

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON
ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

----- X

October 13, 2022

Start: 2:38 p.m.

Recess: 5:09 p.m.

HELD AT: Council Chambers, City Hall

B E F O R E: James F. Gennaro, Chairperson

COUNCILMEMBERS:

Jennifer Gutiérrez

Kamillah Hanks

Robert F. Holden

Ari Kagan

Julie Menin

Francisco P. Moya

Sandy Nurse

Lincoln Restler

Alexa Avilés

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

CHAIRPERSON GENNARO:

Anthony Fiore
Chief Decarbonization Officer
Deputy Commissioner of Energy Management
Dept of Citywide Administrative Services

Christopher Diamond
Director
Office of Sustainability, Resilience and
Commissioning
Department of Design and Construction

Julia Casagrande
Policy Advisor
Mayor's Office of Climate and
Environmental Justice

Ali Khan
Mayor's Office of Climate and
Environmental Justice

Rebecca Fishman
Mayor's Office of Climate and
Environmental Justice

Ms. Catarina Korath
Resident of Astoria, Queens

Karl Palmquist
Vice Chair
New York City Group of the Sierra Club

Lonnie Portis

Environmental Policy and Advocacy
Coordinator
WE ACT for Environmental Justice

Paul Mankiewicz
Environmental Engineer

Eric Weltman
Senior Organizer
Food and Water Watch

Daniel Chu
Energy Planner
New York City Environmental Justice
Alliance

Jeanne Bergman
Sane Energy Project and
Public Power New York Coalition

Karen Imas
Public Policy Manager
Attentive Energy

Cindy Beauvais[sp?]
Citizen of New York

Joanna Oltman Smith
Member of 350 Brooklyn

Milo
Resident of the Lower East Side

Haym Gross
Chair
New York City 2030 District

Donna De Constanzo
Eastern Regional Director
Climate and Clean Energy Program at NRDC

Georgie Page
Member of 350 Brooklyn

Alexis Hidalgo
Equitable Policy and Programs Fellow
New York League of Conservation Voters

Ken Coughlin
Board Member
Stop The Chop NY NJ

Shravanthi Kanekal
Resiliency Planner
New York City Environmental Justice
Alliance

Rami Dinnawi
Environmental Justice Coordinator
El Puente

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good afternoon and welcome to
3 today's hybrid New York City council hearing for the
4 Committee on Environmental Protection. To minimize
5 these eruptions, please place all electronic devices
6 to vibrate or silent mode. If you'd like to submit
7 testimony please send via email to
8 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Again that is
9 testimony@council.nyc.gov. Thank you for your
10 cooperation Chair Gennaro, we are ready to begin.

11 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, Sergeant. I
12 think at the outset, I just want to thank everyone
13 for their patience. This was a one o'clock hearing.
14 The other hearing ran long. And so I... It is
15 regrettable that that happens sometimes. So I want
16 to thank you for your patience, and for the members
17 of the committee and people out there in Zoom land,
18 who are watching. Good afternoon. My name is Jim
19 Gennaro, Chair of the Committee on Environmental
20 Protection. Is coming through through the mask? Can
21 you hear it? Okay. And we'll be holding an... an
22 oversight hearing today on renewable energy as well
23 as New York City's climate adaptation efforts. We'll
24 be hearing testimony on four pieces of legislation,
25 Intro 315, authored by Councilmember Brannon in

2 relation to identifying all vacant and underutilized
3 municipally-owned sites that would be suitable for
4 the development of renewable energy. That sounds
5 like a good idea. Intro 330, sponsored by me, that
6 would require the city to create and maintain a
7 database of subsurface conditions to support wider
8 adoption of geothermal heat pumps. Res... Resolution
9 169, authored by councilmember Restler, calling upon
10 the CLCPA, Climate Action Council to draft, and the
11 governor to implement a final Climate Action Council
12 scoping plan that commits to meeting CLCPA targets
13 and bold climate and environmental justice action in
14 New York.

15 Resolution 189, author... authored by
16 Councilmember... Councilmember Aviles in support of
17 the New York State Build Public Renewables Act, which
18 would enable the New York Power Authority to build
19 and... to build and own new renewable power
20 generation storage and transmission. The Reso
21 supports the New York State Build Public Renewables
22 Act, which is now in the state legislature. Proposed
23 Reso 258 A, authored by me, supporting the Clean
24 Water, Clean Air, and Green Jobs Environmental Bond
25 Act of 2022, which will be on the ballot this

2 November 8. If it is enacted by the voters would
3 authorize the issuance of \$4.2 billion in bonds to
4 finance critical environmental restoration and
5 resiliency projects across the State of New York.
6 And I'll get into the fair share component of that
7 when I... when I hear testimony on it, I'm just
8 trying to go quickly.

9 10 years ago, Superstorm Sandy devastated New
10 York City causing an estimated \$19 billion in losses,
11 in addition to damaging residential and commercial
12 property. The storm also severely affected critical
13 city infrastructure and services. Close to 2 million
14 people lost power at some point during the storm.
15 ConEd steam system was unable to service one third of
16 its customers for nearly two weeks. But two months
17 before Sandy, the council passed Local Law 42 of 2012
18 in order to prepare for and mitigate the impact of
19 climate change on New York City. That Local Law
20 codified the New York City Panel on Climate Change,
21 which previously was created by Mayor Bloomberg. It
22 had like a specific scope to look at city
23 infrastructure. So it came with the business, went
24 out of business. I brought it back and give it
25 like... gave it a much broader scope to do more than

2 just... just looking at infrastructure, to look at
3 the city the... the impact on the city's economy, the
4 impact on marginalized communities. It was like a
5 whole thing. And so that's what... one of the things
6 that Local Law 42 of 2012 did. The other thing that
7 Local Law 42 of 2012 did is that it... it... hang on,
8 I lost my place. Right. This law also created the
9 New York City Climate Adaptation Taskforce. The idea
10 was for the New York City Panel on Climate Change to
11 do its thing and then then to interact with the, you
12 know, Climate Change Adaptation Taskforce and figure
13 out how the city in a... in a sensible, you know,
14 measured, studious way could walk down the field
15 towards climate in a resilient future that we all
16 want, because of what I feared two months before
17 Sandy, that we wouldn't get a big storm and like a
18 lot of storm surge, and no one would know what the
19 hell to do. And that's exactly what happened. So I
20 should have come up with that law several years
21 earlier. But one of the, you know, one of the things
22 that we want to probe in this hearing is that
23 whatever became of the New York City Climate Change
24 Adaptation Taskforce... the New York City Climate
25 Change Adaptation Taskforce. That's a real thing.

2 It's in law. No one seems to be able to find it.

3 And so I didn't write the law for nothing, and I want
4 to find it, and we're going to ask today about that.

5 And, you know, notwithstanding the Adap New York
6 Resiliency Plan that is being drafted by the
7 administration, pursuant to Local Law 122 of 2021 --
8 and it's my understanding that it is going to be
9 rolled out on the 10th anniversary of Sandy, you
10 know, I want to probe the activities of the New York
11 City Climate Adaptation Taskforce over the last 10
12 years, just to see what, if anything, it is doing
13 now.

14 I'd like to... I'd like to thank the great
15 committee staff who have done such great work over
16 the years. We have a Committee Council, Samira
17 Swanston, who was not able to be here because she's
18 under the weather. We send her our best and hope
19 that she recovers fully. In her stead, we have Irene
20 Byoski, policy analysts, Rick Kichala, financial
21 analyst, analyst Andrew Lane Lawless, and finally my
22 legislative director, Nabi Carr, for all of their
23 hard work.

24 And with that, I am going to recognize the
25 Councilmembers that are here. We have councilmember

2 Hanks, Councilmember Nurse, Councilmember Restler,
3 who I'm going to call upon him in a minute to do a
4 statement on his Reso, Councilmember... Councilmember
5 Aviles. I would like to offer her the opportunity to
6 make a statement as well. Councilmember Kagan, and
7 Councilmember Menin. And with that, I know that... I
8 know that Lincoln has a time crunch.

9 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: I can go first.

10 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay, okay. So okay.

11 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: I'm happy to. I'll jump
12 in.

13 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay. Lincoln is going.

14 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: Chair Gennaro. Firstly,
15 it's good to see you. I'm glad you're feeling
16 better.

17 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you.

18 COUNCILMEMBER RESTLER: I know it was a rough
19 patch. So we're happy to see you back approaching
20 full strength. I just want to thank all of my
21 colleagues. I think there's 37 of us who have joined
22 as co sponsors of resolution 169. And so I want to
23 thank each of you for your strong support. And thank
24 all of the tremendous advocates who have pushed for
25 this resolution, which I really do believe is

1 critically important. [CLERK ADJUST MICROPHONE]
2 I'll bring that in a little closer, sorry. My
3 vertical challenges are even... even felt when I'm
4 sitting. The... But I... The City Council knows
5 all too well, that the climate crisis is the single
6 greatest threat facing the people of New York. It's
7 here. It's now, and it depends... demands nothing
8 less than urgent and comprehensive action. This
9 resolution calls on the State Climate Action Council
10 and the governor to implement a final scoping plan
11 this year, to meeting New York's Climate Leadership
12 and Community Protection Act (the CLCPA) targets and
13 taking bold climate and environmental justice action
14 in New York.

16 With the passage of the CLCPA, we no longer have
17 climate goals in New York State we have climate
18 mandates. And the purpose of the Climate Action
19 Council's scoping work is to flesh out those climate
20 mandates with specific actions that will do what
21 needs to be done to drive down emissions.

22 The mandates in the CLCPA could not be more
23 ambitious and impressive. We are proud as New
24 Yorkers to be a national leader in this space to
25 fight climate change. The mandates are as follows:

2 For the state to reach net zero carbon economy by
3 2050, a 100% zero emission electric sector by 2040, a
4 40% reduction in greenhouse gas emissions by 2030,
5 70% renewable energy by 2030. Meeting these targets
6 is essential to ensuring that we mitigate the harms
7 caused by climate crisis... by the climate crisis and
8 work towards building a green efficient city that
9 isn't overcome by the rising sea levels, the annual
10 superstorms, the unbreathable air, and the sweltering
11 summers.

12 The 10 year anniversary of Hurricane Sandy is
13 almost upon us, and it's a sobering reminder that the
14 failure to act on climate change has devastating
15 consequences. We have lost neighbors and loved ones,
16 and seen our communities destroyed from Sandy and
17 subsequent storms. Communities are still not
18 recovered from the aftermath of Sandy. In my
19 district at Gowanus Houses, we still have capital
20 work that has not been done to fix the destruction
21 caused by Sandy. It's clear we need to do everything
22 in our power to ensure that our neighborhoods aren't
23 devastated yet again by the next superstorm. We also
24 need to ensure that the communities who have been
25 historically and continually harmed most by the

2 impacts of climate change are able to reap the
3 benefits of these changes. The CLCPA rightly calls
4 for 40% of the green investments to be directed to
5 disadvantaged, vulnerable communities, especially
6 communities of color. We must work together to make
7 sure these billions of dollars are going to the
8 places that need it most. To avoid climate
9 devastation, we need action on every level of
10 government to rein in corporate actors, set ambitious
11 meaningful targets, and push to meet them. We are
12 sending a strong and unified message that this city
13 council and the 8.6 million people that we represent
14 knows that the CAC must act to comprehensively
15 address climate change on our streets, in our
16 neighborhoods, across our city, and in our state. We
17 hope that the CAC and the governor will heed the call
18 and implement the strongest possible plan to... to
19 address climate change in our community. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, Councilmember
21 Restler. Thank you for your, you know, passionate
22 voice on this. There... There's a lot of advocates
23 that have... you know, _____ was not able to make
24 it this morning, but I would like to thank all the
25 advocates that have been critical in, you know, being

2 part of the team to make sure that this Council makes
3 its voice heard. So I thank you very much, Lincoln,
4 for your... for your passion on this.

5 And before I call councilmember Avilés, I want to
6 recognize that we're joined by Councilmember
7 Gutierrez, a great member of this committee. And now
8 I recognize Councilmember Avilés for a statement on
9 her resolution.

10 COUNCILMEMBER AVILÉS: Thank you so much Chair
11 Gennaro for holding this hearing today on Resolution
12 189, a bill which supports the state level
13 legislation known as Build Public Renewables Act.
14 With the passage of the Landmark Climate Leadership
15 and Community Protection Act of 2019, New York State
16 committed to moving away from non-renewable energy
17 and relying entirely on renewable energy sources,
18 combined with recently... with the recently passed
19 federal legislation, the Inflation Reduction Act,
20 which proves... which provides incentives to
21 nonprofit entities as well as a host of subsidies for
22 efficiency upgrades, there now exists, at least from
23 a cost benefit perspective, not a single reason why
24 we cannot build a democratically-owned public power
25 authority. The Build Public Renewables Act will lead

2 us into the future not just on renewable energy, but
3 on labor and employment standards, and will
4 undoubtedly serve as a model to other states who
5 pursue democratization of utility services. This
6 legislation will ensure that the people of New York
7 are offered quality, livable, and unionized jobs.
8 Workers currently employed and non-renewables will be
9 offered a just transition to green energy jobs, and
10 near and dear to my heart as Chair of Public Housing
11 Committee, the BPRC will require the New York Public
12 Utilities Authority to prioritize the hiring of
13 residents at NYCHA to undertake work done at NYCHA
14 owned properties. We know that thus far privately
15 owned utilities have failed to rise up to the
16 challenge of meeting climate goals, and to say
17 nothing of their willingness to center justice in
18 their business practices. While I don't fault for-
19 profit entities for what may be the nature of their
20 business, these entrenched interests should not
21 prevent us from leveraging the incredible opportunity
22 before us to build a better future for our city and
23 state. We've squandered so much time with regards to
24 the climate crisis. We've squandered time in failing
25 to heed to the calls of our environmental justice

2 communities. Let us not miss this moment. Now is
3 the time to mobilize. Now is a time to lead with
4 vision. I want to thank all the 27 cosponsors of
5 this Resolution, thank my state level colleagues who
6 have put forward the bill. I look forward to working
7 with the advocates in the room today in this fight
8 for a democratically accountable public utility that
9 centers justice. And I look forward to hearing for
10 the comments that will be offered on this legislation
11 today.

12 And I would be remiss if I did not mention the
13 island of Puerto Rico, who is also fighting to make
14 the utility public again. It was public at one point
15 and put into private hands. And we see the result of
16 that, much to the catastrophe and ongoing assault to
17 the people of Puerto Rico. Fuera LUNG MASS. Build
18 public renewables. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, Councilmember
20 Avilés for your common sense, and insightful and very
21 important Resolution, we really appreciate you
22 bringing it forward, and thank you for being here.

23 Before I turn it over to the Counsel to swear in
24 the witnesses, I want to recognize that we're joined
25

2 by Councilmember Robert Holden, a member of this
3 committee.

4 So I'll call upon the Counsel to do the
5 housekeeping and to swear witnesses in, and then we
6 can commence with your testimony.

7 COUNSEL: Thank you Chair.

8 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: If I just may... we're also
9 joined by Councilmember Moya, so I wanted to put that
10 on the record. Thank you for being here, Francisco.

11 COUNSEL: Thank you, Chair, again. Good
12 afternoon, everyone. And now I'd like to welcome
13 representatives from the administration to testify.

14 We have Antony Fiore, and Julia Casagrande, and
15 also Chris Diamond, who will be available for
16 questions and will be appearing over Zoom. And now I
17 would like to ask you to raise your right hands.

18 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth
19 and nothing but the truth before this committee today
20 and respond honestly to Councilmember questions?

21 ALL: Yes.

22 COUNSEL: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you.

24 COUNSEL: And Mr. Diamond? I guess I saw him...

25 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Has everyone been sworn?

2 COUNSEL: Mr. Diamond? I just... we just did not
3 hear you answer. Thank you. That was a yes.

4 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: We could read his lips.
5 Okay. Very good.

6 COUNSEL: Mr. Fiore, you may begin your
7 testimony.

8 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yes. Thank you for being
9 here and for offering your good testimony.

10 MR. FIORE: Okay. Good afternoon, Councilmember
11 Gennaro, members of the Committee on Environmental
12 Protection. Thank you for the opportunity to testify
13 on the potential for renewable energy generation and
14 installation of geothermal heat pump systems in New
15 York City, subjects of Introductions 315 and 330.
16 Again, my name is Anthony Fiore. I am New York
17 City's Chief Decarbonization Officer, and Deputy
18 Commissioner of Energy Management at the Department
19 of Citywide Administrative Services. In this role, I
20 oversee decarbonization mandates for city government
21 operations.

22 I'm joined today by Christopher Diamond, the
23 Director of the Office of Sustainability, Resilience
24 and Commissioning at the city's Department of Design
25 and Construction, and Julia Casagrande policy advisor

2 at the New York City Mayor's Office of Climate and
3 Environmental Justice.

4 In partnership with the Council, the
5 Administration has committed to achieving carbon
6 neutrality by 2050, focusing primarily on
7 opportunities to invest in environmental justice
8 neighborhoods. The city shares the goals that these
9 bills seek to address, and looks forward to working
10 with the Council on this legislation to inform the
11 potential to generate renewable energy, and
12 decarbonize our building systems in New York City.

13 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: And if I could just jump in
14 for a second: When you talk about this legislation,
15 you're talking about 315 and 330. Is that right?

16 MR. FIORE: That's correct.

17 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay.

18 MR. FIORE: The city has committed to using clean
19 sources of electricity to power New York City
20 Government operations, and increasing renewable
21 energy generation on city properties. Notably, DCAS
22 is deploying 100 megawatts of solar on city
23 properties by 2025 to reduce load and improve local
24 grid reliability. To date, the city has completed
25 over 120 solar projects that generate about 18

2 megawatts of electricity, and has identified nearly
3 200 additional sites as solar ready. Building on
4 this success, the city has also committed to securing
5 100% of its electrical consumption from renewable
6 energy. The Adams Administration has made a historic
7 investment to advance clean energy generation,
8 resulting in the build out of two new transmission
9 lines that will bring 2500 megawatts...

10 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: I'm sorry for the
11 interruption but I would just like... if people could
12 not have have side conversations. I'm hearing
13 chatter from somewhere. Where's that coming from?

14 [BACKGROUND VOICES]

15 Oh, Sergeant, if you could take care of that, I'd
16 appreciate it. Okay. I just want you to be able
17 to...

18 MR. FIORE: Thank you. I appreciate that, Chair.

19 So the historic investment has resulted in the
20 build out of two new transmission lines that will
21 bring 2500 megawatts of renewable energy directly
22 into New York City. This commitment will not only
23 reduce the city government's carbon footprint, but it
24 will also reduce air pollutants including carbon

dioxide, sulfur dioxide, and NOx by almost 50% and reduce wholesale energy prices by almost 20%.

In addition, in fall 2021, our partners at the New York City Economic Development Corporation, announced the 15-year offshore wind vision plan to develop best-in-class infrastructure to support the construction and operation of offshore wind farms in the New York bight, including infrastructure to support manufacturing, staging, installation, operations, maintenance, and transmission. The city has committed almost \$200 million to offshore wind projects, which puts New York City on a path to reduce 34.5 million tons of carbon dioxide, as well as meet its goals of 100% clean electricity by 2040, and carbon neutrality by 2050.

The Economic Development Corporation is realizing the Offshore Wind Vision Plan by announcing an agreement with Equinor and its partner BP to transform the 73 acre South Brooklyn marine terminal into one of the largest offshore wind port facilities in the nation earlier this year. The terminal will become a power interconnection site for the Empire Wind One and serve as a hub to support the Empire Wind Two and the Beacon Wind offshore wind farms.

2 The Administration is committed to additional
3 offshore wind spans across New York City. Our
4 partners at the Economic Development Corporation have
5 also released a request for proposals, which recently
6 closed, to transform the 33 acre Rossville municipal
7 site in Staten island into a site for offshore wind
8 manufacturing and industrial jobs, and they are
9 currently reviewing responses.

10 Finally last month, the Economic Development
11 Corporation and the City University of New York
12 announced that the six City University of New York
13 colleges that are initial recipients of \$4 million in
14 city funding to help train the next generation of
15 professionals for climate-smart careers, including
16 training students in electric vehicle repairs,
17 creating built environment and green energy solution
18 courses, while also developing new offshore wind
19 industry curriculum, and providing needed
20 certification for green energy jobs.

21 And the city will continue to make great strides
22 in assessing the potential for renewable energy
23 within New York City in the coming year. For
24 example, the Mayor's Office of Climate and
25 Environmental Justice is leading PowerUp NYC, an

1 energy planning study that will identify specific
2 actions the city can take in the near term to rapidly
3 advance our energy transition goals including actions
4 that support the strategic interconnection of
5 offshore wind and clean transmission projects, the
6 rapid deployment of solar and storage resources
7 within the five boroughs, and the accelerated
8 deployment of clean energy on public land.
9

10 The city has also been a leader in building
11 decarbonization. Since 2014 DCAS has invested nearly
12 \$1 billion in energy efficiency and clean energy
13 generation projects across 2000 city-owned buildings,
14 contributing to a reduction in city government energy
15 use by the equivalent of about 250,000 residencies,
16 and avoiding about \$115 million in annual energy
17 costs, reducing overall greenhouse gas emissions by
18 almost 25% between fiscal years 2006 and 2019, and
19 generating more than 4000 family sustaining jobs.

20 Geothermal heat pumps and heating systems are one
21 way to further the transition to clean energy
22 technologies from fossil fuel based heating.

23 Geothermal heat pumps, or ground source heat pumps,
24 rely on the constant temperature beneath the earth's
25 surface to provide clean and efficient heating and

cooling while using less electricity than other types of heat pumps. The city has two tools to help the public understand the potential use of geothermal heat pumps in New York City.

First, the Mayor's Office of Climate and Environmental Justice maintains the New York City Community Energy Planning Tool, which shows ground source heat pump potential by block and allows geothermal feasibility to be mapped alongside other community characteristics relating to environmental justice and resiliency.

Second, DDC maintains the Geothermal Pre-Feasibility Tool in compliance with Local Law 6 of 2016, which identifies areas where geothermal heat pump systems may be an option for retrofitting buildings heating and cooling systems based on geological and hydrogeological data. The city has already built eight building-level geothermal projects, including at the FDNY rescue company to facility in Brooklyn, and at PS 62 on Staten Island. Pursuant to Local Law 2 of 2022, the city is also undertaking a study to leverage city on sites for district scale geothermal systems. This study will help the city understand how to realize further

2 efficiencies and maximize environmental benefits
3 through balanced loads, and a diversity of thermal
4 sources and sinks. The city is enthusiastic to work
5 with the Council after the completion of the
6 feasibility assessment to identify a path forward to
7 facilitate geothermal heat pumps' use throughout New
8 York City.

9 It's important to emphasize that the city is also
10 focused in its investments in the historically
11 marginalized communities that experience cumulative
12 disproportionate impacts of environmental hazards and
13 climate risks. Two thirds of the greenhouse gas and
14 fine particulate matter emission reductions achieved
15 to date through city led programs have been in such
16 communities. The city is in the midst of a
17 comprehensive database assessment of environmental
18 justice in New York City. The resulting report will
19 identify communities being disproportionately
20 impacted by environmental burdens, and will form the
21 basis of an implementation plan to promote
22 environmental justice and ensure equity is an
23 integral part of the city's decision making processes
24 at large.

1 Ensuring affordable energy access for all has
2
3 also been a key focus of the city's energy planning
4 efforts, and the city has been a strong advocate for
5 low-income utility customers. Reaching our climate
6 goals will require many buildings to switch their
7 heating and hot water systems from fossil fuels to
8 heat pumps, powered by clean electricity. It is
9 imperative that this transition be planned to ensure
10 it is affordable for all New Yorkers. A just
11 transition to a clean energy system is foundational
12 to addressing climate change and creating a fairer
13 and healthier city.

14 Before my colleagues and I take your questions, I
15 want to comment briefly on the bills being considered
16 today. Introduction 315 would require the city to
17 identify and report on vacant or underutilized
18 municipal properties, including closed and capped
19 solid waste landfills and brownfields that would be
20 suitable for renewable energy generation. The
21 Department of Citywide Administrative Services would
22 undertake this work, and believes that the
23 understanding and making public what city properties
24 may be underutilized or vacant, and advising how
25 these properties could potentially be used is a

2 worthwhile exercise. This work should support
3 communities and other city agencies as they develop
4 priorities for vacant and underutilized lots, which
5 may support any number of potential uses, including
6 renewable energy generation, the creation of
7 affordable housing, new parks and urban farms,
8 relocating critical city facilities that are at
9 increasing risk of flooding, or to address other
10 unforeseen needs.

11 Understanding what tax lots are going to be
12 unused or underutilized for the indeterminate future,
13 as compared to those that have some future use
14 planned is essential to allowing DCAS and other
15 agencies to identify the best use of these properties
16 as we focus efforts on developing into the renewable
17 energy generation potential.

18 We look forward to working with council on this
19 bill and on the larger effort to use vacant city
20 properties to make our city more livable as we
21 increase the share of clean renewable resources that
22 power our city.

23 Intro 330 would require the city to create a
24 database of subsurface conditions to support better
25 engineering of geothermal heat pumps. We agree that

2 geothermal is an important tool in the transition to
3 a clean energy economy and in some locations will be
4 a primary method for decarbonizing building heating
5 systems. As you know, geological characteristics are
6 a key component of geothermal systems, and the
7 subterranean space in New York City is no less
8 complex than the above ground real estate. That is
9 exactly why with the help from the Council, the City
10 develop the geothermal prescreening tool and the New
11 York City Community Energy Planning Tool. In
12 addition, DDC released New York City's geothermal
13 heat pump manual in 2002, the first of its kind, to
14 educate and assist DDC project managers and their
15 consultants. The manual was updated in 2012 to
16 reflect changes in the industry and technological
17 advances in materials, and has come to serve as the
18 How To Guide to doing geothermal in the city.

19 As I mentioned earlier, the Administration is
20 developing program to pilot district level geothermal
21 systems on city-owned sites in accordance with Local
22 Law to have this year. Beginning next March, and
23 over the coming years, the Administration will begin
24 reporting its findings as we develop and implement
25 the pilot, which will help inform how these systems

2 can maximize geothermal opportunities to meet our
3 2050 energy goals.

4 The city also wants to applaud New York State for
5 passing the Utility Thermal Energy Network and Jobs
6 Act, which will allow utilities to develop projects
7 that will connect multiple buildings into a shared
8 thermal network including community thermal systems.
9 This means utilities can provide thermal energy to
10 customers, rather than fossil-based natural gas to
11 meet their space heating, water heating, and cooling
12 needs. The Administration looks forward to
13 continuing to work with the Council to build off
14 these tools, and the pilot program to identify the
15 best opportunities to support the growth of the
16 geothermal heat pump industry in New York City and
17 push for rapid building decarbonization in line with
18 our climate energy and equity goals.

19 In short, we support the intent of these bills
20 and look forward to working with council on them.
21 Thank you for this opportunity to testify on this
22 important topic. My colleagues and I are happy to
23 answer any questions that you have.

24 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you. Thank you very
25 much, Mr. Fiore. Your... Your good reputation

2 certainly precedes you here today, and I appreciate
3 all of your good efforts to make this a greener and
4 more sustainable city.

5 As is customary, I as Chair would ordinarily lead
6 off the questions, but since the hearing started so
7 late, and I have to be here for the whole hearing
8 anyway, I'm going to defer my questions and give an
9 opportunity to my colleagues who've been waiting
10 since 1:00 to ask theirs to go first.

11 Everyone's supposed to go, "Ah, how gracious."

12 [Laughter.]

13 Nothing? Nothing?

14 My God, no one's listening.

15 But okay. So we give... so we have
16 Councilmembers who have signed up for questions, and
17 it's my pleasure to recognize my Chair on the
18 Sanitation and Solid Waste Committee, Councilmember
19 Nurse.

20 Oh, hang on. We're doing a five minute thing?

21 We're doing that?

22 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: I only have two questions.

23 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah. Okay. Go ahead.

24 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Thank you, Chair. Very
25 generous of you.

2 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you.

3 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: I'm glad to be first today.

4 Thank you for your testimony. I had... I think I
5 had a question for the Mayor's Office of

6 Environmental Justice first. So my question was:

7 The Federal Inflation Reduction Act has further

8 incentivized renewable energy, particularly in

9 disadvantaged communities, and now allows public and

10 tax-exempt entities to access Solar Initiative. So

11 we're just curious if the city has begun to analyze

12 how this new law can support efforts and reduce the

13 cost of building solar on public buildings, schools

14 and land.

15 MR. FIORE: Just push it.

16 MS. CASAGRANDE: Thank you, Councilmember for the

17 question. We are beginning to look into it. I don't

18 know if... do you have anything to share on it.

19 MS. KHAN: Sure.

20 Okay, I'm going to pass it over to my colleague

21 for a little more information than where we've

22 started.

23 MS. KHAN: Hi, my name is Ali Khan, I'm with the

24 Office...

25 COUNSEL: I'm sorry...

2 MS. KHAN: Oops. Sorry.

3 COUNSEL: I have to swear you in.

4 Do you affirm to tell the truth, the whole truth
5 and nothing but the truth in your testimony before
6 this committee, and to respond, honestly, because
7 member questions?

8 MS. KHAN: Yes. All right. So my name is Ali
9 Khan, Mayor's Office of Climate and Environmental
10 Justice. The IRS guidance was only released last
11 week, so I think we are still looking at it, but it's
12 something that is on our radar, and we're absolutely
13 paying attention to, and it's a very, very exciting
14 opportunity.

15 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Okay.

16 MR. FIORE: I'll just add that we are excited
17 that, for the first time, it does allow
18 municipalities to access these tax credits, although
19 at a reduced rate, so we're still evaluating, you
20 know, what the impact of that will be but certainly
21 is a good headwind.

22 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Okay, great. Yeah. I'm
23 very excited as well. And then I think this question
24 is more for you. It's been good to see the Mayor's
25 Office of Climate and Environmental Justice host

2 PowerUp NYC community townhalls as part of the
3 mandated long term energy plan. This report will
4 provide us with specific recommendations for
5 integrating additional renewable energy sources
6 citywide including a renewable Rikers. Can you just
7 give us an update or tell us when we can expect the
8 report release?

9 MS. CASAGRANDE: We're expecting to release a
10 report this spring. I don't know the exact... I
11 don't think we have the exact date at this point.

12 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: So in the spring. Okay.
13 Okay, thank you. That's it, Chair.

14 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, Councilmember
15 Nurse. Pleasure to have you with us. And the next
16 Councilmember that signed up for questions, I happily
17 recognize Councilmember Hanks for questions.

18 COUNCILMEMBER HANKS: Thank you Chair Gennaro.
19 Thank you so much. This is such an important
20 hearing. I'm very excited about the bills that we're
21 talking about at the hearing today.

22 So my question is: How much energy is expected
23 to be generated by the vacant municipality owned
24 sites that are available for renewable energy
25 generation?

2 MR. FIORE: I think that's the exact question
3 that Intro 315 is... is looking to answer.

4 COUNCILMEMBER HANKS: Right.

5 MR. FIORE: And what I can tell you today is that
6 the city is committed to building 100 megawatts of
7 solar generation by 2025 on city properties that
8 include roofs, vacant lots, and other properties, and
9 we're also currently evaluating a 2030 deployment
10 target. And then, in addition, the Mayor's Office of
11 Climate and Environmental Justice is in the midst of
12 developing the city's next long-term Energy and
13 Climate Plan. And part of this process will be to
14 evaluate renewable energy potential on Rikers Island,
15 as we just heard.

16 COUNCILMEMBER HANKS: So do you anticipate with
17 the attempting to identify these sites, do you...
18 what are some of the challenges or barriers you may
19 expect, or what we can expect to... to bump up
20 against in getting this done and finding these sites
21 that have potential?

22 MR. FIORE: So, you know, there's over 12,000,
23 lots in the municipal portfolio. Many of those are
24 of limited use, meaning like their sliver lots, or
25 their passageways or through ways, either for

2 pedestrians or for cars, or other restrictions.

3 There's also a whole population of properties that
4 are regulated like wetlands or coastal areas. And so
5 those types of properties would be much more
6 challenging. But I think as we go through this and
7 weed those types of properties out, there will be a
8 population of properties that may be amenable to the
9 siting of renewable energy generation.

10 COUNCILMEMBER HANKS: Thank you. And one last
11 one: How much energy does New York City need to
12 generate to reach the net zero energy generation by
13 2050?

14 MR. FIORE: Okay. So... thank you for that
15 question. First, let me just say, you know, Local
16 Law requires the city to reduce our carbon emissions
17 80% by 2050. And then in order to reach carbon
18 neutrality, the city could employ further energy
19 efficiency, interventions, load modifying
20 interventions, or offsets. The state law also
21 requires, as we heard, 100% clean energy generation
22 by 2040. Now, the amount of energy generation
23 required is dependent on the amount of new loads, say
24 from electrifying buildings, heating, and hot water
25 systems, electrifying generation... I'm sorry,

2 transportation, what building codes may look like,
3 appliance standards, economic activity, weather and
4 many other things. So it's, it's not an easy
5 question to answer. But the city has take undertaken
6 extensive planning studies to look at just that. And
7 using data published by The New York independent
8 system operator that is responsible for the overall
9 grid, the expectation is that there will need to be
10 about 34% more electricity in 2050 than... than there
11 is today. And then that generation will come from
12 many locations. It will come from in city. It will
13 come from Upstate. It will come from offshore and
14 from adjacent states as well.

15 COUNCILMEMBER HANKS: Thank you so much. It
16 sounds like we have a long way to go. But this is
17 absolutely a very good start. Thank you for your
18 answers.

19 MR. FIORE: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, Councilmember
21 Hanks. I appreciate your great questions. Next, I'm
22 very pleased to recognize Councilmember Gutierrez for
23 questions.

24 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIERREZ: Thank you, Chair. And
25 thank you for allowing us to get our questions in. I

2 have two questions. This one is regarding Local Law
3 97, so I hope that in some capacity, you can answer
4 it: I did notice that very recently, DOB finally
5 released a series of draft rules and protocols for
6 property owners to meet with compliance of Local Law
7 97. Would you be able to weigh in on what kind of
8 outreach has been done? How that looks like? Where
9 does it live outside of the website? And in what way
10 are you all assisting income-restricted rental and
11 co-op buildings will have to meet these compliance
12 benchmarks by 2035?

13 MS. CASAGRANDE: Sure, thank you, Councilmember
14 for that question. I don't have all of that
15 information in front of me right now. I'd be happy
16 to discuss further outside of this hearing. However,
17 for outreach, the New York City Accelerator is
18 reaching out to buildings that have... that are
19 required to comply with Local Law 97, especially if
20 limits have changed with the Energy Star Performance
21 metric mapping that came out in...

22 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Please pull a microphone
23 right up to your...

24 MS. CASAGRANDE: Oh, sorry. Yes, the New York
25 City Accelerator is doing is doing that outreach at

2 this time. And as far as HPD outreach, I would have
3 to get back to you about exactly how that's ongoing.
4 But happy to discuss further.

5 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIERREZ: Thank you. Yeah. I'm
6 just curious on what that outreach looks like, if
7 it's physical snail mail, letters, someone knocking
8 on their door, I just would love to know what it's
9 like.

10 MS. CASAGRANDE: Yeah. I don't have the list
11 of... of what they're doing in front of me, but I
12 know that they're doing multiple things, including
13 calling, letters. They're... They're looking for
14 multiple touchpoints to make every effort to reach
15 building owners.

16 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIERREZ: Thank you. And my last
17 question: I was reviewing a report from the Center
18 for Urban Future, where they demonstrated that New
19 York City buildings have shown an overall decrease in
20 emissions since 2014. However, in 8 of 25 city
21 agencies buildings emissions have actually increased.
22 Can you can you discuss or speak to what that... why
23 that is, and kind of what is the... the conflict
24 between our city's larger climate goals and how these
25 city agencies are operating?

1 MR. FIORE: I'm not intimately familiar with that
2 report. I... I was briefed briefly on it, and I
3 think there were some methodology issues with how
4 that was being reported. But what I can tell you is,
5 as of the end of 2019, city government operations
6 emissions were reduced by 23%, as compared to 15% in
7 the private sector, and I think that's illustrative
8 of the investments that that city is making, and that
9 it is leading by example and reducing emissions at a
10 faster pace than the public sector.
11

12 So for any one particular building may increase
13 emissions for a whole host of reasons. It could be,
14 you know, increased functional use of a building, for
15 example an existing school that gets, you know, pre-K
16 operations in it could be new buildings. It could be
17 new regulations that require additional regulatory
18 treatment, for example, with wastewater resource
19 recovery facility. So, you know, if there's a list
20 of those 8 buildings, we're happy to look at those 8
21 buildings and come back with an answer. But overall
22 for the government portfolio, it's outpacing the
23 private sector in emission reductions.
24
25

2 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIERREZ: Interesting. Okay. So
3 you disagree with... with this conclusion from their
4 report?

5 MR. FIORE: If the conclusion is that overall,
6 the city is lagging behind the private sector, I
7 disagree with that conclusion. If it's about 8
8 specific buildings, I would...

9 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIERREZ: Agencies. It's 8
10 specific agencies.

11 MR. FIORE: Yeah. Yeah. So, again, I can speak
12 to the overall portfolio. And as I mentioned, an
13 agency for example, like the Department of
14 Environmental Protection, where there are new
15 regulations that require increased treatment of
16 wastewater, and increased treatment of the water
17 supply, that adds energy use. So you could see,
18 because of new functional requirements, an increase
19 in... in energy use for any one particular facility.

20 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIERREZ: That wouldn't offset
21 the average that you were just saying...

22 MR. FIORE: Correct.

23 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIERREZ: ...of the 2019
24 reduction down 23%, you said.

25 MR. FIORE: Correct.

2 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIERREZ: Okay, thank you.

3 MR. FIORE: You're welcome.

4 COUNCILMEMBER GUTIERREZ: Thank you Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, Councilman
6 Gutierrez. Okay, now it's my turn. And as I said,
7 in my opening statement, I'm going to go back in time
8 a little bit. Because I want to make sure that what
9 I did 10 years ago doesn't get lost. Hopefully,
10 you're going to have some... some answers for this.

11 I was... I see that there's a question that was
12 formulated by staff that is more coherent than me
13 rambling about it. Here it is: Local Law 42 of 2012
14 mandated the creation of a city Climate Change
15 Adaptation Taskforce that would consist of city,
16 state, and federal agencies, and private
17 organizations and entities tasked with and
18 formulating updated and continued strategies to
19 address the potential impact of climate change on the
20 city's communities, vulnerable populations, public
21 health, natural systems, critical infrastructure,
22 buildings, and the city's economy.

23 When I brought the New York City Panel on Climate
24 Change back from mothballs and created it in law
25 permanently, I wanted to broaden the scope of it.

2 And, you know, my thinking was to, you know, move the
3 city forward in a... in a... as I said before, in
4 kind of like a very structured and thoughtful way to
5 deal with our climate change adaptation imperatives.
6 And the whole idea was that the ATFCC would get
7 together, do all the raw science, and then there
8 would be convened the... the Taskforce on... the
9 Taskforce on Climate Change Adaptation. And I left a
10 fair amount of latitude in the law back then so that
11 the... so that the Administration, it didn't
12 necessarily have to be the same people, you know?,
13 because let's say like the panel on climate change,
14 you know, puts forward certain science, and then you
15 might want to have a certain group of people that you
16 put together to deal with that to figure out how we
17 like move forward. So I left a fair amount of
18 latitude regarding, you know, the appointment process
19 and who had to be on it. And so there was... I felt
20 it needed some scope, so to speak, in order to be the
21 most flexible and adaptive. And so that's like
22 the... you know, that's like the preamble. And so,
23 first question: Has the taskforce then meeting twice
24 annually, as mandated by Local Law 42 of 2012?

2 MR. FIORE: So I'm going to ask my colleague,
3 Rebecca Fishman from the Mayor's Office of Climate
4 and Environmental Justice to join us and answer your
5 question.

6 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Sure. I think Ricky's got
7 to do his thing. Let me just mention that we're
8 joined by Brad Reed, the head of the Council's
9 Division on Infrastructure, who plays such a critical
10 role, and I'm grateful for him to be sitting in on
11 this hearing today.

12 COUNSEL: You affirm to tell the truth, the whole
13 truth and nothing but the truth and your testimony
14 before this council, and to respond honestly to
15 Councilmember questions? Thank you.

16 MS. FISHMAN: Thank you, Councilmember Gennaro,
17 for following up on the Local Law 42 of 2012. I know
18 that you asked us this question during the hearing on
19 October 3 too.

20 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: I did?

21 MS. FISHMAN: Yes.

22 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Oh. Okay. I forget.

23 MS. FISHMAN: We looked we looked into this. And
24 the Climate Change Adaptation Taskforce (or the
25 CCATF) has convened under the prior administration,

2 and did create an inventory of risks and
3 infrastructure, and it is nearly complete but was not
4 completed because of the pandemic. The new office of
5 the mayor... the Mayor's Office of Climate and
6 Environmental Justice will need to revisit this.

7 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: What was that again? I
8 didn't get that last part?

9 MS. FISHMAN: The new office so our office, the
10 Mayor's Office of Climate and Environmental Justice
11 will need to revisit it. The report was never
12 completed, but all the risks and inventory of... of
13 risks to our infrastructure was created.

14 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah. I... I think you're
15 missing the point. The point was: In the first
16 incarnation of the New York City Panel on Climate
17 Change that was created not by this legislature in
18 law... It was created by the Bloomberg
19 administration. He just created it, because he's the
20 Mayor, he can just create it. So that was created.
21 They fulfilled their mandate on critical city
22 infrastructure. And they... you know... and back...
23 and back then, the... the Climate Change Adaptation
24 Taskforce did not even exist. So I think what you're
25 referring to is the New York City Panel on Climate

2 Change in its first incarnation, previous to Local
3 Law 42 of 2012. It did what it was supposed to do as
4 mandated by Mayor Bloomberg. And that's great. And
5 I thought that was great at the time. But I also
6 thought it was great to... so the panel on climate
7 change, you know, came into existence to fill this
8 mandate, went out of business. I brought it back.
9 And so... I know that that's been active. That has
10 been, you know, meeting. But it was, you know, we
11 had two pillars of how we move forward on climate
12 change adaptation, which is, I guess, now called
13 resiliency or... you know, resiliency or whatever.
14 And, you know, the whole idea of that law 10 years
15 ago was to have the... the newly created-in-law panel
16 on... The New York City Panel on Climate Change, with
17 its much broader scope, not just on infrastructure,
18 but you know the impact of climate change on the
19 city's commuter roles, on the city's communities,
20 vulnerable populations, public health, natural
21 systems, critical infrastructure, city buildings, and
22 the economy. I put a lot of thought into this. And
23 so... so the... so the Taskforce... so the climate
24 change panel was... had a much broader scope. It was
25 supposed to meet and then bring forward the science

2 that would, you know, go to the, you know, Climate
3 Change Adaptation Taskforce, that could pretty much
4 be whoever the Administration wanted it to be,
5 because I wanted to give them that flexibility. If
6 you have like a fixed membership that has certain
7 expertise or whatever, it might not fit for the next
8 go-round of the science that came out from the Panel
9 on Climate Change. So I wanted the Administration to
10 have the flexibility to configure the Panel on
11 Climate Change... on... on Climate Change Adaptation
12 any way it wanted, but it's in law, and it has to
13 happen. And so it was... it was... that was the
14 construct. That was my idea of how we move forward.
15 And it was signed into law, and so what I'm what I'm
16 hearing now is, we don't really think this exists
17 anymore, and the tests... and what you just spoke of,
18 you know, regarding critical infrastructure, that's
19 more in line with what the original New York City
20 Panel on Climate Change, as envisioned by Mayor Mike
21 Bloomberg to deal with infrastructure issues. Now
22 we're in like the second... you know, this is, you
23 know, New York City Panel on Climate Change 2.0,
24 broader scope. It's... it's in law. It's... it's a

2 permanent part of the mayoralty, as is the New York
3 City Panel on Climate Change Adaptation.

4 So it seems like we have the NPCC going strong,
5 but we don't have the Climate Change Adaptation,
6 and... and, you know, that Taskforce and unless and
7 until this council gets rid of it, which we're not
8 going to do, it has to exist. It has to be... It has
9 to be empaneled and has to do its work.

10 So, again, has that been happening every six
11 months? Again, you folks... you know the
12 Administration is less than a year old, probably
13 never heard a Local Law 42 of 2012, but it's on the
14 books, and just because the de Blasio administration,
15 when I wasn't around, you know, didn't keep that task
16 moving forward as was supposed to. Because after I
17 did it, I left the Council like after that because of
18 term limits. So the question is, like the quest for
19 The New York City Climate Change Adaptation Taskforce
20 that has to exist. That's in law. That's a mandate.
21 It's not discretionary. And it's supposed to work
22 hand-in-glove with the New York City Panel on Climate
23 Change.

24 So I ask again, like the status of, of the
25 original construct of that law was, you know, the

2 NPCC meets, puts together the science. You know, the
3 Administration puts together the Climate Change
4 Adaptation Taskforce. The private sector people,
5 whatever, you know, universities, I don't care. I...
6 I leave that to the Administration's good judgment,
7 but it has to exist, and it has to turn out a work
8 product. So anything further you have to say about
9 this I appreciate it.

10 MS. FISHMAN: Yes. I apologize if... if my
11 answer was not clear enough. It should have been
12 clearer that this did happen, and that there is a
13 report, and it is just not complete. It was paused
14 due to the pandemic, and that our office, the new
15 Office of the Mayor's Office of Climate and
16 Environmental Justice would need to revisit.

17 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay, I'm not exactly
18 following that. So...

19 MS. FISHMAN: I... I guess we will get back to
20 you with more details. But what I... what I am
21 trying to say is that this did happen. What you're
22 describing has happened, and we just haven't... we
23 haven't been able to publish the report. The report
24 is not complete.

2 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay. So people have heard
3 of the City Panel on Climate Change Adaptation.
4 That's like a thing.

5 MS. FISHMAN: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay. Good. That's,
7 that's what I...

8 MS. FISHMAN: And I apologize if my answer was
9 not clear enough. But that is...

10 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: No. That's alright. I,
11 you know, didn't want to be too, you know, touchy
12 about it. But... and... and there are other follow
13 up questions for that. But, but to the extent that
14 your office may be able to pull together, you know,
15 the history of, you know, what the Climate Change
16 Adaptation Taskforce has produced in terms of work
17 products, that would be, you know, much appreciated
18 by the Council. I mean, we created it, we thought
19 about it, it got signed into law, it needs to do,
20 what it what it was called upon to do.

21 And my next question after that: So it's my
22 understanding that the next report of the NPCC is the
23 fourth report. Is that... That... That's the one
24 that you're referring to, right?

2 MS. FISHMAN: So these are two... These are two
3 separate reports.

4 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay.

5 MS. FISHMAN: So what you're talking about is the
6 fourth assessment.

7 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Right.

8 MS. FISHMAN: That is going to be published by
9 the end of April 2024. Hopefully, around Earth Day.
10 There will be a 2022 Climate Science and Projections
11 Report with updated projections for the city to use.
12 This we published by the end of this year. This will
13 be one year after the IPCC publication, so that
14 satisfies the law.

15 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay, you know what? I'm
16 going to give a little note to staff here. If we
17 could arrange a -- you know, not to take up
18 everyone's time too much here -- to have... to
19 arrange to brief me -- you know, I'm using everyone's
20 time here -- to brief me on, you know, how the
21 interplay between the NPCC and the and the City
22 Climate Change Adaptation Taskforce, how that is
23 working. I think it's supposed to be like, every six
24 months, or whatever it is. And so, I think a
25 briefing is called for to make sure that everybody's

2 on the same page in terms of what, you know, Local
3 Law 42 of 2012 is. Now I understand that, you know,
4 there are... there... there's some kind of climate
5 change adaptation... where's my statement? So many
6 papers on my here. In my statement, I made reference
7 to... Yeah, so yeah. Something is coming out, like
8 later this month? Something called AdaptNY. It's a
9 resiliency plan that's... that was produced pursuant
10 to Local Law. 122 of 2021. Right?

11 MS. FISHMAN: That's correct.

12 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: So right, right. And
13 so.... And while these are all great, you know, I
14 think Local Law 122 is a great law. Okay, yep. You
15 know, the... the the original vision of this council
16 back in 2012 was to... was to have the city's climate
17 change adaptation policies come forth from the
18 wellspring of the interchange between the NPCC and
19 the, you know, Climate Change Adaptation Taskforce.
20 And then we have other calls for, you know, climate
21 change adaptation plans and like resiliency plans.
22 And it just... it seems like a little disjointed. I
23 mean, so, you know, we had a construct. I want to
24 see where that is at. And no problem with this, you
25 know, what, this AdaptNY Resiliency Plan, but I mean,

2 you know, I have this attachment to this construct
3 that was created a long time ago. And that's the way
4 it's supposed to work.

5 So this... we will follow up in a briefing. I'm
6 calling upon Ricky to make a little note, and Nabi to
7 make a note, and we'll set that up. And we'll have a
8 grand old time.

9 MS. FISHMAN: Okay, thank you Councilmember.

10 COUNCILMEMBER GENNARO: We'll have big fun. I'll
11 bring cookies. I have actually have cookies in my
12 backpack. I bought them at lunch, but I didn't eat
13 them. But so thank you. Thank you very much for
14 your... for your for your answer. I appreciate your,
15 you know, willingness to engage going forward.

16 And Ricky, said Councilmember Nurse had a
17 followup... I recognize Councilmember Nurse again for
18 questions.

19 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Thanks, Chair. I did... I
20 did have a question. Because that first line of
21 questioning, I was having a hard time. I was just
22 curious about the Taskforce. You said it has met.
23 Okay. Has it met this year.

24 MS. FISHMAN: So the Taskforce, as far as I
25 understand, has convened and did publish... or sorry,

2 did not put together a report. But that report is
3 just not complete.

4 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Yeah, okay.

5 MS. FISHMAN: It's not ready to be released. But
6 we do have to go look... look at that and figure out
7 how we can release that.

8 COUNCILMEMBER NURSE: Right. So convened. And
9 you're waiting on to finish the report. You're
10 figuring out, and it will convene again this year?
11 Or twice a year?

12 MS. FISHMAN: We will get back to you on that.

13 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah, and it's just... you
14 know, this comes down to a question of like, what,
15 you know... you know, what the black-letter law says,
16 you know, black-letter law says, you know, just in my
17 own my memory going back 10 years, which is asking a
18 lot for me, that it was supposed to... both the NPCC
19 and the Climate Change Adaptation Taskforce was
20 supposed to meet on a regular schedule, you know,
21 certainly not anticipating, you know, a pandemic, but
22 that should have been like the rhythm going forward.
23 Okay? This is the NPCC. This is the Climate Change
24 Adaptation Taskforce. This is the construct. This
25 is how we do it. We put together... you know, so

2 every, every meeting of the... of the every, you
3 know, incarnation of the Climate Change Adaptation
4 Taskforce is kind of like a pickup game, so to speak,
5 depending upon what talent we need to deal with the
6 science that came out of the thing. Right? And so,
7 the... the thing... the... the NPCC. So I gave the
8 Administration a lot of latitude, but not so much
9 latitude that it didn't have to bother with it. I
10 mean, that's, you know, I can't do that. It's just
11 like, the law is the law. It's not like it convenes
12 if you feel like it. It's... it's black-letter law.
13 And that will be explored. And Sandy has my back on
14 this, too. So I'm very grateful. Grateful for that.

15 And let me quickly go through the statement here.
16 Your testimony. Mr. Fiore, you know, the bottom line
17 that when it comes to 315 and 330. I mean, you know,
18 back in the day, I was the one that, you know... I
19 mean, being a geologist, that was I was, you know, I
20 thought that the geothermal thing was really the way
21 to go. And a lot of stuff you talked about in your
22 testimony was, back in my day when we... well, I
23 guess, it's still my day, but I really want to...
24 but... but I thought that the one, you know,
25 notwithstanding all the work that's been done, over

2 the last decade on geothermal, you know, I thought
3 that, you know, the one piece that was still missing
4 was the overall, you know, geologic assessment, of
5 where... of where certain hotspots would be in the
6 city. And to do that, and based on your statement
7 here, you seem to concur that this is a worthwhile
8 endeavor, I just want to reaffirm that.

9 MR. FIORE: So first, thank you for, you know,
10 speaking about geothermal back then and bringing it
11 up.

12 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Right.

13 MR. FIORE: And as I mentioned, we agree that
14 geothermal is an important tool. In response to that
15 original law, the city has since then developed two
16 tools to do just what you're talking about. I think
17 we would love to work with you to understand what
18 additional layers or...

19 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay.

20 MR. FIORE: ...data might be incorporated into
21 those tools to bring additional value. Absolutely
22 would like to work with you on that.

23 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay. I mean, if part of
24 what we're calling for in Intro 330 is already, you
25 know, is already underway, let's see what kind of

2 value added we can bring in this new bill, to kind of
3 fill any gaps where there might be. And I applaud
4 the Administration for the extent to which it's
5 already taken a look at, at least on some level, the
6 geologic piece, you know. Because, as you said, you
7 just can't do it everywhere. But, you know, to know
8 where the hotspots are, then people building
9 buildings, people managing buildings, people looking
10 to comply with Local Law 97. You know, there's...
11 Yeah, I foresee some sort of, you know, city-
12 sponsored geothermal conference to sort of help, you
13 know, building managers and others on... or, or, you
14 know, including that. Because something I think is
15 definitely necessary is... is that, you know, once
16 the rules are all... all said and done for Local Law
17 97, I mean, I think there has to be a real, you know,
18 proactive way to get out that information to everyone
19 who needs it. And I think conferences are a great
20 way to do that. Not a conference where everybody
21 gets COVID. We don't want that. But we'll figure
22 out some way to step around the COVID and have a
23 conference and get the information and all that. And
24 so I certainly appreciate that.

2 And with that, does anyone else have any
3 questions for the Administration? Okay. No, sure.
4 I just... you know, the hours late, it's going to...
5 the rain is going to come chucking down real hard and
6 you know, and I'm ready for that. And so, with that,
7 I'd like to thank the Administration, for your
8 great testimony and sportsmanship, okay? Whatever.
9 You know.

10 MR. FIORE: Thank... Well, thank you Chair.

11 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: At the end of every
12 hearing, as I was asked my staff, like, "Who won?"
13 You know, I mean? Just like, you know, like, who won
14 the hearing. We always seem to win. At least... at
15 least, we think that.

16 MR. FIORE: We all need to be in the same boat,
17 rowing in the same direction, because the fragmenting
18 is the problem.

19 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Right. It's also fun to
20 win. That's all, you know.

21 MR. FIORE: Well, we appreciate everything you
22 do.

23 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you all very much. I
24 appreciate it. I appreciate everyone from the
25 Administration. It's great to partner with this

2 administration, you know, true environmental
3 champions, and I look forward to many, many good
4 things that we do together. I appreciate that.

5 MR. FIORE: Thank you. Thank you very much.

6 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: You bet.

7 COUNSEL: We'd like to call the first public
8 panel, Carolina Korath, Karl Palmquist, Lonnie
9 Portis, and Paul Mankiewicz. Carolina, Carl, Lonnie
10 and Paul. Paul Mankiewicz. Paul Mankiewicz?

11 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Yeah, Paul is back there.

12 COUNSEL: Yeah. That's it. Carolina?

13 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay. It looks like...
14 Okay. All right. So we're all... we're all set.
15 And... and I think the clock... Is someone doing the
16 clock? You got to clock in there? Okay. And the
17 clock is all good. Yeah, so each witness will
18 have... it's my discretion to have two minutes or
19 three minutes. So I went with three minutes because
20 I... now I'm going for the record. I want to... I
21 want this to go to midnight. You know what I mean?
22 So... And you've waited so long. So you waited a
23 long time. How can I do two minutes really? Come
24 on. And so please... so please state your name for
25 the record, and proceed with your good testimony.

2 COUNSEL: You're currently _____. You may begin.

3 MS. KORATH: (inaudible)

4 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: I think your microphones
5 off.

6 MS. KORATH: Oh, I just push it.

7 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yup.

8 MS. KORATH: Thank you. I'm sad to see that so
9 many Councilmembers that I admire had to leave, but
10 here we are. My name is Carolina Korath. I'm a
11 resident of Astoria...

12 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: You got me. You got me.

13 MS. KORATH: I do.

14 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah, you got me.

15 MS. KORATH: I'm a resident of Astoria, Queens.
16 I came today to state support for Resolution 169.
17 Though now that I'm here, I will also say that I
18 state support for the other Resolutions as well. I
19 don't need to repeat the persuasive arguments that
20 Councilmember Restler made for the Resolution. We
21 all know that climate change is the universal crisis
22 of our time. Instead, I want to share two personal
23 anecdotes. I was diagnosed with asthma as a child,
24 and I lived in several large cities across the
25 country prior to moving to Queens 16 years ago.

2 Before living here, my asthma had little to no effect
3 on my life. When I fell in love with Queens, I
4 didn't know what Asthma Alley was, but I soon found
5 out. As a New Yorker, my asthma has landed me in the
6 emergency room in urgent care so many times, I cannot
7 leave the house without my rescue inhaler. And I now
8 have regular appointments with a pulmonologist. Even
9 with the privilege of having health insurance, my
10 medical and medication costs have easily surpassed
11 \$10,000. I can't imagine what they would be without
12 insurance. I've missed cumulative weeks upon weeks
13 of work. And as an actor, freelancer and part time
14 restaurant worker, I didn't get sick pay. Again,
15 I've generally had the privilege of being able to
16 float myself financially in those times. But I know
17 many New Yorkers do not. When we talk about
18 pollution and fossil fuel use, we know there are high
19 cost externalities, and my personal ones are just one
20 example of millions. Again, I speak from a place of
21 relative privilege, and I'm trying to reinforce that
22 urging the enforcement of the CLCPA is an
23 environmental justice issue.

24 My other personal anecdote is one of pride. I'm
25 currently a master's student of Environmental Law and

2 Policy at Vermont Law School. And in policy
3 discussions, I've had the opportunity to share the
4 details, goals, and framework of the CLCPA with other
5 students who come from other states. Their reactions
6 of ones are ones of awe and inspiration. And it's
7 clear that New York has set the bar for climate
8 action on the state level. As 40% of the population
9 -- and let's be honest: tax base of the state -- we
10 need to send the message to Albany that we will
11 accept nothing less than fulfillment and enforcement
12 of the CLCPA, a promise made to New York that we will
13 indeed be a climate leader and protect our
14 communities. The erosion of political will to do
15 this, by fossil fuel interests is completely
16 unacceptable. Thank you for your time.

17 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you. As long as
18 we're talking about asthma, I got my thing here.
19 Now, do you use the Aero flow chamber?

20 MS. KORATH: I unfortunately actually had to buy
21 an aerosol like ventilator.

22 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Oh, okay.

23 MS. KORATH: And I don't use that for the rescue
24 one, but...

2 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah, because I used to use
3 just this. But then you do like the chamber and it
4 goes into chamber and you get a better effect, or
5 whatever. I just thought... so...

6 MS. KORATH: I'm glad you don't have to have an
7 Albuterol respirator with you, and like the you
8 look...

9 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Oh my god. Oh my god.
10 Sorry about that.

11 MS. KORATH: ...look like Darth Vader. Yeah,
12 That's... that's cooking gas and pollution, and
13 living in Astoria. That's where we are in New York
14 City.

15 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: But I've turned a lot of
16 people on to like the Aerochamber.

17 MS. KORATH: Oh.

18 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Because it's just...
19 it's... I think that I...

20 MS. KORATH: I take the tip. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: I'm just saying. Okay.
22 Thank you very much for your testimony. And I'm
23 doing a little show and tell here. This is the only
24 prop I brought. That's it. I carry it around too.

2 You don't know when we're going to need it. So you
3 know, there you go.

4 MR. PALMQUIST: Great. Okay. So, thanks, Chair
5 Gennaro and the rest of the Committee on
6 Environmental Protection. I really appreciate the
7 opportunity to speak with you today. And it's really
8 nice to kind of be here in this quiet room at this
9 point. I'm Karl Palmquist, Vice Chair of the New
10 York City group of the Sierra Club and I'm here to
11 express the Sierra Club's support for Resolution 169.
12 Climate change impacts everyone, and as we approached
13 the 10 year anniversary of Superstorm Sandy, which
14 we've already talked a bit about so far today, later
15 this month, we're reminded of our vulnerability as a
16 city and as a people. But I think we all really
17 realize that we don't need a reminder. Like
18 Councilmember Restler mentioned we're still seeing
19 the impacts of Superstorm Sandy. And sort of in our
20 city, we're seeing storms that are increasingly
21 frequent and increasingly severe.

22 In 2019, the New York State Legislature passed
23 the CLCPA, the Climate Clean Energy and Environmental
24 Justice Law that marked a turning point in New York
25 State's effort to combat climate change and

2 transition the economy to electrification and
3 renewable energy, prioritizing disadvantaged
4 communities. The Climate Action Council scoping plan
5 is essential to the successful and effective
6 implementation of the climate act. It decides how we
7 do what we need to do.

8 With Resolution 169 York City has a chance to
9 guide the CAC's efforts. We ask that the New York
10 City Council make the voices of the more than 8
11 million New Yorkers that it represents heard. This
12 path must get us to clean air, healthy ecosystems,
13 and climate justice.

14 Lastly, I'll mention that for the other two bills
15 the committee is considering, Intros 0330 and 0315,
16 pertaining to new geothermal in New York City and
17 siting of renewables on brownfield sites. We're
18 excited to have more renewables in New York City and
19 to work with the city as it further explores these
20 pieces of legislation. Evaluating the balance
21 between just housing, climate resiliency, green space
22 and clean energy production should be an absolute
23 priority moving forward. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you very much. TO
25 your testimony I say, "Amen." Thank you.

2 MR. PALMQUIST: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Lonnie. Lonnie. Lonnie.

4 MR. PORTIS: Surprised to see me?

5 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: I'm... I'm not surprised,
6 but I'm always delighted.

7 MR. PORTIS: All right. Good afternoon, Chair
8 Gennaro and Committee on Environmental Protection.
9 I'm Lonnie Portis, the Environmental Policy and
10 Advocacy Coordinator at WE ACT...

11 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Who doesn't know that?

12 MR. PORTIS: [Laughs] Just got to let the people
13 know. ... from WE ACT for Environmental Justice.
14 And I'm going to try to keep my comments brief, but I
15 will submit a full written testimony following this
16 hearing.

17 New York City is more reliant on fossil fuel
18 generation than the rest of New York State, which is
19 also behind on the study for emissions reduction. By
20 2030 mandate for the CLCPA, it's imperative that New
21 York City does everything possible to identify
22 potential for local renewable energy generation from
23 solar, wind and geothermal. This is why we support
24 Intros 315 330, which both aim to do just that.

25

2 Also, we're glad to see that city Councilmembers
3 supporting the clean water clean air and green jobs
4 environmental Bond Act of 2022 through Resolution
5 258, which will bring much needed funds and jobs to
6 New York City to make our communities healthier,
7 greener and more resilient.

8 We would like to applaud the city Councilmembers
9 to support the CLCPA scoping plan and the Build
10 Public Renewables Act, Resolution 169 and Resolution
11 189 respectively. I want to uplift the positive
12 impact that both will have on low income communities
13 and communities of color. The CLCPA scoping plan
14 takes steps towards addressing the disproportionate
15 burden of climate crisis by ensuring that there is
16 adequate investment in disadvantaged communities
17 towards greenhouse gas emission reduction, and other
18 climate change mitigation adaptation and resiliency
19 measures by identifying disadvantaged communities.
20 It's crucial to achieving the CLCPA mandates of a
21 minimum of 35% to 40% of the benefits of spending on
22 clean energy and energy efficiency programs, projects
23 and investments.

24 With the Build Public Renewables Act, the New
25 York Power Authority will be able will be enabled to

2 sell low cost renewable energy directly to New
3 Yorkers wholesale NYPA will sell renewable energy to
4 low-to-moderate income customers, prioritizing
5 disadvantaged communities. This will lower utility
6 bills for over a million households, approximately 3
7 million New Yorkers that cannot afford their utility
8 bills now.

9 Thank you again, Chair Gennaro, and the Committee
10 on Environmental Protection for allowing me to
11 testify on such important topics today. And we, as
12 always, looks forward to continued collaboration with
13 this with you on this committee to achieve climate
14 and environmental justice. And I did that in under
15 three minutes.

16 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, Lonnie. Let me
17 take this opportunity to... because as people
18 testify, they're going to go... I didn't... I didn't
19 go into the into detail on the on the Bond ACT
20 Resolution, which is mine. It's not just a rah-rah
21 Bond Act, past-it, pass-it, pass-it thing. It's...
22 It's conditional support, based on New York City
23 getting its fair share of Bond Act monies, which it
24 never does. And so that's a problem. I mean, you
25 know, I had a conversation with the DEP Commissioner

1 the other day, and the state... I mean, forget about
2 what... what is about. But it's... it's \$220 million
3 on... on... for certain kinds of environmental
4 projects to be spread throughout the state. And I
5 know all the all the Albany tricks because I was a
6 deputy commissioner at, you know, DEC for seven
7 years. And so it's \$220 million throughout the
8 state. It's written in a way that that no city in
9 the state of New York and get more than \$10 million.
10 So there's \$220 million on the table, and all New
11 York City is eligible for, at maximum, is \$10
12 million, and we're more than 40% of the population,
13 it's, you know, I think it's north of 45%. And I
14 don't know what the amount of tax revenue is... 60%,
15 or whatever it is. So this is what happens... and
16 the federal monies that are coming down on that,
17 whatever you call it on the you know, inflation
18 killer, whatever federal law, what the heck, whatever
19 the hell it is. Yeah, whatever it is, you know.
20 That's going to go to the state, and they're going to
21 play the same game with that, you know, and so...
22 but, you know, this is our money, you know, the
23 people in New York City are entitled, their fair
24 share for the Bond Act.
25

2 So the homework assignment for people here is to,
3 you know, let it be known to your state
4 representatives, or whatever, that when the Bond Act
5 passes, which I hope it does, you know, that New York
6 City gets its fair share. So, your... your Senator,
7 your Member of the Assembly. They should know that
8 you expect them to make sure that there's proper
9 apportionment of the Bond Act monies. And so I
10 wanted to do a little commercial for the Resolution.
11 You people are all networked. You have online...
12 whatever... all your organizations, whatever. That's
13 like... you know, we need people getting that message
14 out, because we don't want to get the fuzzy end of
15 the of the lollipop, you know, again, on Bond ACT
16 monies. Fuzzy end of the lollipop. Anyway, so...
17 Thank you, Lonnie.

18 Paul. My friend, Paul Mankiewicz.

19 MR. MANKIEWICZ: It's good to see you, Jim.

20 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Good to see you.

21 MR. MANKIEWICZ: So I'm going to be very quick on
22 this is a great program. It's just the problem is
23 your colleague and mine, Dan Walsh, I'm working on it
24 with. The metabolism of New York City, which is a
25

2 critical piece to solve. We spend something like
3 3000 megawatts.

4 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Dan Walsh, the Brownfields
5 guy.

6 MR. MANKIEWICZ: Dan Walsh. That's right.

7 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah, yeah.

8 MR. MANKIEWICZ: Yeah, an old friend. And he
9 convinced me to write this paper on metabolism in the
10 city with him.

11 But let me just quickly say, of the 11,000
12 megawatts of energy, every megawatt costs a half ton
13 of co2 every hour. So this is a huge amount. Every
14 single day, literally, the cooling of the city for
15 over 3000 megawatts, costs something like 34,000 tons
16 of carbon. The point is that it also costs... We
17 have... It's 2000 megawatts to treat the water at
18 the wastewater treatment plants. So say half of
19 that... some amount of that water is stormwater,
20 which could be combined sewer... from the combined
21 sewer, which I built the first 30 in the city of New
22 York, as you know. Basically, it could be captured
23 on rooftops, dropping the temperature of the city,
24 dropping the cooling costs of the city, and also
25 giving something like an opening to the biota.

2 If every kid can't get their hands into leaves,
3 we're failing. And that's got to be literally every
4 street, every seaside. It could be Cunningham Park.
5 It could be also West Harlem, or wherever.

6 So the point is that basically, we spend \$3,000,
7 to cool the city... 3000 megawatts. When the city
8 was Mannahatta, it produced 130 megawatts every
9 single day capturing 4000 tons of carbon in the
10 process.

11 I like what these folks are saying about
12 geothermal. One could couple flood control with
13 building aquifers -- I built the first in the city,
14 including a six acre one under the sim site -- which
15 could also be geothermal, warming and cooling the
16 buildings during... If you decouple them, you're
17 moving these things, you're wasting the energy to
18 move it without actually solving multiple problems at
19 the same time. So it's a great way to look. But
20 just as you're saying, it's a pickup game. You've
21 got to get expertise, and they're only looking at
22 part of the story. And... and we're not going to get
23 there from here, but we could, because the waste
24 stream of New York is immense. And we could build
25 soils, we could literally make them safe. I built a

2 three quarter acre park on Lower East Side with
3 basically the composted biosolids of the city of New
4 York: high iron, manganese, and phosphorus, three
5 quarters of an acre. Now the lead is coupled by
6 those elements and also the kids can play in that
7 stuff.

8 And Dan Walsh has a huge literature on this, as
9 you know.

10 So the point is our waste stream and the ecology
11 of the city, coupled with water, coupled with
12 geothermal is probably the way out, but we have to
13 integrate it now. As you said, we have to get the
14 expertise... people talking to one another. One
15 could do this for the city. And we could do it now.
16 But thanks for the opportunity.

17 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, Paul. And
18 any... any... I would like to have the benefit of
19 anything that you or Dan Walsh have in writing on
20 this, because...

21 MR. MANKIEWICZ: Yeah, you know...

22 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: ...it's hard to assimilate
23 just, you know...

24 MR. MANKIEWICZ: Yeah, yeah. It's too quick.

25 I'll send a... a short piece along, and actually Dan

2 and I maybe will come and talk to you when he's back
3 from... he's traveling right now, but that's sounds
4 good.

5 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: You know what? Also go to
6 Nabi right over there, and just, you know, and she
7 can give you her Council email. I want her... I
8 mean, I pretty much see everything anyway, but you
9 know, she... that I really have to, you know, get my
10 head into, and... and so, you know, please see Nabi.
11 She'll give you her personal... she'll give you her
12 email and she'll get it to me. You know, even though
13 I pretty much see everything anyway. But I
14 appreciate that.

15 And so, thank you very much to this panel. I
16 think this panel is going to be hard to beat. Pretty
17 hard to beat.

18 [Laughter]

19 COUNSEL: Next panel will be Eric Weltman, Jane
20 Bergman, Daniel Chu, and Karen Ives.

21 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: And while this panel is
22 getting set, I just need a like a two minute
23 recess... I mean for me.

24 [2.5 minutes of silence]

2 Sorry about that recess over please find your
3 seats.

4 COUNSEL: Eric Weltman?

5 MR. WELTMAN: Good afternoon sir. My name is
6 Eric Weltman, and I'm a senior organizer with Food
7 and Water Watch. Food and Water Watch was active in
8 the fight to ban fracking in New York and we continue
9 to oppose pipelines power plants now their
10 infrastructure to transport and burn frack gas and
11 other fossil fuels. As such, we greatly appreciate
12 the opportunity to speak in favor of two Resolutions
13 169 and 189, that would advance these essential
14 efforts.

15 It is critical that Governor Holcomb and the
16 legislature stand up to the fossil fuel industry and
17 enact bold policies to prevent climate change. The
18 science is clear and the real life experience is
19 tragically evident. We must move off fossil fuels
20 and do so rapidly or risk devastating climate
21 catastrophe. As we approach the 10th anniversary of
22 Superstorm Sandy, heat waves hurricanes and other
23 weather events wreak havoc from Puerto Rico to
24 Pakistan, too many people have died and many more
25 will die unless we take action now.

2 New York, both city and state has an essential
3 role to play by setting example for the nation and
4 world and minimizing our own greenhouse gas
5 emissions. Under your leadership, Chairman Gennaro,
6 the city council banned fossil fuels in new
7 buildings. And now it begins the essential task as
8 you know, of implementing Local Law 97 Establishing
9 energy efficiency standards of buildings.

10 At the state level, this leadership includes
11 issuing bold recommendations by the Climate Action
12 councils that meet the goals of the CLCPA, as called
13 for by Resolution 169 and includes passing the Build
14 Public Renewables Act that's called for by Resolution
15 189. The critical element of the Climate Action
16 Council Plan must be a ban on fracked gas and other
17 fossil fuels in new buildings. We cannot increase
18 our reliance on fossil fuels by allowing new
19 buildings to be hooked on gas. The state must follow
20 the city's lead in establishing such a ban by passing
21 the all-electric building act.

22 At the same time, the state must supersize its
23 production of renewable energy. One crucial tool for
24 doing that so is the New York Power Authority. The
25 nation's largest state owned electric utility,

2 established by then-Governor Franklin Roosevelt NYPA
3 has a strong track record of providing affordable,
4 reliable clean energy. By passing the bill public
5 renewals was act New York will unleash NYPA's
6 capacity to construct large scale solar and wind
7 power projects, providing low cost energy, while
8 generating 1000s of good green jobs.

9 In conclusion the New York City Council should
10 lend its voice in support at the state level policies
11 are essential to protecting our city from climate
12 change threat to our communities and families. We
13 appreciate the leadership of Councilmember Avilés in
14 introducing Resolution 189, and Councilmember Restler
15 and introducing 169 and respectfully urge to swift
16 approval by the committee and passed by the budget
17 Council. And we hope that Governor Holcomb and the
18 state legislature will heed your urgent call to
19 action. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. And good to see
20 you.

21 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you. Thank you,
22 thank you and everyone and Food and Water Watch. And
23 as you were testifying, I just got an inspiration.
24 And this is a note to staff, to Ricky and to Nabi:
25 Once we passed the Resolutions, this... I'm talking

2 to staff now, you know, there's an official
3 transmittal that goes from the Council to the state.
4 We don't pass them just make wallpaper out of them.
5 We send it to whoever is supposed to get it. And why
6 don't we do a thing where when we do like... like,
7 when the Council does its transmittal, I guess we'll
8 do our, you know, official transmittal. But then if
9 we can get like a whole coalition of, you know,
10 environmental groups and advocates, like on this big
11 like, sign on letter.

12 I mean, I don't want to tell the advocates what
13 to do, but you know, they can get like the official
14 copy of the Resolutions, both of them, and you can...
15 someone can take the leave whatever organization
16 wants to do it, and reach out to all like-minded
17 organizations and like, send them right to the
18 governor. You know, and so I...

19 MR. WELTMAN: That sounds like a great idea.

20 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah. I think that'd be
21 good, because it's one thing for her to get a piece
22 of paper from... from the City Council. It's another
23 thing for her to get that same piece of paper again
24 from a host of advocates...

25 MR. WELTMAN: Yes.

2 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: ...about basically saying
3 like, "Hey, what the hell?" and so...

4 MR. WELTMAN: I think we could be a little more
5 polite about it, but...

6 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah, whatever. But you
7 know. That... you know what I mean. So that's a
8 note to Ricky and a note to Nabi. Let's figure out a
9 way to, you know, to choreograph that. It came to me
10 as you were testifying. Thank you again.

11 MR. CHU: Good afternoon. Thank you, Chair
12 Gennaro for holding this hearing. My name is Daniel
13 Chu. I'm the Energy Planner with the New York City
14 Environmental Justice Alliance, or NYC-EJA. NYC-EJA
15 is also a member of the PEAK coalition along with Up-
16 pros, The Point CDC, New York Lawyers for the Public
17 Interest, and The Clean Energy Group. We're the
18 nation's first comprehensive effort to shut down the
19 peaker plants in New York City. NYC-EJA supports all
20 bills and Resolutions presented today which are
21 critical steps and accelerating the city's progress
22 and adjust transition.

23 We also call on the Council to make necessary
24 amendments to Intro 315 to define renewable energy,
25 incorporate battery storage into this study, and

2 empower the city agencies to take action on the
3 results of the study.

4 New York City Government is more than 50% behind
5 the 2025 goals of solar and storage, and we're also
6 dragging your feet and phasing out fossil fuel
7 assets, putting us on a pathway to fail the state-
8 mandated emissions-free grid energy grid by 2040.

9 Intro 315 does not specify what types of renewable
10 energy the city will study, which leaves a big
11 loophole for fossil fuel interests to slip in false
12 solutions such as hydrogen combustion into the study
13 technologies that, although don't produce CO2, are
14 expensive and emit more NOx emissions than burning
15 fossil fuels. This bill should define renewable
16 energy in line with Section 66P of the State Public
17 Service Law.

18 Understanding the viability of using stranded
19 properties, including brownfields for renewable
20 energy development can benefit environmental justice
21 communities by prioritizing low-income and people of
22 color neighborhoods and phasing out our fossil fuel
23 addiction. PEAK coalition has conducted and
24 published extensive research on the benefits of coal
25 citing renewable energy and battery storage and

2 methods that ensures critical resource reliability
3 and lower fossil fuel utilization during peak hours
4 of energy demand. PEAK Coalition has also
5 collaborated with the New York Power Authority over
6 the past few years confirming the feasibility of
7 transitioning NYPA's peaker plants to battery storage
8 assets alone. Incorporating battery storage into the
9 study will ensure that we can meet the city and
10 state's battery storage targets and improve the
11 resiliency of distributed generation systems. We
12 also urge the Council to require this report to be
13 made public and clearly communicated with communities
14 near vacant lots where renewable energy and storage
15 developments are feasible and suitable, especially on
16 sites where affordable housing developments are not
17 desirable.

18 Energy democracy is a core component of address
19 transition energy planning should no longer be done
20 in the backroom so government and regulated
21 utilities, that people have a right to disagree and
22 scrutinized and call for responsible, accountable and
23 rapid transition process in line with the CLC EPA and
24 the Climate Mobilization Act. We further ask the
25 City Council to take urgent action on the results of

2 this study, including requiring the DCAS to begin the
3 procurement process within weeks after delivery of
4 this report, and take advantage of benefits and
5 credits were available through the infrastructure
6 investment act and Inflation Reduction Act. PEAK
7 Coalition also urges the committee to pass the bills
8 regarding geothermal siting, and Resolution 169 on a
9 climate plan to protect New York. PEAK also supports
10 the Resolution regarding the bill Public Renewables
11 Act, which had previously issued a memo and testified
12 in the state assembly in support of. Thank you for
13 your time and consideration.

14 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you. I'm going to
15 give you a little... I'm going to give you a little
16 homework assignment. After you testify, I want you
17 to come up. I want to see Ricky, get Ricky's emails,
18 because you made very specific recommendations to,
19 you know, to one or both of the Intros.

20 MR. CHU: 315, yeah.

21 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: And so... Um... 315 and
22 330. I think both... or whatever. But I mean, you
23 know, this is the kind of testimony that a Chairman
24 lives for. You know, when you... very, very specific
25 recommendations that should get the full

2 consideration of the Council. So whatever document
3 you could provide directly to Ricky. That'd be
4 great.

5 MR. CHU: Yeah, we'll submit...

6 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: So you're working with both
7 Eddie and Elizabeth? So UpRose is working...

8 MR. CHU: So UpRose is a member of NYC-EJA and
9 they are also a member of PEAK Coalition, and we work
10 together.

11 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Right. But that's headed
12 by Elizabeth, right? UpRose, right?

13 MR. CHU: Yeah. And I work for Eddie.

14 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Oh, you work for Eddie.
15 Yeah, so say hi to Eddie, and, you know, to
16 Elizabeth, for me.

17 MR. CHU: I will.

18 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: And so and make sure you
19 get those specific recommendations to Ricky, right
20 here.

21 MR. CHU: Yeah. We will submit our written
22 testimony and we will also send it to Ricky.

23 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah, I mean, it's good...
24 it's very specific stuff. It... that's like the
25 nectar. Like we love that. Thank you.

2 Please.

3 COUNSEL: Jean Bergman?

4 MS. BERGMAN: Good afternoon. My name is Jeanne
5 Bergman, and I am here today testifying in favor of
6 Resolution 189 on behalf of the Sane Energy Project
7 and the Public Power New York Coalition, of which
8 Sane is a member. This Resolution calls on the New
9 York State legislature to pass and the governor to
10 sign the Build Public Renewables Act. The BPRA will
11 empower the New York Power Authority to own and build
12 new renewable energy generation plants resulting in
13 more clean and affordable energy for New Yorkers. I
14 want to begin by thanking the City Councilmembers who
15 have responded to the urgency of this moment. By
16 supporting the Resolution. You have aligned with the
17 majority of New Yorkers who are calling for publicly
18 owned renewable energy and who are desperate for real
19 solutions to both the climate crisis and the lack of
20 affordable heat and power. We are eager to take this
21 mandate from New York City back to Albany to win
22 passage of the Build Public Renewables Act. The BPRA
23 will lower energy costs for New Yorkers because
24 publicly owned electricity is less expensive than
25 that produced by private companies, because public

1 entities don't need to make a profit for investors.
2 And cheap NYPA power will be prioritized first for
3 government buildings like schools, universities, and
4 hospitals, and for low income residents. The BPRA
5 will reduce the opportunities of privately owned
6 companies whether they're selling fossil-fuel-fired
7 or renewable energy to gouge residents with high and
8 unpredictable bills, and the BPRA is revenue neutral.
9 Bonds and revenues from the sale of its electricity
10 will cover the cost of construction. Renewable
11 energy also promises substantial savings compared to
12 fossil fuel energy overall. The prices of gas and
13 oil are both rising steadily and spiking wildly
14 because of international conflicts and extreme
15 weather. Renewable energy costs are intrinsically
16 stable and much less expensive than fossil fuels.

17
18 More fundamentally, the dual crises of energy
19 affordability and climate chaos make it clear that we
20 must transform our energy system for one based on
21 investor-owned corporations seeking to upsell a
22 commodity irrespective of the harms that may cause to
23 one that treats heat and power as necessary public
24 goods which must be carefully developed, produced,
25 and managed to mitigate economic injustice and

2 environmental destruction. The BPRA is a small step
3 towards this more just, more rational system.

4 Other Resolutions before this committee today,
5 including especially 169, and legislation in Albany
6 many may move us further, and are needed to move us
7 further. But it is critical that we avoid the trap
8 of false solutions that fail to address the core
9 issues of greenhouse gas emissions regardless of
10 source. And here, I'm looking at you hydrogen and
11 RNG.

12 The climate crisis is upon us. We have passed
13 crucial tipping points and the Earth has entered a
14 death spiral. We have been lucky so far here in New
15 York to escape the wildfires, droughts, extreme heat
16 and floods that afflict other regions. But we are
17 not unaffected. We're already trying to manage
18 higher food prices from heatflation, climate refugees
19 seeking safety and kindness that are stressing our
20 fragile services and health impacts of hotter and
21 longer summers. I urge all the members of the city
22 council to vote for Resolution 189 for renewable
23 public power, and to support the other Resolutions
24 that will have a meaningful impact on our fossil fuel
25 and non-fossil fuel methane emissions. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, thank you.

3 Every time a word or a phrase has never been used in
4 any of my hearings of this committee going back to
5 2002, I always make note of it. And this is the
6 first time that the phrase "death spiral" has been
7 used in this committee going back to 2002. So we
8 made you know, we made committee history today,
9 but...

10 MS. BERGMAN: Sorry to hear it.

11 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah.

12 MS. BERGMAN: I wish it was something happier.

13 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: No one's ever used "death
14 spiral" before like in... in the committee and I just
15 want to make note of that. Thank you for your... for
16 your good testimony. I... It's a scary thing, death
17 spiral, but not inaccurate. And thank you very much
18 for your compelling and passionate testimony. Thank
19 you.

20 MS. BERGMAN: Thank you.

21 MS. IMAS: Good afternoon Chair Gennaro. My name
22 is Karen Imas, and I'm the Public Policy Manager for
23 Attentive Energy, an offshore wind developer working
24 here in the New York bight. Thank you for the
25 opportunity to testify today. We're here to express

1 support for Resolution 169. Attentive Energy is
2 developing in 84,000 acre area located approximately
3 54 miles off the coast of New York. And when
4 completed, the project has the potential to generate
5 3000 megawatts of clean energy to power 1 million
6 homes. The power will support the state's climate
7 and economic goals. In the years building up to the
8 federal lease auction, and ultimate award of a lease
9 from the federal government. Attentive Energy
10 focused its effort on meaningful and proactive
11 stakeholder engagement, a community-first approach to
12 offshore wind development, and an approach that is
13 really important for any renewable energy project
14 coming into the New York landscape. We've been
15 active on the ground in the New York bight for more
16 than three years connecting with stakeholders, labor,
17 seeking out diverse voices and perspectives, and
18 listening to the needs of local communities, and we
19 look forward to a shared success of this project
20 moving forward.

22 Today's hearing comes at an important time in New
23 York Cities in New York State's efforts to tackle
24 climate change and develop an aggressive goal
25 renewable energy agenda, and Attentive Energy

2 supports Resolution 169, which urges the Climate
3 Action Council to draft and the government to
4 implement the final Climate Action Council Scoping
5 Plan that commits to meeting the CLCPA goals, the
6 bold climate and environmental justice action in New
7 York.

8 By enshrining into law clear and concrete targets
9 for developing wind, solar energy efficient and
10 storage technologies, the law provides a clear
11 timeline for the rapid deployment of clean energy and
12 in the process, importantly, unlocking the next wave
13 of investment in New York's clean energy industries.
14 Attentive Energy, and our team here in New York, is
15 particularly focused on supporting the CL CPAs goals
16 alongside creating economic development opportunities
17 and directing spending on climate programs to
18 disadvantaged communities.

19 The technology of building the offshore wind
20 farms is just one piece of the success, the community
21 piece, the economic piece and the environmental
22 justice piece is just as relevant. Creating
23 employment pathways that promote diversity, and
24 include historically disadvantaged communities will
25 help begin to address environmental justice

2 priorities. These goals are not only critical to
3 combatting and greenhouse gas emissions, but also
4 meeting targets that this city council has set for
5 greener buildings. Achieving the CLCPA's targets is
6 essential, given that electricity represents a
7 significant share of total energy consumption and
8 many buildings.

9 Further, as we know, renewable energy efforts
10 like offshore wind are linked to protecting public
11 health, further strengthened by the CLCPA's
12 requirement that the state prioritize projects that
13 both reduce HG emissions and eliminate pollutants in
14 historically disadvantaged communities.

15 Attentive Energy is committed to tackling these
16 challenges delivering clean renewable energy projects
17 to New York City, alongside robust community first
18 approach. That is why we're here to echo support for
19 Resolution 169, and we look forward to continuing to
20 work with federal, state and local partners to
21 achieve our shared ambitious climate goals. Thank
22 you.

23 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, Karen. Thanks
24 for being here. And I didn't know about the firm

2 Attentive Energy, but I do now. And is it a big
3 firm?

4 MS. IMAS: It's a... Here in the New York and
5 New Jersey region, we're about 30 employees, and
6 greater across the country, and then globally, there
7 are other renewable energy projects taking place
8 around the world. We are one of the federal lease
9 holders. BOEM had the federal lease auction earlier
10 this year, and a number of offshore wind companies
11 have secured lease rights. And so we are one of
12 those awardees, and are now preparing to bid into
13 NYSERDA's open solicitation, which has a deadline at
14 the end of December. So a lot of action coming into
15 the city, to Long Island, to the region, which I'm
16 sure we're going to see a lot more of in the coming
17 months and years.

18 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Good luck with that.
19 That's really great.

20 MS. IMAS: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you very much to this
22 panel. I appreciate your good testimony and your
23 patience. You know, the hour is late and you're
24 still here. Thank you very much. And those other
25

2 companies you're talking about, I don't see them here
3 today, but you're here.

4 COUNSEL: The next panel will be Haym Gross, Sara
5 Groanin, Joanna Oltman Smith, and Alison Considine.
6 Got it. So no Sara. Cindy Beauvais[sp?]. Milo
7 (inaudible).

8 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Okay, I think we're going
9 to go in this panel, just to change it up, we're
10 going to go from my left to my right, which is your
11 right to your left. So we'll start with you.

12 MS. BEAUVAIS[SP?]: Alright. I've got to
13 press... what button am I pressing when I'm going to
14 start?

15 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: The sergeant will direct
16 you.

17 MS. BEAUVAIS: Okay. Oh. It's already started.

18 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: You've got to just talk
19 right into the mic.

20 MS. BEAUVAIS: Okay. So first, I wanted to say
21 thank you. You're amazing. I'm having a great time.
22 And I feel your... your love and your passion. And I
23 hope I have enough time.

24 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Oh, thank you.

2 MS. BEAUVAIS: You're welcome. Thank you. Hi,
3 my name is Cindy Beauvais. I'm a Boricua single mom
4 who lives in Brooklyn, and I'm finally being brave
5 enough to stand up to fight for what's right. Fight
6 in peace, of course. I am seeking justice for a
7 safer world, not only for my amazing children, but
8 for all the amazing children in the world. They
9 deserve a beautiful, safe planet where they can live
10 in peace and without so many illnesses caused by all
11 the chemicals that are put out into the world. It is
12 super sad that everything is about money and greed,
13 not caring about people's health and just allowing
14 all these things that potentially kill lots of people
15 daily, and make so many sick, having to fight for
16 their lives through long treatments and medicines
17 that cost so much money, which lots of people can't
18 afford, and therefore they end up losing their life.
19 And it's all because of the greed of the world. It
20 truly breaks my heart.

21 I'm asking you to please join me and save in the
22 future of the children. Together, we can make this
23 world a better place. Please, please think of the
24 children all around the world who are dreaming to
25 have a future of being a doctor or firefighter. And

2 if we don't stop all of these bad practices that
3 catastrophes will get worse as it has been impacting
4 my beautiful island, Puerto Rico, and other places
5 around the world who are suffering the effects of
6 climate change.

7 If we don't make a change towards the right
8 direction, eventually climate change will end the
9 world, and the children won't be able to make their
10 dreams come true. So please do right by our
11 children. Please do the right thing. I believe in
12 everyone. Thank you all for your time. I love you.
13 God bless you and your families. PS, if you didn't
14 realize I care about you all and your families as
15 well. I will keep praying for our world. Thank you.
16 Be the change. It starts with you.

17 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you very much. And
18 we... we thank you, and on behalf of the City Council
19 by the power invested in me, I send you the love of
20 the City Council in your direction. Thank you very
21 much. God bless.

22 MS. BEAUVAIS: Thank you. God bless you. Thank
23 you.

24 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Tough act to beat.

2 MS. OLTMAN SMITH: Good afternoon. My name is
3 Joanna Oltman Smith, I'm a member of 350 Brooklyn,
4 and also very active with New York Renews, also a
5 mother, also brought... brought to this place by a
6 strong sense of urgency.

7 So I'd just like to share with the Council some
8 of my personal experiences around the CLCPA. I'm
9 here in support of Resolution 169. Over the last
10 decade, I've worked alongside thousands of other New
11 York citizens to pass the Climate Leadership and
12 Community Protection Act. Some of us even sprawled
13 out on the floor of the New York State Capitol in
14 front of the executive chamber doors, risking arrest,
15 staring at State Trooper boots, while inside the
16 former governor was slowly... ever-so-slowly changing
17 his mind, and eventually listening to our state
18 representatives, who we finally in 2019 convinced to
19 vote the CLCPA into law... "black letter law" as you
20 likes to say. Which is to say that I have had a
21 great interest in how the Climate Action Council
22 would get down to work. Watching various CAC Zoom
23 meetings, I rooted for the scientists and
24 representatives from environmental conservation and
25 justice organizations who spoke truth to the fear-

2 mongering fossil fuel representatives who had bought
3 their way with big campaign donations onto that same
4 Council.

5 Given all that, it is something of a miracle that
6 the CAC's deliberations have resulted in a draft
7 scoping plan that robustly pursues a rapid and just
8 transition to low-emissions future for New York
9 State. The plan is sensitive to the needs of all
10 communities, investing heavily in those where the
11 negative health and social outcomes of the old ways
12 of doing business are most pronounced. Let's be
13 clear. The scoping plan poses an existential threat
14 to the fossil fuel industry, and they're pushing back
15 hard spending millions of dollars lobbying localities
16 to undermine it.

17 And that's why the New York City Council, that
18 represents nearly half of all New York State
19 residents must adopt Resolution 169 to help bolster
20 that scoping plan. It's essential to our statewide
21 approach to combating the climate breakdown that
22 we're seeing around us in real time. I'll end by
23 mentioning that I attended mini-climate week, and
24 also just yesterday, at Columbia, they had a big
25 gathering of energy experts at a summit and to a one,

2 all of the top executives from multinational banks,
3 who are continuing to invest full steam in fossil
4 fuel infrastructure, and also all the leaders at the
5 think tanks and the academics that are advising them,
6 are all saying how hard it is to invest in green
7 infrastructure. They're saying they don't have the
8 right instruments. They don't have the right ways of
9 calculating the risk. But what they really don't
10 have is a way of calculating the extreme paradigm
11 shift that is essential to protecting us all from the
12 existential risks of climate change. And that's
13 where government comes into play. Government has to
14 step in with sound policies and laws that give them
15 no other choice. And the climate action councils
16 final scoping plan needs to do exactly that. And we
17 can help them do it. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you very much. I
19 appreciate that.

20 MILO: Good afternoon. My name is Milo. I'm a
21 resident of the Lower East Side. I'm New York born
22 and bred. And I was 13 years old when Hurricane
23 Sandy hit the city and I still remember having to
24 walk up and down my apartment building in the dark
25 with my flashlight, and the way that the city was

2 really devastated from the storm. And as other
3 people have mentioned, we're still trying to recover
4 from Hurricane Sandy.

5 Now at age 23, I'm a research assistant and I
6 study the effects of extreme weather events that are
7 occurring at higher frequencies because of climate
8 change on public health, as well as the effects of
9 fossil fuel pollution on public health.

10 And as other people have mentioned, fossil fuel
11 pollution, in addition to causing the climate crisis,
12 also causes various, you know, immediate health
13 outcomes, including asthma, cardiovascular disease.
14 I'm actually studying the effects on preterm birth,
15 and because of historic racist housing policies,
16 people of color are disproportionately exposed to
17 fossil fuel pollution, and I'm looking at the effects
18 on preterm birth. And... and there's a huge amount
19 of evidence that fossil fuel pollution is one of the
20 contributing factors for why preterm birth is much
21 higher among black families compared to white
22 families. And preterm birth has really long-term
23 chronic implications. It can lead to neurological,
24 respiratory, digestive, visual auditory... I'm
25 probably missing a few other... like, so many health

1 effects. And no child deserves to have, you know,
2 that put on them because of where they were born and
3 where they're being raised. And no child deserves to
4 be dealing with the extreme heat that we're
5 experiencing more and more in the city. No child
6 deserves to have to worry about the next Hurricane
7 Sandy. But here we are.

9 So we need the City Council to pass Resolution
10 169 and 189, in support of strong climate policies
11 for the city and for the state. We need to
12 democratize our energy system so that it's responsive
13 to the needs of the public and not profit-driven
14 utility companies and fossil fuel companies. And,
15 you know, I know that I'm speaking to the choir, like
16 I know, you guys care about climate change, and I
17 just wanted to share some stories about why this
18 fight is really important to me, and why it is
19 important to, you know, everybody in this city, in
20 this world.

21 Given all of the obstacles we're facing at a
22 federal level, we really need to step up at a state
23 and local level to make sure that New York is doing
24 its part and is leading in this fight. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you very much. And I
3 can assure you that both Resolutions will pass. So
4 we're getting that done.

5 MR. GROSS: Good afternoon, Chair Gennaro. My
6 name is Haym Gross. I'm an architect. I'm Chair of
7 the New York City 2030 District. We're not for
8 profit partnership organizations and activists
9 confronting climate change. NYC 2030 is one of 20
10 districts across North America, counting over 500
11 million square feet of properties as members. We are
12 implementing Heat/Cool Smart Brooklyn, which is a
13 NYSERDA-funded, and Brooklyn Borough President
14 sponsored community campaign to retrofit buildings
15 with clean heating and cooling and weatherization.

16 And I speak enthusiastically in supportive
17 Council Resolution number 169, and also the intros
18 and other Resolutions before you.

19 The Resolution 169 calls for the final Climate
20 Action Council Scoping Plan to promote bold climate
21 and environmental justice action in New York. The
22 CLCPA Commitments for New York State to meet 40%
23 reduction in carbon emissions and 70% renewable
24 energy by 2030 are tremendously ambitious and
25 certainly milestones, and very difficult targets to

2 meet. In addition, the commitment to direct 40% of
3 the benefits and spending on climate initiatives to
4 disadvantaged communities is laudable, and also a
5 very high bar to meet. The state's actions mandated
6 through CLCPA are essential but they are woefully
7 insufficient.

8 New York City, the communities institutions,
9 businesses, all stakeholders have to do a lot more to
10 achieve these targets. I'm probably not going to
11 have enough time to read all this. But I did submit
12 a written... written testimony. You know, all the...
13 the key metrics here, but 42% of the city's GHG
14 emissions are devoted or drawn from heating... space
15 heating and hot water. The decarbonization of New
16 York City's buildings... particularly its multifamily
17 buildings are going to take an enormous effort. I do
18 this stuff on the ground. We've been doing it
19 through the pandemic, and I can tell you that the
20 resources just are not there. Over 75% of New York's
21 residential buildings are heated by oil or gas. The
22 multifamily buildings of 5 to 25 units are not, for
23 the most part, covered by Local Law 97. So we need a
24 lot more support there. In May, Con Edison suspended
25 its clean heat program. It basically pulled the plug

2 on the key program to transition from fossil fuels to
3 electrified heat pumps. They're not going to
4 reinstate that program until sometime in 2023. So we
5 lost a heating season.

6 And so \$227 million that they spent in the first
7 couple of years, only 10% went to meet multifamily
8 buildings, and multifamily buildings account for over
9 60%... 60% of New York City's dwelling units. The...
10 the other intros represent a lot more of the picture
11 that we need to meet: Microgrids, thermal energy,
12 district energy systems, et cetera. We need
13 community-scale projects. We need whole building
14 cross trade and cross solutions initiatives to really
15 meet these retrofits through... meet these targets
16 through effective deep energy retrofits. We also
17 need to Team these...

18 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: You need to summarize,
19 because I have people waiting to testify online also.

20 MR. GROSS: Okay. We can go on and on. But I
21 support 169 and the other efforts, and I also greatly
22 support your... your revival of the of the... the New
23 York City Climate Adaptation Task Force.

24 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you.

2 MR. GROSS: And I'd love to help you with the
3 wonderful resources that we have. We work at the
4 Brooklyn Navy Yard, we work with Pratt and the New
5 School, and we want to work with you.

6 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Why don't you reach out to
7 the Administration, because like they're the ones who
8 get... I gave them a lot of latitude in how they can
9 set up the climate action pact... the climate change
10 the climate... whatever, The Panel, and I gave them
11 like, a fair amount of latitude. It looks like we
12 gave them too much latitude to the point where they
13 just thought you know that the law was a
14 recommendation, which it is not. And so I pass a
15 law. I was term-limited out of office. I'm back and
16 the Climate Change Adaptation Taskforce is coming
17 back.

18 MR. GROSS: Okay. Well, I hope you can also see
19 what... find out with... specifically with regard to
20 the... these multifamily buildings and the small-to-
21 medium sized multifamily building...

22 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Well, you know...

23 MR. GROSS: ...are ubiquitous in the city. They
24 don't have any resources. See what the New York City
25 Accelerator is doing, and maybe you can put a little

2 Fire underneath...

3 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah, I mean, that is
4 available to people and, you know, buildings that
5 are... don't necessarily have that are not under the
6 umbrella of Local Law 97 can avail themselves of, you
7 know, all of the, you know, the help from, you know,
8 from the accelerator.

9 MR. GROSS: They need a lot more.

10 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: And so... but first of all,
11 like we got to get Local Law 97, which is going to
12 be, you know, Herculean to get that done. Thank you
13 very much. Thank you very much to this panel.
14 Cindy, come here.

15 COUNSEL: We'll be shifting to online testimony
16 now. First up, we have Donna De Costanzo. Whenever
17 you're ready Donna.

18 MS. DE CONSTANZO: Okay, thanks so much. Good
19 afternoon, Chair Gennaro. My name is Donna
20 DeConstanzo.

21 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Hi Donna.

22 MS. DE CONSTANZO: Hi Chairman, how are you? I'm
23 Eastern Regional Director for the Climate and Clean
24 Energy Program at NRDC. And I want to thank you and
25 the Council for your strong leadership on tackling

2 climate change and appreciate the opportunity to
3 testify today on behalf of the NRDC, Urban Green
4 Council and the Regional Plan Association.

5 The city council should pass Resolution 169 to
6 show its support for a strong final CLCPA scoping
7 plan. 2019 was a big year for bold action on climate
8 in New York, as the New York City Council adopted its
9 landmark local law 197 Building Performance
10 Legislation, the state advanced aggressive climate
11 policy with the adoption of the CLCPA, one of the
12 strongest laws of its kind in the country, with
13 ambitious climate and clean energy targets as well as
14 a central focus on equity in disadvantaged
15 communities, including a requirement that 35% to 40%
16 of overall benefits accrue to those communities.

17 The New York State Climate Action Council, which
18 was tasked with developing the state scoping plan for
19 how we will achieve the ambitious CLCPA targets,
20 released a strong draft scoping plan at the end of
21 2021, and will release a final scoping plan by the
22 end of this year.

23 We strongly support the passage of Resolution
24 169, because it is critical that the final CLCPA
25 scoping plan remain as strong as possible in order to

1 meet the laws climate, clean energy and equity
2 targets. Doing so will lead to both climate and
3 environmental justice action in New York, and will
4 deliver tremendous benefits to all New Yorkers,
5 including lower toxic air pollution, thousands of new
6 family sustaining local jobs, and a greater quality
7 of life. The state scoping plan will also play an
8 important role in achieving the goals of Local Law 97
9 as it contains key recommendations to significantly
10 scale up energy efficiency and building
11 electrification. There is well funded and formidable
12 opposition to the state's vision and draft scoping
13 plan that stands to benefit financially from
14 continuing the status quo, but the reality is that a
15 strong plan to meet the state's climate and equity
16 commitments is good for all New Yorkers.

18 Adopting Resolution 169 will demonstrate strong
19 support from the state's largest municipality for a
20 CLCPA scoping plan that ambitiously leads to a better
21 climate, prioritizes the most vulnerable communities,
22 and a healthier future for all.

23 Intros 350 and 330 will illuminate new
24 opportunities to advance heat pumps and renewable
25 energy deployment within the city. With limited

2 opportunities for siting new clean energy projects
3 within our densely developed landscape, finding new
4 opportunities and spaces that are already owned by
5 the city pursuant to Intro 315 will be another tool
6 we have to continue to scale up clean technologies
7 like solar PV and storage. In addition, the database
8 created by Intro 330 will further support the
9 deployment of heat pumps across the city by helping
10 to support the engineering and design of geothermal
11 heat pump systems, which are another part of our
12 broadening toolbox to reach wide scale building
13 electrification and meet Local Law 97 targets.

14 I want to thank you for the opportunity to
15 testify today regarding these important issues, the
16 NRDC, Urban Green Council and RPA. Thank you, again
17 for your leadership and look forward to continuing to
18 work with you and the Council to advance clean energy
19 in New York and maintain New York City's strong
20 climate legacy. Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you, Donna. Always a
22 real pleasure to see you. Anyone listening, you may
23 or may not know that Dan has served this council with
24 great distinction as a counsel to the Committee on
25 Environmental Protection, and, you know, and aside

2 from being a wonderful colleague, is a great friend
3 as well. And... and... just to... just to... is
4 Donna still on? I see myself here.

5 MS. DE CONSTANZO: Yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: I just have my... I got a
7 single family house. It's 97 years old. And now
8 it's all... We heat and cool with heat pumps now. So
9 I knew you'd be proud of me for doing that. So.

10 MS. DE CONSTANZO: That's wonderful to hear.
11 Thanks. Chair Gennaro, that's wonderful.

12 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Yeah. Sometimes I feel
13 like I'm 97. But anyway, that's... that's another
14 story. Donna, always great to see you. Thank you so
15 much for... for participating in this hearing, and
16 giving us the benefit of your... of your... of your
17 great views on behalf of all the organizations that
18 you represent. And they are very lucky to have you.
19 Thank you.

20 MS. DE CONSTANZO: Thanks so much, Chair Gennaro.

21 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: You bet.

22 COUNSEL: Next, we'll be hearing from Georgie
23 Page, followed by Alexis Hidalgo, followed by Tom
24 Coughlin.

25 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

2 COUNSEL: Whenever you're ready.

3 MS. PAGE: Okay, I'm sorry. Good afternoon,
4 Chair Gennaro and members of the Committee on
5 Environmental Protection. My name is Georgie Page,
6 and I am testifying in support of Resolution 169 and
7 a strong courageous rigorous scoping plan from the
8 state Climate Action Council that will meet our CLPP
9 mandate. I also support Resolution 189 and intros
10 315 and 330.

11 First, I want to thank Councilmembers Restler,
12 Hanif, and others for consistently championing
13 critical environmental legislation, as well as
14 Resolutions like this, and never taking their eyes
15 off the ball.

16 I am a private citizen, who for the last three
17 years has dedicated around 10 hours of nearly every
18 week, doing everything I can to help forestall or
19 mitigate the impending crisis of global warming. Our
20 group, 350 Brooklyn, is composed of volunteers who
21 nevertheless mobilized hundreds of responses to this
22 scoping plan. I hope in this government that is
23 theoretically of the people for the people and by the
24 people, our voices might hold some weight against the
25 constant lobbying onslaught of fossil fuel interests,

2 whose only motivation is greed, not wildlife, not the
3 future, not our children's health. Greed. What
4 motivated me to come here today? I am not motivated
5 purely by altruism. Most days I am motivated by
6 anxiety. I'm supposed to be helping my partner start
7 a contracting business so that one day we can build
8 our passive dream home. I've already designed the
9 logo and priced our t-shirt. But these climate
10 questions haunt me. Where can we build? Where will
11 it be safe from drought, wildfires, power outages, or
12 on the other end of the spectrum, flooding,
13 tornadoes, hurricane, and the escalations of fear and
14 war.

15 While I do realize that the vast majority of
16 people on our planet don't have the luxury of
17 thinking about building their own businesses or dream
18 homes, they're thinking about potable water and
19 educating their daughters. The reality is that we
20 are all connected, and everything is at stake. Our
21 fates are intertwined. Therefore, increasingly,
22 citizens, consumers, activists in you, our elected
23 officials, are called upon to do something that does
24 not come naturally to the average American. We must
25 think globally, we must take very seriously the task

2 of calculating our global impact and our energy
3 security as part of this conversation. More and
4 more, we're starting to see that the toxicity of oil,
5 and its extraction, and its marketing corrodes
6 everything it touches, the we must hasten its
7 obsolescence. In fact, in New York State, offshore
8 wind, solar and even geothermal energy will soon come
9 online, offering hundreds of 1000s of homes and
10 businesses. We are right on the cusp of an energy
11 revolution that can create a safer world and more
12 prosperity for more people.

13 As long as we can avoid getting trapped into a
14 brand new codependent relationship with the oil
15 industry and the extensive hydrogen fuel cells and so
16 called Eco fuel that they're peddling. Don't be
17 fooled. The new fuels are just as bad as the old
18 fuels and we are running out of time. I was also
19 moved to come here today by the lies being spread by
20 fossil fuel interests, like the Petroleum Institute
21 and their phony activist group.

22 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

23 MS. PAGE: Can I just have 30 more seconds? New
24 Yorkers for affordable energy and energy citizens.
25 These groups are desperate and they're still

2 succeeding in spreading dangerous misinformation.

3 Just a few months ago, these corporate shills
4 launched a television vision ad to drum up opposition
5 to the all-electric Buildings Act using bald-faced
6 lies and sell-out politicians. The ad claims that
7 the bill would ban gas stoves and furnaces, sticking
8 you with a \$30,000 price tag to replace them. The
9 truth is that the bill actually only applies to new
10 construction, so no one will be required to replace
11 their stove. We can't go forward if we keep letting
12 them drag us back. Resolution 169 helps to counter
13 their efforts. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you. Thank you very
15 much for your passionate and comprehensive testimony.
16 I have to beg the remaining witnesses indulgence for
17 two minutes. I need to excuse myself for two
18 minutes. I literally will be back in two minutes.
19 My apologies for the witnesses, and Ricky will give
20 the order of witnesses, and I'll be right back.

21 COUNSEL: Testifying next will be Amanda Sachs,
22 followed by Ken Coughlin, followed by Shrvanthi
23 Kanekal, and then Rami Dinnawi.

24 [2 minutes of silence]

25 COUNSEL: Alexis Hidalgo, whenever you're ready?

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

3 MS. HIDALGO: Hi, everyone. My name is Alexis
4 Hidalgo and I'm the Equitable Policy and Programs
5 Fellow for the New York League of Conservation
6 Voters. NYLCB represents over 30,000 members in New
7 York City, and we're committed to advancing a
8 sustainability agenda that will make our people our
9 neighborhoods and our economy healthier and more
10 resilient. I would like to thank Chair Gennaro for
11 the opportunity to testify today.

12 Burning fossil fuels creates harmful air
13 pollution and perpetuates environmental injustice.
14 Communities of color and low income communities are
15 more likely to live close to power plants, refineries
16 generating oil and gas, petrochemical facilities
17 producing chemicals, and ports, highways and railways
18 generating pollution. NYC also has one of the
19 country's highest rates of asthma hospitalizations
20 and deaths among children and young adults, African
21 Americans, and Latino patients, and residents of
22 high-poverty neighborhoods.

23 While the city has a multitude of commitments in
24 place to encourage a transition to net zero
25 emissions, these plans are only the start of lowering

emissions. We need to expand renewable energy in the city, which is why NYLCB supports Intro 315 and 330.

The majority of homes and businesses burn fossil fuels on site for heating, contributing to over 30% of New York's greenhouse gas emissions. Geothermal heat pumps would be able to provide low and zero emission heating, so we need to make it easier for building owners and utilities to know the best places for geothermal wells, and where drilling would clash with existing use of subterranean areas. Intro 330 would cut that red tape to make building more geothermal energy easier.

In addition to expanding geothermal energy, the city should study vacant and underutilized city-owned sites for the potential to be used for renewable energy generation. This would allow for the expansion of renewable energy and sites such as closed and capped landfills and brownfields in the city. Transforming these spaces would reduce emissions and could potentially allow more New York New Yorkers to benefit from clean energy through programs like community solar. These bills, which would promote renewable and alternative energy sources, will help to reduce our reliance on energy

2 produced from fossil fuels, therefore improving
3 public health and fighting climate change. With ever
4 increasing energy demand and rising energy costs it's
5 imperative that New York City adopts renewable
6 sustainable sources of energy production. Thank you
7 so much for letting me testify today.

8 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you very much. And
9 thank you for your great work on behalf of the League
10 of Conservation Voters. It would be... it would be
11 interesting to me if the... if we could get... we
12 just add it on, you know, right before the hearing,
13 but my Reso on the on the Bond Act that advocates for
14 fair share. You know, we'd be very grateful for the
15 support of LCV on that as well.

16 I mean, we don't want to discourage people from
17 voting for the Bond Act, but we're just looking for
18 fair share. And so that would be something that...
19 that... I think the council would appreciate if we
20 could get the support of LCV on the Fair Share Bond
21 Act Reso. So maybe talk to Julie about that.

22 MS. HIDALGO: We will do.

23 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: And please send her my
24 best, and Josh Kleinberg as well.

25 MS. HIDALGO: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you.

3 COUNSEL: Next is Ken Coughlin.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

5 MR. COUGHLIN: Hi Chair Gennaro. Thank you for
6 hanging in there with us and for your attentiveness.
7 And I hope your vocal cords are fully restored soon,
8 because the environment needs your voice.

9 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you.

10 MR. COUGHLIN: I am Ken Coughlin, a board member
11 of Stop The Chop NY NJ, and we strongly support
12 Resolution 169. Stop The Chop NY NJ is a nonprofit
13 volunteer organization that was formed to ban
14 nonessential -- meaning sightseeing and commuter
15 helicopter traffic -- in the New York metropolitan
16 region. Helicopter jurors are among the most carbon
17 intensive modes of transportation, burning between 50
18 and 500 gallons of fuel per hour depending on the
19 aircraft. Some still even burn leaded fuel, which
20 was banned 25 years ago by the EPA. Close to 100,000
21 nonessential helicopter flights originate from New
22 York Area heliports each year. Despite sporadic
23 efforts to reduce this number, conditions have only
24 worsened. In the last five years New York City's 311
25 system saw more than a 2,000% increase in noise

1 complaints related to helicopters. On fair days in
2 my neighborhood, the Upper West Side, the near-
3 constant drone of helicopters has become the new
4 normal. In June, the New York State Legislature took
5 a good first step toward giving us some relief when
6 it passed the Stop The Chop Act, which will allow New
7 Yorkers and our attorney general to sue certain
8 helicopter companies for excessive helicopter noise.
9 We urge Governor Hochul to sign this bill without
10 further delay. We also urge the governor to close
11 the West 30th Street heliport located in Hudson River
12 Park to nonessential helicopter companies. A park is
13 no place for a heliport.

14 Also, as we know, the adverse impact of air
15 pollutants falls especially hard on people living in
16 New York City's environmental justice neighborhoods,
17 many of which are directly under the pads of commuter
18 and tourist helicopters. If we are to meet the goals
19 of the Climate Protection Act, and avert the worst
20 effects of the crisis upon us, every transportation
21 mode must be held to new and urgent co2 standards.
22 Helicopters are the literal low hanging fruit in this
23 effort. Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you. Yeah, thanks
3 for... I mean, it was... I gave you a little bit of a
4 latitude there... you waited a long time. But you
5 tied it in well enough with the topics that we're
6 discussing today that I appreciate your testimony,
7 and you're creating that nexus between the
8 helicopters and the items we're talking about today.
9 Thank you very much.

10 MR. COUGHLIN: Thank you.

11 COUNSEL: Shravanthi Kanekal.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

13 MS. KANEKAL: Good afternoon Chair Gennaro and
14 members of the Council. My name is Shravanthi
15 Kanekal and I'm the Resiliency Planner for the New
16 York City Environmental Justice Alliance, also known
17 as NYC-EJA. I'm testifying today on behalf of NYC-
18 EJA and Climate Works For All, which is a coalition
19 of labor, community, state environmental justice and
20 climate organizations fighting climate change and
21 inequality in New York City, by demanding the just
22 transition. NYC-EJA and Climate Works For All
23 support both bills being introduced today, Intro 315
24 and Intro 330, and all the Resolutions being
25 proposed. New York City is currently more reliant on

2 fossil fuel generation than the rest of the New York
3 State. We're currently behind on the 70% emissions
4 reduction mandate set by the leadership and Community
5 Protection Act, as well as the city's goal to install
6 100 megawatts of solar energy and 500 megawatts of
7 energy storage by 2025.

8 The city should use public land to invest locally
9 in renewable energy and energy storage that could
10 meet peak demand needs, reduce electricity bills, and
11 provide local resilient power. Renewable and
12 resilient energy systems will advance energy
13 democracy, reduce energy costs burdens, improve air
14 quality, and strengthen the resiliency of
15 communities, while also capturing the community and
16 workforce benefits sustainable systems can deliver.
17 Using vacant and underutilized properties, including
18 brownfields for renewable energy development, can
19 transform polluted land into future clean energy
20 hubs, and has the potential to directly benefit
21 environmental justice communities.

22 To this end Intro 315 will help achieve the
23 city's and state's climate goals and reduce our
24 reliance on fossil fuels innovation. We need to
25 ensure that we're prioritizing an accelerated

1 timeline for meeting our emissions reduction targets.
2
3 As my colleague Daniel previously stated, I'd like to
4 uplift that in regard to Intro 315, the city should
5 also consider studying energy storage capabilities on
6 these vacant and underutilized lots. The legislation
7 should clarify your definition of renewable energy as
8 there should be no (inaudible) solutions. And the
9 generators report should be made public and
10 communicated with communities that the identified
11 underutilized lots are close to.

12 As we shift away from fossil fuels, it's
13 imperative that we think about diverse sources of
14 renewable energy, geothermal is a reliable and
15 predictable source of energy that uses significantly
16 less electricity than conventional heating and
17 cooling systems. We support Intro 330 to help create
18 a more streamlined database of subsurface conditions,
19 which is essential to identify the best locations for
20 where geothermal energy can be harnessed. Community
21 and district level geothermal infrastructure has the
22 potential to be incredibly beneficial the large
23 campuses like CUNY buildings, hospitals, NYCHA
24 properties, a large portable housing buildings,
25 schools, et cetera.

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

3 MS. KANEKAL: We're glad to hear the city looking
4 into locations for district level geothermal. New
5 York City's current electricity generation is deleted
6 antiquated and inequitable. We must collectively
7 work to achieve New York City's climate mandates like
8 Local Law 97. And those that have been actually
9 done.

10 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Please conclude.

11 MS. KANEKAL: I'm actually done. So thank you.
12 And thank you for the opportunity to testify.

13 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you very much for
14 your testimony, and for your good work on behalf the
15 New York Environmental Justice Alliance. We really
16 appreciate you being here and your patience in
17 waiting so long to testify. And it was good
18 testimony. Thank you.

19 MS. KANEKAL: Thank you Chair.

20 COUNSEL: And finally, Rami Dinnawi.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

22 MR. DINNAWI: Thank you, Chair. Thank you the
23 Council for this opportunity. I apologize, but I am
24 on public transport. So I apologize for the sound.
25 My name is Ramadan Navi. I'm the Environmental

2 Justice Coordinator for El Puente. And first and
3 foremost, I want to echo my complete support for
4 these two bills, Intro 315 and Intro 330 as well as
5 Resolution 169, and to echo everything our partners
6 have mentioned before in terms of the 100 megawatt
7 solar project.

8 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: I think we lost the last
9 witness. He was giving his testimony but the signal
10 dropped it seems.

11 MR. DINNAWI: Apologies for that. So these
12 builds are a first step... or actually a step in a
13 journey forward that will require continuous action
14 if we actually intend to keep our word and our
15 (inaudible). We must clearly define (inaudible)
16 community and base that definition on the CLPCA
17 compliance planning. New York City is also required
18 to electrify government operations, install 100
19 megawatts of solar energy and 500 megawatts of energy
20 storage by 2025.

21 And so, in order to meet that, we need to pass
22 these Resolutions and we need to move forward with
23 government support, along with the public support of
24 these Resolutions. The bill 0315 should also

2 consider the possibility of studying these energy
3 storage capabilities on city-owned lots.

4 I know I am echoing a lot of what our partner
5 organizations and advocates have been mentioning, but
6 it is very imperative that we realize and acknowledge
7 that New York City and any law that we pass here is
8 does not just affect our local city. New York City
9 is the third largest emitter of greenhouse gases
10 globally, and as we saw, globally, in the past few
11 months, Pakistan had flooding that almost displaced
12 30 million people. And so any decision we make here,
13 to put it in a global perspective will affect
14 millions upon millions of people.

15 All that is to say, we need to also have a
16 transparent public process were the communities that
17 are in proximity to the vacant lots that are going to
18 be studied for geothermal, and energy storage, and
19 energy generation, need to be communicated with and
20 made... and these reports need to be made available
21 for these communities to actually engage in the
22 public... participate in the public process. The
23 time to act is now. You know, we might believe that
24 the illusion of the climate catastrophe is a future
25 or near-future concern, for us here in the Global

2 North. But for those that we impact in the Global
3 South, it is as real as the voices that we heard
4 today. And I want to say thank you for the
5 opportunity and the time.

6 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Thank you very much for
7 your good and compelling testimony and for your
8 patience in waiting so long. What was the
9 organization you that you represent?

10 MR. DINNAWI: The organization that I present is
11 El Puente. We're a community based organization in
12 South Williamsburg that focuses on human rights,
13 social justice, and the nexus between environmental
14 justice and the arts.

15 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: Well, thank you very much
16 for your great advocacy on behalf of so many, and it
17 is noted and appreciated. And once again, we
18 appreciate your patience for waiting to testify.
19 Thank you very much.

20 COUNSEL: If we have inadvertently missed anyone
21 that has registered to testify today, and has yet to
22 have been called, please use the Zoom raise hand
23 function, and you will be called in the order that
24 your hand has been raised.

2 Seeing no one, I will turn it over the Chair for
3 closing remarks.

4 CHAIRPERSON GENNARO: I just want to put on the
5 record that I think this is a very valuable and
6 timely hearing. It was a good oversight hearing as
7 well as a good legislative hearing. So we have
8 plenty to work with now to keep us busy as we try to
9 get these resolutions passed, these bills negotiated,
10 and this oversight topic fully explored. And I
11 certainly intend to press the Administration on the
12 fate of the New York State... New York City climate
13 Adaptation Change Panel, which seems to have fallen
14 into oblivion.

15 It is my intention to make sure that it is
16 returned, and that the Administration follows the...
17 the letter of the law when it comes to all laws that
18 are passed by the Council.

19 And with that said, I appreciate the president of
20 the Administration. All the witnesses, the staff
21 sergeants, everyone who was involved, Ricky and Nabi
22 for staying the distance.

23 And with that said, this hearing is hereby
24 adjourned.

25 [GAVEL]

1 COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

125

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 10/26/2022