

CITY COUNCIL  
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

----- X

DECEMBER 7, 2022  
Start: 1:54 P.M.  
Recess: 3:03 P.M.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS - CITY HALL

B E F O R E: ADRIENNE E. ADAMS, SPEAKER

COUNCIL MEMBERS: DIANA I. AYALA  
SHAUN ABREU  
JOANN ARIOLA  
ALEXA AVILES  
CHARLES BARRON  
JOSEPH C. BORELLI  
ERIK D. BOTTCHER  
JUSTIN L. BRANNAN  
GALE A. BREWER  
SELVENA N. BROOKS-POWERS  
TIFFANY CABAN  
DAVID M. CARR  
CARMEN N. DE LA ROSA  
ERIC DINOWITZ  
AMANDA FARIAS  
OSWALD FELIZ  
JAMES F. GENNARO  
JENNIFER GUTIERREZ  
SHAHANA K. HANIF  
KAMILLAH HANKS  
ROBERT F. HOLDEN

## A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

CRYSTAL HUDSON  
KRISTIN RICHARDSON JORDAN  
RITA C. JOSEPH  
ARI KAGAN  
SHEKAR KRISHNAN  
LINDA LEE  
FARAH N. LOUIS  
CHRISTOPHER MARTE  
DARLENE MEALY  
JULIE MENIN  
FRANCISCO P. MOYA  
MERCEDES NARCISSE  
SANDY NURSE  
CHI A. OSSE  
VICKIE PALADINO  
KEITH POWERS, MAJORITY LEADER  
LINCOLN RESTLER  
KEVIN C. RILEY  
CARLINA RIVERA  
RAFAEL SALAMANCA, JR.  
PIERINA ANA SANCHEZ  
LYNN C. SHULMAN  
ALTHEA V. STEVENS  
SANDRA UNG  
MARJORIE VELAZQUEZ  
INNA VERNIKOV  
NANTASHA M. WILLIAMS  
JULIE WON  
KALMAN YEGER

2 SGT. LONG: This is a sound check for the  
3 Stated Meeting. So the date is December 7th, 2022.  
4 Being recorded by Danny Long in the Chambers. Mr.  
5 Majority Leader.

6 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Good  
7 afternoon and welcome to the Stated Meeting of  
8 December 7th, 2022. I am the Majority Leader Keith  
9 Powers. I would like to thank everyone for joining  
10 us here today. If you would like to follow along,  
11 the agenda for today's meeting is posted on the  
12 website.

13 UNKNOWN MALE: Please join us for the  
14 Pledge of Allegiance.

15 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Roll  
16 call. Abreu?

17 SHAUN ABREU: Present.

18 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Ariola?

19 JOANN ARIOLA: Here.

20 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Aviles?

21 ALEXA AVILES: Present.

22 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Ayala?

23 DIANA AYALA: Here.

24 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron.

25 Thank you. Bottcher?

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 4

2 ERIK BOTTCHER: Present.

3 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

4 Brannan.

5 JUSTIN BRANNAN: Here.

6 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Brewer?

7 GALE BREWER: Here.

8 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Brooks-

9 Powers?

10 SELVENA BROOKS-POWERS: Here.

11 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Caban?

12 TIFFANY CABAN: Present.

13 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Carr?

14 DAVID CARR: Present.

15 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: De La

16 Rosa?

17 CARMEN DE LA ROSA: Here.

18 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

19 Dinowitz?

20 ERIC DINOWITZ: Here.

21 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Farias?

22 AMANDA FARIAS: Present.

23 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Feliz?

24 Gennaro?

25 JAMES GENNARO: Here.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 5

2 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

3 Gutierrez?

4 JENNIFER GUTIERREZ: Presente.

5 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Hanif?

6 SHAHANA HANIF: Here.

7 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Hanks?

8 KAMILLAH HANKS: Present.

9 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Holden?

10 ROBERT HOLDEN: Here.

11 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Hudson?

12 CRYSTAL HUDSON: Present.

13 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Joseph?

14 Kagan?

15 ARI KAGAN: Present.

16 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

17 Krishnan?

18 SHEKAR KRISHNAN: Here.

19 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Lee?

20 LINDA LEE: Here.

21 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Louis?

22 FARAH LOUIS: Present.

23 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Marte?

24 CHRISTOPHER MARTE: Here.

25

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 6

2 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy?

3 Menin?

4 JULIE MENIN: Here.

5 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Moya?

6 FRANCISCO MOYA: Here.

7 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

8 Narcisse?

9 MERCEDES NARCISSE: Here.

10 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Nurse?

11 SANDY NURSE: Here.

12 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Osse?

13 CHI OSSE: Here.

14 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

15 Paladino?

16 VICKIE PALADINO: Here.

17 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

18 Restler?

19 LINCOLN RESTLER: Here.

20 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

21 Richardson Jordan?

22 KRISTIN RICHARDSON JORDAN: Present.

23 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Riley?

24 KEVIN RILEY: Present.

25 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Rivera?

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

7

2 CARLINA RIVERA: Present.

3 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

4 Salamanca?

5 RAFAEL SALAMANCA: Present.

6 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

7 Sanchez?

8 PIERINA SANCHEZ: Present.

9 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

10 Shulman? Tha- -- thank you. Shulman?

11 LYNN SHULMAN: Here.

12 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

13 Stevens?

14 ALTHEA STEVENS: Here.

15 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Ung?

16 SANDRA UNG: Present.

17 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

18 Velazquez? Vernikov? Council Member Vernikov?

19 INNA VERNIKOV: Here.

20 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

21 Williams?

22 NANTASHA WILLIAMS: Here.

23 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Won?

24 JULIE WON: Here.

25

2 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
3 you. Yeger?

4 KALMAN YEGER: Here.

5 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:  
6 Borelli? Powers?

7 KEITH POWERS: Here.

8 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker  
9 Adams?

10 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Present.

11 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.

12 We will now have today's invocation delivered by Imam  
13 Dr. Tahir Kukaj of Albanian Islamic Cultural Center  
14 located at 307 Victory Boulevard in Staten Island.

15 SARGENT AT ARMS: All rise.

16 IMAM DR. TAHIR KUKAJ: Merciful loving  
17 God known by many names and beyond all names Spirit  
18 of Life, Spirit of Love, Spirit of Community, Spirit  
19 of Justice, we assemble here today in this blessed  
20 place as grateful citizens of New York that we are  
21 proud to call home. But also as humble people of  
22 faith who simply yet sincerely confess as Americans  
23 in God We Trust. Thus, we do claim you as our  
24 Creator who made us in a perfect image thus rendering  
25 the human person and human life as sacred and knowing

2 with rights calling for protection and with freedom.  
3 Not too much to do whatever we want but what we owe.  
4 We profess you as our common God and Creator who  
5 unites us, a lawgiver who has implanted within us a  
6 grasp of the truth a thirst for Justice. And I  
7 believe that we are at our best when our will is  
8 constant with your own. Todays distinguished  
9 Legislators we ask the gift of the wisdom only you  
10 can bestow. A replaying of the honor and ability of  
11 public service and sensitivity to those in need.  
12 Please enlighten in a radiant way our leaders, City,  
13 Council Members, we ask your blessings on the people  
14 who have been called to lead the Community in which  
15 we live and work and play. Our Lord remind them  
16 because we all forget from time to time, especially  
17 in the noisiness what is life about that they are not  
18 only leaders but also here responsible to lead and  
19 serve New Yorkers. Remind them that no matter where  
20 we live, everyone in this City, black, white,  
21 Christian, Muslim, Jew, Hindu, Sikh, LGBTQ, Atheist,  
22 Hispanic, Asian, we're all your creatures and we are  
23 neighbors, we are siblings. Throughout the ages  
24 Prophets have called the leaders of the people to  
25 respect and protect at least the least of those among

2 us, our children, elderly and poor who are hungry and  
3 those who have no homes, those who are healed in body  
4 and mind. And the strangers and immigrants in our  
5 midst those who live in the margins, those who are  
6 alone, those who are forgotten grant in us the Wisdom  
7 and Courage to know and do what is right and good and  
8 true. May they and we speak out when it's time to  
9 speak and listen patiently and receiptently when it's  
10 time to listen? May they and we also are guided by  
11 the Spirit of Community, by Spirit of Justice and by  
12 Spirit of Love. God Almighty whenever someone asked  
13 to do something without supplying us with the ways to  
14 do it that is assurance for all of us. God Almighty  
15 bless this City Council, Members and their families.  
16 Bless our City. Bless our state and always God Bless  
17 the United States of America. In your name we make  
18 this prayer. Amen.

19 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you  
20 and I've asked Council Member Kamillah Hanks to  
21 spread the invocation on the record.

22 KAMILLAH HANKS: Thank you Majority  
23 Leader. Thank you Imam Tahir for joining us at City  
24 Hall and delivering such a meaningful invocation at  
25 today's stated meeting. Imam Tahir is a pillar of

2 the entire Staten Island Community not only as a  
3 faith leader but as a leader in Community, public  
4 safety and youth engagement. Since 2003, Imam Tahir  
5 has been at the helm of the Albanian Islamic Culture  
6 Center in my District serving as a steward of Staten  
7 Island's Muslim Community and giving us all a  
8 stronger connection to our boroughs, Albanian and  
9 Balkan communities at large. Imam Tahir has always  
10 prioritized working closely with Staten Island's  
11 elected officials to build bridges between all the  
12 different faiths in our community coordinating an  
13 outreach in educational programming and providing our  
14 residents with resources and food especially during  
15 the height of the COVID pandemic. As NYPD's Muslim  
16 Chaplain Imam Tahir works with the NYPD to connect  
17 the Muslim community and provide spiritual guidance  
18 to NYPD's Muslim Officers also working with Staten  
19 Island's Interfaith Clergy to ensure that hate,  
20 violence and prejudice have no place in our borough  
21 or City. Mostly recently Imam Tahir was recognized  
22 as one of our City's influential faith leaders by  
23 City and State and their inaugural faith para 100 a  
24 truly deserved recognition. Imam Tahir's  
25 contributions to the 49th District are immeasurable

2 and I am grateful that he was here to join us today.

3 Again I would like thank Majority Leader Powers and I

4 know that I join my Staten Island Delegation in

5 thanking Imam Tahir Kukaj for being here today and I

6 make a motion for unanimous consent to spread the

7 invocation in full upon the record. Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you

9 Council Member Hanks and thank you for your presence

10 here today. Thanks so much. We are going to now

11 have the adoption of Minutes by Council Member Vickie

12 Paladino.

13 VICKIE PALADINO: I vote that the minutes

14 of the Stated Meeting of November the 3rd, 2022 be

15 adopted as printed?

16 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.

17 Now Messages and Papers from the Mayor?

18 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

19 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS:

20 Communication from City, County and Borough Offices?

21 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

22 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Petitions

23 and Communications?

24 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

25

2 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Land Use  
3 Call ups?

4 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

5 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
6 We will now have communication from Speaker Adrienne  
7 Adams.

8 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Thank you very  
9 much Majority Leader and good afternoon everyone. I  
10 hope that you had a good Thanksgiving and a great  
11 start to the holiday seasons with your family and  
12 loved ones. Over the past several months our City  
13 has been working to accommodate and support tens of  
14 thousands of people seeking asylum from their home  
15 countries. New York City has welcomed our newest  
16 arrivals with open arms and it is critical that they  
17 like all New Yorkers continue to be treated with  
18 dignity, decency and compassion. Coordinating  
19 services across different city agencies to meet the  
20 needs of those seeking asylum has not been easy. We  
21 must recognize the hard work of our City and  
22 nonprofit workers who provide critical support and  
23 resources. Just this past weekend I joined Council  
24 Member Shekar Krishnan and our partners at the New  
25 York Immigration Coalition for a key to the City

2 Family Resource Fair to provide basic necessities for  
3 families seeking asylum. The Council is also hosting  
4 a holiday drive for asylum seekers from now until  
5 December 22nd here at City Hall and across the street  
6 at 250 Broadway to collect new clothes and coats,  
7 school supplies, baby formula, diapers and other  
8 essentials. It is clear that gaps in services remain  
9 and it will require policy improvements and an all  
10 hands on deck effort to ensure that they and our  
11 communities get the help needed. On Monday December  
12 19th and Tuesday December 20th we will be holding a  
13 two day hearing to examine the City's response and  
14 delivery of services to migrants who have arrived in  
15 New York. Shared by Deputy Speaker Diana Ayala and  
16 myself the Committee of the Whole will hear from key  
17 city agencies including the Mayor's Office of  
18 Immigrant Affairs, New York City Health and  
19 Hospitals, Department of Health and Mental Hygiene,  
20 Department of Social Services, Department of Youth  
21 and Community Development and the Department of  
22 Education. The following day will be dedicated  
23 solely to public testimony. I look forward to this  
24 important two day hearing. Our third on this crisis  
25 alone as we work together to support individuals and

2 families seeking asylum and everyone across our City.  
3 Friday December 2nd was a Special Education Day which  
4 commemorates the signing of the individuals with  
5 disabilities Education Act into Law in 1975. It is  
6 critical that we provide our most vulnerable students  
7 with the effective and sustained services they need  
8 to succeed. Nearly five decades after the passage of  
9 this crucial law we remain focused and Committed to  
10 supporting all students with disabilities. This week  
11 is National Influenza Vaccination Week which serves  
12 as a reminder to everyone that it is not too late to  
13 get your flu shot. Winter is on the way and we are  
14 already experiencing cold temperatures over the past  
15 few weeks. The temperatures are going up and down  
16 and it's important that we protect ourselves and our  
17 loved ones this flu season. Make an appointment now  
18 and some places you don't even have to make an  
19 appointment but if you want to you make an  
20 appointment now with [vaccinefinder.NYC.gov](http://vaccinefinder.NYC.gov). Now  
21 let's move on into our stated agenda. Today we are  
22 voting on several legislative rules, finance and land  
23 use items. First we will vote on the following  
24 appointments, David Fullard a Commissioner of the New  
25 York City Local Condition of Release Commission,

2 Gregorio Mayers, a Commissioner of the New York City  
3 Local Condition of Release Commission, Lily Shapiro,  
4 a Commissioner of the New York City Local Condition  
5 of Release Commission. Next we will vote on the  
6 following finance items, a pre-considered resolution  
7 sponsored by Council Member Justin Brannan,  
8 authorized an article XI tax exemption for one  
9 building in Yorkville. A pre-considered resolution  
10 sponsored by Council Member Justin Brannan authorizes  
11 an Article XI tax exemption for three buildings in  
12 Corona. A pre-considered resolution sponsored by  
13 Council Member Justin Brannan authorizes an Article  
14 XI tax exemption for two buildings in Briarwood. A  
15 pre-considered resolution sponsored by Council Member  
16 Justin Brannan amends a previous exemption for one  
17 building in Harlem. A pre-considered resolution  
18 sponsored by Council Member Justin Brannan amends a  
19 previous exemption for two buildings in Harlem. We  
20 will also be voting on the following Land Use items  
21 Livonia 4, a department of housing preservation and  
22 development application that will facilitate the  
23 development of affordable senior and supportive  
24 housing in the Brownville Neighborhood of Brooklyn in  
25 Council Member Barron's District. This project will

2 build a total of 499 units on four parcels of city  
3 owned land. The four buildings will include two  
4 affordable housing developments, a senior housing  
5 development and a supportive housing development  
6 targeted for young adults at risk of homelessness and  
7 youth aging out of foster care with onsite services  
8 and amenities at each of the buildings. The Council  
9 is modifying the application to strike MIH option 2  
10 and add the deep affordability option. 280 Bourbon  
11 Street Rezoning, a rezoning application to facilitate  
12 the construction of 300 units of housing included 75  
13 affordable units under MIH option 1 alongside  
14 commercial and community facility space in the Boerum  
15 Hill Neighborhood of Brooklyn in Council Member  
16 Restler's District. The rezoning also includes two  
17 city-owned parking lots where HPD has committed to  
18 developing up to 150 units of affordable housing.  
19 The Council is modifying the application to strike  
20 MIH option two and to add the deep affordability  
21 option. And finally we will be voting on the  
22 following pieces of legislation. Resolution 258B  
23 sponsored by Council Member James Gennaro calls on  
24 the Governor to ensure that funds from the clean  
25 water, clear air and raindrops environmental bond Act

2 2022 which was approved by New Yorkers in November of  
3 2022 and authorizes the issue into \$4.2 billion in  
4 fund in bonds to finance critical environmental  
5 restoration and resiliency projects across the state  
6 are allocated to New York City in a matter that  
7 reflects the city's contributions to statewide tax  
8 revenue. Resolution 159 sponsored by Council Member  
9 Lincoln Restler calls on the Climate Action Council  
10 to draft and the Governor to implement a final  
11 climate action scoping plan that commits to meeting  
12 the targets mandated in the Climate Leadership and  
13 Community Protection Act. The CLCPA signed into law  
14 in 2019 called for an 85 percent reduction in  
15 greenhouse gas emissions by 2050 with interim targets  
16 of 40 percent reduction by 2030, 100 percent zero  
17 emissions electricity by 2040 and 70 percent  
18 renewable energy by 2030 among other mandates. The  
19 Climate Action Council is tasked with developing the  
20 scoping plan. We are going to say thank you to Staff  
21 Ricky Chala. Resolution 292A sponsored by Council  
22 Majority Whip Selvena Brooks-Powers, calls on the  
23 State Legislature to pass and the Governor to sign  
24 S.5320A.9731 which would amend the Administrative  
25 Code of the City of New York to allow commuter vans

2 to accept hails from prospective passengers in the  
3 street and would repeal certain related provisions in  
4 New York City Law such as the existing penalty for  
5 accepting a street hail. Thank you to our staff  
6 members, Kevin Katowski and Elliot Lin. Introduction  
7 76A sponsored by Council Member Justin Brannan would  
8 require the Department of Environmental Protection to  
9 establish a financial assistant's program to reduce  
10 the cost of purchasing and installing backwater  
11 valves. This Bill would also require DEP and  
12 consultation with other designated agencies or  
13 offices to complete a study that evaluates where the  
14 backwater valves should be installed to mitigate  
15 damage caused by backflow. The study would be posted  
16 on the DEP website and submitted to the Mayor and  
17 City Council. The Financial Assistance Program would  
18 be informed by the findings of this study and subject  
19 to appropriation. The Bill would also require DEP to  
20 prioritize neighborhoods regularly affected by back  
21 flow events and conduct outreach and education to  
22 property owners about the benefits of backwater  
23 valves. We thank you to your staff member Jessica  
24 Steinberg-Albin. Next, Introduction 759B sponsored  
25 by Council Member Linda Lee would require the New

2 York City Police Department to establish a program to  
3 distribute kits used to etch identifying numbers into  
4 catalytic converters for the purpose of deterring and  
5 investigating their theft. It would also require the  
6 NYPD to educate the public about the benefits of  
7 etching and their etching kit program. We thank you  
8 staff member Josh Kingsley. Next, we will vote on a  
9 civil service legislative package. Introduction 658  
10 sponsored by our Civil Service and Labor Committee  
11 Chair Council Member Carmen De La Rosa requires the  
12 department of Citywide Administrative Services to  
13 establish a Civil Service Ambassador Program that  
14 will provide presentations and educational materials  
15 to high schools, universities, juvenile justice  
16 facilities, foster care programs and other  
17 populations that would benefit from joining the Civil  
18 Service and the process of taking Civil Service  
19 Examinations. Resolution 310A also sponsored by  
20 Council Member De La Rosa called on a state  
21 legislature to pass and the governor to sign  
22 S.3062CA.7503 raising the minimum wage annually by a  
23 percentage based on the rate of inflation. Thank you  
24 to staff members Nick Connell and Elizabeth Arts.  
25 Introduction 698A sponsored by our Governmental

2 Operations Committee Chair, Council Member Sandra Ung  
3 would require the Department of Citywide  
4 Administrative Services or DCAS to operate a public  
5 service core program that offers internships at  
6 various city agencies. In addition, the Bill would  
7 require DCAS to make efforts to recruit a diverse  
8 pool of students for the program and report annually  
9 on its efforts. And finally Introduction 696 also  
10 sponsored by Council Member Ung would amend certain  
11 provisions of the City Charter related to the design  
12 and contents of ranked choice voting or RCV ballots.  
13 The goal of this legislation is to make RCV ballots  
14 easier to read particularly for voters with lower  
15 literacy levels, low vision or do not speak English  
16 as their primary language. The Bill would also  
17 improve the layout of RCV ballots by adding new  
18 design requirements. Thank you to Staff member CJ  
19 Murray and Erika Cohen. Thank you for your attention  
20 and I turn it back into the hands of our Majority  
21 Leader.

22 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you  
23 Speaker Adams. We are now moving discussion of  
24 general orders but before I do that I just want to  
25 mention and acknowledge and say a very happy birthday

2 to our speaker. Her birthday is going to be on  
3 Friday. You didn't think I knew that did you.

4 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: I deserve it.

5 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Uh, it's a  
6 very happy birthday and I hope it's a relaxing one  
7 which I know is a lot to ask for. Um, but happy  
8 birthday. We're now going to move in to general  
9 order and we will start with Council Member Lee  
10 followed by Council Member Restler.

11 LINDA LEE: Good afternoon Madam Speaker,  
12 Majority Leader and my fellow Council Members. I am  
13 proud to introduce Intro 759B which we will be voting  
14 on today. Across this City we have experienced an  
15 exponential rise in catalytic converter thefts with  
16 these thefts quadrupling over the past year and these  
17 are known to target parking lots, auto repairs shops,  
18 residential driveways and anywhere cars are parked to  
19 remove a catalytic converter. These thefts leave  
20 residents with thousands of dollars in repair costs  
21 for their vehicles and a loss of peace of mind in  
22 their communities. The metals found in a catalytic  
23 converter are worth thousands of dollars on the black  
24 market and today the New York City Council will  
25 curtail this illegal activity and give New Yorkers a

2 much needed measure of protection. This Bill would  
3 invest and expand on the good but overstressed work  
4 on NYPD which has already been actively engaged in  
5 combating the rising trend of catalytic converter  
6 thefts. I want to thank Council Committee staff, my  
7 colleagues in the Committee and public safety  
8 including Chair Hanks and Speaker Adrienne Adams for  
9 bringing this legislation to the floor in an effort  
10 to protect our residents and hopefully this Bill  
11 along with the last stated with Council Member  
12 Burisko [phonetic] will help at least to alleviate a  
13 bit this issue so thank you.

14 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you  
15 Council Member Lee. We will now go to Council Member  
16 Restler.

17 LINCOLN RESTLER: Thank you very much  
18 Majority Leader. I just wanted to share briefly a  
19 little bit about the rezoning we are voting on today  
20 at 280 Bergen Street in Boerum Hill. This is the  
21 last industrial block of a brown stone neighborhood  
22 and it is the first rezoning that was certified in  
23 Council ship 33 during this year and I couldn't be  
24 happier with the outcome. I really want to thank the  
25 Community Leaders who partnered with us and met every

2 other week for a period of months with a developer  
3 our NYCHA tenants association presidents and civic  
4 association leaders, community board representatives,  
5 community based organization leaders. We had a group  
6 of eight or nine folks who met consistently with the  
7 developer and my office to get us to a much better  
8 outcome on this project. This will generate 450  
9 units of housing in Boerum Hill and fully half 225 of  
10 those units are going to be affordable and when I saw  
11 affordable the significant majority of those units  
12 are affordable to a family of three making \$72,000.  
13 Really affordable housing and we were able to do it  
14 because we are converting two parking lots that the  
15 City actually owned but the developer controlled for  
16 40 years into 100 percent affordable housing. We are  
17 also not building one single new parking spot on this  
18 develop. So in the most transit rich part of  
19 Brooklyn we are building 450 units of housing with  
20 zero parking. In fact we are removing two parking  
21 lots. And then lastly as part of the Gowanus  
22 Neighborhood Rezoning that the Council passed last  
23 year the supermarket that serves the three NYCHA  
24 developments in our community is unfortunately going  
25 to be redeveloped and we got this developer to commit

2 in a Community Benefits Agreement to building a  
3 brand-new truly affordable supermarket that will  
4 continue to ensure that low to moderate income  
5 residents in our community to afford access to  
6 quality food. This is the kind of rezoning that I'm  
7 really proud to support, expanding housing supply but  
8 expanding housing supply to the people who need it  
9 most, working class families in our communities.  
10 Thank you very much.

11 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
12 We have Council Member Barron followed by Council  
13 Member De La Rosa.

14 CHARLES BARRON: Thank you my Colleagues  
15 arise another 100 percent affordable. Thank you.  
16 Thank you. This one is especially important because  
17 I'm partnering with my neighboring Council Member  
18 Darlene Mealy so I want to thank Darlene Mealy so  
19 much for the Browsling [phonetic] Park. We work it  
20 together and this, the special about this is youth  
21 coming out of Foster Home ages 18 to 24 will have an  
22 apartment, an affordable apartment set aside for  
23 those youth and of course we have the seniors with  
24 the vouchers and for the homeless. This is once  
25 again 100 percent affordable. We have worked hard

2 over the years. There were some issues with some of  
3 the land the homeowners had. We resolved that with  
4 Community Board 16 so once again a 100 percent  
5 affordable project and I want to thank the Council  
6 for the support.

7 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
8 And we have Council Member De La Rosa.

9 CARMEN DE LA ROSA: Thank you. I want to  
10 thank Madam Speaker for her support and our  
11 Colleagues will be voting on Intro 658 the Civil  
12 Service Labor Committee has been working for a few  
13 months on the Civil Service Exam and today we will be  
14 voting on Intro 658 as we know we're facing  
15 significant staffing shortages in the municipal  
16 workforce with vacancy rates almost at an 8 percent  
17 and entry and promotion within 80 percent of City  
18 government positions are subject to the passage of  
19 Civil Service Examinations. Introduction 658 would  
20 require the Department of Citywide Administrative  
21 Services to establish and provide education and  
22 outreach citywide through the City programs to  
23 population that can benefit from joining civil  
24 service and participate in the examination process.  
25 This Introduction calls on also members that are part

2 of the Civil Service Workforce to learn about  
3 promotions and opportunities that exist to them  
4 through the Ambassador Program so I ask for your  
5 support today as we consider this Introduction.  
6 Thank you.

7 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
8 Is anyone else signed up for General Orders? Seeing  
9 none, we will move to the report of Special  
10 Committees.

11 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: None.

12 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Reports  
13 of Standing Committees.

14 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Report  
15 of the Committee on Civil Service and Labor  
16 Introduction 658A, Civil Service Ambassador Program.

17 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Amended and  
18 coupled on General Orders.

19 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Report  
20 of the Committee on Finance, pre-considered LU 149  
21 and Reso 425. Pre-considered LU 153 and Reso 429  
22 property tax exemptions.

23 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Coupled on  
24 General Orders.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 28

2 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Report  
3 of the Committee on Governmental Operations Intro  
4 696, ranked choice elections.

5 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Coupled on  
6 General Orders.

7 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Intro  
8 698A Public Service Corps?

9 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Amended and  
10 coupled on General Orders.

11 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Report  
12 of the Committee on Public Safety. Intro 759B  
13 catalytic converters.

14 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Amended and  
15 coupled on General Orders.

16 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Report  
17 of the Committee on Resiliency and Waterfronts.  
18 Intro 76A backwater valves.

19 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Amended and  
20 coupled on General Orders.

21 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Report  
22 of the Committee on Rules, Privileges and Elections  
23 M95 and Reso 430 approving the appointment of  
24 Gregorio Mayers, Local Conditional Release  
25 Commission, LCRC.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING 29

2 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Coupled on  
3 General Orders.

4 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: M96 and  
5 Reso 431 approving the appointment of David Fullard,  
6 LCRC.

7 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Coupled on  
8 General Orders.

9 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: M97 and  
10 Reso 432 approving the appointment of Lily Shapiro,  
11 LCRC.

12 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Coupled on  
13 General Orders.

14 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: On the  
15 General Orders Calendar LU 135 and Reso 433 through  
16 LU 138 and Reso 436 Livonia4.

17 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Coupled on  
18 General Orders.

19 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: LU 143  
20 and Reso 437 and LU 144 and Reso 438, 280 Bergan  
21 Street Rezoning.

22 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Coupled on  
23 General Orders.

24

25

2 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

3 Resolution appointing various persons, Commissioner  
4 of Deeds.

5 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Coupled on  
6 General Orders. I now ask that the clerk take a roll  
7 call vote on all of the items coupled on today's  
8 General Orders Calendar?

9 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:  
10 Dinowitz?

11 ERIC DINOWITZ: Yes.

12 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:  
13 Salamanca?

14 RAFAEL SALAMANCA: Aye on all.

15 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Abreu?

16 SHAUN ABREU: Congrats Carmen. Aye on  
17 all.

18 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Ariola?

19 JOANN ARIOLA: Aye on all. Except for  
20 M95, M96, and M97 for which I am a no.

21 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Aviles?

22 ALEXA AVILES: Aye on all except for M96  
23 and 431 for which I abstain.

24 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
25 you. Ayala?

2 DIANA AYALA: Aye on all.

3 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Barron?

4 CHARLES BARRON: I abstain from the  
5 David, appointment David Fullard appointment and I  
6 vote aye on Gregorio and the Shapiro. But aye on  
7 those two abstain from the second one and abstain  
8 from the Bergen Street project. And aye on all the  
9 rest.

10 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Okay.  
11 Bottcher?

12 ERIK BOTTCHEER: Aye on all even Fullard.

13 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:  
14 Brannan?

15 JUSTIN BRANNAN: Aye.

16 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Brewer?

17 GALE BREWER: Aye.

18 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Brooks-  
19 Powers?

20 SELVENA BROOKS-POWERS: Aye.

21 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Caban?

22 TIFFANY CABAN: I vote aye on all except  
23 for M96 and the corresponding Reso to which I  
24 abstain.

25

2 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
3 you. Carr?

4 DAVID CARR: I vote no on M95 and M96,  
5 and M96 with accompanying Resolutions 430, 431 and  
6 432 and aye on the rest.

7 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: De La  
8 Rosa?

9 CARMEN DE LA ROSA: Aye.

10 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Farias?

11 AMANDA FARIAS: I vote aye on all.

12 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Feliz?  
13 Gennaro?

14 JAMES GENNARO: Aye.

15 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:  
16 Gutierrez?

17 JENNIFER GUTIERREZ: I vote aye on all  
18 with the exception of M96 with accompanying  
19 Resolution 431 for which I abstain.

20 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
21 you. Hanif?

22 SHAHANA HANIF: Aye.

23 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Hanks?

24 KAMILLAH HANKS: Aye on all.

25 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Holden?

2 ROBERT HOLDEN: Aye on all except M95,  
3 M96, M97 for which I vote no.

4 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Okay.  
5 Hudson?

6 CRYSTAL HUDSON: Aye on all with the  
7 exception of M95, M96, M97 and their accompanying  
8 Resolutions for which I abstain.

9 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
10 you. Joseph?

11 RITA JOSEPH: Aye on all.

12 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Kagan?

13 ARI KAGAN: All on all except for M95,  
14 M96, M97 and Reso 258B, Reso 169.

15 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
16 you Council Member. Krishnan?

17 SHEKAR KRISHNAN: Aye on all.

18 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Lee?

19 LINDA LEE: Aye on all.

20 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Louis?

21 FARAH LOUIS: Aye on all.

22 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Marte?

23 CHRISTOPHER MARTE: I vote aye.

24 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Mealy?

25

2 DARLENE MEALY: I abstain on M96 and 97  
3 and aye on all.

4 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
5 you.

6 JULIE MENIN: Aye on all.

7 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Menin?  
8 Oh.

9 JULIE MENIN: Sorry, aye on all.

10 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
11 you. Moya?

12 FRANCISCO MOYA: I vote aye.

13 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
14 you. Narcisse?

15 MERCEDES NARCISSE: I vote aye.

16 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
17 you. Nurse?

18 SANDY NURSE: I vote aye on all.

19 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Osse?

20 CHI OSSE: I vote aye on all with the  
21 exception of M95, M96, M97 I which I abstain as well  
22 as accompanied by their resolutions.

23 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
24 you. Paladino?

2 VICKIE PALADINO: Aye on all except for  
3 M95, M96, M97 of which I am a no.

4 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
5 you. Restler?

6 LINCOLN RESTLER: Aye on all with the  
7 exception of M95, M96, M97 and their accompanying  
8 Resolutions 430, 431 and 432 for which I abstain.

9 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
10 you. Richardson-Jordan?

11 KRISTIN RICHARDSON-JORDAN: Aye on all.

12 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Riley?

13 KEVIN RILEY: Aye on all.

14 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Rivera?

15 CARLINA RIVERA: I vote aye.

16 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

17 Sanchez?

18 PIERINA ANA SANCHEZ: I vote aye on all  
19 with the exception of M96 which I abstain.

20 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
21 you. Shulman?

22 LYNN SHULMAN: Aye on all.

23 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

24 Stevens?

25 ALTHEA STEVENS: Aye on all.

2 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Ung?

3 SANDRA UNG: Aye on all.

4 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

5 Velazquez?

6 MARJORIE VELAZQUEZ: Aye.

7 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK:

8 Vernikov?

9 INNA VERNIKOV: Aye on all except no on  
10 M95, M96, and M97 with accompanying Resolutions 430,  
11 431 and 432.

12 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
13 you. Williams?

14 NANTASHA WILLIAMS: I vote aye on all.

15 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Won?

16 JULIE WON: I vote aye on all. And I'm  
17 abstaining from M95, M96, and M97 and the  
18 accompanying Resolutions 430, 431 and 432, abstain.

19 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
20 you Council Member. Yeger?

21 KALMAN YEGER: Aye on all with the  
22 exception of M95, M96, M97 and accompanying  
23 Resolutions 430, 431, and 432. Thank you. Borelli?

24 JOSEPH BORELLI: I was just asked by a  
25 reporter about partisanship in the Council and yet

2 here we are with a progressive caucus and the  
3 republican caucus have in derrounded [sounds like] to  
4 the same conclusion. Aye on all except M95, M96, M97  
5 and accompanying Resolutions 430, 431 and 432.

6 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Thank  
7 you. Powers?

8 KEITH POWERS: Aye on all.

9 WILLIAM MARTIN, COMMITTEE CLERK: Speaker  
10 Adams?

11 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Aye on all.

12 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Bilans  
13 stanja [sounds like] and calendar are adopted by a  
14 vote of 50 in the affirmative, zero in the negative  
15 and zero abstentions with the exclusion of M95 and  
16 Resolution 430 adopted by a vote of 38 in the  
17 affirmative, 8 in the negative and 4 extensions. M96  
18 and Resolution 431, 32 in the affirmative, 8  
19 negative, 10 abstentions, M97 and Resolution 432  
20 adopted by a vote of 37 in the affirmative 8  
21 negative, 5 abstentions. We will now move to  
22 Introduction and the reading of Bills.

23 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: All Bills have  
24 been referred to Committees as indicated on today's  
25 agenda.

2 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Hold on  
3 one second. Actually while moving to that discussion  
4 of Resolutions while we wait for the finally tally we  
5 have first Council Member Brooks-Powers signed up.

6 SELVENA BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. I  
7 would like to speak in support of a resolution I'm  
8 sponsoring today. Resolution 292A which would allow  
9 commuter vans to accept street hails. Some of New  
10 York's 51 Council Districts aren't transit rich.  
11 Within a few blocks of this business you can catch  
12 trains on nearly a dozen subway lines but other  
13 Districts like mine are transit deserts. District 31  
14 is one of the largest by land area but it contains  
15 just a single subway line, the A train. In Districts  
16 like mine, New Yorkers have to rely upon commuter  
17 vans or dollar vans. These vans are a transportation  
18 lifeline for communities, communities of color,  
19 especially that lack access to core transit  
20 infrastructure. Under the State Law a TLC license  
21 commuter vans are not currently authorized to accept  
22 street hails. The only way community members are  
23 legally permitted to use these vans is through  
24 prearranged travel beforehand. This limits the  
25 assistance commuter vans can provide to communities.

2 We need flexibility and affordability and transit.  
3 New York and everywhere should have cheap reliable  
4 options to allow them to get to work. I ask this  
5 body vote yes on Resolution 292A and join me in  
6 support including transportation across New York  
7 City. Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you  
9 and I'll hear from Council Member Gennaro.

10 JAMES GENNARO: Thank you Mr. Leader. I  
11 just want to speak briefly on Reso 258B that's about  
12 the fair share for the Bond Act monies. This \$4.2  
13 billion dollars in New York City. If it passes all  
14 will not get their fair share of Bond Act monies.  
15 That's what happened with the 1996 Bond Act. It's  
16 the state DEC that makes these decisions. Recently  
17 for example and it is not just Bond Act money. All  
18 kinds of funding for there was \$220 million in the  
19 State Program and they made the decision that no city  
20 could get more than \$5 million out of the \$220  
21 million and New York City got \$200 million out of  
22 that, 1 percent which is not fair. So this is kind  
23 like that and I also served for six years as a Deputy  
24 Commissioner at the DEC for 2014 to 2020 so I see how  
25 unfair it can get. We have to demand we get a fair

2 share not only from Bond Act monies but from all the  
3 allocations that we are short changed on. So thank  
4 you very much Mr. Leader.

5 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you  
6 Council Member Gennaro. We can, we will have a voice  
7 vote on today's, just one second. We will now have a  
8 voice vote on today's Resolutions. If you wish to  
9 vote against or abstain from today's Resolution  
10 please notify the Legislative document by email or by  
11 approach the desk before the vote. We will now read  
12 the resolutions into the record. The resolution 169  
13 calls on a Climate Action Council to draft and the  
14 Governor the implement a final Climate Action Council  
15 Scoping Plan that commits to meeting CLCPA targets  
16 and bold climate and environmental justice action in  
17 New York. Will all those in favor please say aye?

18 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

19 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: All  
20 opposed say nay. Any abstentions? The ayes have it.  
21 Resolution 258B calls on the Governor to ensure the  
22 appropriations of the funds from the Clean Water,  
23 Clear Air and Green Job Environmental Bond Act of  
24 2022 are allocated to New York City in a matter that  
25 is commemorate with the City's contribution to

2 statewide tax revenue. All those in favor please say  
3 aye.

4 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

5 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: All  
6 opposed say nay. Any abstentions? The ayes have it.  
7 Resolution 292A calls on the New York City  
8 Legislature to pass and the New York City Governor to  
9 sign Senate Bill 5320 and Assembly Bill 9731 which  
10 would amend the administrative code of the City of  
11 New York to allow commuter vans to accept hails from  
12 prospective passengers in the street and would repeal  
13 certain provisions of the law relating thereto.

14 Would all those in favor please say aye?

15 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

16 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: All  
17 opposed say nay.

18 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Aye.

19 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Okay. Any  
20 abstentions? The ayes have it. Resolution 310A  
21 calls on the State Legislature to pass and the  
22 Governor to sign senate Bill number 3062D and  
23 Assembly Bill Number 7503 which raises the minimum  
24 wage annually by percentage based on the rate of  
25

2 inflation and labor productivity. All of those in  
3 favor please say aye?

4 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

5 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: All  
6 opposed say nay. Any abstentions? The ayes have it.  
7 We will now move into today's General Discussion. We  
8 will start with Council Member Ariola.

9 JOANN ARIOLA: Thank you Majority Leader.  
10 Today I am introducing Reso 415. It's a resolution  
11 calling on the United States Congress to pass and the  
12 President to sign the September 11th Day of  
13 Remembrance Act. The impetus for this Resolution was  
14 because of an email my office received earlier this  
15 year from a set of twins Anthony and Alexa Gennaro  
16 who lost their uncle and never met their uncle when  
17 they lost him in the September 11th attacks on the  
18 World Trade Center. Despite never having had the  
19 opportunity to meet their uncle in person Anthony and  
20 Alexa felt an attachment to the lost relative thank  
21 to the 9-11 curriculum at the school they attend in  
22 Belle Harbor, the St. Francis De Sales Catholic  
23 Academy. In class they learned about the attacks and  
24 their teachers took time to honor the victims and  
25 keeping, and their families. This letter led me to

2 further realize the importance of keeping the memory  
3 of that tragic day alive so that our future  
4 generations will live up to the pledge that we made  
5 21 years ago to never forget all those taken from us  
6 that day. Barack Obama made September 11th a Day of  
7 Remember when in 2016 he proclaimed it to Patriot Day  
8 and National Day of Service and Remembrance. I  
9 propose that we take that next step to truly honoring  
10 the lost and made September 11th a full fledged  
11 Federal Holiday as our new generations get older and  
12 the memories of that day get lost. It is only  
13 through a Federal Holiday that we can truly ensure  
14 that we live up to the promise of the fallen more  
15 than two decades ago and guarantee that their  
16 memories will live on in time. Thank you.

17 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you  
18 Council Member Ariola. We are going to go to Council  
19 Member Riley next. Before we do that I just want to  
20 read the Land Use Vote. Land Use Items 143 and 144  
21 and accompanying resolutions were adopted today by a  
22 vote of 49 in the affirmative and one abstention. We  
23 will now go to Council Member Riley.

24 KEVIN RILEY: Thank you Majority Leader.  
25 Today I introduce to you a piece of legislation,

2 Intro 850 and it ensures of enhancement the  
3 sanitation of our community. Intro 850 will  
4 concretely assign the jurisdiction of City Agencies  
5 to sustain regular cleaning and maintenance of  
6 certain City properties with a history of some areas  
7 like center malls, safety zones, underpass and  
8 overpass being overlooked and neglected. This  
9 patient of legislation provides means for clarity,  
10 transparency and accountability for cleaning New York  
11 City. Intro 849 to encourage discernibility of the  
12 New York City bus lane restrictions. This will  
13 require the DOT to post signage indicating the hours  
14 and days that bus lane restrictions are in affect.  
15 Taking further steps to publish and update this  
16 information on the DOT website will increase our  
17 city's ability to provide more access and knowledge  
18 to do the right thing in regards to navigating bus  
19 lanes and lastly Intro 848 this mission of correctly  
20 ensure the notices with our foster care system. This  
21 will require the ACS to conduct quarterly random  
22 audits and reports on foster care placement notices.  
23 This piece of legislation provides transparency to  
24 indicate these notices are being delivered in a  
25 timely and sufficient manner. Intro 848 takes

2 actions detailing when there is a failure to provide  
3 notice if legally required information is missing and  
4 also includes but is not limited to reporting on  
5 quantifying instances where notices were required but  
6 not sent. I appreciate all of my colleagues look  
7 into this Bill and they sign on and thank you for  
8 this opportunity, Majority Leader.

9 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you  
10 Council Member Riley. We will now go to Council  
11 Member Borelli.

12 JOSEPH BORELLI: Thank you Majority  
13 Leader and happy December to you. Today I am  
14 introducing a Resolution on my favorite topic the  
15 imminent congestion pricing plan that the MTA is  
16 destined to bestow upon us, us happy accepting  
17 drivers who will pay this charge. While the MTA was  
18 releasing their environmental assessment, our  
19 neighbors across the pond in London were given the  
20 opportunity by Transport for London, their version of  
21 the MTA to weigh in on whether this congestion  
22 pricing plan which has been in existence for over 20  
23 years. They were given the opportunity to weight in  
24 in a public referendum on whether they wanted to  
25 expand their congestion charge from a tiny central

2 business district to a broader part of greater  
3 London; 66 percent of Londoners voted no, 66 percent,  
4 2/3 of Londoners said that their congestion is not  
5 benefiting the people of London and the advertised  
6 benefits have not materialized as they were promised  
7 and so 2/3 of them voted against it. This is the  
8 same plan were advocates here are telling us has  
9 worked tremendously well, incredibly successful. So  
10 I'm asking through resolution that we call on the  
11 Governor to put the congestion charge as a referendum  
12 item on next years' ballot so that we can ask our  
13 constituents who now have access to a study, the MTAs  
14 own study, their own environment assessment which  
15 says starkly and shockingly that there aren't that  
16 many benefits to congestion prices. So we should ask  
17 our constituents whether they want to have this tax  
18 that once implemented will never go away so I'll ask  
19 you all to sign on to my resolution and give the vote  
20 to implement this congestion charge to our  
21 constituents. Thank you.

22 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
23 No, no clapping please. Next we are going to go to  
24 Council Member Brooks-Powers.

2 SELVENA BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Today  
3 I am introducing several important Bills I want to  
4 briefly discuss. First is Intro 835 which will  
5 require the Comptroller to conduct annual audits of  
6 MWBE procurement ensuring that business has equitably  
7 access to contract and opportunity to ensure their  
8 community and extends economic opportunity across the  
9 City. This Bill would help hold the City accountable  
10 and ensure agencies engage and utilize diverse  
11 businesses. Second is Intro 836 which would place a  
12 cap with a colored temperature of new street lights.  
13 Experts say limiting color temperature street lights  
14 is good for our eyes, for our sleep, and for the  
15 overall health of our community. Third is Intro 834  
16 which would create a Downed Tree Task Force to assist  
17 in safe clearing and removal of trees and tree limbs  
18 that have fallen due to severe weather. New York's  
19 communities know how damaging storms can be and how  
20 important it is for the city to respond quickly to  
21 clear the streets and allow for safe movement once  
22 again and finally I am Introducing 833 which would  
23 require the City to look at one, how rezonings have  
24 impacted transportation across the City. I have  
25 talked a lot about transportation equity during my

2 time as a Council Member examining how land use  
3 actions have impacted transportation in the past will  
4 help us plan better for the future. I look forward  
5 to working with my colleagues on the Bills moving  
6 forward and I ask that all members interested to  
7 please sign on. Thank you.

8 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
9 And now we will hear from Council Member Shulman  
10 followed by Council Member Menin.

11 LYNN SHULMAN: I'd like to switch because  
12 it's Council Member Menin's Bill so let her go first  
13 speaking.

14 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: We will  
15 now hear from Council Member Menin followed by  
16 Council Member Shulman.

17 JULIE MENIN: Okay. Thank you so much.  
18 So today I am really proud to introduce the  
19 Healthcare Accountability and Consumer Protection Act  
20 alongside Council Members Shulman, Narcisse, Abreu,  
21 Brannan, De La Rosa, Stevens, Bottcher, Feliz, Ung,  
22 Williams, Sanchez, Krishnan, Dinowitz, Hanks, Ariola,  
23 Velazquez and both the Manhattan and Brooklyn Borough  
24 Presents to empower consumes with transparent price  
25 information on healthcare prices. This is going to

2 actually create the nation's first ever Healthcare  
3 Accountability Office and specifically what the Bill  
4 does, Intro 844 is it would mandate that the City  
5 publish a price of every single medical procedure  
6 that is happening in New York City Hospitals. It  
7 also would give the City the ability to audit  
8 healthcare expenses. It would grade hospitals on  
9 compliance with this transparency measure. It would  
10 also release data on the hundreds of millions of  
11 dollars that these not for profit hospitals are  
12 receiving in tax incentives and the amount that's  
13 going to charitable. This is such an important  
14 issue. If you are a woman giving birth in New York  
15 City you could be paying \$55,000 for a C-section at  
16 Montefiore or \$20,000 at another hospital or \$17,000  
17 at an H and H Hospital. If you need a routine  
18 colonoscopy in New York City you could be paying  
19 \$10,000 at one hospital or \$2,000 at another  
20 hospital. I honestly can't think of another industry  
21 where as a consumer you get 0 information of what you  
22 are about to be charged. And we know that consumer  
23 medical debt is one of the highest pieces of debt  
24 that many families have across New York City. The  
25 other advantage of this bill is it will allow us to

2 save money. Currently the City of New York is  
3 spending \$9.5 billion a year, almost 10 percent of  
4 our City's budget on employee healthcare cost and  
5 that is risen exponentially in recent years. It's  
6 estimated that we could save \$2 billion if we brought  
7 prices down and so I'm urging my colleagues to please  
8 sign on to Intro 844. Thank you.

9 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
10 Now you will hear from Council Member Shulman  
11 followed by Council Member Paladino.

12 LYNN SHULMAN: Thank you. I want to  
13 speak in support of Intro 844. Healthcare is a human  
14 right but not when you cannot afford it. For too  
15 long hospitals who have overcharged patients with  
16 inconsistent rates causing New Yorkers to fall into  
17 crippling medical debt. We cannot let this continue.  
18 We are on the cusp of the worst global health crisis  
19 of our lifetime which means more people than ever  
20 must rely on our broken healthcare system. New  
21 Yorkers deserve accountability. We deserve action,  
22 we deserve transparency. As a recent breast cancer  
23 survivor and someone who has devoted my personal and  
24 professional life to healthcare advocacy. I am very  
25 proud to be a co-sponsor of this Legislation that is

2 being introduced today by my colleague Julie Menin  
3 who's healthcare regulator background form the basis  
4 of this important legislation. This Bill will  
5 finally bring a transparency and accountability to  
6 hospital costs that all of us deserve. I also want  
7 to say that this kind of Legislation doesn't happen  
8 in a vacuum and requires the support of the speaker  
9 of this body and I want to thank speaker Adrienne  
10 Adams for her support and her leadership on this.  
11 Thank you.

12 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
13 And now I'll hear from Council Member Paladino  
14 followed by Council Member Barron.

15 VICKIE PALADINO: Good afternoon  
16 everybody. Today I'm introducing Resolution 422  
17 calling upon the State Legislature to mandate  
18 vocational education in all public high schools.  
19 Blue collar workers are the backbone of our City and  
20 they keep our subways running, they keep our streets  
21 clean, they keep our phones on and our networks  
22 humming. They repair our bridges and our roadway.  
23 They build our bridges. They are the ones we count  
24 on when anything goes wrong yet we are failing our  
25 City and our young people by not doing nearly enough

2 to ensure we have a future population equipped to  
3 fully inherit our City because our schools are doing  
4 almost nothing to train the next generation in these  
5 crucial skills. Never before has a college diploma  
6 costs so much and delivered so little return on its  
7 investment. Our students deserve to know that there  
8 are lucrative important and fulfilling career  
9 opportunities available to them in which they do not  
10 require a traditional academic path and the crippling  
11 financial commitments that accompany them. Career  
12 and technical education programs provide young people  
13 and invaluable option when making their post-  
14 secondary education decisions and we owe it to them  
15 to give them that option. Millions of New Yorkers  
16 including myself have built a comfortable life for  
17 our families through honest blue collar work and that  
18 proud tradition must be passed on to our next  
19 generation. This is not a partisan issue. This is  
20 about giving our kids every possible opportunity to  
21 achieve success and giving our City the workforce it  
22 needs for the future. I hope this Council can come  
23 together and let our colleagues in Albany know how  
24 important this issue is. Thank you very much  
25 everybody and you all know how I feel about the young

2 people and the future of this City and they are the  
3 heartbeat and we need to keep it going. Thank you.

4 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
5 And now you'll hear from Council Member Barron  
6 followed by Council Member Sanchez.

7 CHARLES BARRON: Thank you my colleagues.  
8 I want to invite all of you tomorrow we are having a  
9 special visit from his excellency the Ambassador to  
10 Cuba it's a permanent mission and United Nations  
11 Ambassador Yuri Gonzalez. So he will be with us  
12 tomorrow 12 noon in the Library Conference Room at  
13 250 Broadway and all of you are welcome to come. I  
14 want to thank Chi Osse the Council Member for the  
15 appropriate Committee for our Resolution on Cuba.  
16 For having a hearing on that tomorrow and this is  
17 simply doing something that should have been done a  
18 long time ago lifting the embargo and allow travel to  
19 Cuba. For you who listen to the different propaganda  
20 about Cuba and socialism we should keep our minds  
21 open, Fidel Castro and Ernesto 'Che' Guevera they  
22 were leaders in the world in providing technical  
23 assistance to countries in Africa. There wouldn't be  
24 no Angola without Cuban support. Countries in the  
25 Caribbean, Maurice Bishop and Grenada, Cuba provided

2 technical assistance for them as well. Countries in  
3 Latin America, Cuba even though they were embargoed  
4 by the United States provided technical assistance,  
5 doctors, technicians, engineers to these developing  
6 countries and to my surprise when I did visit Cuba  
7 and I went to their international medical school by  
8 the way one of the best in the world and I hate to  
9 make you jealous but healthcare is free in Cuba and  
10 so is education. But when I went there I was  
11 surprised that two students said you know hey Council  
12 Member Barron how are you? It was two students from  
13 East New York and I didn't even know that they were  
14 that were receiving free medical education from Cuba  
15 and also Castro said we will give you support for  
16 Katrina victims that our government neglected and  
17 allowed to die on the roofs in New Orleans. So I  
18 want to thank Chi Osse for the hearing and also  
19 invite all of you to green the Ambassador tomorrow.  
20 Thank you.

21 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you  
22 Council Member. We will now hear from Council Member  
23 Sanchez followed by Council Member Aviles.

24 PIERINA SANCHEZ: Good afternoon I simply  
25 wanted to take a moment to thank your Sergeants who

2 work at the Council. I had a hearing yesterday on  
3 Code Enforcement and I had a baby in one arm and sort  
4 of a million bags and things in the other hand and I  
5 got to test all of City Hall's Accessibility features  
6 and Madam Speaker I just want to thank you and I want  
7 to thank the Sergeants for being so accommodating as  
8 well as the folks who are at City Hall every day.  
9 Thank you.

10 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you  
11 and thank you to our Sergeants as well. We will now  
12 go to Council Member Aviles followed by Council  
13 Member Won.

14 ALEXA AVILES: Thank you Majority Leader.  
15 It's not a surprise to most of you that this holiday  
16 season families across our City are struggling.  
17 During a time of the year marked by the rewards of  
18 giving families are facing record high inflation,  
19 record high housing costs, rising healthcare costs,  
20 stagnant wages all the while corporations rake in  
21 record levels of profit. It's not a coincidence and  
22 it's a pattern we've seen repeated again and again  
23 leading us to record high in equality. As we are all  
24 aware of this pattern repeated ad nauseam for the  
25 past four decades or more. It won't come as a

2 surprise for you to learn that our Federal Government  
3 is also considering a proposal that would provide tax  
4 relief to corporations of approximately \$120 billion  
5 over a 10 year period. And it also won't come as a  
6 surprise that our working class families see no such  
7 sign of relief in the near future and instead are  
8 preparing for real impacts of economic downturn. We  
9 must finally say enough. We must shift our focus  
10 implementing improvement strategies that uplift our  
11 working class families and thereby uplift our  
12 economy. That's why today I am introducing  
13 Resolution 417 along with Council Member De La Rosa  
14 which calls on the Federal Government to extend and  
15 make permanent the Child Tax Credit which provided  
16 relief to millions of families last year with the  
17 worst economic outlook the expiration of these  
18 benefits have put at least 10 million children at  
19 risk of poverty and with a familiar pattern of the  
20 majority of those children being black and brown. We  
21 know what happens when we prioritize corporate  
22 profits over the working class. With a crisis  
23 looming let's finally change this pattern. Let's  
24 finally do the right thing. I encourage you all to  
25 sign on to Resolution 417.

2 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
3 We will hear from Council Member Won followed by  
4 Council Member Farias.

5 JULIE WON: Thank you Majority Leader. I  
6 would like to call on my colleagues to support two  
7 pieces of Legislation that I am introducing today  
8 which is Intro 851 and Intro 852. Since 2019 and  
9 2020 School Year, our City's public schools have lost  
10 more than 100,000 students, about 10 percent of our  
11 total enrollment. This is a larger decline than  
12 larger Cities like Chicago or Los Angeles. An Intro  
13 851 would require DOE to report on student's  
14 enrollment, dis-enrollment from public school and  
15 this data would be broken down by school district,  
16 age, grade level, race and ethnicity as well as  
17 information regarding where students are transferred  
18 to that way we have a tracking system of where the  
19 students are because in my school district alone I  
20 know that we've lost hundreds of students and we want  
21 to know where they are to make sure that they are  
22 safe and that we are doing everything that we can to  
23 plan for the long-term especially when it comes to  
24 individualized school funding and with the current  
25 funding formula that we have today. So this will

2 probably increase as granularly [sounds like] of the  
3 enrollment data a while protecting student privacy.  
4 So I really encourage you to sign on to that and for  
5 852 we have over half a million New Yorkers who still  
6 don't have internet access. And we know today with  
7 the current DOIT as well as ECTO that we have  
8 programs like Big Apple Connect as well as affordable  
9 connectivity program and what Intro 852 will do would  
10 require DOIT to create and distribute information on  
11 discounted internet services and community's internet  
12 service providers to local community groups so that  
13 people are, this basically will be an awareness  
14 campaign. So I really call you all to sign on and I  
15 look forward to working with you all.

16 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
17 And now we will hear from Council Member Narcisse  
18 followed by Council Member Kagan.

19 MERCEDES NARCISSE: Hi. Thank you. What  
20 I have to say about that is that healthcare is not  
21 affordable to all New Yorkers. Our system is  
22 failing. Something is critically wrong when patients  
23 are fighting for their lives and hospitals are  
24 fighting for their last cent. As a Registered Nurse  
25 I have seen it first-hand. It saddens me that

2 hospitals, we should be looking out for the best  
3 interest of the communities they serve. Far too  
4 often look at the turning a profit. New Yorkers  
5 should not have to shop around at hospitals as if  
6 they are looking for a Black Friday sale for a C-  
7 section or heart surgeries. It's not funny but  
8 that's how it looks to me as a nurse. Healthcare  
9 providers have an obligation to the people they serve  
10 and elected officials have an obligation to ensure  
11 that the system works for the people. Not for them  
12 and not against them which is why I am proud to  
13 support the Healthcare Accountability and Consumer  
14 Protection Act and I would like to say thank you to  
15 my colleagues Menin that worked so hard and Lynn  
16 talking about the importance of having healthcare  
17 access available to all. And also I would like, I'm  
18 looking forward to working with Council to introduce  
19 Legislation that would bring more transparency around  
20 staffing measures and working condition in our  
21 healthcare system. We have to provide the best  
22 quality healthcare in New York State. If anywhere  
23 else we have to lead by example so I thank you and I  
24 count on my colleagues to make sure that everyone has

2 access to the best quality healthcare in New York  
3 City. Thank you.

4 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Thank you.  
5 And finally we hear from Council Member Kagan.

6 ARI KAGAN: Thank you. Good afternoon.  
7 First of all I would like to welcome back all of my  
8 colleagues who visited Israel and enjoyed their great  
9 time at the Holy Land. As you probably know this  
10 week I became a proud member of Republic Conference  
11 and though there are many reasons of my decision, the  
12 main point is I became very dissatisfied with the way  
13 the Public Safety is treated in New York City. I  
14 became sick and tired of the assaults and crime and  
15 toughened policy policies. We need to take public  
16 safety seriously to support our law enforcement and  
17 to prioritize rights of law abiding citizens over  
18 rights of criminals. I intend to work closely with  
19 my Democratic and Republican college to improve  
20 quality of life for communities in Brooklyn and of  
21 course New York City. Thank you very much.

22 MAJORITY LEADER KEITH POWERS: Is anybody  
23 else signed up to speak? Okay. Thank you. And I'll  
24 call on Speaker Adrienne Adams to close today's  
25 meeting.

1 CITY COUNCIL STATED MEETING

61

2 SPEAKER ADRIENNE ADAMS: Thank you. The  
3 Stated Meeting of December 7, 2022 is hereby  
4 adjourned. (gavel pounding)

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date DECEMBER 15, 2022