13 services funding for the over 80,000 asylum seekers
14 our city has welcomed. This refusal will limit the
15 ability of our newest neighbors to get work
16 authorization, leaving them dependent on a strained
17 shelter system. The mayor loves to talk about how we
18 are in a crisis, yet with the budget and veto of the
19 CityFHEPS package, he has been unwilling to take the
20 urgent steps needed to get us out of said crisis.

21 While this budget administers cuts across the
22 board, the already bloated NYPD budget is increasing
23 by a staggering \$1.85 billion, effectively boosting
24 police spending by seventeen percent. We are giving
25

2 the police a blank check while starving the social
3 services that keep our communities safe.

4 As co-chair of the Progressive Caucus, chair of
5 the Immigration Committee, and council member for the
6 39th district, I cannot approve this budget. My
7 community sent me here to fight for a New York that
8 provides [TIMER CHIMES] a worldclass public education
9 to young people, lives up to our values as a
10 sanctuary city, and prioritizes care over cages. In
11 order to best represent them, I must vote no on M
12 141, M 142, and the accompanying resolutions, thank
13 you.

14 [APPLAUSE]

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: We are going to hold a
16 second while we clear upstairs, thank you.

17 [APPLAUSE]

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Hanks?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER HANKS: Thank you, Mr. Majority
20 Leader. Thank you Speaker Adrienne Adams, Chair
21 Brannon and everyone who worked on this effort in
22 pulling us through another budget season. I also
23 want to echo the sentiments of Council Member Carr,
24 part of my Staten Island Delegation, with that, I
25 vote aye on all, with the exception of M 169 and the

2 accompanying resolutions 703, 705, and 713, thank
3 you.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

5 Council Member Holden?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: [NO RESPONSE]

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Hudson?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Permission to explain my
9 vote?

10 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HUDSON: Today's budget adoption is
12 a testament to the Council's will to serve as a
13 counterweight to a mayor wholly unconcerned with the
14 material well-being of New Yorkers. From the
15 Preliminary Budget to the Executive Budget, Mayor
16 Adams was firm in his position to starve the programs
17 most important to vulnerable New Yorkers. This
18 administration made concerted efforts to slash
19 hundreds of millions of dollars from the programs our
20 communities rely on most, from libraries to meals for
21 older adults. However, this council, under the
22 leadership of Speaker Adams, held firm. Speaker
23 Adams secured critical wins while negotiating with an
24 unreliable and ideologically divergent
25 administration. An accomplishment that would not

1 NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 69
2 have been possible without the tireless advocacy of
3 so many partners, providers, and our own neighbors.
4 This budget, while not wholly sufficient, fully
5 restores funding for our city's library systems,
6 maintains investments in our cultural institutions,
7 expands funding for the MTA's Fair Fares program,
8 baselines funding for the City's Right to Counsel
9 program, secures millions to bolster the City's
10 crisis management system, and entirely restores
11 funding for CUNY among other wins.

12 And as chair of the Council's Committee on Aging,
13 I am heartened by the restoration of funding for
14 older adult services, clawing back many of the cuts
15 this administration made. With the most progressive
16 city council in city's history, and the invaluable
17 work of grassroots organizations, it is clear we are
18 making inroads in reforming broken systems that need
19 deeper investment.

20 The NYPD still has too much money. Period.
21 Thought we cannot control the agency's outrageous
22 overtime spending, and have no role in negotiation
23 with The Police Benevolent Association, we held the
24 line on the elements we do control, like the
25 Operating Budget, which has not increased.

2 If it wasn't already apparent, this budget made
3 clear that the Council does not have a willing
4 forthright partner in this administration. Mayor
5 Adams' concessions are neither generous nor willing.
6 They are council and community wins, and they are
7 affirm to continue building a city that leads with
8 principals of care, compassion, and believe that New
9 Yorkers deserve the services to which they are
10 entitled, not an analysis of what they can do
11 without.

12 I am disclosing on the record of the council
13 proceedings that the Museum of the City of New York
14 is funded in the [TIMER CHIMES] budget we are
15 adopting, and my spouse is associated that entity.

16 I vote aye on all.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

18 Council Member Joseph?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Permission to explain my
20 vote?

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER JOSEPH: Over the last few months,
23 my colleagues, under the leadership of Speaker Adams,
24 fought tooth and nail for priorities that mattered to
25 New Yorkers. This was particularly challenging

1 budget negotiations due to restoring many of the cuts
2 proposed in the mayor's Executive Budget. We were
3 large successful in pushing back against some of the
4 most [INAUDIBLE] components. Through the budgets, we
5 were able to get \$4 billion in capital for affordable
6 housing, our NYCHA repairs, CUNY, libraries, mental
7 health continuum, community schools, Promise NYC,
8 immigrants, family engagement, art education,
9 shelter-based coordinators for foster youth, Work,
10 Learn & Grow.

12 When it came to ensuring that we put our New York
13 City as our priority, early childhood was not left
14 behind. We were able to convert seats, school year
15 extended seats as well.

16 But, let me be clear, the mayor and his
17 administration continue to slash budgets for vital
18 services like housing and mental health while
19 protecting and expanding the NYPD's bloated budget.
20 Continuing down this path will strip care and
21 services from most the vulnerable New Yorkers.

22 If we truly believe in the notion "if we do not
23 education, we will incarcerate", there must be ample
24 investment in New York City's children. Within our
25 public school system there are more school cops than

1
2 counselors, school workers, and restorative justice
3 coordinators. It is not enough to tell New York's
4 students that we care about them, we must show them
5 that when they walk into their school buildings. A
6 student who is happy, has access to help, resources,
7 and extra curriculars, that is the true essence of
8 what public safety is.

9 The budget is not perfect, there are some wins
10 for New Yorkers. But, we cannot keep fighting these
11 budget battles strictly on a restorative basis.

12 I am committing to holding the mayors' feet to
13 the fire when it comes to fully funding our schools,
14 preventing midyear adjustment cuts, advocating for
15 high quality education that all New Yorker City
16 students deserve.

17 Rest assured that this council will use every
18 tool at our disposable to address the growing crisis
19 we are facing around homelessness, affordability, and
20 [TIMER CHIMES] mental health.

21 I am proud of what we were able to accomplish
22 thus far, and I applaud Speaker Adams for her
23 leadership through this process. To the advocates who
24 have been on the frontlines doing this work, I say,
25 thank you.

1 Our work is not done. I look forward to fighting
2 for what New York City truly deserves with a focus on
3 abundance not scarcity.
4

5 I vote aye.

6 And, on the record, I would like to disclose that
7 my son... the Department of Education is funded in
8 this budget, and my son is a student, thank you.

9 COMMITTEE CLERK: thank you.

10 Council Member Hanif?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER HANIF: Thank you.

12 I am disclosing on the record of the council
13 proceedings that New York Immigration Coalition is
14 funded in the budget we are adopting, and my fiancé
15 is associated with that entity, thank you.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, Council Member.

17 Council Member Kagan?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER KAGAN: Thank you.

19 I am disclosing on the record of the council
20 proceedings that the City University of New York is
21 funded in this budget we are adopting, and my
22 daughter is a student at that entity.

23 I am voting no on the budget, and am voting yes
24 on Preconsidered Resolution 705 -- basically it's the
25 transparency resolution. It is the only resolution I

2 am voting yes. And I am voting no on everything
3 else.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, Council Member.
5 Council Member Krishnan?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: Permission to explain my
7 vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: First, for disclosures I
10 am disclosing on the record of the council
11 proceedings that one: the Bronx Defenders is funded
12 in this budget that we are adopting, and my wife is
13 an employee of that entity. And, that, two: The New
14 York City Department of Education is funded in the
15 budget we are adopting, and my son... both my
16 children are students of that entity.

17 The budget is the single most important piece of
18 legislation every year. It is negotiated between the
19 mayor and the council. It sends paychecks to nurses,
20 teachers, and lifeguards. It fills sinkholes and
21 paves streets. It brings textbooks to schools, and
22 picture books to libraries. And this year's budget
23 was a win by our council against the mayor's bleak
24 vision for our city.

1 This year's budget addresses our city's
2 challenges head on. For the first time ever, we will
3 provide full year, fulltime, free early childhood
4 care to thousands of working parents. We will spend
5 \$4 billion to build new affordable housing. And for
6 our New York City Parks Department, we won new parks
7 workers and lifeguards, and we restored the positions
8 for urban park rangers.

9 And as a former housing attorney, I am proud that
10 we in the city council led the charge to finally fund
11 a true right to counsel for New Yorkers who are
12 facing eviction or unjust criminal prosecution. We
13 will give a record \$41 million to our housing lawyers
14 and public defenders to guarantee New Yorkers' right
15 to an attorney. This is a historic investment. And,
16 let me be clear, one that I know personally, how
17 historic it is, because we have not seen such an
18 investment in legal services in years past. These
19 are wins.

20 We also fought and won against the mayor's cuts
21 to so many institutions that working families of New
22 York City depend on. There will be no cuts to our
23 libraries. No cuts to school budgets. No cuts to 3-
24 K, or CUNY programs.

2 This council will not let our city fail our
3 families. We pulled this budget away...

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KRISHNAN: May I conclude?

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead... [CROSS-TALK]

7 We pulled this budget away from the mayor's
8 austerity, and towards the abundant New York City
9 that our council believes in. But, there is still
10 much work to do in the years ahead. We need at least
11 one percent of the budget for Parks. We need to pay
12 our City and nonprofit workers what they are worth.
13 We need to put people in homes and make sure they can
14 stay there. And we cannot keep throwing good money
15 after bad -- more money towards NYPD and corrections
16 already bloated budgets has not made us more safe in
17 our communities, it never will. We need to build a
18 safe, fair, flourishing city for all. That is the
19 work ahead.

20 And, so, having stood with the activists on the
21 steps of City Hall, having fought alongside my
22 Colleagues in the Council every single step of the
23 way, to make critical investments and reverse dire
24 cuts, I now proudly stand with my colleagues to vote
25 yes on this budget.

2 I would also like to thank Speaker Adams, our
3 Council leadership, our Finance Team, Tanisha
4 Edwards, Richard Lee, Ray, and all of this city
5 council who have worked so hard get to this point.
6 Thank you.

7 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

8 Council Member Lee?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Permission to explain my
10 vote?

11 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEE: Good afternoon, colleagues.
13 It has been a long and hard budget negotiation, and
14 there are many great wins against the mayor's cuts
15 that are worth highlighting here, including funding
16 for our libraries, parks, early childhood education,
17 CUNY, programs to baseline funding for older adults.

18 And we often talk as a council about supporting
19 and funding the folks who work in the gaps between
20 city services. These nonprofit workers who I am
21 talking about are our everyday heroes. When there
22 are cuts to city agencies and programming, they are
23 the ones stepping up to the plate and shouldering
24 that weight.

25

1 So, am very proud that as a council we fought
2 hard to secure the \$40 million in baselined salary
3 enhancements for the nonprofit workers, and an
4 additional \$50 million for the next fiscal year. And
5 that is all is build upon the \$68 million that was
6 baselined for salary enhancements we secured last
7 year -- which is three consecutive years of
8 incremental wins that *this* council has delivered for
9 our nonprofit workers. This is a workforce that has
10 been neglected and undervalued for many years. There
11 is a lot of lost time and ground to make up, and one
12 or two budget cycles alone will not do the trick.
13 But, these numbers are a testament to the long term
14 commitment of this council and its leadership when it
15 comes to supporting our nonprofit workers and
16 continuing the fight for true COLAS in their
17 contracts with the City.

19 I want to thank Speaker Adams and Chair Brannan
20 for their leadership. I also want to thank those who
21 I know in this council have been fighting extremely
22 hard, including Council Member Brewer, as well as
23 Council Member Stevens. And thank you for allowing
24 me to contribute to these efforts and discussions
25 these past few months.

1
2 And with that, I proudly vote yes on this budget,
3 which also comes with my commitment to continuing
4 this fight to make sure that our nonprofit workers
5 get the COLAS that they deserve.

6 And, also with that, I am also disclosing on the
7 record of the council proceedings that the New York
8 City Department of Education is funded in the budget
9 we are adopting and my child is associated with this
10 entity.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

12 Council Member Louis?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Permission to explain my
14 vote?

15 Majority Leader Go ahead.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Thank you, Majority Leader.

17 I want to applaud Speaker Adams, Chair Brannan,
18 and the entire Finance Team for the dedication to
19 this budget. But, I particularly want to thank those
20 that I annoyed on the Finance Team, Tanisha, Richard,
21 Jimmy, Savannah, Paul, Crilhien, Eisha, and Ivan from
22 OMB, thank you for taking all of my calls. I really
23 appreciate of this Finance team and all of your hard
24 work to help fifty-one members navigate through a
25 tight budget process. Despite the draconian cuts,

2 and those cuts do not pinch, they hurt, Speaker Adams
3 and the BNT were innovative when getting wins for
4 childcare, CUNY, COLA, and other programs and
5 institutions. Responsible stewards also have to make
6 difficult decisions, and despite those difficult
7 decisions, we have a responsibility to deliver for
8 New Yorkers, and deliver a budget to operate a city
9 in dire need of services. Therefore, the fight does
10 continue.

11 Once again, I would like to thank Speaker Adams,
12 Chair Brannan, and the Finance Team, and all those
13 got us to the finish line to ensure that we are
14 dedicated to the progress of our city.

15 I vote aye on all.

16 And I would also like to disclose on the record
17 for the council proceedings that the MTA,
18 Metropolitan Transportation Authority, is funded in
19 the budget that we are adopting, and my brother is an
20 employee with this entity. Thank you.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

22 Council Member Marte?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: Permission to explain my
24 vote?

25 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER MARTE: I am disclosing on the
3 record of the council's proceeding that the Fortune
4 Society is funded in the budget that we are adopting
5 and my brother is associated with that entity.

6 I would like to thank my Budget Director,
7 Berenice, council Finance, and my staffers Ian Wong
8 (phonetic), and Henry Lin (phonetic), we are going to
9 miss you.

10 I vote no on M 141, M 142 and accompanying
11 resolutions, and I vote yes on the rest, thank you.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you
13 Council Member Mealy?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MEALY: I vote aye on all.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Menin?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: Permission to explain my
17 vote?

18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER MENIN: I am disclosing on the
20 record that the National September 11th Memorial and
21 Museum is funded in the budget we are adopting, and I
22 am associated with that entity. And, secondly, TADA!
23 Youth Theater and Dance Alliance is funded in the
24 budget, and my daughter has attended classes there.

2 So, first of all, I want to thank the speaker, I
3 want to thank the council Finance and Budget
4 Negotiating Team for handling the very arduous task
5 of agreeing on the City Budget through these
6 difficult times. This is clearly not a perfect
7 budget, but we avoided cuts that would have decimated
8 funding to early childhood education, to libraries,
9 and to CUNY.

10 The cut to these vital institutions and programs
11 would have rendered just tremendous, tremendously
12 deleterious impacts. And I really want to thank the
13 speaker for preventing this from happening.

14 This council was able to prevent cuts to DOE
15 programs and baselined \$15 million to convert 1,800
16 3-K seats into 3-K extended day. This investment
17 keeps New Yorkers in the workforce while their
18 children receive a high quality early childhood
19 education. I also want to say that certain
20 investments are very important in affordable housing,
21 Fair Fares, and in sanitation services were
22 incredibly important.

23 I want to thank Speaker Adams, Jeremy John,
24 Tanisha Edwards, Richard Lee, and my council

2 colleagues who fought for and prioritized these wins,
3 thank you.

4 I vote aye, thank you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you, Council Member.

6 Council Member Moya?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye.

8 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

9 Council Member Narcisse?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: Permission to explain my
11 vote?

12 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: This budget today
14 respects the fiscal reality of our economic status.
15 What I mean by that, we have \$10 billion from the
16 federal level that we are not having. We have over
17 \$500 billion from the federal and millions from the
18 state. We heard it. It has been difficult. I have
19 not seen a perfect budget from the aspect of my
20 business life.

21 Today, it is kind of... I am kind of
22 disappointed to some level, because knowing that we,
23 every day, the Council team, the Finance Team, the
24 speaker, the Finance Chair, every day, in and out, in
25 all of the teams, my colleagues, we fought very, very

1 hard. And we are very diverse, from different levels
2 of life. Understand some of us have been in
3 business, some of us have been volunteers all over.
4 Understand the inequities in our communities. So,
5 for some of my colleagues, who are talking about \$107
6 billion, and many of you know that \$107 billion is
7 not us deciding on this \$107 billion... [BACKGROUND
8 NOISE]
9

10 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Council Member Moya,
11 please turn your microphone off!

12 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: So, we are not the ones,
13 unfortunately, for whatever, we are not the one
14 deciding on all that money. We wish we were the one
15 that's kind of, uh, magic wand, and say, this is what
16 we want. And I believe that everyone here will be
17 laughing, will be clapping, will be having a party,
18 because that would be our decision. But, let's focus
19 on the positive side of this, where we started from
20 zero, and, then, we were able to have so many wins.
21 We are talking about NYCHA. We are talking about the
22 3-K [TIMER CHIMES]. We are talking about libraries.
23 We are talking about the pay parity. Fair Fares. We
24 are talking about mental health. Me, as a nurse over
25 three decades, seeing those difficulties, because

2 without food on your table, you cannot eat every
3 night. Without a shelter... We have been hit so
4 hard over 81,000 asylum seekers in the city of New
5 York. We are trying to deal with all of that. And
6 my colleagues understand that we do not have the
7 override over a \$107 billion. We know that for a
8 fact. And did so much... [CROSS-TALK]

9 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Council
10 Member...

11 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: to reach that level.

12 So, I want to say thank you again to everyone
13 that participated and not being a hypocrite to the
14 system, and understanding what took place, how hard
15 we put our hearts and souls in to make sure the city
16 of New York continues running. Because if we did not
17 make the decision today, organizations would not be
18 functioning in the city of New York... [CROSS-TALK]

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Council
20 Member, we need to hear [INAUDIBLE] votes... [CROSS-
21 TALK]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER NARCISSE: so, thank you, and I
23 vote aye to everyone with respect for all of you,
24 thank you.

25 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

2 Council Member Nurse?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Thank you.

4 Good afternoon, colleagues, I just want to begin
5 by remembering a New York City Legend Carl Stubbs.

6 [SNAPPING]

7 COUNCIL MEMBER NURSE: Carl Stubbs was an activist
8 and freedom fighter with VOCAL-NY. In May of this
9 year, he finally secured an apartment for himself
10 after constantly fighting for others. And
11 unfortunately, Carl passed away today after a battle
12 with pancreatic cancer. And I want to remember him
13 as we vote for this budget. There are thousands of
14 people like Carl who need help, and as I vote today,
15 I am thinking about this budget may or may not have
16 met his needs.

17 I want to thank Speaker Adams for leading the
18 Council in what we all know is an incredibly
19 difficult budget negotiation. I want to thank
20 council Finance staff, thank you for folks who
21 answered my calls. Thank you to all of my
22 constituents for reaching out and sharing your
23 concerns.

24 I am truly grateful that we got the restorations
25 of critical programs. But, as the speaker said

1
2 yesterday at the handshake, this is budget is a
3 restorative budget. The mayor has created an
4 environment that is combative and deeply concerning.
5 This budget is the result of the mayor cultivating a
6 negotiating train that precluded any opportunities
7 for a transformational or expanded progressive
8 agenda. New Yorkers should be alarmed that we were
9 forced to fight for basics like public higher
10 education, meals for seniors, money for oversight
11 agencies. And despite a 100,000 cases clogging
12 eviction court, this administration refused to fully
13 fund Right to Counsel, many New Yorkers will be
14 evicted and displaced this year.

15 It is abundantly clear that these proposed cuts
16 were a shallow, thinly veiled negotiating tactic as
17 opposed to practices in good or collaborative
18 governance. And I am really hopeful that it is clear
19 that this is going to be a very long fight for the
20 next couple of years.

21 It is alarming that the mayor [TIMER CHIMES] is
22 cutting \$17 million to reentry programs that help
23 individuals find housing, stay off drugs, and get
24 jobs, while not adequately funding the mental health
25 components we need like hospital-based mobile

2 treatment teams, more respite centers, or OPCs. We
3 again see the over emphasis on traditional policing
4 reflected in the NYPD receiving retroactive pay
5 raises that go back *six years*, while sixty percent of
6 our human service providers, who carry out lifesaving
7 services, are forced to rely on public assistance.
8 These human service providers are public safety
9 workers, who carry out essential survival services,
10 and we need to affirm their value in their paychecks.

11 I am saying no to how this mayor is governing and
12 his approach to the City Budget.

13 We are not fighting against just this year's
14 cuts, but a considerable gutting of public capacity
15 and CBO capacity to not just do the bare minimum, but
16 help New Yorkers thrive. New Yorkers need more.

17 And, with that, I vote nay on M 141, M 142, and
18 the accompanying resolutions, thank you.

19 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Holden?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: I would like to disclose
21 on the record that my son is an adjunct lecturer at
22 CUNY of which we are voting on today under
23 transparency.

24

25

2 And I vote aye on all except M 169 and
3 accompanying resolution 713 and 703 and 704, thank
4 you.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

6 Council Member Ossé?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: Permission to explain my
8 vote?

9 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER OSSÉ: This is the most important
11 decision made by the city government each year. At
12 our hands is the world's largest municipal budget,
13 funding vital services for nine million people. This
14 is a \$100 billion that can be used to heal. *\$100*
15 *billion* that can set the globe's greatest city on a
16 path toward recovery and prosperity or maintain a
17 status quo. And this city council has been given an
18 impossible task. Everyone in this room has been
19 forced to spend a year performing the hardest part of
20 this job -- to be a check and a balance to the mayor.

21 At every turn, the mayor has tried to bleed our
22 city dry to serve his truth constituents: Corporate
23 interest and the carceral state. When this body
24 should have been devoting our energy to *servicing*
25 neighbors, we have been forced instead to defend them

1
2 against an executive who is on a campaign of
3 fearmongering and division.

4 This mayor has decided to rule instead of lead,
5 slashing the sources of true public safety in my
6 community, like education and social services, than
7 insisting history's largest police budget is the only
8 way to clean up his mess. He has negotiated in bad
9 faith, stripping tens of millions of dollars from
10 starving agencies, then expecting us to praise him
11 for returning what he stole. But, Malcolm X said,
12 "If you stick a knife in my back 9 inches and pull it
13 out 6 inches, there's no progress". I will not thank
14 this mayor for those six inches. I will continue to
15 fight to pull that knife out of New York's back and
16 heal its wounds.

17 I want to thank Speaker Adams for her clear-eyed
18 leadership, waging a defensive fight for all New
19 Yorkers. I want to thank the Budget Negotiation Team
20 for playing the best they could with the hand they
21 were dealt when the mayor had already rigged the deck
22 and bought the table.

23 This council has outdone itself in shielding New
24 York from the mayor's worse impulses, and you have
25 made your constituents proud.

2 I vote to say that a city full of cops but short
3 on housing, a city that fills Rikers but gambles with
4 preschools, is a city beneath the dignity of its
5 people. Our rallying cry is not to restore the cuts,
6 but to reimagine what New York can be [TIMER CHIMES]
7 reinvest our resources to get there, and renew the
8 relationship between government and citizens.

9 The budget passing today is strategic, letting us
10 live to fight another day while securing some very
11 real wins for our people. But, the greatest city in
12 the world deserves the best. New Yorkers and the
13 people of Bed-Stuy and Crown Heights deserve not
14 just to survive but to thrive.

15 I vote no, and I most especially vote no on M
16 141, M 142, and all accompanying resolutions, thank
17 you.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Paladino?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: Permission to explain my
20 vote?

21 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

22 COUNCIL MEMBER PALADINO: I am proud that this
23 budget keeps the NYPD whole, even as we have
24 difficult budget due to the revenue difficulties and
25 the migrant crisis. I disagree with some of my

1
2 colleagues in Council, we need our police, and they
3 need they be funded.

4 I vote aye on all except for M 169, Resolution
5 713, Resolution 703, and Resolution 704, thank you.

6 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

7 Council Member Restler?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RESTLER: I would like to disclose
9 on the record that the Mercantile Library
10 Association, also known as the Center for Fiction,
11 and the Brooklyn Heights Association are funded in
12 this budget, and my mom serves on the board of both
13 organizations, so thanks to your service to those
14 groups, Mom.

15 I want to begin by thanking my staff, especially
16 my brilliant Policy Budget Legislation Director,
17 Molly Haley, Chief Mariana Alexander, and everyone
18 who worked on this. The great team at Council
19 Finance, BMT, Chair Brannan, and especially the
20 speaker for courageously and consistently fighting
21 back and securing many crucial restorations in the
22 face of the mayor's disastrous budget proposals.

23 We all know that our city is in crisis. And
24 instead of the mayor forging forward with a bold
25 vision for New York, he has insisted on a budget that

1 harms our communities and fails to create the
2 opportunities that New Yorkers need. Families are
3 struggling to get by. We have a record 100,000
4 people in our shelter system and a humanitarian
5 crisis at Rikers. Rather than propose a budget with
6 strategic investments that meet the needs of our
7 constituents, meets the challenges of this moment,
8 the mayor has made disastrous cuts.
9

10 This council has been clear-eyed that the mayor's
11 approach is wrong, and I am again grateful to our
12 leadership for preventing the worst cuts from taking
13 effect, especially for our libraries and CUNY.

14 And I am proud to have organized a number of
15 priorities that have been incorporated into this
16 budget with Chair Rivera and Kevin Riley pushing for
17 increased funding for supervised release, will mean
18 few people on Rikers Island. Along with Chair
19 Avilés, pushing for restoration of the NYCHA Vacancy
20 Readiness funding will mean more people are out of
21 shelters and into permanent housing. And I am proud
22 that many of the priorities that we pushed for in the
23 Progressive Caucus have been partially incorporated
24 into this budget. But partial restorations will not
25 make enough of a difference. Half loaves are not

2 going to cut it. Our city is in crisis, and we need
3 to invest in a more secure future.

4 Some of the areas that are particularly
5 unacceptable that I want to highlight today [TIMER
6 CHIMES] are supportive housing, where we have cut
7 HPD's funding by \$14.7 million; HRA where we cut
8 staff by 2,000 people at The Department of Social
9 Services, where we have huge waiting lists for
10 supportive housing and vacant units. There is not
11 one penny for justice involved supportive housing.
12 Supportive housing is the solution to homelessness
13 and yet we cut it. DHS's budget is cut. We cut a
14 billion dollars from 3-K. Funding for our individual
15 neighborhood schools will be lower than the year
16 before.

17 We could have done better. And that is why I am
18 voting no on M 141 and M 142 and the accompanying
19 resolutions, and aye on all the rest, thank you.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Richardson
21 Jordon?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: Permission to
23 explain my vote?

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

1
2 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDSON JORDAN: I wish to be
3 associated with the comments made by Council Member
4 Restler, Council Member Ossé, Council Member Nurse,
5 Council Member Marte, Council Member Hanif, Council
6 Member Gutiérrez, Council Member De La Rosa, Council
7 Member Cabán, and last, but mostly, Council Member
8 Barron.

9 I think what we are all saying today is that this
10 city deserves more, that we have a social
11 responsibility to do more. And if we are going to
12 talk about hypocritical, it is hypocritical to be
13 public servants, and not serve the public. That fact
14 that "it could be worse" is going to be little
15 consolation to those who are in most desperate need.

16 I most definitely vote no. No on M 141, 142, M
17 143 and accompanying resolutions.

18 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Riley?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER RILEY: I am disclosing on the
20 record that the New York Department of Education is
21 funded in the budget we are adopting, and my
22 daughters are students at this entity. The YMCA is
23 funded in the budget we are adopting and my immediate
24 family are associated with this entity. And New York
25 City ACS is funded in this budget that we are

2 adopting, and my sister is an employer of this
3 entity.

4 And I vote aye on all.

5 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Rivera?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Permission to explain my
7 vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Thank you.

10 Thank you, Madam Speaker, for your leadership and
11 your work to pass this budget. The Fiscal Year 2024
12 Budget builds on work this council has done to
13 preserve and expand education, youth employment
14 opportunities, arts and culture, senior meals,
15 address housing needs, including for NYCHA families,
16 support important public spaces and institutions and
17 more.

18 The mayor's Executive Budget proposed
19 irresponsible cuts to many vital city services, and
20 our negotiations reversed some, while making key
21 investments to move our city forward.

22 The administration's refusal to fully acknowledge
23 the significance of outside expertise, especially
24 within places like our jail system, is a move to
25 eliminate outside scrutiny. One budget will not

1
2 solve this, but the Council has the power of
3 oversight and legislation, and we will mandate
4 transparency and continued accountability to the
5 public and the Board of Correction.

6 I am thankful to have secured a \$37 million
7 increase for supervised release, which will keep
8 people off of Rikers and connect them with the mental
9 health and social services they need to avoid
10 recidivism, as well as resources for alternatives to
11 incarceration, and to support restoration of cuts to
12 the Board of Correction, who provide a critical role
13 in overseeing jail operations.

14 It is up to us to continue fighting back against
15 proposed cuts by the mayor, and continuing work
16 alongside colleagues, advocates, neighbors, and our
17 talented staff, here at the Council, to build a more
18 fair, compassionate and healthy city.

19 With that, I vote aye, thank you.

20 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Salamanca?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Permission to explain
22 my vote?

23 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: All right, I am
25 disclosing on the record of the council proceedings

2 that the New York City Parks and Recreation is funded
3 in the budget we are adopting, and my wife is an
4 employee of that entity. The Castle Hill Little
5 League is funded in the budget we are adopting, and
6 my son is associated with the that organization. And
7 the Y is funded in the budget that we are adopting,
8 and my wife, son, and I are associated with this
9 organization.

10 And I vote Aye on all.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

12 Council Member Sanchez?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Permission to explain my
14 vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: The way we get to safety,
17 to recovery, to progress, is by investing in our
18 people, investing in the development of who we are as
19 a people -- our education, the care of our children,
20 stability in our homes, our enrichment. And the
21 budget that we are passing today falls short, not
22 because this council, our speaker, and our leadership
23 didn't make clear our priorities, but because we have
24 a mayor intent on austerity, harboring false notions
25 of how we get to safety, and who invited a harsh

1 process. Nevertheless, our speaker and this council
2 clawed significant wins on behalf of New Yorkers in
3 all of our communities. This budget finally makes
4 available \$4 billion in capital for the construction
5 of supportive and affordable housing this year. We
6 will continue our oversight to achieve the headcount
7 we need to actually spend these funds, but finally
8 they are there. We will also continue to fight to
9 ensure this \$4 billion becomes and stays an annual
10 commitment. This budget also helps to keep the most
11 vulnerable New Yorkers within their homes with an
12 expanded funding for Right to Counsel. It achieves
13 some cost of living adjustment gains for human
14 service workers, expands Fair Fares, restores funding
15 in our libraries, and CUNY, takes steps to correct
16 design flaws of the original universal 3-K, and it
17 funds Promise NYC.

19 I just want to make very clear, in the context of
20 this budget, that there should be no mistake made,
21 this council will shortly also be passing our
22 CityFHEPS legislative package, which will expand
23 housing stability for New Yorkers in their homes via
24 expanded vouchers. All of this happening together,
25 and I just want to and shoutout the leadership of the

2 speaker of our New York City Council, Adrienne Adams,
3 thank you.

4 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Schulman?

5 UNKNOWN: Did she vote?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: Permission to explain my
7 vote?

8 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SCHULMAN: This was not an easy
10 budget. First, federal stimulus funds that have
11 padded the New York City Budget for the past two
12 cycles is mostly gone now.

13 Second, we had over \$1 billion in unexpected
14 costs to take care of the migrants coming to our
15 city, with little help from New York State or the
16 federal government.

17 But, even with these and other challenges, we are
18 passing a budget with significant investments for
19 education, health care, libraries , housing, older
20 adults -- where I want to make a special mention
21 about Meals On Wheels, which is a lifeline for many
22 of the seniors in my district and the quality life in
23 our neighborhoods.

24

25

2 I want to give a shoutout to Speaker Adams, you
3 know, Kermit the Frog said *it is not easy being*
4 *green*, it is not easy being speaker.

5 Speaker Adams took it upon herself ,you know, we
6 are all thanking her, but I want to thank her
7 specifically, she took it upon herself to go up to
8 Washington, with members of the Council, to get more
9 money for us for the migrants that we have coming in.
10 And she succeeded in getting over \$130 million, which
11 affects this budget. So, I wanted to point that out,
12 because without that, we wouldn't have some of the
13 wins that we have today.

14 With that, there is still a lot work... There is
15 clearly a lot of work to be done. I look forward to
16 working with Speaker Adams and my colleagues to
17 continue the fight to make New York City more
18 equitable and just, because it is very important for
19 us to work on the investments that didn't make it
20 into this budget.

21 With that, I am disclosing on the record of the
22 council proceedings that Office of the Mayor of the
23 city of New York is funded in the budget we are
24 adopting, and my brother in an employee of that
25 entity.

2 And, with that, I vote on all.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Sanchez?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Very important, I vote
5 aye.

6 And I would also like to disclose on the record
7 of the council proceedings that the City University
8 of New York is funded in the budget that we are
9 adopting, and my brother is employed by that entity,
10 thank you.

11 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

12 Council Member Stevens?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Permission to explain my
14 vote?

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: I would like to start off
17 by thanking Speaker Adrienne Adams, her team; the
18 entire Finance Division; the Finance Chair, Justin
19 Brannan; and thank you for the leadership and
20 commitment for fighting for all New Yorkers.

21 I would like to acknowledge the complexity of the
22 decisions we were faced with throughout this year's
23 budget process. And that is essential, because going
24 through this budget, we all knew that we were going
25 to have to make hard decisions. One of the things

2 that I am most disappointed by is that we were unable
3 to deliver a real COLA for the human service sector.
4 The human service workers are essential, and yet they
5 are the second lowest paid industry in New York, with
6 a workforce that is overwhelmingly women and people
7 of color. The #JUSTPAY Campaign highlighted the need
8 to invest in their workforce, and this budget does
9 not deliver for them. What is worse than not giving
10 them a real COLA, is that it is not on par with the
11 other workforce and industries throughout New York
12 City. It sets them back, and will make it even
13 harder for them to hire and retain staff and their
14 programs -- that we *all* need in our communities, and
15 we all advocate for.

16 Although this council fought as hard as we could,
17 we were unable to deliver, so I apologize to the
18 nonprofit sector for that. However, we will continue
19 our fight, and we will get equity for the human
20 services sector.

21 Despite my extreme disappointment in some of the
22 outcomes of this budget, we did get some wins that I
23 am proud of like the investment and Work, Learn &
24 Grow, restoring food services for seniors, and
25 expanded 3-K for our youngest New Yorkers.

2 Thus, in spite of my disappointment, I am
3 committed to continuing to fight for District 16 and
4 the residents of all of New York. And with that, I
5 vote aye.

6 And I also have some disclosures: I disclose on
7 the record that the city of New York is funded in
8 this budget we are adopting, and my daughter is a
9 student in that entity, and Columbia Presbyterian is
10 funded in the budget we are adopting, and my daughter
11 is an employer of that entity, thank you.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

13 Council Member Ung?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER UNG: I vote aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Velázquez?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: Permission to explain
17 my vote?

18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER VELÁZQUEZ: I am disclosing on the
20 record of the council proceedings that the New York
21 City Department of Environmental Protection is funded
22 in the budget we are adopting, and my spouse is an
23 employee of that entity. Samaritans of New Yorkers
24 is funded in the budget we are adopting, and my
25 sibling is a board member of that entity. And that

2 the New York City Department of Housing and
3 Preservation and Development is funded in the budget
4 we are adopting, and my sibling is associated with
5 that entity. So, those are that.

6 I would like to thank Speaker Adams; Finance
7 Chair, Justin Brannan; the Council's Finance
8 Department; my fellow colleagues in the New York City
9 Council Budget Negotiation Team, and leadership for
10 coming together to pass a budget that reflects our
11 core values of our great city.

12 The budget negotiations are a challenge. I am
13 proud that my colleagues and I were working to
14 deliver on the needs of the people in New York City.
15 We knew this year's budget would be challenge, and as
16 my colleagues have repeatedly said today, there is a
17 lot of work still to be done. I look forward to
18 continuing our work within the Council to deliver not
19 only for New York City, but my home, my district, 13.

20 And I vote aye.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

22 Council Member Vernikov?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VERNIKOV: I vote aye on all with
24 the exception of M 169 and accompanying resolution
25 713, and no on Resolution 703 and 704, thank you.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you. Council Member
3 Williams?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I am disclosing on the
5 record of the council proceedings that the City
6 University of New York is funded in the budget we are
7 adopting, and I am a student at that entity. And
8 that the Queens Alumnae Chapter of Delta Sigma Theta
9 Sorority, Incorporated is funded in the budget we are
10 adopting, and I am associated with that organization,
11 and that Mount Moriah AME Church is funded in the
12 budget we are adopting, and I am associated with that
13 organization.

14 And, with a that, I vote aye.

15 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

16 Council Member Won?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Permission to explain my
18 vote?

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER WON: I just want to thank Speaker
21 Adams as well as the entire Finance team, the
22 [INAUDIBLE] colleagues, and my council colleagues at
23 large, because since the Executive Budget was
24 released, we have stood united, and we have fought
25 hard, and I want to give special thanks to even my

2 colleagues holding the line. Because we are in
3 agreement that this is a restorative budget, and this
4 is not where we wanted to be. But, we fought hard,
5 and we were able to fully restore funding for adult
6 literacy and \$13.2 million, as well as \$4 billion in
7 housing for affordable housing and NYCHA, for
8 libraries, arts and culture, and so much more,
9 because we continued to fight.

10 But, the fight is not over. As we have spent the
11 last year, we know that we will continue to fight
12 this upcoming year, because the budget is not a
13 static document, but it is fluid, and it is a
14 yearlong process where we will have to continue to do
15 the work legislatively as well as budgetarily to make
16 sure that we are restoring even more funding. And
17 because of these commitments that I have to my
18 district, I am going to be voting aye to make sure
19 that am continuing to deliver, especially for my
20 NYCHAs, as well as my nonprofits to offset costs,
21 especially if I know that there is going to be harm
22 done, to ensure that every single dollar for my
23 district is committed to.

24 The mayoral administration continues to
25 prioritize policing and other carceral systems over

2 critical lifesaving services that are paramount to
3 our communities. And because of that, in order to
4 survive and develop, our communities need investments
5 into permanent affordable housing that we have fought
6 for -- mental health care that we have fought for,
7 and so much more. So, for improving community health
8 and safety, we prioritize crisis management for \$86
9 million, reducing recidivism and strengthening
10 reentry at \$120.1 million, prevention from overdose,
11 treatment, and addiction at \$14.6 million, which is
12 now baselined, and so much more. And we will continue
13 to fight, and I just thank everyone for all their
14 efforts to make sure that we have a budget that will
15 serve as many people as possible.

16 But, I know that we have many years ahead,
17 especially with such a tough [TIMER CHIMES]
18 negotiation with this current administration, thank
19 you so much.

20 I vote aye on all.

21 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you
22 Council Member Yeger?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: I vote aye on all, with the
24 exception of M 157, M 169, Resolution 713, Resolution
25 703, and Resolution 704, thank you.

2 COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank you.

3 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Avilés?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: Permission to explain my
5 vote?

6 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Go ahead.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: So, I would like to start
8 by commending the speaker for her fight and her
9 incredible grace under unedging pressure and an
10 impossible task; my colleagues and Council staff who
11 worked tirelessly on this budget, I am thankful to
12 all of you for fighting on behalf of New Yorkers.
13 And I understand that this is not an easy body of
14 work.

15 This vote is not a reflection of that hard work.
16 I vote no on this mayor's austerity budget that guts
17 services and calls it a win. I vote no on an expense
18 budget and a capital budget, in particular, that I
19 did not have an opportunity to review since I
20 received it walking into this chamber today.

21 While the Council has proudly won restorations
22 for important programs like libraries and CUNY, these
23 programs should have never been on the chopping block
24 to begin with. At a time when New Yorkers are facing
25 inflation, out of control costs, and the worst

2 affordability crisis in decades, this mayor has
3 recklessly cut programs and services. This budget
4 maintains *deep* staffing cuts to those agencies we
5 need the most, while not making any significant
6 investments in low income housing, mental health,
7 social services, or education. As the Chair of
8 Public Housing, I cannot ignore the \$338 million in
9 rental arrears that are on the table, without relief
10 it means 77,000 families may face eviction in the
11 midst of a housing and shelter crisis. We are going
12 to need that \$46 million that pays for lawyers.

13 Instead of lifting us up, this mayor chooses to
14 use fear tactics and scarcity arguments to move
15 forward his priorities like privatizing the health
16 care of our city's retirees or blaming asylum
17 seekers. Ask yourself, what is missing from this
18 budget and why. We will soon find out. Apparently,
19 the mayor cannot find money to provide school aids
20 with a living wage, pay parity for EMS workers, or
21 more school social workers or guidance counselors or
22 capital funding for new classrooms [TIMER CHIMES],
23 which is desperately being cut. But he finds money
24 for the nearly \$1 billion in police overtime,
25 misconduct settlements, and an even or bloated NYPD

2 budget, and more school police. This is simply
3 wrong.

4 I look forward to the opportunity to vote yes on
5 a budget that supports people over profit, a budget
6 that invests in quality education for all, that
7 invests in housing as a human right. While this
8 budget is still far from that realization, I remain
9 committed to fighting to get us there for a budget
10 that people deserve.

11 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you, Council
12 Member.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER AVILÉS: For these reasons, I vote
14 no on this mayor's budget on M 141, and M 142 and the
15 and accompanying resolutions.

16 COMMITTEE CLERK: Council Member Borelli?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Permission to explain my
18 vote?

19 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: I will grant it.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Thank you.

21 Uhm, first the obligatory disclosers, we are
22 funding The Department of Education, and my wife is a
23 public school teacher; we are funding the Staten
24 Island Youth Soccer League, uh, both of my children,
25 John and Joe, are players; and we are funding the

2 Great Kills Little League, which my son Joe wasn't
3 very good at, didn't want to play, but John is
4 excelling, and hopefully... hopefully he sticks with
5 it.

6 We have talked a lot about what this budget cuts,
7 uh, and what the mayor failed to deliver on. And yet
8 many of us, almost all of us, have not mentioned the
9 \$1.4 billion that is now going towards covering the
10 migrant crisis. And with respect to what the mayor
11 said yesterday, uh, when he was asked, "What is the
12 offramp to this problem?", it is clear that there is
13 no answer. And we are facing budget gaps, uh, not
14 just next year, but in the years ahead. And that is
15 going to only get worse if this crisis doesn't end.
16 So, I would urge all of my colleagues whether it be,
17 uh, the council members here, the speaker, but also
18 the mayor, and the comptroller, and the governor, it
19 is time to drop the check on the White House. When
20 Joe Biden finishes his ice cream and the bill comes,
21 we have to be the ones to drop the check on there.
22 Because this is \$1.4 billion that could have been used
23 on the services that we are talking about that many
24 of whom, uhm, many of which were not able to be
25 funded. To give a comparable, \$1.4 billion is almost

2 three times the general operating fund of the city of
3 Buffalo. The second largest city in our state. We
4 can run it almost three times on what we are spending
5 on this federal problem. The federal government is
6 not asking us to run other federal agencies, so why
7 should we be responsible for running the immigration
8 and customs enforcement agencies.

9 So, I will be voting aye on all, with the
10 exception of M 169 and accompanying resolution 713,
11 703, and 704. And I do want to thank, uh, all of the
12 staff who worked many, many late hours and put a
13 tremendous amount of work in completing everything
14 from the tedium of doing the budget, to doing the
15 negotiation with the mayor. So, congratulations and
16 thank you all.

17 COMMITTEE CLERK: Powers?

18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: I vote aye

19 I am disclosing on the record that Mount Sinai
20 Hospital is funded in the budget we are adopting, and
21 mother is an employee of the organization.

22 Congratulations to everyone who worked very, very
23 hard on this budget.

24 COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker Adams?

2 SPEAKER ADAMS: I am disclosing on the record of
3 the council proceedings that Pearls and Ivy
4 Foundation of Queens is funded in the budget we are
5 adopting, and I am associated with that entity; and
6 that Greater Allen A. M. E. Cathedral of New York is
7 funded in the budget we are adopting today, and I am
8 associated with that entity as well.

9 Thanking my colleagues for all of their hard
10 work, their sleepless nights, and tireless days in
11 the work on this budget. I proudly stand fast in the
12 wins that we have made in the interest of the people
13 of the city of New York, and I vote aye on all.

14 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: All items on today's
15 General Orders Calendar are adopted by a vote of 50
16 in the affirmative, 1 negative, and 0 abstentions;
17 with the exception of M 196 and Resolution 713,
18 Resolution 703, and Resolution 704 adopted by a vote
19 of 42 in the affirmative, 9 negative, and 0
20 abstentions; M 141 and 142 with accompanying
21 resolutions adopted by a vote of 39 in the
22 affirmative, 12 negative, and 0 abstentions; and M
23 143 and Resolution 710 adopted by a vote of 47 in the
24 affirmative, 4 negative, and 0 abstentions;
25 Resolution 705 adopted by a vote of 51 in the

2 affirmative, 0 negative, 0 abstentions; and M 157
3 adopted by a vote of 49 in the affirmative, 2
4 negative, and 0 abstentions.

5 I now formally declare that the Executive Expense
6 Revenue Contract Budget, the Executive Capital
7 Budget, and the Community Development Program for
8 Fiscal Year 2024, all as modified, and all in
9 accordance with the New York City Charter, have been
10 hereby adopted as of 3:05 P. M. on this 30th day of
11 June, 2023.

12 I will now call on Speaker Adrienne Adams to
13 close today's Stated Meeting.

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you, Majority Leader...

15 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Sorry, we have one... We
16 have to go to General Discussions, apologies.

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: That's okay.

18 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: We have two people signed
19 up, I believe I only see one of them here; we are
20 going to call on Council Member Brewer.

21 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: Thank you, Majority
22 Leader. I do want to mention that Richard Ravitch
23 died last Sunday at 89 years old. For those of you
24 who knew, uh, he was appointed Lieutenant Governor
25 under David Patterson, but he never actually ran.

2 But in 1975, he actually saved New York City from
3 financial collapse. In the 1980's, as Chair of the
4 MTA, he rejuvenated mass transit. He really built
5 affordable housing at Waterside Plaza. He literally
6 has saved many people in the arts, able to perform
7 because they have a home at Manhattan Plaza. He was
8 instrumental in working on the finances of Puerto
9 Rico. Just recently he was one of the founders of
10 the Five Borough Institute. He has also been working
11 to the day or the moment he died on finding ways to
12 provide more affordable housing using an insurance
13 company. When he was with the Urban Development
14 Corporation, Trump wanted to have a tax abatement and
15 the Grand Hyatt, and he told he to go to hell, he
16 wouldn't do it, and Kotch overruled him. This is a
17 man, I know that not all of you know him, I was at
18 the service, I was at the shiva, this is a man who
19 really changed New York. He was incredibly willing
20 to give ideas and share ideas, and he reached out to
21 everyone. So, we have lost a great, and I just want
22 to make sure you don't forget it, thank you very
23 much.

24 MAJORITY LEADER POWERS: Thank you.

2 Before I hand it over to the speaker, I just want
3 to add my voice in support of what Council Member
4 Brewer said. I had the honor and privilege of
5 representing Waterside Plaza, where the Lieutenant
6 Governor, Dick Ravitch, was the owner and built it,
7 and he was a great partner and a great New Yorker.
8 And I hope we have many more New Yorkers just like
9 Dick Ravitch.

10 With that, I will now hand it over to Speaker
11 Adrienne Adams.

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Associating myself with the
13 remarks of Council Member Brewer and the Majority
14 Leader.

15 Thank you everyone, the Stated Meeting of June
16 30, 2023 is hereby adjourned. You may applaud!

17 [APPLAUSE]

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date July 15, 2023