

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON RULES, PRIVILEGES
AND ELECTIONS

----- X

December 17, 2014
Start: 10:47 a.m.
Recess: 11:29 a.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: BRAD S. LANDER
Chairperson

MELISSA MARK-VIVERITO
Speaker for the Council

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Inez E. Dickens
- Daniel R. Garodnick
- Ydanis A. Rodriguez
- Margaret S. Chin
- Deborah L. Rose
- Jumaane D. Williams
- Rafael L. Espinal, Jr.
- Mark Levine
- Vince M. Ignizio

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Barbara A. Lowe, MS, RN

[sound check, background comments, pause]

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Are ready. [gavel]

Good morning and welcome the meeting of the New York City Council's Committee on Rules, Privileges and Elections is now resuming from recess. Well, it's-- is it really resuming from recess. Yes, we're underway. It's a brand new hearing. I'm City Council Member Brad Lander, Chair of the Rules Committee. Before we begin, I would like to introduce the other members of the committee who are present with us this morning. We have Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez from Manhattan; Council Member Debbie Rose from Staten Island. She's here both in her capacity as a Rules Committee Member and a potential appointee of the Rules of the Council today.

DEBBIE ROSE: [off mic]

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Well, we're going to give it very serious consideration--and thorough consideration. Council Member Margaret Chin from Manhattan. A guest, not a member of the committee, but Council Member Ben Kallos from Manhattan who is here as a potential appointee as well. Council Member Rafael Espinal from Brooklyn; Council Member

Mark Levine from Manhattan; and Council Member Inez Dickens from Manhattan. I suspect we will be joined by several other members of the committee before too long. I would also like to acknowledge the Counsel for the Committee Jason Otano [sp?] and the good work as always of the Council's investigative staff members. Chuck Davis, our Director of Investigations, as well as Deandra Johnson, and Diana Arriaga who do such good thorough work looking at the backgrounds and researching the deep and dark history of people like Debbie Rose and Ben Kallos before we consider appointing them.

Today, we have before us three candidates for our review. Ms. Barbara Lowe, who I appreciate and who is here as a guest, and who will speak to us in just a minute. A resident of Manhattan and a candidate selected by the Manhattan Delegation of the Council for designation by the entire Council. And subsequent appointment by the Mayor to the New York City Health and Hospitals Corporation Board of Directors. Should she be appointed, she'll be eligible to serve the remainder of a five-year term, that would expire on March 20, 2019. Ms. Lowe, welcome and we'll come back to you in just a minute

to ask for your opening statement, and to ask a few questions.

We're considering two other appointments today, both of them of Council Members to represent the Council on relevant boards. Council Member Debbie Rose, who Chairs the Committee on Waterfronts is a candidate for designation by the Council to appropriately the New York City Waterfront Management Advisory Board. As you know, she represents the 49th District on Staten Island a thoroughly waterfront district. And she would fill a vacancy and serve an undefined term at the pleasure of the Council. And Council Member Ben Kallos, Chair of our Committee on Government Operations, candidate for election by the Council to the New York City Commission on Public Information and Communication or, COPIC. And we will invite you to then make a brief statement as well.

But let's first welcome and have a few questions for and hear from our external nominee, Ms. Lowe. As members of the committee and members of the public hopefully know, HHC, the New York Health and Hospital Corporation is a public benefit corporation charged with the duty of providing high quality dignified and comprehensive healthcare and treatment

to the public, especially to those who cannot afford such services. The HHC Board of Directors consists of 16 members. Included within the board's membership in addition to ex-officio members are ten appointees of the Mayor. Five of whom are designated by the Council for consideration by the Mayor, and generally with some relationship to the five boroughs. And in this instance, to Manhattan. The term of office for directors is five years with a vacancy filled under the terms of the original appointment. Directors are not compensated but are reimbursed for actual expenses.

We had-- Welcome to Council Member Helen Rosenthal from Manhattan as well. We had with us earlier Council Member Corey Johnson, who both chairs the Health Committee and together with Council Member Chin co-chairs the Manhattan delegation, at whose request or nomination of Ms. Lowe is before us today. But Corey is not here in his capacity as Health Committee Chair.

[background comments]

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Let me recognize Council Member Chin in her role as the Co-Chair of

the Manhattan Delegation before we invite Ms. Lowe to speak to us.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you, Chair Lander. The Manhattan Delegation we had an extensive interview with Ms. Lowe, and she also answered our questions here, which is in the packet. And I look forward to Council Members' support.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: [interposing] Super.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you to you, and to Chair Johnson and to the Manhattan Delegation. And I will as Council Member Chin did, point people to the opening statement questions as well as background research information in your packet on Ms. Lowe. It was very helpfully prepared. Ms. Lowe, let me now officially again welcome you, and ask you-- the Committee Counsel will swear you in, or affirm, as you like, and then you can make your opening statement, and we'll ask you a few questions as well.

LEGAL COUNSEL OTANO: Do you swear or affirm that the testimony that you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth? Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Welcome. If you'll go ahead, please, and give us your opening statements, and then I think a couple of council members may have questions.

BARBARA LOWE: Okay. All right. Good morning Council Member Lander and Johnson and respective committee members. I am Barbara Lowe, as you know, and I'm here to be considered for appointment to the Health and Hospitals Board position that was vacated earlier this year by Reverend Diane Lacey. Reverend Lacey served for many years on behalf of the Manhattan Delegation and the communities that she so eloquently spoke for. It is an honor that I come before you, and I thank you for inviting me here.

Let me just start by saying that I--a little bit about my background. I'm proud to be an individual who grew up in Harlem, and to be born into a family that came from Barbados. My family taught me and my siblings about justice and equality very early on. Their values are my values, and they make up my moral fabric. Through my work, I have sought to even the playing field for others who are trapped in poverty who confront discrimination, face hurdles

getting citizenship, and those who live in indigent communities without access to essential services or are practically denied. I am clear that hard work and ongoing commitment is why I'm here today. That hard work was gratifying throughout these 40 years. I've been a nurse, an educator, an advocate, and my lessons from that hard work is applied in all that I've done.

As a young nurse working in a major--I should say the community--the Upper East Side Medical Center. I entered nursing at the age of 20. It was challenging because I witnessed a two-class structure where women of moderate means delivering in this hospital were assigned different room facilities than the very affluent. The exposure to that kind of treatment just made me more determined to work on behalf of communities who are denied quality care, and who are treated differently. I've had an interesting path and journey as a professional. It's been excellent, and it's been very progressive. In addition to entering the proud profession of nursing, I was able to achieve a Bachelor's Degree while working at that medical center, and education.

What was so unique about that is that I taught young people in a health careers program from my high school, Ben Franklin. That was really a high point for me because I got instant feedback from young people about the future holds. I also reported directly to the first person who was given a title, Vice President for Nursing. And she actually was one of my first mentors in the profession of nursing. My interest in community health flourished into a real opportunity when I earned a Master's Degree of Science from Hunter College. With that Master's, I qualified to get the position of Assistant Director of Nursing and Interdisciplinary Training Supervisor at the DOOR. I understand most of you know the DOOR Program. It was recently televised.

The Door is a unique company as a program with international recognition. We're a range of interdisciplinary services. We are seamlessly organized to promote maximum use by young people from all over New York City who all have no problem accessing the services they wanted. The interventions were age appropriate, and directed a priority treatment needs and goals. The attention and services was excellent by these young people

because their needs were met. There were no barriers. Barriers and inequities were virtually absent in this wonderful world called the Door. I talk about the Door because it's one of the models that really stands out. It's a respectful model.

It is a model where collaboration is really the means to working with people, and that cooperation happens with your clients and patients, and young people themselves. The interesting thing is that the young people fared well. Many are now leaders in their communities today. I discovered the importance of using a needs-based approach in clinical services to effectively address presenting issues and priorities with patients, my patients. These consortia for service delivery are the focus of my practice, my policy, and my advocacy to this day. The vision of working towards greater equity and care and applying the principles learned in my formative years has become an integral part of my approach to addressing disparity in communities here in New York, and also in the U.S. Virgin Islands where I worked.

I bring those virtues to my work as a leader. I've worked here at City Hall in the Dinkins Administration. As the Deputy Director for Health

Policy, I have held two positions at HHC. The first one was the Cumberland Diagnostic and Treatment Center where I implemented a model program for substance abuse in women, who had the goal of sobriety and also to get their children out of foster care. That program is now turning its 16th year. It's still functional. It was person centered. It was very respectful to the women who needed care, and it demonstrated for me to really develop programs with that kind of approach. Collaboration is very important all the time.

The second job I held was at Woodhull Hospital as the Chief Nurse Officer. I retired from that position. I had 900 nurses under my charge, which meant that I worked on a 24/7 basis. What was wonderful about that work was that I had responsibility over the clinical outcomes. I have to say that the nurses removed mountains. The nurses underwent strict development, leadership development, and in the end, we had operationalized wonderful controls in the Nursing Department. We had cross-controls using good staffing methodologies. We had nurses. The right nurses were matched with the right patient. The frontline nurses were empowered using

god staffing were empowered to make decisions about that. The frontline nurses were empowered to reduce infection rates.

I'm going to move forward here in my comments. I would just like to say that HHC has a-- is at a turning point. I'm going to depart from all of this. HHC and Metro Plus moving forth we facing daunting financial challenges, but we are also facing wonderful opportunities. The HHC Corporation has the opportunity to enroll more patients and health plans. It is really important that those efforts be really magnified for vulnerable populations. I looked at the New York State AIDS Institute data regarding how many people living with AIDS really don't have consistent care, but probably are eligible for health insurance. That's just one example of the work that can be done.

More importantly is closing the financial gap has to do with utilizing good practices, building good care at the frontlines in communities where access is really, really available. And people feel that they are welcomed in those services and their needs are met. So I think that moving forward by 2020, HHC can be--can fulfill a legacy of urban

health, building a culture of health in our communities by doing the work that's necessary. It may mean that they would have to implement something in their outcome assessments, which is really necessary on the population's health. But I see HHC leading this country in determining how communities, indigent communities can be served.

I think that I have competencies, the competencies and the background and the knowledge to sit on the Board and join my colleagues to make a difference. And I look forward to your decisions, and the potential to work for the HHC and with the HHC Board, and for further goals. That concludes my comments. Thank you. I look forward to your questions.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much, Ms. Lowe. Let me just say that we're honored to have you here. We really deeply appreciate your service to this city, to its most indigent, to the health of so many New Yorkers. You are exactly the kind of person this Council likes to consider. And we appreciate the fact that your public service and your openness to working with us. And I really want to appreciate the Co-Chair of the Manhattan Delegation

for bringing us this excellent nominee. Before I recognize the Chair of the Health Committee and then the two other members so far who have asked to make a questions or statements, I want to flag for committee members that we will be voting at the end of this hearing.

As you know, in this hearing ordinarily we try not to have the vote the same time as we have the hearing and on the same day of the Stated. Partly, it means we are rushed, and we don't have the ability to give real fair and due consideration to wonderful nominees. And partly, you know, it means that there is not the same opportunity for kind of reflection before we have to vote. In partly in deference to the Manhattan Delegation knowing you are someone excellent, and just the holiday schedule and conflicts, we are doing it today. But it will remain the practice of this committee separate in general our hearings and our vote. That said, we are voting in this committee. So while I have three members on the staff to make statements or ask questions, I am flagging for you that your colleagues have to stick around until we can get to the vote. So, Chair

Johnson follow by Council Members Kallos and Dickens.
Go ahead Chair Johnson.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: Good morning.
It's so good to see you.

BARBARA LOWE: [off mic] Thank you.

COUNCIL MEMBER JOHNSON: And good morning to my colleagues and thank you Chair Lander. I want to take a moment to take a moment to extol the virtues of the candidates before us this morning. As we all know, the incredible work and records of our colleagues and my friends, Council Members Debbie Rose and Ben Kallos. I will focus on Barbara Lowe who is slated to join the Board of the Health and Hospital Corporation as a Council appointee. As you heard, Ms. Lowe's long and distinguished career as a frontline nurse, and as an administrator, and as a planner throughout the HHC system will be an asset to the corporation. Her 35-year record of service is a shining example to public service, and public health. And I am grateful that she has agreed to come out of retirement [coughs] and assume this critical role.

HHC stands at a critical precipice, as Ms. Lowe said, and Barbara will be an exemplary leader and collaborative representative of the

interests to the Board. As you all know, HHC is the largest municipal hospital and healthcare system in the country, and it's the single largest provider of healthcare to uninsured New Yorkers. By providing services to New York City residents regardless of their ability to pay, HHC is integral to the system of safety net hospitals, the default system of care for the uninsured, Medicaid and other vulnerable populations. One in every six New Yorkers receives health services at an HHC facility. In 2011, HHC served approximately 1.3 patients of which 478,000, 37% were uninsured.

HHC is now facing a new fiscal crisis with over \$1 billion in deficits in the coming years due in part to the Federal Affordable Care Act, State Medicaid Redesign, and other factors. I don't envy the task before HHC and I look forward to collaborating with them and with Barbara to help get our vital system of public hospitals on to firmer footing. Mr. Chair, I would just like to say that, you know, HHC is a \$7 billion corporation. I think the envy of the country as it relates to public hospitals. And we saw how ably HHC, its doctors and

nurses performed during the Ebola scare not too long ago.

Ms. Lowe is replacing a wonderful board member who was revered for years, Reverend Lacey who really shook things up on the HHC Board in a good way. And I know that Barbara Lowe will do the same thing, be an independent leader looking out for patients, and for the people who really depend upon these vital services. So I wholeheartedly support her nomination, and I look forward to working with her and having the Council work with her. Thank you, Mr. Chair, for the ability and the opportunity to testify this morning.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you, Chair Johnson, for that persuasive testimony, and as always for your leadership in reminding us of the centrality of HHC in the city as a whole, which sometimes escapes notice. You know, I think you're right, the Ebola crisis recently, and for me Hurricane Sandy were two moments when you remember the HHC aren't just poor people's healthcare. They're the city's doctors and nurses in such a critical way. So thank you for those words, and for your leadership. And before I recognize Council Members Kallos and

Dickens, I do want to call people's attention to the pre-hearing questions as well, seven single-spaced. It looks like about seven point typed responses to questions. So before you ask a question, not that you're not welcome, you could just see whether she's already been asked and answered it. They are thorough answers to a good set of questions that our staff put to her beforehand. Council Member Kallos.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: I want to thank Chair Lander for chairing the Rules Committee and doing such an amazing job with that and get so many of our appointments done. I want to thank Chair Johnson for his leadership on the Health Committee, and as always being a champion for issues facing our city of public. And especially HHC and to our Delegation Co-Chair Margaret Chin for running an amazing process that's produced an amazing candidate like Barbara Lowe. I have the pleasure of being the one to nominate her for this, and can say that we can't do any better than having actual employees with experience at HHC at the table in getting things running. With her experience of Chief Nurse Officer at Woodhull Hospital and Mental Health Center. And the years of experience that she has her. So we're

very lucky to have her. And not only does she have my support and the support of my delegation, but if there are employees out there that are working at HHC, they and the rest of their brothers and sisters are also supporting her. And she sits here as a representative not only for the City Council, but the City of New York, all the employees of HHC and every patient that HHC will see. And I urge my colleagues to please support her.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you, Council Member Kallos. Let me recognize we've been joined by our Speaker, Melissa Mark-Viverito as well as Council Members Garodnick and Williams. On the stack are Council Members Dickens and Espinal. Council Member Dickens.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Thank you, Chair and good morning, Ms. Lowe. It's good to see you again. Chair, with your permission I want to welcome a friend of Barbara and that's Sharon Nelson, the incoming President of the New York City Chapter of the National Women's Political Caucus. Thank you. Who is here in support of this nomination.

Ms. Lowe, and you know, you've given admirable service since the days of when you were in

the Dinkins, Mayor Dinkins' Administration. So you go back a long way. And although you now are in Upper West Sider, you have historically been a Harlemite. I just wanted to say that for clarity.

BARBARA LOWE: Oh. [laughs]

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: I do want to commend you for being willing to take on this service that goes without remuneration. In addition, you will be stepping into the shoes, the place of Reverend Lacey who has served admirably for so many years on the Board of HHC. And who although she represented the entire city, she worked hard tirelessly as a Board member on behalf of the entire city. She never did forget that she came from Harlem, and I just wanted to state that for the record.

I have one question, though, and as my Chair said, we should look for the answers to many of the questions. And, indeed, one of my questions was answered. But the one that I do ask you about and that's considering your former position as Chief Nurse Officer at Woodhull. In which you had responsibility not only for the healthcare of the citizens of that community, the residents, but you

also had a responsibility for the fiscal and financial survival of the hospital. There is a proposal to privatize dialysis. And that's a major concern because sometimes at hearings we at the City Council have questions as it relates to the privatization of various forms whether in the health field or in other fields where it will no longer be done by hospital employees. Considering that you have had the fiscal responsibility as well as the health--responsible to the community and of the city. And now you're a Board Member of Health and Hospital Corporation, how do you perceive that this privatization is it possible? Will it be feasible? Is it financially feasible, and will it render the best possible dialysis care for our citizens.

BARBARA LOWE: Thank you so much for your references to privatization of dialysis. I think that particular effort began when I departed. I was already out of my seat as the Chief Nurse, but I was in the seat when the roles--I always say different things about the roles that you see restructuring. I changed the title. So I'm not going to dare try to reach into it here. But my feeling has been, and my feelings are today that privatization of clinical

services is a very iffy proposition. One because I like to always see that my patients are well cared for, and that quality of care is going to be maintained.

There has been such a brouhaha about the notion that quality maybe compromised with the dialysis privatization for institutions. So I would say that any notion to privatize within HHC Clinical Service is a danger. I also have strong feelings about job retention in communities. HHC is a huge employer in all the communities of residents of those communities. So I personally take issue putting people out of work in the communities that we serve and their employees of that community. I know that hasn't been brought up, but I personally have that feeling. So I hope I answered your question.

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Well, I thank you so much for that answer. I commend you for publicly giving an answer such as that considering that that may put you sometimes in an adversarial position with the other board members or of the administration of HHC. And so, I'm very happy to hear that you would be willing to take a stance that maybe better serves the public, that needs these

services and cannot afford privatization. So I thank you for that answer. And Chair, thank you so much for the time.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much, Council Member Dickens. That was a helpful and important addition and thank you. The last Council Member who signed up to make a statement or ask questions of this nominee is Council Member Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: What years did you work at Woodhull Hospital?

BARBARA LOWE: Let's see, it was 2001 until 2011.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: I was actually born in Woodhull Hospital.

BARBARA LOWE: I see.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Four of my siblings were born there as well. And I did receive treatment until about 2002 when I was 18.

BARBARA LOWE: Oh.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: But, you know, I think Woodhull has had a reputation in the local community being unfortunately a trap [sic], you know. And I can't speak for the nurses. I'm sure you guys have done a great job, but the quality of care was

always--it seems to be an issue in the Bed-Stuy and Bushwick East New York community, and I can speak from experience. My mother actually went there in December. A few months later she passed away of cancer, and they misdiagnosed her and sent her home with Advil. So I just want to know in what areas do you see room for improvement on the issue of management of chronic diseases, and how do you think your position on the Board will be able to help that situation?

BARBARA LOWE: Well, we know that people who have chronic diseases fare much better when they have access to care and engage in care, and care is comprehensive. We look at the occurrence of other diseases. I think substance abuse to me is a very chronic disease, and I had the opportunity in Cumberland to work with women who presented with the most horrific issues. What happened in their cases, was a real partnership with those patients, a real caring, a real supportive environment negotiating systems with them. I'm talking Social Services, and a host of other things. I'm very familiar with Bushwick because earlier on in the '80s I worked for the March of Dimes. I started the Healthier Babies

Campaign there. There was no Social Service Office in Bushwick. That's really serious for a community for like Bushwick who had declined economically after the problems in the '70s. At that point, Woodhull was brand new. So I know about the reputation, and I knew about that reputation walking. But when I tell you that we did a lot better--and they're doing better every single day. But there has to be engagement of the staff. There has to be really using--they must use the best practices effectively. They must be truthful about their outcomes. They must use their outcomes to improve for the next patient. But the chronic diseases are a challenge, but we've seen with the Medical Home, which is the new primary care model, a real commitment to change the outcomes for diabetics, for asthmatics, and cardiology. And we will continue to do that with Health Home, which all chronics dual-insured patients who like a lot of the insurance money, the public insurance money, major outcomes with collaborative working with community organizations. To keep them in service, and to keep them moving forward on a better path for health.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Well, thank you. I just, you know, I believe that patient's measure the quality of care of hospitals by how well they're being diagnosed and treated and the prognosis they're given. And, I just feel that HHC Hospitals need a lot of work, you know for that reason. There's a lot of my constituents who ending coming to Manhattan and going to NYU or a local, or hospital demand [sic] because of that issue. So I just hope that that will be able to be your role in the agency to make sure that that hospital care is much better. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you, Council Member Espinal. I know so many people can tell some powerful stories before us as witnesses. We honor them and I just want to say thank you, and we are thank and appreciate you being here as a council member. So thank you. All right, seeing no other questions, I'm going to close the public hearing at this point on Ms. Lowe and thank you. Please stick around. I appreciate your time, service, and answers to our questions.

We now turn to the proposed appointment of our colleague, Council Member Debbie Rose to the Waterfront Management Advisory Board. In the

interest of time, I will dispense with the information about it, and refer interested members of this committee or the public to Charter Section 1303 created by Council Local Law in 2006 creating the Waterfront Management Advisory Board, if you would like more information it. And at this time, I will ask Council Member Rose if she has a statement that she would like to make.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Yes, I do and thank you. Do I need to be sworn in? [laughs]

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Right, I guess you do. I think yes. You definitely--

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing]
Yeah, I do.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --swear or affirm that you will--

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: [interposing] Okay.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: --tell the truth today especially. Committee Counsel, please. Thank you, Council Member Rose for your willingness to swear or affirm that you will tell the truth to us.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Okay.

LEGAL COUNSEL OTANO: Well, Council Member, do you swear or affirm that the testimony

that you are about to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth?

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: I swear and affirm. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: All right, thank you. [laughter]

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Thank you. Good morning to my esteemed colleagues. It's kind of strange being in this position, but I want to thank the Chair and I want to thank Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito for nominating me as the Council's representative to the New York City Waterfront Management Advisory Board. As the Chair of the Committee on Waterfronts, I see this as a wonderful opportunity to further my role as Waterfronts Committee Chair. Our waterfronts are very important. For close to half a millennium, they have helped to make New York City the leader in the global business marketplace, as well as the top destination for artists, builders, and dreamers from around the globe.

Maritime industries are still an important driver of the jobs. Over 200,000 jobs in our region are based upon port activity. And New

York city is home to the third largest port in North America, as well as being one of the top 15 ports in the world. My district, as you know, is a waterfront district, a vibrant working waterfront with some of the city's most successful maritime businesses. We have construction of the world's tallest observation wheel, and the city's first high-end outlet mall. We also have development taking place in Bay Street Landing, the Home Port, Triangle Equities, and the Lighthouse Museum, and a new waterfront park. Indeed, there is extensive development taking place all over the city's waterfront. And we just saw the Council vote on Astoria cove.

And much of our major economic development over the last 12 years took place on our city's waterfront. Wise management and oversight--I'm sorry--and oversight of our city's waterfronts are of critical importance to this continued economic development, and to furthering Sandy Recovery efforts. The Waterfront Management Advisory Board provides an important forum for cooperation among city, state, federal, and civic partners to advanced shared goals and initiatives for the optimal balance of waterfront and waterway uses. The Board provides

direction and accountability for implementing the 130 initiatives identified in the City's Comprehensive Waterfront Plan. Issues of particular importance to me in this role will include coastal remediation, Sandy recovery issues, further storm protection, and environmental justice issues as well as continued economic development. I am really excited to join the Board and help to further its important mission. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much Council Member Rose for your leadership on these waterfront issues. We know it's been a challenging time on many issues in your district, and your life as well. And that you are finding time to continue to provide leadership in the Council and the City on these critical waterfront issues. It means a lot to us. If there are members who have questions for Council Member Rose, the floor is open. If you are simply going to say in what high esteem we hold her, I urge you to save those comments for another time and express them enthusiastically when we are a little less on the clock.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Oh, we need those remarks. Okay. [laughs]

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Okay. When you vote perhaps. If there are council members with questions, then we will, of course, take them now. See none, we will move onto the final item on today's calendar, which is the proposed appointment of our colleague Ben Kallos to the New York City Commission on Public Information and Communication for an indeterminate term. Again, that's at the pleasure of this Council. Again, I'll dispense with the long description and let members of this committee and the public know that the New York City Charter Section 1061 provides for the establishment and describes the composition and responsibilities of COPIC. And you can get all the details there. And I will now welcome and turn it over to Council Member Kallos for his statement.

COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Thank you, Speaker Viverito as well as Chair Lander for this amazing opportunity. I Chair the Governmental Operations Committee, and one of the reasons I wanted to was because of this great commission called COPIC, which was created in 1989. And is the Commission on Public Information and Communication. And so, I have oversight over this body, but it's been slightly

dysfunction. It hasn't been meeting. We have this great leader in our Public Advocate Tish James, and I am looking forward to having the opportunity if appointed by this body to working with our Public Advocate to get the word out on all the information, all the great things that government does. And I will submit written testimony, and we will be reading it. And there is also, if anyone is interested, a 30-page report I drafted with former Public Advocate Mark Green on the great things we could do with COPIC that is also available for anyone upon request. And I will end my remarks and just ask for your support, and I thank you very much.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Thank you very much, Council Member Kallos. I will flag that the new Commissioner of the Department of Records, Pauline Toole, a constituent of mine has already really made dramatic improvements there, and urge people to go see the new online NYC archives. It's a good moment in public information and communication. I look forward to your helping carry it forward at COPIC. If there are members with questions or comments on the proposed appointment of Council Member Kallos? Seeing none, we will move forward to-- And I guess

we don't. We also if there are any members of the public here who have come to testify on these last two proposed appointments of Council Member Rose to the Waterfront Management Advisory Board or Council Member Kallos to COPIC. We don't have any appearance cards and seeing no one in the room, I will now close the public hearing on these items, and move forward to call for a vote on all three of the proposed appointments on today's calendar. I will ask the clerk to call the vote.

CLERK: Kevin Penn, Committee Clerk, roll call on the Committee on Rules, Privileges and Elections. Council Member Lander.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: Enthusiastically aye on all.

CLERK: Dickens

COUNCIL MEMBER DICKENS: Congratulations to both of my colleagues, Council Members Debbie Rose and Ben Kallos and, of course, congratulations to Mr. Barbara Lowe and with a debt of gratitude, and I vote aye.

CLERK: Rodriguez.

COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: [off mic] Aye on all.

CLERK: Chin.

COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: [off mic] Aye on
all.

CLERK: Rose.

COUNCIL MEMBER ROSE: Aye on all, and I
thank Council Member Kallos, we're not reading a
statement and so you got two votes from me.
[laughter]

CLERK: Williams.

COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I thought long
and hard about Council Member Rose and Kallos, but I
decided to vote aye on all anyway. [laughter]
Congratulations to you both. Congratulations to Ms.
Lowe.

BARBARA LOWE: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LANDER: You know he means it
when he says it.

CLERK: Espinal.

COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye on all and
congratulations to all.

CLERK: Levine.

COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: With congrats to
all three of the nominees, I'm very happy to vote aye
on all.

CLERK: Speaker Mark-Viverito.

SPEAKER MARK-VIVERITO: [off mic] I vote aye on all.

CLERK: By a vote of 9 in the affirmative and 0 in the negative and no abstentions, all items have been adopted.

COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Thank you very much. We'll leave the roll open for five minutes. I saw a couple of other members out in the hallway. I will give them a chance to come in and vote. Thank you very much to the members.

[pause, background comments]

CLERK: Garodnick.

COUNCIL MEMBER GARODNICK: I'm pleased to vote aye.

CLERK: The vote stands at 10 in the affirmative.

[pause]

CLERK: Ignizio.

COUNCIL MEMBER IGNIZIO: I vote aye.

CLERK: The final vote in Committee on Rules, Privileges, and Elections 11 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative and no abstentions.

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date December 21, 2014