

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY JOINTLY WITH
COMMITTEE ON TECHNOLOGY

----- X

May 11, 2022
Start: 9:05 a.m.
Recess: 3:30 p.m.

HELD AT: REMOTE HEARING (VIRTUAL ROOM 1)

B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan
Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

- Diana Ayala
- Charles Barron
- Gale A. Brewer
- Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
- David M. Carr
- Amanda Farias
- Kamillah Hanks
- Crystal Hudson
- Ari Kagan
- Farah N. Louis
- Francisco P. Moya
- Chi A. Ossé
- Keith Powers
- Pierina Ana Sánchez
- Marjorie Velázquez
- Julie Won

Speaker Adams
Rafael Salamanca Jr.
Carlina Rivera
Joann Ariola
Erik Bottcher
Tiffany Cabán
Alexa Avilés
Carmen De La Rosa
Nantasha Williams
Rita Joseph
Althea Stevens
Robert F. Holden
Lynn Schulman
Shaun Abreu
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Darlene Mealy
Sandy Nurse
Kevin C. Riley

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Keechant L. Sewell
Commissioner
New York City Police Department

Edward A. Caban
First Deputy Commissioner
New York City Police Department

Kenneth E. Corey
Chief Of Department
New York City Police Department

Kristine Ryan
Deputy Commissioner, Management
and Budget
New York City Police Department

Danielle G. Pemberton
Deputy Commissioner
New York City Police Department

Amy J. Litwin
Deputy Commissioner, Department
Advocate
New York City Police Department

John J. Miller
Depty Commissioner, Public
Information
New York City Police Department

Mark T. Stewart
Deputy Commissioner, Community
Affairs
New York City Police Department

Ernest F. Hart
Deputy Commissioner, Legal
Matters
New York City Police Department

Chauncey Parker
Deputy Commissioner, Community
Partnerships
New York City Police Department

Oleg Chernyavsky
Assistant Deputy Commissioner
New York City Police Department

Donna Jones
Chief of Staff
New York City Police Department

Michael Lipetri
Department Chief, Crime Control
Strategies
New York City Police Department

James W. Essig
Department Chief, Detectives
New York City Police Department

Kim Y. Royster
Department Chief, Transportation
New York City Police Department

Jason K. Wilcox
Department Chief, Transit
New York City Police Department

Kathleen M. O'Reilly
Department Chief, Housing
New York City Police Department

Juanita N. Holmes
Department Chief, Training
New York City Police Department

Jeffrey B. Maddrey
Department Chief, Patrol Services
New York City Police Department

Isa M. Abbassi

Department Chief, Strategic
Initiatives
New York City Police Department

Marlon O. Larin
Deputy Chief
New York City Police Department

Martin Morales
Department Chief, Personnel
New York City Police Department

Matthew V. Pontillo
Department Chief, Risk Management
New York City Police Department

Thomas Galati
Department Chief, Intelligence
New York City Police Department

Theresa Tobin
Department Chief, Interagency
Operations
New York City Police Department

Edward Thompson
Deputy Chief
New York City Police Department

Samuel Wright
Assistant Chief, Recruiting
Training Section
New York City Police Department

Deanna Logan
Director, Mayor's Office of
Criminal Justice

Oswaldo Cruz
CFO, Mayor's Office of Criminal
Justice

Nora Daniel

Chief of Staff, Mayor's Office of
Criminal Justice

Matthew Fraser
Commissioner
New York City Department of
Information Technology and
Telecommunications

Joseph Antonelli
Deputy Commissioner
New York City Department of
Information Technology and
Telecommunications

Tynia Richard
General Counsel
New York City Department of
Information Technology and
Telecommunications

Michael McGrath
Chief Operating Officer
New York City Department of
Information Technology and
Telecommunications

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

7

2 SERGEANT LUGO: Okay. Waiting for the live
3 stream.

4 MS. ANDERSON: Looks good.

5 SERGEANT LUGO: Live Stream is up. Sergeants,
6 video recording please.

7 SERGEANT BRADLEY: DC recording is up.

8 SERGEANT SADOWSKY: cloud recording all set.

9 SERGEANT LUGO: Thank you.

10 The morning everyone. Welcome to today's remote
11 New York City Council fiscal year 2023 executive
12 budget hearing of the committee's on finance, public
13 safety and technology. At this time would all
14 panelists please turn on your videos for verification
15 purposes. To minimize disruption, please place
16 electronic devices to vibrate or silent. If you wish
17 to submit testimony, you may send it to
18 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Again, that's testimony
19 at council@nyc.gov. Thank you for your cooperation
20 chairs. We are ready to begin.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Sergeant. Give
22 me one second.

23 Okay, good morning, everyone. And welcome to the
24 fourth day of executive budget hearings. My name is
25 Justin Brannan. And I have the privilege of chairing

2 the Committee on Finance. First on our agenda today
3 is the New York City Police Department, and I'm
4 pleased to be joined by my colleague, Councilmember
5 Camilla Hanks who was the chair of the Committee on
6 Public Safety, as well as our Speaker Adrienne Adams,
7 who we will hear from shortly.

8 I first have to acknowledge Officer Vargas who
9 was shot last night in the Bronx. Our thoughts...
10 our thoughts and our prayers are with Officer Vargas
11 and his family. I spoke this morning with
12 Councilmember Stevens. The shooting occurred in her
13 district. I understand that officer Vargas is
14 expected to make a full recovery and for that we are
15 grateful.

16 I've always acknowledged that it takes an
17 extraordinary amount of courage to stare down the
18 unknown every day as a New York City cop. We all
19 know that there are too many illegal guns on our
20 streets. These guns come from other states, and
21 they're in the hands of people who currently feel
22 emboldened to use them. Above all, this Council
23 under the leadership of Adrienne Adams is dedicated
24 to keeping our city safe. There may be different
25 ideas on this council and among New Yorkers of how we

2 get there, but we are all ultimately dedicated to
3 making sure that New Yorkers and everyone that visits
4 this city feels safe, full stop.

5 Commissioner Sewell, I would like to extend a
6 welcome to you and your leadership team here today,
7 as we dive into the NYPD fiscal 23 executive budget.
8 The department's projected fiscal 23 budget of \$5.59
9 billion represents 5.6% of the city's overall
10 proposed fiscal budget. NYPD's fiscal 23 budget
11 increased by 3.4% or \$182 million from the
12 preliminary plan of \$5.41 billion. The increase is
13 the result of a number of actions taken, most
14 significant of which are adjustments for planned
15 collective bargaining increases for detectives and
16 sergeants, and a new need for mobility data plans and
17 infrastructure as well as a new need for
18 cybersecurity. I want to deep dive into these new
19 needs that were added in your budget in this finance
20 plan, which will add \$52 million in fiscal 23,
21 cybersecurity mobility data plans and back end
22 infrastructure as well as neighborhood safety teams
23 equipment. This body has made a commitment to ensure
24 that our budget is balanced but also fair, a budget
25 that is equitable for the eight-plus-million New

2 Yorkers who call New York home while some agencies
3 have seen their budgets cut and why peds budget is
4 increasing today and in the coming weeks as we
5 negotiate the budget. I want to make sure that the
6 NYPD is spending its dollars wisely and for the
7 greater good. I look forward to hearing from you and
8 your team Commissioner, as we look deeper into the
9 details and seek answers to this committee's
10 questions. I want to thank Nevin Singh for his
11 preparation of our hearing today, and of course my
12 senior adviser John Yeddin, and the finance team for
13 all their hard work and getting everything ready for
14 today's hearing. I now want to turn to my colleague
15 Chair of the Public Safety Committee, Camilla Hanks
16 for her opening remarks.

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Chair Brannon. I
18 echo you sent sentiments and prayers for Officer
19 Vargas. I'm also very happy to hear that we are
20 joined by Speaker Adams. Thank you very much. I am
21 Councilmember Camila Hanks Chair of the Committee on
22 Public Safety. Welcome to the public safety hearing
23 where we will discuss the police department's fiscal
24 2023 executive budget. Today we will hear from NYPD
25 Commissioner and her top deputies about the NYPD

2 budget and their priorities for the next fiscal year.

3 Later at 12pm, we will also hear from the Mayor's

4 Office of Criminal Justice.

5 Public safety is paramount to the city's recovery
6 and the police department plays an extremely
7 important role. As we work together as partners to
8 adopt a budget it's vital that the council's concerns
9 are addressed and our input is recognized. The New
10 York City department's fiscal 2022 budget is \$5.8
11 billion and the fiscal 2023 budget is \$5.6 billion...
12 \$5.8 billion I apologize and the fiscal 2023 budget
13 is 5.6 billion. The budget supports 35,030 uniformed
14 officers as well as 15,042 civilian personnel.
15 Throughout this year, the Department has worked on a
16 transition to new leadership, the efforts to combat
17 gun violence and working to add community liaisons to
18 improve relationships and to the public. Today I
19 hope to learn about the department's ongoing
20 initiatives and the budget priorities for fiscal
21 2023. And I also look forward to hearing more about
22 the changes since we last met at the preliminary
23 budget hearing in March.

24 I would like to thank Commissioner Sewell and her
25 staff for being here, Nevin Singh for preparing this,

2 and I would also like to thank my staff and the
3 committee staff for all their hard work. And I will
4 now turn to the Committee Counsel to swear in the
5 members to the administration. Thank you.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you chairs. I first
7 want to turn the Speaker Adams to see if she had any
8 opening words. Madame Speaker your... There we go.

9 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much counsel. I
10 just want to say good morning to all and also echo
11 the sentiments of our chair regarding Officer Vargas.
12 Our prayers are certainly with him and his family. I
13 will defer any remarks to questions in the interest
14 of time. Thank you so much.

15 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, ma'am.

16 So good morning, everyone. My name is Malcom
17 Butehorn, Counsel to the Finance Committee. And
18 welcome to the first agency hearing for today May 11.

19 I would like to acknowledge council members
20 present for the record. Councilmembers Schulman,
21 Hanks, Farias, Brannan, Hudson, Sánchez, Holden,
22 Louis, Adams, Stevens, Kagan, Velázquez, Ayala, and
23 Brooks-Powers. Unlike in past council members and
24 mayors of the mayoral administration will have the
25 ability to mute and unmute themselves. When not

2 speaking. We just ask that you please remember to
3 mute yourself. If we hear any background noise, we
4 will go ahead and mute you. Councilmembers who have
5 questions should use the raise hand function in Zoom.

6 I would like to remind council members we are in
7 an extremely tight schedule today. You will have
8 five minutes for questions, and the NYPD due to last
9 night's shooting is on a very tight time schedule as
10 well, understandably, so when the sergeant calls
11 time, we ask that you please wrap up your comments so
12 we can move on to the next person with questions.

13 The following members of the administration are
14 here to testify. I will first read the oath and
15 after I will call on each of you individually to
16 respond.

17 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth
18 and nothing but the truth before these committees and
19 to respond honestly to Councilmember questions.

20 Commissioner Sewell?

21 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: I do.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: First Deputy Commissioner
23 Caban?

24 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CABAN: I do.

25 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Corey?

2 CHIEF COREY: I do.

3 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Ryan?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: I do.

5 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Lipetri?

6 CHIEF LIPETRI: I do.

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Essig?

8 CHIEF ESSIG: I do.

9 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Royster?

10 CHIEF ROYSTER: I do.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief Wilcox?

12 CHIEF WILCOX: I do.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief O'Reilly?

14 CHIEF O'REILLY: I do.

15 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Pemberton?

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PEMBERTON: I do.

17 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Assistant Deputy Commissioner

18 Chernyavsky?

19 ASSISTANT DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CHERNYAVSKY: I do.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Chief of Staff Jones.

21 CHIEF OF STAFF JONES: I do.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: There we go. Thank you.

23 Chief Holmes? (NO ANSWER) Chief Maddrey?

24 CHIEF MADDREY: I do.

25 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Chief Abbassi?

2 CHIEF ABBASSI: I do.

3 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Litwin?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER LITWIN: I do.

5 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Parker?

6 (NO ANSWER) Deputy Commissioner Hart? (NO ANSWER)

7 Deputy Chief Larin? (NO ANSWER) Chief Mirallas? (NO

8 ANSWER) Chief Pontillo? (NO ANSWER) Chief Galati?

9 NO ANSWER) Chief Tobin?

10 CHIEF TOBIN: I do.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Deputy Chief

12 Thompson?

13 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: I do.

14 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Deputy Commissioner Stewart?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER STEWART: I do.

16 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Assistant Chief Wright.

17 ASSISTANT CHIEF WRIGHT: I do.

18 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: And Deputy Chief _____?

19 DEPUTY CHIEF _____: I do.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Commissioner

21 Sewell whenever you are ready

22 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: Good morning Speaker Adams,

23 Chair Brannan, Chair Hanks, and members of the

24 Council. Thank you for the opportunity to discuss

25

2 the mayor's executive budget for the 2023 fiscal
3 year.

4 I am joined today by members of my executive
5 staff who will assist me in answering your questions.
6 I would like to begin by updating you and New Yorkers
7 on the police involved shooting last night. Officers
8 assigned to the 42 precinct public safety team
9 engaged with an individual carrying an illegal
10 firearm. One officer was shot in his left arm by
11 this individual who was also shot in the exchange.
12 This individual was previously convicted for a
13 robbery pattern in 2016 and released on five years'
14 probation. He was again arrested in 2020 with an
15 illegal gun, released, pled guilty to attempted
16 criminal possession of a weapon in the third degree
17 in December 2021. Released again, and his court date
18 scheduled for last week was moved to June. We have
19 been able to determine that the illegal firearm, a
20 Glock nine millimeter was reported stolen in
21 Richmond, Virginia in 2021. The investigation into
22 this incident is ongoing.

23 The officer shot represents the eighth...
24 /eighth/ such officer this year alone in New York
25 City and highlights the dangerous conditions your

2 officers are faced with in their fight to combat gun
3 violence. The work of police officers in the 42
4 precinct has contributed to a 28% increase in gun
5 arrests so far this year, which has led to a 31%
6 decline in shooting incidents year to date in that
7 command. The NYPD family, as I am certain all New
8 Yorkers are grateful our wounded officer is
9 recovering at home with his family after having been
10 released from the hospital earlier today. I want to
11 thank New Yorkers for their inspiration, support, and
12 partnership and our vision of a safer New York City.

13 While we have significantly increased the number
14 of officers patrolling our streets and subways and
15 dramatically increased arrests of those preying on
16 the innocent, the contribution of members of the
17 public has proven invaluable as we fight to achieve
18 our shared goal. Oftentimes, it is because of you
19 that we are able to develop leads, timely gather
20 vital evidence, and ultimately apprehend dangerous
21 suspects. Your assistance in bringing the subway
22 shooter to justice last month was nothing short of
23 remarkable. From the courageous riders,
24 eyewitnesses, and concerned citizens who kept a keen
25 eye out for the suspect, to the business owners who

2 provided us with crucial video footage, to everyone
3 who provided comfort and solace to their fellow New
4 Yorkers. Whether injured or coping with fear and
5 uncertainty, the NYPD and, may I say all, of New York
6 City thanks you.

7 Everyday New Yorkers have always been
8 instrumental in helping this department solve crime
9 and keep New York City safe. Recent examples have
10 been arrests in the shooting of a Bronx 16-year-old
11 Anjali Jambo, the murder of 61-year-old Juana
12 Esperanza Soriano De Perdomo in the Bronx, the hate
13 crime assault of 65-year-old Filipino immigrant Vilma
14 Kari in Midtown, the bias-motivated gang assault of a
15 21-year-old Hasidic Man in Brooklyn, and the
16 prosecution of the individual who opened fire on one
17 of our officers in broad daylight during his commute
18 to work on the busy Macombs Dam Bridge. All of these
19 arrests have been made since I last testified to you
20 during March's preliminary budget hearing. New
21 Yorkers are stepping up and so are your police
22 officers and detectives. When compared to the same
23 period last year murders are down 15%, while arrests
24 for murder are up 12%. Shootings are down 5%, while

2 gun arrests are up 10%. Officers have recovered over
3 2600 illegal guns so far this year.

4 Although we are still seeing increases in other
5 index crime categories, your officers and detectives
6 are pushing to turn the tide on these trends.

7 Arrests for rape and robbery are up 34% each. Felony
8 assault and burglary arrests are up 27% each. Grand
9 larceny arrests are up 34% and grand larceny auto
10 arrests are up 48%. While arrests are up for each of
11 the major felony crimes 21%, of those arrested for
12 murder whose cases are open are currently not in
13 custody. The same is true for 87% of those with an
14 open rape case, 76% with an open robbery, 90% with an
15 open felony assault, 69% With an open burglary, 78%
16 of those with an open gun case, and 37% with an open
17 shooting case. So far this year 16% of those
18 arrested for possessing an illegal gun and 24%
19 arrested for shooting had an open felony case at the
20 time of arrest. Those arrested for burglary, grand
21 larceny and auto theft were rearrested for a new
22 felony offense within 60 days at a rate of 24%, 20%,
23 and 21%, respectively. An arrest is only the
24 starting point in the victims journey toward justice.
25 With the cycle of victimization resulting from those

2 that commit crime are arrested, released, then re-
3 arrested for victimizing additional people is
4 completely avoidable.

5 The NYPD is committed to doing its part to ensure
6 the safety and quality of life of everyone in this
7 city, but meaningful success will not be achieved
8 through our work alone. The criminal justice system
9 must be calibrated to ensure violent felons and
10 recidivist offenders do not escape meaningful
11 consequences by taking advantage of reforms aimed at
12 providing a second chance to first-time low-level
13 offenders.

14 We have already begun assigning officers in
15 administrative positions to patrol as we move forward
16 with our top-to-bottom efficiency review. As of
17 today, we have completed the first phase of our
18 review one month ahead of schedule. And as a result,
19 over 125 officers will be reassigned to patrol
20 functions. The productivity of our officers'
21 enhanced deployments, which account for an additional
22 658 officers patrolling our streets daily, coupled
23 with our recent deployment of our neighborhood safety
24 teams that focus on gun violence are beginning to
25

2 show measurable results. However, as we all know too
3 well, the summer presents challenges to our efforts.

4 In anticipation of summer crime levels. My
5 executive team and I have developed a reduction plan
6 that we have already begun to implement. The summer
7 violence strategy comprises strategic deployment,
8 enhanced supervision, real-time effectiveness
9 reviews, and leverages resources and personnel from
10 every corner of the department. We began our
11 preparation over a month ago with the identification
12 of 40 commands across the city that have historically
13 experienced increases in crime in the summer. We
14 pinpointed that in both 2020 and 2021, between the
15 month of May and Labor Day, approximately 42% of
16 shootings occurred between 9pm and 2am in these
17 commands. Our strategy will therefore adjust officer
18 tours and focus deployments to ensure uninterrupted
19 and robust coverage.

20 But I want to be clear, the scope of the strategy
21 will go far beyond gun violence. Neighborhood
22 coordination officers and youth coordination officers
23 will be working later tours. Field intelligence
24 officers willing Increase field deployments during
25 weekends and night hours. Traffic Safety teams will

2 be deployed in each of these commands during weekend
3 evening hours. A lieutenant and sergeant will be
4 assigned to oversee 311 and quality of life response
5 and enforcement in each command. A multi-agency
6 response will be on standby and will respond
7 immediately to locations with large crowds,
8 unauthorized sale of alcohol, and noise violations on
9 weekends. A summer violence coordinator in the rank
10 of inspector will be assigned to every patrol borough
11 and will be tasked with maximizing efficiency and the
12 effectiveness of our efforts and making adjustments
13 as needed in real time.

14 Officers assigned to these 40 precincts will be
15 exempted from regular summer details and will instead
16 remain in their commands to maximize the
17 effectiveness of the violence reduction strategy. I
18 believe their familiarity and experience in the
19 neighborhood and its residents will be better
20 utilized in their home command.

21 We have identified over 125 officers to backfill
22 the usual summer detailed deployment in Coney Island,
23 Orchard Beach, and The Rockaways to ensure adequate
24 coverage. The steps I have outlined represent
25 highlights of the overall strategy, which is

2 comprehensive and a true representation of an all-
3 hands approach.

4 Mayor Adams has presented a bold public safety
5 agenda involving nearly every facet of his
6 administration, and we at the NYPD are committed to
7 efficiently executing our aspects of his vision. The
8 Mayor's vision for subway safety is at the top of the
9 list. Since its inception in February, the NYPD has
10 deployed over 1000 additional officers per day into
11 the subways to address the increase in crime and
12 subway rules violations and to assist the various
13 non-NYPD partner outreach teams to provide services
14 to the homeless and those suffering from mental
15 health crises. Though non-punitive corrective
16 members are always the first resort when it comes to
17 lower level offenses. Year-to-date, we have seen in
18 approximately 18% increase in civil, and an 8%
19 increase in criminal summons for subway rules
20 violations.

21 Transit felony and misdemeanor arrests are up
22 approximately 49% and 66% respectively. While we are
23 still seeing an increase in subway crime as compared
24 to last year, when ridership was significantly lower,
25 if we compare the current crime numbers to the pre-

2 pandemic crime, we are actually witnessing a
3 decrease. Results will continue to improve upon, as
4 ridership continues to increase. We are also
5 redoubling our efforts as part of the
6 administration's initiative to address quality of
7 life conditions citywide, to focus services and
8 resources on these everyday problems that gradually
9 erode New Yorkers sense of safety. New Yorkers are
10 demanding our help, whether through 311 calls for
11 service -- up over 17% versus last year -- or direct
12 requests made to our patrol officers and at precinct
13 level meetings, New Yorkers have made it clear to us
14 that the status quo cannot stand.

15 Last month, we renewed our commitment to
16 addressing these quality of life conditions and
17 instructed our officers that when they observe such
18 issues they must be addressed. The aim of this
19 renewed effort is to be fundamentally non-punitive.
20 Corrective action can take many forms, from simply
21 warring an individual to broader public engagement
22 and collaboration with community groups, businesses
23 and service providers. However, when non-punitive
24 efforts fail to address your complaints, enforcement
25 action will become part of the solution. If certain

2 locations are plagued by complaints, or a subject
3 must be warned and admonished repeatedly, officers
4 are expected to take appropriate enforcement action
5 to rectify the condition, starting first with a civil
6 summons when available, and resorting to a criminal
7 suspect summons when arrest is necessary.

8 Through April, we have responded to over 381,000
9 311 calls for service for quality of life offenses,
10 as compared to 325,000 in 2021, and 253,000 in 2020
11 for the same period. So far this year, we've issued
12 over 6000 civil summonses and 15,000 criminal
13 summonses. However, I would be remiss if I did not
14 acknowledge and credit our officers for the countless
15 effective non-punitive interactions that have
16 addressed your concerns. Officers have also stepped
17 up Traffic Safety Enforcement in response to
18 unacceptable levels of pedestrian and cyclist
19 injuries and fatalities. Year to date, failure to
20 yield enforcement is up 33%, up 62% in April. We
21 have also significantly increased enforcement for
22 speeding, red light, and hazardous violations up 57%,
23 28%, and 48% respectively for the month of April. I
24 believe the stepped up enforcement and our work with

2 the Department of Transportation will help turn the
3 tide.

4 I want to take a moment to update the Council on
5 some of the important initiatives I mentioned at the
6 preliminary budget hearing in March. We have begun
7 distributing the APX NEXT digital radio to our
8 officers, which will allow the department to update
9 this vital equipment remotely without the need for
10 officers to come off patrol duties to have their
11 equipment manually updated. These new radios will
12 also enable us to centrally determine an officers
13 location when necessary, especially during rapidly
14 unfolding emergencies. We have also updated officers
15 department cell phones with a precision alert system.
16 This new technological tool will enable officers to
17 push out alerts through their phones with the name of
18 a wanted suspect or vehicle license plate and receive
19 immediate feedback if the individual or vehicle is
20 encountered by another city agency. We believe this
21 tool not only builds upon our precision policing
22 model, but will also be an invaluable crime-fighting
23 tool and will assist in locating individuals reported
24 missing or abducted.

2 As part of the Department strive to leverage
3 technology to better be able to connect to the
4 communities we serve, the NYPD offered streaming
5 access to 232 of the 309 Build The Block Meetings in
6 the first quarter of 2022. Although in-person
7 attendance will become the norm again, in a post
8 pandemic environment we will continue to look for
9 ways to provide virtual access to as many people as
10 possible in as many contexts as possible. Improving
11 community engagement is not limited to technological
12 upgrades. We have also revamped the precinct
13 commanding officer selection process to give a
14 greater voice to both elected officials and the
15 communities we serve. Now, when a commanding officer
16 position becomes available, the Chief of Department
17 will alert members of the service of the vacancy and
18 the minimum and preferred qualifications for the
19 position. After internal interviews, the finalists
20 will present at a precinct or PSA Community Council
21 meeting moderated by the Community Council president.
22 The meeting will be open to all community members to
23 attend in person or remotely, rather than a select
24 few as has been done in the past. Attendees will be
25 given the opportunity to provide feedback to the

2 department using a newly created feedback forum,
3 which will be used in making the selection. While we
4 keep reassessing the process with an eye toward
5 improvement, I believe this new process addresses the
6 concerns we have heard and operational challenges we
7 have witnessed.

8 Finally, I would like to announce changes I am
9 making to the Special Victims Unit. After listening
10 to the concerns raised by survivors, advocates, and
11 elected leaders, I have taken steps to put in place a
12 system that will provide officers and detectives with
13 a career and promotional path wholly within the
14 Special Victims Unit, if they choose to pursue it.

15 Special Victims work is among the most
16 challenging assignments in the department, and we owe
17 it to survivors to ensure experienced and talented
18 investigators that are best suited to do the job are
19 not forced to seek transfer because of a lack of
20 opportunities. I've also assigned a new commanding
21 officer to oversee the Special Victims Unit.

22 Inspector Carlos Ortiz is an experienced police
23 executive, having served 25 years in this department.
24 During his career, Inspector Ortiz served as a
25 domestic violence sergeant for five years, oversaw

2 six detective squads in the Bronx as a captain, was
3 the commanding officer of Manhattan South detectives
4 as a captain and Deputy Inspector, and commanded the
5 115th precinct, where he was promoted to inspector.

6 My executive team and I had met with special
7 victims advocates ahead of this election, and
8 facilitated the opportunity for the advocates to meet
9 with three candidates that were under consideration
10 individually, and to provide feedback which I used in
11 making my decision.

12 I believe Inspector Ortiz is the right individual
13 for this job. He will not only instill an atmosphere
14 of empathy among investigators, but will use his
15 experience to ensure investigators are conducting
16 quality investigations and have manageable case
17 loads.

18 Lastly, I believe victims of human trafficking
19 are by definition, special victims. That is why I am
20 transferring the responsibility to investigate human
21 trafficking cases out of our vice unit and into the
22 Special Victims Unit. I strongly believe this move
23 and the specialized training and skills possessed by
24 our special victims investigators is the right
25

2 approach for survivors. And will change the way the
3 department fundamentally views human trafficking.

4 Turning to the executive budget, and its impact
5 on the NYPD in the coming fiscal year: In totality,
6 the NYPD is fiscal year 2023 expense budget is \$5.6
7 billion, the vast majority of which, 91% is allocated
8 for personnel costs. The remaining 9% is dedicated
9 to non-personnel costs, including technology that
10 provides officers with immediate access to critical
11 safety equipment, tools, and application. In this
12 financial plan, the department's fiscal year 2023
13 budget increased by \$182 million. Of this amount
14 \$119 million was for detective and sergeant labor
15 contract increases. The balance of this increase,
16 \$62 million, is for critical improvements to
17 cybersecurity, maintenance of the domain awareness
18 system, and adjustments for lease, fuel, and energy
19 costs.

20 I am determined to run this department
21 efficiently and effectively to not only bring justice
22 and closure to victims and their families, but to use
23 our resources in a manner that will prevent
24 victimization and improve the quality of life of
25 everyone in every neighborhood. Our partnership with

2 you and the communities we serve is the most
3 effective public safety tool. I am committed to
4 enhancing these partnerships so we can all take pride
5 in a safer and more prosperous city.

6 Thank you. And we'd be happy to answer your
7 questions.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you very much,
9 Commissioner. I now want to turn it to our Speaker
10 Adrienne Adams for the first question.

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much Chair
12 Brannan. Thank you Chair Hanks. And Commissioner
13 Sewell, it's always a delight to see you. Thank you
14 and your entire team for being here this morning.
15 And again, our hearts go out to Officer Vargas.

16 I have to remark, of course, on your announcement
17 of Inspector Ortiz in taking over the Special Victims
18 Unit. I am very pleased to hear that. As you know,
19 there has been... you know, as a former chair of this
20 committee, this has been an extreme issue for us in
21 The Council in... in fighting for victims. So it's
22 refreshing to hear that there's been a change. It
23 sounds like and we'll... we'll watch and of course
24 we'll do our oversight duties, but it is... it is
25 good that there was a change in leadership there. My

2 question is how long was the Inspector Ortiz a
3 domestic violence sergeant? How long did he do
4 that...?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CABAN: Five years.

6 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: Five years.

7 SPEAKER ADAMS: Five years. Okay. And again,
8 just for the edification of my colleagues, what is
9 the number of personnel of detectives in that unit,
10 and what is the breakdown, male versus female?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CABAN: In the Special
12 Victims Unit, in the adult section, we have 115
13 Detectives, police officers investigating. In the
14 child section, there's 83 Detective investigators, a
15 total of 265 members of the Special Victims division
16 and we're... we're looking to upstaff that in the
17 near future when Inspector Ortiz comes along.

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: Do you have a gender break down
19 for us?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER CABAN: Yeah sure. Okay,
21 yeah. We have white males 142. I'm sorry... Can I
22 just get back to you on that? Take the next
23 question. I have it in my notes here. I've just got
24 to find it. Oh here we go. I'm sorry. 167 males,
25 109 females.

2 SPEAKER ADAMS: I asked that question, because of
3 the... the cases that come before you, and the number
4 of cases that come before you brought by women,
5 obviously, so that's why I asked that question.

6 I'm going to move along, and another... kind of
7 organic to my question, you know, over the years, and
8 my colleagues are going to going to dig a lot deeper
9 than this, I will definitely defer to them to dig a
10 lot deeper into this, and that is, of course, the
11 financial management of your budget, which has been
12 an issue for a number of years, your priorities, and
13 over time, I'm sure will come up in this conversation
14 as well, which again, I will defer to my colleagues
15 to dig deeper into.

16 I'm, again, happy to hear that your goal is to
17 manage the department efficiently and effectively.
18 What I would like to see also is transparency. And
19 that is what my question is going to revolve around
20 this morning. Again, as the former Chair of Public
21 Safety, I consistently called for an overhaul of the
22 city's expense budget structure to create new units
23 of appropriation that will help increase
24 transparency. Our FY 2023 budget response... in our
25 budget response, the council called for the NYPD to

2 add units of appropriation to match the 18 different
3 program areas in the Budget Function Analysis, or
4 BFA. For example, NYPD budget has \$3.4 billion or
5 60% of funding under one, U Of A titled Operations.
6 This U Of A includes the protection of life,
7 property, responding to emergency calls,
8 investigation of reported crimes, and a myriad of
9 other agency operations. But it's unacceptable that
10 billions of dollars are allocated within one sole U
11 of A with no transparency of how much the NYPD spends
12 on each core operation. So my question... my first
13 question is, why is the NYPD budget structured in
14 such a way that there are Units of Appropriation with
15 billions of dollars appropriated with very little
16 transparency of how this funding is allocated?

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So I can speak to
18 that. So the NYPD actually has the second highest
19 number of units of appropriations after the
20 Department of Education. And one thing that we have
21 done in terms of increasing transparency is we
22 actually increase the number of budget functions. So
23 we actually have more than 18 now. As part of the
24 recent financial plan, we've now created additional
25 budget functions. So there are now 30. And what we

2 did was we created budget functions for each of the
3 patrol bureaus, as well as 2 budget functions for the
4 detective bureau. So what we're doing there is
5 trying to increase transparency, while at the same
6 time enabling the department to have a flexibility
7 within the unit's appropriation to transfer officers
8 and staff as we need to. The budget also has more
9 granular detail within each of those units of
10 appropriation at the budget code level. So we are
11 hearing you on the transparency and working to
12 provide that through the budget function analysis
13 increase in terms of budget functions.

14 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay, I thank you for that. That
15 is an increase, and we're looking for those numbers
16 to go higher than that. Are there plans to increase
17 the number of U of A's above the 30 to ensure that it
18 mirrors the program areas in the budget function
19 analysis?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So with the budget
21 functions, we're open to looking at creating more
22 budget functions. And I'm sure as part of the
23 dialogue between now and adoption, we'll also have
24 conversations about units of appropriation.

2 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay, I'm just going to encourage
3 that to continue, because the council doesn't vote at
4 that level. We do vote at the U of A level, just to
5 be clear, and we do need to see those numbers
6 increase in order to foster that transparency that we
7 need. I will... I may come back for another round of
8 questioning, but I know that my colleagues are eager
9 to into this conversation and I'm going to defer to
10 them at this point. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Speaker Adams
12 for your leadership.

13 Commissioner, I want to get right into it in the
14 interest of time. When this... when this year's
15 fiscal budget FY 22 was adopted last year, the NYPD
16 budget was \$5.4 billion. Now it's \$5.6 billion.
17 Similarly, FY 23's budget increased from \$5.1 billion
18 to the current \$5.6 billion. Can you... large print,
19 can you explain the reasons for the increases?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So essentially, the
21 vast majority of increases are tied to the collective
22 bargaining, increases for sergeants and detectives.
23 So in fiscal year 22, you're right, there was an
24 increase of a little over \$200 million. 52% of that
25 was tied to collective bargaining. In fiscal year

2 23, a \$181 million increase, and 66% of that is tied
3 to collective bargaining. And in the out years, \$145
4 million increase per year, about 80% of that is tied
5 to collective bargaining. Basically, in addition to
6 the collective bargaining, the funding is also being
7 added for other critical needs within the department.
8 Over time, funding for... as you mentioned earlier,
9 the domain awareness system, which is a critical tool
10 that allows NYPD personnel to access information out
11 in the field regarding 911 calls, history of 911
12 addresses, and other reports and information. We have
13 to make sure that we can maintain that system and the
14 funding for that is added one or two years at a time.
15 So that's reflected in the budget.

16 Cybersecurity, to make sure we have the strongest
17 defenses against cyberattacks, which have obviously
18 been increasing nationwide and globally, funding to
19 staff... for staff to support our gun violence
20 strategies partnership, funding for the neighborhood
21 safety team dashboard cameras, and as I mentioned,
22 the collective bargaining, and then their small
23 amounts for increases in heat, light, and power.
24 Just to put our budget in overall context, looking
25 over the past decade, NYPD's budget has grown by 25%.

2 The citywide budget has grown by over 50% during that
3 time period. So we do take our fiscal responsibility
4 very seriously, but we also need the resources and
5 the critical tools to make sure we can perform our
6 duties.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, how much federal
8 funding has the NYPD received this year? And what's
9 your projection for federal funding next year?
10 (crosstalk) Just... Just for context, I'm asking
11 because I want to know if it's safe to say, based on
12 previous year's allocations, that the budget will
13 increase about \$200 million from the Federal
14 counterterrorism grants.

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah, on average, we
16 get about \$200 million a year in federal funding, and
17 those grants, and that funding is reflected in the
18 budget one year at a time. We may actually get some
19 additional funding this year. So the federal
20 government has released several notices of funding
21 opportunity over the last several weeks. We are
22 currently applying for or in the process of applying
23 for over two dozen grants, which have an individual
24 max available to them of about \$30 million. So I

2 think we'll probably be around \$200, but it may be a
3 little bit higher.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So this is our fourth,
5 executive budget hearing so far. And the trend that
6 we're hearing from some of the agencies is, you know,
7 they wish they could get some more money from OMB.
8 So were there any needs that the NYPD had that the
9 administration did not fund?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: One of the areas that
11 we've been discussing with OMB and continuing to have
12 additional conversations is with regard to our fleet
13 funding, which has been cut significantly, and
14 obviously, we have significant number of frontline
15 vehicles that need to be in operating order. And as
16 they age a creates it more stress on the vehicles and
17 maintenance. The technology that I mentioned earlier
18 with regard to the domain awareness system and other
19 technology, we're very grateful to OMB for providing
20 that funding in the current year and next year.
21 Ideally, we would see that funded in the baseline
22 because those are ongoing needs for the department.
23 And of course, we have the ongoing discussion
24 regarding the overtime budget, which in the out
25 years, and the current year was based on fiscal year

2 21, which was really an anomalous year with regards
3 not having a lot events, and with regard to us not
4 being able to do some of the critical things we
5 really do need now to do. So those are things that
6 we've been discussing with and we'll continue to
7 discuss with OMB, and I'm sure in the context of the
8 adopted budget negotiations.

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, but the main the main
10 ask that that wasn't granted is with regard to the
11 fleet.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: The fleet was a
13 significant ask. Yes, because we sustained a
14 significant cut on the fleet over the last three
15 years.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So I appreciate you keeping
17 an eye on... on spending efficiently and on potential
18 savings. Have there been any areas that have been
19 identified for savings in the future that you're
20 looking at for savings?

21 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So we're always
22 looking at... at efficiencies with... within the
23 department. One of the areas that we're looking to
24 explore further is to make sure that our our IT
25 expenditures are... are really focused and we're

2 utilizing them. You know, IT maintenance is a
3 critical issue. It is an area where we do need more
4 resources, but it's something that we're going to be
5 looking at very closely, just in terms of
6 efficiencies overall. The Commissioner mentioned a
7 lot of the redeployments we're doing, which really do
8 help us in terms of making sure that we're able to
9 operate with the reductions we've already taken,
10 particularly with regards to the uniformed staff,
11 which is staying at about 1200. And we're
12 continuously monitoring and evaluating overtime,
13 making sure that we can utilize the right mix of
14 staff, for example, for events, where can we use
15 civilian staff versus uniformed staff and making sure
16 we're utilizing that in the appropriate way to
17 maximize deployments and have the officers where they
18 need to be when they need to be there.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. So in relation to
20 headcount, has attrition slowed from the previous
21 years during the pandemic, when I know it was
22 particularly high?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Chief Morales...

24

25

2 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: Chief Morales should be on,
3 if you'll bear with me. Chief Morales, would you
4 please discuss the headcount?

5 CHIEF MORALES: Good morning, could you hear me?

6 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: Yes, yes, we can.

7 CHIEF MORALES: So attrition for... for 2021, the
8 rate was 7.6%. For 2020 was 8.6%. And for 2019, it
9 was 5.7%. So I think we took a little bit of a high
10 attrition in 2020. I think most of that occurred in
11 the first three months of the fiscal year, due to
12 some decrease in budget and overtime. And also, you
13 know, we're in a way... the way the city was going
14 with... with protests, I think that that was one of
15 the main causes of people leaving, but overall, the
16 attrition is, you know, has been remaining pretty
17 steady this year.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And when... when are the
19 next academy classes scheduled to graduate and how
20 large are the classes?

21 CHIEF MORALES: So we put in a class of 800 this
22 past April. In December, we put a class of about
23 600. They're going to graduate in in June. And the
24 class that we put in April will graduate in October.
25 The next class will be in probably the second week of

2 July, but we have not determined the headcount of
3 that class.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: How is headcount
5 determined?

6 CHIEF MORALES: Well, we look at attrition as the
7 main cause.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I want to move along
9 to cybersecurity. The new needs that were added to
10 your budget Miss financial plan, which add up to \$52
11 million in FY 23. There's a \$13 million addition in
12 FY 23, and a \$15 million dollar addition in the out
13 years for various cybersecurity related items. In
14 addition to those funds added, there's also a \$23
15 million add in capital funds. We have some details
16 on the breakdown of these funds. But I'd like to get
17 some more details. I'd like to know how the needs
18 for these items are determined and then... does the
19 NYPD bring in outside IT consultants to assess these
20 needs?

21 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: Chief Thompson should be
22 on. DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: Good morning.

23 So just to begin, our cybersecurity is focused on
24 three major components. That's our security
25 operations center, that's 24/7. In that center, we

2 have live dashboards where we monitor all of our
3 systems to make sure they're working properly. We
4 also monitor threat intelligence on a daily basis, as
5 well as our cybersecurity architect and design. And
6 then our last component is vulnerability management.

7 So yes, we have a mix of consultants and on-staff
8 people that advise us and monitor our systems, give
9 us guidance and certain tools that are essential for
10 cybersecurity. If there's one particular tool or
11 area you want to discuss, I could probably give you
12 some highlighted information in that.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure. I mean, I guess I'm
14 interested to know what the NYPD spends total on
15 cybersecurity and if... how much of that money is
16 spent on outside consultants versus implementing what
17 the consultants say needs to be done.

18 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: So, it's kind of a mix,
19 but I'll explain. As it relates to our... our
20 security incidents and event management, that pretty
21 much focuses on our recording of logs. So various
22 logs on various different applications and systems
23 have to be recorded and kept on a daily basis. We do
24 that with two consultants and most of the rest of it
25 is in-house staff. So we try to limit those

2 consultants, but they are counted within the
3 contract.

4 Our next area that we focus on and which is a new
5 need as well, is in our asset discovery and response.
6 That's our antivirus software. We... a lot of what
7 we do, we train our folks to do. Our staff in total,
8 just to get back to your question is about 29
9 individuals, of that 29 individuals only 12 are
10 consultants... in-house consultants that work with
11 us, but the majority of our procurements are based on
12 what our needs are to increase cybersecurity, as well
13 as to assist us in the deployment and monitoring of
14 our cybersecurity problem.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: With the threat of... you
16 know, I've seen a lot of concern, rightfully on all
17 levels of government about cybersecurity. What is
18 the NYPD's plan in case there's some type of security
19 breach? And where are the experts telling us that
20 that breach, or that threat is coming from is it
21 domestic? Is it global?

22 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: As far as intelligence
23 goes, we monitor various different sources for
24 intelligence. We monitor _____ out of Washington,
25 DC, who puts out memos, the FBI that provides

2 intelligence information, but we also monitor our
3 daily traffic. We receive incidents and events on a
4 regular basis. We monitor the flow of where
5 information comes in. So if we see... we can monitor
6 if information is flowing through our fiber from
7 outside of the United States, that's a critical thing
8 for us, we'll monitor that. But we monitor the flow
9 of traffic. And we get... take guidance from our
10 federal resources, whether it's FBI intelligence or
11 information out of the chief security officer in
12 Washington, DC, that puts out various intelligence
13 memos.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: But what are the threats
15 that we're... we're worried about? I mean, are we
16 talking about, you know, threats to our banking
17 system, or to the NYPD itself? What are we most
18 worried about?

19 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: We're worried about our
20 systems. I mean, there's various threats across the
21 platform. Our concerns are our system, what
22 information is going out, what's coming in, are
23 people coming in leaving breadcrumbs and trying to
24 access our system? So the tools that we... we
25 procure, manage the protection of those systems,

2 whether it's our password management system that
3 allows us to ensure nobody is trying to go in, leave
4 a breadcrumb and get a password. We monitor
5 everything. We see each incident, or event as... as
6 something we should be concerned about and
7 monitoring. And we do that in real time. So our
8 dashboards constantly give us alerts, and we look at
9 every alert. Based on what we see in the alert will
10 dictate the level of investigation.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Have we... do we... do you
12 think as far as the City of New York, is our is our
13 cybersecurity where it needs to be?

14 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: I think we probably are.
15 We make sure that every system we buy is CJIS
16 compliant, so it's federal government compliant. I
17 think we're in a good place, and we continue to
18 procure to make sure we harden our infrastructure, as
19 well as our mobile devices.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Has there ever been a
21 breach in the NYPD systems?

22 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: Not that I'm aware of.
23 Not that I'm aware of.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, I want to... I want
3 to move quickly, because I obviously want to give my
4 colleagues time.

5 The mobility data plans in the back end
6 infrastructure, which is not an inconsequential
7 amount of money: There are funds for two years that
8 helps support the department's Domain Awareness
9 System. Can you tell us briefly about the Domain
10 Awareness System?

11 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: It's our central
12 repository for all information for our officers in
13 the field, and already patrol cars, by looking at
14 their phones, by looking at their tablets or their
15 laptops, they can gain access to any of our systems,
16 from cameras to information when they respond to
17 radio runs, to information on perpetrators, to
18 complaint information, mental illness information
19 when they're responding to a job run. It is a
20 central repository of all of our systems. All in one
21 area.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: And is that... how is that
23 backed up? Is it on the cloud?

24 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: We use cloud-based
25 government storage. We have to use the government

2 cloud, which is CJIS compliant. And then we have a
3 number of layers of redundancy. I don't really want
4 to share all those things. But it is backed up.
5 Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. I mean, it's it
7 sounds, it sounds pretty critical. So I would expect
8 that it would require funding again in a future
9 financial plan. So I guess I'm curious as to why
10 those funds are not baselined.

11 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: In the past, and I'll
12 defer to the Deputy Commissioner of Budget, to ask
13 for asset funds that we no longer get, and that may
14 account for the significant spike more recently or in
15 the last two years.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes, I can speak to
17 that. At one point, based on a large asset forfeiture
18 settlement that the Manhattan District Attorney
19 received several years ago. That funded a lot of our
20 domain awareness system costs for several years. At
21 that time, the... once the funding dropped off, it
22 was not baselined in the budget, so we are receiving
23 funding every financial plan for about two years at a
24 time. It's a discussion that we have with OMB. I
25 think they just look at, you know, the level of

2 resources they're anticipating in the future years.
3 And they're aware that this is an ongoing cost. So
4 it's an ongoing dialogue we have with them, but
5 you're correct. I anticipate that these funds if
6 need for these funds will continue in the out years
7 of the financial plan.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. My last question.
9 The mayor's blueprint to end gun violence. I guess
10 my biggest critique was... was there wasn't really a
11 price tag attached to it. So the neighborhood safety
12 teams that are critical in this work: Can you detail
13 what type of equipment is required? I see about a
14 million-and-a-half dollars, \$200,000 baseline for
15 equipment for the neighborhood safety teams?

16 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: So our neighborhood
17 safety teams all have dash cameras in their vehicles
18 as well and body worn cameras. So that's where
19 that... (crosstalk)

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: The cars that they use, do
21 they do not already have those dash cameras?

22 CHIEF COREY: Councilmember, we are piloting...
23 we piloted the use of dash cameras in those
24 neighborhood safety team vehicles. We currently have
25 them out in 14 vehicles spread over 7 precincts. And

2 we are attempting to procure additional cameras to
3 outfit the rest of those cars. Our cars are not
4 typically equipped with dash cameras, except for
5 highway patrol autos.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Got it. So... I'm asking
7 because these are the only funds we've seen in the
8 budget for the safety teams. Has there been a
9 request for any additional funding?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So the actual... the
11 training is being done in the academy. And there's
12 really no additional discrete cost for that. And the
13 cost for the officers themselves, these are officers
14 that were already on NYPD payroll, and we already had
15 the funding for that. So really it is limited to, at
16 this point, the dash camera.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Good. We appreciate that
18 in-house spending certainly.

19 Last question, how many neighborhoods are these
20 teams currently operating in?

21 CHIEF COREY: So right now they're operating in
22 30 precincts and 4 housing PSAs.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Got it. Okay. I
24 appreciate your time. I'm going to hand it over now

2 to our Public Safety Chair, Camilla Hanks. Thank you
3 so much.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Chair Brannan. I
5 want to thank Commissioner Sewell and NYPD for their
6 testimony, Speaker Adams and Chair Brannon for his
7 questioning.

8 My first line of questioning is going to surround
9 gun violence strategies, partnerships. These are...
10 these are issues that are very near and dear to all
11 New Yorkers. How we're going to solve gun violence.
12 I lost one of my... my students the day before
13 yesterday, shot in the chest at 3:45 broad daylight,
14 and he's 26 years old. And so, you know, these
15 things are... you know, have to be solved.

16 So, what is the gun violence strategies
17 partnership and how will the 20 positions be
18 contributing to it? Will they be administrative
19 positions, data analysts legal counsels? Can you
20 provide more details?

21 CHIEF LIPETRI: Good morning. So the Gun
22 Violence Strategic Partnership is a collaborative
23 effort through numerous law enforcement agencies
24 throughout the city and also our federal partners, in
25 partnership with all five District Attorney's

2 offices, the special narcotics prosecutor, we have
3 daily meetings to target the individuals that
4 continue to contribute to a large, large proportion
5 of the shooting violence in New York City.

6 As discussed in prior hearings, we have
7 identified approximately 800 individuals that have
8 fired a weapon in New York City over the past year
9 and a half, either... identified either as a suspect,
10 a person of interest, is wanted, or has been
11 arrested. That population is point 0.009% of the
12 population of New York City. That is precision
13 policing. We share that list with our district
14 attorney's offices. We also share that list with our
15 federal prosecutors, and every one of those
16 individuals, everyone is under investigation by
17 either the detective bureau, namely the Gun Violence,
18 Oppression Division, the Violent Crime Squad, the
19 narcotics units, or the local... local precinct
20 detective squads. In addition, our Intelligence
21 Bureau is also investigating these individuals.
22 Approximately 25% of the 800 are presently
23 incarcerated. That is a sharp increase from the list
24 from last year, where approximately 16% of the list
25 was incarcerated. So again, it's about precision

2 policing. It's about collaborating with our local
3 prosecutors and our partners in law enforcement. But
4 it's also about the... the analysis that comes with
5 that. It's data driven. It's... you know, and a lot
6 of the new analysts that that we're looking to hire
7 will help in this analysis, not just within crime
8 control strategies within the detective bureau, and
9 also helping the local prosecutors every day focusing
10 on this small, small group of individuals.

11 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Can you share any
12 lessons learned thus far? And what's the total budget
13 and headcount for this initiative? What unit and/or
14 division is this housed under?

15 CHIEF LIPETRI: So it's housed under multiple
16 bureaus, but namely the Detective Bureau and the
17 Intelligence Bureau, along with the Crime Control
18 Strategies Bureau, are basically at the forefront of
19 this of this strategy.

20 As far as lessons learned, it's about retaliatory
21 violence in New York City. Now, there is a large
22 percentage of shootings in New York City that
23 continue to be connected in some way or another. And
24 this is what we're... and this is what I feel we do
25 best is to stop retaliatory shootings. And this is

2 what the 800 individuals are part of. They've been
3 involved in multiple shootings. So if you look at a
4 quarter of that list, a quarter of that list,
5 approximately 250 individuals have been involved in
6 three or more shooting incidents since 2020.

7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Has there been
8 any information shared by the state or federal
9 agencies that lead to a gun arrest?

10 CHIEF LIPETRI: Yes, we share information with
11 our parole partners, our probation partners, our
12 federal partners, and, you know, we have had
13 positives in regards to visits by parole where
14 firearms have been recovered with individuals on
15 these arrests. But we're really focused on the the
16 arraignment process also. You know, when we're making
17 the gun arrest, we want the best arraignment possible
18 with these individuals, so we can keep these
19 individuals incarcerated while carrying illegal
20 firearms in New York City but are also connected to
21 prior shooting incidents.

22 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. I'm going to move
23 over to headcount adjustments. There were several
24 adjustments between units in this budget. I would
25 like to get some clarity on which units are being

2 increased in terms of headcount and budget in which
3 units are being decreased.

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So essentially, the
5 headcount change that you're seeing for the most part
6 are actually tied to additional funding for traffic
7 enforcement agents. We decided to get construction
8 grants throughout the year, and as they go up, we
9 reflect the headcount for that. So that's... that's
10 the majority of what you're seeing there.

11 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Um, the Vice Division and its
12 budget was reduced from \$18 million to \$13 million.
13 Can you tell us the reasoning and reducing it and why
14 that amount specifically?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So essentially, what
16 happened there was it was a technical adjustment. I
17 mentioned earlier how we had created some new budget
18 functions, as we were looking more closely at the
19 distribution of the funding in various budget codes.
20 We noticed that the level of resource that was in the
21 budget code was not accurately reflecting the
22 expenditure level for that. So we were essentially
23 making a technical adjustment to that. The budgetary
24 documents more accurately reflect the reality.

2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Can you give us
3 the former headcount and now the updated headcount
4 for the division?

5 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: There was... there was
6 no material change with that. It was just a
7 technical adjustment. It was essentially at the same
8 level that it was before we made the technical
9 adjustments. Purely just technical to adjusted to
10 reflect the reality of the budget situation.

11 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay. So I'm going to... did
12 you not move... move anyone from Vice to SVD?

13 Hello, yeah. Very hard to hear, by the way.

14 CHIEF ESSIG: Are you doing? Good morning, Chief
15 Essig. So as the police commissioner spoke before,
16 we're going to take the human trafficking element out
17 of Vice, and they're going to switch over into the
18 Special Victims Division. That accounts for
19 approximately 24 detectives who are going to do that.

20 That'll leave the vice division with
21 approximately 44 investigators. They are going to be
22 a citywide unit. And now being charged with
23 gambling... investigating gambling locations,
24 problematic social clubs, and community complaints of
25 sex trafficking at commercial residential

2 establishments with the goal of closing down that
3 establishment and arresting the sex trafficker. So
4 vice will be doing citywide under 50 detectives.

5 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Yeah, thank you. So you're
6 moving human trafficking to SVD. Was there an added
7 headcount to SVD.

8 CHIEF ESSIG: They... They'll fall under Special
9 Victims, those 24 investigators who do human
10 trafficking, and they're... they're arresting the
11 human trafficking and doing rescues on... on young
12 women who are victims of the sex trafficking. So
13 that 24 will just fall under the Special Victims
14 aspect of it.

15 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, so. All right.

16 CHIEF ESSIG: The headcount will naturally go up
17 by 24, but that in the child section of it, and the
18 adult section, we're still going to look to staff
19 that at adequate levels, to ensure that staff up
20 their caseload is adequate.

21 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So will they be receiving new
22 training?

23 CHIEF ESSIG: In human trafficking?

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Yeah. And were you able to
3 provide the specific training budgets for the SVD.
4 I'm trying to just understand.

5 CHIEF ESSIG: They're still going to be doing the
6 sex trafficking. They're just... it's a natural fit
7 to move under the Special Victims Division. They do
8 the same type of work... they're rescue... rescuing
9 young survivors, sometimes young girls as young as 12
10 and 13. And there's a natural crossover between the
11 investigators in the adult section, the child
12 section, and the human trafficking. So we will...
13 they will be part of the trauma-informed training
14 once they get in the Special Victims Division, as
15 well as the... the training that they had in the Vice
16 Division in terms of sex trafficking.

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. The Central
18 Investigation Division increased headcount from 150
19 to 226... 226 positions. Can you detail what this
20 division does and why you saw the need for the
21 increase?

22 CHIEF ESSIG: That's that's our... our
23 specialized investigators, gun violence, robbery.
24 We've seen increases of robbery complaints city wide,
25 gun violence complaints city wide. So that's why

2 there was a slight increase in... for the
3 investigators for that, to ensure that case law was
4 commensurate with the amount of investigations they
5 conducted.

6 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. That's the same
7 with the Fugitive Enforcement Division, which has
8 increased from 117 to 360 positions, an increase of
9 243. Can you detail what this division does and why
10 you saw the need for the increase?

11 CHIEF ESSIG: Yeah. Our Fugitive Enforcement
12 Division is integral to crime reduction. These are
13 the men and women who go out when wanted cards on
14 violent perpetrators or... or people who warrant out
15 from court. They go out and they pick them up.
16 Their... their caseload has increased substantially.
17 And, as the police commissioner has talked about,
18 just in the last three years, our perpetrators picked
19 up for people who will wanted in homicides or
20 shootings in 2019, it was 235. We... as of year to
21 date... In 2020, it was 285. Last year, it was 335.
22 And this year, we've already picked up close to 475
23 perpetrators of homicides and/or shootings that we've
24 taken off the street. So as we asked them to do
25 more, we had to staff that unit.

2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: We also see that the Grand
3 Larceny Division has been reduced by 80 positions,
4 and the Narcotics Division has been reduced by 119
5 positions. Can you tell us the reason for these
6 decreases?

7 CHIEF ESSIG: Well, Grand Larceny Division was
8 established in 2014. I think at the time it had 235
9 members. We see, as we're starting to shrink and we
10 have to focus in on crimes, grand larcenies and/or
11 robberies kind of meld into one. So our grand
12 larcenies, to ensure efficiency, our Grand Larceny
13 Division is in the process of being moved under our
14 Robbery Division, crimes against properties and
15 persons. So to be under one command structure.
16 There's a lot of inter... melding of the crime stats,
17 so we figured it would be easiest to do it that way.
18 So that's why their... their headcount is going down.
19 Narcotics Division, years ago, was over 1200 persons
20 in the Narcotics Division. We no longer do minor
21 street enforcement. They do casework. There's 208
22 narcotics investigators city wide now. But, you
23 know, they... that unit has come down substantially.

24

25

2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Has the Gun Violence
3 Suppression Division been increased? What is the new
4 budget and headcount?

5 CHIEF ESSIG: Gun violence last year was not...
6 this year, last year... we substantially increased
7 the gun violence suppression division. I think it
8 was Chief Lipetri who talked about of monitor and
9 investigate violent individuals. They also
10 investigate gangs and crews that are doing violence
11 in Gun Violence Reduction Task Force, so that
12 increased last year. This year, they haven't been
13 increased. They are at a good staffing level we
14 feel, right now.

15 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So this is the division
16 that's formerly known as the gang unit.

17 CHIEF ESSIG: In 2016, we started the Gun
18 Violence Suppression Unit. It morphed into the Gang
19 Unit. The Gang Unit was disbanded last year, whereas
20 the gang unit was doing suppression on the streets in
21 some cases, the Gun Violence Suppression Unit is just
22 doing investigations of cases. So yes, in essence,
23 it has taken the place of the Gang Unit, but not
24 exclusively. We have violent crimes in every
25 borough.

2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Yeah, you previously
3 testified that, you know, there's a small percentage
4 of people that are committing many of the crimes
5 related to gun violence. So what would you say the
6 gun violence... what is the percentage of gun
7 violence committed by your estimate... your
8 estimation? Like people in gangs committing crimes
9 out of this number?

10 CHIEF ESSIG: That would be Chief Lipetri.

11 CHIEF LIPETRI: Approximately 50% of... of our
12 gun violence this year, and really most years, is
13 attributed to gangs and crews. As far as this year
14 that will only increase, right? As investigations go
15 forward and we identify more individuals at the
16 scene, or we get information throughout the course of
17 the investigation. Sometimes, obviously, the motive
18 will change. But approximately 50% of all gun
19 violence is tied to gangs or crews in New York City.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much. My last
21 line of questioning is a topic that is... that the
22 advocates are really looking to get more clarity on.
23 This is the Strategic Response Group.

24 How much has... Excuse me. How much has the
25 deployment of SRG officers to protests and

2 demonstrations contributed to the department spending
3 on overtime?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So we can get you that
5 number, but I'll have to come back to you.

6 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. That's important.

7 The executive budget includes personnel costs for
8 445 positions within the SRG, but reporting on the
9 unit suggests that it's... that it's full composition
10 is actually much larger. In 2021, The Intercept
11 reported the unit was estimated to include around 700
12 officers. What is the full headcount of the SRG?

13 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: So, Madam Chair, I don't
14 have the headcount of the SRG in front of me. But it
15 is substantially less than 700. I believe it's even
16 lower than 450. But we will get to that.

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you for that. We would
18 definitely want to have that information. Beyond the
19 personnel costs reflected in the executive budget,
20 how much additional spending goes towards the SRG,
21 including its training equipment, etc.?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So to get you that
23 level of granular detail, we're going to have to go
24 back and get it for you.

2 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, yeah. SRG's most
3 visible present is at protest despite the
4 department's initial promise in 2015, that the unit
5 would not have a role in protests. What is the
6 criteria used to determine deployment of SGR to
7 protests and demonstra... demonstrations?

8 DEPUTY CHIEF THOMPSON: I'm not I'm not familiar
9 with the 2015 promise that you refer to. One of the
10 core functions of the SRG was actually to be
11 specially trained to handle protests. I think people
12 sometimes confuse the SRG, with the CRC which is the
13 Counterterrorism Is Critical Response Command.

14 So SRG is frequently deployed the protests in
15 Manhattan, because they are the experts in managing
16 large crowds. They are specially trained for that
17 function, so we do use them fairly regularly. But we
18 have adopted our... our tactics around producing...
19 I'm sorry... policing First Amendment assemblies.
20 Since the summer of 2020, all officers underwent new
21 training in constitutional policing at community
22 events, which replaced the old disorder control
23 training. That training is now given on a recurrent
24 basis. A refresher course is given on a recurrent
25 basis. That curriculum was designed with input, both

2 addressing the concerns that were raised in the Law
3 Department's report and the DOI report on how those
4 2020 protests were policed. The curriculum was
5 shared with advocacy groups who frequently engage in
6 protest. We incorporated their feedback. We invited
7 a variety of groups to observe some of the training
8 being conducted and give us additional feedback, and
9 which we then further revised the training. So all
10 of the officers have been trained in that are...
11 tactics in policing, again free speech assemblies
12 have changed dramatically since the summer of 2020.

13 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: That's... that concludes my
14 questioning. I will pass it over to Speaker Adams.
15 Thank you so much for answering our questions, and I
16 appreciate it. Thank you very much. Speaker Adams?
17 Madam Speaker?

18 SPEAKER ADAMS: Thank you very much, Madam Chair.
19 I'd just like to segue back into the topic of
20 overtime for a minute. The NYPD overtime budget is
21 \$607 million for FY 22 and \$452 million for FY 23.
22 An additional \$66 million in federal funding was
23 added. Can you give us the reasons for this
24 extraordinary addition? It's a lot for this year.

2

3 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So as I... as we
4 discussed... so the budget for fiscal year 22 in
5 baseline was determined by the prior administration
6 based on the expenditure level in fiscal year 21. In
7 fact, it was reduced from the expenditure level in
8 21. What that did not fully recognize was (1) the
9 return of events which happened first of all over the
10 summer, we had a little bit of a break from COVID
11 events came back and they've continued to come back
12 into the spring. So we had a much lower event
13 spending last year, and that was what the budget was
14 based on. In addition, in fiscal year 21, because of
15 the significant budget reductions, there were certain
16 critical operations that were at reduced...
17 significantly reduced levels, including crime
18 reduction, and of course over time was reduced
19 because of COVID. We had significantly curtailed
20 Vision Zero over time, and some of our critical
21 housing deployments, and basically looking at and
22 assessing what the circumstances are right now, we
23 are looking to balance, and we have the need to
24 continue to prioritize and spend overtime to
25 supplement what we're doing.

2 We are, as was discussed earlier, doing a lot
3 with regard to redeployments, but we do still need to
4 utilize overtime. It's a very critical tool. So the
5 primary areas where we are over the budget are in
6 crime reduction, also the transit safety deployments,
7 which were not accounted for at all in the budget,
8 and also investigations, which, with the additional
9 arrests and the additional crime that is happening,
10 investigations go up, they're very labor and time
11 intensive. And the overtime is reflective of that.

12 SPEAKER ADAMS: Can you tell us how much has been
13 spent to date?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes. In city funds,
15 on the uniform side, we have spent \$480 million to
16 date.

17 SPEAKER ADAMS: Did we...? Okay, let's just
18 backtrack just a little bit. Given that NYPD
19 received federal stimulus dollars for this current
20 fiscal year, is there a drop off in federal dollars
21 for next year?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes, I... So that's a
23 one-time American Rescue Plan funding that the budget
24 office put in to address the fact that we did have a

2 gap in the overtime and that does not continue in the
3 out years.

4 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay, I'll just kind of wrap with
5 with this for a minute: Is it possible -- or why not
6 -- to right-size the budget for next year so that we
7 can have a more accurate idea of a picture of how
8 much will be spent?

9 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: I think that's a
10 really important dialogue that we need to have. I
11 just... in fiscal year 16, as part of the addition of
12 the resources for neighborhood policing, there was a
13 recognition at that time that there was this historic
14 gap between what was actually being spent in overtime
15 historically, and what was in the budget. And at
16 that time, there was an adjustment made, which is...
17 was based on evaluating what the department's needs
18 were by category. I actually worked at the Office of
19 Management and Budget at that point in time and
20 worked with my colleagues here. We sat down, we
21 analyzed what was necessary, and we did make such an
22 adjustment, which is what has brought our budget to
23 about \$505 million a year. And we were... the
24 department was for several years able to -- because
25 it was more realistic reflection of the operational

2 needs of the department -- was within \$1 or \$2
3 million of that for several years, because it did
4 reflect as you're suggesting a more realistic
5 picture. So I you know, I look forward to having a
6 dialogue to see if we can sort of get back to that
7 analysis and get back to determining the appropriate
8 level, not only one year at a time, but in the
9 baseline.

10 SPEAKER ADAMS: Okay, I think that's really,
11 really important. And one more topic that I'm going
12 to segue over to. And again, I know my colleagues
13 are really concerned about this, and that is your
14 funding for youth groups and youth programs. We hear
15 a lot about punitive... you know, punitive action
16 being taken, you know, for... you know, for
17 quote/unquote perpetrators and the like, but what is
18 the NYPD doing when it comes to creating or
19 sustaining a robust budget for youth programs and our
20 youth groups out there? How are you working with
21 that? Are you working... are you providing the
22 funding that's necessary for youth programs and youth
23 groups out there? On the same level, perhaps that you
24 are funding overtime here and here? And what are we
25 doing for our youth groups?

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So I will speak to the
3 specific funding for our youth coordination officers
4 is approximately \$29 million dollars a year. There
5 are other programs that the department is engaged in,
6 also working with partners that I think Deputy
7 Commissioner Parker can probably speak more to that I
8 don't have the individual budget lines for. But the
9 YCOs themselves? That's \$29 million a year.

10 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: I think that Deputy
11 Commissioner Parker is on. We're going to ask him to
12 talk about our programs.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER PARKER: Thank you,
14 Commissioner. Madam Chair, the... the range of
15 programs that the NYPD plays an integral role in
16 include the Saturday Night Lights program. All of
17 these are really multi-agency partnerships, but that
18 that's a program where gyms in underserved
19 communities are closed on Saturday night, started
20 with one gym. It's now in 106 gyms across the city
21 and we've been getting requests from elected
22 officials could that be expanded. But that's a
23 partnership between DYCD, the five District
24 Attorney's offices, NYPD, and our youth coordination
25 officers play a critical role. They... they're part

2 of the team and each one of those sites on Saturday
3 night, City Parks, Department of Education. We
4 really create a constellation of partners to all work
5 together on that particular initiative. There's
6 also... as you know, there's the Explorer Program,
7 which is under Commissioner Stewart and that has, I
8 think, over 1000 and growing number of kids who
9 participate in the Explorer Program in all the
10 precincts across... across the city. The police
11 department in partnership with some of their federal
12 partners, were able to get asset forfeiture from
13 criminal cases and invested that in... one of those
14 projects was broken-down basketball courts in public
15 housing, 15 basketball courts, in partnership with
16 NYCHA have restored to mint condition so that those
17 kids have a place to play.

18 We're doing a multimillion dollar project with
19 City Parks to convert the Colonel Charles Young Field
20 in Harlem, which is a huge dirt field and the
21 ground... they're doing the groundbreaking next...
22 early next... in the winter to turn that into the
23 Harlem Field of Dreams. There's a lot of different
24 projects that were involved in. It's integral to the
25 Police Commissioner's youth strategy to make these

2 relationships, build these relationships, and be
3 fully committed to the path forward together with our
4 young people.

5 SPEAKER ADAMS: I can appreciate the... the
6 commitment, but it's not panning out in the dollars,
7 in your partnership with DYCD and other partnerships,
8 it's just not panning out, and the funds are not...
9 not panning out at all. We pushed forward in our
10 budget response, Saturday Night Lights. It's
11 currently funded at \$5 million. So we need more of a
12 partnership with... with our youth programs. We need
13 four we need for the NYPD to make a commitment to
14 this council to fund our youth programs. The money
15 is there for other things, we understand that, you
16 know, your priorities are your priorities. But you
17 need to bump up your priorities when it comes to the
18 youth in the city of New York. We've got to do a
19 better job at that. We need for you to be acceptable
20 when funding requests are made to NYPD on behalf of
21 our youth programs, because the council is certainly
22 doing our part, but we definitely need for NYPD to
23 step up and do your part as well. With that, I will
24 defer back to my colleagues before the question.
25 Thank you very much.

2 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: Speaker Adams, may I just
3 say we... we wholeheartedly agree with you in terms
4 of the engagement with our youth. We are fortunate
5 to have the foundation which assists us in a number
6 of programs to engage our youth communities. We will
7 certainly take a look at the funding that we asked
8 for going forward. But we have been able to have
9 some significant partners in our quest to engage our
10 youth and bring them on board.

11 SPEAKER ADAMS: I appreciate that, Commissioner.
12 We also need to take a good look at our PALs and what
13 our hours are like in our PALs. I can tell you in
14 district 28, it's been an uphill battle and a climb
15 for us here. And I'm sure my colleagues will concur
16 with that sentiment as well. So thank you very much.
17 Appreciate it.

18 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: Thank you.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Madam Speaker.

20 Next, we will turn to council questions. I want to
21 remind council members present you will have five
22 minutes. There are lots of hands up and we have
23 limited time. So please listen for the sergeant's
24 cue. And when he calls time, we ask that you wrap up
25 your comments and thoughts and/or questions.

2 We're first going to turn to Councilmember Hudson
3 followed by Councilmembers Ossé, Kagan and Cabán.
4 And we have others after that. But we'll first start
5 with Councilmember Hudson.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time starts now.

7 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Thank you so much. And
8 good morning Chairs and Commissioner Sewell. My
9 first question is: What is the budget for crisis
10 management systems in FY 23? And how does that
11 compare to FY 22? How many individuals and
12 communities are these programs serving?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So the budget for
14 crisis management is actually in the Mayor's Office
15 of Criminal Justice. I believe they're coming later
16 today, and I believe they'll have their... that
17 number for you.

18 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Okay, apologies. In FY
19 23, the NYPD are taking on a larger role in homeless
20 and mental health outreach, both through existing
21 units such as the NYPD full response teams and new
22 teams that are outlined in the Mayor's Homeless Plan
23 and are described simply as "12 new cross agency
24 teams" that will be patrolling the subways. However,
25 it's unclear how many NYPD officers are assigned to

2 these teams. So can you please give us the number of
3 officers on these new teams as well as the number of
4 officers on the existing NYPD call response teams?

5 And then just a couple of follow ups: How many
6 officers have been relocated to the subway system,
7 and how many officers are part of the Subway Homeless
8 Teams?

9 CHIEF COREY: So I don't have the number of
10 officers assigned to the Call Response Teams. Chief
11 Tobin is on and she might, if she can get to that.

12 As far as the... the balance of the question
13 about the teams that are working with other city
14 agencies to engage the homeless, that's not a full
15 time assignment for any officers. Officers are
16 redeployed on a daily basis from their primary patrol
17 functions to assist the Department Homeless Services,
18 Department of Social Services, outreach groups,
19 Bowery Residence Committee and others, in engaging
20 homeless, be it in the subway or on the street. The
21 role of the officers is to maintain, you know, to
22 keep the peace and to maintain public safety, while
23 these other agencies go about performing their
24 duties.

2 So again, we have not created any new teams of
3 officers specifically to engage that. There is a
4 unit that we created in the transit system, our
5 subway safety task force, which has approximately 35
6 officers, they have a much wider mission of
7 conducting quality of life enforcement and addressing
8 conditions that are identified by officers on patrol
9 that would be too time consuming for patrol officers.
10 So these officers would then work with other city
11 agencies in addressing those longer term conditions.

12 So I hope that answers your question. And then I
13 see Chief Tobin, and she probably has a Call Response
14 Answer.

15 CHIEF TOBIN: Sure, the number of officers that
16 we have assigned are 22 police officers and three
17 sergeants.

18 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Okay, thank you. And can
19 you tell us how many NYPD officers are currently on
20 modified duty?

21 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: Chief Morales should be
22 able to address that. Chief Morales please?

23 CHIEF MORALES: Good morning. We currently have
24 247 offices on modified assignment.

2 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Thank you. And what
3 does... the budget code number for the street crimes
4 unit fund? And why has it remained virtually
5 unchanged in the budget since at least FY 2014, when
6 the street crimes unit was supposed to have been
7 disbanded in FY 2020?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: I'll have to look at
9 that. From a technical perspective, it might just be
10 a technical adjustment that needs to be made. But
11 I'll get back to you on that.

12 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Okay, and then since I
13 have a couple more moments, one last question: We
14 know from... from research and also just common sense
15 that hate violence is massively underreported. The
16 number of complaints the NYPD received is likely a
17 fraction of the incidents that are actually
18 occurring, and at the March Public Safety Committee
19 hearing NYP testified that the task force's closure
20 rate was about 50%. So at best, the NYPD is making
21 arrests and half of a fraction of the total number of
22 incidents, and in addition, only about 15% of those
23 arrests lead to hate crimes convictions. So we're
24 talking about a fraction of a fraction of a fraction

2 here. And I'm wondering, is there not a better and
3 more effective approach to reducing hate violence?

4 CHIEF COREY: So listen, I think reducing hate
5 violence requires a multi-level approach. So the
6 people who commit crimes of hate that they need to be
7 investigated by the task force, which they are, they
8 need to be held accountable, and they need to be
9 prosecuted. What happens once we make an arrest and
10 turn it over to the prosecutor, those questions need
11 to be directed to the appropriate prosecutor as to
12 why convictions aren't being secured for hate crimes,
13 perhaps at the rate that they should be. There's
14 also a large educational component that should be
15 taking place, where youth in our schools are exposed
16 to people from other cultures. And that's how you
17 learn to diffuse hate when you start to see everyone
18 as a human being and you start to appreciate our
19 commonalities and not so much our differences. And I
20 know that there have been talks with the department
21 of education about implementing just such a program.

22 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Thank you, and I'll yield
23 the rest of my time and my colleagues.

24

25

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Excuse me. Thank
3 you, Councilmember Hudson. Next we'll turn to
4 Councilmember Ossé followed by Councilmember Kagan.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Good morning, and thank you
7 Chairs Brannan and Hanks. Good morning Commissioner
8 and NYPD folk. In 2020, according to The New York
9 Post, nearly 200 of your cops lied to the Civilian
10 Complaint Review Board, and reports have stated that
11 most were not disciplined.

12 The first question is Are any of these officers
13 still in the force today?

14 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER LITWIN: (inaudible).

15 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: I can't hear you.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER LITWIN: Good morning, can
17 you hear me now?

18 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Yes.

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER LITWIN: Amy Litwin,
20 Department Advocate's Office. So that report did come
21 out. It determined or stated that officers were
22 found to have lied. You know, historically, when
23 there are allegations of misconduct that do not fall
24 within the CCRP's jurisdiction, those cases are
25 referred to the department for investigation and

2 discipline. Some of the officers that I noted in
3 their record had been disciplined actually, and since
4 March of 2020, the CCRB now has jurisdiction over
5 allegations of false statements made during the
6 course of their investigations.

7 When they determine and substantiate an
8 allegation, there is due process that is involved,
9 and they seek charges and specifications for those
10 officers, and have the opportunity to take those
11 cases to the trial room. To date, we have not seen
12 any instances where the cases that they're looking to
13 prosecute have been resolved, either through an
14 inter-department trial or through a negotiated plea.
15 Once that happens, certainly there will be
16 transparency surround all of those outcomes. Those
17 trials are open to the public, and any trial
18 decisions are also posted publicly so that the
19 members of the community see do for themselves what
20 the actual allegations were, what the evidence was,
21 and then what the ultimate outcome was and what the
22 discipline was.

23 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Okay, so I'm going to take
24 that as a yes, there are still cops that are on the
25 force that have allegedly lied to the CCRB. Given

2 that the mayor is increasing the already large NYPD
3 budget and proposing cuts to other crucial agencies.
4 Commissioner, what are you doing to discipline these
5 lying officers? And I'm sure you can agree with me
6 that hard working New Yorkers do not want to spend
7 their tax dollars on untruthful cops.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER LITWIN: So, you know, that's
9 a great question. You know, in the work that I do in
10 the... in the Department Advocates Office, it's very
11 important that we take any allegations of false
12 statements, misleading statements, inaccurate
13 statements, we take them incredibly seriously. We
14 have discussions almost daily about how to approach
15 these cases, when there are cases that we are
16 handling ourselves. Certainly the CCRB, as I
17 mentioned, has jurisdiction as well, but we see these
18 cases. And we also agree that if an officer has made
19 statements that are false, on material facts related
20 to an investigation or a case, then those officers
21 don't have a future with the police department, and
22 we routinely look at these cases and we take them to
23 trial. We are often seeking termination or seeking
24 to separate these officers when this is what
25 transpires.

2 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: And have any been
3 terminated?

4 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER LITWIN: Yes, officers have
5 been terminated for making false statements.

6 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Do you know how many... do
7 you know how many from that nearly 200 report?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER LITWIN: So that report does
9 not speak to the number of officers who receive
10 charges and specifications by the department. That
11 report only speaks to the CCRB's determination that
12 they believe they have found officers to have lied.
13 Allegations by CCRB does not mean that there has been
14 due process, and that a case has been taken to the
15 trial room. As I mentioned before, CCRP has asked us
16 to serve charges on their behalf, and we have done
17 that in a number of cases that are pending. We have
18 served charges for them so that they can litigate
19 these cases, and they can make a determination in
20 front of the trial Commissioner so that there can't
21 be inappropriate outcome and appropriate discipline.

22 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: Okay, moving on. Thank you
23 very much. For the sake of time. The neighborhood
24 safety teams -- I've been told, and our communities
25 have been told -- are the "best of the best" in terms

2 of getting guns off of our streets. How much of our
3 taxpayer dollars are... would you say are spent on
4 each NST or Neighborhood Safety Team?

5 CHIEF COREY: Well, there's no new cost for those
6 teams. They were all funded by officers who are
7 already on the department payroll, already working in
8 those precincts, and they were just assigned to a
9 different function.

10 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: So not additional cost, but
11 how much do each of those NSTs cost?

12 CHIEF COREY: Each... each team is one sergeant
13 and five police officers. We'd have to cost that
14 out. But it's... again, these officers are already
15 on our payroll. They are already part of our
16 headcount. This was not a new need.

17 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: I would love to get that
18 number. But they have been created and allocated for
19 getting guns off of our streets. It has been a
20 little over a month, to be exact a month and a half,
21 since one of my districts and STS started and they
22 haven't apprehended any firearms since starting. And
23 you know, shootings are definitely prevalent within
24 my community, and it is in the 81st precinct...

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

2 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: ...to be exact. If these
3 teams aren't getting guns off the streets, what
4 metrics is the NYPD using to assess if these teams of
5 so-called the best of the best are effective or not?

6 CHIEF COREY: Well, citywide the teams have done
7 a tremendous job getting guns off the street, they've
8 actually made 76 gun arrests, seizing 69 firearms.
9 When we look at the average of gun arrests made by
10 police officers across the city prior to these teams
11 rolling out, we averaged 97 gun arrests per week.
12 With... since the teams have been deployed that
13 average has increased to 103 gun arrests per week. I
14 would say that an additional six guns off of our
15 streets each and every week, which would total up 312
16 per year is a pretty substantial metric. In addition
17 to the guns they have also made eight robbery arrests
18 5 felony assault, 5 burglary 15 grand larceny, 12
19 grand larceny auto arrests, so more than 30% of their
20 arrests are for a gun or other index crime. They've
21 made a total of 397 arrests citywide, 71% of those
22 arrested have a prior arrest history, and 55% of
23 those arrest stead of a prior... have an arrest for a
24 prior major felony.

2 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: So I'm asking specifically
3 for a team that hasn't gotten any guns off of the
4 streets. What are you doing to you know, assess
5 their efficacy if their main point is to get guns off
6 the streets, and they're not doing that?

7 CHIEF COREY: So we want everyone to
8 constitute... to police constitutionally. All stops
9 are based upon reasonable suspicion, every team is
10 out there working hard. We do certainly look at the
11 way the teams perform. But we do not assign metrics
12 to them. We don't tell them you have to come in with
13 X amount of arrests or X amount of guns or anything
14 else. That was one of the mistakes of the past. We
15 want them out deployed in the areas where they are
16 seeing violence happening, using the intelligence
17 that's... that is given...

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired. ...and
19 targeting them in the community. So the fact that
20 one team has yet to come up with a gun is certainly
21 not indicative of the success of the overall mission.

22 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: So just on the record,
23 you're not using any type of metrics. You said.
24 This... these are your words. I'm just trying to
25 clarify you're not using specific metrics.

2 CHIEF COREY: I... I actually spelled out quite a
3 few metrics that we use. I said we do not give them
4 quotas. We don't tell them to get arrests.

5 COUNCILMEMBER OSSÉ: My time has expired.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Excuse me. Thank you. Next
7 we're going to call on Councilmember Kagan followed
8 by Councilmember Cabán. Councilmember Kagan:

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

10 COUNCILMEMBER KAGAN: Thank you so much. And
11 thank you so much, Chair Hanks. Thank you so much,
12 Chair Brannan, Madam Speaker, and Commissioner.

13 I would like first of all, to thank all our brave
14 police officers who risk their lives every single day
15 to protect our safety. I also would like to send my
16 deepest appreciation to two police officers who were
17 attacked just in the last several days, one in the
18 60th precinct, and another one in the Bronx. They were
19 almost killed in the line of duty. And I really,
20 really appreciate the hard work, dedication to the
21 safety of New Yorkers, and I am really, really
22 grateful to police officers who risk their lives
23 every single day just to protect our... our city, and
24 including my family. Thank you very, very much.

2 Second of all, I have two questions to NYPD. One
3 is about its anti-crime units. Is my understanding
4 that none of the units were deployed in South
5 Brooklyn, and in Coney Island in particular. If not,
6 why not? If yes, what are the plans, especially for
7 busy summer season?

8 And my second question is about school safety
9 agents. Are we going to see a decrease or increase
10 of numbers of school safety agents in schools? At my
11 recent meeting with school principals in my district,
12 every single one of them asked to increase number of
13 school safety agents in their schools, due to the
14 situations that occur daily. That's my two
15 questions.

16 CHIEF COREY: So I'll take the first part of the
17 question, Councilmember. There are three
18 neighborhood safety teams operating within Brooklyn
19 South they are in the 67, 69 and 71 precincts. They
20 are not, as, as you said in the 60th precinct in
21 Coney Island. The 30 precincts that they operate in,
22 and that the officers were selected from were
23 specifically chosen, because in 2021, they accounted
24 for 80% of the shooting incidents in New York City.
25 So those are the precincts where the gun violence was

2 greatest where the need for these teams were
3 greatest. And that's why they were deployed there.

4 As far as the summer plan for Coney Island, you
5 always see an influx of officers down there into
6 Coney Island for the summer months. That plan is
7 being finalized now, but it will be on par with what
8 you've experienced in prior years, with a substantial
9 number of officers being pushed in to the boardwalk,
10 the amusement area, as well as other parts of... of
11 the precincts, school safety.

12 Um, school safety...?

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: On the school safety,
14 the good news is that at the end of April, we hired
15 200... a class of 250 additional agents. The last
16 time we had a larger class was in 2007 when we hired
17 264. So we're working very hard to maximize the size
18 of our classes and hire as many school safety agents
19 as we can. As you're aware, we did sustain a cut to
20 our school safety headcount, because there were so
21 many vacancies. As we work to hire up we will
22 continue to have dialogue and OMB has indicated they
23 will work with us to assess the need for additional
24 headcount going forward but we are continuing to hold

2 classes and we are maximizing the size of those
3 classes.

4 COUNCILMEMBER KAGAN: So it's going to be
5 increased or decreased in the next fiscal year, the
6 number of school safety agents?

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: We... we will be
8 filling vacancies that we have. So the number of
9 agents will... will go up in terms of actual bodies
10 in schools.

11 COUNCILMEMBER KAGAN: Thank you.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember
13 Kagan. Next we'll turn to Councilmember Cabán,
14 followed by Councilmember Stevens.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

16 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Good morning. Thank you.
17 I'm going to try to get through as many questions as
18 I possibly can.

19 I'm going to start with some PR related
20 questions. How many full-time positions are
21 dedicated to NYPD public relations across departments
22 and precincts? And does the NYPD contract with any
23 outside agency to support your public relations,
24 and... and/or your communications work? And if yes,

2 which agency do you contract with, and how much is
3 the contract?

4 I just want to acknowledge that my time is my
5 time is running, so I'm hoping I can get some of that
6 time back.

7 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MILLER: Okay, Councilmember.
8 In precincts, there are no full time public relations
9 people. There are community affairs officers, but
10 that's... public relations is not their specific
11 roles. In terms of contracting, we don't contract
12 with any outside corporations or consultants except
13 through the Chief Of Personnel's office. There is an
14 advertising agency that assists with advertising for
15 recruiting.

16 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: And what about departments?
17 I also asked about departments? So like, what is...
18 what is the scope of the... the public relations,
19 staffing and, and monetary output budget wise?

20 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MILLER: So, staffing,
21 there's a full time staff approximate 36 people in
22 the Deputy Commissioner for Public Information
23 Office, that's a 24-7 / 7-day-a-week office. If you
24 call at three in the morning, they answer the phone.
25 Last night there was kind of a clear example of why

2 that's necessary, because of... it's the city that
3 never sleeps. In terms of staffing, you know, 95, or
4 north of that percent of our budget is personnel
5 costs.

6 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Okay, and can you get us
7 those numbers?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MILLER: I'll uh...
9 (crosstalk)

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: I have that. So the
11 the budget is \$3.3 million, and \$3.25 million of that
12 is for personnel costs.

13 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: And how much funding is
14 dedicated to social media?

15 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MILLER: So, uh, social media
16 operations are basically free. I mean, we have a
17 Facebook account, a Twitter account, other accounts
18 where we push forward that dialogue with the public
19 about what we're doing, um...

20 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Somebody's running it,
21 right? Is it... is it a staff member putting in a
22 certain number of hours?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MILLER: Yeah. Yeah, so the
24 same model. Personnel costs are 95% or 94% of that.
25 And there's approximately three or four people who

2 work on social media, but some of them also do other
3 jobs.

4 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Okay, so it not free, it's
5 paid... it's paid labor.

6 I want to move on to another area of... of
7 questioning. My colleague, Councilmember Ossé was
8 asking about the NST teams, and you gave numbers
9 related just to the guns, but I want to get a full
10 scope of like the footprint of what these teams are
11 doing. And so not just those limited numbers, but I
12 want to know, overall, how many stops have these
13 teams made? How many summonses have these teams
14 issued? How many arrests overall have these teams
15 made? And what's the breakdown of those arrests?
16 How many are for violations? How many are for
17 misdemeanors? And how many are for felonies?

18 CHIEF COREY: Right. So the teams have made 397
19 arrests since March 14, that's between March 14, and
20 May 9. As indicated 76 of those are for firearms and
21 69 firearms were recovered.

22 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: I have those numbers
23 already. I want the other numbers, please.

24 CHIEF COREY: Okay. Do you want... Alright, so
25 we'll go to the stop numbers. 339 stops, a total of

2 180 summonses, of which 141 were criminal summonses,
3 and 39 were oath summonses.

4 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: And how many of the arrests
5 were the breakdowns for violations and misdemeanors?

6 CHIEF COREY: I don't have it broken down by
7 that. I have it broken down by specific offense. So
8 I can read you the list if you'd like, or if in the
9 interest of time we can provide you with a
10 misdemeanor-felony breakdown later on.

11 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Yes, please do provide it.
12 And then chair, I would just ask for a few extra
13 questions a few extra seconds for to ask and
14 additional questions. There was a lot of empty...
15 empty air time after my initial question.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah.

17 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: So the budget request...
18 Moving on to another issue the budget request, \$34.7
19 million in funds for the domain awareness system,
20 under this vague label of, you know, quote, mobility
21 data plans and backend infrastructure, and DAS is a
22 secretive Microsoft build to mass surveillance
23 network that allows the NYPD to watch the daily
24 movements of the whole city, and has received
25 hundreds of millions of dollars in funding directly

2 from DHS. DAS enables the NYPD and other police
3 departments that pay the NYPD and Microsoft for a
4 licensing to the system to criminalize, to surveil,
5 to monitor, and detain immigrant New Yorkers and
6 communities of color especially. So our city and
7 state funds should not support I think any expansion
8 of DAS. We need more transparency and how the system
9 works. And so what DAS data and systems does the
10 NYPD share with federal agencies?

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

12 _____: Bear with us.

13 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MILLER: Okay. So, uh,
14 sharing with federal agencies: Federal agencies do
15 not have access to the Domain Awareness System. It's
16 an NYPD system. So as a matter of organizational
17 structure or not, we have approximately 26,000
18 cameras in the Domain Awareness System. On a day to
19 day basis, nobody is generally sitting watching these
20 cameras surveilling the daily lives of New Yorkers.
21 However, as you see in our own social media, they are
22 highly instrumental in capturing crimes and suspects
23 from crimes, and we can then put out in request for
24 public assistance in identifying and apprehending
25 these people, and bringing justice to victims.

2 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.

3 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we will
4 turn to Councilmember Stevens followed by
5 Councilmember Barron.

6 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

7 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Good morning, to you, uh,
8 Chairs for this hearing, and the wonderful job you
9 guys have been doing. Special shout out to Chair
10 Brannan. You've been doing a great job these last
11 couple of days. Well, let me get to the questions.

12 So the 20 funded positions for the gun violence
13 strategy partnerships seems to be more focused on
14 reacting and to investigating gun crimes. How is the
15 NYPD investigating and partnering with agencies and
16 CBOs to prevent gun violence? And are any of those
17 positions dedicated to working with violence
18 interrupters in communities with high rates of gun
19 violence? If not, why not?

20 CHIEF LIPETRI: So good afternoon. So not only
21 is the gun violence, strategic partnership, reactive,
22 it is also proactive. So what we're doing is we're
23 identifying incidents of violence... previous
24 violence, that might not rise to the level of
25 somebody actually getting shot, but we are connecting

2 violence through ballistics matches, through gun
3 arrests, and then we're overlaying that with the
4 geography of locations that specific crews will
5 frequent. So we are proactively investigating these
6 crew-related shootings, in addition to reactive,
7 looking at previous days or weeks arrests of
8 individuals that are tied to violence in New York
9 City.

10 As far as the Cure Violence, we meet with them,
11 my office, crime control strategies, the Intelligence
12 Bureau, the Chief of Departments Office, I have a
13 weekly call with them on Thursday... specifically
14 Thursday, to talk about the weekend deployment, to
15 talk about the weekend violence that might be
16 attributed mainly to crews in and around New York
17 City. So that's been going on for quite a long time,
18 and I think the collaboration will continue. And
19 it's only getting better.

20 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: And I know, Build the
21 Blocks was brought up around... you have a strategy
22 being used. But can you talk about how effective
23 those meetings are? How many community members on
24 average are in these meetings? And how are you
25 collaborating with community members to be a part of

2 those meetings in a way where it's actually
3 meaningful and impactful?

4 CHIEF COREY: So the Build The Block meetings, I
5 mean, the... the attendance at them varies
6 dramatically. It varies from month to month. It
7 varies from precinct to precinct, and quite frankly,
8 from sector to sector. Some of them are very-well
9 attended. Some of them are very-poorly attended.
10 It's one of the things that we're looking at
11 reengineering and finding a better way to have those
12 neighborhood coordination officers engage with people
13 in their assigned sectors, particularly in the warmer
14 spring and summer months, when so many people are
15 outdoors, and there are so many outdoor activities
16 taking place that... that probably creates a better
17 opportunity than trying to bring people into a
18 meeting.

19 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Yeah, I mean, because
20 that's one of my main issues where I feel like it's
21 not being done in a collaborative way where community
22 members really have a voice. I've had folks tell me
23 that they feel like it's snip... snip sessions. So
24 that's why they don't go. And so you know, if it's
25 being used as a strategy, and that's the perception

2 of most community members, then maybe we should be
3 rethinking what that strategy actually really looks
4 like, then maybe switching some of that dynamic to
5 have more community focus.

6 And then I guess my last question, just throw out
7 I know, Saturday Lights was brought up again. And as
8 a way of saying, like, oh, this is the outreach that
9 we're doing with young people, but... for for the
10 most part isn't? Isn't the CBO's doing a lot of the
11 work with it, and how does those collaborations
12 really happen? Are officers actually planning?
13 Because I truly believe that CBO should be in the
14 front of this and officers should not be involved, in
15 programming with young people at this point, because
16 that's the skill set of the CBO.

17 So could you talk a little bit about what those
18 planning sessions look like with CBOs, if that's
19 happening with NYPD? Because it's constantly being
20 brought up as a way of young people and programming.
21 And that's the program that you guys are doing.

22 CHIEF COREY: So I don't... so we don't really
23 manage the programming for Saturday Night Lights, and
24 we don't manage a lot of the youth programming that
25 we are that we are involved in. I think a lot of it

2 happens exactly the way that you're suggesting that
3 it should: That the CBOs, or other groups that put
4 something together and ask for officers to
5 participate, and we're happy to send officers to
6 participate, because we want them to engage with
7 young people. We want to start building those
8 relationships, and creating that that relationship of
9 trust. So we don't have to organize it. There are
10 plenty of basketball tournaments and... and other
11 events that take place. We have other programs such
12 as our options program. We have the Community Center
13 at 127 Pennsylvania Avenue. And we could go on and
14 on. And we want... I said ideally, a CBO puts
15 together an event and says, "Hey, we'd like to have
16 some officers there. Come and engage with the
17 youth." And we provide those officers to do just
18 that.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

20 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Just one question to ask.
21 So why is money being allocated for the NYPD for this
22 thing? So what does that money for? To pay the
23 officers to be there? I'm confused.

24

25

2 CHIEF COREY: It's not it's not to pay the
3 officers to be there. I believe that the money
4 funnels through to keep the centers open.

5 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: The money goes through
6 NYPD to go to the community centers?

7 CHIEF COREY: And some of it goes to fund
8 overtime for officers to staff those locations, not
9 necessarily for the engagement but for security.

10 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: So the funding does go to
11 the officers. Alright, thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Councilmember.
13 Next we'll turn to Councilmember Barron, followed by
14 Brooks-Powers starting.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

16 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much. It
17 appears that the commission that has left the
18 hearing. I don't see your answering any questions,
19 but anyway, that's all right.

20 Isn't it true if you could just jot down my
21 questions and my statements because I want to get
22 through all of them rather than going back and forth
23 with you and eating up my time.

2 But isn't it true that the real total of the NYPD
3 budget is \$11.2 billion when you add fringe benefits
4 and pension? That's number one.

5 And isn't it true, while you know this that there
6 was an increase of \$182 million in the FY 2023
7 budget, while at the same time, Mayor Cop Adams has
8 decreased the education budget by a billion dollars.
9 Mmm-mmm-mmm.

10 The first 100 days have been a failure. It's not
11 just about -- as important as it is -- it's not just
12 about taking guns off the street. It's about
13 reducing crime. And you have to say in the first
14 three, four, or five months, the crime rate has risen
15 through the roof. People are being shot almost every
16 day. And it appears that -- and your own confession
17 of your arrest -- only 31% were put guns, I heard
18 another 75% were some of the non-violent infringes.

19 It seems as though it's not working. It's been a
20 failure. Every other agency that has programs that
21 didn't work, Mayor Cop Adams, cut and reduced. Every
22 agency has been cut except for NYPD. It's not
23 working. You cannot measure the success of deploying
24 police in our communities with how many guns they
25 take off the street. If people are shooting guns,

2 and people are getting killed and shot on subways all
3 over the place at a higher rate than it was last year
4 when we didn't have the Street Crime Unit -- that
5 you're trying to change to the name neighborhood
6 safety teams, which is... well, anyway -- that's one,
7 if you could answer that.

8 And then what are the crime rates? And then the
9 abuse of overtime: You admit that it's \$505 million
10 yearly. You had an increase of \$78 million in the
11 budget, yet... you know, I think a lot of it happens
12 because police want to make more money. They don't
13 think they're being paid enough. So they get more
14 money by doing overtime work that may or may not be
15 needed to be done. The police department takes up
16 1/3 of the \$1.4 billion in overtime for the entire
17 city, a third of it goes to NYPD. That's abusive.

18 And we need an elected Civilian Complaint Review
19 Board because, Commissioner, when the complaints come
20 to you, or any other Commissioner, 95% of these cops
21 get away with it, no matter what the CCRB says. And
22 when they are penalized, they lose a holiday pay, or
23 something very, very minor. So I think that that
24 needs to be scrapped, and we needed an elected
25 Civilian Complaint Review Board. Would you agree

2 with me, Commissioner that poverty and unemployment
3 and mental health needs and guns are the causes of
4 crime? Not the lack of police and not the no-cash
5 bail?

6 I believe you read the bill. But for those of
7 you on your staff who have not read the bill, no cash
8 bail is for non-violent, minor offenses. So when
9 somebody debates with me and says, "This person was
10 led out on bail and they committed a crime." Well, if
11 they were let out on bail, then they're not... have
12 nothing to do with the no cash bail, because we don't
13 have cash for minor offenses like Kalief Browder, who
14 went to jail for a backpack for three years because
15 he couldn't meet bailed and then came out and
16 committed suicide. So I hope you read the bill
17 because we need to stop that narrative that that's
18 the reason why crime is going up. It's a lie. It's
19 a lie. It's not even a missed narrative. It's a
20 lie.

21 And the police unit that was assigned to the
22 demonstrators brutalized demonstrators for exercising
23 their right to protest, the AG's office is pathetic.
24 They did not prosecute any police. And your
25 department did not punish police for their crimes.

2 We are tired of hearing "retraining". I've been at
3 this thing for 30 years, 50 years as an activist, and
4 every time police brutalize, they need more training,
5 they need cultural sensitivity. They need
6 punishment. Consequences.

7 And then finally, we have to look at this
8 increase... this bloated \$11 billion budget with
9 50,000 police officers, 35,000 uniform 15,000
10 civilian. It's not working. It is simply not
11 working. And then what you and the department do,
12 you try to find ways along with Mayor Cop Adams to
13 make it seem it's working by saying how many guns it
14 took off the street. But the idea is to bring crime
15 down.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Without a Street Crime
18 Unit last year, crime went down. With it this year
19 is through the roof. I'll stop there.

20 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: So, Councilmember Baron,
21 you mentioned any other commissioners. And in your
22 30 years, I'm fortunate, just like my predecessors to
23 have an extremely competent group of content
24 specialists in this room with me and online today.
25 So I'm sure in your 30 years, you've had the

2 privilege of speaking to other commissioners who've
3 had the same group of executives during their tenure
4 as well. So I value them tremendously to be able to
5 help answer my questions.

6 But if I could pull out a question -- I'm not
7 sure if it was a question and what you said -- I do
8 believe that public safety is a shared
9 responsibility. I do believe that we have to come
10 together and solve the problems of crime in our
11 communities and inequality. And I think the mayor's
12 approach to that has been well known and well
13 documented, and we support that. But arrests are at
14 a 21-year high. Gun arrests are at a 28-year high.
15 This is the most dangerous thing we do, and we have
16 to make sure we do not lose focus of the victims of
17 these crimes. And as evidenced last night, we put
18 our officers in harm's way, and we ask them to do,
19 and they continue to do it. But we are certainly
20 mindful that this is a shared approach that we have
21 with the mayor's initiative, and all of us agree that
22 is necessary. We do realize that we have to get
23 violent criminals off the street, and thank you so
24 much, our officer is going to be fine who was injured
25 in shot last night?

2 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Is that your answer? You
3 absolutely answered nothing. And I'll just move on
4 because you never do. I asked you... (crosstalk)

5 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: I'm not sure what you
6 asked.

7 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: I asked you...

8 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: We're going to...

9 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: I asked you...

10 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: ... nswer just bear with
11 bear with us, Councilmember. Bear with us.

12 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: I asked you a lot of
13 questions, and...

14 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: One of my content
15 specialists, is going to answer it for you.

16 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: And Commissioner just for
17 the record, the Commissioner gave rhetoric and no
18 concrete answers to any of my questions, but I'll
19 keep on moving.

20 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: We're going to answer
21 your... one of the questions we were able to pull out
22 of your statement.

23 CHIEF LIPETRI: Good morning, Councilmember
24 Barron. I'm Chief Lipetri, Crime Control Strategy.
25 So a lot of your questions were directed at me as the

2 Chief of Crime Control Strategy. So I'd like to
3 address some of those concerns. And you're right,
4 crime has increased over 40% this year.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Right.

6 CHIEF LIPETRI: So what are we seeing? So what
7 are we seeing? Approximately half of the crime
8 increase is attributed to grand larcenies. A lot of
9 those grand larceny, unfortunately, are compromised
10 bank accounts using a COVID Relief Scam, that are
11 targeting the most vulnerable New Yorkers, we have an
12 increase of 1000s of those complaints to attribute to
13 the grand larceny increase. With the increase and...
14 and the opening of many, many more restaurants, bars,
15 and hotels. We've also seen a sharp increase in
16 grand larcenies as far as fraud and compromised bank
17 accounts, because of unattended property that... that
18 are being stolen from these locations that were not
19 open last year. Saying that, we also have increases
20 across most of the seven majors. And let's just
21 remember that each one of these seven majors
22 attributed to a victim in New York City. So we see
23 when we talk about robberies, we see a sharp increase
24 in robberies with gunpoint possession across New York
25 City.

2 We all know just, from what we see, more
3 individuals are carrying firearms than we've seen in
4 a very, very long time. And I've 28 years of
5 experience in policing in New York City. And I've
6 never seen more of an increase, not just in... in
7 shootings, but also in confirmed shots fired, also in
8 individuals possessing firearms. But who are
9 possessing those firearms? We're at a 300% increase
10 of individuals under the age of 18, from 2019 that
11 are possessing firearms in New York City. We are at
12 a substantial... a 10% increase, year over year over
13 year, of previous convicted felons... about a quarter
14 of our arrestees carrying the firearm are a previous
15 convicted felon.

16 Also individuals that are getting arrested with a
17 firearm, approximately 20% of those individuals
18 already have an open felony. So that's going to
19 segue... segue into the least restrictive manner of
20 what we talk about.

21 When we look at the changes in... in bail in the
22 criminal justice system and 2020, I just want to make
23 it clear that... that a lot of the changes were were
24 agreed upon... or not agreed upon, but as a law
25 enforcement professional, we did need some changes.

2 But I think it's important to look at the way that we
3 analyze it... the way that I analyze it, and look at
4 really... just keep it very, very simple. So I'm
5 going to keep it simple.

6 So I'm going to look at burglaries: so the rate
7 of felony recidivism, where you get arrested with
8 a... for a burglary, and then within 60 days, you get
9 re arrested for a felony... a new felony. So that
10 felony has to be committed within that 60 day
11 timeframe. I'm not talking about somebody who
12 committed that... that felony a month prior to the
13 original arrest for burglary. So 24% of our burglary
14 arrests, got re-arrested for a new felony in 2021.
15 When you go back to 2017, it was only 6%.

16 When you're looking at grand larceny, same thing.
17 You get arrested for a felony grand larceny in New
18 York City, within 60 days, you commit a new grand
19 larceny, you get arrested? 20% of our grand larceny
20 arrests fit that parameter. In 2017, again 6%. When
21 you look at grand larceny of auto, in 2021, 21% of
22 individuals arrested for grand larceny auto were re-
23 arrested for a new felony within 60 days. In 2017,
24 it was 10%. So there's things that, yes, we need to
25 continue to collaborate, move resources, namely

2 street robberies, the crimes that are driving New
3 York City right now. But the grand larcenies are a
4 big part of the... of the crime increase.

5 When you look at the data as far as shooting
6 individuals arrested last year, we had 117
7 individuals that were arrested last year who were out
8 on an open gun charge. That is a 185% increase from
9 2019. So when we talk about recidivism, and we talk
10 about that very, very small percentage of individuals
11 that are creating a lot of the mayhem in New York
12 City, they are previously convicted felons. They are
13 individuals who have open felony arrests.

14 We're not talking about bail that nobody would
15 have gotten in the past, I agree with you. We're
16 talking about bail that somebody would have gotten in
17 the past. And then when we look at the bail laws, I
18 think it's important to remember that it has to be
19 the least restrictive matter. So if somebody gets a
20 cash bail, it is very, very low percentage of what
21 they really have to pay. And those are the
22 individuals unfortunately, that we see time and time
23 again, creating new violence, new crimes in New York
24 City with a victim behind each one of those crimes
25 and the shooting victims.

2 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: You know, thank you so
3 much for that. And I'm so glad you broke it down
4 like that. If you don't mind... Madam Chair. I'm
5 glad you brought that down. Because what you just
6 mentioned is felonies. And the No Cash Bail... Most
7 of them are felonies that got back out. And the No
8 Cash Bail Law -- obviously you didn't read it
9 thoroughly --- is for non-violent misdemeanors, not
10 for those who committed a felony

11 (crosstalk)

12 This false...

13 Now this hold it. Hold it.

14 This false narrative has to stop. You heard it
15 through his own mouth. All of that, that he
16 mentioned, was for those who are convicted or charged
17 with felonies, no cash bail. According to
18 statistics: 98%. 98% of those that receive no cash
19 bail for nonviolent minor offenses, did not commit
20 another crime, stop lying to the public.

21 And you just... as a matter of fact, I have some
22 people who said to me, when we were debating that
23 this person was let out on bail and committed another
24 crime.

2 Well, we don't, that has nothing to do with no
3 cash bail. It's the Kalief Browder types, that...
4 Rikers Island is filled with people who jump
5 turnstiles, who did minor offenses, and didn't get
6 summons, they got cash bail that they couldn't meet.

7 So stop lying to the public and making the public
8 think that the rising crime is due to no cash bail.
9 It's due to poverty, unemployment, lack of mental
10 health money, and too many guns on the street that
11 the feds need to do something about letting into our
12 communities. That's the truth. And you know, it.

13 CHIEF LIPETRI: Just... just on the 2% that that
14 you're speaking about. That is not accurate. The 2%
15 is... is you're explaining it the 2% way, which means
16 you're looking at every single arrest. I am not
17 looking at every single arrest.

18 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: So I am.

19 CHIEF LIPETRI: That's why it's not accurate.

20 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: But it is accurate. It is
21 accurate Chief. The ones we let out on no-cash bail
22 did not. It is accurate. The ones that were let out
23 due to the No-Cash Bail Legislation did not commit
24 violent crimes. Less than 2% did that that's a fact.

25 CHIEF LIPETRI: That is not a fact.

2 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: That a fact.

3 _____: Councilmember, I think the narrative
4 that you're speaking about is not an NYPD narrative.
5 We've never we've never articulated position
6 against... or used the word no-cash bail. We never
7 speak... when we speak about the bail reform laws, we
8 don't speak about misdemeanors or crimes that are not
9 bail eligible. What we speak about is recidivism. We
10 acknowledge and we actually supported the fact that
11 individuals that are low-level offenders, that are
12 given a second chance. We've highlighted the
13 inequity... inherent inequity in a cash bail system,
14 where two individuals of different economic means
15 both commit the same crime, one of them can buy their
16 freedom and the other one is left in jail. We have
17 said that repeatedly throughout the reform process.
18 What we highlight is individuals that are recidivist,
19 either dangerous criminals that go out and commit
20 dangerous crimes or individuals that get out and
21 commit... and repeatedly commit new crimes against
22 the citizens of the city.

23 (crosstalk)

24 But those are the individual we argue the courts
25 should have an ability to look at, and to actually...

2 (crosstalk)

3 ...acknowledge their career, their body of work
4 and decide to remand them into custody, not to set
5 bail. So if you have a dangerous person or
6 recidivists, right?, and they're rich, they should
7 not be able to buy their freedom, and an individual
8 that's a recidivist that is poor should not be able
9 to buy their freedom.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

11 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: All right, real quickly:
12 What you said there: Dangerous? Dangerous? That
13 word dangerous? Some of you perceive all our black
14 youth as dangerous just by the way they dress. But
15 what happens in the actual court. The people... a
16 matter of fact, our No-Cash Bail Law says if you
17 committed a violent crime five years ago, it does not
18 apply to you.

19 So tell the truth.

20 And you may support the no-cash bail, but Mayor
21 Cop Adams doesn't. He gets out there on TV and makes
22 it seem like... that no-cash bail is causing all the
23 crime to go up.

24 What you just said is accurate.

25

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Councilmember, we have to
3 move on. We've got a lot of colleagues.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: What's not accurate is
5 that 98% do not commit another crime. That's a fact.

6 I don't want to go back and forth. Thank you.

7 _____: I think it's important to clarify the
8 record that both the mayor and the department have
9 been consistent in and what we deem to be dangerous,
10 and what the individuals that we're speaking about
11 and their body of work of criminality, that is what
12 we want courts to be able to consider when that
13 individual is arrested yet again and put in front of
14 the court.

15 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Dangerous is subjective,
16 and has nothing to do with our no-cash bail law.

17 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And the remaining
18 council members for questions will be Brooks-Powers,
19 Carr, Nurse, Brewer, Williams, Sánchez, and Joseph.
20 We will turn to Brooks-Powers.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

22 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you so much.
23 And good morning, everyone. Thank you to Chairs
24 Brannan and Hanks for convening today's hearing. And
25 thank you to the Administration's representatives for

2 being here today. And just a few questions for the
3 police department. I'll ask them first and then
4 we'll wait to hear their responses to them.

5 So how does the NYPD plan to coordinate with the
6 Department of Transportation in reaching our city's
7 Vision Zero goals? Are any investments being made in
8 coordination with the Department of Transportation or
9 separately?

10 Also, I would like to have an update on the 116th
11 precinct. I'm not sure if this had been touched on.
12 If so, I may have missed it, and I apologize in
13 advance, but can the Department provide an update on
14 the construction and operational timeline for the
15 116th precinct in Southeast Queens?

16 Also, what proportion of the new precincts
17 capital resources like vehicle fleets will be
18 incorporated from the 105th, if any?

19 What is the status of the Far Rockaway Community
20 Justice Center?

21 And the final two questions: Our streets are
22 more mixed use than ever. People are walking and
23 using the subway more each month. Bicycle lanes
24 continue to be added each year, and now car usage and
25 traffic is increasing. Fatalities for every type of

2 transport has been up in fiscal 2021, from
3 pedestrians to motor vehicles. What new initiatives
4 or programs, if any, do we have to deal with this
5 issue? And how are we ensuring we keep pedestrians
6 and bicycles safe, in terms of like clearing bicycle
7 lanes? Do you issue tickets for blocking bicycle
8 lanes?

9 CHIEF ROYSTER: So good morning, Councilwoman.

10 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Hi chief. How are
11 you?

12 CHIEF ROYSTER: Great. Great to see you. And
13 thank you very much for that question. It is my
14 pleasure to talk about traffic safety, is public
15 safety.

16 And one of the ways we coordinate with the
17 Department of Transportation is that we look at
18 engineering education and enforcement for our Vision
19 Zero initiative. I am responsible for coordinating
20 the Vision Zero initiative for the NYPD. And every
21 week we have a Traffic Safety Forum. It is a
22 multifaceted, holistic traffic forum where we meet
23 with our Vision Zero partners -- that would be the
24 Department of Transportation, TLC, MTA and other city
25 agencies. But more importantly, is to focus on

2 pedestrian and cyclist fatalities. It's about
3 driving down fatalities and saving human lives.

4 And how do we do that? It's a layered effect.
5 Our enforcement is focusing on (1) the science, the
6 data: where are these fatalities occurring? Where are
7 the collisions occurring? And collisions with
8 injuries? And we focus on that particular data, but
9 also we focus on the fact of: Where should our
10 enforcement be? Where do we deploy our officers?
11 The officers in the precincts as well as the officers
12 in the transportation bureau. And then the last
13 pillar would be culture: How do we change the
14 culture? The driving culture, which we've seen since
15 COVID has been reckless. People getting behind the
16 wheel, people speeding, people failing to yield to
17 pedestrians. So with those three pillars doing the
18 Traffic Safety Forum, our core focus is on driving
19 down fatalities. And how do we do that with the
20 Department of Transportation? One of the ways that we
21 do this is that all executives in our 77 precincts
22 attend these forums. And they have to tell us what
23 their plan is in the particular precincts. What are
24 their safety plans? What are they addressing? And
25 the Department of Transportation sits side by side to

2 determine what engineering issues need to be
3 corrected in those various precincts.

4 The other thing is that we look at outreach: How
5 do we outreach to the community? And we doubled down
6 on outreach this year, because we wanted to make sure
7 that not only motorists, but pedestrians know about
8 traffic safety. And the outreach is also done by our
9 social media, and also going to different communities
10 and talking about what we're seeing in the community.
11 And what we should be looking at as far as safety.

12 Now, when I mentioned enforcement, we've seen
13 that a lot of fatalities -- I want to say over 50% of
14 the fatalities -- that involve pedestrians are done
15 at intersections. And so our enforcement is focused
16 at intersections. And I just wanted to say that the
17 enforcement this year, year to date is increased at
18 intersections.

19 We also look at speed, speed during the hours of
20 darkness, and also speed on our highways. And we
21 have actually deployed our highway units throughout
22 the city in various locations where we've seen that
23 motorists are speeding.

24 What has been driving our fatalities this year is
25 on the highways. We had 17 People lose their lives

2 on the highways because of speed. And this was...
3 this was passengers as well as operators.

4 I just want to say that when you start to look at
5 the layers of enforcement, we need to do this in all
6 of our precincts. Everyone is involved. It is
7 equitable enforcement. We look at hazardous
8 violations -- that means red light violations, people
9 not failing to yield to pedestrians, people that are
10 speeding on our streets, people that are not using
11 seatbelts. These are all the hazardous violations
12 that we look at and we conduct equitable enforcement.

13 I just want to say that last year, we had to
14 pivot, because we realized that we wanted everyone
15 involved in traffic safety, not just for 28 days, not
16 just year to date, but every single day. And...

17 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

18 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Please finish.. please
19 continue your answer.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yeah, please finish.

21 CHIEF ROYSTER: So last year, we instituted a way
22 that we could tell whether or not officers were
23 actually engaging with the public. And of this
24 particular process that we have, we have yielded over

2 88,000 engagement... engagements with the public as
3 it relates to outreach on public safety.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And really quickly
5 before we get to the answers to other questions,
6 while I have you Chief Royster, in terms of which you
7 and I have spoken about... in terms of the illegal
8 truck parking and those efforts, what is the
9 administration looking to do to beef up ensuring that
10 the trucks are no longer parking illegally in
11 residential communities? Because this is, at this
12 point, a citywide issue. At one point I thought it
13 was all just southeast Queens. But as I talk to my
14 colleagues, we recognize that this is a really big
15 issue, and the need for enforcement is there. We
16 understand that truck drivers (inaudible) that middle
17 of the road, but we're also finding is that these are
18 mostly derelict trucks being left, sometimes with
19 out-of-state plates on them, that is just getting
20 dumped into our communities.

21 You're absolutely right. It's a quality of life
22 issue that's affecting our residents. And since
23 we've last spoken, all of the precincts have focused
24 their resources in making sure that they address this
25 issue. I just want to say that we have some low-

2 hanging fruit here, and one of the causes is that,
3 number one, we want to make sure that the tractor
4 trailers are towed. However, we are experiencing
5 some challenges because we have lost the Manhattan
6 tow pound, so all of the vehicles that we tow now go
7 to outside tow pounds. So the actual challenge here
8 is space.

9 But I just want to say that, you know, we have
10 aggressively looked at the codes which deal with
11 tractor trailers parking at locations as well as
12 large trucks, and this year, even though our numbers
13 are down for towing, we are doing a lot of
14 summonsing... summonses in areas. So for code 78,
15 which is a truck... a commercial truck parked in a
16 location, that particular fine is \$65. But we are
17 looking at tractor trailers, that particular fine is
18 \$250 for the first offense, and \$500 for the second
19 offense. So that's what the precincts are doing now,
20 is that is that enforcement.

21 The second thing we're doing is booting these
22 vehicles. But that doesn't remove the vehicle from
23 the location.

24 And then the third thing you're doing is removing
25 the vehicles from the location. So we are taking an

2 active approach and looking at several ways of making
3 sure that these vehicles are not parking in
4 residential areas from 9pm to 5am, in the morning.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And then I had a
6 few other questions that I asked before. If someone
7 could answer those questions, I'd appreciate it.

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yes, Councilmember.
9 So you asked about the 116th precinct. So
10 construction kicked off in 2021. And we will be 25%
11 complete with the project by this summer, 50% By the
12 spring of 2023, 75% by the fall of 2023, and we
13 anticipate 100% completion in late summer 2024. So
14 that project is moving forward, while we're very
15 excited about when that precinct opens.

16 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And then in terms
17 of the resources for that precinct? Is it going to
18 be shared? Are they receiving resources from the
19 105th? What is the fleet going to look like?

20 CHIEF COREY: So yeah, we still I mean... we'll
21 figure out the... the actual logistics as it gets
22 closer. We work with our Office of Management
23 Analysis and Planning. We'll break up. We'll see
24 what the current call volume is, the current crime
25 rates in that area that the 116th is going to cover.

2 And then we make the staffing decisions. And then of
3 course, the other resources that will need to be put
4 into place to support that staff. So that'll happen
5 a little closer to opening day, if you will.

6 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: And then the last
7 question I had asked was about the issuing of tickets
8 in terms of blocking bicycle lanes, and it really
9 could be for pedestrians as well. Because I get a
10 lot of incoming in terms of blocked bike lanes,
11 illegal parking on like sidewalks and things like
12 that. Are... what is the... the data behind the
13 ticketing for that? Is it being enforced? Is it not?

14 CHIEF ROYSTER: Yeah, so for this year... year to
15 date, the bike lane enforcement is up 148%. So we
16 are focusing on summonsing vehicles that are in bike
17 lanes, as well... as well as vehicles that are
18 parked, as well as vehicles that are driving in bike
19 lanes. I also want to mention if I can, just to go
20 back to you, is that for this year, we've... we've
21 conducted 17 joint operations, which resulted into 40
22 tows, and 44 boots. So I just want to give you that.

23 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you.

24

25

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you Councilmember. Next
3 we will turn to Councilmember Carr, followed by
4 Councilmember Nurse.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 COUNCILMEMBER CARR: Thank you so much Chairs for
7 this important hearing. Commissioner. Chief Corey,
8 it's great to see you and the NYPD leadership team.
9 I really appreciate all the work that the men and
10 women under your command do on a daily basis, risking
11 their lives to keep us... to keep us as a safe city.
12 Especially considering when you know, protecting
13 human life is a noble end in and of itself. But we
14 can't have a prosperous city that lifts everyone in
15 New York unless we also have a safe city. So thank
16 you so much for the mission that you all perform.

17 You know, I want to talk about school safety
18 agents like Councilmember Kagan did earlier. So I
19 understand from the answers to his inquiries, that,
20 you know, the number of budgeted positions is going
21 to decrease but you expect the full agent headcount
22 to increase with the filling of vacant positions that
23 are not being eliminated. And I just wanted to...
24 wanted to know: Do you feel like the elimination of
25 those budgeted vacancies is warranted? Because I

2 hear from school principals, elementary, middle, and
3 high school that they really just need more school
4 safety agents across the board.

5 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: So we wholeheartedly agree
6 that we need children to be safe in our schools. But
7 if you... if I may, I'd like Chief Larin to actually
8 go into a little bit of details about the weapons
9 confiscated this year, and we'll talk about our
10 headcount.

11 CHIEF LARIN: Yes. Good morning, Commissioner.
12 Good morning council member. As the commissioner
13 stated, even with our current headcount of school
14 safety agents, we've been able to recover an
15 overwhelming amount of weapons and dangerous
16 instruments. The current count is 4728. And we...
17 when compare that to the last full school year, 2018
18 to 2019, it was 2153. So that's an increase of 119%.
19 And to speak to Commissioner Ryan's point earlier
20 with the headcount: In our opinion, what happened
21 was when there were discussions that school safety
22 division was going to be absorbed into the DOE, there
23 was a lag in hiring, there was a lag in exams that
24 were being put out, so we have a vacancy of 353
25 agents right now. There's a class that's currently

2 being trained. They were hired about a month ago. So
3 they should be out in about 12 weeks. And there's
4 also a filing period open right now that closes on
5 the 24th, for the next school safety agent exam. So
6 we're asking all of our partners to help us put the
7 word out because we believe that word of mouth is the
8 best way to recruit people onto this job. But with
9 the agents that we do have, were able to manage the
10 call volume, the incidents that come in, and we look
11 at who reports to work every day. So if we have to
12 shift our resources to a bigger school, or if there's
13 an event, we've been able to do that successfully
14 with the current count that we have in place.

15 COUNCILMEMBER CARR: I appreciate that answer.
16 So I'm just going to bundle the rest of my questions.

17 So in terms of school safety, one of my concerns
18 is... is about retention of folks in those positions.
19 I know a lot of individuals move on to maybe becoming
20 police officers or other parts of the uniformed
21 services. And so I'm just curious, what is the
22 attrition rate or the turnover rate in school safety
23 agent titles as... and how does that compare to say
24 police officers or other parts of the departments?

2 And then my other questions on different items
3 are: Majority Whip Brooks-Powers talked about truck
4 enforcement, and the 122, the 121, and the 123 do
5 great jobs at doing enforcement along our highways
6 with parked trucks, but it seems like these truck
7 operators or owners just see the tickets as the cost
8 of doing business and it keeps happening. So I'm
9 glad that there's going to be this sort of stepped up
10 enforcement considering what is in the legal toolbox
11 already. But do you feel there's a need for higher
12 enforcement, particularly for first time offenders to
13 kind of make it more than just the cost of doing
14 business for these truck operators? And can we be
15 helpful in that regard on the Council?

16 My other questions are related to DOE
17 enforcement. The legalization of marijuana use in
18 New Jersey is... has proceeded. It's now legal in
19 New York, although I know no retail dispensary
20 licenses have been issued. But we're going to allow
21 on-site consumption at retail dispensaries in New
22 York City, because the opportunity to include that
23 under state law is passed. And so I'm just concerned
24 that as these dispensaries open, particularly in a,
25 you know, a car-dependent area, like I represent,

2 Staten Island, that we don't necessarily have enough
3 folks trained to address that at the precinct level,
4 the way we do in highway patrol.

5 And then my final question is related to the
6 overall police headcount. I understand that we're
7 going to be keeping stable at around 35,000-plus
8 officers city wide, and that's, you know, below I
9 think the 40,000 officer peak from several years ago,
10 and I'm wondering if you know, is this just a budget
11 decision, or do you feel like there's actually a need
12 for a bigger uniform headcount NYPD to address a lot
13 of the quality of life concerns and the rising issues
14 with... with gun crime that were happening in the
15 city.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So I can respond to
18 your question on the attrition from school safety
19 agencies. It averages between 30 to 40 per month.
20 With regards to that... I think that works out to be
21 maybe about 8%. I think the city-wide attrition
22 rate. It depends on the agency, but it's a little
23 lower than that, generally around 6% or 7%. So it's
24 slightly higher than what is seen elsewhere but not
25 significantly higher.

2 CHIEF COREY: To the... to the second question
3 around cannabis impaired driving. A substantial
4 number of our officers have already received, and
5 others will continue to receive, training in
6 recognizing cannabis impaired motorists, and much
7 like we do with the people who drive intoxicated by
8 alcohol, when the officers encounter someone who they
9 believe to be under the influence of in this case,
10 we're talking about cannabis, they would then be
11 removed to the intoxicated driver testing facility
12 which in your case Councilmember in Staten Island is
13 at the 120 precinct, where specially trained officers
14 from the Highway Patrol would come and administer the
15 testing required to support such a charge. So the
16 precinct officers... a number have been trained and
17 the remainder are being trained in recognizing the
18 signs of cannabis impairment.

19 CHIEF ROYSTER: So, I would just like to add some
20 data to Chief Corey's statement: We've had over 9000
21 officers trained in impaired driving, and we continue
22 to do this training with all of the new recruits that
23 come out, as well as our officers that are in the
24 precinct. So this training is continuous. And we...
25 we want to make sure that everyone is knowledgeable

2 about impaired driving as... as the Chief spoke about
3 cannabis as well as driving while impaired under
4 alcohol.

5 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: And to your... your final
6 point: We are managing our staff efficiently and
7 effectively. While we are down in numbers from what
8 we once were at our peak, with our enhanced
9 deployment task forces and initiatives, we are
10 reorganizing people and taking them actually out of
11 civilian... sorry... administrative positions to put
12 them out on the street. So while we do realize that
13 we're not where we were, we are doing a phenomenal
14 job at arresting and addressing the concerns of
15 demand power that we have.

16 COUNCILMEMBER CARR: Thank you chairs. I
17 appreciate your time.

18 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Next we'll turn to
19 Councilmember Nurse.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

21 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Hi, good morning. And
22 thank you, Chair. I just had a couple of questions.
23 On

24

25

2 e, would you be able to tell me the number of
3 guns that have been pulled from precinct 75, 73, and
4 83? From the neighborhood safety team specifically?

5 CHIEF COREY: Yeah, I have that. So in the 75,
6 three, in the 73, one, and... what was the third
7 precinct? The 83, one.

8 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Thank you. And just
9 pivoting real quick. In terms of social media, how
10 much of the Intelligence Division budget is related
11 to monitoring civilian social media interactions?
12 Where does that data live? And can you tell me a
13 little bit more about what is the criteria for which
14 you would be monitoring someone?

15 _____: Just one moment.

16 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MILLER: So social media
17 monitoring usually focuses on open investigations
18 into groups like ISIS, or al Qaeda, or others that
19 use social media to recruit people or exhort people
20 to violence.

21 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: And the percentage of the
22 budget? Of the Intelligence Division budget.

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER MILLER: That's personnel-
24 driven. I have staff members who focus on that. But
25 I'd have to get back to you with that.

2 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Okay, and you can... I'd
3 definitely love to see that data.

4 And just lastly, I wanted to clarify, following
5 the points that Councilmember Barron made about what
6 is a violent felony and what isn't. Can you confirm
7 that someone stealing a candy bar or for example,
8 stealing a Amazon package out of a lobby would be
9 categorized as a violent felony?

10 CHIEF COREY: No. That would not be
11 categorized...

12 CHIEF LIPETRY: Yeah, no, that would not be...

13 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Stealing a package from a
14 lobbyist is not a violent felony?

15 CHIEF LIPETRY: That is correct.

16 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Okay. Okay. Thank you. I
17 just wanted that clarification. Thank you. Those
18 are my questions.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember
20 Nurse. Next we'll turn to Councilmember Brewer.

21 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. My
22 first question is just on the hate crimes. And I
23 hope this hasn't been asked before. But I know... I
24 believe it came up with Councilmember Julie Won the
25 other day when she had her hearing about some of the

2 Asian hate crimes, and there has been some
3 reorganization. But it's my understanding that in
4 2017, there were approximately 325 hate crimes to the
5 NYPD. And then obviously, the lockdown was
6 differently. But in 2021, it was 565. And it's up
7 75% this first quarter. So they seem to be going up.
8 And I just want to have a sense of how much has been
9 allocated in terms of funding to the task force and
10 what kind of strategies are using, because Asian,
11 Jewish community, LGBTQ has gone way up. What are
12 you doing to recalibrate so to speak in terms of that
13 task force and the funding for it?

14 CHIEF ESSIG: Good morning. I'm Chief Essig,
15 Chief of Detectives. And you're correct. The last
16 three years 2020, 2021, and then this year, a
17 substantial increase in hate crimes, particularly
18 Asian hate crimes, anti-Jewish, anti-Asian hate
19 crimes. This year, we're up about 194% in hate
20 crimes. Most of the increases are anti-Jewish,
21 antisemitic hate crimes. The anti-Asian hate crimes
22 that we've seen the explosion in in the last few
23 years are kind of unlike the other hate crimes, where
24 it's more personal. Almost all anti-Asian hate
25 crimes are personal, where there is an assault

2 involved, whereas some of the other ones are written,
3 language, phone calls, swastikas drawn, etc.

4 We currently have 20 Hate Crime detectives
5 assigned to the Hate Crimes Unit. That's an increase
6 of 17 over the last year. We also have an Anti-Asian
7 Hate Crime Task Force, where they supplement...
8 they're not investigators, but they supplement the
9 Hate Crimes Unit. They're used as interpreters or
10 outreach to the community. There's 25 members of a
11 service who are of various ethnic descent that assist
12 the Asian Hate Crime Unit.

13 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay, all right. So
14 hopefully that number goes down. But there's a lot
15 of work to be done. I have little time.

16 The second question I have is just... I know
17 we've heard from traffic, and I appreciate that
18 chief, but believe it or not, the number one
19 complaint I get are the... I don't know if it's the
20 placards, the personal cars, the perpendicular as
21 opposed to horizontal, parking, et cetera. And so if
22 there's something we can do, I don't know if we pay
23 for parking garages. But the issue is that every
24 single precinct and _____ Louis brings this up at
25 every single nightly discussion, why is it that every

2 single precinct seems to have so many cars parked at
3 it, and it doesn't seem to be related necessarily to
4 the precinct itself. Is there something we can do to
5 address that? I know it's hard. I know, people
6 drive in. I got it. But it really sends a message
7 not dissimilar from the concern of young people and
8 police to the community that, you know, sort of screw
9 you, we're going to park wherever we want. That's
10 the concern I have. So how do we address it? It's a
11 placard issue? It's the parking issue? How do we
12 address that.

13 CHIEF ROYSTER: So Councilmember Brewer, it's
14 great to see you. I'll start with the placard. Last
15 year, we did a pilot program where we utilized
16 technology to determine if a vehicle was connected to
17 a placard that was parking in violation. And we
18 expanded that pilot, now it is city wide. And that
19 technology is used by agents that issue our parking
20 citations. And this year, year to date, we've had an
21 increase of 31% of parking summonses issued to
22 vehicles that are attached to a placard.

23 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Can you give me a number?
24 Because 31% could be you know could be, you know, one
25 to three. So... so is that like...?

2 CHIEF ROYSTER: I could give you a... a number.
3 So the actual number is over 19,000... is 19,099
4 versus 14,519. Last year.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay, so... go ahead.

6 CHIEF ROYSTER: So what this technology does, is
7 that we can determine once that vehicle is parked in
8 violation, we can determine if the vehicle is
9 attached to a placard, whether that placard is
10 associated with the Department of Transportation, the
11 Department of Education, the NYPD, or our law
12 enforcement officers, or any of the agency that
13 issues placards.

14 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: So for the discussion
15 about that topic, and just finally, I go to all of
16 the block the meetings I go to the Free State
17 Council, I just did a phenomenally excellent Transit
18 One meeting with many people.

19 The question is: What do you got to do with
20 people who are hopefully not going to Rikers... at
21 least I hope not. And one of the suggestions is...
22 believe me, picking up on what the Speaker asked:
23 Nobody knows what to do. PD does not know what to do
24 with these young people. And we want to do the right
25 thing, but they have no clue. One suggestion is peer

2 navigators in the precinct. And I know this may not
3 be your favorite suggestion, but you have to have
4 somebody... at the young people... not just young
5 people, but generally somebody to help them navigate
6 what they can do differently. If you just send
7 people... I have 35 foster care kids. I know where
8 young people, even adults go. So something like peer
9 navigators in the precinct. I know all the things
10 Chauncey is doing is not enough. We have to think
11 differently, working with the other agencies, about
12 how to deal with people who are just jumping the
13 turnstile, stealing from the lobby, etc. We're not
14 doing that. And particularly at transit, the same
15 repeaters, over and over again, with something like
16 peer navigators in the precinct. Would you support
17 something like that?

18 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: I would. I have to say
19 that we totally agree that we have to do... we have
20 to reach our youth? And I think we have a commitment
21 to that. And I know the administration has a
22 commitment to that. So we are certainly exploring
23 every option that we have, we are actually expanding
24 some of our youth programs for this summer. We
25 didn't add any because, we are ramping them up

2 because they were down because of COVID 19. So we
3 expect a robust enrollment in our youth programs this
4 summer, and we're constantly looking for ways to
5 engage the community and show youth that there's
6 some... there's another way. I mean, can we get a
7 hold of them earlier in their lives to be able to
8 make a difference? So they don't go down the path of
9 criminality? That's definitely one of our objectives
10 as well, we, we certainly realize we have to have
11 enforcement, but we need to have engagement because
12 we want to stop them early on before they lead to
13 criminal activity.

14 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you Commissioner.
15 The only comment I would make is at the precinct, at
16 the arraignment, one minute off the streets, they're
17 gone. It's just how they are. I'd love to work with
18 you on that. And thank you very much.

19 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: Thank you Councilmember.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And our final
21 questions come from Councilmember Williams, then
22 Sánchez, Joseph, and Avilés, and then we are done.
23 Councilmember Williams?

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

2 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you Chairs. So I
3 don't think this specific question was asked, but I
4 know that the budget adds funding for the
5 neighborhood safety teams, and also a gun violence
6 strategies partnership. Can you talk through what
7 that money will be used for?

8 CHIEF COREY: So the money being requested in the
9 budget for the neighborhood safety teams is to equip
10 the unmarked vehicles that they use with dashboard
11 cameras, so we can capture a fuller accounting of...
12 of what took place in any particular encounter
13 between the teams. Our patrol vehicles are not
14 typically equipped with those, just our highway
15 patrol. So that's just for the equipment and
16 maintenance of those cameras to outfit those
17 vehicles. On the gun violence strategic partnership,
18 it was to hire a number of analysts, crime analysts,
19 intelligence analysts to help refocus the strategy,
20 and really make sure that we are doing this with the
21 level of precision that we need to, to get those...
22 the worst of the worst, the trigger pullers, the
23 people who are shooting children in our
24 neighborhoods, to identify them, to do thorough

2 investigations, and then turn those over to a
3 prosecutor for effective prosecution.

4 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, and you mentioned
5 dashboards, which leads me to my next question: We
6 know the NYPD contracts with different folks or uses
7 different vendors. And as an example, we know,
8 there's been a lot of issues with shot spotters, and
9 body cams. And so is there some type of auditing or
10 measuring of success around the different contracts
11 and or vendors that you're using?

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So we do have an audit
13 unit here at NYPD and they work closely with our
14 contracts team to monitor our contracts. We do
15 multiple audits per year on select contracts. And
16 then also if anything is determined throughout the
17 course of a contract that looks problematic, that
18 auditing team is brought in to take a look and to
19 make sure there's corrective action taken.

20 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. Would you be able
21 to share your list of vendors and contracts? Like
22 the people you have contracts with?

23 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: Yeah, we can... we can
24 get you that. And many of them are actually on the

2 controller's... my checkbook, but we can tell you
3 that information.

4 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, cool. And the
5 other question I have is around forfeiture money. So
6 I wanted to know how much money does the NYPD have
7 access to? And who decides how that money is spent?

8 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER RYAN: So asset forfeiture
9 amounts vary year to year. There have been times, as
10 I mentioned, previous, there have been significant
11 settlements that we've received funding from. But
12 traditionally, you're we're probably looking at
13 having about you \$20 million some years. Some years,
14 it's less than that. And the rules and guidelines
15 are prescribed by the federal government. Some asset
16 forfeiture comes from the Department of Justice.
17 Some of it comes from the Department of Treasury,
18 other equitable sharing guidelines and rules we have
19 to follow about what the funds can and cannot be used
20 for, and we do follow those rules.

21 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, um, and since I
22 have a few more minutes, the other question I wanted
23 to ask is also about the SRG unit, and wanted to know
24 what grounds does the department view to deploying
25 officers to enforce? So I know there was some

2 reports that that unit was used to enforce
3 encampments suites of unhoused New Yorkers.

4 CHIEF COREY: So, when it comes down to the
5 NYPD's role in homeless encampments, our role there
6 is to keep the peace. So other agencies take the
7 lead: Department of Homeless Services, Department of
8 Social Services, there's some nonprofits and CBOs
9 involved. Our officers are there to keep the peace.
10 The only time SRG units have been used utilized in
11 that is when protests have developed around that, and
12 protesters are going to be arrested for physically
13 obstructing those agencies from performing their
14 lawful duties.

15 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay, so in terms of the
16 metric, it's only when you deem some other type of
17 escalation, do you deploy the SRG unit?

18 CHIEF COREY: Correct. They are called in
19 when... when there are demonstrations that involve
20 civil disobedience, and that there are numbers of
21 arrests to be made. Again, they are experts in that
22 area, they would be called in to make those arrests.

23 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. Thank you so much
24 chairs. I will yield the rest of my few seconds.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember
3 Williams. Next, Councilmember Sánchez?

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Your time will begin.

5 COUNCILMEMBER SÁNCHEZ: Good morning,
6 Commissioner and NYPD leadership, and chairs. So
7 first, I want to start with a note of gratitude. I
8 had a shooting outside of my office two days ago, we
9 all jumped to the floor, And of course, NYPD were
10 first here. I called immediately. And I also spoke
11 to our precinct commander, and they were here
12 immediately. So I want to thank you for always being
13 here and for the... for the work that for the for the
14 work that you do to get guns off our streets.

15 But I did want to ask a question. And this is a
16 particular one, right? This is based on interactions
17 that I've had with folks on the ground here. You
18 know, my... my beat cops, my folks that are on my
19 corner, my folks are in corners across the district,
20 I'm really friendly. I say hi to everybody. I want
21 to strike up conversation. And you know, some of...
22 some of the officers are not warm, do not say hi back
23 and things like that. And others have had made these
24 troubling comments about, you know, how they wish
25 they could profile and they wish they could, you

2 know... they... you know, the complaints about how
3 many folks are being released after having a weapon
4 and how they wish they could profile. So... I you
5 know, just in listening to the hearing this morning,
6 and hearing you talk about precision policing, 800
7 individuals identified and, and on someone's radar or
8 another, that first question is about, you know...
9 how... how are the folks that are just most on the
10 ground closest to communities? How are they being
11 trained and talked to, you know, talked to about the
12 precision policing, versus this... seeming like
13 desire to profile in communities? So that's, that's
14 one

15 And then I have an unrelated question on... on
16 transit, but I want to start there.

17 CHIEF COREY: So it was... I don't know who the
18 officers are that you're speaking to, if they
19 actually use the word profile. That's extremely
20 disturbing to me. You know, our officers receive...
21 receive extensive training in cultural competency,
22 also in communication skills I am with you, they are
23 not anywhere near as friendly as we'd like them to
24 be. But that's a work in progress on our... on our
25 part. So please continue to say hello to them and

2 engage them in conversation, they will respond. You
3 know, sometimes they're a little shocked that
4 somebody is saying hello to them and not cursing at
5 them. So... but we will continue to try to advance
6 that. And we do encourage them to do exactly that.
7 And I think that you'll find that our younger
8 officers, our newer officers are much more engaged in
9 that, because we have really hit that in the academy
10 the last few years. I myself, I'm usually the final
11 speaker that they get, and I talk extensively about
12 the need to engage with people and... and to have
13 those conversations on the street, which in New York,
14 as we all know, doesn't even have to be verbal.
15 Sometimes it can just involve eye contact and a nod.
16 And that's generally recognized as a Good morning.
17 How are you? Right? So that's where we begin.

18 On the precision policing front. We know who's
19 creating... we know who's causing crime in the city.
20 The frustration I think that officers may be
21 expressing to you, I think comes from situations like
22 the one we saw last night, right? Right there in the
23 Bronx in the 42nd precinct where, you know, you have
24 an individual who's arrested for multiple robberies.
25 Released on five years' probation. Arrested with a

2 gun. Released on his own recognizance for 20 months.
3 Goes back to court. Pleads guilty to that charge.
4 And yet remains free. None of those prior actions
5 serve to serve as any sort of deterrent to him
6 carrying an illegal firearm again, on the streets of
7 the Bronx, and then ultimately shooting a police
8 officer last night. So the... the officers are
9 tremendously frustrated that they continue to arrest
10 the same people over and over again, seemingly
11 without consequence. And at the same time, also
12 troubled because you have a lot of young people --
13 and Chief Lipetri talked about it before -- that if
14 being arrested carrying guns -- and everybody in this
15 room has been in this business for a very long time,
16 and I know how that story ends when there's no
17 consequences, because I've seen it play out far too
18 many times. So just yesterday, we're discussing a
19 17-year-old in the Bronx, who has been arrested three
20 times with an illegal gun that we linked to either
21 nine incidents of either shots being fired or people
22 being shot. And yet he continues to walk the streets
23 of the Bronx. So the way that story ends, in my
24 experience... in my more than three decades of
25 experience is, we are either looking for him very

2 shortly for homicide, or we're standing over his body
3 in the street. And neither of those outcomes is
4 acceptable to me. And it's not acceptable to the
5 officers who go out there who genuinely care, and
6 they want something to be done to save this
7 individual, but also to protect all of the other
8 people who are going to be victimized.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

10 COUNCILMEMBER SÁNCHEZ: Thank you. Thank you so
11 much. I'll defer my second question for follow up.
12 But... but just to say, you know, I agree, you know.
13 There was a piece on NPR this morning about how gun
14 violence has increased... increased across the
15 country, but has really increased in black and brown
16 communities the most, but because we have these
17 economic challenges, because we have these... these
18 root causes. And so, you know, I just want to want
19 to echo that, some of the comments that my colleagues
20 made earlier that, you know, there's a bigger picture
21 here. You know, we have to... we have to, as a city,
22 as city leadership have to address the bigger
23 picture, providing opportunities, relieving some of
24 these economic stressors. But you know, these are...
25 these are my kids. Literally the person, the shooter

2 lives, like a couple blocks away, right? That's...
3 that's my kid. That's like my cousin. I just I
4 consider all of all of the constituents in this
5 district, my family, my cousin, and, you know, making
6 mistakes. So, you know, just, it's... it's
7 complicated. And thank you for being here two days
8 ago. Thank you for being on the street and putting
9 your lives on the line. You know, but there's a
10 there's a bigger picture here that, you know, I look
11 forward to continuing to talk with all of you about.

12 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: Also, Councilmember
13 Sánchez, I just want to tell you, I know, that was a
14 very harrowing experience that shooting happening, so
15 close to you. But I want to thank you personally for
16 reaching out to us immediately in concern and to
17 offer assistance. I appreciate that.

18 COUNCILMEMBER SÁNCHEZ: Of course. Thank you,
19 Commissioner.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Councilmember Joseph?

21 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: I just have to stop you for
22 a moment. I'm sorry. We just have to set the record
23 for something... just bear with us for one moment.

24 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Sure.

2 _____: I just wanted to clarify the record in
3 response to one of Councilmember Nurse's questions
4 about whether stealing property from a lobby and
5 Amazon package from a lobby is a violent felony
6 offense, it could be charged as a burg-2, which is
7 classified as a violent felony offense. But we were
8 also talking about bail eligibility in the context of
9 that conversation. And with the burg-2, stealing a
10 package from a non-livable area is not bail eligible.
11 So just want to clarify that if you steal up a
12 package from a residential lobby, it could be charged
13 as a burg-2, not necessarily that it is charged as a
14 burglary-2, but even if it is charged as a burglary
15 to is not bail eligible under the bail reform law.

16 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And now I'll turn
17 to Councilmember Joseph.

18 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time will begin.

19 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Good morning everyone.
20 Good morning, Commissioner, Chairs Brannan and Hanks.
21 Thank you for having me.

22 I have a couple of questions. I wanted to find
23 out in Precinct 67 How many guns were collected in
24 precinct 67 and 71.

2 CHIEF COREY: I might not have that broken down
3 to that level of specificity, Councilmember. We
4 might have to get that back to you.

5 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: All right. No problem.
6 Thank you so much.

7 Um, next questions is around school safety. I
8 wanted to find out: What conversation are you having
9 with the DOE about best practices for our school
10 safety? I know you talked about earlier about...
11 about 254 coming in. And are you also engaging young
12 people in conversations around school safety?
13 Talking to student advocates? I know that's something
14 that we talked about engaging young people,
15 constantly making decisions for them and without
16 them. So I wanted to know if that's something that's
17 being thought of. Does all the schools have school
18 agents? And if they do, how do you determine where
19 they're placed? And has the DOE expressed any
20 interest in keeping the initial agreement for 2020 to
21 have school safeties transferred over to the DOE?

22 CHIEF LARIN: So... (crosstalk)

23 COMMISSIONER SEWELL: So I'm... I'm sorry, Chief,
24 I'll just start before I pass it over to you.

2 So I have regular conversations with Chancellor
3 Banks. He is very interested in having a
4 relationship with the police department where we can
5 come together to find out the best practices to
6 engage the people in the schools, the youth and the
7 school safety officers to make the school system
8 safer. We actually have a meeting with them next
9 week as well in furtherance of that objective. And
10 I'll turn it over to Chief Larin.

11 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you, Commissioner.
12 Very important.

13 CHIEF LARIN: Thank you, Commissioner. Good
14 morning, Councilmember. Thank you for your question.

15 Conversations with advocates is something that we
16 are leveraging. We work with groups such as Touching
17 Your Generation from Harlem. We work with the New
18 York City School Safety Coalition, we work with our
19 partners at the unions. So we speak with anyone
20 that's willing to come to the table. And with this
21 concern that we have with the weapons increase, we
22 believe that there has to be an educational
23 component. Chief Corey mentioned that earlier in
24 regards to hate crimes. So we're launching a
25 campaign called My School Is For Education And Not

2 Confrontation. Our creative services team... the
3 department's creative services team is working on a
4 graphic that we can put out to our parents and our
5 guardians, because we believe that a lot of them
6 simply don't know that, for instance, a pepper... can
7 of pepper spray is illegal. They're not supposed to
8 have that. So our goal is to not criminalize these
9 young people. We try to handle incidents
10 administratively as much as possible. But we want
11 the young people... we want to help change their
12 mindset, we want to get buy-in from them and see that
13 this is not the way to go. We do understand that
14 some of them are fearful when we survey them. They
15 say that it's for protection. But we don't want to
16 see them take matters into their own hands. Although
17 our school crime is down for this school year, we do
18 have an increase in felony assault. So some of the
19 young people are using these cutting instruments that
20 they're taking into the schools. But you are right,
21 we do need to have more of these listening sessions.
22 We have one tomorrow, scheduled in Harlem. We have
23 school safety agents that are conducting
24 presentations on awareness for the students, but we

2 want them to see that this is something that we're
3 doing with them and not to them.

4 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: That's exactly the
5 conversation, because a lot of the young people that
6 reach out to me: They want police free schools. They
7 don't want you in their building. They feel over...
8 over-policed, especially in the black and brown
9 schools. So that's a conversation that I've been
10 having. And my phone doesn't stop ringing from young
11 advocates. So I want them to be also at the center
12 of the conversation. And have... have you guys ever
13 thought about maybe restorative justice practices
14 versus policing in the schools?

15 CHIEF LARIN: So that's part of... so the second
16 part of your question that you asked earlier, the
17 Department of Education is offering crisis
18 intervention training, which seeks to do just that:
19 How to not go immediately to creating an arrest
20 record for the young person, and how to have a an
21 approach where counselors are involved. Maybe it's
22 just the child in crisis, that they ordinarily
23 wouldn't resort to criminality. So they have
24 delivered that training most recently, during the
25 Easter break, they did 50 of our agents, but during

2 the summer, we're looking to have that since most of
3 our schools will be closed, to have our agents
4 receive this five day training. So they have
5 committed to do that for us.

6 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Do you think five day
7 training is enough? Is it constant professional
8 development in order to develop it? As an educator
9 I'm constantly asked to do public... PD all the time
10 as an educator. I was also mandated to take de-
11 escalation classes. Is that something that's been
12 offered to school safety officers in schools?

13 CHIEF LARIN: So our in-service component is in
14 place to revisit these topics that are introduced,
15 but deescalation is a...

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

17 CHIEF LARIN: ... deescalation is a very large
18 component to the entry level training that our agents
19 get during their 17 weeks, mostly because they don't
20 have the less lethal options that our officers have.
21 So for instance, no OC spray, no taser, not much of
22 anything except handcuffs and a radio. So they rely
23 a lot on speaking to the young people and just trying
24 to bring them down from whatever state that they're
25 in.

2 COUNCILMEMBER JOSEPH: Thank you. You can follow
3 up... and officer please follow up with the data that
4 I requested. Thank you.

5 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember
6 Joseph and Councilmember Avilés?

7 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Oh, I can unmute myself
8 how fantastic. Good afternoon, everyone. Thank you
9 chairs for this hearing. And thank you to the NYPD
10 staff for being here.

11 I have a couple of different questions. But
12 following along the questions around school safety
13 agents, I'd love to know... the one thing that I
14 hear in my district consistently is not a request for
15 more agents. It's been a request for crossing
16 guards, which are at a full dearth throughout the
17 district. And we talk about traffic violence in a...
18 in a district that is both industrial manufacturing
19 and deals with an increase in car traffic, which is
20 actually city wide. Crossing guards are a major
21 issue, not school safety agents. I will, like
22 Councilmember Joseph, note that the requests that we
23 receive in our office both from young people and
24 families is not for agents, it is for school guidance
25 counselors to work through difficulties that families

2 are having; appropriate, culturally-competent, school
3 social workers to help manage the multiple array of
4 challenges that students are facing that,
5 unfortunately, bring them to places. I've had PD
6 demonstrate to me weapons that they've confiscated.
7 And a majority of the pictures they show me are
8 pepper spray, which is not an issue of violence of
9 children. It's of feeling unsafe. It feels... as we
10 know, violence is a public health approach, and it
11 seems like adding more police in schools is not at
12 all addressing why these children feel this way. So
13 I'd love to know a little bit about: How many
14 crossing guard vacancies do you have? Why is that not
15 prioritized? How do you justify adding 800 new
16 school safety officers? And what are the metrics
17 you're using to deploy those officers? I understand
18 you mentioned recovery of weapons has increased.
19 What are those weapons exactly? Where are they
20 showing up? I'd just like more precise and targeted
21 information. Because we seem to have a real hard
22 time adding 50 mental health providers but very
23 easily adding 800... 500... 300 school safety agents.
24 The... the two elements just don't mix.

2 _____: Thank you, Councilmember. We have over
3 500 vacancies for school crossing guards. And we
4 have done a lot of efforts in terms of recruitment,
5 through Build A Block meetings, through the
6 department website, and the process of determining
7 precinct school crossing guards staffing levels has
8 historically been formula weight... weight, among
9 other things is school density, traffic conditions,
10 commercial routes, and collision prone locations.

11 We have consistently struggled to maintain our...
12 our budgeted level for school crossing guards. But
13 it's not without efforts by the department in terms
14 of trying to advertise and solicit help from the
15 community and in our process of hiring.

16 CHIEF LAVIN: And I can speak to the weapons
17 recovered council member. So just to go back: The
18 numbers 4728. So the most common weapon is a stun
19 gun or taser. We recovered 416 so far. In the last
20 full school year we recovered 42. Metal knuckles
21 comes in second at 104. The last four school year we
22 recovered 18.

23 In terms of dangerous instruments, pepper spray
24 is the most popular item at 1372. The last number
25 that we have is 186. So that's an increase of 1186.

2 Knives under four inches is 1141, as opposed to
3 774. We're also seeing other dangerous and sharp
4 instruments at 229 over 11. And I would also know
5 that firearm recoveries are up significantly, 16 on
6 school facilities versus 5. And I did say that
7 crime on school property is down, but what we're
8 seeing is that when the young people come out to the
9 streets, unfortunately when we don't catch these
10 weapons and we don't recover them, they are prone to
11 use them, and that's where we work with our partners
12 in the Patrol Services Bureau, just to ensure that we
13 have school corridors in place, and omnipresence so
14 ensure that all students are safe.

15 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: And do we have a breakdown
16 of what that looks like geographically by district,
17 to understand more precisely what is going down and
18 if in fact, it is the conditions outside the building
19 that are driving what children are doing to keep
20 themselves safe. Why are we increasing the number of
21 safety units within the buildings?

22 CHIEF LAVIN: So the number 800 agents, I'm not
23 sure where that...

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.
25

2 CHIEF LAVIN: ...comes from. Our vacancies are
3 at 353. We don't break it down by district. But we
4 do break it down by patrol borough and by precinct.
5 I can get that over to your office after the call...

6 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: That'd be great.

7 CHIEF LAVIN: Sure. But while we...

8 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: And the 800 was an
9 estimation. It was... I know, there was a 791.
10 Obviously, you have a new class that came in. I'd
11 love to see the data that's driving the justification
12 for these... filling these vacancies, which quite
13 frankly, I don't understand... the numbers don't
14 match. How many agents are in elementary schools?
15 Sitting at desks, cutting flowers, and being lovely
16 individuals, is not the deterrent that you're talking
17 about. It's not the weapons element that you're
18 talking about. So there's just a disconnect in... in
19 both the numbers, the function and the goal?

20 CHIEF LAVIN: Well, most of our agents are
21 deployed where you have a complex. I'll give you an
22 example: Lehman complex in the Bronx. That has five
23 schools in it. North over 3000 students. So a
24 campus like that, we would have agents in the double
25 digits, we just need that to cover exits, to conduct

2 visitor control, to ensure that there's no
3 trespassers coming in, packages. We get threats
4 coming in from the outside. So we need these agents
5 on site, too. And that's, quite frankly, not enough
6 when you say 14 agents for 3000 students. So that's
7 why sometimes we do miss things. We're not
8 immediately there, when a crime does happen in a
9 gymnasium or something of that nature. Our
10 elementary schools is where we actually have the
11 least amount of agents, but we also see charter
12 schools that are housed in DOE facilities. So we're
13 responsible for the safety of those students as well.

14 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: I understand that. I'd
15 love to see where the actual deployment is. Because
16 I think it's helps inform this conversation. Ith 4000
17 agents and a whole host. All the... all the
18 elementary schools in my district have multiple
19 safety agents and sometimes two at a time. It
20 doesn't... there's... there's definitely a disconnect
21 between what you're... where you're recovering.
22 Right, because we don't know where you're recovering
23 and how you're driving the safety tactic to actually
24 what is happening on the ground?

2 CHIEF LAVIN: Well, I honestly think that if we
3 had the ability to conduct more unannounced scanning,
4 the numbers would be exponentially higher. And that
5 is concerning to us, because it's not permissible.
6 Weapons in schools, it's just not okay. And we would
7 we covet your support on that.

8 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Yeah, no one is suggesting
9 weapons in school is okay, or that unsafe conditions
10 are okay. Where... what I am suggesting here is a...
11 is a much clearer understanding around how we use our
12 public dollars in the notion of... of public safety,
13 when we have 4000 agents across the city, many whom
14 are deployed in places where quite frankly, they're
15 not needed. And we have an ever increasing number of
16 positions that we're trying to fill without an
17 accurate justification. And, and a pretty
18 significant call. Obviously, there's mixed...
19 there's mixed feeling here, right? Obviously
20 there... there are some that are calling. We heard
21 other Councilmembers who... who have heard those
22 calls, and there are others who are not calling for
23 that. And yet still, we're saddled with an ever-
24 increasing police presence in schools, where we are
25 calling for other interventions that are not nearly

2 getting the investments that they require, despite
3 long-term advocacy engagements, and all that other
4 stuff.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time is expired. So... So I
6 look forward to the data because we don't nearly see
7 enough we just see weapons recovered, and I need to
8 see much more specific data across the district. So
9 thank you so much. Look forward to the conversation.

10 CHIEF LAVIN: Yes, ma'am.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Just bear with us one moment
12 please.

13 Sorry about that. Chair Hanks. I need to turn
14 to you because Chair Brannan lost power. So he's off
15 the Zoom. And I know he had already spoken with the
16 NYPD, and that we are concluding this portion of
17 today's hearing. Any questions not asked or answered
18 for follow up will be taken by Finance Staff from all
19 council members. But I'm going to turn it to you for
20 closing remarks?

21 Chair Hanks are you there?

22 Okay, no Chairs are there. I'm the chair right
23 now.

24 Commissioner Sewewll, thank you for you and your
25 team for being here. I know Councilmember Brannan

2 said we were going to end the questioning, and we
3 have. So thank you for your time. Every
4 Councilmembers that are here on public safety, we're
5 going to turn to MOCJ in a few minutes. MOCJ I know
6 you're on. We're going to turn to you in a few
7 minutes. And that concludes the portion of today for
8 NYPD. Thank you everyone. Malcolm I'm sorry. I see
9 Councilmember Salamanca raising his hands. Per Chair
10 Brannan, we concluded NYPD, because we're totally
11 over schedule. So we're going to turn to MOCJ in a
12 few minutes everyone just bear with us while we get
13 our chairs back and pivot to the next panel.

14 [30 SECONDS SILENCE]

15 SERGEANT LUGO: Okay, Director Logan coming
16 please test your audio.

17 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Hello, testing.

18 SERGEANT LUGO: Yep. Coming in loud and clear.

19 Thank you.

20 DIRECTOR LOGAN: No, thank you.

21 SERGEANT LUGO: CFO Cruz, can we test your audio?

22 CFO CRUZ: Testing? Can you hear me?

23 SERGEANT LUGO: Yep. Picking you up loud and
24 clear. Thank you.

25 CFO CRUZ: Great. Thank you.

2 SERGEANT LUGO: Chief of Staff Daniel, can we
3 test your audio?

4 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: Hello.

5 SERGEANT LUGO: Picking you up loud and clear
6 thank you.

7 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay, Chair Brannan. I know
8 you're on your phone. Chair Hanks, do we have you
9 back?

10 CHAIR HANKS: Yes, we do.

11 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay. I just... for the prior
12 hearing, I just want to make sure that it goes into
13 the official record that the other council members we
14 were joined by were Joseph, Carr, Williams, De La
15 Rosa, Avilés, Cabán, Ossé, Bottcher, Barron, Ariola,
16 Salamanca, Powers, Rivera, Riley, Brewer, Mealy, and
17 Nurse. And Chairs, just so you were aware, those
18 Councilmembers that were not able to ask questions,
19 that we did shut down, that we said that finance
20 staff will reach out and collect any questions that
21 were not asked of the NYPD, so... (crosstalk)

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Counsel, just for the
23 record, NYPD told us going into the hearing that they
24 had a hard stop at 1130, so we went almost a quarter
25 of an hour over. But I wanted to try to get through

2 at least one round. I know we left some members
3 behind, so I want to make sure that we prioritize the
4 questions they had in writing and make sure we get an
5 answer from PD ASAP. But PD did tell us in good
6 faith that they had a hard stop at 11:30, and we went
7 over so... but I don't like the idea of leaving
8 anyone behind, at least for our first round, but we
9 really didn't have a choice.

10 COUNCILMEMBER SCHULMAN: Counsel, also I was I
11 was at the hearing. So you didn't... I didn't hear
12 my name mentioned.

13 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: You were mentioned in my
14 first... All Councilmembers: I'm constantly
15 monitoring you, so I will always make sure that
16 you... I have ever-present eyes in the background.

17 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I was going to say
18 the same.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: So everybody was covered.

20 Okay, we're now about to start MOCJ second
21 agency. We're behind schedule. So I'm going to once
22 again say council members when at times for
23 questions, put your hands up early stick to the five
24 minutes when the sergeant calls time so we can be
25 cognizant of moving on to your fellow colleagues.

2 Present for the record Chairs... Chairs Brannan
3 and Hanks. Councilmember Avilés, Barron, Brewer,
4 Cabán, De La Rosa, Holden, Joseph, Louis, Ossé,
5 Rivera, Sánchez, Stevens, Majority Leader Powers,
6 Majority Whip Brooks-Powers. I'm now going to turn
7 to Chair Brannan for his opening statement, then
8 Chair Hanks for hers. They're both very short. Then
9 we will swear in the witnesses and be off to the
10 races.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, counsel. Good
12 afternoon, everyone. We just heard from the NYPD.
13 We're now going to hear from the Mayor's Office of
14 Criminal Justice. I'm still joined by my colleague
15 Chair Hanks, and I welcome her in partnership...
16 continued partnership with today's very important
17 financial oversight hearing.

18 I'm going to keep this extremely short. Another
19 tool in the Public Safety Toolkit of this city, I
20 welcome MOCJ here this afternoon, and I'll focus my
21 questions on MOCJ on the issue of procurement and
22 contract delays, something this council has heard
23 consistently about, and the critically important
24 topic of pay parity for public defenders, and the
25 blueprint to end gun violence.

2 I look forward to a forthright conversation on
3 these issues, and others raised by my colleagues. I
4 want to thank Jack Storey for his preparation for
5 today. I'll now turn it over to Chair Hanks for her
6 opening remarks.

7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Chair Brannan.
8 Thank you very much. We're going to be hearing from
9 the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice, who's whose
10 fiscal 2023 projected budget of \$12.9 million and
11 budgeted headcount of \$87 is quite small in
12 comparison to the central role that it plays in
13 overseeing and shaping criminal justice and public
14 safety initiatives in New York City. This includes
15 management of over \$800 million in criminal justice
16 and indigent defense contracts.

17 So today, we look forward to learning about how
18 the executive budget supports MOCJ's expansive role
19 in facilitating, coordinating, and overseeing
20 community based programs that help make our city
21 safer and fairer. And I thank Jack Storey as well,
22 for all of his help in preparing this important
23 hearing. I will pass it off to Central Staff. Thank
24 you.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Chairs. The
3 following members of the administration will testify
4 and our answer questions: Deanna Logan, Director of
5 the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice, Oswaldo Cruz,
6 Chief Financial Officer, and Nora Daniel, Chief of
7 Staff. I will first read the oath and after I will
8 call on each member from the administration
9 individually to respond.

10 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth,
11 and nothing but the truth before these committees and
12 respond honestly to Councilmember questions? Director
13 Logan?

14 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I do.

15 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: CFO Cruz:

16 CFO CRUZ: I do.

17 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: And Chief of Staff Daniel?

18 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: I do.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you.

20 Director Logan, Logan, whenever you were ready.

21 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Good morning. Thank you.

22 Actually, good afternoon. Good afternoon, Chair
23 Hanks, Chair Brannan, Members of the Committee on
24 Public Safety. My name is Deanna Logan, and I'm the
25 director of the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice.

2 We affectionately referred to as MOCJ. And so
3 throughout my testimony, I will refer to us as such.

4 I'm joined this afternoon by our chief financial
5 officer who is Oswaldo Cruz, and Nora Daniel, our
6 Chief Of Staff. We thank you for this opportunity to
7 come before you and testify and answer questions
8 about the budget and the priorities of MOCJ of this
9 year.

10 MOCJ advises the mayor on criminal justice policy
11 and is the mayor's representative to the courts,
12 District Attorney's defenders, state and criminal
13 justice agencies, among others. And MOCJ works with
14 law enforcement, city agencies, not-for-profit
15 foundations, and the public to implement effective
16 strategies that make the city safer for improving
17 system by... improving system coordination. MOCJ
18 brings together community and institutional
19 stakeholders to address those systemic issues that
20 could undermine the safety and stability of our
21 neighborhoods. We strive to move our city forward by
22 providing better resources and access to supports
23 needed to promote and maintain those healthy
24 communities for all New Yorkers.

2 Our office is committed to implementing Mayor
3 Adams his vision for a safe and fair city for all New
4 Yorkers. MOCJ's teams all work along a public safety
5 continuum, and that continuum supports the healthy
6 neighborhoods that are the foundation and creation of
7 safety. Our interventions program EMS and services
8 range from public-health-informed community models
9 implemented by our office of neighborhood safety to
10 the system coordination work conducted by our crime
11 strategies team, and operationalized by our strategic
12 operations team. MOCJ also includes the Office of
13 Special Enforcement, the Office of crime victim
14 supports, and the office for the prevention of hate
15 crimes. Our Office of Special Enforcement or OSC
16 enforces the city's multiple dwelling law, which
17 helps to maintain our affordable housing stock.

18 In February of this year, OSC announced a \$1.1
19 million settlement on the Upper West Side, which I'm
20 happy to report paved the way for 82 affordable
21 housing units for low income and formerly
22 incarcerated New Yorkers. The Office of Crime Victim
23 Supports or OCVS now has absorbed the Crime Victims
24 Assistance Program, which is the city's largest Crime
25 Victim Services Program.

2 In the last year OCBs realized a dream and
3 expanded its Abusive Partner Intervention Program
4 APIP, which we know this council had a lot of help in
5 doing. And that program now provides court
6 mandated... court mandated interventions to female
7 and male identified individuals who have engaged in
8 intimate partner violence, helping to break cycles of
9 abuse in intimate partner relationships.

10 The Office for the Prevention of Hate Crimes
11 played a critical role coordinating prevention and
12 response to hate crimes. As hate crimes rose in the
13 city, OPHC cultivated networks of over 100 community
14 organizations and city agencies. They mobilize to
15 educate New Yorkers on hate and bias, provide
16 community-based and culturally competent responses to
17 hate and bias incidents, and to foster healing.

18 OPHC's Path Forward Initiative provided \$2.4 million
19 in critical funding to directly support and uplift
20 grassroots work with some of our most vulnerable
21 communities.

22 MOCJ is continuing its work on reducing
23 unnecessary incarceration. Our programs and services
24 reinforce and support enhanced public safety while
25 maintaining fairness and reducing reliance on

2 carceral systems. Court mandated programs like
3 supervised release, alternatives to incarceration and
4 the abusive partner intervention program are valuable
5 options provided at various points in the criminal
6 justice system. In addition, MOCJ implemented
7 enhanced reentry services through the Community
8 Justice reentry network. Our Alternatives To
9 Incarceration Programs are court mandated diversion
10 programs that provide participants with supportive
11 services in their communities instead of a jail or a
12 prison sentence. ATI programs are key components of
13 the city's investment in reducing the courts reliance
14 on incarceration. MOCJ currently invested \$32
15 million in contracts and FY 22 with 15 nonprofit
16 organizations to run 24 ATI programs throughout New
17 York City. In 2017, the city increased this
18 investment in our Alternatives To Incarceration
19 programs that serves approximately 5500 people, as
20 well as to provide additional behavioral health
21 service to ATI participants and housing resources for
22 women enrolled in ATI programs. In 2020, the city
23 expanded its ATI programs even further to provide
24 additional supportive services to more fully address
25 participants needs.

2 Overall, the number of people served by ATI
3 programs is expected to increase from starting at
4 4000 annually in 2012 to approximately 6300 annually
5 in 2022. During the COVID pandemic, these programs
6 were able to redirect many of their services to
7 provide a remote model furnishing ATI clients with
8 cell phones and other means to engage in services
9 safely during our public health emergency.

10 Our supervised release work: In 2016, New York
11 City launched the supervised release citywide
12 offering judges the option of releasing appropriate
13 and eligible individuals under specific supervisory
14 conditions in lieu of setting bail. Supervised
15 release is designed to reasonably assure court
16 attendance and engage participants in social services
17 that may sustain past the duration of an individual's
18 court case. Participants in supervised release are
19 required to report to program case managers
20 regularly, and are offered court reminders, case
21 management services that include mental health,
22 addiction, employment, and peer services. MOCJ
23 currently contracts with three organizations to
24 provide supervised release city wide. The current
25 overall value of these contracts for FY 22 is \$72

2 million. MOCJ issued a request for proposal and new
3 awards for supervised release system in this fiscal
4 year 2022.

5 Our reentry work over the past few years, we have
6 seen promising reductions in individuals returned to
7 jail. Now while these reductions are encouraging,
8 the numbers of those who actually returned to jail
9 are still too high. And we are currently making
10 significant investments in services and reshaping the
11 way we deliver those services to provide an even more
12 effective programming. The investments and effective
13 deployment of that programming will be key in
14 reducing the overall return rate that we're seeing of
15 individuals returning to jail. MOCJ expanded its
16 reentry programming to improve transition and release
17 planning services. The city invested \$20 million in
18 its new programming. It builds upon the successes of
19 the jails to jobs reentry services program that was
20 launched in 2018. During their incarceration in jail
21 or prison, individuals are allowed to work with
22 transition coordinators to create discharge plans for
23 when they are released, as well as working with
24 reentry mentors, who help facilitate their reentry
25 process on an individualized basis.

2 The reentry mentors developed relationships with
3 released individuals to encourage participation in
4 relevant services and programmings. The supports
5 provided by this team of service providers include
6 assistance in locating temporary or permanent stable
7 housing, mental health care, substance use treatment,
8 counseling, pay transitional employments, job
9 training, career certifications, and educational
10 assistance among other services, depending on the
11 specific needs of each returning individual. MOCJ is
12 also contracting with Unite NYC, a web based referral
13 management platform and service directory that
14 streamlines service referrals among providers to
15 ensure that individuals are quickly connected with
16 the right services to meet their individual needs.

17 We anticipate that the case planning and
18 coordination combined with expanded service offerings
19 and stronger relationships will help to ease the path
20 to a stable life outside of the New York City
21 Department of Correction, and outside of the New York
22 State Department of Corrections custody, reducing the
23 likelihood of return to jail and prison.

24 Additionally, in order to maximize safety during
25 the public health emergency, MOCJ worked with agency

2 and nonprofit partners to stand up an entirely new
3 set of services in under-enrolled hotels in New York
4 City.

5 Beginning in late March 2020, MOCJ worked with
6 New York City's Office of Emergency Management and
7 nonprofit partners Exodus and Housing Works to
8 provide emergency reentry housing to clients leaving
9 jail and prison, and those services provided medical
10 and wraparound services to individuals in emergency
11 reentry hotels. These hotels have been vital to
12 maintaining safety as we transition out of the
13 pandemic, and we are incredibly proud of the work
14 done by MOCJ staff and our providers to ensure that
15 those leaving custody had a safe secure place to go
16 with necessary services. MOCJ continues to work with
17 the Department of Correction and DDC and other city
18 partners to close Rikers, and to implement the Fairer
19 Smaller Jails Plan across four boroughs. The updated
20 completion date on full implementation is August
21 2027. As demolition of current jails moves forward,
22 MOCJ and city agency partners met regularly with
23 council members and local communities to help
24 maintain communication channels among all
25 stakeholders.

2 I hope you see that we are committed to building
3 stronger neighborhoods and improving public safety.
4 Research has shown that strong neighborhoods are
5 essential components of sustained improved public
6 safety. Our Office of Neighborhood Safety and its
7 public health approach to public safety were codified
8 by this body last year, and thank you. ONS, as we
9 call it is comprised of the Mayor's Action Plan (MAP)
10 and the Office to Prevent Gun Violence (OPGV) and
11 Atlas. These offices leveraged city investments to
12 supporting communities by helping residents co-
13 produce lasting public safety. The MAP program was
14 launched in 2014 and currently operates in 15 NYCHA
15 Developments city wide that had historically
16 experienced high rates of crime. Over seven years,
17 the MAP program has proven to be an effective driver
18 of change in communities. MAP enlists residents,
19 city agencies, and community based partners to help
20 address the factors underlying safety. Through its
21 neighborhood staff, MAP harnesses the collective
22 expertise of the residents, the government, and
23 community partners to drive change in both the
24 neighborhood and the administrative levels. MAP's
25 work help to develop the strong community

2 infrastructure that allowed the Neighborhood Stat
3 Remote Model to successfully respond to the
4 challenges of the pandemic.

5 In addition to the investments in building strong
6 neighborhoods, lasting public safety also requires
7 investing in non-enforcement methods of interrupting
8 cycles of violence. OPGV, the Office to Prevent Gun
9 Violence, employs a multi-pronged approach to improve
10 public safety by interrupting the cycles that lead to
11 gun violence. OPGV was launched in 2017, and works
12 to address gun violence through a shift in social
13 norms and the work of community members in mediating
14 disputes to prevent shootings. The core components
15 of OPGV's work is through Crisis Management System or
16 CMS, which deploys teams of credible messengers,
17 community members whose backgrounds allow them to
18 connect with and motivate at-risk individuals. Those
19 messengers direct individuals to 31 sites where they
20 mediate conflicts that have occurred on the streets
21 and they provide New Yorkers with services that can
22 create peace and supportive healing. These include a
23 year-round employment program, mental health
24 services, trauma counseling, and other opportunity-
25 centered resources.

2 Our Atlas program is one of the newer volunteer
3 programs that strives to connect court-involved
4 individuals to employment, social and therapeutic
5 services. The program ensures that credible trusted
6 outreach staff from affected communities are
7 responsible for program recruitment and provision.
8 Service providers are local, community-based
9 organizations who have the relationships and specific
10 knowledge to effectively recruit and engage program
11 participants.

12 As I conclude my testimony here, I would like to
13 reiterate that what I hope you take from our
14 testimony... from my testimony and the answers to
15 your questions, is our commitment to public safety,
16 and our understanding that public safety is
17 fundamentally a co-production with citizens. New
18 Yorkers are the most important factor in maintaining
19 and improving our city's public safety. While we are
20 still striving towards a safer, fairer criminal
21 justice system, we believe that the investments made
22 will continue to help our city stay safe, help New
23 Yorkers to create healthy, thriving communities. We
24 are thankful for the opportunity to present this
25 testimony on MOCJ's work. And Mayor Adams continued

2 commitment to supporting that work. We are happy to
3 answer any questions that you may have. Thank you.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Director Logan.
5 Oh, sorry about that. Hold on one second.

6 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Oh, no, we lost you cheer
7 Brannan. We lost you.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: You got me now?

9 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Gotcha now. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sorry about that. We just
11 had an internet issue. But I think we're back up and
12 running. So I appreciate your testimony. Before we
13 begin, like all committees, we may not get to all the
14 questions that our... our members may have, or you
15 might not have responses, but we don't anticipate
16 that. But we will send up a follow up... we'll send
17 a follow up letter for any questions that are
18 unanswered today.

19 So getting right into it with contract delays, I
20 know MOCJ oversees an expansive array of contracted
21 services. As the administration has sought to expand
22 many of these programs, the council has consistently
23 heard about the challenging contracting delays.
24 During a March 30 oversight hearing on the blueprint
25 to end gun violence, MOCJ, testified that it was

2 working with other city agencies, the Comptroller's
3 Office and the Mayor's Office of Contract Services.
4 To expedite the procurement process for CMS system, a
5 CMS providers. Can you give the committee an update
6 on the specific steps that MOCJ has taken to address
7 procurement delays to expedite these... these
8 important contracts?

9 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So what we did was we worked
10 with our partners as we explained at MOCS, and with
11 the comptroller's office, I personally have had
12 conversations with the comptroller's office. We give
13 them overview ahead of the contracts coming to them,
14 so that they understand and they have a better
15 grounding. That gives them the foundation that they
16 need to do a much more expedited review, and when we
17 highlight the con... the contracts for the services
18 that are critical to New York, they have committed to
19 taking that information, reviewing, and moving much
20 quicker on their review. Additionally, MOCS has been
21 an excellent partner, and they work with our
22 procurement team to have bi-weekly meetings. So
23 Tuesday mornings and Thursday mornings at 9:30, we
24 have a list of prioritized contracts that are
25 reviewed, any of the particular questions that need

2 to be answered, documents that need to be prioritized
3 for provision in order to move the contract through
4 the system is highlighted, and then brought to bear
5 with that with all of the stakeholders at the table
6 so they can be reviewed and move through in a much
7 more expeditious fashion.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. As a former chair of
9 the contracts committee, I certainly know that
10 procurement reform is not the most exciting topic...

11 DIRECTOR LOGAN: It is for us.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, critically important,
13 especially for the critical work that MOCJ does.

14 So how can the administration expect contractor
15 providers to play a central and expanded role in
16 public safety if they're not... if they're not
17 getting the resources they need?

18 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So Chair Brannan, I... I know
19 that the resources may be slower, but what we are
20 committed to doing is working with our partners. And
21 so there are, in addition to getting contracts
22 registered, other tools that are used in order to
23 make sure that providers have resources. So there
24 are advances on contracts once they are registered.
25 The city's fund also provides loans to entities in

2 order to make sure that resources are available and
3 we are constantly on the phone with providers to get
4 to as quickly as we can the concerns, and remove any
5 of the log jams that are impeding, or may pose a risk
6 to the impeding of them being able to provide the
7 services that we know are critical to New Yorkers.

8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So for the CMS providers,
9 how many of the expanded or amended contracts have
10 been have been registered?

11 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I want to... Nora Daniels who's
12 our CFO has been working with our contract. I'm
13 fairly certain that we expedited, and maybe only one
14 is not actually registered. But Nora, can you
15 correct me if that's incorrect? And/or Ozzy?

16 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: I believe all of the base
17 contracts for CMS providers have been registered.
18 Amendments are still in process. But we can get you
19 where those are for specific providers if you have
20 specific... specific questions about individual
21 providers, but all the base contracts have been
22 registered.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. How... like how many
24 contracts is that?

2 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Approximately 18 contracts... or
3 18 providers. There may be multiple contracts within
4 that because there are other funding sources for
5 them.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. As part of the
7 closure of Rikers Island, The Council and the prior
8 administration negotiated a POA... a Points Of
9 Agreement for \$391 million in investments for
10 criminal justice reform, which included \$254 million
11 in citywide investments, and \$137 million in District
12 invents investments. The council understands that
13 these investments will be funded with a combination
14 of new funding and existing resources. Is this
15 administration still committed to funding these
16 investments within the timeframe outlined in the POA?

17 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Yes, the administration is
18 committed to funding those resources.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Moving along to pay
20 parity for public defenders: During fiscal 2020...
21 During the budget negotiations for FY 2020, the
22 council successfully fought for pay parity across
23 many public sectors including for defense providers
24 whose baseline contracts are managed by MOCJ. Pay
25 parity for indigent defense providers was to be

2 implemented in two phases. Phase one would be
3 retroactive to July 1, 2019 for attorneys with less
4 than five years of experience. Phase two would cover
5 attorneys with a longer tenures.

6 The city's commitment to achieving pay parity has
7 not been fully implemented. So what is the plan to
8 uphold the city's commitment and to amend the
9 contracts and disperse funds to providers as soon as
10 possible?

11 DIRECTOR LOGAN: We are continuing to work with
12 OMB but I'll turn it to our Chief Financial Officer
13 who has been more in the details with OMB on this
14 particular plan.

15 CFO CRUZ: Good afternoon, Chairman. And yes, as
16 Director Logan noted, our... we've been in continuous
17 dialogue with OMB and the partners on implementing
18 future steps. It's... it's something that we, again,
19 remain committed to and support. We continue to work
20 with OMB and the partners on... on, on what that
21 implementation might look like.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, so since the original
23 commitment to fund pay parity for legal service
24 providers, city attorneys in the law department
25 received a 3% Pay adjustment, which only furthered

2 the disparity between contracted providers and city
3 attorneys. So will this administration commit to
4 fully funding and implementing pay parity that
5 includes this 3% increase?

6 CFO CRUZ: I want to say it's precisely that type
7 of nuance that... that warrants to further dialogue
8 with OMB and the partners. I don't have a direct
9 answer to that. But back to you.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Well, how are those
11 conversations going?

12 CFO CRUZ: They've been consistent. I know OMB
13 is... again, is studying the matter closely. And
14 meeting with providers, which again, is something
15 that's relatively unprecedented, which is a good
16 sign, again, of progress, and I guess that there's an
17 ear, they're listening and they understand the
18 predicament. The issue.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. There's something
20 that's very important to The Council. So we're very
21 invested in making sure that happens. Are attorneys
22 working on council discretionary funded contracts
23 excluded?

24 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I'm sorry, I don't know that I
25 understand the question, when you say, "Are attorneys

2 working on counsel discretionary contracts?" What
3 are we referring to?

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Are attorneys work... who
5 are working on contracts that were funded by counsel
6 discretionary money. Are they... are they excluded?

7 CFO CRUZ: Excuse me, I'm sorry. I am... Yeah, I
8 can take this. I don't believe they would be. I
9 mean, I think we're talking about parity across a
10 practice or across... across an organization it would
11 be it would be difficult to differentiate
12 specifically the attorneys that the council funds
13 versus the ones that don't. I'd argue it would
14 further the disparity. So I think what we're doing
15 is looking... at what we're doing in partnership with
16 OMB and the partners is looking at... at the matter
17 holistically.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, during the March 30
19 oversight hearing on the blueprint... the blueprint
20 to end gun violence, I asked about the total cost of
21 the initiatives outlined by the administration and
22 whether or not they were fully funded. I also asked
23 about unfunded mandates included in the
24 administration's plan. So does the executive budget

2 now include any new funding for initiatives outlined
3 in the mayor's blueprint? And if so, what are they?

4 Who wants to take that?

5 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So, in terms of the mayor's
6 blueprint, we have been working to make sure that we
7 have the resources for the employment opportunities
8 that we are responsible for. Our crisis management
9 system operators are also resourced to continue going
10 through FY 23. We have an RFP that was issued to
11 ensure that we have net expansion of CMS services.
12 So as we are moving forward, we believe that we are
13 resourced for... to meet the objectives of the
14 mayor's blueprint.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, how much of MOCJ's FY
16 23 executive budget is funding initiatives outlined
17 in the mayor's blueprint?

18 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Um, I don't know that we have a
19 full breakdown of what specifically we... are funding
20 breakdown is done by programmatic areas. So in terms
21 of the programmatic areas that support the blueprint,
22 our Office for Neighborhood Safety, our Strategic
23 Operations Unit, which handles the precision hiring,
24 that supports areas within Queens and Brooklyn and
25 Bronx are funded. All of the programmatic areas that

2 would be supporting components of the blueprint...
3 because the blueprint is a conglomeration of work
4 across city agencies, collectively, to address the
5 various components and... and as the mayor likes to
6 say, the rivers that lead into gun violence.

7 So for the areas where we support and all of the
8 upstream work that the mayor has pointed to in the
9 blueprint that we are responsible for, we believe
10 that we are appropriately resourced to move forward.

11 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Are there any unfunded or
12 underfunded components of the mayor's blueprint that
13 MOCJ is concerned about?

14 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I don't believe at this time
15 that we have any, but we will go back and review and
16 obviously we will work with OMB, we will work with
17 The Council, if there seems to be an area where we...
18 we are falling short.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, and MOCJ, you're...
20 MOCJ is confident that you currently have the
21 capacity to support the mayor's blueprint?

22 DIRECTOR LOGAN: We definitely have the capacity
23 to support the mayor's blueprint. We would love to
24 have additional work on the procurement side, as you
25 have pointed out, because that is a... not the part

2 that everybody wants to talk about, but would be the
3 area that would be strengthened and allow us to much
4 more be much more nimble in our ability to get and
5 move our procurements through to our partners.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: So you would say the
7 biggest challenge right now for MOCJ is really the
8 procurement challenges, the contracting challenges?

9 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I think that is our biggest
10 challenge, but it is consistent with our partners
11 across the city, and we've heard.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Absolutely. Okay,
13 Director, I appreciated the CFO's... and everyone who
14 helped out I appreciate it. I'm going to turn it
15 over now to Chair Hanks.

16 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Hi, good afternoon.

17 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Hi, good afternoon.

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: It's so good to see you
19 again. Thank you so much for your excellent
20 testimony. As... as you know, you know, furthering
21 our conversations that MOCJ plays an essential role
22 in shaping our criminal justice and public safety
23 initiatives in New York City.

2 So my first line of questions is... I want to
3 thank Chair Brannan for his... his great questions as
4 well. I apologize.

5 The state of the state changes to bail laws. We
6 need to assess MOCJ's budget with regard to potential
7 changes to state bail laws. Has MOCJ analyzed the
8 impact of the change in state bail laws on its
9 criminal justice programming?

10 DIRECTOR LOGAN: We are in the process of doing
11 that analysis and finishing to see... and finishing
12 that analysis to see how that impacts our ability to
13 coordinate with the stakeholders, and where we will
14 have to provide additional supports, as well as how
15 we can expand and/or strengthen the pretrial services
16 that we provide to the courts.

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: I guess you'll get back to us
18 on that when we have a better idea.

19 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Absolutely.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. Does MOCJ believe
21 that these state changes will impact providers'
22 caseloads, capacity, or programming?

23 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I think it's very hard to tell
24 whether the changes themselves will impact the
25 capacity and providers. Right now, we know that

2 cases have been staying in the system longer. So
3 the... our partners are seeing higher caseloads
4 because people are not necessarily having their cases
5 finished in the timeframe that you would have seen
6 pre-pandemic. And so we are working with...

7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: What would you attribute that
8 to?

9 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I would attribute it to the fact
10 that we had a significant pause and just being able
11 to address cases. We were operating for quite as an
12 extended period of time with just essential caseload.

13 As we have seen OCA's commitment to providing
14 resources... we're seeing the system moving a lot
15 faster. We are also seeing very good movement from
16 our partners in the state as it is for individuals
17 that had been staying in the system and not
18 transitioning to state facilities, as we should. So
19 we are heartened by the movement that we're seeing
20 now that the pandemic has, has pivoted in such a way
21 that we can now have much more robust in person
22 operation and that the system is addressing the
23 cases.

24 I was really heartened to see that we had eight
25 trials operating in the Bronx in the last couple of

2 weeks. So we are very optimistic that continuing
3 coordination movement highlighting the cases that
4 have been in... incarcerated for extended periods of
5 times, and all of the stakeholders commitments to
6 addressing those will start to alleviate the backlog
7 that we've seen.

8 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Very good. Thank you for
9 that.

10 Does the executive budget include additional
11 resources in response to the change in the bail laws?

12 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I don't know that it's specific
13 to the change... the current change in the bail laws,
14 but there are definitely supports for the
15 administrative and... the administrative resources
16 and the personnel resources that were needed to
17 address the discovery concerns by stakeholders as
18 well as the personnel resources needed to take in,
19 review, and process that discovery.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So thank you very much. I'm
21 going to move along to staffing.

22 The executive budget increases the office
23 headcount to 87 positions. Does this headcount in the
24 executive budget reflect the actual needs of the

2 office and or are there any additional positions that
3 may be required?

4 DIRECTOR LOGAN: We are going back and reviewing.
5 We've been in... I think, as many of the agencies
6 with attrition and transition of staff. So where we
7 are now is a place of assessing just what areas need
8 strengthening, what areas are operating in the way
9 that they need to operate, and then we will be able
10 to answer that much more fully as to where we need to
11 be going forward.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Do you have a timeline on
13 when you'll be able to let us know?

14 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Hopefully, we should have a
15 better assessment by the beginning of June so that we
16 know where we stand and... and are...

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, we're looking forward
18 to knowing that.

19 How many of these new positions will be dedicated
20 to managing MOCJ's criminal justice and indigent,
21 indigent defense contracts?

22 DIRECTOR LOGAN: We add we have approximately
23 three positions that we are looking to staff that
24 will be dedicated to the indigent defense portfolio

2 and includes a grant manager, another attorney, and
3 another administrative position.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Yeah.

5 Talk a little bit about central staff and if you
6 have sufficient resources to administer and monitor
7 its significant contract portfolio.

8 DIRECTOR LOGAN: As... as I said, to Chair
9 Brannan, our portfolio is... that... that is one of
10 the areas where we could always use some
11 strengthening. We have a very dedicated crew of
12 fiscal and contracting professionals. However
13 they're... that area could use additional hands,
14 analysts to move that contracting... discretionary
15 contracts also come through MOCJ which is not
16 necessarily the area that is... that people think of
17 when they think of MOC day. They think of the... the
18 contracts that we hold that we move. We still do
19 have to make sure that the funding that comes from
20 the City Council, as well as additional state funds
21 that flow through MOCJ to providers move. And so we
22 would always welcome the ability to expand that area.

23 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Definitely. Yeah, I agree
24 with that.

2 So I'm going to move over to the Crisis
3 Management System expansion. A lot of these... some
4 of these questions have been answered, but does the
5 executive plan include any additional funding for
6 expanding the CMS crisis management system for the
7 record?

8 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So it's committed to finishing
9 the expansion that we started, and making sure that
10 we are moving into providing services in the said
11 areas, the precincts that were identified before, the
12 70, so that we are... we can go forward. We also are
13 making sure that we have the... the Gowanus houses
14 added in there. So we are... we are poised to
15 provide services in the areas that needed expansion.
16 We're always open to, as you know, Chair Hanks,
17 having the conversations and working with the
18 stakeholders, because that's how we identify where
19 there are additional needs, right, The Council and
20 our stakeholders...

21 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: We discussed that and having
22 those... that education component is so important.
23 And, you know, this is... whatever is important needs
24 to be funded and... and be managed properly. So I
25 get it.

2 Does the administration plan to increase funding
3 for this program in the Fiscal Year 23, adopted,
4 adopted budget if needed?

5 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Obviously, again, we would be
6 open to looking at and saying where it's needed.
7 So...

8 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, great. So I know you
9 have the precinct-by-precinct breakdown. I was told
10 that you received that. Would MOCJ commit to sharing
11 the precinct-by-precinct data on a regular basis?
12 Sharing the data with us?

13 DIRECTOR LOGAN: We absolutely will work with the
14 council to give you the information that... that will
15 most help be helpful to The Council in order to
16 understand work that we're doing.

17 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, so as Madam Speaker has
18 has alluded to... to the youth program funding and
19 the importance of the prevention and the intervention
20 programs.

21 Can you give an overview of MOCJ's total budget
22 for youth programs? Which programs are currently in
23 place? And what are they budgeted for?

24 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I would give our Chief of Staff
25 a chance to go... to kind of go through that since

2 she has been instrumental in working with our
3 programmatic teams of getting that breakdown.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Laura. Hi.

5 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: Hi. Hi. I'm sorry, you
6 indicated... you said the youth programs?

7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Yeah, just to give us an
8 overview of MOCJ's , total budget for youth programs
9 and which programs are currently in place and what
10 are they budgeted for.

11 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: So we'd have to give you
12 that breakdown. We can provide that breakdown for
13 you. We have quite a few youth-focused programs,
14 including SYP MAP programming. Some of our ATI
15 programs are also geared towards youth. And, you
16 know, primarily it's through ONS, through school
17 conflict mediation, as well as, the SYP and Vibe, and
18 other programs to help with it in MAP, so we can get
19 that break down to you.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. And is there any
21 additional youth programs that are going to be added?

22 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: We are consistently
23 looking at programs that we might be able to
24 incorporate into our programming. You know, really
25 depends on what the needs that we're seeing, and the

2 conversations that we're having with stakeholders and
3 with providers.

4 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much. I'll
5 look forward to getting that information on all the
6 things that we discussed.

7 So the last piece and then I'll pass it over to
8 my colleagues is the Jail To Jobs Workforce
9 Development Initiatives. The Jail To Jobs: It was
10 launched in 2018. It provides individuals leaving
11 city jails with one-on-one peer mentors, workforce
12 training, educational subsidies, and short term
13 transitional employment. The program also requires
14 all workforce providers to be trained in issues and
15 laws relating working with people with criminal
16 records. The fiscal 2022 adopted budget included
17 \$6.6 million in fiscal 2022 for the Jails To Jobs
18 Program. What is MOCJ's total budget for workforce
19 development initiatives in fiscal year 2022, and
20 fiscal year 2023?

21 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: Again, our workforce
22 development initiatives are sort of spread across a
23 number of different programs.

24 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: They're embedded in some of
25 the youth programs? There's nothing standalone?

2 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: (inaudible) programs. So
3 there's Jail to Jobs, and then a lot of our other
4 programs also include a workforce development
5 component. So there's also the Precision Employment
6 Initiative as well as employment within the ONS
7 portfolio, which is OPGV. We've got anti-violence,
8 anti-gun violence employment, and then there's also
9 SYP and youth employment within MAP.

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, great. And so do you...
11 Does the executive budget include any additional
12 resources for workforce development? And if not,
13 why?

14 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: There are additional
15 resources that the mayor committed to additional FYP
16 resources? And so we do have additional funds related
17 to that. There's also... there... that's the primary
18 increase in workforce development within the budget.

19 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, great. I look forward
20 to getting all of that detailed information. I think
21 it'll be extremely helpful to us. And I... that
22 concludes my line of questioning and I'll hand it
23 back over to Central Staff. Thank you very much.

24 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you Nora.

2 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: Thank you.

3 SERGEANT LUGO: Malcom. You're just on mute.

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN You'd think I'd know by now.

5 All right. Let's try that again. Thank you,
6 everybody, and welcome. Council members. Let's
7 remember five minutes topsip please listen for the
8 sergeant. We are behind schedule the order of
9 questions Councilmembers Schulman, Barron, Hudson,
10 Cabán, Louis, Rivera, Stevens, and Brewer. We've
11 also been joined by Councilmembers Carr, De La Rosa,
12 Farias, Abreu, and Gutierrez. We will turn to
13 Councilmember Schulman

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 COUNCILMEMBER SCHULMAN: Hi. Good afternoon.

16 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Good afternoon.

17 COUNCILMEMBER SCHULMAN: I want to thank the
18 Chairs, Chair Brannon, and Chair Hanks, for their...
19 for holding this hearing and for their great line of
20 questioning. And I also want to thank everybody here
21 from MOCJ. So I'm going to be very brief, which I'm
22 sure everybody is happy about. I want to ask you
23 about... Ms. Logan, I want to ask you about the
24 Assigned Council Plan, particularly 18B.

2 So my understanding is that 18B lawyers...
3 there's a shortage of them, because a lot of them
4 have been leaving because of pay issues and other
5 things, that there's been a decline in attorney for
6 children's programs of 30% since 2018. I'd like to
7 know, if you have with... with, especially with raise
8 the age more cases of going to family court, as you
9 know, 18B is for children learning from litigants.
10 Do you have enough personnel in the 18B program and
11 resources to handle these cases?

12 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So the assigned counsel plan is
13 housed within the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice.
14 However, the funding for the actual salaries for the
15 18B attorneys on the panel is a state concern, and
16 right now that is being negotiated with the state.
17 Our office is working very closely with court counsel
18 and with the state to support getting adequate
19 funding to the assigned counsel plan so that we can
20 make sure that the resources... the attorney
21 resources are available to the different areas within
22 the court system that they... that they support, and
23 they represent clients.

2 COUNCILMEMBER SCHULMAN: I'm very glad to hear
3 that. Um, how many 18B lawyers are there now? And
4 are there enough of them to handle the caseload?

5 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I'd have to go back and give you
6 the... the breakdown. I know that working with OCA
7 and with the other indigent providers, we are trying
8 to make sure that clients are not left without
9 representation, and so we would have to give you a
10 specific breakdown by different area in terms of how
11 many attorney 18B attorneys there are covering each
12 region.

13 COUNCILMEMBER SCHULMAN: And I appreciate that,
14 because what we don't want delays and a lack of
15 quality of legal representation for these very
16 deserving and needing clients. So thank you very
17 much. That was the question that I had.

18 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you.

19 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember.
20 Next we'll turn to Councilmember Barron.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: He usually has his video off
23 so we may just have to wait. I will circle back to
24 him. We will turn to Councilmember Hudson.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

3 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Thank you so much. Hello,
4 Director and hello again Chairs. I wanted to ask
5 about the crisis management system and the budget...
6 what the budget is for FY 23 compared to FY 22, and
7 how many individuals and communities these programs
8 are serving?

9 DIRECTOR LOGAN: As it relates to the budget,
10 I'll let our CFO give you the breakdown for FY 22 and
11 FY 23.

12 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Thank you.

13 CFO CRUZ: So the budget remains relatively
14 constant. For FY 22 and 23, we're talking about \$138
15 million crisis management systems budget from year to
16 year.

17 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Okay, so \$130 in both
18 years?

19 CFO CRUZ: Correct.

20 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Okay. And then what's the
21 process, in the event of an emergency, you know,
22 contract? What's the process for allocating the
23 funds? Or at least that's how that's how they've
24 been presented to me, as like an emergency contract.
25 Maybe that's not the proper terminology.

2 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Yeah. So, I think the issue has
3 been that in the, during the health crisis, we had to
4 expand and stand up programming very quickly. So
5 those were emergency contracts. As we have come out
6 of this health crisis, we are we are going through
7 a... the procurement process, right? The rules under
8 procurement are no longer suspended like they were in
9 2020 for the pandemic. And so we are moving through
10 the current formal procurement process.

11 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Okay, and then I guess
12 just one quick follow up question is, with new
13 organizations coming on board, you know, people who
14 have been doing this work for a while and then maybe
15 gained some expertise and then want to go out... out
16 on their own and create their own, you know,
17 organization: What is the... can you just talk
18 about, like the... the barriers to entry for that
19 process and what folks might face in terms of, you
20 know, red tape? Hoops they have to jump through,
21 like, what's the actual process for getting online
22 and bringing a new organization onto line in order to
23 get contract funding?

24 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So any new organization is going
25 to go through the request for proposal process, that

2 are not currently contracted with the city. That
3 request for proposal process is a fairly robust
4 process, there's a lot of paperwork that needs to be
5 filled out, the insurance, workers compensation, all
6 of the documentation that shows that they have the
7 back office supports that would make them eligible
8 for contracting with the city. And those are areas
9 where we know have historically been a challenge for
10 smaller grassroots organizations. One of the ways
11 that we have been able to try and create a more level
12 playing field for those smaller organizations is to
13 use a prime organization who would be... would be
14 able to provide some of that infrastructure for the
15 smaller organizations to remove some of those
16 barriers to access.

17 COUNCILMEMBER HUDSON: Great, thank you so much.

18 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you Councilmember
19 Hudson. I'm still not seeing Councilmember Barron.
20 We're going to turn to Councilmember Cabán.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Councilmember Cabán, are you
23 there?

24 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Yes, sorry. Great. Thank
25 you. Good afternoon, y'all.

2 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Good afternoon.

3 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: My question has to do with
4 it... I mean, a little bit about last year's... last
5 fiscal year. There was that that \$2-plus million that
6 came out of the Points Of Agreement that chair
7 Brannan had mentioned in his questioning. And so I
8 just... I'm wondering if I can get a detailed
9 breakdown of that \$2-plus million in funding that was
10 earmarked for last fiscal year for restorative
11 justice programming through MOCJ, and like, what's
12 happening with it? Because I just there doesn't seem
13 to be clarity on whether it actually was dispersed
14 and used. And then how does that tie into this next
15 fiscal year? Any money that hasn't been used where it
16 is? And then is it being combined it combined with,
17 you know, what the points of agreement layout in
18 terms of the disbursements for this fiscal year?

19 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Yeah, so Councilmember Cabán, I
20 think that the best way to do that, because it is a
21 fairly involved spreadsheet is to send that... that
22 breakdown that we've committed to spending on the
23 Points Of Agreement, and we'll make sure that we
24 highlight for you the specifics on the restorative
25 justice funding and how that is going, how that...

2 that commitment was met, and how it's going to be got
3 met moving forward.

4 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Okay, so the understanding
5 that it has been met, and that that \$2-plus million
6 has been used and dispersed...

7 DIRECTOR LOGAN: I... I think that we have to...
8 I have to go back and look specifically, unless our
9 CFO or Nora knows specifically where the restorative
10 justice monies were spent and which agency or which
11 entity started working with that... those funds but
12 that I would have to go back and look for you.

13 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: I can provide a little
14 bit of insight on it. So the... the funds have not
15 been dispersed yet. So there was an advisory
16 committee that developed some recommendations for the
17 restorative justice programming. And so we're
18 currently taking those recommendations and looking
19 into how to implement them. But we will keep you
20 updated on how the funds are eventually dispersed.

21 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Well, I have a follow up
22 question on that. Because I mean, it's... if it was
23 earmarked for the whole fiscal year. And I think if
24 I'm hearing correctly, none of it has been dispersed.
25 I'm familiar with the advisory committee. I know

2 even just from like the outside looking in there
3 been. They... they've even put out some public
4 communications about sort of like, how the funds
5 should be used and where they want them to go and
6 things like that. So like, what's... what's the
7 holdup? Because it seems like it is something beyond
8 just... we need them to tell us where to put the
9 money, because I do get the sense that they have a
10 pretty good idea of where and how they want the money
11 used. Like what are... what are the other barriers?
12 What has kept this from happening? Because I just...
13 I find it hard to believe it is just a matter of
14 like, being told where it should go.

15 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: So it's my understanding
16 that we're in the process of selecting a prime
17 vendor. But I will go back to our... our team to
18 find out a little bit more about it and get back to
19 you on it.

20 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: But why has it taken so
21 long? I'm guessing I also heard that there was a
22 vendor identified and... and suggested by the
23 advisory board. I think it was a church organization
24 or something like that. But yeah, I guess my... my
25 overarching question here is like, why has it taken

2 this long? Is it the capacity? Is it staffing? Is
3 it something else? Like what or where? Where does
4 the issues lie?

5 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: I think we were just
6 going through the process. But I can find out for
7 you if there's been any sort of specific delays if
8 there was something specifically that delayed it.
9 I'm not familiar with a specific delay related to it.
10 But I can find out for you and let you know.

11 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Yeah, I would love to find
12 out. I think to have, uh, you know, several million
13 dollars earmarked for an entire fiscal year and then
14 to see not a single cent of it dispersed and used,
15 when it's really important programming, right?,
16 that's going to keep us safer and healthier. Is
17 like... is deeply concerning. So I do look forward
18 to getting that information. Thank you.

19 CFO CRUZ: Well, what I'll add just very quickly
20 to Nora's statements, Councilmember Cabán, is that we
21 are baselined for this funding. So it's good... it's
22 good that it is in the in the budget in the in the
23 out years, and it and it grows from year to year.
24 So... so as we ramp up and as we get going, we will
25 have the ability to sustain and this programming.

2 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Great, thank you. I yield
3 the rest of my time. Thanks.

4 COUNCILMEMBER: Thank you, Councilmember. Next
5 we'll turn to Councilmember Louis followed by
6 Councilmember Rivera.

7 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

8 COUNCILMEMBER LOUIS: Thank you so much, Chairs
9 Brannan and Hanks, for the hearing. I'm happy to
10 hear from Deanna and Nora. I'm going to add some
11 quick questions. Can we get an update on the FY 23
12 RFP process for new MOCJ Cure Violence contracts?
13 Also, according to MOCJ's executive plan for the \$1.2
14 million, that one \$1.2 million will be included for
15 the expansion of the Office of Abusive Partner
16 Intervention Program also known as APIP. The current
17 MOCJ APIP is a 26-week fee-based program for
18 individuals who are mandated to participate by the
19 courts. I wanted to know if you both can explain how
20 its curricula and model have impacted these
21 individuals?

22 And the last questions on Family Justice centers.
23 We know that they... they're very important for New
24 York City and serve multiple folks. I wanted to know
25 if MOCJs fiscal 23 plan proposed... proposal for an

2 additional \$1.13 million in city and state funding.
3 I wanted to know how that will be utilized. Thank
4 you.

5 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So that's multiple questions and
6 I am hoping that I have them all. And please,
7 Councilmember if I if I miss one, bring us back to
8 the one that we missed. I'll start with our... the
9 APIP program. The APIP program is the... there are
10 fees, but the fees are not passed on to the
11 participants. It is fee free. And I know that we...
12 we were very strong advocates of making sure that it
13 stayed that way, because the APIP model is not a...
14 has moved away from the more punitive model of
15 dealing with intimate partner violence, which
16 required participants as part of moving through the
17 process to pay for their programming. In this model
18 that punitive... that punitive component is removed
19 and it is focused on the behavioral changes that an
20 individual needs to go through in order to maintain
21 healthy relationships, the APIP model additionally,
22 expanded. So most of the intimate... intimate
23 partner violence focused on male identifying
24 individuals and APIP incorporated curricula that was
25 specific to female identifying individuals as well.

2 And so we... we are seeing that as a much more
3 robust program than our previous iterations of
4 intimate partner violence. We are committed and I
5 will let Ozzie speak to the specific funding for the
6 Family Justice centers. But we do understand that
7 that is a very critical component of making sure that
8 those... those services are there and consistent and
9 being provided. I'll also let Nora go ahead and talk
10 more about our FY 23 RFP process for the CMS
11 programming.

12 CFO CRUZ: Sure, so if I could step in really
13 quick and kind of talk about the Family Justice
14 Center. So what you're seeing in the financial plan
15 with regards to that as a technical adjustment. In
16 prior financial plans, we had transferred to HRA
17 funding and contracts for the family legal components
18 of the... of the Family Justice Center. My
19 understanding is that they're in the process of
20 completing an RFP and have asked us to continue the
21 work on our end for one more year. And so what
22 you're seeing in the in the plan is the money
23 effectively coming back to us for us to extend these
24 contracts for one more year.

2 I will note, there's a small technical adjustment
3 that will be required in the future being that
4 initially, we thought we were only going to be
5 amending for six months, but we're going to be doing
6 it for a complete year. So you should expect to see
7 an equal adjustment in a subsequent financial plan
8 making this one full year.

9 COUNCILMEMBER LOUIS: So the change is just for
10 the technical component, it's not for outreach
11 services, programs, or anything of that sort.

12 CFO CRUZ: Correct. Everything stays as is we're
13 just doing the procurement for one more year.

14 COUNCILMEMBER LOUIS: Okay. Thank you, Mr.
15 Cruz. And if I could get an update regarding the FY
16 23 RFP process for the Cure Violence contracts.
17 Thank you.

18 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: All right, Councilmember
19 Lewis, good to see. So due to our -- as you know, we
20 have been in the process, and you've been very
21 helpful with that process in terms of providing
22 feedback, et cetera -- our... due to... we had a very
23 overwhelming response to the RFP. And in addition to
24 that we are looking to, and we did, institute an
25 evaluation process that was very community-focused

2 and involved a lot of stakeholders from the
3 community. And as a result of those two components,
4 we are a bit delayed on the RFP. And so we're
5 anticipating issuing and designating the awards in FY
6 24. And we are working with our providers and also
7 the organization Block Power in order to maintain
8 continuity of services for the next year.

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

10 COUNCILMEMBER LOUIS: Thank you so much to the
11 panel. Thank you chairs. I'll yield back to you.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you Councilmember Louis.
13 Next we'll turn to Councilmember Rivera.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Thank you very much. I
16 just want to make sure can you can hear me. Okay.

17 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Yes, ma'am.

18 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Great. All right. Thank
19 you to the chairs. Thank you, of course, the
20 administration as Chair of the Committee on Criminal
21 Justice, I deeply appreciate MOCJ's efforts to
22 support people involved with the criminal legal
23 system as well as expanding programs with evidence
24 based practices, and developing innovative services

2 that build deep ties with the communities across the
3 city.

4 So how does MOCJ measure programming success and
5 metrics in particular? Do you know how many people
6 are accessing these programs in detention and
7 continuing on these service programs once they leave?

8 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So I know that we have seen our
9 expansion in getting the planning phase done while
10 people are incarcerated, and that they have continued
11 to jails to jobs, as well as accessing housing. Our
12 reentry hotels had over 800 individuals that are
13 housed in them, receiving services during the...
14 currently and during the height of the pandemic. I'd
15 give Nora an opportunity to go through and see if we
16 have a specific number as to the full continuity of
17 individuals who start program either in DOC or in
18 state docs. And where are they where they are once
19 they have come back out and they are in more
20 permanent housing as well as accessing services.

21 CHIEF OF STAFF DANIEL: Hi. Hi, Councilmember
22 Rivera. The... we will have to get you the full
23 number of folks who have accessed services through
24 COC, and then through our reentry providers on the
25 outside. But we are... we do know that through our

2 hotels program, about 1600 people have been served
3 there over the past year. And so, you know, we know
4 that those folks have gone through the program and
5 are accessing the services that we provide there,
6 which does include the Jails to Job Program, so I
7 will get that... get that those numbers for you.

8 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: All right, I would
9 appreciate that.

10 So a question on Family Justice Centers. We know
11 that they can be powerful resources for survivors of
12 domestic and gender based violence. So I'm glad to
13 see an increase in support for these centers. So
14 what language capabilities do Family Justice Centers
15 have? And how do you plan to provide culturally
16 appropriate services? And I've heard from service
17 partners that work in the Family Justice Centers
18 often provide critical language services, but they're
19 actually not funded to do that. So their capacity is
20 strained. Do you plan to extend contracts to these
21 partners?

22 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So when you say that there... I
23 just want to be clear, when you say there are
24 partners who are providing languages, we as a city
25 make sure that we are providing translated materials

2 as well as information in like 15 language, the 15
3 major languages that we see across the city.

4 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: But... but they're... as
5 you know, as you know, we're very, very diverse.

6 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Extremely.

7 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: So this was actually a
8 question that came out of an AAPI roundtable with the
9 number of service providers who say that sometimes,
10 maybe those dialects or those languages that aren't
11 covered, they actually have to provide services, and
12 they don't receive funding to do so. So I guess, you
13 know, to consider extending funding to those service
14 providers -- and we're happy to get you a number of
15 them that exists within the centers, though, I'm sure
16 you've had those... those names of those nonprofits
17 yourself -- but also, I guess, what language
18 capabilities does the Family Justice Center have? And
19 how do you plan to provide culturally appropriate and
20 humble services ongoing, and understanding kind of
21 the sensitive environment that we're in right now,
22 especially with some of the Violence Against
23 communities like the AAPI community?

24 DIRECTOR LOGAN: And so on that front, we have
25 been working very closely. Our... our office to

2 prevent hate crimes has significantly stood up more
3 roundtable discussions and community events in order
4 to start to get more information about that. So
5 Councilmember, we really would like to hear where we
6 can strengthen some of the language access and
7 cultural competency of... within the family justice
8 centers, if there is an area or specific center that
9 is servicing a population that is not meeting the
10 complete needs of the population, were absolutely
11 open to having a separate meeting and discussion so
12 that we can work on that. Our coordinating efforts,
13 especially as we've seen the rise in AAIP hate has
14 been to make sure that we are doing that and
15 providing grants to the organizations to be able to
16 fund smaller entities within the communities so that
17 they are... they do have capacity to providing
18 services.

19 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

20 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Very good. Well, thank
21 you very much. I just want to clarify, did you say
22 that MOCJ's funded contract partners work both inside
23 Rikers, and city jails, and outside the community? I
24 just wanted to confirm that?

2 DIRECTOR LOGAN: That is correct. So MOCJ's
3 programming is dealing within DOC and dealing with
4 DOCS to have to do release planning, and then making
5 sure that people are connected to services, once they
6 actually are released and able to get housing jobs
7 and continue on that continuum of reintegrating into
8 society.

9 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Thank you so much for the
10 time, Chairs, and for your answers, and I look
11 forward to communicating both with the numbers and
12 then some of the service providers that I mentioned.
13 Thank you.

14 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you.

15 SERGEANT LUGO: Malcolm, you're just on mute
16 there.

17 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: I'm clearly having problems
18 today. Thank you. Councilmember Stevens? Are you
19 starting time?

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

21 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Yes, I'm here.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: There we go. Hi.

23 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Good afternoon.

24 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Good afternoon. I hope
25 all is well. I just have a couple of quick questions

2 and just thinking about what the expansion of you
3 know, the... the CMS sites and thinking about that...
4 I've... we've been getting a lot of feedback from the
5 groups around victim services, and how it's really
6 hard to access... access to services. And some of
7 the groups are having a lot of issues. Can you talk
8 a little bit about what the process looks like of
9 getting feedback and supporting CMS sites with the
10 work that they're doing across the city?

11 DIRECTOR LOGAN: So our... our Office of
12 Neighborhood Safety has program initiative managers
13 that work closely with our community partners. We
14 also as MOCJ have a very strong relationship with our
15 Office to End Gender Based Violence. And our Office
16 of Crime Victim Support is a coordinating factor
17 amongst the.... with EndGBV, as well as internally
18 with our programming and serves to help connect
19 people to services. Happy to talk about how we can
20 make that more robust. As you know, our office...
21 Office for Crime Victim Services has recently
22 absorbed the Crime Victims Assistance Program. And
23 so we are continuously striving to see how we can
24 strengthen and really make that outreach more robust.

2 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Because... I'm happy to
3 hear that you guys are looking to make it more
4 robust, but there is like a formal system that...
5 that can be tracked. Because I think that it's
6 important that if we have victim services, and then
7 we have CMS sites saying that they're not able to
8 access some of the services, and they're having
9 issues, that we should really definitely be thinking
10 about how to really make sure that those things are
11 happening in conjunction and working well together.

12 I guess my next question, too, is just around...
13 with the expansion, are we... are we getting
14 feedback? Do you guys have a formal process for
15 getting feedback from the CMS sites around the
16 supports that they need before expanding the
17 site's... capacity?

18 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Yeah, so all of the expansions,
19 even though we, you know... the statement was we're
20 expanding. Those expansions happen in conjunction
21 with each one of the CMS sites. So our partners were
22 the ones who helped to shape where and how the
23 programming within their specific catchments were...
24 were going to be expanded. What the... what the
25 personnel resources were, what the offerings needed

2 to be. All of those things were done in conjunction
3 for... by our programmatic teams with our partners in
4 their in their catchment areas. And I don't know,
5 Nora, if you wanted to add anything to that, but that
6 is... that is how we designed where, where and what
7 sorry, expansions should be occurring.

8 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: No, I think you covered
9 it.

10 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Is that all Councilmember
11 Stevens?

12 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: I'm sorry, my phone was
13 muted. You'd think I'd know how to work this. No...
14 but no, thank you. That was, um... that was helpful,
15 but definitely look forward to having some more
16 conversations, because some of the feedback that I've
17 been receiving in some of my other calls, and
18 receiving that there is a disconnect between, like
19 victim services and even like getting feedback from
20 the CMS sites around like how that is actually being
21 rolled out. So definitely, we'd love to talk more.

22 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Absolutely. We are absolutely
23 open to having additional conversations,
24 Councilmember Stevens to talk this through.

25 COUNCILMEMBER STEVENS: Thank you.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember. And
3 next we'll turn to Councilmember Brewer.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BREWERS: Thank you very much. And
5 I really want to thank you for two things. One is
6 during the last year, you helped domestic violence
7 _____. And I can't thank you enough. It may have
8 been before your time, but MOCJ was their savior for
9 helping people in domestic violence in Harlem. And
10 second, we're very excited about the work that you've
11 done with the _____ building and the one that the
12 _____ Society is moving into. And you mentioned
13 that in your testimony. So thank you, huge.

14 My question is more on the terrific work you do
15 when folks are coming out of prison or jail. But I'm
16 trying to get them some support, before they go in
17 and to prevent. And I mentioned that to the
18 commissioner of PD, and she understands that.
19 Midtown Court has some ideas. I know you work with
20 them. But how... we got to... we got to figure this
21 out, because I happen to be supportive of the work
22 that Alan Bragg is doing and others, but they too say
23 that... and the police are the first to tell the that
24 they don't know what to do with the young people whom

2 they do not want to send to Rikers, whom they want to
3 support, but they have no place to send them.

4 And the problem is there really aren't programs.
5 I know you think they are but there are not, because
6 the young person is either in the precinct and there
7 is a program that the Manhattan Midtown Court is
8 trying to figure out, where you'd have these sort of
9 navigators in the precincts. So literally when
10 somebody comes to the precinct, you're there, you
11 follow them if you need to, to the courthouse, and
12 then when they released, which I hope they are, then
13 you are with them when they are released and you take
14 them to Avenues For Justice or whatever the program
15 is. They have to have that kind of support.

16 Is that something that you're thinking about? Or
17 is that just PD? Or who's thinking about this? I
18 know that that's the right way to go. You know what?
19 It's the only way to go. Because they're not going
20 to follow... they're not going home. I had 35 foster
21 kids. Everybody knows they... they act out. You've
22 got to have that contact immediately. So what are
23 we doing? Is that something that MOCJ is thinking
24 about?

2 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Yes, absolutely, Councilmember
3 Brewers. So the... what MOCJ has been working on
4 multi facets, right? We have within our office of
5 neighborhood safety, we fund year round internships
6 for individuals that are identified as at-risk, and
7 they are... they are within the crisis management
8 system. They are getting the mentors. They are
9 learning skills. They're working on their resume. And
10 they're working on themselves as people, right? A
11 lot of our partners -- one that I would point out is
12 Life Camp -- will make sure that kids have the
13 necessary foundation. And we don't call it
14 therapeutic services, but it is therapeutic services,
15 right? It's getting... getting them to work in
16 gardens. Getting them to really start being more
17 introverted and looking at which ways they can move
18 into a different path. So we do fund that one. As
19 well, the Office of neighborhood safety has Safe In
20 The City Grants. So any community member that thinks
21 have a great idea of something to do with young
22 people can apply for those grants, and those grants
23 go up to \$20,000, for a community to really start
24 thinking about what they can do to shape a young
25 person's life.

2 We are absolutely looking to see how we redirect
3 the paths of individuals in coordinating with our
4 NYPD and see DA and defender partners. We are
5 looking at how we really expand our Pretrial Services
6 Suite so that it will encompass having much more peer
7 mentorship involved there. I know that DAs have
8 raised the willingness and want to be able to say
9 that instead of asking for bail that they ask for an
10 individual to be assigned to a peer mentor. And so
11 all of those ideas we are open to working with and
12 bringing to fruition so that we can strengthen as you
13 are pointing out not only the work that we do once
14 people have already been justice involved, but to
15 really cut off the avenue of getting people to become
16 justice involved.

17 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I know Erica does a good
18 job. I love Ramon. I love MAP. I have spent hours
19 and hours and hours at the MAP program in Harlem.
20 But I'm what I'm seeing is working with Midtown
21 Court. That's what it's coming out with. It's great
22 to have... you just have to be right there in the
23 precinct, and you have to be at arraignment. It
24 doesn't work to say, "Hey, Johnny, will you go to the
25 mentorship program?" They do not go. So I'm just

2 trying to say it's got to be right in your face in
3 terms of support. And for whatever reason, because I
4 talk to the cops all day long. They don't know about
5 these programs. I'm just telling you can say up
6 here, they know, okay, all the way up here. But down
7 on the grounds when I... they don't even know what
8 Midtown Court is. And I was with like 30 of them the
9 other day. Okay, that's a fact. So they certainly
10 never heard of MOCJ. Then they don't know it. Okay,
11 and they don't know, Erica. They don't know Ramon.
12 They don't know all these things. So it has to be
13 somebody who's with them, and with the young person
14 at the precinct.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

16 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: All right. I'm trying to
17 make my point. I'm not going to give up, because I
18 know that's the right way to go. And I hope you
19 think about funding something like that. All right.
20 Thank you.

21 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you.

22 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember
23 Brewer. Councilmember Baron?

24 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay, I just wanted to make
3 sure I went back to him. Chairs Brannan and Hanks,
4 we have concluded Councilmember questions for MOCJ.
5 I'm going to turn it back to you two for your closing
6 thoughts.

7 CHAIR HANKS: So thank you so much. I appreciate
8 everyone that came out today for this very important
9 hearing. Thank you to all of MOCJ who testified and
10 we look forward to hearing more information as we
11 discussed and some of the questioning line of
12 questioning that I had. I thank my colleagues for
13 coming out and answering those really powerful
14 questions. And thank you so much, and I will hand it
15 over to Chair Brannan, who will close it off.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Chair Hanks.
17 Yeah, I echo Chair Hanks's sentiment. And you know,
18 as we look at public safety holistically, MOCJ is a
19 big part of that. So it sort of, as is at the
20 intersection of a lot of the challenges we're
21 hearing... that we've been hearing for a while,
22 right? I mean, this administration is barely five
23 months old, but with procurement challenges, you
24 know, this is something that needs to get fixed from
25 the top down. But when you're talking about public

2 safety and the work that MOCJ does, I think doing
3 what we can to fix the broken procurement system is
4 going to go a long way in keeping some of our most...
5 most vulnerable, a lot safer. So it's, it's really
6 critical work and we're here to support you, however
7 we can and to be partners in doing this work. So we
8 appreciate your time today. And thank you so much.

9 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thanks. Thank you, Jack.

11 DIRECTOR LOGAN: Thank you.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, MOCJ. We're going
13 to just pause for a few moments while we switch over
14 to DoITT.

15 For the last portion of the hearing, I just want
16 to recognize we were joined by Councilmembers Moya
17 and Velázquez. So everyone bear with us. We'll
18 switch to the Department Of Information Technology
19 and Telecommunications in just a few moments.

20 SERGEANT LUGO: In the meantime, we will do audio
21 checks. Commissioner Fraser can we just test your
22 audio?

23 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Testing testing.

24 SERGEANT LUGO: Coming in loud and clear. Deputy
25 Commissioner Antonelli?

1 FINANCE COMMITTEE

233

2 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANTONELLI: Testing.

3 SERGEANT LUGO: Loud and clear as well. General
4 Counsel Richard?

5 COUNSEL RICHARD: Tynia Richard here.

6 SERGEANT LUGO: Thank you. Chief Operating
7 Officer McGrath.

8 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Testing
9 testing.

10 SERGEANT LUGO: Thank you. I'll switch over your
11 name.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Okay, Chairs Brannan and
13 Gutiérrez, just let me know when you're ready.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I'm good.

15 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Me too.

16 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: All right.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Jen-Gu is here?

18 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Hey Jen-Gu. Okay, good.

20 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Everybody is here. Alright.

21 Good afternoon, everyone, and welcome to the final
22 portion of our agency testimony for today, May 11:

23 The Department of Information Technology and

24 Telecommunications. My name is Malcom Butehorn, and

25 I'm counsel to the Finance Committee.

2 I would first like to acknowledge the council
3 members that we are joined by: Councilmembers
4 Brannan, Gutiérrez, Abreu, Barron, Brewer, Carr,
5 Farias, Holden, Moya, Ossé, Rivera, Sánchez, and
6 Velázquez. I'm going to remind everyone that you
7 were able to mute and unmute yourselves. We just
8 asked you to remember to mute yourself when not
9 speaking. So I will turn to Chair Brannan for his
10 opening, then Chair Gutiérrez, and then I will swear
11 in the witnesses.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you, Malcolm. Good
13 afternoon, everyone. Welcome to the third portion of
14 today's executive budget hearing.

15 Next, we'll hear from the Department of
16 Information Technology and Telecommunications. I'm
17 pleased to be joined by my colleague and Chair of the
18 Committee on technology Councilmember Gutiérrez.
19 DoITT's projected fiscal 23 budget of \$716.5 million
20 represents less than 1% of the city's proposed FY 23
21 budget in the Executive Plan DoITT's FY 23 budget
22 increased by 1% to \$9.6 million from the preliminary
23 plan of \$707 million. I want to jump right into this
24 hearing, but I do want to extend a warm welcome to
25 Commissioner and CTO, Matt Fraser and his team for

2 being here today. My questions will mainly focus on
3 the reorganization of DoITT and the city's various
4 technology offices, the Internet master plan and
5 broadband expansion... expansion is of a particular
6 interest to this Council, and the reduction in the
7 city's Cyber Command as well as additional savings
8 that I think we can find in expanding cloud services
9 and storage. I want to give special thanks to John
10 and Florentine from the Finance Division for all
11 their work in making today possible. And I now want
12 to turn for her first executive budget hearing Chair
13 of the technology committee. Chair Gutiérrez for her
14 opening statement.

15 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you so much, Chair
16 Brannan. Good afternoon and welcome to the fiscal
17 2023 executive budget hearing for the Department of
18 Information Technology and Telecommunications, known
19 as DoITT. My name is Jennifer Gutierrez and I am the
20 chair of the Committee on technology. Today's
21 hearing is joint with the committee on finance and
22 just want to thank my colleague again, Councilmember
23 Brannan, for co-chairing today's hearing with me.

24 The department's proposed fiscal 2023 Executive
25 Budget totals \$716.5 million, including \$176.1

2 million in city funding to support 1755 full time
3 positions. The budget also includes \$540.3 million
4 in OTPS, of which nearly \$282 million is allocated to
5 contractual services.

6 Additionally, the department fiscal year 2022
7 through 2026 capital commitment plan totals \$703
8 million dollars. In the executive plan DoITT's
9 fiscal 2022 budget totals \$993.3 million and is \$277
10 million more than its fiscal 2023 budget. The net
11 change is driven by the recognition of additional
12 non-city funding in the current fiscal year, mainly
13 to cover COVID-19 expenses. At today's hearing, it
14 is my hope to examine how the department is currently
15 managing operations with significant vacancies of 224
16 positions, and how these vacant positions impact
17 DoITT's overall performance. We will also hear how
18 DoITT has been utilizing federal funding in response
19 to the pandemic. Lastly, we will dive deep into
20 DoITT current capital projects, specifically how the
21 department is rolling out its broadband initiatives.
22 As the office continues to consolidate the city's
23 various technology offices into a single entity, the
24 Office of Technology and Innovation or OTI, we look
25 forward to working with DoITT to ensure that the

2 department has sufficient resources to carry out its
3 duties in the most efficient way.

4 In closing, I want to thank the committee staff
5 for working on putting this hearing together
6 including Florentine Kapoor, John Russell, Irene
7 Bayovski, Charles Kim, and my chief of staff Ana
8 Esindor. I'll hand it over.

9 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you chairs. The
10 following members of the administration are here to
11 testify and/or answered questions Commissioner and
12 CTO, Matthew Fraser, Deputy Commissioner of
13 Management and Budget, Joseph Antonelli, General
14 Counsel Tynia Richard, and Chief Operating Officer
15 Michael McGrath.

16 I will first read the oath and after I will call
17 on each member from the administration individually
18 to respond. Do you have do you affirm to tell the
19 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth
20 before these committees and to respond honestly to
21 Councilmember questions. Commissioner Fraser?

22 COMMISSIONER FRASER: I do.

23 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Deputy Commissioner
24 Antonelli?

25 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANTONELLI: I do.

2 COUNSEL BUTEHORN General Counsel Richard?

3 COUNSEL RICHARD: I do.

4 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: And COO McGrath?

5 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: I do.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you everyone.

7 Commissioner Fraser. We may begin when ready.

8 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Thank you very much. Good
9 afternoon chairs Brannan and Gutierrez, and members
10 of the council City Council's committee on finance
11 and technology. My name is Matthew Fraser, and I'm
12 the Chief Technology Officer of the city of New York
13 and the commissioner of the Office of Tech and
14 Innovation. I'm joined today by Joseph Antonelli,
15 our Deputy Commissioner for Management and Budget.
16 Tynia Richard, our General Counsel and Deputy
17 Commissioner for Legal Matters. And Michael McGrath,
18 our Chief Operating Officer.

19 Thank you for the opportunity to testify on OTAs
20 fiscal 2023 Executive Budget. Furthermore, I'm
21 excited to update the Committee on the consolidation
22 of the city's legacy technology offices within OTI
23 and how we are leveraging the technology to improve
24 service delivery to all New Yorkers and close the
25 digital divide. Since my testimony in March, we've

2 made three key appointments to OTI's executive team:

3 Kelly Moen, Michael Fitzpatrick, and Ruby Troy, who

4 will be driving OTI's efforts on cybersecurity,

5 information privacy, strategic planning, and

6 implementation initiatives, respectively. Kelly Moen

7 is our new city-wide Chief Information Security

8 Officer. Kelly leads OTI cybercommand in the

9 protection and defense of the city's digital

10 enterprise to ensure continued security and integrity

11 of our operations and ability to get stuff done for

12 New Yorkers.

13 Michael Fitzpatrick is our new city wide Chief

14 Privacy Officer and leads the Office of Information

15 Privacy. Michael will ensure the administration and

16 its agencies zealously protect New Yorkers

17 information privacy, while maximizing allowable data

18 sharing and for inter-agency coordination. Ruby Choi

19 is our Deputy Commissioner for Strategic Initiatives,

20 and will be leading a portfolio of key initiatives

21 around user-centered digital transformation,

22 improving IT programs and managing and customer

23 service and researching emerging technologies to help

24 the city further its mission for these agencies.

25

2 Additionally, the Strategic Initiatives Division
3 is working with various stakeholders to develop a
4 strategic plan, which will lay out the mission,
5 vision and goals and major initiatives and serve as a
6 roadmap for OTI moving forward.

7 One of these major one of these major initiatives
8 is the My City Portal, through which OTI will
9 transform the way New Yorkers experience and transact
10 with their government online.

11 When seeking essential services and benefits,
12 residents are often forced to navigate bureaucratic
13 processes that are unduly time consuming, cumbersome
14 and confusing, especially for working families. We
15 are creating the My City Portal to help alleviate
16 those burdens for those burdens. My City will not
17 only provide a one-stop shop to access all services
18 and benefits, but its first major feature will
19 provide a unified intake process for our working
20 families, where they can apply for all subsidized
21 childcare options and city offers. Making essential
22 city services and benefits subsidized childcare more
23 accessible to New Yorkers will change lives, bolster
24 our economy and support the children and families.
25 OTIs new needs for this budget cycle reflect our

2 commitment to improving and modernizing digital
3 service delivery across the administration. For
4 example, additional funding will go towards ongoing
5 311 application modernization, which will extend
6 311's Customer Service Management System to provide
7 significant enhancements to 311 application.
8 Enhancements will include multi language capabilities
9 and developing solutions with ESRI to improve
10 location accuracy for service requests, conditions
11 across mobile, portal, and call center channels. New
12 Yorkers will be able to navigate the application in
13 their choice of 10 different languages and access to
14 content translated by native speakers.

15 Beyond our new needs OTAs fiscal 2023 budget
16 provides operating expenses of approximately \$716
17 million, allocating \$176 million personnel services
18 to support the 1755 full time positions, and \$540
19 million for OTPs. Intercity funds transferred from
20 agencies will account for \$146 million, or about 20%
21 of the total allocation of telecommunication costs,
22 representing the largest portion of interest expense
23 projected at \$141 million for fiscal year year 22.
24 For fiscal year 22, the expense budget appropriation
25 increased by \$24.7 million from fiscal year 23.

2 January's financial plan to the Executive Plan. The
3 increase to the fiscal year 22 Executive Budget is
4 largely attributed to funding that OTI receives for
5 COVID and vaccine-related costs, funding associated
6 with the approved capital projects as well as from
7 agencies for telecommunication related costs.

8 For fiscal year 23, the expense budget
9 appropriation increased by \$9.6 million, for the
10 fiscal year 23 January financial plan to the
11 executive plan. The increase for the fiscal year
12 2023 executive budget is largely attributed to the
13 funding that OTI has received for the extension of
14 our IFA positions, lease costs, adjustments, and
15 rollovers of grant funding from fiscal year 22 to
16 fiscal year 23. OTIs fiscal year 23 executive budget
17 provides for a capital budget of \$1 billion over the
18 fiscal year 2022 through fiscal year 2031, a 10 year
19 window, the majority of the budget and fiscal year 22
20 and 23, totaling \$461 million over the two fiscal
21 years. For fiscal years 22 and 23, the capital
22 budget appropriation decreased by \$51 million, for
23 the fiscal year 23 preliminary financial plan to the
24 fiscal year 23 executive plan. This... this
25 decrease... this decrease to combine fiscal year 22

2 and fiscal year 23 is largely attributed to project
3 realignment.

4 Thank you for the opportunity to testify today.
5 I will now take Councilmember questions.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Thank you Commissioner. I
7 want to jump right into it. In January of this year,
8 one of the first executive orders the mayor signed
9 consolidated the city's various technology...
10 technology offices. And I know your agency is
11 undergoing a reorganization, including a name change
12 from DoITT to the Office of Technology and
13 Innovation. I guess, just plainly: Why was this
14 reorganization necessary? And what improvements to
15 citywide Technology Operations can we expect from
16 this reorganization?

17 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Fantastic question. So
18 when we look at the reorg, I think we have to look at
19 it in two different aspects. One of it was a
20 realignment of the city entities that had a tech or
21 tech-adjacent function... or... and in some cases,
22 the other part of it is actually an extension of
23 authority for broader oversight over the city's
24 technology initiatives.

2 So historically, when you looked at New York
3 City, and you asked who had the voice of technology
4 or what... what direction technology was going in, we
5 had... there wasn't a very... there wasn't a clear
6 answer. Cyber Command, which was responsible for the
7 cybersecurity needs of the city was pointed... had
8 its own lead that was disparate from the city's tech
9 authority. DoITT had its own lead that was disparate
10 from the city cyber authority. We also had a lead
11 for data and analytics, and a lead for information
12 privacy, that that were all under different chains of
13 command. So when we looked at the problem of how do
14 we (1) provide consolidated services, not to the city
15 agencies themselves, but to the public? And how could
16 we coalesce all those efforts around an entity, it
17 was clear that was that there wasn't a single place
18 in the city where we could do it. So when the Office
19 of Technology of Innovation was birthed, what we
20 are... what we serve as for the city is a guiding
21 light for not just tech initiatives, but its tech,
22 its cyber, its privacy, but it's also partnership and
23 thought leadership around business initiatives that
24 are focused on making New York City greater for those
25 that are dependent on government services.

2 So when you look across the enterprise of how
3 it's actually materializing, what efficiencies that
4 we've been able to create? We've consolidated two
5 separate security missions over the first... first
6 two months, with the announcement of the Joint
7 Security Operations Center, within what was once
8 DoITT, and what was once New York City Cyber Command.
9 We had one information security team that was
10 working... that was focused on infrastructure
11 protection for hosted agencies -- by hosted I mean,
12 agencies where DoITT holds their infrastructure --
13 and then you had another entity that had a broader
14 mission to ensure that the city's tech estate
15 across... across all entities were protected. And
16 those teams suddenly worked in unison. And what we
17 did, as we established a joint security operations
18 center, is we tore down the wall that stood between
19 those two... those two teams brought all resources
20 together as a consolidated team. We also brought in
21 our partners... brought in our partners from the
22 NYPD, from the FBI, and also from New York State.

23 And now we have a consolidated security
24 mission... cybersecurity mission that has more
25 capability than any individual entity had before,

2 individually, as we work collectively towards a
3 common goal of security.

4 And that's not just limited from a security
5 perspective. Also, from an operations perspective,
6 we've had the capability to take a look at commodity
7 level services that the city provides... the city
8 leverages. Things like, when you think about cell
9 phones and rate plans and how that stuff works out
10 between agencies. And due to the consolidated
11 authorities and mission, we're all... we're working
12 on rationalizing things like the acquisition of
13 commodity services. And we have as we move into the
14 new fiscal year, and as we get towards the end of the
15 calendar year, we're projected to see significant
16 reductions in terms of... in savings associated with
17 some of these initiatives.

18 So that's just a little bit of how but if you
19 have any questions about a specific area, I'm happy
20 to answer it.

21 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure. I mean... you
22 touched on something there at the end, is there...
23 are there budget savings that we can expect as... as
24 a result of these increased efficiencies of the
25 reorg?

2 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah. So the... the... if
3 you look at how the entity, or DoITT, or any of these
4 entities have operated year over year, and you look
5 back historically, the budgets seldomly shrink, they
6 think more often than not expand. And what that
7 expansion... if you measure the value in terms of
8 output and what the public is received, I think you'd
9 find varying results. So what we're... what we're
10 hoping to do is instead of seeing significant
11 expansions, we're appropriating costs that we're
12 saving towards initiatives that affect the lives of
13 those that are dependent on the government. And we
14 expect in many cases for some of the new initiatives
15 that are coming up to self-fund them through
16 reappropriation of programs that... that we may
17 deprecate or we may consolidate. Does that does that
18 answer the question?

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure. Yeah, I appreciate
20 that.

21 I want to talk about the Internet Master Plan and
22 the broadband expansion.

23 So 2020 the de Blasio administration launched the
24 internet master plan. One of the primary goals of
25 the Internet Master Plan was to establish a robust

2 marketplace by leveraging city assets where internet
3 providers would compete to bring the best and fastest
4 low-cost internet to all New Yorkers. Will DoITT now
5 be... and this administration continuing the internet
6 master plan from the de Blasio administration?

7 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So also another great
8 question. We're... we're looking at Internet Master
9 Plan holistically. And the reason why we're doing it
10 is part of the Internet Master Plan, and part of
11 what's proposed, is infrastructure build out across
12 the city using some city assets. But given the
13 fractured nature of what was once the legacy CTOs
14 office, and what was DoITT, there wasn't a concerted
15 effort to use all of the infrastructure or make
16 available all the city's infrastructure from a fiber
17 perspective. So there's a... there's a possibility
18 that in the existing proposal, that we may be looking
19 for resources to build out infrastructure where the
20 city already has infrastructure present. So what
21 we're doing now is doing a review and a
22 deduplication, to ensure that we're not wasting any
23 money associated with it. It's \$160 million
24 initiative. And although it was started in the last
25 administration, anything that moves forward from this

2 point, it's this administration's burden to ensure
3 that's the best thing for the taxpayers.

4 So we're in the process of unpacking every
5 component of the Internet Master Plan, and deciding
6 what's the best way to move forward. But what I
7 would like to reaffirm in this... in this forum is
8 that (1), low cost broadband, broad diversity in the
9 market: It's the best thing for New York City,
10 because the people that live in the city should not
11 pay a premium because the marketplace is limited.
12 Right? So we are focused on how we do that. And
13 we're also cognizant of the cost of inaction. Every
14 day that a New Yorker that is that needs access to
15 service, especially kids that... that are in school
16 that needs access to service that doesn't have access
17 to it, that day brings them further and further... or
18 extends the digital divide a little bit further. So
19 what we're... we're looking at although the Internet
20 Master Plan is under review, we have options that
21 we're executing now that will fast-track delivery of
22 broadband services to places including public
23 housing. We've already done it across homeless
24 shelters. And we're... we're looking at other ways
25 that we can expand broadband capacity in near term

2 without depending on some of these longer... longer
3 term programs.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, I mean, as you... as
5 you noted, and I think we're on the same... we're...
6 I know we're on the same page here, I mean,
7 definitely a priority of this council, as well as the
8 budget negotiating team of this council, as well as
9 the speaker and myself personally, we are dedicated
10 to prioritizing, expediting universal broadband to
11 low-income New Yorkers and treating internet access
12 like... like the necessity that it is not the luxury
13 that... that it may have seemed to be not too long
14 ago. The... how... you mentioned public housing, and
15 how many NYCHA buildings currently have free and low-
16 cost internet access?

17 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So free broadband access,
18 so we have the Queensbridge Connected Program, which
19 provided wireless access for every... for all the
20 developments within Queensbridge... all the units
21 within Queensbridge housing. Beyond Queensbridge
22 Connected, it's sparse, right?, and it's far less
23 than it should be. What we're aggressively looking
24 at now is a way that we can expand that universal

2 broadband access beyond the few years where it exists
3 to the entire NYCHA development population.

4 So...

5 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Is there a timeline for
6 that?

7 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So the timeline is a bit
8 nebulous, but we are... we are hopeful. And I
9 usually speak in affirmatives, because it's the land
10 I come from. It's like, "This is when it'll actually
11 happen." But in its current state, we expect the
12 first wave of this to get off before the end of the
13 second quarter of this year, meaning that will be in
14 our first five developments and then after we get
15 past the first five, we can rapidly expand beyond
16 that.

17 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, so according to a
18 press release from last year, the vendors have been
19 selected to carry out the universal broadband RFP
20 project along with the \$157 million in capital
21 funding to support the program. Can you give us an
22 update on the status of the RFP and the vendors that
23 were selected?

24 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So I'd be happy to provide
25 counsel within with an overview of everything that's

2 come out of that process so far, in terms of vendor
3 selection, and where we currently sit. But as I
4 mentioned, as we started this, that we are currently
5 reviewing that RFP to ensure that it... and the
6 responses to the RFP to ensure that what has been
7 proposed is not duplicating any... any assets the
8 city already has in this space. So we're working on
9 it.

10 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, but... okay, because
11 we... the press release stated that the vendors had
12 been selected and secured.

13 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah, so a lot... the
14 process of this... the administration of this is
15 split between the legacy of what was once the CTOs
16 office, which is now a part of the OTI umbrella and
17 the Economic Development Corporation. So during that
18 process, there was a preliminary selection, but a
19 notice to proceed in terms of moving forward has not
20 been issued, which is why the contract is currently
21 on hold, pending a notice to proceed from this
22 office.

23 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, because if... if a
24 vendor was awarded a contract with the city,

2 wouldn't... wouldn't that be regardless of what
3 happens with... with the office?

4 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Sorry, can you repeat that,
5 please?

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: If a vendor... if vendors
7 have been selected, and a vendor won an RFP award,
8 wouldn't that... wouldn't that move forward
9 regardless of what happens with your office?

10 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah. So although a vendor
11 has won an award, it requires a contract to actually
12 be executed.

13 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Sure.

14 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So the contracts have not
15 been executed.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay.

17 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Does that Does that
18 clarify?

19 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, I get it. I'm just
20 trying to figure out where we are. I'm totally
21 understand. I mean, this administration is barely
22 five months old. I understand. I'm just trying to
23 figure out where we are.

24 COMMISSIONER FRASER: No worries. No worries. I
25 think that... (crosstalk)

2 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I mean, because we're
3 interested too in knowing, you know, how final
4 determinations are made, especially with regard to
5 MWBEs. You know, we have lots of questions.

6 Universal broadband is very important to this
7 council. So we had lots of questions about this.

8 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah. So I when we talk
9 about universal broadband, and we look at what this
10 actually means, universal broadband as a service, and
11 what it enables as a utility, as you so rightly
12 mentioned: When you look at things like heat and hot
13 water, and you work in public housing, it's not
14 something that you have to ask to have. It's
15 provided. And broadband, although not technically
16 considered a utility, has been... has evolved to such
17 a point where if you don't have it, as a student
18 that's in school, or the average household, it's hard
19 for them to survive in today's... today's world. So
20 for us, broadband access, which is why it's one of
21 the first things that we looked at, how do we fix
22 that? It's... it's one of the most important
23 priorities to the mayor, and it's one of the most
24 important priorities in this office.

2 So counsel has an... nothing but an ally here,
3 and we will get this where many have tried and
4 haven't made much room, we will get this over the
5 line soon.

6 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: That sounds good to me.

7 Do we have a map? Or any data related to cable
8 infrastructure in the city? What areas, streets or
9 blocks might not be covered or wired?

10 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yup. So we can provide
11 details on that front.

12 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. And do we have a
13 timeline for when we expect New York City to be fully
14 covered by 5G?

15 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So we're currently working
16 very aggressively across the administration to
17 streamline and fast track that process. The timeline
18 is highly dependent on a number of... of external
19 factors: capabilities of the actual carriers to
20 build, approval process and time across the city. So
21 we're in the process of rationalizing that. By the
22 next time we have a touch point, and we can follow up
23 outside of this, we're hoping to unravel and have and
24 have something tangible to point to. Anything that I
25 tell you right now would be speculative, based on

2 some of the inconsistencies across some of the
3 dependents that I just mentioned.

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: What are we doing with
5 these link kiosks? Are we continuing those? I've
6 never seen one outside of Manhattan.

7 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Oh, yeah. So Link... Link
8 is...

9 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Do they exist outside of
10 Manhattan.

11 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Link is certainly moving
12 forward and our Chief Operating Officer Mike McGrath
13 will happily jump in here.

14 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Sorry, can you
15 hear me okay?

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yes, sir.

17 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Okay. Thank
18 you Chair Brannan?

19 Yeah, so the LinkNYC is The program is
20 progressing. There was this hiatus, as we know, when
21 we went to go through an agreement about
22 renegotiation with the vendor -- or not renegotiate,
23 that decision was made a couple of years ago. We
24 since we started that program. There are a number in

2 the outer boroughs. I happen to live in Greenpoint.
3 I can't walk up Manhattan Avenue...

4 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: It's like the Loch Ness
5 Monster, I don't know. Some people have seen them.

6 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: It's so funny.
7 So, anyhow, yeah, but we are progressing. Actually,
8 the build year schedule for build year six, which
9 ended December 31 called for 50 units to be
10 installed, and that was met. And the build year
11 seven projections for 310, our current plans, have
12 that on target as well. So they are progressing, and
13 they are continuing to go out there. And we also
14 have, you know, the old model versus the current
15 model... not old... the current model versus the new
16 one that's... that will enable... help enable 5g as
17 well. So.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Um, how do we think about
19 and plan where... where those kiosks land?

20 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Sure. I'll
21 note that the... the original 1800 and change that
22 were installed, were definitely slanted toward
23 Manhattan, because they were replacing payphones.
24 And, you know, there's a bit of a disparity in that
25 in terms of leaning toward Manhattan. But the

2 current agreement that we have with them calls for up
3 to 4000 units, which is roughly about another 2200-
4 or-so units, and 90% of those needs to be above 96th
5 Street in Manhattan and the... the boroughs of
6 Brooklyn, Queens, Bronx, and Staten Island. And in
7 terms of where they go, there's... the first push is
8 to hit equity districts that have been identified in
9 the agreement. And there's 739 of those that need to
10 be, you know, prioritized to hit areas that were
11 missed, and underserved in general, to try and
12 propagate this out there and address some of the
13 digital divide statements that the commissioner made
14 a few minutes ago.

15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Got it. Okay. I
16 appreciate that. Yeah.

17 Going back quickly to the Affordable Internet
18 access. I know. There's... I mean, the DOE in New
19 York State, I think in Buffalo, work with ISPs to
20 provide affordable internet access to students
21 through bulk purchasing agreements. Is that
22 something that we would consider for our schools or
23 NYCHA? Or something that we are considering?

24 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So you... you hit the nail
25 right on the head, right? So there's a couple of

2 ways where this is accomplished today, on the federal
3 level, you have the federal ACP program, which is
4 reimbursement, up to \$30 a month for broadband
5 access. And then what you have in terms of bulk
6 purchasing... bulk purchasing agreements, were
7 usually isolated to city facilities. But that's
8 one... that's the area that we're exploring for both
9 NYCHA and... and we'll... we'll have to defer to DOE
10 in terms of what's the plan around schools, but we
11 will work in conjunction with them towards... towards
12 that... that consolidated... that combined effort for
13 for... stemming that digital divide.

14 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Two last questions. And
15 then I want to turn it over to the Chair. Cyber
16 Command in terms of vacancy reduction. Cyber
17 Command, I believe is set to lose 64 positions, is
18 that a right number of Cyber Command vacancy
19 reduction?

20 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So what I just want to re-
21 emphasize on the Cyber Command is: Because we've
22 consolidated Cyber Command with the legacy DoITT
23 information security team, Cyber Command's total
24 headcount associated with who's actually... people
25 that are actually in seats has increased, because

2 we've combined the two teams. What we are looking at
3 eliminating is vacant positions. It's not... it's
4 not people. So for the vacant positions, the exact
5 count, or deputy commissioner for management budget,
6 Joe Antonelli, can attest. But from an efficacy and
7 a resource staffing perspective, we've increased the
8 number of bodies that we have towards a combined
9 security mission by consulting the two teams. But
10 Joe?

11 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANTONELLI: Sure, I think the
12 number of 64 that you're referencing is actually the
13 current number of Cyber Command vacancies at this
14 time, and we're not actually set to lose those.
15 That's just the current standing vacancies right now.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay, so where... so where
17 are we at? Because then I'm confused. Because I
18 thought we had... I understand what the commissioner
19 is saying with... with combining the two teams. So
20 how many spots are vacant? Are we eliminating spots
21 still?

22 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So that... and I'll let Joe
23 jump in right after this. So during the initial run
24 of the plan, as the city rationalize the budget,
25 during the last go-round, we took a look across OTI

2 as the enterprise, and we looked at any vacant
3 position that we had, regardless of what function it
4 was associated with. And then we did analysis to see
5 where could we give back where necessary, especially
6 considering the efficiencies that we would gain as we
7 consolidated the teams. So I... Joe can talk to what
8 the historic give-back was on that front, or we can
9 we can come back to after... But Joe?

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANTONELLI: Yeah, I mean, I'd
11 have to get back to you with the exact numbers on...
12 on the historic look-back. But, just basically, to
13 reiterate, what we're looking at right now is based
14 on the current division makeup, which the you know,
15 the Chief Technology Officers kind of talk that we've
16 looked at, we do have 64 vacancies there that are not
17 being cut.

18 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Is there... I mean,
19 is there... the current city policy requires that
20 city employees have a residency in New York City. I
21 know, you know, there's sometimes challenges in
22 finding skilled employees in the cybersecurity field.
23 Are we having issues retaining Cyber Command
24 employees because of that reason?

2 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So cyber... cyber is a
3 market that, from an employment perspective, it's a
4 very, very aggressive employment market at the
5 moment. If you look at just what's going on from the
6 geopolitical perspective, with the events between
7 Russia and Ukraine, and the amount of cyber activity
8 that's been generated out of that, proceeding that
9 the escalation of global attacks and attacks focused
10 on the nation, including what we saw with SolarWinds,
11 what we saw with the pipeline, and what we saw
12 from... from a utilities perspective, and then you
13 look at other municipal parallels, like Atlanta,
14 Baltimore, and what happened in those spaces.

15 Cyber talent is... is one of the areas that are
16 highly in demand. So any entity that has any
17 resources with any capability, retention is a problem
18 across the entire tech industry. But it's a
19 particular issue around Cyber Command around cyber...
20 the cyber industry itself. But... and we don't, we
21 don't really use that... we don't... we don't look at
22 it as an insurmountable challenge. But what we look
23 at is how we develop talent within the New York City
24 pipeline to ensure that we have a consistent... we

2 have consistency in how we groom and build resources
3 to fuel that security vision.

4 So to that end, we baseline security training, so
5 that we can take resources that have come in as entry
6 or mid-level employees across the city in a tech area
7 and build cyber capabilities amongst those, employing
8 some of the best practices that are used by both the
9 FBI and other national security parallels. So when
10 you look at how the FBI takes a federal agent, and
11 turns them into a cybersecurity personnel...
12 professional, it's the same thing that we are looking
13 at employing of how we groom talent within the city
14 itself.

15 So the short answer to the question is retention
16 is a problem across the spectrum, especially in the
17 cybersecurity space. But we have contingencies in
18 place to ensure that we keep the pipeline fed within
19 the city itself.

20 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. My last question is
21 about cloud services. Are all our city agencies
22 using cloud services? If not, why not?

23 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So it really depends. So
24 if you look at... there's a couple of aspects of
25 cloud that we can we can point to. So when you look

2 at some commodity services that are offered at scale
3 in the cloud, like email, the vast majority of the
4 city is dependent on the cloud for email services,
5 whether that be Office 365, or Google Cloud.

6 We're in the process for those that are outliers
7 or remnants, doing a second round of cleanup, to
8 bring them and pull them into the cloud itself.

9 When you look at other things like infrastructure
10 as a service -- and when I say Infrastructure as a
11 Service, for those that aren't familiar, it's the
12 concept of taking... instead of buying a server and
13 installing it in one of your data centers, it's
14 renting space and capacity from a cloud provider. So
15 when we talk about the cloud, so this is... I love to
16 say, "There is no cloud, it's just somebody else's
17 computer." Right? And depending on the scale at
18 which you use it in the way that you use cloud, the
19 costs, if you use it... if you use an Infrastructure
20 as Service Model, which is the traditional way that
21 folks... that the people typically deploy, it costs
22 more operating in the cloud, and it does cost running
23 on premise.

24 So what we're looking at is, as we approach our
25 cloud strategy, it is ensuring not that we just go to

2 cloud for the sake of going to cloud. It's looking
3 at that we how we transform our workloads so that
4 they run cloud native in ways that save operating
5 expense costs, and that provides higher levels of
6 availability. Across the nation, New York City with
7 our combined cloud presence between all the city
8 entities, we are amongst one of the larger entities
9 nationally that... that leverage cloud providers...
10 that leverage cloud services, and we are... we want
11 to ensure that as we continue to grow in this space,
12 we are... we're being fiscally responsible to ensure
13 that we're not burning excess costs, just to... just
14 to move from on-premise to the cloud. Does that...
15 I'll just pause here to see if that makes sense.

16 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Yeah, I mean, I guess I
17 guess it's hard, it's hard for me to believe that
18 it's cheaper to, you know, pay for real estate than
19 it is in the cloud elsewhere. But I, you know, I got
20 interested in the cloud, based on savings, based on
21 how you know, that we can save the city some money.

22 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So big things like Software
23 As A Service, right? I mean, you look at all our
24 Platforms as a Service. You look at something like
25 Office 365. The concept of building mail servers,

2 plus the human capital that's required to manage
3 those mail servers, plus backup, plus all the other
4 things that are required.

5 When you look at services like that, by taking
6 that kind of service and shifting it to the cloud,
7 right?, you save money doing something like that. Or
8 even from a security perspective. Leveraging things
9 like managed service providers that look at the
10 information that comes off of your... your computers,
11 and says, "This is a threat. This is not a threat."
12 For a small business, they may pay \$100,000 or
13 \$140,000, for a service like that, that's cloud
14 based, where for a cybersecurity professional, they
15 can't hire a single FTE at that rate. So there are
16 areas where the cloud is cheaper. But if you use the
17 cloud, like you use... like your on-premise data
18 center, you want to take one server, buy it in cash,
19 versus one server and provision it in the cloud, and
20 you'd let that same server run 24 by 7, 365. And you
21 let that run over a three year period, the
22 consumption costs of what you would pay the cloud
23 provider for the same size, same skills, and same
24 compute would be more expensive than what you pay on
25 premise. And this is where I... this is where I say

2 it's... it's not about whether you go to the cloud or
3 not. It's about making sure that as you move, you
4 transform your services in such a way, where you take
5 advantage of the scale and cost saving nature of the
6 cloud... the cloud. Does that make sense?

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Absolutely. Thank you,
8 Commissioner, I appreciate your time. Thank you to
9 all your deputies, your CTO, and CFO that joined us.
10 I'm going to hand it over now to the chair of our
11 technology committee.

12 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Absolute pleasure. Thank
13 you very much.

14 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you, Chair Brannan.
15 And thank you, Commissioner, and Mr. McGrath for all
16 of your answers.

17 I've got a few of my own. I'm going to start
18 with actually a few from just a follow-up from the
19 preliminary hearing.

20 I want to start with the NYCWiN decommission,
21 because I feel like we didn't spend a whole lot of
22 time on that. So I know that DoITT continues to...
23 to work in replacing end-of-life and legacy system,
24 with NYCWiN, being one of them, which implement
25 measures to secure the city's network. Can you share

2 a breakdown of those costs of what it is to
3 decommission some of these legacy systems? And a
4 schedule for completion dates of the breakdown and
5 transition... full transition off the system?

6 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So as NYCWiN was the first
7 thing, I'll handle them in orders of... in orders of
8 succession. So the first one was around NYCWiN.
9 NYCWiN is fully decommissioned, meaning service wise,
10 there's not a single city entity that is dependent on
11 any service that was once provided by NYCWiN.
12 Alright? NYCWiN is dead. Now, infrastructure wise,
13 we have only two sites remaining with this legacy
14 infrastructure, where we are in the process of
15 pulling that infrastructure down. And by
16 infrastructure, I literally mean, there may be an
17 antenna or a rack or a small tower in a building
18 that... that has that. So we're in the process of
19 pulling stuff out. Now, the reason why we haven't
20 been able to get it done yet. It's a mix, because in
21 some of these properties, they're private property,
22 so we have to manage with the building owners to get
23 the stuff out. And then some of them they're in
24 public housing, so we have to work with NYCHA to get
25 teams in to pull that stuff out.

2 Now, with that being said, although we haven't
3 wrapped those two sites up yet, we expect to have
4 them done within the calendar year. So by the time
5 we get to the end of the year, we look back and you
6 can say every... every remnant of NYCWiN has been
7 pulled out.

8 Now in terms of the spend plans and the funds
9 associated with... with upgrading legacy systems.
10 I'll defer to my my colleague, Joe Antonelli, who is
11 our Deputy Commissioner of Management and Budget.

12 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANTONELLI: So, I mean, in
13 terms of NYCWiN specifically, you know, NYCWiN
14 actually carried a cost to the city of approximately
15 \$42 million a year. Now with the use... or with the
16 decreased dependency on it, now with the use of... of
17 commercial networks, this city cost is approximately
18 \$15 million a year for that. So there was a
19 significant net savings to the city by
20 decommissioning NYCWiN.

21 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I don't know if that's a
22 savings, necessarily, because we're paying to
23 decommission it, but I understand what you mean. And
24 so can you... is the \$15 mil that you just
25 referenced. Is that the cost? Is that... can we say

2 that that's the cost associated with the final
3 infrastructure breakdown?

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: No, that \$15 million
5 really represents what the new annual cost of the
6 system is. So NYCWiN as it existed carried about a
7 \$42 million cost to maintain the equipment, you know,
8 keep everything live, and by switching off of city
9 run equipment, and onto commercially managed
10 equipment, like, you know, the various wireless
11 carriers, etc, we're only carrying now a \$15 million
12 annual cost to utilize that equipment.

13 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, and so what...
14 sorry, go ahead.

15 COMMISSIONER FRASER: I was just saying the cost
16 to remove the equipment from the legacy sites, it's
17 nominal, and we're not... we're not in... we're not
18 even in the million threshold we're in... we're sub
19 million to get that equipment out.

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: And that's for the two
21 remaining sites?

22 COMMISSIONER FRASER: That's for the two
23 remaining sites, right?, because we don't pay any
24 operating costs for it. It's just for the space and

2 also the cost to have a team literally go and pull
3 stuff down.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, can you... do you
5 have the numbers to be specific on it?

6 COMMISSIONER FRASER: We can follow up with that.
7 I don't... I don't have that. I don't want to speak
8 for Joe, but I'm pretty sure Joe doesn't have that on
9 hand and not that don't have that number on hand.

10 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANTONELLI: No. I don't have
11 that number on hand.

12 COMMISSIONER FRASER: See? Synergies. We're
13 well connected.

14 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. Okay. I want
15 to kind of do some of the follow up questions that
16 Chair Brannan asked regarding the broadband
17 component.

18 Can you talk a little bit about the federal
19 programs that offer free Wi-Fi to state residents,
20 and how much is the cost for these programs.

21 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So the federal ACP program,
22 which is the Affordable Cable Program, which is the
23 one that we common... that's commonly referred to in
24 this space. So it's a voucher that families can
25 apply for that reimburse up to \$30 per month in spend

2 associated with broadband. Now in each one of the
3 cable... in each one of the carriers that provide
4 this service, each family is responsible for reaching
5 out, contracting with that service provider, and then
6 using the ACP voucher to reimburse the services for
7 that.

8 The important thing to note about the federal
9 program is that it's not a baseline into perpetuity.
10 The program is scheduled to exist for the next I
11 believe, two years, three years. And then after
12 that, it's unclear whether federal funding will
13 continue to be provided in this space. Which is why
14 we as a city, when we look at the need: Our need
15 goes well beyond two to three years, which is why the
16 broadband initiatives that we're looking at now are
17 focused on sustainable baseline expenses associated
18 with providing that utility like service.

19 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: So thank you, and thank
20 you for specifying how long, like what the timeline
21 is for it. So does that two or three year
22 investment... does that... I guess, where does it
23 meet with the city's plan for broadband expansion?
24 I'm just curious to know kind of what that... what
25 that intersection looks like. Specifically, since

2 we're prioritizing... the city's prioritizing
3 broadband expansion for NYCHA residents, and they are
4 the... they are going to be the primary population to
5 be eligible for this ECP program. So I just want to
6 know, kind of what is the city's plan around where
7 these two programs can potentially intersect?

8 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yup. So currently, the
9 federal program doesn't allow for bulk reimbursement,
10 meaning if the city wanted to make a bulk application
11 on behalf of the residents who live in public
12 housing, the program doesn't currently allow us to
13 leverage it in that way, which one, which is one of
14 the things that we are in conversations with the
15 Federal Government about, to see how we can expand it
16 a bit, so it can help cities help... help the city
17 help its residents by providing consolidated
18 services.

19 Now beyond just the population of folks that...
20 of people that live in city... city-operated
21 buildings like NYCHA or... or some of the homeless
22 shelters... or the homeless shelters, it's the
23 Affordable Cable Program is an ACP program is
24 extended to all those that meet a certain income
25

2 threshold, right? So when you look at our working
3 families, they extend well beyond public housing.

4 So what we're looking to do is expand our
5 messaging campaign and awareness about what's in that
6 space, while providing baseline coverage in the... in
7 the facilities where we actually have control. So in
8 terms of the intersect, we look at with the digital
9 divide is it's a complex, multi-layered problem. And
10 we are putting in solutions that address each one of
11 those layers. And the ACP program is about it's...
12 it's an important tool in the belt to help those that
13 are at that income threshold and access to the
14 services at lowered costs.

15 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. I just have
16 a... kind of a quick questions. I know Councilmember
17 Menin has piloted a program in her district. Are
18 residents that are signing up for this program, to
19 the best of your knowledge, are they being... are
20 they aware that they're signing up for a program
21 that's got a lifeline of about two to three years?
22 And is the idea that in those specific major
23 developments, the city's broadband expansion will
24 then be able to cover those whose voucher has
25 expired?

2 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So I cannot attest to the
3 messaging campaign that went out with this particular
4 program. The mayor and I both support any program
5 that that focuses on providing free access or near-
6 free access to broadband services. So it was one
7 thing that we're happy to see the council taking
8 initiative and pushing forward on. And in terms of
9 the awareness of... of what will come as part of the
10 city's overall program. We're in conversations...
11 early conversations now with tenant associations. So
12 as we touch each development, it's more than just,
13 "Here's a service, we're going to drop it on your
14 door and walk away." We look at broadband as a... as
15 part of an ecosystem of services that can be
16 delivered.

17 So when you look at workforce development, when
18 you look at when you look at upskilling, and when you
19 look at recreational activities that are dependent
20 on... on the internet, right, there's a lot that
21 broadband offers, it's... and what we... when we go
22 into the developments and into NYCHA, we want to go
23 in not just as, "Here's broadband", but here's a
24 continuum of services that we're looking to bring in.
25 And this is how... this is the first step in multiple

2 steps that will that will increase the quality of
3 what you get out of the city.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. I had a
5 follow up question just to the your response to
6 Councilmember Brannan's question about the... some of
7 the providers being selected.

8 I know -- and correct me if I'm wrong -- I did
9 hear that it's... I did understand from your
10 statement... your response that it's on hold, the
11 vendors that are being selected, because the
12 essential contracts haven't been executed. Can you
13 go in a little bit more on what... what that
14 challenge has been? Why are some of the... why are
15 these vendors execution of the contract on hold?
16 Specifically, what are some of the reservations that
17 you as the Commissioner have to move forward?

18 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So when we look at... when
19 we look at \$165 million spend that... that comes from
20 a legacy entity, and especially one that's on the
21 verge of execution? I think that's the biggest thing.
22 It's in terms of flag... just the sheer dollar amount
23 that's associated with it causes... "All right, \$165
24 million, let's... let's make sure that we, before we
25 sign on this, we know where everything is going. And

2 it's in the city's best interest." In terms of the
3 technical complexity, because of the bifurcation of
4 duties between the legacy CTOs office, and what was
5 once DoITT, we had two entities that... One that had
6 the city's franchise authority, and then the other
7 that had a mission of bringing universal broadband,
8 that didn't... that didn't really collaborate towards
9 this... this initiative. So some of the dysfunction,
10 and how that was manifested, and what the contract
11 was issued. So instead of it being held by the
12 city's tech authority, it was... it was held by the
13 Economic Development Corp. And that in and of itself
14 shows like how that communications void manifested
15 from a contract perspective, the same thing
16 manifested from a proposal and service availability
17 perspective.

18 So what we're doing is we're unpacking every
19 aspect of what was provisioned as a build out,
20 looking at where the city has existing
21 infrastructure, and ensuring that we're not putting
22 additional conduit in places where the city has
23 already built conduit historically. So that...
24 that's the thing that... that really... that I've got
25 a lot of concerns about. One of the things that

2 you'd hate to spend... hate to see... if you spent
3 hundreds of millions to diversify the marketplace,
4 but you've only provided services in areas where
5 we've already had services, right? So like that's...
6 that's what we're looking at.

7 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, thank you. Thank
8 you for that response. And just to kind of wrap up
9 the conversation about broadband and broader internet
10 connectivity. Do you... are you aware of any of the
11 city programs for internet connectivity that offer
12 affordable internet? And how... and what is the
13 process to access this... this program? Or are they
14 even being managed by DoITT in these instances?

15 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah. So what was once the
16 legacy CTOs offices spent a lot of time working on
17 building both awareness around the Affordable Cable
18 Program and also managing...

19 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Is that the name of it?

20 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah, the ACP. It's the
21 federal ACP program.

22 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: So it's the same program.

23 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yup. It's the same
24 program. But we as a city had... we had historic
25 messaging campaigns that went out around the

2 availability of program. We had initiatives focused
3 on getting people enrolled. So they're still... we
4 still have a site up on nyc.gov that... that
5 accommodates that enrollment and redirects resources
6 for people to... to that program. So those programs
7 were more so focused on, as I mentioned before,
8 someone going to a cable company or an ISP saying, "I
9 want service. I want to contract with you," getting
10 that lower level rate plan, then getting a voucher,
11 using the voucher to reimburse for the use of that
12 service. What we're looking at now is removing the
13 process of (1) needing to negotiate your own
14 connection with the cable company, working...
15 rationalizing and standardizing the rate plan, and
16 removing the dependency on the voucher for public
17 housing and city-run facilities. So that's... that's
18 what the big difference is, and... but like I said,
19 the legacy programs are still being used in our tool
20 belt to help capture those that that aren't in city
21 facilities.

22 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. Now I just
23 want to transition over to a few follow up questions
24 from our last hearing regarding LinkNYC, which was a
25 marathon of the hearing.

2 The last time we had the hearing last week, Chief
3 Operating Officer, Mr. McGrath testified that they
4 had just completed the physical audit of kiosks and
5 were going to draft a report... and... I mean, excuse
6 me, the report was currently being internally
7 reviewed. I had asked if this report would be made
8 public. And so I'm just... I would like to know if
9 that is still the case? Or if the report is even
10 ready yet? And if not, what... what is the expected
11 timeline?

12 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So great question. So
13 part... one of the things that we are... we are, as
14 the city's cyber privacy and tech authorities, we are
15 key on ensuring that we're very transparent about
16 what we're doing. And... and we hold ourselves to
17 the highest standard. So the Link audit that was
18 performed of the kiosks and all the information
19 surrounding it is something that we take a lot of
20 pride in, but like anything else, anything that's
21 delivered, we have to ensure that we quality assure,
22 the work product meets the standards that we... that
23 we asked for. And our intent is to publish it so
24 that the public can view it. We're very excited to
25 get it out. But like any... any review of any audit,

2 or any funding that we have received, we have to
3 ensure that the work product is complete, and that
4 it's in all the areas that we needed... that we
5 needed, the services performed that. And that's just
6 a process where it's a... it's a normal review and
7 oversight process. And we should have it out
8 hopefully soon. We have a lot of... a lot of
9 resources in our in our GC team... our general
10 counsel team that's focused on reviewing and ensuring
11 that it meets the contracted request.

12 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, can you say if it
13 will be out to the public by the end of the calendar
14 year?

15 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Well, I... if... I want to
16 answer that in a little bit of a different way.
17 We... we would like to see it out by the end of the
18 calendar year, barring extenuating circumstances.
19 And by extenuating circumstances, it's hard for me to
20 say that it would be there until we confirm that
21 everything in the product... in the product of the
22 audit, meaning all the components and all the aspects
23 that we asked in the audit was actually performed.
24 And like you... as you're aware, like some of these
25 processes, if we're go in and something's missing,

2 and we need them to re-perform that work, we're
3 highly dependent on the assessors themselves. So as
4 it stands right now, we have no reason to believe
5 that it will not be ready by the end of the year.
6 Right? But it's hard to say that definitively until
7 we... until we get through the assessment of this.
8 Does that make sense?

9 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: No, definitely. I
10 appreciate the thoroughness. And so. Yeah, I would
11 love to... I would like to review it once it's ready
12 for the public.

13 My next question is Would you consider conducting
14 an audit on data collection?

15 COMMISSIONER FRASER: On data collection?

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Mm-hmm.

17 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Well, I think any... any
18 service or any areas where we actually collect or
19 house information, we are dependent... we are
20 responsible for ensuring that those align to the
21 city's best practices and aligns to nationwide best
22 practices from a privacy and security perspective.

23 So audits are something that we're always open to
24 and we're working... we will look to see what's been

2 done historically in the space and we'll unpack it
3 where necessary.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. Still on the
5 LinkNYC hearing: Mr. McGrath also testified that the
6 additional revenue stream would be from leasing 5G
7 equipment. Would you or Mr. McGrath -- I know
8 you're here -- would you be able to elaborate once
9 again on that statement?

10 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So our Chief Operating
11 Officer Mike McGrath is very eloquent with his words.
12 And as he is... as he is the person that testified I
13 like to give him the floor so that he can do so. Any
14 area where necessary, I will jump in. Please, Mike.

15 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Thanks
16 Commissioner. And Chair Gutiérrez, good to catch up
17 with you again here. Yeah, relative to... Can you
18 repeat the question again? I just want to make sure
19 I answer it.

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Sure. So we this was in
21 the portion of the hearing where we were talking
22 about revenue streams, and you said that the revenue
23 stream would come from leasing of the 5g equipment...
24 an additional revenue stream would come from the
25 leasing of the 5g equipment. So I just wanted to

2 know if you could elaborate a little bit more on
3 that, and if the city... Yeah, I'm sorry. Let's
4 just stop there. If you could elaborate a little bit
5 more on what that will look like.

6 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Absolutely. So
7 there's two aspects to this right? One is our
8 contract with City Bridge. And within that contract,
9 there's the minimum annual guarantee payments. Those
10 payments are based on the number of units that are
11 deployed, and you know, that's the money we get each
12 year.

13 Beyond that... well, not beyond that...
14 underneath that, so to speak, the second piece of
15 this is the agreement that City Bridge and their
16 consortium have with... they do with the carriers,
17 sorry, for leasing those units as they get deployed.
18 That's a contract between them and the carriers,
19 right? Our revenue stream that we get from City
20 Bridge accounts for that, right? So it's X number of
21 units with X number of space, right? That's... I'm
22 sure there's an algorithm that they have, that we had
23 also, and I can, you know, kind of find some more
24 information on that. I'll talk to my team. But
25 that... nevertheless, it's more of a simplified

2 version for us, in that it is just a minimum annual
3 guarantee for which we collect that money. And it's
4 assumed that that they will get their leases and they
5 will take care of all that and so forth. So, you
6 know, we watch, we monitor, and we have a close
7 governance process with them, where we meet very
8 regularly. And nonetheless, from our perspective,
9 our view of things our revenue stream perspective is
10 the minimum annual guarantee. There's also the for-
11 born manual minimum annual guarantee, which is the
12 recoup of the money that was negotiated in the
13 agreement.

14 But as far as the leasing of space, yes,
15 that's... that's a way for them to make money. And
16 that is the underpinning for the amount of minimum
17 annual guarantee that we have with...with City
18 Bridge. So I hope that's a little more clear. If
19 not, I can...

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Yeah. So that's a way
21 for City Bridge... that City Bridge's additional
22 revenue.

23 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Yeah. That's
24 how they make their money to then set up... underpin
25 how they pay us, right? So it's... we don't get

2 involved with leasing, but it's assumed we do,
3 because we govern them, right? We want to make sure
4 these go in places that need them. I mentioned
5 before that 90% of the new units are going to be
6 above 96th Street, and you know, the other boroughs.
7 And so you know, as we deploy these units, when
8 they're ready, that... the leasing will then come
9 into play for the carriers, for where they need to
10 put their equipment.

11 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Got it. And I just want
12 to confirm... I think you may have covered it. So
13 the city... would the city receive any portion of
14 these payments for leasing 5G equipment from City
15 Bridge or lease use?

16 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Well, we
17 receive it as an avenue of the minimum annual
18 guarantee. That that's how we get that. It's...
19 they made forecasts, and we agreed with them based on
20 the money they think they're going to make, right?
21 And the number of more units that get out there, the
22 more that increases, and then there are... I'll call
23 it, I guess, accelerators at \$100 million and \$200
24 million if they happen to get that high. That's
25 where you know, we can actually make a little bit

2 more money. But that's a future tense thing, and we
3 have to see how the, how the carriers actually lease
4 the space in those, and we'll keep a close eye on
5 that. Like I said, we govern City Bridge pretty
6 closely, and we take this, you know, seriously in
7 terms of what they need to be doing.

8 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Absolutely. So with the
9 forecast then increased, as you see this down the
10 line, as you see more of their revenue increase,
11 would that mean more money for the city, essentially?

12 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: It could be
13 yes. And I'm happy to share details offline as to
14 what that means. It's... you know... it's, you know,
15 it has parameters and assumptions as any forecast
16 would. But yes, there's a baseline MAG, as they call
17 it, Minimum Annual Guarantee. And then if they hit
18 certain numbers, if it's super successful, so to
19 speak, then... then yeah, we can certainly make more
20 money off that. And there are provisions in the
21 agreement for that.

22 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Fantastic. And those are
23 benchmarks that DoITT has agreed to as well as part
24 of the contract?

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Yeah, it's in
3 the agreement that we signed last year. Just...
4 Yeah. Last year, or like the year prior. Sorry. My
5 timing is off.

6 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thanks. Thank you.
7 Thank you for that. So these are my last few
8 questions on... on some of the feedback that we got
9 from the... the LinkNYC hearing.

10 One of the questions that I had asked and I know
11 it went unanswered was: If you are aware of the
12 number of kiosks that are... are located near
13 homeless shelters and or NYCHA, but I... if you
14 can... if you have any of those numbers, I'm curious
15 to know if you're able to provide those numbers
16 today.

17 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: I can't provide
18 them today, but I have them. I just need to verify
19 them with City Bridge. So we followed up, as you can
20 imagine, we took the notes on that as well. We did
21 talk to City Bridge. They provided some preliminary
22 information. I just haven't had a chance to sift
23 through that with them to make sure I can tell you
24 intelligently and accurately that this is what we
25 have.

2 But they did provide them and I can at least give
3 you the context in terms of its X number within X 100
4 feet per... around the city. You know, to remember
5 also the units can't be installed in residential
6 districts right now. So you know, there's footage of
7 300 feet, 400 feet, 500 feet near a resident, and...
8 but it's obviously based on commercial or
9 manufacturing space that's nearby. So we have the
10 numbers, I just need to get through them and clean
11 them up. But sorry, that's a bad statement. Not
12 clean them up. Make sure I understand so that we can
13 intelligently tell you that... and accurately tell
14 you what they represent. But we do have a draft of
15 that already.

16 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. No, I got it.
17 I understand what you mean.

18 And then my last question is: Do you consider
19 the location of shelters and NYCHA developments when
20 you're siting the kiosks? I know earlier at the top
21 of the hearing, you mentioned obviously that those...
22 that the first round of the kiosks were being
23 installed where decommissioned pay phones were. But
24 I think obviously, when we're looking at a third of
25 the city lacking access to broad band, and when we're

2 talking about our... the communities that I think are
3 in most need of access. What... kind of... what is
4 the strategy now moving forward with the installation
5 of these new kiosks? And will you seriously consider
6 their distance to shelter... homeless shelters and
7 NYCHA developments?

8 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Yes, it's
9 definitely part of all the discussions. So what we
10 do is we work together with City Bridge to identify
11 areas where we need these now. In the agreement,
12 it's very specific to the number of equity districts
13 that were called out. And there's a certain number
14 of units that were targeted. I say targeted because
15 there could be more or less depending on our
16 discussions with the borough president and community
17 district... and community boards within those areas.
18 But yes, we not only replace DBTs, there are what we
19 call Greenfield locations, sites where we didn't
20 exist. And we are... we actively work with the...
21 the community members to make sure that that there...
22 that they have a say in where they go, as well as try
23 to promote other areas. Now we do have a say in
24 those commercial and manufacturing lanes for right
25 now, but we are hoping later this year to get

2 approval for the residential areas. And to me that
3 that's paramount, because it might be obvious that's
4 where we need it most. Right? And to your... to
5 your questioning about relative location to NYCHA
6 locations and shelters. Yes, that... we try to look
7 for areas that that need it the most and focus on
8 that. It's a big, big part of the Agreement that
9 was negotiated with them, and it's a big, big part of
10 what we need in the city. I think we all agree with
11 that. And we do lean on City Bridge hard to... to
12 keep that as the focus, and they've been great so far
13 with that in the new agreements.

14 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. Next, I'm
15 just going to transition over to the conversation
16 around staffing and vacancies. Commissioner. I know
17 you touched on a little bit on this on chair Branna's
18 questions. So at the... in the executive plan, the
19 fiscal 2023 budget for 311 Technical Support
20 decreases by \$21 million compared to the current
21 budget. The pandemic has shown how 311 services
22 are... were essential as New Yorkers rely on these
23 services. At our preliminary hearing you testify
24 that 311 is now stabilized. How will the budget
25 reduction impact 311 operation?

2
3 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So for the specifics around
4 the budget implications, I'll let Commissioner
5 Antonelli talk to some of that, but in terms of from
6 a service and quality perspective, a lot of the
7 agreements that we have in place that supplement 311
8 services as an overflow, is to ensure that when
9 someone calls, there is a reasonable wait time for
10 it... to answer that phone call. And especially
11 there are periods in time where we see bursts in
12 activities, whether that's whether that's during
13 storms or other high volume times, like during the
14 summer when fireworks are a big issue. So we want to
15 ensure that those base-level lines of support and
16 capabilities in our tool belt remain present. So
17 that's why some of those services that we employ
18 during the height of COVID are services that we will
19 keep running in the background at lesser scale. But
20 in terms of cost in any areas where 311 was directly
21 impacted, uh Joe?

22 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANTONELLI: Sure. I think
23 what the... the Chief Technology Officer highlighted
24 with the supplemental call taking services. That's
25 something that, since the height of COVID, has been

2 funded utilizing federal funding. The approximate
3 cost for that has been around \$24 million a year. So
4 the drop off in funding your seeing is that we don't
5 have any federal funding in the budget for next
6 fiscal year. We do anticipate, you know, working out
7 the funding issues with the Office of Management and
8 Budget, because we do plan on continuing the
9 services. So it's... it's more of just what you're
10 seeing in the budget versus actual operational
11 change.

12 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, that's good to
13 specify. So, um, so there's... you're not
14 anticipating there being a direct... like a big
15 impact of operations, okay.

16 Now, can we talk about the headcount reduction of
17 45 positions. Will that have an impact on 311
18 performance?

19 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANTONELLI: We don't
20 anticipate that that'll have an impact either. Well,
21 I don't know that 40... so 45 is not the correct
22 number. So there's 45 vacancies at 311 right now. A
23 reduction in headcount for 311, which was taken as a
24 part of the January plan was actually 17 heads.
25 So... but throughout the entire pandemic, and

2 historically, our call taker numbers have been at the
3 required levels that we need them to be at. So the
4 vacancy reductions are really happening largely in
5 administrative areas. So we don't... we don't
6 anticipate any sort of drop off in our call taking
7 ability.

8 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So we're, we're looking at
9 his holistically with 311, as... the Deputy
10 Commissioner just pointed out, we want to ensure that
11 (1) when someone picks up the phone and they dial
12 311, the quality of support that they get, and having
13 someone available to answer the phone is a priority.
14 And any area where we projected a cut does not impact
15 our capability to provide that basic level of
16 service. So like, as Commissioner Antonelli pointed
17 out, it's largely coming from administrative areas
18 which have no impact to our capability to answer and
19 triage phone calls.

20 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. I want to
21 just ask a question about 311 operations before
22 handing it off. I know we have a couple of
23 councilmembers with questions.

24 So regarding 311 operations, during the
25 preliminary budget hearing, we've... we've brought

2 questions regarding 311 complaints on homeless
3 individuals, are complaints on the 311 line related
4 to these individuals continuing... are they
5 continuing to be redirected to NYPD?

6 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So when you look at 311
7 just from an operations perspective, our... our
8 mandate... our mission around 311 phone calls is to
9 intake a call and brought them to the appropriate...
10 the appropriate entity. In terms of the processes
11 around homeless services, and who responds to
12 homeless-related complaints? I would respectfully
13 ask the chair to direct the questions to the NYPD and
14 the Department for Social Services as they are the
15 primary entities that are responsible in the city for
16 dealing with that. Our role is... is simply call
17 triaging and routing. And that... that's how we've
18 operated. That's how we will continue to operate.

19 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: But are they being
20 triaged to... I mean, I'm happy to ask this question
21 to PD and DSS, but are they being triaged to the PD,
22 for example? That's something that...

23 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So when... depending on the
24 type of call that comes in, and depending on the type
25 of complaint that comes in, related to a homeless

2 call, it could go to the NYPD or it could go to DSS,
3 or in some cases, it may need to be transferred to
4 911, depending on the egregiousness of the
5 interaction. So as it comes in, both PD and DSS have
6 a role. And in homeless-related phone calls, we
7 would have to break down a specific call type,
8 specific condition, to tell you specifically where it
9 would go. But short answer the question is: There a
10 portion of calls that are routed to PD, a portion
11 that are routed to DSS, a portion that are redirected
12 to 911, based on the call type.

13 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Yeah, I'm curious to
14 learn a little bit more about what that process is
15 for the operators. I know that they oftentimes are
16 encouraged to ask certain questions just to obviously
17 to better triage. And I know that there are certain
18 words that could trigger kind of where it gets
19 directed. I'm curious to know kind of what that
20 looks like and what those conversations look like, in
21 an effort to triage to the appropriate agency.

22 COMMISSIONER FRASER: It makes sense. We can
23 share... we can share a sample of what the decision
24 tree looks like when routing that, so that that gives
25 the insight that you need.

2 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. I'm just
3 going to ask a couple questions very quickly on the
4 capital plan, and then I'm going to pass it over. At
5 this point, what are the... what are DoITT's largest
6 challenges... what are DoITTs' challenges to their
7 biggest capital projects, excuse me.

8 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So challenges. I think, at
9 this point for a lot of what we're moving forward,
10 whether it's our foundational infrastructure programs
11 or any of our other outline programs that focus on...
12 that focus on replacing legacy infrastructure.
13 Are... there are less of... I phrase it less as
14 challenges, but more as complexities in dealing with
15 systems that are as old as and delicate as some of
16 the things that exist within the enterprise. And for
17 us from a funding perspective, our partners at the
18 Office of Management and Budget, and the Budget
19 Director has been very responsive to where the city
20 has priorities. So I don't think financially we face
21 challenges. Administratively, and the technical
22 complexity behind execution is where we're... that's
23 where we typically run into... run into run into
24 issues where we we've got to work around. But

2 there's... there's nothing notable worth mentioning
3 at this point.

4 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. Um, you
5 mentioned, I believe in your... your opening remarks
6 about modernization projects with 311. Are you
7 looking... is the department looking to add any
8 new... any other it modernization projects, and if
9 so, if you can share what those are.

10 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So as... as part of the
11 expanded scope of what the Office of Tech and
12 Innovation is responsible for, we consider it less of
13 what the... the legacy DoITT approach has been in
14 terms of hosting services, and looking at it through
15 that lens. But it's actually working as a business
16 partner with the city's various agencies and looking
17 at initiatives that are running within the... that
18 have been run traditionally within the departments
19 themselves. So when we have big tech initiatives or
20 programs that that have significant spend and
21 significant scope, working with the agencies to see
22 how those programs are moving, finding synergies and
23 combining efforts where necessary. It's the whole
24 goal of making sure that every taxpayer dollar goes
25 towards something that furthers the quality of life

2 of the person that lives in the city, and ensuring
3 that we as government are taking advantage of
4 opportunities where we're modernizing and one area
5 that we also expand it into other areas as well. So
6 we have 311, modernization. The big thing behind 311
7 is a system... it's a system that was commissioned
8 almost two decades ago. And from a
9 telecommunications perspective, it hasn't had a major
10 upgrade since. So what we're doing is we're taking
11 with create taking them the capabilities of a modern
12 call center, and bringing them into 311 not just
13 from... not just from a technical perspective, but
14 from a resiliency perspective. Being able to operate
15 at multiple sites, seamless failover, and expansion
16 of, you know, the quality of service that that people
17 get out of 311. As you mentioned, increased number
18 of languages, better location accuracy, you think
19 about a person that lives that... that's reporting an
20 abandoned vehicle. And I know this is one thing that
21 Councilmember Holden knows a lot... a lot about.
22 Someone calls in about a vehicle that's been
23 abandoned. And then you have someone that comes to a
24 location, because they can't find the street address,
25 or they can't specify, they have to go based on the

2 nearest location that they have. And with the
3 updates to 311, being able to pull GPS and be able to
4 use mapping services to give a more approximate
5 location of where they've seen the issue is going to
6 increase the quality of service not... not only do
7 they get out of 311, but to the entities that respond
8 to 311 related complaints.

9 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Thank you. Absolutely.
10 My last question related to capital is: We saw that
11 the... the capital plan includes \$17.4 million for
12 the implementation of a project named DoITT Alarming
13 ServiceNow? What... what is this project? What does
14 it entail? And what is the direct service?

15 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So the ServiceNow Program,
16 so the Alarming it's an interesting... it's an
17 interesting, uh...

18 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: What is it?

19 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So Service Now is a case
20 management system for service desk tickets. So when
21 you dial the city-wide service desk, and you say I
22 have a problem with a computer, or I have a problem
23 with the system or service, the system that the
24 problems logged in and then routed to someone to
25 triage. That's what ServiceNow does.

2 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: So this an internal edge
3 for the internal... for the employees. It's an
4 internal case management system?

5 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah, it's a case
6 management system for... for folks that work... for
7 people that work in the service desk, not limited to
8 OTI itself, but across the city. So there's a number
9 of agencies that are... that are dependent on what
10 was once Remedy. It's an old service desk ticket
11 system. We... we've updated that from Remedy to
12 ServiceNow.

13 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: Okay, fantastic. Thank
14 you. I'm going to pass it up to our moderator who
15 then will call on our members for questions. Thank
16 you.

17 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Chair Gutiérrez, always a
18 pleasure. Here. I'm not leaving. Don't thank me
19 yet though, but thank you, Commissioner and thank
20 you, Michael.

21 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you Chair. First we're
22 going to turn to Councilmember Brewer, followed by
23 Councilmember Williams, and then Councilmember
24 Holden. Councilmember Brewer?

2 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. I
3 have some little questions. And then couple of big
4 ones. The little ones are: We all care about NYCHA,
5 and in addition DoITT is also involved in the
6 Education Superhighway Group out of California. So I
7 wanted to know if you know, because I don't know the
8 group, if they can help with this issue of trying to
9 make sure that people can get online for \$30. That's
10 number one. Even though it's sometimes hard to work
11 with Spectrum and Verizon, in my experience.

12 Number two, with the franchises, I am concerned
13 about Manhattan Neighborhood Network, and the other
14 providers, and the city because obviously, we have
15 less cable, more online, the money comes from cable.
16 So I just don't know how you're going to handle that
17 issue. With the kiosks, I think there's two issues.
18 One... the current ones, as soon as _____ put them
19 in, I knew he was going to have a problem with the
20 Internet. So they cut it off, because too many
21 people were using it. So I just didn't know if they
22 would also be cut off and the new kiosks. And I know
23 in Manhattan, had to complain about the size of them.
24 So I assume you're aware of that.

2 On E-Rate, I wanted to know if they have them in
3 schools, libraries, and so on. I'd love it to be a
4 hotspot. I tried to go to the FAA and have not been
5 successful in the past, so that you're could have
6 opportunities for free Wi Fi in the area. I didn't
7 know if you were thinking about that. And in terms
8 of 311, you always have city employees, Keene, which
9 is your... I assume still your contracted agency, and
10 CUNY students. I just didn't know, you know, if
11 they're still the three partners. Obviously, we want
12 as many city employees as possible.

13 And then the larger questions are: There are a
14 lot of companies that want to provide internet
15 options and applied for the universal broadband
16 solicitation, as you know, but not all of them have
17 heard back from the city. So I wanted to know the
18 status of the Universal Broad Band Solicitation, and
19 I believe the last administration put in \$157
20 million, and I didn't know how the build out and the
21 \$157 million were coordinated.

22 And then of course, I'm always dealing with
23 the... the private providers, and they're always
24 challenging. But do we have a plan for how to make
25 it easier for companies to build the internet network

2 throughout the city, and my _____ sued Verizon
3 because they weren't doing it. And these new
4 broadband franchises are in place, but some of them
5 rely on Verizon to schedule conduit reviews, and, you
6 know, deal with the costs. And I just didn't know if
7 Verizon, at least in my opinion, is always slowing
8 things down. So I didn't know how you were dealing
9 with Verizon.

10 So those are, those are my questions. And thank
11 you very much.

12 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Councilmember, thank you
13 very much for the questions. So I will... I will try
14 to answer in succession and anywhere... any area
15 where I miss, please feel free to pull me... pull me
16 back in. So in the first question around education
17 superhighway in the work that the Councilmember did
18 in terms of partnering with them to increase the
19 advocacy and awareness of the program: There are
20 many entities that play in the space around advocacy,
21 and that we're able to partner with. And as the city
22 we are... we are exploring all opportunities to
23 leverage partners where... that can extend our voice
24 as far as possible about... especially about free
25 services that the city can leverage, that our

2 residents can leverage. So we are very open to
3 partnership opportunities, and we are actively
4 exploring all viable paths that we can do that with.
5 In terms of the viability in what we're doing
6 around...

7 In terms of what we're doing around the
8 availability of services, and what we're doing in
9 NYCHA as a whole. And exploring where how we can
10 expand that free \$30... use that \$30 per month of
11 broadband, the initiatives that we're focused on
12 right now is democratizing the process for
13 enrollment. So instead of having the tenant be
14 dependent on an individual process to connect with
15 the provider to come in and establish a service, it's
16 more so having a tenant connect with someone just to
17 schedule installation. And let's remove the burden
18 of them having to enroll with the service itself.
19 And as you've mentioned, sometimes dealing with the
20 companies can be a bit complex and navigating how you
21 get to these the service offerings it may be a bit a
22 bit challenging for... for the residents and that's
23 why we want to use our... this opportunity to
24 demystify and scale back the level of engagement
25 that's necessary to get this critical service.

2 So I'm going to pause there for a second and see
3 if that makes sense.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I'll probably follow up.
5 I don't want to take too many people's... I know
6 plenty of places like Silicon Harlem, there are three
7 such groups in Manhattan under the previous
8 administration. I don't quite know what they're
9 doing, except that trying to do the same thing. I
10 think it... it is complicated. I've been trying to
11 do this for many years. So, you know, and it's
12 carrier challenging, too, because in the past if you
13 didn't pay your bills.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

15 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: (inaudible) the key point.
16 I'm sorry. I can't describe it. We should talk
17 about it later at this point.

18 COMMISSIONER FRASER: No. We'll be very happy to
19 follow up offline on this front. And thank you,
20 thank you for all efforts that you've done in the...
21 in the past trying to push these things forward. I
22 mean, for us, it's important to have our allies and
23 advocates in the right places, and you are certainly
24 one of them.

25 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: And the franchises?

2
3 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So the franchise, can you
4 just...?

5 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: So the issue is, I think
6 they're up next year. They're not going to give you
7 cable money. So then what is going to happen with
8 all of the internet and so on, because they're not
9 going to get that cable money.

10 COMMISSIONER FRASER: And so we're... we're in
11 the process of... of exploring all of the existing
12 franchise agreements, and we're looking at those that
13 that are... that are up, and those that have lapsed,
14 and how we can bring them back into compliance and
15 standardize them in a way that continues to ensure
16 that the city collects revenue in the areas where
17 they're actually being utilized. So the team, both
18 from our general counsel's office, and our franchise
19 administration that are working very diligently to
20 try to bring these into compliance.

21 Now, this isn't this isn't an issue that that's
22 new this in this... in this space. I mean, a lot of
23 these agreements have been expired for... or have
24 been in an extension mode for years. So it is our
25

2 goal during this this administration's term to
3 rectify and establish a new baseline.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Are you going to worry
5 about the municipal channels and the (inaudible)?

6 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yes.

7 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: On E-rates, we all have
8 them in libraries and the schools. Do we make some
9 hotspots out of them?

10 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah, so we've been in a
11 lot of contact... a lot of conversation with the New
12 York Public Library, and a number of other entities
13 about having these.... using some of these community
14 sites, including libraries, as a hub for... for... as
15 they've been for generations, go to the library to
16 get a book, but you can also go to the library to
17 connect and leverage some of these services. So
18 we're in conversations to see how we can fast track
19 and partner on some of these efforts.

20 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Outside... outside into
21 neighborhood. That's what I mean. Outside.
22 Outside.

23 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Outside. Oh, outside, like
24 on the perimeter?

2 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Yeah. A hub. Hub.
3 Outside. We've been trying to do that. I just...
4 that's what I'm wondering.

5 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Oh, yeah. So there's... we
6 are actively pursuing not just in building but we're
7 also looking at... as we look at other areas, like
8 NYCHA developments. As we look at pursuing build
9 outs and other places like homeless shelters, not...
10 not just on the inside of the development or in the
11 units, but also in the common spaces, the atriums,
12 and in the public areas.

13 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Yeah, but with the
14 libraries and the schools, you have the E Rate. So
15 the FAA would have to agree to let's do it into the
16 neighborhood. That's a problem.

17 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah. So we... we will
18 follow up with you off offline on that front and make
19 sure that we're all working on the same page.

20 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: On 311, do you have... is
21 it still King and CUNY students and city employees?

22 COMMISSIONER FRASER: It is so.

23 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay. And then do you
24 have Spectrum. Does the city have spectrum?

25 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Spectrum?

2 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: On the clouds, you know,
3 buying spectrum? Did we buy spectrum? I don't know.
4 I was just wondering.

5 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Like... regular...?

6 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Broadway operates with
7 spectrum. HITN has spectrum.

8 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah. So the city, the
9 city owns various degrees of spectrum depending on
10 what you're looking at. So we own radio spectrum, we
11 own a number of other things that... like our public
12 safety channels are used for communication.

13 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: So at some point, if you'd
14 let us... let this committee know what we're paying
15 for it, though, and how much we have.

16 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Okay, sounds good.

17 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: And then the other issue
18 was just about the issue was just about the Universal
19 Broadband Solicitation, the \$157 million from the
20 last administration. What are we doing about that?

21 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So it's currently under
22 assessment and of the \$157 million, the vast majority
23 has not... the vast majority meaning... the
24 significant majority of that money has not been

2 touched as yet and we are trying to determine whether
3 we move forward with that or not.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: And then the issue with
5 the... again, challenging Verizon, just pushing them
6 to do what they're supposed to do. I assume you
7 continue to do that, because it's not easy to get
8 them to help with the build out, or to do what
9 they're supposed to do. I just didn't know where you
10 are with Verizon, and maybe others doing what they're
11 supposed to do, because they're not good at it.

12 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah. So I think... I
13 think historically, there's been a number of
14 challenges that's plagued both our franchise partners
15 in the space, and also a lot of the... a lot of the
16 entities that that are tasked with delivering. And I
17 think one of the things that we're doing is holding
18 them accountable. Right? So when they commit to
19 provide a service for the city, ensuring that that
20 service is provided in the time that they actually
21 commit to providing it, what we've seen historically
22 is big commitments and a limited amount of follow
23 through. And we are... we are, in terms of what this
24 administration's motto is, "get stuff done", we have

2 to ensure that we hold them accountable so we can get
3 the things done that we want to get done.

4 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much, Madam
5 Chair.

6 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. Councilmember
7 Williams.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

9 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you, Chair. I had
10 a lot of questions about 311. But the chair did such
11 an amazing job, so I won't spend so much time there.
12 Just to say I'm really interested in any outreach, or
13 budget to go to outreach. So a lot of people, of
14 course, we always tell folks in our office to call
15 311, call 311, but a lot of times, they don't know
16 how to navigate 311 and understand the process. And
17 so we've been thinking a lot about how to improve on
18 like educating people and outreach around 311. So
19 wanted to know if there's any allocations to outreach
20 in like education... education and training around
21 311.

22 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So for the budgetary
23 breakdown of anything that's specifically focusing on
24 outreach, I... my deputy commissioner for management

2 budget, Joe Antonelli, can... can talk a bit about
3 that... anything specific to that.

4 But before we get to that, one of the things I
5 want to mention is, as we look at 311 service
6 enhancements, what we're trying to do is rationalize
7 and simplify the way that people interact with both
8 the 311 mobile app and 311 website, and also looking
9 at how we can simplify the call tree when someone
10 dials 311. So for us, there's a lot that we can do
11 in terms of enhancing the quality of service that you
12 get other products that we issue. So we're actively
13 looking at a human-centric design model, actively
14 looking at how we can update those things to... to be
15 more compliant and easier to navigate. But, Joe,
16 anything specific on that front, you'd like to
17 mention?

18 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER ANTONELLI: Uh, there's
19 nothing specific that I have to mention. You know, I
20 don't have it have the budget down to that granular
21 level. But certainly, if there's specific outreach
22 that you wanted to do, you know, we'd be open to
23 having that conversation. And, you know, figuring
24 out how that could be funded.

2 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Yeah, I think just kind
3 of following up on the commissioners point, if we had
4 these products and services that we want people to
5 use that, for all intents and purposes, is useful, I
6 just want to make sure that people actually know how
7 to use the products and are aware of the product. So
8 Okay.

9 The next thing is, would you be able to share --
10 not now -- just like the timeline around
11 modernization of 311? And like, you know, exactly
12 what you plan to do in more detail? And this is like
13 a yes or no, because I don't... I don't want you to
14 explain it now. I just want to know, like, okay,
15 great, I would love to know that. And also I wanted
16 to flag if you all are thinking about user feedback.
17 So also kind of getting information from users on,
18 you know, what might make better sense to them, and
19 even working with Councilmember offices to think
20 through how we can improve the 311 system.

21 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yes, so I think when we
22 look at... we look at application development as a
23 whole, the feedback continuum is part of the process.
24 So measuring service, measuring satisfaction,
25 measuring and ease of use is something that we are

2 always open to doing. And as we look at these
3 enhancements, we are looking to also measure the
4 efficacy behind them to make sure that we're heading
5 in the right direction. And so to both your current
6 question and your previous question, yes, and yes.
7 And we will happily follow up.

8 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Awesome. And yes, I
9 would love to meet with you at some point soon. The
10 other two or... well, I don't have a lot of time. So
11 I know the mayor is really interested in
12 cryptocurrency and wondering like from your agency's
13 perspective, has there been any -- well, you know,
14 this is a budget meetings -- so is there any, like
15 budget allocations to kind of explore how the city
16 might manage cryptocurrency or you know, any anything
17 to that?

18 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So crypto is a big part
19 of... crypto... when we talk about blockchain and
20 Web3... it's a big part of how the tech ecosystem and
21 tech ecosystem has evolved. And from a FinTech
22 perspective, crypto represented a decade ago nothing,
23 but today it only represents over \$2 trillion In sort
24 of global investment, so for us as a city, it's one
25 of the areas where we have a vested interest in

2 ensuring that we create policies, and that we... we
3 ensure that our youth as they evolve into the working
4 space, have awareness of what these technologies are,
5 and that they... they're educated and capable of
6 growing and taking part of the next... the next phase
7 of the digital revolution.

8 So we're in the early stages of developing what
9 our... what our strategy is going to be in the
10 crypto-blockchain-Web3 space. We are working as...
11 as the mayor stated, he took his first three
12 paychecks in crypto. That's the initial sign of how
13 much we... how important the space is to him. And
14 we're currently working on building something out.

15 In terms of budget allocation for this: We're
16 leveraging our existing innovation pipeline and our
17 existing innovation budget to build our strategies
18 and policies around the stuff. So it's nothing
19 explicit that's in the budget, but it is a work in
20 progress as we speak.

21 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: And I would love to also
22 follow up with you. And Chairman, may I have just
23 one more minute. Okay.

24 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: One minute.

2 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: I have one minute. All
3 right. So I won't ask you this question... but just
4 in terms of, like, the automated decisions. I know,
5 this has been like a conversation in the past around
6 like the algorithms and so would love an update on
7 that at some point. Um, you guys put the timer for
8 one minute. I love that. Yeah, so I'd love some
9 information on that in the future, and again, as it
10 pertains to the budget, if we could follow up.

11 And then this could just be statement and follow
12 up question in my last 30 seconds, another point is
13 also wanting to see how we can like decentralize the
14 chain of command for like different agencies and even
15 community boards that always have to kind of go to do
16 it to like, make any changes, even if they're super
17 simple changes. And so I just wanted to have a
18 conversation, I understand budgetary, administrative-
19 wise, logistical-wise, programmatic-wise, if there's
20 any conversations around how to sort of like,
21 decentralize the authority around like, making
22 certain changes online for the agencies.

23 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

24 COMMISSIONER FRASER: So I think great, great,
25 questions. We're always looking for ways that we

2 could create broader levels of efficiency. So any
3 area where it's... the process is a bit cumbersome,
4 and we can... we can make it better, I'd be happy to
5 know. You know, if, they like they say... if you
6 want to make any positive change in any parts of the
7 way that you operate, it starts without having an
8 honest conversation about the ways that you can do
9 that and where we can and any areas where you see it,
10 I'm happy to have a discussion about it.

11 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you.

12 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you. And next we'll
13 turn to Councilmember Holden.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you chairs, and
16 thank you, Commissioner. I guess my... my I'll try
17 to be very brief. I guess my first question would be
18 directed to COO Michael McGrath. And, you know, I
19 mentioned this at the last hearing, but I'd like a
20 commitment, sort of, if you can do it, that these
21 LinkNYC kiosks could be -- when possible -- be
22 installed close to like bus stops, because my
23 constituents are... are asking for that. So can we
24 can we make that a priority? At least, where
25 possible?

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Yes,
3 councilmember, I'll say this: We have a list of
4 siting guidelines that we are governed by and
5 relevant... and proximity of us one unit to another,
6 you know, other street furniture, it's something we
7 need to consider. I will commit to you that we
8 will... I'll talk to the team about it and see what
9 we can come up with relative to ideas and possible
10 recommendations on what we could do. That... that I
11 can do, but right now, just based on the siting
12 guidelines and criteria, there are certain rules we're
13 bound by.

14 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: I get it. I know it's
15 difficult, especially we haven't even started to site
16 them in many locations, especially my district. But
17 you know, the ones I've had they... I've never seen
18 anybody using them. You know, that's the problem,
19 and what's the use of having them if they're not
20 going to be used? And I think... and I know they'd be
21 used near a bus stop.

22 But just a question on... Did I hear you
23 mentioned that the kiosk can't be installed within
24 500 feet of residential?
25

2 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: No, no, no. My
3 apologies. So the context of that statement was
4 relative to the to the chair's question of how close
5 are these... how many are close to NYCHA facilities
6 and/or homeless shelters, so to speak. The data that
7 I've gotten so far that I need to just go through and
8 review with the team before, I provide that answer...
9 those answers back is sort of a radial... radius type
10 of stat that we have. So there's X number of NYCHA
11 locations around the city, and there's this many
12 units within 300 feet of them just for now. That's
13 what I meant to convey there. If that wasn't clear,
14 so my apologies.

15 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: But what is the regulation
16 close to residential?

17 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Right now, it's
18 how the zones apply. So right now we can... we're...
19 we are approved to install the units in commercial
20 and manufacturing zones, for example. We are not
21 approved to install them in the strict residential
22 zones, that... that's the guidance... the guiding
23 principles we have.

24 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: But at the last hearing, I
25 mentioned... you answered me, because I said, I have

2 a lot of mixed-use areas, just like the chair has.
3 So if it's residential is... let's say, would it be
4 right outside a window of a residential, if somebody
5 is on the second floor above the store.

6 CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER MCGRATH: Right, and my
7 apologies. Mixed use is approved as well. And so
8 with that, there's... again, I refer back to the
9 siting guidelines for how we can install them, and
10 where we can install them. There's things like: You
11 can't put them outside of the doorways, you know,
12 adjacent to doorways, out by the curb, and so forth.
13 And so I'd be happy to talk to you offline about
14 that, in terms of the details of how the site...
15 siting guidelines work. And if there's some ideas
16 there, and we can maybe put forward some
17 recommendations on how to change them, that's fine,
18 too. But again, it's going to have to go relative
19 to all the siting guidelines.

20 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Right, okay. We'll get
21 into it I guess... we'll get into the trenches
22 when... when this thing... when they start to be
23 installed.

24 And I guess this is a directed to Commissioner
25 Fraser: As far as 311 was mentioned, you mentioned

2 about the mapping locations, which has always been a
3 sore point. I'm... you know, I'm glad you're working
4 on that. And I forgive me if I mentioned this at our
5 at our meeting, but I'm getting forgetful in my old
6 age, but can we add photography submissions, not only
7 you know, more of that, you know, we ended it for our
8 parking violations, which is wonderful, because we're
9 getting a lot more attention to the... to the
10 violations with... with the photography. But on the
11 other end, can we do... can we get agencies to
12 photograph, let's say, a violation of a sanitation,
13 let's say... a dirty sidewalk, where we wouldn't go
14 back and forth as much when you can show the
15 storekeeper or the resident here, here's what your
16 sidewalk looked like. So you submit a photograph.
17 Is that possible?

18 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yup. So in terms of in
19 terms of "possible", everything... there's a lot...
20 everything is possible. In terms of effort, we
21 will... we will follow up offline, but we will
22 certainly unpack and see areas where we can continue
23 to expand this capability. I mean, Councilmember,
24 you've been... you've been a big advocate and helped
25 refine 311 to what it is today. And we will continue

2 to leverage that partnership to make... help... help
3 us be our best selves. So we'll... we'll take this
4 away. We'll see what we can do in... in the near
5 term, but certainly mid term and long term, certainly
6 possible.

7 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah. When I mentioned in
8 the pre... excuse me. When I mentioned in the
9 previous council, I got like pushback, "Well, we'd
10 have to buy, you know, phones for the agents or the
11 officers." But this would minimize... you know, and
12 I think especially in sanitation, or any anything,
13 even buildings. If this comes up, where somebody
14 say, "Oh, I didn't have that commercial van parked in
15 my driveway," or "I didn't have, you know, the dirty
16 sidewalk," you'd be able to show them the condition
17 at the time of inspection. And that would minimize
18 the kind of court fights that go back and fourth. So
19 I just think it just... using the technology that we
20 have today in the best possible way, at the time of
21 the summons, you especially get the pushback in
22 sanitation. Because I constantly get storekeepers
23 saying, you know I sweep every you know, few hours.
24 And this is baloney is a popsicle stick that I was I
25 was summoned for so I think that would...

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

3 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: ...that would help. So
4 thank you. Thank you, Commissioner. And thank you
5 Chairs.

6 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Yeah, I just would like to
7 clarify: Technically, making the capability possible
8 is something we can certainly work on. But in terms
9 of operationalizing... working with the entities that
10 are responding we'd have to work with... with them on
11 on how it's actually operationalized. But as always
12 your... your great ideas, and let's... let's see how
13 we can push it out.

14 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Well, I love the app, and
15 I... I'm just trying to push on every one of my
16 constituents that... I ask them to use 311. The app
17 is great, and I thank you for that. Thanks so much.

18 COUNSEL BUTEHORN: Thank you, Councilmember
19 Holden and Chairs Brannan and Gutiérrez. I'll...
20 excuse me... I'll turn it back to you. We have no
21 more counselor questions for DoITT.

22 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Jen-Gu, you got something?

23 CHAIRPERSON GUTIÉRREZ: I just want to thank
24 everybody. Thank you to the Commissioner. Thank you
25 to the DoITT Team for... for today, for your

2 responses, and just a shout out to my committee team
3 for... for all of your assistance in preparing for
4 today. I'm looking forward to continuing this
5 conversation, and how to just create more access and
6 equity for... for all of our constituents.

7 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Right on. Thank you so
8 much. Thank you to all my colleagues. Thank you,
9 Commissioner Fraser and your team for answering all
10 of our questions. If there's anything that we need
11 more clarity on, we will send it in written form, and
12 it'll help in our negotiation process.

13 So thank you to the whole finance team. Malcom,
14 thank you so much. And with that, this hearing is
15 adjourned.

16 [GAVEL}

17 COMMISSIONER FRASER: Thank you.

18 MS. ANDERSON: I'm going to end the live stream
19 now.

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 06/20/2022