COMMITTEE ON FINANCE CITY COUNCIL CITY OF NEW YORK -----Х TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES Of the COMMITTEE ON FINANCE ----- Х September 28, 2023 Start: 10:25 a.m. Recess: 10:38 a.m. HELD AT: COMMITTEE ROOM - CITY HALL B E F O R E: Justin L. Brannan, Chairperson COUNCIL MEMBERS: Diana Ayala Charles Barron Gale A. Brewer Selvena N. Brooks-Powers David M. Carr Farrah N. Louis Francisco P. Moya Keith Powers Pierina Ana Sanchez Althea Stevens Marjorie Velazquez Nantasha M. Williams Julie Won World Wide Dictation 545 Saw Mill River Road - Suite 2C, Ardsley, NY 10502

2	SERGEANT-AT-ARMS: Good morning and
3	welcome to the New York City hybrid vote on Finance.
4	Please silence all electronic devices.
5	At no time, please do not approach the
6	dais. If you have any questions, please raise your
7	hand and one of us, the Sergeant-at-Arms, will kindly
8	assist you. Thank you for your kind cooperation.
9	Chair, we are ready to begin.
10	CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: [GAVEL] Okay, good
11	morning, everybody. Welcome to today's Finance
12	Committee meeting. I'm Council Member Justin Brannan,
13	and I have the privilege of Chairing the Committee on
14	Finance. We've been joined today by Council Members
15	Velazquez, Brewer, Carr, Won, Williams, Powers,
16	Brooks-Powers, Louis, Ayala, and Stevens, and we've
17	got Moya, Sanchez, and Barron on Zoom.
18	Today, the Committee will be voting on
19	the following items, two property tax exemption
20	Resolutions and four Preconsidered Resolutions to
21	amend and restate the property tax class share for
22	FY-24.
23	The first property tax exemption is a new
24	Article XI resolution for construction of two new
25	all-affordable co-op homeownership buildings in

Council Member Farias' District. The project will be
two four-story buildings of 58 total units priced for
households between 65 and 90 percent AMI.

5 The second property tax exemption is a renewal of a previously granted Article V exemption 6 7 for one building in Council Member Abreu's District. The building is a HUD-assisted rental for low-income 8 9 senior households at 50 percent AMI. As a condition for the renewal, the sponsor will implement capital 10 11 upgrades, repairs, and reserve 30 percent of turnover units for homeless senior households while providing 12 13 supportive services.

14 Finally, the Preconsidered Resolutions 15 would amend and restate the property tax rates for FY-24. Every year, the Council is required to set the 16 17 real property tax rates for each tax class as part of 18 the budget adoption process. Codified in State Law, 19 the required formula to calculate the tax rates 20 leaves the Council with very little discretion in 21 setting the rates. However, recognizing that the 2.2 formula from the State would result in large 23 increases to the tax class rates for Class 1 and Class 2 properties in FY-24, the Council called on 24 25 the State to pass a law amending the formula so that

2	we could set more favorable tax rates for City
3	homeowners. The Governor recently signed that bill
4	meaning that the Council now has what we need to pass
5	this package of four Resolutions to amend the rates
6	and to lower them. Due to the timing of the tax rate
7	setting process, State Law authorizes the Department
8	of Finance to use the FY-24 tax rates to calculate
9	the initial FY-24 tax bills which are mailed out in
10	early June. The Department of Finance will
11	subsequently update the tax bills due to reflect the
12	new rates to the mid-year bills and what we vote on
13	today. The amended FY-24 tax rates will be in effect
14	by this point, superseding the rates put in place at
15	budget adoption back in June so basically what we
16	passed in June was a placeholder, and we're making it
17	permanent now and we're lowering the rates meaning
18	that property owners will only see a change from the
19	old FY-23 rates to the amended FY-24 rates in their
20	bill. Taxpayers will never see the FY-24 rates and
21	never have to pay the FY-24 rates that the Council
22	was required to set at budget adoption back in June.
23	Important to understand the process.
24	Are there any other comments or questions
25	from my Colleagues on these items?

1 COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 5 Seeing none, I will ask the inimitable 2 3 Billy Martin to call the roll. COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank 4 you. Good morning. William Martin, Committee Clerk. 5 Roll call vote Committee on Finance. All items are 6 7 coupled. Chair Brannan. 8 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: I vote aye. 9 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Ayala. 10 COUNCIL MEMBER AYALA: Aye. 11 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Moya. 12 COUNCIL MEMBER MOYA: I vote aye. COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank 13 14 you. Powers. 15 COUNCIL MEMBER POWERS: Aye. 16 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Louis. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER LOUIS: Aye. 18 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank 19 you. Council Member... 20 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Hello. Council 21 Member Barron you said? 2.2 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Council 23 Member Barron. 24 25

2 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, okay. I vote 3 aye on all except for the project that 65 to 90 4 percent AMI. I vote no on that. COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank 5 you, Council Member. Brewer. 6 7 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I vote aye, and I want to thank the Staff for all the work they did on 8 9 the property tax. I know that down the line we still 10 have a lot of work to do in terms of the lawsuit, 11 redressing it, task force, and all the assessment 12 issues, but thank you to the Staff, and I vote aye. COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank 13 14 you. One moment. 15 CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Council Member 16 Barron, please go on mute. 17 COUNCIL MEMBER BARRON: Oh, sorry. 18 COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank 19 you. Apologies. Brooks-Powers. 20 COUNCIL MEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: I vote aye. COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank 21 2.2 you. Sanchez. 23 COUNCIL MEMBER SANCHEZ: Aye. COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank 24 25 you. Stevens.

1	COMMITTEE ON FINANCE 7
2	COUNCIL MEMBER STEVENS: Aye.
3	COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN:
4	Velazquez.
5	COUNCIL MEMBER VELAZQUEZ: Aye.
6	COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Williams.
7	COUNCIL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I vote aye.
8	COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Won.
9	COUNCIL MEMBER WON: Aye.
10	COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Carr.
11	COUNCIL MEMBER CARR: I'll be voting yes
12	on LUs 273 and 274 and no on the rest.
13	COMMITTEE CLERK WILLIAM MARTIN: Thank
14	you. One moment. Apologies.
15	With a vote of 14 in the affirmative,
16	zero in the negative, and no abstentions, all items
17	have been adopted with the exceptions of the property
18	tax resolutions and Preconsidered LU in reference to
19	Stevenson Commons were adopted by the Committee with
20	13 in the affirmative, 1 in the negative, and no
21	abstentions.
22	CHAIRPERSON BRANNAN: Okay. Thank you.
23	With that, this hearing is adjourned.
24	
25	
I	

## CERTIFICATE

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date \_\_\_\_\_ September 29, 2023