

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

December 20, 2018  
Start: 1:56 p.m.  
Recess: 3:54 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers - City Hall

B E F O R E: Corey Johnson  
Speaker

COUNCIL MEMBERS: Adrienne Adams  
Alicka Ampry-Samuel  
Diana Ayala  
Inez D. Barron  
Joseph Borelli  
Justin Brannan  
Fernando Cabrera  
Margaret S. Chin  
Andy Cohen  
Costa G. Constantinides  
Robert Cornegy, Jr.  
Chaim Deutsch  
Ruben Diaz  
Daniel Dromm  
Rafael Epsinal  
Mathieu Eugene  
Deborah L. Gibson  
Mark S. Gjonaj  
Robert F. Holden  
Ben Kallos  
Andy L. King

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

## Council Members:

Peter A. Koo  
Karen Koslowitz  
Rory I. Lancman  
Brad S. Lander  
Stephen T. Levin  
Mark Levine  
Alan N. Maisel  
Carlos Menchaca  
I. Daneek Miller  
Francisco Moya  
Bill Perkins  
Keith Powers  
Joseph Borelli  
Antonio Reynoso  
Donovan J. Richards  
Ydanis Rodriguez  
Deborah L. Rose  
Helen K. Rosenthal  
Rafael Salamanca  
Ritchie J. Torres  
Eric A. Ulrich  
Paul A. Vallone  
James G. Van Bramer  
Kalman Yeger  
Steven Matteo  
Laurie A. Cumbo

Larry Marks  
Chief Administrative Judge

Cathy Wylde  
President and CEP of Partnership for New York

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Robert Haig  
Chair of Commercial Division Advisory Council

Father Joe Holcomb

1  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Today, if members  
3 could join me, and if people could begin to take  
4 their seats, we're about to begin. That's right,  
5 we're all-- Council Member Lancman is here,  
6 wonderful. Good afternoon. Today, the New York City  
7 Council is proud to honor the New York Supreme Court  
8 Commercial Division for its extraordinary service to  
9 our community and national economy. For those who do  
10 not know, the Commercial Division is an important  
11 forum for addressing complex commercial disputes.  
12 Local businesses rely on this division for efficient  
13 resolution of commercial disputes and litigants all  
14 over the world look to the Commercial Division's  
15 expertise across the board. They have truly  
16 distinguished itself in its approach to helping  
17 others and making it a model for other courts,  
18 criminal and civil, and we wish them continued  
19 success for many years to come. So, I'm going to ask  
20 some of the folks of the Commercial Division that are  
21 here to receive this proclamation to please come up.  
22 As you can see how expedient they are, they are here  
23 already. Don't play around. I could go in your court  
24 any day; it's efficient. Larry Marks, Chief  
25 Administrative Judge, Kathy Wylde, President and CEP

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   5  
2   of Partnership for New York, and Robert Haig, partner  
3   at Kelly Drye and Chair of the Commercial Division  
4   Advisory Council. On behalf the City Council and  
5   Council Members Rory Lancman and Paul Vallone, we  
6   congratulate you and thank you for your service to  
7   our city, and we are so thankful that you are here  
8   today. We are going to turn it over to the City  
9   Clerk who is going to read the proclamation, and then  
10   we are going to have words from both Council Member  
11   Lancman as well as Council Member Vallone.

12           COUNCIL CLERK: Council City of New York  
13   Proclamation: The New York City Council is proud to  
14   honor the New York Supreme Court Commercial Division  
15   for its invaluable service to our business community  
16   and to our national economy, and whereas in an era  
17   when the economy is largely a reflection of  
18   globalization and international trade, New York City  
19   remains the Center of the business universe. In such  
20   a competitive environment, business often choose to  
21   locate their headquarters where they have access to  
22   efficient, fair, and predictable resolution of  
23   commercial disputes. New York owes much of its  
24   world-class status as an economic engine to its  
25   world-class court, the Commercial Division of the New

2 York Supreme Court, and whereas the Commercial  
3 Division is a critically important forum for  
4 addressing complex commercial disputes. Litigants  
5 all over the world look to the Commercial Division's  
6 incredible expertise across the board and complex  
7 expanse of commercial law to reach successful and  
8 efficient resolutions, and whereas the Commercial  
9 Division is uniquely qualified to increase taxable  
10 revenue for the City of New York while stimulating  
11 job growth. It strengthens New York City's ability  
12 to attract and retain businesses which add jobs, fuel  
13 demand for real property, and increase tax revenue.  
14 The tax revenues from local businesses also provide  
15 financial support for the New York State Judicial  
16 System, and whereas local businesses rely on the  
17 Commercial Division for efficient, just resolution of  
18 complex commercial disputes without which businesses  
19 would be less inclined to reside and conduct business  
20 in New York City. leaders of national and global  
21 businesses located within our five boroughs recognize  
22 the significant role that specialized business courts  
23 play in their business decisions, and whereas, the  
24 New York Supreme Court Commercial Division has truly  
25 distinguished itself in its responsive, creative, and

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   7  
2    adaptive approach making it an influential model for  
3    other courts, both civil and criminal, and we wish it  
4    continued success in the years ahead. Now therefore  
5    be it known that the New York City Council is proud  
6    to honor the New York Supreme Court Commercial  
7    Division for its extraordinary service to New York  
8    City. Corey Johnson, Speaker for the entire Council,  
9    Laurie A. Cumbo, Majority Leader, Rory I. Lancman,  
10   Chair Committee on the Justice System, and Paul A.  
11   Vallone, Chair of Committee on Economic Development.

12           COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Wow. Thank you so  
13   much, and I want to thank both of my colleagues for  
14   bringing forward here today because you're really  
15   those unsung heroes that don't get enough attention  
16   or accolades or recognition for the incredible work  
17   that you do, much of it I'm sure behind the scenes,  
18   but we really appreciate all that you do for the City  
19   of New York. Council Member Lancman?

20           COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Thank you,  
21   Majority Leader Cumbo, and to my colleagues who are  
22   here today, thank you very much for joining with us  
23   in honoring and celebrating the Commercial Division  
24   and its extraordinary accomplishments to our city, to  
25   our legal system. As Chair of the Committee on the

2 Justice System with some oversight of our courts, I  
3 know how extraordinarily complex and diverse our  
4 court system is, and that reflects this  
5 extraordinarily diverse and complex city. And if we  
6 are going to continue to be the commercial capital of  
7 the country and enjoy all the benefits of being the  
8 center of commerce here in the United States, we need  
9 to have a legal system that can support the  
10 resolution of disputes of caliber and a kind that our  
11 major corporations find themselves in. The  
12 Commercial Division really has earned a distinction  
13 around the world as being a leading forum for  
14 resolution of commercial disputes. And companies,  
15 when they are thinking about whether or not they want  
16 to grow and even come to New York City, something  
17 that's one their mind has got to be whether or not if  
18 they find themselves in a dispute of some kind,  
19 whether or not there's a forum that is capable of  
20 adjudicating that dispute efficiently, transparently,  
21 and with some measure of predictability. And that,  
22 the Commercial Division has brought and benefitted  
23 the entire city. And for that, we're particularly  
24 grateful. I want to thank the Chief Administrative  
25 Judge Larry Marks, Robert Haig from Kelly Drye who



1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   9  
2   has been champion of the Commercial Division for so  
3   long, and of course, Kathy Wylde representing the  
4   corporate community. With that, if I may, I'd like  
5   to ask our Council Member Paul Vallone who chairs the  
6   Committee on Economic Development.

7           COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Thank you,  
8   Council Member Lancman and Majority Leader. Just  
9   quickly, thank you to Council Member Lancman for  
10  acknowledging the hard work of the Commercial  
11  Division, and thank you to the team that is here as  
12  almost 27 years as a lawyer and spending many of days  
13  prior to this life walking into the courts having the  
14  best of every department here in New York they  
15  practice as an attorney, a privilege and an honor,  
16  and thank you for all the hard work, especially as  
17  the Chief Judge. New York State sets the bar for  
18  every other court and every other system to follow.  
19  And it's proud as a lawyer for us to have small  
20  things like this, like a proclamation to say thank  
21  you to all of the work that you have done, the bar  
22  that you have set, and what we all try to attain in  
23  the legal system with honor. So, thank you very much  
24  for that, a well-earned [inaudible].

25

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   10

2                   COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:   And would a  
3 representative from the group like to speak?

4                   UNIDENTIFIED:   Thank you so much.   Thank  
5 you for this proclamation.   I can really say that  
6 the Commercial Division has been one of the most  
7 successful initiatives that we implemented in the  
8 state court system, and that's because we strongly  
9 believe that if the-- if businesses don't feel  
10 confident that they can bring their legal disputes  
11 into the New York Courts had have them adjudicated  
12 efficiently and fairly, that they will take their  
13 business elsewhere along with the jobs that they  
14 provide and the jobs that they create, and actually,  
15 research has documented that.   It's not just a  
16 theoretical concern.   It's a reality that's been  
17 documented.   And I should add that the -- New York is  
18 a member of an international organization that was  
19 formed a couple of years ago.   It's called the  
20 Standing International Forum of Commercial Courts,  
21 and we're a member of that organization, and  
22 countries from around the world are part of that  
23 organization and they look to the Commercial Division  
24 in this state for best practices and model  
25 procedures.   So, we're very proud of that, and again,

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   11

2   I want to thank the City Council for their support  
3   and recognition. Thank you.

4           [applause]

5           COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Can we do a group  
6   photo? Alright.

7           [break]

8           SERGEANT AT ARMS: Could I have your  
9   attention, please? Can I please have your  
10   attention? Quiet on the floor, please. Quiet on the  
11   floor, please. Quiet on the floor, please. At this  
12   time, please place all electronic devices to vibrate,  
13   all electronic devices to vibrate, all electronic  
14   devices to vibrate. Will all non-council employees,  
15   all non-council employees please leave the main floor  
16   of the chambers. There is additional seating  
17   upstairs in the balcony. Madam?

18           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
19   Chambers, please. All rise for the Pledge of  
20   Allegiance. I pledge allegiance to the flag of the  
21   United States of America and to the Republic for  
22   which it stands, one nation, under God, indivisible,  
23   with liberty and justice for all. Please be seated.  
24   Roll call?

25           COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 12

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Present.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Present.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Present.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Present.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli? Brannan?

10 Cabrera? Chin?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN: Here.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Here.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

15 CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES: Here.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Present.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Here.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Presente.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Here.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 13

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene? Gibson?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I am here.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Present.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I am here.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Here.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos? King? Koo?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: I am here.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Thank you. Kallos?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Here.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Here.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

17 CHAIRPERSON LANCMAN: here.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander? Levin? Levine?

19 Maisel?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Here.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Presente.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Here.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya? Perkins?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 14

2 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Present.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso? Moya? Powers?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Here.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Here.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Present.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez? Rose?

10 Rosenthal?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Here.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Present.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Here.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Here.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes, I'm here.

20 COUNCIL CLERK: King?

21 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: Present.

22 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Here.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA: Here.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 15

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Here.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Williams?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm here, check  
6 me in two months.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Here.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Here.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Here.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Here.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Present.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I'm here.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Quiet

20 in the Chambers, please. All rise for the

21 invocation. The invocation will be delivered by

22 Father Joe Holcomb from Saint Andrew Avellino at 35-

23 60 158<sup>th</sup> Street in the great borough of Queens.

24 Quiet in the Chambers.

25

2 FATHER JOE HOLCOMB: Let us place  
3 ourselves in the presence of almighty God. All  
4 powerful and merciful God, we praise you and give you  
5 thanks for all your gracious gifts, most especially  
6 the gift of your infinite and unconditional love. It  
7 is your gift of love that inspires and drives each of  
8 us to seek peace and justice throughout our city, our  
9 nation, and our world. To gain awareness that we  
10 share a common destiny, which is ultimately  
11 transcendent, peace that is not the mere absence of  
12 violence, but as a harmonious co-existence of  
13 individual citizens within a society governed by  
14 justice, one in which the good is also achieved for  
15 each and every one of them. Help us through your  
16 gift of love to work diligently in these coming days,  
17 months and years to seek peace for all in our great  
18 city. May your deliberations in this, the City  
19 Council of the City of New York, bring about  
20 understanding, tolerance, and peace in our city, in  
21 our nation, and in our world. We pray this in your  
22 holy name, amen.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen. Please be  
24 seated, and now Father-- and now a member of Father  
25 Holcomb's flock, Council Member Vallone will spread



1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   17  
2   the invocation in full upon the record.  Quiet in the  
3   Chambers, please.

4           COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE:  Thank you, Madam  
5   Advocate.  Father Joseph Holcomb serves as the Pastor  
6   of Saint Andrew Avellino Roman Catholic Church in  
7   Queens, New York, the parish my family calls home.  A  
8   native New Yorker, Father Holcomb attended Holy  
9   Family Catholic Grammar School, Cathedral Preparatory  
10   Seminary, Cathedral College of the Immaculate  
11   Conception, and Seminary of the Immaculate  
12   Conception.  He went on to attain a Bachelor's Degree  
13   from Cathedral College in Douglas, New York, received  
14   a Master's Degree in Divinity from Immaculate  
15   Conception Seminary, and a Master's in Social Work  
16   from Fordham University.  He was ordained to the  
17   Priesthood in 1980 and has been faithfully serving  
18   multiple communities ever since.  In July 2009, he  
19   was appointed as the sixth Pastor of Saint Andrew  
20   Avellino Roman Catholic Church, and has worked  
21   tirelessly to make improvements on the first day at  
22   our parish.  His faith and dedication pours into  
23   every member of our family as well as the surrounding  
24   community.  According to Father Holcomb, over the  
25   past century the Church has had the most vocations to

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   18  
2   the Priesthood or religious life including nuns and  
3   bothers of any church in the United States. His  
4   efforts have led to the crucial enhancements at the  
5   Church and a newly enriched connection with his  
6   parishioners.  Father Holcomb's work in the Church  
7   with the Children of Our Academy, of which all three  
8   of my children have attended, has touched thousands  
9   of lives and we are so privileged to have him here in  
10  our Queens community.  On a personal note, during  
11  this difficult time for my family, a time where great  
12  healing and faith was needed for my wife and  
13  children, Father Joe has provided that bond with his  
14  prayers for each one of us.  I am so grateful that  
15  each one of my fellow Council Members and family here  
16  at City Hall have now received that same blessing.  
17  Thank you, Father Joe.

18           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:  Bless you father.  
19  Thank you for your prayer today.  Thank you.  
20  Adoption of minutes, Council Member Moya?  Motion  
21  that the minutes of the Stated Meeting of November  
22  14<sup>th</sup> be adopted as printed.  Messages and papers from  
23  the Mayor?

24           COUNCIL CLERK:  None.

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 19

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Communication  
3 from City, County, and Borough Offices?

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M121 and  
5 M122, budget documents.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Finance.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Petitions and  
8 communications?

9 COUNCIL CLERK: None.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Land Use Call-  
11 ups?

12 COUNCIL CLERK: M123.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Roll call at this time.  
14 I ask for a roll call vote on all of today's items on  
15 the Land Use Call-up Calendar, just the Land-Use  
16 Call-up Calendar.

17 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
18 Chambers.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: I vote aye on all.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Ampry-Samuel?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: Permission  
23 to comment on the Land-Use Call-up in my district.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes, Council  
25 Member.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL: This

3 housing development project that's on the grounds of  
4 Marcus Garvey Village ignited some really heated  
5 community conversations, and negotiations that have  
6 direct impact on not just the existing residents of  
7 Marcus Garvey, but also the nearby churches and the  
8 community as a whole. The original proposal included  
9 724 units across seven buildings that went up 12  
10 stories in an already dense community, but with  
11 several months of advocated-- several months of some  
12 serious advocating on behalf of the community about  
13 what's best for the community, I'm glad we have come  
14 to some form of middle ground. I'm glad that we'll  
15 be able to see eventually affordable housing 80  
16 percent under 60 percent AMI and the other 20 percent  
17 between 61 and 80 percent AMI, and that's truly  
18 affordable for the Brownsville community. And so,  
19 I'm proud to be able to vote on this particular  
20 project, and I look forward to really working with  
21 Marcus Garvey and the L&M developers on behalf of the  
22 community in collaboration with my colleague Council  
23 Member Barron in the months and years to come. So  
24 with that, I'm going to vote aye on all the Land-Use  
25 Call-ups, but I also ask for permission to be able to

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   21  
2   couple items on the General Order Calendar in all  
3   resolutions.

4           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Yes.

5           COUNCIL MEMBER AMPRY-SAMUEL:   Thank you  
6   so much, and happy holidays to everyone.

7           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Thank you.   Happy  
8   holidays.

9           SPEAKER JOHNSON:   I like that sweater.

10          COUNCIL CLERK:   Ayala?

11          COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA:   Aye on all.

12          COUNCIL CLERK:   Barron?

13          COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON:   Aye on all and  
14   I'll hold my comments for when it's presented.   Thank  
15   you.

16          COUNCIL CLERK:   Borelli?   Brennan?  
17   Cabrerera?

18          CHAIRPERSON CABRERA:   Aye.

19          COUNCIL CLERK:   Chin?

20          COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN:   Aye on all.

21          COUNCIL CLERK:   Cohen?

22          COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN:   Aye.

23          COUNCIL CLERK:   Constantinides?

24          CHAIRPERSON CONSTANTINIDES:   Aye.

25          COUNCIL CLERK:   Cornegy?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 22

2 COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Aye on all.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Deutsch?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH: Aye.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Aye [sic].

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Dromm?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM: Aye.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Espinal?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene? Gibson?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: I vote aye.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Aye.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Aye.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Aye.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: King?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: With your

23 permission, can I vote on all Land-Use Call-Ups and

24 then everything on the calendar today?

25 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 23

2 COUNCIL MEMBER KING: I vote aye on all.

3 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

5 COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Aye.

6 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

7 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: Aye.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: Aye.

10 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander? Levin?

11 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Aye.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Aye.

14 COUNCIL CLERK: Maisel?

15 COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL: Yes.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Menchaca?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA: Aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet. Quiet in  
20 the Chambers, please.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Moya?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: Aye.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Perkins?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS: Aye on all.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Powers?

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 24

2 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye on all.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

4 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Reynoso? Richards?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Aye on all.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Rivera?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Aye on all.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: Aye.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Rose? Rosenthal?

12 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: Aye on all.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres? Treyger?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: Aye.

17 COUNCIL CLERK: Ulrich?

18 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Yes.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Aye on all.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer? Williams?

22 Yeger?

23 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Aye.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Matteo?

25 COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO: Aye on all [sic].



1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 25

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

3 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Aye.

4 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 Today's Land-Use Call-Ups are adopted by a vote of 43  
8 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative. Quiet in the  
9 Chambers as we now hear from the Speaker, Corey  
10 Johnson.

11 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Good afternoon. Thank  
12 you all for being here with us this Thursday, our  
13 last Stated Meeting of 2018, and--

14 [applause]

15 SPEAKER JOHNSON: we have a busy agenda  
16 ahead of us. Before we get into our agenda, I want  
17 us to take some time to send my best wishes and the  
18 best wishes of the entire City Council to the seven  
19 firefighters who were injured in Sunnyside Queens  
20 last week responding to a fire in Council Member Van  
21 Bramer's District. To the FDNY I say, and I know all  
22 of us say thank you. Thank you for your bravery and  
23 your courage, and our thoughts continue to be with  
24 the Sunnyside community and the members of the FDNY  
25 and their families who were injured last week. I

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   26  
2   also want to take this time to acknowledge the loss  
3   of again, two 9/11 First Responders who we have lost  
4   since our last Stated Meeting.  Detective Steven  
5   Mullen and Lieutenant Jennifer Meehan both died from  
6   illnesses they developed during their time serving  
7   down at Ground Zero.  Let's remember Detective Mullen  
8   and Lieutenant Meehan, and keep their families in our  
9   hearts.  We are forever grateful to these heroes for  
10  their sacrifice.  I am also sad to note that today,  
11  today is a very somber anniversary here in New York  
12  City.  four years ago today, two police officers were  
13  assassinated in their car, targeted for their  
14  uniforms that they wore while they were protecting  
15  and serving our city as they were sworn to do,  
16  Detectives Wen Jen Lu [sp?] and Rafael Ramos [sp?]  
17  were taken from us and from their loved ones four  
18  years ago today.  We will never forget them.  We will  
19  forever their memories, and so I'd ask everyone to  
20  please rise and take a moment of silence in memory of  
21  Detectives Mullen, Lieutenant Meehan, Detective Lieu  
22  [sp?], and Detective Ramos.

23                           [moment of silence]

24                   SPEAKER JOHNSON:  Thank you.  I apologize  
25  if it's Detective Ramos, not Ramos, Ramos.  I'd also

2    like to acknowledge a few staff members who are  
3    leaving us, sadly. They won't be with us at the  
4    beginning of next year. We're losing Yuriv Veet  
5    [sp?] this week. He has been at the Council for  
6    several years. First, with the Community Engagement  
7    Division, and most recently with the Finance  
8    Division. Yuriv, we wish you luck and we want to  
9    thank you for all that you have done here at the  
10   Council. Where is he? Is he here? He left. See  
11   ya. We also are saying goodbye to Jeanette Merrill  
12   [sp?] from the Finance Division. Jeanette was with  
13   us for three years covering the Health Committee and  
14   the Hospital Committee and the Mental Health  
15   Committee. I got to work with Jeanette when I was  
16   Chair of the Health Committee. Jeanette, I want to  
17   thank you for everything you did for me when I was  
18   Chair of the Health Committee. I want to thank you  
19   for everything you've done for the current Chairs and  
20   for the Council as a whole. I'm really grateful for  
21   all the work we've done together, especially all the  
22   work you did with me on HIV and AIDS funding. So, I  
23   want to thank you, and I want to wish you best in  
24   your next chapter. If we could have a round of

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   28

2   applause for Yuriv and Jeanette. Jeanette's in the  
3   back. Jeanette, if you could stand up?

4                   [applause]

5           SPEAKER JOHNSON: There is someone else  
6   who is leaving us in 2019 that I want to acknowledge.  
7   Today, is our final Stated Meeting with our Public  
8   Advocate Letitia James.

9                   [applause]

10          SPEAKER JOHNSON: Yay, we got the cake.  
11   Tish James has been a proud fighter for all New  
12   Yorkers as Public Advocate. I am so sad to see her  
13   leave us today. The good news is for us is that she  
14   is going to-- the good news for us-- Majority Leader,  
15   the good news for us is that Letitia James is going  
16   to continue to fight for all of us in her new role as  
17   the next Attorney General of the State of New York.  
18   Tish is a dear, dear, dear, dear friend of mine,  
19   someone who I love, and I know she's a dear friend of  
20   most people here, and I know that I speak for all of  
21   us when we say go get 'em Tish. We are so proud of  
22   you. We are so proud of you. We are excited for  
23   what you're going to do, and let me say, if I was  
24   breaking the law in the State of New York, which I am  
25   not, I would be terrified right now of the thought of

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   29  
2   Attorney General Tish James coming after me. I'd be  
3   losing sleep. So, Tish, you're going to crush it. I  
4   can't wait to watch you and root for you. We love  
5   you, Tish James. Another big round of applause for  
6   the amazing Public Advocate, Letitia James.

7                           [applause]

8           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And this is Cake  
9   Man from Fort Greene.

10           SPEAKER JOHNSON: Can someone blow those  
11   candles out? Tish, did you want to say anything, or  
12   do you want to hold it 'til later?

13           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: I want to hold it.

14           SPEAKER JOHNSON: You'll hold it, okay.

15   Okay, we're going to-- if folks could sit down. Now  
16   we're going to jump into our docket for the day.  
17   Now, the Council will vote on the following Land Use  
18   items, a preliminary-- by the way, Tish James said to  
19   me on the steps this morning of City Hall, "You  
20   better not do anything to single me out today, you  
21   hear me? You hear me?" I said, "Tish, come on." I'm  
22   not joking. Then I said, "Just wait, Tish." So we're  
23   going to vote on the following Finance items: The  
24   Preliminary Budget extender allowing Mayor de Blasio  
25   to submit the Fiscal Year 2020 Preliminary Budget by

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   30  
2   February 7<sup>th</sup>, an expense budget modification, and a  
3   revenue budget modification implementing the changes  
4   to the Fiscal 2019 November plan, and 20 Article XI  
5   property tax exemptions preserving a total of 1,069  
6   units of affordable housing.  These properties are  
7   located in Council Member Cabrera, Gjonaj, Diaz,  
8   Salamanca, Gibson, Cohen, and Rivera's Districts.  
9   The Council will vote on the following Land Use  
10  items: The Council will vote to approve zoning text  
11  amendments to modify the special Garment Center  
12  District to allow for the conversion of buildings  
13  from manufacturing to office space, standardized sign  
14  regulations, modified bulk regulations to ensure  
15  conformance of historical context with the purpose of  
16  revitalizing garment manufacturing in this area.  
17  There's been a tremendous amount of work, a  
18  tremendous amount of work for years, and I want to  
19  acknowledge my partner in this effort, our great  
20  Borough President Gale Brewer.  I'd also like to  
21  thank the New York City Economic Development  
22  Corporation President James Patchett, the Garment  
23  District Steering Committee, and so many others who  
24  have been crucial helping make this reality.  I want  
25  to thank my District Chief of Staff, Eric Botcher,

2 and my District Director Matt Green [sp?]. Together,  
3 we are taking a big step towards ensuring the garment  
4 manufacturing industry has a permanent home in New  
5 York City. The Garment District is an integral part  
6 of our city's economy and the New York fashion  
7 industry, and today we're making sure that it will  
8 flourish for years to come. The Council will vote to  
9 approve with modifications, a zoning text amendment  
10 proposed by the New York City Department of City  
11 Planning to establish restrictions on hotel  
12 development with an M1 light manufacturing district  
13 citywide. I want to thank our Chairs, Chair Rafael  
14 Salamanca and chair Francisco Moya, for working  
15 together with their colleagues to shepherded [sic]  
16 this thorough the Council. It was not easy, and  
17 Francisco and Rafael have worked tremendously on this  
18 over the last year. SO I'm very, very grateful for  
19 all the work that they've done. We also want to vote  
20 on the Franklin Avenue rezoning and the designation  
21 of a mandatory inclusionary housing area Option One.  
22 During negotiations, Majority Leader Cumbo secured  
23 commitments from the applicant to increase onsite  
24 affordable housing as well as the significantly  
25 increased future affordable housing developed on the

2 adjacent site. We'll be voting to approve, as  
3 Council Member Ampry-Samuel said and as Council  
4 Member Barron will speak to in a little while. We're  
5 going to vote to approve the Marcus Garvey Village  
6 applications with modifications to facilitate the  
7 development of seven mixed-use buildings with 676  
8 affordable housing units on unused portions of the  
9 Marcus Garvey Village housing development in  
10 Brownsville located in Council Member Barron and  
11 Ampry-Samuels' districts. Also, we're going to vote  
12 to approve with modifications a rezoning in Council  
13 Member Steve Levin's district to facilitate the  
14 development of a 12-story commercial office building  
15 at 29 J Street in Dumbo. The Council will vote on the  
16 site selection of new schools. The first school is a  
17 432-seat primary school and a 231-seat 3K and UPK  
18 facility in Minority Leader Matteo's district on the  
19 former Saint John's Educational Campus. The second  
20 school is 380-seat primary school in Council Member  
21 Menchaca's district on the site of Saint Rosellia  
22 [sic] Church. I want to thank the Land Use staff,  
23 Brian Paul, Amy Levetan [sp?], Julie Levin, John  
24 Douglas, and Raju Mann. Moving on, the Council will  
25 vote on the following legislation: First, we're



1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   33  
2 going to vote on introduction 1288A sponsored by  
3 Council Member Ben Kallos, which will apply the  
4 campaign finance system that voters just approved to  
5 covered elections held prior to the 2021 primary  
6 election including special elections held this year  
7 in 2019. I want to thank the staff who worked on  
8 this, Brad Reed, Elizabeth Cronk [sp?], Emily  
9 Forgeone [sp?], Zachary Harris, and Rob Newman.  
10 We're also going to vote Introduction 863A sponsored  
11 by Council Member Jumaane Williams which would  
12 prohibit employment discrimination and discriminatory  
13 harassment based on an individuals' reproductive  
14 health choices. I want to thank the staff, Rachel  
15 Cordero [sp?], Amenta Killawon [sp?], Harbani Ahuja  
16 [sp?]. We're also going to vote on Introduction 748A  
17 sponsored by Council Member Fernando Cabrera, which  
18 would establish OATH procedures for violations of the  
19 Taxi and Limousine Commission's laws or regulations.  
20 We'll vote on-- Jason, you're killing me over there.  
21 We're going to vote on two pieces of legislation  
22 requiring reporting of sexual abuse in city jails.  
23 The first, Introduction 933B sponsored by Majority  
24 Leader Cumbo will require the Department of  
25 Correction to report on incidents of sexual abuse and

2 harassment to incarcerated individuals. The second  
3 is Introduction 1090A sponsored by Council Member  
4 Danny Dromm which will require the Department of  
5 Correction to report on incidents of sexual abuse,  
6 harassment, and force by the Department of Correction  
7 to people who are visiting city jails. I want to  
8 thank the staff Brian Crow [sp?] and Alana Siven  
9 [sp?]. We're also going to vote on Introduction 633.  
10 This is a big one. Sponsored by Majority Leader  
11 Laurie Cumbo, which would require the Mayor's Office  
12 of Data Analytics to report on an annual basis data  
13 from every city agencies looking at gender,  
14 ethnicity, and race at multiple pay bands to find  
15 instances of pay disparities. The Council on an  
16 annual basis will also be given 90-day access to  
17 employment level data for all city workers so that we  
18 can conduct our own statistical analysis. This is a  
19 giant step forward for pay equity in New York City.  
20 It took years of work, and there are many, many  
21 people I'd like to thank. I want to thank Gloria  
22 Middleton, the President of CWA Local 1180 and all of  
23 her wonderful members. I want to thank Beverly  
24 Newfield of POWHERNY. I want to thank our incredible  
25 Chair of Civil Service and Labor, my friend Daneek

2 Miller, and of course, Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo.  
3 That's just a few of the people. And I also want to  
4 thank the former President of CWA Local 1180, Arthur  
5 Chiliodus [sp?]. I want to take a moment to tell you  
6 why this bill is so important. This bill is about  
7 equality. It is about equal pay for equal work, and  
8 it's about time, and this is so important, that the  
9 City recognize the contributions that people of color  
10 and women and especially women of color make to our  
11 city every single day as part of our city's  
12 workforce. By passing this bill today the Council is  
13 saying that we are not happy with the status quo. We  
14 will fight for equal pay and we will fight for  
15 diversity. We will know that-- we know that all  
16 workplaces are better when they reflect the diversity  
17 of our city, but for too long that has not been  
18 reflected where it matters most, in paychecks. Pay  
19 gaps and opportunity gaps for women and people of  
20 color are a reality for far too many people in this  
21 city every single day, and it's even worse in city  
22 government than it is in the private sector in New  
23 York City. That is shameful. Women employed in our  
24 city government, our municipal government, face a  
25 gender wage gap that is three times larger than the

2   gender wage gap in the private sector in New York  
3   City, three times larger in city government than it  
4   is in the private sector in New York City. This is  
5   unacceptable, and today the Council is fighting back  
6   in a big way. I am so proud of all of us in this  
7   room. This bill will help us find and eliminate  
8   instances of pay discrimination in the city's  
9   workforce, whether that be discrimination based on  
10   gender or race or ethnicity or age or disability or  
11   any other protected category that's enshrined in our  
12   city's Human Rights Law. I'm reminded today of the  
13   late great Shirley Chisolm. She said that you don't  
14   make progress by standing on sidelines. You make  
15   progress by implementing ideas, and today, we are  
16   implementing the idea of equality. I want to thank  
17   the staff who worked on this for a very long time,  
18   Malcolm Butehorn [sp?], Jeff Baker, Andrea Vasquez,  
19   James Sabudi [sp?], Rose Martinez, Elma Sawi [sp?],  
20   Brad Reed, Amenta Killawon [sp?], Harbani Ahuja  
21   [sp?], and Leah Scripiyak [sp?]. we'll vote on Pre-  
22   considered Introduction 1300 in relation to the  
23   naming of 68 thoroughfares and public places,  
24   including Chief of Detectives William Alley [sp?],  
25   Chief Ronald Spattafora [sp?], Police Officer Manuel

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   37  
2    "Manny" Vargas who all died of illnesses related to  
3    their service on 9/11.  And we're also going to vote  
4    on cultural icons.  Christopher Wallace, AKA Biggie  
5    Smalls is getting a street renamed after him, as well  
6    as the Wu Tang Clan and Woodie Guthrie.  On a  
7    personal note, Queens Boulevard and 71<sup>st</sup> Road is  
8    going to be renamed Adelaide Connaughton Way.  
9    Adelaide was a dear friend of mine.  She was a  
10   longtime partner of the City Council's Lynn Schulman  
11   who works in our Community Engagement Division, and I  
12   am so happy that we are voting today on this, and I'm  
13   so happy that Adelaide's many, many contributions to  
14   this city is being recognized with a street renaming  
15   in the borough that she loved.  Adelaide, we miss  
16   you.  We will keep you in our hearts.  I want to  
17   thank the staff who worked on this: Christ Artori  
18   [sp?], Patrick Mulvahil [sp?], Chima Obecheri [sp?],  
19   and Monica Lejack [sp?].  Finally, we'll vote on the  
20   last piece of legislation introduced by Public  
21   Advocate Letitia James, Introduction 1075A would  
22   require the Department of Sanitation to establish a  
23   pilot program to collect organics form buildings  
24   wholly occupied by one or more city agencies and  
25   institutional special use buildings.  I want to thank

2 the staff, Nicole Abben [sp?], Nadia Johnson, and  
3 John Seltzer. I also was remiss in earlier not  
4 saying, and I'm sure that Council Member Rose who is  
5 not with us here today, so she can't say it because  
6 she is dealing with something personal today. I'm  
7 really sad that her really wonderful-- is she here?  
8 Is Winnie [sp?] here? I'm really that-- sad, but  
9 happy for Richmond County, that her Deputy Chief of  
10 Staff, Adweena [sp?] Martin, Winnie Martin, who's  
11 been at the Council since 2012 is leaving to now  
12 become the new Richmond County Public Administrator.  
13 She'll be the first woman and first person of color  
14 to ever hold that position on Staten Island.  
15 Congratulations, Winnie; we will miss you.

16 [applause]

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Okay, since this is the  
18 last-- the final stated meeting of 2018-- the final  
19 stated meeting of 2018, I want to take a moment and  
20 reflect on this past year. I can't express how  
21 honored and humbled I am to serve the people of New  
22 York City alongside all of you here. Adrienne, Alan,  
23 Alicka, Andy Cohen, Andy King, Antonio, Barry, Ben,  
24 Bill, Brad, Carlina, Carlos, Chaim, Costa, Danny,  
25 Debbie, Diana, Donovan, Eric, Fernando, Francisco,

2   Helen, Daneek, Inez, Jimmy, Joe, Jumaane, Justin,  
3   Kalman, Karen, Keith, Keith Powers, Laurie, Margaret,  
4   Mark-- that's an inside joke-- Laurie, Margaret, Mark  
5   Gjonaj, Mark Levine, Mark Treyger, Matthew, Paul,  
6   Peter, Rafael Espinal, Rafael Salamanca, Ritchie,  
7   Robert, Bob, Rory, Ruben, Steve Levin, Steve Matteo,  
8   Vanessa, and Ydanis. Did I miss anyone? Thank God I  
9   didn't miss anyone. I want to thank every single one  
10  of you. I want to thank every single one of you. I  
11  get to stand up here and make these remarks twice a  
12  month. This body is only strong because of the  
13  members who make up this body. You all are the ones  
14  who serve this city every single day, who serve your  
15  approximately 170,000 constituents, and at a time  
16  where there is dysfunction and distrust in  
17  government, I believe at the federal level in many  
18  instances, I believe the New York City Council is a  
19  place that is a force for good in people's lives in  
20  New York City. I've always believed that government  
21  can be a force for good and should be a force for  
22  good, and I believe that the members of this body and  
23  this institution play a crucial and critical role in  
24  serving New Yorkers, and I believe you all do that  
25  every single day. So, I am so deeply honored that I

2 get to serve alongside of you. I also want to thank  
3 a few other people, if I may. I want to thank my mom  
4 who is my rock. I want to thank my sister, Melissa,  
5 my nephew, Van who's a year-and-a-half. I want to  
6 thank some of the incredible staff, and I can't name  
7 all of them. I can just name a few of them, some of  
8 the staff that I interact with every single day here  
9 in this magnificent building. I want to thank the  
10 Chief of Staff, Jason Goldman, for his incredible  
11 work since he took over in June. I'm not allowed to  
12 swear on the floor of the City Council, but people  
13 said this place is going to be in big trouble when  
14 Ramon Martinez leaves, and I think we're doing just  
15 fine, and that's because of Jason's leadership. I  
16 want to thank Cici Scott [sp?], my Chief of  
17 Operations. I want to thank my shadow, the guys who  
18 is always with me, Sean Kofflan [sp?], Lilian Pescone  
19 [sp?], Anthony Perez [sp?], Jenn Formino [sp?] my  
20 communications director. I want to thank Eric Botcher  
21 [sp?], my District Office Chief of Staff and my  
22 entire District Office staff, and I want to thank  
23 Phyllis and Robin who greet everyone with a smile  
24 downstairs when they come into the Speaker's Office.  
25 So, I want to thank you all, and I also want to thank



2 the amazing detectives that I get to spend time with  
3 every single day from the New York City Police  
4 Department. I want to thank Sergeant John Gee [sp?],  
5 who lead that detail, and I want to thank Malik whose  
6 here, and Ray, and Faisal, and Pat and Frank. I want  
7 to thank all of them for everything they do for me  
8 and they do for the City of New York. So, I want to  
9 thank you all for everything you do as well. I am  
10 extremely proud of what we accomplished, and I hope  
11 you all are proud of what we've accomplished this  
12 year as well. It's really actually amazing what  
13 we've been able to do just in one year. We stood  
14 with survivors and we passed the Stop Sexual  
15 Harassment Act in New York City which is among the  
16 strictest legislation of its kind in the country. We  
17 stood with taxi drivers and for-hire vehicle drivers  
18 to protect them at a time when the industry is in  
19 upheaval, and we became the first major city in the  
20 world to regulate app-based for-hire vehicle  
21 companies like Uber and Lyft. We took a major step  
22 for our City's safety in affordable housing by  
23 passing legislation to help crack down on illegal  
24 hotels. We helped people who can't afford to get on  
25 the subway every morning by winning Fair Fares in our

2   budget, something that is literally going to make  
3   everyday life better for hundreds of thousands of  
4   poor New Yorkers. We helped our children in our  
5   schools by securing 125 million dollars in Fair  
6   Student Funding. I'm looking at you, Mark Treyger.  
7   We listened to the parents of disabled children and  
8   committed 150 million dollars to ensure that our  
9   schools are accessible. These parents came to us.  
10   They asked for our help, and we, the Council,  
11   delivered for them. We fought for NYCHA residents,  
12   for runaway and homeless youth, the LGBT community.  
13   We got life-saving speed cameras turned back on. We  
14   fought for immigrants who are under attack in our  
15   city, and I could go on and on. We have had such a  
16   great year, and I am so proud of everyone in this  
17   room, everyone, the members, the staff, everyone  
18   who's standing in this room. I want to thank you all  
19   for making me the Speaker of this body. I want to  
20   thank you for fighting every day for the people of  
21   this city, and I hope you all have a happy holiday  
22   season with your loved ones and a happy New Year. I  
23   hope you get some rest over the next couple of weeks,  
24   because we're not finished. We're coming back, and I  
25   hope to do much more in 2019. I am so excited for

2    what we've done this year and what we will do.

3    Sending love to you all and your families. Thank you  
4    very much. Let's get on with today's votes.

5                   [applause]

6                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank  
7    you, Mr. Speaker. Discussion of General Orders  
8    beginning with Council Member Kallos. No. Next,  
9    Council Member Rosenthal. Pass. Council Member  
10   Cornegy? Cornegy?

11                   COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Yes, thank you,  
12   Madam Public Advocate/Attorney General. I just want  
13   to speak on my streetcar naming. I'd like to take a  
14   moment to share a brief bio of Fannie Pettie Watts  
15   who with today's passage of Intro 1300 will have a  
16   stretch of Decatur Street in Brooklyn co-named Fannie  
17   Petty Watts Way in her honor. Fannie Pettie Watts  
18   was born in Perry [sic], Georgia on December 20<sup>th</sup>,  
19   1899 and attended public school of Savannah, Georgia.  
20   She continued her formal training at Georgia State  
21   College, and she later graduated from Howard  
22   University with a Bachelor of Arts in Education. She  
23   also achieved her post-graduate degree in social work  
24   and housing at New York University. Fannie Pettie  
25   Watts then relocated to Brooklyn where she married

2   the late John G. Watts and was also the mother of two  
3   sons. Professionally Founder Fannie Pettie Watts was  
4   a social investigator for the Department of Social  
5   Services in Brooklyn. She was also the Director of  
6   the Cradle Roll [sic] Division of Brooklyn's Nazarene  
7   Congregational Church where she assisted with the  
8   organization and development of prenatal parenting  
9   classes and gatherings for expectant parents. She  
10   was an active member of Nazarene Congregational  
11   Church until her death. Additionally, and very  
12   importantly, Fannie Watts as an active participator  
13   in the local block association and was the link  
14   between community development workers and a range of  
15   other local authority and voluntary sector providers  
16   such as the police, social workers, and teachers.  
17   Her commitment to the Bedford-Stuyvesant Community  
18   and her focus on community collaboration led to the  
19   creation of a number of volunteer opportunities and  
20   community leadership roles. Fannie Pettie Watts was  
21   one of the co-founders of Zeta Phi Beta Sorority  
22   Incorporated. She's a life member and held  
23   membership with Delta Alpha Zeta Graduate Chapter in  
24   Brooklyn, New York. She is credited with organizing  
25   Omicron Beta Chapter in Brooklyn. Fannie Pettie

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   45

2   Watts's triumphant life ended August 22<sup>nd</sup>, 1995 and  
3   was buried in the Cemetery of the Evergreens in  
4   Brooklyn, New York. Thank you.

5           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.  
6   Council Member Cumbo? Yes.

7           SPEAKER JOHNSON: I had it written down,  
8   but I inherited a gift from you this year, which was  
9   a loss for you, but a gain for me. I am  
10   extraordinarily grateful that someone you're not able  
11   to bring along with you to the Attorney General's  
12   Office from your police detail, the amazing second-  
13   grade detective Rene Molina [sp?] has been with me  
14   since the beginning of October, and I thought I  
15   mentioned his name, and I apologize for not, because  
16   I love Rene and I know you love Rene as well. So, I  
17   wanted to be sure that I included Rene Molina in my  
18   thanks today.

19           [applause]

20           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you for  
21   that. Council Member Cumbo?

22           COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I rise  
23   today so very proud of the legislation that we are  
24   passing today. This is an incredible opportunity  
25   along with Council Member Miller as well as Public

2    Advocate Letitia James. We are making Her-story  
3    today. And I have a quick story to share about it.  
4    My parents are here today, and my mother and father  
5    were both general managers at Off-track Betting, and  
6    they met. They fell madly in love, and here I am,  
7    but upon finding out that they're both managers at  
8    Off-track Betting, they had discuss their finances,  
9    and when my mother found out that my father was  
10   making way more money than she was, let's just say  
11   head rolled at OTB, and ultimately she wound up  
12   making more money than him. But that's just one of  
13   those stories. Not everyone has the opportunity to  
14   find out if their counterparts are making the same  
15   amount of money as they are. We are here to change  
16   that in the City Council today, and I'm so proud to  
17   work with Council Member Miller. We are creating the  
18   transparency that so many individuals need to know to  
19   understand if there are wage disparities that are  
20   happening every single day. As Rihanna said it in  
21   her pop song, "Pay me what you owe me." But even  
22   better, Dolly Parton said it, and I'll say in  
23   closing, forty years ago, "Working nine to five, what  
24   a way to make a living, barely getting by. It's all  
25   taking and no giving. They just use your mind and

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   47  
2   they never give you credit.  It's enough to drive you  
3   crazy if you let it.  Nine to five, yeah, they got  
4   you where they want you.  There's a better life.  And  
5   you think about it, don't you?  It's a rich man's  
6   game, no matter what they call it, and you spend your  
7   life putting money in his wallet."  And we know that  
8   many African-American women have to work a whole year  
9   plus eight months in order to make what their white  
10  male counterparts make.  And I want to thank the  
11  dynamic and powerful black and brown women of CWA who  
12  brought this legislation forward by-- excuse me.  They  
13  brought this legislation forward through a lawsuit  
14  that they created.  This has brought transparency to  
15  the City of New York.  I want to thank Gloria  
16  Middleton for all of her incredible work and all the  
17  dynamic members of CWA who took their power and their  
18  energy to create a way for New Yorkers all across the  
19  city.  So, I'll close because my comments are coming  
20  to an end.  I don't want Letitia James to feel that  
21  she's giving me some extra time, but I'll take it up  
22  on General Orders.  Thank you.

23                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:  Thank you.  
24  Council Member Yeger?

25

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   48

2           COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you. Madam  
3 President, first in your last meeting, I honor you  
4 for your service. We've know each other for a long  
5 time. I was proud to support you five years ago. I  
6 knew that was the right decision. I know you're not  
7 going far, you're still Brooklyn, and you're only  
8 going a few blocks away, sometimes upstate, but  
9 you'll always be Brooklyn, and I'm proud to call you  
10 a friend. Your work here has been incredible. Good  
11 luck to you and Godspeed.

12           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. I  
13 appreciate that.

14           COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER: I rise today,  
15 Madam President to talk about a bill that my good  
16 colleague Council Member Kallos has proposed. He's a  
17 longtime champion of smart, increased public  
18 financing. He's always been open about that. He's  
19 always been honest about that. And I know that his  
20 bill comes from a good place and it has good  
21 intentions. In my view, sometimes process is as  
22 important as the intended result, and we see that  
23 during the debate that we're having here in this body  
24 over Amazon. This bill was introduced last Tuesday.  
25 We had a hearing on Wednesday. Under the Charter,



2   that was the day that it laid on the desk of the  
3   members in this chamber and we voted it out of  
4   committee today, and today we will vote it on the  
5   floor. The bill will require the City of New York as  
6   per the fiscal estimate to spend four million dollars  
7   in the next calendar year, four million dollars from  
8   January 1<sup>st</sup> 'til November of next year. In my view,  
9   I don't think that we need to spend four million  
10   dollars on a race that's already receiving public  
11   funds. The six to one is generous; eight to one is a  
12   little more generous. There's no question the voters  
13   chose eight-to-one for the future, but they didn't  
14   choose it for this special election that's happening  
15   in 75 or so days. And we had a choice to not spend  
16   an additional four million dollars. We could have  
17   spent it on NYCHA. We could spend it on school  
18   teachers, police, libraries, road repairs, homeless,  
19   healthcare, all the other things that we talk about  
20   in this Council that we want to spend money on that  
21   we can't because we can't afford it, and here's four  
22   million dollars-- Madam President, I'm wrapping up in  
23   a second. Its four million dollars that we're going  
24   to spend. I know that the proponents of this bill  
25   come from a good place, I do, because they-- every

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   50  
2   single person who is supporting this bill comes from  
3   a place where we ran on the public financings. We  
4   receive the money from public financing. We wouldn't  
5   be here, perhaps, but for public financing, but it is  
6   four million dollars, and it's a chance to say that  
7   we don't have to spend this money. Nobody's not  
8   going to run for Public Advocate because that extra  
9   eight-to-one, that extra two dollars for every dollar  
10   is not given, nobody. Nobody has said so far, "I  
11   will not run because I won't get enough money." So,  
12   it's a chance to say no. It's a chance to give that  
13   money to something more useful. Thank you, Madam  
14   President, for indulging me with the extra time. And  
15   again, Godspeed to you. It's not going to be the same  
16   without you up there.

17                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Bless  
18   you. Council Member Kallos?

19                   SPEAKER JOHNSON: Council Member Kallos  
20   doesn't need to speak at this time he said.

21                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Council Member  
22   Ulrich?

23                   COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Okay, alright.  
24   Well, first, I want to say, Madam Public Advocate--  
25

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   51

2                   SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Start the  
3 clock.

4                   [laughter]

5                   COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: Thank you. My  
6 you're leaving such large shoes to fill, let's just  
7 put it that way, but you've always been such a  
8 wonderful friend, and the City of New York has  
9 benefitted immensely from your public service, and I  
10 wish to add my voice to my colleagues in honoring  
11 your service and your commitment to every single New  
12 Yorker, and we wish you the best. We know you're  
13 going to do a fantastic job as the Attorney General.  
14 I want to talk about what my colleague Council Member  
15 Yeger brought up with respect to the Campaign Finance  
16 bill that we're voting on today, Intro. 1288A. I will  
17 be abstaining on that bill, because I intend to  
18 benefit from it. So, I think it would be conflict of  
19 interest for me to vote on something that is going to  
20 make it easier for me to receive public funding. So,  
21 I don't want my abstention on that bill to be seen as  
22 anything else other than me just being cautious. And  
23 I would advise respectfully my colleagues who are  
24 also seeking that same office, if they are going to  
25 be participating in the matching funds program, they

2    should abstain, too. I think it sends the right  
3    message to New Yorkers that we are running a  
4    transparent good government operation here in the  
5    City Council. So, again, no disrespect to Council  
6    Member Kallos. I think it's a great bill, but I just  
7    can't vote for it if I'm going to benefit from it.  
8    Thank you very much.

9                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Reports of  
10   standing committees.

11                   COUNCIL CLERK: On the report of special-  
12   -

13                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]  
14   Excuse me. Council Member Barron?

15                   COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you, Madam  
16   Public Advocate. I just want to say that I stand  
17   with my colleagues that have street namings,  
18   particularly Fannie Pettie Watts. She was the founder  
19   of Zeta Phi Beta, which has been noted, and that's  
20   the sorority that I pledged when I was at Hunter.  
21   Fannie Lou Hamer is having a co-naming, Muhammad Ali  
22   Jinnah Way as well as Audrey Law [sic]. I just want  
23   to commend my colleagues for that. I want to just  
24   bring comments on the Marcus Garvey extension project  
25   which was alluded to earlier. First, before I talk

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   53  
2    about the project just briefly, Marcus Garvey was an  
3    outstanding individual. Born in Jamaica, came here  
4    in 1916 and started what became the largest mass  
5    organizations across the world, United nat-- the  
6    Universal Negro Improvement Association. He also  
7    founded a doll factory for black dolls because he  
8    realized there was a shortage of black dolls. He  
9    organized the Black Nurses, because that was also a  
10   shortage that we had here in this country. And he  
11   bought three ships and starting a shipping line. So,  
12   his motto was, "One God, one aim, one destiny, and he  
13   gave us the black liberation flag, the red, black and  
14   green. But to talk about the project in my remaining  
15   seconds, I'm very pleased to be able to share this  
16   project with my colleague. They wanted 12 buildings.  
17   We said that's too dense. They came down to seven.  
18   They wanted 12 stories. We said that's too high.  
19   They came down to seven. I just want to encourage my  
20   colleagues to make sure that we benefit that we need  
21   for our community. So, at the Marcus Garvey  
22   Extension Project you will be able to get a studio  
23   for rent of \$215 to \$837 dollars, depending on your  
24   income. Or one bedroom from \$283 to \$1,058. A two-  
25   bedroom ranging from \$425 to \$1,280 or a three-

2    bedroom apartment ranging from \$512 dollars to  
3    \$1,472. So I just want encourage my colleagues  
4    negotiate and where people are not bringing in  
5    apartment that are in some way matched to the income  
6    of the people who live in that community. They are  
7    not doing a service to those who are struggling to  
8    stay there. And I'll have more to say about later.  
9    And also, this project will have supportive housing  
10   in it, and we're looking to negotiate a separate  
11   single building in phase tree. Thank you so much.

12                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13   Reports of standing committees.

14                   COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the committee  
15   on civil and human rights, Intro. 863A, employment  
16   discrimination.

17                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Mr. Speaker?

18                   SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled in  
19   general orders.

20                   COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the Committee  
21   on Civil Service and labor, Intro. 633 A, pay equity  
22   reporting.

23                   SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and coupled on  
24   General Orders.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 55

2 COUNCIL CLERK: Report of the committee  
3 on Criminal justice, Intro. 933 B and 1090A, sexual  
4 abuse reporting.

5 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Amended and couple on  
6 General Orders.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Repot of the Committee on  
8 Finance, Pre-considered Intro. 1303 budget extender.

9 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
10 Orders with a message of necessity.

11 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered Reso. 674,  
12 transparency reso.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
14 Orders.

15 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered M121 and  
16 Reso. 677, and M122 and Reso. 678 budget documents.

17 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
18 orders.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Pre-considered LU 290 and  
20 Reso. 679 through Pre-considered LU 309 and Reso. 698  
21 on page five tax exemptions.

22 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
23 Orders.

24

25

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   56

2           COUNCIL CLERK:   Report of the Committee  
3 on Governmental Operations, Intro. 748A, OATH  
4 hearings.

5           SPEAKER JOHNSON:   Coupled on-- amended  
6 and coupled on general orders.

7           COUNCIL CLERK:   Intro. 1288A Campaign  
8 Finance Law.

9           SPEAKER JOHNSON:   Amended and coupled on  
10 General Orders.

11          COUNCIL CLERK:   Report of the Committee  
12 on Land Use LU 259 and LU 269, zoning amendments.

13          SPEAKER JOHNSON:   Approved with  
14 modifications and referred to the City Planning  
15 Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70B of the Rules of  
16 the Council and Section 197D of the New York City  
17 Charter.

18          COUNCIL CLERK:   LU 270 and Reso. 699 and  
19 LU 271 and Reso. 700 Franklin Avenue rezoning.

20          SPEAKER JOHNSON:   Coupled on General  
21 Orders.

22          COUNCIL CLERK:   LU 272 through LU 281 on  
23 page nine, Marcus Garvey Village and 29 J Street.

24          SPEAKER JOHNSON:   Approved with  
25 modifications and referred to the City Planning



1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   57

2   Commission pursuant to Rule 11.70B of the Rules of  
3   the Council and Section 197D of the New York City  
4   Charter.

5           COUNCIL CLERK:   LU 287 and Reso. 701 and  
6   LU 288 and Reso. 702 school facilities.

7           SPEAKER JOHNSON:   Coupled on General  
8   Orders.

9           COUNCIL CLERK:   LU 289 and Reso. 703,  
10   sidewalk café.

11          SPEAKER JOHNSON:   Coupled on General  
12   Orders.

13          COUNCIL CLERK:   Report of the Committee  
14   on Parks and Recreation, Pre-considered Intro. 1300  
15   in relation to the naming of the 68 thoroughfares in  
16   public places.

17          SPEAKER JOHNSON:   Coupled on General  
18   Orders.

19          COUNCIL CLERK:   Report of the Committee  
20   on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management, Intro.  
21   1075A, organic waste collection.

22          SPEAKER JOHNSON:   Amended and coupled on  
23   General Orders.

24          COUNCIL CLERK:   On the General Order  
25   Calendar Intro 720, site safety training.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 58

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Laid over.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: LU 259 and Reso. 704  
4 through LU 281 and Reso 713 on page 13 various  
5 applications.

6 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
7 Orders.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Resolution appointing  
9 various persons, Commissioner of Deeds.

10 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Coupled on General  
11 Orders, and at this time I would ask for roll call  
12 vote on all of the items on today's General Order  
13 calendar.

14 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Quiet in the  
15 Chambers.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Adams?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER ADAMS: Aye.

18 COUNCIL CLERK: Ayala?

19 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: No on Intro.  
20 1288A, aye on all the rest.

21 COUNCIL CLERK: Barron?

22 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Permission to  
23 explain my vote?

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

25

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 59

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Thank you. As I  
3 have said before, New York City is facing an  
4 overwhelming crisis with homelessness. The ANHD has  
5 done reports and they've shared with us what the AMIs  
6 are in each of our communities. The most oppressed  
7 group or the most challenged group to find housing  
8 are those who are formerly homeless, those are 30  
9 percent, 40 percent, 50 percent. Yes, when we came  
10 in, we did the rezoning and it passed, but the MIH is  
11 far too low for us to really make an impact on the  
12 crisis that we're facing. I do not believe that LU  
13 270 and 271 brings housing to a community that has  
14 only 16 percent of its residents making 100,000  
15 dollars or more presently to address that project to  
16 bring in 70 percent at market-rate. So, for that  
17 reason I'm voting no on 270 and 271. Aye on all the  
18 others. Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Borelli?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER BORELLI: Aye on all  
21 except 1288A and a Merry Christmas to all and a best  
22 of luck to our Attorney General-Elect, and may you  
23 spend as little time as possible in Albany.

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Amen.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Cabrera?

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   60

2           COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA:   Permission to  
3 explain my vote?

4           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Yes.

5           COUNCIL MEMBER CABRERA:   Madam Public  
6 Advocate, I was going to spend time [sic]-- it's  
7 always a privilege to talk about whoever getting an  
8 opportunity to pass my own bill here today, but I  
9 want to spend my time really talking about you. I  
10 remember when I came in nine years ago. We were  
11 sitting in the same row in the back. We were in the  
12 corner, and there were some that said, "She will  
13 never be Public Advocate." And I was thinking about  
14 that today, and it's amazing how destiny always makes  
15 a way for people who have a good heart. You have a  
16 good heart. Stay to the truth. Fight for the truth  
17 and for justice for the poor as you always have, and  
18 I also want to commend your staff. You have amazing  
19 staff like Timothy Tapia [sp?] and others that really  
20 you know how to empower future leaders, and in doing  
21 so you empower your office. let me just say here in  
22 closing, I want to thank the Speaker, Brad Reed,  
23 Senior Counsel, and also Elizabeth Cronk [sp?], Zack  
24 Harris [sp?], and my own staff, Claire Maclavane  
25 [sp?] for Intro. 748A, and I want to thank to all my

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   61

2   colleagues who will be voting aye on this bill that  
3   is going to help taxi drivers, and with all their  
4   burdens and financial burdens they're facing today.

5   Thank you so much, and I wish you truly the best, and  
6   my God's favor be upon your life.

7           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Thank you.   Bless  
8   you.

9           COUNCIL CLERK:   Matteo?

10          COUNCIL MEMBER MATTEO:   No on 1288, aye  
11   on the rest.

12          COUNCIL CLERK:   Chin?

13          COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN:   Permission to  
14   explain my vote?

15          PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Yes.

16          COUNCIL MEMBER CHIN:   I just wanted to  
17   take this opportunity to thank the Speaker and all my  
18   colleagues for all their support this year.   My  
19   district has been crazy, busy, hectic, never a dull  
20   moment, but I am just so appreciative of all the  
21   support, and of course to our Public Advocate, it'll  
22   be great seeing you on the state, and we have to look  
23   forward so much good that will be done.   And I want  
24   to wish everyone a happy holiday and a joyful and

25

2 wonderful new year. And I vote aye on all. Thank  
3 you.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Cohen?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: Permission to  
7 explain my vote?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER COHEN: I also just want  
10 to thank and congratulate the Speaker on an  
11 incredibly productive and successful first year. I  
12 want to profess my love for our Public Advocate, and  
13 I'm thrilled you're going to be our Attorney General.  
14 I want to wish my colleagues a happy holidays and a  
15 happy New Year. I'm going to abstain on 1288, and  
16 I'm going to vote yes on all other items on the  
17 General Orders Calendar.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Constantinides?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: May I be  
21 allowed to explain my vote?

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: I just  
24 wanted to congratulate our Public Advocate soon to be  
25 Attorney General, Tish James. Thank you for-- I

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   63  
2   won't know this chamber without you. I've been here  
3   as a staffer, seeing what a great Council Member you  
4   were and a great leader you've been, and now as a  
5   Public Advocate, and then moving into the Attorney  
6   General's role, whether it's working in our district  
7   together at a crop less gardens or on climate change,  
8   every day I know how much you care about New Yorkers  
9   and how you put every New Yorker first, so we look  
10  forward to seeing you do that on a statewide level.  
11  Congratulations. I'm wishing you all the best.

12           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13           COUNCIL MEMBER CONSTANTINIDES: And I  
14  vote aye on all.

15           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

16           COUNCIL CLERK: Cornegy?

17           COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: Permission to  
18  explain my vote?

19           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20           COUNCIL MEMBER CORNEGY: First of all, I  
21  want to thank Speaker Johnson for giving us a full  
22  first year, probably one of the most productive years  
23  at the Council, for fighting for us as a body, and  
24  putting us first. I want to say to Tish James, just  
25  go get 'em, Tish. And I vote aye.

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   64

2           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Thank you.

3           COUNCIL CLERK:   Deutsch?

4           COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH:   Permission to  
5 explain my vote?

6           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Yes.

7           COUNCIL MEMBER DEUTSCH:   So, firstly, I'd  
8 like to acknowledge the presence of my adopted  
9 parents, Mr. and Mrs. Cumbo who are sitting right  
10 behind me, and I just want to thank the Speaker for a  
11 great year and his friendship, partnership, and to  
12 you, Public Advocate, for your friendship over the  
13 last four-plus years and prior to Public Advocate as  
14 a Council Member in your district, in Williamsburg, I  
15 think the 35<sup>th</sup>. And I want to wish all my colleagues  
16 a happy and healthy new year and happy, healthy  
17 holidays to everyone, and I vote aye on all.

18          PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Thank you.

19          COUNCIL CLERK:   Dromm?

20          COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM:   Permission to  
21 explain my vote?

22          PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Yes.

23          COUNCIL MEMBER DROMM:   Thank you very  
24 much. I want to congratulate the Speaker on a very  
25 productive year. I want to thank Council Member



2 Koslowitz and congratulate Lynn Schulman on the co-  
3 naming on Adelaide P. Norton Way. Adelaide was a  
4 friend of mine. She was a compassionate, wonderful  
5 human-being. She fought for the voiceless. She  
6 fought for the LGBT community. She fought for those  
7 who are re-entering society, the formerly  
8 incarcerated, and for the criminal justice involved  
9 individuals. She is truly missed, and I love her  
10 dearly. And with that I'm going to vote aye on all  
11 except for 1288A I vote no.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Diaz?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Permission to  
15 explain my vote?

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER DIAZ: Thank you. I'd like  
18 to vote yes on all except on 863A, and also there is  
19 a bill here that I have no full understanding because  
20 it deals with Taxi and Limousine Commission, and that  
21 bill was supposed to go to my committee, but  
22 [inaudible] Government Operation, and this is the  
23 bill that my committee, we want to deal with it,  
24 because they as the drivers and it's hurting the  
25 driver. This is wrong what you're doing, what we're

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   66  
2   doing.  I'm voting yes on 748A.  This bill we have,  
3   ladies and gentleman, eight drivers have killed  
4   themselves.  The pressure because of the-- the  
5   pressure that have been put on them [sic], and we  
6   have to-- we're supposed to be alleviating their  
7   burden, not putting more burden on them.  The Mayor  
8   don't want [inaudible] bill.  Now we do need-- we  
9   need another bill, and I didn't want to see that bill  
10  in my committee, because it was wrong for the driver.  
11  This is the bill.  This is wrong.  It's no good.  
12  It's not good for the driver.  Besides that, I'm  
13  voting yes on all.  Merry Christmas.  Happy Chanukah  
14  and Happy Kwanza to all of you.

15           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:  Thank you.

16           COUNCIL CLERK:  Espinal?

17           COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL:  Permission to  
18  explain my vote?

19           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:  Yes.

20           COUNCIL MEMBER ESPINAL:  I just really  
21  want to congratulate Tish James on becoming our State  
22  Attorney General and for all the great work you've  
23  done here, and I admire all the legislation you've  
24  passed as Public Advocate.  So thank you for all the  
25  great work you've done, and I want to congratulate

2   Corey, and wish him a good luck on his new endeavor  
3   of becoming the Public Advocate January 1<sup>st</sup>. You  
4   have big shoes to fill. Good luck with that. And I  
5   vote aye on all.

6                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7                   COUNCIL CLERK: Eugene?

8                   COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Permission to  
9   explain my vote?

10                  PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

11                  COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: I would like to  
12   thank Speaker Corey Johnson for your leadership, you  
13   know, keeping this body such a powerful body, and we  
14   feel all empowered and inspired by your work. Thank  
15   you very much. And I know that you mother should be  
16   very happy of that. And I would like to join my  
17   colleagues also to congratulate one more time Public  
18   Advocate, and I thank [sic] General-elect Letitia  
19   James. Many of us, we had the opportunity to serve  
20   with you when you were a Council Member and also as a  
21   Public Advocate. We know that you are ready, and you  
22   know what you are made of. Go for it.

23                  PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24                  COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: And all the best-

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 68

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

3 Thank you.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: for the borough  
5 of Manhattan. And to all of you here in the chamber,  
6 my colleagues and all of those who are here today for  
7 this great Stated Meeting, I want to wish you a very  
8 blessed and happy, healthy holiday season to you and  
9 your loved one. With this, I vote yes on all.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER EUGENE: Thank you.

12 COMMITTEE CLERK: Gibson?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Permission to  
14 explain my vote?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER GIBSON: Thank you, Madam  
17 Public Advocate. I say that one last time. I'd like  
18 to congratulate all of our colleagues passing bills  
19 today, particularly want to highlight our Majority  
20 Leader Laurie Cumbo on a great bill related to pay  
21 and employment data, and I also want to congratulate  
22 Chair Daneek Miller and CWA Local 1180 and all of the  
23 advocates, and I too want to join all of my  
24 colleagues in congratulating our amazing Speaker  
25 Corey Johnson and his team for an incredibly

2 successful year in addition to all of the incredible  
3 budget successes that he cited. I am particularly  
4 grateful for all of my colleagues in supporting  
5 myself and Fernando Cabrera on the Jerome  
6 Neighborhood rezoning plan. Thank you. And Fair  
7 Fares and Fair Student Funding and school  
8 accessibility, really important to me in my district-  
9 - Summer Youth and COMPASS and SONYC, adult literacy  
10 and EFAP, we truly made such a difference this year,  
11 and I am grateful to be a part of this body. Want  
12 to thank our Finance Chair Danny Dromm, our Finance  
13 Director Latonya McKinney [sp?], and my heavy-hitters  
14 that really helped me on the Subcommittee, Regina  
15 Poreda Ryan [sp?], Chima Obecher [sp?], Rebecca  
16 Chaisson [sp?] and Nathan Toth. Thank you for  
17 helping me as a new Chair of a Subcommittee created  
18 by our Speaker. I want to thank my team, Team  
19 Gibson, for holding me down both here and in the  
20 district office led by my new Chief of Staff, Wendy  
21 Gyagos [sp?]. And finally, as I wish everyone a  
22 happy holiday season, I want to join in recognizing  
23 our incredible Public Advocate. Although I am often  
24 mistaken and called Ms. James Tish, so many times  
25 throughout this city, there will never be another

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   70

2   Tish James, and you will certainly be missed. You  
3   have been an advocate, a litigator, and agitator, a  
4   motivator, a champion, a leader, a role model, a  
5   friend, a source of encouragement for so many of us  
6   here and in the City. You have really set the bar  
7   tremendously high, shattered glass ceilings, and  
8   overall been a phenomenal woman. So, as one chapter  
9   closes, Tish, and your new chapter opens, we wish you  
10   success. We look forward to working with you in your  
11   new role, and yes, you go get 'em. Happy holidays to  
12   all my colleagues. Merry Christmas. Happy Kwanza.  
13   Happy Chanukah. Happy Three Kings Day, and I look  
14   forward to working with each and every one of you in  
15   the New Year. God bless. Thank you. I vote aye on  
16   all with the exception of 1288, I will abstain.  
17   Thank you.

18                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19                   COUNCIL CLERK: Gjonaj?

20                   COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: Permission to  
21   explain my vote?

22                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23                   COUNCIL MEMBER GJONAJ: First of all, I  
24   just want to wish you, and I'm excited for your  
25   future, but mostly I'm excited for New York, Tish.

2 Speaker, thank you on a great year. I wish all of my  
3 colleagues a happy holiday, and most of all, a  
4 healthy, peaceful and productive New Year. I vote  
5 aye on all except Intro. 1288A.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL CLERK: Grodenchik?

8 COUNCIL MEMBER GRODENCHIK: I was worried  
9 you forgot how to pronounce it. It's okay, Donovan.  
10 Madam Public Advocate, I have rarely asked your  
11 indulgence to explain my vote, and I don't think  
12 today is a good day to start to do that, so I'm not  
13 going to. However, I want to thank my Speaker, Corey  
14 Johnson, for an outstanding first year, and  
15 especially, Corey, for realizing my dream of ending  
16 the budget dance on emergency food, and I'd be remiss  
17 if I didn't thank my partner in that, Steve Levin. I  
18 want to wish everybody a happy and healthy and safe  
19 holiday season. It's not going to snow before  
20 Christmas, so you got no excuse to go where you're  
21 going. Happy New Year, a healthy new year for  
22 everybody, and Helen, if you'll give a moment to talk  
23 to Tish James privately. No. I just want to wish  
24 her the best of everything. Last Saturday night I  
25 was with her and we were at a party in southeast

2   Queens together, and the room was packed and there  
3   was my friend Tish just sitting in the corner by  
4   herself, Attorney General-elect of the State of New  
5   York, no pretense about her, no heirs about her, just  
6   living her life as she always does. And Tish, I grew  
7   up in public housing. I never realized that I could  
8   be an elected official, but you carry with you the  
9   dreams of millions of young children who can now  
10   dream of making their world a better place. A young  
11   girl from New York City who rose to the top, or most  
12   of the way to the top. There's still room for growth  
13   for all of us. So, I'm not going to put you in  
14   trouble today, but I just want to say I am so  
15   thrilled to have supported you, and look forward to  
16   seeing you as our next Attorney General on January  
17   1<sup>st</sup>, and with that, I withdraw my request to speak on  
18   this. I do vote aye on all. Thank you.

19                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

20                   COUNCIL CLERK: Holden?

21                   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Permission to  
22   explain my vote?

23                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

24                   COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Congrats to Tish  
25   James, unbelievable accomplishment and Godspeed.



1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 73

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Happy and healthy  
4 holidays, and I just want to thank Speaker Johnson  
5 for tremendous leadership and attention, and  
6 certainly it was an entertaining year, a very fast  
7 year, but what we accomplished is amazing thanks to  
8 you. I am still amazed at you, and what you can  
9 remember, the names you could remember, the faces and  
10 so forth, and also the-- for putting up with, again,  
11 the texts late at night and tolerating it and  
12 answering me, and I think we have kind of a good  
13 time, but thank you very much for a great year,  
14 Speaker Johnson.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: How do you vote?

16 COUNCIL MEMBER HOLDEN: Sorry. Aye on  
17 all except Intro. 863A.

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL CLERK: Kallos?

20 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: This time I'd  
21 like permission to explain my vote.

22 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

23 COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: On November 6<sup>th</sup> of  
24 2018, New Yorkers overwhelmingly voted to get big  
25 money out of New York City politics. After a decade-

2 long fight for real campaign finance reform, New York  
3 literally took matters into their own hands by voting  
4 yes on ballot question one. That is, 1.4 million  
5 voters flipped their ballots over to page four, voted  
6 on question one with 1.1 million voters choosing yes.  
7 To put that in perspective, that's almost as many  
8 people as voted in favor of this measure voted for  
9 Mayor in 2017, whether it was de Blasio or  
10 Malliotakis. New Yorkers could not have been clearer.  
11 This was a mandate for New Yorkers to get big money  
12 out and reform the system now. I want to thank  
13 Speaker Johnson for endorsing question one on the  
14 ballot, recognizing this mandate of the voters and  
15 his leadership. However, despite voters clearly  
16 making-- knowing this reform is what they wanted, the  
17 changes did not take effect until 2021. Introduction  
18 1288 extends the newly adopted Campaign finance  
19 system to the February 2019 Special Election,  
20 September 2019 Primary Election, and November 2019  
21 General Election for Public Advocate, and the cascade  
22 of elections that will follow. This legislation will  
23 allow ballot question one to lower contribution  
24 limits from \$2,550 citywide to \$1,000 increased  
25 public matching. Every small dollar contribution

2 matching every dollar up from six to eight for \$250,  
3 public grant from 75 percent. There's so much more,  
4 but in the remaining 30 seconds I wanted to thank Rob  
5 Newman, Brad Reed, Elizabeth Cronk, but I did want to  
6 take a moment at the risk of upsetting the next  
7 regulator at our state despite her wishes, I just  
8 want to thank New York City Public Advocate for her  
9 partnership and giving me an opportunity to stand  
10 with her where she stood up to small companies like  
11 Comcast, locked that merger, pushed Charter to  
12 actually provide affordable internet for over a  
13 million low-income New York City residents, and now  
14 she's going to be in a position to actually make sure  
15 they follow through on their promise, fighting to  
16 make sure that every New Yorker can save for their  
17 pensions, and as we try to do that in Albany, it is  
18 you who will likely end up suing to make sure that we  
19 can save for our retirement. And as we try to  
20 implement electronic voter registration, it will be  
21 your office that will be suing to make sure that we  
22 can make it easy for people to vote. You've got a lot  
23 ahead of you. I am confident you will get it done.  
24 I am so grateful to have you as the attorney for the

2   City of New York, and I can't wait for you to  
3   represent all of us as a state. Thank you.

4           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5           COUNCIL CLERK: Koo?

6           COUNCIL MEMBER KALLOS: Oh, I vote aye on  
7   all.

8           COUNCIL CLERK: Council Member Koo?

9           COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Madam Public  
10   Advocate, may I explain my vote?

11          PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12          COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: First, I want to  
13   thank the Speaker and the staff, especially Jason,  
14   Cici [sic], and the wonderful staff doing a wonderful  
15   job for all of us and for the City of New York.  
16   Second, I want to congratulate for being the next AG  
17   fighting for all New Yorkers for equal justice and  
18   equal opportunities. I wish you very good luck in  
19   your next journey.

20          PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21          COUNCIL MEMBER KOO: Lastly, I want to  
22   wish happy holidays to all my colleagues, because we  
23   together doing many, many good things for the  
24   citizens of the city, making lives better for  
25   everyone. And I want to wish those who undertake

2 next journeys running for office, wish all of them  
3 good luck, and I vote aye for all.

4 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

5 COUNCIL CLERK: Koslowitz?

6 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: May I be  
7 excused to explain my vote?

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

9 COUNCIL MEMBER KOSLOWITZ: A year ago I  
10 knew that Corey Johnson was going to be a very good  
11 Speaker, but I never imagined that he would be a  
12 great Speaker. I am happy to be able to spend my last  
13 three years in the City Council under the leadership  
14 of Corey Johnson. Thank you. To Tish, I started off  
15 being a Council Member with you. You were a Council  
16 Member and Public Advocate. I've watched you grow,  
17 and I continue to watch you grow for the rest of my  
18 life. So, thank you for everything that you have  
19 done, and it's a pleasure to know you. And with  
20 that, I vote aye on all, and I just want to wish  
21 everybody happy holidays, merry Christmas, happy New  
22 Year, and happy Kwanza.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL CLERK: Lancman?

2 COUNCIL MEMBER LANCMAN: With  
3 congratulations to Speaker Johnson on a truly  
4 extraordinary year as Speaker and for this body and  
5 with genuine excitement for my friend Tish James  
6 becoming my lawyer of her 18 million or 19 million  
7 fellow New Yorkers, I vote aye on all.

8 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL CLERK: Lander?

10 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Request  
11 permission to explain my vote?

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: Madam Public  
14 Advocate we're really going to miss you. Without  
15 your courage I don't know if we would have had the  
16 guts to form the Progressive Caucus and to push for a  
17 living wage, and paid sick days and police reform.  
18 Without your friendship I know for sure I would have  
19 missed my 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary dinner with my wife  
20 instead of having my son and especially my daughter  
21 gain a role model that they look up to constantly, so  
22 we really are going to miss you here, but we are just  
23 so thrilled you will be fighting fiercely for the  
24 rights of all New Yorkers, and we're grateful and  
25 we're counting on you. Thank you.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 79

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I have to say one  
4 other farewell as well. This is the last meeting for  
5 Annie Levers as my Policy Director. Starting next  
6 week she will be joining the Speaker's team. Mr.  
7 Speaker, you are gaining someone who is truly one of  
8 the smartest and most hard-working and delightful and  
9 decent people that I have ever had the opportunity to  
10 work with, any fast-food workers, and car wash  
11 [inaudible] and Lyft and Uber drivers, and tenants  
12 protected from harassment and people who want a more  
13 integrated City, and I am deeply, deeply grateful  
14 for the years that we spent together. I'd be lying  
15 if I said I was happy about it, but I am genuinely  
16 thrilled for you and for the people of New York who  
17 get to benefit from your work and an even strong--

18 SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] Sorry,  
19 Brad.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER LANDER: I also want to  
21 congratulate Council Member Williams on Intro. 863A  
22 to expand the New York City Human Rights Law to  
23 protect New Yorkers from discrimination based on  
24 their reproductive health choices. I want to thank  
25 Council Member Kallos for pushing forward Intro.

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   80  
2   1288A which I'm pleased to vote for, and with only a  
3   certain amount of begrudging, I vote aye on all  
4   orders on the General Calendar, and I request  
5   permission to vote aye on all Land Use Call-ups?  
6   Madam Public Advocate? I vote aye on those as well.  
7   Thank you.

8           COUNCIL CLERK: Levin?

9           COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Permission to  
10   explain my vote?

11          PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12          COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: Thank you, Madam  
13   Public Advocate. First, I want to thank the Speaker  
14   on an amazing year and for his leadership and his  
15   friendship, and I know that that really goes for  
16   every member of the New York City Council. I'll  
17   quote Ritchie Torres in saying, "If Corey had an  
18   approval rating in the City Council, I suspect it'd  
19   be nearly 100 percent." I think that that's  
20   absolutely true. He has been so amazingly accessible  
21   to Council Members, and sensitive to issues both big  
22   and small, and we greatly appreciate everything you  
23   do for us, Speaker. Thank you. Congratulations.  
24   Madam Public Advocate, I think it needs to be noted  
25   how much you have done for this Council and your



2 dedication to this Council. And you've been a member  
3 of this body for over 15 years, and you have seen  
4 this body grow as an institution, and you have had a  
5 meaningful impact on its strength and all the  
6 important issues that it has worked on over the last  
7 15 years. You have been right there front and center,  
8 and we're so grateful, and we're going to miss you  
9 very dearly. And I can just say personally, as I  
10 first met you I was a staff member. I was 24 years  
11 old, and you always treated me with respect and  
12 decency, and it was a pleasure to serve with you as a  
13 neighbor in the Council and with you as Public  
14 Advocate. I can say to all New Yorkers that you will  
15 have an attorney general that is not only a very  
16 decent person and a very honest, but a person with  
17 utmost integrity-- utmost integrity-- and that is the  
18 most important quality that you can have in an  
19 attorney general, somebody that we can have absolute  
20 confidence in, and I'm proud that you'll be serving  
21 that role. And lastly, before I vote, I just want to  
22 -- is I want to thank you. I also want to thank my  
23 colleague Laurie Cumbo for sponsoring the renaming of  
24 a street in the 33<sup>rd</sup> District in honor of Ken  
25 Thompson--

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 82

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

3 Yeah.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER LEVIN: our late District  
5 Attorney in Brooklyn who did so much in his time as  
6 District Attorney, and is gone far too soon. We send  
7 our love to his family during this holiday season,  
8 and we're very honored to be able to pass this small  
9 token to the Thompson family today, and with that, I  
10 vote aye on all. Thank you.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Rodriguez?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ:

14 Congratulations, Tish.

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER RODRIGUEZ: My daughter  
17 and my family love you a lot. And Speaker, thank you  
18 for the great job, Jason, Chief of Staff, and the  
19 whole team here. And I would like to refer briefly  
20 about two important co-names among a few that we have  
21 here. One is Carlos Cruk [sic] who was a Dominican  
22 brother who-- I didn't get to meet him, but he played  
23 a major role together with Malcolm X organizing,  
24 spending his time fighting for social justice. And  
25 Carlos Cruk from the Dominican Republic from San

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   83

2   Pedro Margaret [sic], and he played important role in  
3   that movement. Also, today to we are naming San  
4   Romero de las America after [inaudible] Romero [sic]  
5   who was killed in El Salvador, one of the most  
6   important leaders that we had in the 80s who inspired  
7   many of us to be fighting since the 1980s for  
8   immigrants and for social justice, and with that, I  
9   vote aye.

10           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

11           COUNCIL CLERK: Levine?

12           COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you, Madam  
13   Public Advocate. Permission to briefly explain my  
14   vote?

15           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16           COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE: Thank you so much.  
17   I think he stepped out, but I do want to congratulate  
18   Speaker Johnson and an extraordinary successful first  
19   year, and I want to thank him personally for helping  
20   to make this such a fulfilling and impactful year to  
21   me, and he's back. You missed the nicest things any  
22   Council Member has ever said about you, Mr. Speaker.  
23   Trust me, they were great. And Madam Public--

24           SPEAKER JOHNSON: [interposing] You can  
25   say it again.

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   84

2           COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE:   You want to--  
3   replay the tape.   Madam Public Advocate thank you for  
4   inspiring me.   Thank you for daring to make history.  
5   I will miss you very, very much around this building,  
6   but I will be swelling with pride as you ascend the  
7   heights.   Please don't be a stranger to your friends  
8   here in the City Council.   We will miss you.   We need  
9   you.   And we celebrate you.   And of course, I will be  
10   for the last time telling you that I will be voting  
11   aye on all.

12           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Thank you.

13           COUNCIL MEMBER LEVINE:   Thank you.

14           COUNCIL CLERK:   Maisel?

15           COUNCIL MEMBER MAISEL:   Yes.

16           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   I love you.

17           COUNCIL CLERK:   Menchaca?

18           COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA:   Permission to  
19   explain my vote?

20           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Yes.

21           COUNCIL MEMBER MENCHACA:   I want to vote--  
22   - I'm going to vote aye on all.   And one of the  
23   things I'm most proud of is now the seventh school in  
24   the district, and this now totals over 3,000 seats  
25   that will be coming to District 38, an incredible

2 feat and a testament to the work that we're doing on  
3 the ground with parents who had been leading that  
4 discussion and restabilizing the relationship with  
5 the SCA, and that's going to help not just over-  
6 crowded issues, over-crowding issues, but the sense  
7 of power and empowerment of our moms in our district.  
8 I want to say thank to Corey Johnson our Speaker, and  
9 thank you for continuing to empower me in voice as  
10 the Chair of Immigration. The work that we do  
11 together is not only important, but it is felt on the  
12 ground. All my colleagues, we got a lot of work to  
13 do. We're going to do it together, and so I wish you  
14 a feliz navidad and happy holidays for next year.  
15 And then finally, I want to address our Public  
16 Advocate. We're going to miss you. I met you the  
17 first week that I came to New York when I was Coro  
18 [sic] fellow. You were our first interview, and if  
19 you could imagine the DNA that you restructured in my  
20 body to fight was all because of you. That propelled  
21 me into where I am today. That shows up in a lot of  
22 different spaces where I challenge the institutions  
23 that I'm a part of, that I'm not a part of, the Mayor  
24 to the Governor, and even you, and I want to say  
25 thank you for allowing me to continue to do that

2 work. And you will be the next attorney general of  
3 the incredible state, and we will fight together, and  
4 I hope that you can join-- we can join together in  
5 that fight. We have laws-- we have a lot of work to  
6 sue the hell out of Trump. We have a lot to sue the  
7 Governor. We have a lot of work to sue the Mayor,  
8 and I think when we find that moment of justice,  
9 we're going to do that together, I have no doubt.  
10 Thank you so much.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12 COUNCIL CLERK: Miller?

13 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Permission to  
14 explain, please?

15 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

16 COUNCIL MEMBER MILLER: Before I lose  
17 this voice. So, I want to start by saying  
18 congratulations once again to our next attorney  
19 general, my good friend and colleague, my sister, and  
20 who is absolutely not going anywhere if you know  
21 Tish. You will see her. She will pop up everywhere  
22 that you walk in the door, and here comes Tish. So  
23 we're excited about the work that you're going to do,  
24 the work that we'll continue to do together. I want  
25 to take a moment to talk about Intro. 633. Today,

2   after three long years of tense legal battles and  
3   negotiations, we have a made a break-through in our  
4   ongoing efforts to combat systematic racism and  
5   unconscious bias and how our City values is work done  
6   by women and people of color within the civil service  
7   core and its workforce. We will pass landmark pay  
8   equity legislation, Introduction 633, that finally  
9   lifts the curtain on the extreme disparities that  
10  have limited the upward mobility and earning  
11  potential of these dedicated workforce members who  
12  toiled for generations only to see that there ascent  
13  slowed by a deep-seeded culture of nepotism,  
14  privilege, and sexism. For years the Administration  
15  acted in a way that was contrary to its principles of  
16  fairness and equity for all New Yorkers regardless of  
17  gender, race, by resisting our efforts to obtain  
18  demographic information that would effectively  
19  eliminate pay discrimination. But we have pushed  
20  hard for a bill that would enable through data  
21  analysis necessary to fix these inequities and to  
22  promote a genuinely merit-based civil service system.  
23  for that, I want to thank Public Advocate, Attorney  
24  General Tish James, Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo,  
25  Speaker Corey Johnson for the courage to once again

2   bring this to the floor and see it to fruition,  
3   President Gloria Middleton, and of course, my friend  
4   and mentor Arthur chilliotis [sp?] as well as the  
5   staff that have worked so hard to pass this  
6   legislation that will make a difference in the lives  
7   of women and folks of color who have unjustly been  
8   passed for promotion and today will bring pay equity.  
9   If you would indulge me, I'd just like to thank the  
10  Civil Service staff, counsel, Malcolm, Kevin,  
11  Elizabeth, and Kendall, from my staff, Brandon Clark  
12  and the great Joe Goldblum [sp?]. and I'd just like  
13  to leave by wishing everyone a happy and safe holiday  
14  season, but also I am also losing a staff member  
15  today who will be moving on to go to work in the  
16  state, and that is Mr. Aksh Patel [sic] is going to  
17  move forward, but I think that is what we're all  
18  about here, cultivating that next generation of  
19  leadership, and I am very proud of the work that we  
20  have done together and look forward to working with  
21  each and every one of you in the year 2019. Thank  
22  you, Madam Public Advocate.

23                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Thank you.

24                   COUNCIL CLERK:   Moya?



1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   89

2           COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA:   Love you Tish.

3   Love you Speaker.   I vote aye on all.

4           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Thank you.

5           COUNCIL CLERK:   Perkins?

6           COUNCIL MEMBER PERKINS:   Aye on all, and  
7   congratulations, Tish.

8           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Thank you.

9           COUNCIL CLERK:   Powers?

10          COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS:   Permission to  
11   explain my vote?

12          PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Yes.

13          COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS:   I won't be as  
14   efficient as Moya, but I'll try. I just want to say  
15   congratulations also to the Speaker for what is a  
16   very successful year. I also want to congratulate  
17   him, Eric Botcher [sp?] and the staff here for the  
18   Garment District that's passing today which is  
19   something they have worked on for a very long time.  
20   So I want to say congrats to them. I want to say  
21   also that we are doing a lot of street renamings,  
22   Biggie and all them, and I know the one that is  
23   really meaningful is the one for Adelaide today, and  
24   I know Lynn Schulman is here, and that is such an  
25   important thing to memorialize her, the work that she

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   90  
2    did to Fortune Society, the work that she's done in  
3    her community. I know that we'll be-- this is really--  
4    - maybe not the one everybody knows as much, but the  
5    one that's really going to be personal to this body.  
6    So thank you for all those who participate in that.  
7    And finally, Ms. Public Advocate, we're so proud of  
8    you. I think you've heard it so I don't want to be  
9    repetitive, but I know you probably want me to be  
10   repetitive. We're really proud of you. You came  
11   from this body. You keep on going up. Maybe  
12   President is next. We don't know. But we are really  
13   proud of the work you're doing and your partnership  
14   and your leadership here. We'll miss you up there.  
15   Corey Johnson will be the next Public Advocate, and  
16   Corey Johnson, I want to say as the former Health  
17   Chair, if you were a restaurant you'd get an A grade  
18   on the front of it. We look forward to you being the  
19   short term Public Advocate as well. Thank you.

20                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

21                   COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: And Merry  
22   Christmas.

23                   COUNCIL CLERK: Richards?

24                   COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS: Permission to  
25   explain my vote?

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   91

2                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Yes.

3                   COUNCIL MEMBER RICHARDS:   First off, I  
4   want to congratulate Tish who's been relentless, I  
5   want to say, principled, more importantly and I think  
6   that's an attribute that we need to keep in mind as  
7   leaders and being conscious of our city and now  
8   obviously our state.   You've proven that you don't  
9   have to change who you are to succeed, and I think  
10   that that's the biggest lesson I think you taught  
11   many in this body and people across the state and  
12   country.   You can be Tish.   You don't have to all of  
13   a sudden be called Letitia.   You have to call me  
14   Letitia.   Tish is fine.   My community really  
15   appreciates you and thank you for being a source most  
16   importantly of inspiration to women I know across the  
17   state, but most importantly, I want to say to those  
18   young women in our community of color who really look  
19   up to you, and that was certainly present last week  
20   at the party at the Giabrua [sp?] Club.   I want to  
21   thank the Speaker and congratulate him on a great  
22   term so far.   You know, when times of controversy  
23   come up, and it's easy as the Speaker to sort of shy  
24   away from things, and I want to thank Corey for his  
25   leadership and standing with us when Ms. Hedley [sic]

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   92  
2   was attacked, because he could have easily just  
3   shrunk in that moment.  And I know we had a private  
4   meeting this week, and he was just as strong in that  
5   meeting with both the Police Commissioner and the  
6   head of HRA.  That's what leadership is about, and I  
7   want to truly thank you for standing with us, and I  
8   know there were many of us, including me at one  
9   point, who might have thought you were going to rule  
10   with an iron fist, and that the battle days could  
11   come back if we weren't with you, but you've proven a  
12   lot of people wrong, and I want to congratulate you  
13   on a good term.  To Edwina, to Ashkar,  
14   congratulations on moving forward in your next  
15   endeavors.  You've been great to work with, always  
16   respectful, pleasant and smiling, and I want to thank  
17   you for who you are and congratulate you.  With that  
18   being said, I vote aye on all.

19           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:  Thank you.

20           COUNCIL CLERK:  Rivera?

21           COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA:  Tish, keep  
22   slaying.  I vote aye on all.

23           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:  Thank you.

24           COUNCIL CLERK:  Rosenthal?

25           COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:  [off mic]

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   93

2           SPEAKER JOHNSON:   You could pass.  You  
3 could pass if you want.

4           COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:  Permission to  
5 explain my vote?

6           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:  Yes.

7           COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL:  Thank you.  
8 I'm just so grateful that my friend Adelaide  
9 Connaughton is having a street named after her, the  
10 Adelaide Connaughton Way was certainly something  
11 special.  She was an amazing woman.  Left us-- she  
12 left us way too soon.  Not only a Queens's community  
13 leader, but really a leader for the City on many  
14 important issues.  I will miss her.  I'm also  
15 delighted that a block of West 63<sup>rd</sup> street in my  
16 district will be co-named Sesame Street.  Sesame  
17 Street serves children everywhere from every  
18 background, and the truth is that they are  
19 extraordinary on how they serve the entire-- yeah,  
20 you look great.  I get an extra second for that.  You  
21 know, Sesame Street serves over 150 million children  
22 in 150 different countries, and it's consistently  
23 been ahead of its time, promoting understanding and  
24 kindness across social, cultural, and economic  
25 barriers.  Their most recent Muppet is Lily who is

2 homeless, and I heard from Lily the other day. She  
3 is a remarkable little Muppet. So, Sesame has a  
4 number-- Sesame has a number of other programs.  
5 Their autism initiative fights stigma often  
6 associated with autism for over 10 years. The Sesame  
7 Street characters and content have helped families of  
8 military families, helped children of military  
9 families manage the obstacles of deployment,  
10 relocation, injury and grief. The Sesame Street  
11 workshop has conducted outreach and education with  
12 millions of the world's most vulnerable children  
13 including those displaced by the tragic conflict in  
14 Syria and refugee populations both in the Middle East  
15 and Bangladesh most recently with the Yemeni  
16 community. So thank you, Sesame Street, for leading  
17 by example and showing all of us that a better world  
18 is possible through simple acts of kindness and  
19 understanding. And congratulations to you, Speaker,  
20 for your awesome first year. Really appreciate all  
21 the support you've given to the Committee on Women.  
22 Thank you. Oh, and I'd like-- oh, wait. And  
23 congratulations to you, Madam Public Advocate--

24 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: [interposing]

25 Thank you.

1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 95

2 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: for being a  
3 leader for women throughout the country. We really  
4 appreciate that.

5 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROSENTHAL: And I vote aye  
7 on all. Yeah, I vote aye on all. Thank you.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Salamanca?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: Permission to  
10 explain my vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER SALAMANCA: First, I would  
13 like to congratulate our Speaker on a productive  
14 year, and I look forward to 2019, and I would like to  
15 congratulate you, Madam Attorney General-elect. The  
16 Bronx is proud of you. And I speak for all of my  
17 NYCHA residents in my council district when I say  
18 that you got it right by naming NYCHA the worst  
19 landlord in the City of New York, and we will  
20 continue-- I know we will continue to work hand-in-  
21 hand to right that wrong. Happy holidays to all, and  
22 I vote aye on all. Thank you.

23 COUNCIL CLERK: Torres?

24 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES: Aye on all.

25 COUNCIL CLERK: Treyger?

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   96

2                   COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER:   Permission to  
3 explain my vote?

4                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Yes.

5                   COUNCIL MEMBER TREYGER:   Public Advocate,  
6 I will never forget how in the pouring rain you came  
7 down to Coney Island on the Boardwalk to support  
8 myself, Councilman Deutsch and our group, a small  
9 group of people that wanted to preserve the Boardwalk  
10 at a time when the Mayor opposed us, and as always,  
11 Tish James wins, and we thank you for always being  
12 there and having our back on issues hyper-local,  
13 citywide, statewide. We wish you much continued  
14 success, Attorney General-elect. Mr. Speaker, I want  
15 to say that I enjoy watching you on Good Day New  
16 York, and I've seen you in action in the Budget Room  
17 both here at City Hall and up in Albany with meetings  
18 with the Governor. We would not have achieved as  
19 Education Chair, we would not have achieved the  
20 significant historic victories for our schools and  
21 for all of our kids if not for your leadership. You  
22 do not take no for an answer, and I am so proud to  
23 call you my Speaker and a friend. I also just want to  
24 very briefly mention that we're having a street co-  
25 naming in my district after Woody Guthrie. That's



2 right Woody Guthrie, one of the most important,  
3 influential musicians of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. His music  
4 and lyrics reflected the country's deep struggles  
5 with inequity and social justice raising awareness  
6 about issues including, but not limited to, racism,  
7 politics, warfare, economic inequality and labor  
8 practices. He settled in Coney Island on Mermaid  
9 Avenue in 1943 where he spent many years of his life,  
10 and by the way, he is so connected to Coney Island  
11 that his family spread his ashes into the water at  
12 the beaches of Coney Island. And Bob Dylan once  
13 referred to Woody Guthrie as the true voice of the  
14 American Spirit. I ask for your support for this  
15 legislation because I believe we have a  
16 responsibility to ensure that current and future  
17 residents of our city do not forget the legacy of  
18 art, music and words as agents of change that Woody  
19 Guthrie forged across this nation and right here in  
20 Coney Island. It was in New York City where Woody  
21 Guthrie wrote perhaps his most famous song, "This  
22 Land is Your Land." Well, Woody, this block is your  
23 block. And with that, I vote aye on all. Happy  
24 holidays. Happy New Year. Thank you.

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   98

2           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   Excellent.  Thank  
3 you.

4           COUNCIL CLERK:  Ulrich?

5           COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH:  Permission to  
6 explain my vote?

7           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:  Yes.

8           COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH:  I would be remiss  
9 if I did not congratulate Corey Johnson on one year  
10 of being a fantastic Speaker of the Council.  I'll be  
11 at the Council Christmas party later, so that means  
12 I'll be calling you around 2:00 a.m. to congratulate  
13 you again.  Expect a call.  I'm just warning you now.

14                           [laughter]

15           COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH:  You can laugh;  
16 it'll happen.  But you know, he treats the three and  
17 a half Republicans here very well.

18                           [laughter]

19           COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH:  We're still  
20 waiting for Holden.  I don't know what's going to  
21 happen, but--

22           SPEAKER JOHNSON:  [interposing] Holden,  
23 you--

24           COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH:  [interposing] He's  
25 in the Republican row, so.

2 SPEAKER JOHNSON: Holden, you look good  
3 in that seat.

4 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: He looks good  
5 here. I'm just saying. But we get treated better  
6 than we should, I think, but anyway.

7 [laughter]

8 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: I also wanted to  
9 share a story about Tish James. We have a Department  
10 of Veterans' Services in this city now, a fully  
11 dedicated agency that serves more than 200,000 men  
12 and women who have served our country. We put MOVA,  
13 the Mayor's Office of Veterans Affairs, on the ash  
14 heap of history and for good reason. It was always  
15 underfunded, never had the resources or the staff  
16 that it needed to do outreach and provide services  
17 and referrals for veterans and their family members.  
18 We got rid of MOVA and we passed that bill, we did  
19 it, my colleagues. But I have to tell you, I  
20 believe-- and I want to say on the record-- that bill  
21 would not have been passed and the Department of  
22 Veteran Services would not exist today if it were not  
23 for the strong and early support that we received  
24 from Public Advocate Letitia James. She was out there  
25 in the rain, in the cold, with the advocates, with

2 the veterans, with the people who care about  
3 veterans, and we beat that drum all the way to the  
4 floor of the City Council, and that bill was signed  
5 into law by Mayor de Blasio shortly thereafter. So,  
6 Tish, on behalf of all the veterans that you have  
7 helped, in particular, I want to say thank you again.  
8 Thank you.

9 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

10 COUNCIL MEMBER ULRICH: And I vote aye on  
11 all, except Intro. 1288A in which I abstain. Thank  
12 you.

13 COUNCIL CLERK: Vallone?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: Madam Advocate,  
15 congratulations.

16 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: God bless you  
18 and your family. Take this next week, please shut  
19 your phone off, enjoy the time, because you deserve  
20 it. You earned it. You worked harder than anyone  
21 we've ever seen before. From myself and my whole  
22 family thank you.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

24 COUNCIL MEMBER VALLONE: To everyone, to  
25 Corey, Speaker, our leader, Corey, thank you very

2 much for always standing with it-- empowering each  
3 and every one of us and giving us the best year I  
4 think we've ever had. So with that, I say aye on all  
5 except for Land Use 259, which I say no. God bless  
6 every one of you. Merry Christmas, happy holidays,  
7 and a healthy, healthy New Year.

8 COUNCIL CLERK: Van Bramer?

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Permission to  
10 briefly explain my vote?

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

12 COUNCIL MEMBER VAN BRAMER: Thank you.  
13 First of all, I vote aye on all, including on all  
14 Land Use Call-ups. I, too, want to congratulate  
15 Corey Johnson our Speaker on an amazing first year.  
16 His support on big things and small including such a  
17 thing called Amazon. On this day when we celebrate a  
18 trailblazer and a woman who has accomplished so much,  
19 I feel like I have to mention Gertrude McDonald [sp?]  
20 and the street that we're honoring for her in our  
21 beloved Sunnyside, Queens. A lot of folks don't  
22 remember now, but Gertrude McDonald was the first  
23 woman to receive a major party nomination for State  
24 Assembly in the 1960s. We honored her in this  
25 chamber when she was approaching 100, and she made

2   her 100<sup>th</sup> birthday, and she is a legend in Queens and  
3   certainly in Sunnyside. And she often talked about  
4   how difficult it was for a woman to run for office  
5   when she ran for office in the 1960s and then  
6   continued to be a civic leader for over half a  
7   century. I also want to say to you, Madam Public  
8   Advocate, I recall a meeting off-end that I believe  
9   only you and I probably remember where there were a  
10   lot of cultural leaders in a room under a previous  
11   Speaker, and the meeting didn't go as we thought it  
12   was going to go, but as you now ascend to this new  
13   leadership position and the sky is truly the limit  
14   for you, I think about that meeting, and how far  
15   people go when people underestimate them. I know you  
16   remember that, too. It's an important reminder of  
17   your uncommon decency with respect to that moment, me  
18   and my mother. So, I want to thank you and  
19   congratulate you on your path and your journey.  
20   Thank you very much.

21                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

22                   COUNCIL CLERK: Williams?

23                   COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: May I be  
24   excused to explain my vote?

25                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

2 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Thank you very  
3 much. First, I want to align myself with the words  
4 of Council Member Barron when speaking on MIH;  
5 however, I'm going to be consistent and vote aye on  
6 all and all Land Use Call-ups because of the Option  
7 One, but my hope is that this body will look at MIH  
8 again and correct the things that were wrong. I do  
9 want to mention Intro. 863 which is called the New  
10 York City Boss [sic] Bill. It actually expands now  
11 beyond employers. The bill adds a sexual and  
12 reproductive health decision to the Human Rights Law.  
13 It is the largest expansion in the nation, locally.  
14 I want to thank Council Member Eugene, the Speaker,  
15 Council Member Cumbo, Council Member Rosenthal,  
16 Rivera, Chin, the Women's Caucus, the Progressive  
17 Caucus, all the sponsors, central staff, the Speaker,  
18 Jason Goldman [sp?], Jeff Baker, Rachel Codera [sp?],  
19 Habana Adjula [sp?], Planned Parenthood New York  
20 City, even Catholic Charities who spoke to me with  
21 their issues, and I'm glad we were able to get it  
22 done, Mike Toomi [sp?], my former LD, Malik Wright  
23 [sp?], my LD now, Administration and the Commission  
24 on Human Rights. This is one of those things I  
25 didn't realize wasn't already a law, but there were

2 some gaps in the state and federal law, and now I'm  
3 happy that we're allowed to close those gaps now:  
4 Coverage in wide-ranging from abortion and birth  
5 control usage to in vitro fertilization, the HIV  
6 testing, and counseling. I'm glad that this city is  
7 going to be leading the nation in how to fight back  
8 against Trump. Corey Johnson, I have been waiting  
9 nine years to serve in a council that understood the  
10 name to be a true co-equal branch of government and  
11 push back when necessary on this Mayor. I'm very  
12 proud to now say that I serve on that council. So  
13 thank you for the past year. I did want to say I'm  
14 glad that my bill is being passed on the same day as  
15 Council Member Cumbo's pay equity bill. Public  
16 Advocate Tish James, I can't say it, but you know  
17 where I'm going, okay?

18 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Don't say it.

19 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS:

20 Congratulations. You have made history. I have  
21 served with you and seen you as a Public Advocate.  
22 Your voice has been a part of almost all of the major  
23 things that we've done here. I thank you for being  
24 one of the core 34 that passed a construction site  
25 safety. I know that the snow chains must have



2 brought you some good luck, and so I hope you can let  
3 me hold them, or at least try on your shoes or  
4 something, because I have some big dreams ahead.  
5 Happy holidays to everyone, and thank you.

6 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm sorry, I  
8 just wanted to say-- I wanted to shout out Mohammad  
9 Ali Gina [sp?] being co-named. He's a founder of  
10 modern [sic] Pakistan and is going to be the  
11 beginning of Little Pakistan. Thank you.

12 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: And how do you  
13 vote?

14 COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Aye on all,  
15 and-- aye on all and all Land Use Call-ups.

16 COUNCIL CLERK: Yeger?

17 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Madam President,  
18 may I be excused to explain my vote?

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Yes.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER YEGER: Thank you. I'm not  
21 going to echo by word what everybody else has said,  
22 but my feelings I made known earlier. With respect  
23 to the street namings, clearly Council Member  
24 Rosenthal has the best street co-naming on this  
25 entire bill, but I wish to quickly mention my salute

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   106  
2   to Council Member Richards for naming the-- co-naming  
3   the street for Rabbi Rafael Palkovitz [sp?]. He was  
4   a tremendous scholar in my community. He was a  
5   personal Rabbi to members of my family and he was a  
6   leader and a pioneer in Far Rockaway, and that was a-  
7   - that is a wise choice and I salute you for doing  
8   that. Madam President, I vote aye on all with the  
9   exception of 1288 and Intro. 633 on which I vote no.  
10  Thank you very much. Happy holidays to all.

11           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

12           COUNCIL CLERK: Cumbo?

13           COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: Thank you. I just  
14  want to start off by also thanking Speaker Corey  
15  Johnson. You have done an amazing job at elevating  
16  the issues that matter most to members, and for that,  
17  I thank you. I also want to congratulate you for the  
18  cover of City and State. Quite remarkable in your  
19  first year. This is really phenomenal. I also want  
20  to bring attention to individuals I didn't get a  
21  chance to thank with Intro. 633A, our wage  
22  transparency bill. I want to thank Laura Popa, Jeff  
23  Baker, Teirsa Nasir [sp?], Rachel Cadera [sp?],  
24  Gloria Middleton, Arthur Chilliotis [sp?], Beverly  
25  Nufil [sp?], Amenta Killawon [sp?], Malcolm Butcheron

2 [sp?], Monica Abben [sp?], and Sebastian Levenson,  
3 and all of the people that made this possible. I also  
4 want to recognize the Biggie Smalls and Ken Thompson  
5 Street co-namings. The Biggie Smalls co-naming was  
6 quite a controversial one, but it's undeniable that  
7 Biggie Smalls was perhaps the most internationally  
8 renowned figure coming out of Brooklyn, New York, and  
9 he has left his print on the boroughs of Brooklyn,  
10 New York. It's undeniable that he is an ingredient in  
11 the identity of Brooklyn, New York. And when you  
12 think about Ken Thompson, our first District Attorney  
13 ever elected from the borough that's of African-  
14 American descent, these are two individuals that  
15 lived a block away from one another, but yet have two  
16 very distinctive stories, which is what Brooklyn is  
17 made of. And to my love, Public Advocate, now  
18 Attorney General-elect, I love you.

19 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Love you.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: It has been an  
21 exciting road. There's a song that reminds me of  
22 you, "The Wind Beneath my Wings," and it says, "It  
23 must have been cold there in my shadow to never have  
24 sunlight in your face. You were content to let me  
25 shine. That's your way. You always walked a step

2 behind." Well, I didn't exactly always walk a step  
3 behind, and it wasn't actually always cold in your  
4 shadow. It's been red-hot, fiery, controversial, the  
5 greatest roller coaster ride that I have ever been  
6 on, and you are the greatest, and we are so excited.  
7 It's been an honor for you to be my predecessor, and  
8 as you continue to rise, I continue to rise, and keep  
9 warming up that seat for me. Thank you. And I vote  
10 aye on all.

11 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Love you. Love  
12 your parents.

13 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: OH, and I want to  
14 thank them, too. I want to thank my parents for being  
15 here.

16 [applause]

17 COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO: And although  
18 Prince is not here, I want to thank him as well,  
19 because I didn't know how I was going to get through  
20 this first year as the Majority Leader mom, but so  
21 many of you have been so helpful, and I thank my  
22 parents for helping me get through this year. It's  
23 been an exciting ride, and Prince has informed so  
24 much of the legislation that I have passed this year.  
25 Thank you all so much.

2 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL CLERK: Speaker Johnson?

4 SPEAKER JOHNSON: I vote aye on all, and  
5 if people want to celebrate our outgoing Public  
6 Advocate and Attorney General-elect with the cake  
7 that we got, hopefully there will be very few people  
8 who speak during General Discussion so we can get out  
9 of here. So, I vote aye on all.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: As we wait for the  
11 results, I just want to say-- I want to congratulate  
12 the Speaker and his staff for an incredible year. I  
13 want to congratulate President Middleton, who I guess  
14 has left, and Arthur Chilliotis, and all the members  
15 of CWA, and the Majority Leader Laurie Cumbo, who's  
16 an excellent friend, my dear sister, my little  
17 sister, and my neighbor. I want to thank her for  
18 this long trail to justice for women in New York  
19 City. Thank you for honoring my neighbor Ken  
20 Thompson who was a great District Attorney in the  
21 borough of Brooklyn, and thank you for voting for my  
22 bill today, my last bill here in the City Council,  
23 which would expand organics collection in the City of  
24 New York. It's been a bittersweet moment for me. For  
25 the past 15 years, five years as Public Advocate and

2   10 years as the City Council representing the 35<sup>th</sup>  
3   District. This beautiful storied room has been home  
4   to so many memories for me. It's been the great  
5   honor of my life to work here with you in the  
6   People's Chamber doing the people's business.  
7   Together in this room we fought for transparency and  
8   accountability from our government. We have worked  
9   every year to ensure that the old saying that a  
10  budget is a moral document is more than just a  
11  talking point. You guys have actually actualized it.  
12  It's been great to work with this tremendous staff,  
13  and I will always respect staff as a former staff  
14  member. I know that we don't get anything done  
15  without our staff, and so I truly honor them and  
16  appreciate them and will always respect them. We  
17  have passed laws that reflect the needs and values of  
18  the people who trusted us to represent them, even  
19  especially those New Yorkers traditionally excluded  
20  from the halls of power. And even though today is my  
21  last day sitting in this chair, presiding over this  
22  body, it will always-- this will always be the place  
23  where a girl from Brooklyn without rich friends-- I  
24  was trying to do this without crying--

25                           [applause]

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   111

2           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:   This girl from  
3 Brooklyn without rich friends and without powerful  
4 connections, she plowed through believing in her  
5 convictions, and believing that-- believing in a  
6 simple concept called justice and was given the  
7 chance to serve as a dually elected in the voice of  
8 the people.  And so today I just say thank you and  
9 just to remind all of you the most vulnerable amongst  
10 us, the poor, the residents of NYCHA who are  
11 suffering, seniors, children, veterans, all of those  
12 who are excluded, they speak through us.  Continue to  
13 speak for them.  Thank you so much, and God bless  
14 you.

15                           [applause]

16           COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:   Please join us in  
17 the committee room for cake.  Cake Man Raven [sic],  
18 it's the best cake in the City of New York.

19           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:  All items on  
20 today's General Order Calendar--

21           COUNCIL MEMBER CUMBO:  [interposing] Prove  
22 me wrong.

23           PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES:  were adopted by a  
24 vote of 48 in the affirmative, 0 and 0 abstentions,  
25 with the exception of Land Use 270 and 271 which was

1           STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL   112  
2   adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 1  
3   negative, and 0 abstentions, and Intro. 1288A which  
4   was adopted by a vote of 39 in the affirmative, 6  
5   negative and 3 abstentions, and Intro. 863A which was  
6   adopted by a vote of 46 in the affirmative, 2  
7   negative, and 0 abstentions, and Intro. 748A which  
8   was adopted by a vote of 47 in the affirmative, 1  
9   negative, and 0 abstentions, and Land Use 259  
10   Resolution 704 which was adopted by a vote of 47 in  
11   the affirmative, 1 negative, and 0 abstentions, and  
12   Intro. 633A which was adopted by a vote of 47 in the  
13   affirmative, 1 negative, and 0 abstentions, and the  
14   revised Land Use Call-up vote is 48 in the  
15   affirmative, 0 in the negative. Introduction and  
16   reading of bills?

17                   SPEAKER JOHNSON: All bills have been  
18   referred to Committee as indicated on the agenda.

19                   PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Discussion of  
20   Resolutions, the Resolution 566-- quiet in the  
21   chambers, please. We are still in session.  
22   Resolution calling on the state legislature to pass  
23   and the Governor to sign A10935A and S8844A which  
24   would amend the education law to automatically enroll  
25   optional employees in the New York City Board of



1 STATED MEETING OF THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL 113

2 Education Retirement System, BERS, after 90 days of  
3 employment unless the employee affirmatively opts in  
4 or out of the program in advance. Any discussion?  
5 All of those in favor say aye.

6 COUNCIL AS A WHOLE: Aye.

7 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: All of those  
8 opposed? Any abstention? The ayes have it. Now  
9 General Discussion, and the only speaker is Council  
10 Member Rivera.

11 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: Alright, so  
12 there's a resolution--

13 [off mic comments]

14 [laughter]

15 COUNCIL MEMBER RIVERA: [inaudible] Give  
16 me one second. I just want to clear my throat. So,  
17 I'm introducing a resolution today to ask Congress to  
18 pass the Count Victims Act, which is to help speed up  
19 access to benefits for disaster victims and aid in  
20 agency and nonprofit coordination during and after  
21 disasters. I say this because many of you know I'm a  
22 proud Puerto Rican woman-- woman-- and there are  
23 still people in Puerto Rico who are suffering. The  
24 President still will not admit how many people have  
25 died on that island, 2,975. So I ask you to join me

2 in supporting this resolution, and to everyone who  
3 has helped me around issues on Puerto Rico, Land Use,  
4 Zoning, Women's Issues-- a special thank you to Corey  
5 Johnson, Jason Goldman-- he's been alright-- and to  
6 everyone here thank you for making my first year  
7 really, really special. I'm really proud of this  
8 body. Happy holidays. Let them eat cake.

9 [applause]

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Congratulations.

11 And now closing remarks from our Speaker Corey  
12 Johnson.

13 SPEAKER JOHNSON: This meeting of  
14 December 20<sup>th</sup>, 2018, the last Stated Meeting of the  
15 New York City Council in this first year of the new  
16 session is hereby adjourned, and would everyone  
17 please join us in the member's lounge celebrating our  
18 Public Advocate Letitia James. As they said, let her  
19 eat cake.

20 [gavel]

21 PUBLIC ADVOCATE JAMES: Thank you. Thank  
22 you guys. Thank you so much. Thank you.

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date January 21, 2019